



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## EXPERTS' REPORT

**TOURISM BUSINESS MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR  
OF APPLIED TOURISM SCIENCE)**

**TOURISM BUSINESS PLANNING (MASTER IN AP-  
PLIED TOURISM)**

**TOUR AND TRAVEL OPERATIONS (DIPLOMA III)  
HOSPITALITY (DIPLOMA III)**

POLITEKNIK NEGERI BALI

December 2021



HEI	<b>Politeknik Negeri Bali</b>
Programme	<b>Tourism Business Management</b>
Degree	<b>Bachelor of Applied Tourism Science</b>
Extent	145 SKS
Length of studies	8 Semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	<b>Tourism Business Planning</b>
Degree	<b>Master in Applied Tourism</b>
Extent	44 SKS
Length of studies	4 Semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	<b>Tour and Travel Operations</b>
Degree	<b>Diploma III</b>
Extent	114 SKS
Length of studies	6 Semesters
Language	Indonesian
Programme	<b>Hospitality</b>
Degree	<b>Diploma III</b>
Extent	113 SKS
Length of studies	6 Semesters
Language	Indonesian
Concept accreditation	<input type="checkbox"/>
First-time international accreditation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
No. reaccreditation	
Responsible agency	AQAS e.V.
Responsible consultant(s)	Doris Herrmann

**Content**

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure.....</b>	<b>8</b>
1. Criteria.....	8
2. Approach and methodology .....	8
<b>III. General Information on the Politeknik .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....</b>	<b>11</b>
1. Quality of the Curriculum of the Bachelor’s and Master’s Programmes: .....	11
2. Quality of the Curriculum of the Diploma III Programmes: .....	16
3. Procedures for Quality Assurance .....	20
4. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students .....	23
5. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification .....	25
6. Teaching Staff .....	27
7. Learning Resources and Student Support.....	29
8. Information .....	31
<b>V. Recommendations of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>32</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS COMMISSION

on the Diploma IV Programmes /Bachelor and Master Degree Programmes (Accreditation Procedure)

„**Tourism Business Management**“ (Bachelor of Applied Tourism Science)

„**Tourism Business Planning**“ (Master in Applied Tourism)

and

The Diploma III Programmes (Certification Procedure)

„**Tour and Travel Operations**“

„**Hospitality**“

offered by **Politeknik Negeri Bali**, Indonesia

**Based on the report of the expert panel and the extensive discussions of the Standing Commission on 6 December 2021, the Standing Commission decides:**

1. The study programmes “**Tourism Business Management**“ (**Bachelor of Applied Tourism Science**) and “**Tourism Business Planning**“ (**Master in Applied Tourism**) offered by Politeknik Negeri Bali, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditation is conditional. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2022**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months after the online visit.

The study programmes comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version.

2. The accreditation for both programmes is given for the period of six years and is valid until **30 September 2027**.
3. The Diploma study programmes “**Tour and Travel Operations**“ (**Diploma III**) and “**Hospitality**“ (**Diploma III**) offered by Politeknik Negeri Bali, Indonesia are certified according to the AQAS Criteria for Vocational Programmes.

The certification is conditional. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2022**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months after the online visit.

The Diploma III programmes comply with the requirements defined by the AQAS Criteria in their current version.

4. The certification for both programmes is given for the period of six years and is valid until **30 September 2027**.

The following **conditions** are given:

**For all programmes:**

1. The participative approach of teaching students is in place but the concept of “student centred learning (SCL)” needs to be developed further by PNB. The approach must also be visible in the different course descriptions. It is further necessary, that PNB evaluates the effectiveness of this concept and adapts it in the future.
2. A body to appeal against exam results must be introduced.
3. PNB must establish a formalized and transparent way to transfer SKS into ECTS.

**For Bachelor**

4. Students must learn how to **apply research methodology** already at an early stage of their studies.

**For Master**

5. Because the profile is more a professional programme, **entry requirements** must be defined to serve this target.

**For Diploma III programmes:**

6. The **review process** by the Professional Advisory Board **and the applied criteria must** be clearly documented.
7. The **English proficiency standard** needs to be defined and for further qualification certified.

The conditions were fulfilled on time.

The Standing Commission confirms this with its decision of 27 February 2023.

The following **recommendations** are given for the further improvement of the programmes:

**All programmes:**

1. It is recommended to align and thereby strengthen the curricula’s content with the institutional vision of “**Green Tourism**”, e.g. by integrating more sustainability courses and/or sustainability aspects in existing courses in the programmes. These aspects should be transparently described in the course handbooks.
2. PNB should take measures to assure that students have an appropriate level of **English proficiency** at the end of their studies.
3. **Students reports** written at the end of their internship **should be standardized** and a clear methodology and structure herein should be defined, specifying the involved elements such as analytical, reflective or critical parts.
4. In order to make full use of the feedback provided by stakeholders, the results of **all kinds of feedback should be summarised and aggregated** in a short annual quality report and followed up with proper documentation on the improvements.
5. The **formal admission criteria** should cover all substantive qualities needed for the successful completion of the programmes.

6. Regulations for the **recognition of prior learning** should be implemented.
7. Staff development in regard to **new topics and trends such as digitalization or sustainability** should be supported by PNB.
8. Different kind of **courses to practice and enhance the English skills** and options to gain international experience should be offered for the teaching staff.
9. The **cooperation between staff and industry** should be strengthened, e.g. through staff 'internships' and research projects, invitations of industry speaker etc.
10. To **further strengthen internationalization** it is recommended to invite international guest lecturers and provide PNB staff opportunities for research leaves or short visiting stays at international universities.
11. The **access for staff and students to reputable journal articles** should be broadened.
12. For international stakeholders the **website should be updated** and additional information should be provided.

#### For Bachelor

13. The **structure of the curriculum** should be revised: academic writing and methodological courses should be given in an earlier semester (e.g., from 3<sup>rd</sup> semester). It could also be considered to offer the internship semester one or two semesters earlier.
14. PNB should consider to converting some of the **mandatory courses** into elective courses and offer more focus courses to deepen the knowledge in some areas, for example (marketing, financial management, front office operations, etc.).
15. More **study and internship abroad opportunities** should be provided to students and information on funding opportunities should be given.
16. PNB should consider **to rename the programme** as "Hospitality Business Management" or integrate a broader range of courses from the other areas of Tourism.
17. For BA/MA: PNB should provide more **professional development opportunities** for its staff with a focus on acquiring PhDs and international experience on research, coupled with higher quality research output.
18. Offers to **introduce the programmes to overseas students** should be implemented.

#### For Master

19. PNB should check if a '**bridging programme**' between fresh graduate and the one from industry could be developed.
20. Especially on the MA level, the **methodological approach** should be strengthened.

#### For Diploma III programmes:

21. With the umbrella "**Green Tourism**" the curriculum should follow a guideline of sustainability aspects in tourism. Regarding internalization in the industry and the market, the curriculum should provide the capability to serve international tourist and work in an international team.
22. Procedures should be introduced to **safeguard academic integrity** and prevent academic fraud.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT**

**ON THE DIPLOMA IV PROGRAMMES / BACHELOR'S AND MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAMMES (ACCREDITATION)**

- **“TOURISM BUSINESS MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR OF APPLIED TOURISM SCIENCE)**
- **“TOURISM BUSINESS PLANNING” (MASTER IN APPLIED TOURISM)**

**AND THE DIPLOMA III PROGRAMMES (CERTIFICATION)**

- **“TOUR AND TRAVEL OPERATIONS”**
- **“HOSPITALITY”**

**OFFERED BY POLITEKNIK NEGERI BALI, INDONESIA**

Online-Site-Visit of the Polytechnic: 14 - 19 October 2021

**Panel of Experts:**

<b>Prof. Dr. Rupert Holzapfel</b>	City University of Applied Sciences Bremen
<b>Prof. Dr. Dwi Suhartanto</b>	Politeknik Negeri Bandung
<b>Prof. Dr. Dagmar Lund-Durlacher</b>	HNE Eberswalde
<b>Dr. Ute Dallmeier</b>	CEO, FIRST REISEBÜRO Mönchengladbach (representative of the labour market)
<b>Katja Borowski</b>	student representative

**Coordinator:**

Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Corinna Herrmann	

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in Higher Education Institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither restrained to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of Higher Education Institution

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor's degree programme in Tourism Business Management, the applied Master's degree programme in Tourism Business Planning, as well as the Diploma III programmes in Tour and Travel Operations and Hospitality offered by Politeknik Negeri Bali (PNB).

### 1. Criteria

The BA/MA programmes are assessed against a set of criteria for programme accreditation developed by AQAS. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled, this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of the programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to each programme. In case of success, an accreditation certificate is given, showing that the academic programmes fulfil the ESG.

Both Diploma III programmes are assessed against a set of criteria developed by AQAS which include some elements of the ESG but reflect on the specifics of vocational programmes (VET). According to a decision of the Standing Commission an AQAS-Certificate can be given to programmes which correspond to Level 5 of the European Qualification Framework (EQF).

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *The initialisation*

PNB mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in January 2021.

PNB produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In May 2021, the Politeknik handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation of the study programmes and the Diploma III programmes as well as an extended appendix.



The appendix included e.g.:

- Overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. graduates per study programme, average GPA per programme, number of collaborations with international/industry/private/public partners, expenditure development, etc.)
- CVs of the teaching staff
- Curriculum structure
- Course network
- Workload assessment
- Examination regulations
- Diploma supplement
- Curriculum tools and module descriptions
- Academic guidebook of the department and PNB 2016-2020
- and others

AQAS has checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility and transparency. The final version of the SER was handed in September 2021.

The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 30 August 2021.

#### *The nomination of the panel of expert*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline/s, the labour market and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows principles for the selection of experts of the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA).

The Standing Commission nominated in August 2021 the before mentioned expert panel. AQAS informed PNB about the members of the expert panel and it did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *The preparation of the online site visit*

Prior to the online site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to PNB and to the panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the online site visit.

#### *The online site visit*

After a review of the Self Evaluation Report, an online site visit to PNB took place online from 14 - 19 October 2021. The experts interviewed different stakeholders of all four programmes, e.g. the management of the HEI, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates and representatives of the labour market. In separate discussions and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The online site visit concluded with the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to PNB's representatives.

#### *The report writing*

After the online site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS criteria for the programme accreditation. The report included a recommendation to the Standing Commission. The report was sent to PNB for comments.

*The decision*

The report, together with the comments of the department, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to make a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes on one hand and the certification of the two Diploma III programmes on the other hand. Based on these two documents, on 06 December 2021 the Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation respective the certification. AQAS forwarded the decision to PNB. PNB had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General Information on the Politeknik

---

Polytechnic Education was first established in 1976 based on a collaboration between the Institut Teknologi Bandung (ITB) and the Swiss government. In 1984, the Indonesian government developed Polytechnics throughout Indonesia, one of which was the Polytechnic of Udayana University. It was officially declared to be independent under the name Politeknik Negeri Bali (PNB) or Bali State Polytechnic (BSP) in 1997. The Polytechnic Education programme is a vocational education pathway, meaning it offers students Diploma study programmes as well as Bachelor and Master study programmes. Until April 2021 the PNB has six departments with 19 study programmes, including nine Diploma III study programmes, nine Diploma IV (Applied Bachelor's) study programmes and one applied Master's programme. The departments are civil engineering, mechanical engineering, electrical engineering, accounting, business administration and tourism.

The PNB has named three strategic objectives that are part of its Development Master Plan (2011-2025): To become a center for applied science and technology education and training based on excellence in the tourism sector (Center of Excellence in Tourism Technology); to produce graduates who have professional abilities and have international competitiveness in the field of applied science and technology in an effort to create qualified, skilled, intelligent human resources with strong national characteristics; and to act as a center for innovation studies and application of applied technology that focuses on the tourism sector and contributes to the improvement of community welfare, environmental and cultural preservation, and sustainable development. Apart from the Development Master Plan, the PNB has also set up a 2020-2024 Strategic Plan, based on the latest environmental change analysis, that evaluates the performance achievements in the previous five years (2015-2019), and refers to the strategic objectives of the vocational education programme formulated in the strategic plan of the Ministry of Education and Culture 2020-2024.

The PNB underlines the importance of Green Tourism in its study programmes. Green Tourism means that all study programmes have to apply local principles that are based on sustainability, traditional social-cultural heritage and conserving natural resources. The principles have to be integrated in the day-to-day operation on the campus and in research done by faculties and students in a holistic sense, also covering green services, green infrastructure, green energy and green supply chain. The concept aims at elevating awareness of internal and external stakeholders to preserve Bali as a small island tourist destination.

The PNB Tourism Department currently organizes four study programmes, namely Tour and Travel Operations (Diploma III), Hospitality (Diploma III), Tourism Business Management (Bachelor's Programme), and Tourism Business Planning (Applied Master's Programme). The department aims at pursuing the vision to become a center for superior vocational education in the field of tourism that is innovative, adaptive, and has international competitiveness by 2025.

## Experts' Evaluation

There is a strategic goal of the Politeknik for internationalisation of its study programmes to provide more exchange opportunities for PNB students as well as attracting international students. So far, there are a few exchange programmes with international universities established which seem to work well but with only a limited number of students. There is also the possibility for internships abroad. It should be considered by the management of PNB to develop a roadmap to internationalisation for its academic programmes and to set a budget for it. Also a strategy to attract international students should be developed. Credit transfers between exchange partners are done.

## IV. Assessment of the study programmes

### 1. Quality of the Curriculum of the Bachelor's and Master's Programmes:

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field.*

*The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

## Description

The structure and content of all four study programmes curricula at Politeknik Negeri Bali (PNB)/Bali State Polytechnic (BSP) are based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and contain the four elements attitude formation (MPS courses), mastery of knowledge (MPP courses), specific skills (MKK courses) and general skills (MKU courses). The learning outcomes are formulated within these four pillars and are supposed to match the differing degrees. Respectively, the SER states that the depth of the curriculum structure and content is adjusted according to the provisions of the Diploma III, Bachelor's and Master's programmes. Specific learning outcomes are also stated on the Semester Learning Plan for each course.

### 1.1 Tourism Business Management (TBM) (Bachelor's Degree/Diploma IV)

#### *Study Programme Objectives*

The SER presents intended learning outcomes of the study programme, which contain the four elements of attitude, mastery of knowledge, general skills and specific skills. All four elements are split up into sub targets that are presented as learning outcomes. While the element of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the element of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example the mastery of knowledge in the following fields: Operations, Human Resources, Marketing, Finance, as well as mastering communication techniques or the latest information technology. The element of general skills contains learning outcomes that are generally gained in this line of study such as to be able to apply critical thinking in carrying out specific types of work in the hospitality sector with quality and quantity that can be measured by competency standards in the hospitality sector, as well as to manage to learn independently and more. The pillar of specific skills consequently is more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example to be able to optimize hotel revenue and profits through the application of the yield management concept that

is adjusted according to the characteristics of the hotel, as well as to be able to communicate in a professional manner, both oral and written, using Indonesian, English and one other foreign language (e.g. Japanese and Chinese).

The graduates' qualifications should be tailored to the needs of the industry and workplace that the student will pursue after completing the studies. Professions of graduates can be Human Resources Manager, Chief Accounting Manager, Sales & Marketing Manager, and Executive Housekeeper, Food & Beverage Manager, Bar Manager, Front Office Manager, and Restaurant Manager, MICE organizer, entrepreneur, and researcher.

According to the SER the learning outcomes of the study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board (PAB). The curriculum is evaluated periodically every four to five years through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, industry, academia, media, and society).

As stated in the SER, curriculum evaluation is carried out by considering the suitability of graduate competencies with user needs, the suitability of science and technology developments, and changes in regulations in the higher education sector. Curriculum evaluation is followed by a revision of learning tools, namely the Semester Learning Plan, Module, Lesson Plan, Activity Control, and Class Covenant.

#### *Curricular Elements and Programme Quality*

The curriculum of the Tourism Business Management study programme consists of 47 courses, of which 34 are theoretical and 13 practical courses. An idealized typical course plan is available. The course structure is built on the four mentioned elements that also make up the basis for the learning outcomes. MPS courses (attitude development) contain topics like "Pancasila", "Indonesian Language", "Business Relation & Law of Business" as well as others, with a total of five courses. MPP courses (Mastery of Knowledge) contain topics like "English for Tourism", "Information and Technology", "Management Introduction" as well as others, with a total of 14 courses. MKK courses (specific skills) contain topics like "Front Office Operations", "Room division Management", "Food and Beverage Management", as well as others, with a total of eleven courses. MKU courses (general skills) contain topics like "Applied Basic Computer" and "Financial Management" but also an internship programme for three to six months in the seventh semester as well as a thesis and Student's Society Service in the final semester, which means a total of 17 courses. 98 theoretical credits (equal to 167 ECTS) and 47 practical credits (equal to 80 ECTS) are given by completion of the study programme. This also means that 39 percent of the study programme consists of theoretical hours and of 61 percent practical hours. To complete their education the students must gain a total of 145 (equal to 247 ECTS) credits stretched over eight semesters.

#### **Experts' Evaluation**

##### *Study programme objectives*

Graduate profiles and competencies as well as learning outcomes are clearly described in the Academic Handbook and Study Regulations. There is a strong focus on hospitality management and operations qualifications (subject specific), but also interdisciplinary courses such as Mathematics for Business or Research Methodology are integrated.

The PNB is considered to be a strong brand for vocational tourism education with strong ties to the tourism industry and excellent learning facilities. All courses, including the language courses, which are listed in the curriculum, are mandatory. Industry representatives request a stronger focus on sustainability related and digitalization topics as these are knowledge and skills needed for the future.

Curriculum revisions are done periodically every four to five years. The last curriculum revision was done in 2017. The revisions are taking place with strong participation of all relevant stakeholders. There are several

instruments in place to engage stakeholders such as the alumni tracer studies, focus group discussions, or an industry advisory board. Finally, the changes in the curriculum have to be approved by the government. Overall, the curriculum is updated according to the industry's needs on a regular basis. It seems that current research findings play a minor role in the curriculum revisions.

The focus of the programme is an applied one and the profile of a Bachelor graduate is located between level 5 and 6 of the European Qualification Framework (EQF). Subjects such as Financial Management, Business Law, Organizational Behaviour and Entrepreneurship would be expected to be better represented in a Tourism Business Management programme. However, the achievement of the level of qualification is demonstrated by a final thesis and exam, both of which also prove a scientific approach of the programme. Random examinations of several Bachelor theses revealed a good scientific level of these (e.g., sound statistical analyses using statistical software such as SPSS). While it is laudable that theses and faculty research are published in an own journal, it would be beneficial to expose these research findings to a national and international readership. In particular research of professors needs to be exposed to the international scientific community by conference presentations or publications in international journals.

The programme intends to attract international students and to embrace internationality. In this matter, PNB should discuss if the title "Tourism Business Management" may be irritating for potential incoming exchange students, since a large majority of courses focusses on the hospitality sector but lack other tourism industries, such as Destination Management or Tour Operation.

#### *Curricular Elements and Programme Quality*

All curricular elements (courses/modules) and their functions are well documented in several documents such as the Lesson Plan, Semester Learning Plan, Module Handbook. The vocational nature of the curriculum meets the industry needs but not the academic demand of a business management programme. Courses such as English for F&B, English for.... are to be found rather in vocational high schools. Courses focusing on the management disciplines are short. There is an idealized typical course plan available. However, in regard to the structure of the curriculum, academic writing and methodological skills are only introduced in the 6<sup>th</sup> semester but should be introduced earlier (from semester 3 onwards) as they are needed in all academic courses. All courses including language courses are compulsory which leaves little room for specialization. The curriculum covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge, as well as subject-related, methodological, and general skills. This is documented on the level of the intended learning outcomes. It is not transparently described which courses are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes. However, in the interview it was reported that some hospitality courses are jointly offered to Diploma III Hospitality Management students and Diploma IV TBM students.

The panel of experts were informed that there is an English proficiency test on the national level for politechnics. PNB should check if this test fulfils its needs regarding the competencies needed in tourism or if additional requirement should be formulated.

Specific elements of the programme, such as blended-learning, internships, thesis, etc. are specified. All elements of the curriculum are assigned a certain number of credits directly related to the expected workload. The total programme workload is allocated to the different courses.

The Politeknik declares to have a focus on green economy, which is not sufficiently reflected in the curriculum design of the TBM programme. The panel of experts recommends PNB to define a concept of sustainability and to specify what "green tourism" means for PNB. During the online visit the teaching staff explained how "green tourism" is included in different courses but on the basis of the course descriptions there are hardly any sustainability or 'green' courses integrated. Therefore, more information needs to be provided on the level of the Intended Learning Outcomes and in the descriptions of the content. On the basis of the information which

was provided to the panel of experts, it was not possible to get a clear picture, if the teaching staff is sufficiently qualified to teach sustainability aspects in the courses. However, university operations try to comply with this strategic focus by heading towards IT-based operations and developing a paperless administration.

### Findings I:

1. The **structure of the curriculum** should be revised: academic writing and methodological courses should be given in an earlier semester (e.g., from 3<sup>rd</sup> semester). It could also be considered to offer the internship semester one or two semesters earlier.
2. PNB should consider to converting some of the **mandatory courses into elective courses** and offer more focus courses to deepen the knowledge in some areas (for example marketing, financial management, front office operations, etc.).
3. Students must learn how to **apply research methodology** already at an early stage of their studies.
4. PNB should take measures to assure that students have an **appropriate level of English proficiency** at the end of their studies.
5. Integrate **more sustainability courses** and/or sustainability aspects in existing courses and describe these aspects transparently in the course handbook.
6. More study and **internship abroad opportunities** should be provided to students and information on funding opportunities should be given.
7. The PNB should either **consider to rename the programme** with a title more referring to the Hospitality industry (e.g. Hospitality Business Management) or to adjust its contents.

### Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

#### 1.2 Tourism Business Planning (Applied Master's Programme)

##### *Study Programme Objectives*

The SER presents intended learning outcomes of the study programme, which are based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and contain the four elements of attitude, mastery of knowledge, general skills and specific skills. All four elements are split into sub targets that are presented as learning outcomes. While the element of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the element of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering applied theory by conducting analysis, interpretation, synthesis, as well as integration of theory and innovation in strategic tourism planning and development in the fields of hospitality, travel, destinations and events as well as mastering the application of research methodology in tourism.

The element of general skills contains learning outcomes that are generally gained in this line of study such in order to be able to develop logical, critical, systematic, and creative thinking through scientific research and to be able to make sound decisions in the context of problem solving in the development of science and technology, that pay attention to and apply humanities values based on analytical or experimental studies of information as well as others. The pillar of specific skills consequently is more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example to have the ability to be innovative in planning and developing green tourism in the fields of hospitality, travel, destinations, and events, as well as abilities in the domain of green tourism and others.



The graduates' qualifications should be tailored to the needs of the industry and workplace that the student will pursue after completing the studies. According to the SER, professional careers of graduates can culminate in senior management positions in the tourism and hospitality industry sectors; academic and/or research positions in applied tourism science as well as entrepreneurial activities and administrative positions.

PNB describes that learning outcomes of the study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board (PAB). The curriculum is evaluated periodically every four to five years through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, industry, academic, media, and society).

As stated in the SER, curriculum evaluation is carried out by considering the suitability of graduate competencies with user needs, the suitability of science and technology developments and changes in regulations in the higher education sector. Curriculum evaluation is followed by a revision of learning tools (RPS and Module).

### *Curricular Elements and Programme Quality*

The curriculum of the applied Master's programme on Tourism Business Planning consists of 18 courses, with 10 of them focusing on theory and 8 rather practical courses. An idealized typical course plan is available. The course structure contains ten MPP courses (Mastery of Knowledge) with topics like "Tourism Business Planning and Development", "Green Tourism Paradigm", "Quality Management in Tourism Business" as well as others. There are three MKK courses (specific skills), namely "Applied Analysis on Green Tourism Planning", "Green Tourism Regulation Strategy" and "Development of Leadership and Professions in Tourism". MKU courses (general skills) make up five courses, namely the "Green Tourism Business Project" and the "Tourism Scientific Applied Writing and International Seminar" but also an internship in the third semester as well as a thesis proposal seminar and the thesis itself in the final semester. 22 theoretical credits (equal to 38 ECTS) and 22 practical credits (equal to 37 ECTS) are awarded with the completion of the study programme. According to the SER, one third of the study programme has a focus on theory and two thirds focus on practice or applied theory respectively. To complete their education, students must gain a total of 44 (equal to 75 ECTS) credits over four semesters.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

It is the experts' opinion that the applied Master's programme on Tourism Business Planning in its current form possesses a unique selling proposition as a professional programme similar to professional MBA programmes in the disciplines of tourism and hospitality. With regards to the study programme's objectives, one recommendation would hence be to focus on the respective target market segment, i.e. professionals with adequate work experience and an appropriate level of English language skills, assessed and certified in an internationally recognized language proficiency test, rather than enrolling young and inexperienced Bachelor's graduates as well as seasoned professionals in the field. In any case, competency and entry level criteria in general, should be established and defined more clearly.

In order to match the requirements of this Master's programme with the European Qualifications Framework, it is recommended to strengthen the curriculum in terms of learning content and outcomes with regards to scientific research methodology and methods.

One unique selling proposition and prospective competitive advantage of the Politeknik as a whole, is its institutional focus on Green Tourism. However, the potential of such a strategic marketing decision on image, positioning and branding is not really reflected in the curricular elements of this particular study programme and it is hence recommended to align and thereby strengthen the curriculum's content with the institutional vision of a green economy.

In summary, the experts find it essential to clearly distinguish between a genuine academic Master's study programme on the one hand and an MBA programme with a more practical focus on the other hand. If the

Politeknik wants to create a new type of “hybrid” study programme, such as the applied Master’s programme proposes, it needs to implement and achieve a higher level of theoretical and scientific research expertise in its curriculum. In conclusion, the criteria with regards to curricular elements and programme quality are only partially fulfilled and the recommendation would thus be to either rename the programme into an MBA programme or restructure the curriculum accordingly.

### Findings II:

1. Because the profile is more a professional programme (like a professional MBA), **entry requirements** must be defined to serve this target group (competency criteria like the level of work experience, or English competency, need to be defined).
2. PNB should check if a **‘bridging programme’** between fresh graduate and the one from industry could be developed.
3. The **methodological approach** should be strengthened (focus on applied research).
4. It is recommended to align and thereby **strengthen the curriculum’s content** with the institutional vision of “Green Tourism”.

### Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

## 2. Quality of the Curriculum of the Diploma III Programmes:

*The intended learning outcomes are clearly defined and communicated. They include subject-specific and interdisciplinary aspects, and cover labour market requirements.*

*The curriculum supports achievement of the previously defined learning outcomes.*

*Diploma holders’ skills correspond to the appropriate level of the relevant national qualifications framework or of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).*

*The training schedule is transparently described.*

### Description

The structure and content of all four study programmes curricula are based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and contain the four elements attitude formation (MPS courses), mastery of knowledge (MPP courses), specific skills (MKK courses) and general skills (MKU courses). The learning outcomes are formulated within these four pillars and are supposed to match the differing degrees. Respectively, the SER states that the depth of the curriculum structure and content is adjusted according to the provisions of the Diploma III, bachelor and master programmes. Specific learning outcomes are also stated on the Semester Learning Plan for each course.

#### 2.1 Tour and Travel Operations Study Program (Diploma III)

##### *Study Programme Objectives*

The SER presents intended learning outcomes of the study programme, which are based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and contain the four elements of attitude, mastery of knowledge, general skills and specific skills. All four elements are split up into sub targets that are presented as learning outcomes.



While the element of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the element of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering theoretical concepts of World Geography, principles and techniques of communication in English and other foreign languages, and concepts about administrative matters as bookkeeping and organizational matters, as well as others. The element of general skills contains learning outcomes that are generally gained in this line of study such as applying logical, critical, innovative, quality and measurable thinking, as well as to be able to maintain and develop cooperation networks and more. The pillar of specific skills consequently is more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example to be able to communicate effectively in organizing tourism travel business products and services, to be able to apply the latest and accurate information systems and technology related to the travel business.

The graduates' qualifications should be tailored to the needs of the industry and workplace that the student will pursue after completing the studies. Professions of graduates can be Travel Supervisor, Product Designer, Tour Leader, Tour Guide, Sales and Marketing Supervisor, Ticketing Supervisor, Reservation Supervisor, Travel Consultant, Mice and Event Organizer, and Flight Division Supervisor.

According to the SER the learning outcomes of the study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board (PAB). The curriculum is evaluated periodically every four to five years through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, industry, academic, media, and society).

As stated in the SER, curriculum evaluation is carried out by considering the suitability of graduate competencies with user needs, the suitability of science and technology developments, and changes in regulations in the higher education sector. Curriculum evaluation is followed by revision of learning tools, namely Semester Learning Plan (RPS), Module, Lesson Plan (SAP), Activity Control (SAP Control), and Class Covenant (KP).

#### *Curricular Elements and Programme Quality*

The curriculum of the *Tour and Travel Operations study programme* consists of 47 courses, of which 21 are theoretical and 26 practical courses. An idealized typical course plan is available. The course structure is built on the four mentioned elements that also make up the basis for the learning outcomes. MPS courses (attitude development) contain topics like "Pancasila", "Indonesian", "Professional Ethics" as well as others, with a total of five courses. MPP courses (Mastery of Knowledge) contain topics like "Tourism introduction", "World Aviation Geography", "Management Introduction" as well as others, with a total of eleven courses. MKK courses (specific skills) contain topics like "Outbound Tour operation", "Travel Office Practice", "English for Tourism & Event", as well as others, with a total of 19 courses. MKU courses (general skills) contain topics like "Travel Accounting" and "Database Processing" but also an internship programme for three to six months as well as a final project in the final semester, which means a total of twelve courses. 48 theoretical credits (equal to 72 ECTS) and 66 practical credits (equal to 100 ECTS) are given by completion of the study programme. This also means that 42 percent of the study programme consists of theoretical hours and of 58 percent practical hours. To complete their education the students must gain a total of 114 (equal to 172 ECTS) credits stretched over six semesters.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

#### *Qualification and learning outcomes*

The learning outcomes of the Tour and Travel Operations Study Programm (Diploma III) are developed based on the Indonesian Regulations and Framework. Desired qualifications to be achieved from the vocational programme are well formulated and documented as learning outcomes. They are basically subject-specific and

interdisciplinary and thus relevant for preparing students for the national tourism industry labour market. The learning outcomes of the Tour and Travel Operations Study Program are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board. The curriculum is evaluated periodically, every four to five years, through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, national industry, academic). The achievements of the intended level of qualification can be demonstrated by a final examination where applicable. The graduates qualifications are tailored to the national industry and workplace needs in national context. The international perspective, especially regarding the new challenges due to the worldwide pandemic, is still not in focus. This might be a disadvantage for an international career in the tourist industry. The title of the qualifications is yet appropriate.

#### *Quality of the curriculum*

The curriculum of the Diploma III Tour and Travel Study Program consists of 47 courses; 21 are theoretical and 26 practical and its structure is suitable for achieving the learning expected of diploma III with a strong practical focus. The curriculum is detailed and well-documented and there is an idealized typical course plan available. The curricular elements are all compulsory and not elective. Considering the diversity of student backgrounds on the one side and the advancing specialization, digitization and internationalization of the tourism industry, several elective subjects need to be adopted in the curriculum. Regarding the umbrella of “Green Tourism” and the worldwide travel trends to sustainability this approach should take more place in the theoretical part of the curriculum.

The learning outcomes of the Tour and Travel Study Program are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board. However, the document of the reviewing process is not well presented. The curriculum was last changed in October 2020. While the teaching process has changed to online during the pandemic, no information is available on how the curriculum has been adjusted, especially regarding the practical courses.

The basic language in international tourism is English and some of the subjects are taught in English. Stating that English proficiency standard is an important qualification for the industry, there should be an entrance test and optional an internationally recognized certificate (e.g Cambridge Certificate of Proficiency in English) to qualify the students for the international tourist industry.

#### *Course manual*

The course manual for the Diploma III Tour and Travel Study Program is available and relatively well-prepared.

#### **Findings III:**

1. With the umbrella “**Green Tourism**” the curriculum should follow a guideline of sustainability aspects in tourism. Regarding internationalization in the industry and the market, the curriculum should provide the capability to serve international tourist and work in an international team.
2. The **review process** by the Professional Advisory Board **and the applied criteria must** be clearly documented.
3. The **English proficiency standard** needs to be defined and for further qualification certified.

#### **Conclusion**

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

### 2. 2 Hospitality Study Programme (Diploma III)

#### *Study Programme Objectives*

The SER presents intended learning outcomes of the study programme, which are based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and contain the four elements of attitude, mastery of knowledge, general skills and specific skills. All four elements are split up into sub targets that are presented as learning outcomes. While the element of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the element of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering general theoretical concepts about environmental health and tourism science, Persuasive communication principles and techniques in marketing hotel products, and knowledge within hospitality fields, like baking and pastry, as well as others. The element of general skills contains learning outcomes that are generally gained in this line of study such to be able to cooperate, communicate and be innovative in their work, as well as to demonstrate quality and measurable performance and more. The pillar of specific skills consequently is more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example to be able to complete wide-scope work and analyse data with a variety of suitable methods and able to promote hotel products, including food, beverages, and rooms, as well as others.

The graduates' qualifications should be tailored to the needs of the industry and workplace that the student will pursue after completing the studies. Professions of graduates can be Front Office Supervisor, Floor Supervisor, Commis Chef, Head Waiter, and Entrepreneur.

According to the SER the learning outcomes of the Hospitality study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board (PAB). The curriculum is evaluated periodically every four to five years through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, industry, academic, media, and society).

As stated in the SER, curriculum evaluation is carried out by considering the suitability of graduate competencies with user needs, the suitability of science and technology developments, and changes in regulations in the higher education sector. Curriculum evaluation is followed by revision of learning tools, namely Semester Learning Plan (RPS), Module, Lesson Plan (SAP), Activity Control (SAP Control), and Class Covenant (KP).

#### *Curricular Elements and Programme Quality*

The curriculum of the hospitality study programme consists of 42 courses, of which 24 are theoretical and 18 practical courses. An idealized typical course plan is available. The course structure is built on the four mentioned elements that also make up the basis for the learning outcomes. MPS courses (attitude development) contain topics like "Pancasila", "Indonesian Language", "Occupational Health and Safety" as well as others, with a total of six courses. MPP courses (Mastery of Knowledge) contain topics like "Management Introduction", "Tourism Introduction", "Hotel and restaurant Introduction" as well as others, with a total of five courses. MKK courses (specific skills) contain topics like "reservation", "Pastry & Bakery", "Basic English for hotel operation", as well as others, with a total of 20 courses. MKU courses (general skills) contain topics like "Hotel Supervision Techniques" and "Customer Relation and Sale" but also an internship programme for three to six months as well a final project in the final semester, which means a total of eleven courses. 62 theoretical credits (equal to 94 ECTS) and 51 practical credits (equal to 77 ECTS) are given by completion of the study programme. This also means that 39 percent of the study programme consists of theoretical hours and of 61 percent practical hours. To complete their education the students must gain a total of 113 (equal to 171 ECTS) credits stretched over six semesters.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

#### *Qualification and learning outcomes*

The learning outcomes of the DIII Hospitality programme are developed based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework. Desired qualifications to be achieved from the vocational programme are well formulated and documented as learning outcomes. They are basically subject-specific and interdisciplinary and

thus relevant for preparing students for the industry. The learning outcomes of the Hospitality study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board. The curriculum is evaluated periodically, every four to five years, through an evaluation process involving stakeholders (government, industry, academic, media, and society). Thus, the graduates' qualifications are relatively tailored to the industry and workplace needs.

#### *Quality of the curriculum*

The curriculum of the Diploma III Hospitality consists of 42 courses; 24 are theoretical and 18 practical, and its structure is suitable for achieving the learning expected of diploma III. The curriculum is also well-documented and the course structure is built on the elements that also make up the basis of the learning outcomes for the hospitality operators. The elements of courses are also clearly informed and contain the delivery process either in the class, laboratory, and industry. Although all curricular elements are documented, the curriculum elements are compulsory and no electives. This is due to the "package" system used in Polytechnic. However, considering the diversity of student interests and jobs available, several elective subjects (which are in line with MBKM programme national policy), need to be adopted in the curriculum.

Next, the learning outcomes of the Hospitality study programme are reviewed and validated by the Professional Advisory Board. However, the document of the reviewing process is not well presented. The curriculum was last changed in October 2020. While the teaching process has changed to online during the pandemic, no information is available on how the curriculum is adjusted to catch up with this environmental change.

Lastly, while English subject is available in many semesters and some of the subjects are delivered in English, no English proficiency standard for graduates is stated. Stating the English proficiency standard is important as the graduates will work in the tourism market where tourists come from not only domestic but also overseas.

#### *Course manual*

The course manual for the DIII Hospitality programme is available and relatively well-prepared.

#### **Findings IV:**

1. With the umbrella "**Green Tourism**" the curriculum should follow a guideline of sustainability aspects in tourism. Regarding **internalisation** in the industry and the market, the curriculum should provide the capability to serve international tourist and work in an international team..
2. The **review process** by the Professional Advisory Board **and the applied criteria must** be clearly documented.
3. The **English proficiency standard** needs to be defined and for further qualification certified.

#### **Conclusion**

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

### **3. Procedures for Quality Assurance**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

*[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

## **Description**

The SER illustrates that on an institutional level the Center for Learning Development and Education has the task to monitor and evaluate academic activities in the study programmes according to the Internal Quality Assurance System standards that the center has formulated. On the department level, the Center for Learning Development and Education is represented by a Department Quality Assurance Team. This team establishes a mechanism and carries out evaluation of the learning process by compiling a questionnaire containing student input at the end of every semester. An internal quality audit is carried out once in one cycle of the Internal Quality Assurance system. Improvement of quality is gained through following the stages of setting, implementing, evaluating, controlling and improving standards (PPEPP). The scope of the internal quality audits covers students, graduates, human resources, curriculum and learning, facilities and infrastructure and research and community service. In addition, the Department's Quality Assurance Team also has the task of preparing study programmes to apply for accreditation and/ or re-accreditation. The SER reports on the findings of the internal quality audit at the Tourism Department in 2019. Examples of the audit include the lack of international cooperation in the Tour and Travel Operations Study Program that has been addressed through the establishment of a cooperation with RMUTP Bangkok Thailand and Hsing WU University Taiwan (sample activity). Other results of the self-analysis are listed in the SER.

The SER also mentions the evaluation on the study programme level in the Tourism Department that aims at (1) identifying obstacles in programme implementation; (2) making programme implementation more efficient; (3) ensuring the sustainability of the programme in the following years. According to the SER, quality assurance measurements on a study programme level include reviewing the curriculum regularly. The curriculum evaluation involves also stakeholders like the industry and alumni. The alumni are part of tracing studies to determine the suitability of graduates' competencies in their field of work, the length of time required for graduates to get their first job as well as the amount of the first salary. This is used as a basis for revising courses according to the needs of the Industrial and Business World (DUDI).

According to the SER the results of monitoring and evaluation from the Internal Quality Audit and curriculum evaluation are discussed regularly which results in input and recommendations for the development of the study programmes. The Indonesian National Qualifications Framework-based curriculum evaluation was carried out starting in 2014, then adapted to the Indonesian National Work Competency Standards (SKKNI), ASEAN Common Competency Standard for Tourism Professional (ACCSTP), and Standard National Higher Education (SNPT) as an effort to improve the quality of learning.

Furthermore, evaluation of lecturers is carried out by students at the end of each semester by filling out forms in the PNB online system to address the learning process that has taken place for each course. Assessment of the quality of the service given by the administrative staff as well as assessments to follow student's progression by learning control activities are also named as mechanism to improve the quality of learning.

## **Experts' Evaluation**

The SER outlines the PNB quality assurance system in a comprehensive manner including targets and responsibilities. The school's management assigns top priority to the QA system because it is considered as a means to improve the teaching and learning process and also necessary to achieve the goals for internationalisation. However, the SWOT analysis presented in the SER, mentions the Quality Assurance System as a

weakness which should be improved. In the discussions during the online visit it was mentioned that QA is still in an improvement process in order to meet international quality standards.

Responsibilities within the programme and for programme elements are clearly defined and available to students through the Academic Guidebook of the Tourism Department.

There is a policy of evaluation and quality improvement in place with the Academic Quality Assurance Unit (UPMA) which oversees the departmental Quality Assurance Unit for the tourism programmes. All important stakeholders are included to provide feedback on the development of the study programmes. Feedback loops are organized through meetings both on individual or group level.

QA instruments such as course and programme evaluations, evaluations of student workload, progression & completion evaluations, evaluations of changing societal and industry needs are monitored regularly. Each semester, course evaluations are conducted online on the SION system. In order to see their course grades, students need to fill in the course evaluations. It is not clear if the anonymity of students is ensured in these evaluations because they have to register to this system with their username.

The evaluation results of the course surveys are shared with the teaching staff. The head of the programme discusses the evaluation results as well as suggestions for improvements with the lecturer.

Students are not informed about the survey results. Students get the opportunity to discuss their experiences and problems with an assigned student advisor who supports the student throughout the study programme. The student advisor plays a central role for students' concerns and problems. This is a very personal though rather subjective support mechanism.

There is also a student body elected each year to act as student representative. If they receive student complaints or feedback, they may contact the head of the study programme, possibly followed by the head of department and vice rector of academic affairs. The role of the student representative body is central for complaint handling and feedback of students to assure an objective treatment of the feedback.

Quality Assurance for the tourism programmes is located at the department level which means that findings are discussed and followed up by the Tourism Department. The head of department plays a central role in the feedback loop and shares the evaluation results within the department (also via a whatsapp group of the department). The department head and the head of the study programme are responsible to follow up with quality issues. Findings of the internal quality audit for the Study Programs at the Tourism Department in 2019 and the subsequent improvements are illustrated in the SER.

Alumni also play an important role in quality assurance. They are on stand-by for feedback in regard to latest developments in the industry. There is also an annual conference organized to provide feedback from the alumni and industry. In general, the collaboration between lecturers and the industry is considered as very beneficial to update and improve curriculum and lecturing standards. Also, there are tracer studies in place and feedback through alumni seems to be working well.

#### *Information Management*

The SER provides information on the composition of the student body. Over the past 5 years there was a good gender balance. The resign and drop-out rates in the study programmes are documented and between 0% and maximum 10% in the past three years. The reasons for resigning or drop-out of the programmes are not documented.



**Findings V:**

1. There is a **lack of formal documentation of the feedback** provided. In order to make full use of the feedback provided, the results of all kinds of feedback should be collected, aggregated and provided in a written form. In particular, individual feedback given by students to student advisors should be documented and be accessible for further improvements.
2. The results and findings of all quality instruments in place (feedback to student advisor, stakeholder meetings, alumni tracer studies, etc.) should be summarised **in a short annual quality report** and followed up with proper documentation on the improvements.

**Conclusion**

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

**4. Learning, Teaching and Assessment of Students**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process. Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently. Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*  
[ESG 1.3]

**Description**

According to the SER, PNB ensures that Semester Learning Plans are handed out at a first meeting which contain the competencies expected per meeting, topic, and subtopic, learning method, assessment indicator and method, and weight score. Lecturers prepare appropriate learning materials using also digital means in form of e-learning, google classroom, google meet and zoom. The aim is to foster student creativity. Forms of learning can be lectures, responses and tutorials, seminars and practicum and field practice. Research and community service is added as a form of learning in the bachelor and master programme. An interactive, holistic, integrative, scientific, contextual, thematic, effective and collaborative learning process is pursued according to the PNB and shall be achieved through Student Centered Learning (SCL). The SER states what aspects the SCL includes at PNB, such as students learn not only from lectures but can use various methods and activities. Learning methods that are implemented at PNB include small group discussion, role-play & simulation and various others. The SER states that these can be adjusted to the course, taken into account the various backgrounds students may have when starting their study programme.

There are several possibilities to track students' progressions, such as learning control activities. It is made sure that a student who does not attend a certain number of meetings, will receive warnings or sanctions.

The total number of course meetings in one semester is a minimum of 16 meetings (including middle test and final exam) per course.

The various course types that are based on the elements on attitude, mastery of knowledge, general skill and specific skill are mixed throughout the semesters. Usually, the student can obtain two to three credits for the completion of a course. The final projects or the thesis are usually completed by gaining six credits. Two examinations per course are carried out, one mid-semester and one at the end of the semester. According to the SER the type and method of evaluation is adjusted to the nature of the course. Students are obliged to take all the exams that are held and if the person concerned is sick or unable to attend, the lecturer who

teaches the subject being tested must give a follow-up exam. Students have the right to receive test results back as feedback on the relevant learning process. Apart from those two exams there is the possibility of daily assessments, practical exams and assignments. The SER states that if a student scores below standard after taking into account the above-mentioned ways of learning assessments, the lecturer who teaches the course provides a remedial test which is allocated for a week after the final semester exam. Assessment of student learning success is given in letter grades (A-E) and value indexes. Overall, the student's success in learning can be seen from the student's semester grade point index (IPS). Guidelines for student learning assessment are determined by the PNB in accordance with the Academic Guidebook.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

The PNB uses different and diverse methods for teaching and learning. The concept "Student centred learning (SCL)" is in place and considers the students' diversity. Methods used for the implementation of this concept mentioned during the onsite visit were such as role plays, small group discussions, smart board presentations and quizzes, according to the university's goal to produce students demonstrating creativity, independence and critical thinking. The approach further includes problem-based learning and pragmatism based learning. However, the concept of student-centred learning is neither standardized and related to the different modules, nor mentioned in the different module descriptions. Further, there is no evaluation yet on how effective this method of teaching has proven to be, used to develop the approach in the future.

Other methods of teaching, mentioned by the PNB during the onsite visit included the presentation of social work students must do ("community service"). Further, there are teaching approaches in cooperation with the industry, herein the example of wine production has been mentioned. These methods constitute valuable approaches of the university to apply knowledge and skills. The vocational approach connects theory and practice and enables students to implement their knowledge outside the university. The PNB also invites guest lecturers, in particular alumni to offer students insights into the industry. For the vocational programmes, various specific facilities are dedicated to the teaching of job-related skills in an environment simulating the future workplace in a realistic way. PNB students interviewed during the onsite visit demonstrated a high motivation and satisfaction with the learning process.

PNB uses different types of exams over the course of programme, such as essays or multiple-choice tests, as well as mock-up practice. The assessment regulations and procedures are defined and made readily available in published form to students and requirements for the examinations are transparent.

The responsibilities and structures related to the organisation of exams are clearly defined as well as responsibilities to support students when writing their thesis.

Research methodology required to enable students to conduct research and for scientific writing is being taught, but at a very late stage of the studies. According to the PNB, the methodology subject is not related to assignments during the semester, but only to the final thesis and internship report. In this matter, a lack of standardization of the reports students must write at the end of their internship has been identified, meaning that there is no methodology in place, defining if reports have to contain analytical, reflective or critical parts.

The responsibilities and structures related to the organisation of exams are defined. The timing of exams is organised appropriately according to the interviewed students and examination dates are announced in a timely manner. Opportunities to re-sit an exam are offered as necessary. Data regarding the number of failed course/module examinations in the study programme is collected and used for evaluation. The grading scales and the distribution of grades is documented and assessed.



Exam regulations are specified in the Academic Guidebook. However, there is no regulation on handling students' complaints and appeals except to address the student advisor. A body to appeal against exam results should be installed to create clear procedures and responsibilities.

According to the programme Managements, teaching methods are adjusted regularly together with teaching staff.

In the Bachelor and Master programme, plagiarism detecting software such as Turnitin was mentioned to be used. For Diploma III programmes little procedures are in place to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud within the programme.

#### Findings VI:

1. The participative approach of teaching students is in place but the concept of **“student centred learning (SCL)” needs to be developed further** by PNB. The approach must also be visible in the different module descriptions. It is further necessary, that the PNB evaluates the effectiveness of this concept and adapts it in the future.
2. **Students reports** written at the end of their internship **should be standardized** and a clear methodology and structure herein should be defined, specifying the involved elements such as analytical, reflective or critical parts.
3. **A body to appeal** against exam results must be introduced.
4. For Diploma III programmes procedures should be introduced to **safeguard academic integrity** and prevent academic fraud within the programme.

#### Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

#### 5. Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*  
[ESG 1.4]

#### Description

Student admissions is the responsibility of the Deputy Director I of the PNB and is handled by the Bureau of Academic and Student Administration (BAAK). Prospective new students who are accepted must meet the following requirements: 1. Good character, healthy body and spirit 2. Certificate of a Senior High School, Vocational High School or other equivalent. 3. Age not more than 24 years at the time of registration 4. Pass the selection for new student admissions 5. Other requirements deemed necessary will be adjusted and regulated by the Director of the PNB.

According to the SER, the PNB, especially the Tourism Business Management Study Program, has now entered its fourth year in organizing a programme for Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL). RPL students have different educational backgrounds and come from different industries. The programme aims at recognizing one's learning achievements previously achieved either through formal, non-formal, informal education or training related to their work or self-taught through life experiences. Recognition of learning achievement is intended to place a person at the appropriate qualification level on Indonesian Qualification Framework. The RPL process can be implemented in the education sector and the world of work. For this reason, the

implementation of RPL in the education and work world is based on equalization of qualifications in accordance with the Indonesian Qualification Framework

Additionally, the SER describes that the competence of students of the Tourism Department is assessed by a competency test in accordance with the chosen study programme. The competency test is conducted by the PNB Professional Certification Institute (LSP). Certificates will be handed out if the competency test is completed successfully.

Especially for the Applied Master Program in Tourism Planning, the admission of new students is carried out by independent selection and is intended for bachelor and applied bachelor (Diploma IV) graduates from all fields of science. The maximum number of new student admissions for this programme is 33 people.

The SER states that every student has to have a student activity credit unit that shows 24 points for Diploma III programmes and 28 points for Diploma IV programmes (Bachelor) as a requirement for their graduation. For the applied master programme, a published article in a national journal is the requirement for graduation.

Every graduate of Diploma III and IV (Bachelor) as well as Applied Master Tourism is given a graduation judicium which is based on a final assessment that reflects the academic performance while studying at the PNB.

Diploma III graduates of the Tour and Travel Operations and Hospitality Study Program obtain the title of Associate Tourism Expert (A.Md. Par). Diploma IV Tourism Business Management graduates obtain a Bachelor of Applied Tourism Science (S.Tr. Par). Graduates of the Applied Masters in Tourism Planning obtain the title of Master of Applied Tourism (M.Tr. Par).

PNB gives out a Diploma Supplement as well as the diploma certificate and the academic transcript.

### **Experts' Evaluation**

Generally, pre-defined regulations on Student Admission, Progression, Recognition and Certification are in place and available in published form.

The specific prerequisites relevant for all the four study programmes are included in the published admissions criteria and have been justified by PNB. A competency test must be passed by the students. However, there is no test of the applicants' English proficiency once they enter the different degree programmes, even though according to the PNB and students, a high share of the courses is being taught in English. Further, there is no mandatory proficiency test of the English language in the end of the studies. Especially this aspect seems to be of importance for the labour market since it has been mentioned by several labour market representatives in the interviews during the onsite visit. The PNB intends to prepare students to work in Bali's tourism industry, which is a very international one. In order to reach this goal, English skills are substantive qualities. For the Applied MA study programme Tourism Business Planning, students are not required to demonstrate any working experience to be admitted. This contrasts with the profile of the programme, resembling a professional one in its approach.

The selection procedure for the study programme follows defined criteria and procedures that are publicly available to students and possible applicants.

Assessing the recognition of prior learning, the university is making noticeable efforts to develop the procedures of recognition, in particular with its RPL programme in the Tourism Business Management Study Program which is in the fourth year. In addition to that, during the onsite visit, some mechanisms to recognize prior learning have been elaborated on by the university, such as the potentiality for students to continue with the Diploma 4 programme after having obtained the Diploma 3 certificate and when demonstrating two years of

working experience. Mechanism to recognize working experience during the studies as internships are in place. However, no general regulations for the recognition of Prior Learning have been provided by PNB.

Evaluating the presence of learning agreements to facilitate the mobility of students, it can be stated that there are learning agreements in place. The PNB in particular highlighted the learning agreement with the Université de Angers in terms of the double degree mutual recognition. Generally, there are no standard systems to transfer the SKS to ECTS but individual agreements with several other universities.

Qualitative and quantitative data is available on the admission procedures of past cohorts.

Graduates of the different four study programmes receive documentation explaining the qualification gained, including context, level, and status of the studies in form of the diploma certificate and the academic transcript.

### Findings VII:

1. The **formal admission criteria** should cover all substantive qualities needed for the successful completion of the programmes.
2. PNB should take measures to assure that students have an **appropriate level of English proficiency** at the end of their studies (see above).
3. PNB must establish a formalized and transparent **way to transfer SKS into ECTS**.
4. Regulations for the **recognition of prior learning** should be implemented.

### Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

## 6. Teaching Staff

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### Description

The SER lays out the procedure for the recruitment of new teaching staff. The selection of staff is carried out in accordance with the regulations for the admission of Civil Servants within the Ministry of Education and Culture. Candidates must pass several competency tests to prove their qualification. Successful candidates will be referred to the department of the respective study programme.

According to the SER, the PNB ensures staff development by different means. The PNB lists among others: enrolling lecturers in a Doctoral degree, establishing different types of professional development, involving lecturers in competency training workshops as well as offering English language and computer skills courses.

The PNB requires lecturers also to be active in research and community service. The SER states that one research article has to be published in scientific journals by every lecturer every semester. The results of this applied scientific work are to be applied to the teaching and learning process.

The teaching staff at the Tourism Department is made up of two lecturers that have a professorship, 37 associate professors, 20 assistant professors and six assistant professors of with a lower position. There are also

various lecturers that have technical competency certificates and competency assessors. On a study programme level, the Tour and Travel Operations study programme has 18 permanent lecturers with a lecturer - student ratio of 1:12, the Hospitality study programme has 20 lecturers with a lecturer - student ratio of 1:27, and the Bachelor's degree programme Tourism Business Management has 21 permanent lecturers with a lecturer - student ratio of 1:31. For all of these programmes the lecturers have varying degrees as an educational background. For the applied Master's programme in Tourism Business Planning there are six permanent lecturers, including two full professors. All lecturers in this programme hold a doctoral degree. The ratio of lecturer - students in this programme is 1:11. The department also has external lecturers, sourced from within the tourism and hospitality industry sectors. Their qualifications have to be recognized by the Ministry of Education and Culture through the Directorate General of Vocational Education.

The SER lays out a table containing the specific lecturer's information, position, denomination, contract expiring date and teaching hours.

### Experts' Evaluation

With regards to the staffing profile, it is the experts' opinion that all programmes would benefit from an increase in terms of PhD holders. It is, however, recognized that this already is the case in the applied Master's programme. One recommendation is though that professional development of existing staff should be strategically planned in advance. Part of this endeavour could be the introduction of international staff exchange programmes, which would enhance the current staff's expertise as well as their international experience and standing.

The overall goal to become an internationally recognized educational institution would further benefit from the provision of teaching opportunities in an internationally attractive teaching environment, i.e. with adequate remuneration and teaching conditions for guest professors from overseas. Especially the applied Master's programme would benefit from a higher level of internationalization. The recruitment of visiting scholars could run parallel to the suggested staff exchange programmes. Third party funding of staff research and professional development activities could be applied for, e.g. through organizations like the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD). Staff (and also students') mobility could be enhanced through the participation in internationally recognized and renowned professional networks and institutions. One core aspect of internationalisation, a high command of English skills, should be addressed on all levels (staff, students and administration). Also, the participation at international conferences and publications in international journals would increase the international visibility of PNB. These are considered necessary steps on PNB's way of becoming an internationally recognized tertiary education provider.

With respect to academic research output, it is suggested that "less could be more". A high publication rate, coupled with a high teaching load as well as administrative tasks, is usually unsustainable and does not really foster staff health and morale. A concept regarding areas of research that should be covered by the department plus a focus on specific conferences, which staff members use as a platform to present their research, plus a list of journals that are interesting for publications, could support the teaching staff in bundling their efforts. The international standing of PNB would benefit from fewer publications of a higher standard, i.e. research published in internationally recognized academic journals.

Therefore, the criteria with regards to the staffing profile are, in the experts' view, partially fulfilled.

### Findings VIII:

1. For BA/MA programmes PNB should provide more **professional development opportunities** with a focus on acquiring PhDs and international experience on research, coupled with higher quality research output.

2. For Diploma III programmes PNB should take measures to strengthen the experience of staff in industry.
3. Staff development in regard to **new topics and trends such as digitalization or sustainability** should be supported by PNB.
4. The **cooperation between staff and industry** should be strengthened, e.g. through staff 'internships' and research projects, invitations of industry speaker etc.
5. To **further strengthen internationalization** it is recommended to invite international guest lecturers and provide PNB staff opportunities for research leaves or short visiting stays at international universities.
6. Different kind of **courses to practice and enhance the English skills** and options to gain international experience should be offered for the teaching staff.

### Conclusion

The criterion is only partly fulfilled.

### 7. Learning Resources and Student Support

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.  
Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.  
[ESG 1.6]*

### Description

Students are required to take part in the Introduction to New Student Campus Life (PKKMB) programme. According to the SER, this programme is an effort to prepare students for the campus environment. Handing out organizational information as well as character building activities are carried out. The Semester Learning Plan as well as the lesson plan are handed out at the first course meeting and include detailed content of the study programmes that the students have chosen.

Services for students include guidance and counselling with at least four meetings in one semester overseen by an Academic Advisor. Academic Advisor are permanent lecturers at the PNB who are appointed based on the Director's Decree and are assigned the task of guiding a group of students with the aim of helping them to complete their studies. The PNB provides programmes for the development of interests and talents, to develop soft skills, as well as counselling on scholarships, and has established health services and a career centre. The SER addresses that the PNB accepts students with special needs (economic limitations or living in remote areas) through a scholarship programme of the government.

According to the SER the building of the Department for Tourism includes classrooms, a resource center, a computer laboratory with 35 units, a travel bureau laboratory, a language laboratory, as well as other laboratories that support the education in the tourism sector. The SER also lays out its resources such as smartboards and projectors and wireless internet. The students have access to the PNB Central Library. There is an current effort to cooperate with the National Library of Indonesia so that the students can also access these e-resources. The department manages three journals for the publication of writings of lecturers and students. The department has four administrative staff, five laboratory assistants, and two technicians that support the study programmes.

## Experts' Evaluation

### *Learning Resources*

The panel of experts had the opportunity to get to know the campus and the infrastructure of PNB via videos which were shown during the online-visit. Overall, material resources such as classrooms, computer work-places, and laboratories are available for every study programme (Diploma III, BA and MA) and are in relatively good condition to support the teaching and learning process. The availability of the learning resources supports the process of achieving the intended learning outcomes for all four study programmes. The laboratory, especially the Winghead hotel (at present is under renovation) and Tour and Travel Operator are set as a real business, which is very useful to facilitate the delivering practical and managerial practice for all students. The learning resources are also well handled by capable staff who can ensure the successful development of student's knowledge and skills. The equipment in laboratories and workspaces relatively reflects current professional standards and is appropriate for the intended learning outcomes.

The teaching staff of PNB is well aware of the threat of plagiarism and discussed this problem and measures against it with the panel of experts. However, the learning facility for similarity check, the "Turnitin", is not effectively used especially for Diploma III programmes. Considering the importance of this software to increase the credibility of student's written exams, it is highly recommended to provide this software, not only for checking the MA and BA student's thesis but also for Diploma projects as well as other student reports (see Finding VI, 4).

The library is sufficiently equipped and available for the department as well as for the institution (central library). Additionally, students and staff have access to the national library. Thus, the libraries provide adequate resources for students and staff. However, there is not enough information if PNB provides high reputable journals for both students (especially MA and BA) and staff. As the national library does not offer such journals and it is very expensive but crucial for conducting high-quality research and publication, it is highly suggested that PNB provides access for its students (especially for MA students) and staff to such reputable journals.

### *Student Support Services*

The Tourism Department offers an introductory programme for new students, which is one important step to help newcomers to enter university life successfully. However, there is no information from the SER and online visitation whether the introductory programme is available for overseas students. Considering the significant different environment between overseas and local students, it is highly suggested that this programme is available and prepared for those overseas students.

Next, during the study process, the department has also arranged an institutionalized student academic advisory service. Individualized advising for a specific issue that a student confronts during his study is handled by teaching staff in the frequent consultation session. This service helps students to solve the issues that arise during their study at PNB. Further, support and administrative staff are relatively qualified and can help facilitate the teaching and learning process as well as, indirectly, develop student competencies.

PNB also assists a substantial number of students facing economic difficulties through various scholarship programmes, provided by PNB, the government, and other sources. Other important student support services such as health center, accomodation, counselling, and career service are also provided in a relatively adequate standard.

## Findings IX:

1. Offers to **introduce the programmes to overseas students** should be implemented.
2. The **access for staff and students to reputable journal articles** should be broadened.

**Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled. Recommendations for further enhancement are given.

**8. Information**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*  
[ESG 1.8]

**Description**

The PNB has determined the types of public information that can be accessed in accordance with the provisions of Law No. 14 of 2008 on Public Information Openness (KIP) and includes the PNB Profile, the academic services, the new student admissions information, graduation information, scholarships, library, academic and student activity agenda, info on candidates for civil servants recruitment or contract workers, information on planning for annual programmes and activities, institutional performance reports, financial performance, info about regulations, certificates, and circular letters, ownership of facilities and infrastructure information, review of lecturer and staff services

Also, the distribution of information from the Tourism Department to the public is carried out by the PNB publication unit through television broadcasts, newspapers, radio, correspondence, and visits to schools and participating in exhibitions. Also, the department distributes information through SMS, e-mail, WhatsApp groups, Facebook, and through the website of the Tourism department.

**Experts' Evaluation**

The information provided on the programme, intended learning outcomes, selection procedure, qualification awarded and teaching, learning and assessment procedures seems to be sufficient for a national public. The content and information on the Website and Facebook and Co. seems actual and relevant, but is in Indonesian Language need to be provided in English..

For international stakeholders the website ( <https://sites.google.com/a/pnb.ac.id/en/home>) contains just basic information and isn't either up to date nor state of the art. Regarding the recommended roadmap for internationalization and improvement of mobility of staff and students a multilingual website should be an indispensable digital business card. **(Finding XI, 1)**

**Conclusion**

The criterion is partly fulfilled.



## V. Recommendations of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit with conditions

the BA programme “**Tourism Business Management**”, offered by **Politeknik Negeri Bali**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit with conditions

the MA programme “**Tourism Business Planning**”, offered by **Politeknik Negeri Bali**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to certify with conditions

the Diploma III programmes “**Hospitality**” and “**Tour and Travel Operations**”, offered by **Politeknik Negeri Bali**.

The assessment of all four programmes took place as an online procedure. Therefore, the panel of experts states that is necessary to carry out a confirmation visit at PNB as soon as the pandemic situation allows it. Besides checking the infrastructure, such a visit would give the opportunity to discuss some of the findings and recommendations for further enhancement.

### Summary of Findings:

#### For all four programmes:

1. It is recommended to align and thereby strengthen the curricula’s content with the institutional vision of “**Green Tourism**”, e.g. by integrating more sustainability courses and/or sustainability aspects in existing courses in the programmes. These aspects should be transparently described in the course handbooks.
2. PNB should take measures to assure that students have an appropriate level of **English proficiency** at the end of their studies.
3. The participative approach of teaching students is in place but the concept of “**student centred learning (SCL)**” **needs to be developed further** by PNB. The approach must also be visible in the different course descriptions. It is further necessary, that PNB evaluates the effectiveness of this concept and adapts it in the future.
4. **Students reports** written at the end of their internship **should be standardized** and a clear methodology and structure herein should be defined, specifying the involved elements such as analytical, reflective or critical parts.
5. **A body to appeal** against exam results must be introduced.
6. In order to make full use of the feedback provided by stakeholders, the results of **all kinds of feedback should be summarised and aggregated** in a short annual quality report and followed up with proper documentation on the improvements.
7. The **formal admission criteria** should cover all substantive qualities needed for the successful completion of the programmes.
8. PNB must establish a formalized and transparent **way to transfer SKS into ECTS**.
9. Regulations for the **recognition of prior learning** should be implemented.



10. Staff development in regard to **new topics and trends such as digitalization or sustainability** should be supported by PNB.
11. Different kind of **courses to practice and enhance the English skills** and options to gain international experience should be offered for the teaching staff.
12. The **cooperation between staff and industry** should be strengthened, e.g. through staff 'internships' and research projects, invitations of industry speaker etc.
13. To **further strengthen internationalization** it is recommended to invite international guest lecturers and provide PNB staff opportunities for research leaves or short visiting stays at international universities.
14. The **access for staff and students to reputable journal articles** should be broadened.
15. For international stakeholders the **website should be updated** and additional information should be provided.

### **Bachelor**

16. Students must learn how to **apply research methodology** already at an early stage of their studies.
17. The **structure of the curriculum** should be revised: academic writing and methodological courses should be given in an earlier semester (e.g., from 3<sup>rd</sup> semester). It could also be considered to offer the internship semester one or two semesters earlier.
18. PNB should consider to converting some of the **mandatory courses** into elective courses and offer more focus courses to deepen the knowledge in some areas, for example (marketing, financial management, front office operations, etc.).
19. More **study and internship abroad opportunities** should be provided to students and information on funding opportunities should be given.
20. PNB should consider **to rename the programme** as "Hospitality Business Management" or integrate a broader range of courses from the other areas of Tourism.
21. For BA/MA: PNB should provide more **professional development opportunities** for its staff with a focus on acquiring PhDs and international experience on research, coupled with higher quality research output.
22. Offers to **introduce the programmes to overseas students** should be implemented.

### **Master**

23. Because the profile is more a professional programme, **entry requirements** must be defined to serve this target.
24. PNB should check if a '**bridging programme**' between fresh graduate and the one from industry could be developed.
25. Especially on the MA level, the **methodological approach** should be strengthened.

**Both Diploma III programmes:**

27. With the umbrella “**Green Tourism**” the curriculum should follow a guideline of sustainability aspects in tourism. Regarding internalization in the industry and the market, the curriculum should provide the capability to serve international tourist and work in an international team.
28. The **review process** by the Professional Advisory Board **and the applied criteria must** be clearly documented.
29. The **English proficiency standard** needs to be defined and for further qualification certified.
30. Procedures should be introduced to **safeguard academic integrity** and prevent academic fraud.