AQAS

AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SEMARANG

CLUSTER SOCIAL SCIENCES

POLITICAL SCIENCES (BACHELOR OF SOCIAL SCIENCES)

SOCIOLOGY AND ANTHROPOLOGY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION (MASTER OF EDUCATION)

December 2023

Content

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **"POLITICAL SCIENCES" (BACHELOR OF SOCIAL SCIENCES)**

- **"SOCIOLOGY AND ANTHROPOLOGY EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **"SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **"SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION" (MASTER OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SEMARANG, SEMARANG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 19th meeting on 04 December 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes **"Political Sciences" (Bachelor of Social Sciences)**, **"Sociology and Anthropology Education" (Bachelor of Education)**, **"Social Sciences Education" (Bachelor of Education)**, and **"Social Sciences Education" (Master of Education)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

    The accreditations are conditional.

    The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

Conditions:

For all study programmes:

1. A structured data collection and feedback loop within the PDCA cycle has to be ensured to fill the curriculum development efforts by real-world insights, especially by:

    a. implementing regular meetings of relevant stakeholders of a broader range which will ensure that programmes are aligned with the labour market's needs, and

    b. involving students and alumni in the further development of the study programmes.

2. The lesson plans at UNNES have to provide explicit rubrics for assessments, including clear breakdowns of each component to effectively convey expectations to students.

3. A more transparent and less lecturer-dependent procedure regarding complaints and appeals must be installed.

4. The programmes' transparency to externals has to be raised, by:

a. publishing the prerequisites for each study programme on its webpage, and

b. providing professors' research focuses (potentially in English and Bahasa Indonesia) on the relevant webpages.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Political Sciences" (Bachelor of Social Sciences):</u>

5. New intended learning outcomes on the programme level must be established, aligning graduates with the skills and knowledge required for the job market, while also modernizing the curriculum in accordance with current demands e.g., a focus on media-politics, NGOs, parties, and national mandates.

6. To prepare the students for the globalized era, their understanding of international dynamics, potentially through the inclusion of courses like ASEAN objectives must be enhanced to provide a comprehensive perspective on regional influences.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Social Sciences Education" (Master of Education):</u>

7. The curriculum has to be revised by consolidating introductory courses, allowing for a more focused specialization courses at the Master's level.

8. The graduate profile must be updated to address the needs of graduates pursuing non-educational career paths and necessary knowledge and skills must be therefore identified and reflected in the curriculum.

9. The QA unit has to collect and analyse data on the progression of students to effectively monitor their advancement.

10. The university must take action in the following aspects:

a. The university has to regularly check on missing contents, errored links and up-to-dateness of the relevant webpages.

b. Information on the current curricula, courses and credits hours, and English content on the relevant webpages must be available.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

<u>For all study programmes:</u>

1. UNNES should actively prioritize student-centred learning, integrating diverse teaching methods, especially for Bachelor's and Master's programmes.

2. Greater support should be provided to the faculty in internationalizing their research by encouraging publication in higher-ranked and globally recognized journals, while concurrently adhering to international standards in research management and publication.

3. UNNES should intensify their efforts in regards with teaching staff development, by focusing on:
   a. more trainings for lecturers on the supervision and handling of PhD students, and
   b. include more regular training with regards to pedagogy.

4. The international exposure of staff should be fostered, by providing opportunities for:

    a. attending conferences on a regular basis and accessing journals for more up-to-date literature in specific topic areas, and

    b. offering more English language training for teaching staff.

5. It is recommended to carefully review and revise course titles in order to accurately reflect content differences and prevent confusion among students.

6. UNNES is encouraged to promote more intensively the MBKM opportunities to students, by focusing on:

    a. amplifying more internship options outside the teacher's education path, and

    b. further support of international student mobility for the Bachelor's and Master's programmes.

7. It is suggested to increase transparency and information regarding research grants and scholarships on the homepages of the programmes.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Political Sciences" (Bachelor of Social Sciences):</u>

8. Diverse specialisation tracks, including private sector roles (media, NGOs, associations) and public sector positions (local government, state-owned enterprises) should be introduced in the programme.

9. To enhance international recognition and integration, some courses in English should be offered alongside those taught in Bahasa Indonesia.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" (Bachelor of Education):</u>

10. To distinguish the programme more and align it with broader career prospects beyond high school education, it is recommended to consider diversifying the curriculum, e.g., by incorporating ethnographies in urban spaces representing a more dynamic perspective on the discipline.

11. Room should be given in the curriculum to the incorporation of Youth Studies and the expansion towards an international or comparative focus to align with current societal developments.

12. More scientific literature in English should be included.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Social Sciences Education" (Bachelor of Education):</u>

13. Specialised tracks beyond the traditional teaching path should be included in the programme.

<u>Additionally for the study programme "Social Sciences Education" (Master of Education):</u>

14. Potential knowledge gaps in research should be eliminated by preparing students for advanced research work and incorporate an emphasis on scientific elements.

15. Students should actively participate in collaborative research endeavours with their lecturers, focusing on a central and overarching research theme.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- ▪ **"POLITICAL SCIENCES" (BACHELOR OF SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION)**
- ▪ **"SOCIOLOGY AND ANTHROPOLOGY EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- ▪ **"SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**
- ▪ **"SOCIAL SCIENCES EDUCATION" (MASTER OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SEMARANG, SEMARANG, INDONESIA

Visit to the university: 13 – 16 June 2023

Panel of experts:

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Patrick Ziegenhain	President University, Department of International Relations (Indonesia)
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Laavanya Kathiravelu	Nanyang Technological University, Department of Sociology (Singapore)
Prof. Dr. Hermin Indah Wahyuni	Universitas Gadjah Mada, Faculty of Social and Political Science (Indonesia)
Barbara Favaro	Ocean Risk and Resilience Action Alliance (ORRAA), Programme Associate (Italy) (representative of the labour market)
Clemens Schmid	Student of Wien University, Culture and Social Anthropology (Austria) (student expert)

Coordinator:
Vi Le

Patrick Heinzer

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I.   Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II.   Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes **"Political Sciences" (Bachelor of Social Sciences)**, **"Sociology and Anthropology Education" (Bachelor of Education)**, **"Social Sciences Education" (Bachelor of Education)**, and **"Social Sciences Education" (Master of Education)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang** (Indonesia).

1.   Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2.   Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in September 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In August 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission in its meeting on 29 August 2022 and the circulation procedure on 26 October 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in February 2023.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in May 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 13-16 June 2023. Virtually, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 04 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2024, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III.   General information on the university

Universitas Negeri Semarang (UNNES) is a public university located in Semarang City, Java/Indonesia. Before changing to a public university in 1999 by presidential decree, the university was founded as the Semarang Teacher Training and Education Institute (IKIP) in 1965. In 2021, UNNES consists of eight faculties (Social Sciences, Education, Language and Arts, Mathematics and Natural Science, Engineering, Sports Science, Economics, and Law) and one graduate school (with 22 Master programmes and eight PhD programmes). The programmes which are subject to this procedure are located at the Faculty of Education.

According to the self-evaluation report (SER), UNNES has developed an overarching vision and mission to become a university with international recognition. One of the aspects outlined by UNNES is that a well-established quality assurance system throughout the whole university is crucial. Therefore, UNNES has implemented a quality assurance office (BPM) and a quality assurance agency (GPM) to organise the faculties' quality assurance processes. On the university level, UNNES has obtained A-results by the national higher education accreditation board in Indonesia (BAN-PT) and is ISO 9001: 2015 certified. Internationalisation is also one of the components that supports UNNES to fulfil its mission and vision. At this SER, the university outlines that collaboration with more than 50 higher education institutions worldwide is carried out. On a national scale, it is said that the university is amongst Top 20 most popular universities concerning enrolment numbers of students. Furthermore, it is stated that UNNES is listed as 71st worldwide in terms of the sustainability of the resources. The three programmes that are subject to this accreditation procedure are part of the Faculty of Education at UNNES. This faculty offers seven bachelor's degree programmes.

IV.   Assessment of the study programmes

1.   Quality of the curriculum

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*
>
> *The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*
>
> *[ESG 1.2]*

Description

1.1 General structure

The SER indicates that the programmes are based on several higher education laws and the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI) and the respective references to the level (Bachelor's programmes are linked to level 6 and Master's programmes to level 8). UNNES provides information in its documentation on how the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) links to KKNI by providing an overview table of the three levels (Knowledge, skills, and competencies) in the EQF. It is said that Bachelor's graduates will have the ability to master theoretical concepts in the respective discipline (knowledge), the ability to apply their skills to solve problems (skills), and the ability of data and information driven decision-making (competencies). Master's graduates will expand that knowledge capacities towards an ability of problem-solving through an inter- or multidisciplinary approach (knowledge). They will have innovative skills in research and innovation (skills), and they will be able to carry out third mission relevant research (competencies).

The Indonesian higher education system introduced lately an outcome-based education approach (OBE). Programmes following this approach follow nationally defined guidelines to develop the curricula, which comprises the planning phase, the implementation phase, and the monitoring & evaluation phase with linked outputs (e.g., OBE based lesson plans, learning material and media, activities to strengthen research outputs of students and teachers, or national and international external accreditation activities. In 2020, the Indonesian Ministry also started implementing the so-called independent learning-independent campus (MBKM) curriculum, an instrument that allows Bachelor students to take internships, student exchanges or humanitarian projects outside the respective study programme. MBKM allows students to take up to three semesters in these activities with 20 additional credit points.

Concerning the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, the SER explains that the programmes follow the Indonesian policies for standards in higher education, which define that the study programmes are based on a graduation profile and on the intended learning outcomes (ILO) on the programme level. Each set of ILOs on the programme level cover generic (general attitudes and skills) and discipline-specific (specific knowledge and skills) components. The generic components integrate knowledge, skills and competencies that must be possessed by every student. They include moral behaviour, the contribution to improve the society, the appreciation of a multireligious society, or the internalisation of ethical values and norms. The SER includes a matrix for each programme in the cluster to demonstrate the differentiation between generic and discipline-specific components. The SER demonstrates that the generic components are taught as university wide courses, e.g., civics education, *pancasila* education, or religious education.

All courses are assigned to a defined number of credits. Based on Indonesia's national regulations, one credit of non-practical courses consists of 50 minutes of face-to-face teaching per week per semester, 60 minutes of structured assignments per week per semester, and 60 minutes of self-learning per week per semester. One credit of practical courses consists of 170 minutes per week per semester.

It is stated that all students receive detailed semester lesson plans at the beginning of each semester. These semester lesson plans include the intended learning outcomes on the course level, the teaching method, the assessment method, literature used in the course, the student workload, and the grading structure. The steps for the preparation of the lesson plans are located on the university-level quality assurance unit and uploaded to the UNNES academic system.

General remarks

After a thorough analysis, the experts panel wishes to express that, so far, the curricula of all five study programmes in the social sciences are oriented towards Indonesian national values, ideologies, and perspectives. An overarching remark that goes beyond accreditation is that UNNES focuses strongly on Indonesia and strives to become a production centre for Indonesian schoolteachers. However, it must be stated that the necessity will arise for the university if UNNES aims to internationalise their educational offers and strives to be a part of the international academic debates.

The overarching motto of UNNES is "conservation". During the online site visit, the experts learned that this means preserving the traditional cultural values and the natural environment of Central Java in specific and of Indonesia in general. This motto certainly has its positive aspects, particularly the focus on the preservation of nature and the regional/national cultural heritage. The experts believe that this very important university strategy could be further established as a stronghold for UNNES.

1.2 <u>Political Sciences (Bachelor of Science)</u>

Description

The study programme "Political Sciences" is a bachelor's degree programme leading to a Bachelor of Social Science degree. It comprises 144 national credit points (SKS) and is a four-year programme. The SER outlines that the programme is based on a graduate profile and intended learning outcomes on the programme level.

The SER states that the graduation profile has been developed with input from the Association of All-Indonesian Political Science study programmes (APSIPOL), labour market representatives that employ programme graduates. The profile includes multiple paths for graduates, e.g., as political consultants, political party administrators, political communicators, development policy analysts, journalists, or researchers. Following the ILOs composition regulations, the Bachelor's programme "Political Sciences" consists of thirteen ILOs out of which nine are either completely (four) programme-specific or marked as generic and programme-specific (five) ILOs. The independent programme-specific ILOs include the concept of practical application of political science (including the Pancasila political ethics), the ability to carry out research in the discipline for the society, the application of basic skills to strengthen local institutions, or the ability to conduct political research. An overview of the intended learning outcomes on the programme level reads as follows:

ILO1: Believe in God the Almighty and capable of showing a religious manner; and uphold the humanitarian values based on religion, morals, and ethics.

ILO2: Contribute to enhancing the quality of life of community, nationality, and state for the civilization advancement based on Pancasila and commitment to the NKRI, 1945 Constitution, and *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*; and have a role as a proud citizen, have nationalism and sense of responsibility for the nation and country.

ILO3: Appreciate the cultural diversity, views, religions, beliefs, and others' opinions or findings, and cooperate and concern for society and the environment.

ILO4: Law-abiding and disciplined, value internalizations, norms, academic ethics, and responsible to their inline jobs, and also able to internalize the independence, management, and entrepreneurship.

ILO5: Master the theoretical concepts in political science and political research methodology, and understand the development of political science in local, national, and international levels.

ILO6: Master the concept of political science's practical application, applying Pancasila politic ethics in making positive contributions to promote and strengthen local institutions and master the idea of problem-solving and analysis of political problems.

ILO7: Master the concept of political science research as a positive contribution to the community and master the political manner, political communication, and community knowledge.

ILO8: Implement logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in terms of science and technology development that concern and apply the humanity values that suit the field of expertise. Able to show the self-contained performance, quality, measurable, and examine the development implication or science and technology implementation which concern and apply humanity values in the context of nationality based on clauses, procedures, and scientific ethics in the solution, and opinion.

ILO9: Able to arrange and examine the scientific description in the form of a final project or final report and upload it to the university's website and able to make a decision appropriately in the context of problem-solving in political issues based on data analysis and information.

ILO10: Able to implement skills in the field of political science and the practical expertise of political science which concern Pancasila ethics, the reinforcement of local institutions with appropriate political science methodology.

ILO11: Arrange the legal draft, which can positively contribute to solving the problem in the political field and has practical expertise in political communication, political analysis, and arranging academic public policy manuscripts.

ILO12: Able to conduct political research which is beneficial for nation and country with an appropriate science principle, and able to communicate oral and writing in any kinds of media such as visual, audio, and audio visual.

ILO13: Able to arrange planning, implement the planning, implementation monitoring, and coordinate any kinds of community activities that strengthen the local institution, also able to advocate for enhancing citizen's participation in development.

The SER describes that the curriculum has undergone some changes in the past (a curriculum adjustment and the above-mentioned MBKM integration) leading to the current curriculum. The SER outlines that students must take a total of 144 SKS. In addition to the university courses, students have to take faculty specific courses, each worth 2 SKS. These include "Introduction to Social Sciences", "English", "Social Conservation" and "Entrepreneurship". The programme-specific courses cover at the beginning introductory courses in political science, anthropology, governance studies, law studies or economy. This leads to more elaborated courses in anti-corruption education, statistics, English for political science, Indonesian society studies, Indonesian political system, or a comparative analysis of the political system. The current version of the SER states that there are compulsory and elective courses but does not specify the quantity and which courses are eligible as electives.

Experts' evaluation

The learning outcomes and desired qualifications as well as the curriculum for the political sciences are clearly described in the annexes delivered by UNNES. The intended learning outcomes such as ILOs 1-4, 6-7, 10-13, however, are clearly oriented towards character-building with a strong focus on national values other than global perspectives. It seems that these learning outcomes still date back from the time when training future schoolteachers was the main target of UNNES. Now, with a general Bachelor of Political Sciences, new learning outcomes need to be defined, which make those who finish the political science fit for the job market with the requested skills and knowledge and the relatively old-fashioned curriculum needs to be revamped accordingly **(Finding 1)**. For instance, students need knowledge about media and politics, the role of NGOs in the political process, the functions of political parties, interest groups and associations. The experts are aware that some of the curriculum contents is mandated by national government authorities. Nevertheless, the university still have enough scope of action to set their own priorities in the curriculum.

In an era of globalisation where international developments and decisions have a significant impact on Indonesian domestic policies, it is of utmost importance to have at least a basic understanding of regional and international developments. From the experts' perspective, courses like Indonesian society studies, the Indonesian political system, and others are useful for students on the way to become Indonesian schoolteachers but have not yet reflected the international orientation and the general academic debates/topics of social sciences. To address this gap, it could be helpful to introduce courses that encompass a more expansive global perspective. For example, integrating a course dedicated to the study of ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations) would be instrumental in fostering an in-depth understanding of the regional dynamics that directly impact Indonesia. This course would not only facilitate a nuanced comprehension of ASEAN's objectives, achievements, and challenges but also highlight the ways in which Indonesia contributes to and benefits from this regional organization (**Finding 2**).

Furthermore, the experts emphasize the necessity of diversifying the specialization tracks within the study programme. Currently, the programme primarily focuses on preparing students for careers as schoolteachers.

However, it is crucial to acknowledge that there exists a broader spectrum of career paths within the social sciences that warrant specialized attention. To address this, it is recommended that distinct specialization tracks be introduced to cater to the varied aspirations of students. These tracks should be tailored to meet the requirements and expectations of different sectors, including the private sector encompassing areas such as media, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and associations. Additionally, special tracks should be established for those aspiring to pursue careers in the public sector, including roles in local government and state-owned enterprises. To facilitate this process, elective courses focusing on these specialized tracks should be made available earlier in the study plan. This enables students to delve into specific areas of interest and gain in-depth knowledge in their chosen field. Following the completion of relevant electives, students can then embark on internships with organizations aligned with their specialization track. This sequential approach empowers students to not only gain practical experience but also develop the necessary skills to enhance their employability upon completing their Bachelor's degree. This strategic expansion of specialization tracks is vital in ensuring that the programme is aligned with the diverse career aspirations of its students **(Finding 3)**.

In tandem with the introduction of these specialization tracks, it might be important to broaden the scope of internships in accordance with the updated profile of the programme. By doing so, students will have a wider array of options for internships, thereby affording them valuable exposure and experience in both teaching and non-teaching fields. This practical experience is invaluable in equipping students with the skills and knowledge required to excel in their chosen career paths **(see Finding 22a)**.

In addition, all courses are taught in Bahasa Indonesia only, which means that the number of international students will be relatively low. The whole orientation of the curriculum is closely connected to Indonesian education goals, mainly the training of teachers with Indonesia-required qualifications. This will likely hinder the process to achieve the overarching vision and mission to become a university with international recognition and internalisation. As a result, the experts recommend having a few courses taught in English **(Finding 4)**.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.3 Sociology and Anthropology Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The study programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" is a Bachelor's degree programme leading to a Bachelor of Education degree. It consists of 144 national credit points (SKS) and is a four-year programme. The SER outlines that the programme is based on a graduate profile and intended learning outcomes on the programme level.

The SER states that the graduates of the programme are usually employed as educators at universities. However, the list includes alternative employment paths such as researchers, education managers, community social researchers, journalists, writers, communicators, or education facilitators. This graduation profile is the result of a discussion with the Association of Indonesian Sociology and Anthropology Education study programmes (APPSANTI). The ILOs on the programme level differentiates as described above in generic and specific ILOs. The programme has a total of 15 ILOs out of which six are covered by the university courses. The programme-specific ILOs include the mastering of socio-cultural science theories, pedagogical theories, learning theories, and data, technology, and human literacy concepts. Furthermore, graduates will know to apply and communicate basic concepts, theories, and methodologies in social research.

Experts' evaluation

This programme is intended to train undergraduates to teach in senior high schools in Indonesia and can be seen as directly a legacy of when UNNES was more of a teacher training college. In transitioning to a fuller university structure, this programme can be further broadened and codified in terms of how it is delivered and how well it prepares students for facing a future beyond directly training them as teachers. In terms of its success as a programme, it seems to be delivering in terms of training educators, and this is evidenced by excellent feedback by labour market representatives who agree that the students trained by UNNES come across as caring and dedicated educators. However, moving forward, it is important that the programme keeps up with changing demands of students and changing standards of the higher education sector, particularly in terms of curriculum and pedagogy. This would greatly help the Cluster for Social Science to be accepted nationally and internationally.

This programme differentiates itself from other programmes at other universities and particularly the Bachelor of Social Science in that it offers a combined focus of Sociology and Anthropology, as opposed to one that is more focused on integrated social studies. Compared to other singular focus on one subject area, this degree has the potential to be developed into a unique programme that goes beyond the needs of training educators for high schools. The programme seems to have a focus on social conservation – and developing local knowledge. For example, one of the aspects of study is the socio-cultural structure of Javanese society. Before Covid-19, there was an ethnographic school where teachers of sociology and anthropology are invited to learn about ethnography of farming in the region. This hands-on approach is welcome, however, in tying anthropological approaches to very traditional and static notions of culture, the programme does not come across as dynamic. Ethnographies in urban spaces should also be included as part of diversifying the curriculum and in developing broader understandings of what sociology and anthropology as disciplines encompass **(Finding 5)**.

The curriculum since 2020 has been cut down to 144 credits per semester, which is more in line with the Indonesian average, as it had previously been 50 credits which is rather high workload. The programme has 71 courses with each course is having only 2 credits. A team-teaching model is applied – with 16 to 18 credit hours in a semester. This seems to be a rather intensive learning regimen. In semester 6, it is internship MBKM, which prepares students for jobs after graduation. Students also have possibilities for exchange with other universities, e.g., UKM through national collaborations. However, perhaps due to the pandemic, these do not seem to have been taken up very frequently. Therefore, exchange programmes with regional and other non-Indonesian universities for both students and lecturers should be reinstated and expanded with a wider range of national and international education institutions as a means of exposing students to perspectives from outside of Indonesia **(see Finding 22b)**.

At the moment, the offerings are rather dated in terms of subject areas and are not really keeping up with latest developments in society. Much of the subjects offered reflect an understanding of the social sciences that is rather dated and not dynamic. Indonesia with a large young population would for example be a perfect place for the incorporation of Youth studies, which explores developments from this particular life-course perspective. It would also be highly relevant to educators as this is the population that they will encounter professionally. UNNES has attempted to modernise the curriculum through the offering of the study of digital society, but these types of changes appear to be limited and should be greatly expanded. Subjects with a more international or comparative focus should also be included in the curriculum (**Finding 6**).

In the Indonesian higher education context, a shift towards a prioritising of English language texts will be relevant for internationalisation. Cutting-edge research, especially in social sciences and pedagogy, is predominantly published in English. This ensures scholars have access to the forefront of academic thought, fostering a culture of research excellence and global connectivity within Indonesia's higher education landscape. The experts have detected a strong focus on the Indonesian context in the literature used in the

programme, which does not fully comply with the university's strategy. Thus, in order to better internationalise, more English language texts and materials should be referred to as this is where the bulk of cutting-edge research is being published, both in the social sciences as well as in pedagogy **(Finding 7)**.

Internships are a key part of the training that this degree programme provides, and it is well-integrated into the structure. Most students join the schools in which they did internships, showing that this then works very well in terms of links between the programme and labour market. This internship is conceived as a professional programme – where, with a certain set of grades students can get a certification of competency which helps them greatly in finding a job later in industry, even if not immediately through their placements. Those who do not want to take up teaching also have the option of doing social entrepreneurship instead, although this appears to be a minority. In this way, there seem to be alternative pathways for students even if they do not want to take up teaching at the end of their degree. Internships in industry is also possible and UNNES provides some network to facilitate this. In addition to industry internships, collaboration with the school of research means that there is also a possibility for students to go onto research careers. This programme also seems to draw on its strong alumni connections to facilitate job placement.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.4 <u>Social Sciences Education (Bachelor of Education)</u>

Description

The study programme "Social Sciences Education" is a Bachelor's degree programme leading to a Bachelor of Education degree. It consists of 144 national credit points (SKS) and is a four-year programme. The SER outlines that the programme is based on a graduate profile and intended learning outcomes on the programme level. The two profiles for the programme follow, according to the SER, the Indonesian Educational Technology association agreement, the Indonesian national qualifications framework (KKNI) and national higher education standards. The graduate profiles are either to become an education technology developer or a curriculum developer. The respective annex provided with the SER outlines two different graduation profiles for the two paths. It is stated that the programme follows level 6 of KKNI, which is the equivalent to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF).

Following the Indonesian model of an outcome-based education (OBE) and the national policy for standards in higher education define that intended learning outcomes on the programme level are differentiated in four categories: Attitude, Knowledge, Generic skills, and Specific skills. These skills can be either achieved by generic courses or specific courses (discipline-specific) within the curriculum. Following this principle, the SER indicates a total of eleven intended learning outcomes on the programme level, out of which six will be achieve by generic courses, one by generic and discipline-specific courses, and four by discipline-specific courses. The general courses cover the attitude field (high standard of morality, honouring values, beliefs and intellectual property), one of the two knowledge competencies (uphold academic and educational ethics), and the generic skills field (critical thinking and communication, data-based decision-making, transfer of knowledge). Also, there are courses that impart generic and discipline-specific contributions to the programme in mastering contemporary issues, theories and practices. The discipline-specific intended learning outcomes include the ability to select, determine and implement educational technology theories, to create an appropriate learning environment, to organise educational training services, and to conduct scientific research in the discipline.

The SER includes an annex with the course structure which shows a differentiation between university courses (24 SKS), faculty courses (8 SKS), and study programme specific courses. The university courses consist of

"Pancasila Education" (2 SKS), "Citizenship Education" (2 SKS), "Indonesian Language" (2 SKS), "Conservation Education" (2 SKS), "Religion Education" (2 SKS), "Internships" (4 SKS), "Community Service" (4 SKS), and the Bachelor thesis (6 SKS). The faculty courses include courses in "Introduction to Education", "School Management", "Educational Psychology" and "Counselling Guidance", each worth 2 SKS. The programme-specific part of the curriculum covers 111 SKS and is divided into compulsory and elective courses. It is stated that students have to take all compulsory within the first seven semesters, while elective courses shall be taken between the fourth and the eighth semester.

Experts' evaluation

The graduate profile is to become an educational technology developer or curriculum developer. The learning outcomes referred to specific disciplines include the ability to choose, determine and apply educational technology theories; to create an appropriate learning environment; to provide educational training services; and to conduct scientific research in the discipline. From the discussions with the study programme's management, it is known that this study programme is more specific in producing social science developers in elementary and junior high schools. The curriculum in its current state excels in providing students with a holistic and well-rounded comprehension of the field of sociology. Through a designed composition of core courses, students are introduced to the theories, methodologies, and essential concepts that constitute the backbone of sociological studies. These courses form the cornerstone of a robust foundation, empowering students to engage in critical analyses and interpretations of intricate social phenomena.

The experts have discussed the composition of the curriculum with the relevant stakeholders. It became clear that there the graduate profile slowly opens to other graduate profiles apart from the teaching path. The curriculum already took note of this change by implement opportunities for educational technology developers or curriculum developers. In comparison to the Bachelor's programme "Political Sciences" this trend still needs to be confirmed on the long run and it should be looked at differently. The experts believe that a strategic decision should be made whether to open the graduate profile towards other graduate profiles **(Finding 8).** Firstly, this move would align with the evolving demands of the job market. In today's rapidly changing global economy, there is a growing need for individuals with diverse skill sets and expertise. By offering specialized tracks in areas outside of traditional education, the faculty is demonstrating a responsiveness to the broader professional landscape and providing students with a wider range of career opportunities upon graduation. Secondly, it would enhance the attractiveness and competitiveness of the programme. However, should the strategy turn out to be opening the graduate profile, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level will need to be changed. In addition to this, it could be reasonable then to implement earlier electives for students outside the traditional teaching career path as electives.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

1.5 Social Sciences Education (Master of Education)

Description

The Master's programme "Social Sciences Education" is a two-year programme with the workload of 38 SKS, consisting of compulsory courses (32 SKS) and electives (six SKS). The SER states that students are required to take a total of 17 courses in these two years. The programme's curriculum is composed based on the graduation profile. The SER indicates that graduates of the Master's programme can be employed as social studies educators, researchers, or social science education curriculum's developers. It is also stated that the

graduation profile has been aligned with the Association of Indonesian Social Studies Education study programmes (APRIPSI).

The SER provides a table with an overview of intended learning outcomes on the programme level. The structure follows the same scheme as above differentiating between attitude, knowledge, general skills, and specific skills. These skills can be either achieved by generic courses or specific courses (discipline-specific) within the curriculum. The annex of the SER also provides a matrix on how the courses are matched to the ILOs on the programme level. Consequently, the Master's programme "Social Sciences Education" offers two attitude learning outcomes, three knowledge learning outcomes, four general skills, and two specific skills. The attitude learning outcomes cover components of professionalism for the discipline in line with religious values and the foundational philosophical theory of Indonesia (*Pancasila*). It is stated that these learning outcomes are integrated in all courses of the study programme. The knowledge learning outcomes can be seen as programme-specific intended learning outcomes. They include the mastering of social science education and philosophy, learning models for the education sector, the ability to develop learning concepts and social science theory, and the ability to carry out research in interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary teams. The general skills learning outcomes cover problem-solving skills for the discipline and research-related components (e.g., the ability to propose scientific ideas, develop research topics, and publish research findings in international journals), which are predominantly covered by the final thesis and the course "Critical Thinking and Publication in Academic Writing". The specific skills learning outcomes include the ability to further develop current theories of the discipline and policies applicable to the education sector in social sciences. Both aspects are imparted in the final thesis writing process, the final thesis, and the course "Social Science Education Curriculum".

Based on the graduation profile and the intended learning outcomes on the programme level, the department has composed the curriculum. The courses cover compulsory courses on the "Philosophy of Social Studies Education" (two SKS), "History in Social Sciences" (two SKS), "Sociology in Social Sciences" (two SKS), "Economics in Social Studies" (two SKS), "Geography in Social Sciences" (two SKS), "Socio-Cultural Concepts and Theories" (two SKS), "Journal Studies and Scientific Writing" (two SKS), "Social Studies Learning Planning & Innovation" (two SKS), "Social Studies Educational research Methods" (three SKS), "Local Culture" (two SKS), a "Social Studies Seminar" (three SKS), and the final thesis (eight SKS). As elective courses, students may choose six SKS out of six courses: "Social Studies Education Paradigm and Theory" (two SKS), "Textbook Studies and Writing" (two SKS), "Citizenship Studies" (two SKS), "Gender perspective" (two SKS), "Indonesian Governance" (two SKS), and "Global Insights" (two SKS).

The SER describes that each student has to follow clear steps until students may obtain their degree. The SER differentiates in three stages: The first stage includes a basic social studies concept course (called the matriculation course). This course strives to harmonise the knowledge of students before entering the actual programme. The second stage includes the Master's programme as outlined above, where students have to take 38 SKS. The third stage entails passing all courses to be taken in the study programme, followed by the fourth stage, which is the thesis and the oral defence of the thesis.

Experts' evaluation

After reviewing the evidence and discussing the curriculum with the relevant stakeholders, the experts conclude that a curriculum's redesign concerning the introductory courses has to be carried out. Currently, too much room is given for the introductory courses in introduction to social sciences, philosophy, and alike which causes a limited time to specialise in more specific matters of the discipline. Courses such as History, Economics, Geography, and Sociology within the social sciences appear quite broad and do not adequately encapsulate the comprehensive knowledge expected at the Master's level according to the European Qualification Framework. The experts argue that by consolidating these foundational courses, students are afforded the opportunity to cultivate a strong interdisciplinary foundation within a condensed timeframe. This not only

optimizes the utilization of their time and resources but also ensures that they are well-prepared to deepen into more advanced, specialized coursework and research endeavours. It is important to note that Master's level education demands a deeper and broader understanding of the subject matter and scientific methodology compared to undergraduate studies. Such distinction is, however, not reflected in the curriculum at the moment (**Finding 9**).

Furthermore, the development of the Master's curriculum should be aligned with the undergraduate and prospective doctoral curricula to ensure that there would be no knowledge gap as well as students are well-prepared for involving in more research work. In other words, curriculum developers have to incorporate a stronger emphasis on scientific elements, considering the high degree of dynamism in societal dynamics and responsiveness to market demands **(Finding 10)**.

Along this line, it is highly recommended that students actively participate in collaborative research endeavours with their lecturers, focusing on a central and overarching research theme **(Finding 11)**. This approach allows students to engage in meaningful research alongside their lecturers, ensuring their research efforts are coordinated around a shared theme. This collaborative endeavour can enhance the overall research experience, fostering deeper academic engagement and advancing collective research objectives, which is beneficial for both students and lecturers. It will foster critical thinking and the application of theory in the discipline.

One more point worth pointing out is that the current curriculum is not sufficiently catered for graduates pursuing non-educational career paths, failing to provide them with relevant subject matter for career development. A more explicit definition of the expected graduate profile is thus crucial for identifying the necessary knowledge and skills **(Finding 12)**. Each component within UNNES, both at the university and study programme levels, also plays a contributory role in the development of this curriculum to make sure that the curriculum can accommodate students who want to pursue either teaching or non-teaching career paths.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2.   Procedures for quality assurance

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*
>
> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

Description

Following the national policies for the quality assurance of higher education programmes in Indonesia, UNNES states that an internal and external quality assurance system has been implemented for all study programmes. In 2015, the university implemented the ISO 9001: 2015 quality management system and in 2018 IWA2 from PT AUR. The university level's quality assurance system follows a continuous cycle, including quality standard setting, quality standard implementation, quality standard control, and continuous improvement. As a result of

this system, UNNES has developed several instruments, policies, or manuals to assure the quality of its programmes, focusing on the values in education, research, and community service of the programmes (academic policy), on the quality of the graduates (quality policy), and the implementation of the quality management system (quality manual). It is described that UNNES uses more than 30 quality procedures for the programmes for the whole student-life cycle (from admission to graduation). These instruments aim to enable the faculty and study programme leader to monitor and further develop the study programmes. Furthermore, the SER includes evidence on the teaching and learning process, the evaluation of research output, teaching and research facilities, student's progression (including GPA, attendance, classroom activities, school field introductions, meetings with academic advisors, and information on the thesis).

One of the key aspects is the evaluation of teaching and learning processes. The monitoring procedures, which apply to all programme in this cluster, include the availability of teaching materials (conducted through the SIKADU programme), the number of lecturer and student meetings (monitored through the Mulang programme), the student advisory sessions (SIBIMA) and the student thesis monitoring (SITEDI). As outlined in the SER, UNNES keeps track of the lecturer evaluation, which students hand in at the end of each course. These evaluations are based on the lecture materials, didactical competencies, and quality of the course. The results of these evaluations will be analysed and shared with the teaching staff of the respective courses. The SER indicates that the university uses an integrated academic system (called SIKADU 2.0), which teachers can use for the internal management of the courses (attendance, timetables, grading of students). Furthermore, the class attendance, class activities, internship reports, and the examination for all courses can be monitored by the systems used at UNNES.

Also, it is outlined that periodical review with programme-specific stakeholders is carried out. This covers workshops involving stakeholder representatives, policymakers, and similar programme leaders. A review of the curriculum takes place at least every four years, if needed, even every two years. The feedback also includes the relevant infrastructure, laboratories, IT facilities, and student services.

The SER states that the Bachelor's programmes integrated an internship activity in the curriculum. This procedure entails that students are accompanied by an UNNES supervisor and a civil servant teacher during these internships at schools. With instruments focusing on the research output, the university focuses on the one hand on how study programmes interact with the community and on the other side on the question of how latest research developments are integrated into the teaching activities for the respective programme.

Experts' evaluation

UNNES has implemented a comprehensive system of quality assurance, underpinned by a series of well-defined procedures and activities. At the forefront of this framework is the BPM (Quality Assurance Unit) at the university level, which carries out a regular cycle of quality assurance. Moreover, UNNES adheres to the ISO 9001:2015 standards, further underscoring its commitment to maintaining high levels of quality and excellence.

A structured reporting mechanism ensures transparency and accountability in this process. It had been discussed that study programmes provide updates on their achievements to the respective faculties on a quarterly basis. At the end of each year, the BPM conducts a thorough evaluation of all study programmes across the university, consolidating a comprehensive overview of accomplishments.

Internal auditors play a critical role in this evaluation process. They are tasked with conducting internal audits annually, a meticulous examination carried out by members of the Quality Assurance Team. On a complementary note, external audits are administered by the National Accreditation Body (BAN-PT) once every five years. These external audits hold significant weight as they determine the accreditation status of the Study Program.

The scope of UNNES's quality assurance efforts is extensive, encompassing multiple facets of academic life. This includes the meticulous evaluation of the teaching and learning process, an in-depth scrutiny of research outcomes, an assessment of academic staff performance, an evaluation of the quality of teaching and research facilities, a thorough examination of stakeholder feedback, and a comprehensive review of student progress. Such a holistic approach ensures that the university remains dedicated to the pursuit of excellence across all dimensions of its educational endeavours.

It was confirmed in the online site visit that relevant stakeholders such as labour market representatives and alumni are currently involved in the quality assurance process but only in informal and individual setups. From the experts' point of view, there are two points in UNNES' quality assurance process that need to be addressed: Structural collection of data collection from the industry and student's feedback on the further development of the curricula.

The experts argue that labour market representatives might possess firsthand knowledge of the current trends, technologies, and skills in their respective industries. Currently, these individual setups are clearly helpful but a structural approach via meetings of relevant stakeholders of a broader range will ensure that programmes are aligned with industry needs, enhancing graduates' employability and facilitating a seamless transition into the professional world (**Finding 13a**).

The experts also understand the traditional approach of collecting data from students on the respective study programme. However, it is believed that the involvement of students and alumni in the further development of the study programme is crucial. It is expected that this empowers students to have a voice in their education, leads to learner-centric programmes that cater to their specific needs, and fosters a sense of ownership and commitment, ultimately enhancing their motivation, satisfaction, and academic success **(Finding 13b)**.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3.   Learning, teaching and assessment of students

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*
> *Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*
> *Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
> *[ESG 1.3]*

Description

Learning and teaching

The Academic handbook gives insights on the implementation of teaching and learning activities at UNNES. For the programmes, an active role in the learning process is taken by students especially in discussions, problem-based learning activities, and courses that focus on smaller research projects. The SER specifies that the programmes include different learning methods, e.g., case studies, problem-based learning, problem solving-based learning, project-based learning, simulations, group discussion, presentations, or assignments. It is stated that the quality assurance mechanisms focus on a student-centred teaching and learning approach in the courses. The university has implemented that teaching staff can offer face-to-face and online learning methods. While face-to-face session are scheduled, teachers can use the learning management system

ELENA to provide online teaching to the class. Although this platform was already in place before 2020, it is stated that this was, especially valuable during the COVID-19 lockdown. Teachers can use the system to upload documents, provided additional materials or to attach questionnaires. Being recently introduced into the Indonesian higher education system, the so-called MBKM option ("Independent Campus, Freedom to learn") takes an important role in the teaching and learning process. This option allows students to take courses outside their set curriculum. This may include student exchange, internships, work practice, teaching assistants, research, or thematic community services.

Assessment

Regarding the assessment type of courses, the SER states that the approach and the examination type highly depend on the course level's intended learning outcomes. In general, there are two types of examination: a paper-based examination, and a performance-based examination. While typically theoretical courses will have a paper-based examination, a performance-based examination or a project will be used in course that combine theory and practice. The final project includes an oral defence. Students will have to present their scientific paper, and the examiners will raise some questions for a deeper understanding. These examination types are clarified in the UNNES Academic Handbook. According to the SER, students have the chance to appeal against an examination result. The SER includes an appeal procedure flow.

The higher education institution uses a predefined final scoring formula to calculate the final score for each course. This formula is based on the score of continuous assessment (so-called daily score), mid-term result, and the result of the final examination. Students need to score a minimum of 51 out of 100 to pass a course. The higher education institution outlines that students have the chance to appeal against the examination results. If a C Score or lower (65 out of 100 points) is obtained, the lecturer can automatically provide a re-sit option for the examination. It is stated that this re-sit option can either be the same examination method or writing a scientific paper. Appeals concerning the final score can be done within one month after the final score was announced. The flow of the procedure is shown in the Quality Procedure Manual. The current version of the SER still lacks evidence on long-term data specifically for the programmes.

Experts' evaluation

It is good that UNNES mentions in the SER the active role of students in the learning process, problem-based learning activities, and courses that focus on smaller research projects. It seems that the university is aware that the traditional teacher-centred approach has been outdated. However, the interviews with the lecturers and the students of the bachelor study programmes showed that in practice student-centred learning (SCL) is not always adopted. SCL is also very difficult to implement if the average class size is (according to the interviews) up to 50 students in the bachelor study programs. In terms of updating pedagogical skills, more options for student-centred learning beyond merely classroom presentations and discussions should be integrated into teaching, especially for the Bachelor's and the Master's programmes **(Finding 14)**. This could for example take the flipped class-room model where students do not just come into the classroom to imbibe knowledge but directed learning in more meaningful ways by responding to material and directing learning more actively. This is not self-evident in Indonesia (and other international) universities. Based on the answers from interviews with UNNES students and lecturers, it seems that the methods of teaching and learning show some flexibility towards those with special needs, such as parents with children.

In terms of the clarity of assessments, lesson plans do not detail what are rubrics of assessment. For e.g. in lesson plans Formative assessment is listed as 30% and daily assessment is 50% but this is not broken down in terms of what each component entails. (e.g., formative assessment has six aspects, but these are not detailed). It is unclear how expectations are conveyed to students in terms of how they are supposed to fulfil this criterion. It was also conveyed that project-based assessment is individually assessed, which would be confusing for students who may expect to be assessed as a group. These kinds of rubrics and grading metrics

need to be made clearer for students in order to understand how the learning outcomes are being understood and operationalised **(Finding 15)**.

The methods of learning and teaching as well as assessment formats at the social science study programmes do in general not support enough an interlacing of theoretical and practical aspects. A lot of the seminars are designed to improve character-building for the students and neglect the practical aspects which are necessary for a job in the private sector. Students are therefore not trained enough to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the university context. According to the answers of students, assessment regulations and procedures are generally defined and accessible (including grading scales) to students via the electronic data system of UNNES. The students seem to be well informed about the timing of the exams. There is no general office dealing with student appeals, but they have to deal with their individual lecturers. Specifics of examination procedures, questions concerning the recognition of individual achievements, status of publications, and the timescale for publications are thus communicated quickly and transparently. On the other hand, such close relationships can create dependencies and tensions. Therefore, it is necessary to install a more transparent and less lecturer-dependent procedure regarding complaints and appeals for all study programmes **(Finding 16).**

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*

Description

Admission

The admission procedures for the programmes which are assessed in this cluster follow national regulations which have different levels: the national selection of state universities (SNMPTN), respectively the joint selection of state universities (SBMPTN), and independent selection procedure at UNNES (SM-UNNES). While SNMPTN and SBMPTN are based on the state university entrance examination results, SM-UNNES is applicable for students with extraordinary achievements in sports or arts and who have passed an English language plus an academic potential test. Furthermore, these students must provide evidence that tuition fees and expenses during the study periods will be covered. The higher education institution publishes the different possibilities to enrol at UNNES on its homepage. Currently, there is no information given about the recognition mechanism at UNNES.

The SER shows data on the applicants for the respective programmes and students enrolled in the programmes for the last five years (2017 – 2021). The data show that the programme's enrolment quota has been stable for the programmes without any significant dropdown in the last years. Following the instruments as mentioned above for quality assurance of the programmes, the teaching staff and the programme management can use the internal platforms to monitor students' progression. The current numbers of students are 481 (117 male and 364 female) for the Bachelor's programme "Social Sciences Education", 578 students (148 male and 430 female) for the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education", "652 students

(274 male and 378 female) for the Bachelor's programme "Political Science", and 70 students (35 male and 35 female) for the Master's programme "Social Sciences Education".

Progression

To monitor the progression of students, students receive academic guidance services, mentoring, and activities for self-development. The SER states that each student has an academic supervisor assigned when enrolled at UNNES. The academic guidance is supported by an application that facilitates the communication. The application also tracks and records the entire process. The SER includes a table with current enrolled students, unrolled students, dropped out students, and information on the timely graduation. In case students are at risk of dropping out of the programmes (GPA lower than 2.0), the departments have implemented specific guidance, consultation and monitoring procedures for students. However, the drop-out rate aim is described as less than 1%.

Recognition

Within the MBKM option, students have the chance to add courses outside the university to their curriculum. This includes internships, projects, and teaching experience. Also, students may use this option for third mission activities. However, the SER does not include an overview about cooperation with international higher education institutions. UNNES aims to support all students to participate in national and international competitions. The results and certificates of these participations can be uploaded to the electronic student file as an additional achievement. The SER exemplifies the student mobility for the Bachelor's programmes (differentiating between inbound and outbound) for the academic year 2021.

Certification

After completing the respective study programme, graduates will receive documents that describe the student's qualification and competencies. They will receive the degree certificate, transcript of records and the diploma supplement. Examples are annexed to the self-evaluation report. Graduates of the Bachelor's programme "Political Science" will receive a Bachelor of Social Science, graduates of the Bachelor's programmes "Social Sciences Education" and "Sociology and Anthropology Education" will receive a Bachelor of Education. Graduates of the Master's programme will receive a Master of Education.

Experts' evaluation

The admission procedures for all programmes are described and made available to prospective students via the university's website. During the study visit discussions, the experts were informed that the admission for the PhD programme students depend also on their research focus and interest, which should be aligned with the professor's field of expertise. It was stated that usually professors know their students from previous programmes (Master and/or Bachelor) and therefore it is easy for them to make recommendations on the student admission to the program.

In general, the progression of students is well monitored: professors and in particular students' supervisors/advisors, who are assigned to each student, closely follow students in their study path and are monitoring and keeping in touch both through formal systems (SIDAKU platform, regular consultations) and more informal means, as WhatsApp groups. Students shared positive feedback during the discussions with the panel of experts about counselling support and frequent feedback exchange with professors. Especially for students who do have a family or working commitments (for instance, they teach in a school or work already as lecturers and are carrying out the Master's programme at the same time), there is a certain level of flexibility and hybrid options so that they are able to continue their studies while having a family or working somewhere.

To better keep track and evaluate students' progression and at the same time understand what the feasible and optimal duration of a study programme is, data on progression of students from Master's and PhD programmes must be separately collected and analysed **(Finding 17)**.

Regulations regarding the recognition of competences and transfer of credits from other higher education institutions are available in the main website but it is not clear whether they apply to the study programmes under evaluation. It is positive to note that the university motivates students to participate in various self-development competitions, trainings, conferences. The certificates acquired by students in recognition of their effort and achievements will constitute valuable evidence for their future career steps.

After the completion of the studies, students receive the degree certificate, transcript of records and the diploma supplement. Certificates and results of competitions carried out by students are also included in the student file.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
> *Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*
> *Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*
> *[ESG 1.5]*

Description

Following national regulations, the recruitment systems at higher education institutions in Indonesia are identical at all HEIs. The requirements describe the prerequisites of applicants covering applicants' educational background, expertise, and experience. It is stated that the minimum academic qualification for a lecturer is a master's degree, while for other academic staff members it may vary depending on the needs of the programme. Lecturers at UNNES can be divided into three different status types: Civil Servant Lecturers (PNS; called permanent lecturers), Contract Lecturer, and Adjunct Lecturers (both declared non-permanent lecturers). It is stated that the overall workload of teaching staff is evaluated annually. The workload includes time for education, but also time for research and community service. University-wide, the lecturer has to perform a minimum workload which is an equivalent to twelve credit points. In case lecturers work more than this equivalent, they will get a bonus in remuneration. The general teaching workload for full-time lecturers is 38 working hours per week (for civil servant lecturers), which refers to twelve credit points. In case of changes in the teaching body due to retirement, it is stated that the process to replace this person starts six years before the actual retirement to use the knowledge and expertise and continuous development within the teaching body. The documentation includes information on the CVs of teaching staff.

The SER outlines that UNNES supports the teaching staff to participate in several career development possibilities. The possibilities cover degree-related development options and personal development plans. The support is organised by the head of the study programme and faculty leaders. UNNES offers lecture management and method training programmes that focus on an applied approach in teaching concerning the professional development of staff. This is carried out as workshops and training. Discipline-related and competency-related development of staff (including non-academic staff) is carried by providing training and workshops at UNNES

and outside the higher education institution. This includes ISO certified training and workshops to administrative staff.

The Bachelor's degree programme "Political Science" has, according to the self-evaluation report, two full professors, four associate professors, and one assistant professor. The overview presented in the SER shows that currently all are PhD holders.

The Bachelor's degree programme "Sociology and Anthropology" has, according to the self-evaluation report, one full professor, six associate professors, and fourteen assistant professors. The overview presented in the SER shows that currently ten people are PhD holders and eleven are Master's degree holders (one associated professor and ten assistant professors).

The Bachelor's degree programme "Social Sciences Education" has, according to the self-evaluation report, two full professors, two associate professors, four assistant professors, and four lecturers. The overview presented in the SER shows that currently four people are PhD holders and eight are Master's degree holders (four assistant professors and four lecturers).

The Master's degree programme "Social Sciences Education" has, according to the self-evaluation report, two full professors, and eight associate professors. The overview presented in the SER shows that currently all are PhD holders.

Experts' evaluation

The teaching staff at UNNES range across from full professors to lecturers. During the online site visit, there also appeared to be a range in terms of seniority and gender diversity amongst the faculty. Faculty members in general seemed happy about the opportunities for development made available to them at UNNES. However, there was some expression of desire for greater internationalisation opportunities.

The university leaders have provided adequate numbers of teaching staff at various levels of qualification as well as numbers of students. The lecturer-to-student ratio seems to be manageable, and students and lecturers seem to have close working relationships as they have a lot of face-to-face contact during lessons. This means that communication options and opportunities to recruit student research assistants to assist with faculty's research projects are numerous. The lecturer profiles are very wide in terms of the subject areas covered and the types of research that faculty undertakes. The fit between supervision of students in postgraduate degrees and supervisor specialty is thus unclear as dissertations also seem to cross over a wide range of subject areas.

In terms of fostering a research environment for the faculty, here is where much effort has been made. There is a Pancasila research centre which focuses on the character and history of the nation and region, and GIS/integrated geography research institutes and laboratory as well. In future, there could be more research centres established that are tied more to the focus of faculty research projects. 10% of the total budget of the university has been reserved for research. All lecturers are provided with resources for research through competitive grant schemes. This is a welcome development and speaks to the commitment of UNNES in improving its faculty's' research profiles. For the next step in this process, more should be done to aid with faculty to internationalise their research through publication in higher ranked and more internationally recognised journals. This should be combined with matching international standards in research management and publication **(Finding 18)**. For instance, all faculty conducting research should be required to undertake an ethics training course similar to CITI, and regular updates of this should be encouraged, particularly for those working with people and communities directly, but also for those working with secondary data sets and online sources.

Staff development could be improved over a number of areas. Firstly, in the area of research supervision and management of graduate student projects. More training should be provided. Department has regulation that students and supervisors have to meet every four months and has to record in the student profile system

(Sikadu digital programme to keep track of consultations.) The Vice Dean of academic affairs and Heads of Department monitor this process. But generally, there is no training for faculty. This should be professionalized further in terms of staff training in management of research students and teams. In particular, there should be more trainings for lecturers on the supervision on their research projects with an emphasis on research ethics and ethical practices in supervision, as the power dynamics between supervisors and students can lead to potential incidents of exploitation or abuse **(Finding 19a)**. There do not seem to be adequate checks to safeguard against such potentialities.

At the moment, much of the exchange takes pace with regional universities, with 95% from Malaysia. Longer exchanges perhaps for a semester or a year should be encouraged and supported by the university. This would not just allow teaching faculty to gain international exposure, but incoming foreign faculty would also expose students to international experiences and research. Much of this depends on a match in language capacities. Thus, if the university was to run more courses in English, this would greatly expand the available pool of visiting researchers and teaching faculty.

Staff development should also include more regular training with regards to pedagogy **(Finding 19b)**. This is especially in relation to student-centred learning techniques that do not just rely on older more traditional models of knowledge dissemination. At the moment, there are two models of workshop for new lecturers. One on Instructional techniques to improve professional competency. And an applied approach workshop that profiles some models of teaching and learning. These are available and taken up typically by new faculty upon joining the teaching staff. There are also specific workshops on technology use e.g. how to access international publications, how to write a good reference and use a reference manger.

Teaching staff also should update their knowledge so that they can teach a broader range of topics that are reflective of new social phenomenon **(Finding 20a)**. This should be done through attending conferences on a regular basis and accessing journals for more up-to-date literature in specific topic areas. The continual fine-tuning of course content should be encouraged and supported with regular peer review and training courses. In this respect, the development and institution of a teaching development academy or centre for teaching and learning at the university or Cluster level would be beneficial.

Teaching staff could need more English language training and conduct more English language seminars/courses to enable more international students to join the student body and increase diversity in the university **(Finding 20b)**. English language training would also mean that teaching staff will be more comfortable in using more English language texts in teaching. This may mean that higher English language requirements must be made a requirement. (e.g., 450 TOEFL is too low).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*
> *Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*
> *[ESG 1.6]*

Description

Being a public university, the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia funds the learning facilities for the programmes. The programmes' relevant budget is distributed from the UNNES budget to the faculty budget, and then to the respective programmes. In general, the budget focuses on three pillars (teaching, research, and community service).

UNNES provided information on the faculty funding and the postgraduate school funding differentiating between different categories: education and teaching, research, community dedication, learning facilities, and human resources development.

The SER lists facilities on different levels: university, faculty and study programme level.

On the university level, students have access to several different facilities. Following the self-evaluation report, UNNES offers sports facilities, a student activity centre (that can be used for student activities such as arts or student organisation meetings), the cafeteria, the technology information centre, or the health facilities. Furthermore, students have access to the Wi-Fi installations and the e-learning software (e.g., Turnitin, NVivo software), the mosque or other religious multipurpose rooms, the university counselling room or the entrepreneurship building.

The Faculty of Social Sciences at UNNES, students have access to the cafeteria, the sports facilities, the student gazebo, and the Museum of Social Conservation (for audio-visual learning). In addition, the students can use the parking lot at the faculty.

On the study programme level, the SER lists several facilities such as classrooms (between 8-10 rooms per programme), a lecturer room, a microteaching room, the thesis exam room, a student interaction room, a counselling room, and a podcast space. The facilities also offer support to students with special needs.

Experts' evaluation

The course descriptions, found on the ELENA digital platform, provide comprehensive information, including subject content, teaching and learning methods, assessment methods, and expected workload, both for self-study and in-class hours. While formal course description sheets are available, specifying subject content and teaching methods on a session-by-session basis, the intended learning outcomes are consolidated in a separate document.

Organisational overlap among courses is of no concern due to the limited number of electives offered to students, which are concentrated in the fifth semester of the Bachelor's programme. Aside from these electives, all programmes adhere to a fixed course order. In terms of content overlap, there are some concerns regarding the similarity of course titles both across and within the evaluated undergraduate programmes. While some introductory courses are shared among the three undergraduate programmes in the early semesters, they are reportedly not taught jointly. Nevertheless, there are instances where different programmes have courses with identical names. For instance, the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" offers two courses called "Introduction to Social Science," with one course administered by the university and the other by the faculty. The experts highly suggest reviewing current course titles to accurately reflect content differences and avoid confusion amongst students **(Finding 21)**.

The assessment indicates that the study programme effectively fulfils the criterion concerning appropriate material resources necessary to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The ELENA platform serves as a valuable teaching tool, enabling lecturers to upload materials and facilitating direct communication with students through platforms like Telegram. Approximately 80-90% of teaching staff actively utilise the ELENA system, with reminders from department heads encouraging consistent usage among all lecturers. Moreover, the programme showcases its commitment to providing current and specialized equipment aligned with professional

standards through dedicated laboratories tailored to different student profiles, including the micro-teaching laboratory, democracy simulation room, computer laboratory, and podcast room. Additionally, the utilisation of Turnitin for plagiarism checking further enhances the program's resource availability.

While the national mobility afforded to students through the MBKM exchange and internship programmes are a great asset for the intended learning outcomes that centre on the profile of teacher education, further developments for students with a more research-oriented learning profile would be warranted. However, the internship options that were described by the teaching staff, students and labour market representatives are still limited in their scope and field of application and they are more related to teaching at school. In view of the internationalisation of these study programmes and in line with UNNES vision and mission, more internship options should be amplified in different fields (private and public companies, NGOs, governmental offices, international institutions, research institutes, etc), in particular to improve the university's capacity to attract talents at the national and international level **(Finding 22a)**. Internship placements would have to better reflect the different occupational profiles (and potential future ones that could be introduced after this evaluation) that the study programmes foresee. However, as stated above, the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology" is exempted of this recommendation.

International exchanges are, with exceptions on the PhD level, limited to digital participation in online courses. This however cannot replace the scope of experiences and networking opportunities that in-person international exchanges provide. In light of the ambition to internationalise, further support of international student mobility on all levels would be recommended **(Finding 22b)**.

Appropriate material resources and equipment for the laboratories of study programmes are available. All undergraduate programmes offer a sufficient number of lecture rooms and halls, with a commendable ratio of one room per fifty enrolled students overall. Moreover, the faculty boasts an impressive range of laboratories catering to different student profiles, such as the "micro-teaching laboratory," the "democracy simulation room," a computer laboratory for data processing and audio-visual media creation, and a dedicated "podcast room." Additional facilities include a visual room (cinema), separate exam rooms, guidance rooms, and department-specific student rooms. The presence of a specialised library for social sciences with a designated librarian, alongside a general library with learning spaces, reading areas is another important resource. While it has been noted that the teaching rooms in the graduate programme are equipped with 65-inch televisions and some with interactive LCD displays, the availability of projectors in every classroom remains unclear. However, students have expressed positive feedback regarding the hybrid teaching capabilities of their programs. It is important to acknowledge that while students are highly satisfied with equipment availability, the student organization HIMA has reportedly advocated for improvements in studying conditions, particularly in terms of facility quality.

Students are provided access to an appropriate amount of literature, journals, and academic sources necessary for achieving the intended learning outcomes. The library is sufficiently well-stocked, particularly in relation to the training of teachers, offering relevant materials that align with the program's objectives. To encourage a more international scientific outlook, the university can consider to provide some additional subscriptions such as JSTOR. In terms of material access, specific areas within the library allow access to materials curated by individual professors, including textbooks and other resources. Furthermore, the utilization of the ELENA platform enables direct digital access to material provided by the teachers themselves. Moreover, the university possesses several Scopus-indexed journals, including a dedicated journal for "science education," which proves valuable for Master's students. Additionally, students can also get first publishing experience through smaller, nationally accredited digital journals.

Student advisory services are institutionalised in an exemplary manner. Students have access to comprehensive counselling services at different levels, including the university, faculty, and department. These services

encompass career advice, health-related counselling, spiritual counselling, and counselling for various special needs. Prior to the start of courses, a campus orientation is conducted, serving as an introduction to various aspects of the program, including the ELENA and SIKADU digital platforms. This orientation also provides new and potential students with an opportunity to familiarize themselves with the faculty's resources and tools, as well as counselling services, ensuring students are aware of the resources and support available. Moreover, individualized advising is offered, with each student being assigned a dedicated guardian lecturer who provides support and personal guidance through regular meetings (four per semester). These counselling sessions cover a wide range of issues, including but not limited to career development in relation to the choice of elective courses and finding internship placements. Students have described these relationships as highly supportive, and communication with advisors is facilitated through various channels such as phone, chat, or face-to-face meetings. The faculty demonstrates high consistency and availability of teaching staff members for frequent consultation hours, ensuring students have ample opportunities for guidance and support. The experts consider the strong capabilities of all reviewed programs, even at the undergraduate level, to provide regular, individual counselling to every student as a highly valuable asset. These counselling offers also seem to successfully counteract some of the previously mentioned minor concerns, such as potential for confusion among students due to unclear course titles.

Various measures are in place to accommodate a diverse student body. Economic diversity is addressed through the adjustment of tuition fees based on students' economic levels, with the lowest fee grade being 0.5 million IDR. Government grants are available and utilized by approximately 23% of students. Special achievement grants, which waive tuition fees and provide living cost reimbursements, further support students. Mental health support spaces, a mosque, a multipurpose religious room, recreational facilities such as a golf course, swimming pool, and tennis court, a health centre, an international student dormitory, a student service centre for counselling, and a small park contribute to the holistic well-being and diverse needs of students. Personal connections between students and teaching staff through social media platforms like Telegram enhance flexibility and support. The existence of wheelchair-accessible pathways demonstrates a commitment to inclusivity. However, it should be noted that gender equity decreases at higher academic levels. While individual considerations are given, such as the possibility to participate remotely, flexibility with deadlines, and other empathetic approaches, no institutionalised support, such as childcare assistance for studying mothers, was mentioned. Although affected students reported satisfaction with the flexibility they were granted, the university can consider the repercussions of this flexibility on their academic success. Overall, the study programme still demonstrates a comprehensive and inclusive approach in addressing student diversity through various resources and support mechanisms, successfully fulfilling the criterium.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7.   Information

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*
> *[ESG 1.8]*

Description

The necessary information on the study programme can be accessed primarily on the homepage of the higher education institution; however, the programmes are also advertised on social media. Students have access to

the intended learning outcomes, course descriptions, and course information via the online platform when being enrolled. General information on the overall structure is provided in the Academic Handbook, which is regularly updated. Furthermore, UNNES publishes all necessary information concerning the admission regulations (including the different paths) the qualifications awarded, and the teaching, learning, and assessment procedures for the respective study programme. The admission requirements are published on the UNNES homepage and via print and television mass media, radio and online media.

Experts' evaluation

Information is provided to the public regarding the study programmes, intended learning outcomes, admission procedure, qualification awarded, and teaching, learning and assessment procedures. General information is available, for instance general requirements, registration time, execution of the test for Master's, etc. However, no specific prerequisites are found on the individual websites of study programmes. The prerequisites must be individualised for each study programme and published on its webpage **(Finding 23a)**. In order to structure more formally this procedure and provide more transparent and clear information to prospective students, especially in view of the internalisation of the study program, it could be useful to list professors' research focuses on a section of the individual study programme website and provide this information also in English for international students **(Finding 23b)**.

In fact, while in the university's website, it is written that scholarships are available for students who enrol in international classes, there are other pages where they refer to scholarships provided by the government, who should be available for any programmes. More clarity would ensure a better access to students in need of this support. Further information concerning research collaborations, international events and conferences should be included in the departments' websites **(Finding 24)**.

In terms of fulfilling the criterium for public information, the study programme demonstrates a general presence of extensive information across various online platforms. The university, faculty, and departmental websites provide information about the accredited undergraduate programs, including their intended learning outcomes, selection procedures, qualifications awarded, as well as some information about teaching, learning, and assessment procedures. Additionally, student organisations and UNNES career Instagram accounts contribute to sharing information on upcoming events and programme aims. Each department has its own website, offering specific information related to the respective programs.

On a more detailed level, some specific aspects are missing or require improvement. Some links on the main website do not work as intended, such as the redirection to the faculty of social sciences, and the connection to the alumni page. Also, content on the website of the Master's programme is missing, as for instance under the "student work" and "alumni" sections. More importantly, the availability of curriculum for the Master's programme is unavailable on the departmental websites, while the focus is solely on the Bachelor's level. Additionally, there are discrepancies between the submitted curricula and those available online, including differences in course names and credit values. The university has to regularly check on missing contents, errored links and up-to-dateness of the website **(Finding 25a)**.

Lastly, the limited availability of English translations restricts access for international stakeholders. Therefore, it is essential to address these concerns by rectifying the discrepancies in curricula and course descriptions and ensuring the presence of Master's programme details on the relevant websites as well as to expand the availability of information in English translation **(Finding 25b)**.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

V.   Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes **"Political Sciences" (Bachelor of Science)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study **programmes "Sociology and Anthropology Education" (Bachelor of Education)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes **"Social Sciences Education" (Bachelor of Education)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)** with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes **"Social Sciences Education" (Master of Education)** offered by **Universitas Negeri Semarang (Indonesia)** with conditions.

Commendation:

The university boasts an impressive campus with good facilities and infrastructure, creating an ideal setting for learning. Notably, both students and representatives from the job market have a favourable opinion of the university, highlighting its strong reputation. The institution demonstrates notable expertise in the field of social sciences education, underscoring its commitment to academic excellence. Lastly, the supportive and effective relationship between students and their instructors enhances the educational experience, contributing to the university's impressive academic ambiance.

Findings:

1. It is mandatory for the Bachelor's programme "Political Sciences" that new intended learning outcomes on the programme level will be established, aligning graduates with the skills and knowledge required for the job market, while also modernizing the curriculum in accordance with current demands e.g., a focus on media-politics, NGOs, parties, and national mandates.
2. To prepare Bachelor students of the "Political Sciences" programme for the globalized era, it is crucial to enhance their understanding of international dynamics, potentially through the inclusion of courses like ASEAN objectives to provide a comprehensive perspective on regional influences.
3. It is recommended to introduce diverse specialisation tracks, including private sector roles (media, NGOs, associations) and public sector positions (local government, state-owned enterprises) in the Bachelor's programme "Political Sciences".
4. To enhance international recognition and integration, it is recommended for the Bachelor's programme "Political Sciences" to consider offering some courses in English alongside those taught in Bahasa Indonesia.
5. To distinguish the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" more and align it with broader career prospects beyond high school education, it is recommended to consider diversifying the curriculum, e.g., by incorporating ethnographies in urban spaces representing a more dynamic perspective on the discipline.
6. Room should be given in the curriculum for the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" given to the incorporation of Youth studies, and the expansion towards an international or comparative focus to align with current societal developments.
7. It is suggested that the Bachelor's programme "Sociology and Anthropology Education" should include more scientific literature in English.
8. The department for the Bachelor's programme "Social Sciences" should include specialized tracks beyond the traditional teaching path.

9. The curriculum for the Master's programme "Social Sciences" has to revise the curriculum by consolidating introductory courses, allowing for a more focused specialization courses at the Master's level.

10. Potential knowledge gaps in research should be eliminated in the Master's programme "Social Sciences" by preparing students for advanced research work, and incorporate an emphasis on scientific elements.

11. It is highly recommended that students in the Master's programme "Social Sciences" actively participate in collaborative research endeavours with their lecturers, focusing on a central and overarching research themes.

12. The graduate profile for the Master's programme "Social Sciences" must be updated to address the needs of graduates pursuing non-educational career paths and necessary knowledge and skills must be then identified and reflected in the curriculum.

13. A structured data collection and feedback loop within the PDCA cycle has to be ensured to fill the curriculum development efforts by real-world insights, especially by:
    a. implementing regular meetings of relevant stakeholders of a broader range which will ensure that programmes are aligned with the labour market's needs, and
    b. involving students and alumni in the further development of the study programmes.

14. UNNES should actively prioritize student-centred learning, integrating diverse teaching methods, especially for Bachelor's and Master's programmes.

15. It is mandatory that the lesson plans at UNNES provide explicit rubrics for assessments, including clear breakdowns of each component to effectively convey expectations to students.

16. It is necessary to install a more transparent and less lecturer-dependent procedure regarding complaints and appeals for all study programmes.

17. The QA unit has to collect and analyse data on the progression of students in the Master's programme to effectively monitor their advancement.

18. Greater support should be provided to the faculty in internationalizing their research by encouraging publication in higher-ranked and globally recognized journals, while concurrently adhering to international standards in research management and publication.

19. UNNES should intensify their efforts in regards with teaching staff development, by focusing on:
    a. more trainings for lecturers on the supervision, and
    b. include more regular training with regards to pedagogy.

20. The international exposure of staff should be fostered, by providing opportunities for:
    a. attending regular conferences on a regular basis and accessing journals for more up-to-date literature in specific topic areas, and
    b. offering more English language training for teaching staff.

21. It is recommended to carefully review and revise course titles in order to accurately reflect content differences and prevent confusion among students.

22. UNNES is encouraged to promote more intensively the MBKM opportunities to students, by focusing on:
    a. amplifying more internship options outside the teacher's education path, and
    b. further support of international student mobility for the Bachelor's and Master's programmes.

23. The programmes' transparency to externals has to be raised, by:
    a. publishing he prerequisites for each study programme on its webpage, and
    b. providing professors' research focuses (potentially in English and Bahasa Indonesia) on the relevant webpages.

24. It is suggested to increase transparency and information regarding research grants and scholarships on the homepages of the programmes.

25. For the Master's and PhD programmes, the university must take action in the following aspects:
    a. The university has to regularly check on missing contents, errored links and up-to-dateness of the relevant webpages.

b. Information on the current curriculum, courses and credits hours, and English content on the relevant webpages must be available.