



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN GANESHA

### **LANGUAGE EDUCATION**

BALINESE LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR)

LANGUAGE EDUCATION (MASTER)

LANGUAGE EDUCATION (PHD)

March 2023



**Content**

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure .....</b>	<b>6</b>
1. Criteria.....	6
2. Approach and methodology .....	6
<b>III. General information on the university .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes .....</b>	<b>8</b>
1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme.....	8
2. Procedures for quality assurance .....	13
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students .....	14
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification .....	16
5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff.....	18
6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment.....	20
7. Information / Public information .....	22
<b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>23</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “BALINESE LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (BACHELOR),
- “LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (MASTER),
- “LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (PHD)

### OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN GANESHA, BALI, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 16<sup>th</sup> meeting on 27 February 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Balinese Language Education**” (bachelor), “**Language Education**” (Master) and “**Language Education**” (PhD) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 March 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 March 2029**.

#### Conditions:

1. The faculty must provide evidence of how stakeholders' feedback is incorporated into the development of the curriculum and the PLOs.

#### Balinese Language Education

1. The teaching staff of the Balinese Language Education study programme must improve its language qualification and skills how to teach them, e.g., through workshops with practitioners.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

1. The faculty should put more emphasis on the internationalisation of and mobility in all study programmes under review, and for students as well as teaching staff alike.
2. It is recommended that students are more actively involved in quality assurance programmes – for instance by actively having them participate in panels/committees that are concerned with quality assurance.

3. The university should provide the rubrics for all forms of learning methods and theories and forms of learning organisation.
4. The university should help its students as well as teaching staff to improve their English skills.
5. It is recommended to provide foreign prospective students with comprehensive information about the costs incurred in English.

#### Balinese Language Education

1. The university should ensure that the grading system of the Balinese study programme is aligned to that of the other study programmes of the university.
2. The Balinese study programme should hire practitioners as guest lecturers to teach courses.

#### Language Education (PhD)

1. It is recommended that courses on the philosophy of science and education and philosophy of language and literature are taught earlier in the PhD study programme of Language Education.
2. The faculty should reconsider the level of the course Advanced Ethno-pedagogics of THK Perspective in the PhD study programme.
3. The faculty should include learning methods and theories in the course learning outcomes to determine their level.
4. The faculty must include more academic references in the course descriptions of its PhD study programme.

**EXPERTS' REPORT****ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “BALINESE LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (BACHELOR),
- “LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (MASTER),
- “LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (PHD)

**OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN GANESHA, BALI, INDONESIA**

Visit to the university: 5-9 September 2022

**Panel of experts:**

<b>Prof. Dr. Junko Majima</b>	Institute for East Asian Studies, Dept of Japanese Studies, University of Cologne
<b>Prof. Dr. Didi Suherdi, Med</b>	Department of English Education, Faculty of Language and Literature Education, Indonesia University of Education Bandung
<b>Prof. Dr. Nyoman Kardana</b>	Master of Linguistics Programme, Universitas Warmadewa
<b>Günter Neuhaus</b>	former director of the Goethe Institut Düsseldorf (labour market representative)
<b>Sophie Gaugl</b>	University of Vienna (student representative)
<b>Coordinator:</b>	
Dr. Sarah Jenischewski	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Maria Rentmeister	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programmes “Balinese Language Education”, “Japanese Language Education”, Master programme “Language Education” and PhD programme “Language Education” offered by Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha (Indonesia).

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in April 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In February 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g., number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 21 February 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in June 2022.

#### *Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in June 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### *Site visit*

After a review of the SER, a virtual site visit to the university took place on 5-9 September 2022. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

#### *Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

#### *Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 27 February 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In March 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General information on the university

Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha (UNDIKSHA) is a state university located in Singaraja in the Bali province. The university is structured along 7 faculties and a Postgraduate Programme: Faculty of Education, Faculty of Law and Social Sciences, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Engineering and Vocational Faculty, Faculty of Sport and Health, as well as Faculty of Economics. In total, the university offers 67 programmes to a student number of 12,750.

UNDIKSHA developed from a teacher training institute to its current state as an independent state university, which was granted in 2006. Its vision is defined in a Strategic Plan 2020-2024 and it follows a *Tri Hita Karana* philosophy, which subsumes learning and teaching, research and community service. UNDIKSHA strives to become a leading university in Asia by 2045.

The Bachelor's study programme to be accredited is part of the Faculty of Language and Arts (FBS). The faculty has 1.923 students and offers in total 7 study programmes in 3 departments, e.g., an undergraduate programme in English Language Education and an undergraduate programme in Fine Arts Education. The Balinese Language Education programme belongs to the Indonesian and Regional Language Literature Department. The Master's programme as well as the PhD programme are affiliated with the Postgraduate Programme, which administers 14 Master's programmes and 3 doctoral programmes in total. The faculty is headed by a dean, the Postgraduate Programme by a director.

There is a separate Institution of Research and Community Service on university level whose goal it is to coordinate research activities, as well as the Institution of Learning Development and Quality Assurance.

### IV. Assessment of the study programmes

#### 1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

##### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

##### **Doctoral degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

### Description

#### General



The description of the programme learning outcomes at UNIDKSHA is structured into four categories: attitudes, knowledge, general skills and specific skills. Programme learning outcomes are said to refer to national standards and the Indonesian Qualifications Framework on the respective corresponding level.

The programmes use the Indonesian credit system to assign workload. It is said in the self-evaluation report (SER) that according to national regulation 1 credit hour (SKS) in the learning process consists of 50 minutes of learning process activities per week per semester, 60 minutes of structured assignment activities and 60 minutes of independent activities per week per semester. One SKS is equivalent to 39.6 hours of study per semester.

#### Balinese Language Education (Bachelor)

The graduation profile of the programme aims at qualifying students so that after graduation they can either continue education in the higher education sector, or become professional teachers and Balinese language instructors and speakers, or entrepreneurs.

Based on these profiles, nine programme learning outcomes have been defined. While the category of attitude mostly draws upon the role of students and their responsibility in society, the category of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering educational theory, Balinese language science, and Balinese language education in general. The category of general skills contains learning outcomes that are gained generally in this line of study such as applying logical, critical, systematic, innovative thinking in the context of development science and technology based on humanities values, according to their expertise. The category of specific skills is more focused on specific learning outcomes for example study, design, utilize science and technology and solve problems in Balinese language education.

The SER demonstrates that the curriculum of the Balinese Language Education programme consists of 148 SKS which are said to be study specific courses, supporting science and technology courses as well as core study courses. There are elective courses which are said to give students insight and knowledge in specific fields. Courses such as “Pancasila”, “Religion” and “English” are included in the beginning of studies as well as “Teaching practicum 1 & 2”, “Community Service”, “Cross Study Programme” and the thesis. Other courses related to the educational part of the programme are “Curriculum Development” or “Educational Insight”. Courses unique to the programme are for example “nyurat lontar” (writing on palm leaves), “pasang aksara Bali” (guidelines for writing Balinese letters), “tembang” (singing macapat or traditional Javanese poetry), “kidung/wirama” (singing old Javanese traditional songs), “reading sloka”, “mabebaosan” (speaking), “Kosa Basa Bali” (Balinese vocabulary), “ngwacen aksara Bali” (reading Balinese script), and “masanin lontar” (translating Lontar script).

According to the SER, the modules are updated by the lecturer utilizing the results of research and service that are carried out every year, following the trends of developing issues related to language teaching, utilizing the results of tracer studies, scientific meetings, and similar scientific organization forums, as well as the utilization of scientific publications. In 2020, the national MBKM Regulation (“Freedom of Learning”) was implemented by including the “Cross Study programme” courses to provide students study opportunities outside their own study programme.

#### **Expert’s evaluation**

The Balinese language study programme has adopted (a) the results of tracer studies of stakeholders/labour market, (b) graduates survey, and (c) feedback from students, and the proof that this was successful is that most students have been accepted as contract or permanent teachers in private and state schools in Bali.

The academic degree of this study programme is corresponding to the learning outcomes as defined above and the students appropriately fulfil the requirements of level 6 of KKNI (Indonesian National Qualification Framework). The intended learning outcomes are defined adequately and include academic competencies as well as more practically oriented aspects.

The curriculum is updated regularly every year and the curriculum structure is designed to support the achievement of the intended learning outcomes and to support the learner's progression. Analysis of factors in the development of the curriculum is used as the basis for compiling a profile of graduates who have high competitiveness following the demands and challenges of the times and the labour market. To achieve the intended learning outcomes, the study programme also always updates modules/courses through (a) utilizing the means as described above. Thus, the experts conclude that this ensures the continuous development of the programme. The measures are adequate to also be able to regularly adapt the curriculum in the future. This will also have a positive influence on the learning outcomes which thus can also be updated, if necessary.

The curriculum structure adequately covers (a) compulsory courses, (b) core study courses, (c) study programme specific courses, and (d) supporting science and technology course. The courses (exclude compulsory courses) have been often modified in order to meet labour market needs.

Since 2020, the Balinese study programme has implemented a government programme called MBKM (Freedom to Learn-Independent Campus). The curriculum was modified in accordance with this programme, such as the study programme now gives a chance to all students to study in different study programmes at the same university or the same study programme at different universities.

Curriculum elements such as modules of compulsory and elective courses are well documented. The total programme workload is allocated correctly into different courses/modules of mandatory and elective courses. The grading system for the students' final exam of the Balinese language study programme is different from the other programmes. It is claimed that its own system is due to the university's system. However, to make study programmes of the same university comparable, the grading system of the Balinese language study programme should be aligned to that of the other programmes of the university (**Finding 1**).

The university already has signed memorandums of understanding with some universities, institutions, and companies abroad to facilitate the mobility of students. Now the university is encouraged to actually realize international activities and mobility for the students and/or the teaching staff (**Finding 2**).

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### Language Education (Master)

The Language Education Master's programme is said to correspond to level 8 of the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework, which expects to (1) develop knowledge, technology, and art in science or professional practice through research, to produce innovative and tested works, (2) be able to solve science, technology, and art problems in the field of science through an inter- or multidisciplinary approach, (3) be able to manage research and development beneficial to society and science and gain national and international recognition.

The graduate profile established by the programme as stated in the SER is: language education practitioners (teachers, lecturers, researchers) who can apply theories and learning models professionally based on knowledge through inter- or multidisciplinary approaches to solving problems that are beneficial to society. Based on the profile, eight programme learning outcomes have been defined. While the category of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the category of mastery of

knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering knowledge of pedagogical content in the field of language to produce innovations to solve educational and language learning problems. The category of general skills contains learning outcomes that are to be generally gained to be able to develop and publish logical, critical, systematic, and creative thinking through scientific research with an inter- or multidisciplinary approach. The category of specific skills is supposed to be more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example being able to analyse language and learning through inter- or multidisciplinary research as a form of adaptability to the environment to produce innovative and proven works.

The curriculum of the Language Education programme consists of 42 SKS. The courses of the curriculum are structured into three categories: core study courses (6 courses), compulsory courses (4 courses), and elective courses (3 courses). Core courses include, e.g., “Socio-pragmatics”, “Linguistic Education” as well as the thesis. Compulsory courses include “Ethno-pedagogics Perspective of THK” or “Research Methods on Language, Literature, and Statistics”. The elective courses are for example “Linguistics Miro” or “Contemporary Literature”.

Curriculum updates are said to be based on evaluations and needs analysis also involving stakeholders, such as users, leaders, and supervisors of similar courses.

#### Language Education (PhD)

The Language Education Doctoral Programme is one of three PhD programmes at UNDIKSHA. The programme is said to correspond to level 9 of the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework, which requires graduates to (1) be able to develop new knowledge, technology, and art in science or professional practice through research, to produce creative, original, and tested; (2) be able to solve science, technology, and art problems in science through inter-, multi-, and transdisciplinary approaches and (3) be able to manage, lead, and develop research and development that is beneficial to science and the benefit of humanity and can gain national and international recognition. The graduate profile of this programme includes: becoming a teacher, lecturer, researcher or consultant in the field of language education.

The eight programme learning outcomes of the PhD programme are said to be based on the four categories attitude, knowledge, general skills and specific skills. While the category of attitude mostly draws upon the role of the students and their responsibility in society, the category of mastery of knowledge refers to specific expertise the students must have gained related to their studies. This includes for example mastering and criticizing philosophy, theory, and language education approaches to be able to have professionalism in research development that produces creative, original, and scientifically tested work. The category of general skills contains learning outcomes that are said to be generally gained in this line of study such as being able to discover or develop new scientific theories/conceptions/ideas and contribute to the development, the practice of science, technology, art, and application of humanities values in language skills and learning through scientific research based on interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, or transdisciplinary research roadmaps. The category of specific skills shall therefore be more focused on learning outcomes that refer to this specific study programme, for example being able to analyse language and learning through individually and collaboratively research in language and its learning communicated in forums and/or scientific research journals to gain national and international recognition.

The SER states that the curriculum comprises 6 semesters with 48 credits. Each lecture is held for 16 meetings. The courses of the doctoral programme’s curriculum are composed of seven core study courses, such as “Study of Curriculum and Language Teaching Materials” or “Critical Discourse Analysis”. The curriculum also incorporates five compulsory courses such as “Advanced Linguistic Development” or “Instructional Innovative Language and Literature”. There are three elective courses in the curriculum, for example “Language Problems”. In the final stage of their studies, the students compose a dissertation through research with a weight of 12 credits.

It is stated that the curriculum development of the programme includes, besides national regulations, results of tracer studies and focus group discussions with associations and alumni.

### Experts' evaluation

From the interview, document analysis, and online observation, it is clear that the curriculum of both the Master's and the doctoral programme of Language Education have been adequately developed based on the programmes' learning outcomes (PLOs) by taking into account relevant policies, stakeholders' requirements and feedback as well as the vision and missions of the university and the faculty. In addition, it is also clear that the PLOs cover subject-specific, cross-subject knowledge as well as subject-related, methodological and general skills reasonably. The achievement of the PLOs are supported by relevant courses. The assessment of their achievement is also well established, including good academic achievement as evidenced by a minimum of 60% graduating with a satisfactory predicate. The students' satisfaction survey shows good results (80%), and the data on students completing their studies on time (minimum 70%) are also good. This shows that the PLOs are achieved, and that students and graduates are contented.

In the meantime, some aspects of the curriculum quality have also been regularly assessed through Internal Quality Audits, applying the PDCA cycle (translated as PPEPP). However, assessment of each of the 8 PLOs of Master and 8 PLOs of Doctoral Programmes takes place in total; and therefore, it is not clear if each of the PLOs (1-8) is individually achieved. Hence, it will not be clear that each students achieve all the 8 PLOs before they graduate from the programs. In other words, it should be clear that each of the PLOs (the attitude [1 PLO], knowledge [3 PLOs], general skills [2 PLOs], or special skills [2 PLOs] has successfully been achieved individually and not only enough to succeed in all three areas of PLOs.

While it is confirmed that the formulation of PLOs and the development of curriculum have taken into considerations stakeholders' requirements and feedback, the adequacy of the feedbacks and intensity of the communication as well as the information of how feedback has been incorporated into the PLOs formulation and programme's curriculum are not sufficiently evident both in the documents and from the interviews (**Finding 3**). In this relation, it is suggested that the communication between the programmes and the stakeholders be conducted more systematically and the stakeholders be well informed of how their feedback has been incorporated into the PLO's formulation and programme's curriculum.

In the meantime, the structure of curricula of the two programmes are well-organized, combining the core, compulsory, and elective courses in good proportion. However, the order of some courses need reconsideration. In this context, it is suggested that philosophy of science and education and philosophy of language and literature should be placed in the study plan before other courses that may require philosophical considerations in their imparting (**Finding 4**). Hence, it may be wiser to put them in the first rather than in the second semester. As for the doctoral programme, it is also suggested that courses on research and its aspects are given more credits than those that have been provided in the curriculum.

The level of the content and learning experiences are appropriate for a doctoral programme in the majority of the courses; but in some courses, they are too simple for doctoral students (e.g. BHS320101, "Advanced Ethno-pedagogs of THK Perspective") (**Finding 5**), in which finding and identifying are dominant in some course sessions; and for the rest it is not clear if they are appropriate, because the indicators are not formulated in appropriate ways (e.g. BHS320104, "Study of Curriculum and Language Teaching Materials", and BHS320201, "Philosophy of Language and Literature"), in which the learning methods and theories are not determined. They are formulated in the form of lists of teaching/learning content without any indicators of the learning methods and theories; thus, the course description has to be revised accordingly (**Finding 6**).

Last but not least, the number of recent academic references in each course description is not sufficient and therefore a sufficient number of references needs to be significantly added to the existing ones (**Finding 7**).

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 2. Procedures for quality assurance

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

## Description

Several departments, committees and working groups are outlined by UNDIKSHA to carry out quality assurance at university, faculty and programme level. To realize a functioning quality assurance system on university level, UNDIKSHA states that a Quality Assurance Center (PJM) was formed, as well as Quality Control Units on faculty and programme level. Every year, an "Internal Quality Audit" is conducted. Some of the mechanisms of the audit described in the SER include the formation of internal auditor panels and their training as well as the examination of study programmes by files and field visits, concluding with a report. The documents, prepared by the Quality Control Unit, are described as including National Education, National Research, Community Service, and Non-Academic Standards.

The teaching and learning process is monitored and evaluated in the faculty by distributing questionnaires to the students in the beginning, middle and end of lectures each semester, as described by UNDIKSHA. Following the explanation, the questionnaire given at the beginning of the lesson aims to determine the readiness of the supporting documents given to students, the mid-lecture questionnaire aims to determine the learning process, and the questionnaire at the end of the lecture aims to determine the learning outcomes that have been designed. It is said that a Management Findings Meeting is set up to use the results for improvement of the coming academic year.

UNDIKSHA describes that stakeholder involvement plays an essential role in their quality assurance system and that the internal stakeholders such as lecturers, students and education staff as well as external stakeholders such as industry, university, community partners are included by obtaining their feedback annually

with surveys. Tracer studies, graduate user satisfaction surveys and suggestions from alumni are to be carried out/collected by the Technical Implementation Unit for Career Development and Student Entrepreneurship. Tracer studies are published on the university's website.

### Experts' evaluation

The quality assurance involves different scopes as there are tools such as course evaluations, workload assessment surveys, and surveys about the satisfaction of alumni. Furthermore, professional development in the areas of quality assurance is ensured as the assessors are trained by national certified assessors, who teach them how to utilise QA instruments. Then, they participate in site visits and write reports about the strengths, weaknesses, and solutions of certain study programmes. As monitoring and evaluation of learning take place three times during the semester, it can be said that there is enough monitoring of the programmes.

The quality assurance procedures lead to concrete measures to enhance the quality since the strategy plans are revised after each survey to improve the study programmes. Furthermore, the curricula are revised regularly. Identified findings are addressed as the summarised results of various surveys are published by the head of the study programme and shared with stakeholders, such as the students of the programme.

Moreover, quality assurance involves external stakeholders such as labour market representatives as they are invited to review the curriculum in order to better meet the needs of society and the employers. Their feedback is also collected by having them give suggestions to the heads of the programmes about the skills they are looking for in their employees. By the means of this collaboration, it is ensured that information on the labour market requirements is collected and it becomes clear in which sectors graduates are employed.

Based on the provided curriculum of each programme under review, desired qualifications to be achieved have been presented as intended learning outcomes (ILO) and they have also been broken down into course learning outcomes. They are updated regularly based on tracer study results and feedback from students. Modules are also updated by the lecturers utilizing the results of research and service that are carried out every year, following the trend of developing issues related to language teaching, utilizing the results of tracer studies, scientific meetings, similar scientific organization forums, and utilization of scientific publications.

Alumni are involved in the quality assurance of the programmes as they are able to share their thoughts on the study programmes in the alumni satisfaction survey. Students are also involved in the quality assurance of the programmes as they have the possibility to participate in surveys. However, it can be said that students could be more actively involved in the quality assurance procedures, e.g., by actively having them participate in panels/committees that are concerned with quality assurance (**Finding 8**).

Academic integrity is safeguarded because every lecturer informs their students about the regulations that are in place in order to prevent academic fraud. Every paper is checked before handing it in, the tolerance of plagiarism is 20%, which is explained by quotes and references in the paper.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

#### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

**Doctoral degree**

*The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

**Description**

With the goal to facilitate a smooth teaching and learning process, undergraduate students in each semester are grouped into several classes, with the number of participants limited to a maximum of 35 students per class, while for postgraduate programmes up to a maximum of 20 students per class, as stated in the SER. Each class is led by a class manager consisting of a class coordinator, secretary, and treasurer selected from the students in the class.

The paradigm said to be used in the learning process focuses on interactive, holistic, integrative, scientific, contextual, thematic, practical, collaborative, and student-centred characteristics and shall also contribute to the paradigm of lifelong learning. Learning methods used in the faculty and the Postgraduate School as mentioned in the documents of the university are: inquiry learning, project-based learning, problem-based learning, and collaborative learning. These methods are said to be combined with the technique of giving explanations, exposition, question, and answer, discussion, etc. The emphasis of the learning method should be on students as active participants who are responsible for their learning process. The learning process for each course is to be planned and structured in the form of a semester lesson plan. Specifically in the Master's and doctoral programmes, methods such as library/online research, report writing, and critical review are also said to be used.

To support the learning process, the students shall be engaged in research, possibly under an umbrella research concept. It is also described that students are actively engaged in social services programmes.

Assessment of students is said to be based on attitudes and participation, assignments, mid-semester exams, and end-semester exams. Information related to the assessment is supposed to be carried out transparently and informed during public lectures and at the beginning of each course. Rules related to this assessment are formulated by the university and contained in educational rules documents, such as in the guidelines. A combination of assessment techniques such as participation, performance, assignments, written tests and oral tests are described in the SER.

Through an Academic Information System (SIAK), lecturers deliver instructional documents consisting of semester lesson plans, student task design, course contracts, and student grades, and can also see feedback from students related to the learning that has been done.

**Experts' evaluation**

It is confirmed that the learning and teaching methods support the establishment of a student-centred learning environment in all of the programmes. Inquiry, discussion, project-based and problem-based learning, and other active learning principles have been dominant in the learning activities developed by the programmes. This is evident in the relevant documents and interviews. It is also clear that the methods are in good alignment with the PLOs. IAs for the doctoral programme, the supervision arrangements foster the academic progress of the research work. Through the activities developed, students are trained to apply their knowledge to situations outside the university context. In addition, the methods of learning and teaching as well as assessment formats support an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects.

Furthermore, the methods can be perceived as innovative and have been described as interesting and motivating by the students. An online learning system has been implemented to ensure that students can access the materials from their home as well, which enables flexible learning paths.

The transfer of knowledge to situations outside the university context is ensured by internships and micro-teaching seminars, which involve an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects of the students' studies.

Assessment regulations and procedures are presented in relevant documents, including the lesson plans, and are accessible to students. Examination requirements are transparent and made available to students, including grading scales, since the students are informed about the assessment at the beginning of each course. The majority of the assessment methods reflect the learning outcomes in the individual courses/modules. However, even though single rubrics were claimed to have been attached, no single rubrics is presented. Therefore, it is hard to see the objectivity of the assessment. Hence, it is suggested that appropriate rubrics for all forms of learning methods, theories and forms of learning organisations (essays, articles, reports, oral presentations, panel discussions, etc.), including those for attitudinal behaviours is to be presented (**Finding 9**).

A procedure for student appeals is in place. As students have various means of submitting a complaint – for instance, they can submit it directly to the study programme coordinator or they can send it via email or contact them via a phone call – it can be said that the procedure is accessible and appropriate.

There are regulations to compensate for absence, especially because many of the students in the Master's programme and in the doctoral programme are working already. Moreover, absences can be made up by additional assignments.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.*

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

## Description

Admission to the Bachelor's programmes can be granted through three pathways, namely the recruitment of prospective new students through State University National Entrance Exam, via Joint Entrance Selection of State Universities and an Independent Entrance Selection of New Students. Except for the last pathway, the entrance selection is organized on national level.



The postgraduate education guidelines are said to contain student admission regulations for Master's and doctoral programmes. Selection of postgraduate students is carried out by a team determined by the Chancellor's Decree.

According to the SER, recognition of prior learning is taken into account in the admission process. In addition, relevant courses with the same or more credits from programmes of other universities can be recognized with the approval of the study programme coordinator and the dean.

Student progress is monitored by an academic supervisor, who is also tasked with providing academic guidance to students. Data on students' progress can be accessed by the responsible persons for the study programme such as the head of department or dean, and the respective data are said to give information on the number of active students and student profiles, students who have the potential to drop out, scholarship recipients, student achievements, the average GPA of graduates, the average study period, and the number of lecturers.

Graduates of the Bachelor's and Master's programmes receive a certificate, an academic transcript and a Diploma Supplement at the end of their studies. Doctoral graduates receive a Diploma document and a transcript of grades.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The student admission for the Bachelor's programmes is carried out openly and transparently in the three pathways as described above which are based on the government's regulation so that UNDIKSHA does not have specific requirements for the Bachelor students' admission. However, the student admission for Master's and doctoral Programmes is based on the postgraduate education guideline and the selection is carried out by a team determined by the Rector's Decree. The students' selection in these programmes is carried out by providing a written test and preparing a portfolio. An interview is not carried out in the programmes under review although the test would be allowed by the university's regulations.

The specific procedures and regulations for the Ph.D. and the Master's programme regarding the award of final degree have been defined and these are available to students. The criteria to grant the degree, e.g., include that the students of the Ph.D. programme have to successfully publish an article in an international reputable journal and they have to get minimum a TOEFL score of 500 (and 550 for students with an English background). The students of the Master's programme have to successfully publish an article in a national reputable journal (SINTA) and get a minimum TOEFL score of 475.

The university gathers data on the admission procedures of past cohorts in an online system. To support this, the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Indonesia already prepares a software for that purpose.

The university has transparent regulations regarding the transfer of credits from other higher education institutions.

The undergraduate programmes accept transfers from other study programmes at UNDIKSHA or other universities outside UNDIKSHA by taking into account the administrative requirements specified at UNDIKSHA and special needs determined by the intended study programme. The relevant courses from the prior programme can be admitted to the new programme with the approval of the study programme coordinator and the dean. The university (referring to government regulations of MBKM) also has regulations regarding the mobility of students to other higher education institutions in Indonesia and abroad.

The university has signed MoUs with some universities, institutions, and companies abroad to facilitate the mobility of students.

The graduates of all programmes under review receive adequate certificates on their successful completion which include an academic transcript and a diploma supplement as well.

UNDIKSHA is legally entitled to award doctorates since this comes automatically in Indonesia when the institution is legally permitted to open/run a doctoral study programme.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### Description

Staff at UNDIKSHA is employed as civil servants or as contract lecturers. The implementation of recruitment and selection is carried out at university level concerning the two positions, via the recruitment of civil servant lecturers (following national regulations) and the institute's local recruitment system for contract lecturers. According to information in the SER, the lecturer recruitment planning is initiated by an analysis of the needs of each study programme. It is described that the study programme coordinator together with the Head of the Department conducts an analysis of the adequacy of lecturer resources by calculating the ratio of the number of lecturers: the number of students and an analysis of the average teaching load per semester (full-time teaching equivalent).

It is stated that new lecturers will be given 90 hours of training, providing training to young lecturers related to the learning and teaching process. There is also a continuation of this training programme targeting senior lecturers. Lecturers are given the opportunities to gain a doctoral degree.

The lecturers of the study programme have three primary duties (teaching, research, and community service) or Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi (Three Pillars of Higher Education). It is stated in the SER that many lecturers pursue off-campus activities e.g., memberships in linguistic associations, acting as translators or other activities. There are special funds for journal publications and lecturers who participate or present their articles in seminars or conference forums.

For the Balinese Language Education programme 7 lecturers are listed in the SER. Also, there is a statistics professor affiliated with the programme, as well as one part-time lecturer.

The Master's programme in Language Education has 12 lecturers, none of them are part-time lecturers. Among the 12 lecturers, six lecturers have the position of professor, four are associate professors, and two are senior lecturers. According to the SER, one requirement for lecturers in this programme is to have a doctoral degree in the field of programme.

The doctoral programme in Language Education has 17 lecturers with lecturers with civil servant status and one lecturer with part-time status. Among the 17 lecturers, 10 lecturers have the position of professor, four lecturers are associate professors, and three are senior lecturers. There is one external lecturer teaching in the programme. Similar to the Master's programme, a requirement for lecturers in this PhD programme is to have a doctoral degree in the field of the programme.

### Experts' evaluation

The number of faculty members is adequate for the number of undergraduate students in the programmes under review.

#### Balinese Language Education

Also, the teaching staff of the Balinese Language Education must improve their specific language qualification that adhere to traditional and cultural aspects of Balinese in order to teach the unique courses, e.g., learning from traditional Balinese figures. The study programme should conduct workshops by inviting experts of specific Balinese language skills regarding the specific courses, such as "nyurat lontar" (writing on palm leaves), "pasang aksara Bali" (Guidelines for writing Balinese letters), "tembang" (singing macapat or traditional Javanese poetry), "kidung/wirama" (singing old Javanese traditional songs), "reading sloka", "mabebaosan" (speaking for specific purposes), "kosa kata Basa Bali" (Balinese vocabulary), "ngwacen aksara Bali" (reading Balinese script), and "masanin lontar" (translating Lontar script) (**Finding 10**). The study programme does not hire practitioners to teach courses in the area of language skills; this should be done in the future to improve the general level of language teaching in Balinese (**Finding 11**).

#### Language Education (Master, PhD)

Graduate supervisors do not always hold a doctorate degree, which is acceptable as an exception. However, the experts support an effort to strive for more supervisors with a PhD in the future. It also aligns with the university's continued effort to support lecturers pursuing their PhD.

At the same time, the average of only three supervised students, including both major and minor supervised students, among graduate students of the Master's and the doctorate programme as a whole, seems low relative to the number of faculty members. Even though this is in line with Indonesian requirements to the amount of students supervised, the experts wonder if it would be possible for supervisors to accept more supervised students.

#### All study programmes

Each of the faculty members employed has received higher education, primarily in the country, and holds at least a Master's degree; those with a Ph.D. are still few. The university seems to want tenured faculty members to also earn a Ph.D. This development is highly welcomed by the experts, who recommend continuing this process.

The lecturers should be working more frequently at universities abroad, as a guest lecturer or as a guest researcher, for example, to broaden their view and to allow them to gain international experience which often also helps to motivate students to study abroad. Until now, the lecturers seem to be concentrating on academic activities only within Indonesia, and it would be appropriate to continuously increase the mobility both of teaching staff and of students (see **Finding 2**).

In order to be actively involved in the respective international academic field, one of the prerequisites is the teaching staff's English competence. As far as the experts experienced during the online visit, the impression was given that the overall English language skills of teachers as well as students should be significantly improved (**Finding 12**).

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

[ESG 1.6]

### **Doctoral degree**

*Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.*

[ESG 1.6]

## Description

Following the SER's description, at the beginning of the semester a Semester Study Plan (RPS) is handed out that is supposed to guide students concerning what to prepare and what to expect in the relevant courses and which learning outcomes are to be achieved. Teaching material is supposed to be published online using the university's integrated system.

An orientation period is held at the beginning of studies. Every student is assigned an academic supervisor who shall provide guidance in academic and non-academic matters. In terms of workload, the SER states that the maximum credit load that can be taken in one semester is 24 credits. The GPA (Grade Point Average) of the students determines how many credits can be taken the next semester and will be discussed with the academic advisor. As explained by the university, there is supervision concerning the thesis as well as for the dissertation and students are required to meet with an assigned supervisor for their thesis or dissertation writing several times.

Facilities relevant for the study programmes are managed by the faculty or by the study programme. They include classrooms, IT lab, place for outdoor learning and microteaching lab. Other facilities provided by the university include academic assistance, guidance and counselling services, interest and talent services, soft skills coaching services, career and entrepreneurship guidance services, scholarship services, and health services. The Technology, Information and Communication Unit of the Technical Implementation and Language Service Unit provide further assistance. The library offers e-resources that consist of 34 providers, such as Sage Books, Wiley, Taylor & Francis, Ebsco, Proquest, Springer Nature, Emerald Insight, Cambridge University Press, and others additionally to traditional books.

Scholarships are available in the form of a Chancellor's scholarship for underprivileged students as well as through a Rector's decree to persons, e.g., with disabilities.

## Experts' evaluation

Activity for orientation for new students is provided for each programme. Orientation for the new students of the Bachelor's study programmes is defined by the government so that all new students of all higher education institutions in Indonesia have to follow the orientation for the same period of time with the same materials

provided by government. Orientation for new students of the Master's and Ph.D. programmes is organised by each study programme and the orientation commonly covers general lecture and study programme orientation.

The students are informed about their courses mainly via social media and bulletin boards. Some pieces of information are also spread via email or official letters. Specific information on the exams and assessment methods in the courses is given in the first session of each course.

Appropriate material resources are available to a satisfactory extent as there are enough financial resources to support underprivileged students, and there are multiple computer workplaces. Furthermore, there are two language research laboratories and a well-equipped microteaching room. The technical equipment of the classroom itself also seems to be satisfactory for the study programmes. For the laboratories, there are quality documents, and the data is evaluated and reported to the faculty management who makes sure that the needs of all students are accommodated. Moreover, there are guidelines for the usage of laboratories. The users of the laboratories must obey and follow the guidelines as part of the standards set by the university.

Facilities accommodate to the number of students with regards to room and space as they are managed by both the faculty itself and the study programme. These two parties work together in order to distribute the rooms accordingly and accommodate to the number of students.

The library is equipped with a satisfactory number of textbooks, scientific works, accredited national journals, international journals, proceedings, and e-journals. The experts see that the university works hard to provide a better equipped library for this study programme in the future and stress that it is important to continue and possibly still strengthen this effort.

There are different advisory services that are available to students – for instance, they are assigned an academic supervisor at the beginning of their studies who helps guide them through the beginning of their time at university. This also serves as an introductory offer for new students as they are shown the various facets of their study programme. Moreover, the students are offered counselling by lecturers and the study programme coordinator, and there are health facilities nearby.

Guidance and support arrangements for PhD students are ensured by the so-called “work in progress forum,” where they work for a certain amount of time together with other students, and they have to report progress by the end of their session.

Student diversity is considered to a satisfactory extent when allocating, planning, and providing learning resources and student support. The support and planning mainly focus on students who are working while they study. Furthermore, the focus is put on underprivileged students, who are financially supported by scholarships. Students with disabilities are also taken into consideration and there are some supporting facilities, such as wheelchair lanes for students with disabilities, as well as scholarships. There is also a nursery room to take into account the needs of students who are parents and might need to bring their child to campus with them.

There are different types of scholarship opportunities offered to students. For instance, 25% of the university's students receive a government-funded scholarship, there is a scholarship by the bank of Indonesia, and there are scholarships provided by the university itself for students that come from a poor economic background. The latter is awarded to 30 students each year. Moreover, each provincial local government provides scholarships for their own citizens. In general, it can also be said that the tuition fee is based on the socioeconomic background of the student, and of the 3.500 students that are admitted annually, between 1.000 and 1.500 students are awarded a scholarship.

Doctoral students are in particular supported through academic services on the SIAK-NG which offers them preparation study plan cards and it allows them to view their study results card. They are also supported by the e-learning system. Moreover, they can profit from the Center of Study Acceleration Services. In addition to

academic services, the study programme also provides non-academic services to doctoral students. Furthermore, there are also counselling guidance services, health services, interest and talent services, scholarship services, and boarding services for the doctoral students in place.

To shortly summarize the experts' point of view, especially noteworthy are the well-equipped microteaching room and the variety of scholarships that are in place to ensure that the students are supported financially.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Information / Public information

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

### **Doctoral degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

### Description

The responsible unit for public information at the university is UPT TIK. According to the SER, the unit has developed various information systems and applications, including the academic information system, UNDIKSHA E-library, E-Learning, E-Journal, and an information management system of the community service programme. Those can be accessed through the SSO portal called E-Ganesha. In addition, to optimize IS/IT services, UPT TIK also develops UNDIKSHA mobile applications.

The students can access information from the different university's websites, like that of the FBS (Faculty of Language and Arts) or the postgraduate school. There are also specific websites on each programme.

The e-learning platform can also be accessed via internet and results of tracer studies are published online.

### Experts' evaluation

Comprehensive public information is available. The experts come to the conclusion that the information corresponds to the respective target groups. The relevant stakeholders are familiar with the university's offerings. However, the information could be made available to a wider public and a larger number of stakeholders. Overall, the information is strongly focused on a domestic audience. It would be desirable to provide foreign prospective students with comprehensive information about the costs incurred (accommodation, meals, fees to be paid (if necessary), and scholarship opportunities) in English (**Finding 21**). Of course, the advantages of studying should also be described. Information on both language education programmes should point out that they focus on teaching Indonesian or Balinese, both being languages students already know when they take up their studies.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “Balinese Language Education” (Bachelor), “Language Education” (Master) and “Language Education” (PhD) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha with conditions.

### Findings:

1. The university should ensure that the grading system of the Balinese study programme is aligned to that of the other study programmes of the university.
2. The faculty should put more emphasis on the internationalisation of and mobility in all study programmes under review, and for students as well as teaching staff alike.
3. The faculty must provide evidence of how stakeholders' feedback is incorporated into the development of the curriculum and the PLOs.
4. It is recommended that courses on the philosophy of science and education and philosophy of language and literature are taught earlier in the PhD study programme of Language Education.
5. The faculty should reconsider the level of the course Advanced Ethno-pedagogics of THK Perspective in the PhD study programme.
6. The faculty should include learning methods and theories in the course learning outcomes to determine their level.
7. The faculty must include more academic references in the course descriptions of its PhD study programme.
8. It is recommended that students are more actively involved in quality assurance programmes – for instance by actively having them participate in panels/committees that are concerned with quality assurance.
9. The university should provide the rubrics for all forms of learning methods and theories and forms of learning organisation.
10. The teaching staff of the Balinese Language Education study programme must improve its language qualification and skills how to teach them, e.g., through workshops with practitioners.
11. The Balinese study programme should hire practitioners as guest lecturers to teach courses.
12. The university should help its students as well as teaching staff to improve their English skills.
13. It is recommended to provide foreign prospective students with comprehensive information about the costs incurred in English.