



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## EXPERTS' REPORT

UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA

### **CLUSTER LAW**

“BACHELOR OF LAWS” (BLSP)

“MASTER OF LAWS” (MLSP)

“DOCTOR OF LAWS” (DLSP)

“DOCTOR OF LAWS JAKARTA CAMPUS” (DLPSJ)

June 2022



## Content

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure.....</b>	<b>5</b>
1. Criteria.....	5
2. Approach and methodology .....	5
<b>III. General information on the university .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....</b>	<b>7</b>
1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme.....	7
2. Procedures for quality assurance .....	14
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students .....	17
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification .....	19
5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff .....	21
6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment.....	23
7. Information / Public information .....	25
<b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>27</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “BACHELOR OF LAWS” (BLSP)
- “MASTER OF LAWS” (MLSP)
- “DOCTOR OF LAWS” (DLSP)
- “DOCTOR OF LAWS JAKARTA CAMPUS” (DLPSJ)

### OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA / INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 13<sup>th</sup> meeting on 16 May 2022 and the circulation procedure of 2 June 2022 the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “**Bachelor of Laws**”, “**Master of Laws**”, “**Doctor of Laws**” and “**Doctor of Laws Jakarta Campus**” offered by **Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

The study programmes comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version.

2. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2028**.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

#### **For all study programmes:**

1. It is recommended to bring the issue of modularisation (categorising courses into groups of related content) to the attention of forums on higher education, in order to present the advantages of an easier understanding of thematic and systematic connections between courses and topics through modularisation.
2. It is recommended to increase transparency on SKS to ECTS Credit conversion.

#### **For the Bachelor and Master programme:**

3. In regard to the job market, and the many possible fields of employment for law students, it is recommended to further enable students to make an informed decision about their internships, e.g. through more systematic guidance concerning future professional pathways.
4. It is recommended to equip students with English skills within law courses, to improve their understanding and the use of English legal terminology and the oral use of English in a thematic law setting.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT  
ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES  
"BACHELOR OF LAWS" (BLSP)  
"MASTER OF LAWS" (MLSP)  
"DOCTOR OF LAWS" (DLSP)  
"DOCTOR OF LAWS JAKARTA CAMPUS" (DLPSJ)  
OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS BRAWIJAYA / INDONESIA**

Online visit to the university: 28 - 31 March 2022

**Panel of experts:**

<b>Univ.-Prof. Dr. jur. Stefan Koos</b>	Professorship for Private Law, Commercial and Business Law, Universität der Bundeswehr München, also Visiting Professor at the Business Law Department of Universitas Bina Nusantara (BINUS-University), Jakarta/Indonesia
<b>Prof. Dr. Markus Kotzur, LL.M. (Duke Univ.)</b>	Vice Dean for International Relations and Chair for Public Law, European and International Public Law, Universität Hamburg/Germany
<b>Sohini Singh</b>	Regional HR Manager, DFDL Indonesia, Lao PDR and Thailand (labour market representative)
<b>Judith Barth</b>	Student of law, Universität zu Köln/Germany (student representative)

**Coordinators:**

Corinna Herrmann

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

Annette Büning

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the programmes “Law” (Bachelor/Master/Doctorate) offered by Universitas Brawijaya.

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in April 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In November 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an. The appendix included e.g.:

- Strategic plans of the university, the faculty and the study programmes
- Annual report of the faculty, including statistics e.g. on the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- Academic handbooks of the study programmes,
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 6 December 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in February 2022.

#### *Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in February 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *Preparation of the online site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### *Online site visit*

After a review of the SER, an online site visit to the university took place on 28 - 31 March 2022. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

#### *Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

#### *Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 16 May 2022 and 2 June 2022. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In July 2022 AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General information on the university

Universitas Brawijaya (UB) was established in 1963 and is located in Malang City, Indonesia. UB is composed of 15 faculties and one postgraduate school. In total the university offers 177 study programmes to about 69.319 students (October 2021) and has 2.131 lecturers.

Institutionally, UB has been nationally accredited A by BAN-PT and has implemented the quality assurance programme that has been recognised by ISO 9001:2008. 33 study programmes have been accredited and certified internationally. According to UB, the strategic plan of 2020-2024 focuses on the improvement of the quality of education, research and community service, students and graduates, and institutions and cooperation to become a global competitive university.

The study programmes to be accredited are offered at the Faculty of Law (FL), which was established in 1957 under the name College of Law and Community Knowledge and was first part of Malang Municipal University which later became Universitas Brawijaya. FL offers five study programmes in the area of law. As of July 2021 3.990 students are enrolled in the study programmes. In 2021 FL had 93 internal and 46 external lecturers.

The faculty's vision stated in the SER is to (1) organise a higher education of law with international standards that produces graduates who believe in and fear God almighty, (2) carry out a role as an agent of development and reformer of just legal knowledge based on the values of divinity, humanity, and noble wisdom, (3) organise superior, just, and sustainable legal higher education governance. The faculty is headed by a Dean, who is supported by a Vice Dean for Academic Affairs, a Vice Dean for General Affairs and Finance, and a Vice Dean for Student Affairs. The faculty consists of six departments (Civil Law, Criminal Law, International Law, Administrative Law, Constitutional Law, and Islamic Law). The activities of all study programmes are coordinated by the Department of Legal Studies to ensure coherence and consistency between undergraduate, master's, and doctoral study programmes, both related to learning outcomes and processes as well as the availability of quantity and quality of lecturers. The Quality Assurance Unit (QAU) is tasked with ensuring the quality of education and coordinates with the Quality Assurance Center on university level.

### IV. Assessment of the study programmes

#### 1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

##### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

##### **Doctoral degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

**General remarks**

As explained in the SER, the IQF (Indonesian National Qualifications Framework) sets out different levels of qualification based on three aspects: knowledge, skills and attitude. Each aspect is elaborated further according to the specific study programme based on labour market requirements, which were gained from stakeholders' as well as alumni's recommendations.

1 SKS is equal to 1.5 ECTS. UB describes that the curricula are evaluated and updated every four years, based on stakeholder input and developments in academic standards. According to UB the evaluation process involves a series of a comprehensive and in-depth evaluation on the development of legal science, vision, the needs of future job market, as well as recommendations from stakeholders and alumni. These processes range from academic workshops, tracer study, widening networking with stakeholders and alumni.

As an attempt to produce qualified graduates with international standard, the teaching-learning process is designed by implementing competency-based curriculum based on the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). According to the SER, each of the learning outcomes has been designed to meet the standard of the EQF.

**Bachelor of Laws study programme (BLSP)****Description**

The graduate profiles formulated for the Bachelor of Laws programme include professions as judges, prosecutors, advocates, legal auditors, mediators, curators, liquidators, inhouse lawyers, corporate lawyers, contract drafters, legal drafters, lecturers, legal researchers, state civil servants, politicians, and activists. The SER further lists four programme learning outcomes for this study programme: students should acquire the ability to

- analyse, apply, and formulate legal opinions or decisions both in the judicial process and outside the judiciary,
- carry out the process and stages of legal settlement, as well as to prepare legal documents needed in legal processes both in judicial processes and outside the judiciary,
- form and develop laws in accordance with and required by the development of civilisation,
- have sufficient leadership and literacy skills, respectful of humanity, ethics and religious values.

All aspects of the intended learning outcomes are embodied in four aspects of specific skills:

- able to formulate the concept of legal problems solving through the application of juridical thinking methods based on theoretical knowledge of legal sources, principles, and norms from various fields of Indonesian Positive Law, which are basic skills for carrying out the legal profession,
- able to formulate ideas logically, critically, and argumentatively in the field of Indonesian Positive Law and communicate them orally and/or in writing,
- able to make decisions academically, independently, and responsibly in solving legal problems, and able to cooperate with colleagues,
- able to be ethical, fair, law-abiding, sensitive, and concerned about the social environment in designing and implementing the law.

The workload for BLSP is 144-160 credits taken between 7 to 10 semesters. The courses in semesters 1-4 are theoretical and normative courses to give students an understanding of basic theories and Indonesian Law: In the first semester, students take 20 credits consisting of basic legal subjects, in semesters 2 to 4, 72 credits of positive law courses. In semester 5 and 6, students take 46 credits of legal skills courses to develop their practical skills. Among these practical courses are criminal court practice, civil court practice,



constitutional court practice, contract drafting, international contract drafting, and legislation drafting. For practical judicial courses BLSP provides moot court room facilities to provide real experience of a trial process, while for practical courses on contract and legislation drafting experts are teaching the students directly. In semester 7 students do research and write a mini thesis. Students graduate from the BLSP when they pass the comprehensive exam after writing the mini thesis.

To support graduates in developing their professional skills the BLSP provides an “Internship” that integrates skills into the curriculum. To support the development of entrepreneurial skills of graduates, the programme provides a compulsory subject “Entrepreneur”; furthermore, entrepreneurial skills are integrated in the curriculum. The other activities to reach the vision are international student exchange (with Leipzig University, University of Newcastle, University Kebangsaan Malaysia, and Wollongong University), international joint research, and international conferences.

All students in BLSP are full time students; part-time students are not accepted

### Experts’ evaluation

The BLSP programme has made a convincing impression on the experts. The curricular elements of the programme and their functions are well documented. All courses are adequately described in terms of content. The module descriptions seem sufficiently detailed. Overall, the necessary transparency of the curricular structure is given. Syllabi are provided at the beginning of each semester.

All requirements of the European Qualifications Framework as well as the national qualifications-framework are met.

The curriculum essentially follows national ministerial guidelines. It is, therefore, in a very limited way possible for the faculty to change the topics or modules. A large number of courses are incorporated into the curriculum, which is designed from general to specific. At the beginning of the programme, there are *General Mandatory* non-law modules and religious topics, which also follow ministerial guidelines in part, but are also due to the vision of the university and to the specific social and constitutional situation of the Republic of Indonesia. In the more advanced stages of the programme, courses become more specific. The curricular structure is reflecting the progression of the learners and is based consecutively on the respective learning outcomes. Redundancies and overlaps between courses are possible but are tried to be avoided by inter-lecturer communication. It can be stated that the high number of very specific courses might make it rather difficult for learners to understand thematic and systematic connections between the topics. A better modularisation (categorising courses into groups of related content) would cater towards this issue and could be beneficial to think about. As mentioned before, the curriculum has to follow certain guidelines, which is why this issue cannot be addressed by the faculty alone but may be integrated into higher ranking forums on higher education (**Finding 1**). That being said, the study programme covers all for the Indonesian legal and social order relevant subjects; courses related to international topics, such as International Private Law, International Public Law and International Commercial Law are integrated. A course “Entrepreneurship” provided by the university is compulsory which addresses basic aspects of economic sciences. Interdisciplinarity is therefore given. The programme strives to achieve a broad overview on the legal system and integrates also feedback from the labour market. The number of credit points assigned to the courses depends on the expected workload. The overall workload seems adequate.

Options especially for modules outside the study programme were until now limited due to the ministerial guidelines. This has been reformed (“Campus Merdeka”/ “freedom to learn”/ “MBKM”), giving the faculties more freedom in adapting the curriculum especially in terms of choices for students and the integration of modules from other faculties. The programme is understood by the university management as well as the faculty management as an important factor to widen the interdisciplinary and international experience of the

students. From the interviews the panel of experts gained the impression, that students are encouraged by the university and the lecturers to make use of the opportunities given by the MBKM programme. The faculty sees its relevance especially in widening the international profile of the faculty by supporting international cooperation and exchange. This seems realistic to the panel as it was shown by the faculty that international cooperation (e.g., with Universität Leipzig and British and Australian universities) is not only formally established but filled with life by elaborated programmes and regular exchange of lecturers, researchers and students. It must be highlighted positively that the faculty already practises the 3-in-1 programme, integrating guest lectures by foreign visiting lecturers and practitioners within regular lecture units of the faculty.

The quality of the implementation of teaching methods by the lecturers involved in the undergraduate programme seems excellent. The qualifications of the lecturers are in general very good. Most of the teaching staff has international experience and/or are alumni of good ranked Indonesian universities. Lectures seem to be performed in a modern dialogic and case related way. Hybrid teaching methods were developed due to the pandemic and may be further developed as additional options for the teaching process. However, the faculty is well aware of possible negative aspects of online courses and is discussing the role of the digitalisation in the future. Overall, the grade of the digitalisation was already good before the pandemic. Open discussions between the teaching persons and the students are performed and students are encouraged to articulate opinions and ideas in an open way independent from existing more restricting cultural communicative costumes. This was confirmed by both, students as well as lecturers.

The ILO (intended learning outcomes) of the Undergraduate Law Study Programme cover general and specialised skills and knowledge. They contain general character and religious qualities – following certain state regulations conditions – and general knowledge related to the Indonesian citizenship. This is, as already stated above, not regarded as an accreditation hurdle, as it is related to specific social, cultural and constitutional conditions of the Indonesian State. Furthermore, the faculty seeks to thematise issues of tolerance values within the lectures. The Programme Learning Outcomes (PLO) and Course Learning Outcomes (CLO) are appropriate. Related to the specific law-related aspects the learning outcomes properly describe methodical, practical and theoretical skills. The subject aims and contents are also clearly described. All learning outcomes are documented in the Modul Handbook as well as in the Academic Handbook.

The learning outcomes are designed in a process of discussion between the faculty and stakeholders (development of details of the curriculum, research development). Especially within the 3-in-1 programme the faculty integrates practitioners as lecturers into the curriculum to provide knowledge from professional fields. The curriculum essentially seems to meet the needs of the labour market. Representatives of the labour market stated the good knowledge skills and self-consciousness of the law graduates. Some of the representatives of the labour market stated though that alumni lack practical skills. This seems however, rather an aspect for the Master's Programme than for the Bachelor's Programme as the undergraduate programme equips the graduates with the substantial skills for the intended occupational fields. In regard to the job market, and the many possible fields of employment for law students, it will be however beneficial for the students to further enable them to make an informed decision about their internships, e.g. through more systematic guidance concerning future professional pathways (**Finding 2**).

Another issue related to professional preparedness is related to the English competencies of the students. One English language course in the beginning of the studies is compulsory. To further build on that, it can be recommended to also equip students with English skills within law courses, to improve their understanding and the use of English legal terminology and the oral use of English in a thematic law setting (**Finding 3**). This will lead to better opportunities not just on the national but on the international job market.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## **Master of Laws Study Programme (MLSP)**

### **Description**

As stated in the SER, students of the Master of Laws programme can be classified into two groups. Group a) are students who have worked in the field of law generally as judges, prosecutors, police, lawyers, politicians, and state civil servants. The SER states that by pursuing the MLSP, these students should enhance their ability to develop as well as discover legal sciences and law. Group b) are fresh graduate students from the undergraduate programme.

The graduates' profiles are formulated as follows:

- have the ability to form and develop law through the formation of legislation and legal discovery by using a theoretical approach and legal reasoning,
- have the ability to solve legal problems with an inter- and multidisciplinary approach,
- have the ability to research and develop legal science with an inter- and multidisciplinary approach, which is beneficial to the community and gains national and international recognition,
- have the ability to communicate well, uphold religious, moral, and ethical values.

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are:

- able to formulate the concept of legal problems solving through the development of legal science and positive law with a theoretical and legal reasoning approach,
- able to formulate ideas and to solve legal problems argumentatively and creatively in the field of legal science and/or positive law
- able to conduct legal research with an inter- or multidisciplinary approach, independently or collaboratively, so as to produce research that is part of the research map in the field of legal studies.

The curriculum covers the following fields: basic legal and theoretical subjects (24 ECTS), compulsory and elective subjects (12 ECTS), specialised subject (6 ECTS) and the master thesis with 18 ECTS. MLSP offers five study concentrations: Criminal Laws, Agrarian Laws, Business and Economic Laws, International Laws and State Administration Laws.

The learning methods used are mostly class discussion, case studies, and student involvement in research.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The overall law-programme is excellent and very convincing. This holds true especially for the Master of Laws Study Programme as well. It meets high academic standards and is, as required for a master programme, sufficiently science-oriented without losing sight of the legal practice. The learning outcomes are adequately addressed in the materials, they are described in some detail, and do properly as well as transparently reflect the qualifications that shall be achieved by the students. The students are well-informed about the course structure. The content of the modules is state of the art – both relating to their subject-specificity and their context-awareness (including, where suitable, inter- or transdisciplinary elements). The module contents, moreover, maintain the right balance between subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge as well as between subject-related, methodological and general skills. The modules, furthermore, allow sufficient flexibility to adjust to the ever-changing developments in law and society and, correspondingly, in the labour market.

The programme's curricular structure ensures that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved without unnecessary obstacles. Lectures and seminar-type formats are combined; the teaching style is, at least to some extent, discursive in nature. The students can show their ability to argue properly and display a sufficient degree of critical reflection. Their analytical skills are trained as well. The students are furthermore both encouraged and enabled to control the learning progress and adjust their efforts necessary for successfully

studying. A good training of presentation skills is offered in the Master's Programme (as it is in the Bachelor's Programme too).

Regular evaluations and feedback options for the students ensure the quality of the lectures; critical reflections can be discussed with the lecturers. The academic degree that is awarded ("Master of Laws") reflects the programme's science-oriented concept and adequately corresponds to the learning outcomes. All requirements of the European Qualifications Framework as well as the national qualifications-framework are met. The exams do reflect the achievements by the students. In their final master thesis, the students can demonstrate that they have sufficient knowledge and methodological competences to complete a demanding master's degree. The workload of the ambitious programme is very high and requires structured, disciplined, focused, and continuous learning and studying activities by the students. The workload, however, is correctly and transparently allocated to the different modules. The number of credits assigned to the different elements of the curriculum is correct.

As there are many fields of employment and quite diverse job options available for law students, it would be very helpful to enable students to make more informed decisions about further career paths they want to pursue – e.g. by providing more guidance on how to choose a proper internship or by offering insights in specific job profiles (**Finding 2**). It is quite obvious that the university puts quite some effort on preparing their students for an international labour market. To further strengthen the chances of the students competing under such ambitious circumstances with their peers from more or less all over the world, it is advised, to even further improve the students' English competencies in particular as far as the legal terminology and oral communication skills are concerned (**Finding 3**). It should be emphasised that the university does make some efforts to ensure the diversity and inclusiveness of the campus. The university's internationalisation efforts and the implementation of the "3 in 1"-programme are very much appreciated.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## Doctor of Laws Study Programme (DLSP / DLSPJ)

### Description

DLSP consists of two study programmes, namely at the campus in Malang and the campus in Jakarta. The programmes should develop quality human resources in order to achieve high competitiveness, both nationally and internationally.

The graduate profile is formulated as follows:

- have the ability to find or develop new theories and concepts creatively, original and tested through philosophical thinking methods to solve problems with inter-, multi- and trans-disciplinary approaches,
- have literacy skills, manage and develop research with theoretical and philosophical approaches that are beneficial for the development of legal science and the benefit of mankind, and are recognised nationally and internationally,
- have integrity, scientific responsibility and professionalism based on humanist, ethical and religious values.

The programme learning outcomes are:

- able to develop new knowledge, technology, and/or art in their scientific field or professional practice through research to produce creative, original, and tested works,

- able to solve problems of science, technology, and/or art in the field of science through inter-, multi-, and transdisciplinary approaches,
- able to manage, lead, and develop research and development that is beneficial for the benefit of mankind and is able to gain national and international recognition.

According to information in the SER, the design of the intended learning outcomes refers to level 9 of the IQF and matches level 8 of the EQF.

The intended learning outcomes are formulated as follows:

- able to analyse legal information to form and develop legal knowledge,
- able to solve legal problems at the theoretical and philosophical levels with inter-, multi-, and trans-disciplinary approaches that are beneficial to mankind,
- able to develop knowledge and legal knowledge through publication of research results both orally and in writing in scientific forums and scientific journals, at national and international levels.

The main difference between the two DLSP study programmes is the total study load, namely 49 SKS in Malang and 52 SKS in Jakarta, due to the different student profiles: The majority of DLSP Malang students have an academic background, while DLSP Jakarta students have a more professional background. To achieve the established ILOs, courses on deepening legal knowledge in Jakarta are given a greater weight of 1 credit, and 2 more credits on concentration courses.

The curriculum structure at DLSP is divided into 6 credits of University Compulsory Courses, 7 credits of Compulsory Study Programmes (8 credits at Jakarta Campus), 2 credits of Concentration Elective Courses (4 credits at Jakarta Campus), 6 credits of Dissertation Supporting Courses, and 28 credits of Dissertation. The dissertation consists of the stages of the Proposal Examination of 4 credits, the Research Results Seminar of 8 credits, the Feasibility Examination of 12 credits, and the Open Examination of 4 credits. In addition, DLSP contains 4 credits of Concentration courses to support dissertation writing, including courses on Development of Criminal Law in Multicultural Societies, Contemporary Economic Law, and Constitution and Dissolution of Political Parties as multi-disciplinary courses. DLSP students must take a Supporting Dissertation Course (MKPD) which has a weight of 6 credits.

The SER describes that the doctoral study process at DLSP in semester 1 to semester 3 is carried out in the form of lectures. After completing and passing all the prescribed courses, students have to take a qualifying exam to test their abilities and ensure students' readiness for the research and dissertation writing stages. The research and dissertation writing process consists of several stages, namely proposal examination, results seminar, feasibility test, and final examination. Students graduate and hold a doctorate degree after passing the final dissertation examination.

To improve students' academic abilities in the field of publication, students are required to publish at least 2 scientific articles in reputable international journals, or 1 scientific article in reputable international journals and 1 scientific article in indexed proceedings. Students are also required to present the development or results of their dissertation research in national/international scientific forums at least once.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The overall Laws programme is excellent and very convincing. This holds true also for both Ph.D.-programmes offered on the Malang and on the Jakarta campus. The difference between the two variants is the different target group of the Jakarta programme which is aimed at students who have a professional background. This is the reason why the students of the Jakarta programme have a total study load of 52 credits, to deepen their legal knowledge and achieve the learning outcomes that have been set. The expert panel views this approach as reasonable and it can be said that both the Malang DLSP programme and the Jakarta DLSP programme meet high scientific and academic standards and do adequately prepare the candidates for a potential later

academic career. It is impressive how the doctoral candidates are supported during the whole course of the programme – in particular when choosing their research topic. Here, preparatory seminars help the candidates to develop a sufficient overview of the relevant research fields and come up with a well-informed, original, innovative and carefully reflected research question. The candidates are furthermore supported to come up with a realistic time-plan. Key milestones of doctoral research are set up and used for orientation and guidance throughout the duration of the whole programme. The learning outcomes of the structured Ph.D.-programme are precisely addressed in the materials, they are described in some detail, and do properly as well as transparently reflect the content-based and methodological qualifications that shall be achieved by the doctoral candidates. The students are well-informed about the overall programme-structure in general and about the specifics of the Jakarta and the Malang variants in particular. The content of the science-oriented modules is doubtlessly state of the art and methodologically advanced. The courses are on a doctoral level and it is also made sure that they are thought by competent lecturers. Context-awareness, inter- and transdisciplinary approaches and comparative insights play an important role. The module contents, moreover, maintain the right balance between subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge as well as between subject-related, methodological and more general (theoretical) skills. The modules, furthermore, allow sufficient flexibility to adjust to the ever-changing developments in law, sciences and society. The programme's carefully shaped curricular structure makes sure that the intended learning outcomes can be achieved. The teaching style is discursive in nature. The scientific, methodological and analytical skills of the doctoral candidates are trained adequately. Regular evaluations and feedback options for the students ensure the quality of the programme. The academic degree that can be achieved (Ph.D.) reflects the science-oriented concept of a structured doctoral programme. All requirements of the European Qualifications Framework as well as the national qualifications framework are met. The workload of the ambitious programme is very high and requires structured, disciplined, focused, and continuous learning and studying activities by the doctoral candidates. The workload, however, is correctly and transparently allocated to the different modules. The number of credits assigned to the different elements of the curriculum is correct. Sufficient student mobility is guaranteed.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 2. Procedures for quality assurance

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

*[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

### **Doctoral degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*



*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

## Description

The internal QA procedures at UB follow the Indonesian National Standard of Higher Education (SN Dikti) and are carried out by the Quality Assurance Centre (PJM) at university level, as well as by QA units at the faculty (QAU) and study programme levels. According to the SER, all quality assurance policy documents have been published and can be accessed on different websites.

In addition to the QA audits, the university also reports data collection involving relevant stakeholders. This includes an annual online tracer study by which data is collected from alumni and the labour market with regards to the waiting period for graduates to be employed, the field of employment, and the required qualifications. As stated in the SER, the results of these tracer studies are used to revise and improve the curriculum of the respective study programmes. In addition, every four years an additional curriculum evaluation is carried out. The Academic Handbook for each study programme is updated every year. Evaluation of students' success is carried out every semester, both for course graduation and achieving credits and targets.

Tracer studies are complemented by community satisfaction surveys (SKM), which addresses lecturers, students, staff, and external partners of the faculty which are related to QA services. Students' feedback to specific courses is collected via the academic information system (SIAM). The results of students' satisfaction surveys are communicated to the individual lecturers online. UB states that the results of other satisfaction surveys concerning the overall study programme are published online on the university homepage and are communicated to stakeholders in regular meetings at the beginning and the end of every semester.

Further data collected by the university involves the profile of the student population, students' progression, completion rates, graduates' employability, and learning resources.

The university offers e-complaint as an online facility for submitting complaints and suggestions.

## Experts' evaluation

In general, the quality assurance mechanisms of UB adhere to the national norms of higher education institutions in Indonesia. It can be stated that solid procedures are in place to safeguard the academic standards. In order to serve the students and other stakeholders in expected quality standards, UB has adopted a holistic approach to the development and application of higher education institutional processes. In 2021 alone, UB has earned 33 accreditations for establishing exchange programmes and collaborations with various faculties from renown international universities, showing the desire of UB to further improve their quality of higher education.

The responsibilities of quality assurance are defined on all levels; the university level, the faculty level and the programme level. They follow the determination (P), implementation (P), evaluation (E), control (P), and improvement (P) – circle (PPEPP). UB has a code of conduct for all students, lecturers and staff to ensure high standards of professional and ethical behaviour. Also, the responsibilities within the programme and for programme elements are clearly defined and available as they are all included in the academic handbooks of the programmes.

On a programme level, quality assurance is done through various mechanisms, including internal self-evaluation by collecting feedback from students and external evaluation, which can be formalised as well as an informal feedback or suggestions from law practice professionals of Indonesia across industries. A sizeable

portion of these external stakeholders are UB's alumni which are asked for their feedback in the form of tracer studies.

One mechanism of internal self-evaluation is conducted in the form of a survey taken by the students to evaluate the teaching-learning-process. The first section of the survey scores the curriculum and the professors on the basis of the following competencies, (i) pedagogy (ii) professionalism and (iii) personality. The second section has open-end questions directed at eliciting suggestions and criticism of the lecture atmosphere.

The results of the internal evaluation survey are shared with UB students at the end of the semester. The results show the evaluation of the curriculum, teaching method, lecturers and the programme in general. The statistics and information from the survey is also included in an annual report which is published and easily available to general public, including statistical data on the student composition, study duration and drop-out-rates.

The feedback received is used to improve the quality of lectures and administrative processes by direct incorporation into the performance review of the lecturers and oversight of quality assurance.

Concerning the Master's and PhD programmes, it was explained that the "applied science" teaching approach was used to encourage students to find their area of interest especially with their dissertation process. The focus has shifted from basic research to practice-relevant research, especially when considering the complexities of urban environments and master's/specialised education.

All Master's and PhD students have a pre-determined appointment once a week with their professors to discuss and develop the legal philosophy of their chosen topic/theme for their dissertation encouraging a Socratic 'ask and answer' method of learning. A board of promoters as well as a board of examiners exists to ensure the academic quality of the dissertation. The Dean invites all PhD students for 'one-on-one' sessions every week to guide and assist them through their academic journey and also to help resolve issues if any. Many are provided with an extension to complete their degree; some are also provided financial aid to pursue their academic career.

From the session with the alumni community and students during the virtual site visit the experts gather that the learning method at UB is very inclusive and encouraging of the Socratic method of learning. The students find this particularly beneficial when they either travel overseas to further their education or for their first job.

As a part of UB's external evaluation of quality assurance, all employers, where UB students do internships (varying between 4 weeks to 6 months), send feedback and evaluation on the level of satisfaction of the interns' performance. Some offices also suggest further areas of development for the students. These employers (e.g.: Attorney General Office, law firms, in-house legal teams, etc.) also participate in job fairs.

To continuously enhance their standard of quality and be competitive, UB arranges regular workshops for the lecturers. These workshops focus on improving lecturing skills, new methods of teaching, subject matter expertise, etc. UB also supports their lecturers to get certifications to upskill. The senior lecturers mentor younger lecturers and the students find it particularly attractive to be able to participate in various research activities and assist their professors with various paper publications nationally and internationally.

During the COVID-19 pandemic UB has used technology to support and maintain its quality standards. The university has incorporated online learning very well in the academic programmes. Currently both on-campus as well as online classes are offered to the students. UB has invested in the appropriate infrastructure to support seamless learning online as well.

There is a formal and informal approach to address any issues regarding the safeguard of academic integrity and prevention of academic fraud. As a formal process, the university offers an online e-complaint system for



submitting complaints and suggestions. The Dean and the Heads of various programmes also act as facilitators to resolve issues amicably.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

#### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

#### **Doctoral degree**

*The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

### Description

In the SER, UB highlights its commitment to student-centred learning, referring to the respective standards formulated in national (SN-DIKTI) and international (CEFR) frameworks. As such, the university lists several teaching methods in addition to lectures to foster students' active participation as well as their critical and creative thinking abilities. Case studies, written exams, projects, field work, essays, reportings, discussions and presentations are some of the ways used to assess the learning outcomes of subjects. In each course there are different types of assessment depending on the competencies to be checked. Learning process and assessment are described in each syllabus. Final examination regulations require the students to attend at least 80 % of the total class meetings for each class.

According to information in the SER, students are able to arrange their courses through an application in the student academic system at a certain time before the beginning of the next semester. Through this system, students can arrange their class schedules to avoid overlapping between courses. If students encounter difficulties, they are also able to contact the Department of Academic Affairs which will consult the head of the study programme to overcome existing problems and find solutions.

UB states that the study programmes under accreditation further encourage their students to play an active role inside and outside the classroom. This includes various forms of learning activities such as homework or individual and group projects; case studies, group discussions, exhibitions, and internships are provided to achieve each course's specific objectives.

Following the university's policy as an Inclusive Campus, teaching activities must take into account the diversity of students and their respective needs. This includes for example the assurance of classroom accessibility for students with physical disabilities, assigned interpreters for hearing impaired students, and assistance as well as digitisation services for students with visual impairment.

Assessment of students' achievements include a mid-term exam and a final exam, added with two structured tests (ST 1 and ST 2).

## Experts' evaluation

University Brawijaya showed that the programmes under accreditation incorporate problem-based learning through the use of case studies, moot courts, field studies, and open discussions in the classroom. The panel of experts has no doubt that these methods cover the different students' needs, and the students get adequately prepared for their professional life. This was also highlighted by both alumni and representatives of the labour market. The university put in place the "3-in-1" programme in which one practitioner, one professor from the study programmes under accreditation, and one professor from an international university collaborate in giving a lecture regarding a certain topic. Additionally, students get the opportunity to participate in national and international moot courts and have the opportunity to already participate at early stages in their academic careers in joint publications with their respective teachers. The different teaching and learning methods encourage students to develop a deeper understanding of the subject and to form a holistic view of the matter. The panel of experts is convinced that the variety of different methods also feed into the students' motivation and their overall engagement with their studies. This impression was also strengthened by feedback given by the students during the virtual site visit. This approach shows that the variety of different forms of teaching and learning methods foster a learning environment that appeals to the students' needs.

During the COVID-19 pandemic, the university started a digital learning programme. Representatives of the teaching staff pointed out that some of the methods will be kept and used in the future.

University Brawijaya encourages its students to participate in the Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) programme, which offers students the opportunity to study at different universities, both nationally and internationally, and to complete internships. Especially the internship programme provides the opportunity for students to transfer their knowledge to situations outside the university context and to apply it to their chosen profession. In addition to that the university strengthens the importance of practicing certain situations. To ensure that students are prepared for their professional life, students at University Brawijaya can simulate hearings in the university's own moot courtrooms.

The assessment regulations and procedures are defined in the RPS, the semester teaching plan, for achieving the learning outcomes. Due to the new curriculum that has been released in 2021, not all courses have a RPS yet. However, it was explained to the experts that these documents are currently being prepared. Additionally, for all courses syllabi are provided, as well as learning outcome evaluation plans (REHP). The standard assessment is also described in the Academic Handbooks. At the beginning of the semester, students are informed of the timing and the form of their exams and assessments. Each course has various types of assessment which may include group work, work with case law, readings and presentations.

Students in the programmes under accreditation who do not pass an exam can retake it in the following semester. The university also offers a "third semester" over the summer in which students can retake exams. Additionally, the students have the possibility to give a complaint and appeal a decision. In this case, the student must first try to solve the issue with the lecturer. If that does not solve the issue, the student must submit a written complaint to the Head of the Study Programme no later than one week after the notification of the grade. This procedure is documented in the Academic Handbook which is available online. If a student is sick or has other obligations with the university at the time of the exam, the student can take the exam a few weeks later. This can be discussed through personal interaction with the lecturers who are encouraged to support the students in this matter. Students with disabilities are provided with assistance by the university's Center for Disability Studies which plays an active role in the student's life.

As far as the Ph.D.-programmes on the Jakarta and the Malang campus are concerned, an adequate and supportive supervision is guaranteed. This includes the choice of a suitable research question, the formulation of milestones in the research process, critical reflection of the academic progress and critical discussions of the drafts of the thesis. Even though the Ph.D.-programme is primarily science-oriented, it does not exclusively

address and envisage candidates that want to pursue an academic career. Practical aspects of the relevant research questions are also respected. The assessment regulations are precisely defined and accessible to the Ph.D.-candidates. So are the specific examination procedures: oral defense of the Ph.D.-thesis, cumulative dissertation, monograph, issues of publication, timescale for publication etc. The different options and standards are communicated in a very transparent way. Internal and external examiners are well-informed about the standards required, the grading-scheme applied and the cultural specifics of the two Ph.D.-programmes.

**Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

**4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification**

**Bachelor/Master degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

**Doctoral degree**

*The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.*

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

**Description**

Admission

Bachelor of Laws study programme:

UB offers four admission tracks to prospective students: (1) the National Selection for State University Admission (SNMPTN), (2) the Joint Selection for State University Admission (SBMPTN); (3) Independent Selection Test of UB (SMUB); (4) Independent Selection of People with Disabilities (SPKPD). The first admission scheme (SNMPTN) is regulated on a national scale and involves the evaluation of high school report cards, the score in the national examination (Ujian Nasional), as well as the consideration of academic achievements, alumni tracks, and school accreditation levels. The second admission scheme (SBMPTN) selects students according to their performance in a written exam in which their basic academic potential with regards to the respective field of study is assessed. The SMUB scheme is organised according to UB's standards and involves a computer-based written examination and students' high school report cards. Finally, the Independent Selection of People with Disabilities takes into account individual cases and is combined with the opportunity to receive a scholarship. The SER further demonstrates that data is collected on the distribution of past cohorts with regards to the individual pathways.

Master of Laws study programme:

Prospective students of MLSP should have a law or law related background, such as police degree, Islamic law degree and other; and should have a minimum GPA of 2.75. In addition to this, the background certificate should come from an undergraduate programme with score B of the Indonesian Accreditation Agency (BAN-PT). Further requirements also include a minimum score of 475 TOEFL and a score of 450 in the academic potential test.



Student admission selection for MLSP is carried out in 2 stages, namely: 1) written exam that is carried out after registering as a student candidate. The substance of the material tested is related to criminal law, administrative law, constitutional law, civil law, international law and Islamic law. The prospective students who pass the written exam are those who have a minimum score of 70; 2) Interview Examination with the team of MLSP to confirm the performance of the written test. The interview covers two broad aspects, including legal knowledge (mainly discusses proposed research proposals), and soft skills (attitude, English language proficiency and motivation). Both written and interviews tests are conducted in assuring the achievement of MLSP's ILO.

#### Doctor of Law study programme:

The selection process for prospective students is carried out through several stages, namely the Administrative Selection, a Written Test, and an Interview Examination. The administrative selection aims to select students who meet the academic requirements to enter as new students at DLSP. Academic requirements that must be met are: being a Bachelor's or Master's graduates, one or both degrees being in the field of law; master's degree from an accredited study programme with at least a B score from BAN-PT; a minimum TOEFL score of 475; the value of the Academic Potential Test (TPA) with a minimum score of 500; and the submission of a draft of the Dissertation Research Proposal.

#### Progression

As stated in the SER, student progression is monitored by academic advisors, with whom they meet several times per semester. In addition to academic guidance and recommendation to students, academic advisors also consult with faculty leaders in the case of severe problems in the students' progression. UB states that students' performance in the courses and exams as well as their workload is documented.

To support the student study process, Universitas Brawijaya has a policy to support equal opportunities, including students who already have children. The support is in the form of day care and kindergarten facilities. The Faculty of Law also provides a special room for mothers and children. For students with special needs, DLSP collaborates with the Center for Disability Studies to provide assistance. DLSP students also have the opportunity to access domestic scholarships provided by the Indonesian government. For special conditions, students can apply for a postponement or a waiver of study fees.

#### Recognition

Following the national policy Kampus Merdeka (MBKAM), students have the right and are encouraged to take courses outside of their study programme. This may also include independent student exchanges, campus teaching activities, and internships.

#### Certification

Upon graduation, students receive a diploma, transcript of grades, SKPI (certificate accompanying diploma) which contains qualifications, degrees obtained, and achievements in certain fields.

#### **Experts' evaluation**

The admission requirements of the programmes for Indonesian nationals as well as for international students are clearly defined and standardised for all applicants. The criteria are clearly documented and accessible for the general public. General admission to higher education programmes is mainly given through governmental processes. Regarding the two doctoral programmes the specific procedures and regulations, as well as the conditions for the award of a doctoral degree are clearly defined, reported and available. The University is providing an independent admission procedure for candidates with disabilities (SMPD).

Recognition of credits within the MBKM programme – if students take up courses at other faculties or other Indonesian universities, or even outside-university activities – is regulated within the UB's academic handbook.

Recognition of courses attended in a semester abroad is given as well. The faculty is enabling students to visit foreign universities and therefore applies an adequate recognition policy. However, the composition of the curricula with a great number of small modules might potentially cause problems in recognition at European universities (see chapter 1 for a recommendation on the modularisation). The translation formula of SKS into ECTS credits seems not to be provided by the university, however it is stated that one SKS is equal to 1.5 ECTS. It is recommended to the programme management to increase transparency on SKS to ECTS Credit conversion (**Finding 4**). However, this is just a recommendation, not an obstacle for the fulfilment of the basic criteria, as this issue should be solved rather on a national level.

The certification of graduated students is adequate. The faculty also issues a Diploma Supplement.

The university is legally entitled to award doctorates. The legal status of the doctoral candidates is clearly defined.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### Description

Teaching staff at UB may be employed either as civil servants or non-civil servants. The former group is selected according to the Regulation of the Head of the National Civil Service Agency, while selection of the latter group is regulated by the university's guidelines. The recruitment of academic staff follows a standing operating procedure, which involves an analysis of the position, workload, the employee's prospective needs, and a distribution programme. Required qualifications of academic staff includes the necessary academic qualification and competence, educator qualifications, physical and mental health, as well as the ability to implement national educational goals.

Every lecturer who teaches courses in the law programmes has received a certificate of competence as a teacher. Every year, up-grading and competency training are carried out for lecturers to improve lecturers' abilities and expertise in teaching and assessing student study results. External lecturers are practitioners (among others: judges, prosecutors, police, notaries, lawyers, clerks, businessmen, representatives from NGOs, bureaucrats), who are appointed based on the Rector's Regulation.

The SER lists the following academic staff for the programmes to be accredited:

Bachelor of Laws study programme:

BLSP has 133 full-time lecturers (92 internal, 41 external) with the following areas of expertise: Criminal Law, Civil Law, International Law, Constitutional Law, Administrative Law.

The average teaching workload of each lecturer is equivalent to 36 working hours per week. Each lecturer is responsible to administer courses and to conduct evaluations. In addition, lecturers have the task of becoming academic supervisors and guiding students in writing their Undergraduate Thesis as final assignments. Furthermore, the study programme regularly invites guest lecturers from other universities inside and outside the country.

All teachers at BLSP have met the minimum educational qualifications of a master's degree. They also take part in educational training, namely Instructional Techniques (Pekerti) and Applied Approach Training held by LP3 UB. All teachers have certificates of competence as lecturers issued by the Ministry of Education and Culture.

Furthermore, the SER lists additional trainings that are available to lecturers to enhance their social and professional qualifications. Also, academic staff holding a master's degree are encouraged to pursue their doctoral studies.

Master of Laws study programme:

MLASP has 44 full-time lecturers (36 internal, 8 external) with the following areas of expertise: Criminal Law, Civil Law, International Law, Constitutional Law and Administrative Law.

According to the SER, all internal lecturers have academic qualifications of a doctoral degree; the percentage of Professors and Associate Professors is 90 %. In addition, these internal lecturers are members of certain Associations of Law Teachers, both at national and international levels.

Lecturers teach an average load of 4 credits, in each course the lecturer prepares a module plan (RPS) which contains lecture materials, learning methods and evaluation mechanisms, and does also assist students who are carrying out their final assignments (composing a thesis). Besides that, the lecturer also carries out research and community service projects both on national and international level that shall involve students. MLSP also provides guest lecturers both from within and outside the country. Guest lecturers can come from academia or be practitioners. The full teaching time equivalent for permanent lecturers in educational activities (learning and mentoring), research, community services and additional and/ or supporting tasks is 11.99 credits.

Doctor of Laws study programme:

Internal teaching staff in DLSP consists of 25 lecturers: 7 people are professors; 18 people are holding doctoral degrees. Furthermore, there are 8 external lecturers of diverse professional backgrounds, such as Supreme Court justices, notaries, clerks, tax consultants.

In DLSP, both lecturers and examiners and even the promoter commission must meet certain requirements and are set to support learning achievement in the Doctor of Laws education programme:

- 1) The promoter holds a Doctorate degree with an academic position of at least Head Lecturer and has written scientific articles published in international journals indexed by Scopus, Thomson Reuters, Microsoft Academic Search, or DOAJ as the first author or corresponding author.
- 2) The Co-Promoter holds a Doctorate degree with an academic position of at least Lector and at least has written an article published in an accredited national journal.
- 3) Have expertise in accordance with the substance of the dissertation that will be written by students.



- 4) The promoter must have the status of a lecturer at the Faculty of Law, Universitas Brawijaya.
- 5) Co-Promoters can come from and outside the Faculty of Law, Universitas Brawijaya provided that they have expertise in accordance with the substance of the dissertation that will be written by students.

For the scientific development of lecturers, the faculty allocates a budget for Departmental Discussions, Guest Lectures, National Seminars, International seminars, participating in scientific forums both at home and abroad.

### Experts' evaluation

All programmes under review have a very well qualified and pedagogically competent teaching staff. The lecturers left the overall impression to be very motivated and dynamic, most of them speak a very appropriate English. The students as well appear to be very enthusiastic and motivated. The resources available (manpower, technical and digital infrastructure, e-learning options, campus facilities) do fit the size of the quite large student body. In particular, integrated hybrid classes need to be positively mentioned. Modern technology is, in general, used to the advantage of the students. The university and its law faculty are also in all other regards very well equipped. A full list of all teaching staff involved in the programme is published and made accessible to all students. The information includes the academic and otherwise qualification of the teaching staff (including practitioners), the relevant number of teaching hours as well the duration of their employment. The teaching staff is appropriately qualified with regards to the intended learning outcomes of the programme; consequently, the necessary differences as to the qualification are made clear in the Bachelor's programme, the more science-oriented Master's programme and the in particular science- as well as research-oriented Ph.D.-programme. The size and diversity of the teaching staff are impressive and appropriate for the size student body. The overall workload for staff (teaching, research, administration) is also appropriate for the delivery of the programmes. Regular training opportunities are offered to the lecturers. Sufficient emphasis is placed on their pedagogical and didactic qualifications. Continuity in the teaching staff is ensured. An adequate teaching staff is available for the next six years which is to say for the duration of the accreditation. In case of retirements, change of workplaces etc. an adequate replacement of the personnel is ensured as well. The recruitment procedures for teaching staff are clearly defined and transparent; they ensure a quality- and qualification-based application process. Regular in-service training is offered for the teaching staff and the administrative staff as well.

In particular, the Ph.D.-supervisors are properly qualified. This applies to both their content-related and methodological competences. Thus, it is made sure, that they can sufficiently support and competently advise the Ph.D.-candidates. All responsibilities of Ph.D.-supervisors are clearly defined. This holds true not only for internal but also external supervisors. The university makes accessible all necessary information and materials to them.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

*[ESG 1.6]*

### **Doctoral degree**

*Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.*

[ESG 1.6]

## **Description**

### Learning Resources

The Faculty of Law holds several facilities: The Law Laboratory in the form of 4 moot courtrooms (2 general courtrooms, 1 constitutional courtroom and 1 state administrative courtroom equipped with judicial equipment), and 1 Legislative Drafting room, and 1 Alternative Dispute Resolution room. In addition, as described in the SER, there is also a language laboratory and a computer laboratory that is adapted to standards and is supported by trained technical personnel.

The Faculty of Law has various facilities and infrastructure for students with special needs to access all available facilities and infrastructure, such as building lifts, special parking areas, and special classes.

Through the Virtual Learning Management (VLM) application, lecture materials at UB can be more easily accessed by students. In addition, lecturers and students can also use commercial platforms to get material sources from the lecturers who teach courses. UB also develops information systems such as for research and community service, data centre, tracer study and property inventory.

Twenty hotspots are available in the FL area. The network is managed by IT staff. Students use PLT (Student Service Center) facilities to meet academic administrative needs.

Other facilities provided are classrooms with a capacity of 30-100 students, an auditorium, meeting rooms, laboratories and libraries. All classes are equipped with a sound system, LCD projector and internet connection. There is a multimedia room that can be used to hold meetings, exams and teleconferences.

UB library has a total of 308.847 collections of books and references. The FL library consists of 2 floors with a collection of 16,226 books and other academic documents in both print and e-book form.

For health services, UB has a polyclinic as a university health service center located on campus and a hospital located 1 km from the campus. Students get health services at both facilities.

### Student Support Services

According to the SER, information about the study programmes offered, financing, scholarships, and collaborations carried out by UB and FL can be accessed on the UB and FL websites. In addition, information on education costs, scholarships, cooperation, and students' exchange can be accessed on different websites mentioned in the SER.

UB states that information about the learning process is conveyed directly to new students through the Education Orientation programme. In this orientation, information is provided on the curriculum, teaching and learning system, assessment system, finance, academic administration, student rights and obligations, and the ethics of life on campus.

The SER describes that each student has an academic supervisor who accompanies the student. Consultation includes academic and non-academic consultations. Furthermore, students can consult their course lecturers. The thesis supervisor is tasked with assisting students in preparing proposals, seeking references, compiling research instruments, collecting data and legal materials, compiling and analysing, and drawing conclusions and research recommendations. According to information in the SER, the final project mentoring process is adjusted to the needs of each student and also by agreement with the supervisor.



For the DLSP, the SER describes that dissertation research guidance is carried out starting from the preparation of the dissertation research proposal to the final dissertation examination by the Promoter Commission, consisting of 1 Promoter and 2 Co-Promoters.

### Experts' evaluation

Due to the fact that the site visit took place online, the university showed several videos and live streams of their facilities. The panel of experts is convinced that the facilities of the Faculty of Law are adequate for its students and the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. Especially the four moot courtrooms and the multimedia equipment in all classrooms stood out positively. In addition to that, the videos showed law laboratories, a drafting room, and a library which are well-equipped and had barrier-free access.

Due to COVID-19 regulations, only a limited number of students are allowed at the library. The opening hours were also changed during the pandemic. This, however, is planned to be changed back as soon as the pandemic situation allows it.

The university has two different kinds of scholarships which are communicated via Instagram and the university's website. Students can receive academic or financial scholarships. The student body committee supports students in this process. Members of this committee described this process to the experts as being transparent and easy. Furthermore, students can apply for financial aid for moot courts and various funding schemes are available for students who participate in student exchange programmes. The student body committee and the alumni also support students in finding practical placements and internships.

For new students, an orientation period is organised in which the students can get to know the university, its facilities, and the activities on campus. Students with different backgrounds are supported at the university. As described by members of the university, day-care facilities are available for students with children, as well as services for students with disabilities.

The teachers' advisory services are described as being quite flexible. The panel of experts is convinced that the variety of methods in which students can seek assistance from their teachers is adequate and helps the students to get the best possible learning outcome. Students can reach their teachers via social media or after online classes. In addition to that, some teachers offer in-person meetings on campus.

A variety of information on course and module descriptions can be found on the university's website and in the student learning portal. The students are also provided with syllabi, semester teaching plans (RPS), and learning outcomes evaluation plans (REHP). The expected workload is described in the course modules. The panel of experts recognises that the expected workload especially for Bachelor's students is high, however, especially the students highlighted that they are highly satisfied with what they learn and the way they are being taught. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the development of online learning has progressed in the university. As the teaching staff pointed out, it is the aim that in the future all of the classes should take place in a hybrid form.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Information / Public information

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

**Doctoral degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

**Description**

UB states that all necessary information on the study programmes is available online on the university, faculty, and study programme websites. This includes information for prospective students, the UB curriculum, scholarships, programme missions, student procedures, academic calendars, student affairs, and contact information. In addition, the faculty and the study programmes use several social media accounts (Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, YouTube) to disseminate further information on e.g. current events.

The graduate profile, intended learning outcome, qualification awarded and learning, courses structure, learning method, assessment mechanism, the number of credits that must be taken by students, as well as a courses description are included in the curriculum section of the published academic handbook on the FL website.

FL currently has three law journals that accessible online (online journal system), namely Arenahukum, Brawijaya Law Journal, and Warkat.

**Experts' evaluation**

All electronic information disseminated to the public by UB adheres to set standards of accessibility and transparency. For example, Warintek Bantul (one of their online journal systems) site develops local content related to the information needed by students who attend UB. Public information regarding their history, faculties, student activities and facilities and campus services is very easily available.

The FAQ section covers information in the following sections, such as academics, public relations, students affairs, human resources, corporations, financial affairs, school visitations, media, research and community services, procurements, and UB cares and community satisfaction surveys.

UB is also very active on social media platforms like Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, YouTube, etc. They have particularly used these social media platforms to stay connected and provide public information during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Public information regarding financial aid/scholarship applications is very easy to find, navigate and understand. UB also has a very impressive support system for disabled students and that information is also available on public platforms thereby encouraging students to join UB's academic programmes.

**Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programme “**Law**” (**Bachelor**) offered by **Universitas Brawijaya**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programme “**Law**” (**Master**) offered by **Universitas Brawijaya**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programme “**Law**” (**PhD**) offered in **Malang** by **Universitas Brawijaya**.

The panel of experts recommends

- to accredit

the study programme “**Law**” (**PhD**) offered in **Jakarta** by **Universitas Brawijaya**.

### Findings:

1. The panel of experts recommends bringing the issue of modularisation (categorising courses into groups of related content) to the attention of forums on higher education, in order to present the advantages of an easier understanding of thematic and systematic connections between courses and topics through modularisation.
2. Concerning the Bachelor- and Master programme: In regard to the job market, and the many possible fields of employment for law students, the panel of experts recommends to further enable students to make an informed decision about their internships, e.g. through more systematic guidance concerning future professional pathways
3. Concerning the Bachelor- and Master programme: It is recommended to equip students with English skills within law courses, to improve English legal terminology and the oral use of English in a thematic law setting.
4. It is recommended to increase transparency on SKS to ECTS Credit conversion.