

**Prof. Grzegorz Kurzyński**

**blue = recommendation red = commendation**

The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre from the West University of Timisoara

## **External evaluation report for accreditation and periodic evaluation of the field of doctoral studies Music**

### **I. Introduction**

**- the context in which this external evaluation report was drafted (the type of evaluation, the period of the evaluation visit, the composition of the Experts Committee etc.);**

Periodic evaluation of doctoral studies in the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre from the West University of Timisoara was conducted 11-15 October 2021, in blended format.

Members of the Review Team:

#### **Coordinator**

Prof. dr. Nelida NEDELCUȚ Academia de Muzică "Gheorghe Dima"; Cluj-Napoca

#### **International expert**

Prof. dr. Grzegorz Kurzynski Karol Lipiński Academy of Music in Wrocław, Poland

#### **PhD student**

Lacraru Andrei Universitatea Națională de Artă Teatrală și Cinematografică „I.L. Caragiale” din București

**- details about the doctoral school(s) of which the doctoral domain under review is part (number of doctoral advisors, number of students, institutional context, short history etc.);**

#### **The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre from the West University of Timisoara**

Organizing Institution for Doctoral Studies (IOSUD-WUT) functions since the academic year 2015-2016 in the fundamental domain of Humanities and Arts, for the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC. Since the academic year 2018-2019 the domain of doctoral studies in THEATRE AND PERFORMING ARTS had been approved.

Starting with the academic year 2015-2016 a number of 60 doctoral students (29 came from other institutions of higher education from Romania or abroad) have been enrolled: 25 doctoral students were financed from the budget, with a special place of study for Romany (7 doctoral students with doctoral scholarship, a scholarship being allocated for worldwide Romanians)35 tuition-paying doctoral students, all of them in various stages of developing their doctorate thesis. Until now 21 doctoral students had publicly defended their doctoral thesis, 10 of them were validated by the General Council CNATDCU.

The mission of ensuring the conditions for carrying out the doctoral studies cycle aims to develop human resources for scientific research and artistic creation for the doctoral studies in the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC and in THEATRE AND PERFORMING ARTS, pursuing the insertion on the labor market with a highly qualified degree.

## **Structure**

The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre is led by the Council of the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre and by the director of the doctoral school.

In the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre in the domain of doctoral studies in *Music* the position of doctoral supervisor is performed by 8 university teachers and in the domain of doctoral studies in *Theatre and Performing Arts* by 4 university teachers.

Regarding the quality, competence and expertise of academic, professional research and creative art all the doctoral supervisors meet the requirements for the CNATDCU minimum standards.

Currently in the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre within the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC are enrolled 36 doctoral students, namely 31 doctoral students and 5 doctoral students in extension. Within the domain of doctoral studies in THEATRE AND PERFORMING ARTS are enrolled 14 doctoral students.

The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre acts in accordance with the Code of Ethics of UVT, the University Chart of UVT taking them into account. Issues relating to ethics and academic ethics are discussed in special meetings organized by CSUD. If the problem is not resolved at this level, parties are called by the Ethics Commission of the WUT. Within the guidance committees are co-opted specialists with corresponding competences for the doctoral study field. Thus, the proper development of the research carried out by the doctoral students is ensured. The spaces and material endowment assigned to both domains of doctoral studies allow the realization of the research activities, in accordance with the mission and the assumed objectives

1.3. The internal quality assessment consists in the multicriteria examination of the extent to which ANMGD, through the programs offered, meets the minimum and reference standards established by ARACIS regulations.

## **II. Methods used**

**This chapter will contain the methods and tools used in the external evaluation process, before and during the evaluation visit, including at least:**

- **The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain under review and its Annexes;**

Before the online evaluation visit internal evaluation reports were very precisely and deeply verified and analyzed. No other documents have been requested.

- **The analysis of documents made available by the IOSUD, in physical format, during the evaluation visit (if such documents have been requested);**

not applicable

- **The analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD/Doctoral School(s) website, in electronic format;**
- **On-site visiting the buildings included in the institution's property, comprising (indicative and non exhaustive list, which shall be changed according to the context).**

**Meetings with:**

The following meetings have been held in online format:

- Meeting of panel members for discussing main methodological aspects related to the evaluation of doctoral studies
  - Online meeting with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD)
  - Online meeting with the contact person for the doctoral study domain under review and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report
  - Online meeting with the Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) members / Quality Assurance Department
  - Online meeting with the academic staff corresponding to the doctoral study domain
  - Online meeting with PhD students
  - Online meeting with Doctoral Schools Council (CSD members)
  - Online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission
  - Online meeting with graduates for the respective doctoral study domain
  - Online meeting with the Directors/persons in charge of the research centers/laboratories within the doctoral study domain
  - Online meeting with employers of Doctoral graduates in the domain
  - Meeting with representatives of the institution under review to discuss on the conclusions of the evaluation process and the main recommendations
- Application of questionnaires to doctoral students or academic staff in the doctoral study domain under review.

### **III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators**

#### **Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY**

**Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources.**

***Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School***

*(a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;*

*(b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;*

*c) the methodology for conducting the last competition for the position of CDS director and evidence of its development;*

*d) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);*

*e) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;*

*f) functional management structures [IODES / CDS / Doctoral School Council (regularity of convening meetings)]*

g) the contract for doctoral studies;

h) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals on the topic of doctoral university study programs.

**The responsibility for establishing the topic of the doctoral study programs is of the council and the director of the Doctoral School.**

**The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.**

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.2.** *The regulations of the doctoral school include criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art.17 para.(5) of the Code of doctoral studies, approved by Government Decision no.681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions*

**The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria,**

**Fulfilled**

**Standard A.1.2.** *The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies.*

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.** *Existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic career*

**The records of doctoral students and their academic background can be found in the WUT's own system: UMS -University Management System, but also in the systems of the Ministry of National Education: REI -Integrated Educational Register and RMU - Single Matriculation Register.**

**I would recommend the creation of an formalized alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.**

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.** *Existence and use of a computer program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

**IOSUD-WUT uses as a learning tool for academic writing as support and verification of similarity the online software *iThenticate* (available at <http://www.ithenticate.com>), which are analyzed according to internal procedures, concerning all doctoral thesis that are verified before the defense in front of the guiding committee or before public defense.**

**Fulfilled**

**Standard A.1.3.** *Adequate use of financial resources*

**Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.** *Existence of at least one research or institutional development grant / human resources in implementation at the time of submitting the self-assessment file per domain of*

doctoral studies or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development grants / human resources per domain of doctoral studies obtained by doctoral supervisors in the domain evaluated in the last 5 years.

For the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC there exist research grants, cultural projects in line with the research topics that involves, besides the doctoral supervisors also the doctoral students. For example: Timorgelfest International Festival 2017, with 21 recitals, a symphonic concert with the "Banatul" Timisoara Philharmonic Orchestra or *Baroque in contemporary poses* - concerts and organ courses

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.2.** *The proportion of doctoral students existing at the time of evaluation who benefit for at least six months from sources of funding other than government funding, through scholarships granted by individuals or legal entities or are financially supported by research or institutional development /human resources grants is at least 20%.*

In the case of doctoral students in the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC, only a small part of them benefited from other sources of funding than the governmental ones, the percentage being 14.5%.

I would recommend taking into account the possibility of making free recordings, components of the doctoral thesis in professional doctorates. It is also a way of financial support. The same with the use of audio-video equipment, props, computers, chamber music studio ect.

**Partially fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.3.** *At least 10% of the total amounts related to doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contract and tuition fees collected from doctoral students in the form of paid education are used to settle the training costs of doctoral students.*

This indicator has not been an obligation so far. Consequently, it will be considered in the future, especially since the Methodology for accessing the institutional doctoral training resources, recently developed is pending.

**Partially fulfilled ????**

## **Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure**

**Standard A.2.1.** Existence of a research infrastructure suitable for carrying out specific activities in academic doctoral studies.

**Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.** *The spaces and the material endowment of IOSUD-WUT / doctoral school allow the realization of the research activities, in the evaluated domain, in accordance with the assumed mission and objectives*

The spaces and material endowment of the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre allow the realization of research activities in accordance with the mission and objectives assumed, having at their disposal computers, specific software, tools, library, access to international databases. IOSUD-WUT has an individualized headquarter inside the West University of Timisoara. In addition to office space and archives, there is a room intended for the public presentation of doctoral and habilitation thesis, and also various public lectures. The conferences and symposia organized can also take place in the specially arranged spaces of WUT. In my opinion the infrastructure is rather poor.

**Partially fulfilled**

**Criterion A.3. The quality of human resource**

**Standard A.3.1. Existence of qualified staff in the doctoral school**

*Performance Indicator A.3.1.1. .Within the domain of doctoral studies, at least three doctoral supervisors work and at least 50% of them (but not less than three) meet the minimum standards of CNATDCU in force at the time of the evaluation, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the certificate of qualification.*

The function of doctoral supervisors in the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC is carried out by eight university teachers. All of them exceed the minimum score required in accordance with current CNATDCU minimal standards (habilitated teacher 340 points).

**Fulfilled**

*Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.2. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated domain of doctoral studies are holders within IOSUD, employed with an employment contract for an indefinite period*

The doctoral supervisor function in the domain of doctoral studies in Music is performed by 8 professors, among them 5 members of the academic staff are holders at WUT, 2 professors affiliated and 1 associated professor. The percentage of holders at WUT is 62.5%.

**Fulfilled**

*Performance Indicator A.3.1.3. The subjects of the training program based on advanced university studies related to the domain of doctoral studies are supported by academic staff or researchers, having the status of doctoral supervisor / habilitated professor / senior researcher or associate professor with expertise proven in the subjects taught or other specialists in the domain who meet the standards established by the institution for the didactic and research functions mentioned above, in accordance with the law.*

IOSUD-WUT in MUSIC field has sufficiently qualified teaching staff with appropriate qualifications to effectively deliver its PhD programmes.

**Fulfilled**

*Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.4. The share of doctoral supervisors who coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during their doctoral studies [3 or 4 years], depending on the field of doctoral studies, to which are added the extension periods granted according to art.39, para. (3) of the Code approved by Government Decision no.681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions, does not exceed 20%*

**None of the doctoral supervisors coordinates more than 8 doctoral students at the same time during the doctoral studies or during the extension period.**

**Fulfilled**

**Standard A.3.2.** Doctoral supervisors within the doctoral school carry out an internationally visible scientific activity

*Performance Indicator A.3.2.1. At least 50% of doctoral supervisors in the domain of doctoral studies under evaluation shows at least 5 publications indexed Web of Science or ERIH in journals with impact factor or other achievements, with relevant significance, with contributions at international level that reveal a progress in scientific research-development-innovation for the evaluated domain*

**Eight out of eight doctoral supervisors have an internationally visible activity and meet this criterion (papers published by the doctoral supervisors as authors / co-authors in journals listed in international databases Web of Science, Scopus, Google Scholar, artistic activity and projects, memberships in the boards of professional associations, members in the organizing committees of national and international artistic events, juries, etc.**

**Fulfilled**

*Performance Indicator \*A.3.2.2. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be scientifically active, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the minimum CNATDCU standards in force at the date of evaluation, necessary and mandatory to obtain the certificate of qualification, based on scientific results from the last five years.*

**All doctoral supervisors are further active in the scientific and artistic domain and meet the score required by the CNATDCU minimal standards.**

**Fulfilled**

## **Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFICIENCY**

**Criterion B.1. Number, quality and diversity of candidates for doctoral studies.**

**Standard B.1.1.** The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or in greater numbers than the number of places financed from the state budget.

*Performance Indicator \*B.1.1.1. The ratio between the number of master's degree graduates of other higher education institutions in the country or abroad who have entered the competition for admission to doctoral studies in the last five years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition within the doctoral school is at least 0.2., or the ratio between the number of candidates in the last five years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition in the field of doctoral studies is at least 1.2*

Out of the 60 doctoral students admitted, 29 come from other institutions of higher education from Romania or abroad (one doctoral student from Spain, with master studies at the Faculty of Music and Theatre in Timisoara, five Romanian citizens with master degree completed in Austria, Switzerland, France, Germany, Serbia; 1 doctoral student from Greece). Thus, it can be observed that the doctoral program offered by IOSUD-WUT is an attractive one, even for graduates from other higher education institutions in the country and abroad. There is a tendency to change, namely to attract candidates from other university centers and abroad, especially worldwide Romanian.

Fulfilled

**Standard B.1.2** Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance, are diversified as gender and social representation

*Performance Indicator \* B.1.2.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: the academic, research and professional performance of the candidates, their interest in scientific or artistic research, publications in the field and search topic proposal*

Admission to doctoral studies within the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre is organized in accordance to the legal framework, based on the national methodologies for organizing these competitions, by adapting them to the needs of the doctoral school for the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC. In this respect the Methodology for Organizing the Admission to the Doctoral Studies within IOSUD-WUT and the Methodology of Organizing Admission at the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre are elaborated annually, approved by the Council of Doctoral School, by CSUD and the WUT Senate.

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator \*B.1.2.1. (B.1.2.2.) The expulsion rate of doctoral students, including after dropping out of school, at 3 years after admission does not exceed 30. At 2 years after admission does not exceed 30%*

The expulsion rate is 0%. The rate of withdrawal / abandoning of doctoral students is minimal, since only 5 doctoral students have withdrawn since 2015 (3 doctoral students withdrawn from the 2015-2016 generation, 1 doctoral student withdrawn from the 2017 - 2018 generation and 1 doctoral student withdrawn from the 2019-2020 generation) -the dropout rate being 8.3%

Fulfilled

**Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral university study programs**

**Standard B.2.1.** The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced university studies includes at least three disciplines relevant for the training of doctoral students in scientific research, of which at least one discipline is intended for the in-depth study of research methodology and / or statistical data processing.*



The curriculum includes at least two components dedicated to some of the transversal competences, including aspects related to research ethics, scientometry and academic writing.

A  
Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

Compliance with the research ethics criteria is an essential component of the doctoral education process within IOSUD-WUT. Since the academic year 2018-2019 all doctoral schools included in the curricula of the university training program advanced course of research ethics, in accordance with Order no.3131 / 30.01.2018. For example in IOSUD-WUT it is the discipline *Ethics and academic integrity*.

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. IOSUD-WUT has created mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated domain of doctoral studies aims at learning outcomes, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or by research activities*

The doctoral study program at the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre aims to train specific competencies, including comprehensive advanced study and research programs / artistic creation.

The disciplines proposed to study in the curriculum of the doctoral school pursue training competences of the doctoral students in order to complete the knowledge and to develop techniques on advanced research methods. The professional competences can be found in the discipline sheets, elaborated by the holders who teach the specialized disciplines included in the curriculum for the field of doctoral studies in MUSIC.

Though until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes)

I would recommend also that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.4. Throughout the doctoral training period, doctoral students in the field benefit from the counseling /guidance of some functional guidance commissions, aspect reflected by guidance and written feedback or regular meetings.*

According to the Regulations for Doctoral Studies, each doctoral supervisor, after consultation with the doctoral student, proposes a guiding committee composed of 3 other members who may be part of the research team of the doctoral supervisor, other persons affiliated to the doctoral school or from teachers and researchers not affiliated with it.

PhD students benefit from the advice of functional guidance committees, an aspect reflected by written guidance and feedback or regular meetings.

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.5. For a domain of doctoral studies the ratio of graduate students and number of teachers / researchers their providing guidance should not be less than 3: 1*

The ratio of graduate students and teachers is 3:1.

Fulfilled

**Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral study programs and their evaluation procedures**

**Standard B.3.1. Valuation of research**

*Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. For the evaluated domain of doctoral studies, at least one article or another relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained the doctoral degree in the last 5 years is made available to the evaluation commission. The members of the evaluation commission select for analysis, at random, 5 such relevant articles / contributions per domain of doctoral studies. At least 3 of the selected articles present significant original contributions in the domain concerned.*

Most doctoral students opt for the program of professional doctorate, so that the number of publications is lower than the artistic contributions. However, the presence of ISI-listed items (3) and other contributions to international databases is noteworthy.

???????

**Randomly selected 5 papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review should be delivered – I did not receive.**

*Performance Indicator \*B.3.1.2. The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last 5 years), including posters, exhibitions, made at prestigious international events (held in the country or abroad) and the number of students PhD students who have completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last five years) is at least equal to 1.*

The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre assumes the mission of advanced scientific research, generating and transferring knowledge to society through scientific research, individual and collective creation in the field of sciences and arts, by ensuring performance, capitalizing and disseminating their results nationally and international through:

- a) Scientific publications in specialized journal
- b) Participation in conferences, colloquia, symposia, scientific communication sessions
- c) Publications and relevant artistic creations
- d) Presence of doctoral students at international events
- e) Visibility at national and international level
- f) The awards and distinctions obtained by the doctoral student

The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period and the number of PhD students is more than 1.

**Fulfilled**

#### **Standard B.3.2. External referents**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.1.** *The number of doctoral thesis assigned to a particular referent from a higher education institution, other than the IOSUD evaluated, must not exceed 2 doctoral theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor in one year.*

**The ratio between the doctoral thesis assigned to a certain referent coming from another higher education institution does not exceed two theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor in a year, with a small exception: the presence of two referents from abroad (Republic Moldova and Germany), thus existing the possibility to collaborate with institutions from other countries, strengthening the tendency for internationalization.**

**The small number of specialists in the field of Music, with the degree of associate professor / professor, in accordance with the topics of doctoral research may lead, in certain academic years, to the repetitive use of specialists in commissions. Considering the specifics of the Music field, it is found that for the analyzed period (2015-2020) the criterion is met. ??? dodac???**

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.2.** *The ratio between the number of doctoral thesis assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution than the one in which the doctoral thesis is organized and the number of doctoral thesis defended in the same doctoral domain within the doctoral school must not be higher than 0.3, compared to the situation in the last five years*

**The ratio of number of doctoral thesis assigned to a specific scientific referent coming from another higher education institution than the one organizing the defense of the doctoral thesis and the number of doctoral thesis defended in the same domain of doctoral studies in the doctoral school is 0.2**

**Fulfilled**

### **Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

#### **Criterion C.1. Existence and regular development of the internal quality assurance system**

**Standard C.1.1.** Existence of the institutional framework and application of procedures for monitoring internal quality assurance

**Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.** *The doctoral school in which the field of doctoral studies falls is proof of the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal quality assurance, in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at IOSUD level, among the evaluated criteria being obligatorily:*

- a) the scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors;
- b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary for carrying out the research activity;
- c) the regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized;
- d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;

- e) the training program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students;
- f) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling provided to doctoral students.

In the WUT there is a regulation on the initiation, approval, monitoring and periodic evaluation of each study program, and it is applied rigorously and consistently. In the WUT there is, at the level of each faculty, a Commission for Quality Management (CMC), which promotes a culture of quality in the institution and participates in the development of tools for evaluating and ensuring the quality of educational programs and setting quality standards at the faculty level. Complementary to the executive structures, the evaluation and quality assurance activity in the university is also connected to the requirements promoted by the Commission for Evaluation and Quality Assurance (CEAC) whose functioning is in accordance with the requirements of the legislative framework of the field.

### Recommendation

I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement. More generally recommendation should be about the formal policy that needs to be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the Academy is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.

### Fulfilled

**Performance Indicator \*C.1.1.2.** During the doctoral training internship, feedback mechanisms are implemented by doctoral students to identify their needs, as well as their general level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the obtained results, the elaboration and implementation of a plan of measures are considered.

There is the questionnaire for evaluating the activity of the doctoral school by the doctoral student.

### Fulfilled

### Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility to learning resources

**Standard C.2.1.** The information of interest for doctoral students, future candidates, respectively the information of public interest are available for consultation in electronic format.

**Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.** The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:

- a) the regulations of the doctoral school;

- b) the admission regulation;
- c) the doctoral studies contract;
- d) the regulation for completing the studies, which should also include the procedure for public defense of the thesis;
- e) the content of the study programs;
- f) the scientific profile and thematic areas / research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact data;
- g) the list of doctoral students in the field with the basic information (year of registration; supervisor);
- h) information about the standards for the elaboration of the doctoral thesis;
- i) links to the abstracts of the doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense.

The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre, through IOSUD-WUT, publishes on the website of the West University of Timisoara and on the website of the Faculty of Music and Theatre all information of interest for doctoral students, for future candidates and respectively information of public interest, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.

**Fulfilled**

**Standard C.2.2.** IOSUD / Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed to conduct doctoral studies.

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.** All students have free access to a platform with databases relevant to the domain of organized doctoral studies

All doctoral students have free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the fields of doctoral studies organized within data subscribers WUT and the Central University Library "Eugen Todoran" (BCUT).

Is the foreign database regarding music sufficient? I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases: *Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, RILM Abstracts of Music Literature with Full Text, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge, EBSCO, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Companions to Music?*

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.2.** Each doctoral student has access, upon request and with the consent of the doctoral supervisor, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations

Doctoral students can receive access / become holders of an account on *iThenticate* upon request, based on a simple request to the IT service and after verifying their doctoral student status.

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.** All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school, according to internal rules.

The doctoral study contracts stipulate the right of the doctoral students to have access to the libraries within the WUT, respectively to the different research laboratories, depending on the specific domain of doctoral studies.

Fulfilled

**Criterion C.3. Degree of internationalization**

**Standard C.3.1.** There is a strategy and it is applied to increase the degree of internationalization of doctoral studies.

**Performance Indicator \*C.3.1.1.** IOSUD has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies that carry out activities in the studied domain, which aim at the mobility of doctoral students and teachers; at least 35% of doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or another form of mobility, such as participation in international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%.

So far a small number of doctoral students from the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre have completed a training period abroad, benefited from teaching or training mobility through the Erasmus+ program or another form of mobility: 9%. Instead, several doctoral students participated in international scientific conferences: 25%.

I would recommend increasing the number of PhD students benefiting at least from Erasmus+ programme.

Partially fulfilled

**Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.** Within the evaluated domain of studies, this is supported, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.

Up to the present there are no international PhD joint degrees. In the future, there is the objective of inviting first-rate experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.

Partially fulfilled

**Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.** The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported by concrete measure

Internationalization of the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre is supported by concrete measures - such as the inclusion of international experts in the guidance committee or for the public defense of the doctoral thesis.

Partially fulfilled

**IV. SWOT Analysis**

<p><b>Strengths:</b> The thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.</p>	<p><b>Weaknesses:</b> Lack of the formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences</p>
--	--

<p>Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.</p> <p>Extensive and active participation of <b>IOSUD-UNMB</b> in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and its broad artistic and cultural offer.</p>	<p>Lack of the formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives if Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, etc.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.</p> <p>Foreign databases are rather poor.</p> <p>International relations should be augmented.</p>
<p><b>Opportunities:</b></p> <p>Preparation to the challenges pertaining to the Fourth Industrial Revolution.</p> <p>Creating new and updated ways of knowledge transfer.</p>	<p><b>Threats:</b></p> <p>According to the opinions of interlocutors at the meetings – there are not threats at all.</p>

## V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator (*, C)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.</i></p> <p>The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IODS, respectively of the doctoral school, having as reference period the last five years</p>	fulfilled	The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.1.2</i></p> <p>The regulations of the doctoral school include criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art. 17 para. (5) of the Code of doctoral studies, approved by Government Decision no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions</p>	fulfilled	The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.</i></p> <p>Existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic career</p>	fulfilled	The records of doctoral students and their academic background can be found in the WUT's own system, as well as in the systems of the Ministry of National Education <p>I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.</p>
		<i>Performance Indicator A.1.2.2</i>	fulfilled	IOSUD.WUT uses iThenticate as a

	the time of submitting the self-assessment file per domain of doctoral studies or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development grants / human resources per domain of doctoral studies obtained by doctoral supervisors in the domain evaluated in the last 5 years.		also the doctoral students
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.1.3.2.</i> The proportion of doctoral students existing at the time of evaluation who benefit for at least six months from sources of funding other than government funding, through scholarships granted by individuals or legal entities or are financially supported by research or institutional development /human resources grants is at least 20%.	partially fulfilled	In the case of doctoral students in the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC, only a small part benefited from other sources of funding than the governmental ones, the percentage being 14.5%. I would recommend taking into account the possibility of making free recordings, components of the doctoral thesis in professional doctorates. It is also a way of financial support. The same with the use of audio-video equipment, props, computers, chamber music studio, ect.
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.1.3.3.</i> At least 10% of the total amounts related to doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contract and tuition fees collected from doctoral students in the form of paid education are used to settle the training costs of doctoral students.	partially fulfilled	Until now this indicator has not been an obligation but it will be considered in the future.
	<i>Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.</i> The spaces and the material endowment of IOSUD-WUT / doctoral school allow the realization of the research activities, in the evaluated domain, in accordance with the assumed mission and objectives	partially fulfilled	The institution has appropriate resources to support student learning and delivery of the programmes, but in my opinion infrastructure is rather poor.
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1.</i> Within the domain of doctoral studies, at least three doctoral supervisors work and at least 50% of them (but not less than three) meet the minimum standards of CNATDCU in force at the time of the evaluation,	fulfilled	Within IOSUD-WUT in MUSIC field, there are 8 doctoral supervisors, all of them exceed the CNATDCU minimum standards.



	necessary and mandatory for obtaining the certificate of qualification.		
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.2.</i> At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated doctoral field are tenured in the IODS	fulfilled	The doctoral supervisor function in the domain of doctoral studies in Music is performed by 8 professors, among them 5 members of the academic staff. The percentage of holders at WUT is 62.5%
	<i>Performance Indicator A.3.1.3.</i> The subjects of the training program based on advanced university studies related to the domain of doctoral studies are supported by academic staff or researchers, having the status of doctoral supervisor / habilitated professor / senior researcher or associate professor with expertise proven in the subjects taught or other specialists in the domain who meet the standards established by the institution for the didactic and research functions mentioned above, in accordance with the law.	fulfilled	IOSUD-WUT in MUSIC field has sufficiently qualified teaching staff with appropriate qualifications to effectively deliver its PhD programmes.
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.4.</i> The share of doctoral supervisors who coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during their doctoral studies [3 or 4 years], depending on the field of doctoral studies, to which are added the extension periods granted according to art.39, para. (3) of the Code approved by Government Decision no.681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions, does not exceed 20%	fulfilled	None of the doctoral supervisors coordinated more than 8 doctoral students at the same time during the doctoral studies or during the extension period.
	<i>Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.</i> At least 50% of doctoral supervisors in the domain of doctoral studies under evaluation shows at least 5 publications indexed Web of Science or ERIH in journals with impact factor or other achievements, with relevant significance, with	fulfilled	8 of the 8 doctoral supervisors have an internationally visible activity and meet this criterion.

	contributions at international level that reveal a progress in scientific research - development- that reveal a progress in scientific research-development-innovation for the evaluated domain		
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.2.2.</i> At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be scientifically active, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the minimum CNATDCU standards in force at the date of evaluation, necessary and mandatory to obtain the certificate of qualification, based on scientific results from the last five years.	fulfilled	All doctoral supervisors are further active in the scientific and artistic domain and meet the score required by the CNATDCU minimal standards.
	<i>Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1.</i> The ratio between the number of master's degree graduates of other higher education institutions in the country or abroad who have entered the competition for admission to doctoral studies in the last five years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition within the doctoral school is at least 0.2., or the ratio between the number of candidates in the last five years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition in the field of doctoral studies is at least 1.2	fulfilled	Out of 60 doctoral students admitted 29 come from other institutions of higher education from Romania or abroad.
	<i>Performance Indicator *B.1.2.1.</i> <i>Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: the academic, research and professional performance of the candidates, their interest in scientific or artistic research, publications in the field and search topic proposal</i>	fulfilled	Admission to doctoral studies within the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre is organized within the legal framework, based on the national methodologies for organizing these competitions, by adapting them to the needs of the doctoral school for the domain of doctoral studies in MUSIC.
	<i>Performance Indicator B.1.2.2.</i> The expulsion rate of doctoral students, including after	fulfilled	The expulsion rate is 0%, and the rate of withdrawal / abandoning of doctoral students is low - dropout

		dropping out of school, at 3 years after admission does not exceed 30%. At 2 years after admission does not exceed 30%		rate being 8.3%.
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.</i> The training program based on advanced university studies includes at least three disciplines relevant for the training of doctoral students in scientific research, of which at least one discipline is intended for the in-depth study of research methodology and / or statistical data processing.	fulfilled	The curriculum includes at least two components dedicated to some of the transversal competences, including aspects related to research ethics, scientometry and academic writing.
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.</i> There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	fulfilled	Compliance with the research ethics criteria is an essential component of the doctoral education within IOSUD-WUT (for example the discipline <i>Ethics and academic integrity</i> ).
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.3</i> IOSUD-WUT has created mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated domain of doctoral studies aims at learning outcomes, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or by research activities	fulfilled	Though until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes) I recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.4.</i> Throughout the doctoral training period, doctoral students in the field benefit from the counseling /guidance of some functional guidance commissions, aspect reflected by guidance and written feedback or regular meetings.	fulfilled	PhD students benefit from the advice of functional guidance committees, an aspect reflected by written guidance and feedback or regular meetings.
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.5.</i> For a domain of doctoral studies the ratio of graduate students and number of teachers /	fulfilled	The ratio of graduate students and teachers providing guidance is 3:1.

		<i>researchers their providing guidance should not be less than 3: 1</i>		
		<i>Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.</i> For the evaluated domain of doctoral studies, at least one article or another relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained the doctoral degree in the last 5 years is made available to the evaluation commission. The members of the evaluation commission select for analysis, at random, 5 such relevant articles / contributions per domain of doctoral studies. At least 3 of the selected articles present significant original contributions in the domain concerned.	<b>fulfilled</b> <b>??????</b>	Most doctoral students opt for the program of professional doctorate, so that the number of publications is lower than the artistic contributions. However, the presence of ISI-listed items (3) and other contributions to international databases is noteworthy.  <b>I did not receive randomly selected 5 papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.3.1.2.</i> The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last 5 years), including posters, exhibitions, made at prestigious international events (held in the country or abroad) and the number of students PhD students who have completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last five years) is at least equal to 1.	fulfilled	The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period and the number of PhD students is more than 1.
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.3.2.1.</i> The number of doctoral thesis assigned to a particular referent from a higher education institution, other than the IOSUD evaluated, must not exceed 2 doctoral theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor in one year.	fulfilled	The ratio between the doctoral thesis assigned to a certain referent coming from another higher education institution does not exceed two theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor in a year (one exception).
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.3.2.2.</i> The ratio between the number of doctoral thesis assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution than the one in which	fulfilled	The ratio of number of doctoral thesis assigned to a specific scientific referent coming from another higher education institution than the one organizing the defense of the doctoral thesis and the number of

	the doctoral thesis is organized and the number of doctoral thesis defended in the same doctoral domain within the doctoral school must not be higher than 0.3, compared to the situation in the last five years		doctoral thesis defended in the same domain of doctoral studies in the doctoral school is 0.2
	<p><b>Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.</b> The doctoral school in which the field of doctoral studies falls is proof of the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal quality assurance in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at IOSUD level, among the evaluated criteria being mandatory:</p> <p>a) the scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary for carrying out the research activity; c) the regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized; d) the scientific activity of doctoral students; e) the training program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students; f) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling provided to doctoral students.</p>	fulfilled	<p>The institution has a strong internal quality culture, supported by clear and effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.</p> <p>I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement.</p> <p>More generally, I would recommend a formal policy be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the UNMB is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.</p>
	<p><b>Performance Indicator *C.1.1.2</b> During the doctoral training internship, feedback mechanisms are implemented by doctoral students to identify their needs, as well as their general level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the obtained results, the elaboration and implementation of a plan of</p>	partially fulfilled	<p>There is the questionnaire for evaluating the activity of the doctoral school by the doctoral student.</p> <p>I'd recommend introducing visible changes after student's survey.</p>

	measures are considered.		
	<b>Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.</b> IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as: ..... .....	fulfilled	The Doctoral School of Music and Theatre, through IOSUD-WUT, publishes on the website of the West University of Timisoara and on the website of the Faculty of Music and Theatre all information of interest for doctoral students, for future candidates and respectively information of public interest, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.
	<b>Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.</b> All students have free access to a platform with databases relevant to the domain of organized doctoral studies	fulfilled	All doctoral students have free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the fields of doctoral studies organized within data subscribers WUT and the Central University Library "Eugen Todoran" (BCUT).  <i>Is the foreign database regarding music sufficient? I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases</i>
	<b>Performance Indicator C.2.2.2</b> Each doctoral student has access, upon request and with the consent of the doctoral supervisor, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations	fulfilled	Doctoral students can receive access / become holders of an account on <i>iThenticate</i> upon request, based on a simple request to the IT service and after verifying their doctoral student status.
	<b>Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.</b> All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school, according to internal rules.	fulfilled	The doctoral study contracts stipulate the right of the doctoral students to have access to the libraries within the WUT, respectively to the different research laboratories, depending on the specific domain of doctoral studies.
	<b>Performance Indicator C.3.1.1.</b> IOSUD has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies that carry out activities in the studied domain, which aim at the mobility of doctoral students and teachers; at least 35% of doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or another form of	partially fulfilled	So far a small number of doctoral students from the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre have completed a training period abroad, benefited from teaching or training mobility through the Erasmus+ program or another form of mobility: 9%. Instead, several doctoral students participated in international scientific conferences: 25%.  <i>I would recommend increasing the</i>

		mobility, such as participation in international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%.		number of PhD students benefiting at least from Erasmus+ programme.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.</i> Within the evaluated domain of studies, this is supported, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.	partially fulfilled	Up to the present there are no international PhD joint degrees. In the future, there is the objective of inviting first-rate experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.</i> The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported by concrete measure.	partially fulfilled	Internationalization of the Doctoral School of Music and Theatre is supported by concrete measures - such as the inclusion of international experts in the guidance committee or for the public defense of the doctoral thesis. There should be strategy of internationalization, because until now international relations are rather modest.

**Additional question:**

*To meet the challenges of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, universities will need to take specific actions on foresight and planning. Since the precise skills, competences and knowledge needed in the future are uncertain, curricula will need to be frequently revised and updated. Universities will need to be able to adapt rapidly, and to form broad sets of competences.*

*What did IOSUD-WUT do to become more flexible and be adapted to new educational challenges after the Fourth Industrial Revolution?*