



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS ESA UNGGUL

### **ENGLISH-PSYCHOLOGY-EDUCATION**

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

PSYCHOLOGY (BACHELOR OF PSYCHOLOGY)

ELEMENTARY TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

December 2023



**Content**

---

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>         | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>I. Preamble .....</b>  | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>II. Accreditation procedure .....</b>                              | <b>7</b>  |
| 1. Criteria.....  | 7         |
| 2. Approach and methodology .....                                     | 7         |
| <b>III. General information on the university .....</b>               | <b>9</b>  |
| <b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes .....</b>                   | <b>9</b>  |
| 1. Quality of the curriculum .....                                    | 9         |
| 2. Procedures for quality assurance .....                             | 16        |
| 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students .....                | 18        |
| 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification..... | 20        |
| 5. Teaching staff.....  | 21        |
| 6. Learning resources and student support .....                       | 22        |
| 7. Information .....  | 24        |
| <b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>                 | <b>26</b> |

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
  - “PSYCHOLOGY” (BACHELOR OF PSYCHOLOGY)
  - “ELEMENTARY TEACHER EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS ESA UNGGUL, JAKARTA, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 19<sup>th</sup> meeting on 4 December 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “English Language Education” (Bachelor of Education), “Psychology” (Bachelor of Psychology) and “Elementary Teacher Education” (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Esa Unggul, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

### Conditions:

#### All study programmes

1. A concept must be handed in how the university will improve the resources of the library regarding the standard literature of the study programmes within the next three years. Moreover, to guarantee academic development and to reach the aspired international level of the study programmes, access to international research (in English) must be expanded.
2. The university must ensure that newly appointed teaching staff holds a PhD degree. For contracted teaching staff, the university must intensify and support their opportunities for gaining a higher qualification (PhD), by conducting their research projects and by contributing to more to conferences on national and international level.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

#### All study programmes

1. To create transparency for all stakeholders as well as to highlight the programmes' strength, it should be ensured that all documents concerning the study programmes are always up to date and easily available to all parties interested.
2. For the students' best possible preparation for the labour market and to ensure transparency, it should be ensured that courses in the study programme build up on competences that were taught in earlier courses and that this progression of competences and skills is documented transparently in the programmes' documentation.
3. To lead with good example, to further improve the programme as well as to help teaching staff with their personal development, the opportunity to improve their language proficiency should also be given to teaching staff and encouraged by the faculty.
4. To ensure that students can finish their theses in the allotted time to it, it should be researched why so little students finish it on time. Once the results are evaluated, changes should be implemented to support students to write their theses in the timeframe allotted to it, e.g., by preparing them better in terms of content, research methodology, organization of such work, etc.; changing the requirements of the thesis; etc.
5. Actions taken following negative evaluations should be properly recorded to guarantee the standards of quality assurance, transparency and traceability to follow up on the changes' effects.
6. To support a satisfying degree progression and ensure that prospective students are guided towards a degree that matches their aptitudes and skills adequately, the marketing department should work closely with the respective faculty to create criteria for admissions that achieve these objectives.
7. To allow economically challenged students on scholarships to finish their studies, even if they are not able to do so in the suggested period of eight semesters, a grace period should be implemented, in which students still receive financial support to allow them to graduate.
8. Within the national regulations, the teaching workload for all staff should be reconsidered and reduced to allow for more research, which will also elevate the classes taught as academic staff can connect their research to their teaching as well as the staff's and university's reputation.
9. To foster more internationality, EEU should incentivise, e.g. through financial support, teaching staff and students alike to participate in international mobility or participate in international conferences.
10. It is highly recommended to collaborate more with international universities academically to continue EEU's international approach and become more visible.
11. The space for the counselling laboratory should be expanded and rooms added to give all students the chance to practice in them as well as receive support if needed. To make sure that all students in need are supported, the offer of the counselling laboratory should be advertised more.
12. To accommodate the needs of disabled students, a consultation with them about their needs is advised. Some currently existing hinderances should be remedied.
13. For the library staff to adequately support students and lead them to all possible library resources, EEU's teaching staff should receive additional training and qualifications to be up to date in their field of work.
14. To make sure that all stakeholders and interested parties are aware of the study programmes, the marketing and advertisement strategy should be reconsidered, improved and expanded to reach all target groups.

### English Language Education

15. To ensure the students' success in the ELE study programme, their language competencies should be the highest priority. It should, therefore, be guaranteed that they are given the chance to improve their English language skills, also outside the mandatory language classes, e.g. through bridging courses.
16. In an effort for internationalisation, the students of the ELE study programme should be given the opportunity to practice their skills by teaching English as a Foreign Language throughout their studies.

### Psychology

17. To guarantee transparency for students of the Psychology study programme studying under the programme with night and weekend classes, additional information on the management of these non-regular classes and the differences students face following these classes should be collected in a comprehensive document and made easily accessible for all students and other stakeholders.

### Elementary Teacher Education

18. To support students in their transition of theoretical knowledge to practical use of it, courses of different foci (e.g., courses for content knowledge and those for pedagogical content knowledge) should be better linked and connected. Courses of the study programme Elementary Education should also use synergy effects with other study programmes by connecting itself to courses from them, e.g., psychology. These synergies should transparently be documented in the course handbook.
19. To support students following or developing their individual strengths and interests, it is recommended to include more space for elective courses in the study programme Elementary Education.

### English Language Education and Elementary Teacher Education

20. To give students a realistic view of their future jobs, practical elements in a school environment should be included in the study plan earlier than they currently are. Students should have the chance, e.g., to sit in on classes with experienced teachers, conduct small teaching units, supervise individual children during these practical phases.
21. To keep up with changes in the labour market, and for prospective teachers: in the classroom, the use of digital media should be strengthened throughout all courses. Their implementation should be clearly and transparently indicated in the course description and syllabus.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT****ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “PSYCHOLOGY” (BACHELOR OF PSYCHOLOGY)
- “ELEMENTARY TEACHER EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

**OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS ESA UNGGUL, JAKARTA, INDONESIA**

Visit to the university: 1-3 August 2023

**Panel of experts:**

|                                    |  |
|------------------------------------|--|
| <b>Prof. Dr. Dominik Rumlich</b>   | Professor English Language Education, Universität Paderborn, Germany   |
| <b>Dr. Anrilia Ningdyah</b>        | Universitas 17 Agustus 1945 Surabaya Masters of Professional Psychology Programme, Indonesian Psychological Association, Indonesia   |
| <b>Prof. Dr. Andreas Hartinger</b> | Professor for Primary School Pedagogy and Didactics, University of Augsburg, Germany   |
| <b>Dr. Silke Silanoe</b>           | Head of the department “Teacher Education and Curriculum Development”, Lower Saxony State Institute for Quality Development in Schools, Germany (labour market representative) |
| <b>Valentina Ostovary</b>          | Student Bachelor in Education English and German, Karl Franzens Universität Graz, Austria (student representative)   |
| <b>Coordinator:</b>                |  |
| Dr. Sarah Jenischewski             | AQAS, Cologne, Germany   |
| Maria Rentmeister                  | AQAS, Cologne, Germany   |

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor's programmes "English Language Education", "Psychology" and "Elementary Teacher Education" offered by Universitas Esa Unggul.

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in October 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In October 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 5 December 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in April 2023.

### *Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in May 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

### *Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

### *Site visit*

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 1-3 August. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

### *Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

### *Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 4 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2024, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General information on the university

---

Esa Unggul University (EUU) is a private university in Indonesia, established in 1993 in accordance with a Decree of the Minister of National Education under the auspices of the Kemala Mencerdaskan Bangsa Education Foundation. EUU has ten faculties and 37 departments offering a variety of programmes that lead to Diploma, undergraduate, professional and postgraduate degrees.

At the time of SER submission, the university reported 15,746 active students and 504 teaching staff.

The university defines its core research areas in poverty alleviation, i.e. food safety and security; new and renewable energies; health, tropical diseases, nutrition and medicine; disaster management, national integration and social harmony; regional autonomy and decentralization; arts and culture/creative industries and information and communication technologies; and human development and competitiveness.

EUU has created a strategic plan (RENSTRA) with three main goals: human resources with character and high competitiveness, a healthy and independent university, and a university with superior reputation. As part of this strategic plan, concrete numerical goals regarding the GPAs and TOEFL scores among graduates, the waiting times between graduation and first job, and a quota for teaching staff ranking Assistant Professor or higher have been set for all study programmes.

The study programmes English Language Education and Elementary Teacher Education are part of the Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, which was established in September 2014 and offers these two study programmes. Currently 652 students study in this faculty that has an academic staff of two and 26 lecturers, according to the SER. Its vision is to organise quality, innovative, and relevant primary school teacher education and English teacher in a conducive academic atmosphere, to build people with leadership and entrepreneurial spirit with high character and competitiveness as well as develop research and community service.

The study programme Psychology is taught at the Faculty of Psychology, where it is the only study programme. Currently the Faculty consists of 1,386 active students, one academic staff and 27 lecturers, as the university states. The Faculty's mission is to organise the Psychology education quality with a theoretical and practical approach as well as research and development programmes in the field of psychology in accordance with the code of ethics for science, research and the psychology profession and community service programmes in collaboration with the government and international institutions in the field of psychology.

### IV. Assessment of the study programmes

---

#### 1. Quality of the curriculum

##### **Bachelor's degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2

#### **Description**

According to the SER, all study programmes at Esa Unggul University must formulate their own graduate profiles, learning outcomes, course achievements and sub-courses. In order to achieve academic excellence,

all students of all study programmes must participate in English and entrepreneurship courses. Additionally, EUU follows Indonesian governmental regulations, meaning offering compulsory courses such as Pancasila, Citizenship, Indonesian Language or Religion. Curricula are reviewed every four years, with the last one stemming from 2020, when new policies of the Ministry of Education and Culture were accommodated, as the SER states. Apart from these courses on character building, which are taught at the university level, core courses also include an internship and community service as well as elective courses, which are in line with the MBKM system, according to the university.

One semester lasts 16 weeks for all study programmes, consisting of 14 weeks of teaching and learning as well as one week for a midterm and another one for a final exam. 1 SKS consists of 50 minutes each for lecture, structured tasks and independent study. Students graduate their study programmes with 144 SKS in a minimal time of studies of seven semesters.

### 1.1 English Language Education

The English Language Education study programme was established in 2017 and currently accepts 50 students per semester. It was last nationally accredited in 2019 with a duration of five years.

The study programme has not produced any graduates yet, as the SER says. The first tracer study is proposed to be conducted in 2023. According to the university, the graduate profile consists of educators and edu technopreneurs.

Students are supposed to learn to plan lessons with reference to the curriculum, to select and adapt materials and media, design learning strategies, manage a class, design an assessment procedure and conduct classroom-based research.

The SER includes the following seven ILOs for this study programme:

1. Graduates are able to apply moral personality and integrity through a learning process that values Indonesia diversity and the virtues inherent in their field of expertise independently,
2. Graduates are able to internalize values, norms, academic ethics, and university culture in the form of EMASKU vision,
3. Graduates are capable of performing/integrating English concepts and theories through a critical and reflective linguistics, literature, and pedagogy learning process,
4. Graduates are able to demonstrate skills in using concepts, theories, and methods logically, critically, systematically, and innovatively as a consequence of a learning process that puts an emphasis on scientific academic ethics,
5. Graduates can demonstrate their ability to adapt, collaborate, contribute, and innovate in the power of science to social life, as well as play a role as global citizens with global insight,
6. Graduates are able to perform skill in the use of innovative concepts, theories, and methods related to student comprehension and pedagogical learning through the TPACK (Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge)-based English learning process,
7. Graduates are able to apply their ability to apply innovative concepts, theories, and methods in the field of entrepreneurship (edu technopreneur). through a learning process.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The programme's strengths lie in its commitment to maximizing available resources and the introduction of cooperative initiatives among lecturers at EUU. The orientation of the study programme of English Language Education (ELE) towards international standards is visible and the labour market appeared content with the

outcomes of the ELE programme, even though it has not brought forth any graduates yet. The inclusion of a broad variety of disciplines (next to the traditional ones of English Literature and Linguistics, also Educational Pedagogy/Psychology, Educational Entrepreneurship, etc.) is highly welcome as are the overall objectives to develop critical and innovative thinking, ethics, global awareness, and information literacy in English language teaching. The international orientation is highly appreciated and necessary in such an international and interdisciplinary subject.

The ILOs cover social-attitudinal dimensions, knowledge, skills, and competences. They include important foundations from the area of research (to foster professional development) as well as the closely related academic disciplines of linguistics and literature. Assessment is formative/diagnostic/supportive (assessment for learning) as well as summative; both are informed by procedures of quality assurance and management (collaborative exam development, alignment with ILO of courses, scoring rubrics for written and oral exams, etc.). Here, stronger competence-based assessment might be a potential path for further development, which would also reduce the absolute number of assessment procedures and would allow for the integrated testing of more complex competences across classes (rather than individual course-based assessment).

However, many of these favourable aspects did not become directly obvious from the documentation (initially provided, but only from the on-site discussion session, personal talks and the document session, the latter of which brought forth documents of good quality, such as course descriptions and the like. The curriculum and its components should be made sure to always be up to date and readily available to current and prospective (international) students, parents, faculty, and other stakeholders in a transparent and easily accessible manner (**Finding 1**). This documentation should, especially in an English Language Education, be free of mistakes to confirm the expertise academic staff has in this programme.

Providing comprehensive information about the programme's structure, course outlines, learning resources, and assessment procedures will, furthermore, enhance clarity and promote engagement. A lack of clarity poses challenges for both students and educators in understanding the programme's goals and expectations, which are also the basis for assessment. It is crucial to define clear, up-to-date, and comprehensive learning outcomes that reflect both academic and labour-market requirements. Whereas all important areas of competences are covered by the current ILOs, it is important to keep this level up and potentially look at international universities for inspiration for further improvement, if needed. ELE programmes at European Universities are usually easily accessible online and might provide a helpful source of inspiration.

The curriculum appears to have a sound foundation in pedagogical, language, and content knowledge. However, the integration of these elements (or rather the documentation of their integration) could be improved as the course programme in the documentation provided prior to the site visit shows a compilation of individual classes rather than a comprehensive study programme with classes building on one another in a competence-oriented way to document the students' progression (**Finding 2**). It is essential to establish a strong connection between theoretical knowledge and practical application to enhance the students' teaching skills effectively.

The low English language proficiency among ELE students is (always) a significant concern, as it might impede their ability to achieve the desired learning outcomes. At the same time, EUU must face the reality of students completing pre-university education with low-level English skills. Addressing English language proficiency issues should be a priority across all classes with a focus on creating a supportive learning environment and providing additional opportunities for language learning. Bridging and/or remedial courses should be implemented to help students improve their language proficiency and it must be made clear to prospective students as well as those enrolling in the programme that prior language competence is important to successfully complete the programme (**Finding 3**). Good language proficiency is also important for lecturers and there should be options and encouragements for continuous development also in this area, like language classes for teaching staff or mobility and incentives to make use of them (**Finding 4**).

The integration of practical phases into an educational programme is highly valuable – their fruitfulness is further enhanced if the university decides to take up students' experiences and insights and systematically uses them as a basis for professional development (on the basis of reflections on their experiences, by drawing connections to theory and research, etc.) rather than trust that this happens by default without further guidance. Currently, teaching staff regularly visit students during their practical phases, which guarantees great individuality, but is also time-consuming and does not allow students to learn and benefit from each other. One should think about a course (maybe an elective), which is geared towards taking up students' experiences during practical phases and use them for professional development.

For the purpose of academic development, access to academic knowledge and multiple perspectives is essential: This is something where EUU needs improvement to rise to a level of international quality. The key to that is, on the one hand, the library and the department's educational resources (lecturers do a very good job and work with what they have and work-arounds), but EUU needs to improve the access to current international research in English (which is of utmost importance in an English Language Education programme) (**Finding 5**).

### Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 1.2 Psychology

### Description

The Psychology study programme started in 2001, its last national accreditation took place in 2018. It accepts 120 students annually. The Faculty states that the psychodiagnostics subject is the speciality of this programme.

Out of the 144 SKS to graduate, 130 SKS fall to mandatory courses (semesters one to eight) and students can take 14 SKS worth of elective courses (semesters three to seven) as the university claims. Since 2021, students have had the possibility to participate in a one term student mobility with a university in Italy, as the SER mentions.

Graduate profiles include human resources development, trainer, counsellor, psychologist assistant, and research assistant. Following the SER, the programmes' ILOs consist of:

1. Believe in One God. Uphold the values of Pancasila and nationality in life,
2. Have an entrepreneurial spirit, never give up, be independent and responsible in accordance with applicable norms, in contributing to the field of work in the community,
3. Able to apply logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in the context of the development or implementation of science and technology that pays attention to and applies humanities values in accordance with their field of expertise,
4. Able to compile a scientific description of the results of the studies mentioned above in the form of a thesis or final project report, and upload it on the university's website,
5. Able to make appropriate decisions in the context of solving problems in their area of expertise, based on the results of analysis of information and data.
6. Able to identify and analyse any psychological problems,
7. Able to apply theories and principles of psychology in carrying out work.
8. Able to make decisions and design psychological assessments based on needs,
9. Able to understand and explain the basic concepts of psychological theory,
10. Able to understand and explain theoretical aspects related to problems in the field of psychology.

## Experts' evaluation

The curricular structure supports the achievement of ILOs. The study programme utilizes guidance from the Ministry of Education and relevant associations' agreement to develop curricular elements within the Programme. A diagram displaying series of courses (with each pre-requisite knowledge) is available, but not for the most up to date curriculum. This lack of a current document should be remedied to achieve transparency and help students understanding the courses' mapping and to develop an idealised study plan throughout their Bachelor studies.

Intended Learning Outcomes are stated clearly within the curriculum, which are largely based on the National Curriculum Framework for Bachelor graduates. To strengthen the ILO statements and put them into perspective, it might be beneficial to explain the development and reason behind the ILOs, even if it is just in a summarized format (e.g., summary of the latest graduate surveys and/or feedback from the labour market).

The curriculum and its documentation define which elements are compulsory and which are electives.

Of all the 144 credits that students must take to graduate, the majority of courses are mandatory (90%) and leave 10% for elective courses. The curriculum covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge, as well as subject-related, methodological, and general skills. This information is documented on the level of the intended learning outcomes.

All elements of the curriculum in the Psychology study programme are assigned a certain number of credits directly related to the expected workload. The total programme workload is allocated to the different courses/modules. At the end of the programme, students must complete a minimum of 144 credits to be granted a Bachelor of Psychology. In addition to this, EUU also requires students to gain mandatory supplementary relevant competency certificate upon completion of programme.

The curriculum transparently describes which courses are offered exclusively for the programme and which parts are used in other programmes as well. Some mandatory courses at the university or faculty level are delivered jointly between study programmes or between faculties.

The latest change of the Psychology curriculum took place in 2022, in the form of rearranging the courses' distribution to accommodate the application of MBKM (the abbreviation for 'Merdeka Belajar, Kampus Merdeka'). Following national legislation, MBKM allows students to take courses outside of their degree programme or do an internship for up to 20 credits. The study programme changed course structure arrangement in a way that facilitates students to take MBKM programmes in the 5<sup>th</sup> semester.

The Psychology study programme includes specific elements in relation to learning and teaching methods, such as online learning, part-time studies in the form of week-end classes and night classes, and internship arrangements. The teaching and learning take place in the three Esa Unggul campuses: the main Kebun Jeruk, the Tangerang and the Bekasi campuses. The Psychology programme is the only programme in the proposed programme cluster to have campus-specific lecturers in each campus. One course then will be offered parallel in the three campuses. Discussion session in the site visit confirmed lecturers teaching the same course at the three different campuses meet with each other and discuss course content to be delivered. With this arrangement, the degree of similarity on the course delivery between campuses can be maintained.

However, other significant information on specific curriculum or distinctive curricular arrangements for the different study classes outside the regular classes, i.e., the night and weekend classes, is very limited – if not non-existent. To guarantee transparency for students and other stakeholders studying under this programme, it is highly recommendable to provide additional information on the management of these non-regular classes and

the differences students face following these classes (e.g., study duration, course distribution, arrangement of weekend classes to replace 16 mandatory meetings per semester, internship arrangement, specific exam procedures) in a document that should be available to all stakeholders (**Finding 6**). This more specific documentation will show the quality of the night and weekend courses and provide students with all answers they might have concerning these special classes.

The graduate profile relevant for graduates of this study programme reflect the traditional choice of career within the psychological field as do the stated intended qualifications for graduates from the labour market's perspective. To raise the quality of qualification to the next level, the experts encourage the responsible persons in the study programme to include the institution's values more into the aspired outcome, for example by combining English proficiency level of graduates and entrepreneurship qualities, which are said to be the two distinctive qualities of Esa Unggul graduates. This approach also allows for the programme to widen its graduate profiles to be broadened by utilizing descriptive criteria (in the form of intended 'profiles/characteristics'), instead of targeted jobs. Examples shown in the University brochure under the title of "Graduate Competencies" can be a starting point to formulate these intended graduate profiles. Then, specific jobs related for each intended qualifications/graduate profile can be linked by mentioning jobs suitable for each qualification.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### 1.3 Elementary Teacher Education

#### Description

The Elementary Teacher Education study programme was established in 2013 and last nationally accredited in 2020. It accepts 200 students per year, according to the SER.

The university states that the study programme provides students with pedagogical as well as subject content and supporting knowledge, e.g. school management and research. After graduating, graduates are supposed to have the knowledge and skills to teach all subjects in elementary schools for all grades (i.e. grade one to six). Students are supposed to learn to plan lessons with reference to the curriculum, to select and adapt materials and media, design learning strategies, manage a class, design an assessment procedure and conduct classroom-based research. The graduates' profiles for this study programme are teaching and training, educational research, educational consultancy and management as well as edupreneur, as the SER lists.

The ILOs for this study programme are as follows:

1. Faithful to God Almighty, Uphold the values of Pancasila and nationality in social life,
2. Have an entrepreneurial spirit, never give up, be independent and responsible in accordance with applicable norms, in contributing to the field of work in the community,
3. Capable of compiling scientific descriptions, examining, applying, documenting, storing, and safeguarding the implications of science and technology, and rediscovering them via the use of logical, critical, methodical, and innovative thinking,
4. Capable of developing, maintaining, supervising, and evaluating networks, as well as being accountable for collaborative work,
5. Capable of designing, determining, implementing, and resolving learning difficulties in the field of primary school education by incorporating student characteristics and indigenous wisdom,

6. Capable of implementing and developing curricula, approaches, strategies, models, methods, techniques, and teaching materials, as well as new media and learning tools, in elementary schools,
7. Capable of designing, implementing, analysing, evaluating, reporting, and publishing the findings of scientific research in the field of primary school learning,
8. Acquiring in-depth understanding of concepts, principles, theories, and cross-disciplinary knowledge in accordance with the advancement of science and technology, while taking into account the developmental features of students and indigenous wisdom in primary schools,
9. Acquiring a firm grasp of fundamental principles, research, and management techniques in order to create innovative works that address educational issues in elementary schools,
10. Acquiring a thorough understanding of curricular concepts, approaches, strategies, models, methods, and procedures, as well as instructional materials, media, and creative learning resources, as well as process evaluation methodologies and assessment of learning outcomes in Elementary School.

### Experts' evaluation

The description of the Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) is clear. Different aspects such as attitude, general skills and specific skills are considered. The differentiation of aspects such as content knowledge, pedagogical knowledge as well as pedagogical content knowledge are to be commended. The course learning outcomes that support the ILOs are assigned to different courses in a plausible way. The programme is clearly structured. There are some courses that are fundamental for advanced courses, guaranteeing the progression of students throughout their course of studies in a clearly structured way. This structure is evident and transparent to the students, including which courses to take, and which requirements are expected of them. All courses are very well documented (including the underlying literature and the final tests). However, as with other study programmes, this documentation only became evident during the review of evidence session. It seems that this documentation is not easily available to all stakeholders, a state that should be remedied through consistent and updated documents concerning course contents, study plan, etc. (see **Finding 1**).

Even though a structure of the courses and how they build on each other is given, it is desirable to have more intertwinement between them. It is evident that the lecturers coordinate with each other, but sometimes the connection between courses for content knowledge and the significance of this content for teaching in elementary school (pedagogical content knowledge) is not given. From the experts' point of view, it would also be positive if there were stronger connections to other programmes (e.g., psychology) to establish and use synergy effects, both for teaching and for research (**Finding 7**). With interdisciplinary elements, e.g. through case studies to practically apply theoretical knowledge or team teaching with staff from other study programmes, throughout their studies, students will gain valuable skills and experience. This updated course content or approach should be described transparently in the course documents.

A strength of the programme is its consideration for broadly different competencies important for teaching in elementary school, such as science education, religious education, development of literacy or sports education. Nevertheless, there is little space for students to follow their individual interest or achieve deeper insight and specialization in an area. To support students following or developing their individual strengths, it is recommended to include more space for elective courses in the study programme (**Finding 8**). The MBKM, which can be a challenge for universities as it must be ensured that students do not miss any basic or important content necessary for further studies or later work, is handled very well at Esa Unggul. Especially the personal support of the students is of great importance and needs to be commended. This is true for students on campus as well as in their internships.

The minimum 40 days of internship is very good and important for the students' preparation to become teachers. This internship takes place in the 7th semester. Before this time, students always have had practical experiences from different courses, such as the microteaching course, which prepare them for their internship.

However, in the view of the experts, a first extended practical experience in a school environment in semester 7 is too late. For this reason, the expert panel recommends that students gain practical experience in schools in earlier semesters (**Finding 9**). It is not necessary that the students then take over entire lessons. However, they could sit in on classes with experienced teachers or conduct small teaching units, e.g., the introduction to a lesson or a backup lesson or a backup phase. The students could also supervise individual children during these practical phases, e.g., children with special needs.

The personal contact academic staff has with students during internships automatically signifies their close contact with schools. This relationship is used to guarantee that the needs of the labour market are considered, which the experts commend, and hope will continue. Additionally, to sustain the programme's quality and involve all stakeholders, all courses are continuously evaluated. It has become obvious that the results of these evaluations are discussed very thoroughly and changes result from them.

As mentioned above, the programme includes four graduate profiles. It is important for an academical programme that educational research is always considered, no matter the specific profile. For this reason, there are courses in Basic Statistics and Research Methods. Their importance cannot be overestimated as they often build the backbone of the Bachelor theses. Despite these efforts from the department's side, many students are not able to write the thesis in the allotted time. An evaluation should be conducted to understand the reasons for this situation. The results should then be used to remedy it (**Finding 10**). It is essential to ensure that students are well prepared for the thesis – in terms of content, research methodology, and in terms of the organization of such work. In addition, it is important to ensure that the requirements are appropriate so that the thesis can be written well within the allotted time.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 2. Procedures for quality assurance

### **Bachelor's degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

## Description

Esa Unggul University set 24 internal quality assurance standards based on Indonesia's National Higher Education Standards. According to the SER, the Quality Policy of Esa Unggul University focuses on academic and non-academic areas. For the academic field, policies focus on education, research, and community service (tri dharma of higher education). For the non-academic field, policies focus on administrative activities or resource management. EEU's quality assurance is set up at three levels: a Quality Assurance Unit (UJM) responsible for each study programme, a Quality Control Group (GKM) for each faculty, and the Quality Assurance Office (KPM) for the university as a whole. Each GKM is headed by a chairperson who coordinates

with the Dean, Deputy Dean, and the heads of the study programmes. The university follows the PDCA (plan-do-check-act) cycle for quality assurance.

The university states to conduct internal evaluation for quality assurance in the study programmes regarding the performance of study programmes, lecturers, students, and graduates. The results of the internal evaluation are meant to control and improve the quality of teaching, the curriculum composition, and the quality of study programme management.

The university's Quality Assurance Office makes use of the documentation system ISO 9001:2015 as well as the accreditation provisions of the national accreditation body BAN-PT. It conducts yearly internal audits, the results of which are relayed to the study programmes. In addition, the study programmes undergo external evaluation by the national accreditation agency (BAN-PT) every five years.

The SER describes how EEU utilises its academic information system (SIKAD) for monitoring and assessments. It is used to monitor lecturer attendance (weekly), student attendance (weekly), course pass rates (every semester), and the completeness and relevance of teaching materials (every semester). The collected data can be evaluated and monitored by the Dean, the heads of study programmes, the lecturer coordinators of courses, the study programme staff, as well as lecturers of the relevant subject and students.

The SER defines procedures to gain input from students, alumni, and potential employers in designing and evaluating the curriculum. Students are involved through assessments by their heads of study programme and academic advisors as well as data from the SIKAD system. Alumni take part in focus group discussions and yearly surveys. According to the SER, representatives of the labour market are invited as speakers, but also take part in focus group discussions and questionnaires.

A procedure to guarantee academic integrity is in place. All violations against it will be handled by the faculty senate, as the university states, and sanctioned accordingly.

### **Experts' evaluation**

Responsibilities and targets within the quality assurance system are defined and available. EEU applies a three-layered system of quality assurance: the university, faculties, and study programme levels.

Quality assurance procedures applied currently at the EEU are appropriate for the three study programmes in the proposed cluster. Responsibilities within the programme and for programme elements under supervision for quality assurance are clearly defined. On the programme level, course evaluations include several aspects, for example: a) evaluation of lecturers by students' rating; b) course's content coverage; c) students' attendance; and d) lecturers' attendance. Results from the quality assurance procedures concerning learning and teaching aspects are available in the Head of study programmes' account in their respective Academic Information Systems (SIKAD). The site visit showed that action is taken by the study programme's management (e.g., in the case of low performance teaching staff) or lecturers (e.g., by providing remedial exams following a low success rate of students' exam) if needed. It is important that these actions are properly recorded and documented to guarantee the standards of quality assurance, transparency and traceability to follow up on the changes' effects (**Finding 11**).

The valuation of students' completion rates in each course is available for the heads of the study programmes. The lowest percentage of students' completion rates seen lies below 50% (for example, 43% for Psikologi Dasar and 47% for Pengolahan Data Statistik). Documentation on actions of these results has not been available to the experts. Discussions with lecturers included the actions, e.g., the provision of remedial exams. However, documentation on the procedures and information of these procedures for students is absent. This also applies to other evaluation data, such as graduates' study duration and completion rates. Thus, as has been mentioned previously, it is strongly advised that the Quality Assurance Unit include information regarding

improvement actions in the quality assurance documents and make this information available to the relevant stakeholders (primarily students) (see **Finding 11**).

Other than the evaluation of learning and teaching, in the quality assurance procedures, mechanisms to evaluate supporting services are mentioned, as became obvious through the Student Satisfaction Survey conducted at the end of every semester. Students and the labour market are involved in quality assurance procedures for the programme. Students' involvement includes providing rating for lecturers' performance with regards to course delivery and for other services available, as well as validating course content delivery in each learning session throughout semester. In the site visit discussion, students confirmed these procedures and acknowledged that their lecturers consider this feedback positive and readily adopt it.

The career progression of graduates from the study programme is traced and data on alumni experiences is considered during further development of the study programme. This point was confirmed by graduates in the site visit discussion.

In the quality assurance procedures, a mechanism to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud within the programmes is in place. The faculty senate is the unit to handle issues regarding violations of academic integrity, with most relevant information delivered from lecturers. Academic integrity is a relevant concern when students write scientific articles. It is dealt with using the Turnitin software with a specific percentage of tolerance.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

#### **Bachelor's degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

#### **Description**

EUU characterises its methodology as student centred, based on active discussion and study. According to the SER, the learning process is geared towards the implementation of interactive, holistic, integrative, contextual, thematic, effective, and collaborative learning. The commonly used learning methods are listed as small group discussions, project-based learning, practice-based learning, case studies, and simulation. Teaching takes place face-to-face and online. These methods intend to support reaching the ILOs. All learning objectives are intended to implement the Life-Based Learning (LBL) approach. The LBL approach has three stages within one learning sequence, 1) the stage of knowledge mastering, 2) the stage of expansion of knowledge, and 3) the stage of knowledge implementation in real-life situations. To evaluate students, lecturers carry out quizzes and assess the results of discussions, presentations, and essay reports.

Learning and teaching is supported with an online platform that helps to plan assignments, attendance, video conferences, etc.

For student assessment, EUU states to follow the principles of equity, transparency, and validity. Assessments take place at mid-term and at the end of the term. The SER lists tests, product presentations, performances,

projects, or observations as methods of assessment. For the undergraduate thesis, students are assessed based on the overall report writing process, the quality of the project, and an oral presentation. To participate in a test, students must have attended at least 75 % of the class. EEU states to plan the exams and to have processes in place to retake a test in case students cannot participate in an examination or if a student fails. According to EEU, students can also submit a formal appeal for the outcome.

To graduate in the Bachelor programmes, conducting an internship is mandatory for students.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The study programmes' learning and teaching methods generally contribute to a student-centred learning environment. A lot of different and varied teaching methods are used, such as group discussions, presentations, etc. Innovative forms of teaching are also used. For example, in courses where practical experience is to be provided, there are simulated micro-teaching situations in which students are to improve their teaching skills with other students. The experts also confirm that the methods used correspond well with the ILOs. Another aspect worth mentioning is the very well executed supervision of students during their internship.

As mentioned above, the government's MBKM programme is a major challenge for the university. The expert group has the impression that EEU is handling this challenge very well. Students do not miss any crucial courses.

However, the use of new digital media could and should be strengthened. These are certainly also important for the profession, as was also confirmed by the representatives of the labour market. The experts see that digital media is sometimes used in teaching but should be intensified and their use and teaching clearly and transparently indicated in the course description and syllabus (**Finding 12**).

It is very important that teaching at a university is research-based and evidence-based. This is the case at EEU. Students also know what literature is relevant to each course. The lecturers are oriented towards research. However, improvements should be made in two areas: 1) Access to current literature and to current research results must be improved by better equipping the library and giving lecturers and students better access to (international) articles with new research results (see **Finding 5**). 2) It is always desirable that the teaching is based on the own research of the lecturers. The lecturers at the EEU have only few possibilities to do research themselves and some of them are not yet highly qualified (PhD) (see chapter on Teaching staff), which represents an area for improvement.

The assessment methods are appropriate and fair. Different procedures are used, such as tests or also very innovative forms, like creating a digital teaching video. This variety allows for good matching between the assessment methods and ILOs of the study programme and courses. This is especially true for the courses in which practical skills are to be acquired.

It also became clear that assessment is done very transparently. Students know early on what requirements they must fulfil in a course. They also know which achievements lead to which grading. If a student fails an exam, there are always several opportunities to have a second (and even third...) try until the exam is passed.

A central basis for good teaching is that students can select appropriate courses. This is given at EEU, where no evidence or even indication was found denying students the opportunity to attend a course they want to participate in.

### **Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

#### 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

##### **Bachelor's degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

##### **Description**

For the Bachelor programmes under review, the regulations for student intake follow national regulations. The admission scheme is primarily organized by the university.

For the Bachelor programmes, the admission regulations are provided on the university's website. The minimum requirement for enrolment is a high school degree. The student's English language skills are assessed. Applicants have to pass an Academic Potential Test. The university states that due to the application process, less than 10% of students do not pass the course or do not achieve the learning outcomes in this programme.

EUU states that the monitoring system on the learning progress is carried out by the academic advisor, the Vice Dean, the Dean, the Vice Rector, and the Rector. Each student is assigned an academic advisor who monitors the student's progress. It is stated that students meet their academic advisor at least three times per semester regarding their study and learning progress, support for academic and non-academic problems, and planning of the course load. The academic advisor also checks if students maintain their GPA to progress in the study programme. The GPA of a student defines the workload for the next semester. The university also states to offer counselling for career development, academic success, stress management, communication skills, and psychology tests through a Centre for Counselling and Alumni Support.

If students would like to have experience or academic credits from other universities recognised, set processes are in place to do so. These processes are transparently communicated to students. Upon their graduation, students receive a degree as well as an explanatory letter concerning their qualifications.

##### **Experts' evaluation**

For the programmes under review, EEU's admissions criteria are clearly outlined on their website and easily accessible for stakeholders. The admission process is conducted by the marketing department, which may pose an issue with the evaluated degrees' progression. All three degrees appear to have relatively high drop-out rates and large numbers of students are unable to complete their degrees within the allocated time frame, according to the interview with faculty. Degree progression is a process that begins with student admission. For this reason, and to guarantee that prospective students are guided towards a degree that matches their aptitudes and skills adequately, the marketing department should work closely with the respective faculty to create criteria for admissions that achieve this objective (**Finding 13**).

The curricula are well structured overall and allow students to develop significant skills that will help them to become competent members of the work force and ensure their progression throughout their studies. Particularly the involvement of faculty in supporting their students' progression should be noted.

According to the interviews conducted with faculty, most students are able to complete their courseload within the first six semesters but often fail to adequately progress within the final two semesters. This suggests that the tasks at hand (or the conditions under which they have to be completed) – internship and thesis - pose too much of an obstacle for students to complete within the allocated time frame. A closer look at these two aspects needs to be taken (see **Findings 9** and **10**).

This structural issue within the degrees additionally impacts EEU's commitment to equality and diversity. Students studying with a scholarship based on economic merit are not eligible to extend their scholarships, should they not be able to complete the degree within eight semesters. This is a comparatively small issue with a severe impact for affected students, which is why the experts strongly suggest implementing a grace period for scholarship students to complete their studies (**Finding 14**).

Upon completion of their studies, graduates receive their degree as well as a graduate profile letter, outlining their skills to potential employers. The graduate profiles are fairly comprehensive, though it may be beneficial to review and shorten them to focus on the core skills of each degree. Graduates from EEU are recognized as viable candidates in the labour market, known as competent, professional and hard workers.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Teaching staff

### **Bachelor's degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

## Description

EEU states to follow the national laws and regulations for the recruitment of academic and supporting staff. The recruitment of new full-time lecturers follows a three-step procedure consisting of a psychological test, an interview, and a microteaching test. Part-time lecturers are assessed and approved by the head of the respective study programme. The minimum qualification level is a Master's degree. Full-time instructors can benefit from the study programme's collaborations in the field of publications and research.

Currently the distribution of full-time teaching staff is as follows:

- Elementary Education: 15 Assistant Professor (four PhD holders)
- English Language Education: 7 Full-time teaching staff
- Psychology: 21 Assistant Professors, one lecturer (no PhD holder)

Lecturers must conduct at least one research and community service project every year. Research can be supported through internal grants, external grants, or independent funding. Lecturers are required to publish the results of their research and community service in international, national, and local journals.

For teaching staff, development opportunities consisting of training, planning, workshops, certification, and qualifications for further studies at the doctoral level, post-doctoral, and professionals levels are stated to be available.

## Experts' evaluation

The review of the teaching staff identified several strengths and areas for improvement. The engaged nature of the staff and their commitment, also considering their very high workloads, is commendable. However, there

are challenges in qualifications and research capacity as well as continuous professional development (through internationalisation/multiperspectivity/outside's perspectives) that require attention.

University teaching staff must be research-savvy. Continuous research is extremely desirable for the reputation of the university, the professionalisation of its staff and the quality of their teaching – in Germany, it is called the desired unity of research and teaching, which is also clearly fostered in Indonesia, even adding the community service with the tri dharma approach. At the same time, the teaching load of your staff is substantial, which might prevent cutting-edge research. It is therefore recommended to reconsider the teaching workload for all staff, within the national regulations, to allow for more research, which will then also elevate the classes taught as academic staff can connect their research to their teaching (**Finding 15**).

The commitment and engagement of the teaching staff is evident, which aids in achieving the ILOs. Yet, the evident dedication does not replace academic qualification. Standards that academic staff has to fulfil are in place, but it has become evident that all programmes would benefit and be enhanced if the academic qualifications profile of teaching staff would be raised (**Finding 16**). This must also be considered in hiring procedures. A commendable system is in place wherein lecturers are allowed to pursue a PhD, which should be incentivized even more. Currently, the high (teaching) workload seems to be a deterrent for many in seeking further qualification. Hence, keep exploring and make active use of opportunities to reduce teaching loads to encourage research activities of all of the university's staff, pre-PhD and beyond, as the academic qualification of lecturers is the key to a good education of students (see **Finding 15**).

For the purpose of continuous academic development, access to academic knowledge and multiple perspectives is essential. An important contribution in this area, next to library/academic resources, is made by mobility and exchange: Student and staff exchanges with other universities and international conferences should be supported to the greatest extent possible, with online exchanges and cooperations as cheaper option where there is no funding available. At the same time, if the university would like to rise to the level of international standards, it should allocate more resources to enable teaching staff to attend international conferences or other international experience (**Finding 17**). The institution should aim to go beyond marketing alliances and focus on tangible academic collaborations with global universities. Such partnerships would also allow you to obtain valuable perspectives from the outside to improve the quality and visibility of the university's study programmes (**Finding 18**).

Multiperspectivity and academic development can also be fostered through internal measures, such as (university-wide) measures for professional development or cooperations among lecturers (e.g. team teaching) from the same, related (psychology and language education) or different fields. Supervision, mentorships and mutual help can include many different areas and foster progress with little investment (see **Finding 7**).

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 6. Learning resources and student support

### **Bachelor's degree**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

[ESG 1.6]

## Description

According to the SER, both faculties have two and three laboratories, respectively. Students of the Psychology study programme have access to a counselling laboratory, Micro Teaching, and a computer laboratory, whereas the study programmes of English Language Education and Elementary Education have an E-learning and a general studio.

The Esa Unggul library includes 9 PCs, more than 25000 books and national as well as international e-journals, which can be used by the students.

As the university states, it offers introduction activities to students at the beginning of their studies to help them adapting to campus life, such as Emotional Spiritual Quotient Training or State Defence Training in first two weeks. During their studies, all students have their own academic advisor, whom they meet three times each semester. According to the SER, the university also offers a Guidance Counselling Unit and different scholarships.

At the end of their studies, the Career Centre Unit offers several debriefing programmes on soft skills, job vacancies, CV writing trainings, as the university claims. To further support the graduates' employability, the SER mentions that the university organises guest lectures, international conferences and webinars. Students can visit the industry and research institutes or work as an intern or student research assistant.

To allow students in internationalisation activities, the university claims to offer a visiting student programme, an in-country programme, a community service programme and a student exchange programme.

Consultation offers are available for students with special needs or students in special life situations. For working students, their timetables will be adjusted to their needs, according to the SER.

Students of all study programmes can participate in non-academic activities with their own spaces, such as the kemala ballroom, futsal field, basketball court, volleyball court, mosque, rock climbing, and Tokopedia corner, physiotherapy clinic, language centre.

## Experts' evaluation

EUU has three campuses at which their degree programmes are offered. The site visit took place at the main campus in Jakarta. This report therefore concentrates on this campus' resources. The facilities at the main campus appear to be adequate for the learning needs of students, although the counselling laboratory needs more space and rooms as different stakeholders mentioned and the experts confirm. The counselling laboratory is a valuable resource not just for the degree's students, but the entire student body at EEU. As students have expressed that this resource is currently not frequently used, the panel of experts also recommends advertising the counselling laboratory further to the student body to promote this offer outside of the department and faculty. Supporting students in managing stress and mental health ultimately benefits their personal and professional development (**Finding 19**).

With regards to facilities, the experts noted that certain accessibility measures for disabled students do not appear to be functional. Ramps for wheelchair users should not exceed a 32° angle, as the incline becomes too steep to safely use it. The wall-mounted handle in the disabled bathrooms is also too small and too far behind the toilet to be functional for disabled students. A consultation with disabled students should take place or guidelines for accessible building measures should be developed to then improve these conditions and accommodate the needs of disabled students (**Finding 20**).

The student support through faculty at EEU appears to be exceptional. Faculty works closely with their student body to ensure their personal and professional development. This has been especially observed as part of the

internship programmes, where faculty is heavily involved in their students' progression. EEU also has longstanding professional relationships with potential employers for all three programmes and supports their students in obtaining and completing their internships.

During our site visit, the experts discovered many outstanding aspects of EEU's educational resources, the one resource that is not up to standard, however, is the library. EEU must expand their library resources for all degrees (see **Finding 5**). Faculty have noted that they provide their students with the necessary academic resources through cloud services during their classes and resources they access through PhD students at other institutions. It is, however, important that foundational literature for all degrees become available through the EEU library. EEU must consult with the respective degrees' faculty to purchase literature relevant to their degrees to be made available through the library. The panel further recommends investing in the education of library staff, as they can become one of the most significant resources for academic research. Library staff are the facilitators of a vast amount of knowledge to both faculty and students, it is therefore essential for them to be aware of all available resources in specific subjects, and to be able to utilize online resources and advertise them towards the student body (**Finding 21**). Further it is noteworthy that the online access to the Indonesian library is used by only 25 students and that it does not grant (free) access to international journals at a level that it would be a significant resource to either student body or faculty at EEU. The free access to international journals for students and faculty at EEU must be increased (see **Finding 5**).

Lastly, EEU's state of internationalization and digitalization should be addressed for the reviewed degrees. EEU has a standing (indirect) collaboration with the University of Arizona and several universities within this network. The teaching degree students take part in an international tandem programme where they teach Indonesian to English native speakers. Although these collaborations are a good starting point, it appears that the resources at the University of Arizona are not available to EEU's student body for the respective degrees. The tandem programme, especially for the English Language Education degree, does not require the students to teach English but rather their native language. Although the experts like to commend the university for this programme and its innovation, to the pa recommend implementing more international collaborations wherein the English Language Education students teach English to non-native speakers, or where they may be able to collaborate with English native speakers in creating EFL learning resources (**Finding 22**). Regarding digitalization, it was noted by representative of the labour market, that it appears that the English Education and Elementary Education students from EEU are lacking experience in working with technology and new media. The experts therefore recommend implementing these aspects stronger within the courses of both degrees (see **Finding 12**).

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 7. Information

### Bachelor's degree

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

## Description

According to EEU, the curriculum for each study course is disseminated to relevant internal and external stakeholders through print and also online as an upload in SIAKAD. The printed form is distributed to all

academic staff, students, and supporting staff. According to EEU, the curricula are also presented to and discussed with the students in the orientation programme, in classes, and in the meetings with academic advisors, and disseminated to the parents in the department meetings with them. Furthermore, stakeholders are informed about the knowledge and skills of the graduates, the SER states. Alumni, on the other hand, can join a WhatsApp group where job vacancies are posted, according to the university.

Information on the general profile, curriculum, and lecturers are stated to be available on the respective websites of each study programme.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The university provides information to its students as well as stakeholders and prospective students. The websites of Esa Unggul University, especially for English Language Education, Elementary Education and Psychology are available in both, the Indonesian and the English language – yet it appears that not all of the information is available in both languages (which should be the case, especially if you'd like to attract more international students). The faculty might consider adding more information in English to paint a clearer picture of the study programmes of this accreditation procedure and attract more international students.

The visions, missions and goals as well as information about the faculties and an overview of the courses offered are easy to find and transparently presented. Students and alumni confirmed during the site visit that they are well informed at the beginning of and during their studies. Furthermore, students reported that they use social media for daily updates. All processes are transparent, sufficient and well regulated. Also, information on the website is up to date.

A search for specific information (e.g., study programme sites, curriculum, teaching staff) showed all relevant information on the different websites.

It is commendable that teachers visit high schools to promote their programmes. However, labour market representatives of schools were often not aware of EEU's teaching programme. This shows that the marketing and advertisement strategy should be reconsidered, improved and expanded while highlighting the study programmes' strengths (**Finding 23**).

### **Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “English Language Education (Bachelor of Education)”, “Psychology (Bachelor of Psychology)” and “Elementary Education (Bachelor of Education)” offered by Esa Unggul University with conditions.

### Commendation:

The experts commend the close relationship the departments have to the labour market and the efforts made to connect their demands to their study programmes to ensure a good employability for their students and graduates. Additionally, the motivation and dedication of all staff of EEU to their students and the study programme is remarkable.

### Findings:

1. To create transparency for all stakeholders as well as to highlight the programme's strength, it should be ensured that all documents concerning the study programmes are always up to date and easily available to all parties interested.
2. For the students' best possible preparation for the labour market and to ensure transparency, it should be ensured that courses in the study programme build up on competences that were taught in earlier courses and that this progression of competences and skills is documented transparently in the programmes' documentation.
3. To ensure the students' success in the ELE study programme, their language competencies should be the highest priority. It should, therefore, be guaranteed that they are given the chance to improve their English language skills, also outside the mandatory language classes, e.g. through bridging courses.
4. To lead with good example, to further improve the programme as well as to help teaching staff with their personal development, the opportunity to improve their language proficiency should also be given to teaching staff and encouraged by the faculty.
5. A concept must be handed in how the university will improve the resources of the library regarding the standard literature of the study programmes within the next three years. Moreover, to guarantee academic development and to reach the aspired international level of the study programmes, access to international research (in English) must be expanded.
6. To guarantee transparency for students of the Psychology study programme studying under the programme with night and weekend classes, additional information on the management of these non-regular classes and the differences students face following these classes should be collected in a comprehensive document and made easily accessible for all students and other stakeholders.
7. To support students in their transition of theoretical knowledge to practical use of it, courses of different foci (e.g., courses for content knowledge and those for pedagogical content knowledge) should be better linked and connected. Courses of the study programme Elementary Education should also use synergy effects with other study programmes by connecting itself to courses from them, e.g., psychology. These synergies should transparently be documented in the course handbook.
8. To support students following or developing their individual strengths and interests, it is recommended to include more space for elective courses in the study programme Elementary Education.

9. To give students a realistic view of their future jobs, practical elements in a school environment should be included in the study plan earlier than they currently are. Students should have the chance, e.g., to sit in on classes with experienced teachers, conduct small teaching units, supervise individual children during these practical phases.
10. To ensure that students can finish their theses in the allotted time to it, it should be researched why so few students finish it on time. Once the results are evaluated, changes should be implemented to support students to write their theses in the timeframe allotted to it, e.g., by preparing them better in terms of content, research methodology, organization of such work, etc.; changing the requirements of the thesis; etc.
11. Actions taken following negative evaluations should be properly recorded to guarantee the standards of quality assurance, transparency and traceability to follow up on the changes' effects.
12. To keep up with changes in the labour market, and for prospective teachers: in the classroom, the use of digital media should be strengthened throughout all courses. Their implementation should be clearly and transparently indicated in the course description and syllabus.
13. To support a satisfying degree progression and ensure that prospective students are guided towards a degree that matches their aptitudes and skills adequately, the marketing department should work closely with the respective faculty to create criteria for admissions that achieve these objectives.
14. To allow economically challenged students on scholarships to finish their studies, even if they are not able to do so in the suggested period of eight semesters, a grace period should be implemented, in which students still receive financial support to allow them to graduate.
15. Within the national regulations, the teaching workload for all staff should be reconsidered and reduced to allow for more research, which will also elevate the classes taught as academic staff can connect their research to their teaching as well as the staff's and university's reputation.
16. The university must ensure that newly appointed teaching staff holds a PhD degree. For contracted teaching staff, the university must intensify and support their opportunities for gaining a higher qualification (PhD), by conducting their research projects and by contributing to more to conferences on national and international level.
17. To foster more internationality, EEU should incentivise, e.g. through financial support, teaching staff and students alike to participate in international mobility or participate in international conferences.
18. It is highly recommended to collaborate more with international universities academically to continue EEU's international approach and become more visible.
19. The space for the counselling laboratory should be expanded and rooms added to give all students the chance to practice in them as well as receive support if needed. To make sure that all students in need are supported, the offer of the counselling laboratory should be advertised more.
20. To accommodate the needs of disabled students, a consultation with them about their needs is advised. Some currently existing hinderances should be remedied.
21. For the library staff to adequately support students and lead them to all possible library resources, EEU's teaching staff should receive additional training and qualifications to be up to date in their field of work.
22. In an effort for internationalisation, the students of the ELE study programme should be given the opportunity to practice their skills by teaching English as a Foreign Language throughout their studies.

23. To make sure that all stakeholders and interested parties are aware of the study programmes, the marketing and advertisement strategy should be reconsidered, improved and expanded to reach all target groups.