

Report on the outcome

of the accreditation procedure for:

- PhD in Political Science
- MA in Political Science (two-year)
- MA in Political Science (one-year)
- MA in International Relations (two-year)
- MA in International Relations (one-year)
- MA in Public Policy (one-year)
- MA in Public Administration (two-year)

to be offered in Vienna by the Central European University
Private University

1 Subject of the application

The Agency for Quality Assurance and Accreditation Austria (AQ Austria) conducted an accreditation procedure for the accreditation of PhD in Political Science, MA in Political Science (two-year), MA in Political Science (one-year), MA in International Relations (two-year), MA in International Relations (one-year), MA in Public Policy (one-year), MA in Public Administration (two-year) to be offered in Vienna by the Central European University Private University (CEU PU) in accordance with § 24 Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG) BGBl. I Nr. 74/2011 as amended in conjunction with § 2 Private Universities Act (PUG) BGBl. I Nr. 74/2011 as amended and § 17 and § 18 Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities 2019 (PU-AkkVO) as amended. In accordance with § 21 HS-QSG, AQ Austria publishes the following report on the outcome of the accreditation procedure:

2 Procedural steps

The accreditation procedure comprised the following procedural steps:

Procedural step	date
Accreditation application of the programmes received	31/10/2019
Request for modification of the application materials	14/02/2020
Decision on the expert panel taken by the Board of AQ Austria	20/02/2020
Information on expert panel submitted to CEU PU	20/02/2020
Amended application for the programmes received	20/02/2020
Complete and formally correct applications confirmed	21/02/2020
1 st preparatory virtual conference with expert panel	16/03/2020
Video material of the applicant institution received before site visit	26/03/2020
Additional application materials received before site visit	31/03/2020
2 nd preparatory virtual conference with expert panel	01/04/2020
Virtual site visit	01/04/2020 – 02/04/2020
Additional application materials received after site visit	05/05/2020
Expert panel's report finalised	26/05/2020
Expert report submitted to CEU PU for comment	27/05/2020
CEU PU's comment on the expert report received	12/06/2020
Statement of costs submitted to CEU PU	16/06/2020
Expert panel's response to the CEU PU's comment and modified/final expert report received	18/06/2020
Modified/final expert report submitted to applicant institution	18/06/2020
CEU PU's statement on the statement of costs received	18/06/2020

3 Accreditation decision

On July 1st 2020 the Board of AQ Austria decided to grant accreditation to the above mentioned degree programmes to be offered in Vienna by Central European University Private University, according to § 24 section 4 Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG) in conjunction with § 2 Private Universities Act (PUG) in conjunction with § 9 section 1 Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities 2019 (PU-AkkVO), due to fulfilment of the criteria according to § 17 and § 18 PU-AkkVO.

The Federal Minister of Education, Science and Research approved the decision on July 14th 2020.

4 Annexes

- Comment on the expert report by Central European University Private University from 12/06/2020
- Modified/final expert report from 18/06/2020= expert report from 26/05/2020s

June 12, 2020

The Board of AQ Austria
AQ Austria
Franz-Klein-Gasse 5
1190 Vienna

Dear Madam President, dear Members of the Board,

I hereby confirm that we have received and fully accept the Expert Panel Review Report regarding the following programs: MA in Public Policy (One-Year), Master of Public Administration, MA in Political Science (One-Year), MA in Political Science (Two-Year), MA in International Relations (One-Year), MA in International Relations (Two-Year), PhD in Political Science. We are pleased to learn that the Report confirms the academic excellence of the programs and that they fulfill all the criteria for accreditation.

We fully accept all the recommendations made in the Report. The administration of CEU PU will work closely with the Departments to address every recommendation made in the Report. For specific responses to the recommendations of the AQ Austria Expert Panel, please refer to the Departments' detailed reply in the Annex of this letter.

We would like to thank the Expert Panel members for their expertise and insights, as well as for the productive and collegial discussions during the site visit. We are grateful to the Expert Panel members for their hard work, dedication, and enthusiasm with which they approached the task.

We await the decision of the Board with anticipation and looking forward to the opportunity of starting our programs in Vienna in the coming academic year.

Sincerely,



President and Rector
Central European University Private University

CEU PU Departmental Responses to AQ Austria Expert Panel Report

Cluster 3

Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy and International Relations

We are grateful to the expert panel for the time and effort to evaluate the PhD program in Political Science of CEU PU, and find the report to be thorough, comprehensive and accurate. We would also like to thank the expert panel for the positive evaluation of our program. Our response addresses two issues: one factual clarification (page 8) and the main recommendation of the expert panel (section 3.1.2, page 9, and a final recommendation on page 20). We address each in turn.

1. Factual clarification

Page 8: Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree program includes a line stating that maximum enrollment in the PhD program is 15 students per year. We would like to suggest a correction (15-20 instead of 15) to account for year-specific variations in the size of our incoming cohort. The Doctoral School funds 15 doctoral positions from a general pool. Additionally, 2 earmarked fellowships are allocated to incoming students with certain research profiles (one in higher education, and one in nationalism studies, respectively). The maximum enrollment also includes occasional deferrals of admission from previous years. During the next academic year (2020-21), for instance, our incoming class has 20 PhD students.

2. Response to the main expert recommendation (section 3.1.2, page 9; and final recommendation on page 20)

The main recommendation offered by the expert panel on page 20 states: *“The expert panel members have the following recommendation to CEU PU. On the basis of their findings and especially on the basis of the interviews conducted, the experts recommend that doctoral students' community should be better represented at the university level as the current channels of representation seem highly informal and hardly institutionalized. This recommendation does not conflict with the overall positive evaluation of the development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme.”*

We thank the expert panel for this useful recommendation. As the report already states, PhD students are currently represented in decision-making processes at two levels – the Doctoral School and the university - as follows:

2.1. Doctoral School representation: The Doctoral Program Committee of the Doctoral School in Political Science is composed of the School Director, representatives of the five tracks within the School, and a student representative. The Committee aims at decision-making by consensus. If a consensual decision cannot be reached, the Doctoral Program Committee will take decisions with a simple majority vote. The participation of the student representative in the vote depends on the issue at stake as regulated by par. 1.8. (Section 1.5 of Doctoral School Regulations). A broader decision-making body, the Doctoral School Council, constituted by the Heads of the Department of Political Science, Department of International Relations, the School of Public Policy, the

Doctoral School Director, also includes a student representative (Section 1.6). The Student Representative, as well as one deputy, are elected annually by the Doctoral School's PhD student body and participates in all the activities and meetings of the Doctoral Committee, but cannot take part in decisions that concern specific individual students and applicants, appeals, complaints, admission, termination of probationary or candidate status, or disciplinary matters. If a student is presenting his or her case before the Committee, he/she can ask to have the student representative present during the relevant part of the meeting (Section 1.8).

In addition, the Doctoral School routinely conducts surveys of doctoral students on many specific issues, and organizes two town halls each year where all students are invited to participate and ask questions, express concerns, formulate claims, or make suggestions.

2.2. University-level representation of PhD students

Student Union representation

Every year the student body elects the Student Union Assembly to ensure adequate student representation and participation of students in university governance (as per article VIII of the CEU Student Union Constitution). The Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy, and International Relations selects two student representatives for each track. Indeed, as the expert report duly notes, despite *de jure* representation, there is a widespread sense among doctoral students that *de facto*, PhD representation is less effective in the Student Union as the vast majority of members primarily represent the interests of MA programs.

The student-initiated PhD Working Group

As a practical way to address the structural disadvantages of Student Union representation mentioned above, CEU PhD students (including a core group of Doctoral School students) founded an informal working group on PhD specific problems that interacts routinely with the administration. In general, based on the feedback, students find its activities to be useful, flexible and practical. Its flexibility has been essential during the Covid-19 pandemic when the PhD working group was able act quickly to collect data and prepare policy briefs for the administration. However, despite its flexibility and ad-hoc approach to solving practical problems, many students would like a higher level of *de jure* institutionalization of the working group in order to ensure policy continuity across mandates.

These discussions are ongoing and are not specific to the Doctoral School of Political Science, but rather to CEU PhD student representation, in general. We will give proper consideration to the expert panel's recommendation regarding better channels for PhD student interests and the potential *de jure* institutionalization of their activities and mandate.

Department of International Relations

We are grateful to the expert panel for the time and effort to evaluate the MA programs in International Relations of CEU PU, and find the report to be thorough, comprehensive and accurate. We would also like to thank the expert panel for the positive evaluation of our programs. Our response addresses the recommendations of the expert panel.

- 1. The experts recommend that the University considers introducing certain innovations in teaching methods to include such methods as problem solving, student portfolio, peer assessment, study visits, etc. as well as the use of educational technologies. (p. 53 and p. 69)**

This particular recommendation results from the inadequacy in the presentation of the programs and the timing of that presentation. In reality, by the time the panel submitted its report, various innovations in teaching methods have already been in place within the programs, and further innovations are in the works for the upcoming Academic Year. Thus, some of the newly developed courses already included study visits (OSCE, Chancellery in Vienna in relation to the Congress of Vienna, etc.) In other courses (Foreign Policy Analysis, International Interventions) students were participating in simulations and were tasks with preparing policy-briefs.

For the next Academic Year, four courses would be redesigned to include extensive use of new educational technologies, including various modes of online learning.

- 2. The experts recommend that the University considers a revision of the programme intended learning outcomes provided in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills and competences as well as according to the newest standards in learning outcomes design (e.g. using active verbs, and the Bloom's taxonomy).**

The experts recommend that a more specific description could be provided in the course syllabi indicating which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods. (p. 63 and p. 79)

This work is also underway. Revisions of the learning outcomes would be included in all syllabi already for the next Academic Year's Student Handbooks for both programs.

School of Public Policy

For both the Master of Public Administration and MA in Public Policy, as well as the other two degree programs of the School of Public Policy (SPP), a Curriculum Committee will be established before the beginning of the next academic year (AY). With the move of some courses to be delivered on-line for students who will not be able to make the journey to Vienna in time for Fall term 2020 due to corona virus restrictions, guidelines are already being established for online teaching delivery. A Curriculum Committee will help to systematize procedures but this Committee can also take on some additional issues such as those suggested below from the AQ Austria Expert Panel.

The Curriculum Committee will be an important venue to screen all new course syllabi and - from time to time - assesses syllabi of core courses for consistency (learning outcomes/evaluation) and topical overlap. This Committee will also contribute to the SPP five-year Strategic Review next academic year. This process culminates in an external review and assessment of SPP programs.

See below the responses to specific recommendations made by the Panel.

MA in Public Policy (One-Year)

- 1. External stake holders who would be interested in working with the students, such as think tanks, media outlets and NGOs, could be asked about their ideas and feedback on subjects to be studied in the degree programme. (p. 94)**

Once relocation has taken place, extensive interaction with government agencies and offices of international organizations will be sought. Similarly, faculty in the School will use their personal networks to approach non-governmental organizations and other civil society actors. Since the beginning, the School has benefited from a close relationship with the Open Society Foundations network and its partners.

Already commissioned for next AY is a course to be led by a former World Bank official (Andras Horvai) tentatively entitled “Getting Inside International Organization”. This type of course will give students direct access to the world of practitioners in Vienna. The School envisages additional courses of similar nature.

- 2. A mentoring programme of professionals around Public Policy could be a way to connect the students with ideas about their professional career. (p. 94)**

Mentoring of students in policy practice occurs in some measure through the Visiting Professors who deliver the ‘Skills for Impact’ courses as well as the George Soros ‘Practitioner’ Chair. However, the School recognizes that a more systematic approach could be developed.

In the past, SPP has organized ‘brown bag seminars’ where policy professionals were invited to talk about their career paths and answer questions related to career opportunities and strategies. This ‘seminar’ series can be revived in Vienna. Additionally, the School can look to ways to

better leverage alumni of the School and to draw them back into the orbit of SPP through a mentoring program.

A mentoring program is an excellent idea that can be incorporated and grown within SPP, particularly as SPP will have a new Director of 'Applied Learning' commencing in Vienna in September 2020.

- 3. The experts recommend to further improve the disciplinary foundation of the programme, by strengthening the foundational module with compulsory course components on law and governance. (p. 94)**

During academic year 2020/21 there will be significant refreshment and renewal of teaching resources. At the current academic year, four members of faculty will be leaving the School due to retirement and/or moving to a new university position. Their replacements will release resources and allow a refreshment of the School through appointment of new faculty members to develop compulsory courses on 'law and governance'.

- 4. The experts further recommend reviewing course syllabi as to the question which evaluation methods are best suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The use of evaluation rubrics could help in this regard. (p. 94)**

This is an important consideration that the School will take seriously. During AY2020/21, the School will undertake a joint strategic review with the Department of Political Science and Department of International Relations. Evaluation methods and rubrics will be at the core of this process.

Beyond the upcoming review process, the congruence between learning outcomes and evaluation methods will be regularly assessed by the Curriculum Committee that the School plans to establish.

Master of Public Administration

- 1. In the programme development more systematic attention could be given to the input of external stakeholders, such as employers of graduates: representatives from NGOs, international organisations, consultancies and public administrations. (p. 111)**

External stakeholders are important to the future career prospects of MPA graduates. Through two main mechanisms, students have regularized interaction with external stakeholders from government agencies, NGOS and international organizations through the Applied Policy Project and Applied Policy Lab on the one hand, and through the short intensive-mode Skills for Impact courses on the other. Each brings students into direct engagement with policy practitioners outside the School.

There are also more ad hoc arrangements such as the Visiting Speaker programs, as well individual Visiting Professors like the ‘practitioner’ George Soros Visiting Chair, the Holbrooke Fellow supported by the US State Department, etc. Nevertheless, relocation to Vienna offers a ‘golden opportunity’ to develop new contacts networks of stakeholders and individual members of faculty, and staff, relish the prospect of bringing these individuals and institutions closer to the School.

- 2. The Public Administration nature of the programme is implicit rather than explicit. The programme could do more to position its MPA in the disciplinary field, and clarify its disciplinary identity. This would also mark its difference with the Master in Public Policy. (p. 111)**

The School will take on board the recommendation to develop a required course in Public Administration for the MPA program. Given the 4 faculty departures this year, we envisage that the SPP will include the ability to teach such a course as a criterion for one of the replacement hire searches that will be conducted next academic year. Furthermore, it is envisaged that in order to distinguish the MPA from the MPP, greater capacity will be developed in quantitative methods, digital governance and management of big data.

- 3. The interdisciplinary treatment of substantive policies in the specialisation tracks merits a better framing from a public administration perspective. (p. 111)**

Especially for the core courses, SPP affirms this recommendation. As a first step, SPP faculty will be requested to review their syllabi and make sure that learning outcomes are distinguished along these three lines. As a second step, the creation of a “Curriculum Committee” for SPP will create a venue to systematically review the syllabi of all current SPP courses and vet the syllabi of future proposed courses.

Through the new appointments that the School will be making, we will strengthen the ‘public administration’ content. This will also involve terminating the ‘security specialization’ (due to faculty resignation) which will allow the School to further concentrate resources in public administration.

- 4. The experts also recommend to make the Public Management course compulsory. (p. 111)**

For AY 2020/21 it is not possible to make Public Management compulsory due to lack of teaching resources. However, with new positions to be advertised and appointed, it should be possible the following year. Currently, Public Management is a “mandatory elective”, where students have the option to choose between Public Management and Introduction to Global Governance and Public Policy but must take one of them. Subject to discussion in the Curriculum Committee it would be possible to make Public Management mandatory for the MPA as well as making the Global Governance course a cornerstone course for the MPP.

5. Revise intended learning outcomes in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills, and competences. (p. 111)

As the School is developing on-line variants of face-to-face courses, this represents a good opportunity to systematize intended learning outcomes from each course along the distinction between “knowledge, skills and competences”. The balance of each is likely to differ among courses. For instance, the SPP suite of ‘Skills for Impact’ courses (most of which are scheduled in Spring for students to take the knowledge they have learnt earlier and apply to real-world settings) are focused on ‘competences’. Again, this is a task for the Curriculum Committee to institutionalize in SPP practices and procedures

6. The experts recommend to describe explicitly in the syllabi which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods. (p. 111)

As outlined in the beginning of our response, the Curriculum Committee will help establish consistency across courses concerning learning outcomes.

7. Adapt the diploma supplement to make a clear distinction between the compulsory nature of the Applied Policy Project and the elective nature of the thesis. (p. 111)

SPP Response: The Program Director (faculty) and program coordinator (administrative staff) for the MPA will undertake measures to make the nature of the APP clearer for students. The primary mechanism will be the Student Handbook. In Zero Week, via a round of face-to-face and on-line sessions with in-coming students conducted by the Program Director, the distinction between the compulsory nature of the Applied Policy Project and the elective nature of the thesis will be explained.

The course convener of the Applied Policy Project – who is a newly appointed Director of Applied Learning in SPP – will also be able to provide regular feed-back on the requirements of students in the two different routes they can take through the degree. This would be through ad hoc student consultations, but also hard-wired into the course design and documentation.

8. The experts recommend to add the global cooperation partners on the website. (p. 111)

The School completely agrees. SPP will update the website over July-August and will verify the list of global cooperation partners that are specific to the MPA program.

Expert report on the accreditation procedure for the

PhD in Political Science
MA in Political Science (Two-Year)
MA in Political Science (One-Year)
MA in International Relations (Two-Year)
MA in International Relations (One-Year)
MA in Public Policy
Master in Public Administration

conducted in Vienna by the Central European University Private
University

pursuant to § 7 of the Accreditation Regulation for Private Universities 2019 (PU-AkkVO)

Vienna, 26/05/2020s

Table of contents

1 Basic principles for the procedure.....	5
2 Short information on the accreditation procedure.....	6
3 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – PhD in Political Science	8
3.1 Assessment criterion § 18 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme	8
3.2 Assessment criterion § 18 (2) 1 to 6: Research environment	9
3.3 Assessment criterion § 18 (3) 1 to 3: Supervision and counselling services	12
3.4 Assessment criterion § 18 (4) 1 to 8: Degree programme and degree programme management	14
3.5 Assessment criterion § 18 (5) 1 to 5: Staff	18
3.6 Assessment criterion § 18 (6): Funding	19
3.7 Summary and final evaluation -PhD Political Science	20
4 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in Political Science (Two-Year)	22
4.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	22
4.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	24
4.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	29
4.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	31
4.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	31
4.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development and/or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.....	32
4.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	33
4.8 Summary and final evaluation - MA Political Science (Two-Year)	33
5 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO - MA in Political Science (One-Year)	35
5.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	35
5.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	37
5.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	43

5.4	Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	45
5.5	Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	45
5.6	Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development and/or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.....	46
5.7	Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	46
5.8	Summary and final evaluation- MA Political Science (One-Year)	47
6	Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – Master in International Relations (Two-Year).....	49
6.1	Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	49
6.2	Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	50
6.3	Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	58
6.4	Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	60
6.5	Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	60
6.6	Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development	61
6.7	Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	62
6.8	Summary and final evaluation - MA International Relations (Two-Year).....	62
7	Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in International Relations (One-Year).....	65
7.1	Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	65
7.2	Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	67
7.3	Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	74
7.4	Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	76
7.5	Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	76
7.6	Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development	77
7.7	Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	78
7.8	Summary and final evaluation - MA International Relations (One-Year).....	78
8	Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in Public Policy	81
8.1	Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	81
8.2	Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	83

8.3	Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	89
8.4	Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	91
8.5	Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	91
8.6	Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development	93
8.7	Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	94
8.8	Summary and final evaluation - MA in Public Policy	94
9	Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – Master of Public Administration	97
9.1	Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme	97
9.2	Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management	99
9.3	Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff	107
9.4	Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding	109
9.5	Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure.....	109
9.6	Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development	109
9.7	Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation	111
9.8	Summary and final evaluation – Master of Public Administration	111
10	Documents reviewed	114

1 Basic principles for the procedure

The Austrian higher education system

To date, the Austrian higher education system comprises:

- 22 public universities, the Danube University Krems, a public university for post-graduate continuing education whose structure largely corresponds to public universities;
- 16 private universities, run by nationally accredited private entities;
- 21 universities of applied sciences, run by state-subsidised entities organised under private law or by nationally accredited public entities;
- the university colleges of teacher education, run by nationally accredited public or private entities;
- the philosophical-theological higher education institutions, run by the Catholic Church;
- the Institute of Science and Technology – Austria, which focusses its tasks on the advancement and appreciation of new fields of research and a post-graduate training in the form of PhD and postdoc programmes.

In the winter semester of 2018/2019, 293,644 students were enrolled at public universities (incl. the Danube University Krems). Furthermore, 53,401 students were enrolled at universities of applied sciences and 14,446 students at private universities.¹

External quality assurance

Pursuant to the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG), public universities shall perform an audit procedure for the certification of their internal quality management system every seven years. There are no legal or financial consequences linked to the decision on certification.

Private universities require institutional accreditation conducted by AQ Austria every six years. After twelve years of uninterrupted accreditation, the accreditation may also be awarded for twelve years. Interim degree programmes and certificate university programmes for further education leading to a degree programme also require accreditation.

Following the six-year period of institutional initial accreditation, universities of applied sciences must be re-accredited. After that, they pass on to the audit system. However, the accreditation is linked to a positive decision on certification in the audit procedure. Before degree programmes may be offered, they must be accredited once.

Accreditation of private universities and their degree programmes

In order to be active as a higher education institution in Austria, private universities require institutional accreditation which must be renewed on a regular basis. In addition to institutional accreditation, newly established degree programmes must be accredited once before they may

¹As at May 2019, data source: Statistics Austria/unidata. Contrary to the data of the public universities, the student numbers of the universities of applied sciences do not include non-degree seeking students. 278,039 degree students were enrolled at the public universities in the winter semester 2018/19.

be offered by the private university. The Agency of Quality Assurance and Accreditation Austria (AQ Austria) is responsible for carrying out accreditation procedures.

The accreditation procedures are carried out in accordance with AQ Austria's Accreditation Regulation for Private Universities 2019 (PU-AkkVO). Furthermore, the agency has based its procedures on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area.²

The AQ Austria appoints experts for reviewing accreditation applications. On the basis of the application documents and a site visit at the applicant institution, the experts draw up a joint written expert report. The Board of the AQ Austria then makes a decision on accreditation which is based on the expert report and takes into consideration the higher education institution's comment on the expert report. If the statutory prerequisites for accreditation are met and the required qualitative requirements are fulfilled, the degree programmes shall be accredited by official notification.

Before its entry into force, the official notification of the Board shall be subject to approval by the competent Federal Minister. After the procedure has been completed, a report on the outcome of the accreditation procedure as well as the expert report shall be published on the websites of AQ Austria and the applicant institution. Personal data and those parts of the report that disclose funding sources as well as business and operational secrets shall be exempt from publication.

The Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG) and the Private Universities Act (PUG) form the legal basis for the accreditation of degree programmes at private universities.

2 Short information on the accreditation procedure

Information on the applicant institution	
Applicant institution	Central European University Private University (CEU PU)
Legal nature	GmbH
Initial accreditation	16 July 2019
Last extension of accreditation	-
Site	Vienna
Number of students	ca. 1800 planned

² [Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area \(ESG\)](#)

The Central European University Private University submitted the application for accreditation on 31/10/2019. In its decision on 02/01/2020, the Board of AQ Austria appointed the following experts for the review of the accreditation application:

Name	Function/Institution	Role of the expert
Prof. Dr. hab. Dorota Pietrzyk-Reeves	Director of the BA Programme International Relations and Area Studies, Jagiellonian University in Krakow	Expert from academia, Chair of the expert panel
Dr. Reinhard Krumm	Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, Regional Office for Cooperation and Peace in Europe, Head of Office	Expert with professional practice
Prof. Dr. Marleen Brans	Academic Director of the Master of European Politics and Policies, KU Leuven	Expert from academia
Univ.-Prof.Dr. Margitta Mätzke	Department Chair, Institut für Gesellschafts- und Sozialpolitik, Johannes-Kepler Universität Linz	Expert from academia
Univ.-Prof.Dr. Wolfgang C. Müller	Department Chair, Institut für Staatswissenschaft, Universität Wien	Expert from academia
Mario Schäfer, Ba MMA	Universität Passau	Doctoral Student

Due to the Covid-19-related measurements taken by the Austrian government and, in consequence, by AQ Austria, the site visit already planned had to be cancelled. As an alternative, virtual conferences were held giving the experts the opportunity to talk to CEU PU faculty and students. In addition, preparatory virtual meetings were held for the experts to consult about their findings and draft their joint report.

On 16 and 17 March 2020 the expert panel and representatives of the AQ Austria conducted online-discussions with the representatives and students of the Central European University Private University. These discussions were preceded by a round of written questions answered by the CEU PU both via video-interviews conducted by the CEU PU accreditation officer with the President of CEU PU, Mr. Michael Ignatieff, and the CEU PU Provost, Mr. Liviu Matei, and in writing.

PhD in Political Science

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	PhD in Political Science
Degree programme type	Doctoral degree programme
ECTS	240
Standard study period	4 academic years (12 terms)
Maximum enrolment	15-20 / year and cohort
Academic title	Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	none („fully funded“)
Application submitted	31 October 2019

3 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – PhD in Political Science

3.1 Assessment criterion § 18 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme – PhD Political Science

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

According to the Policy on Degree Programs of CEU PU, the institution has developed a policy that specifies the rules for establishing, operating and modifying degree programmes. The specific PhD programme has been developed and practiced in Budapest long before this accreditation process and although the documents do not detail the original process they clearly evidence careful program development enriched by practicing the programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - PhD Political Science

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university's quality management system. The quality assurance measures also comprise adequate structures and procedures to ensure that the rules of good scientific practice are adhered to.

According to the application documents, the PhD programme is under a two-tier internal quality assurance system, the higher tier at the school level (School Council) and the Doctoral Committee as the lower tier. The composition of the committees and assignment of tasks and the principles of rotation established are considered adequate. The internal quality management system involves regular students' evaluations of each course on offer as well as evaluation of doctoral supervision. External quality assurance via reaccreditation and reviews by external experts come on top of this.

According to the Program Proposal there is one student representative on the Doctoral Committee.

As representation of students in the Students union and the Senate is proportional to students numbers in the different programs, PhD students are currently underrepresented. Since the institutionalized structure does not provide a formal space for interest representation of PhD students, they have formed a voluntary group (PhD working group) to deal with such issues as stipends, residence issues, the ongoing transition phase, and the student life centre. Although the administration shows goodwill to cooperate, rights are very limited to change things, but due to the open society and democracy dedication of the university the PHD students active in the working group stay in contact by sending policy documents to the administration dealing with issues that need to be changed.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- On the basis of their findings and especially on the basis of the interviews conducted, the experts recommend that the doctoral students' community should be better represented at the university level as the current channels of representation seem highly informal and hardly institutionalized. This recommendation does not conflict with the overall positive evaluation of the development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme.

3.2 Assessment criterion § 18 (2) 1 to 6: Research environment

Research environment -PhD Political Science

1. The private university has developed a research concept which incorporates the doctoral degree programme and a development plan which comprises enhancement measures for the degree programme.

The application documents include rules and procedures to ensure that the rules of good scientific practice are adhered to. The research focus as detailed in the application documents comprises the core fields of the discipline of political science and also brings in some important neighbouring disciplines:

- Democracy and Political Institutions: Variety and challenges of democratic regimes. political regime transition; nature of non-democracies and hybrid regimes; qualities of democracies, political accountability; political communication; voting behaviour.
- Political Economy: Political economy of reforms; international political economy; varieties of capitalism in new Europe.
- Public Policy: Public welfare regimes, social policy, corruption and corruption control, fiscal policy, public administration and management.
- Higher Education: innovative approaches to higher education (concepts, history, policy and management, the role of Universities in the 21st century) with specific relevance to Central and Eastern Europe and beyond." (<https://www.ceu.edu/research/areas>)

The topics covered are represented by academics who meet all requirements for a research university with international status. The academic staff is internationally recruited and highly qualified in terms of publication output. The academic staff also guarantees that the breadth of methods that is representative for the discipline of political science is adequately covered. The number of academics and their working hours at CEU PU guarantee a very good student-professor ratio. The cap on PhD supervisions allows sufficient time for individual exchange. Many members of the academic staff are involved in international funded research projects and the university has a large number of international partner universities. The application documents provide ample evidence that the CEU PU promotes research and provides the adequate structural framework conditions to conduct research at a very high level. The facilities and equipment are adequate for operating the PhD program.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research environment -PhD Political Science

2. The private university has defined a research focus for the degree programme which covers the broadness of the respective discipline as regards content and methods. The focus of the research performance corresponds to the university's approach as well as to the respective subject culture and guarantees international visibility.

The CEU PU is a research oriented institution and its mission is to become a leading institution in both research and teaching as stated in the Annex 1.1. The PhD programme well reflects the strengths of the institution in this respect. The application documents show that the CEU PU has a research focus spanning the discipline of political science and, in addition, has important neighbouring disciplines – such as law, economics, philosophy, and history – well-represented. The research output is broad and often published in very good journals or with very good publishing houses. The academic staff has a comparatively huge breath in terms of academic backgrounds and also includes teachers with experiences in important institutions outside the world of academia. All these are strengths which enrich the PhD program. The CEU PU has established a number of procedures, policies and facilities which ensure that research focus and research performance are prioritized and guarantee international visibility. These procedures and policies are especially well established at the Doctoral School. Although publishing their research in academic journals prior to doctoral defence is not a formal requirement, students of the Doctoral School frequently publish their research in well-established academic journals and academic presses. In response to experts' inquiry a list of recent publications of PhD students was provided.

The compilation of syllabi contains several course formats specifically designed to give guidance on international academic communities and labour markets.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research environment -PhD Political Science

3. The private university has employed professors qualified in primary occupation in the discipline relevant for the degree programme who cover the broad range of the discipline's content and methods. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

According to the application documents, the CEU PU has a sufficient number of professors (40 full-time faculty, five part-time faculty, six visiting faculty) who are qualified to carry out the PhD program in terms of the contents covered and methods required and who are employed at least 50% of their total working hours at the CEU PU. Members of staff involved in teaching and supervision at the Doctoral School are often distinguished scholars in their respective research areas and carry out research projects supported by international research grants including Horizon 2020 (the list of recent grants is provided) which facilitates involvement of PhD students in research activities at advanced level.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research environment -PhD Political Science

4. The private university maintains institutionally anchored co-operation projects in research and development or the development and appreciation of the arts which are relevant for the degree programme and adequate for the respective subject culture.

According to the application materials, many academics are involved in research projects funded by international funding institutions and institutionally anchored at the CEU PU. The numbers are adequate for political science and indicate a very research-active academic staff. PhD students also benefit from exchange programmes including Erasmus and The Global Teaching Fellowship programme. CEU PU also offers a Doctoral Research Support Grant program that enables doctoral students a short research stay abroad as visiting research scholars at partner institutions including: Australian National University, European Institute University, Cornell University (CEU has provided a list these institutions). This scheme, as experts have learnt from additional documentation provided by CEU PU, is an integral part of the doctoral programme.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research environment -PhD Political Science

5. The private university promotes research and development activities by providing for appropriate organisational or structural framework conditions.

According to the application materials and the research output documented therein, the CEU PU promotes research and provides the required structural framework conditions at an appropriate level. The institution provides substantial funds for promoting research activities including research grants, conference participation as well as structural facilities that promote research including a well-equipped library. This is well documented in the Staff Handbook and other institutional documents provided by the CEU PU. Doctoral students also benefit from CEU PU's involvement in numerous research networks such as the European Graduate Network, Horizon 2020 Marie Curie Innovative Training Networks, and Acredit.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research environment -PhD Political Science

6. The private university's research infrastructure as well as its facilities and equipment are adequate on a quantitative and a qualitative basis for operating the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

According to the application materials, the CEU PU's research infrastructure, facilities and equipment are adequate in terms of quantity and quality to operate a PhD program in political science. These include the Academic Cooperation and Research Support Office, research trainings sponsored by the institution, paid research leaves and research grants, a very well-equipped library and its facilities including access to numerous international databases, and other facilities documented in institutional documents and the Introduction to CEU PU (Annex 1.1).

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

3.3 Assessment criterion § 18 (3) 1 to 3: Supervision and counselling services

Supervision and counselling services -PhD Political Science

1. The private university shall conclude agreements with the doctoral students which govern the respective rights and duties of the private university, the doctoral students and their supervisors.

According to the application materials, an agreement is signed with each student. There are also general guidelines in force which govern the rights and duties of the students, supervisors, and the university. Relevant documents include the CEU PU Doctoral Regulations and CEU PU Student Rights Policy. There is no formal supervision agreement signed by both parties. However, this agreement functions in practice and includes very frequent meetings between the students and the supervisors, close monitoring of students' progress in their research activities as well availability of supervisors with significant research experience. Students start with a provisional supervisor in their first year and later on they are allocated a permanent

supervisor who can best guide their research (written additional documentation was provided by CEU PU in response to the experts' questions).

According to the student representative, the supervision agreement contains weekly or bi-weekly meetings, the attendance of certain panels, and the deadlines agreed to by supervisor and student. The supervisor provides regular feedback based on student's writing and research progress, as well as other paper-based material. Therefore, progress is closely followed, and the supervision procedure is an outstanding example for CEU PU's student support.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Supervision and counselling services -PhD Political Science

2. The private university shall enable the doctoral students to engage in an intensive dialogue with scientists or artists, respectively, by collaborating with higher education institutions and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad and promote the participation of doctoral students in national and international symposia.

According to the application materials, doctoral students receive considerable encouragement and material support to engage in dialogue with scientists at the CEU PU, in Austrian, and in international conferences. As stated before, under § 18 (2) 4 of this report, this support includes CEU PU's participation in many research networks as well as partnership agreements with numerous prestigious universities which allow doctoral students to spend up to six months as visiting research scholars for which CEU PU provides a research grant (Doctoral Research Support Grant Program).

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Supervision and counselling services -PhD Political Science

3. The private university shall provide the doctoral students with adequate counselling services which are tailored to the specific degree programme.

According to the application materials, the doctoral students receive counselling services tailored to the specific program and indeed to their specific dissertation project. This includes close supervision which each student receives and which involves close interaction between the student and the supervisor to support overall student's progress. CEU PU's regulations allow their faculty to supervise up to five students while the current student-supervisor ratio is 2.3 (as stated by CEU PU in additional documentation, only three out of forty supervisors supervise more than three PhD students at the moment).

An accompanying offer best practice example is the well-suited career service of the CEU PU. The service provides career network meetings with experts and high rank visitors as well as counselling services and workshops. Since most of the PhD students of the CEU PU want to work in academia, the university provides a broad offer of method courses and research opportunities. These academic centres and research groups consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

3.4 Assessment criterion § 18 (4) 1 to 8: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

1. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic competences, personal skills, and social competences and are in accordance with level 8 of the National Qualification Framework.

The programme profile has been clearly defined and the programme itself is well integrated with the structure and mission of the CEU PU. According to the application materials, PhD students are admitted to a clearly defined degree programme, which includes enough flexibility to cater to the needs of individual research projects. The programme offers a rich and extensive curriculum that consists of 240 ECTS credits and offers five research tracks as well as clearly defined research and methodological training. The political science and methodological competences are clearly defined in the course syllabi and the programme description and they meet the state of the art. There are three sets of learning outcomes defined in the Programme Proposal which pertain to transferable skills, competence in research and specialization in one of the five areas of political science as well as teaching skills. Specific learning outcomes are provided in the syllabi along with a description of each course, and they have been defined in accordance with level 8 of the NQF as their objective is to demonstrate students' ability to master academic topics independently. The syllabi of the courses offered by the Doctoral School are very detailed and could be recommended as standard for other programmes.

The organization of the Doctoral School is exemplary in that it combines all specializations within the Political Science cluster under one organizational structure and allows for flexibility in pursuing specialized research interests by defining distinct tracks. This enhances visibility, status, and allows for a more balanced and comprehensive presentation of doctoral education at CEU PU within the university and beyond. Although the Program Proposal states (p.6) that there is not much contact among the tracks, there are indeed joint classes and, students are also required to take courses in the amount of 8 ECTS from another track, facilitating communication and cross-fertilization among the distinct areas of the cluster.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

2. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The "Doctor of Philosophy in Political Science" is the adequate title for the Political Science PhD programme. Both the name of the programme and the academic degree (PhD) correspond to the degree programme's profile as defined in the application documents including the mission of the CEU PU. This can be seen in both research areas pursued by members of staff as well as in the programme's commitment to the development of critical thinking and comparative studies. The programme also corresponds with the CEU PU's mission to promote open society through research and teaching.

In case of non-compliance with the conditions or in case of a conditional approval or an outright failure of the defence, the student is offered an MPhil.

Both academic degrees are in line with international standards and considered adequate by the experts.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

3. The minimum duration of studies stipulated in the curriculum is three years. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

The application materials document that the contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes from mandatory coursework will be achieved by students under normal circumstances, while combining research and teaching within three years with an additional fourth year devoted to writing, submitting and defending of the thesis. The CEU PU even provides support mechanisms to allow for additional 6 months for thesis completion if justified by the circumstances.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

4. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes, especially writing the doctoral thesis, can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies. The ECTS is applied correctly; in any case to the curricular parts (courses) of the degree programme.

The application materials document that the intended learning outcomes including the PhD thesis can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies of four years and that the 240 ECTS is applied correctly throughout the PhD programme. Although the programme is quite intense and the students take a number of regular courses which they need to pass, they are at the same time involved in their own research activities related to their theses.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

5. Regulations for doctoral programmes have been established. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

According to the application materials, regulations for the PhD programme have been established as documented in the Doctoral Regulations (Annex 2.1). The examination methods with a layered system (Comprehensive Exam, approval of the doctoral project, two interim reports, acceptance of dissertation and oral defence) and external experts are perfectly suitable to assess to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved. This also applies to the final examination - thesis defence for which specific regulations are defined in the CEU PU Doctoral Regulations and in The Regulations of the Doctoral School.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

6. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issued.

A Diploma Supplement that is "designed to provide a description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed by the individual named on the original qualification to which this supplement is appended" is included in the Annex 2.3 provided with other CEU PU application documents. It complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

7. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The applications documents document that the admission requirements are clearly defined:

"Applicants are expected to hold an internationally recognized Master's or comparable degree in Political Science, International Relations, Public Policy, or a similar politics and/or policy related program that provides a relevant academic background for the track to which the candidate applies. A comparable degree in other Social Sciences, Humanities, or other disciplines will also be considered in cases of an excellent academic record." (Program Proposal)

In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

8. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The admission procedure is defined in the Doctoral School Regulations (Annex 2.1) as well as in the Program Proposal and the CEU PU Admission Policy. The Doctoral Committee established as part of the quality assurance system is responsible for the selection and admission of new PhD students. The application documents indicate that the admission procedure has been clearly defined along with admission requirements including such criteria as eligibility, educational background, prior educational achievements, and other criteria. Admission Committees have been established to conduct the admission procedure for each track of the PhD programme including selection for in person or online interviews. The procedure ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences. Additionally, only students for whom adequate supervision can be provided are admitted to the programme as confirmed in additional written material provided by the CEU PU.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management -PhD Political Science

9. The recognition procedures for higher education competences in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

According to the application materials, the recognition procedures for higher education competences in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined and correspond to the relevant regulations. These regulations have been defined in the Program Proposal which stipulates graduation requirements (e.g. minimum GPA, minimum comprehensive exam grade, etc.), PhD thesis requirements and grading criteria as well as any additional graduation requirements for specializations. Further and detailed regulations considering this requirement are provided in the Annex 2.1. – Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy and International Relations Doctoral Regulations.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

3.5 Assessment criterion § 18 (5) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff -PhD Political Science

1. The private university has sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

As the application documents and additional materials (video) provided by the CEU PU indicate, the institution has a substantial number of well-qualified academics and non-academic staff members, certainly sufficient to operate a PhD programme in political science.

The Program Proposal states that there are over 50 faculty members involved in Ph.D. supervision, and according to additional written material provided by the CEU PU upon questions of experts, there are currently 40 faculty members acting as doctoral supervisors.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff -PhD Political Science

2. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme. The scientific and/or artistic staff envisaged for the supervision of thesis projects is authorised to teach (venia docendi) or has an equivalent qualification for the scientific or artistic subject, respectively. It is involved in the research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts of the respective subject and performs research and development activities which are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture. The majority of the scientific and/or artistic staff assigned to the supervision of theses has experience in this field.

As the CVs submitted as part of the application materials document, the scientific staff is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme. A sufficient number of the academic staff members has a qualification equivalent to the authorization to teach (venia docendi). All academic staff members are involved in research on their respective subject areas and perform research activities which are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture. This applies also for political science considered in its own right.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff -PhD Political Science

3. The benchmark for an adequate tutoring ratio for the supervision of doctoral theses is eight doctoral students per supervisor (full-time equivalent).

As the application materials document, and as stated in the CEU PU Doctoral Regulations, the cap for individual tutoring (supervision) is at 5 for each supervisor. The current ratio of student to supervisor is 2.3 as stated in additional material provided by the CEU PU upon experts' request. The tutoring ratio for the supervision of doctoral theses is very good.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff -PhD Political Science

4. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures that there is sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts as well as the supervision of doctoral students.

As documented by the application materials including the Staff Handbook and the research output of the CEU PU indicated in the submitted CVs of academic members of staff or the list of externally funded research projects, there is sufficient time for research and supervision of PhD students. The CEU is a research-oriented university. The Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1.) lists explicit – albeit flexible – ratios of time for research, teaching, and administration. A moderate teaching load, generous possibilities for granting sabbaticals, and funds for research and conference-related travel ensure that there is enough time for research. Furthermore, the Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1., p. 29) lists an explicit restriction on the number of theses that any individual faculty member should supervise, so that workloads for teaching and supervision should not diverge dramatically among faculty members, and a balance between teaching and research is easier to maintain.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff -PhD Political Science

5. The private university provides for personnel development measures aimed at the supervision of doctoral students

As documented by the application materials, the CEU provides for personnel development measures aimed at the supervision of doctoral students (building teaching skills, fostering professionalization, supporting research activities and providing research grants, as well as providing career guidance). Additionally, the Doctoral School collects student evaluations for each course on offer, as well as individual feedback assessing students' evaluations of the quality of supervision. Potential personnel development measures reflect these evaluations.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

3.6 Assessment criterion § 18 (6): Funding

Funding -PhD Political Science

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

In its mission CEU PU states in general, that it "will be a financially independent and sustainable institution". And it further defines the aim of the Endowment as "to support the University's operations irrespective of the University's location and accreditation framework".

According to the Program Proposal, the funding of the programs offered by the Department of Political Science is provided from the central budget of CEU PU. There is no tuition fee revenue

planned, but PhD students are granted stipends. Most programmes at CEU PU are funded primarily through the CEU PU endowment fund, to ensure broad access to education.

As detailed in the Program Proposal, planned expenditures, covering all relevant expenses, are sufficiently covered by and the CEU Endowment Funding. The available documents detailing the budget, financial plan, the endowment and the assets demonstrate that the funding is secured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

3.7 Summary and final evaluation -PhD Political Science

Development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme:

The experts found the PhD programme carefully developed. It is under a two-tier internal quality assurance system which is professionally set up. External quality assurance via reaccreditation and reviews by external experts come on top of this.

Research environment:

The experts found that the CEU PU has built a research environment enabling PhD students and academic staff to conduct research at a very high level. For that purpose the CEU PU has established a number of procedures, policies and facilities which ensure that research focus and research performance are prioritized and they guarantee international visibility. These procedures and policies are especially well established at the Doctoral School.

Supervision and counselling services:

Under an umbrella of specific regulations doctoral students' progress is closely monitored by their supervisors. Doctoral students receive considerable encouragement and material support to engage in dialogue with academics within the CEU PU and beyond, including many research networks as well as institutional partnerships with numerous prestigious universities. The doctoral students receive counselling services tailored to the specific program and dissertation project, and they benefit from a very favourable student-supervisor ratio and the CEU PU's career service.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

The programme profile and the learning goals in political science and methodological competences are clearly defined in the programme description and the course syllabi and meet the state of the art. They conform to level 8 of the National Qualification Framework. The intended learning outcomes will be achieved by students under normal circumstances, while combining research and teaching within three years with an additional fourth year devoted to writing, submitting and defending of the thesis. The "Doctor of Philosophy in Political Science" is the adequate title for the CEU PU's Political Science PhD programme. Admission rules and degree programme conform to the rules and best-practice, and they are adequately managed.

Staff:

The CEU has sufficient scientific and non-academic staff for operating the degree programme. The scientific staff is sufficiently qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme. The student-staff ratio is very good while research by the scientific staff and doctoral students is given a priority at the CEU PU.

Funding:

THE CEU PU is a well-endowed institution, the programme's funding is ensured for the foreseeable future. PhD students have to pay no tuition fee.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the doctoral programme "Political Science".

The expert panel members have the following **recommendation to CEU PU**.

- On the basis of their findings and especially on the basis of the interviews conducted, the experts recommend that doctoral students' community should be better represented at the university level as the current channels of representation seem highly informal and hardly institutionalized. This recommendation does not conflict with the overall positive evaluation of the development and quality assurance of the doctoral programme.

MA in Political Science (Two-Year)

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	Political Science (Two-Year)
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	120
Standard study period	2 academic years (6 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20-25 per year and cohort
Academic Degree	Master of Arts (MA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 12.000 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

4 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in Political Science (Two-Year)

4.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme – MA Political Science (Two-Year)

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

The two-year Master programme in Political Science was accredited in the United States in 2010. The first (one-year) MA programme in Political Science originated as a MA in "Politics and the Political Economy of Post-Communist Transition", but subsequently broadened and diversified its thematic and methodological scope. The Program Proposal gives no information about the process of original programme development; Yet the remark, in the Program Proposal, that "the founding members of the Department also shared the conviction that rational choice can provide a shared analytical tool for political philosophy, political economy

and political behaviour” suggests a procedure that might have been less than fully inclusive and rule-bound, and to a greater extent based on shared understandings within select groups founding actors than would be ideal from today’s perspective.

In that sense the diversification in methodological and theoretical perspectives and thematic commitments since then is laudable, as it ensured that the MA-programme has acquired a broader understanding of a Political Science programme, both in terms of the theoretical approaches and substantive issue-areas, as well as in terms of the programmes’ mission and student body.

Current processes of curriculum development are governed by the standards and procedures of establishing, operating and modifying degree programmes that CEU PU has made transparent by publishing an explicit policy regulating the process (Annex 1.2.5). This policy specifies the main components of proposals for new degree programmes and the types of modification of existing programmes that require senate approval. It also lists the Senate, the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee (SeCur) and the Academic Forum as university-internal bodies involved in establishing new programmes, ensuring broad participation of all university-internal stakeholder groups. The process might benefit from including a policy of external review.

The experts gained knowledge of the students’ perspective on their influence regarding programme development. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee, where they discuss new programmes and changes in existing programmes. The students’ representatives are elected by the Student Union, the representative body articulating the students’ interests vis-à-vis the university’s leadership and administration. Of the ten members of the Senate Curriculum Committee, one is a student representative.

The students affirm in unison the great opportunity for anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes. Additionally, due to the good student-staff-ratio, programme coordinators and individual faculty are available constantly. This informal way offers non-institutionalized influence for the students. The experts got the impression that students feel comfortable by that direct approach and the students’ perceived influence.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university’s quality management system.

According to the application materials, the CEU PU has elaborate quality assurance policies on all levels (regular institutional reviews of the department, teaching evaluation, supervision evaluation, and annual individual faculty’s performance reviews), and the Political Science Department and its MA programmes are fully integrated in that quality management system.

The Program Proposal of the Department of Political Science states that the Strategic Reviews of the Department, conducted every five years, are most important among these quality assurance measures. The description of that review type in the IAQA Policy (Annex 1.2.4) suggests a very thorough review, which includes review of the department’s degree programmes. Regular additional short-term and long-term reviews of the department’s MA programmes are additionally conducted to “map the changing interests of the students and collect data on movements, trends etc. in the relevant markets and academia” (Program

Proposal, p. 2). Moreover, there are detailed (and binding) guidelines for workloads and class requirements that faculty adhere to in designing their classes and faculty's annual performance reviews contain information on teaching. Students' teaching evaluations and regular forums for informal exchange on teaching convey additional information about the quality of the MA-programmes.

The specific procedure of the review and evaluation of the programme and staff is confirmed and appreciated by the students and therefore the experts consider the quality assurance to be accomplished.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

1. The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.

The Master's programme in Political Science fits extremely well into the profile and objectives of CEU PU. It shares – and one might even argue: is at the core of – CEU PU's open society mission of educating future professionals in politics, government and international organizations, who are aware of the normative ideals underpinning liberal democracy, understand the political and economic institutions that best approximate those ideals as well as the opportunities and challenges to the realization of an open society (cf. p. 4 of the Program Proposal), and by way of acquiring and disseminating that understanding are critically engaged in promoting democracy. At the same time CEU PU's MA programmes in Political Science seek to "instil appreciation for, as well as excellence and rigor in, critical reflection and scholarly analysis." (ibid.) Striking a balance between these two aspects, social science research as advocacy and social science research as academic excellence, can amount to walking a fine line. The reading lists on the class syllabi and the publication lists on the faculty CVs, though, indicate that CEU faculty and curriculum-developers are aware of that potential tension and know how to walk that fine line without relinquishing the commitment to the open society or the academic quality standards.

During a web conference (2 April 2020), CEU students expressed satisfaction with the university's responsiveness to their needs. They especially highlighted good information and communication on the part of the university with regard to the transition from Budapest to Vienna.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

The programme proposal and each individual class syllabus are very explicit and clear in stating learning outcomes and the overall profile of the programme. They put a lot of emphasis on key transferable social science skills, such as abstract reasoning ability, critical thinking, employment of different methods of analysis, an appreciation of the multidisciplinary nature of many social science projects, etc. This is good and appropriate in higher education programmes, and probably a necessity in view of the diversity of backgrounds among students and faculty. In terms of the key social science skills as well as thematically the profile of the department and programme make sense when considered in relation to the CEU PU's overall history and status as an international university, targeting an international audience with regard to both its student body and the research output of its faculty. This is the basis of considering this criterion to be fulfilled.

As affirmed during the web conference on 2 April 2020, current students feel well prepared for many career tracks within and outside academia. This is partly due to a number of additional services and initiatives surrounding the MA programme. Students mention the career service in this connection, which provides career network meetings with experts and high-level professionals, as well as counselling services and workshops.

The students value the fact that the university offers a broad range of methods courses and research opportunities. There are also several academic centres and research groups, in which students can cooperate with professors, "who act not as supervisors but as advisors". An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee. For those who wish to leave academia, the university offers optional group counselling, which the students considered a major asset and reason for applying to the CEU PU in the first place.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The name of the programme is appropriate in that the MA programme covers the predominant part of the substantive profile of the discipline. It also unreservedly matches CEU PU's political open society mission, in which Political Science is a central proponent, as argued above. And the Political Science Master's commitment to the key social science skills also affirm that the profile of the programme fully and unreservedly matches the name.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (Two-Year)

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

The structure of the curriculum has a convincing combination of methods training and substantive classes, mandatory and elective subjects, and a sound organization of the process leading to the MA-thesis. Judging from reading the class syllabi and the faculty's CVs, there is no doubt about the unity of research and teaching at CEU PU, and the success in achieving the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are formulated and described explicitly in several places, such as the Student Handbook and the individual class syllabi (in addition to the Program Proposal), and there are also explicit descriptions of where (in what classes) and how learning outcomes are supposed to be pursued and measured (e.g. Student Handbook, Annex 4.1., pp. 7 f.).

The components of the curriculum are:

- A preparatory module, in which remedial classes on core competencies are offered (9 ECTS; mandatory to all students, who need them depending on degree of credit equivalence between their previous studies and a BA in Political Science; none of which counting toward the 120 ECTS credits for the MA degree)
- A mandatory foundational module (36 ECTS), where overview courses core issues of Political Science (the choice of which is not entirely clear: e.g. why political communication and not political behaviour, why constitutionalism and not political parties and systems of interest intermediation, why comparative European politics, but not politics of the EU, nor any kind of international politics, etc.?) are offered
- Three thematic core modules (covering Comparative Politics, Political Economy, and Theory), in which students have a limited amount of choice.
- Elective classes (56 ECTS), where students have a large amount of choice from a number and a range of classes that is very impressive, and where students also have (limited) possibilities to choose classes from other departments,
- The MA Thesis including thesis-writing advising and workshops (20 ECTS; p. 20), which are very well-designed.

This all is well-suited to achieving the goals and learning outcomes of the overall programme, pp. 24 ff. provide convincing descriptions of the learning outcomes of the individual modules.

Students are also encouraged (but not obliged) to specialize in certain fields of their choice by selecting elective classes in such a way that they accumulate at least 40 ECTS and write their MA-Thesis in those fields. This in principle is an attractive and sensible option; the thematic range of the available specializations (CP, Electoral Politics, Political Communication, PE, Methods, Normative Theory) is clearly communicated and mapped onto the classes available in the specializations.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

The didactic conception of the individual classes fully capitalizes on the excellent learning environment, especially the small learning groups, and teaching by highly research-active faculty (Program Proposal) that this MA programme has the privilege to offer. Interactive, seminar-style components and group-based exercises are a sizable part of the classes' teaching methods. The description of substantive contents in the curriculum's core components and of the different modules and their learning outcomes is likewise convincing.

The Program Proposal includes 58 class syllabi, which are consistently excellent in the way in which they explicate learning outcomes and define teaching tools and reading materials suitable for achieving the learning outcomes.

During the interview conducted with students, they confirm the excellent student-academic staff ratio, which is very helpful for meeting students' needs, facilitating flexibility with regard to course materials, as well as openness for student suggestions regarding classes and how to improve learning conditions. Students affirm the importance of anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes, which was at the basis of their conviction that intended learning outcomes can be achieved despite the density of the programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

Planning teaching and constructing the syllabi of individual courses "must meet departmental guidelines which regulate the length of reading as well as variety of assessment forms" (Program Proposal, p. 3). The Department has supplied 58 syllabi of the individual classes taught in its MA programmes. Judging from the reading lists and specification of class requirements, workloads are on the higher end (especially as 1 ECTS amounts to 25 hours of work at Austrian public universities), but roughly in line with the specification of ECTS. The choice of class materials and readings on the syllabi seem excellent and definitely suitable for achieving the learning outcomes stated in the curriculum and in the syllabi.

In a web conference with CEU students on 2 April 2020, students gave the experts some indication about dropouts and delays in submitting the MA Theses, and both appears to be rare. According to the student participants in the web conference, these cases were the result of individual problems, and not related to the university or the programme structure. Moreover, in cases of health problems, personal circumstances, or other issues that might affect the completion of assignments, deadlines can be postponed, based in goodwill of the academic staff. Late submission of the final thesis will incur a penalty on the final grade, however. In sum, therefore, the students' perspective on CEU PU's strict rules regarding deadlines is rather positive; they are handled more flexibly than they appear in the written materials.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

Examination methods and policies on grading and course requirements are transparent to students in the Student Handbook (Annex 4.2., pp. 20 ff.) and the CEU Student Rights Policy (Annex 1.2.7). Moreover, the Syllabi of the individual classes also outline the bases of grading clearly. Especially in their heavy emphasis on interactive assignments such as individual or group presentations, papers asking for students assessments and positions, or analyses of social science scholarship are especially suited for evaluating the quality of students' judgment, critical thinking and ability to employ rigorous social science methodology. Information about grading and examination standards is abundant and clear.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issued.³

CEU PU has submitted an example of a Diploma Supplement in Annex 4.5, which lists all the major components of the curriculum and provides information about core features of the programme, admissions and grading. This complies with the requirements of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung (UHSBV)).

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The admission criteria are "set in accordance with internationally-recognized standards and tests to ensure [...] a pool of excellent applicants.", as it is stated in the Program Proposal. The explicit lists of application materials and admission standards in the Program Proposal are in line with prevalent standards and appropriate for the programme. The crucial prerequisite of the two-year MA is a three-year Bachelor's degree (180 ECTS) in Political Science or a related academic discipline, and proof of adequate language competency.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

³ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two- Year)

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The admissions process is transparently described in the Program Proposal and the Draft Admissions Policy, and organized in such a way, that fairness and the overall merit-based orientation of the selection procedures are ensured. It is a three-step procedure, comprising a first (departmental) selection based on the written application materials, a second stage in which applicants are invited to take an online interview, and a third stage, on which applicants are ranked based on merit. Formal letters of acceptance are issued by the admissions office, which also communicates decisions on financial aid. Writing sample and various forms of statements of purpose, statements of research interests and an exposition of a significant Political Science problem are required and, together with recommendation letters, offer the chance of looking behind the schematic information that grades and tests.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

CEU PU participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Therefore, recognition of foreign qualifications is granted and in line with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications, as was adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee.

The CEU PU Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations (Annex 1.2.7) clarify in a transparent way the credit transfer policy of CEU PU: Students are allowed to use "up to 16 ECTS credits non-degree credits towards a CEU PU degree. In the case of students enrolled in two-year master's programs and doctoral programs, students can request a transfer of up to 30 ECTS credits."

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

The Student Handbook (Annex 4.1.) lists 20 permanent faculty as teachers in the department, some of whom are joint appointments or part time faculty. According to the Program Proposal, there are 13 full-time faculty in the department, plus six part-time faculty and currently four visiting faculty. This is an extremely generous staff-situation for advising and teaching incoming cohorts of 20 students in the 2-year programme, and 40-45 students in the 1-year programme.

With three people in administrative positions CEU PU's political science department ranges below what would be expected at many universities in the German-speaking countries; on the other hand CEU PU offers generous departmental support when it comes to research.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

In the supplementary video the student-teacher ratio is listed as 7:1; a prospective development in the direction of 10:1 is mentioned as university-wide number on student-teacher ratios. This, of course, is much more favourable than any public university in Austria can dream of offering in the Social Sciences and Humanities, and it makes for an excellent learning environment.

MA students consider their supervision to be excellent. According to the participants in the web conference on 2 April 2020, all academic staff are very helpful and flexible. Most important for students, academic staff is available when they need them.

The experts consider the criterion to be fulfilled.

Staff - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

Professors are hired and promoted based on merit and according to procedures akin to the search committee- and Habilitation / tenure-track procedures that are prevalent in most European and North American universities. The detailed descriptions are in the Staff Handbook. Against the backdrop of the Austrian context it is noteworthy that hiring and promotion procedures are organized in a way that is less inclusive (academic self-government-based) and more top-down than is customary at Austrian public universities. The subject-specific core competences are covered by professors in primary occupation.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

Judging from the faculty CVs, the members of the Political Science faculty have good educational backgrounds, are well published and active in the academic (and political) communities of their respective fields. If there is some selectivity in the range of thematic fields covered by the CEU Political Science faculty as a whole, then this is matched by a corresponding selectivity in its

curriculum, so that the academic staff of the department can definitely fulfil all the tasks required by the degree programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

The Academic Staff Handbook lists explicit – albeit flexible – ratios of time for research, teaching, and administration. A moderate teaching load, generous possibilities for granting sabbaticals, and funds for research and conference-related travel ensure that there is enough time for research. Furthermore, the Academic Staff Handbook lists an explicit restriction on the number of MA theses that any individual faculty member should supervise, so that workloads for teaching and supervision should not diverge dramatically among faculty members, and a balance between teaching and research is easier to maintain.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

In its mission CEU PU states in general, that it "will be a financially independent and sustainable institution". And it further defines the aim of the Endowment as "to support the University's operations irrespective of the University's location and accreditation framework". According to CEU PU's MA Political Science Program Proposal, "the funding of the programs offered by the Department of Political Science is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue generated by the Department and from the central budget of CEU PU. Most programs at CEU PU are funded primarily through the CEU PU endowment fund, rather than through tuition revenue, to ensure broad access to education..." As detailed in the Program Proposal, planned expenditures, covering all relevant expenses, are sufficiently covered by and the CEU Endowment Funding [...] and – to a very small extent, by expected tuition fees [...]. The available documents detailing the budget, financial plan, the endowment and the assets demonstrate that the funding is secured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

Detailed information on CEU PU infrastructure and library is provided in Annex 1.1, "Introduction to CEU PU" and Annex 1.3. on the CEU PU Campus. According to these documents adequate facilities and equipment are provided for students and staff of the degree programme. CEU PU in its new location in Vienna is leasing a 21,000 m² property which will provide adequate facilities for students and staff such as an auditorium, lecture and seminar rooms, a media lab, the library and a reading room equipped with computers, as well as offices for visiting staff and researchers. Additional 8,000 square-meters space are currently adapted.

The resources include a well-established library that so far functioned at CEU Budapest, which contains extensive print and electronic collections, as well as access to a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development and/or the advancement and appreciation of the arts

Research and development - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

Procedures for hiring, promoting, and monitoring the work of academic staff are designed to ensure high quality and continuous activity in both research and teaching research. CEU PU and its Political Science degrees are also ranked highly in university rankings.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

The Political Sciences Department has established several research groups: Conflict and Security Research Group (CONSEC), Migration Research Group (MiRG), Political Behavior Research Group (PolBeRG), Political Economy Research Group (PERG), Political, Legal and Moral Theory Research Group (POLEMO), The Middle East and North Africa Space (MENAS). In addition, the Department of Political Science organises an annual sequence of departmental seminars. The seminars provide the occasion for faculty, distinguished guest as well as advanced and first year PhD students to present their work.

CEU PU has procedures of performance monitoring (annual activity reports and reviews; described in the Academic Staff Handbook; Annex 1.2.1.) that amount to extremely tight supervision by Austrian standards. There is a firm expectation of excellent publication output and activity in the scientific community, and the academic faculty's CVs reflect this.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

The Political Science department has a range of ERASMUS agreements with European universities, so that MA students have the opportunity to study abroad. There are visiting professors in the department on a regular basis, and MA students will also benefit from the extremely diverse backgrounds and internationalism of the Political Science department's academic staff. The department also hosts the Summer School in Methods and Techniques of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR).

There is also a range of research groups and departmental seminars, in which students and faculty can exchange ideas and get acquainted with the style and norms of academic colloquia.

In the video input provided for the accreditation the rector of CEU PU also stated it as an advantage and an expectation of CEU PU's move to Vienna that students may benefit from the city's dense concentration of international institutions and its business community.

There are indeed ample opportunities for MA students to get involved in research activities and international exchange. One would expect nothing less from a university as internationalized as CEU PU

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

4.8 Summary and final evaluation - MA Political Science (Two-Year)

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

Since its inception in 1993, MA-level teaching in the Political Science Department at CEU PU has evolved into a full-fledged Political Science education from its more specialized beginnings. Both curriculum development and quality control are now rule-bound and rational, and the procedures ensure that changes in the curriculum and/or programme management will not undermine the programme's quality standards or its core substantive commitments.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

The Political Science MA is at the core of CEU PU's open society mission, and it is also committed to the standards of rigorous and state of the Political Science research and teaching. There is ample evidence in the curriculum and especially the syllabi of individual classes that the MA programme is well-suited for achieving these objectives. The learning experience is intense, but research-oriented and in close contact with research-active faculty members. Students gain knowledge about core subfields of Political Science, as well competencies in key transferrable social science skills. The structure of the programme is well-designed in accordance with the programme profile, with classes, regulations for MA Thesis advising, and formal graduation requirements designed to ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. Students' workload can be regarded as feasible within the stipulated duration of studies. Examination

rules and admission requirements are clearly defined and transparently communicated and a sample diploma supplement that meets the requirements is provided.

Staff:

CEU PU offers competitive salaries, generous working conditions, and a vibrant intellectual atmosphere. As a result, it has been able to hire highly qualified and active scholars. Procedures for hiring and promoting staff are rational, transparent and highly competitive. As a result the Political Science MA programmes are delivered by highly qualified academic staff, as the faculty CVs demonstrate. And there are many academic staff members, such that student-teacher ratios are very favourable.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided during the entire period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

CEU PU is renting 21,000 m² of classrooms, offices, library and study space. This will provide adequate facilities for students and staff. Additional 8,000 m² of office space are currently adapted. Rooms are well-equipped and the library contains extensive print and electronic collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

Research and development:

Procedures for hiring, promoting, and monitoring the work of academic staff are designed to ensure high quality and continuous activity in both research and teaching research. This is reflected in the CVs and publication lists of academic staff, as well as in the placement statistics of the programme's graduates. CEU PU is also ranked highly in university rankings.

Co-operation:

There are ample opportunities as well as generous financial support, for MA students to get involved in research activities and international exchange. One would expect nothing less from a university as internationalized as CEU PU.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the Master programme Political Science (Two-Year).

MA in Political Science (One-Year)

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme

Degree programme title	Political Science (One-Year)
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	60
Standard study period	1 academic year (3 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20-25 per year and cohort
Academic Degree	Master of Arts (MA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 12.000 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

5 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in Political Science (One-Year)

5.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA Political Science (One-Year)

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

The one-year Master programme in Political Science was established in 1992/93 and was originally accredited in the US in 1994 and reaccredited in 2003. The programme originated as an MA in "Politics and the Political Economy of Post-Communist Transition", but subsequently broadened and diversified its thematic and methodological scope. The Program Proposal gives no information about the process of original programme development; Yet the remark in the Program Proposal, that "the founding members of the Department also shared the conviction that rational choice can provide a shared analytical tool for political philosophy, political

economy and political behavior” suggests a procedure that might have been less than fully inclusive and rule-bound, and to a greater extent based on shared understandings within select groups founding actors than would be ideal from today’s perspective.

However, since then the 1990s the MA programme has evolved and diversified in its methodological and theoretical perspectives as well as thematic and policy-oriented commitments, so that the MA programme has by now acquired the broader understanding of a Political Science programme, both in terms of the theoretical approaches and substantive issue-areas and in terms of the programmes’ mission and student body.

Current processes of curriculum development are governed by the standards and procedures of establishing, operating and modifying degree programmes that CEU PU has made transparent by publishing an explicit policy regulating the process (Annex 1.2.5). This policy specifies the main components of proposals for new degree programmes and the types of modification of existing programmes that require senate approval. It also lists the Senate, the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee (SeCur) and the Academic Forum as university-internal bodies involved in establishing new programmes, ensuring broad participation of all university-internal stakeholder groups. The process might benefit from including a policy of external review.

The experts gained knowledge of the students’ perspective on their influence regarding programme development. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee, where they discuss new programmes and changes in existing programmes. The students’ representatives are elected by the Student Union, the representative body articulating the students’ interests vis-à-vis the university’s leadership and administration. Of the ten members of the Senate Curriculum Committee, one is a student representative.

The students affirm in unison the great opportunity for anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes. Additionally, due to the good student-staff-ratio, programme coordinators and individual faculty are available constantly. This informal way offers non-institutionalized influence for the students. The experts got the impression that students feel comfortable by that direct approach and the students’ perceived influence.

The experts consider this criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme- MA Political Science (One-Year)

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university’s quality management system.

According to the application materials, the CEU PU has elaborate quality assurance policies on all levels (regular institutional reviews of the department, teaching evaluation, supervision evaluation, and annual individual faculty’s performance reviews), and the Political Science Department and its MA-programmes are fully integrated in that quality management system.

The Program Proposal of the Department of Political Science states that the Strategic Reviews of the Department, conducted every five years, are most important among these quality assurance measures. The description of that review type in the IAQA Policy (Annex 1.2.4.) suggests a very thorough review, which includes review of the department’s degree programmes. Regular additional short-term and long-term reviews of the department’s MA programmes are additionally conducted to “map the changing interests of the students and collect data on movements, trends etc. in the relevant markets and academia” (Program

Proposal, p. 2). Moreover, there are detailed (and binding) guidelines for workloads and class requirements that faculty adhere to in designing their classes and faculty's annual performance reviews contain information on teaching. Students' teaching evaluations and regular forums for informal exchange on teaching convey additional information about the quality of the MA-programmes.

The specific procedure of the review and evaluation of the programme and staff is confirmed and appreciated by the students and therefore the experts consider the quality assurance to be accomplished.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

1. The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.

The Master's programme in Political Science fits extremely well into the profile and objectives of CEU PU. It shares – and one might even argue: is at the core of – CEU PU's open society mission of educating future professionals in politics, government and international organizations, who are aware of the normative ideals underpinning liberal democracy, understand the political and economic institutions that best approximate those ideals as well as the opportunities and challenges to the realization of an open society (cf. p. 4 of the Program Proposal) and by way of acquiring and disseminating that understanding are critically engaged in promoting democracy. At the same time, CEU PU's MA programmes in Political Science seek to "instil appreciation for, as well as excellence and rigor in, critical reflection and scholarly analysis." (ibid.) Striking a balance between these two aspects, social science research as advocacy and social science research as academic excellence, can amount to walking a fine line. The reading lists on the class syllabi and the publication lists on the faculty CVs, though, indicate that CEU faculty and curriculum-developers are aware of that potential tension and know how to walk that fine line without relinquishing the commitment to the open society or to the academic quality standards.

During a web conference on 2 April 2020, CEU students expressed satisfaction with the university's responsiveness to their needs. They especially highlighted good information and communication on the part of the university with regard to the transition from Budapest to Vienna.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

The programme proposal and each individual class syllabus are very explicit and clear in stating learning outcomes and the overall profile of the programme. In the One-year MA programme the intensity of a short Master's degree programme is emphasized, which despite its short duration, provides students with a comparative perspective on the challenges that contemporary political communities and their citizens face, while at the same time conveying hands on, transferable social science skills. In addition, the Proposal claims that students can join cross-country research projects and attend conferences.

The programme description puts a lot of emphasis on key transferable social science skills, such as abstract reasoning ability, critical thinking, employment of different methods of analysis, an appreciation of the multidisciplinary nature of many social science projects, etc. This is good and appropriate in higher education programmes, and probably a necessity in view of the diversity of backgrounds among students and faculty. In terms of the key social science skills as well as thematically the profile of the department and programme make sense when considered in relation to the CEU PU's overall history and status as an international university, targeting an international audience with regard to both its student body and the research output of its faculty. This is the basis of considering this criterion to be fulfilled.

As affirmed during the web conference on 2 April 2020, current students feel well prepared for many career tracks within and outside academia. This is partly due to a number of additional services and initiatives surrounding the MA programme. Students mention the career service in this context, which provides career network meetings with experts and high-level professionals, as well as counselling services and workshops.

Since most of the students of the CEU PU want to work in academia, they value the fact that the university offers a broad range of methods courses and research opportunities. There are also several academic centres and research groups, in which students can cooperate with professors, "who act not as supervisors but as advisors". An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee.

For those who wish to leave academia, the university offers optional group counselling, which the students considered a major asset and reason for applying at CEU PU in the first place.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The name of the programme is appropriate in that the MA programme covers the predominant part of the substantive profile of the discipline. It also unreservedly matches CEU PU's political open society mission, in which Political Science is a central proponent, as argued above. And

the Political Science Master's commitment to the key social science skills also affirm that the profile of the programme fully and unreservedly matches the name.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

In the one-year programme students earn 60 ECTS, a fifth of which are awarded for the MA Thesis. The structure of the curriculum has a convincing combination of methods training and substantive classes, mandatory and elective subjects, and a sound (albeit extremely dense), organization of the process leading to the MA-thesis. As argued above (2.2.), the range of thematic expertise is somewhat less than comprehensive at two central areas of the discipline, but judging from reading the class syllabi and the faculty's CVs, there is no doubt about the unity of research and teaching at CEU PU- Political Science, and little doubt, also, regarding the success in achieving the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are formulated and described explicitly in several places, such as the Student Handbook and the individual class syllabi (in addition to the Program Proposal), and there are also explicit descriptions of where (in what classes) and how learning outcomes are supposed to be pursued and measured (e.g. Student Handbook, Annex 4.1.).

The components of the curriculum are:

- A preparatory module, in which remedial classes on core competencies are offered (mandatory only to students, who need them depending on degree of credit equivalence between their previous studies and a BA in Political Science; none of which counting toward the 120 ECTS credits for the MA degree)
- Mandatory classes on research design and methodology (12 ECTS)
- Courses in three thematic core modules (covering Comparative Politics, Political Economy, and Political Theory) (24 ECTS),
- Elective classes from a broad range of offerings (12 ECTS) and
- the MA Thesis including thesis-writing advising and workshops (12 ECTS)

This is structurally sensibly designed, and in principle well-suited to achieving the goals and learning outcomes of the overall programme and of the individual modules, as detailed in pp. 22 ff. of the Program Proposal. The programme is extremely dense. During a web-conference with students on 2 April 2020, students reported that the one-year programme comprises two thirds of the contents of the two-year programme. However, they also reported as they were prepared for the intense experience, it is possible to keep up with the pace. One important aspect of this feasibility is the fact that many students start the programme with an idea about the topic of their MA-Theses, so that they can use the coursework during the fall- and the winter-terms to elaborate the theoretical and methodological approaches to that topic. In its practical implementation there is also some flexibility with the extremely tight schedule that

moves MA-theses along from the definition of topics, research questions to exposés and drafts. Dropouts and late submissions are comparatively rare.

Students are also encouraged (but not obliged) to specialize on certain fields of their choice by selecting elective classes in such a way that they accumulate at least 20 ECTS and writing the MA-Thesis in those fields. This in principle is an attractive and sensible option; the thematic range of the available specializations (Comparative Politics, Electoral Politics, Political Communication, Political Economy, Methods, Normative Theory) is clearly communicated and mapped onto the classes available in the specializations.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

The didactic conception of the individual classes fully capitalizes on the excellent learning environment, especially the small learning groups, and teaching by highly research-active faculty (Program Proposal) that this MA programme has the privilege to offer. Interactive, seminar-style components and group-based exercises are a sizable part of the classes' teaching methods. The description of substantive contents in the curriculum's core components, the different modules and their learning outcomes is likewise convincing. The Program Proposal included 58 class syllabi, which are consistently excellent in the way in which they explicate learning outcomes and define teaching tools and reading materials suitable for achieving the learning outcomes.

During the interview conducted with students, they confirm the excellent student-academic staff ratio, which is very helpful for meeting students' needs, facilitating flexibility with regard to course materials, as well as openness for student suggestions regarding classes and how to improve learning conditions. Students affirm the importance of anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes, which was at the basis of their conviction that intended learning outcomes can be achieved despite the density of the programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

Planning teaching and constructing the syllabi of individual courses "must meet departmental guidelines which regulate the length of reading as well as variety of assessment forms" (Program Proposal). The Department has supplied 58 syllabi of the individual classes taught in its MA programmes. Judging from the reading lists and specification of class requirements, workloads are on the higher end, but roughly in line with the specification of ECTS. The choice of class materials and readings on the syllabi is excellent and definitely suitable for achieving the learning outcomes stated in the curriculum and on the syllabi.

Workloads are on the higher end, especially when the requirement is to produce an MA Thesis in addition to earning 48 ECTS' worth of coursework within an academic year. During the web conference on 2 April 2020, students reported that the one-year programme comprises two thirds of the contents of the two-year MA programme in Political Science. However, during this web conference students reported that it is possible to keep up with the pace, because they were prepared for the intense experience of a one-year programme. One important aspect of this feasibility is the fact that many students start the programme with an idea about the topic of their MA-Theses, so that they use the coursework during the fall- and the winter-terms to elaborate the theoretical and methodological approaches to that topic. In its practical implementation there also appears to be some flexibility with the extremely tight schedule that moves MA-theses along from the definition of topics, research questions to exposés and drafts. In the web conference students gave the experts some indication about dropouts and delays in submitting the MA Theses, and both appears to be rare. According to the student participants in the web conference, these cases were the result of individual problems, and not related to the university or the programme structure. Moreover, in cases of health problems, personal circumstances, or other issues that might affect the completion of assignments, deadlines can be postponed, based in goodwill of the academic staff. Late submission of the final thesis will incur a penalty on the final grade, however. In sum, therefore, the students' perspective on CEU PU's strict rules regarding deadlines is rather positive; they are handled more flexibly than they appear in the written materials.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

Examination methods and policies on grading and course requirements are transparent to students in the Student Handbook (Annex 4.2.) and in the CEU Student Rights Policy (Annex 1.2.7). Moreover, the Syllabi of the individual classes also outline the bases of grading clearly. Especially in their heavy emphasis on interactive assignments such as individual or group presentations, papers asking for students assessments and positions, or analyses of social science scholarship are especially suited for evaluating the quality of students' judgment, critical thinking and ability employ rigorous social science methodology. Information about grading and examination standards is abundant and clear.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issue.⁴

⁴ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

CEU PU has submitted an example of a sample Diploma Supplement in Annex 4.4, which lists all the major components of the curriculum and provides information about core features or the programme, admissions and grading, as well as information about the Austrian higher education system. This complies with the requirements of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung (UHSBV)).

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA Political Science (One-Year)

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

Admissions criteria are "set in accordance with internationally-recognized standards and tests to ensure [...] a pool of excellent applicants." (Program Proposal, p. 2); the explicit lists of application materials and admission standards (pp. 8 ff.) in the Program Proposal are in line with prevalent standards and appropriate for the programme. The crucial prerequisites of the one-year MA is a four-year Bachelor's degree (180 ECTS) in Political Science or a related academic discipline and proof of adequate English language competency.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (One-Year)

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The admissions process is transparently described in the Program Proposal and the Draft Admissions Policy. It is organized in such a way that fairness and the overall merit-based orientation of the selection procedures are ensured. It is a three-step procedure, comprising a first (departmental) selection based on the written application materials, a second stage in which applicants are invited to take an online interview, and a third stage, on which applicants are ranked based on merit. Formal letters of acceptance are issued by the admissions office, which also communicates decisions on financial aid. Writing sample and various forms of statements of purpose, statements of research interests and an exposition of a significant Political Science problem are required and, together with recommendation letters, offer the chance of looking behind the schematic information of grades and tests.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA Political Science (One-Year)

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

CEU PU participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Therefore, recognition of foreign qualifications is granted and in line with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications, as was adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee.

The CEU PU Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations (Annex 1.2.7) clarify in a transparent way the credit transfer policy of CEU PU: Students are allowed to use "up to 16 ECTS credits non-degree credits towards a CEU PU degree. In the case of students enrolled in two-year master's programmes and doctoral programmes, students can request a transfer of up to 30 ECTS credits."

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff - MA Political Science (One-Year)

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

The Student Handbook (Annex 4.1.) lists 20 permanent faculty as teachers in the department, some of whom are joint appointments or part time faculty. According to the Program Proposal, there are 13 full-time faculty in the department, plus six part-time faculty and currently four visiting faculty. This is an extremely generous staff-situation for advising and teaching incoming cohorts of 20 students in the 2-year programme, and 40-45 students in the 1-year programme.

With three people in administrative positions CEU PU's political science department ranges below what would be expected at many universities in the German-speaking countries; at the other hand CEU PU offers generous departmental support when it comes to research.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (One-Year)

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

In the supplementary video the student-teacher ratio is described as 7:1; a prospective development in the direction of 10:1 is mentioned as university-wide number on student-teacher ratios. This, of course, is much more favourable than any public university in Austria can dream of offering in the Social Sciences and Humanities, and it makes for an excellent learning environment.

MA students consider their supervision to be excellent. According to the participants in the web conference on 2 April 2020, all academic staff are very helpful and flexible. Most important for students, academic staff is available when they need them.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (One-Year)

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

Professors are hired and promoted based on merit and according to procedures akin to the search committee- and Habilitation / tenure-track procedures that are prevalent in most European and North American universities. The detailed descriptions are in the Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1). Against the backdrop of the Austrian context it is noteworthy that hiring and promotion procedures are organized in a way that is less inclusive (academic self-government-based) and more top-down than is customary at Austrian public universities. The subject-specific core competences are covered by professors in primary occupation.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (One-Year)

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

Judging from the faculty CVs, the members of the Political Science faculty have good educational backgrounds, are well published and active in the academic (and political) communities of their respective fields. If there is some selectivity in the range of thematic fields covered by the CEU Political Science faculty as a whole, then this is matched by a corresponding selectivity in its curriculum, so that the academic staff of the department can definitely fulfil all the tasks required by the degree programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA Political Science (One-Year)

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

The Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1.) lists explicit – albeit flexible – ratios of time for research, teaching, and administration. A moderate teaching load, generous possibilities for granting sabbaticals, and funds for research and conference-related travel ensure that there is enough time for research. Furthermore, the Academic Staff Handbook lists an explicit restriction on the number of MA theses that any individual faculty member should supervise, so that workloads for teaching and supervision should not diverge dramatically among faculty members, and a balance between teaching and research is easier to maintain.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding – MA Political Science (One-Year)

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

In its mission CEU PU states in general, that it "will be a financially independent and sustainable institution". And it further defines the aim of the Endowment as "to support the University's operations irrespective of the University's location and accreditation framework". According to CEU PU's MA Political Science Program Proposal, "the funding of the programs offered by the Department of Political Science is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue generated by the Department and from the central budget of CEU PU. Most programs at CEU PU are funded primarily through the CEU PU endowment fund, rather than through tuition revenue, to ensure broad access to education..." As detailed in the Program Proposal, planned expenditures, covering all relevant expenses, are sufficiently covered by and the CEU Endowment Funding [...] and – to a very small extent, by expected tuition fees [...]. The available documents detailing the budget, financial plan, the endowment and the assets demonstrate that the funding is secured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure – MA Political Science (One-Year)

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

Detailed information on CEU PU infrastructure and library is provided in Annex 1.1, "Introduction to CEU PU" and Annex 1.3. on the CEU PU Campus. According to these documents adequate facilities and equipment are provided for students and staff of the degree programme. CEU PU in its new location in Vienna is leasing a 21,000 m² property which will provide adequate facilities for students and staff such as an auditorium, lecture and seminar rooms, a media lab, the library and a reading room equipped with computers, as well as offices for visiting staff and researchers. Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted.

The resources include a well-established library that so far functioned at CEU Budapest, which contains extensive print and electronic collections, as well as access to a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development and/or the advancement and appreciation of the arts

Research and development – MA Political Science (One-Year)

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

Procedures for hiring, promoting, and monitoring the work of academic staff are designed to ensure high quality and continuous activity in both research and teaching research. CEU PU is also ranked highly in university rankings.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development - MA Political Science (One-Year)

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

The Political Sciences Department has established several research groups: Conflict and Security Research Group (CONSEC), Migration Research Group (MiRG), Political Behavior Research Group (PolBeRG), Political Economy Research Group (PERG), Political, Legal and Moral Theory Research Group (POLEMO), The Middle East and North Africa Space (MENAS). In addition, the Department of Political Science organises an annual sequence of departmental seminars. The seminars provide the occasion for faculty, distinguished guest as well as advanced and first year PhD students to present their work.

CEU PU has procedures of performance monitoring (annual activity reports and reviews; described in the Academic Staff Handbook; Annex 1.2.1.) that amount to extremely tight supervision by Austrian standards. There is a firm expectation of excellent publication output and activity in the scientific community, and the academic faculty's CVs reflect this.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - MA Political Science (One-Year)

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

The Political Science department has a range of ERASMUS agreements with European universities, so that MA students have the opportunity to study abroad. There are visiting professors in the department on a regular basis, and MA students will also benefit from the extremely diverse backgrounds and internationalism of the Political Science department's academic staff. The department also hosts the Summer School in Methods and Techniques of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR).

There is also a range of research groups and departmental seminars, in which students and faculty can exchange ideas and get acquainted to the style and norms of academic colloquia.

In the video input provided for the accreditation the rector of CEU PU also stated it as an advantage and an expectation of CEU PU's move to Vienna that students may benefit from the city's dense concentration of international institutions and its business community.

There are ample opportunities for MA students to get involved in research activities and international exchange. One would expect nothing less from a university as internationalized as CEU PU.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

5.8 Summary and final evaluation- MA Political Science (One-Year)

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

Since its inception in 1993, MA-level teaching in the Political Science Department at CEU PU has evolved into a full-fledged Political Science education from its more specialized beginnings. Both curriculum development and quality control are now rule-bound and rational, and the procedures ensure that changes in the curriculum and/or programme management will not undermine the programme's quality standards or its core substantive commitments.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

The Political Science MA is at the core of CEU PU's open society mission, and it is also committed to the standards of rigorous and state of the Political Science research and teaching. There is ample evidence in the curriculum and especially the syllabi of individual classes that the MA programme is well-suited for achieving these objectives. The learning experience is intense, but research-oriented and in close contact with research-active faculty members. Students gain knowledge about core subfields of Political Science, as well competencies in key transferrable social science skills. The structure of the programme is well-designed in accordance with the programme profile, with classes, regulations for MA Thesis advising, and formal graduation requirements designed to ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. Students' workload can be regarded as feasible within the stipulated duration of studies. Examination rules and admission requirements are clearly defined and transparently communicated and a sample diploma supplement that meets the requirements is provided.

Staff:

CEU PU offers competitive salaries, generous working conditions, and a vibrant intellectual atmosphere. As a result, it has been able to hire highly qualified and active scholars. Procedures for hiring and promoting staff are rational, transparent, and highly competitive. As a result, the Political Science MA programmes are delivered by highly qualified academic staff, as the faculty CVs demonstrate. And there are many academic staff members, such that student-teacher ratios are very favourable.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided during the entire period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

CEU PU is renting 21,000 m² of classrooms, offices, library, and study space. This will provide adequate facilities for students and staff. Additional 8,000 m² of office space are currently adapted. Rooms are well-equipped and the library contains extensive print and electronic

collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

Research and development:

Procedures for hiring, promoting, and monitoring the work of academic staff are designed to ensure high quality and continuous activity in both research and teaching research. This is reflected in the CVs and publication lists of academic staff, as well as in the placement statistics of the programme's graduates. CEU PU is also ranked highly in university rankings.

Co-operation:

There are ample opportunities as well as generous financial support for MA students to get involved in research activities and international exchange. . One would expect nothing less from a university as internationalized as CEU PU.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the Master programme Political Science (One-Year).

MA in International Relations (Two-Year)

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	International Relations (Two-Year)
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	120
Standard study period	2 academic years (6 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20-25 per year and cohort
Academic Degree	Master of Arts (MA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 12.000 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

6 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – Master in International Relations (Two-Year)

6.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

CEU PU developed the One-Year MA in International Relations in 1993. At that time, the university was settled down in Prague. Since then CEU PU has developed an institutionalized structure for further evaluating and developing the program. Doing so, the university administration invited regularly external experts to review and evaluate the degree programs. According to the Annex 1.2.5. - CEU PU Policy on Degree Programs, the institution has

developed a policy that specifies the rules for establishing, operating and modifying degree programmes.

The programme is offered by the Department of International Relations and was established originally in 2016 to complement a one-year Masters programme in International Relations. Today it is one of the major MA programmes on offer by CEU PU in accordance with its profile and mission. According to the procedure adopted by CEU PU mentioned in the Annex 1.2.5, the establishment of the programme was consulted with the relevant bodies within the University (the Provost, the Rector and the Academic Forum) and approved by the Senate upon recommendation of the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee.

During their interview with students, the experts gained a better understanding of the students' perspective on their influence regarding programme development. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee where they discuss new programmes and changes to existing programmes. The students' representatives are elected by the Student union, the representation of students' interest towards the administration. All together there are 10 people involved in the Senate Curriculum Committee; one of these 10 members of the committee is a student representative.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university's quality management system.

CEU PU has developed a robust university's quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA). Each degree programme upon its establishment and accreditation is integrated into the quality management system. This includes regular external reviews (from both within and outside of CEU PU) and annual internal reviews by the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee which provides assessment and recommendations. This includes a process for continuous assessment of the quality of the programme, especially in terms of achieving the programme's learning outcomes.

According to the CEU PU application, an ongoing quality assurance review and curriculum development of the programme are also subject of regular discussions and meetings which involve participation of students' representative and are organized monthly at its host Department of International Relations. As stated in IAQA, the annual assessment of the programme will focus on the implementation of its Action Plan, trends in admissions and graduation of students in the programme, achievement of programme-level learning outcomes and students' feedback. Students are required to assess anonymously each component of the degree programme after its completion.

The specific procedure of the review and evaluation of staff is confirmed and appreciated by the students.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore

address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

1. The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.

The MA in International Relations is closely connected with the CEU PU's profile, mission and objectives, and is in line with the institution's development plan. First of all, the programme has interdisciplinary nature and thus the programme's structure encourages students to take specific modules that are already interdisciplinary (e.g. student can combine international law, political economy, sociology, political ethnography, aesthetics, and history). And the focus on the value of diversity and plurality responds to the mission of the CEU PU and its profile as a leading institution that promotes the idea of an open society. As stated in the application document, the MA in International Relations follows one of the main CEU PU strategic objectives which assumes an ongoing process of "exploring and negotiating difference" that allows for creation of a common institutional identity through the process of teaching and learning. For this purpose, a rich curriculum is provided that allows for a broad approach to the IR discipline, which is in line with the aim of "a rewarding and holistic way of approaching the major questions of world politics". The programme is also in line with the University's mission and goal to establish an English-speaking international academic community, which is diverse and engages in "critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, world-class research, and community engagement".

CEU PU has a clear and well-defined development plan (Annex 1.1), according to which its degree programmes are well integrated into the institution's strategy to be a globally-competitive institution of advanced learning committed to attaining academic excellence. This naturally applies to the MA programme in International Relations as evidenced in the programme description. Many other aspects of the CEU PU strategic development plan apply to the programme in its various components such as admissions to the programme, its curriculum, quality assurance, student aid and international cooperation.

During an online interview with representatives of the student body, the representatives highlighted especially the well guided and informed transition period. The experts get the impression that students feel comfortable by that well-suited information policy which indicates that the CEU PU is open for students' participation to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

According to the Programme proposal, the MA in International Relations (Two-Year) has been designed as a full-time programme that prepares students for various professional career paths in academia, government, international organizations, NGOs, think tanks or private business. The programme profile is well-defined and is well-integrated into the mission and profile of the institution. Its main features are its interdisciplinary nature and comprehensiveness which

allows students to grasp and understand the complex interconnectedness of such subfields as foreign policy, international security, global economy, and international organization, in accordance with the overall aim to provide a "big picture/close focus". The programme profile corresponds with the CEU PU mission which focuses on providing first-class education and research-oriented degree programmes.

The intended learning outcomes have been designed in accordance with the programme profile, its objectives, but also in accordance with the respective level (VII) of the National Qualification Framework. The evidence can be found in the Programme proposal as well as in the course syllabi provided. According to the Programme proposal, this degree programme aims at providing students with solid theoretical grounding in the field of international relations (knowledge) as well as the ability to formulate relevant research questions (skills). Thus, the learning outcomes have been defined as a set of abilities that allow students to demonstrate certain understandings, skills or competencies after graduation. The Programme Proposal strongly emphasizes solid theoretical grounding in the field of IR that students obtain and, thus, it pays a lot of attention to theoretical understanding of relevant issues, critical thinking as well as understanding and use of methods and research skills. These general abilities are translated into specific learning outcomes in the description of modules and the course syllabi. The formulation of the learning outcome at the level of the obligatory and optional modules is descriptive and perhaps would sound clearer if formulated as well-defined set of intended learning outcomes that follow three categories: 1. Knowledge, 2. Skills, 3. Competences. At the level of course syllabi the description of learning outcomes varies, but they certainly follow the focus of the programme (general learning outcomes) and its teaching and learning philosophy. The evidence can be found in the Programme proposal as well as in the course syllabi provided.

The profile and the learning outcomes are oriented towards NQF-level VII.

During experts' online interview with representatives of the student body, the students' representatives of the programme said that they feel well prepared for academia and for professional jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the great offer of additional services. An accompanying offer best practice example is the well-suited career service of the CEU PU which provides career network meetings with experts and high rank visitors as well as counselling and workshops. The university provides a broad offer of method courses and research opportunities. Students can also create and join various research groups.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The name of the degree programme is very traditional, as international relations is a well-established discipline of social science. The name closely corresponds to the degree programme's profile and its content. The focus of the programme is on the fundamentals of the discipline of IR including its methods, research design as well as on selected specific areas of international relations which include: 1. International Relations Theory and International Law, 2. International Political Economy and Development and 3. International Political Sociology and History, as well as an additional optional New York Module provided in collaboration with Bard College in New York. This interesting and comprehensive structure makes the programme unique, interdisciplinary and attractive to students. The academic degree that students obtain

has good grounding in the discipline of international relations and involves a significant research component.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

The contents and the structure of the programme curriculum has been designed in accordance with the programme profile, its duration and intended general learning outcomes. The structure combines three mandatory modules (Research Design and Methods, Thesis and Introductory Module), three thematic modules (International Relations Theory and International Law, International Political Economy and Development, International Political Sociology and History) and an Optional New York Module offered in collaboration with Bard College in New York. The curriculum is very rich and interdisciplinary. The structure of the programme is well-designed and allows students to acquire knowledge and understanding of the fundamentals of the discipline (Introductory module) at advanced level as well as research skills and in-depth knowledge of various aspects of International Relations that interests students most (thematic modules). Such structure ensures that students achieve intended learning outcomes as regards knowledge, skills and competences. Teaching tools as in-class discussions and grounded presentations support the overall structures. As the CEU PU is a research-oriented university, it is also evident in this programme's description that students acquire a certain amount of research training, become familiar with methodology of the IR discipline, develop their own research design and write a thesis. Generally, the CEU PU encourages students to do question-oriented research, therefore special focus is put on the development of broad knowledge about research tools and designs to answer research questions. When it comes to learning outcomes, the two mandatory modules are more research skills oriented (e.g. "capability for independent analytical work", "methodological and writing skills") while the introductory and thematic modules are more knowledge and competence oriented, but they also provide for various skills such as problem solving or independent thinking. At the level of individual courses there is evidence (as defined in the syllabi) that all three components of learning outcomes are present (knowledge, skills and competences).

Course syllabi and information on course instructors have been provided as well as a detailed programme structure. Each course syllabus provides information on the module it belongs to, short description, course outline, learning activities and teaching methods, course literature (mandatory as well as additional), learning outcomes, and forms of assessment/examination.

The descriptions of intended learning outcomes in the course syllabi vary as regards their formulation and it would be better if they followed the same pattern and used active verbs. Especially the competence component is not always clearly defined in each syllabus section devoted to intended learning outcomes.

The university provides a broad offer of methodology courses and research opportunities. Students can create research groups that consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors. An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee. Accordingly, CEU PU ensures that intended learning outcomes are achieved through the curriculum as well as broadened through additional offers.

Students feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the great offer of additional services.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that the University considers a revision of the programme intended learning outcomes provided in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills and competences as well as according to the newest standards in learning outcomes design (e.g. using active verbs, and the Bloom's taxonomy).

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

In accordance with the programme profile, the courses are seminar-based and include active students' participation in class discussion and in various other class activities such as presentations or case-study analysis. The learning outcomes envisaged by the mandatory modules correspond with teaching methods used – as evidenced in the course syllabi. These methods include active involvement of students in acquiring appropriate research and methodological skills such as academic writing skills and independent research design. As indicated in the course syllabi, the learning activities and teaching methods designed for all three thematic modules are similar and follow the same pattern of seminar-based courses. It is ensured that students' learning is active, they are supposed to be well-prepared for the class discussion and actively involved in class activities. These class activities, which are very standard such as class discussion and students' presentations are combined with short lectures by the professional staff that prepare students for their own independent reading and analysis. The didactic conception of the programme is in line with its level and the overall profile and ensures that the intended programme learning outcomes are achieved.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that the University considers introducing certain innovations in teaching methods to include such methods as problem solving, student portfolio, peer assessment, study visits, etc. as well as the use of educational technologies.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

This two-year Master degree programme comprises of obligatory and elective modules for which the workload varies depending on the module's content, duration and learning outcomes. There seems to be a clear correspondence between the workload as it is designed in the programme structure, course syllabi and the intended learning outcomes. 1 ECTS credit equals 30 hours of learning activities, of which 5 hours are contact hours spent in a classroom, and 25 hours are for out of class independent student's work. The ratio between obligatory and elective modules is adequate. Students earn 52 ECTS in obligatory modules (or 68 ECTS if they attend the Optional New York Module) and 68 ECTS in elective modules (50 ECTS if they attend the

Optional New York Module). Interestingly, an internship is not mandatory unless a student chooses to attend the Optional New York Module. Students' workload in each of the six semesters varies and ranges from 12-24 ECTS per semester. The programme structure envisages a significant number of hours of independent student work that along with contact hours contributes to the achievement of intended learning outcomes. The ECTS system is applied correctly, as the students' overall workload is considered and, thus, reflects the overall workload required to complete the degree programme. Attendance of classes is required, which also contributes to appropriate design of student's workload.

In the online interview with representatives of the student body, it was stated that dropping out of the degree programme hardly ever happens. Students of the programme confirmed that the workload is feasible and allows for completion of the programme within two years.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

The CEU PU has adopted clear examination rules. They are defined in the document entitled Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations (Annex 1.2.7). Chapter 4 of the document describes all relevant policies such as scheduling of examinations and deadlines, content and forms of examinations, anti-plagiarism software, grading, feedback and retakes. The examination methods adopted by the MA programme in International Relations correspond with the programme profile, its didactic content and the intended learning outcomes. These methods include both examinations and various other forms of coursework such as: midterm exams, final exams, take-home exams, individual or team presentations, literature reviews, papers, as well as course-specific forms of coursework. Each course has a clearly defined required number and form of examination. CEU PU transparently outlines which exam to what extent counts towards the final grade of the course. Annex 1.2.7 creates transparency regarding grading rules of each exam. All courses combine several different methods of assessment, depending on the intended learning outcomes although the syllabi do not specifically indicate how each intended learning outcome is assessed. Providing such information in the course syllabi in the future would be desirable.

There are also clear rules implemented as regards the final examination that leads to the award of the relevant degree. The document included as Annex 1.2.7 stipulates the form and period of final examination, the structure of the final examination board, the examination results and the rules concerning the retake of final examination.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that a more specific description could be provided in the course syllabi indicating which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issued.⁵

CEU PU in the Annex 3.2 provided a sample diploma supplement. It includes all necessary information about the degree achieved such as information identifying the qualification, information on the level of the qualification, on the contents and results gained as well as information on the Austrian higher education system. The diploma supplement complies with the requirements.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The admission requirements have been clearly defined by the CEU PU Program Proposal MA International Relations (Two-year). Applicants must have completed three-years undergraduate studies in social science or humanities. Since the study and working language of the CEU PU is English, applicants must demonstrate English proficiency, according to Annex 1.2.2. where the required score of standardized English language tests is indicated. Generally, candidates are evaluated based on their academic merit, especially academic achievements, strength of recommendations and general compatibility with the aims of the relevant programme. Additionally, CEU PU specifies in a transparent way the documents needed for application. The requirements for the MA IR (two-year) are the online application form, an essay and/or statement of purpose, a curriculum vitae, academic records, official copy of the university diploma/degree certificate in the original language, full transcript, the official English language translation of the diploma as well as of the transcript, one or two letters of recommendation and proof of the English language proficiency. The applicants must also submit an essay concerning an outline of their research question.

The official admission requirements correspond to the provisions of the qualification level in line with the Universities Act (UG).

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

CEU PU provides a transparent and clearly defined admission procedure. As outlined in Annex 1.2.2. the Admission process is divided into three stages. Firstly, the applications are examined to comply with formal or content requirements. Complying applications will be forwarded to the selection committees of each academic programme. Secondly, applicants are invited to attend

⁵ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

interviews after a first blind review of two faculty members who evaluate the applications independently. Finally, the selection committees rank candidates based on the materials and interviews using a point system. According to the Program Proposal, points are given for the two letters of recommendation, two essays (statement of purpose and an outline of the proposed research question), educational background and academic records, professional background (if any) and overall potential. Best practice of transparency is the documentation of the admission process as well as the final decision.

The experts consider the described procedure as clearly defined and as ensuring a fair and transparent selection, in accordance with the admission requirements and the required competences.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

According to the CEU PU Program proposal for the MA International Relations (Two-year), the university participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Therefore, recognition of foreign qualifications is granted in line with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications as was adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee. Annex 1.2.7 CEU PU Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations clarifies the credit transfer policy of CEU PU. In case of the Two-year MA programme, students can apply to a transfer of up to 30 ECTS credits that have not been used before to satisfy degree requirements for any other degree unless negotiated otherwise explicitly with the higher education institution. The course that is subject to the transfer must have been passed and the course must be at the graduate level. CEU PU has listed additional specific criteria applicable to the transfer of credits.

CEU PU provides an application form for the credit transfer. In Annex 1.2.7 the private university defines the procedure of the recognition process transparently and accurately. No later than the beginning of the registration period, after having contacted their department coordinator / department head, students submit their application forms to the Student Records Office. The application requires an official transcript of the courses and grades achieved, the course outline of the educational institution. The Provost decides about the approval based on the recommendation of the Head of the relevant department.

CEU PU will seek to establish whether the differences with relevant qualifications are not too substantial to allow recognition.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

According to the documents provided (Preliminary contracts), relevant members of staff have been offered contracts to teaching positions at the CEU PU on a full-time and a part-time basis. Preliminary agreements specify the respective position and the envisaged extent of employment or teaching load as well as the period of the contract.

The MA in International Relations programme will be delivered by a number of members of teaching staff which includes full professors, associate professors, assistant professors and visiting professors. According to the Programme proposal, there are 12 full-time members of teaching staff and 4 part-time members of teaching staff devoted to the programme's teaching.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

As stated in the Program Proposal, the scientific staff consists of 12 full-time and 4 part-time members. There is hence a very good ratio, according to the expected student quantity per cohort of about 20 to 25.

As stated during the interview with students' representatives, they consider their supervision to be excellent. Most important from the students' perspective, academic staff is available when they need them. Thus, the supervision of and academic support for students is ensured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

The CEU PU provided a list of the core subject areas per degree programme with names of professors in primary occupation responsible for the programme teaching components. Members of teaching staff have sufficient competence in all specific areas of the degree programme including core subjects, methodology of the IR discipline as well as specific subject areas such as international political economy, political history, international law.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

On the basis of provided documentation (CVs of members of teaching staff employed by CEU PU) it can be concluded that all members of scientific staff who teach for the MA degree programme in International Relations have relevant qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of IR. They all have obtained their PhD degrees, often from prestigious or well-recognized academic institutions in several countries, they have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. CEU PU professors teaching International Relations have expertise in the field documented by numerous publications in internationally recognized academic journals or academic presses. Their research potential is demonstrated by research grants, including ERC and Horizon 2020, and by projects they are involved in as documented in CVs of all faculty members.

The experts consider the criterion to **be fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

The Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1.) lists explicit – albeit flexible – ratios of time for research, teaching, and administration. A moderate teaching load, generous possibilities for granting sabbaticals, and funds for research and conference-related travel ensure that there is enough time for research. Furthermore, the Academic Staff Handbook lists an explicit restriction on the number of MA theses that any individual faculty member should supervise, so that workloads for teaching and supervision should not diverge dramatically among faculty members, and a balance between teaching and research is easier to maintain.

The CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook distinguishes between resident academic staff and visiting faculty. Resident academic staff (including all resident faculty members) is expected to divide their 40 working hours per week in “teaching (including supervision) 30-50%, research (including research management) 30-50%, other administration 20-40%.” Generally, research staff is expected to be engaged in research (including research management) at least 90% of their time. Research and research management consists of formal teaching (24 ECTS over the course at two terms; University Professors only 16 ECTS), thesis (research, writing) supervision and consultation with students, open office hours (four hours per week), examination and evaluation duties, duties in admissions and recruitment; participation in the administration of the unit and of CEU PU (service on University or Senate committees, etc.), participation in unit and CEU PU research projects, directing of researchers, regular research and publication, preparation and delivery of papers to the scholarly or professional community (or comparable contributions), service to the wider community. Visiting faculty, in contrast, is primarily occupied in teaching. Since the CEU PU takes on visiting faculty to expand student’s knowledge, there are three visiting faculty involved in the IR Master programme.

Considering the ECTS credit quantity and the teaching workload related to time to be spend on research, there is a well-calculated relation between teaching and research. Furthermore, the additional visiting faculty facilitates resident faculty to focus on research.

According to the Annex 1.1, the CEU PU invests in continuous staff development which is one of the important priority areas for the institution under the goal of developing and strengthening One CEU. For this purpose, a set of professional measures and training opportunities related to further professional development will be established at the institution's level. The document gives several examples of such measures.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

The funding of the MA degree programme in International Relations, as stated in the Program Proposal, is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue generated by the Department and from the central budget of the CEU PU, funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund. As documented in Annex 1.1 and Annex 1.4 the CEU PU Endowment Fund and the institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided. The planned expenses that include all relevant categories as well as expected revenues of the Department of International Relations for academic year 2020/2021 have been provided. Planned expenditure for the upcoming academic year will be covered from centrally allocated budget.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

Detailed information on CEU PU infrastructure and library is provided in Annex 1.1, "Introduction to CEU PU" and Annex 1.3. on the CEU PU Campus. According to these documents adequate facilities and equipment are provided for students and staff of the degree programme. CEU PU in its new location in Vienna is leasing a 21,000 m² property which will provide adequate facilities for students and staff such as an auditorium, lecture and seminar rooms, a media lab, the library and a reading room equipped with computers, as well as offices for visiting staff and researchers. Additional 8,000 square-meters space are currently adapted.

The resources include a well-established library that so far functioned at CEU Budapest, which contains extensive print and electronic collections, as well as access to a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development

Research and development - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

CEU PU aims at being a globally-competitive institution of advanced research. Its scientific staff in primary occupation at CEU PU is required to produce world-class research and conduct research projects that are funded from internal and external funds including EU research funds. As stipulated in Annex 2.2 the Department of International Relations follows a well-defined research concept. The annex also outlines some of the academic accomplishments of scientific staff in terms of outstanding international publications, major professional awards, research grants, events and centres. It also summarizes the research themes and strategies pursued by scholars associated with the degree programme. The Annex as well as CVs of the members of the Department of International Relations provide sufficient evidence that the scientific staff affiliated with the MA programmes in International Relations are involved in research and development activities relevant to their field.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

Research is a cornerstone activity for all academic units at the CEU PU. With their team of well-equipped researchers and practitioners in International Relations the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding as many awards and grants indicate. The department encourages faculty research through funding support for attendance at scholarly conferences and through in-house seminars and workshops, with the expectation that research is published. Additionally, the scientific staff is evaluated regularly once a year. Especially, the review focus is set on research leadership (creation and management of external and internal research groups, programmes, centres, and networks), research management, and efforts and success in attaining external funding for research. Since the CEU PU aims at becoming a leading research institution, research staff is required to publish "in scholarly periodicals and at academic publishing houses of international stature." (Annex 1.2.1)

According to the CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook, the evaluation process consists of two stages: re-appointment review and promotion review. The assessment criteria are clearly defined by general guidelines with added specific departmental criteria concerning the length of the publication, the language, the ranking of a peer-reviewed journal, monographies, chapters in books, co-authoring, editing and not yet published publications. Due to the CEU PU's overall aim to secure quality research, the planned research performances and their evaluation fit in the IR publishing culture as demonstrated by provided lists of publications and research projects.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

Generally, CEU PU takes part in the ERASMUS+ framework and encourages its students and staff – both academic and administrative to maintain and expand their professional networks and expertise as states in Annex 1.1. The CEU offers paid research leaves according to the Academic Staff Handbook policies. To facilitate access to information, CEU PU established the Academic Cooperation and Research Support Office (ACRO) that will regularly hold workshops on externally funded research and grant management. The MA programmes in International Relations have an external partner programme in New York City: Bard Globalization and International Affairs (BGIA). In 2018-2019 three groups of students from the two-years MA from then CEU joined BGIA. According to the Programme proposal, this cooperation will continue in the future for CEU PU students and is officially included in the programme curriculum. According to the website, CEU PU is globally very well-connected through a large number of partnerships with universities all over the world. Besides conducting research together, they offer students and staff exchange opportunities and encourage to expand their professional networks.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

6.8 Summary and final evaluation - MA International Relations (Two-Year)

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

The Two-year MA International Relations programme is offered by the Department of International Relations and was established 2016 in accordance with the relevant procedure. CEU PU has established a quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA). Each degree programme upon its establishment and accreditation is integrated into the quality management system. The experts consider all relevant Stakeholders to be involved in the quality management process.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

This interdisciplinary programme is closely connected with the CEU PU's profile, mission and objectives, and is in line with the institution's development plan that stresses critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning as well as world-class research. The intended programme learning outcomes have been designed in accordance with the programme profile, its objectives, and the respective level (VII) of the National Qualification Framework. Thanks to its interdisciplinary nature and comprehensiveness of the programme students as well as additional career-oriented services graduates are well-prepared to follow various professions in academia, public and private sector as well as international organizations.

The structure of the programme is well-designed in accordance with the programme profile and allows students to acquire knowledge and understanding of the fundamentals of the discipline at advanced level as well as research skills and in-depth knowledge of various aspects of

International Relations that interests students most through thematic modules. The curriculum as well as teaching methods and formal graduation requirements ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. Students' workload can be regarded as feasible and ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies. Examination rules and admission requirements are clearly defined and transparently communicated and a sample diploma supplement that meets the requirements is provided.

Staff:

The programme will be delivered by a sufficient number of teaching staff who have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. The student-staff ratio is very good and all members of scientific staff who teach for this degree programme have relevant qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of International Relations. Many members of staff are engaged in research projects and are recognized specialists in their fields. A moderate teaching load and additional supplies for the academic staff ensure that there is enough time for research. CEU PU invests in continuous staff development which prioritizes research.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund, which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided during the whole period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

21,000 m² property will provide adequate facilities for students and staff. Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted. Rooms are well equipped, and the library contains extensive print and electronic collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals. This infrastructure will facilitate students and staff's research and learning activities.

Research and development:

The Department of International Relations follows a well-defined research concept. With their team of well-equipped researchers and practitioners in International Relations, the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding as many awards and grants indicate.

CEU PU aims at becoming a leading research institution. So, research staff is obligated to publish regularly in internationally relevant academic journals. Their performance doing so is part of the evaluation process in accordance with CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook. Therefore, the planned research performance and their evaluation fit in the IR publishing culture.

Co-operation:

CEU PU is well-connected with the external partner programme Bard Globalization and International Affairs at Bard College in New York City. Additionally, the university takes part in the ERASMUS+ framework and encourages students and staff to expand their professional networks through exchange and conferences. A generous financial support is granted by CEU PU to facilitate the international exchange.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the Master programme International Relations (Two-year).

The expert panel members have the following **recommendations to CEU PU**.

- The experts recommend that the University considers a revision of the programme intended learning outcomes provided in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills and competences as well as according to the newest standards in learning outcomes design (e.g. using active verbs, and the Bloom's taxonomy).
- The experts recommend that a more specific description could be provided in the course syllabi indicating which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.

MA in International Relations (One-Year)

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	International Relations (One-Year)
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	60
Standard study period	1 academic year (3 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20-25 per year and cohort
Academic Degree	Master of Arts (MA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 12.000 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

7 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in International Relations (One-Year)

7.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA International Relations (One-Year)

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

CEU PU developed the One-Year MA in International Relations in 1993. At that time the university was settled down in Prague. Since then CEU PU has developed an institutionalized structure for further evaluating and developing the programme. Doing so, the university administration regularly invited external experts to review and evaluate the degree

programmes. According to the Annex 1.2.5. – CEU PU Policy on Degree Programs, the institution has developed a policy that specifies the rules for establishing, operating, and modifying degree programmes.

The establishment of a new programme needs to be consulted with the relevant bodies within the University (the Provost, the Rector and the Academic Forum) and approved by the Senate upon recommendation of the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee.

The programme is offered by the Department of International Relations and was established as one of the major MA programmes offered by CEU PU in accordance with its profile and mission. At the same time, it is one of the oldest programmes that was offered by CEU Budapest.

During their interview with the students, the experts gained a better understanding of the students' perspective on their influence regarding programme development. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee where they discuss new programmes, and programme changes. The students' representatives are elected by the Student union, the representation of students' interest towards the administration. All together there are 10 people involved in the Senate Curriculum Committee; one of these 10 members of the committee is a student representative.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA International Relations (One-Year)

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university's quality management system.

CEU PU has developed a robust university's quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA). Each degree programme upon its establishment and accreditation is integrated into the quality management system. This includes regular external reviews (from both within and outside of CEU PU) and annual internal reviews by the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee which provides assessment and recommendations. A process for continuous assessment of the quality of the programme has been established, and it concerns especially the achievement of the programme's learning outcomes.

According to the CEU PU application, an ongoing quality assurance review and curriculum development of the programme are also subject of regular discussions and meetings which involve participation of students' representative and are organized monthly at its host Department of International Relations. As stated in IAQA, the annual assessment of the programme will focus on the implementation of its Action Plan, trends in admissions and graduation of students in the programme, achievement of programme-level learning outcomes and students' feedback. Students are required to assess anonymously each component of the degree programme after its completion.

The specific procedure of the review and evaluation of staff is confirmed and appreciated by the students and therefore the experts consider the quality assurance to be accomplished.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

1. The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.

The MA in International Relations is closely connected with the CEU PU's profile, mission and objectives, and is in line with the institution's development plan. First of all, the programme has interdisciplinary nature as it encourages students to choose among many courses offered by the University, and as such responds to the mission of the CEU PU and its profile as a leading institution that promotes the idea of an open society. As stated in the application document, the MA in International Relations follows one of the main CEU PU strategic objectives which assumes an ongoing process of "exploring and negotiating difference" that allows for creation of a common institutional identity through the process of teaching and learning. For this purpose, a rich curriculum is provided that allows for a broad approach to the IR discipline, which is in line with the aim of "a rewarding and holistic way of approaching the major questions of world politics".

The programme is also in line with the University's mission and goal to establish an English-speaking international academic community, which is diverse and engages in "critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, world-class research, and community engagement".

CEU PU has a clear and well-defined development plan (Annex 1.1), according to which its degree programmes are well integrated into the institution's strategy to be a globally-competitive institution of advanced learning committed to attaining academic excellence. This naturally applies to the MA programme in International Relations as evidenced in the programme description. Many other aspects of the CEU PU strategic development plan apply to the programme in its various components such as admissions to the programme, its curriculum, quality assurance, student aid and international cooperation.

During an online interview with representatives of the student body, the representatives highlighted especially the well guided and informed transition period. The experts get the impression that students feel comfortable by that well-suited information policy which indicates that the CEU PU is open for students' participation to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

According to the Program Proposal, the MA in International Relations (One-Year) has been designed as a full-time programme that prepares students for various professional career paths in academia, government, international organizations, NGOs, think tanks or private business). The programme profile is well-defined and is well-integrated into the mission and profile of the institution. Its main features are its interdisciplinary nature and comprehensiveness which allows students to grasp and understand the complex interconnectedness of such subfields as foreign policy, international security, global economy, and international organization, just following the overall aim to provide a "big picture/close focus". The programme profile corresponds with the CEU PU mission which focuses on providing first-class education and research-oriented degree programmes.

The intended learning outcomes have been designed in accordance with the programme profile, its objectives, but also in accordance with the respective level (VII) of the National Qualification Framework. The evidence can be found in the Program proposal as well as in the course syllabi provided: The learning outcomes have been first defined as abilities of students to demonstrate certain understandings, skills or competencies after graduation. The Program Proposal strongly emphasizes solid theoretical grounding in the field of IR that students obtain and, thus, it pays a lot of attention to theoretical understanding of relevant issues, critical thinking as well as understanding and use of methods and research skills. These very general learning outcomes become specific in the description of three subfields of the programme from which students choose one, and, finally, they are closely defined in the course syllabi. The formulation of the Learning outcome at the level of the obligatory (two) and optional (three) modules is descriptive and perhaps would sound clearer if formulated as well-defined set of intended learning outcomes that follow three categories: 1. Knowledge, 2. Skills, 3. Competences. At the level of course syllabi the description of learning outcomes varies, but they certainly follow the focus of the programme (general learning outcomes) and its teaching and learning philosophy.

The programme which is taught for only one academic year has been designed for those who already have completed a four-year Bachelor degree. Its admission, as stated in the Program Proposal, is open to those applicants who have completed at least four years of undergraduate studies in social science or humanities.

The profile and the learning outcomes are oriented towards NQF-level VII.

During experts' online interview with representatives of the student body, the students' representatives of the programme confirmed that they feel well prepared for academia and for professional jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the great offer of additional services. An accompanying offer best practice example is the well-suited career service of the CEU PU which provides career network meetings with experts and high rank visitors as well as counselling and workshops. The university provides a broad offer of method courses and research opportunities. Students can also create and join various research groups.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The name of the degree programme is very traditional, as international relations is a well-established discipline of social science. The name closely corresponds to the degree programme's profile and its content. The focus of the programme is on the fundamentals of the discipline of IR including its methods, research design as well as on selected specific areas of international relations which include: 1. International Relations Theory and International Law, 2. International Political Economy and Development and 3. International Political Sociology and History. This interesting and comprehensive structure makes the programme unique, interdisciplinary and attractive to students. The academic degree that students obtain has good grounding in the discipline of international relations and involves a significant research component.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

The contents and the structure of curriculum of the programme has been designed in accordance with the programme profile. The structure combines three major modules of teaching: two mandatory modules (Research Design and Methods, and Thesis) and three thematic modules (International Relations Theory and International Law, International Political Economy and Development, International Political Sociology and History). This structure is well-designed and allows students to acquire knowledge and understanding of the fundamentals of the discipline at advanced level as well as research skills and in-depth knowledge of various aspects of International Relations that interests students most (thematic modules). Such structure ensures that students achieve intended learning outcomes as regards knowledge, skills and competences.

Teaching tools as in-class discussions and grounded presentations support the overall structures. As the CEU PU is a research-oriented university, it is also evident in this programme's description that students acquire a certain amount of research training, become familiar with methodology of the IR discipline, develop their own research designed and write a thesis. Generally, the CEU PU encourages students to do question-oriented research, therefore peculiar focus is set on the development of broad knowledge about research tools and designs to answer these research questions. When it comes to learning outcomes the two mandatory modules are more skills oriented (e.g. "capability for independent analytical work", "methodological and writing skills") while thematic modules are more knowledge and competence oriented. At the level of individual courses there is evidence (as defined in the syllabi) that all three components of learning outcomes are present (knowledge, skills and competences).

There are 31 course syllabi provided in accordance with the programme structure. Each course syllabus provides information on the module it belongs to, short description, course outline, learning activities and teaching methods, course literature (mandatory as well as additional), learning outcomes, and forms of assessment/examination.

The descriptions of intended learning outcomes in course syllabi vary as regards their formulation and it would be better if they followed the same pattern and used active verbs. Especially the competence component is not always clearly defined in each syllabus section devoted to intended learning outcomes.

The university provides a broad offer of method courses and research opportunities. These academic centres and research groups consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors. An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee. Accordingly, CEU PU ensures that intended learning outcomes are achieved through the curriculum as well as broadened through additional offers.

Students feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the great offer of additional services.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that the University considers a revision of the programme intended learning outcomes provided in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills and competences as well as according to the newest standards in learning outcomes design (e.g. using active verbs, and the Bloom's taxonomy).

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

In accordance with the programme profile, the courses are seminar-based and include active students' participation in class discussion and in various other class activities such as presentations or case-study analysis. The learning outcomes envisaged by the mandatory modules correspond with teaching methods used – as evidenced in the course syllabi. These methods include active involvement of students in acquiring appropriate research and methodological skills such as academic writing skills and independent research design. As indicated in the course syllabi, the learning activities and teaching methods designed for all three thematic modules are similar and follow the same pattern of seminar-based courses. It is ensured that students' learning is active, they are supposed to be well-prepared for the class discussion and actively involved in class activities. These class activities, which are very standard, such as class discussion and students' presentations are also combined with short lectures by the professional staff that prepare students for their own independent reading and analysis. The didactic conception of the programme is in line with its level and the overall profile and ensures that the intended programme learning outcomes are achieved.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that the University considers introducing certain innovations in teaching methods to include such methods as problem solving, student portfolio, peer assessment, study visits, etc. as well as the use of educational technologies.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

This intense one-year programme comprises of obligatory and elective modules for which the workload varies depending on the module's content, duration and learning outcomes. There seems to be a clear correspondence between the workload as it is designed in the course syllabi and the intended learning outcomes. 1 ECTS credit equals 30 hours of learning activities, of which 5 hours are contact hours spent in a classroom, and 25 hours are for out of class independent student's work. Two obligatory modules have 10 ECTS each whereas all courses in thematic modules have 8 ECTS each. It means that the student needs to complete two obligatory modules and five elective courses within a chosen thematic module in order to obtain 60 ECTS. Obligatory modules require 50 contact hours while elective courses require 40 contact hours. Such design seems to ensure equal workload for each student in all three semesters and envisages a significant number of hours of independent student work that along with contact hours contributes to the achievement of intended learning outcomes. The ECTS is applied correctly, as the students' overall workload is considered and thus reflects the overall workload required to complete the degree programme. As the attendance of classes is required, it also contributes to appropriate design of student's workload. The workload varies between the three terms. In the first term students earn 29 ECTS, in the second term they earn 21 ECTS and in the final third term they earn 10 ECTS for writing their thesis.

During online interview with representatives of the student body, it was stated by representatives of the programme that dropping out of the degree program hardly ever happens. According to the students' representatives, these cases were the result of some individual problems, not of any issues related to the workload, which they consider to be feasible. Additionally, in cases of health problems or personal circumstances that might affect the completion the final thesis, deadlines can be postponed if discussed in advance with the course convenor.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

The CEU PU has adopted clear examination rules. They are defined in the document entitled Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations (Annex 1.2.7). Chapter 4 of the document describes all relevant policies such as scheduling of examinations and deadlines, content and forms of examinations, anti-plagiarism software, grading, feedback, and retakes. The examination methods adopted by the MA programme in International Relations correspond with the programme profile, its didactic content and the intended learning outcomes. These methods include both examinations and various other forms of coursework such as: midterm exams, final exams, take-home exams, individual or team presentations, literature reviews, papers, as well as course-specific forms of coursework. Each course has a clearly defined required number and form of examination. CEU PU transparently outlines which exam to what extent counts toward the final grade of the course. Annex 1.2.7 creates transparency regarding grading rules of each exam. All courses combine several different methods of assessment, depending on the intended learning outcomes although the syllabi do not specifically indicate how each intended

learning outcome is assessed. Providing such information in the course syllabi in the future would be desirable.

There are also clear rules implemented as regards the final examination that leads to the award of the relevant degree. The document included as Annex 1.2.7 stipulates the form and period of final examination, the structure of the final examination board, the examination results and the rules concerning the retake of final examination.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend that a description could be provided the course syllabi indicating explicitly which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

*8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issued.*⁶

CEU PU in annex 3.2 provided a sample diploma supplement. It includes all necessary information about the degree achieved such as information identifying the qualification, information on the level of the qualification, on the contents and results gained as well as information on the Austrian higher education system. The diploma supplement complies with the requirements.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The admission requirements have been clearly defined by the CEU PU Program proposal MA International Relations (One-year). Applicants must have completed at least four-years undergraduate studies in social science or humanities. Since the study and working language of the CEU PU is English, applicants must demonstrate English proficiency, according to Annex 1.2.2. where the required score of standardized English language tests is described. Generally, candidates are evaluated based on their academic merit, especially, academic achievements, strength of recommendation letters and general compatibility with the aims of the degree programme. Additionally, CEU PU specifies the documents needed for application. Applicants to this programme are supposed to have a four-year experience at the undergraduate level. The requirements for the MA IR (one-year) include the online application form, an essay and/or statement of purpose, a curriculum vitae, academic records, official copy of the university diploma/degree certificate in the original language, full transcript, the official English language translation of the diploma, one or two letters of recommendation and proof of the English

⁶ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

language proficiency. The applicants must also submit an essay concerning an outline of their research question.

The official admission requirements correspond to the provisions of the qualification level in line with the Universities Act (UG).

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

CEU PU provides a transparent and clearly defined admission procedure. As outlined in Annex 1.2.2., the Admission process is divided into three stages. Firstly, the applications are examined to comply with formal or content requirements. Complying applications will be forwarded to the selection committees of each academic programme. Secondly, applicants are invited to attend interviews after a first blind review of two faculty members who evaluate the applications independently. Finally, the selection committees rank candidates based on the materials and interviews using a point system. According to the Program Proposal, points are given for two letters of recommendation, two essays (statement of purpose and an outline of the proposed research question), educational background and academic records, professional background (if any) and overall potential. Best practice of transparency is the documentation of the admission process as well as the final decision.

The experts consider the described procedure as clearly defined and as ensuring a fair and transparent selection according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA International Relations (One-Year)

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

According to the CEU PU Program proposal for the MA International Relations (one-year), the university participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Therefore, recognition of foreign qualifications is granted in line with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications as was adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee. Annex 1.2.7 CEU PU Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations clarifies the credit transfer policy of CEU PU. In case of the one-year MA programme, students can apply to a transfer of up to 16 ECTS credits that have not been used before to satisfy degree requirements for any other degree unless negotiated otherwise explicitly with the higher education institution. The course that is subject to the transfer must have been passed and the course must be at the graduate level. CEU PU has listed additional specific criteria applicable to the transfer of credits.

CEU PU provides an application form for the credit transfer. In Annex 1.2.7 the private university defines the procedure of the recognition process transparently and accurately. No later than the beginning of the registration period, after having contacted their department coordinator / department head, students submit their application forms to the Student Records Office. The

application requires an official transcript of the courses and grades achieved, the course outline of the educational institution. The Provost decides about the approval based on the recommendation of the Head of the relevant department.

CEU PU will seek to establish whether the differences with relevant qualifications are not too substantial to allow recognition.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff - MA International Relations (One-Year)

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

According to the documents provided (Preliminary contracts), relevant members of staff have been offered contracts to teaching positions at the CEU PU on a full-time and a part-time basis. Preliminary agreements specify the respective position and the envisaged extent of employment or teaching load as well as the period of the contract.

The MA in International Relations programme will be delivered by a number of members of teaching staff which includes full professors, associate professors, assistant professors and visiting professors. According to the Program Proposal, there are twelve full-time members of teaching staff and four part-time members of teaching staff devoted to the programme's teaching.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (One-Year)

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

As stated in the Program Proposal, the scientific staff consists of 12 full-time and 4 part-time members. This is a very good ratio, according to the expected student quantity per cohort of about 20 to 25.

MA students consider their supervision to be excellent. The experts have learned from the representatives of the student body that teaching staff is very helpful and responds to students' needs. Most important for the students, academic staff is available when they need them. Thus, the supervision of and support for students are ensured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (One-Year)

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

The CEU PU provided a list of the core subject areas per degree programme with names of professors in primary occupation responsible for the programme teaching components.

Members of teaching staff have sufficient competence in all specific areas of the degree programme including core subjects, methodology of the IR discipline as well as specific subject areas such as international political economy, political history, international law etc.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (One-Year)

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

On the basis of provided documentation (CVs of members of teaching staff employed by CEU PU) it can be concluded that all members of scientific staff who teach for the MA degree programme in International Relations have relevant qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of IR. They all have obtained their PhD degrees, often from prestigious or well-recognized academic institutions in several countries, they have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. CEU PU professors teaching International Relations have expertise in the field documented by numerous publications in internationally recognized academic journals or academic presses. Their research potential is demonstrated by research grants, including ERC and Horizon 2020, and projects they are involved with as documented in CVs of all faculty members.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA International Relations (One-Year)

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

The Academic Staff Handbook (Annex 1.2.1.) lists explicit – albeit flexible – ratios of time for research, teaching, and administration. A moderate teaching load, generous possibilities for granting sabbaticals, and funds for research and conference-related travel ensure that there is enough time for research. Furthermore, the Academic Staff Handbook lists an explicit restriction on the number of MA theses that any individual faculty member should supervise, so that workloads for teaching and supervision should not diverge dramatically among faculty members, and a balance between teaching and research is easier to maintain.

The CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook distinguishes between resident academic staff and visiting faculty. Resident academic staff (including all resident faculty members) is expected to divide their 40 working hours per week in "teaching (including supervision) 30-50%, research (including research management) 30-50%, other administration 20-40%." Generally, research staff is expected to be engaged in research (including research management) at least 90% of their time. Research and research management consists of formal teaching (24 ECTS over the course at two terms; University Professors only 16 ECTS), thesis (research, writing) supervision and consultation with students, open office hours (four hours per week), examination and evaluation duties, duties in admissions and recruitment; participation in the administration of the unit and of CEU PU (service on University or Senate committees, etc.), participation in unit and CEU PU research projects, directing of researchers, regular research and publication,

preparation and delivery of papers to the scholarly or professional community (or comparable contributions), service to the wider community. Visiting faculty, in contrast, is primarily occupied in teaching. Since the CEU PU takes on visiting faculty to expand student's knowledge, there are three visiting faculty involved in the IR Master programme.

Considering the ECTS credit quantity and the teaching workload related to time to be spend on research, there is a well-calculated relation between teaching and research. Furthermore, the additional visiting faculty facilitates resident faculty to focus on research.

According to the Annex 1.1, the CEU PU invests in continuous staff development which is one of the important priority areas for the institution under the goal of developing and strengthening One CEU. For this purpose, a set of professional measures and training opportunities related to further professional development will be established at the institution's level. The document gives several examples of such measures.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding - MA International Relations (One-Year)

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

The funding of the MA degree programme in International Relations, as stated in the Program Proposal, is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue generated by the Department and from the central budget of the CEU PU, funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund. As documented in Annex 1.1 and Annex 1.4 the CEU PU Endowment Fund and the institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided. The planned expenses that include all relevant categories as well as expected revenues of the Department of International Relations for academic year 2020/2021 have been provided. Planned expenditure for the upcoming academic year will be covered from centrally allocated budget.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure - MA International Relations (One-Year)

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

Detailed information on CEU PU infrastructure and library is provided in Annex 1.1, "Introduction to CEU PU" and Annex 1.3. on the CEU PU Campus. According to these documents adequate facilities and equipment are provided for students and staff of the degree programme. CEU PU in its new location in Vienna is leasing a 21,000 m² property which will provide adequate facilities

for students and staff such as an auditorium, lecture and seminar rooms, a media lab, the library and a reading room equipped with computers, as well as offices for visiting staff and researchers. Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted.

The resources include a well-established library that so far functioned at CEU Budapest, which contains extensive print and electronic collections, as well as access to a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals.

The experts consider the criterion to **be fulfilled**.

7.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development

Research and development - MA International Relations (One- Year)

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

CEU PU aims at being a globally-competitive institution of advanced research. Its scientific staff in primary occupation at CEU PU is required to produce world-class research and conduct research projects that are funded from internal and external funds including EU research funds. As stipulated in Annex 2.2, the Department of International Relations follows a well-defined research concept. The annex also outlines some of the academic accomplishments of scientific staff in terms of outstanding international publications, major professional awards, research grants, events and centres. It also summarizes the research themes and strategies pursued by scholars associated with the degree programme. The Annex as well as CVs of the members of the Department of International Relations provide sufficient evidence that the scientific staff affiliated with the MA programmes in International Relations are involved in research and development activities relevant to their field.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development - MA International Relations (One-Year)

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

Research is a cornerstone activity for all academic units at the CEU PU. With their team of well-equipped researchers and practitioners in International Relations the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding as many awards and grants indicate. The department encourages faculty research through funding support for attendance at scholarly conferences and through in-house seminars and workshops, with the expectation that research is published. Additionally, the scientific staff is evaluated once a year. Especially, the review focus is set on research leadership (creation and management of external and internal research groups, programmes, centres, and networks), research management, and efforts and success in attaining external funding for research. Since the CEU PU aims at becoming a leading research institution, research staff is required to publish "in scholarly periodicals and at academic publishing houses of international stature." (Annex 1.2.1)

According to the CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook, the evaluation process consists of two stages: Re-appointment review and promotion review. The assessment criteria is clearly defined by general guidelines with added specific departmental criteria concerning the length of the publication, the language, the ranking of a peer reviewed journal, monographies, chapters in books, co-authoring, editing and not yet published publications. Due to the CEU PU's overall aim to secure quality research, the planned research performance and their evaluation fit in the IR publishing culture as demonstrated by provided lists of publications and research projects.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - MA International Relations (One-Year)

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

Generally, CEU PU takes part in the ERASMUS+ framework and encourages its students and staff – both academic and administrative to maintain and expand their professional networks and expertise as states in Annex 1.1. The CEU offers paid research leaves according to the Academic Staff Handbook policies. To facilitate access to information, CEU PU established the Academic Cooperation and Research Support Office (ACRO) that will regularly hold workshops on externally funded research and grant management. The MA programmes in International Relations have an external partner programme Bard Globalization and International Affairs (BGIA) at Bard College in New York City. According to the website, CEU PU is globally very well-connected through a large amount of partnerships with universities all over the world. Besides conducting research together, they offer students and staff exchange opportunities and encourage to expand their professional networks.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

7.8 Summary and final evaluation - MA International Relations (One-Year)

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

CEU PU proves best practice since 1993 when the One Year MA in International Relations was first established. The programme is one of the major MA programmes offered by CEU PU in accordance with its profile and mission. The University has established a procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes as well as a robust quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA). Each degree programme upon its establishment and accreditation is integrated into the quality management system, which also applies to this degree programme. The experts consider all relevant Stakeholders to be involved in the quality management process.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

This interdisciplinary programme is closely connected with the CEU PU's profile, mission and objectives, and is in line with the institution's development plan that stresses critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, and world-class research, into which the IR programmes are fully integrated. The intended programme learning outcomes have been designed in accordance with the programme profile, its objectives, and the respective level (VII) of the National Qualification Framework. Thanks to its interdisciplinary nature and comprehensiveness students are well-prepared to follow various professions in academia, public and private sector as well as international organizations.

According to the experts, the programme structure is well-designed in accordance with the programme profile and allows students to acquire knowledge and understanding of the fundamentals of the discipline at advanced level as well as research skills and in-depth knowledge of various aspects of International Relations that interests students most through thematic modules. Such structure as well as teaching methods ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. Additionally, there is a broad supply on research training, methodology and space for critical discussion. Although this One-year Master's programme is a condensed version of the two-year programme, students' workload can be regarded as feasible and ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies.

The admission procedure is fair and transparent according to the admission requirements and the required competences and correspond with the Universities Act (UG).

Staff:

The programme will be delivered by a sufficient number of teaching staff who have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. The experts consider student-staff ratio satisfactory. The core subject areas are taught by professors in primary occupation. All of them have relevant qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of International Relations. Many members of staff are engaged in research projects and are recognized specialists in their fields. A moderate teaching load and additional supplies for the academic staff ensure that there is enough time for research. CEU PU provided evidence that they invest in continuous staff development which prioritizes research.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided during the whole period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

21,000 m² property will provide adequate facilities for students and staff Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted. Rooms are well-equipped and the library contains extensive print and electronic collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals. This infrastructure will facilitate students and staff research and learning.

Research and development:

The Department of International Relations follows a well-defined research concept. With their team of well-equipped researchers and practitioners in International Relations the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding as many awards and grants indicate.

CEU PU aims at becoming a leading research institution. So, research staff is obligated to publish regularly in internationally relevant academic journals and presses. Their research performance is part of the evaluation process in accordance with the CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook.

Co-operation:

CEU PU is well-connected with the external partner programme Bard Globalization and International Affairs at Bard College in New York City. Additionally, the university takes part in the ERASMUS+ framework and encourages students and staff to expand their professional networks through exchange and conferences. Generous financial support is granted by CEU PU to facilitate international exchange.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the master programme International Relations (one-year)

The expert panel members have the following **recommendations to CEU PU**.

- The experts recommend that the University considers a revision of the programme intended learning outcomes provided in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills and competences as well as according to the newest standards in learning outcomes design (e.g. using active verbs, and the Bloom's taxonomy).
- The experts recommend that a more specific description could be provided in the course syllabi indicating which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.

MA in Public Policy

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	Public Policy
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	60
Standard study period	1 academic year (3 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20 per year and cohort
Academic degree	Master of Arts (MA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 12.000 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

8 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – MA in Public Policy

8.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA in Public Policy

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

According to CEU PU's proposal for a master's programme in Public Policy (PP), it was "established in 2004" and "originated from the already (and still) existing Center for Policy Studies (CPS), an academic unit within the University [...] established in 2000". Because of this long experience, CPS "had access to the great range of research being done in universities around the world". The reasoning behind the programme at the beginning was, according to the proposal, "to put CPS's public policy expertise to use in education and contribute to

addressing the problem presented by a lack of well-trained policy-makers and advisors in the region". In other words, during the transformation in Central Eastern Europe, the region needed knowledgeable politicians and public administrators, and the CEU (which was located in Budapest, Hungary, until it moved to Vienna/Austria in 2019) felt responsible for educating the younger generation in the field of PP.

Beginning from its roots in the Center for Policy Studies, which was established twenty years ago, the CEU PU's public policy programme has, according to the programme proposal "broadened its outreach and has developed into one of the most successful and competitive degree programs offered by the University". This development through experience over the years can be seen as a proof of success of the programme in general and also as a need for its continuation – not only in Central Eastern European countries but in Europe in general and globally because of a very volatile political, economic and cultural environment. Overall, the CEU PU, according to Annex 1.1 - Introduction to CEU PU, "is committed to academic excellence and offering a transformative education with a global impact".

There are clear procedures in place for the establishment of new degree programmes, operating existing degree programmes, and making changes to existing degree programmes. For each of these procedures there are rules, check lists, and specifications of stakeholders.

In addition to the rules for programme development, there are detailed procedures on strategic reviews of units, and annual reviews of programmes. When a programme's unit has undergone a strategic review, the programme is exempted in the next year from an annual review.

The experts gained insight of the students' perspective on their influence regarding programme development during the online interview. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee where they discuss new programmes, and programme changes. The students' representatives are elected by the Student union, the representation of students' interest towards the administration. Altogether, there are 10 people involved in the Senate Curriculum Committee; one of these 10 members of the committee is a student representative. Students affirm the welcome opportunity for anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes. Additionally, due to the favourable student-staff ratio, programme coordinators and individual faculty are readily available. Students feel comfortable with that direct approach and with their own perceived influence.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- External stake holders who would be interested in working with the students, such as think tanks, media outlets and NGOs, could be asked about their ideas and feedback on subjects to be studied in the degree programme. A mentor programme could be of interests for students, linking professionals with students.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme - MA in Public Policy

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university's quality management system.

According to CEU PU's proposal and the "Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance (IAQA) Policy", the "CEU PU Mission commit[s] the University to excellence and highest quality in research, education and outreach activities". The IAQA, which is led by the president and rector,

defines quality management as a priority together with "long-term planning, strategic thinking, critical reflection". Furthermore, "IAQA processes at CEU PU are included in the planning, assessment and review cycle". As part of IAQA, "strategic reviews of academic units at CEU PU" are described in Annex 2 of the IAQA Policy.

Also, the School of Public Policy (SPP) conducts in-house assessment through:

- a. the departmentss's annual report,
- b. individual faculty members' academic activity reports,
- c. anonymous student evaluations on courses and thesis supervision,
- d. town-hall style meetings with students.

Besides the above-mentioned quality management, according to the proposal, the SPP of CEU PU is a member of the National Association of Schools of Public Affairs and Administration (NASPAA), which enables "debates about the global standard in public service education". The NASPAA, according to its own website, includes "over 300 institutional member schools at U.S. and non-U.S. universities that award degrees in public administration, public policy, public affairs, non-profit and related fields".

According to a video conference with the experts and students, the specific procedure of the review and evaluation of the staff and the programme is confirmed and appreciated by the students.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

1. *The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.*

CEU PU's Public Policy programme proposal describes in point 11 the programme profile in "reference to the University's mission and strategic goals". Overall, the "interdisciplinary degree with an international profile" programme is very much connected to the overall aim of the university to "promote the values of the open society and self-reflective critical thinking". This is also stated in general in the eleven-point Strategic Plan of CEU PU, according to Annex 1.1 - Introduction to CEU PU. In point 2 it is formulated that the university should be known "as an institution that successfully pursues social relevance by linking its rigorous and academically solid research and educational activities with a continuous interest in addressing pressing problems of our times".

From the specific and the general definition it is clear that the degree programme is in line with the profile and the objective of CEU PU.

According to the video conference of experts with the student body and some programme representatives, the students highlight especially the well-guided and informed transition period during the move from Budapest to Vienna. The experts gained the impression that students feel comfortable with that well-suited information policy, underlining the fact that the CEU PU is open to student participation to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

According to CEU PU's PP programme proposal the learning outcomes are clearly defined: "critically analyze policy issues and develop holistic perspectives", "evaluate public policies and policy instruments", "design and participate in the delivery of public policies" and "undertake further studies in a self-directed and autonomous matter". These outcomes are in accordance with level 7 (Master's programme) of the National Qualification Framework of Austria.

With these goals achieved, the programme proposal envisions career paths "in international organizations, NGOs or public administration – or in journalism, think tanks and academia". According to the Program Proposal, the CEU PU Public Policy programme does not specifically prepare students for any "regulated professions", thus it seems that the criterion for a description of preconditions is not of relevance here.

As affirmed during the video conference of the experts with the student body and the programme's representatives, students feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the substantial offerings of additional services. One such best practice example is the very effective career service of the CEU PU. The service provides career network meetings with experts and high-ranking visitors as well as counselling services and workshops. Since most of the students of the CEU PU want to work in academia, the university provides a broad selection of method courses and research opportunities. These academic centres and research groups consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors. An additional way of networking and obtaining further advice is through studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid; it is all covered by the tuition fee. For those who wish to leave academia, the university offers optional group counselling.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- A mentoring programme of professionals around Public Policy could be a way to connect the students with ideas about their professional career.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy Program Proposal, it is specifically stated that the foundations of the discipline of "public policy" will be studied, as well as the ability to define policy problems, design and carry out an independent research project and develop experience in teams. Furthermore, there are six specializations that reflect the profile of the degree programme: development, governance, higher education policy, media and communication, security and social justice and human rights. Therefore, the name corresponds to the M.A. degree programme's profile.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management- MA in Public Policy

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

The MAPP programme proposal demonstrates that the curriculum is well structured and consists of mandatory and elective components. It combines research (completion of a thesis is mandatory), with the art of writing (the course on Writing for Policy Audiences is mandatory) and practical experience (internship and/or project management). For the completion of the programme 60 ECTS credits (ECTS: European Credit Transfer System) are needed, including both learning and research activities, to be evenly divided within the three terms (fall, winter, spring). This also includes the completion of an internship. The last term can be almost completely dedicated to writing the final thesis.

According to the proposal, the foundational module should develop analytical skills that are central to the core discipline contributing to the understanding of public policymaking and policy analysis: political science, governance, economics and law. The curriculum of the foundational module features policy analysis and economic analysis for public policy as compulsory components, but governance and law remain electives. Having law and governance only as electives means that not all students graduate with the same knowledge of what the programme describes as foundations of Public Policy Analysis.

Making evaluation methods suited for achieving learning outcomes is a challenge for any programme. While the MAPP generally succeeds in finding the best fit for purpose, it happens that evaluation methods do not fully match the intended learning outcomes. E.g. in the syllabus of the compulsory course 'Policy Analysis', the evaluation methods do not fully align with the intended learning outcomes. The course learning outcomes and activities are built around academic policy analysis, with the policy cycle as a structure for classes. The evaluation, however, mixes academic policy analysis (writing an academic paper) with applied policy analysis (writing a policy brief). For the latter, the course activities have provided no input.

According to the video conference of some experts with the student body and some programme's representatives, students confirmed that the university provides a broad offer of method courses and research opportunities. Students can create research groups which consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors. An additional way of

networking and getting advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid; it is all covered by the tuition fee. Accordingly, CEU PU ensures that intended learning outcomes are achieved through the curriculum as well as broadened through additional offers.

Students feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the substantial offer of additional services.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The experts recommend to further improve the disciplinary foundation of the programme, by strengthening the foundational module with compulsory course components on law and governance.
- The experts further recommend reviewing course syllabi as to the question which evaluation methods are best suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The use of evaluation rubrics could help in this regard.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy Program Proposal the goal of the programme is that "each class should be the creation of an inclusive, interactive, participative and enabling learning environment". To do that, classes are small and so is the student-teacher ratio, with a full-time faculty of 28 and a part-time faculty of nine. The classes are taught "in a seminar-style with instructors aiming at facilitating the learning experience of students by using teaching cases, flipped classrooms, group work based on short popular readings related to an overarching topic, and in-class policy projects". At CEU PU one ECTS credit equals 30 hours of learning activities, five hours in classroom and 25 hours out of class.

From the description of these goals it is clear that the student's active contribution in the classroom is fully promoted and that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved.

During the video conference of some experts with the student body and some programme's representatives, students confirmed an excellent student-academic staff ratio which is very helpful to make students' needs, flexibilize the course materials, and be open for student suggestions regarding classes and how to improve learning conditions. The students affirm the great opportunity for anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes, which enables them to ensure that intended learning outcomes can be achieved.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

The one-year Master's degree's has an average study load of 60 ECTS (1 ECTS being equivalent of 30 hours), as does the CEU PU's Public Policy programme. According to one sample schedule provided in the application materials the workload can be evenly split among the three terms and can include an internship. All mandatory semester work will be credited with ECTS. The workload is high, but the outcome is achievable.

During the video conference of the experts with the student body and some programme representatives it was stated that students rarely drop out of the degree programme. According to the students' representatives any such cases were the result of some individual problems, not with any issues related to CEU PU. Since the numbers of students leaving the programmes is quite low, one could argue that the workload is fine. Students generally see the one-year Masters programmes as intense with regard to time and workload and perceive them as covering 2/3 of the overall workload of the two-year Masters programmes. Although the time frame is limited, students consider the workload to be feasible. Additionally, in cases of health problems, personal circumstances, or others that might affect the completion the final thesis, deadlines can be postponed. Consequently, the students feel that the strict rules at the CEU PU regarding deadlines are interpreted and made flexible to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be fulfilled.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

According to the CEU PU's -Annex 5.1 School of Public Policy Student Handbook in general the "requirements for successful completion of individual courses include attendance and a Pass in course assignment". Other requirements "are left to the discretion of the course instructors". For the MA thesis the requirements are very detailed and explained in the above-mentioned Annex 5.1. In this document the examination and the grade system are described clearly, as well as possible appeals regarding a grade.

It is clearly shown in the document that the CEU PU has adopted fair and open examination methods. Therefore the adopted examination rules are suitable to measure the extent to which the learning outcomes have been achieved.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019,

*will be issued.*⁷

The Diploma Supplement of CEU PU (Annex 5.2) in general and its description of "the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed by the individual" is in accordance with the Public Policy programme proposal and complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The requirements for admission are clearly defined in the CEU PU's Public Policy Program Proposal specifically under point 15 as well as in the Draft Admissions Policy and Procedures of Central Europe University under "Annex to the Policy", where the requirements for the School of Public Policy are listed. On the one hand a first degree from a university and certain language criteria have to be met, on the other hand a sample of a written work as well as a statement of purpose have to be submitted. Both tasks are clearly defined in the two documents.

The admission criteria have been clearly defined and they correspond to provisions in paragraph 63 (Admission to Degree Programs) and paragraph 64 (General University Entrance Qualification) of Austria's University Act 2002 - UG.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The procedure of admission is clear and specifically defined in the CEU PU's Public Policy Program Proposal. Besides the academic and language requirements the proposal also refers to work experience and a background in the social sciences (in exceptional cases candidates with a science background can also be selected). According to the Draft Admissions Policy and Procedures of Central European University the general admission requirements, the deadlines and the process are well laid out and ensure a fair and transparent selection of applicants.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - MA in Public Policy

⁷ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

According to the CEU PU's Draft Admissions Policy and Procedures of Central European University (Annex 1.2.2) it is clearly and generally stated that "CEU PU participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). In accordance with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee, recognition of foreign qualifications will be granted by CEU NY/CEU PU unless a substantial difference can be demonstrated between the qualification for which recognition is requested and the relevant Austrian qualification. In applying this principle, the University will seek to establish whether the differences in learning outcomes between the foreign qualification and the relevant Austrian qualification are too substantial to allow the recognition of the foreign qualification as requested."

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff - MA in Public Policy

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy (PP) Program Proposal there are three faculty members mentioned who direct the programme and who sign the pre-contracts. According to Table 3 of the proposal, there are 28 full-time faculty members and nine part-time faculty members involved in implementing the programme. Some of them offer one course, others more than one. All of them have PhDs; among the scientific staff teaching is the head of the programme and the head of the School for Public Policy (SPP). Since CEU PU anticipates 20 students for the "enrollment per year per cohort", according to the proposal, the staff in general is sufficient.

During the video conference of experts with faculty staff of the Public Administration and the Public Policy Programme on 1 April 2020, it was made clear that there is sufficient scientific and non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA in Public Policy

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy Program Proposal "the permanent academic staff allocated to the programme should consist of at least one full-time employee who possesses the required pertinent qualification to be appointed professor, and one additional full time equivalent

allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree. Academic staff in permanent employment should cover at least 50% of the teaching workload. Full-time staff means employees working at least 50% of their working hours in salaried employment at CEU PU".

Overall, 28 full-time faculty and nine half-time faculty members are delivering the programme for a maximum of 20 students. That is fair in terms of quantity and quality, since the vast majority are listed in the proposal as professor or assistant professor.

As confirmed during the video conference of experts with the representatives of the student body and some staff of the degree programme, students consider their supervision to be excellent. Members of academic and administrative staff are considered helpful and flexible. Most important for the students, academic staff are available when they need them.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA in Public Policy

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

According to the faculty CVs and Table 3 of CEU PU Public Policy programme proposal, the overall majority of 28 faculty members of CEU PU, who are "involved in the delivery of the program", are full-time faculty.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA in Public Policy

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

According to CEU PU Public Policy program proposal there are mandatory and elective courses. If one compares the research topics, which are mandatory, with the specialization of the faculty staff involved in the delivery of the programme, one can clearly judge that the full-time faculty in general is very qualified. There are also six subject specializations, which are elective: Development, Governance, Higher Education Policy, Media and Communication, Security and Social Justice and Human Rights. Whereas the topics Development, Governance, Higher Education and Social Justice and Human Rights are mostly covered by the expertise of the full-time faculty, topics as Media and Communication are more covered by the nine part-time faculty members, all of whom have the appropriate academic degrees.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff - MA in Public Policy

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy programme proposal the University "has a tradition of an 'open-door' policy with the aim to encourage exchange between faculty and students". Also, according to Annex 2.2 - Research Concept and its Research Strategy 2020 - 2025, "both faculty and doctoral students in general have an active program or research with a high degree of publication and other related output". In addition, the School of Public Policy (SPP) "will convene regularly a seminar program of research papers". And finally, the "academic staff members will be entitled to paid research leave". At the same time, it is clearly stated in Table 3 that the staff are directly engaged in teaching the students on the course.

Since the CEU PU in general has a Research Strategy and also underlines in its Mission, that "faculty, students and staff make up a diverse community and engage in critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, world-class research, and community engagement", it is clear to say, that there is sufficient time for research and development and appreciation of the arts.

During the interview with faculty staff of the Public Administration and the Public Policy programme on 1 April 2020, it was made clear that there is a balance between teaching and research. If faculty staff has to manage a programme, the teaching responsibility is reduced according to management needs, research time is still granted.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding - MA in Public Policy

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy (PP) Program Proposal, "the financial basis of the programs offered by the School of Public Policy (SPP) is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue generated by the School but primarily from the central budget of CEU PU, funded by the CEU Endowment Fund". The available documents detailing the budget (Annex 1.4.1 - Financial plan), the endowment (1.4.3 - Endowment) and the assets (1.4.4 - Statement of Assets) prove that the funding is secured.

In its mission CEU PU states in general, that it "will be a financially independent and sustainable institution". And it further defines the aim of the Endowment as "to support the University's operations irrespective of the University's location and accreditation framework". According to the video provided, where president and rector of CEU PU [...] elaborates on the financial situation in the time of challenges by the Coronavirus, the financial support and the Endowment Fund is solid.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure - MA in Public Policy

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

In general CEU PU, according to the Annex 1.1 - Introduction to CEU , "is leasing a 21,000 m² property for its Vienna Campus" of which the "first phase of the development was completed in September 2019, with a gross area of approximately 12,000 m²". The campus is equipped with a "200 seating capacity Auditorium", "37 classrooms", "1,300 m² Library and Reading Hall for 150 workstation positions". Also, "most classrooms have two wall mounted interactive screens, a technical cabinet and ceiling mounted room audio installed". Concerning IT, "50 desks are equipped with computers in the library and 250 seats in student co-working and hub areas with Wi-Fi-coverage". Part of the remaining overall space of CEU PU, 8,000 m², "will be ready by September 2020". The information of the library, which has been transferred from Budapest to Vienna has been sufficiently explained in the CEU PU Library Fact Sheet.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development

Research and development - MA in Public Policy

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

All professors sharing the main teaching load are employed by CEU PU. The School of Public Policy (SPP), according to the Research Strategy 2020-2025 (Annex 2.2.-Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy and International Relations Research Concept), "will in general convene regularly a seminar program of research papers". Also, the SPP "brings together researchers across multiple departments at CEU interested in empirical issues related to public policy". In this development the faculty members take part and drive the development and the research together with interested students.

In the Mission statement of CEU PU it is stated, that "academic and social dimensions of CEU PU's mission are closely intertwined". It also underlines, that the university in general "seeks to produce research that transforms our understanding of the world". For this to achieve, the faculty together with students are involved.

Drawing from the specific description of the programme and the general understanding according to the above-mentioned documents, the criterion is considered to be fulfilled.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development - MA in Public Policy

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

According to CEU PU's PP Program Proposal and the Research Strategy 2020-2025 (Annex 2.2.- Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy and International Relations Research Concept) the School of Public Policy (SPP) is one of "three academic units which constitutes the Doctoral School of Political Science". The results can be seen through publications, articles and monographs in respected international scientific journals and research grants. Through research outreach "Doctoral school faculty and students are deeply involved in the academic and policy studies community". Through research in cooperation within CEU PU and with other institutions outside, issues such as "economic development, to gender equality, demographic trends, and political economy" are tackled, which CEU PU considers according to the Mission statement as important.

This approach is linked with the Strategic Plan of CEU PU, which, according to Annex 1.1 - Introduction to CEU PU, states, that it will "be a globally-competitive institution of advanced research and higher learning committed to attaining the highest level of academic excellence...". CEU PU also offers "Research leave" to provide opportunities to enhance the knowledge of academic staff members and to profit from international experience.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - MA in Public Policy

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

According to CEU PU's Public Policy (PP) programme proposal, the School for Public Policy (SPP) "has engaged with global initiatives and hosted numerous public events that have focused on developing an innovative research agenda". Besides that, "the school has built strategic partnerships with policy actors across the globe". It also uses the network of the Open Society Foundation and its institutions. Through this approach, plus assistance with finding internships for its students, the programme in cooperation with CEU PU is broadening horizons and promotes the international mobility of students. Staff members may also take research leave, which would free them to travel for academic purposes.

In general, as stated in the Mission statement, CEU PU by 2025 "will be a University engaged in the life of its local community, a committed citizen of Vienna and Austria, and in regular collaboration with its European and global partners and networks". From this statement one can clearly draw the conclusion that mobility of student and staff is highly appreciated at CEU PU. It has been confirmed by a discussion online with faculty staff in charge of the degree programme on 1 April 2020.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

8.8 Summary and final evaluation - MA in Public Policy

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

The one-year Master programme in Public Policy has existed since 2004. CEU PU has established a quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA), in which the quality assurance of the MAPP is integrated. While the experts consider relevant stakeholders to be involved in the quality management process, they recommend that the programme organize in a more systematic way the inputs from external stakeholders and the employers of the graduates.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

According to the experts, the programme structure is well designed in accordance with the programme profile and allows students to acquire knowledge and understanding of the fundamentals of the discipline at an advanced level as well as to develop research skills and in-depth knowledge of various aspects of Public Policy, also by offering elective courses that interest students mostly through thematic modules. This structure as well as teaching methods ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. In the future, the programme's disciplinary foundation could be enhanced even further and, depending on public policy

challenges in general, the foundational modules could be widened by more compulsory course components.

There is a broad variety of research training, methodology and space for critical discussion. Students' workload of the degree programme can be regarded as feasible and ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies. Corresponding with the Austrian Universities Act (UG), the admission procedure is fair and transparent according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

Staff:

The programme will be delivered by a sufficient number of teaching staff who have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. The experts consider student-staff ratio satisfactory. The core subject areas are taught by professors in their primary occupation. All of them have relevant qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of Public Policy. They are supported by part-time faculty members, equally qualified. Both are engaged in research projects and their articles have been published in relevant scientific journals. The workload of teaching permits enough time for substantial research. CEU PU provided evidence that they invest in continuous staff development which prioritizes research.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund, which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensures that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided throughout the entire period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

21,000 m² property in general will provide adequate facilities for students and staff, while an additional 8,000 m² space are currently being adapted. Rooms are well equipped and the library contains extensive print and electronic collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals. This infrastructure will facilitate student and staff research and learning.

Research and development:

The School for Public Policy (SPP) follows a well-defined research concept. With their team of well-equipped researchers the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding, as awards and research grants indicate. CEU PU in general aims at becoming a leading research institution. Research staff is obligated to publish regularly in internationally relevant academic journals. Their performance in doing so is part of the evaluation process in accordance with CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook. The Public Policy degree programme encourages and supports this approach according to the overall mission of CEU PU.

Co-operation:

The School of Public Policy, as an international school with an international student body, international staff, and international curriculum engages in global mobility. Accordingly, the degree programme and SPP engages with global initiatives, hosts public events with international lecturers, and builds strategic partnerships with policy actors across the globe. Mobility between academia and practice is highly valued in the PP programme through presentations by practitioners and the long experience with internships.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the Master programme MA in Public Policy.

The expert panel members have the following **recommendations to CEU PU**.

- External stake holders who would be interested in working with the students, such as think tanks, media outlets and NGOs, could be asked about their ideas and feedback on subjects to be studied in the degree programme. A mentor programme could be of interests for students, linking professionals with students.
- A mentoring programme of professionals around Public Policy could be a way to connect the students with ideas about their professional career.
- The experts recommend to further improve the disciplinary foundation of the programme, by strengthening the foundational module with compulsory course components on law and governance.
- The experts further recommend reviewing course syllabi as to the question which evaluation methods are best suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The use of evaluation rubrics could help in this regard.

Master of Public Administration

Information on the application for the accreditation of the degree programme	
Degree programme title	Public Administration
Degree programme type	Master degree programme
ECTS credits	120
Standard study period	2 academic years (6 terms)
Maximum enrolment	20-25 per year and cohort
Academic degree	Master of Public Administration (MPA)
Study formate	full-time
Language	English
Location	Wien, 10.Quellenstraße 51-55
Tuition fee	€ 14.500 / year
Application submitted on	31 October 2019

9 Review and assessment based on the assessment criteria stipulated in the PU-AkkVO – Master of Public Administration

9.1 Assessment criterion § 17 (1) 1 to 2: Development and quality assurance of the degree programme

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme – Master of Public Administration

1. The degree programme was developed using a predefined procedure for the development and establishment of degree programmes and involving the relevant stakeholder groups.

The programme was established at the time of the foundation of the School of Public Policy (SPP) in Budapest in 2012. The first cohort of students was hence admitted for the academic year 2013-2014.

The programme was developed in line with the mission of the School of Public Policy. Combining academic training with work based applied skills in policy management, advocacy and data analysis; the programme contributes to the ambition of the SPP to become a hub for public policy education in Europe and the world.

There are clear procedures in place for the establishment of new degree programmes, operating existing degree programmes, and making changes to existing degree programme . For each of these procedures there are rules, checklists, and specifications of stakeholders.

Next to the rules for programme development, there are detailed procedures on strategic reviews of units, and annual reviews of programmes. When a programme's unit has undergone a strategic review, the programme is exempted in the next year of an annual review.

The School of Public Policy maintains good informal contacts with external stakeholders, as well as liaises with them through the organisations of guest lectures and internship programmes. The university could, however, do more to more systematically engage them in programme development.

The experts gained insight of the students' perspective on their influence regarding programme development during the online interview. Students are represented in the Senate Curriculum Committee where they discuss new programmes, and programme changes. The students' representatives are elected by the Student union, the representation of students' interest towards the administration. Altogether there are ten people involved in the Senate Curriculum Committee; one of these ten members of the committee is a student representative.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- In the programme development more systematic attention could be given to the input of external stakeholders, such as employers of graduates: representatives from NGOs, international organisations, consultancies and public administrations.

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme – Master of Public Administration

2. Following its accreditation, the degree programme is incorporated into the private university's quality management system.

The institutional rules on quality assurance are spelled out in the CEU PU's "Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance (IAQA) Policy", which "commit(s) the University to excellence and highest quality in research, education and outreach activities". The IAQA, which is led by the president and Rector, defines quality management as a priority together with "long-term planning, strategic thinking, critical reflection". Furthermore, "IAQA processes at CEU PU are included in the planning, assessment and review cycle". As part of IAQA, "strategic reviews of academic units at CEU PU" are described in Annex 2 of the IAQA Policy.

Internal quality Insurance:

The School of Public Policy (SPP) follows the PUs general rules of quality assurance. The mechanisms for quality assessment of the programme's performance are:

- a. the department's annual report,

- b. individual faculty members' academic activity reports,
- c. monitoring and analysing course registration patterns,
- d. anonymous student evaluations on courses and thesis supervision,
- e. town-hall style meetings with students.

Next to these mechanisms, there are two school meetings where quality assurance matters and changes to the curriculum discussed.

- a. Programme Directors Academic Committee (regular)
- b. School meetings of Faculty, Staff and Students (at least once a term)

External quality assurance

The CEU PU is a member of the US National Association of Schools of Public Affairs and Administration (NASPAA), which provides an external sounding board "about the global standard in public service education". The NASPAA, according to its own website, includes "over 300 institutional member schools at U.S. and non-U.S. universities that award degrees in public administration, public policy, public affairs, non profit and related fields".

The Master of Public Administration is presently accredited in the United States by the Middle States Commission on Higher Education.

The specific procedure of the review and evaluation of the programme and staff by the students is appropriate and therefore the experts consider the quality assurance to be accomplished.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

9.2 Assessment criterion § 17 (2) 1 to 11: Degree programme and degree programme management

Taking into account a heterogeneous student body, the following criteria shall apply. In the case of doctoral programmes with special profile elements, the descriptions shall furthermore address the characteristics defining the profile. Special profile elements in doctoral programmes may include, for example, distance-learning degree programmes or joint degree programmes.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

1. *The degree programme is oriented towards the profile and the objectives of the private university and is clearly in line with the development plan.*

The proposal states the ambition of the School of Public Policy to become a hub for policy analysis in the words of its founder: "a new kind of global institution dealing with global problems, through the multi-disciplinary study of public policy, innovative teaching and research, as well a meaningful engagement with policy practice". The MPA, which combines research and practice in its components, can thus be seen to be, as mentioned in the proposal, "responding to what is, overall, a failure of policy elites to tackle the most urgent problems of our time".

The profile and objectives of the programme are clearly in line with the profile and objectives of the university. Combining academic knowledge with work based and applied skills in policy management, advocacy, and data analysis, the programme nurtures a generation of graduates who have the appropriate knowledge and skills to help define problems and devise solutions.

As experts have learned during the online interview, representatives of the student body highlight especially the well guided and informed transition period. The experts get the impression that students feel comfortable by that well-suited information policy which indicates that the CEU PU is open for students' participation to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

2. The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. They include scientific as well as artistic, personal, and social competences, they meet the professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective level of the National Qualification Framework. As regards regulated professions, the private university shall describe, if and under which preconditions access to those professions can be ensured.

The profile and the intended learning outcomes of the degree programme have been clearly defined. The principle learning goals are the following:

- understanding how issues become problematised and politicised in different local, national, and global settings
- critically understand the policy process from design and implementation to monitoring and evaluation, and to identify options for engagement and advocacy
- gather and analyse data and other information sources for evidence-based policy-making
- understand gender and conflict sensitivity, rights-based approaches, and 'do no harm' principles of open societies

The learning outcomes clearly embrace knowledge, skills, and attitudinal competences, and are moreover practice and problem-based. They comply with level 7 of the National Qualification Framework.

The programme delivers policy analysts. The profession of policy analyst is no regulated profession for which preconditions of access need to be met.

As affirmed during the online interview with the students' representatives, they feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the outlook of the relevant international business, public or NGO sector, due to the great offer of additional services. A best practice example is the well-suited career service of the CEU PU. The service provides career network meetings with experts and high rank visitors as well as counselling services and workshops.

The students value the fact that the university offers a broad range of methods courses and research opportunities. There are also several academic centres and research groups, in which students can cooperate with professors, "who act not as supervisors but as advisors". An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee. For those who wish to leave academia, the university offers optional group counselling, which the students considered a major asset and reason for applying to the CEU PU In the first place.

The experts consider the criterion to **be fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

3. The name of the degree programme and the academic degree correspond to the degree programme's profile.

The university describes its Master in Public Administration as an interdisciplinary degree closely linked to the CEU PU core mission.

It seeks to provide on the one hand an academic foundation in policy analysis, legal issues, economics, and research methods. On the other hand, it offers practice and problem based learning, and on hands experience with real life applied policy projects.

Among the global variation of the Master Degrees in Public Administration, the SPP MPA is a policy analysis oriented MPA. It shares, however, with other public administration degrees a compulsory core on what is generally considered as the multi-disciplinary foundations of public administration as a discipline: law, economics, organisation studies. The academic degree Master of Public Administration (MPA) fits the programme's profile.

Given this strong compulsory core of multi-disciplinary foundational courses, the programme can be considered a MPA course, and the academic degree programme name is warranted. Yet, it would be better if also the Public Management course was a compulsory component. In a Public Administration programme it seems odd for students to graduate without having taken a general course on Public Management or Public Administration. The sample trajectory of a student provided in the proposal shows that indeed students can graduate without having taken what the experts consider a core course for any public administration programme. A case is made for having 'Introduction to Global Governance and Public Policy' or 'International Organizations: Past, Present, Future' as compulsory alternatives. However, since national states' policy space is substantial, knowing how the states are organised and programmes are managed seems an important learning outcome for any public administration graduate.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendations:

- The Public Administration nature of the programme is implicit rather than explicit. The programme could do more to position its MPA in the disciplinary field, and clarify its disciplinary identity. This would also mark its difference with the Master in Public Policy.
- The interdisciplinary treatment of substantive policies in the specialisation tracks merits a better framing from a public administration perspective.
- The experts also recommend to make the Public Management course compulsory.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

4. The contents and structure of the curriculum ensure that the intended learning outcomes are achieved, while combining research (research and development and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts) and teaching.

As to course modules, there is a foundational module, a skills module and six specialisations. Next to this, there is a small set of free electives, as well as the Applied Policy Project and the Thesis module.

a. Foundation module – 38 ECTS:

26 ECTS compulsory courses, 8 ECTS mandatory electives, 4 mandatory credits of Project Management. In the foundation module students are familiarized with multidisciplinary approaches relevant for the programme, as well as research methods, and project management.

b. Skills module – 18 ECTS

These skills modules aim at making students competent for the organization and execution of their work during the programme, but also at preparing them for the labour market.

c. Specializations – 24 ECTS

Students can choose one specialization from four substantive policy domains (development, higher education policy, security, social justice and human rights) and two thematic specializations (governance, media). Since most courses count for 4 ECTS, students will hence take four courses within one specialization.

d. Exploration electives – 20 ECTS

These electives are either methods oriented (regression analysis and impact assessment), disciplinary complements (such as Psychology and Public Policy), or substantive policy oriented (Labour and Population Policy, Religion in the Public Sphere).

e. Applied Policy Project/Thesis module – 20 ECTS

The APP is the capstone project of the programme. Students work in team on a real -life applied policy project for a client. They can put their knowledge, skills, and competences to use, and will be graded on the basis of these. The quality of the project, the team work and skills performance, and an individual policy brief of 5000 count toward completing the project. The proposal lists an independent research project leading to a 12000- word thesis as an alternative for the APP, totalling 20 credits.

f. Voluntary internship

The students are encouraged to do an internship over the summer. This is voluntary but the SPP supports the students in finding internship places. It is not explained why an internship is no compulsory part of the programme.

The programme structure and content is conducive to the achievement of intended learning outcomes. Knowledge, skills, and competences are all substantively furthered. The foundational module trains knowledge and research skills; the skills module obviously trains students' skills but also attitudinal competences, the specialisations offer mainly knowledge, and the capstone APP integrates all three.

The only oddity is the thesis alternative to the APP, with which students can only proceed after approval by the Programme Director.

There is a contradiction between the accreditation proposal and the handbook of the SPP on this point. See annex 5.1. In the handbook it is specified that the thesis is no alternative for the APP while in the proposal the thesis is presented as an alternative. At any rate, there is no explicit rationale in the written documents for having this alternative. There are moreover no separate learning outcomes for training students to do independent research.

During the discussion with staff, it was clarified that the thesis module is an elective component of 4 credits that cannot substitute for the applied policy project, which is the capstone project in line with the learning outcomes. The rationale of the thesis elective is that some students

who want to proceed with doctoral studies might in some doctoral programmes be requested to have written a thesis.

The offer of courses is impressive. All courses are described by a short syllabus following a similar format on the objectives of the course, the intended learning outcomes, learning activities, evaluation, and schedule. There is room for improvement, however, in specifying the learning outcomes in terms of knowledge, skills and competences. It would also have been instructive to have each syllabus specify the learning outcomes' relation with evaluation methods.

The university provides a broad offer of method courses and focused research support. . Students can create research groups that consist of students and professors who act not as supervisors but as advisors. An additional way of networking and getting additional advice is studying for additional academic certificates. There is no additional fee to be paid, it is all covered by the tuition fee. Accordingly, CEU PU ensures that intended learning outcomes are achieved through the curriculum as well as broadened through additional offers. Students feel well prepared for academia and for many jobs in the relevant international business, public or NGO sectors, due to the great offer of additional services.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- Revise intended learning outcomes in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills, and competences.

Degree programme and degree programme management - – Master of Public Administration

5. The didactic conception of the degree programme's modules shall ensure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved and promotes the students' active contribution in the learning process.

According to CEU PU's MPA programme proposal "each class should be the creation of an inclusive, interactive, participative and enabling learning environment". To facilitate that, classes are small and so is the student-teacher ratio, with a full-time faculty of 28 and a part-time faculty of 15. Since the student cohort is 20 students per year, it is possible to work in a seminar style with a variation of working methods: teaching cases, flipped classrooms, group work and group discussions. For courses with quantitative methods, computer labs are more suited to meet the purposes. The APP project is not only the capstone project where knowledge, skills and competences are trained in an integrated way, it is also in way a capstone project on students as active contributors to achieving those outcomes.

From the description of the course syllabi it is clear that the students' active contribution in the classroom is fully promoted and that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved through the didactical approach.

During the online interview with student representatives, they confirmed an excellent student-academic staff ratio which is very helpful to meet students' needs, to flexibilize the course materials, to be open for student suggestions regarding classes and how to improve learning conditions. The students affirm the great opportunity for anonymous feedback concerning teaching and programmes which lead them to ensure that intended learning outcomes can be achieved.

The criterion is considered to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - Master of Public Administration

6. The workload related to the individual modules ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies, and in case of part-time degree programmes takes into account any professional activity. The ECTS is applied correctly.

The Master of Public Administration programme is a full-time two-year programme. The two-year MPA degree programme consists of mandatory courses, mandatory electives, and electives, as well as an Applied Policy Project (with both a team and individual component). To most courses 4 ECTS credits are assigned, in some exceptional cases 2 ECTS credits. The Applied Policy Project as the capstone project consists of 12 ECTS credits for the team component and 8 ECTS credits for the individual component.

The workload is front-heavy, with in each year 24 ECTS credits in both the fall and winter terms, and 12 ECTS credits in the spring terms. The workload seems heavy but doable in the fall and winter terms, with many courses and skills to digest and learning outcomes to achieve. Students are no passive recipients of classical knowledge transfer but are themselves active learning participants, with having to go through many readings, discussions in seminars, exercises and assignments. The ratio between the different modules seems fair. The ECTS appears to be applied correctly, and the proposal shows that the overall workload is considered in the programme structure.

Apart from complying with the course requirements, students are encouraged to do an internship in the summer term. This indicates that the workload is feasible.

During the online interview with student representatives, it was stated that dropping out of the degree programme hardly ever happens. According to the students' representatives, these cases were the result of some individual problems, not of any issues related to the University. Since the numbers of students leaving the programmes are quite low, it can be considered that the workload is fine. It appears that the strict rules at the CEU PU regarding deadlines are interpreted and made flexible to meet students' needs.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management - – Master of Public Administration

7. The private university has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether and to what extent the intended learning outcomes have been achieved.

The CEU PU has adopted clear examination rules. They are defined in the document entitled Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations (Annex 1.2.7). Chapter 4 of the document describes all relevant policies such as scheduling of examinations and deadlines, content and forms of examinations, anti-plagiarism software, grading, feedback, and retakes. The examination methods adopted by the MPA programme are in line with the profile of the programme and didactical approach.

One can see from the course syllabi that the different learning outcomes are tested by a variety of methods that are fit for purpose, even if the syllabi have not explicitly presented the relationship between learning outcomes and evaluation methods.

Overall, course outcomes are tested by more than one means, and by a great variety of means. Class participation, contribution to group discussions, presentations reward students for active presentation; while take-home exams, literature reviews, paper assignment, quizzes have them demonstrate acquired knowledge, as does the occasional exam. Their skills are tested by policy briefs, policy proposals, case briefs, and other skills' assignments. Competences such as team work are also featuring in evaluations.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend to describe explicitly in the syllabi which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.

Degree programme and degree programme management - – Master of Public Administration

8. A "Diploma Supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree (Universitäts- und Hochschulstatistik- und Bildungsdokumentationsverordnung, UHSBV), original version: F. L. G. II no. 216/2019, will be issued.
8

A sample Diploma Supplement of the CEU PU Master of Public Administration degree programme has been issued (Annex 5.3) and complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 1 to § 6 of the University and Higher Education Statistics and Education Documentation Decree.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- Adapt the diploma supplement to make a clear distinction between the compulsory nature of the Applied Policy Project and the elective nature of the thesis.

Degree programme and degree programme management - – Master of Public Administration

9. The admission requirements have been clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, they correspond at least to the provisions provided by the Universities Act (UG).

The admission requirements have been clearly defined in the CEU PU MPA Program Proposal. They consist of general degree requirements, language requirement, a statement of purpose, a CV, and two reference letters.

Applicants will have completed a first degree (Bachelor) from a recognized institution before enrolment. They will be proficient in English according to international standard tests. A statement of purpose will demonstrate their motivation, while a CV will highlight relevant

⁸ The PU Accreditation Regulation 2019 refers to Annex 2 of the UniStEV 2004. This ordinance was amended and therefore the text of the assessment criterion in the expert report was adapted accordingly.

experience. Letters of reference, finally, will be two academic references, or in case the applicant has work experience, one academic reference and one professional.

The requirements for online applications, nature of documents, and guidance for the CV can be found online.

Typically, for the MPA, the selection committee appreciates that candidates demonstrate an interest in the practice component of the MPA programme.

The official admission requirements correspond to the provisions of the qualification level in line with the Universities Act (UG).

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

10. The admission procedure has been clearly defined and ensures a fair and transparent selection of the applicants according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

CEU PU provides a transparent and clearly defined admission procedure. As outlined in Annex 1.2.2. the Admission process is divided into several stages. For the MPA there are two stages. Firstly, the applications are examined to comply with formal or content requirements. Secondly, the selection committees ranks candidates based on the application materials. It appears that the admission into the Master of Public Administration programme does not require an interview stage. The detailed admissions policy is published online, which is commendable.

The experts consider the described procedure as fair and transparent according to the admission requirements and the required competences.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Public Administration

11. The recognition procedures for higher education competences and, if applicable, competences acquired outside higher education in terms of crediting towards examinations or parts of a degree programme have been clearly and transparently defined. When recognising or crediting higher education competences, the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (Lisbon Recognition Convention) shall be considered.

The CEU PU School of Public Policy MPA programme participates in the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS). Therefore, recognition of foreign qualifications is granted in line with the Recommendation on Criteria and Procedures for the Assessment of Foreign Qualifications as was adopted by the Lisbon Recognition Convention Committee. Annex 1.2.7 CEU PU Student Rights, Rules, and Academic Regulations clarifies in a transparent way the credit transfer policy of CEU PU. In case of the two-year MPA programme, students can apply to a maximum of 8 credits, and use a designated form to apply for the transfer.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

9.3 Assessment criterion § 17 (3) 1 to 5: Staff

Staff – Master of Public Administration

1. The private university shall provide for sufficient scientific and/or artistic staff as well as sufficient non-academic staff for operating the degree programme.

According to CEU PU's MPA proposal there is one faculty member mentioned as involved in the direction of the programme. According to table 3 of the proposal, there are 28 full-time faculty members and 15 part-time faculty members involved in implementing the programme. Some of them offer one course, others more than one. All of the full-time faculty members have PhDs; the qualifications of the part-time faculty members are not listed in table 3 of the proposal.

Among the scientific staff teaching is the head of the programme and the head of the School for Public Policy (SPP).

Since CEU PU anticipates 20 students for the "enrolment per year per cohort", according to the proposal, the staff in general is sufficient.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff – Master of Public Administration

2. The relation between scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university and students shall be in accordance with the profiles of the respective degree programmes. Primary occupation here means working at least 50% of one's total working hours in salaried employment at the private university.

According to CEU PU's MPA Program Proposal "the permanent academic staff allocated to the program should consist of at least one full-time employee who possesses the required pertinent qualification to be appointed professor, and one additional full time equivalent allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree. Academic staff in permanent employment should cover at least 50% of the teaching workload. Full-time staff means employees working at least 50% of their working hours in salaried employment at CEU PU".

Overall, 28 full-time faculty and 15 part-time faculty members are delivering the programme for a maximum of 20 students per cohort. That is fair in terms of quantity and quality, since the vast majority are listed in the proposal as professor or assistant professor.

As experts have learned during the online interview, representatives of the student body consider their supervision to be excellent. Members of staff are helpful and flexible. Most important for the students, academic staff is available when they need them.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff – Master of Public Administration

3. The subject-specific core competences of the degree programme are covered by professors in primary occupation at the private university

According to the faculty CVs and table 3 of CEU PU MPA Program Proposal, the overall majority of 28 faculty members of CEU PU, who are "involved in the delivery of the program", are full-

time faculty. One group is competent in the sub-disciplinary domains that are key to delivering the multi-disciplinary knowledge components of the curriculum of the MPA (political science, economics, policy analysis, law, public management, governance). Another group is competent in substantive policy areas that feature in the specialisation components of the curriculum. Part-time faculty members are predominantly experienced and active in delivering skills components, or have a specialist substantive policy profile.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff – Master of Public Administration

4. The scientific staff or the artistic staff, respectively, is qualified according to the requirements of the activities provided for in the degree programme.

The CEU PU MPA curriculum consists of a foundation module, 6 substantive or thematic specialisations, a number of electives, a mandatory skills module, and an Applied Policy Project. Given their excellent reputation as scholars, the full-time staff is clearly competent to deliver the activities for the foundation and specialisation modules, as well as number of electives. The part-time faculty is mainly focused on skills training and appear to have the right background for those activities. The competences necessary for guiding the Applied Policy Project are not explicitly visible. As to the optional thesis project, it can be expected that all full-time staff have the necessary experience to supervise students.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Staff – Master of Public Administration

5. The prioritisation of the teaching, research, and administrative activities of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university ensures adequate participation in teaching in degree programmes and leaves sufficient time for research and development or the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

According to CEU PU's MPA Program Proposal, the University "has a tradition of an 'open-door' policy with the aim to encourage exchange between faculty and students". Also, according to Annex 2.2 - Research Concept and its Research Strategy 2020 - 2025, "both faculty and doctoral students in general have an active program or research with a high degree of publication and other related output". Also, the School of Public Policy (SPP) "will convene regularly a seminar program of research papers". And finally, the "academic staff members will be entitled to paid research leave". At the same time the list of faculty involved in teaching given in the application materials clearly shows that the research staff are directly engaged in teaching the students on the course.

Since the CEU PU in general has a Research Strategy and also underlines in its Mission that "faculty, students and staff make up a diverse community and engage in critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, world-class research, and community engagement", it is clear to say that there is sufficient time for research and development.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

9.4 Assessment criterion § 17 (4): Funding

Funding – Master of Public Administration

The degree programme's funding is secured. Provisions have also been made to fund expiring degree programmes.

In its mission CEU PU states in general, that it "will be a financially independent and sustainable institution". And it further defines the aim of the Endowment as "to support the University's operations irrespective of the University's location and accreditation framework".

According to CEU PU's MPA Program Proposal, "the financial basis of the programs offered by the School of Public Policy (SPP) is provided from the combination of the tuition revenue (14.500 Euro annually) generated by the School but primarily from the central budget of CEU PU, funded by the CEU Endowment Fund". The planned expenses and revenues for the School of Public Policy for the year 2020/2021 include all relevant categories. Planned expenditures for the coming year will be sufficiently covered by expected tuition fees and the Endowment Fund. The available documents detailing the budget, financial plan, the endowment and the assets demonstrate that the funding is secured.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

9.5 Assessment criterion § 17 (5): Infrastructure

Infrastructure – Master of Public Administration

Quantitatively and qualitatively adequate facilities and equipment are provided for the degree programme. In the case that the private university draws on external resources, their authorisation to use them has been contractually secured.

Detailed information on CEU PU infrastructure and library is provided in Annex 1.1, "Introduction to CEU PU" and Annex 1.3. on the CEU PU Campus. According to these documents adequate facilities and equipment are provided for students and staff of the degree programme. CEU PU in its new location in Vienna is leasing a 21,000 m² property which will provide adequate facilities for students and staff such as an auditorium, lecture and seminar rooms, a media lab, the library and a reading room equipped with computers, as well as offices for visiting staff and researchers. Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted. The resources include a well-established library that so far functioned at CEU Budapest, which contains extensive print and electronic collections, as well as access to a wide selection of databases and licences for numerous electronic journals.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**

9.6 Assessment criterion § 17 (6) 1 to 2: Research and development

Research and development – Master of Public Administration

1. The scientific and/or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme is involved in the private university's relevant research and development activities.

CEU PU aims at being a globally-competitive institution of advanced research. Its scientific staff in primary occupation at CEU PU is required to produce world-class research and conduct research projects that are funded from internal and external funds including EU research funds.

The School of Public Policy comprises excellent resident faculty and well reputed visiting faculty. As stipulated in the Research Concept (Annex 2.2) the School of Public Policy follows a well-defined research concept. The annex also outlines some of the academic accomplishments of scientific staff in terms of international publications, professional awards, external research grants. It also summarizes the research themes and strategies pursued by scholars associated with the degree programme. The Annex as well as CVs of the members of the School of Public Policy provide sufficient evidence that the scientific staff affiliated with the MPA are involved in research and development activities relevant to their field.

To promote academic exchange within the SPP academic community of faculty and students, the school organizes a fortnightly research seminar as well as convenes an Evidence-Based Policy seminar series on issues such as economic development, gender equality, demography, and political economy. The research base of the MPA programme is illustrated by the programme's consideration of adding a new specialization track on evidence-based policy making, the faculty expertise for which is deemed present in the school.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Research and development – Master of Public Administration

2. The (planned) research performance of the scientific or artistic staff in primary occupation at the private university assigned to the degree programme are in accordance with the university's approach and the respective subject culture.

According to CEU PU's MPA Program Proposal and the Research Strategy 2020-2025 (Annex 2.2.-Doctoral School of Political Science, Public Policy and International Relations Research Concept) the School of Public Policy (SPP) is one of "three academic units which constitutes the Doctoral School of Political Science". The results can be seen through publications, articles and monographs in respected international scientific journals and research grants. Through research outreach "Doctoral school faculty and students are deeply involved in the academic and policy studies community". Through research in cooperation within CEU PU and with other institutions outside, issues such as "economic development, to gender equality, demographic trends, and political economy" are tackled, which CEU PU considers according to the Mission Statement as important. This approach is linked with the Strategic Plan of CEU PU, which, according to Annex 1.1 - Introduction to CEU PU, states, that it will "be a globally-competitive institution of advanced research and higher learning committed to attaining the highest level of academic excellence...". CEU PU also offers "Research leave" to provide opportunities to enhance the knowledge of academic staff members and to profit from international experience.

Based on the above-mentioned documents, the criterion is considered to be **fulfilled**.

9.7 Assessment criterion § 17 (7): Co-operation

Co-operation - Master of Public Administration

The private university has envisaged co-operation projects with higher education partners and, if applicable, partners outside the higher education area in Austria and abroad which match the degree programme's profile and furthermore promote the mobility of students and staff.

In general, as stated in the Mission statement, CEU PU by 2025 "will be a University engaged in the life of its local community, a committed citizen of Vienna and Austria, and in regular collaboration with its European and global partners and networks". From this statement one can clearly draw the conclusion that mobility of student and staff is highly appreciated at CEU PU.

Being an international school with international student recruitment, and an international staff, international mobility is innate to the school's programme, and requires less emphasis international student mobility per se. Students and staff are internationally mobile to begin with.

According to CEU PU's MPA Program Proposal, the School for Public Policy (SPP) "has engaged with global initiatives and hosted numerous public events that have focused on developing an innovative research agenda". Besides that, "the school has built strategic partnerships with policy actors across the globe". It also uses the network of the Open Society Foundation and its institutions. It is a member of NASPAA, an association who amongst other activities, organizes international events in which students can participate.

As to staff mobility, staff members may take leave, which would free them to travel for academic purposes.

Also mobility between academia and practice is highly valued in the MPA programme through the Applied Policy Project's engagement with real life clients. Important are the relations with internship partners. The SPP partners with the Careers Office at CEU PU, which has a dedicated unit and budget for securing students' (voluntary) internships.

The experts consider the criterion to be **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

- The experts recommend to add the global cooperation partners on the website.

9.8 Summary and final evaluation – Master of Public Administration

Development and quality assurance of the degree programme:

The Two-year Master in Public Administration has been offered by the School for Public Policy since 2013. CEU PU has established a quality management system in accordance with its Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance Policy (IAQA), in which the quality assurance of the MPA is integrated. While the experts consider relevant stakeholders to be involved in the quality management process, they recommend the programme to organize in a more systematic way inputs from external stakeholders and the employers of the graduates.

Degree programme and degree programme management:

This multi-disciplinary programme is closely connected with the CEU PU's profile, mission and objectives, and is in line with the ambition of the School for Public Policy to become a hub for policy analysis. Among the global variation of the Master Degrees in Public Administration, the CEU PU MPA is a policy analysis oriented MPA. Combining academic knowledge with work based and applied skills in policy management, advocacy, and data analysis, the programme nurtures a generation of graduates who have the appropriate knowledge and skills to help define policy problems and devise solutions. Apart from missing a compulsory Public Management or Public Administration course, the programme is well-designed to deliver graduates who are knowledgeable of the multi-disciplinary nature of public administration and policy analysis, specialized in a number of substantive policy domains, and skilled to perform practical policy analytical techniques. Suiting the nature of the programme, the applied policy project is the capstone project instead of a thesis. The curriculum as well as teaching methods and formal graduation requirements ensure that students achieve intended learning outcomes. Students' workload can be regarded as feasible and ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved within the stipulated duration of studies. Examination rules and admission requirements are clearly defined and transparently communicated and a sample diploma supplement that meets the requirements is provided.

Staff:

The programme will be delivered by a sufficient number of teaching staff who have significant teaching experience as well as significant research experience in their fields. The student-staff ratio is very good and all members of scientific staff who teach in this degree programme have relevant multidisciplinary qualifications to provide teaching and instruction in the field of policy-oriented Public Administration. Many members of staff are engaged in research projects and are recognized specialists in their fields. A moderate teaching load and additional supplies for the academic staff ensure that there is enough time for research. CEU PU invests in continuous staff development which prioritizes research.

Funding:

CEU PU is funded by the CEU PU Endowment Fund which is considered to be secured also during times of crisis. The institutional financial plan of CEU PU ensure that sufficient funding for all degree programmes is provided during the whole period of accreditation. Therefore, CEU PU has enough resources to provide their services.

Infrastructure:

21,000 m² property will provide adequate facilities for students and staff. Additional 8,000 m² space are currently adapted. Rooms are well-equipped and the library contains extensive print and electronic collections complemented by a wide selection of databases and licenses for numerous electronic journals. This infrastructure will facilitate students and staff research and learning.

Research and development:

The School for Public Policy follows a well-defined research concept. With their team of well-equipped researchers the scientific outlook is to be considered outstanding as awards and research grants indicate.

CEU PU aims at becoming a leading research institution. So, research staff is obligated to publish regularly in internationally relevant academic journals. Their performance in doing so is part of the evaluation process in accordance with CEU PU Academic Staff Handbook. Therefore, the planned research performance and their evaluation fit in the Public Administration publishing culture.

Co-operation:

The School for Public Policy is an international school with an international student body, international staff, and international curriculum. International mobility is innate to the school's programme, as students and staff are internationally mobile to begin with. Next to this, the School for Public Policy engages with global initiatives, hosts numerous public events, and built strategic partnerships with policy actors across the globe. Mobility between academia and practice is highly valued in the MPA programme through the Applied Policy Project's engagement with real life clients and the relations with internship partners.

The experts **recommend the Board of the AQ Austria to accredit** the Master of Public Administration programme.

The expert panel members have the following **recommendations to CEU PU**:

- In the programme development more systematic attention could be given to the input of external stakeholders, such as employers of graduates: representatives from NGOs, international organisations, consultancies and public administrations.
- The Public Administration nature of the programme is implicit rather than explicit. The programme could do more to position its MPA in the disciplinary field, and clarify its disciplinary identity. This would also mark its difference with the Master in Public Policy.
- The interdisciplinary treatment of substantive policies in the specialisation tracks merits a better framing from a public administration perspective.
- The experts also recommend to make the Public Management course compulsory.
- Revise intended learning outcomes in each syllabus in line with a distinction between knowledge, skills, and competences.
- The experts recommend to describe explicitly in the syllabi which learning outcomes are evaluated by which examination methods.
- Adapt the diploma supplement to make a clear distinction between the compulsory nature of the Applied Policy Project and the elective nature of the thesis.
- The experts recommend to add the global cooperation partners on the website.

10 Documents reviewed

- application for the accreditation of a Doctoral Programme in Political Science, a Master Degree Programme in Political Science (One-Year), a Master Degree Programme in Political Science (Two-Year), a Master Degree Programme in International Relations (One-Year), a Master Degree Programme in International Relations (Two-Year), a Master Degree Programme in Public Policy (One-Year) and a Master Degree Programme in Public Administration (Two-Year)
- six registered video messages in which the President of the CEU PU, [...] , and the Provost of CEU PU, [...] answer questions on general issues handed in by the experts in writing (reception date: 26.03.2020)
- a set of written questions from the experts sent to the CEU PU on 27.03.2020, for which the CEU PU handed in the answers on 30.03.2020
- a fact sheet on the CEU PU Library received on 26.03.2020