

## Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS

on the study programmes:

- “International Business and Trade” (B.A.), Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences (Turkish Programme)
- “International Logistics and Transportation” (B.A.), Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences (Turkish Programme)
- “International Logistics and Transportation” (B.A.), Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences (English Programme)
- “International Trade” (B.A.), Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences (Turkish Programme)
- “International Trade” (B.A.), Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences (English Programme)

offered by Istanbul Gelişim University

**Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the Accreditation Commission in its 70<sup>th</sup> meeting on 19/20 February 2018, the Accreditation Commission decides:**

1. The study programmes “**International Business and Trade**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; Turkish Programme), “**International Logistics and Transportation**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; Turkish Programme), “**International Logistics and Transportation**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; English Programme), “**International Trade**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; Turkish Programme), “**International Trade**” (**Bachelor of Arts**; English Programme) offered by Istanbul Gelişim University are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is **conditional**.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of nine months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 November 2018**.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2024**.

### Conditions:

1. The university must document how the workload is calculated, how teaching staff is involved in this process and how the workload is spread over the period of one academic year. A mechanism must be implemented which secures that the workload is checked, the results are documented and measures are taken to adjust the workload accordingly

2. For each programme a course handbook must be handed in so that the Intended Learning Outcomes (ILO) of the programme as well as of the courses become transparent. The ILOs of the programmes as well as of the courses must be defined more precisely. The content, the teaching and the examination methods must be described and made available to students. A clear structure for the sequence of the competences should be defined and strictly executed.
3. The teaching staff has to be involved in the review process of the programme goals and the course ILO's.
4. The process of redefining the ILO's must be used to sharpen the profile of the programmes, e.g. through mapping course ILOs against the programme ILOs.
5. IGU must hand in an overview of the teaching staff as well as their quantitative involvement in the programmes (including also teaching hours in other programmes).

The conditions were fulfilled on time.  
The Accreditation Commission confirms this with its decision of 25.03.2019.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programme:

1. External stakeholders and students should be informed on the outcome of the QA procedures and the measures taken.
2. After finalizing their studies students should receive a questionnaire to evaluate the entire programme.
3. To strengthen the labour market orientation some measures should be taken at different levels:
  - a. a structured feedback system from the industry should be established
  - b. mandatory internships should be included in the programmes.
  - c. more classroom lecturing of practitioners should take place and institutionalized site visits of companies should be organised.
4. The internationalisation of the programmes should be strengthened, e.g. by a higher number of courses given in English, more language courses, guest lectures, English academic literature and exchange of faculty members and students.
5. In the programme "International Business and Trade" some additional courses on quantitative and qualitative aspects of research methodology as well as software skills and business related courses should be included (detailed information are given in the report).
6. In the programme "International Logistics and Transportation" some fundamental and present topics should be included such as leadership, intercultural management, purchasing, controlling (detailed information is provided in the report).
7. In the programme "International Trade" the Department should consider to integrate international topics such as political and legal systems, intercultural communication, negotiation techniques and business ethics.
8. An explicit programme should be developed for teaching staff in enhancing their teaching effectiveness, on new didactic concepts and to strengthen their research capacity.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Accreditation Commission refers to the attached assessment report.



## Experts' Report

on the bachelor degree programmes:

“International Business and Trade” (B.A.) (Turkish Programme)

“International Logistics and Transportation” (B.A.) (Turkish Programme)

“International Logistics and Transportation” (B.A.) (English Programme)

“International Trade” (B.A.) (Turkish Programme)

“International Trade” (B.A.) (English Programme)

offered by the Istanbul Gelişim University.

Visit to the University: October 23–27, 2017

### Panel of Experts:

<b>Prof. Dr. Hasan Bicak</b>	Ruaf Denktas University of North Cyprus
<b>Prof. Dr.-Ing. Alexander Kumpf</b>	University of Applied Science Landshut, Department of Business Administration
<b>Prof. Dr. Gerhard A. Wührer</b>	University of Linz, Faculty of Trade, Sales and Marketing
<b>Erdal Eler</b>	Airbus GmbH, Hamburg (representative from the labour market)
<b>Frederic Menninger</b>	Student of Konstanz University (student expert)

### Coordinators:

Doris Herrmann, Constanze Noack      AQAS, Cologne, Germany

## **I. Preamble**

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 85 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), which all Bologna countries agreed on as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines, degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution

## **II. Accreditation procedure**

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelors programmes in “International Business and Trade” (B.A.) (Turkish version), “International Logistics” (B.A.) (Turkish and English version) and “International Trade” (Turkish and English version) (B.A.) offered by Istanbul Gelişim University (IGU). It is based on the evaluation of the Self-Evaluation Report (SER) and attached documents and the interviews carried out with internal and external stakeholders during the site visit by the panel of experts.

### **1. Criteria**

The assessment of the programme is in accordance with a set of criteria for programme accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015 and feature a set of indicators used to demonstrate the fulfilment of each criterion. However, criteria are met even if single indicators are not fulfilled. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme as not all indicators are necessarily applicable to a programme.

National regulations, e.g. given by the Turkish Higher Education Council (YÖK), are respected within the accreditation process. The panel of experts is well aware that there may be conflicting perspectives between international practices or standards and national regulations which cannot be solved within a single accreditation procedure. Therefore in a few cases some recommendations have not been given in order to avoid a conflict of interest for the university.

### **2. Approach and methodology**

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in June 2017.

Istanbul Gelişim University prepared a Self Evaluation Report (SER). In July 2017, the university handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the study programme and an appendix.

The appendix included e.g.: Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs); CVs of the teaching staff; Information

on student services; information on the main library and undergraduate/graduate academic regulations. AQAS checked the SER draft for completeness, comprehensibility and transparency.

The accreditation procedure has been officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Accreditation Commission on August 28/29, 2017. The final version of the SER was submitted in September 2017.

#### *Nomination of the expert panel*

Composing the expert panel follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved.. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA) for the selection of experts.

The Accreditation Commission nominated the expert panel in September 2017. AQAS informed the university thereafter about the members of the expert panel and Istanbul Gelişim University did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential points in need of additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University as well as the panel members to increase transparency in the process and upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### *Site visit*

After review of the Self Evaluation Report, the site visit to the university took place from October 23–26, 2017. On site, the experts interviewed in separate discussions different stakeholders, such as the management of the HEI, the programme management, academic and administrative staff, students and alumni as well as representatives of the labour market. The panel also consulted additional documentation such as examples of graded work from students. The visit concluded with presenting a brief summary of the expert's preliminary findings to the university's representatives.

#### *Report writing*

Following the site visit, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to Istanbul Gelişim University for comments.

#### *Decision*

Together with the comments by Istanbul Gelişim University the expert report forms the basis for the AQAS Accreditation Commission to make a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these documents, the Accreditation Commission decided on the accreditation on 19/20 February 2018. AQAS forwarded the decision to IGU. The university has the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In March 2018 AQAS published the report and the accreditation result of the accreditation as along with the names of the panel of experts.

### **III. General Information on the University**

---

Istanbul Gelişim University consists of three faculties, three institutes, four graduate schools, and two vocational schools offering a wide range of graduate and postgraduate programmes, namely the Faculty of Economics, Administrative and Social Sciences, the Faculty of Fine Arts, the Faculty of Engineering and Architecture; the Institute of Social Sciences, the Institute of Natural and Applied Sciences, the Institute of Health Sciences, and the School of Applied Science, the School

of Foreign Languages, the School of Physical Education and Sports, and the School of Health Sciences.

The University is structured as every comparable public institution of identical status in accordance to the Law of Higher Education of the Turkish Republic. Therefore all university bodies and organs such as rectorate or senate are present. Yet every private university is obliged by the Amendments of the Law on Higher Education to have a "Board of Trustees". It enters a contract with the Rector, all faculty members and all other staff. Furthermore, it decides on the budget, all hiring and termination decisions and the amount of annual tuition fees.

IGU pursues the goal of becoming an international education and learning institution by running joint projects with internationally recognized schools, by setting up a global research network and by providing high quality professional education in Turkish and English. A strategic plan 2016-2020 defines these objectives together with those of further developing and implementing graduate education and improving service processes as the main targets to be achieved by the university in the near future.

The University has the goal to follow in its educational approach the principle of creative teaching and participatory learning. The university aims to educate civically engaged, self-reliant individuals by providing excellence and highest quality in its study programmes and by fostering critical intellectual development.

Istanbul Gelişim University offers continuous scholarships, free courses, internships and job opportunities to students. It supports international student exchange programmes. At the same time, it strives to support students' individual, social and academic development during university life. Students can receive consultation and help for their needs at the Psychological Counseling Guidance Unit. As outlined by the university, it supports its students in extra-curricular activities such as student clubs and student councils, summer schools and conferences.

IGU participates in the Erasmus+ programme and encourages student and staff mobility. As outlined by the university, the number of European partner institutions is currently 73. The International Relations Office shares responsibility for the organization of mobility.

#### **IV. Assessment of the study programmes**

---

##### **1. Policy and Procedures for Quality Assurance**

*The programme is subject to the Higher Education Institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*[ESG 1.1]*

##### **Description**

As outlined by the university, one of Istanbul Gelişim University's main objectives in quality assurance lies in the effective participation of internal and external stakeholders in all activities in accordance with international quality standards.

According to IGU's statement the establishment of the quality assurance system of the university is based on ISO 9000 Quality Management System, TS EN ISO-9001: 2015, Higher Education Law

No. 2547 and “Higher Education Quality Assurance Regulation”. The aims, mission and vision of the university are determined according to these criteria and their appropriateness is measured.

In this regard feedback of internal and external stakeholders shall be collected within the framework of the University Quality Commission. It consists of the Rector, Vice-rector and 14 members from various faculties, institutes, vocational schools and colleges. The commission is supposed to define, implement and further develop factors necessary for the improvement of quality standards. It thus evaluates reports, surveys and suggestions by students and external stakeholders. Additionally, an Office of Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance is implemented which is working in coordination with the commission. The main performance indicators set at Istanbul Gelişim University are: a) Number of Programmes, b) Number of Students, c) Number of Academic Personnel, d) Number of Programmes taught in English, e) Erasmus Mobility, f) Student Activities, g) Number of Research Sources, and h) Academic Publication Numbers of Staff.

The incorporation of feedback of internal and external stakeholders forms the basis for the further development of study programmes. Evaluation reports have to be approved by the Rector, reviewed by Deans and Heads of study programmes and acknowledged by the Senate. A student council creates further opportunities for students to participate in the supervision of programmes, as presented by the university.

Furthermore, the SER explains that several measures are supposed to be in place to monitor programme quality, e.g. by using regular course assessment questionnaires. As mentioned above, the university obtains data covering various activities of its programmes. At the end of each term, student’s evaluations are taken into account in a success analysis.

The Istanbul Gelişim University Graduates and Members Association was established in May 2017 to continue the university’s relation with its graduates, to increase information sharing, foster graduates’ solidarity and to follow-up on their career developments.

The departments of International Trade and International Logistics and Transportation have been operational for six years. Currently 202 students are admitted in the International Trade department and 184 students in the International Logistics and Transportation department. The departments of International Trade in English and International Logistics and Transportation in English have been operational for three years. In the International Trade in English department 100 students are admitted and 61 students in the International Logistics and Transportation in English department. The department of International Business and Trade has been operational for a year and has 25 students.

### **Experts’ Evaluation**

For all programmes at IGU the desired qualifications achieved through the programme are presented as Intended Learning Outcomes. They are both subject-specific and interdisciplinary in nature. The university explained that if it is needed and if requests from the academic area change, the descriptions of the programme ILOs are revised. So the panel of experts has no concerns that a procedure for the review of the course description is in place. The ILOs are available to the students and give them an orientation; however, the descriptions are not detailed enough to be comparable with “good practices” at other European universities (see Chapter 2) and there are several inconsistencies.

During the site visit at Istanbul Gelişim University details of the quality assurance system of the university on a general level were presented. There is no doubt that processes, regulations and criteria are in place which are appropriate to check the relevant study programmes. The QA system is documented and comprehensive. It involves instruments with different scopes, such as course evaluations, programme evaluations, progression and completion rates as well as evaluations of the learning environment and support services. The practice of IGU, that students have to fill in the course evaluation in order to see their examination results may lead to the situation that

they just evaluate somehow in order to see quickly their grades. IGU should monitor if it wants to keep this practice.

It remained intransparent, however, how the student workload is checked and corrected, although representatives of the departments explained that this issue is discussed with the students. IGU must reconsider the workload calculation because there seems to be some inconsistency between the duration of the academic semester (14 weeks) and the examination period (3 weeks) in relation to the hours of workload. IGU must implement a mechanism which secures that the workload is checked, the results are documented and measures are taken to adjust the workload accordingly (see also Chapter 2). In case there should be a gap between teaching staff assessment and student assessment of workload, it needs to be resolved appropriately. **(Finding 1)** It might be also necessary to inform the students at the beginning of a seminar or lecture, how many hours they should devote to their studies.

It is also unclear how changing societal needs are evaluated – in addition to the exchange with the labour market which takes place. Students are involved in the quality-assurance procedure for the programmes. They are represented in the different commissions and bodies of IGU and experiences from student groups are used for the enhancement of the programmes. Istanbul Gelişim University follows an ideal of a quality culture which also includes that the results of quality-assurance procedures lead to concrete measures to enhance quality of teaching and learning and tries to resolve identified conflicts. Nevertheless, it would be helpful for the commitment of teaching staff and students to QA if the core results of the evaluation procedures would be shared with them. **(Finding 2)**

The career progression of graduates from the study programmes is followed. IGU should develop a questionnaire for alumni to receive an overall feedback on the programmes. **(Finding 3)** For the reaccreditation of its programmes IGU has to show how data on alumni experiences are considered for the further development of the programmes.

Beside this, a structured feedback system from the labour market should be established. **(Finding 4)** Today the University invites, on a regular basis, representatives from the labour market, but there seems to be no structured exchange (e.g. agenda, meeting minutes, defined regular topics).

## Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled because of the lack of a complete and updated course handbook for the specific programmes. For each programme such a handbook has to be handed in so that the Intended Learning Outcomes (ILO) of the programmes as well as of the courses become transparent. The content, the teaching and the examination methods have to be clearly defined. These documents must be made available to the students.

## 2. Quality of the Curriculum

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG1.2]



## Description

### Study programme objectives

The objective of the “**International Business and Trade**” programme is to enable students to be recognized in the international arena and by the business world in Turkey. Through high quality and standards of education within the curriculum, the department aims to integrate students in good position. In the SER the University explains that students are acquainted with necessary qualities of the business and commerce. This should enable students to strive for careers in business life. Career opportunities of this programme lie in the private and public institutions administrative areas such as executive director, foreign trade specialist, investment and risk manager. Furthermore it should enable students to set up their own business..

Globalisation of international trade resulted in an increase of the common market's efforts to join the land-air-sea transportation and the logistics services provided to companies. For companies providing this service upgrading their service quality and standards is inevitable. To meet the needs of a logistics customer in every aspect, there is a need for qualified middle and high level staff. The aim and objective of the “**International Logistics and Transportation**” programme is to train the needed personnel. Students are educated to develop competences the private sector requires such as the ability to analyse and synthesise as well as the ability to communicate in a foreign language. Students are provided with internship opportunities and integrated into the research work of the academic staff. Career opportunities are open within the rising commercial area of Turkey in the international trade and logistics industry. As students are trained in economic, legal, political, and cultural aspects occupations in foreign trade, finance and logistics are possible. Especially in import and export companies and customs consultancy a growing number of job opportunities arise as logistics specialist or in other administrative positions.

With globalisation accelerating the economic development of a country international trade becomes of growing importance. Within the programme “**International Trade**” concepts and practices of international trade such as economics, law and business dominate to equip students with the knowledge to work for the Turkish government and in businesses, and to contribute to international trade import and export strategies and policies enhancing performance in modern foreign trade. Students are trained theoretically and practically in national and global competitive strategies with an international vision. The overall aim and scope of the programme are entrepreneurial spirited, self-confident students equipped with the necessary scientific and social skills as well as scientific thinking and managerial skills to work interdisciplinary. Students should be enabled to provide solutions to problems. Graduates should have career opportunities with international trade or foreign trade companies, in all public and private sector institutions as administrative assistant, manager or assistant specialist.

### Curriculum

International Business and Trade, International Logistics and Transport and International Trade departments have instructional plans consisting of compulsory and elective courses. Some compulsory courses are university wide compulsory such as “Ataturk’s Principles and History of the Turkish Revolution”. The departments aim not only to teach business, trade and logistics courses but also courses from other departments within their programmes. These subject-related courses and the cross-subject courses are designed to expand students’ business opportunities and raise awareness for future work areas. The programmes are coordinated in cooperation with departmental lecturers, department research assistants and faculty secretariats, under the leadership of the department head. Wishes and requests are coordinated by the department heads. Lecturers encourage students to conduct research on the basis of the information students receive in the lessons. By making various assignments, presentations, projects and group work, students are provided with basic knowledge on how to conduct research. In addition, departments meet with the leading firms in the sector to support joint projects.

The first four semesters of the programme “**International Business and Trade**” introduce the basics and compulsory courses such as “Introduction to economics”, “International Trade I” or “Trade Law”. From semester five onwards selective courses can be chosen from a preselected pool including non major courses from other departments.

Similar, the programme “**International Logistics and Transportation**” teaches the compulsory and basic courses within the first four semesters such as “Storage and Inventory”, “Logistics Service Marketing” or “Railway Transportation”. Further compulsory courses such as “Sea Transportation Management” or “Air Transportation Management” follow from semester five onward coupled with selective courses also from a preselected pool.

The programme “**International Trade**” follows the structure of the other programmes. The first four semesters give room for the compulsory courses such as “International Trade”, “Import and Export Management” or “Foreign Exchange Regimes and Foreign Trade”. The following semesters students choose selective courses from the preselected pool next to the further compulsory courses.

### Course descriptions

The course handbook is organized to help students. This student handbook only provides policies that are in effect at the date of publication, yet does not guarantee that these policies will not be changed. The student handbook is updated in this regard. Current regulations and guidelines can also be accessed from the web site of the university. Annually department updates are made by the department heads and sent to the dean. Teaching staff distributes a syllabus at the beginning of the class.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

On a general level the responsibilities and expectations within the programmes are defined. The panel of experts was satisfied with most of the information that was provided by the management and staff members during the site visit at IGU. Nevertheless, it causes a problem of transparency for the experts that the course handbook does not give specific information on the Intended Learning Outcomes (ILO), content, teaching methods and examinations so that not all the elements of the programmes are clearly defined and available to students. The description of the ILOs should distinguish between knowledge, skills and competencies. The course handbooks for the programmes in the Cluster of “International Trade and Logistics” have some shortcomings which must be remedied. The format of the course handbooks should be improved and the descriptions should be completed (e.g. academic literature and the teaching language should be included; courses given in English should be described in English). **(Finding 5)**

In the discussions with the teaching staff it became obvious that some of the instructors have taken over already existing course descriptions without being familiar with the ILOs. Therefore, all teaching staff members who are involved in teaching the courses should also be involved in the review process for the definition of the Learning Outcomes and the output needs to be monitored and approved by internal commissions or authorities. **(Finding 6)**

During the site visit the panel of experts discussed with the staff members that the three study programmes are characterized by a great similarity and that they share courses; the reason for this practice has been discussed as well. IGU should use the process of reviewing the Learning Outcomes to also work on the sharpening of the goals of the programmes. The target of the university should be to provide clearly distinguishable programmes. It would be recommendable to use a mapping technique for the courses to get an overview and to be sure that parts of the curriculum are not left out. **(Finding 8)**

Depending on the goals of the programmes and depending on international standards some up-to-date courses should be added to each of the programmes (see programme specific findings below).

For the programmes which have an English track a preparation year is mandatory. Although the students get English language training in this period, there still seem to be some shortcomings in their level of English. IGU should check if the training courses are effective to reach the intended level which is needed to follow the programmes.

The academic degree awarded to the graduates corresponds to the Learning Outcomes and the requirements of the appropriate level of the Turkish Qualifications Framework.

#### Curricular Elements and Programme Quality

The curricular structure of the study programme supports the achievement of the Learning Outcomes. Most of the curricular elements yet not all are documented. The curriculum defines which elements are compulsory and which are electives. A typical course plan is available for the programmes. It would be helpful to students if any prerequisites for modules (if relevant) would be mentioned in the course descriptions. The order of curricular elements supports the learner's progression but some courses are given too late in the curriculum. Some examples are:

1) International Business and Trade: International Trade and E-Trade together at 2<sup>nd</sup> semester seems to be very early before students get the basic knowledge. Statistics at 4<sup>th</sup> semester seems to be very late.

2) International Logistics and Transportation: Customs Administration 1<sup>st</sup> semester without knowledge of Foreign trade management 2<sup>nd</sup> semester or export policies 3<sup>rd</sup> semester. Introduction in Transportation management together with Railway transportation at same 4<sup>th</sup> semester Railway transportation should be after the introduction. The placement of the courses Sea Transportation in 5<sup>th</sup> semester and Port Management in 8<sup>th</sup> semester could be ok but there is too much time distance between the courses.

A clear structure for the sequence of the competences should be defined and strictly executed.

#### **(see Finding 5)**

There is no doubt that in principle the curriculum of each programme covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge as well as subject-related, methodological and general skills. But the experts can only come to a reliable conclusion about this issue when complete and detailed course descriptions are handed in. The curriculum defines which courses are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes. Curricular modifications have been documented.

For the longer existing programmes the experts had the opportunity to check some final theses. These final exams demonstrated that the intended level of qualification has been achieved after completing the programme.

Istanbul Gelişim University strives to attract more foreign guest students as well as international teaching and research staff. **(Finding 8)**

#### 2.1 Remarks on "International Business and Trade" (B.A.) (Turkish Programme)

The already described shortcomings of the Course Handbooks are also true for International Business and Trade, which descriptions are not complete: some descriptions are lacking, some information remains unclear.

Regarding research methods and analytical skills, there are no specific modules covering quantitative and qualitative aspects of research methodology. Some elements might be taught in non-specific subjects. A specific course should also cover software skills (e.g. SPSS, or R) which are necessary for research projects. An important aspect in an 'International Business and Trade' programme should cover in-depth international business-to-business marketing, business negoti-

ations in different cultural environments. The intercultural and international exposure of the students should be strengthened. **(Finding 9)**

The literature suggested for the specific modules is mostly in Turkish (e.g. International Trade, Introduction to Economics, Management and Organizations). As the courses should prepare the graduates for a position in the international business arena, the language of the present course material should be reconsidered and when necessary changed. **(see Finding 8)**

## 2.2 Remarks on “International Logistics and Transportation” (B.A.) (Turkish and English Programme)

The “International Logistics and Transportation” programme is offered in Turkish and in English. The structure and the courses of both tracks are the same; the only difference between the tracks is the course language at the majority of the courses. Nevertheless both tracks are offered in parallel and the students are either on the Turkish track or on the English track. In order to graduate from this programme students have to take 48 courses within 8 semesters with in total 240 ECTS. These 48 courses are composed out of 16 academic core courses, 22 major courses and 11 elective courses, which can be chosen individually by the student from the 5th semester on out of a variety of elective courses within and outside of the department. The ECTS for each course varies between 2 and 8 ECTS and the direct contact hours varies between 2 and 3 hours for each course. The majority of the courses have 6 ECTS and 3 contact hours.

Particularly for the English track but also for the Turkish track student mobility is strongly recommended. However the structure of the programme has limitations since the number of credits and the number of courses are not comparable with - for example - the practice at German universities (usually 5 ECTS and 6 courses are given each semester). This might cause difficulties in transferring and recognizing the credits of incoming and outgoing students.

The structure and offered courses provide a good basic knowledge on international logistics, however, some important fundamental and present topics are missing. For international business, logistics and trade activities in practically topics such as leadership, intercultural management, purchasing, controlling / key performance measurement, business ethics / CSR, information technology, lean management, green logistics and operations research are very important. **(Finding 10)**

The course descriptions of a wide range of courses are inconsistent (the Learning Outcome is not specific and not consistent, recommended literature is missing or the descriptions are not written in the language of the course, for example Fundamentals of law, Customs administration, Import and Export Management, Financial Mathematics, Introduction to transportation management, Railway transportation, Storage and inventory, International Transportation, Sea transportation and management, Administrative structure of Turkey, Air transport management, Business English II, Road transportation, Transportation politics, International agreement, Supply Chain Management, Turkish Economy and Statistics. **(see Finding 5)**

There is no evidence that a good command of English is really a precondition for a successful completion of the English study track.

## 2.3 Remarks on “International Trade” (B.A.) (Turkish and English Programme)

The “International Trade” programme is offered in Turkish and a student who graduates from this programme needs to take 46 courses equivalent to 240 ECTS. These 46 courses are composed of 9 academic core courses and 27 major courses making up 36 courses which students have to take and 10 elective courses of which 3 are non-departmental and 7 are departmental electives.

It is important to note that elective courses are not grouped with respect to their Intended Learning Outcomes. Therefore the panel of expert got the impression that - irrespective of an elective course a student chooses – he/she will achieve the same intended LOs. Since it was not clear if the students are guided in the selections process, it is possible that a student could take an elective that would not contribute to the achievement of the programmes' LOs.

In semesters 5 and 7 the ECTS of elective courses (6 ECTS) are higher than the major courses i.e. International Finance (3 ECTS), Human Resources Management (4 ECTS). Furthermore the ECTS of YDL 101 English 1 has 4 ECTS in the course description (profile) while it has 3 ECTS in the curriculum of the International Trade programme. All these inconsistencies need to be resolved by revising the course and programme ILOs appropriately and mapping them. **(see Finding 5)**

In the discussions during the site visit the Department members mentioned that they would like to prepare their students for public and governmental institutions such as chamber of commerce, embassies etc. Therefore the Department should consider to include international topics like political and legal systems, intercultural communication, negotiation techniques and business ethics which would be very helpful for the students. **(Finding 11)**

## Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled. Many aspects are covered and fulfilled but the profile of each programme has to be sharpened when redefining the intended Learning Outcomes of the courses.

## 3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

### Description

#### Teaching and Learning

Concerning learning and teaching the Self-Evaluation Report (SER) states that student-centered, teaching and learning materials are used in teaching. Presentations, individual or group assignments, projects are adopted. When the Board of Department convenes, the views of the students are taken into account. According to the SER, extra curriculum activities such as workshops, seminars, and conferences are organised that take into consideration the interest of the student, as well as the needs of the labour market.

IGU describes in the SER that for students who cannot attend classes due to various reasons there is the opportunity to study via long distance learning. Students with disabilities or special needs are provided with special exams. In addition, selected student representative take part in meetings and are solving problems, responding to requests and complaints that they may encounter throughout the training period.

IGU offers entrepreneurship courses and other certificate programmes so that the students get prepared for the business life. Seminars, courses and certificate programmes that are organized under the roof of the Lifelong Learning Coordinator within the university trains students to be effective in fields such as communication and foreign languages.

Istanbul Gelişim University has been taking part in the Erasmus+ Programme since 2008-2009. The number of students and faculty members who benefit from the Erasmus Program is given in the SER. As a partner in the Erasmus Programme, the University has signed 73 bilateral agreements with various universities from 23 countries. The International Relations Office lends assistance for the incoming students and supports outgoing students, too.

### Student Assessment

Regarding the assessment of student work IGU measures and evaluates student success according to Istanbul Gelişim University Regulations for Examinations and High Education that was formulated in compliance with the Law of Higher Education. There are two relevant exams in each programme: one mid-term exam and a final exam. According to the SER some courses have written exams and oral exams, some course also require students to carry out presentations. Responsible instructors and lecturers determine the most convenient measures among those and their ratio of contribution to overall success. Therefore every student should have the opportunity to be familiarised with an appropriate spectrum of examination types over the course of the studies.

Students and other stakeholders have access to assessment criteria and course descriptions via the website and the online systems (OBIS). Grades are presented to students through these systems as soon as they get approved by the Registrar's Office.

The Academic calendar is published on the university's official web sites before the beginning of that academic year. A semester consists of 14 weeks plus 3 weeks for the exams. It is possible to take a make-up exam for student which is organised after two weeks of final exam. In calculating students' grades, 40 % mid-term examination grades and 60 % of the final or make-up examination grades are considered. Students are successful if lecture success grades are 60 and above.

The organization of the exams is carried out by the Planning Unit. Sufficient for the examinations are separated and the course load of each student is taken into consideration and the optimal examination is put into the programme. It is the responsibility of the exam coordinator to take all precautions for the safety of the examinations and the procedures.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

During the site visit at IGU the teaching staff explained that different teaching methods are used to support students in self studying. Because further information needs to be included in the course descriptions, the panel of experts cannot come to a conclusion if the methods of teaching and learning are appropriate and correspond to the Intended Learning Outcomes, yet. The experts got the impression that Gelişim University tries to take into account the diversity of students and their needs, enabling flexible learning paths. A consultancy for disabled students is offered, regulations exist to support them and also personal help is offered. Some of the buildings seem not always be well accessible for disabled students. IGU offers the opportunity of long-distance learning.

Assessment regulations and procedures are defined and made available in published form to students. Assessment methods seem to be suitable to achieve the Learning Outcomes and students should be familiarised with a variety of examination types over the course of the studies but both aspects can only be assessed by the panel of experts if detailed course descriptions will be handed in. Changes to the examination concept are documented. The panel of experts discussed if it is appropriate for calculating the final grade only to focus on the mid-term and final exams. They see the danger that students do not receive an appropriate feedback for their progression of learning. For international recognition this issue could become difficult because the number of exams might be considered too little and because both exams get a high value in the final grade of the student which might be inappropriate. The experts were informed that this practice refers to a national regulation in Turkey but they would like to support the University to discuss this issue and to implement alternative ways to check students and to give feedback concerning their progression in the learning process. **(Finding 12)**

Responsibilities and structures related to the organisation of exams are clearly defined. The timing of exams is organised appropriately and examination dates are announced in a timely manner. Suitable opportunities to re-sit an exam are offered as necessary. There are transparent and published regulations to compensate for disadvantages, illness, absence, or other mitigating circumstances that may affect a student.

Istanbul Gelişim University collects data on different aspects of the student-life-cycle, including the number of failed examinations in the study programme. Grading scales and the distribution of grades is documented and assessed.

Due to the fact that the main goal of a university is to support young individuals in lifelong learning, employability and social responsibility the question was discussed in which courses these aspects are particularly transferred. Transparent ILO's in the course handbooks would help to assess how this is implemented in the curriculum.

IGU supports students on different levels, one example is the Psychological Counselling Service, which gives students psychological support and advice in hard times. Furthermore, there are numerous students clubs. Some of these clubs are intended to gain practical experience (e.g. logistics and trade club or young entrepreneurs' club).

#### Labour Market Orientation

Istanbul Gelisim University seems to have a strong career oriented consulting support for its students. Nevertheless, the transferability of student's knowledge into the working environment should be strengthened to enhance employability. An internship is not included in the programmes but the students receive support if they are looking for internships on their own. If the national regulations allow this, mandatory internships should be included in the programmes (not before 5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup> semester). **(see Finding 4)**

For the students it is also helpful that practical projects are included in the curriculum, as for example a course on „International Transportation“, in which students interview companies from the private sector in order to get information from real business life. It is a good example how students get in touch with companies and gain experience how to work with professionals and how business in transportation works in practical life. The panel of experts appreciates that a regular exchange between teaching staff and representatives of the labour market takes place. These contacts should be used to include more classroom lecturing of experts with practical experiences in the field and institutionalized site visits of companies. All external part time lecturers should be supported/ under the supervision of a permanent teaching staff of the Departments. **(see Finding 4)**

The panel of experts gained the impression that the programmes focus strongly on the needs of the regional labour market. Higher education is preparing for business life and international orientated programmes only make sense in case the students are prepared to work abroad or at least are in permanent contact with international companies. Therefore, the departments should review if graduates receive sufficient preparation for becoming business people for the national or the international job market. If the later should be addressed, it has to be ensured that more courses are taught in English. **(see Finding 8)**

#### **Conclusion**

The criterion is partly fulfilled. The labour market orientation of the programmes should be developed further to improve employability.

#### 4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

##### **Description**

##### Admittance to the study programme

Students are placed in associate's and bachelor's programmes through a central examination system and within the framework of regulations set by the Council of Higher Education. Students who graduate from secondary education institutions are placed to the programmes they want to study based on the scores they got from the central examination. Students who select one of the programmes of Gelişim Vocational School, or Faculty of Fine Arts, Faculty of Architecture and Engineering, and Faculty of Economic, Administrative and Social Sciences and placed in these programmes based on the scores they got from the YGS (Transition to Higher Education Examination) and LYS (Undergraduate Placement Examination) become eligible to register at the university.

For programmes with foreign language instruction students must pass the foreign language proficiency exam at Istanbul Gelişim University in order to start their undergraduate or associate degree programme.

In order to help the students choosing a programme, IGU Promotion Days are organized. In this process, students are given detailed information about the departments and the respective programmes.

During the site visit IGU informed the panel of experts that there are 3,300 students enrolled in the Faculty. In 2016/17 336 students graduated the programmes.

Istanbul Gelişim University offers free English language courses Saturdays, with all-inclusive breakfast. These courses run all year long, specifically for foundation year students. The weekend school focuses on two areas, first general English speaking skills in the morning and second vocational English terminology in the afternoon. General English courses are popular courses for everyday conversational English.

##### Creditation and Recognition

The curricula are structured in compliance with the European Qualification Framework. The four-year programmes "International Trade", "International Business and Trade", and "International Logistics and Transportation" consist of 8 semesters and a total of 240 ECTS must be obtained during this period. Istanbul Gelişim University operates with an academic year consisting of two periods. The workload and credits correspond to 30 ECTS per semester or 60 ECTS in an academic year with 1530 hours of student workload. 1 ECTS corresponds to 25.5 h of workload.

Before a student leaves to study abroad, a "recognition sheet" is prepared taking account of the courses in the learning agreement. Istanbul Gelişim University gives full academic recognition to the courses taken and ECTS received from the universities abroad. An "Academic Recognition Sheet" is prepared by the Departmental Coordinator considering the documents in the Transcript of Records gained abroad.

##### Certification

Graduated students receive a "Diploma Supplement" with their diplomas. This supplement is based on a model developed by European Commission, European Council and UNESCO/CEPES. It is approved by Higher Education Institutions.



## Experts' Evaluation

The panel of experts comes to the conclusion that all administrative procedures are in place at Istanbul Gelişim University. Formal requirements for admission are clearly defined and available in published form. Specific prerequisites are not relevant for these study programmes. The selection procedure for the study programmes follows defined (national) criteria. Admission requirements are shown to support the objectives of the study programmes. The admission requirements are or have been adjusted when necessary. Qualitative and quantitative data is available on the admission procedures of past cohorts.

Turkey is working on regulations for recognition of Higher Education Qualifications, previous periods of study and prior learning, including the recognition of non-formal and informal learning. Therefore, it does not lie within the responsibility of a single university to define criteria on these issues.

Graduates receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including context, level, and status of the studies (Diploma Supplement).

Learning agreements are used by IGU to facilitate mobility of students. IGU gives the chance of gaining double diploma degrees at foreign universities which is highly appreciated by the panel of experts. The panel of experts was also impressed by the financial support and scholarships the students can receive from Istanbul Gelişim University when going abroad. Because advanced English language skills are needed, as most of the partner universities are in the United States of America, measure to strengthen internationalisation should be taken. A concept of "internationalization at home" should be considered (see above).

The panel of experts has concerns concerning the workload. First of all, there is a gap between the goal of the university striving for excellence and the student workload of 1530 hours per academic year which is significantly higher than at other universities. Secondly, during the site visit it was unclear how the workload is distributed over the study term (14 weeks of studies and 3 weeks of examination). In the discussions with the experts the students calculated the workload differently compared to the information given in the course handbook. This gap has to be closed. The university must explain how the workload is calculated, how teaching staff is involved in this process and how the workload is spread over the period of one academic year. **(see Finding 1)**

## Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled. The procedure for workload calculation and the distribution of the workload over the academic year needs to be justified. At the beginning of the courses students should be informed about the expected working load in hours per semester, so they can make up their plans for the academic year.

## 5. Teaching Staff

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of the staff.*

*[ESG 1.5]*

## Description

The management of human resources is organized through a central system trying to achieve optimum performance. The Strategic Planning and Quality Assurance Office assures a consistent distribution of faculty members having equal workload. Staff is informed about the university's aims and objectives during their work and evaluation meetings. Furthermore they are rewarded

according to their performance and further benchmark indicators and have the opportunity to take part in the regularly offered training programmes by the university. Newly hired professors and lecturers go through a process of orientation with the help of the head of the department and research assistants.

During the site visit the Dean of the Faculty of Economics, Administrative, and Social Sciences explained that there are 121 staff members: 14 professors, 4 Associate Professors, 79 Assistant Professors plus lecturers. Some taught at state universities before, none is retired.

Although the SER states that most of the academic positions at the department are full-time permanent positions some contracts of academic staff are formed on an annual basis at Istanbul Gelişim University according to the Turkish Labour Law. In these cases the contracts for temporary academic positions are being renewed on condition of a bilateral agreement of both parties as well as the results of the annual student survey evaluating the institutions and instructors at the end of every academic year.

When positions expire during the accreditation period or academic staff leaves before the contracted period new advertisements are announced on the "Higher Education Institution" official web site immediately. As semester courses must be maintained, new teaching staff is hired according to their specialty.

In the SER IGU describes that the requirements of the teaching staff are firstly communicated by the department/programme presidencies to deanships/directors. The deanship/directorates inform the rectorate of the required teaching staff qualifications through a written request. The Rectorate assesses the received demands and provides coordination to reveal the total need.

Within the scope of the Higher Education Law numbered 2547, appointment and promotion conditions for higher education institutions are taken as basis for recruitment and appointment of teaching staff. The process for academic staff recruitment in Turkish higher education institutions is regulated by the legislations of the Council of Turkish Higher Education (YÖK) and done in accordance. These processes for academic staff recruitment are being checked by the Council annually for transparency and fairness. Besides this, all the recruitment process evaluations are being published on our website to provide further transparency.

IGU describes that application documents such as the bachelor's degree transcript are evaluated together with the written exam score of ALES and YDS (ALES and YDS are Turkish exams). According to a weighted average of these scores the person for employment is determined. The assessment through this measurement ensures justice among the candidates during the hiring process. New academic staff members are furthermore recruited due to their research, academic portfolio, experiences and English proficiency. With regard to fields requiring special expertise, individuals known for their work and publications are employed by the university with tuition hourly wages. In the recruitment of administrative staff, a different way is utilized and employees are only hired if they possess the necessary knowledge and experience so that they can produce solutions to any sort of problem that can be faced.

Istanbul Gelişim University aims to increase the number of academic resources available on a regular basis in order to provide both students and academic staff with enough support in their academic studies and research.

The university lists the publications and research projects of the full-time instructors of the International Business and Trade Department in the SER.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

The panel of experts experienced many young and motivated staff members at IGU so that one of the preconditions for a high level education is fulfilled. There is a variety of practical expertise included in the teaching staff, but the already existing practical experience should be broadened

when new staff will be hired. Emphasis should be put on international and practical experience. The teaching staff should be encouraged to join academic associations and to become an active member in national and international (research oriented) organisations. **(Finding 13)**

Due to the wide range of courses in the three programmes, sometimes the topics of teaching seem not to lie within the expertise of the young assistant professors. IGU should assure that all subjects which are taught in the programmes can be covered by qualified teaching staff of the academic field or by experienced practitioners from the labour market.

Especially at the Department of International Logistics and Transportation the staff members have a short time membership at the university. To avoid that staff turnover is getting too high, it would be beneficial for the HR management of IGU to offer also contracts with a longer duration.

The experts learned during the site visit that a range of courses is offered by IGU to support the teaching and the administrative staff. There are no doubts that measures for staff development are part of the good practice at IGU. The reputation of IGU in the academic arena depends on the research output of the academic staff via articles, conference proceedings, and book contributions. The qualification of the teaching staff to become assistant professor or full professor depends on the research output too. Therefore it could be one element of success of the University if an explicit programme would be introduced for teaching staff in enhancing their teaching effectiveness, on new didactic concepts and to strengthen their research capacity. **(Finding 14)**

IGU has a process in place to check the required resources with regard to the capacity of the institution. Positions are either filled, advertised or in the middle of appointment proceedings. When contracts expire in the next five to seven years, IGU intends to fill the position anew. Transparent recruitment procedures for teaching staff are in place. Information on staff member are available in the SER but not detailed enough. It would be helpful for the panel of experts to get an overview over the teaching staff as well as over their quantitative involvement (teaching hours) in the programmes. If their teaching hours include offerings open to other programmes, this has to be included. **(Finding 15)**

If associate/part time lecturers are involved in the programme, they are made familiar with the requirements of the programme.

## **Conclusion**

The criterion is partly fulfilled. The teaching staff of IGU should be supported by developing an explicit programme to enhance their teaching effectiveness, to make them familiar with new didactic concepts, to strengthen their research capacity and to widen their national and international work experiences.

## **6. Learning Resources and Student Support**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students to advise on achieving successful completion of their studies.*

*[ESG 1.6]*

### **Description**

#### Facilities and resources

IGU is distributed over three campuses in Istanbul. Overall, facilities comprise 24.400 m<sup>2</sup> of indoor areas with classrooms, conference rooms, reading rooms and exhibition rooms. Students can benefit from 13 fully equipped computer laboratories and several libraries, as defined by the uni-

versity. In addition, the campuses host cafeterias, health centers, a fitness club and a radio and television studio.

Students can access learning material and online courses via a Learning Management System provided by IGU. A Student Information System and a Student Mail System facilitate registration and the information exchange. The Department of Information Technology monitors all soft- and hardware systems and IT areas for students and staff.

IGU Library and Documentation Centre currently contain ca. 115,000 items of learning material, including electronic sources such as E-Books and online journals. The seating capacity amounts to 200. According to the university, the library and documentation centre is designed to meet all kinds of information and documentation requirements of its students, academic and administrative staff.

The study programmes are financed mainly by tuition fees. According to IGU, the financial resources of the university are determined and distributed in the budget period every year considering the physical and technical requirements for the sustainability of programmes as well as student and teaching staff numbers.

### Student Support

Although the university charges tuition fees it provides financial aid and scholarships to many of its students. Besides these scholarships, free courses, internships and job opportunities are provided for students. IGU aims to support students' individual, social and academic development during university life. The support system starts at the very beginning after the placement test. In order to help the students to choose the programme, IGU Promotion Days are organized. In this process, students are given detailed information about the department and the intended study programme.

After becoming a student at Istanbul Gelişim University, undergraduate and graduate students are appointed with academic advisors from related departments for guidance in order to help with resolution of problems they might have related to education and training. Academic advisors inform students about legislation and advise them on issues such as course selection, re-registration procedures, and other academic issues. Until the appointment of the advisor or in cases of illness and travel excuses, the head of the department concerned shall act as advisor, approve the necessary documents and submit them to the institute.

With respect to the university's international aspirations it supports international student exchange programmes. Increasing the level of participation of students in the Erasmus Mobility is an important aim of the university. Therefore the budget allocated by the National Agency to the university is used in its entirety to expand the internationalisation and some students are also provided with flight ticket support. IGU's students also benefit from the Erasmus Internship Mobility, which concentrates on participating in workplace practices within the European Union member countries in private and public institutions and organizations as well as education and research centers.

Further support for students is provided by the ongoing activities at Istanbul Gelişim University through the administrative units, such as Psychological Counselling and Guidance (PDRAM), and Centre for Continuing Education and Centre for Career Development. The Psychological Guidance, Counselling and Research Center (PDRAM) facilitates personal, social and academic development of students and employees, while helping their adaptation to university life. The Centre for Continuing Education offers modern and distinguished education and learning service with its well-equipped and experienced instructors, academic and professional knowledge, and the modern education and learning environment it provides.

The Disabled Student Unit was established within the framework of the "Regulation on the Advisory and Coordination of Higher Education Institutions in Istanbul Gelişim University" also regulating its working procedures and principles. The general aim of the University Disability Student

Unit is to take necessary precautions and make arrangements to facilitate the learning life of disabled students within higher education.

With its Career Development Coordination Unit, the university aims to provide the best service to the students both during their education and after their graduation. Among the activities of the unit are: implementation of the career tests for students to determine a professional predisposition, providing counselling to the students and graduates about studying abroad. The Office of Career Development provides students with constant service to enable them to establish long-term relations with the private sector by offering consulting services to students and creating internship opportunities. The departments and the Office of Career Development organises Career Days as well as conferences or seminars to introduce students to work environments and invites experts from private-public sectors, in order to initiate a professional link between students and private-public sector representatives. It also provides information and advice about the transition exams.

Istanbul Gelişim University Graduates and Members Association (IGU-MEZDER) was established in May 2017 to continue the university's relation with its graduates, increase sharing of information, foster the graduates' solidarity, and to follow-up on their career development.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

Course descriptions are available to students. These documents contain the intended learning outcomes, methods of learning and teaching, assessment methods and the expected workload. These descriptions have to be revised to reflect the programmes more transparent and appropriate (see Finding 4).

IGU has defined strategies and processes to ensure that offered course are coordinated on both content and organisational levels. The programme's implementation allows students to complete their studies within the expected period of time as defined in the curriculum.

### Learning Resources

The panel of experts visited the already existing facilities as well as the new tower bought in 2017 to extend rooms for teaching and research. All facilities are very adequate, the classrooms are sufficient for the purpose of learning and all places are well looked after. The facilities are sufficient with regard to room and space required for the number of students in the programmes.

There is a transport infrastructure to travel to Gelişim University. IGU invests high efforts to make life as comfortable as possible for students. One example are social activities such as the „Bicycle Project “. This makes it easier to commute from one campus to another quickly and easily.

The IGU states in the SER that appropriate material resources (finances as well as computer workplaces) are available for the study programmes to achieve the Intended Learning Outcomes. Access is provided to an appropriate amount of literature, journals and academic sources to enable the achievement of the Learning Outcomes.

### Student Support Services

Orientation programmes are offered for new and potential students. Institutionalised student advisory services are available to students on a constant level and information on these services are available to students in an adequate way; specialised information sessions are offered regularly.

Individualised advising for specific programme content is provided. Teaching staff members offer frequent consultation hours and are available to students. Students explained during the site visit that their teaching staff is always helpful and available if support is needed. The organisational climate is nice and students are satisfied with the conditions of studying at IGU.

Specific offers are available for exchange students / incoming students.

Student diversity is considered when allocating, planning, and providing learning resources and student support.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Information

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme. [ESG 1.7]*

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders. [ESG 1.8]*

### Description

According to the SER Istanbul Gelişim University gives importance to ideas and proposals of students as well as the academic staff to improve programmes and enhance managerial effectiveness. For this purpose, the university makes questionnaires about the opinions of academics and students at certain times and evaluates the results. IGU describes that it is gathering and evaluating opinions at different levels of management, with local, regional and national stakeholders, for example with meetings with employers and public authorities, to improve programmes and enhance their effectiveness.

In the SER IGU states that it has specific initiatives to match the programmes with the business world's needs and meetings are held with the authorities from the business world. Accordingly, faculty deans, department heads and other lecturers of the University are observing the scope of the programmes according to the changes in the business world, based on the information at these meetings. In addition to these, conferences are organized in which participants participate in many different sectors and positions in order to answer and provide information about the students' business world.

### Experts' Evaluation

An intense exchange with organisations from the labour market takes place so that information on the labour market requirements is collected and the departments consider the results. The description of potential employment fields for graduates is available but could be improved (see above). It would be helpful for students and external stakeholders if this aspect would be described in more detail.

IGU collects different data on a wide range of topics. Therefore, information on the duration of studies is available. This data will also be relevant for the reaccreditation of the programmes. Information on the composition of the programmes' student body is available. IGU has a data management system in place for students which is on a good level. Its documents show many students do not complete their studies.

It is in the interest of IGU as a private university to inform its stakeholders. Information is provided to the public on the programmes, Intended Learning Outcomes, selection procedure of students, qualifications awarded as well as on teaching and assessment procedures. Different information on programmes is published on the university website, so that it is available but some information could be provided in more detail.

The university gathers information from stakeholders, regular staff meetings and its students. One aspect which could be improved is the information of external stakeholders and students on the outcome of the QA procedures and the measures taken. **(see Finding 2)**

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendations of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends to accredit **with conditions** the study programmes

- International Business and Trade (B.A.) (Turkish Programme)
- International Logistics and Transportation (B.A.) (Turkish and English Programme)
- International Trade (B.A.) (Turkish and English Programme)

**offered by the Istanbul Gelişim University**

Findings:

1. The university must document how the **workload** is calculated, how teaching staff is involved in this process and how the workload is spread over the period of one academic year. A mechanism must be implemented which secures that the workload is checked, the results are documented and measures are taken to adjust the workload accordingly
2. External stakeholders and students should be informed on the **outcome of the QA procedures** and the measures taken.
3. After finalizing their studies students should receive a questionnaire to **evaluate the entire programme**.
4. To strengthen the **labour market orientation** some measures should be taken at different levels:
  - a. a structured feedback system from the industry should be established
  - b. mandatory internships should be included in the programmes.
  - c. more classroom lecturing of practitioners should take place and institutionalized site visits of companies should be organised.
5. For each programme a **course handbook** must be handed in so that the Intended Learning Outcomes (ILO) of the programme as well as of the courses become transparent. The ILOs of the programmes as well as of the courses must be defined more precisely. The content, the teaching and the examination methods must be described and made available to students. A clear structure for the sequence of the competences should be defined and strictly executed.
6. The **teaching staff** has to be involved in the review process of the programme goals and the course ILO's.
7. The process of redefining the ILO's must be used to sharpen the **profile of the programmes**, e.g. through mapping course ILOs against the programme ILOs.
8. The **internationalisation** of the programmes should be strengthened, e.g. by a higher number of courses given in English, more language courses, guest lecturers, English academic literature and exchange of faculty members and students.
9. In the programme "**International Business and Trade**" some additional courses on quantitative and qualitative aspects of research methodology as well as software skills and business related courses should be included (detailed information is given in the report).
10. In the programme "**International Logistics and Transportation**" some fundamental and present topics should be included such as leadership, intercultural management, purchasing, controlling (detailed information is given in the report).
11. In the programme "**International Trade**" the Department should consider to integrate international topics such as political and legal systems, intercultural communication, negotiation techniques and business ethics.

12. IGU should discuss options to check students' achievements and to give feedback concerning their **progression in the learning process** (beside mid-term and final exam).
13. When **new staff is hired** IGU should take the opportunity to broaden the practical experience of the teaching staff. Emphasis should be put on international and practical experience.
14. An explicit programme should be **developed for teaching staff** in enhancing their teaching effectiveness, on new didactic concepts and to strengthen their research capacity.
15. IGU must hand in an **overview of the teaching staff** as well as their quantitative involvement in the programmes (including also teaching hours in other programmes).