

Accreditation Report

Caspian University

Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan

**Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor),
Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor), Private Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD),
Public Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD), Public Finance (Bachelor), Corporate Finance
(Bachelor), Financial Risk-Management (Master), Finance (PhD)**

I. Procedure

Initial accreditation of the study programmes: from 31 March 2016 to 30 September 2021
by ACQUIN; provisional accreditation: until 30 September 2022

Date of contract: 22 June 2021

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 8 March 2022

Date of online visit: 4-6 April 2022

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Jasmine Rudolph, Yuliya Balakshiy

Accreditation decision: 22 July 2022

Peer review experts:

- **Professor Dr. Georg Gesk**, Chair for Chinese Law, Faculty of Law, University of Osnabrück, Germany
- **Professor Dr. Thomas Schomerus**, Professorship for Public Law, in particular, Energy and Environmental Law, Leuphana University Luneburg, Germany
- **Professor Dr. Dr. Thomas Gergen**, Professor of Civil & Business Law, spec: Intellectual Property Law, Director Research Unit IP: Basics & applications, Institut Supérieur de l'Économie Université Luxembourg, Luxembourg
- **Professor Yernar Nurlanovich Begaliyev, PhD**, Academy of Law Enforcement Agencies under the General Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Kazakhstan

- **Milan Nicholas Grammerstorf**, Law (state examination) at Bielefeld University and Business Administration (B.Sc.) at RWTH Aachen University, Germany
- **Professor Dr. Klaus Schäfer**, Chair of Business Administration I (Finance and Banking), University of Bayreuth, Germany
- **Professor Dr. Gulmira Yessenova**, Dean of the Faculty of Business and Information Technology, Turan-Astana University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan
- **Professor Dr. Andreas Knabe**, Holder of the Chair of Finance, Faculty of Economics and Management, Otto von Guericke University Magdeburg, Germany
- **Michael Spaeth**, Executive Director of OOO PSI Moscow, Division Manager at PSI Software AG, Berlin, Germany
- **Adiya Smakova**, Student of Finance (B.A.), Kazakh-German University (DKU), Kazakhstan

The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of the study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)¹ in the current official version. Additionally, the Salzburg Recommendations are considered for PhD study programmes. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.

¹ http://www.enqa.eu/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/ESG_2015.pdf

Content

I.	Procedure	1
II.	Introduction	5
	Short profile of HEI	5
	General information on the study programmes	7
	Results of the previous accreditation	13
III.	Implementation and assessment of the criteria	16
	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance	16
	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes	22
	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment	34
	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification	39
	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff	42
	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support	46
	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management	49
	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information	52
	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes	54
	ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance	57
IV.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	60
1.	Assessment of compliance with the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the current official version	60
2.	Accreditation Recommendation	63
V.	Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	66

II. Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students for participating in the discussions and willingly sharing information and their views during the on-site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

The evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the on-site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head(s) of the study programme(s), study programme(s) coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and alumni.

The main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as the main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedures. In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts has been appointed to ensure that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g., legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria are considered. The peer-review expert panel includes professors, representatives of the professional practice, and a student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme(s).

Short profile of HEI

One of the top interdisciplinary institutions in the country, the Caspian University educates highly skilled, sought-after professionals who are in demand on the republican job market in a variety of industries, including law, engineering, and technology. The main objective of the Caspian University is to train competitive specialists who are focused on implementing the national programme for the advancement of science and education in the Republic of Kazakhstan within the framework of the innovative development of the country and who have the professional skills tailored to what is required on the job market.

The Caspian Public University was established in 1992 as a Kazakhstani private institution of higher learning in Almaty. The university underwent a restructuring in 1995 to become the Kazakhstan Institute of Economics and Law. The institution changed its status and was given the new name Caspian University eight years later. The Club of the Rectors of Europe CRE and the University of Oxford presented Caspian University with the European Quality Award

in 2007. The first and only Kazakh-Korean Small and Medium Business Center was established here in 2014. Out of 360 nominations, the Yu.G. Basin Law Clinic won a grant from the Foundation of the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2014 for its social initiative.

The Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA), the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), as well as the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Atameken) conduct ratings of educational institutions on an annual basis. The institution has been ranked among the top 20 interdisciplinary universities of Kazakhstan for the last five years.

There are seven academic institutions within the Caspian University. They are the Caspian International School of Medicine, the Caspian Business School, the Adilet High School of Law, the High School of Economics and Management, the High School of Humanitarian Sciences, the Academy of Civil Engineering, Architecture, and Design, as well as the Institute of Geology, Oil and Gas, and IT. The Caspian University offers training in 18 Bachelor, 6 Master, and 2 PhD major areas.

As of 01.10.21, there are a total of 3,699 students. In 2021, enrolment in the university educational programmes amounted to 1,834 students, an increase of 83 percent over the number of students enrolled in the same programmes during the previous academic year. As of 5.10.21, there are 267 instructors, 193 of them work full-time and 74 work part-time. There are 131 members of the administrative team.

In 2021, there were 1,126 graduates, which is a substantial increase of 34% over the academic year 2019-2020. Starting from 2021, the university graduates are awarded diplomas of the new design created by the university with unique QR codes and logos of the accreditation agencies.

General information on the study programmes

Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor), Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor), Private Law (Bachelor), Public Law (Bachelor)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	6B04218 Private Law 21/08/2019 6B04216 Public Law 21/08/2019 6B04217 Court and law enforcement 21/08/2019 6B04219 Jurisprudence (with deep study of the Chinese language and the law of the People's Republic of China) 21/08/2019
Faculty/department	Adilet Higher Law School
Standard period of study (semesters)	4 years (8 semesters)
Number of ECTS credits	276 ECTS
Number of study places	20-25 places each
Number of students currently enrolled	425 students Including 20 students 5B030100 Jurisprudence 156 students 6B04216 Public Law 193 students 6B04218 Private Law 25 students 6B04217 Court and law enforcement 31 students 6B04219 - Jurisprudence (with deep study of the Chinese language and the law of the People's Republic of China)
Average number of graduates per year	83 students
Target group(s)	The applicants holding certificates of secondary education, technical and vocational education, and higher education
Admission requirements	A certificate of secondary education or above, Unified National Testing
Form of study	Full-time, full-time with the use of distance educational technology
Tuition fee	Ranging from 380,000 to 988,000 tenge depending on the mode and regular study duration

Private Law (Master) and Public Law (Master)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	7M04239 Public Law (profile direction) 21/08/2019 7M04241 Private Law (profile direction) 21/08/2019 7M04240 Public Law (scientific and pedagogical direction) 21/08/2019 7M04242 Private Law (scientific and pedagogical direction) 21/08/2019
Faculty/department	Adilet Higher Law School
Standard period of study (semesters)	1 year (2 semesters) (profile direction) 2 year (4 semesters) (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Number of ECTS credits	70 ECTS (profile direction) 130 ECTS 7M04240 Public Law (scientific and pedagogical direction) 125 ECTS 7M04242 Private Law (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Number of study places	10 places each
Number of students currently enrolled	8 students (profile direction): 0 students 7M04239 Public Law 8 students 7M04241 Private Law 18 students (scientific and pedagogical direction): 5 students 7M04240 Public Law 13 students 7M04242 Private Law
Average number of graduates per year	8 (profile direction) 18 (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Target group(s)	The applicants holding a Bachelor or a comparative degree
Admission requirements	Entrance exam administered by the National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Form of study	Full-time
Tuition fee	890,000 tenge (profile direction) 790,000 tenge per year (scientific and pedagogical direction)

Public Law (PhD) and Private Law (PhD)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	8D04250 Public Law 21/08/2019 8D04251 Private Law 21/08/2019
Faculty/department	High School of Economics and Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	3 years of study (6 semesters)
Number of ECTS credits	206 ECTS 8D04250 Public Law 198 ECTS 8D04251 Private Law
Number of study places	5 per each
Number of students currently enrolled	10 students: 2 students 8D04250 Public Law 8 students 8D04251 Private Law
Average number of graduates per year	5
Target group(s)	Holders of master's degree
Admission requirements	Entrance exam administered by the National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Form of study	Full-time
Tuition fee	1,300,000 tenge per year

Public Finance (Bachelor) and Corporate Finance (Bachelor)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	5B050900 Finance 1/09/1996 6B04112 Public Finance 12/11/2019 6B04113 Corporate Finance 09/25/2019
Faculty/department	High School of Economics and Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	4 years (8 semesters)
Number of ECTS credits	240 ECTS
Number of study places	20 places each
Number of students currently enrolled	212 students Including 12 students in 5B050900 Finance 45 students in 6B04112 Public Finance 167 students 6B04113 Corporate Finance
Average number of graduates per year	54 students (for the period of 2016-2021)
Target group(s)	The applicants holding certificates of secondary education, technical and vocational education, and higher education
Admission requirements	A certificate of secondary education or above, Unified National Testing
Form of study	Full-time, full-time with the use of distance educational technology
Tuition fee	Ranging from 380,000 to 729,000 tenge depending on the mode and regular study duration

Financial Risk-Management (Master)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	7M04136 - Financial Risk Management (profile direction) 29/08/2019 7M04137 – Financial Risk Management (scientific and pedagogical direction) 11/09/2019
Faculty/department	High School of Economics and Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	1 year (2 semesters) (profile direction) 2 year (4 semesters) (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Number of ECTS credits	60 ECTS (profile direction) 120 ECTS (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Number of study places	5 places each
Number of students currently enrolled	5 students (profile direction) 9 students (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Average number of graduates per year	up to 5 graduates (for the period of 2016-2021) (profile direction) up to 7 graduates (for the period of 2016-2021) (scientific and pedagogical direction)
Target group(s)	The applicants holding a Bachelor or a comparative degree
Admission requirements	Entrance exam administered by the National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Form of study	Full-time
Tuition fee	840,000 tenge (profile direction) 750,000 tenge per year (scientific and pedagogical direction)

Finance (PhD)

Location	521 Seifullin Ave., Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan
Date of introduction	8D04149 Finance 21/08/2019
Faculty/department	High School of Economics and Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	3 years of study (6 semesters)
Number of ECTS credits	180 ECTS
Number of study places	5
Number of students currently enrolled	0
Average number of graduates per year	2 graduates (2016-2021)
Target group(s)	Holders of master's degree
Admission requirements	Entrance exam administered by the National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Form of study	Full-time
Tuition fee	1,300,000 tenge per year

Results of the previous accreditation

The *Jurisprudence (Bachelor/Master/PhD)* and *Finance (Bachelor/Master/PhD)* were assessed and accredited by ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 with the following conditions:

- The study programme documents must be revised with regard to the reporting of credit points according to the Kazakhstani system and ECTS. Mathematical errors, incorrect workload calculations, and conversions between the two systems must be corrected. In particular, the maximum allocation of 60 ECTS credits per academic year must be adhered to.
- For modules in which individual disciplines are combined, independent module descriptions must be created in which the overarching competence goals are described.

For further development of the study programmes, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The higher education institution should ensure the transparency of the performance levels of students and graduates in an appropriate manner. With the aim of linking up with international standards, it is recommended that the awarding of credit points be based on the current version of the ECTS Users' Guide.
- In order to better grasp scientific breakthroughs from a global perspective, students should get familiar with the literature in English during their studies. Support should be provided by offering English for Specific Purposes.
- Each year and mode of study should include a visual depiction that makes it apparent to students and prospective applicants which mandatory and compulsory elective disciplines must be studied at which points in the course of study.
- The university should examine whether further cooperation with foreign partner universities – in particular universities with courses taught in English – can be concluded in order to enable students to study abroad. Longer stays abroad should also be made possible.
- In the context of the internationalisation aim, study plans – including ECTS – should be transparently presented on the university webpage.

Jurisprudence (Bachelor)

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The title of the thesis and its grade should be included in the Diploma Supplement. An explanation of the GPA system should also be added.

- The specialisations in the course of study should not be shown separately in the Diploma Supplement, as the existing presentation gives the impression that specialisations could be chosen.

Jurisprudence (Master)

The following condition was stated based on the result of the assessment:

- The fourth semester's programme of study for the pedagogical-scientific master's in jurisprudence must be specified. The regular duration of study must be altered if course-work is consistently completed in the fifth and sixth semesters.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The title of the thesis and its grade should be included in the Diploma Supplement. An explanation of the GPA system should also be added.
- The composition and size of the modules should be reviewed.

Jurisprudence (PhD)

- The composition and size of the modules should be reviewed.

Finance (Bachelor)

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The title of the thesis and its grade should be included in the Diploma Supplement. An explanation of the GPA system should also be added.
- The range of courses should be examined so that, if necessary, training components that make the course of study more internationally compatible might replace elective disciplines.

Finance (Master)

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The title of the thesis and its grade should be included in the Diploma Supplement. An explanation of the GPA system should also be added.
- The range of courses should be examined so that, if necessary, training components that make the course more internationally compatible might replace elective disciplines.

- Research techniques should not only be taught in topic modules for the master's degree, but also as a separate course for scientific work procedures (development of a research question, research, citation, etc.).

Finance (PhD)

The following condition was stated based on the result of the assessment:

- The acquisition of theoretical and methodological skills by PhD candidates in pertinent courses at the university or elsewhere must be ensured.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:

- The range of courses should be examined so that, if necessary, training components that make the course more internationally compatible might replace elective disciplines.

A temporary accreditation was issued for the remedy of conditions until 31 December 2017. The conditions were fulfilled for all study programmes, and the accreditation was extended until September 30, 2021. Following the application for the reaccreditation, a provisional accreditation was granted valid until September 30, 2022.

III. Implementation and assessment of the criteria

ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes while involving external stakeholders.

Implementation

The Quality Assurance Policy outlines the standards for managing study programmes and is included in the work plans of all structural divisions, with all internal stakeholders accountable for quality at all levels of the operation at the Caspian University. The Quality Assurance Policy is published on the official website of the university. The academic policy, strategic objectives, purpose, and internal quality assurance policy standards are all taken into consideration while implementing the Quality Assurance Policy, which is a crucial part of the university strategic development plan.

The upgrading of the Quality Assurance Policy is an intrinsic part of the university development process; thus, the analysis and amendment of this document are done systematically. This factor is related to the rapidly changing needs of external and internal stakeholders, such as faculty, students, and employers, as well as various regulatory documents issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, national system documents, the Charter of the Caspian University, and the university academic policy.

The administration, faculty, and students have an active role in the formulation and support of the Quality Assurance Policy, as well as in the planning, development, and execution of all university procedures. The activity of its stakeholders is crucial to quality assurance policies. External stakeholders include the state, which regulates university activities normatively and legally, regional executive authorities and local self-government bodies; employers seeking qualified specialists, applicants selecting a university, local regional educational institutions of various types, and multiple public organisations unrelated to the education system, and university graduates.

The university structural division heads exemplify the organisation principles and guarantee that the desired outcomes are achieved. Quality assurance is an essential aspect of the university activities for all study programmes personnel and instructional staff. The quality assurance policy, university regulations and norms, and job descriptions reflect the duty of heads at all levels, including those responsible for guaranteeing the quality of specialist training. Job

descriptions and rules outline the activities, tasks, and responsibilities of the university structural units and personnel in terms of quality assurance. A clear duty matrix for administrative and instructional employees allows for greater efficiency in assuring the quality of the offered study programmes and the university day-to-day operation as a whole.

In accordance with the relevant regulations provided by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Caspian University in Almaty established a Quality Assurance Policy. The Mission and Strategy for 2014-2020, the Development Strategy for 2021-2025, approved by the decision of the Board of Studies No. 7 of February 24, 2021, as well as work plans of academic schools and the concept for educational programmes development, form the framework for long-term planning and strategic management. All of the above-listed documents are made accessible on the website of the university in three languages, Kazakh, Russian, and English.

November 25, 2020, the current version of the Quality Assurance Policy was approved by the decision of the board of studies, including the rector as chairman, vice-rectors, deans of academic schools (faculties), heads of structural units, representatives of the teaching staff, students, and public organisations. University employees and students were informed of the Policy.

The Quality Assurance Policy defines the principles for the management of the educational programmes and is reflected in the work plans of the university structural divisions. It is an integral part of the university strategic development plan. It is implemented in accordance with the mission, strategic goals, academic policy, and standards of the internal quality assurance policy. In particular, the mission of the university aims at training professional specialists demanded by the labour market.

The Caspian University is constantly updating the quality assurance policy as an integral process of university development, taking into account changing needs of stakeholders such as faculties, students, and employers, and considering various documents such as ministerial regulations and state programs. The documents with relevance for the internal quality assurance system are the Quality Assurance Policy, the University Academic Policy, regulations on the Academic Committee and on the Education Quality Monitoring Center, the Admission Rules, the MEP Passport, and the Corporate Culture Code Appendix.

The following institutions and persons are responsible for quality assurance: the university rector has delegated certain responsibilities to vice-rectors, such as the vice-rector for educational and methodological work who is in charge of planning academic activities, academic policies, and procedures for developing and monitoring educational programs. The vice-rector for strategic development and science is responsible for the university development strategy

and the administration of scientific activities. The vice-rector for academic development is responsible for the general administration of the university educational work and for international relations. Further tasks are performed by the heads of structural divisions, such as the deans, the deputy deans, and the leaders of educational track programs. For example, the latter is responsible for designing the concept for educational programme development, labour market study, programme curricula development and approval. The leader of educational track programs is also responsible for the development and implementation of programme quality improvement, the pedagogical methods for programme quality, and for controlling programme educational and methodological support.

Within the Educational and Methodological Council, a committee of one chair and three members is in charge of preparing its meetings, with regard to the following areas: programme quality, methods of teaching and assessment, educational and methodological development, education, science, and business Integration, and formation of the students' learning community.

Furthermore, the Regulations on Advisors provide for keeping records of students' opinions on study programme quality and evaluation. Advisors provide academic support for students and assist them in choosing disciplines, introduce students to the programme content, the catalogue of academic disciplines, requirements for a diploma, resources of the chosen educational programme, etc.

Through a responsibility matrix of the administrative and teaching staff, the structure of the quality assurance policy has been made transparent.

Assessment

The Caspian University has made it a priority to create a quality culture that applies at all university levels, is accepted by all university members, and is regularly checked and improved. According to the expert group's impression, the institution has a very good formal quality assurance strategy in place, with all control loops closed, meshing extremely well, and working together. Internal quality assurance tools are widely available and well-known to all staff and students. The quality assurance policy covers all essential areas and notifies all university members about the use of quality assurance instruments on a regular and transparent basis.

Quality assurance stems from the education quality center. The center has several tools, one of which is questioning, as well as committees with students and professors who evaluate the lessons. The quality policy is closely intertwined with the code of corporate culture, which is a system of moral and ethical standards of conduct based on widely acknowledged moral principles; it establishes norms of conduct for instructors, staff, and students, as well as the rules

that govern their interaction. Additionally, the policy to combat corruption at the university is a vital component of the policy on maintaining the quality of teaching and studying. The institution performs an annual systematic effort to instill an anti-corruption culture in its team and to encourage zero tolerance for any sort of corruption.

All relevant committees are also participating in the ongoing effort of further improving quality assurance and coordinating processes. These are the Committee on quality, Committee on methods of teaching and assessment, Committee on educational and methodological developments, Committee for education, science and business integration, and Committee for the formation of the student learning community.

The development strategy of the Caspian University for 2021-2025 corresponds to the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of education and science, strategic and programme documents adopted at the republican level. The formation and management of study programmes undergoing accreditation are carried out based on science-based approaches to planning, methodological support, and training technologies. The implementation of the study programmes complies with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of education, including the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university reviews its strategic objectives with regard to changes in external factors and new key areas of state policy.

The expert group was convinced that the university has developed a quality assurance policy aimed at continuous improvement of the educational process, research activities, and implementation of innovative projects. This policy is based on the mission, vision, and values of the university. The quality policy is reflected in local acts and regulations as well as internal documents of the university.

The Academic Policy document (approved by the Board of Studies, November 25, 2020), reflecting the development strategy and other regulatory documents is available for study in all structural divisions of the university and posted on the university website, which is a guarantee of transparency, openness, accessibility not only for employees and students but also for employers and other interested parties.

The development plans of the study programmes undergoing accreditation that have been approved by the university management and the Quality Assurance Policy of the study programmes reflect the relationship between scientific research, teaching and training, thus confirming the existence and functioning of the internal quality assurance system of the study programmes.

The expert group confirms compliance of the Development Plans of accredited universities with the University Development Strategy and the programme documents adopted at the national and regional levels.

The expert group confirms the existence of Development Plans for study programmes, which makes it possible to ensure the synchronous development of various study programmes in the context of the university strategy. The experts were convinced of the consistency of the university's strategic goals, the adequacy of the mission, vision, and strategy to the available resources: financial, information, material, and technical.

The Caspian University pursues quality management that aims to ensure and guarantee all aspects of quality. The accompanying systematic monitoring from goal setting and goal achievement deals with the statistical evaluation of data in order to integrate new content development into the study programmes, to secure the material equipment of the university, and to meet the teaching staff in all didactic requirements.

The implementation of these quality goals consists of the selection of professors and university lecturers in accordance with the Higher Education Act, a structured hiring process for external lecturers, and the comprehensive evaluation of university studies by students and graduates. The evaluation system, therefore, promotes the continuous improvement of curriculum development, and the qualification of teaching staff. Against this background, all modules (lectures, seminars, etc.) are evaluated in different time sequences. A graduate survey has taken place and is also planned for the new degree programmes.

The relationship between lecturers and students is characterized by mutual respect and trust; a basis that enables constructive discussions. From the point of view of the expert group, adequate quality assurance measures have been defined and are planned.

The selected evaluation instruments meet the challenges and educational demands of the study programmes. Overall, the impression is that the quality management system of the university is suitable to ensure and further develop the quality of the study programmes reviewed here.

The Caspian University pursues a continuous improvement of quality management. It should be noted that the university implements clear procedures and responsibilities for quality assurance of teaching. This has a positive effect on the further development of the study programmes, both with regard to the topicality of the teaching as well as the didactic quality of the teaching. All stakeholders participate in quality assurance processes and are responsible, within their competence, for the quality of the educational services provided.

As far as can be seen, the policy for quality assurance covers all relevant areas. In particular, the policy reflects the relationship between learning and teaching. It covers, for instance, the

organisation of the quality assurance system, the relevant actors, academic integrity, topics such as guarding against intolerance and discrimination, and it involves external stakeholders. Examples were given for the participation of external stakeholders such as the state implementing the regulations of the university activities, regional executive authorities and local self-government bodies, employers interested in competent specialists, applicants choosing a university, local regional educational institutions of various types, university graduates as well as various public organisations and associations not directly related to the education system (NurOtan, the Assembly of Peoples of Kazakhstan, scientific institutions, etc.). External stakeholders such as employers also participate in the university quality assurance policy through the university Advisory Council and Board of Trustees.

In the report provided by the Caspian University, it was mentioned that all relevant stakeholders participate in the policy for quality assurance. Teaching staff and students are included in the management of the university. This was confirmed during the first meeting with the faculty and study programme managers.

The Caspian University established a general quality assurance system with clear responsibilities for the university institutions and staff. There is regular training for the university staff, and an Educational and Methodological Council analysed the quality of lectures and practical exercises. According to the self-report, all requirements regarding implementation, monitoring, and revision of the quality management system are fulfilled. This was also the impression given during the online meeting with the university management, teaching staff, and students.

A further important part of the quality assurance policy is the measures taken for preventing discrimination and intolerance of students and teachers. The Caspian University provides a Code of Corporate Culture and a Student Code of Ethics, involving teaching staff regarding zero tolerance for plagiarism and corruption. There is also an annual Action Plan on Combating Corruption, and further activities in this field. The high quality of these activities was also reflected during the online meeting with the university management, teaching staff, and students.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Implementation

A working group reviews the study programmes in order to enhance their content and aims. All programs adhere to the standards of the State Mandatory Standard for Higher Education and Postgraduate Education, which determines study programme content with an emphasis on learning outcomes, training duration, the volume of teaching load, and students' extent of preparedness.

The study programmes are a system of documents developed and approved in response to the labour market and relevant industry requirements, based on the State Mandatory Standard for Higher Education, standard curriculum, and taking into account the recommendations of the Republican Educational and Methodological Board on the study programmes. The prevailing languages of study are Kazakh and Russian. The Caspian Dream Team project is a one-of-a-kind programme, with multilingualism defining the degree of quality and social value of the programme. Caspian Dream Team students are taught disciplines in English, Russian, and Kazakh.

The layouts of study programmes indicate the development of programmes at all levels of training and the overall labour intensity of educational activity in the tabular version. The blueprints were created by the developers of each study programmes and form of education as a graphic description of education, indicating to students and those interested in enrolling which required and elective topics are studied at a certain level of education. The layouts of the programmes also indicate which disciplines are required for the study and which are optional.

Learning outcomes are interrelated and based on the Dublin descriptors, with ECTS and the qualified framework of the European Higher Education Area taken into consideration. The desired learning outcomes are represented in the catalogue of academic disciplines of programmes and are developed for each subject across all three levels of training. These are provided to students via the university internal information web portals.

To increase students' cognitive activity, the principles of student-centered learning are applied through student engagement in the production and selection of educational resources - training courses and techniques. This approach is carried out in tandem with teacher and student research activities. The collaborative scientific innovations of teaching staff and students (reports, theses, papers), which have been evaluated at scientific and practical conferences and published in scientific journals, can be used to design new courses.

Programmes are designed to meet scientific, theoretical, and practice-based requirements for professional and social competencies. All relevant university disciplines are involved in the programme development: teaching personnel, departments, offices, employers, etc. The methods for implementation are open and transparent, and decision-making is collegial. The scientific level and aims of the programmes satisfy the set standards, are compatible with the university purpose, and suit the demands of potential customers.

The departments ascertain the need to change the content of the study programmes based on an analysis of the following factors: changes in state standards applicable to the programmes; results of an employer survey/questionnaire; results of a student survey as to their satisfaction with acquired competencies; results of the final assessment; demanded competencies in the labour market. Internal documents govern the procedures of study program conception, approval, introduction, and implementation.

Assessment

Based on the submitted documentation and discussion rounds with different status groups at the university, the expert group established that the study programmes undergoing accreditation in this cluster are subject to periodic revision and subsequent development. The form and content seem appropriately differentiated for Bachelor, Master, and PhD programmes. The recommendations of the previous accreditation of the Caspian University have been considered by intensifying the teaching of methods of scientific research.

In the discussions with the students and alumni, it could be identified that the students of both Law and Finance specialisations might benefit a lot by spending some time abroad. It is therefore recommended to make sure that more international exchange programmes are created for students as well as for the staff of the Caspian University, as this stands in line with its internationalisation strategy, too. In terms of strengthening the internationalisation strategy, it is also recommended to embed more literature in English in the library for all programmes and all levels to familiarize the students with the contemporary international standards in their respective areas of study.

Jurisprudence programmes

The Law educational programmes cluster consists of three levels: Bachelor, Master, and PhD. The law courses are offered by the Adilet Higher School of Law.

The Bachelor courses are 6B04218 Private Law, 6B04216 Public Law, 6B04217 Court and Law Enforcement, and 6B04219 Jurisprudence (with deep study of the Chinese language and the Law of the People's Republic of China). The undergraduate programmes are implemented in a full-time form or a full-time with the use of distance learning technologies. The regular study time is 4 years (8 semesters).

Courses at the Master level consist of 7M04239 Public Law (1 year), 7M04240 Public Law (2 years), 7M04241 Private Law (1 year), and 7M04242 Private Law (2 years). The standard study for Master programs is 1 year (2 semesters).

At the Doctoral level, two courses are offered, 8D04250 Public Law and 8D04251 Private Law. Here, the regular study time is 3 years (6 semesters).

The programs were developed in accordance with national legislation requirements, such as Law No. 319-III On Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan of July 27, 2007, and Order No. 604 on approval of State Compulsory Education Standards of All Education Levels of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of October 31, 2018. The State Compulsory Standard of higher education and postgraduate education was developed in accordance with the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan on July 27, 2007.

The Adilet HSL educational programmes are based on modules. Bachelor programmes consist of three blocks of modular disciplines: state compulsory, social-communicative and professional, with a list of disciplines of the mandatory component and the elective component indicating the number of ECTS. Master and PhD-programmes contain three blocks of modules, at the master level the obligatory state modules and the obligatory professional modules, and at the PhD level the mandatory state module and the elective modules for professional orientation.

Bachelor, Master, and PhD students actively participate in university management and in educational programmes development. However, their views should be taken more into account when proposing new elective disciplines by involving not only students but also graduates in the Employer Advisory Council and in the School Academic Committee in order to fully determine the legal practice needs in the study of new major disciplines. Expert opinion for study programmes is an important component in programme development. For this purpose, Adilet HSL involves experts from among employers. However, an expansion of the number of experts by including external stakeholders, as well as representatives of NGOs and the business community.

The process of mastering the study programmes is aimed at the personal growth and development of students and the improvement of their research competencies. At the same time, students should have a more active role in grant and international scientific research conducted by the school's teaching staff, the Research Institute of Private Law, and the Research Institute of Public Law.

Over the course of discussion rounds, it became apparent that the university Law students would benefit from adding Administrative Procedure Law content to increase the focus on administrative procedure in all Law programmes. The following annotations regarding the law programmes are made: the university should consider including more contemporary topics (e.g., sustainability, ethics, future of energy, etc.) integrated with a cross-module focus for all law programmes. The university should contemplate increasing the number of ECTS of Civil Law in all law programmes.

Law (Bachelor)

At the Bachelor level, the course programme consists of general education disciplines, basic disciplines, and major disciplines. It also includes professional practice. The courses aim at students to achieve civil and moral positions as future specialists, working in a socio-cultural development while being able to communicate in an interpersonal social and professional way within the state, in Kazakh, Russian, and foreign languages. Students shall be able to use modern information and communication technologies in all spheres of life and to enhance mobility, critical thinking, and physical self-improvement.

The courses are governed by the State Compulsory Standard of Higher and Postgraduate Education, approved by Order No. 604 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on October 31, 2018, regulating the study of disciplines of the general education cycle (total credit amount 56, of which 51 ECTS are disciplines of the compulsory component and 5 ECTS are disciplines of the university component. The study programme covers 130 ECTS (57 ECTS fall under the university component and 73 ECTS under the elective component). An internship of 5 ECTS is also required.

The university component, which can be decided upon by the university, is the core of the programme. It aims at deepening the professionally significant subjects, including practical and theoretical knowledge. The final assessment includes a complex exam and defending a diploma paper.

Law (Master)

Adilet HSL master educational programmes cover two areas of training, the profession-oriented track training managerial personnel in the law industry, and the scientific and pedagogical track, aiming at pedagogical and research skills, preparing personnel for universities, research institutes etc. The major disciplines of 7M04242 Private Law of the scientific-pedagogical track cover 49 ECTS, and EP 7M04240 Public Law of the scientific-pedagogical track covers 54 ECTS. The programme also includes teaching practical training for undergraduates. The final examination includes a complex exam and defending a master thesis.

Law (PhD)

The PhD-program in law started in 2013. There are two tracks - Private Law and Public Law. The programme aims at qualified specialists with a Master degree or a scientific degree as the candidate of science. PhD students are supposed to be further engaged in scientific and teaching activities and to creative qualities, communicating with leading domestic and foreign scholars. The theoretical training consists of the cycle of basic disciplines and major disciplines including disciplines of the university component, the elective component, and profession-oriented practice. A doctoral student's research work covers 123 ECTS. The final exam includes a complex exam and a defending qualification paper.

Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor)

This programme has a unique set of features with a curriculum developed in cooperation with the target country higher education institutions, and its potential is likely to increase in the future as a direct result of the growing influence of the PRC in the region. As the counteraction between the two countries keeps increasing, the university should consider implementing more International Investment Rules to keep up with the rapidly developing investment industry trends and their impact on the local economy and development. Over the course of the discussion rounds, several alumni have or are continuing their education in China, and they seem to be very satisfied with the level and content of training within this programme.

Private Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD)

Private Law has got the most students in general. It must therefore be provided with the most hours in the curricula and the most staff. It is desirable to increase both titles. In addition to that, the hours and ECTS of pure and severe matters of private law must grow while limiting the number of additional matters like i.e., personal development module (8 ECTS).

For EP 6B04218 Private Law, the programme contains very numerous basic disciplines of the university component: Theory of State and Law, Constitutional Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Civil Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the major discipline of the university component, Civil Procedural Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the latter being in an adequate

volume. It is pertinent to organize the logic of a Bachelor programme as follows: at first, students master the knowledge of basic disciplines, and then based on them, study major disciplines.

For 7M04241 Private Law, 7M04242 Private Law, the programme includes the following major disciplines: Modern problems of the general theory of law, Theory and practice of applying the civil legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Theory and practice of applying the civil procedural legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, problems of Civil Law and regulation of investor relations. The latter ones are fully welcome. The faculty is willing to make sure that new matters, although being a question of the point of view if a matter is considered “modern”, can be built up in new modules. On the other side, we welcome to see embedding new topics, like medical and pandemic law, in lecturers being already in force.

For 7M04241 Private Law, and 7M04242 Private Law; the programme includes basic disciplines: Philosophy of Law, Legal entities in private international law and major disciplines: Modern problems of Civil Law, Modern problems of civil procedural law. The program fulfils entirely the criteria.

As far as research is concerned, currently, the Research Institute of Private Law of the Caspian University is the only scientific Centre of civil law in Kazakhstan known for its achievements in the field of civil law, private international law, and arbitration (arbitration) law. The Private Law Research Institute has got a unique position and is a lighthouse in the country among all universities. On November 21, 2020, students of 6B04218 Private Law held a trial on family proceedings in the 5th semester as part of the implementation of the Memorandum of Cooperation between the Caspian University and the Court of Almaty. Other events are likewise desirable.

Professional-orientated, Bachelor and Master are going to train competitive specialists in the field of protection of property and personal non-property rights of citizens, based on principles of equality and independence of participants in legal relations, in the field of Private Law allowing to develop practical skills for providing legal services to national and foreign companies in the field of Private Law relations.

Within the framework of 6B04218 Private Law hosts the following disciplines which are worth to be mentioned: Roman law and Legal rhetoric. Furthermore, one detects Legal systems of the present time, Intellectual property law normally contains Patent Law. It need not be mentioned twice. Private international law, Negotiation and Consumer rights protection are underlined while the basic Contract Law figures among these specialisations.

The experts had a generally very good impression of all reviewed law programmes offered by the university. The study programmes are well integrated into the overall strategy. As credibly

explained in the online interviews, external stakeholders and students are involved in the design of the study programmes. The objectives of the programmes at all three levels reflect the requirements of the professional field as well as the scientific demands. This was confirmed by the lecturers as well as the students and graduates. Although the curricula are to a certain extent based on state requirements, the university has managed to make good use of the existing leeway and therefore meets the defined objectives. The career opportunities for graduates seem to be very good, they are adequate in relation to the respective level (Bachelor, Master, and PhD). In particular, the reports of the graduates in the online interviews were very positive. The expected student workload is sufficiently defined, and the necessary credits are transparent. Internships are well structured, and the support provided by the Caspian University seems adequate, as was confirmed by students in the online interviews.

The first accreditation of the law programmes took place in 2015. Here, the experts noted that academic research activities, such as participation in international conferences abroad, and participation in project tenders or competitions, were not sufficiently little used by the teaching staff of the departments. In the current accreditation, the experts again recommend that the university should put more effort into the field of international law in the Public and Private law programmes.

In the 2015 accreditation, the experts also required that the course of studies for the 4th semester of the pedagogical-scientific Master programme in Law should be clearly defined. If regular coursework is to be completed in the 5th and 6th semesters, the standard period of study should be adjusted. In the current accreditation, the experts found that CPU fulfilled this requirement.

In addition to the recommendation regarding the international law programs, the experts make the following law-programmes-specific recommendations: there should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme, especially in the Bachelor programme.

Public Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD)

The Public Law study programmes are in most ways similar to the other track offered by the university – described in detail above - which is Private Law. All in all, the university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Finance

Public Finance (Bachelor) and Corporate Finance (Bachelor)

The two Bachelor programmes in Public Finance and Corporate Finance are generally well-designed. Their structure contributes to achieving the formulated learning outcomes. Students

are meaningfully introduced to the subjects, are provided with necessary methodological training, and are given the opportunity to choose specialisations according to their own interests and the specific specialisations of the teaching staff. Internships enable early contact with prospective employers. The curriculum contains not only academic courses in the chosen specialty, but there are also courses that develop students' personal and social skills further, deepen their general knowledge, and enhance their understanding of the civil responsibilities that follow from receiving higher levels of education. The programmes conclude with a thesis, which is the first step to independent and innovative research. Hence, this curriculum reflects the four purposes of higher education of the Council of Europe which states "preparation for sustainable employment, personal development, preparing students for active citizenship, and creating a broad advanced knowledge base and stimulating research and innovation".

The study programmes confer valuable skills and competencies upon students. For example, students are able to communicate multilingually in multicultural environments, they can analyse market and business processes and apply modern management methods to achieve business goals. Graduates have the ability to work in teams, have acquired leadership skills and the ability to communicate effectively. They are able to make independent, autonomous decisions and have the competence to carry out project activities alone or in teams to solve business and economic problems. Graduates are able to apply appropriate digital technologies, tools, basic methods and theories to solve professional tasks and analyze business and financial information to make rational and effective management decisions.

The Corporate Finance programme has a well-developed and appropriate curriculum. Students are trained to analyse financial situations and problems from different perspectives and are prepared for teamwork with colleagues and clients. They can take action to mitigate risk and assess the effectiveness of using financial resources to minimise financial losses. They are enabled to make sound financial and investment decisions in accordance with applicable regulations. Students also receive training for developing modern financial products and services. Following this programme, students will also be able to organize and effectively carry out the independent entrepreneurial activity in the real and financial sectors of the economy.

The Public Finance programme is structured similarly to the Corporate Finance programme but puts a stronger emphasis on government activities and their economic implications. However, at its core, it is less of an economics programme, but rather a management of public finances programme. Like Corporate Finance, this programme prepares students for a practical career in private businesses and financial institutions, this public-finance program prepares students to become practitioners working e.g., in the public administration, the central bank, or supervisory/regulatory agencies. This explains the strong overlap in courses between the two programmes. In the Western tradition, Public Finance is often used to describe economics

programmes, so the Caspian University could look for ways to emphasise as much as possible that this course is a Public Financial Management course, and not a course in Public Economics.

Despite their similarity, it is justified to have two different programmes targeted at activities in either the private or the public sector. There are several courses that distinguish Public Finance from the Corporate Finance programme, e.g., the Public Regulation of the Economy, Public Budget, Public Control and Audit, and Treasury. However, in the current exposition of the modules, these courses are not as visible behind module titles that are the same as in the Corporate Finance programme, e.g., Financial Systems Module or Analysis and Audit Module. This blurs the distinct contents of the two programmes. We would recommend that the two programmes are more clearly separated. This does not necessarily require new courses, but the list of modules should reflect the differences more. The aforementioned courses should certainly be taken by all students in the Public Finance programme, so it would be straightforward to make them mandatory and clearly display them as “core courses” in the Public Finance specialisation. The other courses from Corporate Finance and other business and management fields can then be offered as electives in other modules.

If resources would allow over the course of the further development of the Public Finance programme, additional, more policy-oriented courses could be considered. Public Finance programmes typically include courses that deal with market failures and government interventions, allocative and distributional aspects of taxation, collective decision-making, and much more, and cover both their theory as well as empirical applications.

In both programmes (Corporate and Public Finance), the training in empirical research methods would ideally be expanded already at the Bachelor level. Students need to be able to understand and critically evaluate empirical studies. For those who want to go on to Master programmes, this is typically an essential prerequisite to being able to follow Master-level courses. But also, for students who will become practitioners, it is vital to be able to understand how to apply new empirical research results to solve practical problems.

The aim of Public Finance (Bachelor) and Corporate Finance (Bachelor) is to foster students' personal and professional development in the domain of public finance/corporate finance so that their employability and competitiveness in the labour market are ensured. Graduates of the public-finance programme possess qualifications to manage public revenues and expenditures. They are acquainted with the various ways of raising public revenues and understand related policy problems, they are able to understand and formulate legal regulations relating to taxes and other kinds of contributions to public revenues, they know how to manage public debt, and they are sensitised for some economic-policy issues, such as the regulation of financial markets. Graduates of the Corporate Finance programme possess qualifications to make

informed investment decisions, are able to deal with risk-management tools, understand problems related to acquisitions and corporate restructuring decisions, are able to use modern tools of company valuation, and understand the functioning of financial markets. Both programmes take four years to complete, and students are awarded 240 credits, and the academic degree of Bachelor in Business and Management in the specialisation of Public Finance or Corporate Finance.

The study programmes are roughly structured as follows. Each year, students take courses worth 60 ECTS. The first year of studies consists mainly of mandatory modules. These cover a broad range of topics, such as language studies, history, political science, and philosophy. There are also mandatory physical education courses. It is evident that this first year is meant to educate students in a rather broad manner and to raise the general knowledge of students, before engaging in more specialised studies. In the second and third years, the actual training in public or corporate finance starts. In the public-finance programme, there are some introductory courses in economics (microeconomics and macroeconomics, history of economics) as well as introductory finance courses. In the third year, students receive more in-depth training in specialised courses. There are some courses that are specifically aimed at public-finance issues, such as Public Budget or Public Control and Audit, whereas many other specialised courses are from the fields of corporate finance and financial markets. In the corporate-finance programme, the second year contains introductory courses in Finance and Business Law as well as foundational courses in Economics. In the third year, students receive more in-depth training in Finance. There are courses on e.g., banking, monetary policy, securities markets, financial services of banks, bank management, and insurance. There are also courses that appear important for the regional labour market, such as Islamic Finance. In both programmes, students also undergo an internship and receive further methods of training in statistics. In the first semester of their final year, students can specialise further by choosing among various elective courses. In their last semester, they conduct another internship and write and defend their bachelor thesis.

With this combination of general-knowledge courses, in the beginning, more specialized courses in the second and following years, internships and a research-based thesis, in the end, the programmes aim to educate students that are not only highly qualified specialists, but also well-educated citizens that can make a meaningful contribution not only to their future employers but also to society at large.

Financial Risk Management (Master, 1-year profile direction; 2-year scientific and pedagogical direction)

The main goal of the Master programmes is the acquisition by students of in-depth financial and economic knowledge. The university offers two full-time Master programmes in Financial Risk Management, the profile direction with one year of studying (two semesters) and the so-called scientific and pedagogical direction with two years of studying (four semesters).

Graduates of the profile direction programme should receive broad, fundamental knowledge to be able to adapt to the changing requirements of the professional sphere and modern processes. The educational programmes of this Master are of an applied nature and are aimed at acquiring skills and competencies with in-depth knowledge of applied financial disciplines and modern digital solutions in the field of finance in the real and public sectors of the economy.

The first semester of this one-year programme includes mandatory major modules in a Foreign language on the professional level, in Management and in Psychology of Management (10 ECTS points) and more Finance-specific modules in Forecasting, Finance, Taxes and Banking (20 ECTS points). The second semester comprises of Practical internship (5 ECTS points), Experimental research work of Master students including the completion of a Master thesis (13 ECTS points), and Final examination (12 ECTS points).

Graduates of the programme of the scientific and pedagogical direction should demonstrate a high degree of professionalism and be able to formulate and solve modern scientific and practical problems, as well as successfully engage in pedagogical and administrative activities. It is the objective of the programme to offer in-depth scientific and pedagogical training of post-graduate education personnel for self-development in the field of science and education of comprehensively educated, competent intellectually developed specialists in the field of finance. The students should be able to successfully implement not only their professional knowledge, skills, and abilities in the labour market, but also to develop communication skills, critical thinking, and global and general scientific skills.

Studies extend over two years and students gain 120 credits and the academic degree of Master of Economic Sciences. Each year, students take courses worth 60 credits. The first semester includes mandatory major modules (30 ECTS points) in Foreign language, Psychology, Management, Research, and International Standards and Forecasting. In the second semester, the students get courses on Risk Management, Management Methods, Advanced International Standards and Forecasting, and Finance, and start with Professional Training and Research Work (30 credits). The second year comprises mandatory modules in Advanced International Standards and Forecasting (5 credits), Finance and Financing (11 credits), Insurance (3 credits), Professional Training and Research by Master student including the development of Master Thesis II and III (11+18 ECTS-points), and the Final examination (12 ECTS-points).

The convincing goal of the two Master programmes is to train masters with very good practical (especially for the one-year programme) and analytical skills. The Master programmes aim to train financial analysts with very good competencies in the field of financial risk management. The degree level is in line with the contents of the curricula. The learning outcomes are very well taught and achieved. The expected student workload is clearly defined and transparent. The students get good guidance during their studies, and the results of the evaluations are discussed with them. Graduates (especially of the two-year programme) are adequately able to conduct their own scientific research to create innovative products based on the synthesis and integration of scientific knowledge and methods and to carry out project activities in the professional field. The two-year programme graduates possess the ability to work scientifically, to handle the risk management process of a company, to calculate risk measures and they have the creativity and initiative to further improve risk management strategies.

Looking at the absolute number of students enrolled, it must be noticed that the Master Programmes attracted only a small number of students over the course of the last years. Therefore, the university should show engagement in attracting more students to the Master Programmes in Financial Risk Management. Along the same lines, the Caspian University should consider specific measures to gain matriculations for the Finance (PhD) programme. More international research collaborations should be implemented, to strengthen student and faculty research activities. The PhD programme in Finance seems to be based on a solid concept, so the expert committee finds it disheartening that there are currently no matriculated students.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.

Implementation

The major goal of the university is to meet the requirements of students, from adjusting to the process of academic studies to assisting in the development of a professional career. The academic policy underpins the university operation framework, defining a system of measures, rules, and procedures for planning and managing educational activity, as well as the effective organisation of the educational process, with the goal of implementing student-centered teaching and improving the quality of teaching and learning. Extra-curricular activities for students to acquire professional and socio-personal competences are mostly carried out in informal groups. These are the student clubs. The institution offers multiple student clubs in a variety of activities and interests; information about them and contact information of managers may be found in the student guide.

Student-centered learning is critical to attaining learning outcomes because it allows each student to create flexible conditions for determining the trajectory of their education. Students have the chance to become acquainted with the profile of their future professional activity when selecting educational fields. Specific rules govern the procedure and sequence of enrolment in educational disciplines arranged by the office of the registrar with the methodological and advising support of advisors. The academic policy specifies the registration procedure. The advisers assist students in the selection of subjects for the study programme. If required, they provide guidance and coordinate student discipline selection.

When selecting disciplines, the student is directed by modular curricula and a catalogue of educational disciplines, as well as the advisor's recommendations. Students can select their thesis subjects as well as their supervisor. Academic cohorts are established based on the outcomes of the selection process, with a suitable number of students enrolled in the subject. To provide classes in a discipline, there must be at least five students registered for it. If the registered number does not satisfy the minimum number of students, they are given the option of choosing from the available disciplines, and registration is repeated. The existence of studied prerequisites is a compulsory factor for enrolment in the subject.

The educational process for each programme is fully equipped with all essential information sources, including textbooks, manuals, study guides, and subject-matter innovations, active distribution materials and instructions on autonomous work, and access to network educational resources. On the website, students may gain access to electronic textbooks, video lectures, presentations, and other resources. Teachers receive regular feedback regarding the techniques and procedures used to assess and adapt instructional methods by administering a questionnaire to students at the end of their studies.

Support for the students' sense of autonomy is demonstrated by the teachers' simultaneous and appropriate leadership and assistance. A student-centered approach focuses on the outcomes of training, which become the primary outcome of the educational process for the student. Students and faculty work together to establish a shared knowledge of the difficulties that occur during the learning process. Such cooperation is a major aspect of the concept of student-centered education, and the role of the teacher in this process is crucial, which highlights the relevance of competent teaching staff selection.

The evaluation of student performance is done in a thorough and systematic manner. The modes of evaluation of students' knowledge in each field are agreed on a periodic basis at a meeting of the educational and methodological board, and systematic assessment is carried out during seminar/practical sessions and during the midterm and examination process. At the same time, other types of evaluation are used: oral assessments, written assignments, project independent work, and tests.

The knowledge evaluation strategy and criteria for assessing students' educational achievements in accordance with the values of objectivity, fairness, and openness are stated in discipline syllabi. The syllabus of the discipline reflects the forms, dates, quantity, and technique of formative and midterm checks. The performance of students is directly monitored by the teacher who delivers the discipline. The syllabus defines the monitoring methods as follows: oral control (a survey, a conversation, a report, a statement on a given topic, etc.); written control (an essay, a presentation of material on a given topic in writing, etc.); combined control; presentation; practical control (during practical work, workshops, and practical training); monitoring as a method of control; test control; graphical control; cases, etc. All forms of student knowledge control, as well as the rating and the final evaluation in a discipline, are scored on a scale of 100. The admittance to the exam determines the efficacy of discipline mastery (outcome) and amounts to no less than 50 points (weighted average score midterm 1 and midterm 2).

The establishment of an appeal system, defined by the appeal provisions, ensures objective evaluation of results. Students who disagree with the exam results may file an appeal. The appeal procedure is carried out as follows: by order of the dean, an appeal commission is

created for the duration of the examination session. Members are recruited from among instructors whose qualifications match the training profile and discipline. If a student does not agree with the outcome of the final assessment (exam), they may make an appeal to the chairman of the appeals committee no later than 12 p.m. the next day after the exam result is announced. The student's appeal application is filed to the dean, who forwards it to the appeals commission. In turn, the appeal committee must make a judgment within three working days and provide the meeting minutes to the registrar's office.

There is also a mechanism for students to file an appeal with the university administration. To that aim, the students can submit their appeal to the student service center or to the email address provided. In addition, the student's case is forwarded to the dean. Decisions on student appeals are usually determined at the dean's level. If the problem raised in a student's appeal falls outside the purview of the dean, the appeal is heard at the level of the vice-rector for educational and methodological work. Students can make direct appeals to the university administration (rector). Students can do this by posting an appeal on the rector's blog or sending an email to the rector.

Assessment

According to the stipulated standard, the university should ensure the implementation of the programmes in such a way as to stimulate students' participation in the joint development of study programmes. It allows ensuring the quality of study programmes due to their valuable stakeholder evaluation.

As part of the issue of ensuring respect and attention to different groups of students and providing flexible learning paths at the university, a position of an adviser has been stipulated. By the nature of the activity, the adviser is called upon to provide counselling to students on all areas of the educational process, including the drafting of individual students' curriculum by the means of choosing and registering for elective disciplines. The whole concept of an advisory unit requires the availability of sufficient staff in regard to the annual intake of students for each profession as well as a sufficient and even distribution of consulting hours.

Sufficiently varied types and methods of teaching and learning are applied to make sure students are engaged. The registration procedure for academic disciplines is organized by the registry with methodological advisory assistance to students and is regulated by the academic policy of the Caspian University. In the process of choosing academic disciplines, the opportunity to get acquainted with the profile of the students' future professional activity is provided by the university. To provide advice and form an educational programme, there is a mentoring institute represented by advisors.

Over the past five academic years, sufficient measures to introduce improved teaching methods into the educational process have been implemented. Thus, various forms of lectures, as well as approaches, techniques, technologies, and types of practical classes, have been implemented (creative tasks, presentations, working in small groups, learning in collaboration, role-playing and business games, quizzes, case studies, master classes, situational analysis, discussions).

Sufficient possibilities to place complaints and suggestions regarding the approach to teaching are provided. For these purposes, student applications are submitted to the student service centre. Students are provided with an opportunity to appeal directly to the university management. Regular feedback on the techniques and methods used to evaluate and adjust pedagogical methods is provided in the form of a procedure for assessing the teaching staff and the course by students through the automated information system Univer which involves entering the students' login and password. This may call into question the anonymity of the student questioning or indirectly affect the objectivity of students in the assessment process. The feedback of the student body is manifested in involving the student in the process of developing the study programmes of all levels.

The policy of knowledge assessment and criteria for evaluating students' academic achievements in accordance with the principles of objectivity, fairness, and transparency are disclosed in the syllabi of disciplines. The forms, terms, quantity, and procedure of the current, boundary control are reflected in the syllabus of the discipline on the digital platform of the university.

Taking into account the importance of assessing the progress of students, advance publication of criteria and methods of evaluation in the automated information system of the Caspian University is implemented. In the syllabus, methods and evaluation criteria are defined. Various forms of intermediate and final examination of students' knowledge are provided, according to the forms of control provided by the dean's office and approved at the meeting of the academic council of the university.

In order to ensure transparency and objectivity of the evaluation of learning outcomes within the examination procedures, the use of the format of cross-examinations is practised. The dean's office forms an order of the dean to conduct cross-examinations, in which the second faculty member performs the functions of an additional examiner.

The objectivity of the evaluation of learning outcomes is ensured by the existence of an appeal procedure, which is regulated by the regulation on appeal. A student's application for appeal is submitted to the dean's office, which forwards the application for consideration by the appeal commission. The appeal commission, in turn, is obliged to make its decision within three working days and transmit the minutes of the meeting to the registrar's office.

Based on the ideas voiced by the students, the expert group recommends introducing more learning spaces for students in order to increase the effectiveness of student-centered process of studies and further develop the on-campus infrastructure. Additionally, the expert group suggests providing more opportunities for students to design their own study profile in the form of more freedom in choosing the elective courses so that each individual student could reach their full potential.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g., student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

Implementation

The university admission procedure is conducted yearly in line with the model admission rules for training in educational institutions that carry out study programmes of higher and postgraduate education. These regulations for student admission to Bachelor, Master, and PhD programmes are available and published on the Caspian University information website, under the section targeted at applicants.

The following forms of education are used to determine who is admitted to undergraduate programmes: the full-time studying model is offered to those with general secondary, technical, and vocational education (college); the full-time form using distance learning technologies is available on the basis of technical, vocational, and higher education. There has been a consistent and stable enrolment of students in undergraduate programmes throughout the reporting period.

A competitive process is used to select candidates for Master and PhD programmes based on the outcomes of comprehensive testing. The admission of students to Master programmes over the course of the previous four years has decreased due to revisions in the Rules for admission to Master and doctoral studies in the Finance cluster: from 13 students in 2018–2019 to 11 persons in the 2021–2022 academic year. Furthermore, it is important to note that beginning with the 2019–2020 academic year, PhD candidates have no longer been admitted to the PhD programme in Finance. The overall economic crisis and the effects of the quarantine measures put in place are to blame for the decline in the number of Master students enrolled and the absence of a contingent of doctorate studies since 2019.

Section 15 of the academic policy governs the process for acknowledging prior study periods and learning outcomes for them. The student achievement attained as part of the study under academic mobility programmes are another way to recognise a student's study periods. Section 14 of the policy on academic mobility refers to the principle for arranging and recognising the learning results gained within the scope of academic mobility programs. The university administration has provided evidence of specific processes for identifying the outcomes of students' academic mobility based on comparative statements. The clause in the academic mo-

bility of students serves as the foundation for academic mobility. Transfer of credits in accordance with ECTS establishes the selection process for students to take part in academic mobility and acknowledges its outcomes.

The qualifications attained following completion of the study programmes are shown on the informational and educational portal of the university official website. This certification is precisely defined, explained, and relates to a certain level of the national qualifications system. Following completion of a study programme, specific qualifications are defined in accordance with the level of the National Qualifications Framework in Higher Education and, therefore, the framework of qualifications in the European Higher Education Area:

- 1) Qualification level 6 – Bachelor's degree.
- 2) Qualification level 7 – Master's degree.
- 3) Qualification level 8 – Doctoral degree.

The section on the study programmes and the passports of modular educational programmes on the informational and educational portal both include details on the qualifications of a graduate of educational programmes at all levels of education. Throughout discussions and conversations with freshmen during the induction week, advisors explain to students the degrees awarded. The state attestation commission decides whether to provide credentials for Bachelor, Master, and PhD programmes based on the outcomes of graduates completing the final state attestation.

According to the newly introduced piece of legislation, institutions in the Republic of Kazakhstan will begin issuing diplomas based on their own templates in 2021. The graduates received personalised university diplomas. A unique generated identification number, a QR code, and the proper design and security markings are all included in these diplomas. The certificates also list national and international accreditation rating agencies that have acknowledged the quality of education at the university in the global context. The national education database stores the diploma identification number alongside a particular certificate bearer. These features allow a simple confirmation of a diploma legitimacy. This way, linking a person's credentials to the national educational database will enable verification of the validity of this person's university degree.

Assessment

The process for gathering, monitoring, and assessing the development of Bachelor, Master, and PhD students in line with the stated standards, according to experts, has been developed at a suitable level by the institution. In all academic fields, professional settings, and final certification, there are processes in place for evaluating students. The academic policy of the Caspian University, which is published on the university website and specifies the process for conducting current and midterm performance exams, and intermediate and final evaluations

of students, ensures the recording of the assessment processes. Indicators of students' objective progress and knowledge quality at the university from the 2016–2017 through the 2020–2021 academic years enable the statement of consistent indicators of both comparative progress and knowledge quality.

The expert group noted that sections 13 through 15 of the university academic policy, which is available online, explain the pertinent recognition processes and the mechanism for their implementation. As a result, section 13 of the university academic policy on recognition/reset of credits governs the recognition of credentials from higher education and prior learning. When a student is admitted to a Bachelor programme, they are given credit for the credentials they have acquired via studying in the context of technical, vocational, post-secondary, and higher education. This results in a shorter time spent in training. Previous studies are taken into consideration while applying to Master and PhD programmes for postgraduate study.

The evidence produced in accordance with this standard's criterion was generally deemed to be of a fairly satisfactory level by the experts. The sufficient level of procedural availability for gathering, monitoring, and analysing the progress of students is one of the procedures' strengths. The other is the presence of a well-regulated and accessible process for the admission of students to Bachelor, Master, and PhD programmes. The academic performance of students at all levels is strong.

Having stated that, some requirements call for directional enhancement. In order to improve the university research profile, it is indeed necessary to increase the number of students applying to the Master and PhD study programmes. The lack of student enrolment in the PhD programme for studies in Finance is an area that requires extra attention. Low levels of international Bachelor and Master students' outbound and incoming academic mobility is another point to consider. Joint educational initiatives, dual degrees, and collaborative research projects could be supported in this context. These might necessitate extra English-taught courses or disciplines.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff.

Implementation

The Caspian University has developed and implemented an effective and transparent personnel policy that clearly sets out the criteria for access to leadership, incentives for teaching staff, skills development, and self-improvement of the teaching staff. Free access of teaching staff to university resources is assured. The university personnel policy is geared toward preserving academic traditions and at the same time fostering innovation.

Hiring, redeployment, and dismissal of the teaching staff are carried out by the Human Resources Department on the basis of the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Education, and the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Science.

All procedures related to recruitment, promotion, encouragement, termination, and informing on rights and obligations are carried out by the Human Resources Department in accordance with the legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal normative documents, e.g. Rules for the Competitive Placement of Posts of Teaching Staff and Researchers, Qualification Characteristics of Positions of Pedagogical Workers, job descriptions for the relevant positions of teaching staff, where their job responsibilities and rights are outlined. Part-time employees are hired by concluding a contract for the provision of the services.

The rights and duties of the staff and the requirements for the competence of the teaching staff are determined by job descriptions, which are drawn up on the basis of the Standard Qualifications for Teaching Positions. The teaching staff is assessed on a regular basis in terms of their competencies in the field of educational, methodological, research, and other activities. Guest lectures with representatives of practice are conducted and, on average, 30 to 40% of teaching staff are practitioners.

Classes are taught by teaching staff with Master degrees, and PhDs, as well as by candidates of sciences and professors. The teacher's training load is formed in accordance with the working curricula; catalogue of educational disciplines; data on the student number, and allocation standards. Teachers work according to individual plans. The individual plan reflects the teacher's planned activity for one academic year in educational, methodological, research work, and advanced training in accordance with the university policies and goals. The workload of a full-

time teacher is determined annually by the norms for the time of planning and accounting for the teaching load of the teaching staff of the Caspian University. For a full-time academic professor, the workload ranges from 540 to 600 hours, for associate professors it lies between 600 and 660, and for lecturers it amounts to 720 hours per academic year.

The teaching staff ranking tool enables faculty to be motivated to improve their performance, as well as to analyse the extent to which they are included in the implementation of strategic plans. The staff development plans are based on the formal evaluation and feedback from teaching staff and students. Further training of teaching staff and employees is organized by various structures. Professional development is carried out through the organisation of courses, conferences, seminars, individual internships in companies and organisations on the job, pieces of training, master classes, round tables, and winter and summer schools. For these purposes, professional trainers and speakers are involved.

The questionnaire titled Students' Perception of the Teacher is one of the tools for determining the level of students' satisfaction with the quality of the disciplines teaching. A report, based on the results of the questionnaire, reflects all the weaknesses and strengths of the educational process. The results of this report are discussed with the teaching staff and are considered at a meeting of the university board of studies and further transmitted to the dean for further improvement and improvement of the quality of teaching activities.

Additionally, it appears that the university places a high priority on supporting research. Every year, the university holds traditional scientific and theoretical conferences, in which, in addition to the teachers at the university, students, undergraduates and PhD students also take an active part. An important characteristic of the expansion of international scientific and educational relations is the attraction of foreign teachers and research scientists and the external academic mobility of the teaching staff. In order to increase the publication activity of the teaching staff in foreign journals with an impact factor, in the 2020-2021 academic year, the Regulation on Compensation of Costs for Publication Activity was developed, regulating the basis, conditions, and size of payments for the publication activity of the teaching staff. The regulation provides for reimbursement of costs for authors who are university personnel and who have written scientific articles that have been indexed in international databases such as Scopus and/or Web of Science.

The application of various types and techniques of teaching is one of the key areas of work for instructors. Because it entails actively implementing knowledge integration based on the extensive usage of educational discipline resources, the adoption of this teaching technique helps them to tackle the problem of systematising students' knowledge. Due to the pandemic, the educational process was switched to a distant format for the 2020-2021 academic year. Task forms and video lectures have been created for this purpose. The teaching personnel

received instruction on the technique of offering classes via remote educational technology to expand information spread and training.

The employment of active training methods is one of the primary responsibilities of teaching staff. They effectively provide training courses in-class utilising interactive boards, multimedia projectors, and video equipment. The notion of interaction and cooperation between the instructor and the learner is an essential concept of training.

Assessment

The Human Resources Management Policy is clearly lined out in the documents and transparent for all stakeholders. The monitoring of teaching staff activities, the procedures for evaluating their performance, and the approaches to assessing the competence of teaching staff are sufficiently described. The university human resources policy is adequately implemented in accordance with the main priorities of its strategy. Indicators on the qualitative and quantitative composition of the teaching staff confirm in principle the availability of human resources necessary for the implementation of study programmes and meeting the qualification requirements for admission to educational activities. Human resource management processes are adequately regulated by internal documents of the organisation.

New appointments are made on a competitive basis. Members of the competition committee are the first vice-rector, vice-rector for educational and methodological work, vice-rector for academic development, vice-rector for science and strategic development, director of the human resources department, as well as deans of schools. The main principles of the commission are to ensure equal opportunities for all to participate in the contest, maintain fair competition among the participants, monitor the observance of objectivity, and transparency of the competition. During the meeting of the competition commission, an interview is held with the candidates for the vacant position. The purpose of the interview is to assess the professional and personal qualities of candidates, taking into account the qualification requirements, and the peculiarities of educational programmes, for the vacant position of which the competition is announced. The decision of the competition commission on the selection of a person is the basis for concluding an employment contract for the posts of the university teaching staff.

The teaching staff is appropriate to carry out the study programmes. The qualifications of teachers and their numbers correspond to the fields of study of Bachelor, Master, and PhD graduates, meeting the licensing requirements and attesting to the university educational resources. The average ratio of students to teachers is below ten in the Bachelor and nearly one in the Master programmes. During the inspection by the expert group, all the teachers underlined their engagement and that they are involved in developing teaching methods.

The level of satisfaction of students with the teaching of the faculty at the university is high. Based on the results of some surveys, it can be concluded that the educational and methodological level of teachers is at a fairly good level.

Moreover, the professional development of the teaching staff and the staff is organised and meaningfully used in various forms and methods of professional development. The university has established a system for encouraging professional and personal development of faculty and staff, which includes moral and material incentives. Moral incentives include expressions of gratitude, awarding of degrees, submission of state and departmental awards, etc. Material incentives include a system of bonuses for teachers and staff for their personal contribution and work results achieved.

The teaching staff shows scientific activity and is interested in publishing and participating at international conferences. The university welcomes these activities. But the research output could be higher so the university and the faculty should strengthen their research output. It should be one of the important strategic directions of the university to support the research of the faculty. It should be noted that sufficient attention is paid to the issues of encouraging the research activities of teachers, this indicator should be a more important factor in the system for evaluating the contribution level.

Academic mobility for the teaching staff should also be promoted much more: more mobility programmes for academic staff should be offered to strengthen the international level of teachers and create international networking. Academic mobility for teaching staff promotes the exchange of teaching experiences between teaching staff, improves the quality of teaching by introducing interactive innovative methods, contributes to the implementation of joint projects and research, and to the enrichment of cultures. Also, international teaching staff might bring additional perspectives to the study programmes. There, it is recommended that the university should promote academic mobility for the teaching staff and create international exchange programmes for both students and for the teaching staff. The faculty could be encouraged to participate in (inter)national conferences and to submit collaborated research work to leading peer-reviewed journals. From the experts' point of view, more and more collaborated research work embedded in national and international networks lead not only to a higher reputation of the university, its faculties, and study programmes, but also to significant spillover effects on teaching both at the undergraduate and graduate level.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

Implementation

On top of lecture halls, the institution features 12 multimedia complexes, nine training labs, 14 multimedia rooms with projectors, five reading rooms, two of which are electronic, 11 computer classrooms, and five reading rooms. The usage of multimedia and video technology is widespread. Additionally, the law programmes benefit from tailored premises, e.g., from the assembled video library, and instructional and documentary movies are screened on a variety of subjects, including scene analysis, on-the-spot evidence verification, investigative experiments, face-to-face encounters, and the investigation of murders as well as other sorts of crimes. Students benefit from the visual presentation as they acquire new knowledge.

There is a courtroom, a training facility, and a criminal investigative lab. There are laboratories, which are used to teach students in real-world scenarios and develop their practical abilities. The practice facility training in the subjects of the civil and criminal procedural cycles is provided in the courtroom. The courtroom is a unique space for law students to participate in practical training sessions, lectures, and consultations. The operation of the courtroom is intended to give students professional abilities and training in leading classes in the subjects of the Civil Procedure Law, Criminal Procedure Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and other specialized courses.

The lab is fully equipped with the tools required to conduct examinations using microscopes, comparative microscopes, and devices with ultraviolet and infrared radiation to study documents for the detection of various types of forgeries and corrections in them. These examinations can be used to demonstrate the work with tangible evidence. The laboratory also contains the forensic tools required for locating, repairing, eradicating, and examining traces.

The university is an autonomous, nonprofit educational organisation that covers all its expenses by providing educational services. At the start of the academic year, the school creates a budget, evaluates the outcomes of the previous time period, and creates a projection for the next year. The forecasted data are contrasted to the actual execution in the future as planned data.

The tuition fee, which is set by a collegial body and varies by educational level, is the primary source of revenue. Some of it is provided by the state. The money made from carrying out research initiatives is another source of support for the study programmes.

The salaries of the administrative and teaching employees are competitive on the job market. Wages were undoubtedly a major motivator for employees, and the administration try to guarantee that their employees received fair compensation. It is also important to note that highly qualified faculty members (professors and associate professors) receive additional compensation according to their academic title and degree.

The Caspian University, being a socially conscious institution, implements large-scale social programmes to assist students. Students' motivation is examined in the context of achievements based on training outcomes and active engagement in the university socially meaningful initiatives and research activities. In this context, for orphans, a scholarship called A Start to Life is granted. It covers the costs of tuition, housing, and food. It should be mentioned that students of the Caspian Dream Team learning trajectory are funded by the rector's grant that covers the cost of tuition. The university promotes inclusive education and offers support to students with disabilities. The student body as a whole is supported by advisers, faculty, and other university staff on a case-by-case and systematic basis.

Online education is provided as part of inclusive education and is implemented utilising information and telecommunication networks with distant interaction of students with disabilities and with health issues. In the library's reading room, 5% of the seats are reserved for students with impaired musculoskeletal systems and 5% for students with impaired eyesight (additional lighting around the perimeter). The university website has been optimised for visually impaired users in an enlarged font. For the blind, a voiced version was created. Educational films with subtitles for people with hearing loss are made available.

Assessment

There are two academic buildings, a sports and recreation complex, a sports hall, a library, an educational and production base, a museum, a dormitory with 157 beds, catering and medical facilities, and an educational and laboratory base among the sufficient and appropriate equipment available to the university.

In terms of the qualification of the administrative staff in advising students, there are support services that adapt students from the process of studying at the university to employment and assistance in building a professional career. For students, there is the possibility of unlimited access to the electronic catalogue, full-text resources of the library, and full-text resources of foreign companies. It is also possible to get books on subscriptions and in the reading room. During the academic year, the university library monitors the prospectuses of publishing

houses and price lists of bookselling organisations in order to select the necessary literature. The library purchases educational, teaching, and methodical literature and subscribes to periodicals differentially, based on the provision of each student in all cycles of disciplines of educational programmes. Replenishment of the library fund is carried out at the request of faculty in accordance with the relevance of disciplines and new sources of educational literature.

Within the framework of the academic mobility programmes, students are provided with opportunities from support services as well as advisors, and social networks of the university. Foreign students are assisted in terms of registration and offered passport and visa support. The university library, equipped with traditional and electronic catalogues, newsletters, Internet, and resources, provides the necessary conditions for the implementation of independent educational and research work of students.

The following social support and incentive measures are provided to students: free psychological assistance, free legal assistance at the university student law clinic, assistance from advisors, Internet access, use of the library fund and reading rooms of the university, use of the laboratory facilities for conducting research within the framework of a diploma/Master project or other research, free classes in extracurricular and university clubs, free access to sports sections and use of sports halls, provision of scholarships in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan on education and provision of accommodation in a dormitory. The expert group recommends introducing more learning spaces for students in order to increase the effectiveness of student-centered process of studies.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse, and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.

Implementation

The Caspian University leadership is fully aware of the need to ensure that pertinent data is gathered for future development. There is a short and a mid-term information gathering process. The system of information collecting, analysis, and administration is continuously being worked on by Caspian University. Automated management is the primary method of information flow. Through a single platform, this solution enables the teaching staff to post their online courses and manage registration. Everyday activities include open access to the Internet and interactive engagement using e-learning tools. Personal login information and passwords are used to log onto the system.

The information collection, analysis, and management system of the Caspian University are based on the use of information and communication technologies and software. The official website of the Caspian University is sufficiently used for information management. The university provides feedback to students, their parents, employees and the teaching staff of the university, employers, and members of the wider public.

The management of study programmes undergoing accreditation systematically monitors the progress and achievements of students, in particular, the results of the examination sessions are discussed at faculty meetings. Information on the management, planning, and implementation of the study programmes is fully accessible. The university has persons responsible for the reliability of the information and timely informing the structural divisions of the university as well as the teaching staff. Over the course of the discussions, the accreditation group was informed that the representatives of the university attend schools and colleges to spread information. Additionally, online conferences, advertisements, online ads, and social media are used for that as well. When people attend in person, they are given a tour, but everything necessary is available online. The website provides all the information, and there is a hotline. The university organises nationwide contests, provides stipends, discounts, etc. It also strives to communicate with the parents of the students.

The management ensures communication and exchange of information at the university by distributing organisational and administrative documentation, informing on the decisions of the

academic council, administration, and other types of documentation, demonstrating visual information materials, scientific and methodological publications, and articles in the central and local press, placement of information on information stands, and the website of the Caspian University. To ensure that those who need to be informed are, this is implemented on various levels with a distinct set of target groups.

The Caspian University has introduced information management processes, including data collection and analysis, to ensure the quality of study programme implementation, to assess performance, and to determine the degree of implementation of its mission, goals and objectives, and opportunities for continuous improvement of the service. The data is collected from all relevant interested groups, including the internal and external shareholders.

Assessment

The Caspian University has a well-functioning information management system. The current and complete data structure is used efficiently for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and the planning of follow-up activities. The information management system of the Caspian University is comprehensive, and several departments are responsible for statistics and data management at the institution level.

The system for collecting, analysing, and managing information at the university is based on the use of information and communication technologies and software. The university education portal is used for information management, where documents containing the university quality and academic policies are published. Access to information on the management, planning, and implementation of study programmes is provided through the university education portal. Information management involves the use of various methods to provide information to learners, employers, stakeholders, and faculty of educational programmes. Confidentiality of information is generally ensured.

A survey of teaching staff and employees is conducted annually and includes a study of the level of satisfaction of teaching staff and employees with the working conditions, prospects for professional development and administrative management of the university. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of study programmes is conducted annually to examine student opinion on the quality of the university educational and administrative services.

Students may receive a certificate confirming their status at the university. For degree programmes undergoing accreditation, there is sufficient information to attract potential applicants. The expert group notes that the Caspian university regularly collects and analyses information on study programmes, students, graduates, and its other activities as part of the

quality management system and makes it available to the internal system for quality assurance. The workload of students, consisting of attending lectures, and seminars and carrying out independent work, is strictly regulated. There are partnerships and exchanges with foreign universities, primarily with higher educational institutions from Europe.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

Implementation

Caspian University provides public information on the activity, requirements, and characteristics of its study programmes. The purpose of public information is to create a positive image and to establish and maintain cooperation with all interested parties by informing the general public about various activities of the university. The official website contains all the necessary information for prospective students. The prospective student section provides information about the work of the admissions committee, indicating the working time and contact details. The information about admission requirements and the list of necessary documents may be found in this section under the subsections corresponding to the intended level of study: undergraduate, Master, or PhD.

The educational programmes section allows the prospective students and other people to find information on the offered study programmes and teaching staff. The university website makes it possible for prospective students to familiarise themselves with the rules of admittance and to submit an online application with their documents to be considered for matriculation. Furthermore, the prospective student section gives an overview of annual tuition fees for the student programmes, conditions for receiving scholarships and discounts, including social discounts, discounts for the Caspian Dream Team (a highly competitive Law programme at Caspian University taught in three languages), discounts for Altyn belgi holders (pupils with straight A's), discounts based on high performance in the unified national test, etc. This section also provides information about the university dormitory and its rules of residence.

Based on the university academic policy, any person can gain an insight into the rules of exam organisation, assessment of the educational achievements of students, the procedures of registering students for educational disciplines, transferring and re-admitting students, and eliminating academic backlogs, etc.

The university website utilises a guide to help navigate through the information about its management and structural units, general information about internal regulations, operations of the registrar's office, academic calendar, general concepts of the credit-based educational system, general academic rules of the educational process, general rules for using the library, safety techniques, as well as about the ethical code of students, and student clubs.

Academic calendars for Bachelor, Master and Ph.D. programmes can be accessed on the university platform. Representatives of certain programmes collaborate with the department of marketing and PR to provide career counseling at schools and colleges in Almaty. They do this to inform prospective applicants about the educational programmes offered, and provide them with pertinent handouts (brochures, booklets, stands, etc.). The university actively participates in commercial educational exhibitions held both in Kazakhstan and abroad by the Bolashak Center for International Programmes, MyFair LLP, and Modern Education Forum. The purpose, vision, and values of the university, as well as notifications of events and other events, are effectively communicated to the general public via the university corporate-styled information stands.

Annually, the rector publishes a report in the media, which analyses the activities and participation of Caspian University in the development of the educational system in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Through evaluation of previous performance, identification of growth areas and opportunities, and setting of new goals, the public may track the university development over the course of a specific period of time. In 2020, the rector's report was published in the newspapers as well as posted on the official website of the university and on social media.

Assessment

The university carries out its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement, and awareness of all stakeholders in educational activities, focusing on students, teaching staff, and employers. One of the main opportunities for informing is the use of information technology and the media. In addition to information on the university website, details about the specifics of study programmes undergoing accreditation are communicated to the public and applicants through various events, one of which being the open doors day.

Innovative proposals from interested parties are submitted to the management through oral and written statements, official messages to the rector's blog through the university website, or through personal communication during office hours. The received proposals are considered at faculty meetings to decide whether it is possible to implement the suggestions. In case of a positive decision on the implementation of innovative proposals, the issue is submitted for collegial discussion at the level of the department council.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

Implementation

Undergraduate, Master, and PhD study programmes are monitored and evaluated in line with the regulation on monitoring and evaluation of educational programmes. The process for reviewing and assessing study programmes is based on several basic principles: compliance with programme goals and objectives, the relevance of the study programme, determination of training results and competencies corresponding to the study programme profile, training methods consistent with study programme objectives, resource provision of the study programme, appropriate allocation of ECTS by study programme modules, and disciplines in a modular curriculum.

The gathering and analysis of reports on the activities of all university structural divisions during the academic year is the tool for assessing and monitoring the execution of study programmes. The board of studies hears and considers structural division reports, and decisions are taken to improve the educational process. In the months of April and May, the educational and methodological board analyses, amends, and enhances study programmes. The curriculum is examined and approved as part of the following year content. The goal of incorporating research findings into the educational process is to ensure the integration of research and training activities.

All of the aforementioned types of scientific activity by teachers and students ensure both the consolidation of knowledge and the formation of methodological approaches to scientific research, as well as the ability to substantiate the relevance of the topic and develop the study goal and objectives. Monitoring the quality of study programmes is also maintained by gathering input from employers who are members of the advisory council of the university. On top of that, a survey is conducted with potential employers to determine their satisfaction with the quality of the study programme based on graduates' performance.

The centre for monitoring the quality of education conducts student questioning in line with the provisions on questioning, with the option of remote access for the students and automated

processing of replies. The survey includes 13 questions about the quality of teaching, compliance of the discipline content with the training profile, the occurrence of overlap with other disciplines, and the opportunity to provide proposals and feedback.

The committee on quality, comprised of several employees and instructors, also monitors teaching quality. This committee examines instructors' classes to assess the quality of their teaching techniques. To review the method of conducting courses, a sheet of evaluation of lecture and practical classes has been compiled, and members of the quality committee provide ideas for enhancing teaching methods. Within the course program concerning Chinese Law, close cooperation with Chinese partner institutions guarantees high standards of content and constant updating of content. A survey is also used to track teaching staff satisfaction, which represents the level of satisfaction of the faculty in various aspects of their work.

All university structural units operate in line with the authorised work plan to fulfil the aims and objectives of the Concept for the Development of study programmes at all levels of education for the cluster of programmes undergoing accreditation.

Assessment

To assure quality and conformity with strict quality requirements, the study programmes are routinely assessed and updated. The ongoing review of all study programmes leads to a structured examination and development through the application of appropriate adjustments. Different processes are used for the study programmes and their internal quality assurance, such as using questionnaires of students following specific courses. The regular feedback and assessments create a controlled flow of information between the students and the lecturers, allowing for the prompt adoption of any necessary or beneficial changes in the following semester.

The institution has created a quality framework that calls for the periodic examination of all academic programmes using a comprehensive surveying tool. The external stakeholders also got involved, e.g., internship places providers, potential employers, etc. This allows the university to effectively utilise the freedom window within the national laws and regulations frameworks by offering tailored electives that give its students a competitive advantage as well as ensure a higher level of satisfaction of the employers.

Teaching staff is also able to both provide and receive feedback from their peers by cross-visiting classes. Close cooperation with partner institutions provides vital input in new fields, allowing for accumulation of knowledge that previously was not available to faculty or students alike. The faculty that undergoes external training or participates in national and international conferences shares the information with others. Such an approach practiced at the university

provides for the continuous improvement of the teaching within the programmes. This is done in addition to the students' feedback.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.

Implementation

The effectiveness of the internal quality assurance systems is evaluated using various external quality assurance processes. Results of the external evaluation conclusions and recommendations serve as a catalyst for the development and implementation of new prospects for the institution. Commentary and suggestions have been taken into account upon the publishing of the 2016 ACQUIN expert report on the programme accreditation of the cluster of majors in Finance and Law.

The Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA), the Atameken National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and various national and international institutional and programme accreditation procedures are used to carry out external monitoring. More precisely, frequent external evaluations of student learning outcomes, accreditation, ratings of programmes, and licensing are all examples of external quality assurance procedures.

Institutional accreditation is a thorough evaluation of the university operations for the provision of high-quality educational services consistent with its proclaimed status. Specialised accreditation is an assessment of the effectiveness of specific programmes offered by the university. The selection of the certification body is entirely discretionary. In the context of institutional and programme accreditation, the university first vice-rector and vice-rector for educational and methodological activity coordinate the operations of the university structural divisions.

Following each external quality assurance procedure, the university performs an analysis and, if necessary, generates an improvement plan, enabling a continuous quality control loop. The board of studies, the educational and methodological board, and the administration convene to examine the outcomes of external quality assurance; these findings are also posted on the university official website.

Assessment

While the Caspian University in Almaty approach is comparable with any high-quality higher education institution, the principles embedded in its quality assurance framework reflect the distinctiveness of the university and support the realisation of the Caspian University vision for its future.

The Caspian University policies and procedures promote a culture of reflective practice and provide mechanisms for continuous improvement in both process and quality. Enhancement requires a systematic collection and use of feedback and data; quality benchmarking; input from internal and external experts; continuous engagement with the Caspian University students as partners; fostering collaborative approaches; acting on lessons learned and building on best practices.

Engagement with the Caspian University students and their representatives is central to its approach. Students are to be able to contribute to local and strategic discussions about the quality of education at the university and wider developments impacting their experience. The framework supports a variety of formal and informal mechanisms for seeking feedback from students at key points within the student lifecycle including student surveys, module evaluations, student representation in key decision-making bodies and, importantly, through the strong relationship of the Caspian University with its students. The students can expect to be informed of how their collective feedback has been used to drive the development of educational provision and the broader university community both for themselves and future students at the university.

The framework facilitates communication of needs and priorities from across the university, channelling these to the appropriate decision-making bodies within the governance and executive structures, enabling representation, and clearly articulating how decisions will be communicated back to stakeholders.

The Caspian University is very proud of the diversity of its staff and students, academic programmes, professional and business partnerships, and research and enterprise portfolios in the Kazakh educational world. The framework facilitates interdisciplinary approaches and collaboration across professional, academic and institutional boundaries, allowing the Caspian University to maximise the potential of students and the university itself. This flexibility in approach requires clear lines of accountability to maintain consistently high-quality academic standards and enable regular assurance and enhancement work.

The strategic plan of the Caspian University highlights the importance of partnership, community, and collaboration in enabling to achieve the Caspian University goals for education, research, and enterprise. The framework is developed, managed, and reviewed using a range of consultative processes which draw on the expertise and experience of the Caspian University staff, students, partners, and wider academic and professional communities.

The Caspian University measures its success and defines its agenda for educational provision not just in relation to the standards set by the academic sector, but also against the needs and aspirations of the businesses and professions it serves.

The Caspian University seems to be required to seek relevant professional accreditation wherever possible. The best sample as presented value and operational excellence of the Caspian University is that the International Convention ESQR's Quality Achievements Awards recognized the Caspian University as a university providing quality services in the field of education, for which it received the award Mark of European quality.

The university has identified student future, community, enterprise, research, innovation, internationalisation, and diversity as being key to its strategic vision for the future. The principle of externality requires the framework to support sustained and regular engagement with partners of the Caspian University.

In summary, the quality assurance is appropriate and does cover organisational structure very well – may be in a very top-down matrix sense of understanding. The legal framework – given by the state of Kazakhstan – is the overall framework for any operations of the Caspian University and therefore reflected in everything. Alumni have confirmed it, and alumnus data is quite impressive – stimulation of improvement is more or less external (by state requirements) and internal by arranging partnerships for external partners (incl. auditing bodies). The Caspian University is quite well aware (and experienced) of the results of external auditing and taking them into account as much as possible. The Caspian University is no different to solid universities in other parts of the world – the quality assurance mechanism is functioning as intended. It appears, though, in some instances, there is a danger of applying the form-over-substance strategy, with the result being ultimately counterproductive. The Caspian University is getting audited quite often so at times it is impossible to track where ideas have originated from.

Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

IV. Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

1. Assessment of compliance with the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the current official version

The following study programmes – *Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and law of the PRC) (Bachelor)*, *Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor)*, *Private Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD)*, *Public Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD)*, *Public Finance (Bachelor)*, *Corporate Finance (Bachelor)*, *Financial Risk-Management (Master)*, and *Finance (PhD)* – have been assessed on the basis of the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), the Salzburg Recommendations (applicable for doctorate programmes), and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards 1.1** (Policy for quality assurance), **1.2** (Design and approval of programmes), **1.3** (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), **1.4** (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), **1.5** (Teaching staff), **1.6** (Learning resources and student support), **1.7** (Information management), **1.8** (Public information), **1.9** (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes), and **1.10** (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The expert group concludes that the **Salzburg Recommendations 1** (Research as the basis and the difference), **2** (Critical mass and critical diversity), **3** (Recruitment, admission and status), **4** (Supervision), **5** (Outcomes), **6** (Career development), **7** (Credits), **8** (Quality and accountability), **9** (Internationalisation), **10** (Funding), **11** (Autonomy), **12** (Legal framework), and **13** (Intersectoral collaboration) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance: Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes: Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding

level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification: Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.5 Teaching staff: Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support: The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.7 Information management: Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.8 Public information: Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes: Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous

improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance: Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

National criteria are integrated into the ESG standards.

The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

2. Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review expert group recommends accreditation without conditions for the following study programmes: Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor), Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor), Private Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD), Public Law (Bachelor/Master/PhD), Public Finance (Bachelor), Corporate Finance (Bachelor), Financial Risk-Management (Master), and Finance (PhD).

General recommendations

- In line with the internationalisation strategy, more international exchange programmes should be created for students and staff.
- More learning spaces for students should be created.
- Students should have more opportunities to design their own study profile in terms of individual customisation.
- In terms of strengthening the internationalisation strategy, the university should embed more literature in English in the library for all programmes and all levels to familiarize the students with the contemporary international standards in their respective areas of study.

Study-specific recommendations

Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.

Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.

Private Law (Bachelor)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme. Especially in the Bachelor programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Private Law (Master)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Private Law (PhD)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (Bachelor)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (Master)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (PhD)

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Finance (Bachelor)

- The transparency and profiling of the two study programmes need to be strengthened: the two Bachelor programmes should be more differentiated in terms of their content. This should also be reflected in the module descriptions in a differentiated manner. More courses therefore should be offered in the elective area to create

distinct profiles. Another possibility would be to subdivide identical, large-scale modules for the two programmes into individual, stand-alone modules, thus creating a better profile for the two programmes.

Corporate Finance (Bachelor)

- The transparency and profiling of the two study programmes need to be strengthened: the two Bachelor programmes should be more differentiated in terms of their content. This should also be reflected in the module descriptions in a differentiated manner. More courses therefore should be offered in the elective area to create distinct profiles. Another possibility would be to subdivide identical, large-scale modules for the two programmes into individual, stand-alone modules, thus creating a better profile for the two programmes.

Financial Risk-Management (Master)

- The university should work to attract more students to Master and PhD programmes, in part to enhance the university research profile.

Finance (PhD)

- The university should work to attract more students to Master and PhD programmes, in part to enhance the university research profile.
- More international research collaborations should be implemented, to strengthen student and faculty research activities.

V. Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the peer group and the statement of the university the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN decided on 22 July 2022:

General recommendations for all study programmes

- In line with the internationalisation strategy, more international exchange programmes should be created for students and staff.
- More learning spaces for students should be created.
- Students should have more opportunities to design their own study profile in terms of individual customisation.
- In terms of strengthening the internationalisation strategy, the university should embed more literature in English in the library for all programmes and all levels to familiarize the students with the contemporary international standards in their respective areas of study.

Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor)

The study programme in Jurisprudence (with in-depth study of Chinese language and Law of the PRC) (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.

Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor)

The study programme in Judicial and Law Enforcement (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.

Private Law (Bachelor)

The study programme in Private Law (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme. Especially in the Bachelor programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Private Law (Master)

The study programme in Private Law (Master) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Private Law (PhD)

The study programme in Private Law (PhD) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- There should be more hours in the curriculum of the Private Law Programme.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (Bachelor)

The study programme in Public Law (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.

- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (Master)

The study programme in Public Law (Master) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Law (PhD)

The study programme in Public Law (PhD) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should include more Administrative Procedure Law to increase the focus on administrative procedures in all Law programmes.
- The university should put more effort into the field of International Law for the Public and Private Law programmes.

Public Finance (Bachelor)

The study programme in Public Finance (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The transparency and profiling of the two study programmes need to be strengthened: the two Bachelor programmes should be more differentiated in terms of their content. This should also be reflected in the module descriptions in a differentiated manner. More courses therefore should be offered in the elective area to create distinct profiles. Another possibility would be to subdivide identical, large-scale modules for the two programmes into individual, stand-alone modules, thus creating a better profile for the two programmes.

Corporate Finance (Bachelor)

The study programme in Corporate Finance (Bachelor) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The transparency and profiling of the two study programmes need to be strengthened: the two Bachelor programmes should be more differentiated in terms of their content. This should also be reflected in the module descriptions in a differentiated manner. More courses therefore should be offered in the elective area to create distinct profiles. Another possibility would be to subdivide identical, large-scale modules for the two programmes into individual, stand-alone modules, thus creating a better profile for the two programmes.

Financial Risk-Management (Master)

The study programme in Financial Risk-Management (Master) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendation is given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should work to attract more students to Master and PhD programmes, in part to enhance the university research profile.

Finance (PhD)

The study programme in Finance (PhD) is accredited without any conditions. The accreditation is valid until 30 September 2030.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- The university should work to attract more students to Master and PhD programmes, in part to enhance the university research profile.
- More international research collaborations should be implemented, to strengthen student and faculty research activities.