



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA

# CLUSTER CULTURAL SCIENCE III

ANTHROPOLOGY (BACHELOR)

FINE ARTS (BACHELOR)

March 2023



**Content**

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure.....</b>	<b>6</b>
1. Criteria.....	6
2. Approach and methodology .....	6
<b>III. General information on the university .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....</b>	<b>8</b>
3. Quality of the curriculum .....	8
4. Procedures for quality assurance .....	12
5. Learning, teaching and assessment of students .....	14
6. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification.....	15
7. Teaching staff.....	17
8. Learning resources and student support .....	18
9. Information .....	20
<b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>22</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “ANTHROPOLOGY” (BACHELOR)
- “FINE ARTS” (BACHELOR)

### OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA, MALANG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 16<sup>th</sup> meeting on 27 February 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Anthropology**” (**Bachelor**) and “**Fine Arts**” (**Bachelor**) offered by **Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 March 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 March 2029**.

#### Conditions:

1. Evidence must be given on how the Bachelor’s programme in Fine Arts provides a more systematic documentation and a more extensive visual presentation of students’ works in order to fully assess the achievement of the Bachelor’s level.
2. The Bachelor’s programme in Anthropology must increase the field specific literature in the library. An overview of the newly acquired literatures must be provided.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

#### Both study programmes:

1. Both study programmes should incorporate more external activities like fieldworks and exhibitions into the curriculum.
2. It is recommended to have more interdisciplinary courses in collaboration with other departments.
3. In order to strive for internationalisation, both study programmes should increase the number of courses taught in English.

4. Both study programmes should include courses offering room and guidance for self-direction, group discussions, and self-assessment of students, which also helps further enhance their communication skills.
5. Transparency for students should be increased about opportunities for consecutive studies in Master's programmes. The future development of the curriculum should more strongly consider this option as well.
6. Activities outside campus like internships should be listed in the course overview.
7. Students should be encouraged to get more involved in the MBKM Independent campus programme, since the number of participants remains low.
8. To reflect the efficiency of the courses more precisely, the number of respondents on surveys should be increased.
9. The study programme should conduct a more thorough analysis to improve the current on-time completion rate (50%).
10. Final tasks/project of each course should be made as the main outcome with higher percentage of the final grade to ensure self-guided and project-based learning.
11. The admission information such as admission requirements, eligibility, selection procedures, tuition fees, and important dates for each scheme of the selection process should be neatly packed as guidelines.
12. Internationalisation should be developed by having more international collaborations and partnerships in the form of international internships, student or lecturer exchange, or collaborative research.
13. Module and course descriptions as well as the examination regulations should be directly uploaded on the website rather than linking to an external platform considering data protection.

#### Anthropology (Bachelor)

14. The procedure to increase the percentage of PhD holders in teaching staff should be expedited to improve the quality of both research and teaching.

#### Fine Arts (Bachelor)

15. Connections to commercial galleries and curators should be intensified.
16. The programme should pay more attention to digitalisation as well as the transition of conventional values/arts into the digital era.
17. Students are suggested to submit a portfolio for a better learning observation.
18. It is recommended to reconsider colour-blindness as a special criterion for the eligibility to apply for the programme if it aims to inclusion of prospective students.
19. The programme should provide more studio capacity for students.
20. The university should provide a showcase of students' artwork on the website in order to raise the profile of the programme and students.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT****ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “ANTHROPOLOGY” (BACHELOR)
- “FINE ARTS” (BACHELOR)

**OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA, MALANG, INDONESIA**

Visit to the university: 5, 6, and 9 September 2022

**Panel of experts:**

<b>Assoc. Prof. Dr. Keum Hyun Kim</b>	University of Malaya, Malaysia, Department of Asian & European Languages, Faculty of Languages & Linguistics
<b>Prof. Jörg Obergfell</b>	Trier University of Applied Sciences, Department Art and Design
<b>Karina Tungari</b>	Illustrator & Graphic Designer, Hamburg, Germany (representative of the labour market)
<b>Ribal Zeitouni</b>	Student of Technische Universität Berlin, Culture and Technology (student representative)
<b>Coordinator:</b>	
Ronny Heintze	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Vi Le	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programmes “**Anthropology**” and “**Fine Arts**” offered by Universitas Brawijaya.

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in April 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In November 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g., number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 6 December 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in January 2022.

#### *Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in August 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### *Site visit*

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 5, 6, and 8 September 2022. Virtually, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g., the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

#### *Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

#### *Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 27 February 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In April 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General information on the university

---

Universitas Brawijaya (UB) was established in 1963 and is located in Malang, Indonesia. UB is composed of 15 faculties and one postgraduate school. In total the university offers undergraduate and postgraduate programmes to about 69.319 students (October 2021). According to UB, the strategic plan of 2020 focuses on the improvement of the quality of education, research and community service, students and graduates, and institutions and cooperation.

The study programmes to be accredited are offered by the Faculty of Cultural Studies, which was established in 2009 and which offers ten study programmes in the area of languages, literature, fine arts, and anthropology. As of July 2021, 3.171 students and 135 foreign students were enrolled in both undergraduate and postgraduate programmes.

The faculty's vision stated in the SER is to (1) provide quality education and teaching in the fields of humanities and culture, (2) to conduct research and community service that excels in the fields of humanities and culture, (3) to disseminate knowledge and facilitate its use in the context of improving people's lives. The faculty is headed by a Dean, who is supported by a Vice Dean for Academic Affairs, a Vice Dean for General Affairs and Finance, and a Vice Dean for Student Affairs. In addition to four supporting units (Research and Community Service Agency, ICT Centre, Journal Publishing Agency, and the Quality Assurance Team), the faculty consists of three departments (Department of Language and Literature, Department of Language Education, Department of Arts and Anthropology), and a Division of Administrative Affairs.

### IV. Assessment of the study programmes

---

#### 3. Quality of the curriculum

##### **Bachelor's/Master's degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

#### **Description**

##### General Aspects

As explained in the SER, curriculum development and revision involve three steps which include input from lecturers, a consortium of the respective academic field, and a labour market need analysis: (1) formulation of graduate profiles and intended learning outcomes, (2) formulation of study and learning materials as well as courses and credit loads, and (3) course organisation, including semester learning modules, task plans, and evaluation plans. The two study programmes to be accredited have been recognised by national (BAN-PT) and international (AUN-QA) accreditation.

Following the Tridharma approach of Indonesian higher education, the achievement of the intended learning outcomes is supposed to be interlinked with research and community service applying to both lecturer and students.



## Experts' evaluation

### General evaluation of both study programmes

The SER clearly formulates the learning outcomes of the courses. It outlines in detail a holistic approach that emphasizes the balance between individual student-centred learning and broader subjects of culture and society as well as an interplay between theoretical and practical studies. A very positive aspect of the implementation of the study programmes is the meeting at the beginning of each semester with the participation of the teaching staff and heads of the study programme in Anthropology and in Fine Arts. They discuss themes, workloads, and module details in a democratic process of joint presentations and feedback in order to plan the subsequent semester and ensure a cohesive and up-to-date curriculum. The workloads of the study programmes are well-documented, and the students confirmed that the distribution of assignments is challenging but not overwhelming. The course plan includes elective courses that insure input from external stakeholders. Interdisciplinary courses are also mentioned, and students can take courses from other programmes. The university is supportive in collaboration among faculties in research, teaching, and community service (e.g., giving funding). However, interviews with staff and students gave the impression that there should be even more external activities like fieldwork and exhibitions (**Finding 1**) which also could be offered as interdisciplinary collaborations (**Finding 2**). Both faculties strive for internationalisation but despite the mentioned ten practitioners and visiting lecturers invited every year, there still appears to be a lack of courses offered in English (**Finding 3**). As stipulated in the SER, an important aim of the curriculum is to produce critical graduates. Therefore, courses should leave room and offer guidance for self-direction, group discussions, and self-assessment of students. This is related to a slight lack of graduate's communication skills that was noted by representatives of the labour market, otherwise they confirmed that both study programmes are in line with the requirements of the labour market (**Finding 4**). In addition, the transparency for students about opportunities for consecutive studies in Master's programmes should be increased (**Finding 5**).

### Fine Arts (Bachelor)

#### Description

The graduate profile of the Bachelor programme in Fine Arts mentions students who are creative, productive and innovative, in order to qualify for professions such as artists who are able to execute art and organise art events, art critics, and art managers. The SER lists 12 intended learning outcomes (ILOs) according to which students are said to learn how to

- demonstrate a responsible attitude to uphold academic norms in scientific activities in the field of art and culture based on religion, morals, and ethics;
- internalise values, norms, and academic ethics independently and in collaboration in carrying out practices and studies in the field of fine arts;
- apply theories and principles of art and culture in works of art and art studies;
- integrate art and culture in art studies;
- interpret art and culture based on an entrepreneurship attitude;
- apply critical, innovative, and evaluative thinking in the context of developing or implementing science and technology;
- make decisions to solve contextual problems in the field of art with appropriate methodologies;
- develop entrepreneurial knowledge in the practice of visual arts;
- apply art knowledge to produce works of art and visual literacy;
- practice fine arts knowledge through media and technical enrichment;
- integrate theoretical and practical knowledge in the field of writing of fine arts;

- create and produce works with conventional, digital, and intermedia tools that are oriented towards local culture as well as national and international perspectives.

As stated in the SER, the curriculum of the programme was revised in 2019 with the goal to implement an outcome-based education framework. The overall 144 credits of the programme correspond to 207.36 ECTS, according to the SER, and are distributed across national/university-based courses (e.g., religious education, philosophy of science, civic education, and community service), department-based courses (anthropology of art, creative writing, professional ethics), as well as compulsory and elective courses of the study programme. Compulsory courses are supposed to address areas such as art management, art history, art theory, illustration, art criticism and art research methodology, amongst others. Elective courses may be taken in the area of sociology of arts, technical drawing, photography, art and public spaces, and environmental art, amongst others. Also, the curriculum includes courses assigned to four concentrations: painting, graphic art, sculpture, and art studies. All courses are scheduled for semesters one to seven; the university states that the distribution should help students to focus on their final thesis in the last semester.

### Experts' evaluation

The Fine Arts Bachelor programme of UB demonstrates a balance between traditional crafts and contemporary media. Art is not only conveyed as a practice of self-reflection but also as part of culture and community service. Furthermore, scientific aspects and economic prospects for graduates are also well considered. Especially, the discussions with staff and students gave the impression of a dynamic programme that is rooted in tradition but also up to date and connected to the current international discourse.

Until the 6<sup>th</sup> semester, the programme features a wide array of compulsory modules to provide an overview of basic art techniques and subjects. Graduates will surely gain a basic skill set in the most important fields of Fine Arts. With a sound foundation provided, students can choose consciously their area of specialisation. On the other hand, there is a question on how much room in the early stages of studies left for personal development and the sharpening of each student's individual profile and artistic attitude. By studying the timetable, one gets the impression that there is not much time left to implement and credit those crucial goals from an early stage. For example, there was no information provided if students are encouraged to show their works in partly self-organised exhibitions each term in the early stages of their studies. Overall, there seems to be a lack of opportunities for students to present their work to peer groups, reflect on their opinion and further enhance their communicative skills (**see Finding 4**). These activities and aims seem to be exclusively reserved for the last two semesters. The appropriateness of graduates' skills for the labour market was confirmed by the professional panel, but there could be more connections to commercial galleries and curators (**Finding 6**).

In terms of interdisciplinarity, there is a wide range of courses offered in the early semesters covering disciplines like Language, Management or Anthropology. That way certain interdisciplinary and methodological skills are ensured, whereas there is a shortcoming of explicitly interdisciplinary courses and cooperation with other departments, e.g., architecture or computer science (**see Finding 2**). Students are encouraged and able to obtain credit points for outside campus activities like internships, however those activities are not listed in the course overview (**Finding 7**).

The experts had access to a few exhibition flyers and event documentations. To value the student's and lecturer's achievements and highlight the course outcomes and profile of the department, a more systematic documentation as well as a more extensive visual presentation of the course works for each module would be crucial (**Finding 8**). There was no opportunity to see examples of portfolios of students. Even for the final thesis any documentation of the practical part was not available which makes it hard to evaluate the most important part of the outcome of a Fine Arts course. However, examples of undergraduate theses were accessible and feature a wide range of topics ranging from historical to contemporary subjects even including complicated specialist theories by western thinkers such as Martin Heidegger or Arthur C. Danto.

A challenge to each Fine Arts programme is the rapid development of digital technologies. At UB, students must attend a small “Digital Art Application” module (3 CP) in the 3rd semester. It was also emphasised by the teaching staff that other courses include digital media and content. However, this seems to be a relatively small amount and a missed chance considering that the Fine Arts department is particularly predestined to offer a bridge between traditional, tactile craft techniques and digital content and media (**Finding 9**).

Overall, the Fine Arts department left the impression of being very well structured, in some parts being even too well-structured to realise outcome-based results. However, this is balanced by the dynamic sense of community, freedom and creativity, when students and teachers showed their enthusiasm and openness to future challenges during the digital site visit.

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

### Anthropology (Bachelor)

#### Description

Graduates of the Anthropology programme are said to qualify for positions as junior researchers, academics, and practitioners. Following the ILOs provided in the SER, students learn how to:

- show responsibility to uphold academic norms in the field that are based on religion, morals, and ethics,
- internalise the values of independence, cooperativeness, entrepreneurship, and concern for communities and the environment;
- explain concepts and theories about culture and cultural diversity;
- apply various relevant research methods to collect data;
- analyse cultural phenomena and community dynamics;
- demonstrate critical, constructive, humanist, and innovative thinking in the context of development or the implementation of science and technology;
- show independent, quality, measure, and evaluative work based on the data and information validity;
- utilise science, technology, and art to identify and analyse socio-cultural phenomena in practice and academic development;
- analyse and apply theories, concepts, and anthropological approaches to socio-cultural phenomena in governmental and non-governmental sectors, the entrepreneur world, media, and communities;
- conduct studies and formulate alternative solution to socio-cultural problems in particular communities based on cultural analysis using anthropological and multi-disciplinary approaches within the right frameworks and research methodologies

The SER states that the 146 credits correspond to 210.2 ECTS and are distributed across national/university-based courses (e.g., religious education, civic education, and community service), faculty-based courses (Indonesian people and culture and philosophy of science), department-based courses (anthropology of art, creative writing, professional ethics), study programme compulsory and study programme elective courses. Compulsory courses of the study programme are supposed to address areas such as social and cultural anthropology, multiculturalism and pluralism, social and cultural change, physical anthropology, social theory, ethnography, and methodology, amongst others. Electives may be taken in the areas of anthropology of religion, body, gender and sexuality, migration and diaspora, or medical anthropology, amongst others. All courses are scheduled for semesters one to seven; the university states that the distribution should help students to focus on their final thesis in the last semester.

### Experts' evaluation

The Anthropology programme has holistic modules as all subjects such as university courses, faculty courses and department courses, and diversified compulsory/elective subjects are designed to assist students to acquire essential knowledge, theories, and various research methodologies. For example, compulsory courses are indispensable subjects like social and cultural anthropology, multiculturalism and pluralism, social and cultural change, physical anthropology, social theory, ethnography, and methodology, whereas elective courses broaden the student's horizon and uplift their competencies through the subjects such as anthropology of religion, body, gender and sexuality, migration and diaspora, medical anthropology, anthropology of art, creative writing and professional ethics.

In terms of course design, the programme is offering comprehensive courses through various subjects and a supporting system to ensure the quality of the programme, the knowledge and competencies of the students to be in line with the current trends of anthropology and the demands of the job market. As a result, all stakeholders such as students, graduates and labour market representatives have expressed their high satisfaction with the programme during the interview sessions. However, there is a necessity of improvement in the module handbook of the course. The introduction of intensive fieldwork was highlighted by the experts and requested by the representatives of students and industry stakeholders as the experience in field work is one of the core elements in anthropology (**see Finding 1**).

The university is offering various programmes such as internships, an exchange programme and other courses through Kampus Merdeka/Merdeka Belajar MBKM (Freedom to Learn/Independent Campus) which seems to have been contributing to the diversity of the programme as students have been given lots of choices for their learning process. However, the participation of students is still slow. The department should enhance their efforts to encourage more students to be exposed to various knowledge obtaining and practical experiences while optimising opportunities for expanding their views and networking (**Finding 10**).

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 4. Procedures for quality assurance

### Bachelor's/Master's degree

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

### Description

As outlined in the self-evaluation report, all programmes adhere to external and internal quality assurance mechanisms. External QA procedures are conducted by the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN-PT), international accreditation and international certification bodies. Both study programmes have been accredited with the score B in the BAN-PT evaluations of 2020 (Fine Arts) and 2021 (Anthropology). Internal

QA procedures follow the Indonesian National Standard of Higher Education (SN Dikti) and are carried out by the Quality Assurance Centre (PJM) at university level, as well as by QA units at the department (UJM) and study programme (GJM) levels. The central instrument for internal QA procedures is an internal quality audit (AIM), in which both the system (i.e., adequacy, quality, and standards of the QA mechanisms) and the performance (i.e., the implementation of the QA system) are evaluated. The AIM process thus checks the conformity between the university's quality standards and their implementation in the respective academic, financial, and administrative quality management activities. Audits are performed with regards to the quality of the faculties, departments, study programmes, and laboratories as well as with regards to the bureaus, institutions, central laboratories, technical executive units, and business agencies. Results of the AIM are said to be communicated to the individual study programmes in the form of a quality improvement plan with regards to the adherence to the tri dharma approach and lecturers' qualifications.

In addition to the QA audits, the university also reports data collection involving relevant stakeholders. This includes an annual online tracer study by which data is collected from alumni and the labour market with regards to the waiting period for graduates to be employed, the field of employment, and the required qualifications. As stated in the SER, the results of these tracer studies are used to revise and improve the curriculum of the respective study programme. Additional feedback is collected from external stakeholders in the form of focus group discussions. In addition, every four years an additional curriculum evaluation is said to be performed. Tracer studies are complemented by community satisfaction surveys (SKM), which addresses lecturers, students, staff, and external partners of the faculty which are related to QA services. Students' feedback to specific courses is collected via the academic information system (SIAM). The results of students' satisfaction surveys are communicated to the individual lecturers online. Results of other satisfaction surveys concerning the overall study programme are said to be published online on the university homepage and are communicated to stakeholders in regular study programme/department meetings at the beginning and the end of every semester. Finally, the SER also mentions e-complaint tools both at the university and the faculty level, which can be accessed on the respective websites.

Further data collected by the university involves the profile of the student population, students' progression, completion rates, graduates' employability, and learning resources. With regards to academic integrity, the SER states that the faculty has a mechanism to check for plagiarism in both lecturers' and students' publications.

### Experts' evaluation

During the different discussions with the groups, the self-set standards for quality assurance processes have been stated as not only to fulfil basic requirements and criteria but also to give a basis for continuous development and improvement.

There are different levels of quality assurance processes including the university level, faculty level, department level and study programme level. Especially interesting for this report are the different evaluation processes on the department and study programme scale. In addition to the Indonesian accreditation process and the internal audits (AIM, see above), there is an annual survey for all faculty members as well as evaluation of courses at the end of every semester to ensure the overall academic quality of the faculty. The surveys are conducted with all relevant stakeholders, such as alumni or labour market representatives. All data gathered is then reviewed by the faculty and communicated back afterwards. This is to be pointed out positively. For quality assurance to fulfil its purpose, not only the collection of representative data is important, but also a continuous feedback loop to guarantee improvement on all levels, which are given here. However, the number of participants doing surveys is still quite low, which cannot reflect precisely the efficiency of the courses. The experts recommend that the number of respondents on surveys should be increased (**Finding 11**). Meanwhile in the site visit, the representatives of students expressed their respect and high satisfaction with their lecturers

in teaching and various supports to students' study, research, and welfares. They also appreciated their relationship and collaboration with their lecturers.

Besides monitoring measurements, a lot of thought has been put into staff development. Following the results of our discussions with the different groups, all seem to value the importance of staff development to assure the quality of teaching and research. The assistance provided by the university to the departments for their staff development is regarded as sufficient. (For further information on staff qualification, see the specific chapter on teaching staff).

However, even if in general the quality assurance processes are thought through well, there is one indicator requiring further explanation. As initially stated in the SER, the completion rate of the studies is 50% which means half of the students could not complete the programme. However, as part of the process, it became clear to the experts that this percentage is the completion rate of students who graduated on time. Therefore, the experts recommend that the study programme should conduct a more thorough analysis to improve the on-time completion rate even better (**Finding 12**).

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

### **Bachelor's/Master's degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

### Description

The Anthropology Study programme states that teaching and learning methods aim at supporting students to become critical and constructive thinkers who prioritise humanist values and participate in the development of socio-cultural environments. The Bachelor programme in Fine Arts highlights their focus on fostering creativity, productivity, and innovation in their students. All teaching and learning processes are said to be aligned with the Indonesian Qualification Framework, the approach of Outcome Based Education, and the national Freedom to Learn/Independent Campus curriculum (MBKM). Teaching methods mentioned in the report include lecturing, classroom discussions, classroom assessment, demonstrations, student-oriented learning, case-based learning, and project-based learning. Also, students in the undergraduate programmes are to participate in the MBKM programme, in which they can choose to obtain some credits in the form of internships, teaching internships, research, humanitarian projects, independent projects, entrepreneurships, and community service. In addition, students are said to be encouraged to participate in extracurricular activities and to be involved in lecturers' research activities. During the COVID-19 pandemic, teaching activities took place online both synchronously and asynchronously by employing various software and the university's learning management system (VLM2 UB). Learning activities in the Fine Arts programme are further supported by the faculty and the department, so that students have access to necessary equipment and material. Furthermore, artworks are said to be disseminated in the form of exhibitions at the Faculty of Cultural Studies.

Following the university's policy as an Inclusive Campus, teaching activities are said to take into account the diversity of students and their respective needs. This includes for example the assurance of classroom



accessibility for students with physical disabilities, assigned interpreters for hearing impaired students, and assistance as well as digitisation services for students with visual impairment.

Assessment of students' learning achievements include a mid-term and final exam, either in the form of in-class examinations or take-home/project examinations. In addition, evaluation in the Anthropology programme may also occur during the semester in the form of quizzes (15% of the overall grade), structured assignments (20%), as well as in-class participation and presence (10%), so that the mid-term exam weighs 25% and the final exam 30%. The Fine Arts programme mentions structured assignments to contribute 50% of the final grade, participation and presence (10%), the mid-term exam (10%) and the final exam (20%). Students are said to be informed of the assessment methods and the requirements to obtain credits in a specific course at the beginning of the semester. Also, all examination schedules are said to be published on the website of the faculty. Student appeals are said to be addressed to the respective lecturer, who produces a written statement to be evaluated by the Head of Study Programme, Head of Department, and the Vice Dean for Academic Affairs. The latter will inform the academic coordinator about the decision. If this process does not succeed, the student also can file an e-complaint.

### Experts' evaluation

Brawijaya University has well-implemented the inclusion of students with adapted admission procedures and barrier free access to facilities and learning materials. The Independent Campus curriculum fosters an outcome-based education in which the outcomes are documented in the form of exhibitions and publications. The university has provided pictures of these activities which demonstrate a lively culture of community and experiment with active and self-motivated students. Some of this information can be found on the news section of the UB's website. However, subsequent public representation seen as part of the appreciation of the students' outcomes could be stronger (**see Finding 22**).

Structured assignments together with mid-term exams and attendance contribute 70-80% to the final grade of each course. Although this may help students to reach the intended learning outcomes in small steps, it takes away the importance of a final project which normally leaves more room to work self-directed. Especially in higher semesters, it could be advisable to focus more on the final tasks as main outcome to ensure the self-guided and project-based learning (**Finding 13**).

UB offers several occasions to conduct interdisciplinary work in research and outside campus activities and it is mentioned that students can take credits from other departments. To strengthen interdisciplinarity even more, there should be the possibility of joint course offers by different departments including joint lectures with more than one lecturer from different fields (**see Finding 2**).

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 6. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

### **Bachelor's/Master's degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

## Description

### Admission

UB offers four admission tracks to prospective students of the Bachelor programmes: (1) the National Selection for State University Admission (SNMPTN), (2) the Joint Selection for State University Admission (SBMPTN); (3) Independent Selection Test of UB (SMUB); (4) Independent Selection of People with Disabilities (SPKPD). The first admission scheme (SNMPTN) is regulated on a national scale and involves the evaluation of high school report cards, the score in the national examination (Ujian Nasional), as well as the consideration of academic achievements, alumni tracks, and school accreditation levels. The second admission scheme (SBMPTN) selects students according to their performance in a written exam in which their basic academic potential with regards to the respective field of study is assessed. The SMUB scheme is organised according to UB's standards and involves a computer-based written examination and students' high school report cards. Finally, the Independent Selection of People with Disabilities takes into account individual cases and is combined with the opportunity to receive a scholarship. The SER further demonstrate that data is collected on the distribution of past cohorts with regards to the individual pathways.

The admission process of the Fine Arts programme also requires that applicants submit portfolios that include a black and white narrative drawing with an 'atmosphere' theme, and a still life artwork.

### Progression

As stated in the SER, student progression is monitored by academic advisors, with whom they meet three times per semester. In addition to academic guidance and recommendation to students, academic advisors also consult with faculty leaders in the case of severe problems in students' progression and may also contact students' parents. Students' performance in the courses and exams as well as their workload are said to be documented via the online management system SIADO.

### Recognition

Following the national policy Kampus Merdeka (MBKAM), students have the right to take courses outside of their study programme. This may also include independent student exchanges, campus teaching activities, and internships. Also, the English Literature programme has a double degree programme with the University of Queensland and the Federation University Australia through which credit transfer is regulated.

### Certification

Students are said to receive a diploma, a transcript of records, a diploma supplement, their TOEFL certificate and a document on Information and Communication Technology upon graduation. Graduates from the Fine Arts programme receive the title Sarjana Seni (S. Sn), while graduates from the Anthropology programme are awarded the titel Sarjana Seni (S. Sos).

## Experts' evaluation

The admission scheme is shown clearly on the website. This includes the admission requirements, eligibility, selection procedures, tuition fees and important dates for each scheme of the selection process. However, the admission information on the website could be neatly packed together as the guidelines for submitting required portfolios (**Finding 14**).

On the UB's website for admission selection and process (Selma) states colour-blindness as a special criterion for the eligibility for the prospective student for the fine arts programme. The experts believe that inclusion should be the keyword and therefore recommend eliminating this criterion if it still conducts (**Finding 15**).

In addition to the portfolio requirement, the experts think that it will be good for prospective students to be encouraged to submit a portfolio in interdisciplinary arts (**Finding 16**). This enables UB to reflect and to show



upcoming students' weaknesses and strengths. Moreover, through portfolios the programme can observe students' progress during the learning process as well as help them gain a sense of cultural identity and the ability to keep abreast of technological and scientific advances.

The experts also suggest developing international exposure by having more international partnerships (**Finding 17**). This would provide students with more opportunities to participate in or organise international exhibitions. Furthermore, this also enables students to do international internships and join student exchange programmes, collaborative research, literacy exchange and competitions. It would be good to have a broader global view and exposure as UB has mainly focused on East Java traditional arts such as Batik painting.

For those students who want to complete the programme earlier, recognition and equalisation of informal learning processes such as student exchanges, campus teaching activities, humanitarian projects, independent projects, and internships are provided in the form of a credit transfer programme following the national policy MBKM. As for certification, graduates receive documentation explaining the qualifications gained, including context, level, and status of the studies (diploma supplement).

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Teaching staff

### **Bachelor's/Master's degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

## Description

Teaching staff at UB may be employed either as civil servants or non-civil servants. The former group is selected according to the Regulation of the Head of the National Civil Service Agency, while selection of the latter group is regulated by the university's guidelines. The recruitment of academic staff follows a standard operational procedure, which involves a needs analysis, an application, administrative verification, and a competence test.

The SER lists the following academic staff for the programmes to be accredited:

- Fine Arts programme: 11 full time lecturers (MA degree), 2 part time lecturers (MA degree), 2 external lecturers (PhD)
- Anthropology programme: 11 full time lecturers (2 PhD, 9 with an MA degree), 2 part time lecturers (professors), 7 external lecturers (PhD)

The teaching workload of full and part time lecturers is said to be ten hours a week per semester. External lecturers teach three hours a week per semester.

Staff development in the area of didactics and teaching methods is offered in the form of a lecturer certification programme which is organised by the Ministry of Education and Culture. The SER states that UB has a mandatory professional development programme for lecturers that is regularly held every year and addresses

philosophy of education, teaching methods, and scoring systems, amongst others. Finally, teaching staff is also said to be encouraged to pursue higher qualifications, such as a doctorate.

### Experts' evaluation

The faculty of cultural studies features diverse teaching staff with a good balance of gender, age, and profession. In Fine Arts, lecturers represent a wide range of approaches ranging from traditional to contemporary techniques and subjects. The lecturers are also active as professionals, e.g., realising exhibitions. However, international links and activities could be stronger (**see Finding 17**). Apart from assistant professors, there is only one external associate professor.

According to the information provided by the university, the expertise of teaching staff is highly evaluated because their expertise and areas of interest cover a variety of fields such as anthropology of museum, religion, population, health, visual, media, ecology, culinary, arts, development, law, gender, biological anthropology, community empowerment, ethnography and so on. However, the percentage of PhD holders among the lecturers of the Anthropology programme remains quite low. Particularly, the percentage of fulltime local lecturers is only 18%. One of the reasons is that the recruitment of teaching staff is conducted based on the Indonesian government criteria which only require the Master's degree to become lecturers at the university. The faculty and the department have informed the experts that they have a future plan for the human resource development of their teaching staff for 2022-2030. This plan together with the support from the department, faculty, and university would give the lecturers the opportunity to obtain their PhD, so that the programme can secure having excellent scholars who can conduct demanding research as well as supervise Master's and doctoral candidates. With more PhD holders among the teaching staff, the Anthropology programme could become one of the best programmes in the region to provide the labour market with the graduates who can meet the expectation and demand from the industry, as qualification and competency of the graduates for their career development will be ensured. In short, the department should expedite the procedure to increase the percentage of PhD holders (**Finding 18**).

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 8. Learning resources and student support

### Bachelor's/Master's degree

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

[ESG 1.6]

### Description

UB is a state university funded centrally by the government and through tuition fees due in each programme. Scholarships are set in place to support students from low-income families, outstanding students (academic and non-academic), and students with active organisational experience.

Classrooms and workspaces available for the study programmes include classrooms with a capacity of 30-50 students, a sound system, LCD projectors, and air-conditioning, a working area, and an examination room.

The central library offers books, reference collections, general collections, serial collections, and theses. Also, students have access to e-books and e-journals. In addition, the faculty manages its own library. The faculty

also offers a Humanities Laboratory with an Arts & Culture Division and a Language Division, two multimedia rooms, a microteaching room, a movie room, a design studio, a painting studio, and a sculpture studio. Further facilities mentioned in the report include prayer rooms, break rooms, work rooms for the Student's Union and the Student Activity Units as well as an arts exhibition space.

UB states that it has implemented an IT infrastructure which allows for online services, including online attendance, e-complaint forms, e-journals, e-library, and general e-learning activities. The SER also mentions a Microsoft Campus Agreement to provide both students and lecturers with necessary software. The faculty provides public computers which are maintained and managed by the so-called PSIK unit. All IT facilities are said to be monitored and updated on a regular basis. Information systems supporting the study activities include an Academic Information System (SIKAD), an Academic Information System for Lecturers (SIADO), an Information system for Students' Theses (SISO), an Information System for Student's Community Service Programme (SISO-KKN), and an online study plan (KRS).

Student support is provided by the Centre for Disability Studies and Services, which organises volunteer support, counselling, and digitalisation of learning material. Furthermore, students with disabilities are provided with mentors who assist them in their learning process. Student counselling takes place at the university's Centre for Academic and Professional Education Development, in the form of face-to-face or online meetings. In addition, academic advisors provide support, counselling, or may refer students to the faculty's counselling bureau. Also, career consultancy is provided by the university's Career and Entrepreneurship Development Unit, which connects students and alumni and provides information on job vacancies, internships, job trainings, and entrepreneur programmes. The university also offers free health facilities including health counselling.

Students' mobility is said to be supported by the study programmes' individual exchange programmes. Exchange programmes are said to be managed by the International Relations Office at the faculty level and by the International Office at the university level. International agreements are said to exist with the University of Southern Queensland, University of Canberra, University of Adelaide, University of Malaya, Sichuan International Studies University, Guangxi Normal University, Hiroshima University, and Kochi University

Introductory events for new and potential students are said to be carried out by the individual programmes. International students are said to be coordinated by the International Office and, at the faculty level, by an International Programme.

### Experts' evaluation

As stated above, the students of the anthropology as well as the fine arts programme have access to various resources which provide the necessary information and assist them with the planning and conduction of their study.

However, while enrolled students are supposed to be provided with all necessary information and assisted during all stages of their study, the important information is not quite easily accessible to everyone. For example, the Anthropology programme provides its module and course descriptions including the regulation on the examination and grading procedure on its website via the links connecting to PDF-files in a Google Drive. As such, said files should be directly uploaded on the website rather than linking to an external platform considering data protection (**Finding 19**).

In addition to an impressive student support system, UB provides its students in the fine arts and anthropology programme with a lot of facilities. In general, they are quite sufficient and well perceived (for a detailed description, see above). However, there are a few shortcomings. One is that there is the need for higher studio capacity (**Finding 20**). This can be addressed, as UB is providing the faculty with a new building in which the necessary spaces might be included.

One crucial point is the equipment of the faculties' library. While there is already a good amount of literature available for students through the access to reputable peer-reviewed journals, there is the need for more field specific books, especially in anthropology. The department has to come up with a strategy to acquire more field specific books for the faculty's library (**Finding 21**).

The excellent communication between students and staff has to be highlighted. As discussed in the digital visit, students are provided with numerous individual support possibilities. Students are supported by their supervisors on their possible workload, meaning the maximum sensible number of credits to be completed in one semester in regard of the students' individual needs. Furthermore, students receive assistance in choosing research topics and sufficient supervision during the writing. Also, the process of acknowledging externally and non-academically acquired competencies is strongly supported. In addition to the fair crediting of non-curricular work, it has been stated that there is sufficient assistance in seeking non-academic collaborations, for example exhibitions or field work.

In conclusion, the resources provided to the students are generally sufficient. The facilities are well-equipped and most of information is publicly available. Moreover, there is a great amount of support and counselling for the students by the staff.

### Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 9. Information

### Bachelor's/Master's degree

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

### Description

UB states that all necessary information on the study programmes is available online on the university, faculty, and study programme websites. This includes information for prospective students, the UB curriculum, scholarships, programme missions, student procedures, academic calendars, student affairs, and contact information. In addition, the faculty and the study programmes use several social media accounts (Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, YouTube) to disseminate further information on e.g. current events.

### Experts' evaluation

UB provides all information needed to the public. Programme courses, intended learning outcomes, admission, teaching, learning and assessment procedures can be accessed through the UB's website.

Regarding the engagement with stakeholders and students, UB shows actively up-to-date information such as announcements related to workshop, seminar, achievements, studies, academic calendar, etc. on their social media platforms.

However, the expert finds that the categories and subcategories on the website could be more compact and more neatly packed together (**see Finding 14**). In this way, it would be more convenient and easier for the visitors to find the content that they are interested in. It seems that similar information is scattered on the different sites.

Furthermore, it would be good for UB to provide a showcase of student's artwork on the website as this would raise the profile of the programmes and of the students/graduates (**Finding 22**).

### **Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Anthropology**” (**Bachelor**) offered by **University Brawijaya** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Fine Arts**” (**Bachelor**) offered by **University Brawijaya** with conditions.

Findings:

1. Both study programmes should incorporate more external activities like fieldworks and exhibitions into the curriculum.
2. It is recommended to have more interdisciplinary courses in collaboration with other departments.
3. In order to strive for internationalisation, both study programmes should increase the number of courses taught in English.
4. Both study programmes should include courses offering room and guidance for self-direction, group discussions, and self-assessment of students, which also helps further enhance their communication skills
5. Transparency for students should be increased about opportunities for consecutive studies in Master’s programmes. The future development of the curriculum should more strongly consider this option as well.
6. Bachelor’s programme in Fine Arts: Connections to commercial galleries and curators could be intensified.
7. Activities outside campus like internships should be listed in the course overview.
8. In order to fully assess the achievement of the Bachelor’s level, the Bachelor’s programmes in Fine Arts must provide a more systematic documentation a more extensive visual presentation of students’ works.
9. The Bachelor’s programme in Fine Arts should pay more attention to digitalisation as well as the transition of conventional values/arts into the digital era.
10. Students should be encouraged to get more involved in the MBKM Independent campus programme, since the number of participants remains low.
11. To reflect the efficiency of the courses more precisely, the number of respondents on surveys should be increased.
12. The study programme should conduct a more thorough analysis to improve the current on-time completion rate (50%).
13. Final tasks/project of each course should be made as the main outcome with higher percentage of the final grade to ensure the self-guided and project-based learning.
14. The admission information such as admission requirements, eligibility, selection procedures, tuition fees, and important dates for each scheme of the selection process could be neatly packed as guidelines.
15. It is recommended to reconsider colour-blindness as a special criterion for the eligibility to apply for the Bachelor’s programme in Fine Arts if the programme aims to inclusion of prospective students.
16. Students of the Fine Arts study programme are suggested to submit a portfolio for a better learning observation.
17. Internationalisation can be developed by having more international collaborations and partnerships in the form of international internships, student or lecturer exchange, or collaborative research.

18. The Bachelor's programme in Anthropology should expedite the procedure to increase the percentage of PhD holders in teaching staff to improve the quality of both research and teaching.
19. Module and course descriptions as well as examination regulation should be directly uploaded on the website rather than linking to an external platform considering data protection.
20. The Bachelor's programme in Fine Arts should provide more studio capacity for students.
21. The number of field specific literatures in the library must be increased, especially in the Anthropology programme.
22. The university could provide a showcase of students' artwork on the website in order to raise the profile of the programme and students.