

**“NATIONAL CENTER FOR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE”  
FOUNDATION**



National Center For Professional  
Education Quality Assurance  
Foundation

**EXPERT PANEL REPORT  
ON INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION  
OF THE POLICE EDUCATIONAL COMPLEX OF THE REPUBLIC OF ARMENIA**

**Yerevan – 2019**

## **INTRODUCTION**

The institutional accreditation of the Police Educational Complex of the Republic of Armenia is carried out based on the application presented by the latter. The process of institutional accreditation is organized and coordinated by the National Center for Professional Education Quality Assurance Foundation (ANQA).

Whilst carrying out its operations, ANQA is guided by the regulation on “State Accreditation of RA Institutions and their Educational Programs” set by the RA Government on 30 June, 2011 N978 decree as well as by N959-Ն (30 June, 2011) decree on approving the RA Standards for Professional Education Accreditation.

The expertise was carried out by the expert panel formed according to the demands of ANQA Regulation on the Formation of the Expert Panel. The independent expert panel consisted of four local and one international expert from Poland.

Institutional accreditation aims not only to the external evaluation of quality assurance but also to the continuous improvement of the institution’s management and quality of educational programs. Hence, there were two important issues for local and international expert panel members:

1. To carry out an expertise of institutional capacities in line with the RA standards for state accreditation,
2. To carry out an evaluation for the improvement of institution’s quality and for its compliance with international developments and for its integration into the European Higher Education Area (EHEA).

The report refers to the expertise of institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA according to the state criteria for professional education accreditation as well as to the peer review from the perspective of integration into the EHEA.

## CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .....	2
<b>SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
EXPERTISE OF INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES OF THE POLICE EDUCATIONAL COMPLEX OF RA ACCORDING TO THE STATE CRITERIA AND STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
PEER-REVIEW FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF EDUCATION INSTITUTION'S INTEGRATION INTO EUROPEAN HIGHER EDUCATION AREA	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
<b>DESCRIPTION OF THE EXPERTIZE .....</b>	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
EXPERT PANEL COMPOSITION.....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
PROCESS OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW .....	22
<b>EVALUATION ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA</b>	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
BRIEF INFORMATION ABOUT THE TLI .....	26
I. MISSION AND PURPOSE.....	29
II. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION .....	32
III. ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES.....	39
IV. STUDENTS.....	45
V. FACULTY AND STAFF .....	50
VI. RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT .....	55
VII. INFRASTRUCTURE AND RESOURCES .....	60
VIII. SOCIETAL RESPONSIBILITY .....	64
IX. EXTERNAL RELATIONS AND INTERNATIONALIZATION .....	67
X. INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE .....	72
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>79</b>
APPENDIX 1.CVS OF EXPERT PANEL MEMBERS .....	79
APPENDIX 2. SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT .....	81
APPENDIX 3. LIST OF THE DOCUMENTS OBSERVED.....	83
APPENDIX 4. LIST OF THE RESOURCES OBSERVED .....	86
APPENDIX 5. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS .....	87
APPENDIX 6. ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE OF THE EDUCATION INSTITUTION .	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>

## SUMMARY OF THE EVALUATION

### EVALUATION OF INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

The expertise of the Police Educational Complex of RA (hereinafter the Educational Complex or TLI) was carried out by an independent<sup>1</sup> expert panel formed according to the requirements of ANQA Regulation on the Formation of the Expert Panel. The evaluation was carried out according to 10 criteria set by the RA Government on 30 June 2011 N 959–Ն decree.

Since its establishment in 2011, this is the first accreditation in accordance with the current state criteria and standards for accreditation, and The Educational Complex never underwent accreditation before. The Educational Complex participated in this accreditation based on its own application.

While carrying out the expertise the expert panel took into consideration the fact that the Educational Complex has a key role and responsibility, being the only departmental educational institution that prepares police officers in the republic, in the process of preparing and training the staff for the divisions of the RA Police system, their capacity-building, and shaping of professional competition, required knowledge, skills and abilities of police officials. The Educational Complex considers its mission “to deliver higher education (Bachelor's and Master's degrees (in judicial education), and post-graduate (training of specialists of the commanding staff with pedagogic education), science-based solutions to the issues connected to the police activity, research in Law, as well as pre-vocational and middle-vocational education (training of specialists with police education) and further educational programs; to create, transfer and deliver knowledge in the frames of strategic programs conditioned to state and public needs”.

The Educational Complex awards with the following ranks: police officer (pre-vocational education), police lieutenant (middle-vocational education), Bachelor in Law and Master in Law (higher education).

In the 2017-2021 strategic plan (SP), the mission, vision, strategic directions, goals and objectives of the Educational Complex are formulated. The expert panel finds a large part of the SP goals ambitious, taking into account also the dynamics of the development of the Educational Complex so far. The TLI itself has come to this conclusion and launched the process of reviewing its strategy.

The Educational Complex implements full-time and part-time education of Bachelor's and Master's degrees in “Law” paid and free of charge. They differ both in the content of education and in the benefits given to the students. Those professions do not have educational criteria

---

<sup>1</sup> APPENDIX 1: CVs of Expert Panel Members

approved by the state. The plan of the secondary education is based on the state educational criterion approved by the Minister of Education and Science. The curricula are designed under the credit system. The development of the academic programs based on the learning outcomes was conducted in 2019, while the subject courses with the learning outcomes were already described in 2017. The APs of the Academy and College of the Educational Complex in fact differ only in the level of complexity and the number of hours per subject, as well as some non-specialized subjects added. The expert panel finds that there is a need for content differentiation of those programs caused by the qualifications awarded on different NQF levels. The expert panel evaluates positively the TLI's efforts directed at the student-centered education in sense of diversification of methods, implementation of IT in the learning process and creation of a friendly atmosphere that promotes learning. Meanwhile there is a need for clarification of the assessment policy and methodology of organizing hands-on trainings.

The student-teacher (full-time) ratio in 2018-2019 academic year was 21, the student-administration ratio – 33. The average age of the teaching staff (TS) is 44. In addition to the main teachers that are policy servants, civilians are also invited to work on the contract basis. The expert panel highly evaluates the involvement of experienced police officers in the teaching staff, which gave them an opportunity to transfer their practical knowledge and experience to students. Besides, a high percentage of the Educational Complex alumni in the TS promote the sustainability and rejuvenation of the staff. The incomplete and non-coordinated implementation of the professional and pedagogical assessment of the TS does not allow to reveal the main issues and organize re-trainings based on the assessment outcomes. It endangers the purposefulness of the trainings and effectiveness of the costs. The students and alumni are satisfied with the TS.

The infrastructures and resources available in the Educational Complex create a productive environment for learning and are sufficient for providing professional education. The resources of the police units are also indirectly used during the hands-on practice for the development of students' practical skills. Meanwhile, the professional classrooms, laboratories and auditoriums need to be re-equipped with the newest technical means in order to ensure continuous quality improvement and sustainability. It is noteworthy that certain steps have already been taken to update and renovate the sports equipment and laboratory of criminology. The financial inflow mainly consists of state funding, as well as the students' fees and revenue from other sources. The centralized policy of financial allocations and control is implemented by the RA Police. In some directions (e.g., research, internationalization), the expert panel sees a strong need for financial investments in order to make the strategic goals more realistic.

The current mechanisms of student recruitment and admission allowed the Educational Complex to ensure a stable quantity of students. The surveys conducted to reveal the educational

needs of the students are newly introduced and do not function efficiently. On the other hand, the friendly relations of the TS and governing staff of the Educational Complex with students, the willingness to listen to their questions and issues and to find solutions are noteworthy. The expert panel evaluates positively the operating mechanisms of providing additional advice and support to students, and the staff's availability. Probably the strongest point of the Educational Complex is the existing service for promoting the non-fee-paying students' career, which provides 100% employment after graduation. However, the absence of the processes of career promotion of the fee-paying graduates (except for a few excellent students selected) is alarming, since it negatively affects the future communication with them and the responsibility of awarding qualification.

The Educational Complex clarified its research interests and priorities by the field topics. However, the scientific-research (SR) works of the Educational Complex were not based on them, and the results in these fields are not tangible. The absence of a realistic development policy and relevant procedures for realizing the established vision of the SR field does not secure the link between the goals and actual activity. In spite of the opportunity to publish in the scientific journal of the Educational Complex free of charge, there are no reward mechanisms that would enhance the SR field. The student scientific clubs created for linking research and educational process in nature do not contribute to the development of students' research skills. The engagement of students in the research works of the TS is rather weak.

Although the Educational Complex plans to expand the external relations and improve the processes of internationalization, according to its strategic documents, its actions are not aligned with the actions and timelines set by the plan-timetable. There is almost no influence of international collaboration on the APs and educational process, the mobility programs for students and teachers are still in perspective, in spite of the existence of agreements that provide such opportunity. The expert panel finds that the Educational Complex does not use the established external relations to enhance the efficiency of its academic process and develop the educational and research programs. Low level of the foreign language proficiency is one of the main obstacles to the processes of internationalization.

The current system of governance with the established structure on the whole is in line with the strategic goals and objectives of the Educational Complex. The regulated state of the system of governance is provided also by the status of a police unit, which in turn secures a clear hierarchy of decision-making and subordination. The transparency of governance is ensured by the availability of documents, internal informational system and web page. The system of governance allows both teachers and students to represent their interests in the management processes. In sense of introduction of the PDCA principle, only the stages of planning and partially doing exist in the administrative processes.

The quality assurance (QA) system of the Educational Complex is newly introduced, it is not sufficiently integrated in the processes and does not operate in a coordinated way. The Education Quality Assurance Department (EQAD) does not collect enough data for evaluating the performance of programs and other services, and reporting on their quality. The actual processes do not ensure the implementation of the QA policy and concept approved by the Educational Complex yet. The ongoing QA processes do not play a significant role in improving the APs and the activity of the Educational Complex.

The EQAD is secured with the necessary material-technical resources. However, in order to create an efficient team, the EQAD staff and the persons responsible for QA strongly need to undergo professional re-trainings. The department has not built a climate of confidence in the importance of the QA processes among the stakeholders yet.

### **STRENGTHS OF THE INSTITUTION**

- 1) Availability of the TLI strategy and time schedule, as well as the documentation regulating educational and other processes,
- 2) Due to its being a part of the security forces, smooth implementation of the system of governance with a clear mechanism of hierarchical subordination and accountability,
- 3) Involvement of internal stakeholders (students and teachers) and the RA Police as the main employer in the collegial body of governance,
- 4) The structural integrity of the academic programs, continuous reviews of the academic courses in line with the RA Police requirements,
- 5) Teaching staff with extensive service-based experience and professional practical skills,
- 6) Opportunity for the future career promotion for all the non-fee-paying students,
- 7) Organization of international conferences and publication of the research outcomes of the staff in the TLI's scientific journal approved by the HQC,
- 8) Availability of auditorium, technical, professional classroom, librarian, project and other necessary resources for organizing the learning process,
- 9) Major contribution and role played in transition of knowledge and values to the society and provision of additional services,
- 10) Membership in international institutions and associations of the field, opportunities to establish international relations,
- 11) Existence of the approved policy and concept of quality assurance.

### **WEAKNESSES OF THE INSTITUTION**

- 1) Insufficient participation of internal and external stakeholders in the formation of the TLI's strategic goals and objectives, lack of the analysis of the labor market,
- 2) Absence of the mid- and short-term planning arising from the strategic plan, and of the implementation of the key performance indicators,
- 3) Lack of the single coordinated study of the internal and external factors effecting the TLI,
- 4) Incomplete implementation of the PDCA cycle of quality management in the processes taking place in the TLI, absence of the linkage of the improvement processes with the assessment outcomes, as well as the further actions with the issues revealed,
- 5) Absence of the mechanisms of AP monitoring and improvement, as well as benchmarking,
- 6) Weak involvement of students in the research activities,
- 7) Lack of the complete system of assessing the performance of the teaching staff, as well as the connection of the improvement activities with those assessments,
- 8) Absence of the joint research projects with other universities within the framework of cooperation, lack of the tangible research achievements of the teaching staff in the thematic fields established as priority,
- 9) Absence of the financial planning in accordance with the strategic goals and objectives,
- 10) Non-analytical character of the reports of the Educational Complex and lack of availability for the society,
- 11) Lack of the influence of international collaboration on the academic programs and environment contributing to internationalization in the educational process,
- 12) Lack of mobility of teachers and students within the frames of similar programs with other educational institutions,
- 13) Weak influence of the internal quality assurance system on the quality improvement of the TLI's academic courses and other processes, lack of the involvement of internal and external stakeholders in the quality assurance processes.

## **MAIN RECOMMENDATIONS**

### *Mission and goals*

- 1) Review the ambitions, strategic goals and objectives of the institution based on the analysis of the existing possibilities and field specificities, involve stakeholders in the development process,
- 2) Revise the plan-timetable of the SP implementation making a clear allocation of the actions and the resources (including material and financial) needed for them,

- 3) Determine clear indicators of the SP progress and carry out the performance analysis of the strategic goals and objectives using those indicators,
- 4) Introduce mechanisms and procedures aimed at evaluating and improving the outcomes of the realization of the mission and goals.

#### *Governance and Administration*

- 5) Conduct a coordinated process of performance assessment of the system of governance and its separate parts to ensure its compliance with the strategic goals and resources endowment,
- 6) Ensure clear distinction of the functions of the structural units arising from the strategic goals, their documentation in relevant regulation and full implementation,
- 7) Carry out an integrated systematic examination of external and internal factors that have influence on the TLI and base the development of strategic plans on its outcomes,
- 8) Implement a financial planning in line with the SP, linking the budget with the strategic goals and objectives in order to avoid the failure of the plan realization,
- 9) Prepare precise mid- and short-term plans for the units arising from the strategic plan, as well as the analytical reports of the outcomes,
- 10) Revise the administration of the TLI's policy and procedures, introducing the PDCA principle of quality management in all the processes,
- 11) Create a data base necessary for managing the TLI's academic programs and other processes, as well as assessing and analyzing their performance; make the base available for stakeholders,
- 12) Develop mechanisms of evaluating the awareness of stakeholders, providing information not only about the content of the academic programs but also their quality.

#### *Academic Programmes*

- 13) Formulate more measurable learning outcomes for the APs conducting analyses of the employer's requirements of the graduates' competences and of the labor market,
- 14) Organize awareness raising activities related to the credit system in order to promote full implementation of the system,
- 15) Ensure clear distinction of the AP content of the Academy and College in order to secure the qualification differentiation and trustworthiness in accordance with the NQF,
- 16) Increase the effectiveness of organizing practical trainings to help students reach the outcomes of capacities and skills,
- 17) Clarify the methodology of current assessment system ensuring the correspondence of the implemented methods with the outcomes,

- 18) Conduct benchmarking with the collaborating universities to secure the content compliance of the APs and contribute to mobility,
- 19) Carry out monitoring of the APs in accordance with the established procedure and introduce relevant improvement mechanisms.

#### *Students*

- 20) Conduct qualitative examinations of the student recruitment and admission processes to evaluate the effectiveness of the current policy and the objectiveness of the processes,
- 21) Develop a clear procedure and timetables for how students can contact the administrative staff,
- 22) Review the processes aimed at revealing the students' educational, consulting and other needs related to learning, making them more targeted and based on the students' needs,
- 23) Take steps in promoting the career of the fee-paying students by creating a career center and the alumni data base,
- 24) Develop clear mechanisms of involving students in scientific-research works. Ensure the scientific-research focus of the activity of the scientific clubs,
- 25) Improve the mechanisms of evaluation of the services for students, and quality assurance.

#### *Faculty and staff*

- 26) Introduce a procedure of competitive selection of the TS and SS to ensure transparency and publicity, as well as engage the best specialists,
- 27) Clarify the requirements for the professional qualifications of the teaching staff in accordance with the goals of the academic programs,
- 28) In order to ensure the TS sustainability, introduce new mechanisms of promotion of the scientific degrees of the main TS that are police servants, and secure their growth,
- 29) Link the current mechanisms of the TS assessment, conduct general qualitative analyses of their performance and develop an improvement policy based on them,
- 30) Base the TS re-training programs on the results of internal and external evaluation in accordance with the priorities of the academic programs, assess the effectiveness of the trainings.

#### *Research and development*

- 31) Review the scientific-research strategy determining the most affordable goals, and taking into account the involvement of the TS with research capacities and the opportunities for financial investments,
- 32) Develop the realization of the chairs' scientific-research activities in the direction of the approved thematic priorities of the field, introducing the reward mechanisms for the TS,
- 33) Prepare joint research programs with the local and international partner universities and institutions, activate the implementation of the applied research as a profitable activity, contributing to commercialization of research,

- 34) Develop clear mechanisms of correlation of research and learning processes, engaging students in the research works as well.

#### *Infrastructure and Resources*

- 35) Allocate the financial resources in accordance with the strategic priorities,
- 36) Replenish the laboratory base and librarian fund in accordance with the requirements of the academic programs,
- 37) Evaluate the resources and services provided to the TLI's students in accordance with the requirements of realizing the APs and the strategic plan.

#### *Societal responsibility*

- 38) Prepare the TLI's reports with the analytical approach linking them with the SP (as well as other strategic plans) objectives and view them as an assessment mechanism for the implementation of the strategic goals,
- 39) Fill the web page with the necessary information including qualitative analyzes of the APs and awarded qualifications, ensure the publication of information in foreign languages,
- 40) Introduce effective mechanisms of feedback and study of public needs,
- 41) Develop procedures aimed at establishing public relations to evaluate the effectiveness of the mechanisms implemented by the TLI and the achievements.

#### *External Relations and Internationalization*

- 42) Bring the procedures and processes of external relations operating in the TLI in line with the approved strategy and ambitions,
- 43) Review the functions of the department responsible for internationalization focusing on the influence of international collaboration on the improvement of the TLI's APs and other processes, as well as building an environment promoting internationalization,
- 44) Through cooperation with local and foreign universities and scientific-educational centers, introduce joint projects, exchange the experiences, conduct comparative analyses and localization of the outcomes to develop the TLI's educational and research programs,
- 45) Ensure the implementation of collaboration programs established in the TLI's international contracts and agreements to enhance its international recognition,
- 46) Take steps in the direction of the exchange of students and teachers, and creating opportunities for mobility,
- 47) Ensure sufficient level of foreign language proficiency of the staff and students to promote international mobility.

#### *Internal quality assurance*

- 48) Integrate the TLI's quality assurance policy and procedures, the concept, implemented mechanisms in one complete quality assurance system, base the working plans on it and determine quantitative and qualitative indicators of realizing the plans,

- 49) Activate cooperation between the TLI's quality assurance department and other units to reveal and share the best practices,
- 50) Involve internal and external stakeholders in the quality assurance processes, shifting from passive participation to the partner engagement,
- 51) Undertake professional trainings of the QA department staff and the persons responsible for quality to enhance the performance of implementation of the QA system,
- 52) Create clear mechanisms of QA data collection and conduct content analyses based on the reliable data provided by those mechanisms, with the aim of improving the APs and other processes,
- 53) Conduct comparative analyses of the performance of the TLI's QA system and the experience of other higher education institutions, localize the outcomes to review the system and bring it in line with the TLI's specificities,
- 54) Adopt reliable mechanisms ensuring the transparency and publicity of the QA processes for internal and external stakeholders.

-----  
**Gagik Qtryan**

**Head of the expert panel**

**November 26, 2019**

## PEER-REVIEW FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF EDUCATION INSTITUTION'S INTEGRATION INTO EUROPEAN HIGHER EDUCATION AREA

The international expert hopes that this part of the holistic report will be constructively used, in line with the global report, to the development of the Police Educational Complex of the Republic of Armenia.

### Observations

#### I. Mission and Goals

The mission, perspective and persistent values of the educational complex are set out in the Strategic Plan of the RA Police Educational Complex approved by the Scientific Council on 24.11.2017. According to the Plan, The Educational Complex is a state higher educational institution functioning in the Police system of the Republic of Armenia, which delivers **higher education** (bachelor's and master's degrees in judicial education, as well as training of specialists of the commanding staff with pedagogic education) and **post-graduate** (development of professionals with legal education, scientific elaboration of the police issues, research in the field of law), as well as **pre-vocational and middle-vocational education** (training of specialists with police education) and further educational programs. The mission of the Educational Complex is to create, transfer and deliver knowledge in the frames of strategic programs conditioned to state and public needs. The mission of the educational complex corresponds to the RA National Qualifications Framework approved by the Government of the Republic of Armenia N 714-N of July 7, 2016.

In particular, educational activities arising from the mission of the Educational Complex are in line with the 3rd, 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th levels of the National Qualifications Framework. The Educational Complex pays attention to the compliance of the qualifications framework with the national and European system of qualifications, levels 6 and 7. The Educational Complex, being a police-oriented educational institution, introduced mechanisms and procedures to evaluate the effectiveness of implementation and progress of strategic goals, that take both external and internal stakeholders' opinions into account. However, these mechanisms are focused solely on reporting rather than real and effective evaluating of mission achievement. It is vital for further development, that all the Educational Complex's community (academic and administrative) mutually shares values defined in mission statement, not only credulously accepting its' wording as orders. It requires trainings and teaching addressed to academic and administrative staff in that matter.

Analysis of the internal security environment of a country in the 21st century proves that no state bodies in the modern world will provide this security on their own. This requires cooperation with non-governmental organizations and international cooperation.

## **II. Governance and Administration**

The objective of the Educational Complex administration is to improve and develop the management system necessary to implement strategic plans of human, material and financial resources.

The presented strategic plans are very ambitious and give rise to concerns about the possibility of their implementation. Although the management bodies of the Educational Complex ensure that management standards are maintained at all levels, it seems that the academics of the Educational Complex suffers from a strict police framework that hinders the development of democratic management mechanisms. The direction should be to increase stakeholder participation in the management of the Educational Complex.

The improvement of the quality of the Educational Complex management system, its transparency, accountability and control should result from the democratization of management, as this factor plays an important role in the development of universities, especially in the field of science and research. The strict limits set by the police legislation allow managing authorities to operate according to clearly defined procedures, but on the other hand, it undermines the independence of democratic university bodies whose role is to coordinate and regulate the educational, scientific and research activities of universities. A positive aspect of self-governance and scientific independence is the delegation of direct management of the aspects of education and research to the heads of faculties. Since the appointment of a faculty head is preceded by an open competition, this encourages researchers to self-improvement and quality assurance.

The proper quality assurance and continuous improvement in line with the PDCA management cycle requires the active participation of all staff. This requires further training and teaching of support staff to address weaknesses in management procedures. It is also necessary systematically to monitor changes in internal and external factors influencing the quality of the Educational Complex's operation. The introduction of an electronic system of document circulation may help in this respect. It should result in ensuring continuity of information flow at the administrative level and improving the mechanism for information disseminating about the Educational Complex.

## **III. Academic Programs**

The curricula implemented in the Educational Complex covers very different levels, from 3rd level to 8th level training of NQF. Unfortunately, in many cases it is difficult to find differences (except for the number of hours) in training at different levels and in the paid and unpaid education system.

Academic programs are built with educational descriptors based on measurable results in the areas of knowledge, skills and competences, focused mainly on one client - the Police. These results should be correlated on three levels: National Qualifications Framework - academic programs - description of courses, which requires further work.

When developing both academic curricula and teaching and learning methods, priority should be given to those that would more effectively promote students' competences needed in the labour market. Unfortunately, there are currently no mechanisms to verify compliance with the NQF at the appropriate levels of skills and competences in terms of qualifications. Periodic updates and a review of curricula, with an appropriate balance between practical and academic elements provided for them, are essential.

The academic programmes of the Educational Complex are monitored by expert evaluations, discussions with interested parties, verification of students' satisfaction, but the decisive opinion is held by one client - the RA Police. The requirements of the RA Police, from which academic programmes derive, are not conducive to flexibility and independence in curriculum preparation. However, it is important to ensure that the authorship of academic programmes remains with the Educational Complex, so that they are not accepted only as an external task or assignment.

Additionally, based on analyses of changing labor market requirements, additional alternative modules should be developed to give students the opportunity to choose modules from a larger number and thus co-create the curriculum of their studies.

The weak point of academic programmes is the lack of internationalization and student mobility, which would be planned in a broader and coordinated way. In the area of international cooperation, with universities and police education institutions, Russia's dominant role can be seen.

Attention should be drawn to the great potential for cooperation, especially in the area of cross-border and organized crime, with European Union agencies, especially Europol, Eurojust and CEPOL. This creates an opportunity for the Educational Complex to further develop its academic programmes.

In terms of student assessment, the Educational Complex has got a system of knowledge, skills and competences assessment, aimed at assessing the achievement by students of the intended results specified in the course descriptions ("Regulation on the Assessment of Knowledge, Skills

and Competencies of Learners of the Educational Complex of the Police of the RA" and the regulations on the organization of respective educational process developed according to educational programs). The efficiency of the assessment is checked in accordance with the tools provided in the Quality Assurance Handbook. This is common practice in line with the general European framework.

#### **IV. Students**

There are clear mechanisms for the admission, selection and education of students in the Educational Complex. The Educational Complex provides students with the opportunity to obtain didactic support, additional lessons and counselling and ensures the protection of students' rights.

However, there are no mechanisms to support students in the research sphere. The scope of student participation in the Educational Complex's researches is practically limited to the preparation of a Master's thesis (according to a template but with a limited methodology of conducting research). The overall scientific and research activity of the EC is weak, and this makes the students' involvement low and passive as well. For this purpose, it is necessary to link research activities with educational programmes, change the nature of activities of student research groups (consistent application of research methodology) and support international student mobility (so that they can learn how other research groups function).

The weakness of student research may require a deeper change of priorities and a transition from a strict practical orientation of the curriculum to a more general academic orientation such as a dual (hybrid) academic system. Interviews with students show that they are unable to propose problems for reliable research, but instead they propose a general description of the observed reality.

The Educational Complex in general provides support to students and ensures the effectiveness of learning.

#### **V. Teaching and Support Staff**

There are rules on the procedure for recruiting employees, but unfortunately, they are not very clear. They are police in nature, not academic, which does not ensure the quality of employee recruitment (NOT on a competitive basis). Lecturers and managers of departments and chairs are officers with many years of professional experience in the RA Police, which is a significant advantage of the staff. However, the large number of teaching hours allocated to individual lecturers results in insufficient participation in scientific programmes and initiatives.

An important factor in academic staff management is the existence of mechanisms for assessing the quality of educational and scientific activities, related to both bonuses and penal

schemes strengthening these mechanisms. Nevertheless, the "Student Questionnaire on the quality and effectiveness of teaching" should not be overestimated in the assessment of professional and pedagogical skills of teaching staff. The evaluation criteria for educational and research work should be clearly defined.

The evaluation of the quality of teachers' work should not be confused with evaluation of their popularity.

An important factor hindering international development and cooperation is the lack of foreign language skills among university staff (except for Russian).

A positive factor is the involvement of stakeholders and external experts (e.g. lawyers) in didactic processes, but this process requires regular and effective action. Ad hoc lectures conducted by occasional invited guests do not constitute a significant advantage.

## **VI. Research and Development**

The Educational Complex's scientific potential is very limited. The research activity is initiated only by lecturers, among whom there are no scientists - most of them are even very good, but they are didactic. In addition, their work is hampered by a lack of financial resources. There are also no precise mechanisms to promote research work. The Educational Complex declares its research activity by organizing lectures and scientific conferences, as well as methodological conferences. Such conferences are only a kind of public reporting of quasi-research activities, and participants are not able to evaluate the results or introduce new experiences in research activities. The role of the main consumer of research results is played by the Educational Complex (although there are no links between the conducted research and the education process) or at best by the Police HQ. There is no commercialization of scientific research results.

Participation of students in R&D activity is limited only to the preparation of a master's thesis, conducted in parallel with the didactic process, which is not of a research character, but rather a procedure of confirming qualifications. The Educational Complex does not participate in any international or local grants for research and development. Extending the cooperation with the civil market, which may become an important recipient of research results, may improve their quality, but probably does not fall within the competence of The Educational Complex. Building on the experience of other European police universities, such market cooperation always leads to a better position in the overall R&D market.

The existing student scientific groups are learning groups rather than scientific groups (although there are exceptions). This may be due to erroneous objectives and research problems.

## **VII. Infrastructure and Resources**

The Educational Complex being a state institution in the RA MoI system, does not have its own financial resources (revenues depend on tuition fees, the proportion of which on the total revenue is about 10%, other revenues of 0,7%) and, therefore, cannot carry out financial or economic activity independently. The Educational Complex receives state funding from the state budget through the RA Police. This very important factor hinders autonomy of the Educational Complex. In particular, long term financial planning conducted on high, Police HQ or ministerial levels does not promote innovation. Disbursement of funds held by the Educational Complex and supervised by the Police seems to be weakly exposed to inefficiency, but on the other hand it is too inflexible to support academic activities.

Resources, particularly financial, play a crucial role in the achievement of the Educational Complex's mission and goals. Therefore, number of financially-demanding actions for the enrichment and improvement of the educational material base, including e.g. renovation of buildings, modernization of classroom, development of information systems and library infrastructures are strongly required.

Important the Educational Complex advantage and its' strong point is existence of specialized classrooms of IT, criminology, criminalistics, shooting training, simulations crime scene rooms, law laboratory, combat sports and others (there has been a large improvement in the conditions over the last 3 years). Nevertheless, further investments are needed in the area of infrastructure.

Similarly, it is necessary to invest in a library where there is a visible lack of textbooks on research methodology, professional books published in the xxi century and journals, especially foreign ones.

The positive element is the acquisition of resources by the Educational Complex from external sources, e.g. the Norwegian Fund, the US Embassy, etc.

### **VIII. Social Responsibility**

From the perspective of the society, the Educational Complex internal procedures are far from being transparent, although the Educational Complex is willing to establish new ways of communicating its' activities to the public. The Educational Complex signals transparency through disseminating public information over its website and own journal (including the anti-corruption and strategic plans). They have also an action plan for raising the reputation of the Educational Complex has been developed in 2019.

Annual reports on the annual activities of the Educational Complex are submitted to the Office of the Police of the RA and full accountability within the police environment is visible.

More participation of the Educational Complex in public and social life is visible, but without feedback mechanism (Facebook comments are weak feedback).

## **IX. External Relations and Internationalization**

The Educational Complex is just beginning to develop its external relations and exchange best practices, taking steps towards the development of internationalization of the Educational Complex. The Educational Complex has made internationalization one of its priorities. This is evidenced, inter alia, by the international cooperation strategy for the years 2017-2021 of 2017.

These priorities include objectives that are easier to implement (e.g. organization of visits of foreign guests, mobility of employees and students) and very ambitious (internationalization of scientific research, introduction of an international perspective into educational programmes).

The latter part will require improving the quality of research and creating a number of educational programmes in foreign languages (English, Russian). In both cases, it is necessary to adhere to recognized methodologies and good practices. The use of recognized research methodologies may lead to the Educational Complex becoming a partner in international research projects.

A good step in this direction is to obtain and disseminate information about publication opportunities and participation in scientific conferences. Each such participation will result in gaining new knowledge and experience. It is also important to organize international scientific conferences. On the positive side, students and teachers of the Educational Complex take part in scientific and educational events abroad, but a small number of them do not provide a solid framework for such activities. The obligation to pass on the acquired knowledge to other employees of the Educational Complex, which is included in the detailed plan of international exchange, is a very good idea. Such cascade training should be supplemented, preferably by a computer-based knowledge base about the exchange. Unfortunately, the impact of any international cooperation on the educational process is not visible.

Without questioning the contacts within the CIS and with the USA, Attention should be drawn to the cooperation within CEPOL and Europol that provide not only operational but also academic knowledge.

Highlighting the excellent work of the CEPOL contact person, I should note that CEPOL offers much more than just exchanges to its partners.

Using the CEPOL system, the Educational Complex employees and students can gain the latest knowledge online and at the same time improve their language skills. And they can do it at any time when they have free time.

A very good idea included in the strategy is to establish relations with international organizations operating in Armenia. Such contacts do not require high costs and can be a source of the latest knowledge (e.g. in the area of human rights, intellectual property rights, etc.).

The numerous bilateral cooperation agreements signed should be used to increase the number of publications and scientific periodicals by the Complex staff in foreign languages available in the library. It is also worth promoting such acquisition of literature in cooperation with the Armenian Police Headquarters.

An important factor hindering the development of international contacts of the Educational Complex is the lack of information on the official website ([www.edupolice.am](http://www.edupolice.am)), apart from the titles of the subpages, in Russian and English. The Facebook profile is maintained in the Armenian language. Lack of information about international programs and cooperation on the website hinders internationalization and reduces the recognition of the Educational Complex by academic, scientific and international institutions and organizations, which may be potential partners of the Educational Complex.

The last point is very general. International cooperation is expensive, but if the Educational Complex wants to educate students at a high level and conduct research at the same level, it cannot save on it.

## **X. Internal Quality Assurance**

Over the last years, the Educational Complex has made a huge step towards overall improvement. Establishment of the QA system in line with the requirements of national and European Quality Assurance standards at the Educational Complex began in 2016 as a quality assurance group, and in June 2017, the Education Quality Assurance Department was established as an administrative unit. The Educational Complex has a clear policy and procedures in QA sphere which are stipulated in a sound documentation base, particularly The Quality Assurance Handbook. It can be stated that for the management of internal QA activities the Educational Complex allocates sufficient human resources. The quality assurance cycle is not applied in all processes of the Educational Complex and not all employees of the educational complex perceive a culture of quality. There is also a lack of mechanisms for real involvement of internal and external stakeholders in quality assurance processes.

## **Recommendations**

1. The main problems the Educational Complex faces, as a higher education institution, relate to ensuring an adequate level of teaching and research.

2. It is necessary to develop mechanisms for self-evaluation and evaluation of academic teachers that will promote those who carry out their activities in a way that ensures high teaching and scientific quality. These mechanisms must be measurable and widely known.

3. It is necessary to increase attention to proper methodology of conducting research, both by scientific staff and students.

4. The Educational Complex should invest in and strengthen quality assurance processes.

5. The whole community of the Educational Complex (academic and administrative) should be regularly familiarized with the mission and vision of the Educational Complex and trained to achieve understanding of the mission and vision of the Educational Complex.

6. It is necessary to define key performance indicators that are relevant to assess whether or not the strategic objectives have been achieved and to explain why specific indicators have been chosen.

7. Different motivational mechanisms for academic and educational staff should be developed and introduced, connected with a transparent assessment of its quality.

8. The representatives of the Educational Complex should actively participate in the formulation of the Strategy of the Police of the RA, which results in the mission of the Educational Complex.

9. The development of academic programmes should be based on cooperation with the Police and the Ministry of the Interior, and not only on compliance with their requirements.

10. International academic exchange programmes should be introduced on a regular basis, not only in the framework of CIS, to ensure inbound and in outbound mobility of both teachers and students.

11. The international cooperation in educational processes and academic programmes, both with police institutions and organizations and with foreign universities, should be strengthened.

12. Much wider use should be made of the opportunities provided by partner organizations (e.g. CEPOL, Europol) to teach by e-learning.

13. It is necessary to prepare for the start of own scientific journal that would be indexed in international databases (e.g. Scopus, Web of Science).

14. The knowledge of English should be further developed by both academics and students.

15. The role of collegiate groups should be increased and police dependencies should be minimized in the academic area.

16. The introduction of an electronic document workflow system should be pursued.

17. The quality system must be verified using the accreditation carried out.

## **DESCRIPTION OF EXTERNAL REVIEW**

### **COMPOSITION OF EXPERT PANEL**

The external expertise of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA was carried out by the expert panel having the following composition (See APPENDIX 1 – CVs of expert panel members):

- **Gagik Qtryan:** Deputy Head of the Public Relations section of RA Ministry of Defense Information and Public Relations Department, PhD in Physical and Mathematical Sciences.
- **Jerzy Kosiński:** Professor of the Polish Naval Academy, Doctor of Military Sciences.
- **Hakob Hovhannisyan:** Artashat Regional State College, Quality Center manager.
- **Tigran Khachikyan:** Lecturer at the Chair of Civil Procedure of YSU, PhD in Law, director of YSMU Law clinic.
- **Yelena Harutyunyan:** 4th-year student at YSU, Department of Political Science.

The composition of expert panel was agreed upon with the TLI.

The works of the expert panel were coordinated by Anushavan Makaryan – Head of the ANQA Institutional and Program Accreditation Division.

The translation was provided by Mariam Harutyunyan.

The composition of expert panel was agreed upon with the University and was appointed by ANQA director.

The assistant to the ANQA Director, Tatev Movsisyan kept records.

All the members of expert panel including the coordinators and the translator have signed impartiality and confidentiality agreements.

### **PROCESS OF THE EXTERNAL REVIEW**

#### **Application for state accreditation**

The Police Educational Complex of the RA applied for institutional accreditation by submitting to ANQA the application form and the copies of the license and the appendices.

The ANQA secretariat checked the data presented in the application form, the appendixes and the ANQA electronic questionnaire completed by the TLI.

After making the decision on accepting the application request (18.01.2012), a bipartite agreement was signed between ANQA and The Police Educational Complex of the RA (15.02.2019). The timetable of activities was prepared and approved.

Within the deadline set in the schedule, The Police Educational Complex of the RA presented the Armenian and English versions of its self-evaluation report according to the form set by ANQA, and the package of attached documents.

The self-evaluation was carried out by a team formed by the order of the Head of the Educational Complex.

### **Preparatory phase**

The ANQA coordinator observed the report with the aim of revealing its correspondence to the technical requirements of ANQA. Then, the self-evaluation report and adjacent documents were sent to the expert panel, the members of which had been previously agreed upon with the institute and confirmed by the director of ANQA.

Five training on the following topics were organized for the expert panel members with the aim of preparing the latter and ensuring the effectiveness of the activities:

1. The process, criteria and standards of the RA accreditation,
2. The main functions of the expert panel members,
3. Preliminary evaluation as preparatory phase of developing expert panel report, the main requirements of writing the report.
4. Methodology of observation of documents and resources.
5. Techniques and ethics of meetings and questions to be posed.

Having observed the self-evaluation and adjacent documents of the Police Educational Complex of RA, the expert panel conducted the preliminary evaluation. According to the format, the list of additional documents needed for observation was prepared, as well as the list of questions and issues for different target groups noting the respective departments or target groups.

Within the scheduled time, the expert panel summarized the results of the initial evaluation and formed a time schedule of the site-visit. According to the ANQA manual on the expertise the intended meetings with all the target groups, close and open meetings, document and resource review, visits to different infrastructures and else were included in the time schedule. According to the ANQA manual on the expertise, the intended meetings with all the target groups, closed-door and open meetings, document and resource observation, visits to different infrastructures and else were included in the time schedule.

### **Self-evaluation of the Police Educational Complex of RA**

The Educational Complex represented Armenian and English versions of its self-evaluation report, according to the form set by ANQA, and the package of attached documents on 10.05.2019. The report mainly contains general and descriptive information, the majority of the

documents presented as grounds were not accepted, although they contained information about the date of approval and the person or institution that approved, quantitative information and its analysis was not collected enough.

### **Preliminary visit**

The preliminary visit was paid two weeks before the site visit involving the head of the expert panel and the process coordinator. Throughout the said visit, the plan-schedule of the site visit was agreed upon, the list of additional documents was presented, discussions and mutual decisions were reached referring to organizational, technical, informative questions of the site visit, as well as the conduct and the norms of ethics of meeting participants. The rooms prepared for focus groups and expert panel discussions were observed, the issues related to the equipment and facilities were clarified.

### **Site visit**

The site visit of the expert panel took place from September 16 to 20, 2019. The work of the expert panel started with a closed-door meeting the day before the visit with the aim to discuss and agree the assessment framework with the external panel member, the issues to be clarified, strengths and weaknesses of the TLI per criteria, the procedure of focus groups, and to make further steps more precise.

All the expert panel members, including the ANQA coordinator and the interpreter.

The site visit initiated and culminated with meetings with the Head of the Educational Complex. The representatives from the teaching staff and students, faculty heads and chairs, employers and alumni were selected from the previously provided list for clarification of issues randomly. All the meetings foreseen by the schedule were carried out including an open meeting, in which post-graduate researchers took part. Throughout the site visit, the expert panel carried out document review, resource observation and focus group meetings in different infrastructures of the TLI.

The information obtained during different meetings, as well as the main outcomes of document review were summarized during closed-door meetings of the panel at the end of each working day, and the final meeting at the end of the site visit. The expert panel discussed the main outcomes and reached an agreement on meeting the requirements first of the accreditation standards, and then – the criteria. All the panel members reached conclusions on the criteria satisfaction through open discussions, adhering to the consensus principle.

The assessment was carried out within the framework of State Criteria and Standards of Accreditation and ANQA procedures, following which the assessment has two levels – **satisfactory and unsatisfactory**.

### **Expert panel report**

The expert panel prepared the preliminary expert panel report based on the review of the self-evaluation of the Educational Complex, the documents attached to it and the observations during the site-visit as a result of regularly organized discussions. Based on a number of findings of the discussions, the head of the expert panel and ANQA coordinator prepared the draft of expert panel report, which was reconciled with the experts. The international expert prepared a separate peer review. The document was translated and handed over to the head of the expert panel. The responsibility to include the international expert's observations and approaches in the report rests with the head of the expert panel and the coordinator. The peer review is fully included in the report.

The response of the Police Educational Complex to the preliminary review was handed over to ANQA in 8.11.2019 with no remarks and suggestions presented. The expert panel prepared the final variant of the report, which was approved by the panel in 26.11.2019.

---

**Anushavan Makaryan**

**Signature of the coordinator**

**26.11.2019**

## EVALUATION ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

### BRIEF INFORMATION ABOUT THE EDUCATION INSTITUTION

**History:** The TLI was founded in 1966 when Yerevan police secondary school was established. In 1991, it was renamed Higher School of Police of the RA Ministry of Internal Affairs, and in 1995 – Higher School of the RA Ministry of Internal Affairs. In 2000, by the RA Government decree, Higher School of the RA MIA was renamed “Academy of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of RA”. In 2003, by the RA Government decree, “the Code of Conduct of Education in the Police Educational Institution” was approved. By the RA Government decree of 2011, “the RA Police Academy” state non-profit organization was reorganized into “the RA Police Educational Complex” SNPO, the Regulations of which were approved by the RA Government in 2006. According to the Regulations, the subject of the Educational Complex activities is to implement educational, scientific, expertise, consultative, educational-productive, and publishing activity. The Educational Complex considers its mission to “to create, transfer and deliver knowledge in the frames of strategic programs conditioned to state and public needs for the development of education”. While realizing its activity, the Educational Complex is led by the 2017-21 strategic plan (hereinafter SP) and its plan-schedule. The self-evaluation, strategic plan and other documents contain provisions that reflect the commitments and ambitions of the Educational Complex in different areas of its activity.

**Education:** The Educational Complex implements pre-vocational, secondary vocational higher and post-graduate, as well as additional educational programs. Higher and post-graduate professional education is delivered by the Police Academy of the Educational Complex, which includes the Faculty of Law (consisting of six chairs), the Faculty of part-time studies, and Master's degree department.

Secondary vocational education is delivered by the College of the Educational Complex, which includes the Faculty of Police Secondary Vocational Education and five chairs. Pre-vocational education is delivered by the Educational Center consisting of the Department of pre-vocational training and two branches. Additional education is delivered by the Faculty of Training and Certification, where the RA Police officers as well as the representatives of criminal executive department and military police are trained by mutual agreement of the department heads, in accordance with the RA Government 2003 Decree.

The Educational Complex considers the aim of its educational programs to “prepare specialists that are can largely enhance the legal and public security of RA, can prevent, detect and deter crimes and administrative violations, detect and track them, provide high-quality legal assistance and public services”.

The strategic goal for education is defined in the SP: “to provide educational programs in line with the students’ needs and the requirements of the current labor market, with relevant teaching methodology and technologies”.

To reach this goal, the following objectives were formulated:

- prepare documents that reflect the structure and content of the professional educational programs, within the national and field framework of qualifications of RA,
- ensure the unity of educational process with research and creative activities,
- introduce an innovative educational process by preparing high-quality specialists online, widely using e-learning technologies in all the educational programs and teaching methods,
- improve the technologies of organizing teaching and learning, as well as knowledge assessing, with the aim of continuous development of the quality and effectiveness of education.

**Research:** A strategic goal in this field, determined by the Educational complex is “To develop research activity of the Educational Complex, to create competitive scientific and innovational potential, to transform gradually into a research educational complex”.

To reach this goal, the following objectives were formulated:

- provide introduction and development of the research component on the Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees with a view to build sustainable and measurable research and innovation capacities,
- ensure the sustainable development of the scientific potential of the Educational Complex through the perspective planning and upgrading of post-graduate studies, as well as fundamental revision and improvement of a researcher’s educational program,
- enhance the effectiveness of scientific-research activities in the Educational Complex,
- support the transmission of the outcomes of intellectual activity and dissemination of best educational practices.

**Internationalization:** The strategic goal in this area is defined by the Educational Complex the following way: “Ensure comprehensive development of external relations of the Educational Complex, facilitate the internationalization of the institution’s activity”.

To reach this goal, the following objectives were formulated:

- expand and diversify international relations of the Educational Complex, facilitate continuous processes of internationalization with European universities and international organizations of higher education on the institutional and project levels,

- expand international scientific cooperation of the Educational Complex, pursue the institution's involvement into the European research area.

**Quality assurance:** The Educational Complex has not set a precise goal in this field but has addressed this as an objective within “Up-to-date approaches to high-quality education”, that is “to improve the efficiency of the work of bodies and processes of internal quality assurance system”. The objectives of the policy of internal quality assurance are:

- provide with information required for the relevant structural units of the Educational Complex to develop and introduce procedures for internal quality assurance,
- provide with information required for developing the process of internal quality assurance in line with international standards,
- ensure prerequisites for the formation of quality culture,
- on the basis of existing achievements in the field of education, and national specificities, implement high-quality education relevant to the state, society and person of that particular period on every level of professional education, including post-graduate and additional studies,
- ensure the attractiveness of the Educational complex and its integration into the EHEA through resilient procedures and mechanisms of the quality assurance of education,
- contribute and facilitate the introduction of research outcomes in the teaching and learning processes, ensure students' engagement in the them,
- contribute and facilitate the introduction of the culture of continuous improvement of quality.

The expert panel was guided by the principle of "compliance goals" and considered the above-mentioned information as the main ambitions and goals of the institution.

## I. MISSION AND PURPOSE

**CRITERION: The Tertiary Level Institutions' (TLIs) policy and practices are in accordance with its mission, which is in accordance with the Armenian National Qualifications Framework (hereafter ANQF).**

### Findings

**1.1 The TLI has a clear, well-articulated mission that represents the institution's purposes and goals as well as is in accordance with the ANQF.**

The mission, view and permanent values of the Educational Complex are determined in the 2017-21 strategic plan, approved by the Scientific Council. According to it, the Educational Complex is a state higher educational institution operating within the Police system under the RA Government. It provides higher (Bachelor's and Master's degree in Law) as well as post-graduate professional (preparation of scientific-pedagogical staff in Law, scientific study of the problems related to the police activities, research in Law), pre-vocational, secondary vocational (preparation of specialists with police education) and additional educational programs. The educational activity derived from the mission covers the 3rd, 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th levels of the NQF. The Educational Complex gives the following qualifications: policeman (pre-vocational professional education), police officer (secondary vocational professional education), Bachelor in Law and Master in Law (higher education). In line with the TLI's mission, the following strategic priorities (directions) were envisaged in the strategic plan: 1. up-to-date approaches to higher education, 2. human recourse management, 3. up-to-date research, 4. competitive science and innovation, 5. external relations and expansion of international activities. For each objective, improvement assessment indicators are set in the SP.

Attached to the SP, the action schedule is set, where the expected steps for implementation of strategic objectives, action timelines by years, the responsible structural unit, requires resources (human, material, financial), the outcomes and key performance indicators (KPI) are presented. Although the improvement assessment indicators do not fully repeat the KPIs, they are in fact the same indicators. In the column of the schedule for the required resources, only human resources and/or units are mentioned: material and financial resources for action are not planned. The budget of the Educational Complex and the SP are not interconnected.

In spite of the availability of the approved SP, in 2017, the RA Police Headquarter requested the 2018-2022 action plan directed at the development of the TLI's activities, on the format of the Headquarter. The format also includes the activity title, expected outcomes, responsible unit, timelines, and the financial source. The plan sent to the Headquarter contains only a small part of the activities described in the SP.

## **1.2 The TLI's mission, goals and objectives reflect the needs of the internal and external stakeholders.**

Clause 5 of the quality assurance concept of the Educational Complex defines the following stakeholders: state, society, applicants (students) and their parents, alumni, staff, partners, the RA Police and other employers.

The SP of the Educational Complex was prepared by a group of representatives of different institution units, the composition of which was approved without an order. The Committee of Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance attached to the Scientific Council did not participate in that preparation as well, since it was formed later. The 2019 work plan of the committee include only three items: to prepare the student guidelines, to develop a policy of revealing the students' educational needs, and to revise the regulation of the committee activities.

External stakeholders did not take an active part in preparing the SP. The involvement of internal stakeholders in the process of discussing the SP was realized through their participation in the activities of the Educational Complex Board and the Scientific Council. The positions of the RA Police as the main employer of the Educational Complex are reflected in the decisions made with the inclusion of the deputy head of the HR department of the RA Police in the listed councils. The Academia and College SPs were sent for aligning to the RA Police Headquarter and concerned departments. No objections and proposals were presented. According to the self-evaluation, the Educational Complex still considers the organization of surveys and meetings with external stakeholders rather passive.

In 2018, by the order of the Head of the Educational Complex, a procedure of strategic planning was approved, which defines the basic 16 stages of the process, including the analysis of the current situation, discussion of the outcomes, refinement of the TLI's development policy, etc. The strategic planning has not been carried out under this procedure yet.

## **1.3 The institution has approved mechanisms and procedures to evaluate the achievement of its mission and purpose and further to improve them.**

The Educational Complex carries out the assessment of the implementation of the mission and purposes through discussions of annual reports provided by the structural units of the Board and the Scientific Council. In some sessions, the Deputy Head of the RA Police for coordinating the Educational Complex is invited to the discussions of the reports, and he assesses the undertaken activities, pointing out the existing gaps and ways to improve.

The evaluation of the overall activities of the Educational Complex is implemented through the report of the Head based on the reports of the structural units. It is submitted to both the superior bodies of the RA Police and the internal staff during the Board sessions.

By the 2018 order of the Head of the Educational Complex, “the requirements for the SP implementation report and the procedures for its implementation” were approved. By the new, 2019 order of the Head, certain changes and additions were made, according to which the working group should analyze the reports presented by the units in accordance with the regulations and create a full version to present to the Scientific Council. According to the regulations, annual report should include for items: brief information on the activity envisaged by the SP schedule for the reporting period, description of the steps, outcomes of the taken steps, proposals on making changes and additions in the SP and the plan-schedule (if necessary). According to the regulations, the 2017-2021 SP implementation report was prepared only for 2018. Some issues emerged related to the implementation of certain steps, a part of the steps were suggested to remove (since they were out of competence and ambitious), and another part – to reformulate to make it more realistic. As a consequence of it, the Head of the Educational Complex only closer to the site visit of the expert panel ordered to organize discussions to review the SP.

In the report on the SP implementation, there are no analyses on assessing the progress based on the KPIs. It has not been evaluated and analyzed so far, on which stage the mission and goals indicated in the SP are. No improvement mechanisms and procedures based on evaluation operate yet.

**Considerations:** The mission defined in the SP of the Educational Complex is, in general, clear and it complies with the NQF. The fact that the Educational Complex is the only institution that prepares staff for the RA Police system facilitates the clear formulation of its goals and objectives reflected in the 2017-2021 SP. However, such ambitious goals (transition to a research status, internationalization of the educational programs, involvement in the European research area, etc.) are added to them that are not realistic to implement with the current human and technical resources. The assignment of the Head to review the SP proves that the Educational Complex itself evaluated the complexity to realize its plan.

The schedule of the SP implementation, in spite of some weaknesses, was the basis for planning the further actions in accordance with the mission and goals. Nevertheless, the plan-schedule still requires clarification for the allocation of the necessary material and financial resources and for making the actions realistic due to that. The annual planning within the Educational Complex units overall match with the plan-schedule but the direct link with the plan is not precise in sense of the schedule and the outcomes. The fact that the budget allocations is not

done in line with the strategic goals and objectives disrupts the budget-SP relations and puts the proper realization of the plan under the risk, especially in case of ambitious goals.

Although the external stakeholders were not actively engaged in the development of the SP, the fact of participation of the representatives of the main stakeholder – the RA Police – in the discussions of the plan proves its consistency with this stakeholder. The expert panel finds that the participation of the superior bodies of the RA Police, as the main employer, could contribute to a more precise and targeted planning of the Educational Complex strategy.

The necessity to clarify and review the SP, which was revealed in the 2019 evaluation carried out in the established order of assessing the outcomes of the implementation of the mission and goals, allows to conclude that the SP has not been effectively operating so far, as a basis for activity planning. The established KPIs were not actually used for analyses, and the activity reports were not the basis for the efficiency assessment and further improvement, since they did not contain qualitative analyses. The actual operating mechanism of evaluation was annual reports of the Head of the Educational Complex, which were not directly correlated with the SP goals and the plan-schedule of their realization. The analyses of efficiency of the operating mechanisms (reports, KPIs) would allow the institution to evaluate their operability and impact on the planning and implementation of the strategy.

**Summary:** Taking into account the clear formulation of the mission and goals of the Educational Complex in line with the NQF, the compliance of the strategic goals and objectives with that mission, the consideration of the needs of the RA Police as its main external stakeholder at the core of its work, as well as the implementation of a clear mechanism of accountability of the performance assessment, the expert panel states that the policy and activity of the Educational Complex comply with its mission and the need of the RA Police.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 1 is **satisfactory**.

## II. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

**CRITERION:** The TLI's system of governance, administrative structures and their practices are effective and intend to the accomplishment of its mission and purposes by keeping the governance code of ethics.

### Findings

**2.1. The TLI's system of governance ensures regulated decision-making process in accordance with defined code of ethics and has efficient provision of human, material and financial resources to accomplish its educational and other purposes.**

The governance of the Educational Complex, according to its regulation, is implemented by its founder, the authorized body – the RA Police, and the executive body – the Head of the Educational Complex. The Board of the Educational Complex is an advising body of the Head of the Educational Complex, the activities of which are organized and administrated by the Head. The Scientific Council (no more than 50 members, for 5 years' period) addresses the issues of organizing the methodological and scientific-research activity, planning and governance. In 2018, attached to the Scientific Council, the Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance Committee was formed, the objectives of which, according to the regulation, are to investigate the issues related to the strategic planning and quality assurance, to analyze the situation, to reveal weaknesses and suggest improvement for them, to develop the projects of internal legislative acts, etc. However, the Committee has only discussed the legislative-normative documents prepared in the Educational Complex so far.

The organizational structure of the Educational Complex and changes in it are approved by the order of the Head of the RA Police. The horizontal communication in the structure is ensured by the Scientific Council, in which the managing staff is involved, and the vertical ones are provided through reports. Certain departments cover similar functions. In particular, the functions of the Service Department and the Department of Human Resources and Staff for Personnel regarding the work with personnel are identical, according to the regulations; there is no clear delineation between the functions of the Department of Scientific Work and the Department of International Cooperation and IT in the frames of international cooperation. The functions of international cooperation and IT implementation are united in one department. The structure has no units responsible for organizing the hands-on trainings.

In order to reduce the risk of corruption in making administrative decisions, in 2018 the Educational Complex established the project of the anticorruption policy of the Educational Complex. The code of ethics is not set out as a separate document.

The Educational Complex provides human and material resources for educational and other processes engaging the contracted teachers and other employees if needed. The identification of the resources needed for the units is carried out through providing the respective applications by the unit heads. The preliminary estimate of the annual budget income and expenses is presented by the Head of the Educational Complex to the approval of the Head of the RA Police.

There are no full comprehensive analyses on the existing human, material and financial resources of the Educational Complex. The analyses of the performance assessment of the government system are not carried out as well.

## **2.2 The TLI's system of governance provides students and teachers opportunity to participate in decision-making processes directed to them.**

According to the regulation of the Board of the Educational Complex, compulsory involvement of the teachers and students in the Board is not envisaged. The composition of the Board is approved by the Head. This includes senior management and the head of the Department of Personnel Policy of the RA Police. By the decree of the Head of the Educational Complex, one representative of students is always included, whose candidacy is nominated by the Students' Council. According to the Board regulation, 25% of the Board members is constituted of the Educational Complex students. There are currently 12 students and 2 teachers in the 46-member Scientific Council. The student candidates are nominated by the Students' Council. The students are selected from the Academy and College, non-fee-paying and fee-paying. However, as it is noted in the self-evaluation, the initiative of students and teachers in making decisions related to them in the governmental bodies is weak.

The decisions made by the Board and the Scientific Council related to teachers and students are presented to them during meetings. Discussions are held also during the Department sessions. If necessary, the head of a department presents proposals in the form of memoranda. In order to ensure the efficiency and transparency of the processes in the Educational Complex, the drafts of the adopted internal legal acts are uploaded in the internal computer network.

## **2.3 The TLI develops and implements short, mid, and long term planning consistent with its mission and purposes and has clear monitoring and implementation mechanisms.**

Planning in the Educational Complex is conducted on two levels. The plan-schedule of the SP activities is considered the long-term planning. There is no mid-term planning. The short-term action plans of the Educational Complex units are reflected in their annual working plan but the SP is not a basis for them. The realization of plans is seen in the reports, which do not analyze the KPIs of the SP and the implementation of the strategic goals and objectives. Based on the 2017-21 SP, the Educational Complex designed a short-term plan only for the 2018-2019 academic year, taking out this year's events from the SP.

In July 2019, during the session of the Scientific Council, a unified order for reporting was approved for the structural units of the Educational Complex, which envisages a compulsory element of research on the factors affecting works, the reasons for failures, and the dynamics of

the previous year's indicators. At the moment of the site visit, the order was not introduced yet. Monitoring of the Educational Complex plans is carried out based on the reports, which do not contain a research element yet.

#### **2.4 The TLI conducts environmental scanning and draws on reliable data during the decision-making process.**

According to the procedure of the implementation and accountability of informative-analytical activity established in 2019, the analyses of the factors that affect the objectives and functions of the units. However, the list of the factors, according to which the units should implement analyses, has not been prepared yet. A single comprehensive study of external and internal factors has not been conducted in the Educational Complex; the unit responsible for it is not clarified. Nevertheless, certain factors are highlighted, which were studied together with the RA Police leading to making certain decisions in the Educational Complex, including the submission of legislative changes to the RA Police Headquarter. During the site visit, the participants of the meetings mentioned that the study of internal and external factors are mainly carried out by collecting information through personal communication and contacts. Examination of the main factors is done by the Police, and the instructions it sends impact on the decision-making in the Educational Complex.

Surveys were conducted among several groups of internal and external stakeholders with the aim of revealing the factors that affect the quality of teaching in the Educational Complex. The development of the SP or internationalization policy were not based on the study of the factors.

#### **2.5 The management of the policies and the processes draws on the quality management principle (plan-do-check-act).**

The concept of the quality assurance of professional education of the Educational Complex establishes the importance of implementing the quality management principle (plan-do-check-act). In the SE, the TLI states that the administration of its policy and procedures is carried out in the following directions: strategic planning, planning for each process, documentation of the processes, monitoring of the education quality, control over the learning activities, and analysis of implementing activities emanating from the SP, in the form of reports. However, the document reviews and observations during the site visit proved that the PDCA principle is not well established in the activity of the Educational Complex. Most of the processes are in the planning stage. A significant part of the planned processes (e.g. those envisaged by the SP, the strategic project of internationalization, the concept and policy of internal quality assurance) has not fully

entered the phase of realization. A regulated evaluation and monitoring have not been implemented; unique cases of improvement based on assessment.

## **2.6 There are mechanisms in place ensuring data collection on the effectiveness of the academic programs and other processes, analyses and application of the data in decision-making.**

In 2019, the procedure of monitoring and review of the academic programs of the Educational Complex was approved, but it has not launched yet. Surveys, reports discussed during the Scientific Council sessions and the SE process of institutional capacities are considered the main source for the information about the effectiveness of the academic programs and other processes in the institution.

However, the mechanism of survey is newly adopted and its work is not targeted. No content and systematic analyses of the survey outcomes were carried out. Moreover, no mechanisms for evaluating the effectiveness of the surveys were adopted. The assessment of the reports' effectiveness is not implemented as well. The SE is not analytical yet; there are criteria, about which the provided information does not relate to the required field. There is a lack of professional experience of implementing the SE process.

## **2.7 There are impartial mechanisms evaluating the quality of quantitative and qualitative information on the academic programs and qualification awards.**

The main tool for sharing information about the APs of the Educational Complex and the awarded qualifications is the web page of the Educational Complex, where you can also go through the link available on the official page of the RA Police. However, there was no information on the web page about the quality of the Aps and the awarded qualifications. The outcomes of the IQAD (Internal Quality Assurance Department) analysis are not published. The Educational Complex itself stated about the imperfection of the mechanisms for evaluating the quality of the published information in the SE. The observations revealed that actually there are no such mechanisms.

It is worth mentioning that in 2019, by the order of the Head the web page of the Educational Complex was regulated and activated to a certain extent.

**Considerations:** The existing legislative acts, regulation and procedural base for the activity of the government bodies and units provide the well-designed activities if the management system of the Educational Complex. The regulation of the system of governance is promoted also by its status of a police unit, which ensures hierarchy of decision-making and subordination. The existence of the collegial bodies, in turn, ensures the participatory process of decision-making,

keeping the principle of collegiality. The direct involvement of the RA Police representative in the collegial governance bodies and agreement upon the documents of particular importance creates direct link between the authorized body and the Educational Complex, which provides the compliance of the activity of the Educational Complex with the needs of its main employer. The approval of the organizational structure and its changes by the Head of the RA Police is viewed as an insurance for the structural sustainability, but the clear separation of the functions of certain structural units and the precise distribution of responsibilities would contribute the enhancement of their efficiency.

Since the regulated process of assessing the performance efficiency of the governance system and its separate parts is not implemented, the Educational Complex does not assess the availability of human, material and financial resources relevant to its strategic goals, which threatens the realization of its purposes and the targeted character of its expenses. On the other hand, allocation of material resources to the units in accordance with the regular memoranda and budget capacities provides the availability of required material resources without ensuring their sustainability.

The system of governance is provided with the required human resources, although the expert panel finds that due to the professional specificities, the creation of a separate division for coordinating the system of the highly important hands-on trainings is a necessity. Separation of the budget of the Educational Complex from the SP endangers implementation of the strategic goals, especially for such ambitions (scientific-research, internationalization) that require big financial investments.

In the formal sense, the system of governance of the Educational Complex allows the teachers and students to participate in the decision-making. An important role is granted to the Scientific Council where all the important decisions are discussed and made. However, the observations revealed that the actual participation of the students in the decision-making process is rather passive, which is perhaps caused by subordination that is characteristic to the police service. If the students' voice is not fully expressed, this can endanger the directedness of the decisions to their needs and the student-centered approach in general. On the other hand, the expert panel evaluates positively the efforts made by the TLI's management to establish direct relations with students and bring them to an open discussion.

The planning process in the Educational Complex is regulated and complied with the plans of the superior body. However, the unclear link between the SP and short-term plans, absence of the improvement analysis of the Educational complex demonstrate that the SP is not the main guiding document for action yet. The units still do not view the SP as a document of strategic development. Lack of the analytical element in their reports hinders the efficiency assessment.

Although the Educational Complex do not implement full coordinated investigation of the internal and external factors that influence it, the role of the RA Police in that regard is quite big and compensates for the lack to some extent. The personal efforts of the Educational Complex management promote the collection of reliable information on the challenges it faces, but the expert panel believes that these processes require be more targeting and regulating in the institutional sense.

The PDCA principle of quality management is not entrenched in the Educational Complex policy and procedure administration, since the documental basis that contains the requirements for the realization of this principle is not embedded. Almost in all procedures the stages of evaluation and improvement are not visible, which keeps the institution from arguing that its governmental decisions are made based on the analysis of sufficient and trustworthy data, and there are processes of continuous improvement.

The Educational Complex has not carried out a regulated process of gathering, analyzing and implementing information on the effectiveness of the academic programs and other processes. Several mechanisms have been developed only recently, and they have not undergone efficiency assessment.

Realizing the imperfection of its mechanism for collecting and analyzing information on the academic programs and awarded qualifications, the Educational Complex still does not take any efficacious steps in that direction. Publication of unbiased and well-grounded information on the APs and awarded qualifications would facilitate public trust in the Educational Complex and get its ratings up.

**Summary:** Considering the existence of the system of governance seeking to realize the mission of the Educational Complex, the sustainability of organizational structure that derived from the main purposes and objectives, the coordination of the activity of structural units, the operation of clear mechanisms for planning and accountability, the opportunity for stakeholders to participate in making decisions related to them, and the consideration of the employer's requirements and analyses, it can be stated that the governance and administration of the Educational Complex contribute to realization of its mission and goals.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 2 is **satisfactory**.

### III. ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES

**CRITERION: The programmes are in concord with the institution’s mission, form part of institutional planning and promote mobility and internationalization.**

#### **Findings**

**3.1 The academic programs are thoroughly formulated according to the intended learning outcomes, which correspond to an academic qualification and are in line with the institution's mission and the state academic standards.**

The Educational Complex has Bachelor’s and Master’s degree full-time and part-time programs in “Law”, non-fee-paying and fee-paying. They differ in both the content of education and the benefits the students get. There are no established state academic criteria for those specializations. The Educational Complex considers its mission, the requirements of the RA Police and the compliance with the NQF as a basis for developing the APs. Besides higher education, the Educational Complex provides also post-graduate in Law, as well as pre-vocational, secondary vocational (preparation of police specialists) and additional educational programs. The program of secondary vocational education of the “Police Officer” qualification has an approved module structure, based on the state academic criterion. There is an approved order of organization of the academic process for Bachelor’s and Master’s degree programs in the Educational Complex Academy, which includes the general description of the credit system. During the site visit, the participating teaching staff and students were not aware of the general provisions of the credit system.

The Educational Complex considers as the main goal of its academic programs to prepare such specialists that are can largely enhance the legal and public security of RA, can prevent, detect and deter crimes and administrative violations, detect and track them, provide high-quality legal assistance and public services.

The academic programs of the Educational Complex were developed using an outcome-based approach only in 2019, guided by the “procedure of developing academic programs in the Educational Complex” that was established in the same year. Although the subject descriptions were designed with the trend towards the outcomes already in 2017. The APs were not based on the market analyses, although such approach is required by the TLI’s project specifications. The approved specifications of the APs were agreed with the RA Police Headquarter; no proposals and remarks were received from there in general. The specifications include main parts of the established structure of the academic programs. Although it is mentioned in the SE, that the AP specifications focus on the measurability of the expected outcomes of the education, the part of

outcome knowledge and skills is not formulated with the use of Bloom's taxonomy. The AP outcomes are mapped with the subjects. The majority of the courses is related to such skills that are directly aimed at forming the narrow field knowledge of a police officer.

The site visit revealed that the content of the Educational Complex APs always was the focus of attention of the RA Police and it reflected the requirements of the letter as the main employer. Consequently, the review of the subjects and topics had a regular and reasonable character.

The observations found out that the academic programs of the Educational Complex Academy and College in their essence differ only in the level of complexity and the number of hours for each subject; certain non-specialized subjects are also added in the Bachelor's degree program. Students do not see any essential content difference between those programs as well. The same teaching staff teaches in both the Academy and the College. The teachers who participated in the meetings noted, "in fact, the Academy students gain deeper knowledge and solve more difficult tasks within the frames of the same subjects".

### **3.2. The TLI has a policy that ensures alignment between teaching and learning approaches and the intended learning outcomes of academic programs promoting student-centered learning.**

The process of improvement of teaching and learning methods is considered in the framework of the strategic objectives of the Educational Complex, with the focus on innovative initiatives of adopting up-to-date methods and technologies of teaching, as well as "non-standard" efficient methods.

The AP specifications include matrixes of compliance of outcomes and teaching, the learning methods. In each part of the matrixes (knowledge, skill, capacity) the list of methods is identical. The policy and reasons for selection of teaching and learning methods are not defined. The methods are chosen by teacher based on the specificities of each subject. It is stated in the SE that along with the interactive methods, the format of traditional lectures predominates. The Educational Complex is currently working on expanding the use of IT in the teaching methods, considering it a prerequisite for a student-centered education. The observations revealed that almost all the auditoriums were provided with projectors in the recent years. The Educational Methodological and Development Department of the Educational Complex designed methodological guidelines for organizing and conducting vocational trainings in 2018 within the frames of its function to provide methodological support to the teaching staff.

During the meetings, all the stakeholders attached huge importance to the hands-on trainings. According to the full-time students, more hours should be added to these trainings, since

they gain professional skills during them. Meanwhile, they stated that mostly the police officers attached of the students could not dedicate enough time and pass their practical experience because of their business. On the other hand, lack of skills in documentation is felt during both the hands-on trainings and when starting service after graduation. It is worth mentioning that the part-time education does not include hands-on trainings, except for the students that occupy junior positions in the Police. The reason is that the part-time students are already police servants and do not need this kind of training.

The effectiveness of the methods of teaching and learning is assessed through classroom observations by the management and the heads of the departments. The results are filled in the journals of approved format. Moreover, the assessment of the method effectiveness is reflected in the surveys. No methodological improvement was implemented based on the identified gaps. It became clear after the site visit that students in general are satisfied with the methods implemented by the teaching staff.

### **3.3. The TLI has policy on students' assessment according to the learning outcomes and ensures academic integrity.**

The assessment of students is based on the “regulation on assessing the knowledge, skills and abilities of the students of the Educational Complex” and the procedure of organizing the educational process in accordance with the academic programs. A 20-point scale (8 is the passing score) is used which includes 2 midterm /4 points/ and a final /12 points/ exams. It is noteworthy that during the visits to the faculties it turned out that in the case of getting 4 points per midterm exam and 0 points for the final one a student gets the passing score –  $4+4+0=8$ . The curricula reflect not only the assessment methods relevant to the learning outcomes, but also the kinds of quizzes and execution standards. The Aps include mapping of the assessment kinds and outcomes.

The examples of examination tickets presented to the expert panel mostly included theoretical questions. In most of the cases only one question was related to the ability or skill assessment. Whereas professional skills and abilities prevail in the outcomes of the police higher education, especially in the pre-vocational and secondary education courses.

The regulations on the term paper preparation and defense, the selection, preparation and defense of the diploma works and Master's theses are established. For the last two years, no diploma works were written in the Educational Complex. The Bachelor's degree is awarded after taking the final exams, although in certain cases the students can be given an opportunity to write a diploma work. The Master's theses observed by the expert panel had a comprehensive material under discussion, as well as a significant volume of legislative acts and literature. The selected topics mainly correspond to their content. The works mainly cover the decisions of the RA

Reviewing and Constitutional Courts. However, the lack of using foreign sources other than Russian is obvious. The students' self-analytical component is weak in the works.

In 2018, the regulation of assessing the knowledge of the students of the Educational Complex and appealing against the results was approved. The site visit revealed that there were almost no cases of appealing. In order to ensure the academic fairness and properly organize the examination process, by the 2017 order of the Head of the Educational Complex, assistants were involved in the examination process who presented reports to the Head after the exams. Currently that mechanism does not operate.

“The regulation on following the norms of citing and addressing plagiarism” is established. The regulation does not indicate mechanisms for revealing plagiarism including the clear toolkit, computer programs and other methods.

#### **3.4. The academic programs of the TLI are contextually coherent with other relevant programs and promote internationalization and mobility of students and staff.**

The Educational Complex tries to provide the coherence of its academic programs with other relevant Aps by approving the document of “the benchmarking policy and procedures of the Educational Complex”. However, there are no clear procedures described in that document. The TLI has not yet got operating agreements that provide the exchange and mobility of teaching staff and students based on combining projects. No proves of the students' and teachers' mobility are in place.

According to the self-evaluation, during the process of developing the Aps, the Bachelor's degree academic program of Law of Omsk academy of the RF MIA was analyzed, and there was an attempt to reconcile as much as possible the learning outcomes and implementation criteria, expecting to carry out student exchange programs between the two institutions. A documented ground for this analysis was not provided to the expert panel. The TLI made an agreement to start a benchmarking with one of its partners, Krasnodar university of the RF MIA, but it was not implemented after the visit to the university. No comparative analyses of the similar programs of the European academic area done by the Educational Complex exist yet.

The Educational Complex mentions in the SE that “the expansion and internationalization of the students' and teachers' mobility is hindered by the lack of financial means and the non-sufficient level of foreign language knowledge”. However, the Educational Complex has not taken any productive steps to address these issues.

#### **3.5. The TLI has policy ensuring academic program monitoring, effectiveness assessment and improvement.**

In order to organize and coordinate the AP review process, “The regulation on monitoring and reviewing the academic programs in the Educational Complex” was approved in 2019. The regulation provides for the current monitoring of the educational programs on a cycle of two years, and the regular review of the academic programs on a cycle of five years. No monitoring was carried out in accordance with the regulation, since the APs were approved in the current year. The police secondary vocational academic program has already been reviewed based on the newly established state academic criterion.

In is mentioned in the SP that the motivation of external stakeholders is weak in the AP review process. With the aim of revealing the needs of the internal stakeholders, surveys were conducted among the students and teaching staff. No reviews are implemented based on the outcomes yet. Moreover, no grounds of the expert opinions for the AP monitoring and improvements were not presented, although the regulation provides for such evaluation. The current outcomes related to the academic programs are regularly discussed during the Scientific Council and chair sessions. The curricula are reviewed by the revealed requirement or the RA Police requests.

The Educational Complex has not conducted studies and analysis related to the further employment of the fee-paying students aimed at AP improvement.

**Considerations:** The preparation of the APs based on the learning outcomes was implemented in a regulated way, guided by the development procedure of the academic programs and the established structure of the specification. The development of the APs is not based on the analyses of the labor market, but the direct reconciliation of the APs and curricula with the RA Police contributed the identification of the learning outcomes (although they require clarification of measurability) and design of the program. The teaching staff’s weak understanding of the credit system put its full introduction in the education procedure and organization of the student-centered teaching at risk.

The expert panel considers particularly problematic the fact that the content similarities of the academy and college academic programs endanger the trustworthiness of awarding qualifications relevant to different NQF levels.

It is positive that along with the traditional teaching methods, student-centered methods and IT are used, and students are satisfied with the methods. The expert panel finds that the processes of implementing and assessing the hands-on trainings need to be regulated and clarified. In particular, the absence of practical trainings in the part-time department of the Academy cannot be compensated by the parallel service of the students, since the trainings should be implemented under the established programs that form precise outcomes, and in their workplaces the students

get acquainted only with their narrow field. Moreover, stakeholders also mention the need to enhance efficiency of organizing hands-on trainings and practical work in order to prepare practical specialists of the sphere.

The meetings and visits to departments revealed that the assessment system of the Educational Complex needs certain clarification and grounding, especially taking into account the objectiveness of assessing the abilities of the students that start service immediately after graduation. The absence of evidence of compliance of the assessing methods and learning outcomes is partially a consequence of non-measurable formulation of the outcomes as well. Taking into account also the need to clarify the assessment of practical trainings, the expert panel finds that the current assessment system does not ensure the proper evaluation of skills and abilities. The creation of a new mechanism of following the norms of citing and addressing plagiarism may contribute to assuring the academic fairness.

The topics selected for the Master's theses, and the study of court decisions adds their scientific value. However, the fact of using mainly Russian literature limits the integrity of the theses in the international research area. Meanwhile, certain tools should be introduced to ensure the development of the independent research component in the works.

In spite of an established benchmarking policy, the Educational Complex has just started to take steps in conducting comparative analysis of the APs. The absence of a full comparative analysis with any educational program does not allow the Educational Complex to ensure consistency with other programs and provide the students an opportunity for mobility. Consequently, the APs of the Educational Complex are implemented in isolation without following the developments of the leading educational programs of the field. The Educational Complex tries to implement the APs, learning about the experience of other countries through sending the staff to the business trips, but their influence on improving the APs is weak and not coordinated.

In the process of monitoring and review of the APs, the expert panel evaluates positively the direct influence and support of the RA Police. On the other hand, the inner monitoring of the Educational Complex under the newly established regulation may contribute to revealing the internal issues and improving the APs.

**Summary:** Taking into account the compliance of the APs based on the learning outcomes with the NQD, the mission of the Educational Complex and the requirements of the RA Police, the implementation of teaching and learning methods aimed at student-centered education, the existence of a formed assessment and qualification awarding system, the creation of mechanisms providing the academic fairness, the direct influence and support of the RA Police for improving

the APs, it can be concluded that the APs of the Educational Complex overall meet the requirements of the criterion.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 3 is **satisfactory**.

## IV. STUDENTS

**CRITERION: The TLI provides relevant student support services ensuring the effectiveness of the learning environment.**

### Findings

**4.1. The TLI has set mechanisms for promoting equitable recruitment, selection, and admission procedures.**

For the recruitment of the applicants the Educational Complex uses a number of awareness-raising mechanisms – published press, television (“Duty desk” program), web page (edupolice.am), Facebook page, as well as visits to school for awareness-raising and professional orientation. The members of the Students’ Council also participated in these visits. The reports on the school visits presented to the expert panel revealed that the visits were mainly paid in 2016 and 2018, more actively in 2018. The efficiency of the mechanisms for applicant recruitment was not analyzed.

In order to recruit applicants, the Educational Complex uses the discount system for the fee-paying students for the cases provided by law, and for the non-fee-paying students it provides scholarship in the amount of the minimum salary of RA. In certain cases, the students included in social groups and those with high GPA may receive a 90% discount off the extrabudgetary resources. For the straight-A students the Educational Complex provides also personal scholarships by the order of the Head, in accordance with the established regulation.

The Educational Complex carries out the admission of applicants in accordance with the 2015 regulation of the Scientific Council on “the selection and admission of the applicants in the Educational Complex”, by the formed mandatory committee. The rules for selecting applicants within the state procurement and the process of giving the study permit to the RA Police servants are established under the regulations approved by the order of the RA Police Head.

The admission for the Bachelor’s degree is not organized in the format and programs of the RA unified state examination. They are conducted through testing, in a specially equipped computer auditorium where the applicants take their exams.

The students of the state procurement also fill in special tests prepared by an independent organization, which check their moral and psychological state. The TLI engages public organizations as an observer in the process of applicant admission, and they provide opinion on the examination. The visit revealed that the involvement of the NGOs is not done publicly, they do not receive any announcement in advance, but certain NGOs are invited.

#### **4.2 The TLI has policies and procedures for revealing student educational needs.**

The Educational Complex reveals its students' needs through regular meetings, surveys conducted by the teaching and governing staff, and the students involved in the Scientific Council. The students who met with the expert panel mentioned that some of the issues they raised in the questionnaires and during the meetings were solved.

By the order of the Head of the Educational Complex, a service department officer is attached to each course as a head of the course. Observation of the documents that described his functions and meeting with them revealed that the heads of the course deal with service affairs rather than learning ones. Hence, the discovered needs are not academic.

#### **4.3 The TLI provides advising services, opportunities for extra-curricular activities supporting students' effective learning.**

The policy of the Educational Complex on organizing additional trainings and providing consultations is established in the "regulation on providing extra-curricular consultation activity" approved by the 2019 order of the Head of the Educational Complex. This includes extra-curricular consultation provided by the academic and supporting units, scientific department, management of the Educational Complex and Students' Council.

During resource observation it became clear that chairs do not have any fixed timetable for consultation activity except for pre-examinational ones. The students participating in the meeting stated that teachers are available for giving advice, upon which they agree beforehand.

In accordance with the 2017 order of the Head of the Educational Complex, extra-curricular trainings are aimed at providing methodological and practical support to the students that received unsatisfactory grade for seminars /practical lessons/, and for this purpose teachers are attached by order. Additional language classes have also been conducted. In particular, as the students stated, additional classes for the Armenian language subject were effective, while they seldom went to the foreign language clubs.

Consultations provided within the courses are recorded in relevant stamped chair journals. However, visits to chairs revealed that in some cases these journals have started to be filled in

quite recently. For example, a consultation journal of one of the exemplary chairs presented to the expert panel was opened in 2016, but the consultations were registered only from 2019.

No analysis was carried out to reveal how much the organized consultations and additional trainings contribute to the students' efficient learning.

#### **4.4 The TLI has set regulation and schedule for students to receive additional support and guidance from the administrative staff of the faculty.**

The Educational Complex does not have a regulation and procedures of contacting the administrative staff but as it is mentioned in the SE, it plans to do so. An approved timetable for contacting the administrative staff is also absent. The meetings revealed that for support and guidance the students turn to the heads of the course, faculty and chair heads, management of the Educational Complex during direct meetings, without any fixed timetable. The students who met with the expert panel were satisfied with the support of the administrative staff, emphasizing the friendly atmosphere of the Educational Complex.

#### **4.5 The TLI has student career support services.**

The main services for students' career support are carried out by the department of HR and Staff for Personnel that administers documents of the non-fee-paying students. The career issue of the non-fee-paying graduates is regulated by the contracts signed with them, which imply that in accordance with the law on "Serving in the Police", the graduates must be assigned to serve in the Police. The part-time students already are police officers that combine service with learning.

According to the same law, the fee-paying graduates are privileged to be appointed to serve in the police compared to the graduates of other universities. To select the best alumni of the fee-paying education, a representative from the central police staff participates in final state certification, and based on his recommendations, the best graduates can be assigned to serve in the Police. According to the provided data, in 2014, 54 students (20 girls) were admitted to the fee-paying system of education, out of which 8 students (1 girl) were appointed to serve in the Police. The Educational Complex does not have any data base on other graduates of the fee-paying education and does not support their career as it does not consider doing so as an objective.

During the meetings, the non-fee-students mentioned that the main reason for choosing this TLI was the career opportunities.

#### **4.6 The TLI promotes student involvement in research activities.**

In its SP, the Educational Complex focuses on improving the system of doing research, assessing and ratifying its outcomes. However, according to the tables provided in the SE, in 2012-

2018, there were no students involved in the priority scientific research of the TLI, no projects were implemented with the students' participation, no articles were published authored or co-authored by the students. The visit revealed that in 2019, two students conduct research together with their curator teachers, which is going to be published soon.

As the main mechanism of involving students in the scientific research activities the Educational Complex mentions the activity of students' scientific clubs. There are five scientific clubs operating in the Educational Complex that consist of at least ten students each. Membership to the clubs is voluntary and depends on the students' professional interests. The students mentioned that the scientific clubs make the topics presented within a subject more comprehensible, clear and interesting. For example, in the Criminal Law Club the students cover more complex cases, in the Civil Law Club they investigate legislative gaps and legal issues, deepen their practical skills by studying fake coins and passports. Thus, there is no requirements for the clubs to include research or scientific novelty component in their activity.

No mechanisms of facilitating engagement of students in scientific research has been introduced yet.

#### **4.7 The TLI has a responsible body for the students' rights protection.**

By the 2019 order, the Head of the Educational Complex approved the guidelines defining the rights and obligations of the students of the Educational complex, which includes extracts from the current state legal acts and those of the Educational Complex. Moreover, the student's manual had already been published by the time of the visit.

The main body that deals with the protection of the students' rights is the Students' Council (SC), an elected representative body that includes about 4,5% of the students. It has been operating for five years. An officer from the Educational Complex is attached to the SC who supports and provides consultation to the students but has no right to vote. The SC discusses the issues raised by students during the meetings with the Head of the Educational Complex, which are held regularly. Meetings with the College, Bachelor's and Master's degree students revealed that they were satisfied with the SC activity. Students can address the issues connected to the protection of their rights to the head of the course as well.

It is mentioned in the SE that the students' complaints and resolutions of the issues they reveal have not been analyzed.

#### **4.8 The TLI has evaluation and quality assurance mechanisms of student educational, advisory and other services.**

No clear mechanisms of quality assurance and assessing the educational, advising and other services operate in the Educational Complex so far. The assessment of certain components of educational services is carried out through surveys among students, but the quality assurance and performance improvement mechanisms are not introduced yet. The site visit revealed that not all the students participated in the surveys, and their analyses were not published among students.

**Considerations:** The expert panel evaluates positively the implementation of different mechanisms by the Educational Complex for the applicant recruitment, admission process that involves formation of a special mandatory committee and participation of NGOs. Nevertheless, the expert panel sees the necessity of enhancing transparency in organizing internal admission examinations. Meanwhile, the expert panel considers it risky to lower the admission minimum score, since in the case of absence of certain policy regarding the students admitted with low grades, they will not manage to obtain the required outcomes for qualification.

The direct relations between the teaching and governing staff of the Educational Complex and the students, their willingness to learn about the students' questions and issues, and try to find solution is worth noting. The SC and heads of the courses for their part also provide for solving the issues raised by students and protecting their rights.

The expert panel considers positive the practice of extra-curricular consultations and trainings that allows them to make up for the topics they did not learn well, fill in the gaps. Meanwhile, the lack of documentation of the consultations of previous years illustrates their improper realization so far.

The expert panel considers the friendly atmosphere for turning to the administrative staff quite positive, but still the panel finds it necessary to regulate the process and have approved timetables, which would expand the responsibilities of the academic staff and contribute to clarification of receiving different questions from students.

One of the strongest points of the Educational Complex is presence of the service contributing to the non-fee-paying students' career, which ensures 100% employment of the graduates. However, absence of the data base on the graduates of the fee-paying system (except for a few selected ones with high grades) and the processes of supporting their further career influences negatively on keeping in contact with them and on the responsibility to award qualification.

The institution should be concerned by the indicators of the students' involvement in scientific research. The scientific clubs created for this purpose have not covered research activity yet. Lack of the mechanisms to facilitate students' involvement in scientific research leads to reduced motivation among them.

The activity of the Students' Council – the body responsible for the students' rights – and the guidelines developed in the recent years contributed to creating the atmosphere of legal safety among students. However, the expert panel finds that the presence of the officer participating in the SC sessions may affect the relaxed discussions and issues raised.

The surveys used to assess the diverse services provided for students are still not effective enough. Absence of evaluating their credibility and their influence of the service results puts its efficiency under the risk.

**Summary:** Taking into account the existence of the operating mechanisms of recruiting, selecting and admitting the applicants, organization of revealing the students' educational needs, providing consultations and extra-curricular trainings, the opportunities for applying to the administrative staff and having a direct contact with them, the ensured career of the alumni in the police service, the expert panel finds that the Educational Complex in general provides relevant student support services ensuring the effectiveness of the learning environment.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 4 is **satisfactory**.

## V. FACULTY AND STAFF

**CRITERION: The TLI has a highly qualified teaching and supporting staff to accomplish the institution's mission and to implement the goals set for academic programmes.**

### **Findings:**

**5.1 The TLI has policies and procedures promoting recruitment of a highly qualified teaching and supporting staff capable of ensuring programme provisions.**

The Educational Complex indicates in its SP that the recruitment of the teaching and supporting staff is attributable to the necessity to properly realize the mission, strategic and academic plans of the Educational Complex. Starting to serve in the Educational Complex, moving to another service, and leaving service are regulated by the RA law on "Serving in the Police", labor code, employment contract and other legal acts. Besides the main teachers-police officers, civil persons are also invited on the contract basis. The selection of the teaching staff is not conducted on a competitive basis. Vacancies are not announced: the candidates are found through personal contacts. In accordance with the 2018 order of the head of the Educational Complex, the

head of a department provides relevant opinion on a teacher's professional capacities and pedagogical skills for him/her to teach on the contract basis. Compliance with the qualifications required for the academic program is checked in the Chairs upon the documents presented, and the documentation is done in the HR and Staff for Personnel. As it is mentioned in the SE, there is no common policy and procedures of selecting the teaching and supporting staff operating in the Educational Complex.

45% out of the main teaching staff of the Educational Complex are experienced in working in different police units. From 2018, working servants of different RA Police units and rights protection system are involved in the academic process.

The effectiveness of approaches in selecting the teaching and supporting staff is not assessed. The student participants of the meetings during the expert visit were satisfied with the current teaching staff.

### **5.2 The teaching staff qualifications for each programme are comprehensively stated.**

By the 2015 order, the Head of the Educational Complex approved the general requirements to the teaching staff per title (assistant, teacher, senior teacher, docent, professor, department (chair) and faculty heads, their deputies). The AP specifications represent as a separate section the requirements related to the teaching staff on the professional, personal, pedagogical, scientific-research, organizational, and communication skills. However, the identified requirements do not arise directly from the specificities of the APs. In its SE, the Educational Complex stated that there were no precise requirements to the professional knowledge and skills of the teachers of each academic program based on the learning outcomes yet, but in the SP they plan to develop them. On the other hand, it is mentioned that the criteria and standards of selecting the teaching staff based on the AP requirements still need a better rationale.

### **5.3 The TLI has well established policies and procedures for the periodic evaluation of the teaching staff.**

In its SP, the Educational Complex plans to introduce an efficacious system of indicators for assessing and rating the efficiency of the teachers' scientific-pedagogical activity and accurate assessment procedure. The actual assessment is done in two ways: individual (assessment of the head of the department based on the outcomes of an individual work plan performance and classroom observations) and collective (supervisory classroom observations and making of acts by the government of the Educational Complex). In the reports of the department heads, however, there is no analysis of the outcomes of assessing the teaching staff. In the supervisory acts observed during the visit, there were no issues revealed and no purposes for further improvement. The act

describes the process of conducting the class, and it is not an analytical document or grounds for it.

To evaluate the professional capacities and pedagogical skills of the teaching staff in the Educational Complex, the EQAD conducted the “Teachers in the eyes of students” survey in 2019. Only the students of the fourth and fifth platoon participated in the survey. The results are mainly 100% which proves either inefficiency of making up the questions or unreliability of the outcomes.

Different existing mechanisms of assessing the teaching staff are not interrelated: the outcomes do not undergo cross-analyses. No external assessments are done as well. The teaching staff has not undergone full assessment of compliance with the qualities presented in the APs. The assessment outcomes are considered during the encouragement of the teaching staff. The effectiveness of assessment mechanisms is not analyzed by the institution.

#### **5.4 The TLI implements teacher professional development in accordance to the needs outlined during regular evaluations (both internal and external).**

One of the SP objectives of the Educational Complex is “to engage a highly-qualified teaching staff, providing them with opportunities of continuous improvement, as well as up-to-date and conducive working environment”.

During the 2018-2019 academic year, the most experienced teachers of the Educational Complex conducted trainings for improving the pedagogical skills, with an approved timetable. The teaching staff participated in re-trainings organized by international experts in the Educational Complex and other higher education institutions. Moreover, the teaching staff takes part in inter-institutional, national and international conferences and seminars. With the aim of exchanging experience, paying a study visit, participating in scientific-business events, the teaching staff goes on trips to RF and other foreign police educational institutions. Additional courses have been organized in the foreign language clubs of the Educational Complex, but because of their workload, the teaching staff could not participate in them, according to the SE and meeting outcomes.

The effectiveness of the mechanisms used for the improvement of teachers has not been evaluated.

#### **5.5 The TLI ensures the sustainability of the teaching staff according to academic programmes.**

In order to ensure the sustainability of the staff for the academic programs, the “procedure of rationing and organizing activities of the teaching staff of the Educational Complex of the RA Police” approved in 2015 in the Scientific Council. According to the regulation, in the case of the

excess of the established academic workload for the teaching staff a one-time bonus is given. Besides, the serving teachers with a scientific degree get a monthly bonus.

Two heads of chair of the Educational Complex, funded from extrabudgetary resources, and one servant from the teaching staff, funded through the means of the RA Police, obtained apartments in accordance with the decrees of the Educational Complex Board and the committee studying the accommodation issues of the servants.

It is mentioned in the AP specifications that 53.1% of the teaching staff has a scientific degree and/or title. According to the list provided, only 7 people out of the 60 from the main teaching staff have a scientific degree. These are mainly teachers invited on the contract basis: 25 out of 41 have a scientific degree.

The TLI's staff list is mainly complete, but the workload of certain chair heads and teachers is rather heavy. The reason is that for a number of subjects there is only one teaching specialist in place.

#### **5.6 There are set policies and procedures for the staff promotion.**

The policy and procedures of the Educational Complex for promoting the professional growth of its teaching staff are based on the current police legislation. There are forms of rewards and career promotion set by the RA law on the "service in the Police". Besides submitting for promotion, it is also possible to file an application to superior bodies to award a staff member with a medal, certificate of merit or certificate of appreciation as a reward. In order to ensure scientific improvement, the postgraduate training of the teaching staff is free of charge. As of 2019, the Educational Complex has six postgraduate students, five of which are from the teaching staff, and one – from the supporting staff.

Although the Educational Complex does not have an established policy and procedures for the mentorship of the beginning teachers, in regard to exchange of expertise, the experienced ones carry out trainings aimed at improving pedagogical skills.

The scientific-methodological journal "Bulwark of Law" included in the list of journals accepted by the RA MoE HQC, in which the teachers are being published for free, also promoted development. Publications of the teaching staff in other journals is funded by the Educational Complex as well.

#### **5.7 There is necessary technical and administrative staff to achieve the strategic goals.**

According to the presented composition, the necessary administrative staff with their subordinate units is in place. The formation of the list of the teaching and supporting staff of the Educational Complex, the selection of the staff, the appointment in positions, promotion and

certification are regulated by the orders of the Head of the RA Police and the Head of the Educational Complex, as well as the regulations of the Educational Complex. Currently the Educational Complex has 28 administrative and 59 supporting staff members, who have established functional responsibilities.

The Educational Complex has not analyzed yet, to what extent the administrative and supporting staff contribute to the realization of the SP goals. The site visit revealed the existing issue in clarifying and optimizing the functions of the staff for the realization of the strategy. In particular, the responsibility of the employment policy of the teaching staff does not rest with the Department of Human Resources and Staff for Personnel; the department responsible for internationalization mainly deals with the organization of business trips and ceremonial events; there are no units responsible for organizing hands-on trainings, creating a data-base of the fee-paying alumni and promoting their career growth.

**Considerations:** The Educational Complex managed to recruit teaching and supporting staff necessary for implementing its academic programs by involving not only police servants as the main teachers but also civilians on the contract basis. However, absence of the competition order and dissemination of vacancy announcements hinders the transparency of involvement of new staff, limits the frames of the candidates and it may prevent the inflow of highly qualified specialists. The expert panel highly appreciates the involvement of experienced police officers in the teaching staff, which gives them the opportunity to convey their practical knowledge and expertise to students. Moreover, a huge percentage of the alumni of the Educational Complex in the teaching staff contributes to the students' progress and involvement of young perspective professionals.

The requirements to the professional qualities of the teaching staff are general and, as the TLI itself mentions, are not based on the AP specificities. This lack does not allow the educational institution to analyze whether the TS qualities are satisfactory or not, in accordance with the AP requirements, and to ensure the AP learning outcomes.

The individual and collective types of assessments of the teaching staff provide a certain image, however not in accordance with the qualities required in the APs. There are no deep analyses of the assessments that would allow to reveal the main achievements of the teaching staff and reasons for the shortcomings. The implemented surveys have not undergone an assessment of trustworthiness, which can affect the objectiveness of the result.

The expert panel evaluates positively the TLI's efforts in providing participation of its teaching staff in professional trainings and courses both within the Educational Complex and

abroad. However, since these trainings are not based on internal and external assessments, their focus and the spending effectiveness are at risk.

The Educational Complex managed to ensure the sustainability of providing TS for the APs in spite of a significant dependency on the part-time staff on the contract basis. Meanwhile, heavy workload of the TS and lack of the narrow specialists may endanger the stability of the academic process in case they need to be replaced.

The professional growth of the TS is provided by the Educational Complex through positional promotion (therefore the title) and the policy of rewards. Besides, the opportunity to publish scientific and methodological articles free of charge is another effective mechanism of scientific-research improvement.

The administrative and supporting staff of the Educational Complex promote the realization of the mission and goals of the academic programs; however, in some directions, the expert panel sees the necessity to clarify the administrative functions to enhance the development efficiency.

**Summary:** Taking into account the availability of the TS and SS relevant for the academic programs, direct involvement of specialists experienced in the practical sphere into the educational process, established mechanisms of the TS rewards, availability of the improvement policy and procedures, provision and facilitation of the TS sustainability through the best alumni, the expert panel finds that the Educational Complex has a highly qualified teaching and supporting staff relevant to its mission and APs.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 5 is **satisfactory**.

## VI. RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

**CRITERION: The TLI ensures the implementation of research activity and the link of the research with teaching and learning.**

### **Findings**

#### **6.1 The TLI has a clear strategy promoting its research interests and ambitions.**

In the 2017-2021 SP, the Educational Complex defined as a separate goal “to develop the scientific-research activity of the Educational Complex, form a competitive scientific and innovational potential, gradually shift to the research status of the Educational Complex”.

However, it should be noted that the majority of the planned events still need to be realized in the future. Before that, in 2016, the thematic priorities of the scientific-research activity conducted in the Educational Complex were established in accordance with the manual on publication types, the requirements to their review and publication recommendations. The identified fields were the following: international cooperation of the RA Police, investigative, crime and other violation preventing activity, Police authorization and licensing, activity-planning, decision-making, RA Police history. The expert panel was not presented a list of scientific publications in these fields. Data on the outcomes upon the fields was not collected in the Educational Complex.

In 2019, the Scientific Council approved the guidelines and vision of development for 2019-2023, in which four objectives were formulated with the implementation steps and action plan-timetable. The guidelines of the research field and the vision of development are new, hence there are no results of the implementation according to the timetable yet. It is mentioned in the SE, that the process of identifying the directions expressing the police interests in the scientific research was not carried out in a coordinated way; internal stakeholders took part only.

## **6.2 The TLI has a long-term strategy as well as mid and short-term programmes that address its research interests and ambitions.**

The SP is considered a long-term strategy of research activity, defined as a separate goal, as well as “The guidelines and the vision of development of the research field of the RA Police Educational Complex” approved in 2019. They are available for the staff in the internal network.

There are no mid-term plans. From 2018, the Scientific Department has been developing an annual short-term action plan based on the SP. Besides, all the chairs develop their annual work plans, in which they present as a separate part the SR activities or the SR priorities of the chair. The action plans include preparation of scientific articles, review of the theses and dissertations, participation in conferences and seminars. However, the annual plans of the Scientific Department and chairs do not contain quantitative or qualitative indicators that would allow to assess the implementation of the SR strategy and the dynamics. The reports only present the list of scientific activity conducted without analyzing their compliance with the SP outcomes.

## **6.3 The TLI ensures the implementation of research and its development through sound policies and procedures.**

Research is coordinated in the Educational Complex by the deputy head in academic and scientific affairs and the Scientific Department.

The Educational Complex defined its policy of implementation and development of research in the SR strategy, but there are no procedures ensuring its being realistic yet. The field

scientific research is not conducted systematically. Although the indicator of scientific and methodological activities has increased for about 76% compared to the previous year, the observations showed that the achievements are mainly the individual efforts of the teaching staff. No scientific research is done together with other educational and scientific institutions. The scientific-research collaboration with other local universities is limited by peer-reviews, organization of role plays of students, and participation in conferences.

From 2016, the scientific-methodological journal “Bulwark of Law” has been published, and in 2018 it was included in the list of scientific publications accepted by the RA HQC. Six issues of the journal were published in three years, including approximately 88 scientific articles by 37 local and 75 foreign authors. The teaching staff of the Educational Complex publishes its SR works in the journal free of charge. The TLI has developed guidelines for the articles to be published, related to publication types, review and publication recommendation, which are distributed to the chairs. The scientific works implemented by the teachers are examined during the chair sessions. After the chair discussions, recommendations on the works are presented also by the Scientific Department. The department created an electronic professional library of scientific works by the Armenian and foreign authors in the electronic form.

There is a regulation of assessing the scientific activity of chairs, which provides for a ten-point scale of assessment for different scientific works. Chairs provide reports on the scientific works done, based on which the outcomes are summarized and published during the Scientific Council session. The chair that scored highest receives a certificate of appreciation “For the best performance of scientific activity” and a symbolic challenge statuette. No mechanisms of encouraging the teaching staff for the SR works are in place.

Allocation of financial resources is done under the annual procurement plan, which includes spending on the scientific events and publications planned. The main expenditures are directed at organizing scientific conferences, business trips and publication. The TLI itself notes that there are no mechanisms of commercialization of the SR works. The TLI does not view research as a source of income. Nevertheless, the Head of the Educational Complex mentioned that the TLI still did not have enough financial resources for making its achievements in research more tangible.

#### **6.4 The TLI emphasizes the internationalization of its research.**

In the 2017-2021 SP of internal relation development and internationalization, the Educational Complex considers the internationalization of research as a separate objective. The TLI has an array of collaboration contracts, memoranda of understanding and agreements with over 13 foreign educational institutions. Collaboration is limited by participation in conferences

and mutual visits. In the last 5 years, four international scientific-practical conferences were organized in the Educational Complex, in which the teaching staff and students took part. The materials represented during the conferences are edited and published in “Bulwark of Law” journal. According to the SE, the number of teachers, whose works are published in prestigious international journals, is small.

The TLI is a member of international organizations including the Association of the MIA universities of the CIS countries /2009/, a working agreement with CEPOL /2017/, the Association of European Police Colleges (AEPC) /2017/. During the meetings it was revealed that the chairs had not carried out any joint international research activity. The SR outcomes did not improve as a result of the membership in associations. There are no joint SR projects being implemented, although they are contained in the agreements.

### **6.5 The TLI has well established mechanisms for linking research with teaching.**

In 2015, the regulation of involving the students of the Academy of the Educational Complex in the SR works, and the activity of the scientific clubs was established, according to which five scientific student clubs were formed. They are the following: “Study of the main problems of crime and punishment”, “Study of the main problems of crime solving and investigation”, “State legal subjects”, “Private and civil procedure law” and “Social sciences”, which organize thematic round-table discussions during the academic year, in accordance with the approved plan. The clubs provide biannual and annual reports. The observations revealed that the student scientific clubs are educational groups rather than scientific ones. They focus on gaining deeper knowledge about certain topics, having an interactive format of learning.

The TLI sees the methodological works and research by the teachers as well as thesis curation as a mechanism of linking education with the research activity. There are only a few cases of the teachers’ scientific works co-authored by the students. No extra-curricular trainings are held in the Educational Complex aimed at developing research skills of students.

The satisfaction of the institution’s teachers and students by the link between the research and academic process is not evaluated.

**Considerations:** The Educational Complex has formulated its strategy regarding the SR field, based on such ambitious goals, the realization of which is endangered in the current situation, the current TS and lack of new sources of funding. The absence of collaboration with other educational and scientific-research institutions of RA in this field leads to the slow improvement in research, and lack of joint research projects. In spite of the establishment of thematic priorities, they do not constitute the basis of the SR works of the Educational Complex, and the outcomes are not

tangible. Without the involvement of external stakeholders (including the Police and other employers) in the development of the SR strategy the link between the established priorities and current needs may be broken. In its turn, this hinders the continuous development of research and commercialization of the outcomes based on it.

The absence of a realistic policy of the TLI's development, and relevant procedures to realize the established vision of the SR field does not ensure the link between the goals and actual activity.

In spite of the increasing rates of the scientific-methodological activity, and the opportunity of free publication, the transition to the research status of the Educational Complex is still not implemented under a precise policy. The absence of the relevant staff and mechanisms of financial rewards for the research activity, as well as the heavy workload of the teaching staff do not contribute to the increase of motivation and the efficiency of the SR field.

The expert panel highlights the efforts made by the Educational Complex in the direction of internationalization of research, namely the agreements signed and participation in international conferences. However, the lack of joint research projects based on these agreements, and the small number of publications in prestigious international journals prove that the agreements do not operate purposefully. Participation in conferences and round tables still does not ensure the internationalization of the research activity.

The absence of clear mechanisms of linking the research activity and academic processes in the Educational Complex effects the development of the research component in the APs. The current student scientific clubs do not facilitate the formation of critical thinking and the development of research skills of the students.

**Summary:** Considering that the TLI does not have a realistic policy and procedures for realizing its scientific-research strategy, there are no ongoing projects of collaboration with other educational institutions, as well as enough funding and reward mechanisms for implementing the research activity, there are no international research programs, the students' involvement in the research works is little, the number of publications in foreign journals is small, and there are no clear mechanisms of linking research and educational processes, the expert panel finds that the Educational Complex does not sufficiently ensure the realization of research activity and its link with education.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 6 is **unsatisfactory**.

## VII. INFRASTRUCTURE AND RESOURCES

**CRITERION: The TLI has necessary resources to create learning environment and to effectively support the implementation of its stated mission and goals.**

### **Findings**

#### **7.1 The TLI has an appropriate learning environment for the implementation of current academic programmes.**

In the AP specifications of the Educational Complex the resources necessary for implementing the programs are defined: the TS, material-technical and supporting means. The classes in the Educational Complex are held in 56 auditoriums of five buildings. There are 11 training rooms, 5 computer auditoriums and one room of interactive learning. In order to develop professional skills, the Educational Complex has a criminology room equipped with computers, schemes, weapon samples, as well as a criminology laboratory with the decorations for observing the crime scene, a shooting range (laser and military), a law clinic. The clinic was founded at the end of 2018, and is aimed at providing legal advice to the public by the senior students. The clinic has had only four visitors so far. A training course was organized for 12 students, by the end of which they were awarded with certificates.

The Educational Complex is going to renovate the criminology laboratory in the future: for this purpose, there is already an agreement with the RA Police on the acquisition of the newest equipment for about 30 million drams. There is a library, halls (equipped with technical facilities for conferences and different events), a canteen, two gyms, one of which is currently being refurbished, and the other one has exercise equipment, a fitness hall for girls.

The authors of a big part of the professional literature available in the library are from the TS of the Educational Complex; examples of theses are also presented. The total number of the library books is 25393, including 16269 professional and 9764 fiction ones. As of 2018, the number of visits to the library was about 1430. Both in the SE and during the meetings the TS and students mentioned that the professional literature in the library is insufficient, and the resources of the electronic library are inappropriate. There is no full version of the digitalized library fund. According to the contract of cooperation, the students of the Educational Complex have the opportunity to use the RA national library. The Educational Complex has a dormitory for 40 persons, where the students that live at least 60 km from the Educational Complex can stay. Currently 27 students use the dormitory.

### **7.2 The TLI provides appropriate financial resources with necessary equipment and facilities as needed to achieve its mission and objectives.**

The main directions of the policy of managing the financial resources of the Educational Complex are the following: planning of the financial resources by preparing the preliminary estimate, efficient allocation of the financial resources, forecasting and control of the financial risks, insurance of the alternative financial flows.

With the aim of managing the financial flows in the Educational Complex, an annual preliminary estimate of the budget incomes and expenses, and after a financial year, the annual budget performance report is presented to the RA Police based on the analysis of the actual data. The allocation of the main incomes of the 2018 budget of the Educational Complex is the following: 9.3% of the budget incomes is formed by the tuition fees, 90% is the state funding, and other revenues form 0.7%. The observation of the documents on the financial flows of the recent years shows that both the income of the Educational Complex (due to the increase in the number of students and state funding) and expenses (related to the resources gained and the continuous improvement of the learning environment) have been growing year by year.

### **7.3 The TLI has sound financial distribution policy and capacity to sustain and ensure the integrity and continuity of the academic programmes offered at the Institution.**

The project of the budget of the Educational Complex is made by the Head, the Deputy Head and the Financial Department, discussed during the Board session and if agreed, presented to the Head of the RA Police for approval. At the beginning of the year, the procurement plan is presented to the authorized body, in accordance with which the purchases are made.

At the beginning of the academic year, the heads of the faculties and units provide the Economic department of the Educational Complex with a note of the necessary material-technical and supporting means.

Due to the legal status of the TLI, internal financial auditing is carried out by the Department of internal audit of the RA Police. Each year audit conclusions regarding the financial reports and economic activity are provided, based on which recommendations are given and improvement steps are taken.

### **7.4 The TLI's resource base supports the implementation of institution's academic programmes and TLI strategic plan, which promotes for sustainability and continuous quality enhancement.**

In the APs and SP of the Educational Complex, there are reflections on the resources required for actions. However, in the SP table of the required human, material and financial resources, only the human resources are mentioned.

Although it is worth noting that the TLI has not implemented a complete analysis of the relevance of the resource base with regards to the efficient performance of the SP and APs, the issues concerning the resource endowment are revealed among internal stakeholders by the means of questionnaires. As a consequence, a few cases of improvement of auditoriums were documented: in the last year, auditoriums were equipped with projectors and air conditioners. Moreover, effective steps are taken to renovate the laboratory of criminology so that it meets the AP requirements. In accordance with the needs provided by the faculties, the Educational Complex files an application for the replenishment of the resource base. Along with the resource base available in the Educational Complex, the RA Police base is also used for the improvement of the practical skills by sending students to have practice in the operating units.

#### **7.5 The TLI has a sound policy and procedure to manage information and documentation.**

The circulation of the internal information and documentation as well as external documents is implemented in accordance with the administrative regulation. The Educational Complex introduced Mulberry electronic system of documentation that provides the direct link with the RA Police for sending and receiving data. Document management in the Educational Complex is done through a single inner network that links about 300 computers and is run by the Department of International Cooperation and IT. However, as it is mentioned in the SE, the electronic documentation of the Educational Complex is not introduced completely.

Dissemination of information about the TLI is done through announcements, print and electronic media, [www.police.am](http://www.police.am) official web page of the RA Police, informational manuals, booklets, and “02” newspapers.

#### **7.6 The TLI creates safe and secure environment through health and safety mechanisms that also consider special needs of students.**

Having a status of a military unit, the Educational Complex ensures the security of its territory by maintaining a 24-hour presence. This is organized by the Service Department engaging also students in this process. The observations showed that all the necessary conditions are provided for the duty officers to conduct effective service.

In order to ensure internal fire safety, on every floor of the Educational Complex at visible places there are evacuation plans displayed as signboards and necessary fire extinguishers. To increase the level of the students’ awareness and improve their skills of quick respond to an

emergency, the subjects (modules) of “Civil defense” and “First aid to the civilians in an emergency” are taught. The TLI has a health center with one doctor and two nurses. There are toilets, bathrooms, bandaging room and two infirmaries for 12 patients. The center is provided with the necessary medication and equipment.

The TLI has not developed a policy and procedures aimed at protecting health and safety of the students with special needs, there are no relevant services. The building conditions of the Educational Complex are not adapted for the students with special needs.

#### **7.7 The TLI has mechanisms in place for the evaluation of the effectiveness, applicability and availability of resources given to the teaching staff and learners.**

The mechanisms for assessing the usefulness, availability and effectiveness of the resources and services provided to students and teachers are the surveys, discussions and meetings conducted to reveal the satisfaction of teachers and students with the resources. The TLI has not done the performance assessment of the implemented mechanisms.

The students have the opportunity to raise their questions related to the resources provided and get the respond during the meetings with the governing staff, too. Almost all the councils operating in the TLI include members of the students’ council; there is one student per faculty in the SC. The discussed issues are presented among the students.

**Considerations:** The expert panel finds that the current resources of the TLI sufficiently ensure the realization of the AP goals. Meanwhile, the professional classrooms, laboratory and auditoriums need to be renovated with the up-to-date technical means, which was stated also by the participants of the meetings with the expert panel. It is worth mentioning that certain steps are already taken for renewing and refurbishing the exercise equipment and the laboratory of criminology. The outcomes of the surveys and meetings held in the TLI prove that the students and teachers see the need for the improvement of the library resources, particularly the professional literature, which put the implementation of the APs and the achievements of the learning outcomes under the risk.

The expert panel evaluates positively that the TLI has a centralized system of allocation and control of the financial resources. The expenses planned for the annual budget are directed at the AP implementation, but they are not detailed in accordance with the strategic goals and academic plans, which would have made the financial investments more targeted and efficient. Limited investments in a number of key fields (e.g. research, internationalization, library resources) may weaken the performance of the strategic plan.

The Educational Complex has certain achievements in managing information and documentation. This is facilitated by the introduced systems of managing documentation and information, which have made these processes much more clear and easy. They ensure a direct link with the RA Police and the units of the Educational Complex for sending and receiving data in a short time.

The Educational Complex created a safe and secured environment through the security and health protection services. This was promoted by its status of a police unit, and the availability of the necessary equipment and systems. The health center has medications and facilities to ensure a proper quality of medical service.

The TLI has introduced the mechanism of surveys for assessing the learning environment aimed at revealing needs and improving the environment. However, the targeted implementation of the surveys and, as a consequence, the procedures for revelation and solution of the issues is not coordinated yet. The absence of assessing the effectiveness of the surveys may impact on collecting trustworthy data.

**Summary:** Taking into account the learning environment secured with the auditorium and room fund, material-technical resources, professional equipment, the clear financial policy and its accountable implementation, the introduction of electronic systems of organizing the learning process, communication and documentation, the effective provision of safety and health services, the expert panel finds that the Educational Complex has the required resources to create a learning environment and implement the established mission and goals.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 7 is **satisfactory**.

## VIII. SOCIETAL RESPONSIBILITY

**CRITERION: The TLI is accountable to the government and society for the education it offers and the resources it uses as well as for the research it conducts.**

### Findings

#### 8.1 The TLI has clear policy on accountability.

The Educational Complex sees accountability as one of its strategic goals, that is “to ensure a continuous, transparent and public academic process”.

The Educational Complex follows the principle of hierarchical accountability established in the unit regulations. It starts with the TS, then the reports provided by chair and faculty heads, as well as the trimester, semester, nine-month and annual reports by separate departments and units. However, the reports observed in chairs and departments does not have an analytical character. They list the activities done without mentioning the issues or the ways of their resolution.

On the basis of the reports of the structural units, the Head of the Educational Complex provides an annual report at the annual final expanded session of the Board, in which a deputy head-curator of the RA Police also participates. Then, in accordance with the procedure established, the report on the activity of the Educational Complex of that particular year is presented to the RA Police Headquarter. The annual report is once again discussed during the meeting with all the staff of the Educational Complex. The final report is a collection of the reports provided by the units. It is not analytical as well. As the TLI states in its SE, the processes of accountability and feedback are not quite targeted and they need more measurable indicators of assessment.

Only in 2019, the 2018 performance report of the strategic plan was prepared, which describes the flaws and shortcomings, recommendations on solving them. However, this report is not to be presented to the public, but is a document of internal use. In July 2019, at the session of the Scientific Council, the procedure of conducting informative-analytical activities of the Educational Complex and their accountability, but it has not been implemented yet.

## **8.2. The TLI ensures transparency of its procedures and processes and makes them publicly available.**

The development of public relations is defined as a strategic objective. In order to provide information about the activity of the Educational Complex to the public, the official web page, the Facebook page, “The honor is mine” paper and other mass media are used.

In 2019, the Head of the Educational Complex released an order on organizing the process of spreading information in the official web page. The Department of international cooperation and IT is set as a responsible unit. The documents and materials available on the web page were only recently uploaded. No materials are available in foreign languages (Russian, English). Nevertheless, the students and TS are satisfied with the operation of the web page.

The TLI also holds diverse meetings and informative visits for schoolchildren, media, public and cultural organizations. Different programs are broadcast on TV devoted to organization of the academic process, everyday life and admission of the applicants in the Educational Complex.

### **8.3. The TLI has sustainable feedback mechanisms for establishing relations with society.**

In 2018, the concept of developing the public relations of the Educational Complex was established, based on which the 2019 action plan for increasing the ranking of the Educational Complex was prepared.

The link between the Educational Complex and the public is provided through different tools: meetings with parents, visits to schools, engagement in public processes, EXPO exhibitions. The internet is also used, in particular, stakeholders can ask their questions by sending a direct message on the web page, putting on the “contact us” link. However, as the TLI mentions in its report, the use of these tools is not regulated enough. There are no performance analyses.

### **8.4 The TLI has mechanisms that ensure knowledge transfer to the society.**

One of the main objectives of the Educational Complex is to provide educational, scientific, methodological, and expert services in the fields of the security of civil society, proper protection of public order, and defense of the rights and legal interests of physical and legal persons.

To the fight against unlawfulness of the region, the fight against illicit drug-trafficking, and strengthening of links between the public and police, the Educational Complex has its contribution as a unit of the RA Police.

The Educational Complex regularly works with pupils from general education schools and applicants, providing educational-informative services involving also the Students’ Council to provide a vocational guidance. The Educational Complex conducts additional educational programs to re-train the specialists of the RA Police and other institutions and grant them a permit; these include “Sentry”, “Security guard” and other short-time courses. Besides, a range of diverse events, conferences and research is carried out.

The activity of the “Law clinic” is a new mechanism for transfer knowledge (values) to the society; the aim of this clinic is to provide the public with free legal advice, meanwhile developing the students’ practical skills.

**Considerations:** Being a part of the security forces, the Educational Complex is obliged to provide annual report on its activity based on the existing legislation. It uses the principle of hierarchical accountability to reach this goal, which contributes to the implementation of complete and coherent accountability. The reports presented to the RA Police Headquarter contribute to strengthening relations between the main employer and the institution. However, the absence of the analytical component in the reports hinders the revelation of the main issues and their reasons.

Publication of information about the activity of the Educational Complex using different mechanisms makes it possible to ensure enough transparency and publicity for the society, of course, preserving confidentiality if needed. The fact that the necessary information was uploaded on the web page only during the current year and the information lacks in foreign languages effects the efficient dissemination of information, although the TLI started to take certain steps for improvement.

The expert panel evaluates positively the approval of the concept aimed at clarifying the policy of establishing public relations, and the plan of increasing the ranking of the Educational Complex. In spite of the existence of different mechanisms, their sustainability and systematic implementation are not on a proper level. The absence of analyses does not allow the expert panel to evaluate their further influence on the activity of the Educational Complex.

The expert panel emphasizes the important contribution of the Educational Complex to the transfer of knowledge and values to the society. The services of community policing, protection of the rights and legal interests of physical and legal persons provided by the Educational Complex allow it to play a special role in the system of higher education institutions of Armenia, implementing additional field academic programs.

**Summary:** Taking into account the TLI's fully functional system of accountability for internal and external stakeholders, the mechanisms used for the transparency and availability of the implemented procedures and processes, the policy directed at improving the public relations, the unique role in transferring field knowledge (values) to the society, the expert panel finds that the TLI meets the requirements of the criterion.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 8 is **satisfactory**.

## IX. EXTERNAL RELATIONS AND INTERNATIONALIZATION

**CRITERION: The Institution promotes experience exchange and enhancement through its sound external relations practices, thus promoting internationalization of the Institution.**

### Findings

## **9.1 The TLI promotes its external relations through sound policies and procedures aimed at creating an environment conducive to experience exchange and enhancement and internationalization.**

In the 2017-2021 SP of the Educational Complex, the indicated ninth strategic direction is the expansion of external relations and international activity. The Educational Complex plans to expand and diversify its international relations, facilitate the continuous processes of internationalization with the European universities and international institutions of higher education on institutional and project level, broaden the international scientific collaboration of the Educational Complex, and promote the institution's involvement in the European research area.

Moreover, the "2017-2021 strategic plan of internationalization and development of external relations" and its plan-timetable were approved. In the directions of improvement, the Educational Complex highlights rapprochement with the EHEA, meanwhile preserving and developing the traditional cooperative relations with the CIS, especially the RF MIA, as well as China universities.

A number of events from the plan-timetable for 2017-2019 have not been conducted yet. For example, preparation of APs in foreign languages, creation of a consulting platform for the international students, development of procedures concerning the international students, constant communication with them through informational electronic network, etc.

Both the SP and internationalization plan were developed for 2017-2021 but the link between them is not clear. In particular, certain steps established in the SP are absent from the IP, namely the introduction and expansion of the international summer school, promotion of the engagement of student organizations in international programs, promotion of the TS participation in mobility programs, etc.

No benchmarking of the policy and procedures of external relations and internationalization has taken place. The documents published on the TLI's web page for internationalization do not contain translations in foreign languages.

## **9.2 The TLI's external relations infrastructure ensures regulated process.**

The processes securing external relations and internationalization of the Educational Complex are coordinated by the Department of International Cooperation and IT, which has a staff of eight.

There are issues in the regulations of the department: study and introduction of the newest educational models and learning technologies within the frames of international cooperation, study of the best international experience of academic processes in preparing high-quality specialists.

However, the observation of the annual reports of the department proves that the majority of the processes had a ceremonial and IT provision character. There are no evidences for the direct influence on the academic process, the works on studying, localizing and introducing international expertise, the searching of international educational and research programs and applications for participation. During the meeting with the department head it became clear that such processes have not launched yet. The reports of the department responsible for internationalization are not based on the approved strategy, the key indicators and the performance dynamics are not taken into consideration, but there is just a list of the activities carried out. Thus, the procedures of the department are not based on the IP timetable and do not ensure its realization.

The department head was appointed as the CEPOL network manager and the national responsible person for the online platform of data and experience exchange between the educational institutions of human right protection in the OSCE territory (Police Academy Network/PAN), but it became clear during the meetings that the majority of the Educational Complex staff was not aware of CEPOL and the opportunities it provides. The department staff underwent professional re-trainings (a two-month re-training program in the Diplomatic School of Armenia, “Darknet” program courses in IT), have certificates, know foreign languages.

### **9.3 The TLI promotes fruitful and effective collaboration with local and international counterparts.**

The Educational Complex has signed contracts of collaboration, protocols, memoranda of understanding and agreements with 19 foreign educational institutions, meanwhile has joint several associations of international police educational institutions. However, few of these agreements are used in practice. As it is mentioned in the SE as well, not all the points of the agreements in force are implemented. For example, the visit revealed that within the framework of the agreement with Poland, only one activity was carried out; the opportunities provided by CEPOL are not fully used.

The actual result of cooperation were the business trips of the staff, including participation in courses abroad and international conferences. For the last three years, 83 servants of the Educational Complex (42 of which from the TS) went on a business trip to over 12 countries, and 10 students were sent to Georgia and RF. Within the frames of international cooperation, 55 workers of the Educational Complex participated in courses organized within different programs including international ones. Besides, four international scientific-practical conferences and one session of the executive committee of the AEPC were organized in the Educational Complex. In 2016, the annual spartakiad of training the MIA (police) governing staff of the association of the MIA (police) universities of the member-countries.

The cooperation contracts with the local universities and scientific-academic centers were not provided to the expert panel. Educational and research programs together with any other university are not conducted. No cases of involvement of students and teachers in international exchange programs, no cases of mobility are registered, although some of the agreements provide such an opportunity. During the last three years, neither foreign trainees nor courses in foreign languages were in the Educational Complex, although it was planned in the strategy. There are few cases of publication in foreign journals.

No evidences of improvement of the APs and other processes of the Educational Complex due to international cooperation were provided. No mechanisms for assessing the efficiency of cooperation are available.

It is stated in the SE that the effective cooperation is hampered by the unsatisfactory level of English among the staff and students of the Educational Complex, as well as out-of-date technical equipment and lack of financial resources.

#### **9.4 The TLI ensures internal stakeholders' appropriate level of a foreign language to enhance productivity of internationalization.**

From 2012, free English language courses have been organized for the administrative, teaching and supporting staff of the Educational Complex; in 2015, the English and French clubs were created for students, attached to the chair of languages, and in 2017 – the Persian club. However, the participation in these trainings was not active. In particular, it was stated during the meetings that teachers could not participate mainly because of heavy workload, and the students had a lack of motivation. As a consequence, the current foreign language level in the Educational Complex is rather low among the staff and students, which is identified by the TLI as one of the biggest obstacles in the internationalization processes. There are no clear procedures developed to enhance the foreign language skills of the internal stakeholders, although the TLI has revealed this issue. There was no examination of the effectiveness of the organized courses in terms of improving the language knowledge level, too.

**Considerations:** Although the Educational Complex plans to extend its external relations and develop internationalization processes as stated in its strategic documents, the current procedures were not brought into line with the activities and timelines established in the action plan-timetable. Consequently, the relation between the actual situation and the strategy was disrupted. The discrepancy between the activities carried out and the plan for creating an environment that in fact contributes to internationalization endangers the implementation of the strategic policy.

The expert panel evaluates positively the existence of a separate department responsible for the internationalization processes, but some important functions set by the regulation that should have contribute to creation of an environment for internationalization have not been realized yet. As a result, the influence of international cooperation on the APs and other processes of the Educational Complex is almost absent. The business trips, of course, promote the staff development, but since they do not impact the improvement of the APs, do not facilitate the creation of joint educational or research programs, increase in the number of publications in international journals, they become inefficient in sense of purposefulness.

Weak collaboration with local and international universities and scientific-educational centers leads to an isolated development of the Educational Complex and lack of the exchange of experience with the leading educational and scientific institutions.

The contracts of international cooperation contribute make the Educational Complex more well-known in the international arena. However, if the contracts operated fully, it would be possible to ensure the TLI's development and realization of its strategic goals on the international level. The expert panel finds that the Educational complex does not properly use the established external relations in order to enhance the efficiency of its academic process and develop educational and research programs. The international ambitions set in the SP are not implemented in a coordinated manner. In general, the memoranda and contracts signed are not fully realized.

The courses organized by the Educational Complex to improve the foreign language (English) skills of the staff and students did not have considerable influence on solving the problem. The indexes of foreign language knowledge are still low and remain one of the biggest obstacles to internationalization. On the other hand, the Educational Complex does not implement a targeted policy to solve this issue. The absence of information regarding international programs and cooperation on the web page in addition to unavailability of information in Russian and English hinder internationalization and recognition of the Educational Complex on the international police academic platform.

**Summary:** Taking into account that the internationalization processes in the Educational Complex do not ensure the implementation of the strategy developed for the field, there is a lack of educational and research exchange programs as well as the students' and TS mobility, lack of influence of international cooperation directly on the learning process, no coordinated actions are taken in the direction of realizing the international ambitions set in the SP, and the knowledge of English is a serious issue in sense of the development of internationalization processes, it can be concluded that the external relations do not yet sufficiently contribute to the exchange of experience and development as well as the TLI's internationalization.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 9 is **unsatisfactory**.

## X. INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE

**CRITERION: The TLI has an internal quality assurance system for promoting establishment of a quality culture and continuous improvement of all the processes of TLI.**

### **Findings**

#### **10.1 The TLI has quality assurance policies and procedures.**

In 2017, “The policy of internal quality assurance of the Educational Complex” and “The concept of quality assurance of professional education of the Educational Complex” were approved. The QA policy of the Educational Complex is aimed at determining the principles, approaches and directions of educational quality assurance. However, the QA directions are separated in the part of the quality assurance processes of the concept that includes: realization of the quality assurance policy and procedures, approval of the academic programs and qualifications awarded, monitoring and regular review of the academic programs, assessment of students, the TS quality assurance, introduction of informational systems, and public awareness assurance.

In 2018, the manual of education quality assurance of the Educational Complex was developed, which includes the policy and concept formulated the same way. The regulations and strategic plans established in the Educational complex, as well as the polling questionnaires of students and alumni were added to it. The priorities of the quality assurance policy and the planned steps are not clarified. There are no approved procedures based on the policy, except for the 2018 procedure for conducting surveys. However, the mechanism of surveys is also newly introduced and is not implemented systematically, in accordance with the regulation requirement. There are no qualitative and comparative analyses of the survey outcomes. The effectiveness of the mechanism is not evaluated.

#### **10.2 The TLI allocates sufficient time, material, human and financial resources to manage internal quality assurance processes.**

From 2017, the management of the quality assurance processes in the Educational Complex is carried out by the Education Quality Assurance Department (EQAD), which has a head and three staff members. Two of them are part-time workers. Before that, in 2016, a quality assurance group was formed. The functions of the department are regulated. The EQAD is an

autonomous body that is accountable to the Head of the Educational Complex. The department provides reports also during the sessions of the Scientific Council.

At the initiative of the EQAD, the Committee of strategic planning and quality assurance was formed, which discussed the legal and normative documentation prepared in the Educational Complex. With the aim of sufficient realization of the QA processes, the People permanently responsible for the QA of the faculties and chairs were established in the Educational Complex in 2017. Their participation in the QA processes is still weak. The QA system is just being introduced. The expert observations showed that for the coordinated and targeted implementation of the QA processes the EQAD staff and persons responsible for QA strongly need re-trainings.

The department has two rooms with the necessary material-technical resources and equipment. Due to the TLI's legal organization type and specificity of financial management, no budget funds is allocated for the education quality assurance processes, and material resources are provided on the basis of internal memoranda.

### **10.3 The internal and external stakeholders are involved in quality assurance processes.**

The Educational Complex considers involvement as one of its QA policy principles, according to which it emphasizes the involvement of stakeholders, including the representatives of the SC, in the QA processes, quality assurance committees and process monitoring. In 2017, the regulation of the SC quality assurance committee was approved but such committee has not been created yet.

The direct involvement of internal stakeholders is limited by their participation in surveys and discussions of documents. Surveys were conducted with the full-time students and teachers. There are no evidences of the external stakeholders' involvement in the QA processes. In 2017-2018, a survey was conducted only with the alumni. As the Educational Complex states in the SE, there is a lack of mechanisms of involving external stakeholders in the quality assurance processes. Moreover, the Educational Complex mentions that external stakeholders have uneven understanding of quality assurance processes and lack of motivation to take part in them. Nevertheless, the EQAD has not taken any clear steps aimed at resolving these issues yet.

A survey is considered to be the main mechanism of examining the needs of internal and external stakeholders, for which the procedure for conducting was established in 2018. There are no content analyses of the outcomes, and just a few cases of improvement based on the revealed issues. No targeted examinations and activities for revealing and resolving big issues.

### **10.4 The internal quality assurance system is periodically reviewed.**

In the EQAD regulation, one of the objectives determined is to develop and regularly review the QA policy and strategy of the Educational Complex. The formation of the QA system in the Educational Complex began in 2017; the main documental grounds were approved in recent years. According to the presented evidence, the QA processes are just entering the implementation stage. The Educational Complex has not evaluated the performance of the QA system. No assessment and review mechanisms are created for that. Thus, review has neither been done.

The benchmarking of the policy and procedures of QA processes has not been conducted. No exchange of experience and joint studies of the QA policy were implemented with the local universities. The Educational Complex made an agreement with the RF MIA Krasnodar university for mutual examination of the quality assurance system and implementation of benchmarking. On the 13-18th of May, 2019, the representatives of the Educational Complex visited the university. However, the benchmarking has not been conducted yet.

#### **10.5 The internal quality assurance system provides valid and sufficient background for the success of the external quality assurance processes.**

The QA policy of the Educational Complex has determined the principle of providing factual evidence for processes, according to which, the realization and improvement of the QA processes must be based on the real facts provided by data collection and analyses.

The Educational Complex views the SE and attached documents as a ground for the QA external assessment. Certain data tables presented in the SE contain approximate numbers that are not based on reliable analyses, and some of the tables are simply unfilled. The analytical component is weak in the SE, lack of the self-evaluation experience is noticed. Document observation and statements made during the visit proved that the documentation of certain QA processes is not based on the actual data. For example, the Educational Complex notes that it conducted a survey among employers, but the visit revealed that there is no evidence of that. The students' participation in surveys was not properly secured as well. Very few of the students participating in the meeting were aware of them. No surveys were conducted with the part-time students. The alumni that participated in the meeting also never took part in a survey, although the Educational Complex provided an analysis of the survey with the alumni. There are no qualitative, content analyses based on the surveys. The outcomes are not logically founded.

The EQAD conducted a focus group discussion on the theme "Improvement of a teacher's work". Talks were organized with the chairs regarding the teachers' needs. The revealed issues were not generalized and related to the survey outcomes. The presented analysis was not signed, and it was not clear to whom it had been reported.

There is no information in foreign languages on the web page, although there is an opportunity for that. The provided grounds are insufficient for international expert assessment.

#### **10.6 The internal quality assurance system ensures the transparency of the processes unfolding in the TLI through providing information on the quality of the processes to the internal and external stakeholders.**

According to the QA conceptual principle, the Educational Complex, within its capacities, will ensure the availability, accuracy and importance of the information provided to stakeholders.

The Educational Complex considers its web page as the main mechanism for making the information about the quality of its processes available for internal and external stakeholders. The information on the web page started to be systematically updated and enriched only shortly before the accreditation, by the order of the Head. Analyses by the EQAD have not been published yet.

Not long before the 2019 accreditation, the timetable of meetings with the TLI staff on the topic of “The importance of the TLI’s accreditation, the process and criteria” was prepared as well, in accordance with which meetings and discussions were carried out. The staff learned about the outcomes of the QA processes during such meetings and the sessions of the Scientific Council.

It is worth mentioning that the Educational Complex printed its self-evaluation report for its stakeholders.

**Considerations:** The system of the internal quality assurance of the Educational Complex is just being introduced, it is not sufficiently integrated in the processes and does not operate systematically. In spite of the established policy and concept, and then the Quality assurance manual, an effective system of QA is not formed yet. The absence of clearly identified QA guidelines, fields and general tactics in the QA policy and concept was the reason why the EQAD did not carry out systematic, logically related actions. They were declaratory formulations rather than guidance documents. There are no clarified mechanisms that would allow to assess the continuous improvement of the processes of the Educational Complex, and introduction of the quality culture. The implementation of separate events of the EQAD is not coordinated, it does not enhance the efficiency of the unit activity, the results do not have a targeted impact on the processes. Collaboration and communication between the EQAD and other units is weak, which hinders the revelation and spread of the best practices. The absence of the mechanisms of performance assessment for the QA processes, as well as the absence of content analyses do not allow to evaluate the influence of the QA processes on the improvement of the APs and the activity of the Educational Complex. Lack of the targeted fields and the mechanisms of clarified data

collection in those fields prevents from implementing a grounded evaluation of performance and having a common system of internal quality assurance.

Taking into account the structure of the Educational Complex and the number of students, the current EQAD with its 4 employees can secure the management of the IQA processes. However, the expert panel sees a strong need for the further professional trainings of the EQAD staff and persons responsible for QA in order to form a capable team. The material and financial resources allocated for the department are enough to realize the required activity.

The involvement of internal stakeholders in the QA processes of the Educational Complex is still weak, and external stakeholders are not involved at all. The Educational Complex has just begun to take steps in this direction. The involvement of individual representatives of internal stakeholders in the committees of strategic planning and quality assurance does not ensure the engagement of the whole staff. We should also take into account that the committee has been formed quite recently and its activity does not cover the goals and objectives set in the regulation yet. All this negatively effects the formation of the stakeholders' trust towards the quality assurance processes.

The absence of benchmarking of the policy and procedures of the quality assurance processes did not allow the Educational Complex to carry out a comparative assessment of their effectiveness and determine the necessary directions of revision of the QA system.

The current mechanisms of the QA system do not provide enough grounds for external assessment yet, which is the result of the reliable mechanisms of QA data collection and the absence of the analytical tactics.

The expert panel evaluates positively the steps of the EQAD aimed at discussing the QA issues with internal stakeholders. However, the information about the quality of the processes in the Educational Complex is not available for external stakeholders, which leads to the isolation of the EQAD activity.

**Summary:** Taking into account that the system of internal quality assurance of the Educational Complex is not integrated enough in the AP and other processes, it has little influence on the processes, the QA activities are not carried out in a systematic way, there are only a few cases of qualitative analyses and improvement steps based on them, as well as the strong need for the complete data collection and publication of the qualitative outcomes of the activity, it can be stated that the quality assurance system does not sufficiently contribute to the continuous improvement of the processes and the formation of the quality culture yet.

**Conclusion:** The correspondence of the institutional capacities of the Police Educational Complex of RA to the requirements of criterion 10 is **unsatisfactory**.

## EVALUATION ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

<b>CRITERION</b>	<b>CONCLUSION</b>
I. Mission and purposes	<b>satisfactory</b>
II. Governance and Administration	<b>satisfactory</b>
III. Academic Programmes	<b>satisfactory</b>
IV. Students	<b>satisfactory</b>
V. Faculty and staff	<b>satisfactory</b>
VI. Research and development	<b>unsatisfactory</b>
VII. Infrastructure and Resources	<b>satisfactory</b>
VIII. Societal responsibility	<b>satisfactory</b>
IX. External Relations and Internationalization	<b>unsatisfactory</b>
X. Internal quality assurance	<b>unsatisfactory</b>

---

**Gagik Qtryan**  
Head of the Expert Panel

**July 26, 2019**

## APPENDICES

### APPENDIX 1. CVs OF EXPERT PANEL MEMBERS

**Gagik Qtryan** – In 2005, Gagik graduated from Yerevan State University, faculty of Informatics and Applied Mathematics, specializing in “Mathematics”. In 2007, he did a Master’s in the same faculty, specializing in “Informatics and Applied Mathematics”. In 2010, he received a PhD degree in “Computational Mathematics”, defending in the topic of “Multivariate Polynomial interpolation and the Gasca-Maestu conjecture”. The area of his research includes the multivariate polynomial interpolation, ordinary and partial differential equations, etc. From 2008, he teaches in the system of higher education. In 2012-2015, he was a Vice Rector in educational reforms and the head of the quality assurance center in the Movses Khorenatsi university, in 2015-2018 – the head of the quality assurance and analysis department (second class adviser) in the RA MoD Military Aviation University after Marshal A. Khanperiyants. From 2018 up to now he has been working in the RA MoD Information and Public Affairs Department as the head- deputy head of the Public Affairs Division (first class adviser). He participated in numerous conferences devoted to revealing issues connected to the quality improvement of higher education. In 2012, he participated in the training in the topic of “Internal quality assurance in the tertiary level education of RA”. From 2015, he has been an expert in the accreditation processes of RA universities.

**Jerzy Kosiński** – In 1987, he graduated from the Slovak University of Technology, faculty of Automated Management Systems, and got Master’s degree in Electronics and Computer Sciences. In 1993, he entered the Szczytno Police Higher School for senior officers. In 2003, he entered postgraduate course in Warsaw National Defense Academy and defended PhD in the sphere of military sciences, and in 2015 he got a doctor’s degree in social sciences in Gdynia Naval Academy.

From 1993 to 2018, he worked in the Szczytno Police Higher School, starting with the position of the IT expert in the Department of Communication and Informational Services, and becoming the Vice Rector in Scientific Activity by the end of his career.

From May 2018, he is a professor in the faculty of the commander and naval operations of the Polish Naval Academy in Gdynia.

**Hakob Hovhannisyan** – In 2009, Hakob graduated from National Polytechnic University of Armenia, the faculty of “Informatics and Computer Technology”, specializing as an “electronic computer technology constructor”. In 2011, he did Master’s in “Informatics and Computer Technology” in the same faculty. From 2009, he has been teaching in “Artashat Regional State College” SNCO as a teacher of programming. From 2015 to 2019, he coordinated the Quality

Assurance Center within the same institution. In 2014-2018, NCVETD recommended him as a trainer for the teachers of educational institutions that implement modular education. From 2019, he has a part-time job in “Yerevan Informatics College” SNCO as a teacher. He participated in a number of conferences devoted to the quality improvement of secondary vocational education. In 2017-2018, he participated in “Internal quality assurance in the tertiary level education of RA” Forum. From 2018, he has been an expert in accreditation processes of secondary vocational education institutions of RA.

**Tigran Khachikyan** – In 2008-2012, Tigran studied at Yerevan State University, the faculty of Law, and graduated with honors. In 2014, he finished MBA in the same faculty. In 2014-2017, he had post-graduate studies in the faculty of Law of YSU, PhD in Law. In 2013-2015, he was a chief specialist of the Legal Provision Department in the Special Investigation Service of RA, in 2015-2016 – the deputy head of the Legal Provision Department, and in 2016 – the head. In April-July 2019, he worked as a deputy minister of RA Ministry of Justice. From 2015, he has been a lecturer in the RA Justice academy. From 2016, he has been a teacher in the Chair of Civil Procedure of YSU, from 2018 – a teacher in Public Administration Academy of RA. From 2017, he has been the director of the Law Clinic of Yerevan State Medical University after M. Heratsi, from September 2019, a teacher in the Higher School of Arbitrators. From 2016, he has been a member of the committee for appealing the results of the written qualification examination of the RA judge candidates’, from 2016, an expert in public law in the RA MoJ “Centre for Legislation Development and Legal Research” foundation. He was awarded with the certificates of appreciation of the Chairman of the RA National Assembly and the Head of the Special Investigation Service of RA.

**Yelena Harutyunyan** – In 2016, Yelena entered YSU, the faculty of International Relations, the department of Political science. In 2017-2018, within the framework of “Independent observer” organization, she carried out an observer mission. From 2018, she has been working in the “MITK” Youth-Educational Initiative NGO.

## APPENDIX 2. SCHEDULE OF THE SITE VISIT

16.09.2019 – 20.09.2019

	<b>16.09.2019</b>	<i>Start</i>	<i>Finish</i>	<i>Duration</i>
1.	Meeting with the Head of the Educational Complex	09:30	10:20	50 min
2.	Meeting with the Deputy Heads and the Head of the Academy	10:30	11:20	50 min
3.	Meeting with the representatives of the self-evaluation working group (10-12 participants)	11:30	12:20	50 min
4.	Break, expert panel discussions	12:30	13:30	60 min
5.	Meeting with the representatives of the RA Police who coordinate the activity of the Educational Complex	13:45	14:45	60 min
6.	Meeting with the representatives of the Educational Complex Board	15:00	15:45	45 min
7.	Meeting with the representatives of the Academia alumni (10-12 graduates)	16:00	16:50	50 min
8.	Review of documents and closed-door meeting of the expert panel	17:00	18:00	60 min

	<b>17.09.2019</b>	<i>Start</i>	<i>Finish</i>	<i>Duration</i>
1.	Meeting with the Faculty Heads	09:30	10:30	45 min
2.	Meeting with the Heads of Departments	10:40	11:25	45 min
	Meeting with the representatives of the teaching staff (10-12 lecturers)	11:35	12:20	45 min
3.	Visits to the Faculties and review of documents	12:30	13:30	60 min
4.	Break, expert panel discussions	13:40	14:30	60 min
5.	Visits to the Departments and review of documents	14:40	15:40	60 min
6.	Meeting with the Heads of Administrations, Departments and Divisions	15:50	16:35	45 min
7.	Review of documents and closed-door meeting of the expert panel	16:30	18:00	90 min

	<b>18.09.2019</b>	<i>Start</i>	<i>Finish</i>	<i>Duration</i>
1.	Meeting with the representatives of the Bachelor's degree program students (10-12 representatives, paid, free)	09:30	10:30	60 min
2.	Meeting with the representatives of the Master's degree program students (10-12 representatives, paid, free )	10:40	11:40	60 min
3.	Meeting with the representatives of the Students' council (10-12 representatives)	11:50	12:50	45 min
4.	Break, expert panel discussions	13:00	13:50	50 min
5.	Meeting with the representatives of scientific clubs (10-12 representatives)	14:00	14:45	45 min
6.	Meeting with the Heads of scientific clubs	14:55	15:35	45 min
7.	Resource observation	16:45	17:00	45 min
8.	Review of documents and closed-door meeting of the expert panel	17:00	18:00	60 min

	<b>19.09.2019</b>	<i>Start</i>	<i>Finish</i>	<i>Duration</i>
1.	Meeting with the Committee of Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance	09:30	10:30	60 min
2.	Meeting with the DEQA staff and the Chair responsables for quality	10:40	11:40	60 min
3.	Meeting with the College management	11:45	12:45	60 min
4.	Open meeting with the expert panel	12:45	13:15	30 min
5.	Break, expert panel discussions	13:15	14:15	60 min
6.	Meeting with the representatives of the College teaching staff (10-12 lecturers)	14:30	15:20	50 min
7.	Meeting with the representatives of the College alumni (10-12 graduates)	15:30	16:20	50 min
8.	Review of documents and closed-door meeting of the expert panel	16:30	18:00	90 min

	<b>20.09.2019</b>	<i>Start</i>	<i>Finish</i>	<i>Duration</i>
1.	Meeting with the members selected by the expert panel	09:30	10:30	60 min
2.	Resource observation	10:40	11:50	70 min
3.	Meeting with the representatives of the College studnets (10-12 representatives)	12:00	12:50	50 min
4.	Break, expert panel discussions	13:00	14:00	60 min
5.	Review of documents and closed-door meeting of the expert panel	14:10	16:50	160 min
6.	Wrap-up meeting with the management of Educational Complex	17:00	17:30	30 min

### APPENDIX 3. LIST OF THE DOCUMENTS OBSERVED

N	Name of the document	Criterion
1.	The list of the group for the Strategic plan development approved by the Head's order	1.1
2.	Procedures of the Strategic plan development	1.1
3.	Minutes of the Board and Scientific Council sessions /with the list of the members/	1.2
4.	Reports of the Educational Complex units /2016/	1.2
5.	Established norms of ethics	2.1
6.	Common regulation on the accountability of the structural units	2.2
7.	Orders, reports on formation of the AP development working groups	3.1
8.	Analysis of the labor market requirements for alignment of the AP outcomes	3.1
9.	Minutes or reports of the expert committees of the academic programs	3.1
10.	Methodology for credit allocation, manual	3.1
11.	27.12.2017 № 588-У and 25.05.2018 № 240-У orders of the Head of the RA Police Educational Complex	3.1
12.	The list of participants in foreign methodological trainings	3.2
13.	Regulations on preparing and defending term papers, and selecting, preparing and defending diploma works and Master's theses	3.3
14.	Final works, Master's theses	3.3
15.	Minutes, analyses of the assistants	3.3
16.	Evidence, reports of the analyses of the academic programs of Omsk Academy	3.4
17.	Operating agreements ensuring exchange and mobility of students and teachers	3.4
18.	Evidence of AP monitoring, improvements, expert opinions	3.5
19.	Minutes and reports of round-table discussions of employers, alumni and teachers	3.5
20.	The academic program of the police secondary vocational education	3.5
21.	Reports on the school visits	4.1
22.	Report of the admission committee and the DEQA analyses regarding the admission reports /for the last five years/	4.1
23.	Minutes of the meetings with students set on the schedule, mechanisms for their resolution after the meetings	4.2
24.	Timetable of academic consultations and additional trainings	4.3
25.	Procedures of contacting the administrative staff by students	4.4
26.	List of the students that started service in the RA Police /from the part-time education/	4.4
27.	Journals of research practice	4.5
28.	Student's scientific reports, works, articles	4.5
29.	Student's manual	4.6
30.	Analyses of effectiveness of the policy and procedures of selecting the teaching and supporting staff	5.1

31.	Teachers' reports, assessment of the head of the department regarding the realization of the teachers' individual work plans	5.3
32.	Acts of control classroom observations of the Head of the Educational Complex, first deputy head, head of the methodology and development department, head of the Academy, deputy head, faculty head, Master's degree department head	5.3
33.	List of the awards of the teaching staff /for the last five years/	5.3
34.	List of the participants in the trainings for improving pedagogical skills, participation journals, analyses of the assessment results	5.4
35.	Evidence of professional trainings, list of the participants, agenda, presence sheet, topics	5.4
36.	List of the business trip participants, improvement steps after the visit	5.4
37.	Evidence of professional trainings of the teaching staff that conducts secondary vocational education, the list, topics	5.4
38.	List of the staff receiving allowance	5.5
39.	Policy and procedures of encouraging the beginning teachers and ensuring their professional growth	5.6
40.	Examples of scientific-methodological journal "Bulwark of Law"	5.6
41.	List of the promoted teaching, administrative and supporting staff /for the last five years/	5.6
42.	Job descriptions of administrative staff	5.7
43.	Job descriptions of supporting staff	5.7
44.	Analyses of getting the intermediate outcomes of the SP	6.1
45.	Approved composition of the SP development group of external relation improvement and internationalization	6.1
46.	Reports of the scientific department /2017-2019/	6.1
47.	List of the scientific publications in the fields established as priority	6.1
48.	Annual plans, reports of chairs and departments	6.2
49.	Minutes, reports of the methodological council	6.3
50.	Minutes of the chair sessions, recommendations of the scientific department	6.3
51.	Collections of the congress reports	6.3
52.	Work plans, biannual and annual reports, activity evidence and performance analysis of scientific clubs	6.3
53.	List of publications of teaching staff in prestigious journals /for the last three years/	6.4
54.	Regulation of defining the annual "research" rating of the Educational Complex	6.4
55.	Contracts and memorandums of international cooperation, evidence of joint scientific-research activity	6.4
56.	Evidence of joint research of teaching staff within associations	6.4
57.	Evidence and analyses expressing effectiveness of interconnectedness of research activity and learning process	6.5
58.	Analyses on budget allocations aimed at improving the learning environment	7.2
59.	Regulation of granting scholarships	7.3
60.	Established regulation of paperwork	7.5
61.	Link of the students with special needs in the Educational Complex	7.6

62.	Composition of the faculty council, minutes of the faculty councils' sessions	7.7
63.	Annual reports presented to the deputy head of the Police or the Police headquarter on behalf of the head	8.1
64.	SP reports on the format established by order	8.1
65.	Reports on the study of public opinion	8.2
66.	Established composition of the work group implementing activity that ensures increasing of the rating of the Educational complex /according to the SP timetable, in February 2019/	8.3
67.	Outcomes of the Law Clinic, reports	8.4
68.	Annual reports on internationalization made in accordance with the plan-timetable	9.1
69.	Group developing the internationalization SP, formed by the order of the Head	9.1
70.	Regulating procedure of mobility process among teachers and students	9.1
71.	Documented evidence on studies and benchmarking in the International department. Presented proposals on new educational models	9.2
72.	Certificates of retraining of the International department staff	9.2
73.	Reports on business trips. Evidence of benchmarking	9.3
74.	Evidence of the additional foreign language lessons, lists, registers, tickets, etc.	9.4
75.	Composition of the working group that prepared the quality assurance manual	10.1
76.	Job descriptions of the DEQA staff	10.2
77.	Established composition of the SP and quality assurance committee, minutes of the sessions	10.2
78.	Minutes of the sessions of the SC quality assurance committee	10.3
79.	Outcomes of the meeting of the educational quality assurance specialists with the RF MOI Krasnodar university in February 13-18 2019	10.3
80.	DEQA analyses of the efficiency of the focus groups, surveys, different activities	10

#### APPENDIX 4. LIST OF THE RESOURCES OBSERVED

1. History Museum of the RA Police
2. Specialized auditorium of the mine clearance training
3. Auditorium of criminalistics
4. Laboratory of criminalistics
5. Laser shooting range
6. Library
7. Computer auditoriums
8. Chairs /Law, Civil Administration and Public Policy, Management/
9. Health center
10. Halls
11. Law clinics
12. Faculties

## APPENDIX 5. LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

1. HQC – Higher Qualification Committee
2. SR – scientific research
3. EHEA – European Higher Education Area
4. ECTAS – European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
5. EQAD – Education Quality Assurance Department
6. NGO – non-governmental organization
7. AP – academic program
8. TLI – tertiary level institution
9. MOI – Ministry of Internal Affairs
10. QA – quality assurance
11. ANQA – “National Center for Professional Education Quality Assurance” Foundation
12. ESGQA – European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance
13. NQF – National Qualifications Framework
14. QMS – Quality Management System
15. TS – teaching staff
16. PDCA – plan-do-check-act
17. RF – Russian Federation
18. SP –strategic plan
19. IT – Information Technology
20. SC – Students’ Council
21. SS – supporting staff
22. ScC – scientific club
23. ME – management element

