



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA (INDONESIA)

CLUSTER ECONOMICS II

MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)

MANAGEMENT (MASTER OF MANAGEMENT)

MANAGEMENT (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS MALANG)

MANAGEMENT (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS JAKARTA)

ENTREPRENEURSHIP (BACHELOR OF BUSINESS)

February 2023



Content

Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	3
I. Preamble	6
II. Accreditation procedure	6
1. Criteria.....	6
2. Approach and methodology	6
III. General information on the university	8
IV. Assessment of the study programmes	8
1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme	8
2.1 General information	9
2.2 Management (Bachelor of Management)	9
2.3 Management (Master of Management).....	10
2.4 Management (Doctor of Management)	11
2.5 Entrepreneurship (Bachelor of Business)	13
2. Procedures for quality assurance.....	14
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students.....	16
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification	17
5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff.....	21
6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment	22
7. Information / Public information.....	24
V. Findings	26

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)
 - “MANAGEMENT” (MASTER OF MANAGEMENT)
 - “MANAGEMENT” (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS MALANG)
 - “MANAGEMENT” (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS JAKARTA)
 - “ENTREPRENEURSHIP” (BACHELOR OF BUSINESS)
- OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA (INDONESIA)

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 16th meeting on 27 February 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Management**” (**Bachelor of Management**), “**Management**” (**Master of Management**), “**Management**” (**Doctor of Management**) (Campus Malang), “**Management**” (**Doctor of Management**) (Campus Jakarta), and “**Entrepreneurship**” (**Bachelor of Business**) offered by **Universitas Brawijaya (Indonesia)** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

The study programmes comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version.

2. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 March 2029**.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

1. A clearer differentiation in the graduation’s profile referring to key entrepreneurial skills would allow prospective students a better differentiation between the bachelor’s programme “Management” and the bachelor’s programme “Entrepreneurship”.
2. The bachelor’s programme “Management” could strengthen the curriculum’s interdisciplinarity with computer science related courses coming from other faculties.
3. The bachelor’s programme “Management” could consider including aspects of sustainability of management into the curriculum.
4. The master’s programme “Management” should focus more on the foundation of digital literacy, including computational methods and social science, within the curriculum.
5. The PhD programme “Management” could integrate advanced and specific aspects on digital literacy.
6. Being a valuable asset for the programme, the PhD programme “Management” could include creational skills in computational methods into the curriculum.

7. The bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship" should reflect on the influence of social and sustainable entrepreneurship on the entrepreneurial journey.
8. To foster possible international careers of PhD graduates, it might be wise to consider that teaching experience of PhD students is crucial on an international level.
9. To enable externals an easy overview on the programmes, it might be wise to provide a reduced documentation including the essential components to reflect the core identity of the programmes fully to the public.
10. It might be wise to include more activities in English on social media to attract an international public.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)
- “MANAGEMENT” (MASTER OF MANAGEMENT)
- “MANAGEMENT” (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS MALANG)
- “MANAGEMENT” (DOCTOR OF MANAGEMENT) (CAMPUS JAKARTA)
- “ENTREPRENEURSHIP” (BACHELOR OF BUSINESS)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA (INDONESIA)

Visit to the university: 16 – 18 January 2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Barbara Darimont

Ludwigshafen University of Business and Society (Germany), Department of Marketing and Human Resource Management

Prof. Dr. Britta Gossel

Eberswalde University for Sustainable Development (Germany), Faculty of Sustainable Business

Carsten Schiffer

Student of RWTH Aachen University (Germany) (student expert)

Coordinators:

Patrick Heinzer & Annette Büning

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor's programmes "Management" (Bachelor of Management), "Entrepreneurship" (Bachelor of Business), the Master's programme "Management" (Master of Management) and the PhD programme "Management" (Doctor of Management) offered by Universitas Brawijaya (Indonesia).

1. Criteria

The programmes are assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master), and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD), respectively. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in August 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In December 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix as well as, in case of a reaccreditation, statistical data on the programmes. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,

- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 21 February 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in November 2023.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in November. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on date. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives. The labour market representative who was appointed for this procedure fell ill on short notice, AQAS and the university agreed to move on in the procedure. Consequently, the panel consisted of three members.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 27 February 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In March 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Brawijaya (UB) is a state university and was established in 1963 and is located in Malang City, Indonesia. UB is composed of 15 faculties and one postgraduate school. In total the university offers 177 study programmes (which have all been accredited by National Accreditation Agency for HE) to about 72.722 students (October 2021). The implementation of Three Pillars of Higher Education (HE) is supported by 198 professors, 349 associate professors, 576 assistant professors, 752 lecturers, and 423 teaching staff.

Institutionally, UB has been nationally accredited A by the BAN-PT and has implemented the quality assurance program that has been recognized by ISO 9001:2008. 33 study programmes have been accredited and certified internationally. According to UB, the strategic plan of 2020-2024 focuses on the improvement of the quality of education, research and community service, students and graduates, and institutions and cooperation to become a global competitive university.

The Faculty of Economics and Business (FEB UB) offers 14 study programmes in three departments which have received recognition both on a national and international scale through accreditation such as National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN-PT) and The Alliance on Business Education and Scholarship for Tomorrow, a 21st Century Organization (ABEST21).

The vision of the faculty and the Department of Management is to become an internationally reputable higher education institution in economics and business which (1) produces graduates possessing entrepreneurial spirit, humanity, environment, and spirituality awareness, (2) develops knowledge and technology in order to serve society through education and research based on local and universal values. Furthermore, the faculty aims at becoming a centre of education in management and business of international repute that prioritises ethics, entrepreneurial spirit, leadership, sustainability and is able to play an active role in nation building to the needs of community.

The faculty is led by a Dean assisted by three Vice Deans (Vice Dean for Academic Affairs, Vice Dean for General Administrative and Financial Affairs, Vice Dean for Students Affairs). Each department is led by the Head of Department; a study programme by the Head of Study Programme. Furthermore, the faculty has several boards to support the implementation of the three pillars of higher education (tri dharma, i.e. education, research, and community service), including a Board of Research and Community Service Deliberation (BP3M), a Systems and Public Relations Centre, a Journal Publishing Board, as well as a Quality Assurance Board and Quality Assurance Unit at the departmental level.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Doctoral degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

2.1 General information

All study programmes of the Management Department are said to determine graduate learning outcomes based on market needs analysis. The intended learning outcomes (ILOs) address 1) knowledge aspects, 2) aspects of special skills, 3) attitude aspects, and 4) aspects of general skills. Following the Tri Dharma approach to higher education, the curricula include regular classes, community service, and research activities. All curricular elements are assigned Indonesian credit units (SKS).

As stated in the SER, the Bachelor programmes are offered as regular and international programmes taught in Indonesian and English, respectively. Students in the international programmes can also participate in an Overseas Academic Programme (OAP), divided into four programmes: Double Degree, Internship, Exchange, and Summer School. The Bachelor programmes consist of general compulsory courses in the area of religion, citizenship, and Pancasila; compulsory university courses, including the final project, community service, English, and entrepreneurship; compulsory faculty courses, including introductions to accounting, law, and economics amongst others, and subject-specific compulsory and elective courses.

The Master's and PhD programmes are offered full-time (regular 1), weekend-class (regular 2), and international tracks.

2.2 Management (Bachelor of Management)

Description

PSSM has three visions: 1) organizing undergraduate management education that is ethical, entrepreneurial, and competitive, 2) enrichment of knowledge management through innovative research 3) contributing to the environment through community service. PSSM aims to produce graduate management graduates who work as professional workers in the field of management and entrepreneurship with the following competencies:

1. Mastering managerial concepts and skills and being able to apply them to the field of work by upholding ethics and integrity
2. Have a strong will to develop both in their studies and professionally in the face of the dynamics of the global environment
3. Demonstrates a leadership and entrepreneurial spirit that is oriented towards sustainability

Furthermore, the programme has specified 11 additional intended learning outcomes according to the specifics of the field of study.

The curriculum is taken for eight semesters with a total of 144-157 credits, of which 121 credits are to be obtained in compulsory courses and at least 23 in elective courses. In semesters 1 and 2, general introductory courses are given for mastery of the ILO in general attitudes and skills. Starting from semesters 3 to 6, courses are given to master the ILO aspects of special knowledge and skills, which include compulsory faculty courses, compulsory study programmes, compulsory interest courses, and elective courses. Subject-specific compulsory courses include taxation, business communication, management information systems, and business

research methodology. From the fifth semester onwards, students can choose marketing management, financial management, human resources management, operational management, and or strategy management as one of their concentrations. In semester seven, students conduct community service as an effort to train students' abilities to carry out field practice as an effort to implement concepts obtained during learning and obtain four additional credits in the category internship/field work practice. In the 8th semester, students compile academic works, which is the thesis as a graduation requirement.

Experts' evaluation

The curriculum for the Bachelor of Management meets the standards and is state-of-the-art. Within the framework of the national requirements, knowledge of the theories is the primary learning content in the Bachelor's degree. The academic degree corresponds to the learning outcomes and the requirements of the appropriate level of the European and Indonesian qualifications framework. This is demonstrated in the curriculum and with the completion of the programme by a final thesis. However, the curriculum is very detailed, which is uncommon in Germany but corresponds to the expectations of students and the labour market in Indonesia. A more precise differentiation in the graduation's profile on the term "becoming an entrepreneur" would allow prospective students a better differentiation between the Bachelor's programme "Management" and the Bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship" (**Finding 1**).

The intended qualifications are presented as intended learning outcomes (ILOs) and include both subject-specific and interdisciplinary elements. Nevertheless, due to international developments, further interdisciplinary modules would be desirable, such as compulsory courses in python and workshops with computer scientists (**Finding 2**). The Bachelor's programme "Management" could consider including more aspects of sustainability of management into the curriculum. Sustainability, in this sense, is broad and does not only refer to environmental sustainability (**Finding 3**).

Despite these minor points, the experts' panel testifies that the Bachelor's programme includes essential discipline-specific components in the curriculum and creates a solid foundation on the Bachelor's level with meaningful outcomes. The appropriateness of the learning content is proven through student evaluations. Feedback is also obtained from labour market representatives and incorporated into the curricula. Consequently, the programme is well-established and has a high reputation in Indonesia.

The workload, the exams and the distribution of the workload are adequate. The quiz format in the semester is adequate to test knowledge and the possibility to accompany the students' learning process.

From an external perspective, the curriculum documentation is complex and sometimes difficult to understand (**see Finding 9**). However, with more insights and based on the site visit, it became clear that all relevant information was available.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2.3 Management (Master of Management)

Description

According to the SER, the programme is to become a Master with an international reputation that puts forward ethics, entrepreneurial spirit, leadership, and research-based knowledge development. The programme learning outcomes comprise four aspects, which are 1) attitude competence, 2) knowledge competence, 3) special skills competence and 4) general skills; each aspect consists of specially defined learning outcomes.

The study load of the programme is 51 credits, with the distribution of study load according to subject groups as follows: (1) Program Compulsory (24 credits: Application of Economic Theory in the fields of Management; Strategic Management; Strategic HR Management; Strategic Financial Management; Strategic Marketing Management; Strategic Operations Management; Entrepreneurship and Business Ethics), (2) Compulsory Interest/Concentration (9 credits: Marketing Management; Financial Management; Human Resource Management; Strategic Management; Operational Management), (3) Elective Courses (3 credits: Leadership; Cross Cultural Management; Business Experience; Management Accounting; Decision Making Techniques in Management; Risk Management; Social and Public Entrepreneurship), Thesis (15 credits).

Scientific publication is a requirement for the final thesis examination by showing at least one national or international journal or proceedings at least a letter of acceptance, according to the applicable regulations of the UB chancellor. An internship is not planned, but the programme offers Business Experience courses to connect students with actual business activities according to academic abilities.

Experts' evaluation

Similar to the Bachelor's programme, the curriculum for the Master's programme "Management" meets the latest standards and is well structured. Based on the knowledge, skills and competencies in the Bachelor's programme, the programme applies the learned theories. There is a clear reflection in the curriculum on this matter. Consequently, there is a clear distinction concerning the level between the programmes. The transition from the Bachelor's curriculum to the more advanced Master's curriculum is fully achieved. Nevertheless, it would be advisable to include courses to learn digital literacy in the curriculum, such as a course in computational methods in social sciences, in which statistical methods are taught and, for example, how to deal with big data and network analysis. It should be noted that the university has excellent facilities in this field, which should be used, like the Big Data laboratory (**Finding 4**).

In contrast to the PhD programme (see below), the Master's programme focuses on analysis and the promotion of innovation, which is fitting, as confirmed by the discussions with representatives of the labour market and students. The proportion of Master's students who want to go into teaching is relatively low. Given the detailed assessment of the Master's programme, its curriculum structure, and the course structure, the panel of experts concluded that the academic degree corresponds to the learning outcomes and requirements of the appropriate level of European and Indonesian qualifications framework.

The university would like to promote internationalisation. For this reason, it can only be recommended to continue striving for international cooperation and constantly review the curriculum from this perspective. A positive aspect is a possibility of completing a double degree programme with the National University of Taiwan.

About the documentation of information, the same applies to the Bachelor's degree programme; a better overview would make it easier to find the relevant information. If someone is already studying at Universitas Brawijaya, the flow of information is ensured by the supervisor to whom each student is assigned (**see Finding 9**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2.4 Management (Doctor of Management)

Description

PSDIM has three missions: 1) Organise international standard doctoral education in Management Science based on research, entrepreneurship, and ethics 2) Develop science and technology in the management field

through research with local and universal values 3) contribute to the community through community service activities.

UB describes the goal to become a programme with an international reputation, entrepreneurial spirit, and ethics and to play an active role in the development of science. To fulfil this goal, the learning outcomes for the programme are as follows: 1) graduates can solve business problems and create business strategies that have an impact on improving the economy and quality of life in a sustainable manner, 2) graduates are always willing and able to continue to learn both independently and continuously as well as having good self-confidence and always upholding ethics in meeting professional, and life changes, and (3) graduates actively participate in research and development of science in the field of management. The profile of PSDIM graduates is to become a manager at the top level, a lecturer, a principal investigator, a consultant, or an entrepreneur.

In order to graduate, PSDIM requires students to have at least two articles published in reputable journals or an article published in a reputable international journal and on proceedings indexed on Scopus. On average, candidates will gain their PhD in three to seven years, with one PhD dissertation project. Doctoral candidates also have two internal colloquia to exchange opinions and experiences with other PhD candidates and supervisors regarding their research. Doctoral candidates can join international conferences held incidentally by University, Faculty or School (Department).

The curriculum exists of four basic compulsory courses, which are cross-disciplinary. In the first semester, PhD candidates take basic compulsory courses consisting of four: Philosophy of Science and History of Management Thought, Quantitative and Qualitative Methods, Flexibility Management and Advanced Management Theory and Entrepreneurship, with a total weight of 12 credits. In the second semester, they take four concentration courses according to their fields: marketing, human resources, finance, operations, and strategic, with a total weight of twelve credits. In the third semester, students start the dissertation process with a total weight of 28 credits. All courses are compulsory and exclusively offered to students of the PhD programme. However, students may also choose other management science courses offered at the university that are suitable for their career development.

The Department holds an international cooperation agreement with Yuan Tze University Taiwan for a joint degree programme with PSDIM. The students can take two courses at the other university, and the credits can be equivalent to the credits from the home university.

The documentation indicates that the PhD programme is offered at Malang's main campus but also at a newer campus in Jakarta.

Experts' evaluation

As in the Bachelor's and Master's programmes in management, the curriculum meets new standards and is well structured. A clear distinction between the Bachelor's and Master's programmes is reflected in the curriculum and visible in the composition of modules. A clear research-oriented focus is given by general skills of developing theory and conducting research. The differentiation between Bachelor's, Master's and PhD programmes is well done. Nevertheless, it would be advisable to include courses in digital literacy for research praxis in the curriculum, such as a course in advanced creational skills in computational methods in social sciences or, for example, how to deal with big data and network analysis (**Finding 5**). Universities facilities like the Big Data laboratory should be implemented for research purposes. To enhance creational skills, cooperation with computer science research partners would support this process (**Finding 6**).

The academic degree corresponds to the learning outcomes and requirements of the appropriate level of the European and the Indonesian qualifications framework. In contrast to the Master's programme, the doctorate programme focuses on theory development and research skills, which is fitting, as confirmed by the discussions with representatives of the labour market and students. The evidence provided to the experts showed

that intended learning outcomes on the programme level and course level match with alumni's skills, competencies, and knowledge.

The university would like to promote internationalisation. For this reason, it can only be recommended to continue to strive for international cooperation and to constantly review the curriculum from this perspective, in addition to the doctorate programme.

Concerning the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, it became evident that the PhD programme can offer the same quality at the campus in Malang and the campus in Jakarta.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2.5 Entrepreneurship (Bachelor of Business)

Description

As explained in the self-evaluation report, PSKWU has three missions:

1. Organising entrepreneurship education to produce graduates who have entrepreneurial scientific competencies that are ethical, creative, innovative, and competitive
2. Developing business ideas through innovative research
3. Contributing to society through solution business ideas

The study programme intends to shape profiles of the alumnus as young entrepreneurs, early career consultants, research assistants in the field of entrepreneurship, and entry-level managers.

The curriculum is designed according to three PEOs

1. mastering entrepreneurial knowledge and the ability to apply it in business management,
2. contributing to the environment in the field of entrepreneurship in a creative, innovative, and proactive fashion, and
3. having a commitment to self-development through continuous education.

Furthermore, the programme has specified nine additional intended learning outcomes according to the specifics of the field of study.

Study programme compulsory courses are taken in the first five semesters and include business creativity, entrepreneurship accounting, digital business, design thinking lab, social entrepreneurship, and international entrepreneurship, among others. After obtaining at least 105 credits in compulsory courses, students can choose 13 elective courses in risk management, digital leadership, e-commerce, or product development management. Furthermore, the programme offers seven cross-subject elective courses that address tourism communication, public relations, and law. Students are also encouraged to enrol for the MBKM programme, which allows them to attend elective courses outside the leading institution, inter-study programmes, faculties, and universities across Indonesia. Students conduct community service in semesters 4 and 5, while the last semester is dedicated to the final thesis.

Experts' evaluation

The Bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship" curriculum meets not only the standards but is state-of-the-art. It shows, in addition, an innovative curriculum that supports the idea of a life-long entrepreneurial education. Within the framework of the national requirements, this curriculum meets both the knowledge of the theories

and project-based entrepreneurial learning in the Bachelor's degree. The academic degree corresponds to the learning outcomes and the requirements of the appropriate level of the European and German qualifications framework. This is demonstrated in the curriculum and with the completion of the programme by a final thesis. In addition, students' entrepreneurial learning is supported by the work on one entrepreneurial project idea in a series of courses, concluding with a real-life entrepreneurial experience of having the business projects in real-life activities. The curriculum is very detailed, which corresponds to the expectations of students and the labour market in Indonesia. A more precise differentiation in the graduation's profiles compared to the Bachelor's programme "Management" would allow prospective students a better differentiation between both programmes (see Finding 1).

The intended qualifications are presented as intended learning outcomes and include both subject-specific and interdisciplinary elements. Nevertheless, due to international developments, further modules would be desirable relating to sustainability issues. Sustainability, in this sense, is broad and does not only refer to environmental sustainability. Since "social entrepreneur" is described as one graduate profile, further modules related to social entrepreneurship (e.g., capturing the issues of social innovation or social impact measurement) would be of relevance (Finding 7).

The appropriateness of the learning content is proven through student evaluations. Feedback is also obtained from labour market representatives and incorporated into the curricula. The workload, the exams and the distribution of the workload are adequate. The quiz format in the semester is adequate to test knowledge and the possibility to accompany the students' learning process.

The documentation of the curriculum is complex. For example, the series of modules K1-K6 as providing a whole project-based entrepreneurial learning journey needs to be clarified. More clarity, for example, through overview images in the handbook and website, would be helpful here. However, all relevant information is available.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Doctoral degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

According to the SER, the developed quality policy plays an essential role in carrying out the education mandate. UB has prepared a Strategic Plan (2020-2024), which aligns with the university's policy on quality standards. In order to guarantee the standardised academic quality, UB has developed an integrated quality assurance system for all levels, which is the Quality Assurance Center (PJM) at the university level, the Quality Assurance Group (GJM) at the faculty level and the Quality Assurance Unit (UJM) at the department level, which monitors the quality assurance process by a Head of Quality Assurance Unit. The Quality Manual at FEB UB is prepared as a guide for implementing a quality assurance system in higher education management.

The Quality Assurance Unit of the Management Department carries out a monitoring and evaluation mechanism on the performance of the lecturers in the fields of Education, Research and Community Service. The results are presented to each lecturer in a performance summary compiled every semester and reported to the Head of the Management Department. The monitoring and evaluation system for the teaching performance of lecturers uses the Lecturer Evaluation by Students (EDoM) instrument, which students in all study programmes in each semester fill out. In addition, faculty management is said to conduct regular meetings with stakeholders such as students, teaching staff, and alumni to further address, maintain, and improve performance and academic and non-academic quality.

Updating and evaluating the curriculum (handbooks, modules, teaching materials) is said to be carried out regularly each semester. The Department regularly conducts standardised tracer studies activities to pay attention to the needs of the labour market. Data is said to be collected on student progression and success rates, employability of graduates, alumni job status, alumni collaboration of work and study programme, student satisfaction, teacher effectiveness, the profile of the student population, the availability and status of learning resources, and the institution's compliance with its key performance indicators.

Experts' evaluation

The university has developed a quality assurance concept to which all study programmes are equally subject. In regular surveys, students can comment on the quality of the courses, the study programme, and the workload. In addition, professors regularly seek personal dialogue with students. In addition, the "hard facts" of the study programme are observed. By observing the study behaviour of the students and keeping an eye on the relevant key figures, the university has a good overview of the strengths and weaknesses in the organisation of the study programme. These identified weaknesses can be remedied through discussion in the university's committees.

This monitoring also takes place in the PhD area. PhD students are treated the same way as students in Bachelor's and Master's programmes and take part in module courses mapped in the curriculum and integrated into campus management.

The doctorate programme is a programme in which further qualification as a scientist takes place in addition to an in-depth study of the subject. The second examiner principle and the PhD committee ensure the scientific quality.

The positions of companies and other universities are included in the further development of the curriculum. This applies not only to the further development of the curriculum on the content-related level but also to the

study environment. The university thus fulfils all criteria of academic probity. The evidence showed that the PDCA cycle is closed and the all relevant stakeholders are informed about results and QA activities.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Doctoral degree

The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

The learning methods mentioned for all programmes include direct instruction, case-based learning, problem-based learning, small group discussions, project-based learning, research-based learning, and collaborative learning. The application and weighting of the individual methods are said to be adjusted according to the individual level of each study programme so that, e.g. the Master's and Doctoral programmes can put a stronger focus on research-based learning. Learning activities are said to take place both offline and online. Student diversity is considered because both PSM and PSDIM are offered as full-time and part-time programmes to accommodate students who already hold positions in the labour market. Also, the report emphasises that all programmes apply a student-centred approach to teaching and learning, allowing students to develop creatively according to their capacities, needs, and interests.

The type of exam is considered on the learning objectives in each course, which is communicated to the students at the beginning of the semester. The percentage of attendance obligations in one semester is 80 %. Students who cannot attend are required to provide a certificate informing the reason for the absence.

In the Bachelor programmes, the proportion of a course assessment activity is determined according to the balance of the activity material with the course material in one semester. Therefore, the final score of a course consists of the grades of participation/contribution in class, quizzes, structured assignments, midterm exams, and final semester exams. In PSSM and PSKWU, the weights for participation are 15%, with 15% for quizzes, 20% for structured assignments, and 25% for midterm and final exams, respectively. Assessment in the Master's programme includes participation (20%) and two tasks (40% each) to be defined in the semester learning plan, which is disseminated to the students in the first week of the semester. The final thesis of Master's students includes three stages, i.e. the attendance of a proposal seminar, the presentation of results in a research results seminar, and the final dissertation exam.

Doctoral students pass nine stages of the dissertation exam, which include: two qualification stages in which ideas and problems are collected and refined; the dissertation proposal examination. The field commission, which aims at preparing the student to conduct their research; the commission of the results, in which the dissertation draft is refined; the research results seminar, in which the feasibility of the dissertation draft is assessed; the dissertation eligibility test, the final dissertation exam, and the endorsement/judicial in which the manuscript is approved as the final version. All PhD students must publish scientific papers in international journals and/or procedures as first authors.

Regulations for mitigating circumstances such as illness are said to be in place. Complaints procedures are first handled informally, i.e. the student discusses the issue with the lecturer/ academic decision-maker. If the dispute cannot be solved, the student can file a written complaint to the respective Head of the Study Programme. Also, student associations are said to be involved in complaint hearings to ensure that the student perspective is taken into account appropriately.

Experts' evaluation

Overall, the curricula show learning methods in a wide variety that supports students' learning journey appropriately. It is visible that teaching-learning methods are adapted to the respective educational level, so the Master's and PhD programmes implement a stronger focus on research-based learning. For example, the Bachelor's programme in Entrepreneurship incorporates praxis- and project-based learning methods. It was shown that offline and online learning takes place in both modes. In addition, digital learning environments support the learning process. Student-centred approaches to teaching and learning became visible during discussions. Types of exams are announced on the learning objectives in each course, which are communicated to the students at the beginning of the semester.

In the Bachelor's and Master's programmes, the proportion of a course assessment activity is appropriate and according to international standards. Developing a course's final score based on several parts (participation, quizzes, midterm exams, final exams) meets the idea of processual learning. The weight of those elements is appropriate. Elements of praxis- and project-based learning formats as implemented in the Bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship" meet the current state-of-the-art in entrepreneurship education.

The research-based teaching-learning approach in the PhD programme meets international standards and is State-of-the-Art. Supporting the learning journey through a nine stages programme meets the requirements of an international doctorate programme. Gaining praxis experience in research is provided by the requirement to publish scientific papers in international scientific journals and/or procedures as first authors.

The experts want to point out that teaching experience is crucial on an international level when it comes to staying on the academic path. The discussion showed that the first initial steps had been done to equip PhD students with teaching experience. Nonetheless, the panel believes this should be fostered given the importance of possible international careers of PhD graduates (**Finding 8**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Doctoral degree

The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Admission

The Bachelor's programmes admit both national and international students. The formal requirements for UB Admission include the following:

1. Holding Indonesian nationality
2. Graduated from Senior High School no more than three years before the current academic year
3. Registered and completed UTBK Selection Test or have good academic performance in high school

The acceptance of students to PSSM and PSKWU by the admissions policy is focused on screening prospective students by considering: (i) students' academic abilities or potential, (ii) regional equity, (iii) equality principles, and (iv) good academic potential with financial support underprivileged or people with disabilities. Acceptance of undergraduate programmes (PSSM and PSKWU) involves several entrance exams: SNMPTN and SBMPTN, which are Joint Selections for State Higher Education organized by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. Furthermore, the university also can accept students in a university-specific third admission track.

Postgraduate students have to fulfil requirements such as

1. holding an Indonesian Nationality Identity Card,
2. having good academic records in the previous programme (Undergraduate/Master's) proved by legalized certificates and a transcript of previous degrees,
3. having academic publication (if available),
4. demonstrating good potential academic capability (TPA) as proved by the result with the minimum score of 450 for the Master's programme and 500 for the PhD Programme,
5. demonstrating good English capability with a minimum TOEFL score of 500 for the Master's programme and 525 for the PhD Programme,
6. a health certificate, including a drug-free certificate,
7. a funding statement, and
8. Recommendations from two people with relevant academic backgrounds.

Admission of international students for undergraduate and postgraduate studies depends on the fulfilment of the following formal requirements:

1. They must meet academic and language requirements and commit to complying with specific regulations of the Indonesian government related to education policy.

2. They should demonstrate English language proficiency with a minimum TOEFL (ITP) score of 500 or an IELTS overall score of 5.5 (international programmes in English) or a minimum of Indonesian language proficiency (regular programmes in Indonesian).
3. They must have good academic performance in previous degree programmes.
4. Applicants to a Doctoral Programme holding an international publication (journal) are preferred.

The Fast Track programme is an educational programme organized by UB to facilitate students who excel in academic English, have high motivation, and can complete their study period in undergraduate and Master's programmes in a maximum of 10 semesters.

Recognition

UB states that students are encouraged to enhance their knowledge and experience through mobility and credit transfer programmes. All study programmes confirm their commitment as an international institution that strives for quality improvement on the international level conducted through curriculum benchmarking, exchange programmes, and visiting professor programmes. Corporations with overseas universities exist.

Also, the university follows the national MBKM programme (Freedom to learn) that provides opportunities for selected students to hone their abilities according to their talents and interests by going directly into the professional world as preparation for a future career. Activities conducted in this programme can be converted to equal 20 credits. All selected undergraduate students can participate in this programme with the approval of their respective universities.

Progression

The study programmes assign lecturers as Academic Advisors who support students from the first semester onward in their academic development. Furthermore, students' progression is monitored and evaluated via study plan consultation each semester, the academic information system (SIKAD), and the Online Reporting System (SIMPEL). The heads of the study programme conduct evaluation studies at least once a semester.

Certification

UB provides three official final documents to be handed out to students to certify their graduation: diploma, final transcript, and SKPI/diploma supplement.

Experts' evaluation

Admission

The panel of experts have analysed the formal requisites to enter the programmes. While on the Bachelor's level, prospective students on a very centralised national admission scheme (although there is, in general, a three-way admission path), the Master's and the PhD programmes have more specific admission requirements, which are outlined in the academic.

The requirements for the Master's programme include copies of the undergraduate degree, information on the minimum GPA requirement, the academic potential test (APT), and the TOEFL English test results. Furthermore, the requirements outline that students applying for the Master's programme must submit two recommendation letters and a CV. The PhD programme requires higher results on the stated tests (GPA, APT and TOEFL), evidence of the Master's degree, and a record of publications. The panel of experts testify that the higher education institution presents applicable admission requirements that ensure fair and objectively verifiable access to the study programme. The admission information is available on the faculty's homepage.

The self-evaluation report also provides information on admission data from previous years. While the data for the Master's and the PhD programmes only focuses on the number of admitted students, the Bachelor's programmes differentiate between the different admission paths.

Progression

The discussions with the stakeholders showed that the Faculty of Economics and Business has access to the ample instruments and IT systems of Universitas Brawijaya. During the site visit, evidence was displayed that students and academic advisors have access to the so-called student academic system (*Sistem informasi akademik mahasiswa* (Siam UB)) and the online reporting system (*Sistem Informasi Pelaporan* (Simpel)). The students have confirmed that the system tracks the academic results of any examination in the courses, including mid-term and final-term examinations. Via that system, students also have the chance to contact their academic advisors directly. Vice versa, academic advisors may contact students in case of lousy examination results that might endanger the foreseen academic progression of students. The experts confirm that this system is an effective tool for monitoring academic progression effectively. The tight connection between students and academic advisors indicates that UB cares for their students.

Recognition

As described above, students have good access to the documentation via the two systems (Siam UB and Simpel). These systems also serve as recognition system tools. The experts have learned that systematic student mobility is a relatively new implemented tool (with the MBKM programme implemented in the academic year 2020-2021). The MBKM programme allows students to replace 20 credits in their curricula. The self-evaluation report outlines that the faculty has evaluated the relevant curricula to detect which components can be replaced by courses/activities from other higher education institutions (Indonesian or international) or internships. The discussion showed that the recognition technicalities are based on the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) documents published on the faculty's homepage. These documents include information on the registration for the MBKM programme, the internal data collection of MBKM activities by students, and the registration process for inbound students. Although the instruments and mechanisms are clearly described and published, the university has stated that the number of incoming and outgoing students is currently relatively low. There are multiple reasons for that, according to the university. However, it was noted that many incoming students from primarily Asian countries participate in summer schools. The faculty explained that there are two levels of summer schools: summer schools are eligible for students from any higher education institution (for free), and summer schools with higher education institutions with whom UB has memorandums of understanding. For these summer schools, regulations concerning recognition are established with detailed processes. The same applies to outgoing students who can participate in summer schools abroad. However, the MBKM programme focuses on Bachelor's programmes. The Master's and PhD programmes currently do not include student mobility features *per se* because of the length of the programme (Master's programme) or the background of PhD students, who are primarily already working (PhD programme) but strives to provide research experiences on an international level (see Chapter IV.6).

Certification

The documentation in the self-evaluation report included examples of the certificates for each programme, the transcript of records, and the diploma supplement. These examples specify that Universitas Brawijaya issues a "Bachelor of Management", a "Master of Management", a "Doctor of Management", and a "Bachelor of Business" for the respective programmes. The diploma supplement includes information on the Indonesian higher education system. The documentation issued to graduates transparently outlines the necessary information, which is very helpful for higher education institutions and possible employers.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Doctoral degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

As stated in the SER, the faculty currently employs 162 academic staff, which hold degrees from national and international universities (e.g. in the United States, England, Australia, Germany, Malaysia, China, France, and Italy), and 97 support staff. The Management Department has 44 full-time academic staff members (five professors, ten associate professors, 13 assistant professors, 14 lecturers, and two other academic staff members) and 23 external lecturers from 2019 – 2020.

The human resource involved in implementing the Three Pillars of HE in the Management Department are lecturers and supporting staff comprising civil and non-civil servants. Every five years, the needs of academic staff for each study programme are planned and stated in the institution's strategic plan. The recruitment process includes

- an academic potential test (similar to GRE or GMAT),
- an English test (TOEFL or IELTS), and
- an academic interview with the head of the department and senior academic staff.

The academic staff's average workload in the departments is five to 15 credits in one semester. It means that every academic staff is obliged to carry out activities in education, research, community service and additional assignment in all study programmes, equivalent to around 16 credits in one semester. The staff is limited to teaching up to five courses per semester. In addition, some courses in the Master's and PhD programmes are taught by two to three staff members, so they are expected to have more time to conduct research and community services.

Academic staff development is carried out through training on research, seminars, conferences, professional certification, and workshops. As such, the university aims to support staff to improve the quality of their publications, increase research capacities and community service activities, and increase international exchange and mobility.

Experts' evaluation

The teaching staff for all four programmes are well-balanced in terms of age, gender and experience. The vast majority (about 99%) have permanent contracts, which is not insignificant for the further development of the academic staff, as it gives them specific security that academic development is worthwhile. The experts evaluate this as a good sign of high awareness of stability within the faculty. This is also reflected in a highly motivated teaching culture, where work in progress is a matter of course. Some teachers have international experience and use that in class, and others have international academic degrees. When recruiting staff, public tenders take place, as the University Brawijaya is a publicly funded university. Staff are supported in developing academic and non-academic skills. Academic staff receive further training in training courses, and those who complete these receive certificates. This ensures that they are aware of current scientific debates. Lecturers who publish or prepare a publication in national and international journals receive financial support. For publications, incentives are given, depending on the level of Scopus.

Following the Tri Dharma of Education principle in Indonesia, the faculty has an active policy to conduct research and community service in which students must be involved. Within this regard, publications are included. During the discussion, it was said that some lecturers write books together with students. The experts believe that this is a perfect indicator that students actively participate in the learning process and receive support in their academic progression.

Courses in the Bachelor's programme are designed for ten to 45 participants, and courses in the Master's programme are for ten to 25 students. PhD students are supervised by a professor who supervises between three and seven PhD students, which is an adequate ratio.

UB offers the PhD programme at two different campuses. The discussions showed that the teaching staff had implemented a hybrid form of teaching, which supports students' learning processes at both campuses. Consequently, the experts testify that the teaching staff can handle two different campuses. It was assured that teaching staff members regularly fly to Jakarta to supervise the PhD students adequately.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

<p>Bachelor's/Master's degree <i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.</i> <i>Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i> [ESG 1.6]</p> <p>Doctoral degree <i>Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.</i> <i>Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.</i> [ESG 1.6]</p>
--

Description

Learning resources

UB provides libraries, sports fields, a polyclinic, a campus hospital, mosques, and mushollas. In order to support students' learning process and achievements, the university also provides offices, classrooms, meeting



and seminar rooms, reading rooms, discussion areas, laboratories, and computer laboratories under the management of faculties, the postgraduate programme and each study programme. Among the laboratories for the Bachelor's programmes to be accredited are a bursa corner lab, a tax centre lab, a microteaching lab, an entrepreneurship lab, a computer lab and a publication lab.

The SER describes that FEB ensures an appropriate amount of literature, journals, and information sources: the library's total collection consists of 7.207 book titles and 70 digital items. In addition, students also have access to the UB central library.

Student Support

UB is a state university funded centrally by the government and through tuition fees due in each programme. Scholarships are set to support students from low-income families, outstanding students (academic and non-academic), and students with active organisational experience.

UB'S Academic and Professional Education Development Centre provides online and in-person student counselling services by professional psychologists. In addition to the university-based consultation, all students receive individual guidance through their academic advisors, who are said to receive specific training.

The university pays attention to fulfilling results-based learning needs for all students, including students with disabilities. In the learning process carried out by students with disabilities, they are accompanied by assistants. The International Office, in coordination with every study programme, manages international student admissions and support. The so-called Freshmen Orientation Programme (PKKMB) is said to be a starting point to introduce each student to campus life. Orientation days are conducted before the academic year starts. The PhD programme offers an academic guideline with regulations and information on structural aspects of the study programme.

UB encourages its students to enhance their knowledge and experience through mobility and credit transfer programmes. The Department of Management mentions cooperation with overseas universities for student exchange. Also, FEB UB provides postgraduate students with an opportunity to participate in a sandwich programme by participating in an education programme at a partner university abroad. On this occasion, students benefit from a collaboration programme for approximately three months to deepen their knowledge according to their research interests. Doctoral students are further provided with the opportunity to participate in seminars, training, and guest lectures presented by national and international speakers. Furthermore, they are embedded in more extensive research projects together with lecturers.

Experts' evaluation

Learning resources

During the online site visit, the faculty showed the relevant learning resources via livestreams and videos. Through this, the experts were able to gain first-hand insight into the campus, the faculty building, students housing, classrooms, multimedia rooms, the library, and sports facilities. The experts testified that the programmes are embedded in an excellent infrastructure. Students of these programmes are comforted by multiple facilities during their studies at Universitas Brawijaya. The facilities can be verified as excellent, with dedicated rooms, Big Data labs or co-working spaces. In addition, the facilities include housing options for Indonesian and international students, and the campus life can be described as very vivid. There is sufficient space available for students in the lecture halls, the laboratories, and for self-study. The IT systems offered to students include multiple systems, as mentioned above (SIAM UB or SIMPEL), and apps that outline internship opportunities and other helpful information.

During the livestream demonstration, the experts had access to the library and the library databases of the faculty. The library holds a sufficient amount of programme-specific literature, some available in English or

translated copies of English literature. Furthermore, the faculty has multiple subscriptions to high-class databases, which help carry out teaching and research at a high level. The livestreaming also included evidence on the software programmes (e.g., SPSS) available to students of the programmes. The additional non-programme-specific facilities are modern and of high quality. All of these facilities create a good campus atmosphere highlighted by the students, which supports the vivid campus life. Overall, the experts conclude that the facilities and the resources are up-to-date and match the intended learning outcomes on the programme level and the course level for the four programmes in this cluster.

Student support

The discussions with multiple stakeholders confirmed that students have transparent access to all relevant study documents from the moment of enrolment. The level of information is very detailed and supports students' learning process. However, before enrolment, access to study documents is more complex (see Chapter IV.7). The coordination and student support activities are, based on the evidence during the site visit, of a high standard and include programme-specific and non-programme-specific counselling opportunities. They ensure that the programmes run smoothly and without any overlap. When enrolling at UB, students have an academic advisor appointed who supports and helps if needed. The panel of experts emphasises this tight student support mechanism. Students are introduced to their studies slowly, which is also facilitated by the nationally prescribed courses at the beginning of the Bachelor's programmes. The Master's and PhD programmes focus on more advanced courses. Consequently, the support focus is somehow different. However, the discussions showed that this different focus supports Master's and PhD students with the same level of support. Being part of the strategy, the Faculty of Economics and Business strives to expose students to national and international conferences to connect to current themes in the disciplines. The experts have learned that one of the instruments that students actively use is summer schools with cooperating institutions. Although student mobility for one semester or a whole year is relatively low, the experts believe that these first steps towards internationalisation support the overall strategy of UB.

During the demonstration of the facilities, the experts also discussed the different campuses in Malang (the main campus) and Jakarta. The experts have understood that the two campuses' learning resources and student support activities are nearly equal. The experts evaluate that there are no differences in achieving the intended learning outcomes on the programme level for the PhD programme "Management".

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information / Public information

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Doctoral degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

FEB UB provides various information service platforms to ensure that all stakeholders access all information. Important information is constantly presented on the Faculty and Department websites. FEB UB frequently uses Facebook and Instagram as information mediums. YouTube is used to broadcast seminars live and publish the activities under the Tri dharma activities. According to the SER, academic activity news is updated almost every day on the faculty's websites.

The module handbook and the semester learning plan can be accessed through the department's website.

Experts' evaluation

Information on the study programmes is accessible to external stakeholders through various channels. The primary source is the faculty's and the respective department's websites. These websites include information on the faculty, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, regulations, admission requirements, or information on the teaching staff. Although these pages are mainly in Indonesian, information in English is available but not at the same detailed level. This might block international exposure and hinder international cooperation with other higher education institutions. Also, the information available in Indonesian is currently very detailed, and prospective students might get lost at the beginning. The experts state that it might be helpful to reduce the complex documentation of the study programmes so that potential new partners and prospective students have straightforward and easy access to the core components of the study programmes (**Finding 9**).

In addition, FEB UB uses social media to publish information for specific target groups. After reviewing the content, it became evident that this information is mostly in Indonesian. Given the importance of social media for younger generations, it might be an idea to include English content in the social media strategy of the faculty or the study programmes to attract more students from abroad (**Finding 10**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Findings

1. A clearer differentiation in the graduation's profile on the term "becoming an entrepreneur" would allow prospective students a better differentiation between the Bachelor's programme "Management" and the Bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship".
2. The Bachelor's programme "Management" should strengthen the curriculum's interdisciplinarity with computer science related courses coming from other faculties.
3. The Bachelor's programme "Management" should consider including aspects of sustainability of management into the curriculum.
4. The Master's programme "Management" should focus more on the foundation of digital literacy, including computational methods and social science, within the curriculum.
5. The PhD programme "Management" could integrate advanced and narrowed aspects on digital literacy.
6. Being a valuable asset for the programme, the PhD programme "Management" could include creational skills in computational methods into the curriculum.
7. The Bachelor's programme "Entrepreneurship" should reflect on the influence of social and sustainable entrepreneurship on the entrepreneurial journey.
8. To foster possible international careers of PhD graduates, it might be wise to consider that teaching experience of PhD students is crucial on an international level.
9. To enable externals an easy overview on the programmes, it might be wise to provide a reduced documentation including the essential components to reflect the core identity of the programmes fully to the public.
10. It might be wise to include more activities in English on social media to attract an international public.