

#### **Accreditation Report**

Accreditation of

# Zhetysu University named after I. Zhansugurov Taldykorgan, Republic of Kazakhstan

"Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/ Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences), "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences)

#### I <u>Procedure</u>

**Initial accreditation of the study programmes**: "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor/Master), "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor/Master), "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Bachelor/Master) on 31 May 2015 **by** ACQUIN **until** 30.09.2020; temporary accreditation until 30.09.2021

Date of contract: 22 May 2019

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 14 December 2020

Date of the on-site visit: 07-09 April 2021

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Lyazzat Nugumanova

Accreditation decision: 28 June 2021

Peer review experts:

- **Professor Dr. Saltanat Abildina**, Karaganda State University, Head of the Department of Pedagogy and Methods of Primary Education
- **Professor Dr. Albert Düggeli**, FHNW University of Applied Sciences and Arts Northwestern Switzerland, Professorship for Educational Psychology with a focus on development and education
- PD Dr. Dr. h.c. (Staatl. Iwan-Franko-Univ. UA) Karoline Hillesheim, University of Augsburg, Academic Councilor / Lecturer, Elementary School Pedagogics and Didactics



- **Professor Dr. Steffi Tollkühn**, Zittau/Goerlitz University of Applied Sciences, Faculty of Social Sciences, Early Childhood Pedagogy
- Saltanat Sadykova, QSI International School of Astana, Primary school teacher, PhD Student Nazarbayev University
- Martin Schleef, Student "Pedagogy" (Master), Technical University of Dortmund



The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programmes, lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) in the current official version. For PhD study programmes the Salzburg Recommendations are considered additionally. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the study programmes, are taken into account.



# <u>Content</u>

I	Procedure					
II	Introduction					
	1	Short profile of HEI	6			
	2	General information on the study programmes	7			
	3	Results of the previous accreditation	8			
Ш	Implementation and assessment of the criteria					
	1	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance				
		1.1 Implementation				
		1.2 Assessment	12			
		1.3 Conclusion	12			
	2	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes	13			
		2.1 Implementation	13			
		2.2 Assessment				
		2.3 Conclusion	30			
	3	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment				
		3.1 Implementation				
		3.2 Assessment				
		3.3 Conclusion				
	4	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification				
		4.1 Implementation				
		4.2 Assessment				
		4.3 Conclusion	35			
	5	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff	35			
		5.1 Implementation	35			
		5.2 Assessment	36			
		5.3 Conclusion	38			
	6	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support	38			
		6.1 Implementation	38			
		6.2 Assessment	40			
		6.3 Conclusion	40			
	7	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management	40			
		7.1 Implementation	41			
		7.2 Assessment				
		7.3 Conclusion	42			
	8	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information				
		8.1 Implementation				
		8.2 Assessment				
	-	8.3 Conclusion				
	9	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	43			

# ACQUIN

		9.1	Implementation	43
		9.2	Assessment	44
		9.3	Conclusion	45
	10	ESG S	Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance	45
		10.1	Implementation	45
		10.2	Assessment	45
		10.3	Conclusion	46
IV	Rec	omme	ndation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	47
	1	sment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher Europea ESG) in the actual official version		
	2	Accree	ditation Recommendation	47
v	Dec	ision o	of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	49



#### II Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the study programmes, study programmes coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure. They are completed with criteria for structured doctoral programmes (Salzburg Recommendations). In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are considered.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG, the Salzburg Recommendations, and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programmes.

# 1 Short profile of HEI

Zhetysu University named after Ilyas Zhansugurov (ZhSU) is a large regional university in the Almaty region that combines classical principles with modern educational programmes. The university is developing as a multidisciplinary innovation-oriented Smart-university in the areas of education, science and upbringing.

The structure of the university includes a research institute on biotechnology, seven faculties (Faculty of Natural Sciences, Faculty of Physical Culture and Art, Faculty of Law and Economics, Faculty of Pedagogy and Psychology, Faculty of Humanities and Technical Faculty), 22 departments, a college, a scientific and educational center "Rukhani zhagyru", StartUp Academy ZhGU, a scientific and practical center "Iliyastanu", an office for the commercialization of research results and an IT center.



ZhSU offers 84 study programmes including bachelor, master and PhD programmes. As of 2019, 5618 students, including 5280 undergraduate, 264 graduate and 74 PhD students study at the university.

Currently, the university has 60 cooperation agreements with foreign universities and organizations in the field of joint scientific research, academic exchanges of students and teachers and joint implementation of educational programs and scientific projects.

Educational and research processes at the ZhSU are provided by highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel, the total number of teaching staff is 281 people, incl. 22 doctors of sciences, 103 candidates of sciences, 21 doctors of PhD, 144 masters, 18 professors, 48 associate professors.

# 2 General information on the study programmes

The study programmes in this cluster are offered by the faculty of Pedagogy and Psychology. The history of the faculty of Pedagogy and psychology begins with the Foundation of the University in 1972, when the Department of pedagogy and psychology was organized. On the basis of this Department in 1977, the faculty of music and education was opened. In 2008, the faculty was transformed into the faculty of pedagogy and psychology.

The faculty consists of 48 teachers, including 5 doctors of science, 14 candidates of science, 4 PhDs and 25 masters.

The standard duration of full-time study of bachelor's degree programmes is 8 semester (240 ECTS credits). Students can choose distance learning mode of study.

Master's programmes are offered in two directions profile direction and scientific and pedagogical direction. Students of profile direction receive Master of Education degree. The standard duration of study is 2 semesters (60 ECTS credits). Students of scientific and pedagogical direction receive Master of Pedagogical Sciences degree. The standard duration of study is 4 semesters (120 ECTS credits).

PhD programmes have standard duration of study 6 semesters (180 ECTS credits).

In all study programmes, can study on an competitive educational grant basis or on commercial basis paying annual tuition fee.



#### 3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programmes "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Bachelor/Master), "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Bachelor/Master), "Pedagogy and psychology" (Bachelor/Master) were examined and accredited by the accreditation agency ACQUIN for the first time in 2015 without any conditions:

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated (translation from German):

General recommendations:

- The recognition of study and examination achievements gained abroad should be implemented as a regular practice in the light of the Lisbon Convention with regard to the equivalence of acquired competences.
- In order to better enable student mobility (also between degree programmes), module sizes should be harmonised (e.g. modules could be formed with 5 ECTS credits or multiples).
- The university should work towards expanding the range of courses offered by foreign guest lecturers. These efforts can be promoted in particular through the expansion of university cooperations.
- More literature in foreign languages, especially in English, should be made available for the study programmes. This includes specialised publications as well as textbooks.
- Against the background of the university's goal of establishing itself as a so-called "innovation university", the international disciplinary discourse should be given more consideration. This concerns the reception of academic theories and the participation of academic representatives in international academic projects and conferences.
- In order to improve the international compatibility of the study programmes and to increase the mobility of students, more suitable courses should be offered in English.
- In order to improve the students' acquisition of competences in the field of subjectspecific research methods, corresponding educational elements should be taken into account more intensively in the curriculum than has been the case up to now.

Recommendation "Pedagogy and methodology of primary education" (Master)

• For the international compatibility of the scientific-pedagogical Master's degree, the literature mentioned in the module descriptions should be increasingly expanded by relevant publications in English..

Recommendations "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Master)



- The internationally discussed areas of interculturality, inclusion or disability should be indicated thematically in the modules.
- The module titles "Educational Psychology", "Socionics" and "Bases of Polorole Education" should be reconsidered.

Recommendations "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Master)

- It is recommended to better structure the modules thematically and to bundle them accordingly, i.e. to formulate sub-modules under a general module heading that are available for selection (compulsory elective).
- The module descriptions should indicate which teaching methods can be applied in each particular case.
- For international compatibility, the subjects "Statistics" and "Quantitative Empirical Research Methods" should be included in modules.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved, and the temporary accreditation of the study programmes "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Bachelor of Education/Master of Education/Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Bachelor of Education/Master of Education/Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Pedagogy and psychology" (Bachelor of Education/Master of Education/Master of Pedagogical Sciences) was issued until 30. September 2021.



#### III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

#### 1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

#### 1.1 Implementation

ZhSU has a quality policy developed for the academic year 2018-2021. The policy is publicly available on the official website of the university.

The main priorities of the quality policy are among others training of highly sought-after graduates with innovative qualifications and competencies that satisfy the needs of employers; modernization of the content of study programmes on the basis of professional standards that have a practice-oriented character and inculcate students with managerial, entrepreneurial skills; development of education digitalization in accordance with the state program «Digital Kazakhstan» on 3 key areas: development of information, automation of education management process, training of IT professionals; increasing efficiency of scientific research and integration into international scientific community; increased autonomy for management and academics and transformation of the university from state ownership to national joint-stock company, development of collegial systems of management and quality management to the requirements of international standards ISO 9001:2015; conducting educational work with students on the basis of the values of Kazakhstan's identity and unity, spiritual and moral values of the program of modernization of public consciousness «Ruhany Zhangyru», formation of healthy lifestyle culture and «zero tolerance» towards corruption and ensuring academic integrity; ensuring a favorable moral and psychological climate at the university and developing infrastructure and providing sustainable financial and economic conditions of the university and regional use of resources.

The basis of ZhSU quality assurance system is the internal quality management system (QMS), which guarantees the achievement of educational objectives and expected learning outcomes for each implemented study programme. The QMS is part of the university management system, which provides coordinated activities regarding the content, technology, methods and means of work of managers, employees, faculty, and students to further improve the quality of the educational process and the professional competence of university graduates.

University staff, including managers at all levels, build their activities based on the existing legal framework. The functions, tasks and responsibilities of departments, faculties, and other



structural units are aimed at the successful implementation of a quality assurance strategy. The quality assurance strategy for educational activities and the quality policy are implemented at all levels of management and if necessary are reviewed and revised.

The QMS was developed, implemented and maintained in accordance with the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001: 2015 "Quality Management Systems. The QMS of the university is based on a process approach. For each process of the quality management system, a process manager and its owner are established. The head of the process ensures its implementation, monitors its effectiveness and efficiency. The owner of the process draws up the process in the form of a document, sets control assessments, manages the process, is responsible for its status, and carries out checks.

The responsibilities of departments, faculties and other units, management, employees, and students for quality assurance are governed by the relevant provisions and job descriptions, approved in the prescribed manner.

The university management carries out quality assurance activities in the following areas: organization and planning of educational process, quality of training session, providing students with educational and methodological complexes of disciplines in accordance with the state educational standard etc.

Educational and methodical work of the faculties includes among others modular development study programmes, according to which the training and graduation of specialists is carried out based on the state compulsory standard of higher education (further SCSE) and model rules; educational and methodological support of educational disciplines of the department (the development of textbooks, teaching aids, guidelines, etc.) etc.

One of the main components of the education quality system is students' involvement in university management (student self-government). Students are involved in the work of the Academic Council, the Anti-Corruption Council.

Student deans are elected at each faculty. The main duties of student deans are to attract all students of the faculty to a conscious and systematic participation in the management affairs of the faculty, involve student youth in the decision-making process, development of creative potential and professional growth, on a moral orientation, self-realization in all spheres of life.

For the effective organization of the educational process, the university develops mechanisms for interacting with key stakeholders, analyses the composition of stakeholders and the relationship between them and the university, systems of interests and mutual expectations.

The university defines a group of stakeholders, that is those interested in the process of interaction with the university in the framework of achieving mutually beneficial objective.



#### 1.2 Assessment

The university has a diverse and binding system for quality assurance based on international standards as well as the national specifications for the education system. Academic stakeholders and cooperation partners are integrated into this system, which covers all relevant aspects of study, teaching, practice, and research. For this purpose, a quality management system at various administrative levels was implemented, which is coordinated by the university wide Center for Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance and the Committee for Quality Assurance at the Faculty. An important instrument are evaluations, which are carried out regularly and continuously regarding the courses, the general conditions, and the study situation as well as the student satisfaction. The evaluations and other quality assurance measures are discussed and made transparent in various committees and councils at the different hierarchical levels of the study programmes, the faculty, and the university administration. The participation of all stakeholders, especially students, is continuously ensured. The results are transferred to the modification and development of curricula and modules as well as to the teaching staff. In addition, the university puts great emphasis on the didactic and scientific qualification of the teaching staff and students to ensure the quality of teaching. This is particularly evident in the PhD program "Pedagogy and Psychology", which offers a wide range of individual qualification opportunities.

The university does not pursue an explicit concept on gender equality and justifies this with the fact that there are no corresponding ministerial requirements. However, the university states that attention is paid to gender policy and refers to the academic freedom to decide for itself that, in principle, those who do a good job also receive the corresponding positions.

To promote equal opportunities for students with disabilities or special needs, various means of support exist at the university in accordance with national ministerial requirements, which include measures of accessibility and accessibility as well as individual course design and counselling services.

With the binding implementation of the comprehensive quality management system, the university has successfully realized the recommendations of the first accreditation. Considering existing measures, a continuous monitoring of the quality of academic teaching and research as well as their further development is possible. In the long term, ZhSU could consider establishing further measures to promote gender equality.

#### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



### 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

#### 2.1 Implementation

#### **General Overview**

Study programmes of all three levels, undergraduate, graduate and doctoral studies are developed in accordance with the National Qualifications framework, SES, professional standards and agreed with the Dublin Descriptors and the European Qualifications framework.

The main regulatory documents for the development of the study programme of the university are: classifier of areas of training with higher and postgraduate education in the Republic of Kazakhstan; SES of higher and postgraduate education (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 604), Model rules for the activities of organizations of higher and postgraduate education; Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education.

The procedure for the development of study programmes and the methodology for their design is determined by the Regulation on the development of modular study programme. Study programme is developed for each specialty of higher and postgraduate education by specially created working groups and agreed with the Council of Employers of the faculties. The working group includes the head of the department and two to three leading teachers of the department. Each study programme goes through the procedures of discussion and consideration at the meetings of departments (protocols), faculty council (protocols), expert group (verification act) and is approved by the rector based on the decision of the Academic Board.

Responsibility for the implementation of the requirements specified in this provision lies with the head of the EMC (Educational and Methodical Council). Responsibility for organizing and monitoring compliance with established standards in accordance with the requirements of this provision lies with the head of the EMC and deans of faculties. Heads of departments are responsible for the content of the study programmes. Study programmes are developed in three languages: Kazakh, Russian and English.

Students participate in the development of study programme by taking part in a survey of students on satisfaction with the educational process. Students participate in the discussion of the study programme at the meetings of the Faculty Council and the Academic Board of ZhSU,



where the programme is reviewed and approved. Students can recommend elective courses to be included in the catalogue of elective disciplines.

The faculty pays special attention to attracting employers to the development of programme. The faculty created the Council of Employers. Before approval, the programme is assessed by the employers. A survey on satisfaction with the graduates is conducted among employers of Taldykorgan town and Almaty region. In addition, employers can send their feedback about the graduates including any problems and wishes for improving the training of future graduates.

The academic year consists of periods (semester -15 weeks, trimester -10 weeks, quarter -7-8 weeks). The volume of classroom work is at least 30% of the volume of each discipline. The number of hours allowed for independent work of a student is within the established norm (1:2). Independent work under the guidance of a teacher (SSWT) is a type of work performed by students in contact with the teacher.

Bachelor's degree programmes have a standard duration of study of 4 years or 8 semesters in full-time mode and amounts to 240 ECTS credits.

The curriculum of the bachelor's degree programmes consists of theoretical learning, cycles of general education (GED), basic and main disciplines (BD and MD) and final certification. GED cycle disciplines are studied in first two semesters, BD and MD cycle disciplines are studied in the second through eight semesters. GED cycle includes the following disciplines: Modern history of Kazakhstan, Foreign Language, Philosophy, Kazakh (Russian) language, Philosophy, Information and communication technologies (in English), module of socio-political knowledge (sociology, political science, cultural studies, psychology), Physical training. The cycle of general disciplines comprises 56 ECTS credits, BD 112 ECTS credits of which 88 ECTS credits are electives, MD make up total of 72 ECTS credits of which 37 ECTS credits are electives.

Master's degree programmes can be studies either in scientific and pedagogical or in profile direction. The standard duration of scientific and pedagogical specialization is 2 years (4 semesters) and amounts to 120 ECTS credits. The standard duration of study of profile direction is 1 year (2 semesters) and amounts to 60 ECTS credits.

The content of the master's degree programmes consists of: theoretical learning, including the study of basic and main disciplines; practical preparation of postgraduates: various types of practices, scientific or professional internships; research work that includes the implementation of a master's thesis – for a scientific and pedagogical master's degree or experimental research work that includes the implementation of a master's project – for a specialized master's degree; final certification. One ECTS corresponds to 30 academic hours. The basic disciplines and



main disciplines include the disciplines of the university component (UC) and the elective component (EC).

Master students conclude their studies with writing a master's thesis. In a scientific and pedagogical master students focus on a research work and in profile master's on an experimental research work.

The basic discipline cycle in the scientific and pedagogical direction includes compulsory disciplines "History and philosophy of science", "Foreign language (professional)", "Pedagogy of the higher school", "Management psychology" and in the profile direction - the discipline "Management psychology" and "Foreign language (professional)".

PhD students study on the basis of an individual study plan, which is compiled under the guidance of an academic adviser. The individual work plan of the students is planned for the entire period of study and includes following sections: ICP, scientific-research and experimental-research work, practice, topic of the dissertation with justification and structure, dissertation implementation plan and plan of scientific publications and internships, including foreign ones. The workload of one academic year corresponds to 60 ECTS credits. The doctoral programme comprises of educational component (53 ECTS), scientific and research work (115) and final certification (12). The educational component consists of cycles of basic (BD) and profile (PD) disciplines, which include disciplines of the university component (UC) and the elective component (EC) and practice. The scientific component of the educational doctoral programme is formed from scientific-research work of a student, scientific publications, writing and defending a dissertation. The final certification is carried out in the form of writing and defending a doctoral dissertation

Professional practice is an integral part of the BD and MD cycles of higher education. In the bachelor's degree programmes, education and training practice (2 ECTS) takes place in the 2nd and 4th terms with duration of two weeks in Taldykorgan. In the 6th term, students undergo pedagogical (practical training) (5 ECTS) and in 8th term industrial practice (13 ECTS) is carried out in state educational institutions of the city and region based on concluded agreements. Contracts are concluded with all bodies of professional activity of the city of Taldykorgan and Almaty region.

Profile master's degree includes production, pedagogical and research practice as well as manufacturing practice. Scientific and pedagogical direction includes two types of practices; pedagogical and research.



#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (Bachelor)

The purpose of the study programme is to train qualified personnel who know modern technologies of psychological and pedagogical support of the educational process and provide qualified assistance to students and their families in accordance with the current needs of practice and society.

Graduates of the programme should be able to show an active civil position in interpersonal and intercultural communication in a multilingual environment based on fundamental knowledge and skills in the field of social, political, cultural, and psychological sciences in the context of their role in the modernization and digitalization of Kazakhstan's society, have a basic knowledge of the course of socio-professional training of the psychologist, taking into account modern requirements, possess the skills to find creative solution of pedagogical tasks; know the peculiarities of professional activity of a psychologist, know methods and techniques of analyzing problems. Graduates should know a system of psychological tools for the organization of communicative interaction, know the specific features and general laws of education, scientific and theoretical foundations of training, education and development; use the categorical apparatus of pedagogy and psychology and be able to work in a team. Graduates are able to correctly defend their point of view, offer new solutions, able to adequately react in various social situations, apply methods to preserve and support the mental health of students, possess the skills of psychological diagnosis, correction and education, methods of psychological prevention etc.

Students are prepared for professional activities in the field of education and can work in educational institutions (general education schools, teacher training colleges, institutes of professional development and retraining of teachers, education departments), as well as health care institutions, social protection institutions, institutions of internal affairs bodies, and youth affairs committees.

Following basic and main disciplines, modules are included in the curriculum: Social sciences and self-knowledge (21 ECTS), Basics of psychodiagnostics (21 ECTS), Fundamentals of the professional activity of the future teacher psychologist (47 ECTS), Development of psychological and pedagogical science (15 ECTS), Basics of pedagogical activity (20 ECTS), Psychological and pedagogical aspects of personality (10 ECTS), Methodological foundations of psychological and pedagogical research (18 ECTS), Professional Language (25 ECTS) and "Minor 1, 2 and 3" (5 ECTS each).

#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (Master)

The purpose of the study programme is training of teaching staff to carry out various types of activities in educational institutions of general, secondary vocational and higher education that

# ACQUIN

have a fundamental scientific base, owning a methodology of scientific creativity, modern pedagogical and information technologies, capable of independent research and scientific and pedagogical activities.

Graduates of the scientific and pedagogical direction acquire following competencies: know how to apply psychological and pedagogical knowledge in various fields of activity; know fundamental psychological and pedagogical laws and concepts; able to determine the relationship of methodological, theoretical and applied levels in a scientific study of pedagogy and psychology, as well as to solve the research problem, process, analyse and systematize the psychological information on the research topic; able to analyse and synthesize scientific facts; interpret contradictions; owns research methods; know how to manage individual research activities, taking into account the understanding of its main components; having an idea of the modern methodology of teaching disciplines in a pedagogical university; on the professional competence of a teacher of higher education; know how to determine the composition of the main variables studied, the selection of methods, plan and organize the conduct of empirical research, analyse and interpret their results, build models for the studied subject area; competent in the selection of theoretical and methodological models of psychodiagnostics; primary data collection methods, their analysis and interpretation; methods of quantitative and qualitative analysis in scientific research; know the psychology of cognitive activity of students in the learning process; psychological methods and means of increasing the effectiveness and guality of training etc.

Graduates of the profile focus acquire following competencies: apply psychological and pedagogical knowledge in various fields of activity; know fundamental psychological and pedagogical laws and concepts; able to determine the relationship of methodological, theoretical and applied levels in scientific research on pedagogy and psychology; able to analyze and synthesize scientific facts; interpret contradictions; own research methods; able to manage individual research activities, taking into account the understanding of its main components; able to solve the problem of research, process, analyse and systematize scientific psychological and pedagogical information on the topic of research; competent in the selection of theoretical and methodological models of psychodiagnostics; methods of collecting primary data, their analysis and interpretation; methods of quantitative and qualitative analysis in scientific research; know the psychology of students' cognitive activity in the learning process; psychological methods and means to improve the effectiveness and quality of training etc.

The profile direction of the study programme includes following BD and MD modules; "Organization of scientific and pedagogical research" and "Methods of Teaching".



The scientific and pedagogical direction includes following BD and MD modules; "Scientific and pedagogical research", "Communication and management", "Bases of professional activity of future staff", "Methods of teaching", "Basics of ethno-psychology and ethno-pedagogy in training staff".

#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (PhD)

The goals of the study programme are to train highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel, competitive on the international labour market, and with a high level of general and professional culture, capable of making a significant contribution with their own original research in primary education.

PhD graduate acquires following competencies: demonstrates a systematic understanding of modern trends, directions and patterns of development of domestic science in the context of globalization and internationalization of education; complies with the norms of interaction in the scientific community, as well as the pedagogical and scientific ethics of a scientist-researcher; analyses and compares the scientific approaches to the development of primary education, synthesizes the mechanisms for introducing scientific developments into practical activities; speaks a foreign language for the implementation of scientific communication and international cooperation, participation in scientific domestic and international projects; possesses leadership and leadership skills using modern pedagogical technologies of higher education etc.

The study programme includes following BD and MD modules "Methodology and scientific and theoretical foundations of the training of scientific personnel", "Systematic and methodological support of the process of teaching in higher education".

#### "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Bachelor)

The qualification goals of the programme are among others acquiring effective methods of forming the main types of speech activity of preschool children, knows the main directions and prospects of education development, applies theoretical and empirical research methods in pedagogical science, analyses the anatomical and physiological features of the body of preschool children and is able to organize work with preschool children, understands the specifics and value of preschool education as the foundation of all subsequent education, is able to realize the continuity of education, training, and socialization of preschool children; is able to apply knowledge of the state standard of preschool education and educational programs, theoretical foundations and methods of teaching educational subjects of preschool education etc.

Following BD and MD are included in the study programme. "Private methods of preschool education", "Basic of Preschool Education", "Psychological-pedagogical aspects of education



and training", "Spiritual and moral education", "Informatively-communicative", "Technologies for preschool education", Minor 1, 2 or 3".

#### "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Master)

The purpose of the study programme is training of teaching staff to carry out various types of activities in educational institutions of general, secondary vocational and higher education that have a fundamental scientific base, understanding a methodology of scientific creativity, modern pedagogical and information technologies and capable of independent research and scientific and pedagogical activities.

Graduates of the scientific and pedagogical direction gain following competencies: know how to apply psychological and pedagogical knowledge in various fields of activity; know fundamental psychological and pedagogical laws and concepts; able to determine the relationship of methodological, theoretical and applied levels in a scientific study of pedagogy and psychology, as well as to solve the research problem, process, analyse and systematize the psychological information on the research topic; able to analyse and synthesize scientific facts; interpret contradictions; owns research methods; knows how to manage individual research activities, taking into account the understanding of its main components; having an idea of the modern methodology of teaching disciplines in a pedagogical university; on the professional competence of a teacher of higher education etc.

Graduates of the profile direction have the following competencies: capable of improving his intellectual and cultural level, moral and physical development of the individual; know how to apply psychological and pedagogical knowledge in various fields of activity; - knows the fundamental psychological and pedagogical laws and concepts; able to determine the relationship of methodological, theoretical and applied levels in a scientific study of pedagogy and psychology; able to analyse and synthesize scientific facts; interpret contradictions; owns research methods; knows how to manage individual research activities, taking into account the understanding of its main components; able to solve the research problem, process, analyse and systematize the scientific psychological and pedagogical information on the research topic;

The profile direction of the study programme includes following BD and MD modules: "Topical issues of pedagogy and psychology in preschool education", "Socialization of the modern preschooler" and "Communication and Management".

The scientific-pedagogical direction includes following BD and MD disciplines; "Topical issues of pedagogy and psychology in preschool education", "Topical issues and modern theories of preschool education", "Philosophy of education and modern science", "Socialization of the modern preschooler", "Communication and management".



#### "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Bachelor)

The objectives of the study programme are training of qualified specialists in the field of primary education, competitive on the labour market, capable of simulating psychological and pedagogical activity, carrying out reflection, goal setting, and diagnostics, applying modern technologies of training and education, using systematic theoretical and practical knowledge, and taking responsibility for the results of their professional activities.

Following learning outcomes are defined: owns effective methods of forming the main types of speech activity of primary school children: reading, speaking, listening and writing; Gives an assessment of the main directions and prospects of development of education and general professional sciences, theoretical and empirical research methods of pedagogical science; Applies knowledge of pedagogical technologies in the educational process; Knows the specifics, the value of primary education as the foundation of all subsequent education, is able to realize the continuity of upbringing, training, socialization of children of preschool, primary school and younger adolescents; Interprets the knowledge of the state standard of primary education and curricula, theoretical foundations and methods of teaching primary school subjects in solving professional problems; It uses selection and integration when choosing educational material: it independently produces the necessary didactic materials, applies technical teaching aids in the educational process, solves pedagogical problems, helping to improve the quality of education Etc.

The BD and MD cycles include following modules: "Main theoretical disciplines", "Literature and professional language", "Psychological and pedagogical fundamentals of training primary teachers", "Didactics", "Writing and defending a thesis, passing of comprehensive exam", Minor 1, 2 and 3.

# "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Master)

The objectives of the study programme are to train highly qualified and competitive scientific and pedagogical personnel in the field of primary education, capable of implementing professional activities in the context of the globalization and internationalization of education, with practical skills, high spiritual, moral and leadership qualities.

Graduates of scientific and pedagogical direction develop following competencies: speak a foreign language at a professional level, which allows conducting research, teaching at universities, presenting and defending the results of comprehensive scientific and pedagogical activities, and communicating in a professional environment; critically analyse current trends in the development of scientific knowledge, the history of the development of foreign pedagogy and domestic pedagogical science; analyse the conceptual foundations of the psychological



and pedagogical study of students, the specifics of the diagnosis of the educational process, the system of concepts that reflect the essence of the pedagogical diagnosis of educational results, can think creatively and be creative in solving new problems and situations; analyse the scientific and methodological foundations of measurements and monitoring studies in systems for assessing the quality of education and the provision of educational services, apply a high-quality system for monitoring and evaluating students' knowledge; analyse the modern trends of scientific and educational management, focus on the psychological and pedagogical content of educational activities, implement the main management functions etc.

Graduates of the master of education (profile direction) have following competencies: ability to communicate in the state and foreign languages in the professional environment and in whole society, is able to develop documentation, present and protect the results of integrated pedagogical activities; select diagnostic tools appropriate to the practical and research tasks, apply modern methods and technologies for monitoring the quality of education, design further educational routes for students based on the results; own methods and means of improving and developing the intellectual level of the student, apply methods, techniques, technologies of modern pedagogy and primary education; use the methodology of pedagogical research, organize the work of the research team, own the algorithm of research activities, carry out planning and organization of scientific research, apply methods of processing scientific data etc.

The profile direction of the study programme includes following BD and MD disciplines; "Communicative Management", "Fundamentals of modern pedagogy", "Modern problems of pedagogy and methodology of primary education". The scientific-pedagogical direction of the study programme includes following BD and MD disciplines; "Philosophy of education and modern science", "Fundamentals of modern pedagogy", "Communicative Management", "Professionalpedagogical activity and innovative methods", "Management of the modern pedagogical process".

#### "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (PhD)

The goals of the study programme is to train highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel, competitive on the international labour market, with a high level of general and professional culture, capable of making a significant contribution with their own original research in primary education.

Graduates of the PhD programme have the following competencies: analyse the modern concepts of world and Kazakhstani science in the field of primary education; comply with the norms of interaction in the scientific community, as well as the pedagogical and scientific ethics of a scientist-researcher; analyse and compare the scientific approaches to the development of primary education, synthesize the mechanisms for introducing scientific developments into



practical activities; analyse, evaluate and compare various scientific theories in the field of research, making independent conclusions related to the planning and implementation of their own scientific, pedagogical and innovative activities; use modern research methodology for planning and forecasting the results of scientific activities; speak a foreign language for the implementation of scientific communication and international cooperation, participation in scientific domestic and international projects; generate its own new scientific ideas, communicate its knowledge and ideas to the scientific community, expand the boundaries of scientific knowledge; possess leadership and leadership skills using modern pedagogical technologies of higher education etc.

The PhD programme includes following BD and MD modules: "Philosophy and methodology of pedagogy", "Theory and technology for the training of primary school teachers", "A quality management system for education", "Scientific research in pedagogy and pedagogical practice".

#### 2.2 Assessment

#### General

All study programmes being accredited here fit well into the mission statement and overall strategy of the university. ZhSU offers numerous study programmes in pedagogical direction. The university is very-well connected with the regional educational institutions. External stake-holders especially local schools, pre-school institutions and other potential employers are actively involved in the development and improvement of the study programmes.

Study programmes are designed and approved according to the national laws and ZhSU regulations. The procedures are clear and transparent. All relevant stakeholders are involved in the process.

PhD students are supported as early-stage researchers direct from beginning of their studies. Since one of the admission requirements is good command of English language, PhD students can participate in the international scientific communities. PhD students are encouraged to publish the results of the research in international and national journals. Students are supervised by two qualified teachers, including one foreign lecturer. As part of the study programme, students spend part of their studies in a foreign partner institution. Students receive financial support to attend national and international conferences to present the results of their research work.

The PhD students interviewed stated that they felt well supported by the university in their individual aspirations. They take part in international congresses, have free access to international databases and have the necessary application software. International publications, for example in Scopus journals, are financed by the university.



All doctoral theses, but also articles that students publish or send to meetings and conferences, are checked for plagiarism by external organisations of the Ministry of Education. The research work of PhD students at the ZhSU repeatedly took top places in various - also international - competitions.

The degree programmes assessed here are based on a catalogue of diverse study objectives. These objective formulations can, if one allows for a somewhat general consideration here, also be understood as competence goals, in a similar way as such are widely formulated for the fulfilment of the performance mandate of higher education institutions (HEI). This raises the fundamental question of whether future efforts should be made to anchor these "objectives" in a corresponding competence theory and to align them with a modified competence model appropriate for the HEI. Perhaps this could be a first step towards casting the sometimes somewhat difficult-to-read and understand structural logics of the individual study programmes into a somewhat fundamentally clarifying framework model. This would make the programmes more recognizable in their respective content orientation or, for example, in their workload-specific loading and probably more visible in the overall context of education.

Considering especially the university's focus on internationalization, the peer review experts recommend presenting the structure of study programmes more clearly, especially for those who are not familiar with the local education system. For example, a typical or suggested study plan which includes information on mandatory and/or optional modules, ECTS credits, forms of examination and teaching could be especially helpful for foreign students or teaching staff.

#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (Bachelor)

The title of the programmes "Pedagogy and Psychology" at all degree levels could be reconsidered in such a way that the two fields are brought closer together in their content overlaps. If one considers that "pedagogy" and "psychology" are offered separately as fields of study at many universities, one could call the study programmes "pedagogical psychology", especially considering the content orientations. However, this proposal would have to be considered and analyzed by the university further. This change could substantially guide the development of the degree programmes in the coming years.

The content of the bachelor's degree programme is interestingly chosen and covers central areas of both reference disciplines, i.e. psychology and education. If, as mentioned in the introduction, the two fields were to be merged as Pedagogical Psychology, the contents would still seem adequate; perhaps with the additional benefit that the programme would then have a somewhat clearer profile. The content taught in this study programme is meaningful, especially against the background of the study programmes proposed here for reaccreditation. Firstly, the bachelor level presented here can be meaningfully located within the disciplines,



i.e. in the field of education and psychology. Secondly, content seems to be taught that is relevant to the educational psychology of teacher training. And thirdly, the subject structure is well suited to the socio-cultural specificity or the socio-cultural anchoring of the university in its local setting. Overall, the 240 ECTS credits granted in the programme is rather high in international comparison, which can possibly be explained by the fact that numerous subjects of a so-called "studium genereale" are included in this degree programme.

#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (Master)

The curriculum of this programme logically follows the preceding modules of the bachelor's degree programme. Whether or to what extent a further in-depth study is achieved cannot be clearly determined here, because the master's programme lacks a sufficiently clarifying description of the content of the two profiles offered here. A somewhat clearer explanation in this regard could, on the one hand, make the continuing structure of the preceding bachelor's programme and, on the other hand, the upcoming connection to the PhD programme more visible. In addition, the 60 ECTS credits master's programme (referred to as the profile profile) differs considerably in scope from a 120 ECTS master's programme. This raises the question of the extent to which this profile direction is recognized internationally as a master's programme, especially regarding possible exchange programmes. Possibly, one could also think about reducing the ECTS points in the bachelor's programme and increasing the ECTS credits in the master's programme to fully achieve the international recognition mentioned.

In addition, the university could consider increasing the methodological content in this programme, so that the academic degree at this level could be given a useful differentiation for the students and subsequently either for their further academic career, or then for their labour market-related profiling.

Generally, learning objectives reflect adequately the requirements of the professional field and correspond the demands of the Master level. Curriculum of both directions seems to be sufficient to achieve the defined objectives.

#### "Pedagogy and psychology" (PhD)

The objectives of the PhD programme seem appropriate and are oriented towards internationally comparable goals for this academic qualification level. Likewise, this third cycle of academic training includes central content orientations and thematic deepening that build logically on the two preceding cycles. The university seems to be aware that epistemological and methodological training must be significantly deepened in this third cycle. Perhaps attention should be paid to the fact that in the meantime significant developments have taken place or are still underway in the quantitative as well as in the qualitative areas of social science research.



Perhaps this area should therefore be differentiated somewhat in terms of content, so that, for example, current procedures for analyzing time series data or modelling in multi-level structures could be learned as specific courses tailored to the respective qualification work. Another possibility would be incorporating these specific competences into the training for PhD students through existing collaborations. This could lead to a sharpening of the university's international relations in terms of content, in conjunction with the profiling qualification opportunity for students that has been suggested.

Furthermore, the research programmes currently being advertised in Kazakhstan, for which the HEI is seeking funding in selected areas, could become a starting point for strengthening the HEI's research in the field of education and psychology, and then any research programmes could also be used to raise the profile of the HEI and thus of the PhD students in terms of content. The HEI could consider establishing a research focus which would probably be an important step towards making the topic education and psychology of this university visible as a significant research center. Of course, this would have to be accompanied by an intensification of the renowned and peer-reviewed publication activities. Generally speaking, this should explicitly take up the fourth point of the European Council's objectives for the professionalisation and harmonisation of higher education, namely to build up a broad base of advanced knowledge among students and to stimulate further research and innovation.

Overall, according to the self-evaluation report, the key authorities and actors in the higher education sector are involved in the development of the study programmes. The three-year study programme appears to include 53 ECTS points of cursory content, some of which is compulsory and some of which is open as an elective. However, it is reported that there is a possibility to structure the PhD programme individually, which implies that the dissertation supervisors probably have a significant influence on the content of the students' training path. This individualization is a great opportunity that the university offers its young PhD students. It would perhaps be good to pay attention to the extent to which the content prescribed by the department and the parts of the training that can be negotiated at the individual level are coordinated with each other. This includes considering the extent to which space is available for doctoral students to engage in a joint exchange. Here, it might be possible to create further forums where the scientific discourse can be advanced, for example in colloquia, to which scientific staff from other universities or those with a wider interest in the subject could be invited.



#### "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Bachelor)

The study programme is in accordance with the goals of the university, which are to train specialists who have fundamental knowledge and necessary skills for research, teaching and professional activity. The primary goal of the study programme "Preschool Education and Upbringen" (Bachelor) is to qualify specialized professionals for the preschool sector and the regional labor market. Accordingly, the program meets the mandatory national requirements of the Kazakh education system and fully reflects the international standards of the Council of Europe's four parts of higher education.

The curriculum and the modules are structured in a transparent manner and build up coherently in terms of content. The study contents are competence-oriented and suitable to fulfill the objectives of the study programme and thus to meet the requirements of the labor market. The content and sequence of the studies, as well as the practical parts of the studies and the examinations, are regulated in a differentiated manner and are represented in individual study plans for the students. The student workload is identified and defined, and the weighting of the content is balanced. The number of ETCS credits to be acquired through the internship is appropriate in relation to the total number of ETCS credits. In addition to the comprehensive framework conditions, students have access to a wide range of support options for individualized study, e.g. distance learning, various advisory services, additional learning courses or stays abroad.

Several compulsory internships, which enable students to gain initial experience in their future professional field, are secured by numerous contractual agreements between the university and regional preschool educational institutions. University lecturers and experienced teachers supervise students closely and give them regular feedback during the individual internships. Moreover, employers and external cooperation partners are involved in the evaluations and in further development of the study programme.

After the initial accreditation, the study programme was revised and further adapted to the national and international standards. The university's achievements in internationalization are already evident, and the ongoing efforts towards further internationalization are highly visible. In the long term, the processes of internationalization should be further integrated into the teaching and research of the program, which can be supported by the existing structures, e.g. international literature, technical equipment and foreign language training of students.

# "Pre-school education and upbringing" (Master)

The study programme logically continues the bachelor's programme in terms of content and thus fulfills both the university objective and the international standards of the Council of Europe for the qualification of specialist personnel in the educational field. The purpose of the



study programme is training of teaching staff to carry out various types of activities in educational institutions of general, secondary vocational and higher education that have a fundamental scientific base, owning a methodology of scientific creativity, modern pedagogical and information technologies; capable of independent research and scientific and pedagogical activities.

As in the case of the bachelor's program, the master's degree programme concept and the existing framework and support options make it absolutely feasible to study. The course of studies and the modules are structured in a transparent and coherent way. The study contents are suitable to fulfill the objectives of the study programme. The visible scientific-research orientation of the program should be emphasized. The content and sequence of the programme as well as the practical parts of the studies and examinations are regulated in a differentiated manner and are represented in individual study plans of the students. The student workload is identified and defined, and the weighting of the content is balanced.

However, it is not immediately clear to what extent the two profile directions offered ("profile direction" - 60 ECTS and "scientific and pedagogical direction" - 120 ECTS) are interrelated or can be differentiated. A clearer description of the purpose of the profiles would be desirable, particulary extent to which these advanced studies in the form of a master's program correspond to the requirements of the specific labor market and the intended areas of activity of the graduates. A more transparent differentiation and specification would also be useful with regards to the international connectivity and comparability of master's programs.

#### "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Bachelor)

The bachelor's degree program is coherently structured in terms of both content and structure. It enables the successful implementation of the three core objectives of its mission statement, namely the theoretical foundation of professional action, the promotion of practical skills and the development of practical competences in research. The consecutive study programby creates the prerequisites for admission to a master's program.

Tightly structured but efficient study modules impart subject-specific and interdisciplinary study content that enables qualified teacher training. They include seminars in developmental psy-chology, learning psychology, pedagogy, special needs education and subject didactics. The languages of teaching are Kazakh and Russian, but seminars are also offered in English to improve foreign language skills.

The learning content is competence-oriented and meets international standards. Active teaching and learning methods are already indicated with the modules, and numerous interactive tools are used in digital teaching. Students confirmed the dynamic course of the seminars and stated that they were actively involved in the seminar organization and discussions.



The distribution and weight of ECTS credits is transparent and appropriate.

Several compulsory internships, which enable students to gain initial experience in their future professional field, are secured by numerous contractual agreements between the university and regional schools. University lecturers and experienced teachers supervise students closely and give them regular feedback during the individual internships. In addition, students receive methodological handouts for orientation, which they find very helpful. The number of ETCS credits to be acquired through the internship is appropriate in relation to the total number of ETCS credits allocated.

The university maintains intensive contact with the primary schools in the region. The university consults with the potential employers about educational goals and content as well as a possible improvement in the quality of education. After consultation in various committees, the university incorporates new impulses into the study programme, including in the form of optional seminars. The prospects for graduates to be employed in the teaching profession are very good.

The students receive sufficient support from the university and - not least due to the comparatively small course size and targeted individual support. For international students, the structure can initially seem somewhat unclear, but any initial difficulties this group may have should be solved in the short term thanks to the logical and well-planned coordination of the courses and the direct contact opportunities provided.

After the initial accreditation, the study programmes were thoroughly revised and further adapted to the European standards. The university's achievements in internationalization are already evident, and the ongoing efforts towards further internationalization are highly visible. International standards are applied to research work. A newly developed subject, "Internationalization", focuses on the educational systems of other countries. Students improve their English skills in several courses. Subject literature is increasingly available to the students not only in Russian, but also in English and often in digitalized form. Students have free access to international databases, including the Scopus database.

The study program fully reflects the four purposed of higher education of the Council of Europe.

#### "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (Master)

The study programme builds on the knowledge and competencies students acquired in their bachelor's degree. As all other programmes, this programme is offed in two directions: scientific and pedagogical and profile directions. The two directions differ in terms of duration of study, ECTS credits and the curriculum. For the peer review experts, the information provided in the self-evaluation report and study programme documents did not sufficiently present the



differences between the two directions. The experts would encourage the university to more clearly present the information about the programme directions, especially in the light of possible further internalization and attracting foreign students to the university. The structure and differences though clear to the students and local labour market, might not be so clear to someone not familiar with the Kazakh education system and the HEI.

Nevertheless, the expert group considers the objectives and learning outcomes of the programme as adequate. Graduates are well-prepared for the requirements of the labour market, as well as continuing their studies on PhD level. The structure of the programme is suitable to meet the defined objectives.

Students receive continuous support from the teaching staff, not only during the learning process, but also during the internships.

The study programme reflects the four purpose of higher education of the Council of Europe.

#### "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" (PhD)

Considering the qualification requirements for graduate education, the PhD programme aims to train highly qualified young researchers for research activities in the field of primary education. The PhD students are qualified for professional pedagogical work in educational institutions, the administration and the universities of the country, and an academic career is possible. An appropriate curriculum design ensures that the high demands of the programme can be successfully met. The study programme outlined enables students to achieve both the individual qualification objectives and the overall objective.

A central component of the PhD programme is the research-oriented work of the students. In seminars, for example on writing scientific papers or on pedagogical research methods, students are familiarised with the requirements of doctoral research. Students design and conduct their own research projects under scientific guidance and present them internationally.

Despite the very detailed structure of the degree programme and the high workload due to the requirements for the publication of scientific papers, students noted that they have enough room for their own personal and scientific development. In combination with the high motivation of the students the remarkable results are achieved. The research papers described and in part presented to the peer review experts focus on issues in the future field of work. They combine theoretical knowledge with practical experience and have a direct reference to practice.

As part of the internationalisation process, students are expected to have a very good command of English. The university offers special summer courses to support this. Research stays in other countries are encouraged by the university management and are coordinated and



financially supported by an International Centre at the university, which offers various programmes such as ErasmusPlus. Some PhD students write their dissertations in English. The peer review experts have an impression that the university has already made significant improvements regarding the development of foreign language competence and the internationalisation of the degree programmes. The peer review experts therefore strongly recommend the university to continue further internalization including expanding student and teacher mobility.

#### 2.3 Conclusion

#### The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Peer review experts make following recommendations:

- The university should clearly present the structure of the study programmes, for example in form of a study plan which includes information such mandatory and/or optional modules, ECTS credits, forms of examination and teaching.
- Internationalization including student and teacher mobility should be further expanded and supported.

# 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.

#### 3.1 Implementation

Student-centered learning is implemented at the university through numerous ways: involvement of the students in the development of the study programmes, option of choosing multilingual education, system for evaluating students' knowledge, possibility of appeals by students, supporting students' sense of autonomy, guidance of the students in determining educational trajectory under the guidance of the experienced mentor and use of new educational technologies.

Since 2017-2018, multilingual education in the bachelor's degree programmes "Pedagogy and psychology" and "Pre-school education and upbringing" is conducted. Multilingual education is offered only to full-time students. Students are selected among first-year students based on their level of English. The list of disciplines taught in Kazakh, Russian and English is determined.

The university tries to attract foreign lecturers who can teach in a foreign language. Language training is provided not only in classes, but also through participation in additional English



courses and summer schools. Students of multilingual groups and teachers take free language courses organized by the Center for Continuing Education and Continuing Education.

Distance learning technologies are used in the educational process. For the organization of the educational process on remote educational technologies, ZhSU has created an information and educational portal providing students with educational and methodological, organizational and administrative information which allows them to receive and transmit information in accessible forms, including on-line consultations and off-line interaction.

The educational process makes use of electronic textbooks, computer training programs, multimedia technologies, and video lectures. Teachers implement teaching methods such as business and role-playing games, trainings, discussions, brainstorming, situational tasks, slide show design, and case methods. When conducting practical training, the faculty actively uses monitoring and training technologies, and electronic training manuals.

Teachers successfully use methods and techniques for developing students ' critical thinking, including working in small groups, educational strategy "Logbook", "Fishbone", Clusters, comparative charts, puzzles, Insert, SWOT analysis, round table, business game, debates, psychological training, Bar Camp, Intelligence map, building a scale of opinions.

The University considers situations such as absence from classes and/or failure to appear for the exam for reasons of health, participation in national and (or) events of cultural or sports direction etc. In this case, the student's justification documents are registered, and access is opened in the electronic journal for issuing points for missed classes. In this case, the teacher's journal reflects the reason why mitigating circumstances were considered.

The procedure for appealing exam results is developed and described in the University's Academic policy.

#### 3.2 Assessment

The teaching and learning methods offered at the university are, in the view of the peer experts, sufficiently diverse and offer the possibility of an appropriate performance role. Particularly noteworthy are the university's digital equipment and its digital offerings to students. A central quality management system is used to continuously review the teaching and learning methods that are discussed in various council committees. Students are organised in a self-governing way in the student council of ZhSU. They can contribute their perspective to the development of teaching through their involvement in the academic council and by being invited to attend meetings of the executive board. This is particularly encouraged. Their suggestions and wishes are discussed at various levels. Teaching quality is additionally promoted through compulsory participation in continuing education courses for teaching staff.



The examination system is predominantly based on state requirements. The assessment methods are clearly indicated via the students' personalised learning portal. For the purposes of internationalisation, it would be desirable to specify the respective forms of examination in the module handbook, as well as a uniform and clearer presentation of the credit points to be earned both online and offline. Learning success is ensured by weekly performance assessments (online and offline, only in the bachelor's degree programmes). In addition, there are two intermediate examinations each semester, which serve as admission to the final examination. The initial impression that the examination load is overall quite high, especially in the bachelor's degree programmes, was however refuted by the students in the interview. They perceive the weekly performance assessments as self-monitoring of their own performance. Students can repeat exams and compensate for justified absences during the summer school in the semester break. Students can express their concerns or problems regarding examinations at various levels.

The grades are accumulated from performances and examinations during the semester and the final examinations. It is not immediately clear from the module descriptions to what extent the various forms of examination (oral, written, multiple-choice, etc.) are adapted to the learning objectives of the respective module. This may be due to the fact that the forms of current examinations and interim examinations often depend on the specifics of the discipline and are continuously adapted to current developments in consultation with the stakeholders. A stronger emphasis on competence orientation in the examination formats would nevertheless be desirable in the future.

PhD students are provided with a comprehensive range of support services that are widely accepted. Overall, it can be stated that the university provides close personal support to students. Support for PhD students is focused on publishing their own research and motivating them to conduct international research. The expansion of the international profile represents the greatest development of the university in comparison to the previous accreditation. The continuously high graduation rate with above-average grades in the face-to-face degree programmes should be emphasised. Although a slight downward trend can be observed in recent years, this results from a revision of the study programme after the previous accreditation.

Overall, taking into consideration the documentation the HEI provided as well as the interviews conducted with the representatives of the HEI, the peer review experts conclude that students take an active role in creating learning process, student-centred learning and teaching takes into consideration the diversity of students and their needs and a variety of pedagogical methods are implemented and evaluated.



# 3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

# 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

# 4.1 Implementation

The university regulations on admission rules were developed on the basis of Standard rules for admission to education organizations that implement educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with sub-paragraph 11) of article 5 of The law "On education", have been approved.

The formation of the student contingent of ZhSU is carried out through budget financing, placement of the state educational order for training specialists (educational grants), as well as payment for training at the expense of individuals ' own funds and other sources.

Admission of applicants to the bachelor's degree is carried out on their applications on a competitive basis in accordance with the points of the certificate issued by the results of the unified national testing or comprehensive testing. Citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, foreign citizens with secondary General, primary professional (technical and professional), secondary professional (post-secondary) and higher education are admitted to ZhSU for bachelor's degree programs.

Persons who have received a certificate of award of an educational grant, submit an application for admission and are enrolled to the university by order of the rector of the University.

Applicants who pay the tuition fee must score at least 50 points, and in the field of education "Pedagogical Sciences" - at least 60 points, including at least 5 points-in the history of Kazakhstan, mathematical literacy, reading literacy – the language of instruction, and at least 5 points for each profile subject in the unified national testing. Both students receiving state education grant and on paid basis should pass a Psychotest.

Admission of persons to master's and doctoral studies is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of comprehensive testing or entrance exams. Acceptance of applications for master's degree is carried out by the admission Committee of ZhSU through the information system. Applicants need to pass a comprehensive test consisting of a foreign language test (English, German, French), a test for the profile of the study programme group, and a test to determine readiness for training in Kazakh or Russian.



Admission requirements to the PhD programme are completed master's degree, at least one year of work experience and an international certificates confirming their foreign language proficiency in accordance with the common European competences (standards) of foreign language proficiency.

Students are provided with guidebooks during the period of admission to ZhSU. The handbook contains information about the university, the basic principles of credit technology, the rules of registration for the discipline, transfer from course to course, restoration to study, etc. The student service center provides the necessary information to students (certificates, statements, etc.) and carries out the processes of transferring, restoration to study, etc.

An internal online portal includes information about the current monitoring of students 'knowledge, students' attendance, the distribution of grants, and the distribution of places in hostels.

Registration Office monitors the current student performance in all disciplines and sends it to the departments, where further work is carried out to analyze student performance and provide academic assistance to underperforming students.

The university has a portal of distance education and an electronic journal of quality control of students' knowledge. The university publishes schedule of classroom lessons for students and teachers.

The procedures for accepting students from other universities, transferring the credits they have mastered are described in detail in the academic policy of the university and the Regulation "On transfers, deductions and restorations, the provision of academic leave" of the QMS of ZhSU, as well as posted on the university website under the heading "Translation, restoration, expulsion: what is important for the student to know".

The organization of final certification of students is carried out in accordance with the "Standard rules for conducting current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students in higher education institutions". In 2014, ZhSU developed the Regulation "On the procedure for completing the diploma Supplement" dated September 11, 2014, which was reissued in the 2018-2019 academic year. The diploma Supplement does not replace the main document on higher education and does not give any rights to formal recognition of the original diploma by the authorized bodies of other countries.

#### 4.2 Assessment

The university has implemented clear rules and procedures for ensuring the consistent development of the academic career of the students and their progress along the educational trajectory.



Admission requirements at ZhSU are clearly defined in the opinion of the peer review experts. Studyability is ensured by considering the desired entry qualifications, as the curriculum builds on these and develops and deepens all areas of competence accordingly in the courses. For those students who come from other universities with a relevant degree, there are corresponding recognition rules, whereby this also includes the possibility of obtaining missing qualifications or their proof in certain courses within the framework of a larger ECTS credits allocation.

The admission requirements, the course and compulsory subject designations are set by the state. The additional test for the necessary command of the foreign language relevant to the Master and PhD study programme seems appropriate and suitable. The selection procedures appear adequate. Overall, the entrance requirements are assessed as adequate. Admissions rules and requirements are approved and published.

The main tool for informing students of the procedures regulating their learning life cycle is the official website of the university, automated information system, personal profile and university services, which students can use to find out the information that interests them. Departments receive data on the progression of the students. The data is discussed during the meetings and necessary measures are taken.

Curators and advisers are assigned to the students who starting from the first year of training, regularly interact with students on the organization of training.

Students receive sufficiently informative graduation documents including state diploma with an attachment and a Diploma Supplement.

#### 4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

# 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff

#### 5.1 Implementation

Teaching staff is formed in accordance with national laws and regulations. The university has a competitive Commission that considers candidates for vacant faculty and researcher positions. The formation of the teaching staff is based on the analysis of the needs of the study programme. The qualification of teachers and their quantitative composition correspond to the areas of training of bachelor, master, PhD and meet the licensing requirements.

Announcements about the competition for vacant positions of teaching staff are published in the national media and on the University's website. Appointment of the teaching staff is carried



out based on the decision of the departments, as well as by a secret ballot of the competition Commission. Ballots and minutes of the counting Commission are sealed and stored in the personnel service safe. The Department of personnel management of the University deals with the selection of personnel, registration of their admission, relocation and dismissal, and preparation of documents for approval in the positions of employees.

At the beginning of the academic year, the Academic Council annually reviews and approves intra-University criteria that apply to the competitive replacement of positions of full-time teachers.

Regulations on structural divisions and job descriptions for all employees of the University have been developed and approved. Description of tasks, requirements, and guidelines of the positions are available.

The professional development of the faculty is coordinated by the Vice-rector for academic Affairs. Professional development plans are developed for the teaching staff for each year. ZhSU provides advanced training of scientific and pedagogical staff in the following areas. It includes multi-level-long-term professional development program and international programs, training in structural divisions of other universities, state-accredited academic institutions or organizations that have a license to conduct educational activities in the field of education, internships in the framework of multilateral cooperation of ZhSU with leading enterprises and research institutes and training in internal training courses and seminars etc.

Research work of the faculty of pedagogy and psychology is carried out in accordance with the developed thematic research plans. The faculty participates in the implementation of funded research projects. The university and the faculty participate in the implementation of budget-based basic research funded by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The results of research work of the faculty of pedagogy and psychology are communicated to the general public through publications in various scientific publications of the university itself (Bulletin of ZhSU, collections of scientific papers and conference materials) and in scientific journals of the leading universities in Kazakhstan, foreign countries, academic publications, and international scientific publications. The faculty pays special attention to modern requirements for scientific results in the form of publications in rating publications with a non-zero impact factor and in publications included in the databases of international publishing centers.

#### 5.2 Assessment

The university management and the teaching staff expressed common wish to further develop internationality. Since the last accreditation, the university has come much closer to this goal. Even the difficulties caused by the pandemic could not slow down the enthusiasm and the will



for further development. Nevertheless, the lecturers still see room for improvement in international cooperation in teaching and research and expressed the wish to expand and deepen the already existing international contacts, to participate more frequently in international subject didactic congresses and to exchange ideas with representatives of professional research on the teaching profession. In doing so, they seem to particularly strive for an orientation towards Europe. The already existing close contact and exchange with 55 universities, including universities in the USA and Canada, but especially in Russia, Bulgaria, Turkey, Poland and others, is maintained.

For lecturers, a one-month research stay abroad is financed every year. In addition, the university management also promotes digital exchange and joint digital courses with partner universities. Since the last accreditation, lecturers also frequently publish in English.

The quality of teaching is continually improved using innovative teaching methods. The teachers receive support from the university in acquiring and developing new didactic-methodical methods and technologies (currently e.g. distance learning) through appropriate further training programmes. The existing quality management strives to improve individual teaching competence, considering the specific requirements of the various disciplines, but so far it seems to function according to a rather hierarchical principle and is primarily oriented towards comparison, less towards counselling lecturers.

Evaluation results are not only communicated to the teachers, but also discussed in committee meetings. They form the basis of far-reaching decisions regarding the continued employment of lecturers or the award of bonuses.

In accordance with their job description, the lecturers conduct their own research and constantly initiate new projects, such as inclusive education (both with regard to the students at their university and within the framework of the bachelor's degree programme "Primary education pedagogy and methodology" with courses on "Inclusive Education"). The Ministry is currently funding various research projects, including international ones, such as a project to research teacher professionalism, together with a Turkish university. With other large-scale innovation and research projects, the university is also seeking additional financial support from the Ministry of Education.

The significantly larger staff resources compared to German universities, for example, ensure a good supervision ratio and close contact with the students. The faculty and students repeatedly emphasise this as an important pillar of education.

Teachers' salaries have increased by 55% in the last three years, and foreign language teaching is subsidised. Necessary health care measures for lecturers are financed by the university.



Regarding support for lecturers with physical disabilities, the university complies with ministerial requirements. For example, there are wheelchair accessible ramps and parking spaces for the disabled near the entrance. The university uses software for the visually impaired.

### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

### 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

### 6.1 Implementation

The university has three educational buildings, training and a laboratory complex, a library, a military department, two dormitories, a training camp, sports and educational training ground and a stadium. There are four medical centers at the university. The educational process is implemented in 173 seminar rooms, including 25 educational and scientific laboratories, 26 computer classes, 2 multimedia classes, 4 language laboratories, 6 reading rooms, etc., where 44 interactive whiteboards are installed.

The university has 26 computer classes, 9 of which are equipped with the latest computers, 20 eight-core computers in a set, 11 Macintosh monoblocks, 1 high-resolution interactive wall, a tutorial class equipped with computers and other information and communication tools designed to implement distance learning technologies.

The faculty of pedagogy and psychology have following training laboratories; practical psychology, self-knowledge lab, psychological and pedagogical laboratory of the updated content of education, laboratory of informatization of primary education, primary education laboratory, laboratory preschool childhood, laboratory speech therapy, laboratory special education, Informatization of special education.

The research work of students is carried out on the basis of the Scientific and Methodological Center for the updated content of education at the Faculty of Pedagogy and Psychology.

The university is equipped with modern hardware and software. The university has created a developed information infrastructure, including structured regulatory, educational, scientific, reference and other information. The department of development and implementation of information systems created the digital university SmartZhetysu. The unified information system



includes the Information and Program Complex (IPC) "Administrator", IPC "Admission Commission", IPC "Chair", IPC "Computer Testing", IPC "Student's Study", IPC "Employee's Office", software (software) "Curator", identification cards of students and employees.

The university library provides access to scientific electronic publications of Thomson Reuters, to full-text articles of journals of Springer, Elsevier, Scopus, and Polpred.com databases. In addition to electronic databases, a library of educational and scientific literature on electronic media is available in the library. The library provides access to domestic databases. As of November 29, 2019, the general fund of the library amounted to 564,243 copies, including 20,083 in the Kazakh language, 344,829 in Russian and 19,331 in foreign languages, the AIA - 4,017 copies.

The library has two reading rooms with 176 seats capacity, two computer classes, electronic information rooms that are equipped with new furniture, television equipment, office equipment, so students can receive services, such as "Internet", "Electronic textbooks", television training.

The financial strategy of the university is based on the legislative and regulatory requirements of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university has an independent balance and carries out financial and economic activities according to the University Development Plan, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The university has a student service center, a youth affairs committee, a youth center, a department for the formation of contingent and employment of graduates, a department for educational and social work, a sports club, interest clubs and a single Anti-Corruption Council operate. University has several dining rooms. The university currently has 2 student dormitories with 524 beds.

The goal of academic mobility of students and teachers is to integrate the university into the international educational space through the use of innovative, global educational resources and borrowing the best teaching methods and practices. Study programmes intensified work on the implementation of students' academic mobility. Agreements were concluded and mobility of students and undergraduates with foreign universities was established: University of Genoa (Genoa, Italy); Corvinus University (Budapest, Hungary); Lodz University of Technology (Lodz, Poland); Tallinn Technical University (Tallinn, Estonia).

Within the framework of internal academic mobility, students and undergraduates of the faculty can study at 26 universities of Kazakhstan.

The University has a recreation area on the shores of Lake Balkhash with a total area of 15,000 square meters, including the area of residential buildings 275.6 square meters; sports camp "Karlygash" with a total area of 6100 square meters with residential summer houses, where



practical and field classes in biology, geography, tourism, initial military training and cultural events are held.

The university has a department which supports employment of graduates. One of the main tasks of the department is to promote the effective employment of ZhSU graduates through vocational guidance, providing information on the labour market and job prospects, establishing long-term partnerships with enterprises, organizations and other employers.

#### 6.2 Assessment

The peer-review experts are convinced that the financial resources ensured for the entire accreditation period. Additionally, the ZhSU is seeking further funding from state agencies, but can provide sufficient resources without this. The equipment and material resources can be assessed as adequate. Due to the Covid-19 pandemic, the facilities could only be inspected via specially produced promotional videos of the university. Nevertheless, the peer review experts concluded that they are available and sufficiently equipped. The university's technical equipment deserves special emphasis. Through the introduction of a high-performance broadband connection, all areas now have fast access to the internet. Subject literature is provided by the university. There is no official procedure for students to suggest literature, but subject literature can be suggested to the teaching staff and acquired after discussion.

The university pays much attention to the development of administrative structures to support students. The supporting structures carry out systematic and consistent work with students, both in academic and extra-curricular activities, providing the conditions for learning and supporting personal development.

Student mobility is not envisaged in the bachelor's and master's degree programmes but is expressly encouraged. Relevant support offices exist where interested students can obtain comprehensive information. The university has a sufficiently large network of partner universities and is clearly motivated to continually expand it. Mobility is particularly encouraged for PhD students. In terms of internationalisation outside the Russian-speaking countries, it would be desirable to adapt the website and the information offered there to meet the requirements even more.

## 6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.



### 7.1 Implementation

Study programmes at ZhSU are developed in accordance with the needs of the Almaty region and the Republic of Kazakhstan as a whole. The degree programmes are aimed at meeting the needs of society with human and scientific resources that have a high professional level and moral qualities of a person in the context of integration into the world of the educational, scientific and information community.

According to the self-evaluation report, the university has implemented a system for collecting, analysing, and evaluating information, which include key performance indicators (KPI) of the departments and faculties. The data is used to rank the best performing departments and faculties. The university analyses the structure of the student body in the context of specialties and training courses, students' academic performance, their success, and the proportion of expelled students. This information is discussed at the meetings of departments, councils of faculties, Educational and methodical council and Academic Board of the university. Periodic assessment of students' satisfaction with study programmes and disciplines is regularly carried out by means of sociological research, meetings of students with university managerial personnel, meetings of the youth affairs committee, and the council of curators. Periodic assessment of satisfaction of teaching staff, employees with working conditions, management system, available resources, assessment of the availability of resources for training and student support is carried out through surveying teaching staff and students. Questionnaire results are discussed at the meetings of the Academic Board and if necessary, improvements are implemented. The university stays in contact with the graduates and monitors their careers. A survey of graduates is conducted to collect and summarize information about their employment. This information is used for improving study programmes.

Information about the results of the current control, intermediate certification and final evaluation is displayed on the University's website, which ensures transparency of the process of monitoring and evaluating students' knowledge.

The university systematically collects data on the employment of the graduates.

An annual survey "Satisfaction of employers with the quality of graduate training" is conducted among employers.

#### 7.2 Assessment

The procedures for collecting and analysing information on study programmes and other activities are adequate. The university has implemented a system for collecting, analysing, and evaluating information, which is carried out by the Center for Strategic Planning and Quality



Management of the university. Following data is collected: key performance indicators, information about the body of students, level of academic achievements, students' achievements etc.

The Center conducts and analyses sociological surveys of students, teaching staff, administration, and employers. There are seven types of questionnaires, which are available online.

The peer review experts consider that students and employers are sufficiently involved in providing the information on study programmes. Nevertheless, the results of student surveys as well as subsequent follow-up actions could be communicated more transparently and visibly.

## 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

### 8.1 Implementation

The university has online resources for providing information to all interested stakeholders. The official website of the university includes information on the structure and activities of the entire university, the mission of the university and objectives in the field of education and research.

The university website provides all necessary information to applications, students, teachers, employees, external stakeholders etc.

The main sources of information about the implementation of the mission, goals and objectives of the University are published materials about activities in the media and news feeds (e.g. "Khabar", "Kazakhstan", "ZHETYSU"), the Internet (the University's website: zhgu.edu.kz, so-cial networks), in printed publications such as "Kazakhstanskaya Pravda", "Egemen Kazakhstan", "Modern education", "Higher education in Kazakhstan. Accreditation and nostrification", "Zhetysu" and "Alatau Lights".

The University has a media center, whose main task is to form a positive public opinion about the University and improve the image of the University through the media.

More than 50 information about the University is available on the electronic sites "Taldykorgan online", "Egemen KZ", "Law KZ", "Bnews", "Tengri news", "Kazakparat", "Kazinform", "Nur KZ" and social networks Facebook, Instagram



The university publishes once a month the Almaty regional socio-political youth newspaper "ZHETISU Universiteti".

## 8.2 Assessment

ZhSU has online resources for providing information about the relevant activities including study programmes in three languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English). The main source of informing the public about the activities of the ZhSU is a university website. The website clearly reflects the mission, goals and objectives of the university. Information on the scientific and educational nature, history, achievements of the university and its structure are also described. Additionally, the university has Media Centre which main aim is to form a positive public opinion about the university.

All relevant information is accessible to students, prospective students, graduates, other stakeholders and the public (e.g. their activities, including the programs they offer and the selection criteria for them, the in-tended learning outcomes of these programs, the qualifications they award, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used the pass rates and the learning opportunities). Some parts of site are available in Russian/ Kazakh only (admission and education are available in English). Information is up-to-date and mostly transparent.

To raise attractiveness of study programmes to foreign students, the information provided in English language including curriculum structure, module descriptions, forms of examination etc. should be more accessible and transparent.

#### 8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

#### 9.1 Implementation

Updating of the content of the study programmes is carried out annually on the basis of proposals from employers, students and teaching staff. Changing the structure of the study programme is carried out as amendments to legislative and regulatory acts.

The department of testing and monitoring of the university annually conducts questionnaires of the employers. Employers ' Councils have been established at the faculties.



The modular educational programmes are updated when the requirements for a specialist change, changes in technologies and labour organization.

Sociological survey are conducted on a voluntary basis and anonymously. Students ' questions, suggestions and suggestions received after the surveys are considered by the management, discussed and analysed at various levels (advisors-Department-Dean's office – Vicerector-rector), and then appropriate decisions are made. The results of the survey are brought to the structural divisions of the university and are considered by departments when developing working curriculum, modules, and professional competencies. Among the issues discussed by the students, organization and conducting of educational and industrial practices, educational process, methods and technology of education and socially-household questions – accommodation, leisure activities, food etc.

ZhSU annually holds meetings of the rector with the active student community, including members of the Committee for youth Affairs, heads of academic groups.

#### 9.2 Assessment

All study activities of the study programmes being assessed are subject to continuous evaluation. The results of student surveys on the quality of learning activities are analysed and, for teachers, the data are considered in the university-wide ranking. This rating is published on the intranet of the university. The good results lead to financial rewards, i.e. teachers who show a good result receive a financial incentive. In case of possible poor survey results, the university reacts by not extending the contract with a given teacher.

Evaluation surveys are not carried out in the same way at the university for all training activities, but there are common elements regarding counselling, supervision, and didactics.

The evaluation questionnaires that were provided to the expert group have three from four possible answers a more positive characteristics and only one that has more negative characteristic. Expert group would suggest making Likert scale in the evaluation questionnaire more balanced, so that the probability of the response distribution is not distorted.

In addition to evaluating the quality of the courses, general satisfaction surveys with the quality of teaching and the learning situation are conducted on an ongoing basis.

Students' suggestions and wishes are discussed in the university administration at various structural levels (counsellors, department, dean, vice-rector and rector) and then appropriate measures are taken. They have an impact on the development of curricula, modules and the definition of teaching competences.

In addition to student surveys, employer surveys are conducted. The average results of their surveys indicate a very high degree of satisfaction with the quality of graduate education.



All suggestions of students and other stakeholders are reflected in the minutes of the expanded meeting of the departments, changes introduced are reflected in the study programmes, catalogue of elective subjects and the learning and methodical materials for the subject. Proposals concerning the work of support services are sent to the relevant structural units of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report, the results of the meetings with students and teaching staff showed that the departments monitor, regularly assess, and revise the study programme strategy with regards to the requirements and recommendations of the Ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, students, and other stakeholders.

Thus, the monitoring, regular evaluation and revision of the study programmes allows the staff of the ZhSU to adjust study programmes in a timely manner, taking into account the achievements of modern science, the trends of change in the labour market, thus, ensuring the training of competitive professionals.

#### 9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

## 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

# Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis

#### 10.1 Implementation

The university regularly participates in cyclical external quality assurance. All study programmes at the ZhSU are accredited by national or international accreditation agencies. ZhSU regulary undergoes institutional accreditation.

The university takes into consideration recommendations and remarks made during the previous accreditation. Necessary changes and improvements are implemented upon consulting with relevant stakeholders.

## 10.2 Assessment

ZhSU participates in cyclical external quality assurance that takes account, relevant, of the requirements of Kazakhstan's the legislative framework and European Standards and Guidelines.

The university carries out procedures for the accreditation of study programmes through national and foreign accreditation agencies and publishes information on accredited study pro-



grammes on its webpage. The Center for Strategic Planning and Quality Management is responsible for coordinating accreditations. Also, the university regularly goes through institutional accreditation procedure.

#### 10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



## IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

## 1 Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version

The study programmes "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences), "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences" were assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG), the Salzburg Recommendations and the national regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled in study programmes "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences).

The expert group concludes that the **Salzburg Recommendations** 1 (Research as the basis and the difference), 2 (Critical mass and critical diversity), 3 (Recruitment, admission and status), 4 (Supervision), 5 (Outcomes), 6 (Career development), 7 (Credits), 8 (Quality and accountability), 9 (Internationalisation), 10 (Funding) 11 (Autonomy), 12 (Legal framework) and 13 (Intersectoral collaboration) are fulfilled in study programmes "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences) and "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences)".

## 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend accreditation without conditions of study programmes "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences), "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences), "Pedagogy and



Psychology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences/Master of Pedagogical Sciences/Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences)".

The peer-review experts propose the following recommendations:

#### **General recommendations**

- 1. The university should clearly present the structure of the study programmes, for example in form of a study plan which includes information such as ECTS credits, form of exam and learning, optional or mandatory module.
- 2. Internationalization including student and teacher mobility should be further expanded and supported.



### V Decision of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statement of the Higher Education Institution, the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN decided unanimously on its meeting on 28 June 2021:

General recommendations

- The university should clearly present the structure of the study programmes, for example in form of a study plan which includes information such as ECTS credits, form of exam and learning, optional or mandatory module.
- Internationalization including student and teacher mobility should be further expanded and supported.

#### "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

"Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Pre-school Education and Upbringing" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

#### "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

#### "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

"Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Primary Education Pedagogy and Methodology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2026.



## "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Bachelor of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

"Pedagogy and Psychology" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Master of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2028.

### "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences)

The study programme "Pedagogy and Psychology" (Doctor of Pedagogical Sciences) is accredited without any conditions.

The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2027.