AGENTUR FÜR QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH AKKREDITIERUNG VON STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA

ADMINISTRATION SCIENCE I

BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION (BACHELOR)

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (BACHELOR)

TAXATION (BACHELOR)

TOURISM (BACHELOR)

BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION (MASTER)

August 2023

Content

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **"BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR)**

- **"PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR)**

- **"TAXATION" (BACHELOR)**

- **"TOURISM" (BACHELOR)**

- **"BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION" (MASTER)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA, MALANG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 18th meeting on 21 August 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes "**Business Administration**" (**Bachelor**), "**Public Administration**" (**Bachelor**), "**Taxation**" (**Bachelor**), "**Tourism**" (**Bachelor**) and "**Business Administration**" (**Master**) offered by **Universitas Brawijaya**, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The accreditations are conditional.

   The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 September 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2029**.

Conditions:

All programmes

1. The faculty must provide proof that the relevant documentation and information on its quality assurance system is available on its updated website and guarantee continuously updates.

2. The study programmes must ensure that all core information on their study programmes is available in English.

Tourism

1. The Head of Programme of the "Tourism (BA)" study programme must revise course content, course learning outcomes and examinations used to make sure they complement each other.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

<u>All programmes</u>

1. UB is strongly recommended to revise the ILOs

    a) for all programmes to guarantee they are formulated on a similar level of abstraction,

    b) for the PhD programme additionally to harmonise them between the two specialisations.

2. The faculty should harmonise the structure of module descriptions to be identical, contain an overview of relevant literature, and include the chosen method of assessment as well as the ILOs, which support and match those of the whole study programme. There must be only one version of an ideal study plan.

3. The different course lecturers should make sure that they are using up to date literature in their courses.

4. The Head of Programmes are recommended to include soft skills, such as communication skills and English language skills into the curricula of their programmes.

5. The workload for students should be distributed more evenly and potentially reduced throughout the studies, e.g., by including some mandatory courses to the category of elective courses.

6. Documentation for all study programmes should be revised to improve their transparency and paint a clearer picture of the programmes' content.

7. An administrative body that is responsible for harmonising and taking care of all surveys and questionnaires filled out by students should be implemented.

8. To make sure all stakeholders are heard and kept up to date, FAS should implement a structured process of dealing with all feedback given and disseminating its results amongst all stakeholders.

9. The faculty should define transparently and coherently the different methods of teaching and assessment in a central document.

10. To increase internationalisation the programmes' should
    a) offer staff members more academic experiences outside of UB, nationally and preferably internationally (such as conferences, exchanges or workshops);
    b) hire more international academic staff and inviting more international guest lecturers;
    c) use the experiences of younger, internationally experienced, staff for teaching methods and international publishing;
    d) focus conference and publishing funding on international conferences and journals, respectively.

11. FAS should support its staff to increase its English skills, e.g., through language classes specifically for staff.

12. Additional incentives should be implemented for staff to increase publications and research, e.g., through workload reduction.

13. The faculty's library should be updated to at least offer a standard repertoire of current print editions of the books used the most in courses as well as standard books for the study programmes in question.

Taxation (Bachelor)

1. More courses should be taught in English in the study programme "Taxation" (BA), e.g., "International Business" or "International Taxation".

Tourism (Bachelor)

1. For the study programme "Tourism (BA)" concentrations should be introduced to the tourism curriculum in order to provide students with more specialised qualification in accordance to the field of tourism they are aiming at.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **"BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR, PSAB)**
- **"PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR, PSAP)**
- **"TAXATION" (BACHELOR, PSTX)**
- **"TOURISM" (BACHELOR, PSTR)**
- **"BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION" (MASTER, MAB)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA, MALANG, INDONESIA

Visit to the university: 6-9 February 2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Jens Müller	Professor for Business Administration, especially corporate taxation, University of Paderborn/Germany
Prof. Dr. Noor Ismawati Jaafar	Faculty of Business and Economics, Department of Management, University of Malaya/Malaysia
Prof. Dr. Nicole Küchler-Stahn	Professor for Public and Nonprofit Management/Public Governance, University of Applied Sciences in Berlin
Prof. Dr. Werner Gronau	Professor for Tourism, Travel and Transport, University of Applied Sciences Stralsund/Germany
Dr. Jörg Habich	Managing Director Liz Mohn gGmbh (labour market representative)
Luc Zettl	Student of European and International Administration Andrássy University Budapest/Hungary (student representative)

Coordinator:

Dr. Sarah Jenischewski	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Luca Geserich	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I.   Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes "Business Administration (Bachelor)", "Public Administration (Bachelor)", "Taxation (Bachelor)", "Tourism (Bachelor)", and "Business Administration (Master)", offered by Universitas Brawijaya.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in April 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In November 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g., number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised in the circulation procedure of the AQAS Standing Commission on 22 July 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in December 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in December 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 6-9 February 2023. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g., the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 21 August 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In October 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Brawijaya (UB) is a public university located in Malang, East Java, Indonesia. It was founded in 1963, has three campuses, 15 faculties and 1 Postgraduate School, and offers 177 study programmes (Diploma programmes, vocational programmes, Bachelor, Master and PhD programmes) to approximatively 72,000 active students in the academic year 2021/22. UB employs close to 2,100 lecturers and about 1,900 educational staff. UB's main source of income is from PNBP (Non-Tax Revenue) and APBN (State Budget).

The university defines its vision and mission at university level, as well as at faculty level. The vision of UB is "to Become a Pioneering and Innovative University with an International Reputation of Science and Technology Advancements that Form the Basis of Culture-Based Industries for Community's Welfare". According to the self-evaluation report (SER), the university's missions are (1) providing graduates with standardised education, who are characterised as religious and noble characters, and act with self-reliance, professionalism, and entrepreneurial spirit, (2) providing graduates that have a mission as agents of renewal, a pioneer and disseminators of science, technology, arts, and humanities, as well as agents of the nation's economic development based on local wisdom, and (3) organising distinguished, equitable, and sustainable higher education. UB states that its objectives are (1) providing graduates with good academic ability, entrepreneurial spirit, professionalism, self-reliance, work ethic, discipline, noble character, techno-savviness, and who are ready to compete and excel at the national and international levels, (2) presenting innovative crafts in technology, arts, and social science that play a role in the nation's economy, self-reliance based on noble and local wisdom values, (3) creating a friendly, competitive, and state of the art environment to support every potential student in an academic environment, and (4) providing good education governance that is accountable, effective, efficient, and state of the art environment to compete at national and international levels. The university developed a Strategic Plan for the period 2020-2024 aiming at contributing to its vision and mission. Accordingly, specific goals and performance targets have been defined in the areas of government, innovation, reputation, alumni, faculty, funding, and efficiency.

The Faculty of Administrative Sciences (FAS) developed an individual strategic plan based on and referring to UB's overall Strategic Plan. UB follows a Research Master Plan for the whole university, considering the direction of national research policies and serving as a basis for the research roadmaps of the different faculties and of individual staff.

The five study programmes reviewed are offered by the Faculty of Administrative Sciences (FAS), which was founded in 1960 (with its current name as of 1982). It offers six study programmes at the undergraduate level, three at the Master's level, and two at the doctoral level. The undergraduate study programmes are: Educational Administration, Library Science, Public Administration, Business Administration, Taxation, and Tourism. The Master's study programmes cover Magisters Management in Higher Education (MMPT), Magisters in Public Administration (MAP), and Magisters in Business Administration (MAB). UB has a doctoral programme in Administration Science at the Main Campus in Malang and the doctoral programme in Administration Science at the Jakarta Campus. The faculty consists of two departments, Business Administration and Public Administration. According to the SER, FAS has 147 academic staff members (11 professors, 26 associate professors, 98 assistant professors, 12 lecturers).

According to the SER, the vision of FAS is to become a reputable administrative science development institution based on entrepreneurial governance values in 2025. In its implementation, there are three missions to support the vision, namely:

1. Organising standardised administrative science to produce qualified and professional graduates with a spirited and passionate entrepreneurship.

2. Pioneering the development and dissemination of administrative sciences to contribute to the nation-wide development.

3. Translating dynamic and adaptive good and innovative faculty governance through Institutional Capacity Development.

IV.   Assessment of the study programmes

1.   Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*
>
> *The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*
>
> *[ESG 1.2]*

General information

According to the SER, student and staff workload is assessed based on the SKS credit system for all programmes.

FAS states that the curricula were developed considering national regulations including the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (IQF or KKNI), at level 6 for the Bachelor's programmes and at level 8 for the Master's programmes. The doctoral programme (PDIA) curriculum refers to IQF level 9, which means that graduates shall be able develop new knowledge, solve problems, and manage, lead, and develop research and development that is beneficial for science and the benefit of humanity and gain nation-wide and international recognition.

The SER reports that the curricula of the study programmes contain national graduate competency standards that shall support the achievement of learning outcomes and shall provide flexibility for students to broaden their horizons and deepen their expertise according to their interests. According to the report, each curriculum is to be designed according to relevance of the objectives, scope and depth of material, management that encourage hard skills, personality and behavioural skills (soft skills) that can be applied in work life. It is to be equipped with descriptions of courses/modules/blocks, syllabi, lesson plans and evaluation.

Business Administration – Bachelor (BPBA)

Description

The Bachelor's programme "Business Administration" (BPBA) covers eight semesters (four years) and 147 SKS. The SER states that the planned admission number and admission cycle for BPBA is 300 students per year. Upon graduation students are awarded with a "Bachelor of Business Administration" degree.

FAS states that the BPBA has a philosophy of teaching potential students to develop and implement Business Administration, to become creative, innovative, and professional administrators and continuously adopt technological developments, and to uphold moral values, honesty and integrity. As stated in the SER, the BPBA's objective is to produce graduates who have academic abilities in formulating planning, implementation,

evaluation, and follow-up of business activities, and who can communicate with outside parties in the fields of science, research, and the application of scientific activities in the business field. The programme aims to produce graduates who have sufficient knowledge and abilities to pursue higher education levels.

According to the SER, the composition of the BPBA curriculum structure consists of 1) core courses of the Indonesian Association of Business Administration (total of 30.43%), 2) national compulsory courses (total of 9.78%), 3) university compulsory courses (total of 2.17%), 4) business introductory courses (total of 6.52%), and 5) elective courses (total of 51.09%).

FAS states that the BPBA has six Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) that are generated from IQF level 6. The ILOs are:

1. Students will demonstrate an attitude of pancasila, respect the opinions of others, obey the law, and contribute society;

2. students can design scientific studies to support recommendations for solving social and business problems;

3. students can utilise the latest information technology media according to the relevant business context;

4. students demonstrate effective business communication;

5. students can utilise the concepts of organizational governance, entrepreneurship, and management functions in organizational management and strategic decision making;

6. students can utilise economic, social, political, and ethical concepts to develop business models aware of stakeholders' interests at local and international levels.

The average/intended class size is 30 students.

Experts' evaluation

The ILOs of the study programme address different interdisciplinary as well as subject specific matters. They were developed to equip graduates of BPBA to face the challenges from both the industry and government labour market requirements. Nevertheless, they should be revised to ensure their level of abstraction equals that of all other programmes in this cluster (**Finding 1**). It is welcomed that the six ILOs are frequently updated during the curriculum review process which takes place every 2-5 years. Any change in stakeholder demands will be considered in developing a new curriculum for BPBA. The stakeholders' contribution in the curriculum review process ensures that current developments and new requirements from the labour market are included in BPBA to prepare for future employment-ready graduates.

The BPBA programme documents all its curricular elements adequately. Also, an idealised study plan is available.

The BPBA is mapped as level 6 of KKNI (IQF), and is therefore equivalent to level 6 of the EQF. According to level 6 KKNI, the graduates of BPBA from FAS are expected to have skills of (1) problem solving, (2) decision making, (3) responsibility, and (4) supervision. BPBA has successfully produced graduates of high quality demonstrating the achievement of the six ILOs, which are adequate to reach the envisioned level 6. One example are the abilities of the graduates in effective business communication, demonstrated during the alumni meeting where the majority were able to testify that the skills they acquired while attending BPBA were adequate for them to enter the labour market. The alumni were happy with the programme's structure and contents even though it feels quite heavy in terms of credit hours and student learning time (SLT) to the experts.

Students of BPBA have been equipped with the knowledge, skills and attitude that support the aspired ILOs, resulting in a good to very good status of their achievement. Along with these achievements, the

Q

quality of the programme is shown in the ability of the students to be involved in community engagement and internships as well as the completion of their Final Year Project (FYP) thesis that requires concentrated efforts and commitment. The thesis, which carries six credit hours, and their findings are published in nationally acceptable-ranked journals, which further proves their achievement.

The curriculum covers all subject-specific, cross-subject knowledge, subject-related, methodological, and general skills needed to achieve the ILOs. As demonstrated, courses either qualify as compulsory or elective courses. They cover a variety of areas of knowledge related to a business administration degree and are very comprehensive. The experts were demonstrated that BPBA covers the breadth and depth of business knowledge during the study programme. A majority of the courses are business subject specific (11) and cross-subject (10). Furthermore, the programme offers seven subject related courses, three courses have methodological elements, and seven courses are considered as general skills. The spread of courses is aimed at producing graduates who are skilful and knowledgeable in a wide range of Business Administration with the aim that they are able to become generalists who can function in any employment settings. Nonetheless, the option for students to take ten elective courses enables them to become more flexible in completing their study at FAS.

The BPBA underwent a curricular modification because of the introduction of the MBKM (Merdeka Belajar – Kampud Merdeka; "Freedom to learn – independent campus) programme in 2020 by the Ministry of Education and Culture, Research and Technology where students of the BPBA have the option to complete the degree by taking courses of up to 20 credits in one semester in other departments within FAS or other faculties inside UB or in national or international universities or in foreign universities which have a collaboration with UB in the form of MOU/MOA.

The BPBA programme includes internships either in the industry or communities which can be conducted by the students after they complete at least 113 credits of the programme's total credits. These internships last six to eight weeks and bear four credits.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Public Administration – Bachelor (PASP)

Description

The Bachelor's programme "Public Administration" (PASP) covers eight semesters and 144 SKS. The planned admission number and admission cycle for PASP is 280 students per year. Upon graduation students are awarded with a "Bachelor of Public Administration" degree.

The PASP's objective is to produce graduates with academic qualifications in public policy, governance, government administration, development planning, and public finance. The graduates are supposed to be qualified to occupy important positions in government institutions, state institutions, public organisations, and private organisations.

The PASB has ten Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs):

1. Mastering concepts and theories on designing and managing public sector organisations, implementing public policies, managing public services and participation;

2. formulating alternative solutions for procedural problems in order to promote effective and efficient public sector organisations, including the management;

3. formulating and communicating alternative solutions to the leader beyond the scope of their authority;

4. mastering qualitative and quantitative analysis methods and techniques for public administration;

5. mastering the concepts and theories of ethics and integrity of public administration;

6. utilising information technology in designing and managing public sector organisations, implementing public policies, managing public services and participation;

7. resolving problems in accordance with their authority;

8. compiling staff reviews in the decision-making process;

9. performing job and responsibility effectively and efficiently using thorough information and analytical skills;

10. managing the public sector to promote public values, efficiency, effectiveness, justice, and democracy, individually and collectively.

The programme consists of compulsory courses on a national, university, faculty, department and study programme level. Compulsory courses make up 135 SKS. Students can choose three out of nine offered elective courses with a total of nine SKS (three SKS per course). According to the SER, the nine courses to choose from include: Internship, Administrative Analysis, Public Sector Management, Environmental Policy & Management, Risk and Disaster Management, Political Economy, Fiscal and Monetary Policy, Seminar on Development Administration Problems/Issues, and Seminar Public Service Problems/Issues.

Experts' evaluation

Intended learning outcomes (ILOs) exist and are part of the module descriptions included in the self-evaluation report (SER) handed out to the group of experts. Nevertheless, the quality of the wording of the ILOs varies greatly. While some are rather imprecisely defined (e.g., #7 "Resolving problems in accordance with their authority"), others are rather specific tasks than (strategic) future outcomes (e.g., #8 "Compiling staff reviews in the decision-making process"). UB is therefore strongly asked to revise the ILOs of the programme in a way that they are formulated on a similar level of abstraction (see **Finding 1**).

The module descriptions do not seem to play a major role in the daily business. For example, the talk to the staff of the programme revealed that module descriptions are not generally handed out to or discussed with students. While ILOs are included in most of the module descriptions, the link between them and the content and competencies taught is sometimes loose. Nevertheless, students seem to be well informed about the contents of each module; although not about the learning outcomes as the talk to the students revealed. To make this process less dependent on the motivation of each staff member, it is highly recommended to ensure a regular use of the module descriptions through making the compendium accessible to all students, preferably on the website. The information should also be available in English.

The experts strongly recommend revising the module handbook regarding content and formal quality. The structure of all module descriptions should be identical, the ILOs should be included in all descriptions in the document and each module description should include an overview about the relevant literature (**Finding 2**). Additionally, the literature – used at present – seems (partly) rather old and should be updated (**Finding 3**).

Each module indicates all possible assessment methods. To reflect the alignment of the ILOs, content of the modules, competencies taught, and the assessment method used, the suitable assessment type should be highlighted for each module (see **Finding 2**).

The structure of the programme is strongly influenced by the Indonesian government. More than 80 credits are predetermined by the responsible national agency and are – under the same name – taught in all Public Administrations programmes in the country. This ensures a highly standardised curriculum and may help to

ensure a certain quality of the programme. However, the curriculum contains quite a high number of modules, which leaves students with a rather broad knowledge of various topics. UB could think about streamlining the curriculum (beside those modules predetermined by the state) and slightly reduce the number of modules. This would reduce the workload for students as it allows them to focus on fewer topics and gain deeper knowledge of the remaining ones. To gain a little bit more flexibility in the tight corset of state regulations, UB might discuss about introducing some modules in the curriculum which can – every semester anew – be "filled" with up-to-date content and topics in the field of public administration.

Nevertheless, the structure of the programme is suitable to reach the ILOs and prepare students for an academic career on Master's level as well as to provide them with relevant knowledge and skills to enter the labour market.

The labour market requirements seem to be well represented in the development of the programme. Due to the experts' findings this hold especially true for representatives from public institutions providing job opportunities for interns or graduates. This finding is also backed by the discussion with former students highlighting the excellent job chances after graduation. Nevertheless, the labour market representatives highlighted that the development of "soft" skills, such as communication skills and knowledge of English, should be included in the curriculum. This opinion was shared by former students (**Finding 4**).

The labour market may engage in the development of the curricula. Due to the very personal relations between the staff and some representatives of the labour market some experts got the impression that these processes are rather informal by nature. To include different perspectives from various stakeholders in the process of consulting with labour market representatives should be more formalized.

Quite a high number of staff has been trained overseas. Nevertheless, the focus of teaching (and partly) research seems to be rather regional and dedicated to meet the labour market's needs. Nevertheless, in terms of internationalization there shall be various efforts (staff exchange, visit of international, English-speaking conferences, English literature in the lectures, etc.) to develop an even more international approach to Public Administration in the very near future. Students may study in a track taught completely in English. The number of students in theses tracks is now rather limited. Regarding the recommendations of the labour market representatives UB is encouraged to develop mechanisms enhancing future students to make use of this excellence opportunity to study in English.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Taxation – Bachelor (PSTx)

Description

The Bachelor's programme "Taxation" was founded in 2010 and covers eight semesters (four years) and 145 SKS. The SER states that the planned admission number and admission cycle for PSTx is 186 students per year. Upon graduation students are awarded with a "Bachelor of Taxation" degree.

FAS states that the "Bachelor of Taxation" (PSTx) programme aims to create graduates who can master the concepts, theories, and principles of taxation and relate them to core business knowledge. According to the SER, graduates should be able to grasp taxation issues in the business sector and gain an awareness of the legal problems and tax policy. Additionally, students shall learn to solve tax problems using analytical tools. According to the SER, the composition of the PSTx curriculum structure consists of courses covering 1) tax material (50%), 2) business content (29.41%), and 3) public administration content (20.59%). In total, the programme states to offer 49 mandatory courses and nine elective courses.

FAS states that the PSTx programme has seven Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) that shall lead to IQF level 6. The ILOs are:

1. Students will be able to integrate ethical, legal, intercultural relations, and continual learning principles in taxation into responsible leadership decisions.

2. Students will be able to integrate values, concepts, and principles of entrepreneurship in creating creative solutions to tax problems.

3. Students will be able to demonstrate critical thinking and data management skills in the context of taxation decision-making.

4. Students will be able to demonstrate advanced communication and presentation skills using diverse communication media.

5. Students will be able to relate the accounting process with legal issues and tax laws to ensure financial data accuracy.

6. Students will be able to relate taxation principles and core business knowledge to solve tax problems on a national and international scale.

7. Students will be able to apply technology-based analysis skills to resolve contemporary taxation issues.

Experts' evaluation

The Bachelor's programme "Taxation" (PSTx) is highly specialised on the core contents of taxation. The necessary knowledge for tax consulting about business administration is provided in courses about financial accounting, management accounting, international business, organisational behaviour, and management. This structure is beneficial to promote and achieve the intended learnings outcomes. The curriculum follows a logical structure from general and introductory courses in earlier phases to specialized and complex courses in later parts of the study. Prerequisites of later courses are explained in the course handbook. It consists of compulsory national courses and programme specific (tax) introductory courses in the first year. Courses in year two consist of some advanced tax and accounting courses as well as courses on the relevant institutional information and legal environment. The third year largely focuses on very advanced tax knowledge. Courses on "Appraisal", "International Taxation", or "Tax Planning" require a profound knowledge by Bachelor's students but are a great asset for skills on the labour market. In many institutions such courses are only taught on the Master's level. Moreover, management courses and "Research Methodology" complement year three. Building on such wide array of knowledge, year four is characterised by application and specialisation.

The unique feature of a "Tax Practicum" which is designed for students to help taxpayers with their real cases is an excellent addition to the already acquired theoretical knowledge. This practicum as well as the "Internship" in semester seven provide an opportunity to apply knowledge but also reflect differences between textbook and real cases. Moreover, these practical situations challenge students' personal behaviour and organisational skills and thus may indicate areas for personal development. A prerequisite for a successful integration in the curriculum is the continuous support by the teaching staff. Students, alumni, and teaching staff convincingly described the support activities (e.g., meetings, digital conversations, on-site visits) at UB.

A particular focus in any Bachelor's programme "Taxation" is to develop tax-specific problem-solving skills. Thus, students need to be enabled to apply business knowledge, decision-making concepts and need to know relevant legal institutional details. The ILOs for the PSTx clearly reflect the problem-solving aspect of the study programme. Most courses aim at the ILOs 5 and 6 which require to implement concepts of taxation in the context of business activities and respond to tax problems appropriately. Developing these skills sufficiently on the Bachelor's level should qualify students both for the labour market and for future Master's studies. The UB course handbook states that almost all courses use a variety of assessment methods, ranging from

presentations, discussions, take home cases, midterm, and final exams. Current students and alumni confirmed in discussion that these exam formats are actually used. The variety of assessment methods is appropriate to measure the multiple intended learning outcomes. The experts' opinion of the effectiveness of these measures was underlined by the feedback from the labour market and alumni.

Overall, PSTx graduate students should be able to achieve learning outcomes that correspond with level 6 according to the European Qualification Framework (EQF). PSTx students conclude the studies with a bachelor thesis in which they formulate and answer a research question. With this task students can exhibit their methodological and problem-solving skills on the desired learning level. A supervisor is available for feedback and support from beginning until finishing the thesis. Students and staff highlighted the importance of this support to achieve the desired quality of the thesis. The support builds on the courses "Statistics" (semester 3) and "Research Methodology" (semester 6) and facilitates very important skills to transfer textbook knowledge to an application context. The intense staff support is one reason why students can exhibit their learning achievements.

The workload for the courses is transparently documented and consistent with the experience of staff and students. However, certain parts of the supervision of the bachelor thesis (e.g., methodological guidance) seem to be not fully accounted for. Altogether, the total workload during the semester seems very high. The future development of this study programme may account for this matter. An option may be to reduce certain parts of the mandatory tax courses and add them to the elective courses (**Finding 5**). Against the background of the relevance of international business activities for taxation, it may also be considered to increase the amount of English taught business and tax courses (**Finding 6**). "Tax Planning", "International Business", "Public Finance", "Public Economics", and "International Taxation" are suitable candidates based on the vast international textbook literature available.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Tourism – Bachelor (PSTr)

Description

The Bachelor's programme "Tourism" covers eight semesters (four years) and 145 SKS. The SER states that the planned admission number and admission cycle for PSTr is 96 students per year. Upon graduation students are awarded with a "Bachelor of Tourism" degree.

FAS states that the "Bachelor of Tourism" (PSTr) programme is committed to producing professional graduates in the tourism sector. Tourism scholars are expected to innovate and create responses to tourism developments in the future independently or in collaboration.

According to the SER, the PSTr curriculum structure consists of 46 compulsory courses and three elective courses. FAS states that PSTr has seven Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) that shall lead to IQF level 6. The ILOs are:

1. Apply relevant information to make and defend business decisions (Critical Thinking/ Problem Solving);

2. contribute to a team environment to achieve a planned goal (teamwork);

3. apply decision-support tools & technology to make and defend business decisions (analysis and technology utilization);

4. demonstrate communications skills appropriate for business settings (communication);

5. apply knowledge of ethical, legal, economic and global environment to practical business situations and ascertain their impact (business environment);

6. analyse the role of motivation and influence in achieving a coordinated goal (business knowledge);

7. apply concepts within the core areas of business (management and leadership).

Experts' evaluation

The Bachelor's programme "Tourism" is quite broad in nature. It attempts to unite general management skills with rather specific qualifications in various fields of tourism. This is also reflected in the described aims of the programme, which seem to be rather generic and less orientated on the specific skills related to the various fields of tourism, such as destination development and management, operation and management of tourism services, hospitality management, etc. To resolve this rather complex issue - which is not uncommon for tourism programmes - the experts suggest profiling the programme by introducing specific concentrations (**Finding 7**). Such concentrations could build upon the existing combination of mandatory and optional interest subjects (Destination Management, Hotel Industry Management and Travel Industry Management). At the same time, such concentrations should be clearly visible in the academic pathway. They should include a fixed combination of specifically designed electives in the higher semester, building upon the general content in the earlier semester. Such an approach would surely benefit an increased visibility of possible job profiles for the graduates. In the context of such concentrations, the programme could even utilise the existing competences in the FAS and introduce a concentration of destination governance and destination administration, which might support a clear profile and contribute to a uniqueness of the programme even within an international context.

The existing curriculum clearly outlines existing modules, compulsory ones as well as electives. It combines academic skills with industry and community insights through the internship, as well as the community service module. Regular guest lectures from practitioners and industry representatives ensure a high degree of graduate employability. The final thesis ensures the demonstration of the aimed level of qualification. However, the low number of credits for the thesis might be in contrasted to the role of the thesis and the effort students are supposed to spend in their thesis. The study programme might discuss increasing the number of credits awarded to the thesis, if possible regarding the national standards.

Despite a high amount of content per module, the workload and requirements for the courses seem transparent and reasonable. All in all, however, the total workload during the semester seems very high (see **Finding 5**).

In general, there seems to be a gap between the everyday implementation of the programme and the documentation provided to the experts. Therefore, the quality of the documentation of the programme must be clearly improved. Despite the existence of so-called "semester learning plans" the experts were only provided with module descriptions, no complete module handbook. In several cases the names of the modules are not in line with the topics (e. g., module "Tourism Law and Ethics" or module "Tourism Economy"). Moreover, there seem to exist various versions of the pathway and courses being taught, no singular idealised study plan, which indicates a clear lack of structured processes and administrative deficits (see **Finding 2**). Furthermore, in many cases the learning outcomes are neither in line with the content nor with the examination proposed for the specific module (**Finding 8**). Unfortunately, the module descriptions do not provide a detailed understanding of the course due to their inconsistency.

As outlined by the faculty, there is a high degree of individual guidance necessary for the students during their studies, especially when it comes to the decision of electives, which might be solved by a better documentation of the pathway as well as by the introduction of the proposed concentrations.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Business Administration – Master (MAB)

Description

The Master's programme "Business Administration" covers four semesters (two years) and 45 SKS.

The SER states that the planned admission number and admission cycle for MAB is 32 students per year. Upon graduation students are awarded with a "Master of Business Administration" degree.

The SER states that the Master of Business Administration (MAB) programme is based on the application of business theory (real business practice) and research to solve business problems and develop business administration science. In more detail, studies in this programme are meant to cover the areas of caretaking, entrepreneurship, and management. According to the SER, UB designed the programme to prepare graduates to occupy strategic positions in business organisations as well as to become successful entrepreneurs, educators, and researchers in the field of business administration. According to FAS, the intended graduate profile was created in discussions with the Indonesian Association of Business Administration (AIABI) and representatives of relevant industries.

According to the SER, the MAB curriculum allows enrolment for bachelor graduates from any discipline. Accordingly, the MAB's curriculum intends to advance the business-related knowledge and practices for graduates of non-business-related Bachelor's programmes. For graduates of business-related Bachelor's programmes, the MAB's curriculum intends to expand the acquired knowledge on business. As stated in the SER, the MAB study programme is in accordance with the KKNI level 8.

As stated by the university, the MAB curriculum structure comprises six compulsory courses ("Learning Organization and Knowledge Management", "Business Strategy and Corporation", "Research Methods and Scientific Writing", "Organisation Theory and Behaviour", "Strategic Entrepreneurship", and "Corporate Governance") that are to be taken in the first semester. For the elective courses in the second semester, students can choose six out of ten courses offered. FAS states that the elective courses to choose from are "Leadership and Negotiation", "Innovation Management", "Marketing Strategy", "International Economics and Business", "Managerial Accounting", "Investment and Risk Management", "Managerial Statistics", "Supply Chain Management and Logistics", "Strategic Information Systems", and "Project Management. Starting". In the third semester, all MBA students must write a research-based Master's thesis. For the thesis, nine credit points are allocated while all the subjects offered in the first and the second semesters is three credit points for each subject.

FAS states that the MAB programme has six Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) that shall lead to IQF level 8. The ILOs are:

1. Students can develop critical, logical, systematic and creative thinking based on scientific methods for advancement in business administration science, and they are capable of delivering solution to business-related problems within the scope of industry.

2. Students can demonstrate and develop teamwork skills.

3. Students can demonstrate advanced communication skills.

4. Students can analyse business decisions by accommodating business knowledge and theories, particularly in the field of entrepreneurship, corporate governance and management.

5. Students are able to analyse and develop ethical business strategies, in local and global contexts.

6. Students are able to apply appropriate technology based quantitative and/or qualitative methods in business decision making.

Experts' evaluation

The MAB programme is mapped as Level 8 of KKNI that is equivalent to level 8 of the EQF. It is structured to produce graduates able to occupy strategic positions in business organisations as well as to become successful entrepreneurs, educators, and researchers in the field of business administration. The ILOs combine subjects that prepare the students for these careers and to establish and to lead business organisations along with its business strategy by applying business principles.

The six compulsory courses in the MAB programme structure prepare the students with adequate knowledge about the three main profiles of MAB graduates. Courses like "Business Strategy and Corporation", "Research Methods and Scientific Writing" and "Strategic Entrepreneurship" are subject specific, while the remaining three courses ("Learning Organisation and Knowledge Management", "Organisation Theory and Behaviour" and "Corporate Governance") and the elective courses are interdisciplinary in nature. The six compulsory courses prepare students with the basic competencies needed to align with the ILOs of the MAB programme while the elective courses (six out of ten) prepare the students with complementary competencies. With 45 credits for the whole programme completion, the MAB course is targeted to both business and non-business background undergraduate students who would like to enhance their knowledge in business.

The six ILOs have been developed to equip MAB graduates to face the challenges from both the industry and government labour market requirements. Feedback from the employers and also MAB alumni supported the strength of the MAB programme exhibiting demands from the academic and labour market. The participants showed high regards towards the quality of graduates, referring to their career progression in the organisations they work in.

The ILOs are frequently updated with input from the industry, e.g., through frequent discussions with the Indonesian Association of Business Administration (AIABI) and representatives of relevant industries. The FAS maintains regular communication with the industry through several events such as national seminars and workshops to gain insight related to their MAB graduates' profile and that it remains in line with the industry's expectation. In addition, the profile was also formed based on the results of their tracer study. The intended profile of MAB graduates is formulated through market needs analysis as well as scientific developments analysis by involving internal and external stakeholders. The tracer study provides employability, and meetings with representatives of MAB graduates employers proved that they are happy with the skills and competencies of MAB graduates.

Students of the MAB programme are equipped with the knowledge, skills and attitude corresponding to the aspired level 8 of the KKNI and EQF. This is shown in their ability to lead big, reputable and NGO organisations as was evident during the meeting with FAS alumni. The review of MAB theses also indicated the quality as acceptable, especially considering that some of the student authors did not have any business background at the undergraduate level. This is also aligning with one of the national aspirations for the programme to design the curriculum for the MAB programme to improve and advance the students' existing knowledge based on their prior education.

It is shown that MAB covers the breadth of business knowledge which the students are equipped with during the programme. The majority of the courses are business subject specific (2) and subject-related (2) and methodological (2). Compulsory subjects consist of six courses, which must be taken in the first semester of the programme to form the main/basic competencies that must be owned by the MAB graduates in accordance with the intended learning outcomes. The second group of subjects are elective courses consisting of ten courses in which students can choose six courses. These elective courses, taken by the MAB students in the

second semester, are complementary to the competencies formed in the compulsory subjects. In addition to the compulsory and elective subjects, all MAB students must write a research-based Master's thesis of nine credits, beginning in the third semester. The duration of MBA thesis completion of two semesters enables the MBA students to focus on the gaining in-depth knowledge on their area of interest under the close supervision of two academic staff of FAS.

However, as with other study programmes of this cluster, the experts recommend revising the documentation of the MAB study programme as it is not harmonised throughout the programme, e.g., course titles do not match between the handbook and the curriculum map ("Business Strategy and Corporation" vs." Business and Corporate Strategy") (**Finding 9**).

There has been no change to the current MAB curriculum since 2021, reason being its recent national accreditation. Nonetheless, the academic guidelines handbook is regularly updated at least once a year to keep up with both theoretical and practical developments of each course. The updating process is based on the results of teaching staff meetings and workshops, which are conducted at least once in every semester break and regularly involve relevant practitioners from the industry and government. With the involvement of external parties like the practitioners, the quality of the MAB programme in FAS is enhanced and improved according to the needs of the labour market.

The study programme conducts a Double Degree Master Programme with several universities in Taiwan, including National Pingtung University and Sun Yat Sen University. The activity shows that curriculum of the programme is recognized by other foreign higher education institutions.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*
>
> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

Description

Following the description in the university's SER, the quality assurance system at Universitas Brawijaya (SPMI) is based on a general Quality Manual as well as on quality standards defined at university level that shall apply to all subsequent levels (academic activities and non-academic activities), on standard operating procedures as well as supporting documents. The system differentiates between internal and external quality assurance, the latter including ISO certification, national regulations, as well as national and international accreditation criteria. The internal Quality Insurance System is described as being planned, implemented, evaluated, controlled and developed by the Quality Assurance Center (PJM). The SER states that all teaching and measurement services have standard operating procedures. The quality assurance group of the Faculty of

Administrative Sciences of Universitas Brawijaya is assigned to ensure that the teaching, learning and assessment procedures have been carried out in accordance with predetermined procedures.

UB states that all stakeholders are involved in the quality assurance measures, i.e., lecturers, supporting staff, students, alumni, and representatives of the labour market by tracer studies and stakeholder satisfaction surveys organised every semester by the central Career Development and Entrepreneurship Unit, and through focus group discussions organised directly by the faculty/department. The main evaluation tool in internal quality assurance is the annual Internal Quality Audit (AIM), conducted annually from September to October. Results of the discussions with stakeholders are made available to the public in the strategic planning documents (e.g., Course Handbook and Profile). External quality assurance takes the form of external audits in the context of national accreditation by the national agency BAN-PT and international accreditation.

The Faculty of Administrative Sciences points out in their SER that it has a quality assurance system that focuses on (a) lecture evaluation, (b) programme evaluation, and (c) student workload evaluation. The faculty follows a Quality Assurance Unit Procedure Manual. UB states that the curriculum development and review are carried out by internal and external evaluation in the form of curriculum review, carried out every two to five years.

To track the achievements of its alumni, the Faculty of Administrative Science implemented a tracer study. The goal is to enhance relationships and networks as well as to maintain a bond between alumni and the study programme.

Experts' evaluation

The university has a comprehensive policy for quality assurance that is publicly available in local languages. Internal stakeholders such as teaching and administrative staff as well as students were actively involved in the development of the policy. External stakeholders are involved through various structures of the university, such as e.g., regular personal consultations with practitioners or alumni.

The development and dissemination of the university policies is provided by the Quality Management System. The relevant documents and information are said to be available online on the university's homepage as soon as the relaunch has taken place. The experts highly welcome this development. As it is such an important information and process concerning the programmes' transparency, the experts need to follow up on this matter and receive evidence (**Finding 10**).

Considering the existing policies, the expert group concludes that a continuous development between research and education is provided. The university has implemented ISO-standards, all bodies of the university are part of the Internal Quality Audit (AIM) and therefore have a regular and public evaluation of their performance. Various councils, expert consultations and evaluations help to further develop the study programmes. The procedures and corresponding measures are appropriate and implemented. Equal opportunities are considered at the university and correspond to the national requirements. The proportion of female students and teaching staff is high.

Nevertheless, several quality management measures, e.g., regular consultations with students seem to be somewhat individual, rather than following a centralised and standardised procedure. A more consistent approach, handled by an administrative body rather than the individual teaching staff, might decrease the workload of teaching staff, increase the quality of the process in terms of standardisation and could, therefore, lead to an improvement within the quality assurance system at FAS (**Finding 11**).

Furthermore, it remained unclear to the experts to what extent a structured feedback process of student evaluation exists and to what extent there is a course of action to implement recommended improvements. To

make sure all stakeholders are heard and kept up to date, the FAS should implement a structured process of dealing with all feedback given and disseminating its results amongst all stakeholders (**Finding 12**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3.   Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

<div style="border:1px solid black; padding:10px;">

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

</div>

Description

The SER states that one credit (SKS) is equivalent to three hours of work. According to FAS, students work between six to eight hours a day, and five days a week. Students of a higher level of education are required to perform additional independent studies for two hours in the evening (eight to ten hours per day). The provided example states that a student takes 16-20 credits per semester, leading to 48-60 hours of work per week.

FAS states in its SER that teaching and learning activities derive from the faculty's research and community services activities, and that all study programmes should refer to the faculty-level research master plan when implementing learning activities. UB states that it pursues a student-centred approach in learning and teaching by offering synchronous (face-to-face meeting, also virtually) as well as asynchronous (self-study) teaching methods to enable students to study actively and independently. Following the SER, students have access to learning material and support on the different learning platforms used, including the university's own platform.

At FAS, the following specific teaching and learning forms are to be used in the Bachelor's programmes: lecturing, group discussion, simulation/role-playing, collaborative learning, cooperative learning, project-based learning, problem-based learning. The SER states that regulations for absent students are in place. FAS explains that students can access the assessment rules the FAS has compiled.

For the Master's programme, the following methods are frequently to be used: lecturing, group discussion, case study, and project-based learning. The faculty has a standard procedure in place in case students would like to express dissatisfaction with the learning methods.

For the doctoral programme, FAS lists the rules for graduation standards and assessment criteria. Followed by a final dissertation examination, PhD students must undergo a ratification commission hearing before taking part in the graduation. To reach a title with "Compliment" (cum laude), PhD students are required to have published scientific writings/articles in an indexed international journal.

FAS further states that the scope of the internship course in their programmes was expanded due to a policy set by the government in 2021 which applies to all higher education institutions in Indonesia. The policy is called "Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka" (MBKM). In addition, the MBKM programme allows students to take online lectures, not limited by campus or study programme and outside of college (e.g., internship, work practices, community services in villages). Furthermore, students can request a recognition of prior learning to fulfil the minimum credit requirements.

Assessment techniques carried out by lecturers may include observation, participation, performance, written tests, oral tests, and questionnaires.

Experts' evaluation

While the documentation beforehand lacked certain information regarding different teaching methods it became clear during the on-site-visit that across all programmes different modes of teaching and assessment are used. Due to the aforementioned lack of proper information, the experts were only able to assess a small number of courses in regard to the correspondence of ILOs, teaching and assessment methods. The faculty should, therefore, define transparently and coherently the different methods of teaching and assessment and provide this information in a central document, e.g. syllabi, available to all stakeholders (**Finding 13**). In syllabi for all those courses students were informed about important information as, e.g., topics covered each week, weighting of different types of assessment, types of assessment used during class and in the midterm/final exam. For the midterm/final exam, rubrics were provided to ensure a transparent and fair assessment process.

The programmes concerned and the higher education system in general provide different opportunities for students to transfer their gained knowledge to the outside world (e.g., MBKM, internship, community service).

Nevertheless, as has previously been mentioned, courses taught, ILOs and examination methods do not always complement each other as well as they could, which is something UB should look into to improve the programme's transparency (see **Finding 2, Finding 8**).

It is positive to mention that a structured mechanism is in place how students can complain if they do not agree with a grade given.

Finally, the students' workload should be mentioned. The impression during the site visit confirmed a rather high workload. Whereas students did not complain and the workload does not deviate from the university's targeted amount, the workload could still be distributed it more equally in the eyes of the experts (see **Finding 5**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*

Description

UB's Academic Handbook as well as the relevant Rector's regulations shall govern the admission requirements and admission processes at the university. For undergraduate students, there are several pathways for enrolment. According to the SER, there are six methods of student admissions selection, each of which has specific requirements and procedures: National Selection for State University Entrance Test (National Path by the Higher Education Entrance Test Institute), Joint Selection for State University Entrance (National Path by Higher Education Entrance Test Institute), Independent Selection, Transfer Selection Programme, Selection for Admission of Students with Disabilities, International Student Admission for the Undergraduate Programme. For the Master's programmes, the prerequisites for the enrolment of postgraduate admissions are determined by the Decree of the Rector of Universitas Brawijaya. In the Postgraduate/Master's programmes,

there are three student admission methods, each of which also has special requirements and procedures: Postgraduate Independent Selection, Double Degree and International Student Admission for the Postgraduate Programme. All requirements, conditions and procedures for student enrolment are publicly available on UB's website.

To enrol in the Bachelor's programmes, students must be high school students/equivalent graduated from the last three years, they must already have a high school certificate, as well as adequate health to join the learning process. Bachelor candidates must pass a computer-based written exam. For admission to the Master's and doctoral programme, students have to fulfil several requirements, such as Indonesian citizenship, adequate health to participate in the learning process, they must have a Legalized Undergraduate Certificate and Transcript, a Certificate of Academic Potential (TPA), a TOEFL Certificate/other English language proficiency tests (IELTS, TOEFL ITP/IBT). In addition (but not limited to), two academic recommendation letters, a synopsis of a research plan and certificate of funding sources must be submitted. All qualified applicants must pass an interview process.

According to the SER, the regulations for admission of international students is provided on UB's website. Support for international students is regulated in specific guidelines and standard operating procedures. All information is available in English on the university's website. The university provides a scholarship scheme for foreign students. The scholarships given are the result of UB funds or in collaboration with alumni. With the granting of a scholarship, the university hopes that foreign students from developing countries will not only study, but also increase the promotion of the Indonesian state to the country of origin of the foreign students.

Upon graduation, students receive a certificate containing information that the student has graduated, a transcript of academic grades containing the grade of the courses, a Diploma Supplement (SKPI) and a TOEFL ITP certificate, an IC3 Certificate (Information and Communication Technology), and an alumni book.

Experts' evaluation

Universitas Brawijaya has regulations for student admission in the Bachelor's and Master's as well as the doctoral programmes. The guidelines regarding the recruitment of new students are available in the Academic Handbook 2021/2022. Universitas Brawijaya offers various admission schemes for its different programmes (Independent Selection for Vocational Programme Admission, Undergraduate Programmes, Undergraduate Transfer Programme, Employer-Sponsored Students, Professional Education and Specialist Programmes, Postgraduate Programmes).

Universitas Brawijaya has formal prerequisites for admission and a defined selection procedure. There are several opportunities to join the different programmes. The Department of Business Administration is responsible for the Bachelor's study programme of Business Administration, the Bachelor's study programme of Taxation and the Bachelor's study programme of Tourism. The Public Administration Department is responsible for the Bachelor's study programme of Public Administration and the Master's study programme of Public Administration, and the Department of Administration Department for the Business and Public Administration doctoral programme.

The registration schedule follows the registration regulations for degree programmes of the Rectorate. The interview process works well for the selection, but the process could be improved with regard to the bonding of applicants (e. g., supporting advanced study programmes, visa processes, exchange opportunities). A final report on the results is sent to the dean. All requirements are clearly defined and available to prospective students.

There are two ways of registering new students at Brawijaya University, namely the national path and the independent path. The Bachelor's study programmes open new student admissions through three channels. This written examination is an independent examination route given by the university to prospective students

to be able to continue their studies at tertiary institutions. The capacity for this line is 30% of the total reception lines. Students of the independent path are mostly of higher quality. Consideration could therefore be given to strengthening or expanding this selection process.

Registration for the Higher Education Management Study Programme is through three pathways, namely independent, study assignments, and fast track. Brawijaya University attracts also students from other universities. The applying students need to fulfil the requirements and are interviewed during the process. These access paths are comprehensible and adequately designed. Registration for the doctoral programme in the Faculty of Administrative Sciences is carried out centrally by Universitas Brawijaya.

Universitas Brawijaya has introduced mechanisms and criteria to recognize periods of studies.

The university has an academic system for reviewing student progress based on indicators such as GPA, number of credits, etc. The key indicators have therefore also been available in the assessment process. For example, the number of dropouts is very low. ILOs are measured directly, but also partially indirectly through tracer studies, satisfaction, etc. Accordingly, extensive data material is available on the learning progress of the students. Overall, this approach appears appropriate.

After finishing their studies, students receive an academic Bachelor's or Master's degree or are awarded a doctoral degree. They are receiving their certificate and a diploma supplement.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*
>
> *Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*
>
> *[ESG 1.5]*

Description

At FAS, lecturers are divided into three categories, namely permanent civil servant lecturers, non-civil servant permanent lecturers and lecturers with work agreements. The SER states that regulations for recruitment are in place. Based on national guidelines, the lecturers' workload covers 12 to 16 credits per semester; this includes teaching, research, and community service activities. Research is compulsory for teaching staff. The faculty's research activities are described as following the National Research Master Plan and UB's Research Master Plan for Social Sciences.

According to the SER, the full-time teaching staff for the seven programmes under review comprises 147 lecturers, consisting of eleven professors, 31 associate professors, 93 assistant professors, and twelve lecturers. Based on FAS regulations, teachers in the doctoral programme must be at least an associate professor with a doctoral degree. Assistant professors can teach in the doctoral programme if they form a team with an associate professor or professor. In the Master's programme, the minimum requirement for lecturing is being an assistant professor. Lecturer staffing is arranged in every semester. It is explained in the SER that lecturers shall be given opportunities to pursue career development, e.g., through scientific activities (national and

international conferences or seminars) or opportunities as guest researchers. The SER states that regulations for promotion and filling of vacancies are in place.

FAS states that every full-time teaching staff is qualified to be a supervisor for thesis advisory purposes. The study programme manager appoints a supervisor based on the student's submitted research proposal. For the Master's thesis, two thesis supervisors are required per student. In this case, UB has regulated according to the SER that the principal supervisor is at least a doctor with the position of assistant professor while the second supervisor can be a lecturer.

According to the SER, in the doctoral programme three thesis supervisors are needed. The principial supervisor for a PhD thesis must have a minimum qualification as associate professor with a doctoral degree, who has published an article in a reputable international journal. As explained by UB, external supervisors are only available for the doctoral programme and only appointed for research-related reasons. According to the SER, an external supervisor is not necessarily appointed, except when no local teaching staff has the qualifications to supervise some details in the research project. In such case, external supervisors can be lecturers or practitioners, such as the head of BNPB, state officials, and government officials with adjusted requirements. The former must meet the minimum qualifications with a doctoral degree and have the functional position of associate professor. For the latter, the minimum requirements are their experiences in tailored issues related to the research project. The nominated external supervisor is to be submitted by the internal supervisor to KPS for consideration before their approval.

Experts' evaluation

Without any doubt, the teaching staff is quantitatively and qualitatively sufficient to carry out the study programmes under review. Especially their identification with the Brawijaya University and their motivation to contribute to further improvement must be commended. The university shows a high degree of academically well-educated staff members. Unfortunately, the vast amount of faculty members lacks experience outside of Universitas Brawijaya. In reference to the aimed increase of internationalisation, further efforts should be made to increase the international experience of existing faculty, while also considering hiring more international faculty members as permanent staff, as well as invited guest-lecturers. The existing support for scholarly activities of the teaching staff could set even more focus on internationalisation, especially in providing funding for abroad experience of faculty members. Another recommendation of the experts concerning the aspired internationalisation concerns especially the younger members of faculty with international experience in teaching and publishing, who might be stronger involved in decision-making processes within the university bodies so as to utilise their experience (**Finding 14**). When it comes to plans for further internationalisation, a specific effort on decreasing the existing heterogeneity in terms of the English language abilities, such as staff specific language courses, might also be helpful (**Finding 15**).

In general, a more structured and transparent procedure including specific incentives, even beyond financial incentives, e. g., in terms of teaching load reduction might help to further increase the continuous effort for individual development, e. g., through publications or research (**Finding 16**).

Existing research activities seem to strongly focus on local and applied research which makes it difficult to clearly increase the high impact journal publications of faculty. Hence the existing international network of partner universities could be utilized to increase research in the field of Comparative Area Studies, which promises a high chance of publication in well-established international journals.

When it comes to existing PhD activities, the further inclusion of international examiners within the boards or even the establishment of joint PhD programmes with international partners might even foster the attractivity of Brawijaya on an international level.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*
>
> *Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*
>
> *[ESG 1.6]*

Description

UB states that course material and course descriptions (Semester Lesson Plans, RPS) are updated before the start of every semester. Students shall have access to the material on the university's learning platform and they shall receive a schedule each semester. Information on the academic regulations is explained as being available in the different Academic Handbooks.

FAS describes in the SER that it has its own buildings for its lecture infrastructure and to support other academic activities and administrative services. According to the SER, each of these buildings comprises rooms that function for academic activities based on interrelated groupings and functions. According to the SER, these rooms are technically equipped.

Bachelor students at UB shall be supported by academic advisors, assigned to them for the duration of their studies; their role is to assist students in planning their studies each semester, evaluating semester outcomes and other aspects of the educational process. Each student is required to meet with the PA lecturer at least three times in one semester, which is usually done at the beginning, middle and end of the semester. Additional counselling for non-academic matters is described as being available at the Student Counselling Division. According to the SER, Master and doctoral students do not receive personal academic supervision beyond that provided by the thesis supervisors. However, it is explained in the SER that an orientation period for all accepted doctoral students is provided that aims to explain different aspects of academic and non-academic activities that doctoral students must undergo.

UB offers support for students with special needs through the UB Disability Service Study Centre (DSSC). FAS states that, in addition to mentoring facilities, they also provide infrastructure facilities in the form of special wheelchair ramps and elevators equipped with sound.

Financial aid and scholarships are also described as available for the study programmes. The faculty also offers fee waiver opportunities.

The faculty states in the SER that it provides free internet connection services for students.

According to the SER, the PhD programme in Administrative Science provides a supervisor team for each student consisting of three people: a promoter and two co-promoters responsible for guiding doctoral students. In addition, several other supporting units are listed, such as the Feasibility Commission, Examiner Council, External Blind Reviewer, Endorsement Commission, and the Plagiarism-Free Certification Team. The doctoral programme in Administrative Science has standard rules in the pre-candidate and candidate stages. FAS also states to provide opportunities for doctoral students to assist supervisors/teaching staff in conducting grant-based research.

Experts' evaluation

Students are provided with necessary course related information using syllabi (see also Chapter 3).

The university as a whole but especially FAS provides their students with "non-standard" modes of study. Students whose GPA in the previous semester was lower than 3.0 (out of 4) cannot take a full semester workload (e.g., full semester workload is 20-24, GPA <3 students can take only up to 18 credits). This enables students, who were not able to achieve a very good GPA in the previous semester, to focus more on less courses. While this alone might have negative impact on the duration of studies, the faculty offers students to take up to 15 additional credits in the semester break between spring and fall semester. This "additional" semester can also be used to graduate faster than the regularly scheduled eight semesters for the Bachelor's study programme. Overall, these two additional study modes can be used in different ways to ensure student success and reasonable duration of studies.

The infrastructure which the experts were able to examine during the on-site-visit, was overall appropriate. For different study programmes, different laboratories provided students with the opportunity to apply their theoretical knowledge practically outside of internships. The university also has a centre of Study and Services for Disabilities to support students with disabilities in their studies. Students are able to receive important information on their studies and courses online and are supported through all stages of the student life cycle if they have questions concerning the online platforms needed for their studies.

While the university has an impressive access to the relevant e-learning/libraries such as Springer, Cambridge etc., the equipment with standard literature in the form of books seemed a little outdated. Even though the e-library system provides the students with extensive access, the faculty should consider having a standard repertoire of current print editions in the faculty library (**Finding 17**).

One of the strong points of the FAS is the strong system of academic supervisory. While this system must bind enormous amounts of resources, it ensures close academic supervision and certainly provides a very good level of support in each of the programmes under review. Also, the university-wide offers for support and guidance are adequate.

At the university, a system of tuition waivers/a scheme of nine different levels of tuition fees exists depending on the parent income. E.g., additional scholarships for exchange programmes are offered.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information / Public information

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*
>
> *[ESG 1.8]*

Description

As stated by the university, the website of UB provides overall information on its study programmes and study conditions as well as services to students. As stated in the SER, the homepage includes information on profiles, education, research and service activities, students and alumni services, facilities, and quality assurance procedures and results.

The faculty's website is described as providing general information related to profiles, resources, and institutional policies. The study programmes' websites shall provide information related to lectures, activity resources, and curriculum and student guides (e.g., for internships and thesis) as well as quality assurance. The SER states that it is planned to provide more information on social media for each programme.

Experts' evaluation

Universitas Brawijaya provides a wide range of information materials for students and prospective students, and also for partners and the general public. The websites of Universitas Brawijaya, especially of the Faculty of Administrative Science, are available in Indonesian and in English. The university also uses social media to make information available to the public.

Even though information on the quality assurance system is currently still missing, the range of available information is generally broad, and the content is informative. The design of the website is comprehensible and well structured. In addition to the faculty profile with information on history, vision and mission, goals and strategic, organisational structure, information on faculty members as well as units, etc. is also available. Vision and mission are almost always deduced in each case to the level of the study programmes.

For students, the relevant information on registration, accreditation, the academic calendar, educational and internship guidelines, and guidelines on theses are provided. Complete information on profile, lectures and staff as well as facilities is provided for the assessed study programmes. The structure and layout of the websites especially regarding these details is largely standardised. However, in the assessment period, some websites were still labelled "under construction", and can, therefore, not be assessed in this report.

A highlight on the website is that news on faculty's activities is also available in both languages. Unfortunately, it must also be noted that not all documentation is generally provided in English, especially information concerning the different programmes that is not generally available on the website. In such cases, lecturers try to translate this information for the students. During the desired internationalisation process, it is therefore important to ensure that all information, documents, etc. provided are also available in English (**Finding 18**).

In some areas, additionally, information appears to be outdated. For example, the information on strategic planning already ends with the year 2020. The currently valid Academic Yearbook, as well as other materials provided to the experts, is not available on the website at all. Here, the faculty should ensure that the information provided is regularly updated.

Apart from the content, Universitas Brawijaya could check whether the design and the provided information of the faculties could be harmonized concerning its layout, e.g., in presentations. Certainly, it would be an additional benefit if the entire presentation of the university and all faculties would have the same design and provided information in a largely similar structure. However, this is a fact that neither the study programmes being evaluated nor the faculty can improve this on their own; thus, this remark rather points at UB as a whole.

Universitas Brawijaya also uses input from outside to obtain information for further development. In this respect, the topic of "information" is not just a one-way communication where the faculty provides information about its study programmes. For example, experts from the labour market are also involved in the development of the different curricula. The experts welcome this kind of stakeholder involvement.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

V.   Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes "Business Administration (Bachelor)", "Public Administration (Bachelor)", "Taxation (Bachelor)", "Tourism (Bachelor)" and "Business Administration (Master)" offered by Universitas Brawijaya with conditions.

Findings:

1. UB is strongly recommended to revise the ILOs for all programmes to guarantee they are formulated on a similar level of abstraction.

2. The faculty should harmonise the structure of module descriptions to be identical, contain an overview of relevant literature, and include the chosen method of assessment as well as the ILOs, which support and match those of the whole study programme. There should be only one version of an ideal study plan.

3. The different course lecturers should make sure that they are using up to date literature in their courses.

4. The curricula of the study programmes should include soft skills, such as communication skills and English language skills.

5. The workload for students should be distributed more evenly and potentially reduced throughout the studies, e.g., by changing some mandatory courses to the category of elective courses.

6. More courses should be taught in English in the study programme "Taxation" (BA), e.g., "International Business" or "International Taxation".

7. Concentrations should be introduced to the tourism curriculum in order to provide students with more specialised qualification in accordance to the field of tourism they are aiming at.

8. Course content, course learning outcomes and examinations used in the "Tourism" programme must be revised to make sure they complement each other.

9. Documentation for all study programmes should be revised to improve their transparency and draw a clearer picture of the programmes' content.

10. The faculty must provide proof that the relevant documentation and information on its quality assurance system is available on its updated website and a mechanism for continuous updates is implemented.

11. An administrative body that is responsible for harmonising and taking care of all surveys and questionnaires filled out by students should be implemented.

12. To make sure all stakeholders are heard and kept up to date, FAS should implement a structured process of dealing with all feedback given and disseminating its results amongst all stakeholders.

13. The faculty should define transparently and coherently the different methods of teaching and assessment in a central document.

14. To increase internationalisation the programmes should
    a) offer staff members more academic experiences outside of UB, nationally and preferably internationally (such as conferences, exchanges or workshops);
    b) hire more international academic staff and inviting more international guest lecturers;
    c) use the experiences of younger, internationally experienced, staff for teaching methods and international publishing;
    d) focus conference and publishing funding on international conferences and journals, respectively.

15. FAS should support its staff to increase its English skills, e.g., through language classes specifically for staff.

Q

16. Additional incentives should be implemented for staff to increase publications and research, e.g., through workload reduction.

17. The faculty's library should be updated to at least offer a standard repertoire of current print editions of the books used the most in courses as well as standard books for the study programmes in question.

18. The study programmes must ensure that all core information on their study programmes is available and published in English.