



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI MALANG, INDONESIA

CLUSTER TEACHER EDUCATION

NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

SPECIAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

SPORT COACHING EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

December 2022



Content

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS | 3 |
| I. Preamble | 7 |
| II. Accreditation procedure..... | 7 |
| 1. Criteria..... | 7 |
| 2. Approach and methodology | 7 |
| III. General information on the university | 9 |
| IV. Assessment of the study programmes..... | 10 |
| 1. Quality of the curriculum..... | 10 |
| 2. Procedures for quality assurance | 17 |
| 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students | 19 |
| 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification | 22 |
| 5. Teaching staff | 23 |
| 6. Learning resources and student support..... | 25 |
| 7. Information | 27 |
| V. Recommendation of the panel of experts..... | 28 |

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “NON-FORMAL EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “SPECIAL EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “SPORT COACHING EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI MALANG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 15th meeting on 5 December 2022, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “Non-Formal Education” (Bachelor of Education), “Elementary School Teacher Education” (Bachelor of Education), “Special Education” (Bachelor of Education) and “Sport Coaching Education” (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2023**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2028**.

Conditions for all programmes:

1. The Faculty of Education must develop a standardised procedure to process collected data from stakeholders.

For the study programme “**Elementary School Teacher Education**”:

2. In the “Elementary School Teacher Education” curriculum content referring to children with special need has to get a stronger focus and this has to be described transparently in the course descriptions.

For the study programme “**Sport Coaching Education**”:

3. The graduation profile of the Bachelor’s programme “Sports Coaching Education” has to reflect alternative career paths of graduates. Adjustments to the curriculum must be made, if necessary.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

1. The faculties should consider implementing more English course options into the curricula to foster students' language competencies.
2. The internal quality assurance instruments should include the assessment of the study duration and in cases in which it is extended, this should be analysed.
3. The panel of experts suggests implementing the re-sit option for exams in the educational guide.
4. If the examination methods are changed it should be considered that the method is still adequate to reflect the intended learning outcomes on the course level.
5. It is suggested to implement more reflective learning approaches.
6. The basic fitness test for the admission should be revised to assess valid indicators for study programmes in the field sport and physical education.
7. The Faculty of Education should systematically implement a strategy to enhance staff's English competencies.
8. The Faculty of Education should further develop its internationalisation strategy considering:
 - a. more collaborations with European universities or researchers;
 - b. an expansion of international staff mobility.
9. The support for teaching staff publishing in international journals should be fostered, e.g., by providing more time to carry out research or providing more grant options for staff.

For the study programme "**Non-Formal Education**":

10. The focus on applied theory courses should be fostered in the Bachelor's programme "Non-Formal Education".
11. The "Non-Formal Education" curriculum should develop a joint basis for all imparted directions of non-formal education at an early stage.
12. It should be considered to remove the course in "Ethnology" from the "Non-Formal Education" curriculum.
13. The "Non-Formal Education" department should combine social work competencies with adult education theory knowledge to foster this graduates' path.
14. The "Non-Formal Education" department should create synergies with other departments of the Faculty of Education, e.g., the department for "Special Education".

For the study programme "**Special Education**":

15. The curriculum for "Special Education" should provide opportunities for students to focus more on the educational aspects of the discipline.
16. Adjustments in the curriculum "Special Education" should be made to provide a stronger curriculum. These adjustments should cover the following points:
 - a. Being valuable to all students, the course "Assisted Technology" should be made compulsory.
 - b. In order to raise analysis competencies in research of students, the statistics content should be separated from the research course and placed at an earlier stage of the curriculum.

17. The intended learning outcomes three and four should be more strongly included in the “Special Education” programme's and transparently described in the course descriptions.
18. The department for “Special Education” is encouraged to further develop the teaching material used in the courses.

For the study programme “**Sport Coaching Education**”:

19. More opportunities should be given to those students in “Sports Coaching Education” who pursue different career paths than becoming teachers.
20. The “Sports Coaching Education” curriculum should also emphasise sports science components instead of focusing primarily on sports.
21. New sports developments should be integrated as elective courses in the broad field of sport, exercise, human movement and physical activities in the “Sports Coach Education” curriculum.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- **NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- **ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- **SPECIAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- **SPORT COACHING EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI MALANG, INDONESIA

Online visit to the university: 11 April – 14 April 2022

Panel of experts:

| | |
|---------------------------|--|
| Prof. Dr. Loh Sau Cheong | University of Malaya (Malaysia), Faculty of Education, Head of Department Educational Psychology and Special Education |
| Prof. Dr. Andreas Thimmel | University of Applied Sciences Cologne (Germany), Institute for Childhood, Youth and Education, Jean Monnet Chair on Youth Work and Non-Formal Education in Europe |
| Prof. Dr. Erin Gerlach | University of Hamburg (Germany), Institute of Human Movement Science, Head of Department Physical Education and Sports Pedagogy |
| Assoc. Prof. Zeynep Alat | Ege University (Turkey), Faculty of Education, Department of Basic Education |
| Dr. Ellinor Haase | Chair of International Certificate Conference – The International Language Association e.V., Bochum (Germany) (labour market representative) |
| Martin Schleef | Technical University of Dortmund, Germany (student representative) |

Coordinators:

| | |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| Doris Herrmann, Annette Büning | AQAS, Cologne, Germany |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor of Education programmes “Non-Formal Education”, “Elementary School Teacher Education”, “Special Education”, “Sport Coaching Education” offered by Universitas Negeri Malang.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in December 2020. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In March 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- Module descriptions
- Regulations on quality assurance procedures
- Samples of degree certificates
- Examples of lecturers' research
- Student assessment documents

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 06 December 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in January 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in March 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, an online site visit to the university took place on 11–14 April 2022. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the university, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the statement of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. The AQAS Standing Commission discussed the report in its meeting on 29 August 2022 and took its decision based on the report and the statement of the university on 5 December 2022. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Negeri Malang (UM) is a public state university located in Malang, East Java, Indonesia. It was founded in 1954 as an Institute for teacher training and education and gained university status in 1999, expanding to non-education subjects. UM follows the principles of the three pillars of higher education: education, research and community services. The university's Strategic Plan is built around the motto "Excellence in Learning Innovation". UM is subdivided into eight faculties and one school for graduate programmes; it offers 120 study programmes at Diploma, Bachelor, Master and Doctoral levels. Currently, UM has 38,979 active students, according to the SER.

The Faculty of Education (FIP) offers four programmes to be accredited, according to the SER, the oldest faculty, founded in 1954. FIP also manages the Sports Coaching Education Programme and the Faculty of Sport Science (FIK).

The mission of the Faculty of Education, as described in the SER, is to carry out:

1. High-quality education and learning to develop the potential and personality of noble and superior students nationally and internationally.
2. Research in science and technology, as well as in the field of education, is seen as beneficial for the development of science and the welfare of society.
3. Community service that is oriented towards community empowerment through the application of science and technology, and the education sector.
4. An autonomous, accountable and transparent civil service system that ensures sustainable quality improvement.

The Faculty of Education has 148 lecturers and 5.270 students. The Faculty of Sports has 71 lecturers and 13 education staff, and 2.069 students. Both faculties also offer additional study programmes, e.g. "Guidance and Counselling" or "Educational Technology" in the Faculty of Education, and, e.g. "Sport Sciences" and "Community Health Science" in the Faculty of Sports.

The Faculty of Education reports having 359 domestic and 23 foreign cooperations, including the University of Hiroshima, Mindanao State University, Prince of Songkla University, University of Malaya, and the National Changhua University of Education.

The mission of the Faculty of Sports is to (1) organise student-centred educational and learning activities in physical education, sports and health by using an effective learning approach and optimizing the use of technology; (2) carry out research in physical education, sports and health based on science and technology, which findings are beneficial for the development of science and the welfare of society; (3) organize community service oriented towards community empowerment through physical education, sports and health; (4) organize a faculty-level guidance system that is autonomous, accountable, transparent, and responsible, ensuring continuous quality improvement as a learning resource centre in sports and health.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

a. Overarching aspects concerning all study programmes

All four study programmes that are to be accredited share common characteristics in their curriculum structure as they are study programmes that produce graduates with a degree in Bachelor of Education in their respective fields. The SER states that the programmes' curricula were revised in 2020 the last time. It is stated that stakeholders are involved in curriculum development.

As the SER explains, the curricula of the study programmes consider that a Bachelor's degree has to fulfil the qualifications of level six of the National Qualifications Framework of Indonesia. That includes

- being capable of applying science, technology, and art within a graduate's field of expertise in solving problems and being adaptable to the situation at hand;
- mastering in-depth general and specific theoretical concepts of specific knowledge and being capable of formulating solutions to procedural problems;
- being capable of taking strategic decisions based on information and data analysis, and providing direction in choosing several alternative solutions independently and in a group; and
- being responsible for their work and being capable to be assigned the responsibility of attaining the organisation's performance.

Based on the substance of their content, the curriculum structure of the four study programmes is grouped into three subject groups, namely courses on character building, core courses that aim at providing competence in the academic educational aspects according to the respective fields, as well as elective courses/transdisciplinary courses where students can take courses according to their specialisation.

The SER states that the programmes in the cluster comprise eight semesters with a programme workload of 146 SKS credits in the Indonesian system. According to Malang University, one credit equals 2.8 hours of workload in one week and 43.7 hours of workload in one semester.

Experts' evaluation

The experts have analysed the overall curricula structure for all four programmes. They have understood that the programmes are based on national regulations, the respective graduation profiles, and the intended learning outcomes at the programme level. The experts have learned that the intended learning outcomes on the programme level cover general skills, competencies and attitude components, and also discipline-specific intended learning outcomes (ILOs). This setting allows less flexibility for the departments concerning the expansion of additional skills of students. However, the experts believe that the successful implementation of Merdeka Belajar - Kampus Merdeka (Freedom to Learn – Independent Campus; MBKM) will allow the

departments to have more flexibility, e.g., more English courses which could foster the students' language competences development more intensively (**Finding 1**).

The programmes are in line with level 6 of the Indonesian Qualifications Framework (KKNI) and, thus, in line with the same level of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).

The University provided the experts with calculation metrics concerning UM's workload calculation to compare the study programmes to the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

b. Non-Formal Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The Non-Formal Education study programme aims to provide informal community educational services. The learning outcomes given in the SER include equipping the students with positive characteristics, gaining independence and working innovatively, adaptively and critically based on global dynamics. They aim to allow them to master the concept of community empowerment through informal education approaches that are critical, creative, cooperative, communicative, and literate in information technology. Students shall also be enabled to master the concept of social-preneurship and research that addresses community empowerment through non-formal and informal educational approaches.

The structure of the curriculum includes five basic courses on character building, such as "Pancasila Education", "Civics Education", and "Indonesian Language Education". It includes 33 core courses, three of which are basic courses on the subject matter, e.g., "Introduction to Education", 28 courses on the field of study, e.g., "Identification of Community Learning Needs" or "Development of Community Empowerment", an internship and a community service programme. It also includes 17 elective and transdisciplinary courses, e.g., "Social Entrepreneurship Strategy". A thesis concludes the study programme. The university has depicted an idealized typical course plan.

It is possible to choose elective courses as a part of three specializations, namely elective courses on "Community Empowerment", on "Training", and on "Family Education".

The study programme is supposed to train students to gain jobs as community educators and as managers of non-formal education in government and non-government institutions.

Experts' evaluation

The qualification aim for the programme is presented as intended learning outcomes on programme level. They include academic and scientific requirements for an adequate degree that reflects the Bachelor's level. The programme is built on pedagogical concepts, focused chiefly on adult learning concepts. They also include sociology, anthropology, and educational psychology as the basis of the programme. The teaching and learning process is based on the humanistic philosophical approach. In Indonesia, jobs related to non-formal education are wide open and highly needed by communities as many still do not have any opportunities to receive an education. Non-formal education can become a supplement and complement to formal education. On the national scale, it has been demonstrated that the programme has undergone national accreditation procedures regularly. The intended learning outcomes are updated according to current developments by discussions in the team of lecturers.

The curricular structure of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes and the learner's progression. The concept of participation is essential. All activities in the community start with a need analysis. As such, participation and activity involvement are put into practice leading to high community satisfaction at the end of the service. In addition, they maintain a partnership with the relevant institutions so that they can control and observe all needs of the communities. The participants join voluntarily. They combine research, education, and community service.

The curriculum covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge as well as subject-related, methodological, and general skills. Two systems help students focus on their interests: (1) students receive real experience in rural areas during their studies and discuss issues with both institutional partners and groups; and (2) students can choose the major that suits their interests. The curriculum imparts valuable community education, which is relevant in the discipline, including leadership, social communication, and identifying community needs. As stated, the curriculum combines theory and practice to a reasonable extent. It equips students with the necessary theoretical knowledge and expands this knowledge by having practical experiences. Despite that combination of theory and practice, the experts believe that it is helpful for the programme to include applied theory topics into the curriculum (**Finding 2**). Real issues that students might face when entering the labour market will strengthen their capacities to cope with these situations. Topics such as politics, sociology, economics, and social and welfare policies should also be integrated into the curriculum to this extent.

The experts have learned that the programme combines three aspects of non-formal education (community empowerment, training, and family education). The experts believe these three categories should not be taught separately at the beginning of the curriculum. The curriculum should also be developed towards a curriculum that reflects the discipline at the beginning (e.g., by an overarching overview course that reflects the three directions of non-formal education). This should happen before the sixth semester. Then, at a later stage, more specific courses for the three directions could build on this overview course (**Finding 3**).

When examining the curriculum, the experts have analysed the composition of the curriculum and appreciate the careful conception that fosters the learner's progression. However, integrating an "Ethnology" course into the programme caused a slight irritation. The experts believe this course might be irrelevant to the programme and leaving it out would give room for more relevant courses. A clarification process should take place to figure out whether it can be replaced (**Finding 4**).

Graduates of the programme work in professional or academic associations, non-governmental organisations, and educational institutions. Also, the programme has collaborations with the Centre for Community Learning and Activities. This collaboration supports students in getting practical experience via internships or micro-teaching. The panel of experts commends this very much because it helps students to acquire valuable experiences. In many cases, graduates of the programme work as social workers, which is good. However, when discussing with the stakeholders, the experts learned that there is currently only a lower connection between social work and employment with adult education theory. The experts believe that this could be fostered (**Finding 5**).

During the experts' assessment, it became evident that the departments of the faculty are individually strong. This is an indicator of good faculty leadership. Based on that, it might be helpful for the programme to look into the option for more collaboration between the departments. The logical connection for this programme would be a collaboration with the special education department, e.g., shared courses or other activities (**Finding 6**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

c. Special Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The Special Education study programme addresses inclusive education for children with special needs. The learning outcomes of this study programme include, according to the SER, designing the education of children with special needs, e.g., in inclusive schools at the level of preschool, primary and secondary education; carrying out the education of children with special needs by using a learning approach that is effective, innovative, and humanistic as well as evaluating the education, and implement attitude, knowledge, skills with a commitment to take advantage of every opportunity for life-based self-development.

The structure of the curriculum includes five introductory courses on character building, such as “Pancasila Education”, “Civics Education”, and “Indonesian Language Education”. It includes 38 core courses, three of which are basic courses on the subject matter, e.g., “Introduction to Education”, 33 courses on the field of study, e.g., “Learning Media for Children with Special Needs” or “Education for children with visual impairment”, an internship and a community service programme. It also includes 15 elective and transdisciplinary courses, e.g., “Education for Autistic Children”. A thesis concludes the study programme. The university has depicted an idealized typical course plan.

Graduates from the Special Education study programme are expected to be special education teachers at Special Schools, special education teachers at traditional schools that organize inclusive education, or to become activists in governmental organizations or non-governmental organizations in the field of disabilities.

Experts’ evaluation

The programme is comprehensive with the inclusion of introductory courses, courses in the field that cover the diverse range of special needs education, coupled with an internship, community service, and a thesis. These will equip the students with fundamental knowledge when they serve in special education and inclusive settings. The curriculum is compact, with five introductory courses for character building, three basic courses, 33 courses on the field of study, one internship and one community service programme, 15 elective and transdisciplinary courses, and a thesis. Some courses fall within the interdisciplinary domain, which indirectly has strengthened the programme.

The feedback during the site visit found that the lecturers were committed to their teaching. They adopted different instructional strategies and a variety of assessment methods. Most lecturers conduct research in special education and have published journals and proceedings. As for the students, they adopted positive attitudes towards their learning. Graduates from the Special Education programme are highly in demand by the labour market. Despite the positive remarks, there is still some room for improvement for the programme, as follows:

Special education covers a whole life spectrum, from early childhood to adulthood and old age. Currently, many courses mainly deal with the pedagogical component. However, the curriculum should also focus on education (**Finding 7**). The experts believe that areas such as young adults, transitional phases, adulthood, and family education beyond school settings could be addressed by electives. One way to get there might be courses such as “Transition to Career”, “Employment for Special needs”, or “Family Collaboration” (as an interdepartmental course with the non-formal education Bachelor’s programme).

The experts have learned that the programme focuses on the labour market needs and academia equally. The curriculum is composed so students can specialise in specific areas according to their needs. The experts commend this flexibility. However, some adjustments should be made to provide a more solid foundation for the programme (**Finding 8**). This includes a shift of the course “Assisted technology” from the electives to the compulsory courses (**Finding 8a**) to make up for the labour market needs, and the separation of the statistics

course and the research course (**Finding 8b**). Currently, the statistics content is given within the research course. The programme should consider reversing the alignment of research-focused and statistics courses since research is a broader scope that encompasses data analysis. In contrast, statistics is zooming into data analysis, which is part and parcel of research. By doing so, students will better understand linking statistics with research.

The programme has four Graduate Learning Outcome Standard, namely: 1. Designing the education of Children with Special Needs (ABK) in independence-based special schools, inclusive schools, and non-formal education at the level of pre-school, primary and secondary education; 2. carrying out the education of Children with Special Needs (ABK) in independence-based special schools, inclusive schools, and non-formal education at the level of pre-school, primary and secondary education and using a learning approach that is effective, innovative, and humanistic, as well as optimising the utilisation of various learning resources, science and technology-based learning media, and the potential of the local environment, according to the process and quality standards; 3. evaluating the education of Children with Special Needs (ABK) in independence-based special schools, inclusive schools, and non-formal education at preschool, primary and secondary education; and 4. applying the attitudes, knowledge, and skills with commitment to utilising every opportunity for life-based self-development. It is found that 72.91% of the courses fulfil the second SCPL, 22.92% of the courses fulfil the first SCPL, whereas only 2.08% of the courses fulfil the third and fourth SCPL, respectively. It is therefore suggested that the representation of programme learning outcomes in the curricula should be balanced, with more coverage of application and evaluation aspects (**Finding 9**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

d. Elementary School Teacher Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

As described in the SER, the study programme aims to qualify graduates in elementary school teacher education who master the main scientific fields of primary schools, pedagogical skills, personality, and social skills, as well as managerial and leadership skills, and who integrate technological developments in information and communication. The studies focus on elementary schools' scientific fields of education, mathematics, Indonesian language, social sciences, science, civics, and cultural arts. The graduates are to be enabled to implement, analyse, evaluate, apply, and create life and information technology-based principles, approaches, strategies, methods, and learning contents by integrating research findings in elementary school education. They are to be enabled to produce scientific works based on research and information technology in elementary school education that support the paradigm of civilized human development, emphasising the formation of spiritual and social attitudes. Lastly, they shall produce professional service and assistance models that functionally help solve problems in scientific development in elementary school education based on research and information technology.

The structure of the curriculum includes five basic courses on character building, such as "Pancasila Education", "Civics Education", and "Indonesian Language Education". It includes 41 core courses, three of which are basic courses on the subject matter, e.g., "Introduction to Education", 36 courses on the field of study, e.g., "Problem-solving strategies of elementary school mathematics" or "Basic concepts of elementary school natural sciences", an internship and a community service programme. It also includes 12 elective and transdisciplinary courses, e.g., "Elementary school educational administration and supervision". A thesis concludes the study programme. The university has depicted an idealized typical course plan.

Graduates of this study programme are described as being able to take up a teaching career.

Experts' evaluation

The curriculum of the Bachelor's programme for Elementary School Teacher Education follows clearly set out regulations on the national level. The presentation in the self-evaluation report shows that the curriculum is based on a graduation profile, and the profile is translated into intended learning outcomes (ILOs) at the programme level. As typical for the region, the intended learning outcomes reflect discipline and non-discipline-related intended learning outcomes. After analysing the ILOs, the experts conclude a clear relationship between the graduation profile and the intended learning outcomes. The employment and alumni career paths fields demonstrate that the graduation profile and the graduates' job placement outcome are congruent. The experts have analysed the curriculum during the site visit and the documentation concerning its academic and practice-related standards. They see a robust curriculum with a good intake of students and a good number of graduates ready for the job. This has been verified with the labour market representatives.

The curriculum comprises nationally regulated courses at the beginning of the early semesters, and students take more discipline-specific courses. The curriculum supports the achievement of the ILOs. The overall curriculum of the programme fits to the national qualification framework and, thus, to the European Qualification Framework on level 6. When discussing with the relevant stakeholders, it became evident that the latest changes in the curriculum were primarily due to framework changes, e.g., the implementation of an outcome-based education or the implementation of electives (Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka - MBKM). This has been appropriately documented in the self-evaluation report. The experts have learned that students now have more space for individual study paths with more internship possibilities, opportunities to participate in student exchange programmes, or taking courses from other Indonesian higher education institutions. The experts commend the MBKM implementation since it makes studying more flexible.

The experts have seen evidence that UM has standardised procedures to collect internal and external feedback from relevant stakeholders to keep the curriculum up to date. Despite these procedures, the discussion has shown that inclusive competencies in integrating students with special needs are still somewhat underrepresented. The experts believe these topics are essential due to the inclusive character of education worldwide. Therefore, these competencies must be integrated more prominently into the curriculum (**Finding 10**). One way might be to develop special elective courses on this matter as a starting point for students interested in specialising in that direction.

The student handbook, the key student document, clearly indicates the curricular elements and differentiates between compulsory and elective courses. It includes a typical course plan. The experts have also discussed with the University the allocation of workload. The study programme uses the uniform model of workload presentation, which seems to fit the purpose. As discussed in chapter IV.2 (Procedures for Quality Assurance), it might be that a clear-cut workload analysis might lead to further insights into why students at instances study somewhat longer than expected.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

e. Sports Coaching Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

According to the SER, the study programme aims to qualify graduates who are supposed to be equipped to become sports coaching education teachers. The intended learning outcomes include mastering theoretical concepts of sports coaching standards, implementing comprehensive coaching processes, mastering the

theoretical concepts of developing and guiding athletes' talents, mastering the concept of sports coaching procedures, and being able to solve and analyse sports achievement problems as well as mastering the concepts, principles and techniques of sports and investment of management and entrepreneurship in the field of sports.

The SER explains that a group of elective courses is offered, specifically focusing on the deepening of each sport offered at the university. Specialization subjects offered are Athletics, Gymnastics, Swimming, Football, Volleyball, Basketball, Badminton, Table Tennis, Field Tennis, Pencak Silat, and Physical Conditions.

The structure of the curriculum includes five introductory courses on character building, such as "Pancasila Education", "Civics Education", and "Indonesian Language Education". It includes 37 core courses, 3 are basic courses on the subject matter, e.g., "Introduction to Education", 32 courses on the field of study, e.g., "History and philosophy of sports" or "Sports pedagogy", an internship and a community service programme. It also includes 31 elective and transdisciplinary courses, e.g., "Doping in sports". A thesis concludes the study programme. The university has depicted an idealized typical course plan.

Graduates of this study programme are described as being able take up a teaching career.

Experts' evaluation

Like all undergraduate programmes, the Bachelor's programme "Sports Coaching Education" follows a graduation profile which includes primarily becoming a teacher in Physical Education and sport. Based on that graduation profile, the intended learning outcomes on programme level are comprehensibly composed, which leads to the curriculum. The curriculum is, per se, comparable to other programmes in Indonesia in the discipline. In general, the experts conclude that the overall setup of the programme is fit for purpose and reflects the educational framework given in the Indonesian Qualifications Framework. There is an apparent reference to level 6 of the European Qualification Framework (EQF). The curriculum is based on nationally regulated courses implemented at the university level, faculty courses, and discipline-specific courses. The programme, thus, follows formulated regulations and is comparable to other programmes at the same level in Indonesia. However, minor differences were evident when examining the study programme in more detail. The experts have learned that graduates of the programme are also employed in other fields than high schools. Thus, the experts believe that the graduation profile has to consider this adequately. It has to be clearly outlined that becoming a teacher in sports is not the only employment path graduates of this programme usually take (**Finding 11**).

Having said that, the experts believe that more opportunities to specialise in non-teaching related areas would further support alternative employment paths for students (**Finding 12**). The experts have understood that the department has certain limitations due to the national regulations, e.g., nationally prescribed courses, and the maximum number of credit points on the Bachelor's level. The experts believe that carefully analysing specific courses outside the teacher's education spectrum (and maybe even outside the university) might allow the department to create synergies.

During the site visit, it became evident that the curriculum has implemented the MBKM option into the curriculum, which is appropriate.

As discussed above, the curriculum is comparable to the curricula in the discipline in Indonesia. The discussion with external stakeholders showed that the graduates are fit for the job, highly motivated, and have very good attitude skills. While discussing the curriculum, however, with the teaching staff, it became evident that the curriculum primarily covers the sports side of the discipline. This is, on the one hand, good because it reflects the rich sports culture in Indonesia, but, on the other hand, the experts believe that sports science aspects should be put more prominently in the curriculum (**Finding 13**). Based on the aspirations of the future graduates the students might have the option of elective courses which focus these career options at the end of the

bachelor's programme. The programme is strongly orientated on a traditional system of sports. Due to the dynamic change of the human movement culture and consistent flow one has to think about courses which meet this request by establishing an open approach in class about "movement projects". In collaboration with the students and in co-construction with elements of creative and self-regulated learning students should be enabled to develop new forms of human movement activities with specific perspectives (performance, health, social). Students should therefore be able to develop new trend sport in collaboration with their teachers. Moreover, and in addition to this latter argument, the University of Negeri Malang should think about the name of the programme. If there is a focus on future Physical Education students the programme should be named by this profile otherwise it could be changed but one has to state that the term "sports" in the name of the programme seems to be too narrow to catch all the phenomena in the very broad field of sports, exercise, human movement and physical activities which also will and have to developed in the future. The name of the programme should reflect this background. Similar to the potential, for synergies between Indonesian higher education institutions, the experts' panel believes that more collaboration with UM's Faculty of Education could be a good incubator for the programme to foster the educational science aspect of the programme to also support the competencies in students to become experts in sports education. Considering the idea of structure quality in a system the establishing a programme coordinator should be considered who is responsible for the coordination between the two faculties.

The broad range of sports offered within the curriculum is an excellent sign and is well reflected in the programme. Most of these are traditional sports activities usually included in curricula worldwide, especially in Indonesia. However, on an international scale, the programme might consider new sports developments in the long run (**Finding 14**). Also, as a side effect, this might be a unique selling point for the programme to attract more female students if these new developments would focus on sports that are not typically male-dominated. Courses from the field of sport sociology and gender/diversity studies could also help to reach this goal.

The documentation of the programme is adequate. Students are equipped with a student handbook that covers a broad range of information, including a study plan, an overview of courses in the programme, and specific regulations. The information also includes information on the expected workload.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

According to the SER, the quality assurance policies and mechanisms at UM have been developed according to the National Standards of Higher Education and the national ministry regulations. The UM Educational Guidelines set up the basis for quality assurance policies and procedures at UM, which are carried out by a quality assurance unit at the university and faculty levels. At the programme level, this is done through a quality assurance group. An Internal Quality Audit is done annually, while externally, the programmes are reviewed by BAN-PT (National Accreditation Board-Higher Education). According to the SER, all study programmes under review in this procedure are accredited nationally with an A-rating (Excellent).

In the monitoring-evaluation-implementation procedure, the main task of the quality assurance unit at the university level is to coordinate the design, system development, monitoring and evaluation, as well as manage Internal Quality Audit and disseminate the practice of implementing internal academic quality assurance at the university level.

The faculty quality assurance cycle follows the stages of determination, implementation, evaluation, control, and improvement (PDCA; PPEPP in Indonesian). At the programme and faculty level, online monitoring and evaluation tools are used to improve and develop the quality of learning, assess the lecturers' workload, and evaluate the student-lecturer ratio to ensure the quality of the implementation of the learning process. According to the SER, this so-called "Monevjar" is done regularly at the beginning, middle, and end of the semester.

The quality assurance group at the programme level is said to involve stakeholders, including students, lecturers, staff, alumni, graduates and partner institutions to ask for their satisfaction with the performance of the study programmes and faculties. Data on how many students successfully passed their courses, data on what percentage of students graduate on time, and reasons for dropping out are also said to be assessed.

The SER states that each study programme carries out graduate tracer studies through coordination by the UM tracer study team. The team contacts every graduate on a yearly basis by telephone and other media to fill out a questionnaire. This is done to show the suitability of the curriculum following the desired profile of the study programme. Feedback from stakeholders on graduates is screened through alumni tracer studies with an online questionnaire. UM provides results of many of the mentioned surveys via a website.

Experts' evaluation

Based on the documentation provided and the discussions with the departments, the experts testify that the central quality assurance system at Universitas Negeri Malang is adequately implemented in the four programmes in this cluster. The documentation included several university-wide policies describing the rules and regulations for the quality assurance process. Also, it highlights the responsibilities on the departmental level. On the national level, the programmes are accredited as A-level programmes, which means that they are marked as reputable programmes. In addition to this national external component of QA, the departments demonstrated the efficiency of UM's QA instruments by providing information and data by the programme evaluations. The discussion with the faculty management showed the functionality of the university's three levels of quality assurance units (SPM University, UPM Faculty, and GPM Department) and how they interact with each other. Students are integrated into the QA process on the lower scale by giving feedback on their courses (department level), on the medium scale by providing feedback on the programme as such (faculty level), and on the larger scale by their representation in the University's Senate (university level).

During the site visit, evidence was given on how input from different stakeholders was used to further develop the programmes, e.g., the introduction of life-based learning, adjustments to the labour market needs or reducing concentrations in a programme. A significant change, in general, has been implemented by following the national regulations on the Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka (MBKM), which allows students to take courses from other Indonesian higher education institutions. Understanding that implementing MBKM is not

only a challenge for UM but across Indonesia, the experts still believe that there is a considerable potential to uplift whole disciplines by benchmarking and combining with different programmes on the national scale.

Following UM's regulations, the programmes include a PDCA cycle to constantly monitor the efficiency of the teaching and learning process. This includes the collection of data internally and externally. However, when examining the data for each programme, it became evident that there are different standards concerning processing such data. Understanding that UM is generally based on relatively standardised procedures from top to bottom, the experts believe that a standardisation of the documentation and the depth of data collection is beneficial for the faculty management to compare the department in a more structured way. Vice versa, this standardisation is also necessary for the departments regarding further development of programmes (**Finding 15**).

The data collection also includes statistical data on the students' progression for each programme. The experts have received student composition, duration and completion rate statistics. When examining the data, the experts encountered that, in some instances, cohorts need longer than expected to complete their studies. The experts believe that the QA instruments are well established. Thus, a deeper analysis of why the study duration extends could be integrated into the instruments. This will foster the department's ability to react to developments more easily (**Finding 16**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

Bachelor's/Master' degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

The SER illustrates that the learning schedule of the study programmes can be accessed through an online system and that the courses are announced simultaneously on the university's website. Lecturers can see the name of the course to be taught and fill in materials and other types of content online. Students can register for the study plan through the system. To ensure a proportional learning load for students, they are required to consult their respective academic supervisor to obtain approval for courses and credits taken.

Lectures are carried out by utilizing the official UM e-learning platform. Lectures are conducted in a blended manner, both offline and online. Online lectures can be held at least 30% of the number of meetings in one semester. According to the SER, information related to the lecture can be accessed openly on the UM website. The university also provides open learning resources that can be accessed through the online system. UM states that students may participate in extracurricular programmes at student activity units according to the talents and interests of each student.

The SER states that the teaching features of the four study programmes are generally carried out interactively, scientifically, contextually, and collaboratively, based on information communication technologies with a

student-centred approach regarding and the characteristics of each study programme. Student learning activities in the four study programmes are generally in the form of theoretical lectures, practicum, fieldwork, or a combination of the three forms. An active role of the student is supposed to be pursued by discussions, demonstrations, recitations, experiments, training, field study and teaching simulation. Blended learning, practical course elements, and project- and problem-based learning are also said to play a role in the study programmes. Depending on the programme, specific learning methods are said to be additionally carried out.

According to the SER, UM's Education Guide covers the academic regulations and includes regulations on the teaching and learning processes and the assessment of students. Teaching methods, as well as assessment methods of the courses, are also stated in the module handbook of the study programme. The assessment of students is done via midterm examinations and final examinations. The SER states that written tests, portfolios, or assignments are used in theory courses, whereas in courses that require practice, such as learning simulations, performance assessments are mainly carried out through simulation tests (teaching or skills practice), product assessments or projects.

Additionally, daily assignments or group assignments can be given. Participation during lectures is expected. An examination can be waived for specific reasons, for example, when the exam is conducted at the same time as a competition for students who are also athletes. Each study programme provides each student with the schedule for the implementation of midterm and final examinations through social media or UM's official website. Education guidelines provide information about the mechanism if students cannot take the midterm and final examinations due to illness or other reasons beyond their responsibility. Before graduation, there is a final assessment in the bachelor's programme in the form of an internship and the final thesis.

The SER describes that to improve the competence of lecturers in conducting assessments, assessment development is also carried out and facilitated by the Educational Instrumentation, Selection and Evaluation unit (P2ISEP) as a service centre at UM to improve pedagogical skills and develop assessment conducting.

Experts' evaluation

The teaching and learning approach at UM is based on a clear mission statement that focuses on putting the student at the centre of the learning process. In contrast, the learning process should integrate the Tri Dharma of Education (the three pillars of education in Indonesia). UM understands its role here to support students with good education and support them towards an equal education despite their background. Based on these statements, the site visit has demonstrated that UM, and the programmes, ensure that students have equal access to technical equipment for the learning process. Based on the experiences during the pandemic, the University adapted quickly to the new situation and decided to carry out most courses online.

In contrast, practical courses were carried out on-site in smaller groups and following a strict hygiene protocol. The discussions showed that UM would continue integrating digital formats in future teaching activities. This will include synchronous and asynchronous teaching activities and specially designed teaching materials to support the learning process for these activities. The experts learned that this would especially support students from remote areas. In general, the teaching staff can draw on a broad range of teaching methods outlined in the University regulations. This enables the teaching staff to design the courses according to the intended learning outcomes on course level. Also, it became evident that the courses follow governmental regulations by implementing a more practice-based learning process in the courses. The teaching staff stated, and the students confirmed, that the teaching methods for each course are presented to the students at the beginning of the course. Thus, the teaching methodology can be described as supportive, transparent and adequate to the learner's needs and the intended learning outcomes on course level. When discussing this matter with the relevant stakeholders, it became clear that there are some minor differences concerning the readiness of the teaching material. Consequently, the experts' panel encourages the department for special education to keep updating the teaching material as other departments did in the past (**Finding 17**).

The assessment procedures for the study programmes are regulated by the University's examination regulations, which are published and thus accessible to students. The examination regulations define the range of examination methods and the structural aspects of the examination (e.g., lengths of thesis or duration of presentations). The regulations include alternative examination methods for students with visual impairments. The experts commend this structural integration for accommodating these needs. The examination regulations also specify the responsibilities for the examination process and the preparation sequence. Based on the discussion and the documentation, the experts learned that the study programmes follow the same overall setup when preparing for examinations. To follow up on students consistently, a monitoring and evaluation process is integrated into the sequence of each course at the beginning, the middle and the end. This applies to all study programmes. Practical courses, e.g., internships, are supervised by someone from the internship institutions and a senior staff member of UM. By doing so, UM ensures the academic approach during the internship.

In case of appeals, the student can follow a straightforward procedure (outlined on the faculty's homepage and communicated to students in the courses) that includes communication with the respective teachers as a first step and mediation by the study programme coordinator as a second step.

The current version of the education guide that has been provided to the experts' panel does not include a systematic approach to retaking examinations. The panel suggests implementing this at the university level to prevent UM (and consequently the study programmes) from potential legal disputes (**Finding 18**).

The QA instruments on the university level state that each head of the department discusses the examination methods for each course with the study programme team and the faculty's dean at the end of each semester for the upcoming one. Based on the discussion with the stakeholders, the experts believe that this procedure is adequate, especially since the programmes are already running for a certain time. However, and this reflects on the latest changes in the curricula (e.g., MBKM implementation or shifts towards more practical components), the experts believe that the validity and objectivity of the assessment methods for newer courses should be ensured so that changes concerning the teaching approach (from more theory-based to practical additions) consistently match with the (new) intended learning outcomes on the course level (**Finding 19**).

Given the character of the majority of study programmes in the cluster, the experts also believe that additional examination approaches towards a more reflective learning approach in the sense of an assessment for learning instead of an assessment of learning might be worth considering on the long run (**Finding 20**). However, the experts fully understand the national regulations. They do not want to replace graded examinations in the courses, but they consider an ungraded approach as a relevant component for the personal development of students.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

The study programme policies regarding the recruitment of new students refer to the UM Education Guidelines and the UM Rector Regulation regarding the admission of new students at Universitas Negeri Malang, which are published every academic year. UM describes three ways of admission. First, the national centrally organised National Selection of Universities Admission is based on the results of academic achievements and the portfolio of prospective students; second, the Selection of State Universities Admission, which is based on the results of a computer-based test; third, the Mandiri Selection is for undergraduate students who did not one of the selections mentioned before; admission can be granted for these applicants based on computer-based test scores as well as on a portfolio of achievements of the students.

Students have to have graduated from secondary education as a requirement for admission. Concerning the Sports Coaching Education Programme, a further requirement is a basic skills test to assess the essential ability to perform the sport the student is engaged in.

According to the SER, the programme's progression is monitored through the continuous guidance of an academic advisor appointed to each student who will meet with the student at least four times a semester. This monitoring process is carried out through offline and online services. Offline services are carried out at the campus, while online services are carried out through the UM Academic Information System, in addition to using the chat facility via WhatsApp. The success of a study programmes is to be indicated by the average GPA (0.00-4.00 possible).

The SER illustrates that all four study programmes carry out student exchange programmes with other universities in Indonesia. The students can consult with the academic advisor regarding the minimum credit that has to be taken by students as a condition for participating in a student exchange programme. One exchange programme mentioned in the SER is the "Indonesian Archipelago Student Exchange programme – Credit Transfer System with Information Technology (PERMATA-SAKTI)", which has been implemented in 2019. Following the SER, credits are recognised for this exchange programme and similar national programmes.

When successfully finishing their studies, the formal recognition of competencies or qualifications for graduates is carried out by granting a Bachelor of Education (S.Pd) degree and providing official documents in the form of certificates, transcripts and a Graduation Certificate Accompanying Letter that also states the achieved learning outcomes.

Experts' evaluation

Based on the discussions during the site visit and the documentation provided to the experts, it was clarified that the admission process for the study programmes in the cluster relies heavily on the national centralised admission procedure. The admission for study programmes at the Bachelor's level does not include a selection procedure in general but allows exceptions for international students. However, the admission regulations are published in the education guide and the rector's regulations. The enrolment of students follows three different enrolment schemes, as described above.

The monitoring system of students' study progress, especially undergraduate students, aligns with the quality assurance system at the faculty and study programme levels. It is to remarkable that each student has an

academic supervisor. There are very high satisfaction rates with this system from the students. The supervising lecturer must provide a report on the progress of each student every semester during at least three consultation meetings with his/her guidance students. Academic supervising lecturers also function as study advisors who help develop study plans and monitor the students' study progress. Lecturers are required to give reports to the administrative system (SIKAD).

UM has implemented recognition processes for students who get or have gained competencies outside UM. The so-called Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) has also been implemented within the Indonesian higher education system and thus also at UM. This programme allows students to take specific courses in other faculties or at other Indonesian universities. Besides, internships are recognised by the university, which allows students to strengthen their practical experience. International cooperation agreements have already been signed with universities abroad for some programmes. The recognition of courses taken by students abroad is facilitated, and the experts have provided evidence. These procedures are monitored by the faculty and at the university level. Recognition of competencies obtained from student exchanges with other universities is recognised with an equalisation and conversion system in the UM assessment system. This is evidence that the recognition system is running well.

Students receive accurate documentation following the government regulations outlining whether the students have followed an education or a non-educational programme. This is outlined in the certificate (SPd. for educational programmes or SS for non-educational programmes). In addition, students receive a Certificate of Companion Diploma (SKPI) or a Supplement Diploma, an official statement issued by a university containing information about the academic achievement or qualifications of a graduate with a higher education degree.

For the sports coaching education programme, an additional basic skill test should be added, if applicable. This test is based on traditional fitness measure which reflect health resources and less prerequisites for education programmes. One should think about if the basic fitness test is valid measure to select students for an education programme in the field of sport and physical education (**Finding 21**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

The SER states that all teaching staff of the programmes under review are employed full-time. The standard staff-to-student ratio in Indonesia for a Bachelor's programme is 1:60.

For the four programmes, there are:

- Seven lecturers, 13 assistant professors, 28 associate professors and two full professors for the Elementary School Teacher Education study programme; the lecturer-student ratio is reported as 1:29.

- Two lecturers, four assistant professors, six associate professors and one full professor for the Special Education study programme; the lecturer-student ratio is reported as 1:30.
- Six lecturers, three assistant professors, eight associate professors and three full professors for the Non-formal Education study programme; the lecturer-student ratio is reported as 1:21
- Five lecturers, ten assistant professors, four associate professors and one full professor for the Sports Coaching Education study programme; the lecturer-student ratio is reported as 1:23.

The SER also lists several international lecturers at the Faculty of Education. The total number of administrative staff in the FIP faculty is reported as 53.

Lecturer needs shall be determined by the faculty, also aiming at ensuring that the number of lecturers who will retire and the plan for recruiting new lecturers are considered according to the qualifications and needs of the programme.

UM states that recruitment selection and assignment procedures are based on national laws and regulations. Rector Regulations provide further specifications and serve as a reference for the faculty. The recruitment is carried out through the civil servant and non-civil-servant routes annually. Quality standards of prospective lecturers have to consider the minimum academic qualifications of Master's degree graduates with competencies in the field of expertise. Specifically, applicants must meet the requirements of graduates from an A-accredited higher education institution and have a certified English language proficiency, particularly for lecturers who have a certificate of expertise in the field of education.

According to the SER, the development of lecturers and education personnel is regulated by a Rector's Decree which includes

1. facilitating lecturers to carry out further study assignments either at home or abroad,
2. increasing the development of lecturers who have obtained teacher certificates in implementing the Three Pillars of Higher Education,
3. increasing national and international scientific publications,
4. increasing the ability of lecturers and education staff in the field of information communication technology (ICT),
5. increasing the development of educational personnel who have obtained certificates of expertise so they can be optimally utilized in supporting activities in their work environment.

Different training and workshops are said to be offered for staff development by different service centres, e.g., writing proposals or equipping lecturers with the development of learning models and innovations. At the programme level, young lecturers are supposed to be given the chance to teach together with senior lecturers or participate in national and international seminars and other opportunities for staff development.

Experts' evaluation

It was generally observed that the four programmes have an excellent student-teacher ratio. The discussion showed that the teaching staff is highly committed and motivated. The experts have understood that the national system is quite ambitious with the three pillars of education, but the teaching staff fulfils the demands to a reasonable degree.

The experts have learned that one of the significant strategy aims of UM is to internationalise at multiple layers. Although most of the discussions have been conducted in English, the experts believe that a strategic approach to enhancing the English competencies of staff (including academic language competencies) would be beneficial to put the teaching staff of the four programmes on solid ground (**Finding 22**).

Currently, UM's collaboration is mainly limited to the ASEAN region. This is logical, and the research output seems essential for the community in East Java, and beyond. Despite that, the experts believe that staff strategy should be fostered (**Finding 23**). This touches upon several points that might be important in further developing the programmes. The experts believe more collaborations with European universities or researchers would benefit the programmes (**Finding 23a**). Also, the experts believe that the university should strive to use staff exchange on an international level more strategically (**Finding 23b**). This might increase visibility and attract international staff with different perspectives on the disciplines.

On the national scale, it has been discussed that several research grants and incentives exist to publish research findings. From that perspective, it is an excellent way to support (especially younger) researchers to promote their findings to externals. Based on the discussion during the site visit, it might be beneficial for staff development if UM implements similar initiatives to further develop staff and research activities. This might include professional development of teaching staff to support them to increase publications in international journals and academic books (**Finding 24**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

Students are assigned an Academic Supervisor, whose role is to support students in planning each semester and advising on the choice of elective or transdisciplinary courses, as well as advising on study plans, study results or self-development, and other activities in academic and non-academic fields. Academic consultations should take place at least four times per semester. Several student organisations exist in the faculty, such as the Student Executive Board, the Department Student Association and the Student Council at Faculty Level, and student activity units, in which the students can participate. UM has a Counselling, Career and Academic Competence Development Centre, which provides counselling services, entrepreneurship assistance, soft skills training, and holds job fairs for students and alumni.

According to the SER, the Universal Design Learning (UDL) is implemented in the programmes under review to create an inclusive learning climate regarding student diversity. It is said that the student population consists of students from various regions in Indonesia, abroad, and students with disabilities. According to the SER, there are schemes for scholarships and tuition fee subsidies to provide the same learning opportunities.

The academic infrastructure at UM consists of classrooms, laboratories, workshops, studios, education centres, and computer labs, and in the SER an overview of specific facilities for the programmes under review are given. The Non-formal Education Study Programme, e.g., has lab sites to accommodate students' learning needs outside the campus. This is done through collaboration with villages where models of community-based activities are carried out. The Elementary Teacher Education Study Programme also has specific facilities such as laboratories, including a Model Class Laboratory, Microteaching Laboratory, etc.. The Special Education Study Programme has special facilities such as an Autism Laboratory, Pathophysiology Laboratory,

Microteaching Laboratory, etc. The Sports Coaching Education Programme has facilities such as a Physical Motor Laboratory, Performance Laboratory, etc. In addition, there are sports facilities, swimming pools, canteens, places of worship, gardens and gazebos, health clinics, and facilities for students with disabilities. The SER describes the availability of several online systems that are provided, e.g., for the learning and teaching process. 14 scientific nationally accredited journals for research publication are available at the two faculties.

The students also have access to the university's central library, including national and international journals. Each study programme also provides books, lecture modules, and other learning resources available in the Integrated Library Information System of UM Malang with 1,994 titles of reference units, 7,453 units of copies for the faculty of education, and 801 units of titles and 1,782 units of copies for faculties of sports sciences.

Experts' evaluation

Students have full access to the descriptions of the individual modules, including all information such as the learning outcomes, teaching and learning methods, forms of examination and the expected workload. The avoidance of overlapping courses and the basic requirements for completing the study programmes in the specified time is guaranteed by intensive support for the students (institutional and personal by academic advisor system and an excellent student-teacher ratio) before the start of their studies during the study process. The administrative support offered for students at the University of Negeri Malang is exceptionally well developed. Still, the expert group sees some requirements for providing more support and guidance concerning students' self-organisation and time management, especially for new students.

Any justified absences can be compensated by extending the examination period after consultation with the administration. The university provides its students with an extraordinary campus, suitable facilities, a sufficient number of computer workstations, and a campus-wide Wifi access to the internet. For the already appropriately equipped library with access to international online resources, the expert group recommends a frequent updating and extension process of the resources for special education. Students without technical equipment are provided with university equipment in times of crisis (e.g., Covid-19). To support students with financial issues, the university provides an extensive, multi-stage scholarship programme that draws on various funding sources and that is communicated through governmental and institutional channels.

The university maintains a very close relationship with its alumni, from which the students also benefit greatly, as they have the opportunity to learn about their experiences during and after their studies and thus consolidate their priorities in their studies. University Malang is also well connected to the labour market and associations, which, for example, helps to find good internships. The international activities of the university are sufficient overall. Nevertheless, the expert group would like to recommend expanding these activities in the future (further cooperation with international organisations and foreign universities), encouraging and supporting students to stay abroad. The group of experts also recommends more significant support and encouragement in obtaining foreign language skills by the students, especially in English (**see Finding 1**).

Concerning the accessibility of the campus for students with special needs, which is already well on the way, the group of experts would like to strongly recommend that the participation of these students should not be restricted to unique rooms but that they be fully integrated into the learning process. This also applies to digital inclusion, thus unrestricted access to all of the university's offerings, like learning material.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

According to the SER, the media used for the information of the public and stakeholders are websites and social media such as Facebook, Instagram, WhatsApp, and YouTube. General information, such as admission procedures for new students and general services, is provided by the university via related institutions. Specific study programme information is supposed to be available on each programme's website and via social media such as information on the curriculum, academic and student affairs.

Experts' evaluation

The richness of information is remarkable – on the internet, everything can be found in Indonesian about the university, either in pdf or word format or as a video on several social media such as Facebook, LinkedIn, Instagram, WhatsApp, Twitter, and YouTube. The large amount of information in various styles –like a legal text, a friendly statement, an invitation – on enrolment at the university, courses, degrees, contact and other useful information is adequate. Most of the information is in Indonesian, especially the videos with interviews. A series of videos shows the awarding of graduation diplomas but also life on campus, socialising, and leisure activities.

Information on formal content such as enrolment, study programmes, assessment, degrees, postgraduate studies, and similar is also available in English, as are some of the videos.

Studying some of the students' experience reports confirms the positive image of the university. Negative comments could not be found; experience reports are usually in Indonesian and could only be read in part.

In the discussions with the university, it became clear that there are good contacts with different schools, family education centres and a few NGOs, which proof that the university is opening up to the outside world and considers contacts with non-university institutions and organisations important in terms of jobs for its students. A recommendation may be made, namely, to establish contacts with some of the many, mainly ecological NGOs, where the graduates of non-formal education can be of great use.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “**Non-Formal Education**” (Bachelor of Education offered by Universitas Negeri Malang with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “**Special Education**” (Bachelor of Education offered by Universitas Negeri Malang with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “**Elementary School Teacher Education**” (Bachelor of Education offered by Universitas Negeri Malang with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “**Sport Coaching Education**” (Bachelor of Education offered by Universitas Negeri Malang with conditions.

Findings:

1. The faculties should consider implementing more English course options into the curricula to foster students' language competencies.
2. The focus on applied theory courses should be fostered in the Bachelor's programme “Non-Formal Education”.
3. The three aspects of non-formal education (community empowerment, training, and family education) should not be taught separately but developed towards a curriculum of “Non-Formal Education” that reflects the discipline at the beginning. Then, more specific courses for the three directions should build on this overview course.
4. It should be discussed if the course in “Ethnology” in the “Non-Formal Education” curriculum can be removed.
5. The “Non-Formal Education” department should strive to combine social work competencies with adult education theory knowledge to foster this graduates' path.
6. The “Non-Formal Education” department should create synergies with other departments of the Faculty of Education, e.g., the department for “Special Education”.
7. The curriculum for “Special Education” should provide opportunities for students to focus more on the educational aspects of the discipline.
8. Adjustments in the curriculum “Special Education” should be made to provide a stronger curriculum. These adjustments should cover the following points:
 - a. Being valuable to all students, the course “Assisted Technology” should be made compulsory.
 - b. In order to raise analysis competencies in research of students, the statistics content should be separated from the research course and placed at an earlier stage of the curriculum.
9. The curriculum should ensure that the contribution percentage of the “Special Education” programme's intended learning outcomes three and four are raised within the curriculum.
10. Content concerning children with special needs has to get a stronger focus in the “Elementary School Teacher Education” curriculum.
11. The graduation profile of the Bachelor's programme “Sports Coaching Education” has to reflect alternative career paths of graduates. Adjustments to the curriculum must be made, if necessary.

12. More opportunities should be given to those students in “Sports Coaching Education” who pursue different career paths than becoming teachers.
13. The “Sports Coaching Education” curriculum should also emphasise sports science components instead of focusing primarily on sports.
14. New sports developments should be integrated as elective courses in the broad field of sport, exercise, human movement and physical activities into the “Sports Coach Education” curriculum to enrich the portfolio.
15. The Faculty of Education must develop a standardised procedure to process collected data from stakeholders.
16. A deeper analysis of why the study duration extends could be integrated into the quality assurance instruments.
17. The department for “Special Education” is encouraged to further develop the teaching material used in the courses.
18. The panel of experts suggests implementing the re-sit option for exams in the educational guide.
19. It should be ensured that changes in the examination methods are adequately chosen to assess the intended learning outcomes on the course level.
20. It is suggested to implement more reflective learning approaches.
21. The basic fitness test for the admission should be revised to assess valid indicators for study programmes in the field sport and physical education.
22. The Faculty of Education should systematically implement a strategy to enhance staff’s English competencies.
23. The Faculty of Education should further develop its internationalisation strategy considering:
 - a. more collaborations with European universities or researchers;
 - b. an expansion of international staff mobility within the MBKM umbrella, or alike.
24. The support for teaching staff publishing in international journals should be fostered, e.g., by providing more time to carry out research or providing more grant options for staff.