



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS PADJADJARAN

CLUSTER COMMUNICATION

COMMUNICATION SCIENCE (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

COMMUNICATION SCIENCE (MASTER OF ARTS)

COMMUNICATION SCIENCE (PHD)

LIBRARY AND INFORMATION SCIENCE (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

PUBLIC RELATIONS (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

COMMUNICATION MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

JOURNALISM (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

December 2023



Content

Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	3
I. Preamble	8
II. Accreditation procedure.....	8
1. Criteria.....	8
2. Approach and methodology	8
III. General information on the university	10
IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....	10
1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme.....	10
1.1 Communication Science (Bachelor of Arts).....	11
1.2 Communication Science (Master of Arts)	13
1.3 Communication Science (PhD)	14
1.4 Library and information science (Bachelor of Arts)	15
1.5 Public relations (Bachelor of Arts)	17
1.6 Communication management (Bachelor of Arts)	19
1.7 Journalism (Bachelor of Arts)	20
2. Procedures for quality assurance	21
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students	23
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification	27
5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff	28
6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment.....	30
7. Information / Public information	32
V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....	34

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (MASTER OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (PHD)
- “LIBRARY AND INFORMATION SCIENCE” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “PUBLIC RELATIONS” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “JOURNALISM” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PADJADJARAN, JATINANGOR, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 19th meeting on 04 December 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “Communication Science” (Bachelor of Arts), “Communication Science” (Master of Arts), “Communication Science” (PhD), “Library and Information Science” (Bachelor of Arts), “Public Relations” (Bachelor of Arts), “Communication Management” (Bachelor of Arts), and “Journalism” (Bachelor of Arts) offered by Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

Conditions:

For all study programmes:

1. The process of quality assurance with regard to the evaluation and monitoring of the study programmes must be elaborately documented, paying special attention to how all relevant groups (e.g., stakeholders, experts, alumni, lecturers, students) are addressed, and how their input is included and processed at university, faculty and programme level. As a consequence of this, the changes and modifications in the curriculum must be made transparent to all parties involved.

2. Meetings with labour market representatives and alumni must be more formally and structurally organised on a periodical basis.
3. The module/course descriptions have to be updated regarding the two following aspects:
 - a. Teaching methods must be listed more transparently and support the achievement of the course learning outcomes.
 - b. References and literature listed in the module/course descriptions must be updated.

Additionally for the Bachelor's and Master's programmes:

4. The grading criteria for the assignments and final exams must be defined more clearly and made available to students.

Additionally for the study programme "Journalism" (Bachelor of Arts):

5. Due to the nature of journalism and the internationalisation goal of the study programme, a plan to improve English competencies of students, particularly journalistic writing skills in English to prepare students for the later professional work, must be handed in.

Additionally for the study programme "Communication Science" (PhD):

6. Qualification courses must be provided for students from different backgrounds to bridge the knowledge gap.
7. The practice and application of independent learning and critical thinking must be better reflected in the curriculum.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all study programmes:

1. To maintain and further enhance the alignment of the curriculum with the labour market's needs at the international level, a structured monitoring system should be established for the development of the industry worldwide.
2. Findings of evaluations should be disseminated to students to inform them about changes as well as solutions for improvement.
3. The operational issues caused by the application that monitors and evaluates the MBKM programme should be addressed to ensure the seamless operation of the programme as well as facilitate students' participation in this programme.
4. The collaboration with international academics and sector representatives should be intensified in order to achieve the internationalisation goal in education, as well as to enhance student interactions with experts specialising in different subject fields.
5. Diversification of the teaching staff with varying academic backgrounds and cultural perspectives should be actively pursued.

6. A formal and transparent regulation to increase research capacity and elevate the quality of international publications in indexed journals should be available.
7. The awarding scheme to give additional incentives for teaching staff should be made more transparent by setting more specific criteria.
8. The university's website and social media should be revised regarding the following aspects:
 - a. The website's structure should focus more on the benefits for prospective students, parents, and employers.
 - b. All content of the website and social media channels should be offered in both Indonesian and English.
 - c. The websites should be regularly checked for up-to-dateness.
9. Information on compulsory parts of the curricula such as internships should be made more transparent and visible to students.
10. The information on converting credits from the Indonesian system to ECTS should be made public on the university's website to provide incoming international students with the understanding of the workload.
11. More English proficiency courses as well as courses taught in English should be offered to achieve the aim of internationalisation.
12. The university should ensure the transparency in the hiring process regarding the required criteria on qualifications for external/international lecturers.

Additionally for the study programme "Communication Science" (Master of Arts):

13. The criteria for publications in books or national/international journals by students should be defined more explicitly to guarantee research quality as well as transparency and fairness in the assessment.
14. More courses that can frame current international, regional, national socio-economic, political, cultural problems through multidisciplinary theories and approaches should be integrated into the curriculum. To create more room for new courses to be added, foundational courses such as "communication science" and "development of the communication science" in the first year should be combined into one course.

Additionally for the study programme "Communication Science" (PhD):

15. The uniqueness of the programme profile compared to similar programmes at other universities should be sharpened.

Additionally for the study programme "Library and Information Science" (Bachelor of Arts):

16. The theoretical knowledge of LSCHE (Library of Congress Subject Heading) in any related courses should be embedded in the curriculum to give students a solid foundation for skills in determining subject heading.
17. The elements of artificial intelligence (AI) should be delivered in any related courses of the study programme, since this element of skill is quite in demand in the current industry, particularly in the era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0.

Additionally for the study programme “Public Relations” (Bachelor of Arts):

18. Courses regarding the economic and managerial knowledge and leadership basics (theory and skills) should be added into the curriculum to provide students with an understanding of corporations and organisations and how they work.
19. Given the current wide range of courses, these courses should be categorised into specialisations (e.g., brand management or sustainable PR) so that students can then decide to choose their preferred specialisations.
20. Final examinations should more clearly reflect the achievement of the ILOs as well as ensure a balanced integration of both scientific and practical competencies.
21. Students’ theoretical knowledge and research skills for the thesis writing should be strengthened by adding courses in empirical methodology and scientific writing.

Additionally for the study programme “Communication Management” (Bachelor of Arts):

22. To better prepare students for consecutive Master's programmes and bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application, the following aspects should be implemented:
 - a. Basic courses on theoretical and practical management skills should be introduced.
 - b. Management theory and practice, offering essential corporate and product management fundamentals should be incorporated to complement the existing theoretical aspects like philosophy or psychology.
23. Students’ theoretical knowledge and research skills for the thesis writing should be strengthened by adding courses in empirical methodology and scientific writing.

Additionally for the study programme “Journalism” (Bachelor of Arts):

24. The courses with a possibly overlapping content should be merged and the elective course, namely “Specialised Journalism” offered in semester 6 should be made compulsory and integrate interdisciplinary topics on current international, regional, national political, cultural, economic issues.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts’ report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (MASTER OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION SCIENCE” (PHD)
- “LIBRARY AND INFORMATION SCIENCE” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “PUBLIC RELATIONS” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “COMMUNICATION MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)
- “JOURNALISM” (BACHELOR OF ARTS)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PADJADJARAN, JATINANGOR, INDONESIA

Visit to the university: 31.05.2023 – 02.06.2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Sevda Alankus	Yasar University, Faculty for Communication, Professor for Communication Sciences (Turkey)
Prof. Dr. Jan Lies	FOM University of Applied Sciences, Professor for Public Relations (Germany)
Prof. Dr. Asmadi Mohammed Ghazali	Universiti Teknologi MARA, Professor for Information and Library Sciences (Malaysia)
Prof. Dr. Anang Sujoko	University Brawijaya, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Professor for Communication Sciences (Indonesia)
Dr. Christine Loetters	Founder and Owner of SCL Strategy Communication Loetters, Bonn (representative of the labour market) (Germany)
Julien Seid	Student of Communication Sciences, University of Hohenheim (student expert) (Germany)
Coordinator: Ronny Heintze Vi Le	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the programmes **“Communication Science” (Bachelor of Arts)**, **“Communication Science” (Master of Arts)**, **“Communication Science” (PhD)**, **“Communication Management” (Bachelor of Arts)**, **“Library and Information Science” (Bachelor of Arts)**, **“Public Relations” (Bachelor of Arts)**, and **“Journalism” (Bachelor of Arts)** offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran**.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in August 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In July 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 26 October 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in April 2023.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in April 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 31.05.2023 – 02.06.2023. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 4 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2024, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Padjadjaran (UNPAD)

Universitas Padjadjaran (UNPAD) is a state university established in 1957 and located in Bandung and Jatinangor, Indonesia. In 2014 and 2018, UNPAD as a higher institution was accredited with “A” by the National Accreditation Board. According to the SER, UNPAD aims to become a world-class university and to achieve international accreditation for its study programmes. The strategic plan of UNPAD covers three main pillars of the Tri Dharma approach, which are education, research, and community outreach.

UNPAD has sixteen faculties and one graduate school. The faculties include Faculty of Communication Sciences, Faculty of Law, Faculty of Economics and Business, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Faculty of Cultural Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Agriculture, Faculty of Dentistry, Faculty of Psychology, Faculty of Animal Husbandry, Faculty of Nursing, Faculty of Fishery and Oceanography, Faculty of Agro-Industrial Technology, Faculty of Pharmacy, and Faculty of Geological Engineering. There are 187 active study programmes, of which 178 programmes have been accredited, while the remaining programmes are not yet eligible for national accreditation since they are newly established. In 2001, UNPAD had a total of 38,342 students and 184 full professors. The main research plan of UNPAD focuses on the sector of health, food, energy, environment, policy, information, and culture.

In terms of financing, UNPAD’s funding comes from two primary sources: (1) national and regional budget for public universities and (2) other entities such as businesses, education fund, endowment fund, collaborations, etc. The budget plan at UNPAD is approved by the Board of Trustee thirty days before the start of the new fiscal year.

The Faculty of Communication Sciences (FIKOM)

The Faculty of Communication Sciences was established in 1960 and currently has 10 study programmes. According to the SER, this is the only faculty of communication sciences at state universities in Indonesia. The faculty has seven study programmes to be accredited, namely Library and Information Science (Bachelor), Public Relations (Bachelor), Communication Management (Bachelor), Journalism (Bachelor), and Communication Science (Bachelor/Master/PhD). Research within the faculty is coordinated by three study centres including the Centre for Communication Studies, Information systems, Media, and Culture, the Centre for Health Communication Studies, and the Centre for Environmental Communication Studies.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor’s/Master’s degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum’s design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Doctoral degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

General aspects

As outlined in the SER, the curriculum of the study programmes to be accredited is designed based on the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNi or INQF) and the outcome-based education (OBE) approach. The intended programme learning outcomes are clustered into four main aspects: attitude, knowledge, general skills, and specific skills.

Generally, the curriculum consists of compulsory and elective courses. As for the study workload, 1 credit (SKS) is calculated as 170 minutes per week per semester, including 50 minutes of face-to-face activity, 60 minutes of structured assignment activities, and 60 minutes of independent activities. During the pandemic, all study programmes implemented online learning in synchronous and asynchronous formats through learning management systems such as LiVE UNPAD and Google classroom. The university states that each curriculum is evaluated periodically by both internal and external stakeholders.

1.1 Communication Science (Bachelor of Arts)

Description

The Bachelor's programme in Communication Science defines its graduate profiles as scientific communication professionals, digital communication planners, and social entrepreneurs. Students are expected to gain the ability to identify, explain, and use relevant communication theories in various fields; present in public by combining rhetorical skills, communication planning, and visual communication; create communication products on various media; apply quantitative and qualitative data analysis in various communication research contexts; and conduct research on the development of information and communication technology and its implication for the society. Following the National Work Competency Standard (NWCS), the learning outcomes correspond to level 6, as stated in the SER.

The curricular structure consists of three main parts: (1) scientific foundations and concepts of communication through compulsory courses at the university and study programme level in the first and second semester, in each of which students can take 23 – 24 credits, (2) the specifics of communication science in the field of health literacy, political literacy, and media and cultural literacy in the third, fourth, seventh and eighth semester with a study workload of 6 – 12 credits, and (3) the implementation of the independent learning programme in the fifth and sixth semester. In the last semester, students take 2 credits for thesis seminar and 6 credits for thesis.

Courses are divided into compulsory and elective courses. Compulsory university courses comprise Pancasila and citizenship, English, Bahasa Indonesia, and Religion in the first semester, whereas Public speaking, Introduction to communication science, Communication theory, Communication planning, Survey methods, Qualitative research methods, etc. are classified as compulsory study programme courses. In the fifth semester, students can take elective courses included in the Independent Learning Independent Campus programme (MBKM). If students do a 6-month certified internship programme of the Ministry of Education and Culture, it can be converted to 20 credits. In total, the study workload of this programme is 144 credits, equivalent to 259.2 credits in the ECTS according to the conversion of UNPAD.

Experts' evaluation

The study programme and the desired qualification refer to the Indonesian national qualification framework (IQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 6, which indicates that graduates can apply, study, design, and utilise science and technology in solving procedural problems. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 6. Every desired qualification is already presented as intended learning outcomes. The intended learning outcomes adequately accommodate academic and labour market needs. In terms of academic requirements, their achievement can be demonstrated through students' reports and theses, while in terms of practical sphere, they can produce audio-video projects.

The curriculum structure used by this study programme includes special character-building courses, communication science, communication studies and research, communication knowledge and expertise, and supporting expertise. Courses with specific subjects include types of communication such as interpersonal communication, organizational communication, public speaking, group communication, visual communication, and photography. Cross-subjects include political communication, communication psychology, health communication, communication sociology, social marketing communication, specific propaganda campaigns, and risk and crisis communication. Subjects related to mastery of methodology include social statistics, survey methods, and content analysis (as basic elements of the thesis). The elective courses also offer qualitative research. In addition, courses related to general skills, such as applying logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking, are also offered. There is a transparent and adequate internship programme in the curriculum design. Internship programmes are offered in semesters 5 and 6 in three forms: job training, MBKM, and IISMA (Indonesian International Student Mobility Awards). The curriculum structure supports the defined intended learning outcomes and learner's progression. This is shown by placing several basic courses in the first and second semesters. They proceed from the mastery of specific fields of communication studies to the mastery of research methods. In the 3rd year, students are offered elective courses (integrated with the MBKM) with the hope that in the 4th year, they can complete a research proposal and thesis. Students are also involved in several research or community service activities (KKNM-PPMD) by lecturers to strengthen scientific mastery in the field and support learning outcomes. In the first two years, all courses are compulsory. The result of this curriculum structure shows that 60% of students can complete their study in 4 years.

The Indonesian National Accreditation Board has accredited this study programme with the Excellence (A) title. This means evaluations, graduate surveys, and labour market satisfaction have been conducted. In discussions with alumni and the labour market, it was also seen that they had been involved in several meetings to evaluate the learning process and curriculum. Evaluation of the learning process is usually carried out every four years, while evaluation per semester only involves students. According to the labour market and alumni, the graduates from this study programme are ready to work. The good recognitions come from the labour market, which states that the graduated student from the communication science study programme has a good capability to adapt quickly and adequate skill in the industry. The study programme routinely evaluates the curriculum by involving professional associations (ISKI), UGM Communication Professor as a communication scholar, communication science programme organizer associations (ASPIKOM), alumni and the labour market (Maverick -research company, Agate Studio Company, Mass Media Industry – New Media and Television Stations). They also developed several studies based on trending issues, such as studies related to digital communication planners and social entrepreneurs.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

1.2 Communication Science (Master of Arts)

Description

The objective of this programme is to produce excellent graduates in the field of communication sciences and engage students in more research and community outreach activities. According to the SER, the learning outcomes of graduates are aligned with level 8 of the Indonesian National Qualification Framework.

The curriculum consists of 36 – 50 credits which should be completed in 4 years. However, students can also finish the programme in less than 4 years or extend up to 10 semesters including thesis preparation. The curriculum is structured as core courses (28 credits), elective courses according to specialisation (9 credits), research proposal seminars (2 credits), and thesis (6 credits). Students are required to take a workload of 44 credits, which is equivalent to 77.4 credit points in the ECTS.

In the first semester, students learn about communication ontology (courses including Philosophy, Study of communication, and Information theory and development), communication epistemology (the quantitative and qualitative research methods course), and communication planning development and design (courses such as Strategic communication, Organisational communication and behaviour, and Communication of multiculturalism). Courses in the second semester involve science, technology, and social changes as well as axiology and specialisations. Students are required to attend research proposal seminars and conduct a research proposal session in the third semester, and then start their field or library research when their proposal is approved by the supervisors. The last semester is dedicated to students' thesis.

Experts' evaluation

The study programme refers to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (IQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 8, namely developing science and technology through research, innovation, and testing, solving problems with a multidisciplinary approach. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 7. The curriculum prepares the graduate for the labour market through public/private sectoral specialisations and advance academic works with its research-focused course design. It offers subject-specific specialisations through tracks of media studies, public relations, business communication, health communication, environmental communication, information, and library. Specialisation tracks in health communication and environmental communication give a particular character to the curriculum that considers closely the national/international context in line with general and specific learning outcomes of the programme.

The curriculum structure has a total of 44 credits consisting of 3 levels. The first level is in the form of strengthening communication skills, communication theory and research methods. The second level is the application of theory and research methods, and finally, on the level of final project achievement. The curriculum structure only offers eight compulsory courses before going through the process of preparing a thesis. Strengthening learning is carried out through several elective courses. Achievement of the Master's degree of communication science is indicated by the obligation to complete a final project in the form of a thesis and publication in the form of a book or an article in a scientific journal. However, the extent to which the criteria for publication can be transparently assessed is still unclear to the experts. The experts recommend defining more explicitly the criteria for publication in books or national/international journals to guarantee the research quality as well as transparency and fairness in the assessment (**Finding 1**).

The programme claims to be representing a multidisciplinary approach to communication, but it is designed along the lines of sub-disciplinarity of the communication science (media studies, public relations, business communication, etc.) and through different tracks of electives. Although "environmental communication" and "health communication" titles provide a rough idea about the multidisciplinary approach, the claimed approach is not clearly reflected in the early core programme. It is recommended to integrate more courses into the

curriculum that can frame the current international, regional, national socio-economic, political, cultural problems through multidisciplinary theories and approaches. To create more room for new courses to be added, foundational courses such as “communication science” and “development of the communication science” in the first year should be combined into one course (**Finding 2**). These adjustments will be aligned with the programme learning outcome (PLO) of “having the competence to design problem solving models with an inter/multidisciplinary approach in the field of communication in accordance with the progress of information and communication technology these days and projections in the future”. Furthermore, it is recommended that more English courses as well as courses taught in English should be offered to achieve the aim of internationalisation (**Finding 3**). This recommendation should apply to all study programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

1.3 Communication Science (PhD)

Description

The study programme identifies its graduate profiles as lecturers, researchers, experts, and managers in the field of communication science. According to the SER, the curriculum is developed following the competency-based approach, which support students to have the ability to transform and share knowledge in the field of communication, develop access to data and information sources, and criticise various communication phenomena. UNPAD states that the learning outcomes correspond to level 9 of the INQF.

Doctoral candidates are required to be involved in research activities and the results of their doctoral dissertation must be partly or entirely published in international journals. The study programme states that they support doctoral students in research activities by collaborating with institutions from within and outside Indonesia and organising international seminars and guest lectures from abroad (e.g. the Asian Network for Public Opinion Research – ANPOR). Doctoral students can take part in various international webinars and seminars. Furthermore, the programme also accepts international students.

The study load comprises a total of 42 credits (75.16 credit point in the ECTS), which are distributed into the following courses: Doctoral qualification competence with 12 credits allocated to four courses, namely Philosophy of science, Communication theory, Quantitative research methods, and Qualitative research methods with 3 credits each, Research proposal seminar (5 credits), Research results seminar (5 credits), Dissertation manuscript review (6 credits), Publication of scientific articles in international journals (9 credits), and Doctoral promotion session (5 credits). The duration of the programme is a maximum of 7 academic years or 14 semesters.

Experts' evaluation

The PhD programme in Communication Science refers to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (INQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 9, namely deepening and expanding new science and technology through research, completing problems with multi- or transdisciplinary approaches. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 8. The strength of the programme is preparing the graduates not only for the academic life but also for the managerial or policy maker positions in private or public sector due to its emphasis on “researching for problem solving” and alignment with intended learning outcomes. Based on the results of FGDs with alums/graduates and users, they acknowledge the quality of learning in this programme. This is indicated by the position of graduates of this programme, most of whom have held top-level managerial positions in several higher education institutions

and in industry. Some alumni are appointed as dean, deputy dean, head of department and programme chair at the university level. While in the industry, they are already holding policymaker positions.

The PhD programme is structured strictly on the bases of Master's programme offered by UNPAD. In the first semester of the study period, students gain reinforcement of material that was previously given at the Master's programme level, such as the philosophy of communication science, research methods and communication theories. In the second and third semesters, students are encouraged to write research proposals and start doing research so that they can start producing publications through international conference activities at the end of the semester. The total programme workload is correctly and transparently allocated to the different courses in the proper number of credits assigned. This programme is not loaded by the supporting multidisciplinary theories and approach as in the Master's programme but designed as a research-based programme. However, during the site visit, it was not clear to the experts how orientation of international students and students from different disciplines to the programme are provided. Therefore, foundational courses must be provided for students from different backgrounds to bridge the knowledge gap (**Finding 4**). Additionally, in order to attract more students, the uniqueness of the programme profile compared to similar programmes at other universities should be sharpened (**Finding 5**).

In the "general skills" part of the PLOs, it is emphasised that students are expected to "formulate scientific and technological arguments and solutions based on a critical view of facts, concepts, principles, or theories that can be scientifically justified". The curriculum structure offers three levels or stages to direct students to achieve this by providing a basis for scientific research, including scientific philosophy, communication theory, and qualitative and quantitative research methods. Besides, skills such as independent learning and critical thinking play a significant role in achieving this learning outcome. However, during the site visit, the experts could not explicitly assess to what extent critical thinking and independent learning are embedded in the curriculum, particularly when it comes to thesis framing and writing. In other words, the practice and application of independent learning and critical thinking must be better reflected in the the curriculum (**Finding 6**).

The achievement of the PhD academic degree in Communication Science is indicated by the obligation to complete the final assignment in the form of a dissertation and publication in the form of articles in reputable international journals (Scopus) with Quartile 3 and specifically for graduates with honour predicate must publish scientific articles in Scopus indexed journals Quartile 1 or 2. This also relates to the feasibility targets of research proposals with ILOs in scientific publications. To facilitate the publication process, the faculty has a strategy in the form of holding international conferences or collaborating with international institutions such as the Asian Network for Public Opinion Research (ANPOR), to facilitate students' interaction with international academic networks.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.4 Library and information science (Bachelor of Arts)

Description

The graduate profiles of this study programme include librarians, infopreneurs, and digital asset managers. The programme learning outcomes refer to level 6 of the INQF. The objectives of the programmes are to master the basics of library science knowledge and information science, apply the knowledge and expertise in various professional lines, continue studies, and for students to be able to adapt and develop in their career development.

The curriculum structure consists of three categories of courses, namely university courses, core competency courses, and supporting competency courses. University courses in line with the higher education regulations in Indonesia are mandatory in all study programmes of UNPAD. Core courses include communication science courses, library and information science knowledge and skills, and digital asset management studies, while supporting competency courses involve social knowledge and technology, comprising elective courses.

Courses from semester 1 to 8 are categorised into five course clusters, namely character building, communication sciences, library and information science research, professional knowledge and skills, and library and information science. The workload required is 146 credits, which can be taken in 7-14 semesters. Each semester consists of 20-24 credits, except for the last semester when students have to finish the research report equal to 6 credits. This total amount of credits is equivalent to 262.8 credit point in the ECTS.

Experts' evaluation

Overall, the programme' aims, objectives and learning outcomes are consistent and support UNPAD's vision and mission. The desired qualifications to achieve the intended learning outcomes are well documented according to 5 clusters: (1) character building, (2) communication sciences, (3) library and information science research, (4) professional knowledge and skills, and (5) library and information science. As to ensure intended learning outcomes are consistently updated and follow international standards, the study programme has made references to the National Library of Indonesia, APTIPI (Association for Higher Education in Library and Information Sciences), P3RI (Indonesian Record Management Professional Association), IPI (Indonesian Librarian Association), ATPUSI (Association of Indonesian School Librarians), (IFLA) International Federation of Library Associations, ALA (American Library Association), CONSAL (Congress of Southeast Asian Librarians), as well as input from the stakeholder. This circumstance ensures that the graduates including librarians, infopreneurs and digital asset managers are reliable and able to fulfil the current needs of industries, specifically in the field of library and information science (LIS).

The curricular structure of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcome and the learner's progression, which can also be seen in the lecturer-student evaluation questionnaire and discussion every semester. For example, during the discussion on the use of cataloguing tools in curriculum structure, the related syllabus applied the Resource Description & Access (RDA), a standard for descriptive cataloguing and the most widely used cataloguing standard worldwide. However, it is recommended that the study programme embed the theoretical knowledge of LSCHE (Library of Congress Subject Heading) in any related course to give students a solid foundation for skills in determining subject heading (**Finding 7**). Discussions with labour market experts via forums, workshops, and FGDs showed that the teaching staff frequently update the current needs and technology used in the current market. However, labour market representatives recommended conducting at least one structural annual meeting with faculty members (**see Chapter 2, Finding 18**). The objective of the official meeting is believed to be a beneficial platform to share knowledge and skills from technological perspectives. The experts also agree with a suggestion from the industry that the study programme should deliver the elements of artificial intelligence (AI) in any related course since this element of skill is quite in demand in the current industry, particularly in the era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 (**Finding 8**).

According to the discussion during the site visit, the services provided in UNPAD Library are embedded and support the curriculum structure of the LIS study programme. In addition, UNPAD's library also established a Digital Heritage Management Laboratory that can be utilised by LIS's students. Based on the SER, almost half of the courses offered were related to the skills and knowledge of library management. On the other hand, the study programme has a good collaboration with the National Library of Indonesia and the National Archive of Indonesia, especially in experiencing the use of the Preservation Laboratory, which can shape the skills and knowledge of preservation management and ensure the students are equipped with industry requirements,

especially in government or private information agencies. From the site visit with a thorough review of the curriculum, it is found that the core subjects are categorised into 7 groups throughout 8 semesters which follow the international standard (American Library Association and Congress of Southeast Asian Librarians), namely (i) foundations of the profession and LIS, (ii) information resources, (iii) organisation of knowledge and information, (iv) technological knowledge and skills, (v) reference and user services, (vi) research, and (vii) administration and management. This circumstance showed that the study programme is relevant and comparable with all the library schools worldwide.

All the learning outcomes from three categories of courses; (i) university subjects, (ii) core competency subjects, and (iii) supporting competency courses, are properly referred to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (INQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 6. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 6. The core subjects consist of three groups: (i) communication science, (ii) library and information science, and (iii) digital asset management studies. Based on the discussion during the site visit, the core subjects are shaped to be 60% theoretically and 40% practically which is based on the university's regulations. The total workload is correctly and transparently allocated with 20-24 credits per semester based on five-course curriculum clusters from semesters 1 to 8. All groups of subjects taught are aimed at the ILOs via face-to-face approach, structured assignments, practicums, seminars, and independent study. The intended learning outcomes of the programme are also well supported by two scientific publications, namely (i) Jurnal Kajian Informasi & Perpustakaan, and (ii) Information: Journal of Library and Information Science, joint research by lecturers and students, and internship, particularly at the national library. For example, students can understand preservation techniques and are skilful in the storage and dissemination process of information. There is also evidence of the student's involvement in research and community service activities funded by the Ministry of Education and Culture and from the university's internal grant.

From the SER, there are three categories of modification by the evaluation process, (i) evaluation for every semester (twice a year) by the study programme and students, (ii) evaluation for every semester by the study programme and faculty, and (iii) evaluation for any changes in curricular policies and regulation at university and national level. The experts learned from the site visit that the major revision of the curriculum happens every four years. In contrast, the minor modification only focuses on ICT development and deals with the addition of teaching material. For example, the LIS study programme has implemented the Chat GPT application which can be considered as open AI (artificial intelligence) in their reference material. The evidence showed that the amendments of the curriculum are documented transparently.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

1.5 Public relations (Bachelor of Arts)

Description

The Bachelor's programme in Public relations defines its learning outcomes at level 6 of the IQNF. The programme aims to produce students who are professional, adaptive, innovative, and creative in the field of public relations. The programme states that students will be provided with concepts and theories in public relations, general communication skills, as well as the possibility to apply concepts and theories into practice.

The curriculum is designed with core courses and elective courses. Core courses focus on the science of public relations and communication, which are taken from the first to fourth semester. Electives are integrated with other disciplines from other study programmes, faculties, or universities and available in the fifth, sixth,

and seventh semester. These courses also accommodate eight Independent Learning activities, namely Internships/Work practices, Village thematic community service programmes, Teaching, Student exchange, Entrepreneurship, Independent projects, and Humanitarian projects. The final project is in the eighth/last semester.

The 2020 curriculum is a revision of the 2017 curriculum. The total workload of the 2020 programme is 146 credits in Indonesian credit system. From semester 1 to 7, students are required to take 18-23 credits, while 8 credits in the last semester include 2 credits for seminars and 6 credits for their dissertation.

Experts' evaluation

The desired qualifications regarding operative and strategic PR competencies according to the presented intended learning outcomes are well documented and achieved. The students benefit from the curriculum designed with a variety of courses. Nevertheless, from the perspective of the experts, courses regarding the economic and managerial knowledge and leadership basics (theory and skills) should be added into the curriculum, because if graduates from this programme would like to work as operative and strategic specialists, they need to understand corporations and organisations and how they work (**Finding 9**). Furthermore, the study programme is currently offering a wide range of courses which the experts find more reasonable to categorise these courses into specialisations (e.g., brand management or sustainable PR) and students can then decide to choose their preferred specialisations (**Finding 10**). This is recommended to help the study programme meet the international standards more closely.

The study programme defines a comprehensive concept of Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) detailed in the SER. Their achievement could be validated during the site visit and are properly referred to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (INQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 6. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 6. The curriculum of the programme is also designed to facilitate the attainment of these desired learning outcomes. However, it is recommended that final examinations should more clearly reflect the achievement of the ILOs as well as ensure a balanced integration of both scientific and practical competencies (**Finding 11**).

The experts assess that the final theses meet the requirements of a Bachelor's degree. However, to better prepare the Bachelor's students for Master's programmes, the experts recommend strengthening students' theoretical knowledge and research skills for the thesis writing by adding courses in empirical methodology and scientific writing (**Finding 12**). This approach should encompass teaching the art of scientific writing, imparting the necessary knowledge on how to effectively complete assignments and theses.

During the site visit, the labour market representatives in the field of PR as well as the alumni confirmed the appropriateness of the curriculum aligned with the labour market's needs. To maintain and further enhance this alignment on the international level, it is recommended to establish a structured monitoring system for the development of the industry worldwide (**Finding 13**). This could be implemented by founding an international PR board comprising experts from international corporate communication departments and PR agencies.

Additionally, the programme's curricular modules are transparently outlined within the syllabus, accompanied by a typical course plan. The study workload measured using the Indonesian credit system is plausibly distributed with the elective and compulsory courses presented in a comprehensive manner through idealised schedules. Yet, it is essential to acknowledge the differences in the Indonesian credit system as compared to those of other nations through public information (**see Chapter 7, Finding 30**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

1.6 Communication management (Bachelor of Arts)

Description

According to the SER, the Bachelor's programme in Communication management set its learning outcomes at level 6 of the INQF. Graduate profiles are identified as communication strategists, marketing communication officers, and human resources communication development officers.

Compulsory and elective courses are two main parts of the curriculum structure. Students are required to take a total of 144 credits for this study programme. This number of credits are allocated into six course blocks based on learning objectives, namely strategic communication (19 credits), general communication skills (32 credits), media and communication technology (13 credits), strategic communication for business interests (13 credits), strategic communication for social interests (11 credits), communication human resources (15 credits), and communication management research (18 credits). Compulsory courses can be taken from the first to fourth semester, while semester 5 to 7 are for elective courses. In the last semester, students take 3 credits for seminars and 6 credits for their dissertation. The total study load required is 144 credits, which are equivalent to 259.2 credit points in ECTS.

Experts' evaluation

The qualifications necessary to attain the intended learning outcomes are well documented in accordance with the requirements of the field of operative and communication management. These qualifications are delineated through the definition of specific graduate profiles, which include roles such as communication strategists, marketing communication officers, and human resources communication development officers. The intended learning outcomes are properly referred to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (INQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 6. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 6. However, to effectively prepare students for these roles and align them with the ILOs, it is recommended to incorporate academic and scientific courses into the curriculum (**see Finding 12**). For instance, if the graduates aspire to pursue a career as communication strategists, they should have gained a deep understanding of the socio-economic systems within which they will operate. This holistic approach ensures that students are well-equipped to excel in their chosen professions while meeting the specified qualifications and fulfilling the intended learning outcomes.

The programme's current focus lies on fulfilling the operative and strategic requirements of communication management, aligning well with the ILOs. However, to better prepare students for consecutive Master's programmes and bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application, the study programme's management should introduce basic courses on theoretical and practical management skills (**Finding 14a**). While labour market representatives hold the study programme in high regard for meeting operative communication management requirements, they emphasise the need for additional management training on the job to fully educate graduates. To address this, it is recommended that the curriculum incorporate management theory and practice, offering essential corporate and product management fundamentals to complement the existing theoretical aspects like philosophy or psychology (**Finding 14b**).

Regarding the study workload, the experts believe that it is reasonably allocated and transparently documented. While the study programme already conducted evaluation on the study programme through feedback of graduates, a more comprehensive approach would be more beneficial. Establishing an integrated survey routine that incorporates the perspectives of all relevant stakeholders, including students, lecturers, and employers, will enable continuous monitoring and evaluation of the study programmes (**see Chapter 2**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

1.7 Journalism (Bachelor of Arts)

Description

As stated in the SER, the study programme aims to provide students with the ability to contribute to solving the problem of information and media literacy gaps in Indonesian society, and to understand the crucial role of journalism in the information and media ecosystem in Indonesia. Graduate profiles are identified as journalists, writers, photographers, infographics and data visualisers, data analysts, journalistic content creators, researchers, teachers, and consultants. The university states that the learning outcomes of the Journalism study programme are based on IQNF level 6.

The total number of credits for this programme is 144 credits (259.2 credit point in the ECTS), which can be taken within 8-14 semesters. From semester 1 to 6, students should complete 20-24 credits for each semester. Compulsory courses at the university and study programme level must be taken in the first and second semester. Compulsory courses related to knowledge of journalism include research methodologies, theories, structure, and history of communication, general knowledge, writing, storytelling, and audio-visual techniques (analogical and digital), technologies and technological skills, theory and structure of the journalistic profession, news production, journalistic genres, specialised journalism, and company and business model.

The study programme categorises the body of knowledge into five course clusters, namely character building, communication science, supporting knowledge and skills, journalism study and research, and journalism knowledge and skills. Moreover, students can choose a regular lecture outside the study programme as part of the Independent Learning Independent Campus (MBKM) programme in semester 6.

Experts' evaluation

The curriculum of the Journalism study programme is well defined, structured and transparently publicised on the programme's website. The intended learning outcomes of the programme are properly referred to the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (INQF) and National Higher Education Standards (NWCS) level 6 and concentrate on knowledge, general and special skills in journalism. This qualification also aligns with the European Qualification Framework (EQF) level 6. The programme covers grounding communication and journalism theory classes and offers quite diverse practical courses that bring in general and special skills of journalism. The curriculum offers intensively traditional and digital media such as radio, podcast, newspaper, audio-visual and specific specialisations in journalism such as reporting, opinion writing and news writing. This can be demonstrated through the courses offered such as news writing, reporting, opinion writing, radio journalism, photojournalism to data journalism, audio-visual journalism, convergence journalism, etc. The students are therefore well prepared for the professional life and equipped with basic journalistic skills.

However, the study programme mentioned one learning outcome as "Understanding the determinants of the journalistic ecosystem, namely social, cultural, legal, economic, political, and communication systems in national and global contexts", the experts find the range of courses offered quite limited in order to achieve this learning outcome. The students are expected to broaden the prospective journalists' intellectual capacities to the global, regional economic, political, cultural issues by bringing in subject-specific specialisations. Thus, the experts recommend that the courses with a possibly overlapping content (e.g., "reporting", "in-depth reporting", "news writing") should be merged and the elective course, namely "Specialised Journalism" offered in semester 6 should be made compulsory and integrate interdisciplinary topics on the current international, regional, national political, cultural, economic issues (**Finding 15**).

According to the SER, the curriculum is revised regularly on the bases of "findings from accreditation, certification, and assessment of various institutions" and the programme not only meets the requirements of the digitalisation and convergence of the journalism, but also continue the important traditional media in national context. But the appendix submitted for instance does not document the reports of any regular meeting with

stake holders. The interviews with the alumni and other stake holders also suggest that feedbacks are not given through regular and formally structured meetings rather than via informal and individual exchange of the views (see Chapter 2, Finding 18).

The options that are given to the 6th semester students for doing either a collective media project or individual project/internship (MBKM) seem to be well designed to prepare them for practical experience and start-up initiatives. Required research-based thesis writing for the last year students is also considered one of the strengths of the programme. Yet, during the site visit, the experts learned from students, alumni and labour market representatives that English competencies, especially writing skills are still a challenge when entering the professional world. For the nature of journalism and the internationalisation goal of the programme, English competencies, particularly the journalistic writing skills in English are crucial to prepare students for the later professional work (Finding 16). Furthermore, the university should intensify support for students in terms of international internship (see Chapter 6).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor’s/Master’s degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Doctoral degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution’s policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

According to the SER, there are two mechanisms of quality assurance at the university: The Internal Quality Assurance Unit (SPMI), which carries out the quality assurance process at the university and the External Quality Assurance System (SPME), which is based on national, regional, and international accreditation. Each management level of the university has its own quality assurance unit: Quality assurance unit (SPM) at the university level, Quality control unit (UPM) at the faculty level, and Quality control group (GKM) at the study programme level. The SPM and UPM set standards and guidelines for the quality assurance process as well



as decide on assessment tools. Annually, each study programme writes a report on its performance. Its academic quality will be assessed by SPM through the internal quality audit. Three aspects for evaluation are educational standards, research standards, and community outreach standards.

As stated in the SER, a management meeting on findings is held to discuss the audit results and plan strategic steps for improvement with the participation of the dean of the faculty, vice dean of learning, student affairs, and research, vice dean of resources and organisation, managers, department chairs, study centre chairs, laboratory chairs, and quality assurance unit chairs. Stakeholders involved in the quality assurance at the study programme level are classified as internal and external stakeholders. At the end of each semester, internal stakeholders including lecturers, students, and administrative staff will fill out a feedback form on their own SIAT webpage, while feedback from external stakeholders such as alumni and employers of graduates is collected through tracer study and surveys. Alumni can fill out questionnaires through tracer study webpage, social media platforms, email, and printed forms.

The university highlights the key role of the integrated information system, so-called SIAT, in implementing quality assurance from the university to study programme level. The SIAT system is accessible for four main services, namely academic/learning services, human resources services, research and community outreach services, and facilities and infrastructure services. Furthermore, this system is also used for monitoring and evaluating lecturers and administrative staff's performance, management performance, student performance, and research and community performance.

Additionally, the university states that it conducts quality assurance in finance management, facilities, and infrastructures. As explained in the SER, quality assurance of finance management at the faculty of Communication science is assessed internally by the UNPAD Internal Supervising Unit (SPI). For external quality assurance in this regard, the National Audit Bank (BPK), General Inspectorate of the Ministry of Finance, and public accountants will be in charge.

Experts' evaluation

The faculty and study programme quality assurance (QA) units follow programme activities determined by the university level's quality assurance unit. Quality assurance in the academic field is under the supervision of the University Quality Assurance Unit, while for non-academic fields, it is under the Internal Supervisory Unit and the Audit Board of the Republic of Indonesia (external auditor). Quality assurance is carried out periodically per semester (monitoring and evaluating lectures per semester), annually (internal quality audit), and every four years by an external auditor (National Accreditation Board for Higher Education). The evaluation of student workload is adjusted to students' abilities and is carried out per semester.

Referring to the rules of the National Accreditation Board (BAN-PT), the study programmes evaluate and modify the curriculum regularly once every four years. Curriculum modifications are based on labour market input, alumni and experts and encourage synchronization between trend graduate profiles, learning content, and better learning methods. Based on FGDs with academic staff, they also update learning content based on the latest developments and information from lecturer discussion forums. The Rector of UNPAD also stated that the university's internal quality assurance system conducts internal audits annually to ensure the teaching and learning process is under IQF. According to the SER document, Accreditation Certificate from BAN-PT and discussion with university managerial level, faculty managerial level, and teaching staff, they have continuously modified the curriculum to improve the quality programme. However, no well-presented documentation on this process was provided to the experts during the site visit. The process of quality assurance with regard to the evaluation and monitoring of the study programmes must be elaborately documented, paying special attention to how all relevant groups (e.g., stakeholders, experts, alumni, lecturers, students) are addressed, and how their input is included and processed at university, faculty and programme level. As a consequence of this, the changes and modifications in the curriculum must be made transparent to all parties involved (**Finding 17**).

That said, the implementation of the QA process has involved internal and external stakeholders. The faculty and study programmes usually conduct regular meetings with representative alumni (FIKOM has an alumni association) and students to share their opinions regarding the development of the faculty and study programmes. Input from stakeholders has been followed up and disseminated through regular meetings at the study programme and faculty levels. There are even initiatives from external stakeholders who already have good relations with the leadership and directly provide input for development. However, the experts find this current approach is lacking a structured approach and formality. As a result, meetings with labour market representatives and alumni must be more formally and structurally organised on a periodical basis, so that the input can be better provided and received (**Finding 18**).

The study programmes' managements have a performance contract (Key Performance Index) with several indicators, and some of them are related to academic quality assurance, such as excellent accreditation at the national level and accreditation by international institutions. To achieve the highest national and international accreditation level, each study programme must adjust academic standards with national and international institutions. This is shown through curriculum adjustments, the quality of human resources and infrastructure. All identified findings are then reported to the rector, deans, and heads of the study programme for clarification and improvement. Related to semester evaluations, syllabus-references updates, and teaching methods are usually carried out. However, it would be beneficial when these findings are disseminated to students to inform them about the changes as well as solutions for improvement (**Finding 19**).

The statistical data thoroughly evaluates the teaching and learning process, lecturer performance, lecturer load and administrative staff support. They hold regular meetings at the beginning of the semester and evaluation of achievements to ensure that national accreditation achievements and performance achievements with the Rector are well realised. Information related to labour market representatives' requirements is usually collected through alumni networks and meetings between faculty managers and labour market workers. FIKOM conducts a tracer study to find out in which sector the alumni worked and how many alumni continued their studies.

As for PhD students, the selection of research topics is adjusted to the area of expertise of the supervisor and co-supervisor and the load of each supervisor. Then during the new lecture process, it is determined how the feasibility of a research proposal meets the academic standards set by the National Higher Education Standards. Quality assurance for the PhD programme includes the feasibility of research proposals, publication of articles in reputable international journals, research results trials, and assessment of the feasibility of dissertation drafts to doctoral promotion sessions involving external examiners. All steps levels are already completed by Standard Operational Procedure. UNPAD and FIKOM has a programme to check level of plagiarism for every draft of thesis (Turnitin). UNPAD has a Task Force for the Prevention and Handling of Sexual Violence, which is responsible for preventing and resolving cases of sexual violence and all acts of discrimination.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Doctoral degree

The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

Undergraduate programmes

According to the SER, the undergraduate programmes implement student-centred learning and teaching principles and apply the outcome-based education (OBE) method in designing the curricula. Five learning methods employed by the Bachelor's programmes are one-on-one classroom (learning directly from a lecturer), e-learning (using LiVE UNPAD), connected e-learning (conducting research and community outreach under lecturers' supervision), digital pedagogy (learning independently under lecturers' supervision), and smart learners (using games). In addition, the study programme in Communication science and in Library and information science use the research-based learning by including published scientific work. Problem-based learning, project-based learning, and practice-based learning are also used in the learning and teaching process. As for practice-based learning, it is carried out in campus laboratories, dry laboratories, and in partnership with other institutions.

Lecturers employ teaching methods in the form of lectures, simulation, discussion, practicum, and seminars in a hybrid learning model combining virtual and physical learning. According to the SER, lecturers and students are encouraged to jointly conduct research projects and to have them published in indexed journals, as well as participate in other activities such as seminars, symposiums, and national and international conferences.

The assessment of students evaluates three aspects including attitude, knowledge, and skills. The SER outlines different methods to assess these aspects, for example:

- Attitude: through observation, assessment among students, and assessment of personal aspects
- Knowledge: through written and oral tests
- Skills: through practicum, simulation, and field work.

In general, students are required to attend a minimum of 80% of the total 16 meetings each semester and complete three types of assessment: mid-term test (30%), final test (30%), and other tests such as assignments (10%), quizzes (20%), reports on practicum and fieldwork (10%). The study programmes also apply the High Order Thinking Skills method to evaluate students' critical thinking and problem-solving skills, as stated in the SER. Students will receive grades in two formats, the letter format (A, B, C, D, E) and the number format. A remedial process is only offered for those who want to improve the grades, not those who failed the exams. Academic information related to academic calendar, test schedules, registration schedules, academic advising schedules, and graduation schedules can be accessed on the faculty and study programme webpage or on the student portal.

Graduate and Postgraduate programmes

According to the SER, the graduate and postgraduate programmes focus on the independent learning of students with learning materials provided. Learning methods include interactive teaching, student-centred learning, research-based learning, and project-based learning.

For the Master's programme, students have to accumulate their scores in mid-term tests, final tests, and assignments on the scale from 0 to 100. This score will be then converted into the letter or number format.

Students have two advisers to instruct them with the thesis proposal and the thesis. They will successfully graduate after passing the thesis defence with an average grade of 68.

For the doctoral programme, each doctoral student is assigned with three supervisors and expected to do field research as well as publish academic articles. Since 2020, doctoral students are required to write three academic articles and have them published in indexed international journals. Proof of publication is required for doctoral students to be eligible for the doctoral promotion exam.

Experts' evaluation

Evidence from the site visit proved that the faculty has a clear vision to produce their students with the elements of innovation, creativity, character (personal skills) and learning independence toward a student-centred learning environment. Discussions with the top management of the university revealed that UNPAD focuses on three academic pillars, so-called research, teaching and community service. The learning and teaching methods applied e-learning platform via LMS LiVE UNPAD and all study programmes give opportunities to their students to conduct research and community services which correspond to the intended learning outcomes. Based on the discussion with students from the Bachelor's programmes, they are satisfied with the academic environment at UNPAD and obtain full support from the teaching staff. Some of them mentioned that they have an opportunity to get exposed to practical aspects of various academic projects and acquire supportive channels to get scholarships.

In order to apply for knowledge delivered to students outside of the university context, various elements of learning methods have been applied by all study programmes, for example, interactive teaching, student-centred learning, problem-based learning, and project-based learning. These learning methods have also been supported with adequate and sufficient facilities and educational resources. On the other hand, the learning process is equipped with several e-learning platforms and supporting applications to ensure the effectiveness of the knowledge delivery process and to achieve learning outcomes. Based on a discussion with faculty members, the community service activities have given students an opportunity to increase their knowledge of society and humanities (e.g., sharing with high school students and society in rural areas). There are also academic collaborations with industries, NGOs, and government institutions for certain study programmes. Some study programmes organised guest lecture series or joint classes with international universities. In addition, the character-building course allows students to learn social issues from their perspectives by embedding a national spirit and human principles focusing on Indonesian communities. The students also acknowledged that there are few courses embedded with critical thinking elements that help them to develop their creativity in various aspects.

Overall, the frequency, methods, and criteria of student assessment are documented and communicated to students. The assessment principles, methods and practices are adequately varied. The element of assessments ensures that students' knowledge, skills, and attitudes reflect the learning outcomes in every course. All study programmes have three types of assessment, including a mid-term exam, a final exam, and other test grades (assignment, quizzes, practicum, participation, and fieldwork exam). Based on the SER, lecturers applied HOTS (High Order Thinking Skills) to measure students' critical and problem-solving abilities. There is also a format for assessing students' performance, a so-called Holistic Rubric. During the site visit, although the teaching staff were able to explain how the teaching methods are implemented to achieve the learning outcomes, not all of them are properly presented in the module/course descriptions. Furthermore, references and literatures supporting the course delivery are not up to date. Therefore, the module/course descriptions have to be revised regarding two aspects: teaching methods must be listed more transparently and chosen in a way that methods support the achievement of the course learning outcomes (**Finding 20a**), and references and literature listed in the module/course descriptions must be updated (**Finding 20b**).

During a discussion with students of FIKOM, they acknowledged that there is flexibility in upgrading or improving their marks. On the one hand, the students are also exposed to meeting and discussing with alumni and involved in various international exposure such as exchange programmes and participating in international competitions. Some of the students have participated in international internships, while others are attached to multinational companies. On the other hand, lecturers and students are encouraged to join research projects and publish in indexed journals and participate in seminars, symposiums, and international conferences.

The components of a student's examination grade are appropriate and well explained. There are five components of grading for undergraduates such as mid-semester exam (30%), final exam (30%), quizzes (20%), assignments (10%) and practicum (10%). However, it is necessary for the Bachelor's and Master's programmes to define the grading criteria for the assignments and final exams more clearly, as it was still not clear to the experts during the site visit due to different information provided in different meetings. The criteria must also be available to students (**Finding 21**). All the information regarding the examination, including test schedules, registration, and the academic calendar is well communicated and presented via a web page and social media platform. Students also can access their final grades at the student portal through an integrated system so-called SIAT (Integrated Administration Information System). SIAT was found as a beneficial and interactive platform between students and academic administrators for accessing academic and examination information. All procedures and regulations pertaining to the examination matters are well documented and can be accessed at the UNPAD Technical Guidelines of Education Administration.

Based on the SER, the facilities and accommodations for disabled students are well organised and prepared, such as a wheelchair lane with ramps and elevators, and the doors of the classrooms are designed to be accessible to wheelchair users. Based on discussions with students of FIKOM, every student has an academic advisor, and they can obtain consultation for their academic and financial issues. For educational resources, a discussion with the Head of Librarian (UNPAD's Library) revealed that teaching staff from all study programmes have been invited to a book selection meeting organised by UNPAD's library. This is to ensure that all reference materials are always updated and relevant to current trends and needs. During the site visit, other facilities supporting the learning outcomes include online library journals, laboratories, (graphics, photography, public relations), television and radio studio, multimedia lab, student centres and auditoriums.

For the PhD programme, in order to foster academic progress in the research work and to achieve qualification standards, three advisers have been appointed to assist the students to participate in various academic discourses. The faculty strategies to produce quality PhD students have been proven by providing a strong foundation by offering 4 courses such as philosophy of science, theory of communication, quantitative and qualitative research methods. These courses ensure the student has a strong grasp of theoretical elements and produces a quality thesis pertaining to the field of communication science. For completion, after fulfilling all 4 courses, students need to present their research proposal and then start writing an academic article. Then students are guided to publish articles in international journals indexed in Scopus or WoS. The next step involved the analysis of the dissertation manuscript and suggested applying for the doctoral promotion examination. Based on SER, a student has to show proof of a published academic article in an international journal and two manuscripts of academic articles submitted to other international journals indexed in Scopus at least at Q3 and/or having WoS impact factor. Based on discussions with PhD students, the faculty has prepared a list of potential supervisors and they have an opportunity to choose their desirable supervisors.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Doctoral degree

The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Student admission

The process of recruiting new students depends on the level of the study programme that the students apply to. At the level of Bachelor's degrees, there are three mechanisms for student admission as follows:

- State University Entrance Exam (SNMPTN): selecting students based on students' academic grades at secondary school
- Joint Entrance Selection of State Universities (SBMPTN): selecting students based on the computer-based written exam
- Independent Selection for UNPAD Entrance (SMUP): selecting students based on the computer-based written exam and online testing with the computer assisted test system.

Prospective students selected through SNMPTN and SBMPTN are required to take administrative, academic, and medical tests.

As for the Master's programme, the criteria for prospective students include a cumulative GPA of at least 3.00, research proposal, statement of purpose in Indonesian or English, score of Academic ability test (TKA) or Academic potential test (TPA) of at least 450, and English language skills with TOEFL score of at least 450 or IELTS score from 5.5. The programme is open to both Indonesian and international students.

The admission process for doctoral candidates requires documents such as identity cards and diplomas, letter of acceptance from the principal supervisor, letter of recommendation from the lecturer or the chair of higher education institutions, certificates of Academic ability test and English proficiency test with a minimum score of 500, a dissertation research proposal, and statement of motivation.

The number of applicants, accepted students, and tightness ratio of all study programmes in the past years (2018 – 2021) is indicated in the SER.

Progression

Academic advisers monitor the learning progress of students through the SIAT system. They are responsible for both academic and non-academic guidance from the first semester until students' graduation. As mentioned in the SER, academic advisers can access all academic information (taken courses/credits, GPA, and other details) of students under their responsibility through SIAT. Supervision of the final project will be carried out by two supervisors in the form of face-to-face or online discussion, which is scheduled upon agreement with the supervisors.

Recognition and certification

According to the SER, all undergraduate, graduate, and postgraduate programmes recognise formal and informal activities as well as credit conversions or transfer systems. After completing the study programme, students will receive the legal proof of graduation in the form of diploma/certificate and academic transcript. The certificate is signed by the dean and the rector, while the academic transcript is signed by the dean and the vice rector for academic and student affairs.

Experts' evaluation

Admission processes at Universitas Padjadjaran are characterised by a high degree of transparency. The university maintains publicly accessible documentation of admission criteria at both national and university levels. Formal admission requirements are clearly outlined and readily available in published form. Moreover, the fact that the university timely publishes any changes to these requirements ensures that prospective students remain informed and have access to up-to-date information. UNPAD actively engages in the collection and evaluation of data pertaining to admission procedures from previous years. This data-driven approach underscores the university's dedication to continuous improvement, ensuring that the admission process remains transparent, efficient, and equitable.

The university's regulations for recognising competences and crediting study achievements from other universities under the framework of the MBKM programme are well-documented and readily accessible. The experts highly appreciate this programme as it not only facilitates academic mobility, but also promote diversity within the academic community. Additionally, the university provides robust personal support and coordinates mobility projects in alignment with international principles, thereby fostering global perspectives among its students. However, while the university effectively coordinates the MBKM programme through a monitoring and evaluation application, concerns arose during the site visit regarding the functionality of the application, as it did not perform quite well. Addressing these operational issues would be beneficial to ensure the seamless operation of the programme as well as facilitate students' participation in this programme (**Finding 22**).

Upon successful completion of their study programmes, students receive official proof of graduation, including diplomas/certificates and academic transcripts. These documents are endorsed by authorised signatures, including the dean, rector, and vice rector for academic and student affairs, bolstering their authenticity and significance.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Doctoral degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

It is stated in the SER that the recruitment of lecturers is dependent on the vacancies as well as the fulfilment of the ideal lecturer to student ratio. This ratio is regulated by law as 1:60 at maximum for undergraduate programmes, 1:20 for Master's programmes, and 1:10 for doctoral programmes. The vice dean for resources and organisation is responsible for human resources at the faculty level with regards to recruitment, placement, development, retention, and dismissal of lecturers.

The process of recruiting civil servant lecturers starts with: (1) the submission of the need for the lecturer formation from the study programme to the department, (2) the proposal of the department to the faculty to forward the request, (3) the application is then forwarded by the university to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of Indonesia, and (4) the ministry will then decide to open the national registration and selection process of lecturers which is carried out openly with a merit system and can be monitored on the Ministry website. The same procedure applies for the recruitment of non-civil servant lecturers as permanent staff but solely at the university level.

The selection also consists of three stages of tests: (1) the selection of qualifications through the evaluation of registration documents, (2) the written test which includes basic knowledge competence, personality characteristics, English language skills, and the academic potential tests, and (3) the field competency test through interviews and teaching skills (micro-teaching).

Lecturers of all study programmes are in charge of planning lessons, implementing and evaluating the learning process, supervising and training, conducting research, additional assignments, and community service. Lecturers of undergraduate programmes must take 12-16 credits (21.6-28.8 ECTS) for each semester covering teaching, research, and community service, in which a minimum of 6 credits must be taken for teaching. Lecturers of Master's programmes are assigned with the same workload aforementioned, whereas those involved in doctoral programmes have an average workload of 13.5 credits per semester (24.4 ECTS).

The university lists the following teaching staff capacity in the SER:

- Communication science (Bachelor): 2 professors, 6 associate professors, and 15 assistant professors
- Communication science (Master): 42 permanent lecturers and 4 adjunct lecturers from practitioners
- Communication science (PhD): 12 permanent lecturers and 1 visiting professor
- Library and information science (Bachelor): 12 associate professors (2 of them applying for professorship) and 14 assistant professors
- Public relations (Bachelor): 9 associate professors (2 of them applying for professorship) and 16 assistant professors
- Communication management (Bachelor): 2 professors, 11 associate professor, and 10 assistant professors
- Journalism (Bachelor): 25 lecturers

The concept of teaching staff development of UNPAD involves scientific development, competency development, as well as application of new technologies in teaching and learning methods. The university states that each lecturer can receive a grant for conducting research and community outreach activities.

Experts' evaluation

The university's recruitment procedures for teaching staff are transparent and well-defined. Notably, a mentorship programme exists to enhance the teaching skills of junior instructors. The faculty administration actively

encourages lecturers to participate in national and international academic events while providing valuable training in academic writing and research. UNPAD maintains commendable gender balance among its teaching staff, with women in administrative roles, contributing to a diverse and inclusive academic environment. Additionally, the quantity of teaching staff corresponds to the number of students, ensuring adequate academic support. A significant factor contributing to the university's strength is the extensive records of the teaching staff's working years. These records reflect not only job security but also a high level of workplace confidence. The teaching staff also showed their commitment to the university and its strategic plan.

The qualifications of the teaching staff, as evident from their CVs and publication records, align with the intended learning outcomes of the academic programmes. In order to achieve the internationalisation goal in education, as well as to enhance student interactions with experts specialising in different subject fields, collaboration with international academics and sector-specific representatives should be intensified (**Finding 23**). This can involve inviting them as guest lecturers or external examiners for project-based classes and conducting specialised workshops to bridge the gap between academia and industry. These initiatives will enhance the university's global presence and enrich the academic experiences of students, but the university should ensure the transparency in the hiring process regarding the required criteria on qualifications for external/international lecturers (**Finding 24**). The current recruitment trend characterised by "inbreeding", where most teaching staff graduated with their Bachelor's, Master's, and PhD degrees from the Faculty of Communication Science of UNPAD, warrants reconsideration. While some level of "inbreeding" is tolerable, diversifying the teaching staff with varying academic backgrounds and cultural perspectives should be actively pursued in future hiring processes (**Finding 25**).

Besides, the experts learned during the site visit that the international goals are not only set for education but also for research. Although the current research and publication performances are promising, it is recommended to have a formal and transparent regulation to increase research capacity and elevate the quality of international publications in indexed journals such as SSCI, SCI and Art & Humanities (**Finding 26**). During the site visit, the experts learned about the presence of an awarding scheme to give more incentives for teaching staff (e.g., salary raise based on performance). This scheme undoubtedly proves beneficial to foster motivation among teaching staff for self-improvement and research. Yet, it was unclear to the experts how this scheme actually works. It is therefore recommended to make this scheme more transparent by setting more specific criteria (**Finding 27**). This could be complemented by mechanisms to limit teaching/community service loads, allowing lecturers to devote adequate time to research and academic development.

In conclusion, addressing these multifaceted aspects is pivotal for UNPAD's pursuit of internationalisation. A comprehensive approach that takes into account these key recommendations will undoubtedly contribute to enhancing the institution's international recognition and ensuring a rich and impactful academic environment.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Doctoral degree

Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.

[ESG 1.6]

DescriptionLearning resources

According to the SER, funding of UNPAD comes from three sources: (1) tuition and development fees, (2) central government through salary payments, and (3) other sources through cooperation with third parties. Regarding the tuition fees, the university has a single tuition system through which students pay the tuition fees based on their (parents) financial ability. In addition, the university provides scholarships for students coming from low-income families. Besides, Master's and doctoral students have a chance to receive scholarships through collaborations between the faculty and other institutions such as the Ministry of Religion, the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of Indonesia, or the Ministry of Finance.

UNPAD owns two main campuses, Jatinangor campus in Sumedang and Dipati Ukur campus in Bandung. The university states in the SER that it supports students for outdoor learning and extracurricular activities by providing open-air areas, sport fields, and meeting halls. Sport facilities on the Jatinangor campus include an outdoor football field, an indoor sport hall, a jogging track, and bike lanes. The university also provides services such as online library, health, fitness, cafeterias, and free transportation. There are 17 dormitories across UNPAD's campuses.

In terms of infrastructure at the faculty level, the faculty has six buildings with a total land area of 12.533,88 m², including a Postgraduate Building, Student Centre, Mosque, and Food pantry. In general, each classroom is equipped with an LCD projector. Other facilities include administration rooms, laboratories (graphics, photography, and public relations), television and radio studio, library, and auditorium. For students with special needs, the university also equips walking tracks for wheelchairs, lifts, and priority toilets. According to information in the SER, the faculty also provides students with access to reputable international journals for research activities.

Student support

Student services provided by the faculty relate to the improvement and development of skills, interests, and talents, counselling advisory services, scholarships, and health services, as well as career and entrepreneurial development. Additionally, academic supervision is offered to students of all study programmes for consulting undergraduate theses, master's theses, and doctoral dissertation. Students having non-academic problems can also consult the faculty counselling team managed by a counsellor lecturer. As stated in the SER, students can attend student exchange programmes collaborating with universities in Korea, the United States, Turkey, Hungary, and the UK.

Experts' evaluation

Students at UNPAD receive comprehensive information about course/module descriptions, including details on intended learning outcomes, teaching methods, assessment formats, and expected workloads. This vital information is easily accessible through university-provided resources, ensuring transparency in academic planning. To enhance the efficiency of course offerings and prevent content overlaps, regular consultations are conducted between students and academic advisors. These coordinated efforts prioritise students' needs, enabling them to complete their studies within the expected timeframe.

Students are provided with sufficient resources across all levels including university, faculty, and study programme. This not only enriches the learning environment but also ensures that students have access to holistic and in-depth knowledge, enhancing the overall learning experience. Additionally, the university invests in high-quality equipment that supports professional work across various disciplines, contributing significantly to the academic quality of the institution. UNPAD's libraries are stocked with a sufficient range of national and international literature, alongside other scholarly sources. To complement this, students also have access to online databases which facilitate them to do research.

Recognising the importance of student support services, the university offers various forms of counseling, including regular advising sessions conducted by study programme and faculty administrators. Additionally, comprehensive introductory sessions for new students are held at the beginning of each semester to explain courses, examinations, academic standards, and administrative services to counselling. FIKOM also provides contact centre to serve students in administrative issues.

Furthermore, the institution actively supports and organises internships for students. This commitment ensures that students gain practical exposure aligned with their academic objectives while expanding their horizons through experiential learning opportunities. Doctoral students at UNPAD receive robust support and guidance, including supervision, mentoring, and assistance in publishing their work. Moreover, they are not only encouraged but also actively supported in participating in international conferences. This commitment to their academic and research growth on a global scale fosters a dynamic and thriving research community within the university.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information / Public information

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Doctoral degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

The information about UNPAD can be accessed online at the university website and offline through the UNPAD Public Communication Office. Services can be accessed online through the university web including (1) admission requirements and selection procedures, (2) teaching, learning and assessment procedures can be accessed through SIAT, (3) learning outcomes (including descriptions of Semester Learning Plan and modules) can be accessed through SIAT, and (4) online learning facilities are organised through the LiVE UNPAD platform. In addition, each study programme has its own website where related information is accessible.

Experts' evaluation

UNPAD provides a very comprehensive website. Information that is important for prospective students, their families and potential employers is available on the website. In addition to information on the course of studies

and possible degrees, there are also student voices. The website is maintained by a highly efficient team. The mix of subject-related and personal content offered is successful. This includes voices and reports from students and alumni. The website will effectively attract students to study at UNPAD and FIKOM and hence should be maintained and expanded.

In order to better attract prospective students from abroad in the future, the structure of the website should be examined for its logic. The structure should focus even more on the benefits for prospective students, parents, and employers (**Finding 28a**). As part of such a review, it may be necessary to thin out the existing content to make it clearer and more relevant. The curriculum structure is also published on the website. UNPAD uses numerous social media channels and is very active in the relevant networks. Students and potential students are reached. The image structure is still in Indonesian, even though the website version is English. All content of the website and social media channels should be therefore offered in both Indonesian and English (**Finding 28b**). This bilingualism also applies to the pages that address all students including international students as well as potential employers. The university's efforts to have each faculty design and maintain its own website are supported. Some sub-pages could be parts of a continuous student project in order to be up-to-date and neutral. The websites should be therefore regularly checked for up-to-dateness (**Finding 28c**).

In addition to the subject-related content on the courses offered, the course of studies and organisational questions that are answered on the homepage, UNPAD should check the information on the curricula to inform students transparently in advance about the compulsory programme to be completed. This should also include information about internships or projects offered. Examples could be helpful for illustration. More detailed information on internships would be desirable (**Finding 29**). Extensive information can be found for the Master's and PhD programmes, and students are extensively consulted.

As mentioned in Chapter 1, there are differences in the Indonesian credit system compared to those of other nations. Although the calculation to convert credits in the Indonesian system to credits in ECTS is already provided in the SER, this information should also be made public on the university's website to provide incoming international students with the understanding of the workload (**Finding 30**). This should apply to all study programmes, as by offering programme-specific credit and workload calculations, students from abroad can make informed comparisons with universities in developing countries which UNPAD plan to address. Transparency is key, not only in providing the total programme workload but also in elucidating the nuances of the Indonesian credit point system, aiming to inform incoming students about the unique workload expectations.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Communication Science**” (**Bachelor of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Communication Science**” (**Master of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Communication Science**” (**PhD**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Library and Information Science**” (**Bachelor of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Public Relations**” (**Bachelor of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Communication Management**” (**Bachelor of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Journalism**” (**Bachelor of Arts**) offered by **Universitas Padjadjaran** with conditions.

Commendation:

The University of Padjadjaran (UNPAD) impressively integrates teaching and learning processes at multiple levels, including university-wide and within individual faculties and study programmes. UNPAD ensures academic quality through its dedicated Academic Quality Assurance Unit (SPMI) at the university level and similar units within faculties. The institution boasts a robust infrastructure, featuring a comprehensive library centre offering online and hardcopy references, conducive reading rooms, and well-equipped laboratories. The Faculty of Communication Science (FIKOM) also plays a vital role by facilitating practical experiences and supporting students in publishing scientific papers through its Journal Publication divisions.

Findings:

1. For the Master’s programme “Communication Science”, the experts recommend defining more explicitly the criteria for publications in books or national/international journals by students to guarantee research quality as well as transparency and fairness in the assessment.
2. It is recommended to integrate more courses into the curriculum of the Master’s programme “Communication Science” that can frame current international, regional, national socio-economic, political, cultural problems through multidisciplinary theories and approaches. To create more room for new courses to be added, foundational courses such as “communication science” and “development of the communication science” in the first year should be combined into one course.
3. It is recommended to all study programmes that more English proficiency courses as well as courses taught in English should be offered to achieve the aim of internationalisation.
4. For the PhD programme “Communication Science”, qualification courses must be provided for students from different backgrounds to bridge the knowledge gap.
5. For the PhD programme “Communication Science”, the uniqueness of the programme profile compared to similar programmes at other universities should be sharpened.

6. The practice and application of independent learning and critical thinking must be better reflected in the curriculum of the PhD programme “Communication Science”.
7. It is recommended that the theoretical knowledge of LSCH (Library of Congress Subject Heading) in any related courses be embedded in the study programme “Library and information science” to give students a solid foundation for skills in determining subject heading.
8. The experts recommend delivering the elements of artificial intelligence (AI) in any related courses of the study programme “Library and information science”, since this element of skill is quite in demand in the current industry, particularly in the era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0.
9. Courses regarding the economic and managerial knowledge and leadership basics (theory and skills) should be added into the curriculum of the study programme “Public relations” to provide students with an understanding of corporations and organisations and how they work.
10. For the study programme “Public relations”, given the current wide range of courses, these courses should be categorised into specialisations (e.g., brand management or sustainable PR), so that students can then decide to choose their preferred specialisations.
11. For the study programme “Public relations”, it is recommended that final examinations should more clearly reflect the achievement of the ILOs as well as ensure a balanced integration of both scientific and practical competencies.
12. To better prepare graduates of the study programme “Public relations” and “Communication Management” for Master’s programmes, the experts recommend strengthening students’ theoretical knowledge and research skills for the thesis writing by adding courses in empirical methodology and scientific writing.
13. To maintain and further enhance the alignment of the curriculum with the labour market’s needs at the international level, it is recommended to establish a structured monitoring system for the development of the industry worldwide.
14. To better prepare students for consecutive Master’s programmes and bridge the gap between theoretical knowledge and practical application, the management of the study programme “Communication Management” should:
 - a. introduce basic courses on theoretical and practical management skills.
 - b. incorporate management theory and practice, offering essential corporate and product management fundamentals to complement the existing theoretical aspects like philosophy or psychology.
15. For the study programme “Journalism”, it is recommended that the courses with a possibly overlapping content should be merged and the elective course, namely “Specialised Journalism” offered in semester 6 should be made compulsory and integrate interdisciplinary topics on the current international, regional, national political, cultural, economic issues.
16. Due to the nature of journalism and the internationalisation goal of the study programme “Journalism”, English competencies, particularly journalistic writing skills in English are crucial to prepare students for the later professional work.
17. The process of quality assurance with regard to the evaluation and monitoring of the study programmes must be elaborately documented, paying special attention to how all relevant groups (e.g., stakeholders, experts, alumni, lecturers, students) are addressed, and how their input is included and processed at university, faculty and programme level. As a consequence of this, the changes and modifications in the curriculum must be made transparent to all parties involved.

18. For all study programmes, meetings with labour market representatives and alumni must be more formally and structurally organised on a periodical basis.
19. Findings of evaluations conducted by all study programmes should be disseminated to students to inform them about changes as well as solutions for improvement.
20. The module/course descriptions of all study programmes have to be updated regarding the two following aspects:
 - a. Teaching methods must be listed more transparently and support the achievement of the course learning outcomes.
 - b. References and literature listed in the module/course descriptions must be updated.
21. For the Bachelor's and Master's programmes, the grading criteria for the assignments and final exams must be defined more clearly and made available to students.
22. For all study programmes, the operational issues caused by the application that monitors and evaluates the MBKM programme should be addressed to ensure the seamless operation of the programme as well as facilitate students' participation in this programme.
23. For all study programmes, the collaboration with international academics and sector representatives should be intensified in order to achieve the internationalisation goal in education, as well as to enhance student interactions with experts specialising in different subject fields.
24. The university should ensure the transparency in the hiring process regarding the required criteria on qualifications for external/international lecturers.
25. For all study programmes, diversification of the teaching staff with varying academic backgrounds and cultural perspectives should be actively pursued.
26. It is recommended for all study programmes to have a formal and transparent regulation to increase research capacity and elevate the quality of international publications in indexed journals.
27. The awarding scheme to give additional incentives for teaching staff should be made more transparent by setting more specific criteria.
28. The university's website and social media should be revised regarding the following aspects:
 - a. The website's structure should focus more on the benefits for prospective students, parents, and employers.
 - b. All content of the website and social media channels should be offered in both Indonesian and English.
 - c. The websites should be regularly checked for up-to-dateness.
29. Information on compulsory parts of the curricula such as internships should be made more transparent and visible to students.
30. The information on converting credits from the Indonesian system to ECTS should be made public on the university's website to provide incoming international students with the understanding of the workload.