

AGENTUR FÜR QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH AKKREDITIERUNG VON STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

**EXPERTS' REPORT** 

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACH-ELOR OF ARTS)

ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

INDONESIAN LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

ARABIC LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACH-ELOR OF ARTS)

GERMAN LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACH-ELOR OF ARTS)

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (MAS-TER OF ARTS)

**ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (PHD)** 

Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia) December 2021

HEI	Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia)

Programme	English Language Education
Degree	Bachelor of Arts
Extent	146 SKS
Length of studies	8 Semesters
Language	English / Indonesian

Programme	English Language and Literature
Degree	Bachelor of Arts
Extent	146 SKS
Length of studies	8 Semesters
Language	English / Indonesian

Programme	Indonesian Language Education	
Degree	Bachelor of Arts	
Extent	146 SKS	
Length of studies	8 Semesters	
Language	Indonesian	
Programme	Arabic Language Education	
Degree	Bachelor of Arts	
Extent	146 SKS	
Length of studies	8 Semesters	
	1	
Language	Arabic / Indonesian	

Programme	German Language Education
Degree	Bachelor of Arts
Extent	146 SKS
Length of studies	8 Semesters
Language	German / Indonesian

Programme	English Language Education
Degree	Master of Arts
Extent	36 SKS
Length of studies	4 Semesters
Language	English / Indonesian
Programme	English Language Education
Degree	PhD
Extent	42 SKS
Length of studies	6 Semesters
Language	English / Indonesian

Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.
Responsible consultant(s)	Patrick Heinzer & Dr. Melanie Brück

# Content

I.	Decis	ion of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	5
II.	Pream	ıble	9
	a.	Criteria	9
	b.	Approach and methodology	9
111.	Gener	al Information on the University1	1
IV.	Asses	ssment of the study programme(s)1	2
	1.	Quality of the Curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme 1	2
	4.1 E	nglish Language Education (Bachelor)	13
	4.2 Ei	nglish Language and Literature (Bachelor)	14
	4.3 In	donesian Language Education (Bachelor)	15
	4.4 A	rabic Language Education (Bachelor)	17
	4.5 G	erman Language Education (Bachelor)	18
	4.6 Ei	nglish Language Education (Master)	19
	4.7 Ei	nglish Language Education (PhD)	21
	2.	Procedures for Quality Assurance	2
	3.	Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students / Learning and Assessment of Students 2	4
	4.	Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification / Legal Status, Admission and Certification	6
	5.	Teaching Staff / Academic Level of Supervisory Staff	8
	6.	Learning Resources and Student Support / Support and Research Environment	0
	7.	Public Information	2
v.	Findir	ngs3	4



# **Decision of the AQAS Commission**

on the Bachelor programmes

"English Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts)

"English Language and Literature" (Bachelor of Arts)

"Indonesian Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts)

"Arabic Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts)

"German Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts)

the Master's programme

"English Language Education" (Master of Arts)

and the PhD programme

"English Language Education" (PhD)

offered by

Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Commission in its 11<sup>th</sup> meeting on 6 December 2021, the AQAS Commission decides:

 The study programmes "English Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts), "English Language and Literature" (Bachelor of Arts), "Indonesian Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts), "Arabic Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts), "German Language Education" (Bachelor of Arts) and "English Language Education" (Master of Arts) offered by Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia) are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation/AQAS criteria for PhD programmes.

The study programme "English Language Education" (PhD) offered by Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia) is accredited according to the AQAS criteria for PhD programmes.

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

- 2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2022**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
- 3. The accreditation is given for the period of six years and is valid until 30 September 2027.

# Conditions:

For all programmes:

- 1. It must be assured for all programmes that the predefined examination quality targets are holistically collected and analysed. The results must be used for the continuous quality improvement of the programmes.
- 2. It needs to be outlined (e.g. by using a matrix or by explicitly incorporating student-centred learning) how soft skill compentencies are assessed within the courses of the study programmes.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all programmes:

- 1. Access to discipline-specific journals of international reputation should be given to students.
- 2. To support efforts in internationalisation, relevant information on the study programmes should be made available in English to non-Indonesian speakers.

In addition to the recommendation(s) above, programme-specific recommendations read as follows:

### English Language Education (Bachelor of Arts)

3. Digital and creative skills should be fostered being a relevant set of skills for the future career of graduates.

### Arabic Language Education (Bachelor of Arts)

- 4. The aspect of non-formal oral competencies should be expanded in the curriculum to foster career-oriented tracks within the programme.
- 5. It should be assured that teaching materials for "Arabic Language Education" beyond the acquisition of language competencies focus on student-centred learning.

### German Language Education (Bachelor of Arts)

- 6. It might be considerable to strive towards the language proficiency level of B2 regarding the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages.
- 7. Rather than providing an introductory overview, the courses in "German literature" should focus on acquiring textual competencies in the light of German literature.
- 8. Internships, being a crucial experience for graduates' success, could be extended to foster practical competencies of students.
- 9. The programme should intensify its efforts to cooperate with German-speaking institutions in Europe.

# English Language Education (Master of Arts) & English Language Education (PhD)

- 10. Digital and multiliteracy concepts of education should be integrated as elective courses into the curricula.
- 11. To foster autonomous learning and research of students, it might be wise to integrate a graduate research seminar in both programmes in which students can present their research findings amongst peers.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

EXPERTS' REPORT ON THE PROGRAMMES ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR) ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (BACHELOR) INDONESIAN LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR) ARABIC LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR) GERMAN LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR) ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (MASTER)

# **OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI MALANG (INDONESIA)**

Visit to the university: 4 - 8 October 2021

Panel of Experts:	
Prof. Dr. Endry Boeriswati	Jakarta State University (Indonesia), Faculty of Educa- tion Sciences, Department of Bahasa Indonesian Lan- guage Education
Prof. Dr. Didi Suherdi	University of Education Indonesia (Indonesia), Faculty of Language and Literature Education, Department of Eng- lish Education, Professor for English Literature
Prof. Dr. Gerhard Jaiser	German Jordanian University (Jordan), School of Ap- plied Humanities and Languages, Coordinator of the master programme "German as a Foreign Language (DaF)"
Prof. Dr. Sebastian Maisel	University of Leipzig (Germany), Faculty of History, Art and Area Studies, Institute for Oriental Studies
Prof. Dr. Laurenz Volkmann	Friedrich Schiller University Jena (Germany), Faculty of Arts, Professor of English Language Education
Gunar Yadi	Vice Principal Indonesian School of The Hague (The Netherlands) (Representative of the Labour Market),
Victor Maschke	University of Erfurt (Germany) (Student representative)
Coordinators:	
Patrick Heinzer & Dr Melanie Brück	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

# II. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent nonprofit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution.

### Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the programmes in "English Language Education" (Bachelor / Master / PhD), "English Language and Literature" (Bachelor), "Indonesian Language Education" (Bachelor), "Arabic Language Education" (Bachelor), and "German Language Education" (Bachelor) offered by Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia).

#### a. Criteria

The programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to a programme.

### b. Approach and methodology

### The initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in December 2020.

The University produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In May 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the programmes and an appendix and statistical data on the programmes.

The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student drop outs).
- CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors
- Information on student services
- Core information on the main library
- academic regulations

AQAS

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in in June 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 31 May 2021.

#### The nomination of the panel of expert

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in August 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the University did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### The preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the University and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### The site visit

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, a digital site visit to the University took place from 4-8 October 2021. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the University's representatives.

### The report writing

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Accreditation Commission. The report was sent to the University for comments.

#### The decision

The report, together with the comments of the department, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, on [date] the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General Information on the University

The Universitas Negeri Malang (State University Malang; UM), founded in 1954 as an Institute for Teacher Training and Education, was converted into a university in 1999 and opened for other disciplines apart from the teacher education programmes. Following UM's strategic plan, they strive to provide programmes with the effective application of learning approaches with the consideration of the latest technology and carry out research in education, science and technology, socio-culture, arts, and sports. These research activities and their results should be used for advancement in science and the community. Furthermore, UM's programmes are focusing on sustainable quality development. The SER outlines that this vision has been translated into four strategic goals on the university level (innovative learning, increasing quantity and quality of research, community services based on the implementation of science, technology and education, and constant quality improvement). Furthermore, UM follows a "tri dharma" education, consisting of education, research, and community services.

As of May 2021, UM has currently 32,276 students enrolled in eight faculties (Faculty of Education Sciences, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Economics, Faculty of Engineering, Faculty of Social Sciences, Faculty of Sports Sciences, Faculty of Psychology, and the Faculty of Letters) and one graduate programme. The university offers 22 three-year programmes, 59 Bachelor programmes, 33 Master programmes, and 16 PhD programmes. Currently, UM employs 1,056 tenure-track academic staff comprising 426 PhD holders, 629 Master degree holders, and one Bachelor degree holder. The SER outlines that in addition, 1,086 personnel provide academic, administrative and student services.

The Faculty of Letters host all study programmes which are subject to this procedure. The Faculty is the second oldest Faculty at UM and had been originally the Faculty of Literature and Arts Teaching (until 1975), then changed to the Faculty of Language and Arts (in 1983), and finally became the Fakultas Sastra (Faculty of Letters) in 1999. At the moment of the submission of the SER, the Faculty manages five departments (Indonesian, English, Arabic, German, and Arts and Design) and offers 20 programmes (two three-year programmes, eleven Bachelor programmes, five Master programmes, and two PhD programmes). On the faculty level, the administration is carried out by the dean, in cooperation with three vice deans (finance and administrative affairs, academic affairs, and student's affairs), a coordinator for general affairs, and a director of the centre for language and culture. As of the academic year 2020/21, the Faculty of Letters has 5,000 students and 169 tenure-track and 31 non-tenured academic staff, and 44 support staff. It is stated in the SER that the Faculty's resources are generated by revenues from the Ministry of Education and Culture, student's tuition fees, and collaborative projects on the national or international level. One of the main revenues comes from the Centre for Language and Culture, which provides language courses, language tests, translations, or similar activities.

### IV. Assessment of the study programme(s)

### 1. Quality of the Curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
The intended learning outcomes of the programme	The intended learning outcomes of the programme
are defined and available in published form. They	are defined and available in published form. They
reflect both academic and labour-market require-	reflect both academic and labour-market require-
ments and are up-to-date with relation to the rele-	ments and are up-to-date with relation to the rele-
vant field. The design of the programme supports	vant field. The design of the programme supports
achievement of the intended learning outcomes.	the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
The academic level of graduates corresponds to	The academic level of graduates corresponds to
the requirements of the appropriate level of the Eu-	with the requirements of the appropriate level of the
ropean Qualifications Framework.	national qualifications framework or the European
	Qualifications Framework.
The curriculum's design is readily available and	The curriculum's design is readily available and
transparently formulated.	transparently formulated.
[ESG 1.2]	

### Organisational structure to Bachelor, Master and PhD programmes

The self-evaluation report focuses in a general perspective on the curriculum development process for the study programmes at UM. Following the Indonesian Qualifications Framework (Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia; KKNI), Bachelor programmes follow level 6, Master programme level 8, and PhD programme level 9 and the curricula are based on the national standards for higher education (SNPT, Standar Nasional Perguruan Tinggi) and the guidelines for curriculum development in Indonesian Higher Education. All programmes follow a three-stage-process (creation of a graduation profile, design of a matrix, and the organization of courses) to assure that the intended learning outcomes (ILO) on the programme level are in line with the ones on the course level and focus on the labour market needs of the respective field. Initially, new programmes detect the needs of the labour market (based on input from external and internal stakeholders and associations). Current developments in the respective discipline are considered with state-of-art review processes, benchmarks with national and international programmes, and expert opinions. These processes aim to define a graduation profile and will be translated into intended learning outcomes within the programmes by involving all faculty members. In the second stage, a matrix will be created by the study programme's curriculum task force based on ILO on the programme level (outlining credits and intended learning outcomes on the course level). In the third stage, the study programme's curriculum task force creates courses and the study plan and defines learning materials, activities and assessment instruments). It is said that the curricula at UM are subject to a periodical review process. Following a new policy of the Ministry of Education and Culture in Indonesia, all programmes were reviewed in 2020 to accommodate the so-called Merdeka Belajar- Kampus Merdeka (MBKM, Freedom to Learn - Independent Campus - elective courses). This policy strives to enable more flexible learning paths for students. Together with this amendment, UM introduces like most of Indonesian universities, a credit transfer opportunity which allows students to take similar courses in different Indonesian universities.

On Bachelor's level, the general structure of the study programmes differentiates between university-level courses on character building (12 SKS) and core courses (98 SKS). UM indicates several subtypes of courses within the core courses, e.g., educational foundation courses on university level, language and arts courses

on faculty level, study programme-specific courses, an internship, and student community engagement courses. The courses on character building include courses on religion, civics education, pancalisa education (being the five principles in Indonesian state philosophy), Indonesian language courses for academic purposes, and innovation management courses (which focuses on interdisciplinary project work). Concerning the internship, it is said that students with teaching majors will do an internship at partner schools (national or international schools), while non-teaching major students can do the internship at partner companies and organizations. The community service courses cover interdisciplinary projects in rural areas organized by UM's Institute of Research and Community Services.

On Master's and PhD level, the curricula differentiate between scientific foundational courses on university level (two SKS for Master's and four SKS for PhD's), study programme-specific courses (24 SKS for Master's and 14 SKS for PhD's), and research courses for the Master's thesis (ten SKS) and the dissertation (24 SKS), respectively.

# 4.1 English Language Education (Bachelor)

The Bachelor programme "English Language Education" has 146 SKS (which is equivalent to 255 ECTS) which have to be taken within eight semesters. The SER outlines that graduates of this programme work primarily as English teachers for formal and non-formal institutions and are eligible to enrol in a one-year national certification programme for English teachers. Furthermore, graduates can work as translators, entre-preneurs, journalists, or other similar positions with English proficiencies as a requirement.

Being typical in Indonesia, UM differentiates the intended learning outcomes on the programme level in three components (knowledge and skills, pedagogical knowledge, and interpersonal knowledge and skills). Following the graduation profile for this programme, UM has translated the profile into a total of twelve intended learning outcomes. Graduates will be able to analyse and evaluate ideas in spoken and written English texts, communicate effectively in formal and informal situations and apply knowledge of basic concepts of English linguistics and literature. In addition, graduates will have a didactical and methodical background that allows them to apply learning strategies, assessment procedures and identify problems in the discipline by applying up-to-date research and using instructional materials.

As described above, the curriculum consists of prescribed courses on university level and study programmespecific courses. Apart from the courses on character building (12 SKS), Educational foundations courses (8 SKS), Language and Arts courses (4 SKS), the internship (4 SKS), the student community engagement course (4), and the elective courses (36 SKS), students have to 78 SKS of so-called content and skills courses. These courses cover English Language Skills courses (44 SKS), English Language and Literature Courses (12 SKS), English Language Teaching courses (10 SKS), and research courses (12 SKS), which includes the Bachelor's thesis.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

The experts consider that the clear and transparent structure of the study programme is impressive and makes it easy for students to plan their study progress and choose from many attractive electives. The three levels of "Courses on Character Building", "Core Courses", and "Electives" are sensibly interrelated, and their outcome orientation is transparent. The intended learning outcomes are both subject-specific and interdisciplinary. The overall programme structure of the Bachelor programme ELE follows a clear trajectory of progression along the lines of knowledge, skills and attitudes. The sequencing from basic (practical and foreign language) skills to more refined skills (e.g., research skills), from receptive to productive skills, makes sense and follows a clear philosophy of education. The electives offer a broad palette of topics and specialisations: while tying in with

the non-elective modules, they offer the opportunity to follow one's preferences deliberately, particularly concerning one's (future) professional interests other than becoming a teacher (e.g. they foster translation, mediation and entrepreneurial skills). As stated by alumni, students from the ELE programme are well prepared for the labour market and "ready to enter the working world". The alumni also pointed out that UM's curricula and intended learning outcomes are constantly aligned to the demands of labour market needs, and internship programmes are well integrated. Feedback mechanisms are also in place about students providing fruitful input to optimise the study programme.

All curricular elements and their functions are amply documented. There is an idealised typical course plan available, and it is clear to students which elements are compulsory and which are electives. The curriculum covers a good variety of English Language Education topics, objectives, and related learning outcomes and covers both subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge and subject-related, methodological, and general skills. It transparently describes which elements are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes. Curricular modifications are documented transparently and contribute to an improvement in programme quality. Benchmarking of all programmes is conducted by the Centre of Learning resources. All elements of the curriculum are assigned a certain number of credits directly related to the expected workload. The total programme workload is allocated to the different courses. Consequently, the experts conclude that the curriculum corresponds to the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) on level 6.

The inclusion of intensive courses and extensive reading in Semester 1, which is believed to lay a strong foundation for English language skills, is very strategic and motivating. Similarly, the inclusion of Language and Arts Entrepreneurship (Semester 5) and Innovation Management (Semester 6) offers opportunities to develop a wider job choice other than teaching. In addition, the use of rubrics for various skills (presentations, panel discussions, debates, and others), as indicated in the course syllabuses, ensures objectivity and consistency in students' learning assessments. The experts suggest that benchmarking to the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) or CEFR level equivalents be stated for the programme in general and specifically for language instruction courses.

The experts also encourage the programme managers to foster critical and creative skills and increasingly include digital skills. On the one hand, this will foster the teacher's education path and, on the other, other career paths than teachers education (**Finding 1**).

# Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.2 English Language and Literature (Bachelor)

In comparison to the Bachelor programme "English Language Education", the Bachelor programme "English Language and Literature" focus more on becoming an ICT and research-driven graduate. UM states that specific employment fields are research institutes in humanities and social sciences, NGOs, conventional or new media, performing arts companies or translation or interpretation companies. The programme includes thirteen ILOs on the programme level, covering similarities with the programme mentioned above in terms of knowledge and skills, but with a stronger focus on research and the use of technologies and the application of linguistic theories, such as language phenomena or literary criticisms.

The curriculum consists of 146 SKS which have to be taken within eight semesters. The courses are differentiated in character building courses (12 SKS), core courses (98 SKS), and elective courses (36 SKS). The study programme-specific core courses cover English language and skills courses (e.g., Oral, writing or grammar courses), language and literature courses (e.g., Linguistics, Phonology, Morphology or Cultural studies), and an introductory course to translation. Furthermore, the curriculum includes research courses (12 SKS), including a Bachelor thesis.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

In conjunction with the quality of the curriculum, the clear and transparent structure of the study programme is impressive and makes it easy for students to plan their study progress and choose from many attractive electives. The three levels of "Courses on Character Building", "Core Courses", and "Electives" are sensibly interrelated, and their outcome orientation is transparent. The intended learning outcomes are both subject-specific and interdisciplinary. The emphasis on language, linguistic, and literary studies differs from BA in ELE, which focuses on teaching. The overall programme structure of the Bachelor programme ELL also follows a clear trajectory of progression along the lines of knowledge, skills and attitudes. The sequencing from basic (interpretation) skills to more refined skills (e.g., research skills), from receptive to productive skills, makes sense and follows a clear philosophy of education. The electives offer a broad palette of topics and specialisations: while tying in with the non-elective modules, they offer the opportunity to deliberately follow one's preferences, particularly concerning one's (future) professional interests (e.g. they foster translation, journalism, mediation and entrepreneurial skills). As stated by alumni, students from the ELL programme are well prepared for the labour market and "ready to enter the working world". The alumni also pointed out that UM's curricula and intended learning outcomes are constantly aligned to the demands of labour market needs and internship programmes are well integrated. Students will achieve the correspondent level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).

The extensive documentation covers all elements of the curriculum and indicates its function. The typical course plan provides students with an overview of the study programme and differentiates between compulsory and electives. The curriculum covers a good variety of English Language and Literature topics, objectives, and their related learning outcomes and covers both subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge and subject-related, methodological, and general skills. In case modifications are implemented in the curriculum, it is transparently documented and communicated. Benchmarking of all programmes is conducted by the Centre of Learning resources. All elements of the curriculum are assigned a certain number of credits directly related to the expected workload. The total programme workload is allocated to the different courses.

As is in BA in ELE, including intensive courses and extensive reading in Semester 1 and Innovation Management (Semester 6) is very encouraging and lays a solid foundation. It also offers opportunities to develop a wider choice of job opportunities other than teaching. The diversification of translating strategy in ensuring that the courses suit the translating industry is impressive, and the inclusion of Blog Writing may help students better develop their writing in electronic media. Again, the use of rubrics for various skills (presentations, panel discussions, debates), as indicated in the course syllabuses, ensures objectivity and consistency in students' learning assessments. The experts also suggest that benchmarking to CEFR or CEFR level equivalents be stated both for the programme in general and specifically for language instruction courses.

# Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.3 Indonesian Language Education (Bachelor)

Following the SER, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level highlight eight ILOs for the Bachelor programme in "Indonesian Language Education". They include components that are defined by the Pancasila education and the values of the Indonesian cultures. Besides, graduates will be able to apply theoretical and practical aspects to work as educators within the Indonesian culture. They will understand concepts and basic principles of linguistic and literacy systems and the application of teaching and learning concepts. Furthermore, principles and procedures of entrepreneurship and information technology management will be included in the curriculum.

The curriculum consists of 146 SKS, out of which 12 SKS are character building courses, 36 SKS are elective courses, and 98 SKS are study programme-specific courses. The overview indicates that students can either take predefined courses packages (e.g., Indonesian for foreign speakers, Javanese language or journalism) or transdisciplinary courses as elective courses. The core courses cover the university and faculty level courses, courses in Indonesian language and literature, teaching courses, and specific skills courses. Furthermore, the curriculum includes research courses, including the Bachelor thesis.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

The department has implemented transdisciplinary intended learning outcomes on the programme level, which are very well beyond the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework standards at level 6 set by the Indonesian government. Based on the evidence given during the site visit, it became clear that graduates of the programme fulfil these intended learning outcomes to an extensive extent. A good combination of theoretical concepts and practical components enables them to fit the labour market needs easily. The discussions with the labour market representatives confirmed that graduates of the programme are much appreciated and ready for the respective positions. The further development of these intended learning outcomes happens based on an active input coming from graduates and alumni, as well as associations of similar study programmes, namely IKAPROBSI, which has set standards about the national standards from the Indonesian Ministry of Education and which operate following the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR). An excellent example of this entire exchange process is implementing a course in the Indonesian language for foreign speakers (Bahasa Indonesia untuk Penutur Asing; BIPA), which enables Non-Indonesian students to acquire Bahasa Indonesian competencies. The combination of courses with a solid mix of compulsory and elective courses translates the intended learning outcomes on the programme level into practice. It enables graduates of the programme to gain linguistic and literary knowledge, solid competencies in listening, speaking, reading and writing in Bahasa Indonesia, and sufficient didactical and methodical skills.

Furthermore, graduates are also equipped with research skills that strengthen alternative career paths beyond Indonesian language teachers (e.g., literature researchers). To strengthen these alternative careers, the department has also decided to implement elective courses in the field of entrepreneurship and 21st-century skills as soft skills that support graduates' readiness. This has been evidenced in the course descriptions for the study programme. Based on the discussion during the site visit, it became clear to the panel of experts that graduates of the Bachelor's programme also become Javanese language teachers, drama trainers or actors based on the elective. Even though there are already good examples of these paths, it might be wise for the department that the elective courses on "Javanese language" or "Drama" are professionally certified to foster the professional development of students. Especially for the Javanese language, it might be advantageous for Indonesian Language Education graduates of UM if they can compete with graduates from "Javanese language studies" programmes. Likewise, with other elective courses such as drama, journalism, and BIPA teachers. UM should consider providing professional certification that can be widely recognized by users both nationally and internationally. Indeed, there is no regulation that elective courses can be submitted as professional certification tests in Indonesia. However, this is an opportunity for UM to excel as an internationally reputable university so that its graduates can be accepted in any relevant work field and maintain high competitiveness in the community.

Based on the evidence given in the documentation that gives clear indications about the curriculum, its structure and the relevant components, it can be summarized that the curriculum for the Bachelor's programme in "Indonesian Language Education" exceeds the national standards.

# Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.4 Arabic Language Education (Bachelor)

The Bachelor programme in Arabic Language Education is designed so that graduates will be competent and capable of working as Arabic language teachers in primary and secondary schools. The intended learning outcomes on the programme level describe seven areas that serve as a basis for the curricular structure. These areas include Arabic language, literature, culture, language skills, teaching and learning methods, research components, and entrepreneurship.

As all Bachelor programmes, the curriculum consists of 146 SKS, differentiating between character building courses (12 SKS), elective courses (36 SKS), and core courses (98 SKS). The programme specific core courses cover courses in the Arabic language, literature, culture, teaching and research courses. Students have to write a Bachelor's thesis within the research courses. The elective courses have seven predefined course packages (covering focuses on translation, Islamic religious education, calligraphy, Arabic language for children, computer and internet content, Arabic for particular purposes or Indonesian language for Arabic speakers). However, students can also freely choose courses outside these packages.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

Being a programme with a large student body and a high number of qualified faculty members, the organisation of the study programme indicates a clear structure. Both goals and objectives on the programme level are reflected in the composition of courses, and the requirements of the labour market are considered. The main aim to educate Arabic speakers with high proficiency in language and other competencies is duly noted, and the programme operates in line with current international standards and goals.

As documented in the self-evaluation report and discussed with the department during the site visit, the curriculum is ambitious, innovative and comprehensive leading students across the various proficiency levels and offering different career-oriented tracks in their electives. The consecutive nature of the language courses allows an easy progression. Students can specialise by choosing predefined tracks to follow their interests and their own academic goals. The experts command an impressive variety of career-oriented tracks, such as Arabic teachers, tourism, or the Hajj industry. The curriculum also allows students of different proficiency levels to receive customised training when the beginner classes are divided into groups according to their language knowledge. To acquire a high language competency, student advisors are assigned as tutors and opportunities for long-term studies abroad in Arabic speaking countries are provided. However, less evidence was given concerning heritage students, e.g., students who already possess a certain level of the language (native speakers without formal training) given the fact that many Indonesian students already speak Arabic at home. As outlined, the curriculum strives towards an intended proficiency level B2 for Arabic. As part of the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, this level of proficiency should be measured accordingly.

Furthermore, this includes, of course, standard Arabic and does not include Arabic dialects. However, given the broadness of Arabic, the aspect of non-formal oral competencies should be expanded in the curriculum to foster career-oriented within the programme (**Finding 2**). One way to start implementing might be to use a newly developed integrated textbook as outlined in Chapter IV.3 in this report.

Despite that, it can be concluded that the curriculum structure fulfils the intended learning outcomes on the programme level to a great extent. The composition supports the learner's progression, and all students are well informed about the sequence of the programme and the specific tracks. The courses include valuable subject-specific as well as general and methodological skills. Students have access to that information via the

SIPEJAR online platform in the course descriptions. The course structure provides indications on the credits and reflects on the workload of the courses. Thus, it can be concluded that the programme corresponds to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.5 German Language Education (Bachelor)

UM describes the typical employment field of graduates of this programmes as German language teachers at the high school level. The programme strives to impart language competencies at the B1+ level based on the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR). The ILOs on the programme level cover seven components according to the fields of employment. Thus, the intended learning outcomes cover German language skills, linguistics, teaching competencies, literacy and cultural knowledge, translation skills, and basic understanding of tourism and scientific skills.

The curriculum consists of 146 SKS which have to be taken within eight semesters. This includes 12 SKS character-building courses, 98 SKS core courses, and 36 SKS elective courses. The core courses focus on acquiring German language skills, linguistic and cultural courses, didactical courses, and research courses. The research courses include a Bachelor thesis.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

Being a relatively new department compared to others in Indonesia, the department has notably developed over the past years with highly committed and motivated staff. One of the main focuses of the programme naturally lies in German language education. Given the context in Indonesia, there are only a few students with solid competencies in German when enrolling in the department (being the typical case in Indonesia as well). Despite that, the panel of experts conclude that the intended learning outcomes on the programme and the course level are well defined and lead students to the degree that opens good career options and that is comparable to the European Qualifications Framework level 6. The acquisition of German competencies is not only assured by the staff but also with the intensive collaboration with the Goethe Institute in Surabaya.

The programme aims towards level B1 following the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR). The course composition and the teaching methods used in the courses support the acquisition of the language competency to a satisfactory extent. It became evident that several staff members are trained to be Goethe Institute examiners and are, in consequence, familiar with contemporary teaching methods. The B1 examination itself is obligatory for all students of the programme and taken externally by Goethe Institute. An MoU between Malang University and Goethe Institute Surabaya is in place, which facilitates the examination. From the experts' perspective, this approach indicates a substantial measure to follow language acquisition structurally. In addition to this, the experts believe that at the moment, opportunities should be given to students who are interested in acquiring even a higher level, such as B2 (**Finding 3**). The panel is of the opinion that in future a stronger effort should be made to ensure B2 level for all graduates of the programme. Although this is atypical in the Indonesian higher education system on the bachelor's level, this should be achievable within a Bachelor programme with an entire focus on German studies and is essential for further development of the department. Relevant stakeholders also supported this argument during the site visit.

Besides language education, all students receive primary education in essential aspects of German studies. Based on this, students can choose electives that lead them towards specific career options. The general structure of the programme is considered successful by the panel. The curriculum offers choices within electives and prepares students for the two main career choices: becoming teachers at secondary schools or being active in tourism. Communication with stakeholders for the preparation of students and constant revision of the curriculum seem intensive and appropriate. Students who wish to become schoolteachers are prepared by an internship in collaboration with secondary schools. Close collaboration with some schools was confirmed during the meeting with stakeholders. The internship is not very extensive, comprising of just seven credit points. To foster this important practical insight, it might be considerable to extent the internship in the future (**Finding 4**). One way to reach that goal might be to reduce the number of electives while amplifying the internship.

The study plan includes seminars focusing on fields of contemporary relevance, like contrastive cultural studies, intercultural communication and media in foreign language teaching. These courses are highly relevant to provide essential competencies for students. Furthermore, courses in "German literature", especially historyrelated electives, do not fulfil the programme's aim. These courses require a stronger focus on acquiring textual competencies, instead of accumulating knowledge (which one would rather expect in introductory courses to provide some overview) (**Finding 5**).

For a reason, the programme focuses on most graduates who find their future in schools or tourism business. For further development of the academic profile of the department, however, students who want to follow an academic career are of vital importance. These students are supported in various ways, but mainly on the level of individual supervision. The panel suggests that clearly defined steps to the academic progress of students are implemented in the programme. In particular, language exams for German as an academic language should be offered and preparatory courses for these within the electives, with TestDaF being one of the essential examinations in this field for the German language. A readily available and affordable tool for regular language screening is onSET which can be offered by DAAD lecturers or Goethe Institutes to help prepare students successfully for TestDaF.

The department currently uses programmes and resources offered for exchange of student and staff level by institutions like DAAD, Goethe Institute, or the University of Vienna. To be mentioned is the regular participation in the summer course programme of the DAAD for students and future staff members. An exchange programme with the Department of German Studies of the University of Vienna leads to international students visiting UM. The panel also acknowledged that some graduates of the programme were able to continue their academic education in the master programme "German as a foreign language" at Ramkhamhaeng University Thailand. For future development of the department on a more academic level, an intensification of international exchange and collaboration might be necessary (**Finding 6**). The panel recommends an institutionalized partnership with a European institute for the German language to secure constant exchange on all levels. Funding for a partnership like this can be obtained, provided the German department of UM can further develop and sharpen an academic profile. Beyond the programme accreditation procedure for the Bachelor programme, but vital for the department itself might be implementing a Master programme in German language education. However, the experts are fully aware that this decision heavily relies on interested students and the available capacities within the department.

# Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.6 English Language Education (Master)

The SER describes that graduates of the Master programme will be employed as English language teacher in non-formal and formal education institutions at the primary, secondary, and tertiary (undergraduate) level. In addition, they will be enabled to carry out research and develop syllabi, didactical material, and assessments. The department outlines that there are three primary intended learning outcomes, which are connected to

attitudinal values, generic knowledge, generic skills, and specific skills. In conclusion, there are twelve intended learning outcomes on the programme level covering the further development of research and pedagogical activities in the light of the discipline.

Following the above-mentioned general structure for Master programmes, the curriculum is differentiated into four groups of courses (general courses, major courses, field experiences courses, and research courses for the Master's thesis). The major courses are divided into three subdivisions (subject specialization courses (eight SKS), teaching-learning strategy courses (eight SKS), and elective courses (six SKS)). The field experience course covers two SKS, whereas the research courses are ten SKS. In general, the curriculum consists of a total of 36 SKS within four semesters. However, it is said that it is also possible to complete the study programme within three semesters.

It is stated that the curriculum for that programme is the result of benchmarking the curriculum with similar departments of different universities in Indonesia and the region, e.g., Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, University of Malaya, University of Auckland, Monash University, and Nanyang Technological University.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

The panel of experts consider that the structure of the Master programme is clear and transparent to students and external stakeholders. The setup of programmes enables students to plan their study progress. The intended learning outcomes on the programme level focus on mastering theories of English Language Teaching, capabilities to carry out research, and communicating research results to the broader community through academic fora (oral and written) and community services are sensibly interrelated, and their outcome orientation is transparent. The systematic outlining of intended learning outcomes (differentiating in attitude, knowledge, and skills) and the relation between the programme itself and the courses is helpful and illuminating. The curriculum offers meaningful topics and opportunities to specialise via electives. As for the two English related Bachelor programmes, this approach provides opportunities for students to specialise themselves. The interrelationship among each course and the intended learning outcomes is well demonstrated through a clear map. A constant alignment to the demands of the labour market needs is visible and confirmed by the relevant stakeholders. The documentation of courses outlines all relevant aspects and supports students in identifying compulsory and elective courses within the curriculum.

The curriculum itself covers a good variety of English Language and Education topics relevant to the discipline. While the programme has a long-standing tradition and adapts to changes concerning the content of the curriculum, the experts believe that a shift of the focus from traditional literacy concepts to digital and multiliteracy fields of education should be strengthened. This will foster creative skills and increase digital skills. These are skills that the labour market sector will need in the future (**Finding 7**). First slow development is already visible in the Bachelor programmes, but the panel encourages the department to follow this path accordingly for the other levels.

It became evident that the curriculum is benchmarked with similar programmes, both in Indonesia and abroad. This may have given lessons on many aspects of curriculum development. The experts also appreciate the establishment of a corpus of classroom communication and interaction between teachers and students and teaching materials, which has thus far resulted in C-SMILE (Corpus of State University of Malang Indonesian Learners' English), CINTA (Corpus of Indonesian Texts in Academia), and the spoken-based corpus of UM-SpEAKs (Universitas Negeri Malang Spoken English in Academic Contexts.

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 4.7 English Language Education (PhD)

The PhD programme for English Language Education strives to educate students who can develop theories, concepts, principles and models of the discipline in primary, secondary, and tertiary education in informal and formal education institutions. The curriculum has been reviewed in 2020 based on the feedback from stake-holders, a new structure, and updated intended learning outcomes.

These intended learning outcomes further develop the intended learning outcomes from the Master programme. Graduates will be able to master the bases and theories of the discipline and contribute to current research lines relevant to society. These intended learning outcomes are connected to attitudinal values, generic knowledge, generic and specific skills. Following the general structure for PhD study programmes, the curriculum is structured into foundational scientific courses (four SKS), major courses (14 SKS), and research courses (24 SKS). The research courses are differentiated into exploratory research (two SKS), research methodology (two SKS), dissertation proposal development seminar (four SKS), and the dissertation itself (16 SKS). In conclusion, the PhD programme consists of 42 SKS within six semesters.

At the end of the first-year students will be assigned a doctoral supervisory panel consisting of three supervisors. It is also possible to include external supervisors. Usually, students undertake a comprehensive exam and proposal seminar in the second year, followed by a research phase where students strive to publish their results in journals.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

The PhD programme in English Language Education follows the same structural approach as the Bachelor and the Master programmes at the department. The panel of experts appreciates the clear and transparent structure of the programme and points out that the intended learning outcomes on the programme level are meaningful and connect very well to the Master programme. Thus, they expand the knowledge, skills and attitude learning outcomes to a great extent. Overall, the programme follows a clear trajectory of progression. Based on the evidence given during the site visit, the experts can conclude that the academic degree is comparable with level 8 according to the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). PhD students of this programme are carefully supported by the department, while they are encouraged to carry out research the gamut of ELE in view of international publications. The research results are also used for society, which provides clear evidence that the programme fulfils the third mission project of the university. On the structural level, students are provided with a good mix of compulsory and elective courses at an early stage of the curriculum. This allows them to specialise in certain areas.

Furthermore, the discussion rounds proved that the programme is evident for external stakeholders, who praise the high level of readiness to work of UM graduates. The curriculum is also an object of constant further development based on interaction with the labour market. The curriculum adapts to necessary changes within the curriculum in an outstanding manner. However, the experts recommend the inclusion of digital and multi-literacy concepts of education with courses on "New Media" and "Multiliteracy" in the PhD curriculum to smoothen the regeneration process between the Bachelor's, Master's, and PhD programmes (**see Finding 7**).

The documentation enables externals and students to get an overview easily about the courses and their content. The documentation outlines all necessary information concerning the content, examination methods, and teaching approaches. A clear differentiated link is visible between the intended learning outcomes on the programme level and the course level. Students are given a "road map" detailing the requirements expecting them. Students are given regular feedback on their performance by academic advisors and in regular meetings and feedback procedures.

Upon completion of the programme, the achievement of the intended level of qualification is demonstrated by a final PhD thesis. Students are guided when publishing in international journals, which is one of the requirements for the PhD.

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 2. Procedures for Quality Assurance

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
The programme is subject to the higher education	The programme is subject to the higher education
institution's policy and associated procedures for	institution's policy and associated procedures for
quality assurance, including procedures for the de-	quality assurance, including procedures for the de-
sign, approval, monitoring, and revision of the pro-	sign, approval, monitoring, and revision of the pro-
grammes.	grammes.
A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous	A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous
quality enhancement, is in place. This includes reg-	quality enhancement, is in place. This includes reg-
ular feedback mechanisms involving both internal	ular feedback mechanisms involving both internal
and external stakeholders.	and external stakeholders.
The strategy, policies, and procedures have a for-	The strategy, policies, and procedures have a for-
mal status and are made available in published	mal status and are made available in published
form to all those concerned. They also include roles	form to all those concerned. They also include roles
for students and other stakeholders.	for students and other stakeholders.
Data is collected from relevant sources and stake-	Data is collected from relevant sources and stake-
holders, analysed, and used for the effective man-	holders, analysed, and used for the effective man-
agement and continuous enhancement of the pro-	agement and continuous enhancement of the pro-
gramme.	gramme.
[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]	[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

# Description

Following UM's statute, the university outlines that quality assurance units are in place at the university, the faculty, and the department level. The QA units are responsible for developing, maintaining, and implementing quality assurance and enhancement processes for the programmes, staff, and activities. On the faculty level, the QA unit focuses on the implementation UM policies and instruments. It is said that this level is regularly checked by the national accreditation agency BAN-PT. Furthermore, UM has been one of the ASEAN University Network-Quality Assurance (AUN-QA) associate members. The AUN-QA network offers voluntary assessment processes carried out for the Bachelor programmes "English Language Education" and "Indonesian Language Education".

UM uses the IPO (Input, Process, Output) model for their programmes, meaning that they focus on the financial and material resources, human resources and qualifications, and student supports when assessing the input side of the model. These process aspects focus on how the respective programmes are carried out (from the university down to the course level). This assessment strives to (re)shape the input dimension into an output dimension, which leads to concrete measures. All these aspects cover the three main components of UM (education, research, and community services). The SER describes that UM has designed an online survey system to determine the stakeholders' needs (both internal and external). UM uses the PDCA cycle tool to ensure that the IPO dimensions' results are properly implemented in the respective programmes. QA focuses

on academic and planning regulations, academic integrity, effective academic governance, and associated procedures in the planning stage. In the do stage, the correct implementation of the three principles of UM is assured. This includes the monitoring of standards and effectiveness of the courses offered in each semester, but also ensuring the defined values of academic integrity or research outputs. The check stage focuses on the monitoring and evaluation processes at the beginning, mid, and final semester, student feedback, audit reports, stakeholders' survey results, annual evaluation or periodic reviews. As the last step, the QA unit defines the act stage aiming at continuous improvement and enhancement of the quality of the programmes.

Data from relevant sources and stakeholders is collected on the faculty level to analyse and enhance the programmes. The data collection cover information on the student's population (including men-women ratio, students' background), student's progression (including examination averages of cohorts, final grading, failed exams), completion rates, employability of graduates, students' satisfaction, or learning resources.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

The experts are convinced that responsibilities of all parties involved in the quality assurance within the programme and for programme elements are carried out by a programme level unit, which is in good cooperation and coordination with the faculty level and university level, utilising PDCA cycles in assuring that the adopted input-process-output model work properly. The unit is responsible for assuring that all procedures are implemented and all the programme elements are evaluated. It is also in charge of safeguarding academic integrity and preventing academic fraud within the programme, following the career progression of graduates from the study programmes and against intolerance and discrimination. All these data are considered during the further development of the study programmes. The programmes are closely monitored by the national accreditation agency BAN-PT, and the Bachelor programmes "English Language Education" and "Indonesian Language Education" have also passed the quality standards by the AUN-QA. The high employability rate of graduates also indicates a vivid sign of high-quality standards in a very competitive market. Quality assurance of courses taken by students at other universities (either within the MBKM policy or abroad) is done with agreements.

Regular feedback mechanisms are also in place concerning students providing fruitful input to optimise all programmes. The quality assurance system involves instruments with different scopes, course evaluations, programme evaluations, evaluations of student workload, progression & completion rates, evaluations of changing societal needs, and evaluations of the learning environment and support services. The continual effort to improve the programme's quality is reflected in a tightly organised quality assurance, student guidance and ongoing communication network between UM representatives, staff, students and alumni. The programmes conduct continuous monitoring and evaluation for quality enhancement. The experts understand that information on the labour market requirements is collected, analysed, and used as the basis for many aspects of the programme's development. A clear and comprehensible description of potential employment fields for graduates is available. Information is available on which sectors graduates are employed in and how many graduates continue in education programmes.

Despite the clear overall setup of the quality assurance units, the experts could not find robust evidence on how PDCA was implemented in some elements of the programmes, especially the assessment of the intended learning outcomes on the course level. On the one hand, the quality assurance units confirmed that the intended learning outcomes are measured by TOEFL test scores or by students' GPA, which makes it easy to manage on the department level. On the other hand, this might hinder a full realisation of the PDCA cycle concerning the achievement of the intended learning outcomes on the course level via the examination methods. The experts believe that closer monitoring of the achievement targets on the examination might enable the departments to decide to upgrade the targets to higher levels (in case all of the ILOs are successfully achieved) or reformulate the ILOs. Therefore, the panel of experts strongly recommend collecting, analysing and fully integrating the results of evidence of predefined examination quality targets (**Finding 8**). Given the

highly competitive market in Indonesia, the careful implementation of this might enable the departments to stand out more prominently within the Indonesian higher education system.

### Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

### 3. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students / Learning and Assessment of Students

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
The delivery of material encourages students to	The form of supervision and/or course structure is
take an active role in the learning process.	adequate and corresponds with the intended learn-
Students are assessed using accessible criteria,	ing outcomes.
regulations, and procedures, which are made read-	Students are assessed using accessible criteria,
ily available to all participants and which are applied	regulations, and procedures, which are made read-
consistently.	ily available to all participants and which are applied
Assessment procedures are designed to measure	consistently.
the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.	Assessment procedures are designed to measure
[ESG 1.3]	the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
	[ESG 1.3]

#### Description

UM states that the national standards for Higher Education are used to define the learning and teaching methods at the university. Generally, these standards aim towards student-centred learning, effective learning, and the optimal utilisation of technology.

At UM, teaching and learning are carried out as on-site and online courses (via the learning management system at UM; SIPEJAR). This system is built based on the Moodle software (commonly used in Indonesia). The features include assignments, students' attendances, video conference options, chats, databases, forums, Wikis or survey features, or tests. Students with special needs have the chance to receive support with the so-called GEMPITA assistance programme, which the student organisations organise at UM.

In general, learning and teaching activities cover face-to-face learning, problem-based, project-based, or contextual learning via lectures, discussions, presentation, in-class exercises, mind-map making, summaries, article writing, experiments, field studies, reflections, multimedia productions, and others. It is stretched out that Master and PhD programmes have a higher level of independence for students since there is a more significant focus on research.

All courses on the university level are coordinated by the Centre for the Development of religious life and university-level courses, whereas the faculty courses are coordinated by the Vice Dean of Academic Affairs and the respective team. At the study programme level, the head of programme is responsible for the coordination of the courses. In order to prevent overlaps, all lecturers have to submit the course profile to the respective department and the faculty. This information is also made available to students via UM's academic information system (SIAKAD). Internship courses will be coordinated joint by the course coordinators and the Centre for the Development of Internship and field experience courses. The latter unit also maintains communication with external partners.

The assessment methods at UM follow the university-wide assessment regulations and procedures. In general, the assessment is carried out twice per semester (mid-term and final assessment) and can be carried out either online or in class. It is said that usually the first summative assessment is done in week 8 of the semester (in case of two SKS courses), and week 16 (in case of four SKS courses), while the second assessment is carried out in week 16 (2 SKS courses) and week 32 (4 SKS courses). Furthermore, additional assessments are also allowed during the courses. The Centre's assessment procedures and schedules are coordinated for the Development of religious life and university-level courses. In order to evaluate the effectiveness of the assessment of the respective course/study programme, the respective head of programme has to establish regulations regarding the type of instruments and assessment methods. The QQ unit validates these at the faculty level and at departmental level. As a result, examination rubrics are developed to analyse the effectiveness.

At the Master and PhD level, the assessment methods cover final semester projects, group or individual presentations, final non-research papers, periodical assignments, or portfolios. PhD students have to carry out research and publish their results in reviewed journals. An examination panel for PhD students carries out the final examination (composed by a chair, two or three supervisors, two or three internal examiners and one external examiner.

# **Experts' Evaluation**

Based on the documentation in the self-evaluation report and the discussions, the panel of experts can conclude that the methods of teaching and learning for the programmes are generally in place and correspond to the intended learning outcomes on the course level with reference to the programme level. For instance, the panel commands that the teaching material for the Indonesian Language Education programme includes input from the Association of study programmes (IKAPROBSI) regarding the depth and breadth, which goes beyond the national standard. In many instances, it was mentioned that the electronic platform SIPEJAR was used as a prime source for teaching and learning materials and teacher-student interaction. The evidence during the digital site visit showed that indeed this platform works on a very high level and supports the student-centred learning approach at UM with case-based and project-based methods generally. The platform respects the diversity of students and their needs and allows flexible learning paths. However, it became also evident that teaching materials for the Arabic Language Education programme primarily follow a more traditional approach (except language acquisition). Therefore, it must be assured that a student-centred approach in teaching material is implemented (**Finding 9**).

Being the nature of master and PhD programmes, independent research is encouraged in both master and PhD programme curricula in English Language Education. UM's approach towards providing support to these students follows a mentorship approach which enables students step-by-step to take more responsibility in outcome-based research. The evidence provided during the site visit can be stated as meaningful. This approach focuses on a straightforward vertical approach, with professors being the primary source of guidance and exchange. The experts command this approach because it assures that the research topics are still in the light of the department. Still, the experts believe that it be wise to amplify this focus and expand from a purely vertical one to a vertical and horizontal one, meaning that content-related exchange between students within the programmes should be fostered to enhance autonomous learning of students (**Finding 10**). One way to foster that would be by integrating a graduate research seminar for English Language Education Master and PhD where students can present their research findings amongst peers.

In general, the examination methods used in the programmes are transparently described and follow a clear systematic structure, and a good variety of examination methods is given. The examination methods fit the intended learning outcomes on the course level. The examination regulations provided to students support the high awareness of the examination process, including appeal procedures. Especially PhD students have clear indicators concerning milestones for the PhD thesis writing, which have been proven to be eligible. All programmes have a final thesis with a designated amount of credits at the end of the curriculum. It has been

stated and confirmed that everybody involved is informed early about the examination period, allowing students to plan efficiently.

Concerning the examinations on the course level, it has been evidenced that the examination cover skills, knowledge, and competencies outlined for the courses. Being another integral part of the intended learning outcomes on the course level, the intended learning outcomes regarding attitude on the course level are in many instances examined during the courses but not in the final examination. Although the experts understand that in many instances, the examination of the intended learning outcomes in this part is done during the course itself, it needs to be assured that soft skills in the intended learning outcomes are assessed adequately in the final examinations of the courses (**Finding 11**).

### Conclusion

This criterion is partially fulfilled.

# 4. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification / Legal Status, Admission and Certification

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
	The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.
Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published	Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published
regulations are in place which cover student admis-	regulations are in place which cover student admis-
sion, progression, recognition, and certification.	sion, progression, recognition, and certification.
[ESG 1.4]	[ESG 1.4]

# Description

# Admission

Being a state university in Indonesia, UM carries out student's intake based on national regulations. Thus, the enrolment process is centralized and organized by the Admission Committee of new students. The application is open to all candidates from different parts of Indonesia and without any restriction concerning the socio-economic background.

For Bachelor study programmes, prospective students can apply online following three admission schemes (National Invitation Scheme, SNMPTN; National Examination Scheme, SBMPTN; and an internal scheme), publicly available to prospective students.

The National Invitation Scheme uses the high school results as the main data source. They comprise academic and non-academic achievements (such as sports, arts or music) and the rank of the respective school. Within this process, schools are required to submit student and school databases to Indonesia's school and student database (PDSS). Prospective students can then apply for the respective programme. The official enrolment of students happens based on the Student Admission Committee at UM. This usually happens between December and April.

The National Examination Scheme is carried out between April and June and consists of two multiple-choice tests (scholastic potential test; TPA, and academic potential test, TKA). In this scheme, students can receive scholarships given under specific conditions, such as low-income families.

The last enrolment scheme happens in comparison to the two other scheme at university level. It consists of talent-based examinations, computer-based examination, and a degree transfer programme (SPAJ). SPAJ is

offered to graduates of a diploma 3 programme from other institutions to transfer into a Bachelor's degree programme at UM.

The enrolment process for Master and PhD students follows two admission schemes (Independent scheme and Collaborative scheme). The Independent scheme is carried out once a year and requires a written entrance test. The scheme includes English proficiency tests. Besides PhD students must take an interview test. This information is published on UM's homepage and in the university app. The Collaborative scheme has been established based on memorandums of understanding with an organization or governmental bodies, such as the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs or provincial governments.

International students can apply either for self-funding or scholarship schemes. The admission procedures are open twice a year (May and November). International applicants should demonstrate good English proficiency (e.g., TOEFL (ITP) score of 500 or IELTS overall score of 5.5). However, international students are required to take a four-month Bahasa Indonesian language course before enrolment. International students can either apply for the UM International Student Scholarship (UM-ISS) or the Developing Countries Partnership scholarship (KNB). International students can submit their documents directly via mail to the respective Faculty.

#### Progression

The monitoring system on the student learning progress is carried out by the academic advisor, the Vice Dean for Academic Affairs, the Dean, the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, and the Rector. One of the primary responsibilities lies with the academic advisors. Academic advisors offer three times a year an academic consultation (beginning, middle, and end of the semester). Students can seek assistance on academic matters in case of bad performances of students (a GPA lower than 2.00) or an extended study period (over eight semesters).

#### **Recognition**

The recognition procedures at UM cover several levels (student exchange and under the MBKM programme within Indonesia). As outlined in the SER, the Faculty has established first student mobility agreements in 2019 with Linneaus University (Sweden). The agreement involves an exchange of students, faculty members as well as administrative staff. It is said that the recognition procedure follows the scheme for Erasmus programmes. Within Asia, the Faculty participates in various exchange programmes, e.g., in Taiwan, Malaysia, China, Thailand, or Australia.

It is crucial for the curricula to outline that the MBKM programme to allow some flexibility within the Indonesian higher education system can be used for elective courses with collaborating universities in Indonesia. This programme started with the 2020 cohort and, thus, will happen in 2022.

In addition, an internship with international project partner institutions can be carried out by students. In the past, students have participated in internship programmes with, for example, Egypt.

#### **Certification**

When completing the respective study programme, students will receive the Sarjana Pendidikan degree for teacher's study programmes, or the Sarjana Sastra (for non-teacher education programmes) on the Bachelor level. Master and PhD graduates will receive a Magister Pendidikan degree or a PhD degree, respectively. They will receive a supplementary document for the degree, enlisting the academic and non-academic achievements.

### Experts' Evaluation

Being a state university, UM follows a student admission system at the undergraduate level that follows government regulations. However, UM also conducts student enrolment with additional admission requirements which the government does not fully regulate. This applies especially to the faculty of literature, where the entrance test focuses on specific language proficiencies depending on the programme. Likewise, international students who want to enrol at UM must take so-called BIPA courses to have a basic knowledge in Bahasa prior to starting the actual study programmes. On the Master and PhD levels, prospective students have to pass a TOEFL ITP score of 500 or an IELTS overall score of 5.5 besides the academic potential test, which is in line with the national accreditation standards. International students must pass the BIPA course to be enrolled at UM.

The monitoring system of students' study progress, especially undergraduate students, aligns with the quality assurance system both at the faculty level and study programmes level. Each student has an academic supervisor. The supervising lecturer must provide a report on the progress of student studies every semester at least three consultation meetings with his/her guidance students. Academic supervising lecturers also function as study advisors who help develop study plans and monitor student study progress. Lecturers are required to make reports that are reported to the administrative system (SIAKAD). Also, Master and PhD students are monitored by the SIAKAD system. Students have a supervisor who monitors the writing process when writing their final project (Master's thesis or dissertation).

UM has implemented recognition for students who get or have competencies from other places. Within the Indonesian higher education system, the so-called *Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka* (Freedom to learn; MBKM) has also been implemented at UM. This programme allows students to take specific courses at other Indonesian universities. Besides, internships are recognised by the university, which allows students to strengthen their practical experience. For some programmes, international cooperation agreements have already been signed with universities abroad. The recognition of courses taken by students abroad is facilitated, and the experts have been provided with evidence. These procedures are monitored by the faculty and at the university level. Recognition of competencies obtained from student exchanges with other universities is recognised with an equalisation and conversion system in the UM assessment system. This is evidence that the recognition system has been running well.

Students receive accurate documentation following the government regulations outlining whether the students have followed an education programme or a non-educational programme. This is outlined in the certificate (SPd. for educational programmes or SS for non-educational programmes). Following the Indonesian regulations, Master and PhD graduates receive an M.Pd. or Dr. certificate. In addition, students receive a Certificate of Companion Diploma (SKPI) or a Supplement Diploma, which is an official statement issued by a university containing information about the academic achievement or qualifications of a graduate with a higher education degree.

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 5. Teaching Staff / Academic Level of Supervisory Staff

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
The composition (quantity, qualifications, profes-	The composition (quantity, qualifications, profes-
sional and international experience, etc.) of the staff	sional and international experience, etc.) of the staff
is appropriate for the achievement of the intended	is appropriate for the achievement of the intended
learning outcomes.	learning outcomes.
Staff involved with teaching is qualified and compe-	Staff involved with teaching is qualified and compe-
tent to do so.	tent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruit-	Transparent procedures are in place for the recruit-
ment and development of staff.	ment and development of staff.
[ESG 1.5]	[ESG 1.5]

### Description

Following the SER, the faculty has 107 academic staff members, all of whom are full-time academic staff. 94 academic staff members are certified by the National Committee of Academic Staff Certification, whereas 13 are currently not since they are new in the department and have currently not been able to meet the administrative criteria. Additionally, it is stated that there are overlaps between the departments, if applicable. The teaching hours per academic staff members is set between 12-16 credits per semester which can be distributed into 2-8 SKS for education and teaching, 2-6 SKS for research, 1-6 SKS for community service, 1-4 SKS for professional training, and 0-3 SKS for supporting activities. The overview of staff indicates that the faculty has the following composition of teaching staff:

- **Bachelor English Language Education** (Total staff 13; one associate professor, eight assistant professors, four lecturers),
- Bachelor English Language and Literature (Total staff 11; one associate professor, nine assistant professors, one lecturer),
- **Bachelor Indonesian Language Education** (Total staff 25; nine professors, twelve associate professors, four assistant professors),
- **Bachelor Arabic Language Education** (Total staff 25; four professors, seven associate professors, nine assistant professors, five lecturers),
- Bachelor German Language Education (Total staff 15; six associate professors, eight assistant professors, one lecturer),
- Master English Language Education (Total staff 9; one professor, one associate professor, seven assistant professors), and
- PhD English Language Education (Total staff 7; seven professors).

Concerning the staff recruitment, it is outlined that UM has two types of academic staff (Civil Servant and permanent academic staff). Both of them are recruited in similar procedures following an open call at the university's homepage. The initiation of the recruitment begins with an overview of academic staff needs based on teacher-students-ratio, followed by specific needs detection on the department level. The recruitment process is differentiated into three steps (administrative screening, academic potential test/test in insights about Indonesia, and an English proficiency test). The first two stages are administered on the national scale, whereas the third stage is carried out on department level.

The university provides professional development opportunities to its staff in line with the three strategic goals of UM. This includes workshops on applied teaching approaches, media development courses, and life-based learning. Being part of the agreement with Linneaus University, academic staff has participated in the past in online platform workshops and collaborative training in Thailand. Research activities of staff are fostered by providing research proposal writing, research budget planning or data analysis. Furthermore, management, leadership and personal development activities are offered to staff members at UM, including English proficiency courses.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

Based on the evidence during the site visit, the panel commends the highly motivated and qualified staff for the programmes with excellent pedagogy concepts and research skills, as shown in their evaluations and publications. This expertise is meaningfully used in the teaching and learning process of students. The hiring

and promotion process and other human resources issues in teaching within the programme are transparent and well documented. The CVs of the teaching staff show their academic and other relevant qualifications. It was self-evident that the teaching staff is appropriately qualified for the achievement of all intended learning outcomes. The number of teaching staff and assigned teaching hours seem sufficient and appropriate. The overall workload of all staff (teaching, administration, research) seems appropriate for a successful application of the programme. The retirement issue of some faculty members was discussed, and UM assured that when contracts expire in the next six years, the intent is to refill the position. Vacancies are being advertised or are in the middle of appointment proceedings.

Furthermore, a system has been implemented to keep expertise within the departments, meaning that full professors who are about to retire try to smoothen this process by guiding younger colleagues at a very early stage. Transparent recruitment procedures for teaching staff are in place. Additionally, it must be stated that the qualification of the supervisory staff for the PhD programme is also appropriate to ensure the academic success of the graduate students. Total numbers of faculty, teacher-student ratio and the relevant workload are appropriate for the successful running of the programmes. The areas of responsibility of supervisors are marked and transparent.

Following UM's foundation, the programmes' teaching staff have a solid background in learning concepts and discipline-specific knowledge and competencies. It became evident that the digital competencies within the staff body could be used more strategically in the courses (**see Finding 1 and Finding 7**). The panel is also impressed with the way UM supports faculty development and research. From all conversations and documentation, it became clear that the faculty supports enhancing their research agenda and publishing their findings.

# Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 6. Learning Resources and Student Support / Support and Research Environment

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
Appropriate facilities and resources are available for	Guidance and support are available for students
learning and teaching activities.	which include advice on achieving a successful com-
Guidance and support is available for students which	pletion of their studies.
includes advice on achieving a successful comple-	Appropriate facilities and resources are available for
tion of their studies.	learning and research activities.
[ESG 1.6]	[ESG 1.6]

# Description

# Learning Resources

The Faculty points out that the study programmes have access to four buildings with a total 57 classrooms. In addition, the study programmes can use the Shared Lecture Building, a facility for independent and collaborative learning. The Shared Lecture Building has 200 classrooms. Furthermore, the SER lists 21 workspace rooms with a capacity for 140 students. Besides, seven meeting rooms and one meeting hall can be used by the programmes. The Faculty itself has a multi-function hall for 250 people, and UM owns a lecture hall for 350 people.

UM offers the university's main library, the faculty library, the graduate library, and the institutional library, all of which are integrated into UM's library system. Through the integrated library system, students have access to 113 national and 154 international journals. In addition, the library hosts 74,422 titles with 182,323 hard copies, 17.639 electronic textbooks, and 4.581 e-journals. The Faculty library has access to 13.838 titles (25.710 copies).

For the study programme in this cluster, the Faculty offers different language-related corners. These corners are equipped with facilities where students can individually access hardcopy materials, online books, and software to accommodate language learning. With each distinctive feature in every centre, such as the calligraphy corner for Arabic and Mandarin, students have space to practice their calligraphy skills. The availability of technology in every centre will also support students' independent learning and increase their motivation to learn a language.

Students also have access to a Moodle platform and course management system, and the SIAKAD database provides students with information on academic affairs (syllabi, schedules) or student affairs (e.g., achievement reports). On a general level, UM provides Healthcare Centres access consisting of general and dental units, an ambulance, facilities for religious practices, and other necessary facilities (bank, photocopy, post).

### Student support

The university provides general introduction weeks for Freshmen consisting of information on the university, Faculty and the respective study programme. This also includes an introduction to civic education, a guideline on mental revolution, the free elective courses (MBKM), environmental issue topics, or student policies, counselling services, library access, and online platforms.

The Freshmen Orientation (PKKBM) at the faculty level involves sharing information on the Faculty's history, vision, mission, and objectives, as well as the introduction to faculty officials and support staff and student organisations and their activities. The PKKBM at the department level outlines the department's history, vision, mission, and objectives explicitly, with the introduction to academic staff and the curriculum, profile, facilities, and testimonials from the alumni being the other key information shared during the event. In the academic year 2020/21, PKKMB has been carried out online due to the pandemic.

Academic advisors provide advisory services at the study programme level, with support including counselling on the study plan and on-time graduation, endorsement and approval for course enrolment, or intensive consultation for students with low academic performance.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

Learning resources for the programmes and student support are high and can be assessed as overall satisfactory. Students at all levels are provided with syllabi and course descriptions in due time and sufficient advice. On average, one member of staff is responsible as an academic advisor for about 30 students. Some students also stated that the comprehensive and profound information given to them before starting studies was one reason for choosing UM.

The equipment of the university as a whole is very good. Workspaces for students, language laboratories, media rooms, and classrooms are modern and sufficient for many students. Learning resources are appropriate for the programmes discussed here. Considering the size of the university and the programmes in this cluster, the number of titles and journals in the library might be increased to reach an international level (**Find-ing 12**). An interlibrary loan system within Indonesia is adopted. This can help students to attain research material not available at the university library itself. In addition, an effort should be made to improve direct access to the most recent international literature.

It has been shown to the experts that UM follows a digital learning approach, and sufficient e-learning devices are provided. Students are supported with advice as well as training by responsible university departments. Videos and tutorials are provided as well. Students stated an overall satisfaction with these procedures. Students and alumni also confirmed that this helped to get through the difficult situation caused by the pandemic.

Student representatives confirmed that student evaluation and feedback are considered regularly by teachers and the faculty. Complaints are collected and discussed and may lead to changes. It was also confirmed that student representatives are involved in all decision-making concerning student affairs. Students are also involved in extracurricular activities. Students confirmed that they are supported in their projects outside the university as well.

Students are encouraged by the university to proceed at overseas universities with their studies. Especially qualified students may receive scholarships for this purpose, provided by UM. University representatives also stated the intention to increase the number of incoming international students in the future. It might be helpful for this to revise the university's online presence, particularly in English language (**see Finding 13**). International students with incomplete knowledge of the Indonesian language will find it hard to collect all necessary data. A more explicit structure of the online presence should be aimed at.

Supervision on the level of the doctoral programme is very appropriate. Students are guided through their studies and requested to publish at least one article before finalizing their thesis. All research programmes of the university have to involve students in order to give them research experience. From an international perspective, the guidance, particularly in the doctoral programme, may seem to be a bit too thorough, thus sometimes impeding the development of individual researcher personalities. However, the panel recognizes that this may be unavoidable within the given cultural context.

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# 7. Public Information

Bachelor/Master Degree	Doctoral Degree
Impartial and objective, up-to-date information re-	Impartial and objective, up-to-date information re-
garding the programme and its qualifications is pub-	garding the programme and its qualifications is pub-
lished regularly. This published information is appro-	lished regularly. This published information is appro-
priate for and available to relevant stakeholders.	priate for and available to relevant stakeholders.
[ESG 1.8]	[ESG 1.8]

# Description

The main source of public information about the programmes can be found on the university's, faculty's and department's homepage. The information outlined includes the admission process for national and international students, information on university facilities, such as dormitories, laboratories, sports facilities. The information given on the homepages focuses on academic affairs, academic publications, students and Alumni, and quality assurance aspects. Furthermore, UM promotes its programme on social media channels.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

Operating in a changing higher education system, the panel of experts concludes that the study programmes' information is well available and easily accessible to the national public. All departments have an individual website that can be described as functional, objective, and informative. Social media channels also support

the departments. Looking at the Indonesian part of the homepages, one can find bilingual handbooks which succinctly describe the programmes, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, the selection procedures, and inform the external stakeholders about the outcome. Also, the Indonesian homepages are accompanied by plug-in English translations. However, when looking at the English version of the department homepages, the information given was diametrically opposed to the one provided in the Indonesian version. Therefore, and in the light of the internationalisation efforts of the university, the information on the programmes has to be outlined transparently for Non-Indonesian speakers (**Finding 13**).

### Conclusion

This criterion is fulfilled.

# V. Findings

- 1. Digital and creative skills should be fostered in the Bachelor programmes "English Language Education" being a relevant set of skills for the future career of graduates.
- 2. The aspect of non-formal oral competencies should be expanded in the curriculum to foster career-oriented tracks within the Bachelor programme "Arabic Language Education".
- 3. It might be considerable to strive towards language proficiency level of B2 for the "German Language Education" programme.
- 4. Internships, being a crucial experience for graduates' success, could be extended to foster practical competencies of students.
- 5. Rather than providing an introductory overview, the courses in "German literature" should focus on acquiring textual competencies in the light of German literature.
- 6. The programme "German Language Education" should intensify its efforts to internationalise with Germanspeaking institutions in Europe.
- 7. Digital and multiliteracy concepts of education should be integrated as elective courses into the Master and PhD curriculum "English Language Education".
- 8. It must be assured that for all programmes the predefined examination quality targets are holistically collected and analysed. The results must be used for the continuous quality improvement of the programmes.
- 9. It should be assured that teaching materials for "Arabic Language Education" beyond the acquisition of language competencies focus on student-centred learning.
- 10. To foster autonomous learning and research of students, it might be wise to integrate a graduate research seminar for English Language Education Master and PhD where students can present their research findings amongst peers.
- 11. It needs to be outlined (e.g. by using a matrix, by explicitly incorporating student-centred learning) how soft skill compentencies are assessed within the courses of the study programmes.
- 12. Access to discipline-specific journals of international reputation should be given to students.
- 13. To support efforts in internationalisation, relevant information on the study programmes should be made available in English to non-Indonesian speakers.