

#### **Accreditation Report**

## Kostanay Engineering and Economics University named after M. Dulatov Republic of Kazakhstan

#### Agricultural Management (Master of Economic Sciences)

I <u>Procedure</u>

Date of contract: 19 January 2022

Date of the submission of self-assessment report: 2 August 2022

Date of site visit: 21 September 2022

Attendance by ACQUIN office: Dr. Jasmine Rudolph

Accreditation decision: 9 Mai 2023

#### Peer review experts:

- **Prof. Dr. Elena Kashtanova**, Anhalt University of Applied Sciences, Professor of International Trade in Agribusiness
- FH-Prof. MMag. Dr. Michael Schmidthaler, Upper Austria University of Applied Sciences, Professor and Head of study programme Agricultural Management and Innovations
- **Prof. Dr. Thore Toews**, Technical University Bingen, Professor for applied agricultural business management, agricultural accounting and taxation, taxation theory, agricultural business planning and controlling
- **Farhod Ahrorov,** PhD, Vice-Rector Samarkand branch of Tashkent State University of Economics (Uzbekistan)
- **Dr. Alen Mujcinovic**, Associate Professor, Faculty of Agriculture and Food Sciences University of Sarajevo Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina)
- **Professor Anargul Belgibayeva**, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, Department of Business and Services
- Marat Onaev, Zhangir Khan University (Uralsk, Kazakhstan), Director of the Institute of Agrotechnology



- **Rinat Fazylbekov,** Deputy Head, Department of technology innovation Kazakh Research Institute of Plant, Protection and Quarantine
- **Professor Dr. Aleksandra Mandych**, State Biotechnological University, (Kharkiv, Ukraine), Economics and Management of Enterprise
- **Professor Dr. Volodymyr Pysarenko**, Poltava State Agrarian University (Poltava, Ukraine), Head of marketing department
- **Professor Valentina Yakubiv**, Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Vice-Rector for Research, Department of Business Administration
- Alina Magomedova, PhD, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Associate Professor, Department of Business Economics
- **Nurgaziev Mairambek,** PhD, Associate Professor, American University of Central Asia, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
- Ulrich Pingel, CEO, Agralis GmbH
- Sandra Koop, University Kiel, Student of Agricultural Sciences (M.Sc.)



The **Assessment Report** of the peer-review experts is **based on** the self-assessment report of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) and extensive discussions with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, heads of study programme(s), lecturers, staff representatives, students, and alumni.

The basis of the **Assessment Criteria** is part 1 of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) in the current official version. At the same time the national context, particularly the national regulations regarding the establishment of study programmes, are taken into account.



### <u>Content</u>

I	Pro	cedure	1				
II	Introduction						
	1	Short profile of HEI	6				
	2	General information on the study programme	8				
	3	Results of the previous accreditation	8				
111	Imp	plementation and assessment of the criteria	10				
	1	ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance					
		1.1 Implementation					
		1.2 Assessment	10				
		1.3 Conclusion	13				
	2	ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes	13				
		2.1 Implementation	14				
		2.2 Assessment					
		2.3 Conclusion					
	3	ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment					
		3.1 Implementation					
		3.2 Assessment					
		3.3 Conclusion					
	4	ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certifica					
		4.1 Implementation					
		4.2 Assessment					
		4.3 Conclusion	28				
	5	ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff	28				
		5.1 Implementation	28				
		5.2 Assessment	31				
		5.3 Conclusion	33				
	6	ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support	33				
		6.1 Implementation	33				
		6.2 Assessment					
		6.3 Conclusion					
	7	ESG Standard 1.7: Information management					
		7.1 Implementation					
		7.2 Assessment					
	•	7.3 Conclusion					
	8	ESG Standard 1.8: Public information					
		<ul><li>8.1 Implementation</li><li>8.2 Assessment</li></ul>					
		8.3 Conclusion					
	0						
	9	ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes.	40				

# ACQUIN

		9.1	Implementation	45	
		9.2	Assessment	46	
		9.3	Conclusion	48	
	10	ESG S	Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance	48	
		10.1	Implementation	48	
		10.2	Assessment	48	
		10.3	Conclusion	49	
IV	Rec	omme	ndation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	50	
	1	1 Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version			
	2	Accrea	ditation Recommendation	52	
V	Dec	isions	of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN	54	



#### II Introduction

The experts would like to thank the representatives of the HEI as well as students that they have taken part in the discussions and willingly shared information and their views during the site visit. The discussions are valuable not only for the assessment of the institution, but also for a better understanding of the legal and sociocultural context of the local higher education system.

Evaluation basis for the peer-review experts is the self-assessment report of the HEI as well as intensive discussions during the site visit with the HEI management, deans and/or heads of the departments, head of the study programme, study programme coordinators, teachers, lecturers, administrative staff, students, and graduates.

Main objective of the accreditation procedure is to assess the quality of the study programmes and compliance with the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG). The ESG standards are applied as main assessment criteria in the international accreditation procedure.

In addition, the respective country-specific criteria and standards are taken into account.

A group of experts was set up, which ensured that all areas relevant to the accreditation procedure (e.g. legal, structural, social etc. aspects) as well as the ESG and national criteria were considered. The peer-review experts include professors, representatives of the professional practice and the student representative. A certificate with the ACQUIN seal is awarded upon accreditation of the study programme.

#### 1 Short profile of HEI

Kostanay Engineering and Economics University named after Myrzhakyp Dulatov (KEnEU) is a private higher education institution with the status of a legal entity, implementing professional educational programs of higher and postgraduate education.

The university carries out educational activities on the basis of a license issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan within the national educational system in accordance with the laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The university has two faculties, six departments, as well as the relevant subdivisions.

The university offers 21 bachelor's degree programs and 14 master's degree programs. As of the beginning of the academic year 2021 the number of students is 2271, including 2205 students in bachelor's degree programs, 66 students in master's degree programs. Education at



KEnEU is conducted in Kazakh and Russian languages. The total number of teachers is 155, including 66 candidates of sciences, 7 Doctors of Sciences, and 6 PhDs.



Location	Kostanay Engineering and Economics Univer- sity named after M. Dulatov Republic of Ka- zakhstan: "Agricultural Management (Master of Economic Sciences"
Date of introduction	01.09.2007
Faculty/ department	Agricultural Management
Standard period of study (semesters)	4 semesters, 2 years
Number of ECTS credits	120
Number of study places	10 per year
Number of students currently enrolled	5 per semester, 10 per year
Average number of graduates per year	7 students
Form of study	Full-Time
Tuition fee	17500 Kyrgyz som per semester, 37 000 Kyr- gyz som per year

#### 2 General information on the study programme

)

#### 3 Results of the previous accreditation

The study programme "Agricultural Management (Master of Economic Sciences) was examined and accredited by ACQUIN for the first time in 2016 resulting in the following conditions:

- In order to ensure the quality of theses at the master's level, the university must prepare a handbook for students that defines minimum requirements and standards for master's theses).
- The university's description of the study program indicates a number of ECTS points that is clearly too high. The university must check the calculation of the ECTS points awarded and submit a revised study plan that clearly shows the breakdown into mandatory and elective modules.)
- The University must provide a description of the quality assurance tools applied to the "Agricultural Management" program.

The conditions were fulfilled. The accreditation was issued by the 30 September 2021.

For further development of the study programme, the following recommendations were formulated:



- Training with regard to methods of scientific research should be intensified.
- Students should be guided more intensely towards independent scientific work. For this purpose, lecture notes should be supplemented with more up-to-date literature and students should be encouraged to conduct their own literature research).
- The module descriptions should be revised. The topicality of the literature references should be checked and competencies should be examined to determine whether they correspond to a master level).
- Translation: The university should explore the possibility of offering forms of examination (e.g., portfolio examinations) that assess course-related performance).
- It is recommended to make greater use of the variety of possible examination forms and to design examination forms with regard to the qualification goals of the individual modules in a competence-oriented manner).
- A temporary accreditation was issued for the proper implementation of the ACQUIN reaccreditation procedure. The application was approved and the temporary accreditation of the study programme was issued until 30. September 2023.



#### III Implementation and assessment of the criteria

The peer-review experts assess the quality of the study programme(s) and compliance with the ESG standards as well as with the national standards. The report must document the assessment of each study programme in the cluster, taking into account each criterion. Depending on the criterion, the assessment of criterion may be appropriate at the study programmes cluster level in order to avoid repetition and better describe general context.

#### 1 ESG Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance

Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.

#### 1.1 Implementation

KEnEU has a policy for quality assurance, in accordance with which the activities of the university are carried out within the selected development strategy.

The policy for quality assurance is documented in the "Regulations on the Quality Assurance Commission", which is publicly available and posted on the university's website.

The model of the quality assurance system of the university is aimed at ensuring the quality of the results of educational, research, educational and other types of activities of the university. "Regulation on monitoring the quality of educational program (EP)".

#### 1.2 Assessment

The quality assurance policy is reflected in the document "Guidance on the system of internal quality assurance of education in the private institution "KInEU named after M.Dulatov" (hereinafter referred to as the Guide) dated August 31, 2020. The manual is posted on the university's website and is publicly available.

The Manual reflects the mission, policy and strategic goals in the field of quality assurance of education. The mission reflects the University's commitment to providing high-quality training through the integration of education, science and production, strengthening the material and technical base and human resources, the use of modern methods and technologies in the educational process.

The university staff understands that the existing quality management mechanism at the University operates, but its impact on the solution of strategic objectives of the university in the field of quality is not very great yet. Traditional quality control mechanisms are mainly involved in the activities of many existing university structures.



In order to improve the quality of educational activities, the university ensures compliance with the internal quality assurance system based on international standards and guidelines for quality assurance of higher and postgraduate education in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), which includes: 1) quality assurance policy; 2) development and approval of programs; 3) student-oriented learning, teaching and evaluation; 4) admission of students, academic performance, recognition and certification; 5) teaching staff; 6) educational resources and student support system; 7) information management; 8) public awareness; 9) continuous monitoring and periodic evaluation of programs; 10) periodic external quality assurance.

On the university's website there is a "Strategic Development Plan of M. Dulatov Kostanay University of Engineering and Economics for 2020-2025" dated December 22, 2020, "University quality Goals for 2021-2022 academic year", dated December 28, 2021. However, the name "University Quality Goals for the 2020-2021 academic year" remains on the very sign of this site.

The main elements of intra-university quality control: the state of educational work, the state of methodological work, the state of scientific work, the state of training of scientific, pedagogical and scientific personnel, their retraining and advanced training, the moral and psychological state of students, the state of internal order, labor and academic discipline, the state of professional preparedness of the management and teaching staff, the state of personnel work, the state of educational and material bases, the state of financial, economic and economic activity, the state of management of structural divisions of the university.

The above-mentioned "Strategic Development Plan of M. Dulatov Kostanay University of Engineering and Economics for 2020-2025" dated December 22, 2020 and "University Quality Goals for the 2021-2022 academic year" dated December 28, 2021 were developed with the participation of a significant representation of the structural divisions and departments of the University. The report states that similar documents are discussed by the teaching staff at meetings of academic councils.

The document "Guidelines for the system of internal quality assurance of education in the private institution "KInEU named after M. Dulatov" (hereinafter referred to as the Manual) dated August 31, 2020 prescribes a system of periodic assessment, monitoring and quality control of the educational process.

The University successfully operates a system of quality control of the educational process, developed and implemented the relevant regulatory documents: "Academic Policy", "Regulation on the Commission for Quality Assurance", "Regulation on monitoring the quality of educational programs" ("Regulation on monitoring the quality of educational programs" ("Regulation on monitoring the quality of students", "Regulations on ongoing monitoring, intermediate and final certification of students", "Regulations on



checking for plagiarism of written works of students at the university using the "Anti-Plagiarism" system and others. The quality control system of education at the University is a set of measures and procedures of an external and internal nature aimed at studying and evaluating the process and results of training students in all specialties and forms of education. Quality control of education is carried out in two types: quality control of processes and quality control of the result.

The University supports and promotes the concept of gender equality, provides equal opportunities for education and career growth to persons of different genders.

Documents regulating the content, organization and quality control of the educational process have been developed, approved and are constantly kept up to date.

The University has developed a periodic practice of monitoring and evaluating the satisfaction of stakeholders: students, research and teaching staff, employers and other categories of consumers.

The University has a practice of involving key departments in the functioning of the internal quality assurance system of educational programs.

Conversations with the heads of the university and structural divisions, teachers, students and graduates of the educational program confirmed the existence of a stable practice of involving all departments in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system. The analysis of the internal quality assurance of the programme has shown that the procedures for the development, approval, periodic review and monitoring of the Master's programme "Agricultural Management" (M.Sc.) are carried out in accordance with the study regulations, which indicates that the initiation, development, approval, monitoring, revision and termination of the Master's programme at the University are carried out transparently and in accordance with the approved procedures, in line with the general objectives of the University's development strategy, as well as the students of education participate in the design and improvement of the Master's programme, the evaluation of its components and the quality of teaching.

The quality assurance system for the educational process consists of an internal quality assurance system (administration, department for quality assurance of education, pedagogical and methodological centre for the organisation of the educational process) and external quality assurance.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University it was noted and confirmed that the University has a clear quality culture that ensures systematic development of the educational programme. The University has an Education Quality Assurance Department, whose main purpose is to monitor educational activities and evaluate the data of academic activities in order to effectively manage the quality of the educational process.



During the accreditation process, it was noted that the results of external quality assurance of higher education are presented in detail on the University's website, especially the comments and suggestions made during previous accreditations on the official website of the University.

In the accreditation process, it is clear that employers are constantly involved in the process of periodic revision of the educational programme. The university has consultation and advisory bodies, as well as an expert council of employers and graduates.

During the meeting with the representatives of the University, the question about the students' specific suggestions on the education programme was not fully answered.

It is recommended to develop new tools for involving all stakeholders in the development of directions for the strategic development of the University, for example, to strengthen the role of the Board of Trustees in the development of strategic directions.

The role of student self-government bodies should be enrolled in actualizing the mission, goals and objectives of the university concerning the educational and scientific policy of the university aimed at the development of international academic contacts.

Taking into account the University's desire to ensure continuous improvement of the quality of education, including receiving high marks at the International level, when developing documents and conducting procedures in the field of Quality Assurance Policy, it is recommended to more actively involve and analyze in detail the opinions of invited foreign colleagues.

With the objective participation of representatives of the teaching staff, the student body, employers in the development of basic regulatory documents, it is recommended to record their participation with appropriate signatures in the developed documents.

It is necessary to document the procedure and timing of control, as well as the revision of the quality assurance policy.

#### 1.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

#### 2 ESG Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes

Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated, and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.



#### 2.1 Implementation

KEnEU has a well-established procedure for developing, evaluating and approving an educational program (EP). The procedure for developing EP is documented in the "Regulations on the development of educational programs".

For the development of the study programme "Agricultural Management (Master of Economic Sciences) the following reference and information resources were used: the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", classifier of training areas with higher and postgraduate education, the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (RK) from October 13, 2018, State obligatory standard of higher and postgraduate education, Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the RK, October 31, 2018, Rules of the organization of the educational process on credit technology of education, Order of the Ministry of Education and exclusion of educational programs in the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education", approved by the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Regulation on the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education and professional standards and industry qualifications framework provided by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs "Atameken".

The development of EP consists of the following stages: preparation for the development of EP, design of EP, development of EP structural elements and evaluation of the EP development quality.

The educational program is developed by the Committee on Development of Educational Programs (CDEP), which consists of leading representatives of the university including faculty, representatives of students, representatives of employers or representatives of enterprises of the relevant area of activity.

The content, sequence and logical structure of EP modules are developed by the leading lecturers of the departments. The initial version of EP is offered for consideration to the specialists of different organizations in order to determine the demand of EP content in the industrial activity, and also to receive their proposals on EP updating. These stakeholders also take part in EP approval. In particular, the participation of the teaching staff in the approval of EP is manifested in the fact that the educational programs are approved at the meeting of the department. Representatives of students are members of the Faculty Council, the Academic Council, where educational programs are considered and approved. When approving the EP, extended meetings of departments are held, where representatives of employers and specialists of partner organizations are invited.



The business community is involved in various ways to develop the EP. The Department of "Economics and Management" during the academic year organizes round tables with the involvement of employers. Every year the "Open Doors Day" and Job Fairs are held. Meetings with employers are held when students undergo various types of internships. Representatives of the business community are invited to the department meetings.

Employers act as supervisors of all kinds of internships. They take part in the work of the accreditation commission, are reviewers and consultants of final master's works of students. Also, they participate in the creation and organization of further activities of the branches of the departments. In addition to their direct contribution to the development of EP, the working curricula of disciplines are agreed with the employers.

The following criteria are applied to the external experts of EP: the degree of competence of the expert (level and profile of education, profile and work experience, position held, experience in expertise); level of objectivity of the expert; work experience in the system of higher education.

The procedure for discussing and approving EP, compliance with their standards by level are reflected in the minutes of the department meeting, the Faculty Methodological Council, Educational and Methodological Council (EMC) and the Academic Council of the University. To assess the quality of EP, the university has established mechanisms for internal quality assessment and evaluation of educational programs.

Learning outcomes (LO) are formulated depending on the competencies focused on the level of training, the requirements of professional standards and (or) the requirements/expectations of employers. In the formation of EP, the experience of leading foreign and Kazakh universities was studied, opinions of employers, stakeholders and students were taken into account, as well as the use of relevant professional standards.

In order to consolidate theoretical knowledge acquired by students and to acquire practical skills students are required to pass professional practice. Practice is planned and carried out in accordance with the academic calendar of KEnEU and working training programs. For each type of practice, working programs and methodical instructions containing the detailed list of tasks for undergraduates, requirements for passing of practice, content of practice, types of reporting documentation, samples of registration of reporting documents, etc. are made and approved. Students are appointed supervisors among the associate professors or chairs of the department who know well specificity of a profession and activity of bases of practice. According to the results of the practice students submit a report to the department, which is checked by the head of practice and defended the report in front of the commission established by order of the head of the department.



The effectiveness of practice and the results, based on the reports of students, questionnaires of heads of practice from enterprises are considered at meetings of departments and councils of the faculty. Decisions and recommendations made at the meetings are obligatory for execution.

EP is presented as a system of educational and methodological documents formed on the basis of the State Compulsory Standard of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan postgraduate education, professional standards and recommended for use in terms of competence and qualification characteristics of the graduate model; content and organization of the educational process; resource support for the implementation of basic educational programs; final certification of graduates. The graduate model of the EP is a combined image of the final result of education in the direction of training (qualification), reflects the goals of education and expected educational outcomes. The development of the graduate model involves a range of stakeholders, including teachers, educational and methodological associations, students, representatives of the business community, graduates of the university. The competence model of a graduate is represented as a set of expected (desirable) educational outcomes that a student can achieve at a particular stage of mastering the basic program or as a package (set) of competencies that every graduate of this program is required to master. Competencies are determined by the field of study, by the given profile of training and supplemented by profilespecialized competencies) in accordance with the objectives of the educational program. The EP graduate model is updated annually in accordance with changes in requirements and labor market analysis. Qualification characteristics of a graduate (sphere, objects, subjects and types of professional activity) are reflected in the content of the EP Agricultural Management and are publicly available on the official website of the university.

Since 2018, the workload of disciplines is determined in academic credits (1 credit equals 30 hours) based on the State Compulsory Standard of Higher and Postgraduate Education, the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from October 31, 2018.

Involvement of partners' representatives to control the quality of education is carried out through questioning, examination of EP, participation in the procedures of certification of graduates (reviewing graduation papers, work in the accreditation committee, supervision of diploma works in enterprises).

EPs are developed in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework and professional standards, coordinated with the Dublin descriptors, the European Qualifications Framework, recommendations of employers and trustees, as well as based on the analysis of the labor market demand for specialists in the agricultural sector.



Upon completion of the EP, the graduate receives a diploma of postgraduate education with an academic degree of Master of Economic Sciences.

#### 2.2 Assessment

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) is in line with the University's mission and vision, as well as with the goals of the 2020-2024 strategic plan, particularly with the first 3 objectives of education, research and management.

The content of the educational program has a clear structure; the educational components included in the educational program make up a logical interconnected system and collectively allow the achievement of stated goals and program learning outcomes.

The content of the educational programme corresponds to the subject area of the subject area "Management" of the Master's level of the university. In particular, the ability to solve complex tasks, which fully corresponds to the standard of higher education in the field of knowledge "Management and Administration", is the integral feature of the educational programme. The structure of the educational program provides an opportunity for the formation of an individual educational trajectory, in particular through the individual choice of academic disciplines by students of higher education to the extent provided by legislation.

The educational program and curriculum provide for the practical training of higher education students, which allows them to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

The scope of the educational program and individual educational components (in credits of the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) realistically reflects the actual workload of applicants, is appropriate for achieving the goals and programmatic results of education.

The right to freely choose educational components and form an individual trajectory is provided for by the educational program and regulated by relevant regulatory acts. Students studying in the educational program can individually choose the bases of practice and the topic of the master's thesis. The educational program provides practical training and allows you to acquire the competencies necessary for further professional activity.

Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.

Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.

The structure and content of the educational program confirms the university's commitment to providing high-quality training through the integration of education, science and production, the



use of modern methods and technologies in the educational process. The educational program includes a number of disciplines that study current trends in crop production, animal husbandry, and agroecology.

The university has implemented a system of expert evaluation of the educational program by independent external managers. In particular, in the appendix to the self-certification report there is an expert opinion of the directors of two law firms on the educational program 7M04130 "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences). Representatives of the production are the heads of production practices, members of the final certification of graduates.

The need to create an educational program of the master's degree "Agricultural Management" is due to the new coordinates of the development of the country's economy. The development of agricultural science requires priority attention, together with business it is necessary to find strategic niches in international markets and promote domestic products. The analysis of the Educational program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) showed that the list of names of disciplines and the description of their content are aimed at providing the competencies necessary for a specialist of this profile.

The program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) is aimed at ensuring that a master's student, as a result of studying under this educational program, acquires the ability to make organizational and managerial decisions, form analytical materials for evaluating measures in the field of economic policy and strategic decision-making at the micro and macro levels, analyze and use various sources of information for economic calculations, prepare a forecast of the main socio-economic indicators.

The structure of the program contributes to the achievement of the objectives of the educational program. The structure has disciplines (History and philosophy of science, foreign language, higher school pedagogy, psychology and management) that contribute to the acquisition of general educational competencies. A number of disciplines (Economics of Production processes, Enterprise Management and Controlling, Business Management, HR management, Enterprise Planning) are aimed at acquiring competencies in the field of economics and enterprise management. The program provides for the acquisition of skills in the analysis of the international market through the discipline "Strategy of international agricultural marketing". The trainees acquire knowledge in the field of innovative technologies in crop and animal husbandry, agroecology, and rural development.

The Educational program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) clearly traces the interdisciplinary connection and the focus of each discipline on the acquisition of relevant competencies.



The educational program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) provides an opportunity for professional activity in the field of business and entrepreneurship of all types and organizational and legal forms, in the field of production and provision of services, in the field of financial and credit institutions, research and educational activities.

The Educational program has a summary table reflecting the volume of loans disbursed in the context of the modules of the educational program. The volume of loans and the internal distribution of the total volume by type of activity (theoretical training, research work, professional practice, final assessment) comply with the requirements of state regulatory documents.

The educational program provides professional practice in the amount of 11 credits. Within this practice, it is possible to organize internships, including in foreign educational and research organizations. A "Master's Degree internship program at foreign enterprises and institutions" has been developed.

The educational program and other documents regulating the learning processes correspond to the goals of higher education of the Council of Europe.

The curriculum is prepared by leading scientists of the university, passes all stages of approval, review, discussion and approval at the faculty and university councils. After approval by the Highest Collegial Body of the University (Academic Council), it is approved by the rector.

The existence of existing mechanisms for the development, approval, periodic evaluation and the monitoring of implemented educational programs is very good. as well as the compliance of educational programs with state educational standards and the industry qualification system.

Regular procedures for internal and independent external evaluation of the content, relevance and quality of educational programs are also adequate.

The following improvement hints are identified:

The research activity of teachers could be increased and with it the involvement of students in research. The results of the research serve to further develop the curriculum of the study programme.

It seems necessary to document the procedure and timing of control, as well as the revision of the quality assurance policy.

It seems necessary to conduct a systematic analysis of the demand for graduates.

It seems necessary to increase the participation of undergraduates and the professional community in the formation of educational programs, while documenting the procedure and mechanisms for taking into account the opinions of interested parties.



It seems necessary to take into account the requirements and an individual approach to students under targeted training contracts based on the conditions of the "customer", therefore, the introduction of a set of optional disciplines, in-depth study of individual disciplines of the curriculum.

Better data collection regarding the academic mobility of students should be collected.

#### 2.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### 3 ESG Standard 1.3: Student-centred learning, teaching, and assessment

Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach

#### 3.1 Implementation

Academic Policy (AP) of KEnEU is a system of measures, rules and procedures for the planning and management of educational activities and the effective organization of the educational process aimed at improving the quality of education, creating favorable conditions for the personal development of students and the implementation of student-centered learning.

In order to support and promote the interests of students with special educational needs the policy of inclusive education ("Regulations on the implementation of inclusive education in the institution "Kostanay Engineering and Economics University named after M. Dulatov", approved at Academic council 27.08.2020) is implemented, aimed at improving the level of accessibility and involvement of all students in the educational process by identifying and eliminating possible barriers.

Students, regardless of the language of instruction, are given the opportunity to choose from a range of disciplines. More details about each elective discipline can be found in Catalog of elective disciplines (CED), which can be found on the university website.

In order to take into account, the individual needs of students in the organization of all types of practices, the university established partnerships with companies - bases of practice. As a base for professional practice of students can qualify an enterprise whose statutory activities correspond to the profile of training specialists and the requirements of the educational program, with qualified personnel to manage the professional practice and material and technical base.

The university administration strives to encourage the most talented students and provide equal educational opportunities to students of socially vulnerable groups of population. For this



purpose, the "Regulations on the Rector's Grant and the order of assignment of personal scholarship" were developed and put into effect. Also, a bonus system has been introduced for students and alumni.

The university pays great attention to the organization of the teaching process on the basis of modern achievements of science and practice in the field of training, the use of various modern methods of teaching. Thus, in the development of the "Plan for the development of the educational program", a separate item is "Activities to introduce new forms and methods of teaching and learning, providing feedback on the effectiveness of their use.

Every year at the meetings of Educational and Methodological Council of the University the issues of modern methods of teaching are considered.

For successful mastering of EP disciplines teachers use active teaching methods. For the development of technical thinking teaching with the use of hindering conditions on the basis of active methods such as time constraints, sudden prohibitions, new options, information deficiency, information oversaturation, absurdity, situational dramatization, construction, creative problem solving, thought experiment is used.

Following teaching forms are implemented: lectures, laboratory and practical classes, independent work of the learner, independent work of the learner with the teacher. Teachers practice presentations of training courses with the use of interactive whiteboards, multimedia projectors, the use of video materials in the classes on the topics studied, the use of electronic textbooks.

The teaching staff of the university actively updates and improves its teaching skills in the Kazakhstan educational institutions and industrial organizations. The university's teaching staff undergoes training in foreign universities.

In order to improve pedagogical skills and teaching methods teachers attend classes of methodologically experienced teachers. Mutual attendance of classes by teachers is carried out on the basis of the approved schedule. To be aware of modern methods and means of teaching, the university faculty also uses open sources of information to improve their pedagogical skills. Monitoring of the effectiveness and efficiency of innovations and the use of active teaching methods is carried out in the discussion of mutual visits, master classes and at the meetings of the teaching-methodical sections of the departments.

During the implementation of the program, faculty monitors the independent work of the student. Types of independent work of students, their workload in hours, form and terms of control are regulated in the relevant sections of the syllabus for each discipline.



The choice of form and type of independent work for each discipline is carried out in accordance with the specifics of the studied discipline, its goals and objectives, the degree of complexity and relevance, the level of training of the student, the labor intensity of the discipline. Each learner in the first week of the academic period is provided with a complete package of methodological instructions or recommendations for the performance of independent work, containing topics, purpose and content of tasks, recommended literature, forms of reporting and schedule control and evaluation criteria.

Control over the implementation of students' independent work is carried out as an input control in extracurricular classes, current control (testing, quizzes, colloquia, preparation of essays, reports, etc.) in accordance with the discipline syllabus and evaluated in accordance with the point-rating system of academic achievements.

In order to ensure regular work of students in mastering the EP, to assess the effectiveness and efficiency of their independent work, identifying students who do not comply with the schedule of the educational process, the university carries out various types of control of educational achievements. The main types are current progress control, intermediate control (intermediate rating), intermediate attestation (exam) and final attestation.

The order and forms of knowledge assessment are regulated by the "Regulations on the current control, interim and final attestation" (approved by the Academic Council of the University 27.08.2020.

Criteria and methods of assessment of students' knowledge are communicated to the students in the beginning of the semester in various ways including syllabus and guidebook which are posted on the university website, in the personal online office of the student, as well as by teachers in the classes and knowledge assessment.

To ensure the transparency of the knowledge assessment procedure, such forms of control are used as computer testing for full-time students in the computer classes of the university, computer-based testing with the use of proctoring system for students with the use of DLT and written exam with the use of proctoring system.

A student has the right to submit a statement to the Appeals Commission on the violation of the examination or inconsistency of the results of the exam. The appeal procedure is regulated by the "Regulations on Appeal".

In case a student did not pass the study discipline, the student can retake the course in the summer semester.

At the meetings of EMC, the Methodological Councils of faculties and Methodological Commissions of departments the development and adaptation of modern methods of teaching are



discussed. Comments and suggestions of the students regarding teaching methods are systematically monitored, analyzed and taken into account. Feedback from students is gathered through direct comments to the adviser, the university administration and faculties, student self-government, surveys and questionnaires periodically held at the university, as well as through e-mail.

Students can express their opinion on the quality of teaching disciplines through the questionnaire "Analysis of satisfaction with the quality of the educational program" which is available in the personal online office of the student section. The results of the survey are considered at the meetings of the methodological commission of the department.

The ratio of time between the contact time in the class and the student's independent work on all types of learning activities is determined by the university. According to the Rules of the organization of educational process on credit technology training (Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on April 20, 2011), the amount of classroom work should be at least 30% of the total volume of each discipline.

Representatives of students who are members of the Academic Council can express a complaint directly at a meeting of the Academic Council and receive an answer on the timing and methods of resolution of the problem.

Every year, an analysis of complaints and appeals of students in each area is carried out.

To determine the degree of satisfaction of teaching staff, staff, students and employers of the university meetings with the rector, vice-rectors in the areas of activity, heads of departments are held periodically.

#### 3.2 Assessment

Overall, it can be stated that the teaching methods used promote student-centred learning and are sufficiently diverse. The teaching and learning forms are therefore rated as very good by the evaluators. The students provide information about a very good supervision relationship with the teaching staff. The students are very satisfied with the supervision and emphasised the excellent support and accessibility of the teaching staff. The students advisors advise students on the choice of study programme and the creation of an individual study plan of the "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences).

Students are continuously supported by the teaching staff in preparing for exams. The examination regulations are also transparent.

All documents relevant to the study programme are available in the university information system.



All information on the study programme is complete and transparent. Interactive teaching methods encourage students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students receive questionnaires to evaluate their courses and the overall learning experience. Discussing the feedback from these surveys with students can be an additional valuable tool in the student-centred quality process. Students can use office hours and the various electronic communication tools to submit complaints or suggestions for improvement.

Students also have various options available for complaints about assessment.

Students are assessed through various methods, e.g. written and oral examinations, presentations and written assignments. The assessment corresponds to the intended learning outcomes. The assessment procedure and regulations are clear to students and are published at the beginning of each course.

Quality control of study preparation takes place throughout the study period and consists of sufficient different control measures:

The University provides equal opportunities for students in all fields of study, regardless of gender, nationality, religion and social status, language and mode of instruction, as well as taking into account special educational needs and individual opportunities to design an individual educational programme aimed at developing the student's professional competence and cognitive activity.

Thus, the documents and materials provided by the university indicate that the university has developed an effective system of knowledge control. It can be concluded that the university applies the principle of student-centred learning, which aims at the personal development of students and ensures equal opportunities for all groups of students.

Yet, the university should improve the quality of teaching based on the independent and anonymous evaluations of the students and stakeholders and should collaborate and work closely with alumni and stakeholders to continuously improve the study programme in the future.

The examination system is adequately organised. The information about the examination modalities (e.g. registration and deregistration, type of examination, etc.) is communicated to the students in good time. Students take positive note of the good distribution of examinations in terms of time, which indicates efficient examination organisation. The examination load and the examination density are described as positive by the students. The examination regulations are in place. The examinations are designed in such a way that they correspond to the learning objectives. The examination formats used in the degree programmes enable a good and fair examination of the different areas of knowledge. Overall, sufficient different examination formats are used that adequately cover the different competences and skills. The examination



load and acceptance of the examination formats is also based here on the good communication culture and the close supervisory relationship between teachers and students.

The students confirmed the good balance between the different types of examinations as well as an adequate workload. In case of problems with the examination system, students can contact the lecturers or give feedback online. The examination system is organised appropriately. The information about the examination modalities (e.g. date/registration, type of examination, etc.) is communicated to the students in good time. Students also confirmed that there is a balance between the different types of examinations and that the examination load is considered manageable. In the event of problems in the examination system, students can contact the lecturers directly or provide feedback via the evaluations. The examination load and the acceptance of the forms of examination are also based here, in addition to the formal evaluations, on the good communication culture and the close supervisory relationship between lecturers and students.

The planning of the study programme enables a reliable course of study for the students. The students particularly praise the communication with the lecturers. The students feel well advised. There is a high level of student satisfaction with their studies. The individual supervision, advice and support provided to students certainly contributes to this. Overall, there are sufficient resources available for individual supervision, advice and support for students.

#### 3.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

#### 4 ESG Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.

#### 4.1 Implementation

Admission of students to the EP is carried out taking into account relevant state rules and procedures such as the Law of the RK "On Education", "On approval of the standard rules of admission to study in educational institutions that implement educational programs of higher and postgraduate education", "On approval of the Classifier of training areas with higher and postgraduate education" and "On approval of the rules of unified national testing and public services "Issuance of certificate of passing the unified national testing".

Policy of formation of the contingent regulated by the "Rules of admission to training in educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, approved at the RS of 15.06.2020.



The study program is advertised to the bachelor's graduates through booklets and relevant information is posted on social networks. The official website of KEnEU has a section "Applicant", where students can find the list of educational programs and profile subjects of computer testing for admission to graduate school, the rules of admission and get a consultation on individual request.

The formation of the contingent and the results of admission are considered at meetings of the Academic Council and the rectorate. Forecast indicators of the contingent of students are reflected in the EP Development Plan.

Each group of students is assigned a mentor - an adviser, who by the results of conversations, the study of personal files, identifies students of different social groups, advises and provides information about the specifics of the educational program. The activities of the Advisor are regulated by the "Regulations on the organization of the work of the Advisor".

Compliance between the admission process and the subsequent progress of students is assessed by the results of examination sessions. During the semester students undergo current, midterm, final control, the procedure is described in the "Regulations on the current control, interim and final certification of students", approved by the Academic Council of 27.08.2020 and in the "Regulations on the current control of progress and interim certification using DLT". The results of all types of control are placed online in accordance with the "Instruction on maintaining an electronic magazine". Each student, using his login and password, at any time can see his or her scores in his or her personal online cabinet.

Grading criteria are defined in the "Regulations on the current control, interim and final attestation of students", in the syllabus of each discipline reflected letter system of evaluation of academic achievements of students, corresponding to the digital equivalent on a four-point scale. The order of implementation of contingent formation procedures (rules of admission, transfer from course to course, from other universities, the order of transfer credits mastered in other universities, expulsion, etc.) is regulated by the "Rules of transfer, restoration, expulsion of students, academic leave". Information about the rules of admission, transfer from course to course, transfer from other universities, the order of transfer credits mastered in other universities, rules of expulsion, as well as other questions students can receive during consultations with advisers, at meetings with the head of the department and the dean.

In 1998, in Lisbon, Kazakhstan signed the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region. The procedure of recognition and nos-trification is carried out by the Republican State Enterprise on the right of economic management "Center of the Bologna Process and academic mobility ENIC-KAZAKHSTAN" of the



MES. Every year KEnEU sends information to the Center of the Bologna Process and academic mobility about the implementation of internationalization of higher education by Kazakhstani universities.

The mechanism of recognition of learning outcomes is regulated by the "Regulations on the recognition of learning outcomes obtained through non-formal education" and academic mobility by the "Regulations on academic mobility of students and teachers". Students and faculty are informed about the programs of external and internal academic mobility through m WhatsApp, the official website and through social networks.

Students who have completed the study program and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the degree of "Master" and are issued a diploma of postgraduate education with a supplement (transcript) and (or) the pan-European Diploma Supplement free of charge. The annex to the diploma (transcript) indicates the latest grades on the SRLS grades for all academic disciplines, research or experimental research work, types of professional practices, final certification, indicating their amount in academic credits.

#### 4.2 Assessment

The study requirements are clearly defined and can also be viewed by applicants across parents on the university's website. The website in question is easy to find and very clearly laid out. The university has a suitable procedure for recording relevant information on the course of studies and taking action if necessary. The review panel assesses the admission procedure as transparently described and well thought-out. At the beginning of their studies, students are sufficiently informed about the course of their studies and all opportunities to participate in university life. Upon completion of their studies, graduates therefore receive meaningful and transparent documents showing the qualifications and learning outcomes acquired. In addition, the university has sufficient procedures in place to collect information on students' progress.

Admission requirements are clearly defined. Admission in relation to the need for teachers ensures that there is no oversupply of trained teachers. In addition to the regular admission procedure, the university supports disabled students and students from national minorities.

The university monitors the development of students during their studies. An important element of student success is the sharing of information about the structure of the study programme, prerequisites for course selection, course objectives, course assignments, examinations, work-load, etc. In the department, a compulsory introductory course is offered to all students, which introduces them to all the above-mentioned areas. In addition, students receive information from various counselling services throughout their stay at the university.

The degree certificates issued by the university enable students to either continue their education at institutions outside the country or to pursue a professional career abroad.



Overall, it can be said that the university has transparent enrolment procedures, records and monitors the development of students and issues sufficiently meaningful graduation certificates that demonstrate the qualifications acquired in the program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences).

#### 4.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

#### 5 ESG Standard 1.5: Teaching staff

## Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff

#### 5.1 Implementation

Personnel policy of KEnEU is a holistic, long-term strategy of personnel management, the main goal of which is to fully and timely meet the needs of the university in human resources of the required quality and quantity. The personnel policy of KEnEU consists of a set of principles, norms and rules, organizational mechanisms, managerial decisions, which are consistent with the strategic direction of the university development.

The basic documents in the formation of personnel policy are the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law "On Education" and the Collective Agreement of KEnEU.

The "Regulation on Personnel Policy", adopted by the decision of the Academic Council on 16.11.2020 ensures the transparency and objectivity of the recruitment procedures, professional growth and development of the university staff. The personnel policy of KEnEU is reflected in such documents as "Code of corporate ethics", "Rules of competitive filling of vacant positions of teaching staff and research workers of KEnEU named after M. Dulatov", "Rules of competitive filling of vacant positions of teaching staff and "Regulations on the system of key performance indicators for faculty members". All projects and programs on the implementation of the personnel policy are headed directly by the Rector of the university. Members of the HR management system implement the main directions of the personnel policy within the authority defined by their job descriptions and regulations on structural divisions.

The personnel management service manages the recruitment of staff through various channels. Recruitment methods of staff are rotation (internal recruitment), a database of candidates, specialized recruitment sites, printed publications and recruitment agencies. Announcements of the competition for faculty positions are published publicly on the HEI's website.



The purpose of the personnel policy is determination of qualification characteristics of positions, competitive selection of personnel, adaptation of young professionals, mentoring and counseling, development planning, professional training and development, retraining of faculty and increasing the effectiveness of the system of motivation and incentives. The policy contains complete information including information on recruitment, professional growth, development and incentive system, legal and social protection. Access to the documents on personnel policy is possible through the university website.

The hiring of faculty, as well as the extension of their tenure, is based on a competitive selection process. Procedures for the admission, registration, dismissal, and certification of EP teachers are carried out in accordance with the Rules of competitive recruitment of teaching staff and academic staff of higher education institutions, approved by Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated from October 30, 2018.

The effectiveness and quality of teaching, which is assessed by holding open classes, which are held according to the approved schedule with subsequent analysis and discussion at least once a semester at the meetings of the department, serve as evidence of the level of competence of teachers. The department keeps a journal of the self-attendance of classes, in which each teacher enters information about the classes he or she attended. Teachers fill out a special form that reflects the results of the self-attendance.

The level of competence of teachers is confirmed by the effectiveness and quality of teaching, assessed through open classes, mutual visits to classes, as well as questionnaires "Teacher through the eyes of the student", "Teacher through the eyes of colleagues". The results of these activities serve as the basis for extending employment contracts, recommending a teacher for participation in the "Best Teacher" competition.

The requirements for the teaching staff are reflected in the "Qualification Characteristics of the positions of teaching staff at KEnEU named after M. Dulatov" (adopted by the decision of the Academic Council on June 22, 2021).

The quality of educational and methodical materials used, the timeliness of assignments for students' independent work, the organization of control and evaluation of students' progress is analyzed at the meetings of the department and methodical councils of faculties.

Depending on the number of students and the number of hours of teaching load, the need for the educational program in the teaching staff is annually determined. To cover the teaching load, the university invites qualified master's graduates, practitioners with extensive practical and industrial experience and teachers of other universities.

Currently 25 teachers are involved in the EP. Out of which 20 are full-time, 5 have a Doctor of Science degree and 9 candidates of science.



The university pays special attention to the professional development of young teachers. Following methods are used in the development of young professionals: creation of psychologically comfortable conditions for the professional activity of the teacher during the period of his professional adaptation; mentoring, the purpose of which is to help young and beginning teachers; involvement of the teachers to solving the problems of the university development, realization of the programs, projects on the basis of cooperation and pedagogical co-operation; involvement of young teachers in the organization of university-wide events.

Involving working practitioners in the learning process helps meet the needs and goals of the program. Criteria for a practitioner to qualify for teaching is current work in the production corresponding to the profile of EP, a diploma of higher education in the EP profile, certificates of advanced training courses in the EP profile and the leading position in the organization of the EP profile. The decision on the selection of candidates is made by the head of the department.

Attestation commission (AC) is created for the final attestation of master's students. The chairmen of the AC are scientists from universities of the republic, managers, leading specialists of enterprises. Only external specialists from organizations, whose qualification corresponds to the profile of the work or thesis to be defended, are involved in reviewing graduate works. Reviewers of graduate works are approved by order of the rector by a general list on the proposal of the head of the department, indicating the place of work and the position held.

In accordance with the regulations on incentives and financial assistance to university staff, the employer encourages employees who have high performance. The incentives may include certificates of merit, inclusion in the Gallery of Honor, the issuance of a bonus in connection with the anniversary of the birth date, a bonus in connection with reaching a retirement age, the payment of bonuses under the KPI system, as well as bonuses for loyalty to the university. Staff subject to bonuses and incentives are selected from among the faculty members and appointed by the direct supervisor of the unit in accordance with the merits of the employee to the university and their performance.

During the entire period of study, communication and support of students is organized by university faculty advisors, who are approved by order of the dean for the academic year. Additional payment is provided to the advisors.

Due to the widespread use of digital technologies and the transition to distance or blended learning mode in connection with the pandemic COVID-19, all teachers can conduct online lectures on the platform AdobeConnect, develop presentations for each lesson in MS Office PowerPoint and develop interactive surveys in Google-forms.

KEnEU develops academic mobility of teaching staff through contracts/agreements with partner universities within the framework of internal and external academic mobility.



According to the Academic Integrity Policy, approved by the Academic Council meeting of August 27, 2020, the provisions of this normative document are mandatory for all participants of the academic and scientific process of the university.

#### 5.2 Assessment

The university uses all legally approved methods of recruitment, including through internal rotation, the study of candidate databases, specialized recruitment sites, data from print publications and recruitment agencies. Announcements of the competition for teaching positions are published publicly on the university's website. Officials are engaged in the selection of personnel within their powers, defined by their job descriptions and regulations on structural units.

The personnel policy is transparent, access to documents is possible through the university's website. The documents regulate the recruitment procedure, the policy of professional growth, development and incentive systems, legal and social protection.

The procedures for admission, registration, dismissal and certification of teachers are carried out in accordance with the Rules of competitive recruitment of teaching staff of higher educational institutions approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018.

The university encourages the professional development of teachers, but there are very few teachers who have been trained in foreign enterprises, scientific and educational institutions. Yet the University scientists are engaged in scientific activities, participating in Erasmus+ programs, regional projects. The academic and professional qualifications of the teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program ensure the achievement of the goals and program learning outcomes defined by the respective program. As indicated in the selfreport, out of 25 teachers, only 56% have an academic degree. Of these, 5 teachers work parttime. For the master's degree level, it is desirable to attract the most qualified and engaged in scientific research teachers, to bring the degree to 100%. Yet the progress has to pointed out: There are highly qualified teachers with academic degrees and titles participate in the implementation of accredited Master's degree programs. The existence of an effective system of motivation and stimulation of teachers' activities is well constructed and takes into account all types of work: educational, scientific, international, public, career guidance. The inclusion of representatives of professional practice in the educational process should also be emphasised, which contributes to practice-oriented learning.

Procedures for the competitive selection of teachers are transparent and allow to ensure the necessary level of their professionalism for the successful implementation of the educational program.



The procedure of competitive selection for the positions of scientific and pedagogical workers at the University is regulated by the relevant Regulations and determines the main requirements and procedures of competitive selection.

The announcement of the competition is posted on the University's website in accordance with the legislation. When evaluating candidates during the competitive selection of teachers, academic and professional qualifications are taken into account in accordance with the goals of the educational program and professional activity. The level of proficiency in the state language, foreign languages, the presence of an academic title, a scientific degree in the specialty of teaching disciplines is taken into account; availability of scientific publications, including in Scopus, WoS, textbooks, manuals, methodological developments, participation in international projects, internships, experience of teaching and practical work, participation in grant projects and research topics, etc.

The institution of higher education promotes the professional development of teachers through its own programs or in cooperation with other organizations.

The university, together with its partners, provides various forms of professional development of teachers.

Teachers improve their professional qualifications and teaching skills mostly through participation in projects, internships, trainings, etc.

The institution of higher education attracts practicing professionals, industry experts, and representatives of employers to classroom classes.

All teachers of the program improve their professional qualifications on an ongoing basis in the areas of the disciplines they teach. Teachers undergo internships, courses to improve pedagogical skills. The best practices are the academic mobility of teachers, both international and national, to participate in conferences, forums, and seminars. Active academic and professional activity contributes to the internationalization of the educational program and the University. The competitive selection procedure is transparent, takes into account teachers' professionalism, experience, and pedagogical skills.

Professional teaching is assured. Applicant selection and staff development are clearly regulated and meet all standards. There is no doubt about the academic qualifications of the teaching staff. The numerical ratio of teachers to students is very good, which is also appreciated by the students. In the discussions with lecturers and students, the impression was confirmed that the staff is very good, both quantitatively and qualitatively. The students confirmed very good supervision by the lecturers. All lecturers are very well qualified. They describe the situation in class and the contact with the lecturers as extremely pleasant and motivating. Yet, the



English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.

The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.

Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.

There should be a development and implementation of a system to recruit the best teachers from universities in the region and abroad, including through broad information on selection procedures for positions.

Even though It is recommended that greater use be made of opportunities to recruit faculty from leading foreign educational and scientific institutions to jointly guide students in the study of cross-sectoral scientific problems.

It is recommended that the benefits of international cooperation be used to invite leading foreign scientists to participate in a training programme.

#### 5.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

#### 6 ESG Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support

Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.

#### 6.1 Implementation

KEnEU has a modern material, technical and information base, corresponding to the mission, goals and objectives of the university, as well as the requirements of sanitary norms and fire safety and the requirements of the state compulsory standards on the implemented educational programs.

The university infrastructure includes teaching and laboratory buildings, dormitory, sports facilities, library, medical unit and other educational and auxiliary facilities.

The academic buildings and student dormitory are equipped with firefighting devices in the form of fire hydrants with hoses, educational laboratories are equipped with fire extinguishing means.

In the educational process, 620 PCs (including laptops) are used, which is 80% of the total number of computer equipment of the university. 27 classrooms are additionally equipped with



projectors, screens and interactive boards, which are used by the teaching staff for presentations at lectures, seminars, conferences and defenses of master's theses.

Conformity of educational resources to the objectives of the educational program is determined by the "Plan for the development of the educational program" for 2020-2025, which defines the strategic directions, goals, objectives, target indicators, activities and indicators of results and responsible persons.

The development of infrastructure and material and technical resources is planned according to the annual work plan, approved by the rector, which is developed taking into account the strategic plan and necessary changes.

The development of information resources is planned according to the annual work plan of the Department of Information Technology, approved by the rector, which is developed taking into account the strategic plan and the necessary changes in the infrastructure of the university.

Information support available at the university is adequate, as it corresponds to the strategic objectives of the university and the requirements enshrined in the Standard Rules of higher and postgraduate education organizations, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015.

All internal information resources of the university are available daily from 8:30 to 17:30 (except weekends). If necessary, access to internal resources via VPN is provided. Students have free access to the library and computer labs. Ten personal computers are available to users of the e-Learning Room.

To expand online learning opportunities, Adobe Connect was introduced into the learning process, which allowed a significant expansion of distance learning and communication: conducting lectures online, recording video lectures with the ability to listen online at any convenient time.

The following open educational resources are used in the educational process of the university: video hosting YouTube (cycles of video lectures on disciplines), National Open University IN-TUIT platform (courses on disciplines and fragments of professional development programs). The choice of the platform and materials is conditioned by the preference of the leading teachers.

Students have access to a Wi-Fi network SSID, studentnet, which is constantly being upgraded to provide better coverage on the territory of the university.

The library fund is completed according to the list of subjects studied in the EP and in accordance with the Instruction on the formation of the library fund of KEnEU, developed on 30.12.2011 on the basis of the order of Ministry of Education and Science "On Approval of the



Instruction on the formation of the library fund of the state educational organizations of RK", in accordance with the profile of the university, perspective plan of KEnEU and the analysis of the provision of the educational process with books.

The library fund, including educational, methodical and scientific literature in general education, basic and specialized disciplines is represented on paper and electronic media and amounts to 349,002 copies of documents, including 29,555 copies in the state language, where: paper-based publications - 224,467 copies; e-Electronic publications - 124 540 copies.

All electronic educational and methodical complex of the discipline (EMCD), developed by the teachers of the university, are available on the educational portal of KEnEU in the section "Teaching materials". The digital library of the university provides links to the most popular open access electronic libraries, collections and databases.

Work on filling the electronic library is in progress. The most requested publications were scanned and placed in the university electronic library. As of November 21, 2021 the university electronic library has 1,762 (5410 - 2020) titles of educational and scientific materials. The work on replenishment of electronic libraries under the contracts with Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library (RIEL) and with the Unified Electronic Library of the National Center for Scientific and Technical Information (UEL NCSTI), the works of the teaching staff of the university continues.

To expand printed information resources, contracts are signed with the leading libraries of the city (L.N. Tolstoy Regional Academic Library, City Central Library, I. Altynsarin Library, libraries of universities of Kostanay).

Support and counseling for students consists of assistance with independent work and individual consultations by teachers. Interactive resources of the university help in planning and execution of training programs. With the help of these resources, students can get acquainted with the guidebook, academic calendar, schedule of classes, as well as the results of their academic achievements.

Advising students on the educational process is carried out by EP Advisors and the Student Services Center, students can contact them through the online "Personal account".

Since March 2020 the university has been using the system https://www.antiplagiat.ru/, due to the fact that this platform has a sufficient number of sources for checking and constantly improving algorithms for checking, which allows more efficient detection of plagiarism.

The university uses Tamberg video conferencing systems, as well as such platforms as Adobe Connect, Zoom and others, to participate and conduct video conferences.



Support of EP is carried out by https://sdo.kineu.kz/, which is an internal portal of KEnEU and is a resource aggregator with an access to the internal university systems: database of graduates, library, video conferencing control log, ratings, test builder and Automated management system of a higher educational institution (AMS HEI).

AMS HEI is used to work with the contingent of students and is used by the Admissions Committee, dean's offices, the educational department and the student's office. It is also used to assign admission of students to examinations and sessions, comparison of tests for testing. The entire educational process and all student data are stored and processed in the AMS HEI.

The degree of satisfaction of students, teaching staff and employees with available resources is determined annually by the "Marketing and Communications Department" through student surveys.

The University Center for Entrepreneurship creates conditions for the integration of science and education among students. Among the tasks of the Center is the development and independent implementation of research works and socio-educational projects.

To conduct online classes in webinar format 20 workstations are equipped for faculty .

Modern software is used for educational and research purposes. Academic license from Autodesk allows working with engineering and graphic software such AutoCAD, 3DMax, ArchiCAD, Maya, Inventor and others.

The university has created necessary conditions for people with disabilities, which are regulated in the document "Regulations on the implementation of inclusive education in the institution of Kostanay Engineering and Economics University named after M. Dulatov".

The university building provides equal opportunities for students with special needs: separate entrance to the university building with a gentle ramp and a designated bell to summon an aide, stationary ramps with special devices in front of the entrance to the foyer, a mnemonic diagram at the entrance for visually impaired people, a specialized toilet, an equipped parking place with a special signs, signs are made in contrasting yellow color markings, signs made in Braille, vtactile tiles in the foyer leading to the room of inclusive education and the bathroom, university website with the possibility of adaptation for the visually impaired (audio accompaniment of the transition, the possibility to listen).

Informing and advising groups of students and all stakeholders are carried out by the university staff whose contact information are provided in the "Personal office" on the portal of the university. The names and phone numbers of the Advisor, Dean, Head of Department, Coordinator of the Student Services Center, Technical Support, DDL, the Appeals Commission and Psychological Support, teachers are provided.



Each academic group of undergraduates is assigned an advisor. The activities of the advisor are carried out in accordance with the "Regulations on the organization of the Advisor's work". The advisor provides assistance to the student in the development of an individual study trajectory, consults students on academic issues, controls the progress of students on the educational trajectory, notifies students about the activities of the university (conferences, practices, competitions, Olympiads, distribution of grants, etc.), provides information and consulting support about the opportunities, conditions and prospects of educational, scientific and other activities both within the university and in other organizations, informs about academic mobility programs, provides support during the academic mobility and assists foreign students and students from other universities.

Student Service Center receives applications of students in accordance with the current rules, organizes and issues student cards, electronic passes, certificates, diplomas and regularly updates student database and provides advisory support to students on various issues of the educational process.

Department of Distance Learning (DDL) assists in recordings of online classes in webinar format and placement of the material in the distance learning system.

Safety and security at the university is carried out in accordance with the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Standard Rules of educational organizations that implement educational programs of higher education, other laws and regulations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The university has a video surveillance system and a pass system to ensure the safety of students and faculty.

Departments regularly check the organization of the learning process for compliance with the requirements of labor safety, sanitary norms and rules, instructions on labor protection with students, the availability of instructions for labor protection when carrying out laboratory, practical and research work and logs of the registration of the briefings.

Due to the Covid-19 pandemic the university adopted the "Rules of Conduct in a state of emergency".

#### 6.2 Assessment

The ratio between the number of students and the teaching materials and spaces is appropriate. Libraries and classrooms are well digitised and it should be mentioned which has a positive effect on the development process of student-centred learning. Therefore, the premises and equipment are adequate to support the effective implementation of the programme objectives and learning success in all respects.



From the meeting with the student council and the self-evaluation report, it can be concluded that the information provided to the students about the service facilities of the university is very good.

The resource facilities of the study programme can be described as very good. The modern and excellent equipment, which corresponds to the subject standards, is suitable for providing students with a sound education. In the opinion of the review panel, the overall resource endowment is thus very well suited for the implementation of the degree programme. Buildings, rooms and technical equipment can be described as exemplary. The library offers students extensive support in searching for information and using the available technology. The university is also well equipped for digital teaching.

The needs of a heterogeneous student body are also adequately addressed. Internal quality assurance takes material resources into account in its evaluation culture and regularly solicits feedback from students. The evaluation team assesses all material, financial and human resources as fully sufficient to achieve the qualification goals of the study programme The needs of a heterogeneous student body are taken into account in every respect.

For the administrative staff, there is the possibility of individual further development. The scope and qualifications of the non-academic administrative staff can be described as very good. Sufficient opportunities for further training are available.

It can be stated that the degree programme has a high degree of studyability. Yet, the University of Applied Science Weihenstephan-Triesdorf should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.

In order to guarantee the implementation of the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences), the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.

# 6.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

# 7 ESG Standard 1.7: Information management

Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.



## 7.1 Implementation

KEnEU provides a system of information collection, analysis and management based on modern communication technologies and software tools.

In the process of EP management, elements of information systems by functional areas are used. Transparency of the processes of formation and content of the EP development plan is carried out through the awareness of the teaching staff, employees, students and stakeholders in the following ways: the official website of the university, university internal portal, social and other media.

The activities of the departments offering the EP are determined by the Strategic Development Plan. Those responsible for the functioning of information management processes and the reliability of the information provided are determined from among the participants and managers of the processes in accordance with job descriptions and internal regulatory documents.

If necessary, the regulations and rules are updated, the persons responsible for the processes make the necessary changes and additions. All regulations governing the educational process are approved by collegial governing bodies (Academic Council, EMC). The frequency of information collection and analysis is determined by the appropriate process.

Access to the university internal portal is confidential and is carried out through a personal access information of students and faculty. The personal office of the learner in the subsystem "Student Cabinet" provides information on academic calendar, guidebook, catalog of elective disciplines, practice bases on specialties, access to the electronic library of KEnEU, a collection of links to open electronic libraries. In addition, information about the current progress, the results of examinations, ratings and the current level of tuition fees is posted. Personal account is used by students to view their individual study plan, the schedule of classes, access training materials, etc.

Assessment of the quality of information management is based on the analysis of methods and forms of information collection, analysis of decisions of collegial bodies and management, survey of information systems and software tools and survey of information resources, questionnaires of students, teaching staff and other stakeholders.

Educational programs, departments and faculties provide annual reports, which are considered at the meetings of departments, Faculty Council and EMC of the university. In the context of EP, the annual reports on the results of monitoring reflect admission, graduation rates, the results of examination sessions, employment, etc.

The general report of the university is heard at the meeting of the Academic Council.



Various questionnaires were developed, adapted and tested at KEnEU: "Teacher in the eyes of the student", "Customer satisfaction assessment with studying at the university", "Quality satisfaction analysis of educational program", "Dining hall work satisfaction questionnaire", "Student satisfaction with professional practice results". The results of the survey are analyzed at meetings of collegial bodies, allow to identify problems and areas of improvement.

Employers, social partners take part in the examination of EPs, according to the results of which changes are made such as (exclusion of unclaimed disciplines from IEP, introduction of practice-oriented courses, etc.).

In order to study the interests of employers during the academic year, meetings and round tables with the participation of interested parties and persons are regularly held. Taking into account the interests of employers and deepening the professional training of bachelors the relevant elective disciplines are introduced.

The EP development plan is publicly discussed with representatives of all stakeholders. Students, who are members of the Faculty Council and Academic Council, also take an active part in the discussion and decision-making process.

EP management provides annual revision of the content of curricula and educational programs taking into account the opinion of the representatives of leading enterprises and organizations of this direction, which are discussed and approved at the meeting of the department and the Academic Council of KEnEU.

To determine the degree of satisfaction of the teaching staff, staff and students with the management system, meetings with the rector, vice-rectors in the areas of activity, heads of structural subdivisions are held periodically. The university conducts systematically surveys on issues related to the development of the social sphere, academic activities, organization of leisure time outside of academic hours, wages of employees and financial support of students.

Every year at KEnEU the quality of EP is monitored. Quality monitoring is a specially organized target control and diagnosis of the state of EP on the basis of the systematization of existing sources of information, as well as specially organized studies and measurements. This procedure is defined by the Regulations "On monitoring the quality of educational programs" (approved by the meeting of EMC dated 25.06.2018.

The subjects of monitoring are heads of departments, heads of EP, members of CDEP, employers, graduates. The results of admission and graduation of students are defined as performance indicators of EP. Qualitative indicators include the results of exam sessions, employment rate, satisfaction of graduates and employers according to the results of the survey.



In order to fulfill a requirement of the Ministry of Education and Science on the need to verify the data on the employment of graduates which is gathered from the State Center for Pensions, a procedure on creating a database of graduates is implemented.

The internal information is represented by the operational data that includes information about the contingent of students, orders of enrollment, restoration, expulsion, as well as the appointment of scholarships, personal cards of students, reports on their progress, statements, certificates of employment of graduates; information about the teachers, applications, orders and instructions on transfer of personnel, information on professional development, teaching load of the teaching staff, data on scientific activity and international cooperation and information on assessment procedures.

There are various mechanisms of communication in the university. The system of informing and receiving feedback from students, staff and other stakeholders is provided through the information portal https://kineu.edu.kz/, which has information on staff and also news, events, announcements.

Staff, students and employers can send questions to the university management in the blog of the rector. Boxes for questions and suggestions are located in the university buildings. Rector and administration of the university conduct a daily reception of the teaching staff, employees and students on personal, personnel and other issues.

Faculty members and students are directly involved in the processes of collecting and analyzing information, taking part in meetings of the departments, in the meetings of the Academic Council and Rectorate.

Ways to determine the degree of student satisfaction with the management system are: questioning, surveys, interviews, testing, organizing a forum on the website, the presence of a trust box.

Every year, in November and in March, as part of the monitoring of the quality of education a study is carried out to identify student satisfaction with the learning environment.

To determine the degree of satisfaction of the teaching staff, staff and students with the university management system, meetings with the rector, vice-rectors, heads of departments are held periodically. Systematically conducted surveys on issues related to the development of the social sphere, academic activities, organization of leisure time outside of academic hours, wages of employees and financial support of students. According to the results of the information received, the reasons for inconsistencies and the degree of satisfaction with the management system are analyzed, and decisions on adjustments are made.



Assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of the departments and their interaction is carried out by hearing of the reports of managers at operational meetings, scheduled meetings of the rectorate and the Academic Council. During the year, an internal audit of department work is conducted, by the results of which corrective and/or preventive actions are developed in case of discrepancies.

## 7.2 Assessment

The university has a well-functioning information management system. The administration has thorough data collection systems. The current and complete data structure is used very well for the internal quality management system. The evaluation of the data is accompanied by quality assurance measures and planning of follow-up activities.

The programme uses the existing infrastructure of the university to collect student feedback on individual courses and lectures as well as on the environment at the university in general. Students report that they feel encouraged to give feedback to lecturers and that their feedback is well received by lecturers. A survey of student satisfaction with the quality and conditions of the study programme is conducted annually to investigate student opinion on the quality of the University's educational and administrative services.

For the programme that is in the process of being accredited, there is sufficient information to attract applicants.

The university has the necessary procedures for collecting and analysing information about the programme, including key performance indicators, information about the student body, the level of academic achievement, student performance and examinations. Students are provided with educational resources and student support services.

The expert group therefore notes that the university regularly collects and analyses information on the study programme, students, graduates and other activities as part of the quality management system and makes it available to the internal quality assurance system.

Both students and teachers are involved in the processes through a procedure and existing structures at the university. In addition, graduates and employers are also involved in the process.

Thus, as part of the university's quality management, data on students is collected and their assessment is carried out. Also based on the self-evaluation report of the university and the discussions during the online evaluation, the expert group was able to confirm that the institution implements the necessary measures to assess the quality of teaching.

Information management includes the use of various methods to provide information. Confidentiality of information is also guaranteed.



# 7.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

# 8 ESG Standard 1.8: Public information

Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.

# 8.1 Implementation

Informing the public about its activities, conditions and features of the implementation of EP is carried out primarily through the official website of the university.

The information published by the university as part of the EP is accurate, objective, up-to-date and includes: implemented programs, with an indication of the expected learning outcomes, information on the possibility of awarding a qualification upon the completion of the program, information about the teaching staff, teaching methods, and evaluation of learning achievements, information on passing grades and learning opportunities available to students, on learning opportunities are posted on the University website in the tab "Student"/ "Reference Guide", information about the employment of graduates is posted on the website in the section "Graduate"/ "Employment".

The procedure for determining the ways of presenting information, requirements to the sources of information, the form of presenting information are also prescribed in the Regulation on Information Policy. The university is represented in 7 social networks including Instagram, Facebook, LinkedIn etc.

The university organizes events to explain and support the national development programs of Kazakhstan, such as "Rukhani Zhangyru", "Digital Kazakhstan", "Educated Nation", "Kaz Volunteer" and others.

The university has its own scientific journal "Nauka".

The university's financial statements are posted annually on the website.

Information about the accreditation of EPs can be found on the website in the section "University"/"Accreditation".

The general public, stakeholders, students, employees and stakeholders are informed about the activities of the university also through the media, news publishers and newspapers "Kostanay News", "Kostanay-Agro", "Our Kostanay", "Alau", "NG", "Teacher +", "Bilimdi News" as well as TV channels Qostanay, Alau.



#### 8.2 Assessment

The main source of public information about the study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) is the official website of the university, the website of the Faculty of Agricultural Economics, the website of the Faculty of Agrobusiness and Management, and website of the Master's Center which is the graduation department for this study program.

All persons interested in receiving information about events at the university and, in particular, information updates on program have informational support through close communication using various social networks: Facebook, Instagram. The Master's Preparing Center additionally highlights all information related to the program on its official Facebook page. Considerable attention is paid to the coverage of all events related to the organization of the educational process, the life of students and graduates. The university has its own YouTube channel, where all scientific and educational events of the university are covered and students upload videos. Students can find here the information about the history of successful partnership, advantages of studying the master's program etc.

The university offers detailed information on studying and teaching as well as on the university's main research areas. Organisational documents and relevant regulations are made available on the website. Contact persons and contact points for the degree programme and student life are clearly and transparently named.

The information provided to the public about the degree programme is satisfactory overall. There are many opportunities for prospective students to find out about the university and student life.

Information about study programmes is publicly available (admission criteria, learning outcomes, qualifications awarded, information about employment of graduates, etc.). Information about the study programme that is in line with the university's mission is secured. High school graduates, students, graduates and other interested groups can find out about the university's activities and offers on its homepage. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions. Yet there should be better strategic communication activities developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.

The university provides information about its activities, such as the degree programme and the selection criteria for admission, the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes, the teaching, learning and examination methods, the student success rates and the qualifications of the teaching staff.



In addition, the university provides information on its homepage about its academic achievements, such as publications, external and internal conferences and events, as well as nonacademic achievements, such as cultural and social projects and activities.

The study-related documents and information are to be accessible to both students and prospective students. In addition, contact persons are named for further information and questions.

The university provides information about its activities. The University conducts its activities based on the principles of transparency, openness, involvement and awareness-raising of all stakeholders in educational activities: One of the main means of providing information is through the use of information technology and media. In addition to the information on the University's website, the public and applicants are provided with information on the specifics of the study programme under accreditation through events such as the Open Day.

#### 8.3 Conclusion

The criterion is **fulfilled.** 

# 9 ESG Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes

Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.

#### 9.1 Implementation

The university conducts monitoring and periodic assessment of EP in order to ensure the achievement of the objectives of the study programs and to meet the needs of students and society. Changes of the educational programs are made as necessary in accordance with the requirements of legislative and regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of higher professional education and the current needs of society and labor market development. In addition, new elective disciplines, reflecting the current state of the agro-industrial complex, are periodically included. Compliance with the needs of consumers is provided by the involvement of representatives of enterprises in the development of CEDs. According to the results of monitoring the satisfaction of the needs of students and employers, changes in the EP are taken into account, aimed at improving the EP.

At the end of the academic year, at the meeting of the department with the participation of all interested parties, a self-assessment of the curriculum is carried out, taking into account the



changes made, the results achieved, the effectiveness and the efficiency of the EP implementation are discussed. Also, at least once a year, EMCDs are subjected to examination by the members of EMC of the Faculty.

The analysis of compliance of the title and content of the disciplines to the current directions of scientific development is carried out by reviewing the EP and CEDs by employers. In addition, any interested person can make their suggestions on the website of the university, where these documents are posted, for example, write to the blog of the rector.

The results of achieving the goals of the educational program are analyzed according to the results of the AC. The reports of the AC chairmen on the educational program are heard at the meetings of the department and the Academic Council of the university. Recommendations on improving graduate training, noted in the reports of the AC chairmen, are taken into account in the content of EP, CEDs, teaching and teaching materials of disciplines.

#### 9.2 Assessment

The Examination of the regulatory documents in the Academic Policy section of the university's website, the self-evaluation report, the results of the faculty and student survey, and the results of the online survey confirmed that monitoring and regular evaluation of the study programme "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) is carried out at the University.

The schedule of activities for monitoring the quality of education was approved, according to which the University monitors and regularly evaluates the study programmes in order to achieve the objectives and meet the needs of students and society. In order to determine the level of satisfaction of internal needs, the University organises and conducts a survey among students, faculty and University staff every academic session.

The survey is conducted to determine the level of satisfaction with the students' educational needs, their attitude towards the educational process, the socio-cultural environment, etc.

The results of the survey are statistically analysed, discussed in the administrative meetings and taken into account in the further planning of educational activities. According to the monitoring statistics, the programme management analyses and compiles the survey results in order to initiate the necessary measures to achieve the desired results.

The existing quality management seems to function according to a hierarchical principle. However, the goal is a functioning control circle between the participants in order to improve the quality of research and teaching (Circle of Quality). This Circle of Quality functions according to the bottom up - top down principle.

The university regularly reviews the strategy and policy in the area of quality and monitors its implementation.

# ACGUIN

Overall, it should be noted that responsibilities are clearly and comprehensibly regulated, not least because the core processes of quality assurance are documented in the university's regulations.

Feedback between students and teachers is a prerequisite for improving teaching and should be introduced. The evaluation results of the anonymous course evaluations will be presented to the students after the surveys and discussed with them in order to derive concrete measures for improving teaching.

It became clear in the discussions that there is definitely close contact with the graduates and that they are surveyed very soon after graduation.

The course evaluations thus serve the continuous development and improvement of quality and studyability. The student workload is continuously surveyed in the course evaluations; corresponding questions are included in the questionnaires. An evaluation of the workload through a module should take place at regular intervals.

Students are made aware of the student workload and examination requirements by the lecturers at the beginning of the course. In the degree programme, the measure of how many hours one ECTS point corresponds to the student workload is anchored in the regulatory documents.

With regard to the quality of teaching, it should be noted that measures to ensure it begin with the recruitment of teaching staff. In addition, the university offers teaching staff various further training opportunities, both on technical and didactic topics.

It can be stated that there is a combination of internal and external quality management in order to offer its own study programmes in a generally ESG-compliant manner.

The study program "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) is regularly evaluated to ensure quality and to check compliance with the high quality standards. Ongoing monitoring of the study programme is carried out in accordance with the quality assurance policy. The programme is reviewed regularly and if changes are required, they are made. This process is exemplary. The study programmes thus have suitable and different procedures for internal quality assurance.

The University has a systematic procedure of analysis, development, monitoring and periodic revision of the educational program. Employers who confirmed this process as transparent, understandable and accessible are involved in the improvement of the educational program. A culture of quality has been formed in the academic community of the University, which contributes to the continuous development of the educational program and educational activities under this program.



The process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders is insufficiently organized. It is recommended to strengthen work on the organization of the process of collecting proposals from various groups of stakeholders.

Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.

#### 9.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

# 10 ESG Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance

# Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis

#### 10.1 Implementation

The Department of Marketing and Communications annually makes a plan of surveys for the current academic year, in the framework of which the survey of students by means of Google-form is carried out. During the surveys the level of student satisfaction with EP is revealed. The results of the surveys are discussed at the meetings of the departments, which is reflected in the minutes, are reported at the meetings of the Rectorate.

The university regularly undergoes external quality assurance in the framework of accreditations. The university received an institutional accreditation from a Kazakh national accreditation body. In addition, study programs are accredited by the national accreditation body.

# 10.2 Assessment

As far as the legal framework of quality assurance is concerned, the study programme is conducted in accordance with the regulations and guidelines. For this purpose, the university has a combination of internal and external quality management to offer the study programme in accordance with the ESG. The University has undergone institutional accreditation. The accreditation results are incorporated into the structuring of the university's business processes. Of particular importance is the cooperation with external stakeholders such as partner universities, graduates, industry and employers in order to gain impetus for continuous internal quality development.

Quality management ensures very well that the general quality assurance measures and instruments are constantly up-to-date and transparent. The University fulfils all obligatory aspects of external quality assurance: the different organisational units and levels are adequately



in place and were explained in detail in the interviews with the HEI. Both internal and external quality assurance of the University's measures take into account all legal requirements and benefit from each other to advance the quality development of the study program. External quality assurance extends to all necessary organisational levels such as financial operations and educational provision. The internal and external quality assurance mechanisms for the continuous development of the programe is well developed and the cyclical functioning of the programe's quality assessment is effective. The quality of the surveys and the processing of the results can be rated as very good. No specific problems in the cyclical external quality assurance were reported for the study program.

The follow-up activities of the university's external quality assurance in preparing the next procedure are generally well thought out. The results of the external assessment and recognition of the quality of the study program (reports, expert opinions, etc.) are published on the university's website.

In conclusion, the coherence between external and internal quality assurances is well structured.

#### 10.3 Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.



# IV Recommendation to the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

# 1 Assessment of compliance the Standards and Guidelines in the Higher European Area (ESG) in the actual official version

The study programme "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) was assessed on the basis of the "Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area" (ESG) and the national or other relevant regulations.

The expert group concludes that the **ESG standards** 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), 1.4 (Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), 1.5 (Teaching staff), 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), 1.7 (Information management), 1.8 (Public information), 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes) and 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) are fulfilled.

The assessment criteria are as follows:

**Standard 1.1 Policy for quality assurance:** Universities have a publicly accessible quality assurance strategy, which is part of their strategic management. This strategy is developed and implemented by internal stakeholder representatives through appropriate structures and processes, involving external stakeholders.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.2 Design and approval of programmes:** Universities have procedures for the design and approval of their courses. The courses are designed in such a way that their objectives, including the desired learning outcomes, can be achieved. The qualification obtained during a degree program is clearly defined and communicated; it refers to the corresponding level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled.** 



**Standard 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification:** Universities ensure that the courses offered are carried out in such a way as to encourage students to play an active role in the design of the learning process and that this approach is also taken into account when assessing students / examinations.

The criterion is **fulfilled.** 

**Standard 1.5 Teaching staff:** Universities ensure the competence of their teachers. They use fair and transparent procedures for the recruitment and further training of their employees.

The criterion is fulfilled.

**Standard 1.6 Learning resources and student support:** The university has adequate funding to finance study and teaching and ensure that there is always a sufficient and readily available range of learning and support available for their studies.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.7 Information management:** Universities ensure that they collect, analyze and use the relevant data relevant to the successful conduct of studies and other activities.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.8 Public information:** Universities publish easily understandable, correct, objective, up-to-date and well-accessible information about their activities and courses of study.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes:** Universities are constantly monitoring their courses and regularly reviewing them to ensure that they achieve the goals set and meet the needs of students and society. The tests lead to a continuous improvement of the courses. All affected parties will be informed about any measures planned or resulting from this.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

**Standard 1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance:** Universities regularly undergo external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the ESG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.



The peer-review experts note that the recommendations from the previous accreditation procedure have been adequately taken into account.

# 2 Accreditation Recommendation

The peer-review experts recommend an unconditional accreditation of the study programme "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) with the following recommendations:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- 2. Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- 3. The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should prevail at all partner universities.
- 4. The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- 5. Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- 6. The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- 7. In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- 8. Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- 9. Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- 10. It is recommended to develop new tools for involving all stakeholders in the development of directions for the strategic development of the University, for example, to strengthen the role of the Board of Trustees in the development of strategic directions.



- 11. The role of student self-government bodies should be enroled in actualizing the mission, goals and objectives of the university concerning the educational and scientific policy of the university aimed at the development of international academic contacts.
- 12. Taking into account the University's desire to ensure continuous improvement of the quality of education, including receiving high marks at the International level, when developing documents and conducting procedures in the field of Quality Assurance Policy, it is recommended to more actively involve and analyze in detail the opinions of invited foreign colleagues.
- 13. With the objective participation of representatives of the teaching staff, the student body, employers in the development of basic regulatory documents, it is recommended to record their participation with appropriate signatures in the developed documents.
- 14. It seems necessary to document the procedure and timing of control, as well as the revision of the quality assurance policy.
- 15. It seems necessary to conduct a systematic analysis of the demand for graduates.
- 16. It seems necessary to increase the participation of undergraduates and the professional community in the formation of educational programs, while documenting the procedure and mechanisms for taking into account the opinions of interested parties.
- 17. It seems necessary to take into account the requirements and an individual approach to students under targeted training contracts based on the conditions of the "customer", therefore, the introduction of a set of optional disciplines, in-depth study of individual disciplines of the curriculum.
- 18. Better data collection regarding the academic mobility of students should be collected.
- 19. There should be a development and implementation of a system to recruit the best teachers from universities in the region and abroad, including through broad information on selection procedures for positions.
- 20. Even though It is recommended that greater use be made of opportunities to recruit faculty from leading foreign educational and scientific institutions to jointly guide students in the study of cross-sectoral scientific problems.
- 21. It is recommended that the benefits of international cooperation be used to invite leading foreign scientists to participate in a training programme.



## V Decisions of the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN

Based on the evaluation report of the expert group and the statements of the Higher Education Institutions the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN makes on the 09 May 2023 the following decisions unanimously:

# The study programme "Agricultural Management" (Master of Economic Sciences) at the Kostanay Engineering and Economics University named after M. Dulatov is accredited without any conditions.

#### The accreditation is valid until 30. September 2031.

The following recommendations are given for the further development of the study programme:

- Students' English language skills should be improved. Higher entrance requirements should be created with regard to English skills or students should be offered compulsory language courses to improve their English language skills.
- Within the framework of the further development of the curriculum, current topics such as big data and digitalisation should be given greater consideration.
- The same standards and uniform application procedures for teaching staff should be prevailed at all partner universities.
- The English language skills of teaching and administrative staff should be improved and corresponding further training courses implemented.
- Professional practice representatives should be consulted in an institutionalised way in curriculum development.
- The HSWT should establish a good administrative infrastructure for all partner universities and create even more support services in general and during student mobility phases with a view to even better studyability.
- In order to guarantee the implementation of the study programmes, the staff should also grow with the increasing number of students.
- Better strategic communication activities should be developed to publicise the study offer in order to arouse the interest of potential applicants in the long term.
- Standardised evaluation procedures should be introduced, in order to advance the quality assurance of the study programme and, if necessary, to be able to derive recommendations for action.
- It is recommended to carry out further development of the internal quality assurance system by timely response to legislative changes, and by improving the coordination of measures to monitor the quality of the educational programme and educational activities at the University level.
- The expert group recommends involving students more in the work of the department in order to take their wishes and suggestions more into account when planning and implementing the educational process, selecting, reviewing and updating the educational programme.
- It is recommended to ensure the teaching of professional disciplines by a specialist with appropriate qualifications.

# ACQUIN