

**The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain  
Member of the Evaluation Expert Commission/  
International Evaluator  
Prof. Eleonora Mihaylova Mileva, D.Sc., Ph.D.  
National Sports Academy “Vassil Levski”, Sofia, Bulgaria**

Contents

I. Introduction

II. Methods used

III. Analysis of performance indicators

IV. SWOT Analysis

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

**I. Introduction<sup>1</sup>**

This external evaluation report was drafted for Periodical External Evaluation of the IOSUD/doctoral study domains in Physical Education and Sport at the Babeş-Bolyai University (UBB). The period of the evaluation visit was 2.11.2021 - 5.11.2021.

Babeş-Bolyai University (UBB) operates under the academic autonomy concept, which is defined as specific means of self-management in accordance with the legal framework provided by the Romanian Constitution and by National Education Law No. 1/2011 and other laws such as Government Emergency Ordinance No. 75/2005 regarding the education quality assurance, approved by Law No. 87/2006 with subsequent amendments and in line with internal regulations and decisions (Anexa 1.1.1: Legea de înființare).

According to the Charter, UBB is a “comprehensive university of advanced research and education that undertakes to train young people for the contemporary society and the future.” (UBB Charter, 2014, art. 7, paragraph 1).

Doctoral degree studies are carried out at Babeş-Bolyai University in accordance with the National Education Law no. 1/2011, Law 49/2013, the Code of Doctoral Studies approved by GD 681/2011, the UBB Charter, the UBB Regulation for organising and conducting doctoral studies approved by Senate Decision no. 483/2020 (Anexa 1.1.17), and the regulations of the UBB doctoral schools, as further amended and supplemented.

Doctoral studies are currently being conducted in 31 doctoral schools spanning 32 doctoral areas.

---

<sup>1</sup> Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.



## **II. Methods used**

This chapter will contain the methods and tools used in the external evaluation process, before and during the evaluation visit.

- The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain under review and its

### **Annexes**

The internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain at the Babeş-Bolyai University (UBB) under review is comprehensive and accurately and thoroughly reflects all mandatory criteria and indicators for specific activities.

- The analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD/Doctoral School(s) website, in electronic format

All necessary documents, data and information for the assessment of the doctor's domain are presented. The website of the doctoral school is detailed and informative.

- Visiting the buildings included in the institution's property, comprising (indicative and non-exhaustive list, which shall be changed according to the context)

As a member of the expert evaluation committee, I did not participate in an on-site visit to the institution's property, base, classrooms and facilities.

- Meeting with the contact person for the doctoral study domain under review and the team responsible for the internal evaluation report

The meeting was focused on the main activities of the doctoral school, the conditions of study, the opportunities for scientific activity.

- Meeting/discussions with doctoral students in the doctoral study domain under review

Students from the doctoral school in PE and Sport at UBB from different training courses were present. They had different topics of the PhD thesis. All students expressed their satisfaction with their studies in the doctoral school, giving high evaluation of the supervisors.

- Meeting/Discussions with the graduates of the doctoral study domain under review

A separate online meeting was organized with the graduates of the doctoral school in PE and Sport at UBB. Attendees had graduated in various specialties and work in various fields of physical education and sports. All graduates expressed their positive attitude towards the training and the teachers advisors from the doctoral school. They focused on the relation between the knowledge and skills they acquired and the professional activities.

- Meeting/Discussions with the teaching staff in the doctoral study domain under review

The teaching staff from the doctoral school at UBB focused on the content of the education and the financial provision, the access of the students to laboratories and research activities from the side of UBB, and student participation in research projects and publication in scientific journals.

## **III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators**

### **Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY**

*The UBB has the institutional capacity for education in the doctor's study domain.*

#### **Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources**

*The UBB has all the necessary administrative, management structures and financial support for conducting the training in the doctoral school.*



*Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

*The effective functioning mechanisms are provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies*

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.** *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:*

*(a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;*

The reference framework that regulates the organisation and functioning of the Doctoral School in PE and Sport at UBB consists of laws, Romanian Government decisions, Government emergency ordinances, orders of ministers of education and/or scientific research, the University Charter, its own regulations and Senate decisions.

The regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies at Babeş-Bolyai University (UBB) was last updated in 2021. It is available on the IOSUD website and can be found in the annexes to this file. The updates aim, among other things, at adapting methodologies to the situation generated by the Covid-19 pandemic. The regulations of the Doctoral Schools Physical Education and Sports (SDEFS) were drafted and updated in 2017 in accordance with the UBB Regulation and in compliance with all legal provisions in force at the moment. The regulations are approved by the UBB Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD) and endorsed for legal compliance by the UBB Legal Service. The regulations can be found on the FEFS website, in the doctoral school section Regulament Scoala doctorala EFS actualizat mai 2021.pdf (ubbcluj.ro)

*(b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;*

The methodology for conducting the elections at the level of the Doctoral School Council (CSD) as well as evidence of the conduct of the elections can be found in Anex 1.1.20. (Methodology for organizing elections and appointing members of the board for doctoral studies (CSUD) DE LA I.O.S.U.D. „BABEŞ-BOLYAI” University from Cluj-Napoca and Anex 1.1.21 (Regulation of the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports, Art.10, paa. 4, par. 5).

*c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);*

The regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies at Babeş-Bolyai University is supplemented by a Methodology for the admission of doctoral students and an Annex aimed at online admission during the state of emergency/alert. Provisions regarding the completion of doctoral studies can be found in the General Regulations in a separate section.

*d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;*

At the level of Babeş-Bolyai University, the legislation in force at national level in this field is observed. The specialists who obtained the quality of doctoral supervisor in another country of the European Union, of the European Economic Area or in the Swiss Confederation could automatically acquire the quality of doctoral supervisor in Romania, based on the methodology approved by Order no. 5690/2011 of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sports. Currently, the quality of doctoral supervisor or the qualification obtained in accredited university education institutions from Member



States of the European Union, the European Economic Area, the Swiss Confederation and in prestigious universities in other states provided in the *List of prestigious universities in other states*, approved by order of the Minister of National Education and Scientific Research and updated periodically, it is automatically recognized by the higher education institutions, respectively the institutions organizing doctoral university studies in Romania. The quality of doctoral supervisor or the qualification obtained at other accredited university institutions from abroad than those mentioned above is recognized only on the basis of an international convention of mutual recognition, concluded at intergovernmental or interuniversity level. The legal basis for these recognitions is Order Nr. 5921 from December 6, 2016 for the approval of the Methodology regarding the automatic recognition, by the higher education institutions, respectively the institutions organizing doctoral university studies in Romania, of the quality of doctoral supervisor obtained in accredited university education institutions *from abroad*. This order was issued by the Ministry of National Education and Scientific Research and was published in the Official Gazette no. 1007 of December 15, 2016 (Methodology for admission to doctoral studies at Babeş - Bolyai University, Anex\_1\_3\_43\_hot\_5938\_metodologie\_admitere\_anexe Metodologia de admitere la studiile universitare de doctorat | Institutul de Studii Doctorale (ubbcluj.ro)

- The preparation and development of the public defence of the doctoral thesis (in accordance with the updated Code of doctoral studies) is available on the ISD website (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/pregatirea-si-desfasurarea-sustinerii-publice-a-tezei-de-doctoratin-conformitate-cu-codul-studiilor-universitare-de-doctorat/>)
- EFS doctoral school regulations Art.5. (1) The completion of doctoral studies is done by publicly defending the doctoral thesis. In order to be accepted for public support, a thesis must contain mostly original results (Regulament Scoala doctorala EFS actualizat mai 2021.pdf (ubbcluj.ro)
- Methodologies for completing doctoral studies: Babeş - Bolyai University Regulation for organizing and conducting doctoral studies - Chapter. 9. Elaboration and public defense of the doctoral thesis, Art. 48, Art. 49, Art. 50 – Art. 59 (Annex 1.1.08, Institutul de Studii Doctorale | Universitatea Babeş-Bolyai (ubbcluj.ro)

*e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings;*

The proposed new curricula are subject to the approval of the CSDs, are signed by the directors of the doctoral schools, by the dean and submitted for approval to the UBB management. The curricula are approved in the meeting of the UBB Senate before the beginning of each academic year (Anex A. 3.1.3.). Considering the Decision of the Board of Directors with no. 21,862 of 30 October 2017 on the validation of doctoral school principals the regulations of the doctoral school are elaborated by the Council of the doctoral school by consulting all the titular PhD supervisors in the respective school (Anex 1.1.08.).

*f) the contract for doctoral studies;*

All PhD students sign a doctoral contract. The model of this contract is attached in Anex 1.3.44.1: „*The doctorate is carried out on the basis of a doctoral university contract concluded, through the Institute of Doctoral Studies, between the doctoral student, his PhD supervisor and Babeş-Bolyai University, which establishes the rights and obligations of the parties. Doctoral studies can also be organized in co-supervision, in which case the PhD student from Babeş-Bolyai University carries out his activity under the concomitant guidance of two PhD supervisors. The election of the second supervisor is made after the enrolment of the doctoral student at Babeş-Bolyai University, with the consent of the first PhD supervisor*” (Universitatea Babeş - Bolyai din Cluj-Napoca (ubbcluj.ro).



In Anex appendix \_1\_1\_17\_hot\_483\_2020\_regulament\_doctorat\_ubb also contains the models of additional documents that students will sign in the extension of the initial contract in case they decide to interrupt their doctoral studies or to extend them.

*g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.*

In each academic year, prior to the completion of the curriculum related to advanced university studies, there is a wide discussion between PhD supervisors for the changes at the international level regarding the main topics addressed in sports and physical education sciences at doctoral level.

Each holder of the discipline considers the annual updating of the teaching content by consulting specialized bibliography from the main scientific flow (Anex B. 2.1.3.).

The proposed new curricula are subject to the approval of the CSDs, are signed by the directors of the doctoral schools, by the Dean and submitted for approval to the UBB management. The curricula are approved in the meeting of the UBB Senate before the beginning of each academic year (Anex A. 3.1.3.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.2.*** *The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

The regulations of the doctoral school in PE and Sport at the UBB subject to accreditation, corroborated with the Regulation on the organization and development of doctoral studies at Babeş-Bolyai University, include all the aspects covered by Art. 17 (5) of GD 681/2011.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.*

*The necessary logistical resources have been created for the effective conduct of training in the doctoral school.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.*** *The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.*

The record of doctoral students admitted to the doctoral program is made with the help of electronic platforms. All UBB students, regardless of the educational cycle, are enrolled in RMU. At the UBB level, all students, regardless of the study cycle, can follow their academic path through a platform called Academic Info. Students have access to this platform based on an account and password. At the UBB level, there is the Information and Communications Technology Department that manages this platform and can provide technical assistance to students as needed.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.*** *The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*



CSUD Decision of 3933/08.03./2017, which integrates CSUD Decision 1237/ 29.06 / 2016, details the conditions under which the doctoral students have access to the electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity, before official defense of the doctoral thesis. The softwares used to calculate the similarity ratio are Turnitin and Ithenticate. In order to carry out the process of verifying the degree of similarity, each doctoral student submits an application that is approved by the coordinator and the director of the DS. Additional information in Anti-plagiarism software is used for similarity analysis in IOSUD iThenticate.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard A.1.3. The IOSUD makes sure that financial resources are used optimally, and the revenues obtained from doctoral studies are supplemented through additional funding besides governmental funding.*

*The university relies on additional funds and support to finance doctoral students, outside the state budget.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.*** *Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years. The grants address relevant themes for the respective domain and, as a rule, are engaging doctoral students.*

At the level of the SDEFS doctoral school, starting with 2019, the program for doctoral and postdoctoral students entitled *Cercetător, viitor antreprenor - Noua generație* POCU 123793, was developed, the project manager being Univ.prof. Ioan Hosu, PhD coordinator in the field of sports and physical education sciences at the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports (FEFS).

For the Doctoral School Physical Education and Sports there are currently in implementation a number of 10 doctoral and postdoctoral students who have worked or are working in the Project *Cercetător, viitor antreprenor - Noua generație* POCU 123793. A detailed list of these grants, budget and implementation period can be found in Anex A 1.3.1.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.2.*** *The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional /human resources development grants is not less than 20%.*

The University has policy of stimulating the research activities of doctoral students through scholarships obtained through participation in projects. At the level of doctoral schools subject to accreditation in the period 2016-present the proportion of doctoral students receiving other funding than doctoral grants per doctoral school is 38,88% (Anex A.1.3.2.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***





**Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.3.<sup>2</sup>** *At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).*

At the level of doctoral schools corresponding to the field of sports and physical education sciences there are several types of expenses that cover this field of training of doctoral students. The university constantly stimulates the participation of doctoral students in scientific conferences and congresses by paying their participation fee, by including them in the development of joint articles and free publication in the specialized scientific journal and other similar activities.

Thus, during the evaluation period there are expenses with the doctoral students' conference, a large event with a large international participation, which is included as a separate event in the international conference PR Trend, Media Culture Days, Workshops specially organized for doctoral students. In addition to the organizational expenses, there are expenses related to these events with the travel and accommodation of foreign teachers. The professional training of doctoral students involves at the level of the accredited doctoral school also publishing expenses. PhD students publish in STUDIA EDUCATIO ARTIS GYMNASITICAE and in the collective volumes of the international conferences in which he participates. The budget in the Physical Education and Sports field and a detailed list of expenses can be found in the Anexes (Anex\_1\_2\_3\_buget\_de\_venituri\_si\_cheltuieli\_2020 and Anex A.1.3.3.).

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure**

*UBB has created and provided the necessary infrastructure for conducting scientific activities.*

*Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.*

*The university is constantly improving the infrastructure created to support doctoral students in conducting scientific research.*

**Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.** *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

The teaching and research activities of the university doctoral programme take place in educational areas found in its own patrimony - classrooms, amphitheatres, fields and gyms, seminar rooms, laboratories, as well as an Interdisciplinary research center which are properly equipped with

---

<sup>2</sup> The indicators marked with an asterisk (\*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral studies domains, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation. In case they are not met, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.



computer technology, multimedia systems (Anex 2.1.1.). The Doctoral School can request access to all laboratories and equipment of the faculties and research centres of Babeş-Bolyai University (Anex\_1\_2\_1\_centralizator\_spatii\_pe\_cladiri\_ubb\_2021).

The doctoral school has signed collaboration agreements with the Research Centre for Human Performance of the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports in Pitești, with the Polytechnic Institute of Bucharest, with the National Research Institute for Sports in Bucharest, with the Technical University of Cluj-Napoca

The scientific documentation and library services made available to students of doctoral programs (both in English and in Romanian) are at high standards. At the UBB level, the services of the Central University Library "Lucian Blaga" from Cluj-Napoca are used. Thus, within the university there are over 32 branch libraries of the Central University Library "Lucian Blaga" and 8 libraries of university extensions. The library has learning resources in classical or electronic format. There is currently a total fund of 3.927.795 printed volumes, 13481 audiovisual and multimedia documents, and 2245927 electronic bibliographic units. Out of these 38130 are books and 36452 are periodicals (see report CULT UBB 2020).

The library also has access to 86 databases, of which 23 are accessible online, of which JSTOR, A to Z - Resurse electronice în BCU, EBSCO, SpringerLink, Emerald, ProQuest, Cambridge, ScienceDirect, Wiley Online Library, ADT (Arcanum Digitalis Tudománytár), EISZ (Elektronikus Információszolgáltatás), LEX Baza legislativă, Refinitiv (Thomson Reuters) Eikon, Euromonitor International Passport, Statista, Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, covers the areas of interest of doctoral students of the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports. Subscribed databases can be consulted both from the buildings of Babeş-Bolyai University and remotely, based on the library permit for the current academic year.

Regarding access to computers, the branch libraries have 146 computers, of which 86 are provided by the University.

Within the branch, doctoral students have access to a library equipped with some of the most relevant and current publications in the field of sports and physical education sciences.

The library within the faculty is a branch of the Central University Library and has a total fund of 8,698 publications (8,048 books, titular journals 51, 449 magazines, audio-video materials 41, manuals 160). The publications are arranged by domains and are registered in the online catalogue of the BCU. At the same time, the library within the faculty ensures a sufficient number of subscriptions to Romanian and foreign printed periodicals, corresponding to the assumed mission:

The library is equipped with a reading room with a capacity of 28 seats and 2 computers connected to the internet. Library users also benefit from an internet connection and the FEFS WIFI network. The own book fund from the Romanian and foreign specialized literature exists in a sufficient number of copies to fully cover the disciplines from the curricula and of which at least 50% represent book titles or specialized courses for the fields subject to evaluation, a large part of them having appeared in the last 10 years in recognized publishing houses.

In addition to the databases of books and electronic journals made available on the BCU website, students enrolled in doctoral programs subject to evaluation have access through the ANELIS PLUS project to databases Science Direct Journals, SpringerLink Journals, Wiley Journals, IOP, AIP, APS, ACS, MatSciNet, IEEE/IEL, Emerald, SAGE HSS, CAB Abstracts cu fulltext, CABI Forest, CABI VetMed, Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, SciFinder ProQuest Central, Cambridge Journals, Nature,





and to the National warehouse (<https://portal.anelisplus.ro/content/depozite-institutionale-si-relatia-cu-depozitul-national>).

Starting with April 2020, the Central University Library has started a project to digitize course bibliographies, a project in which the FEFS Library is also involved and which is in progress. On the BCU platform *Bibliography of courses by faculties and fields of specialization* were loaded 28866 documents, of which 8698 related to the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

### **Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources**

*The doctoral school has competent and qualified teachers staff who provide the educational process.*

*Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.*

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.1.*** *Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.*

At the level of sports and physical education sciences doctoral field, within SDEFS, 6 PhD supervisors in the field of physical education and sports sciences carry out their activity, all of them being qualified in this field.

Of the 6 PhD supervisors, 3 meet the minimum qualification standards related to the Commission 28, in force at the moment, so more than 50% of the total supervisors. The scores contained in the individual sheets for verifying compliance with the standards (Anex A.3.1.1. and CV).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.2.*** *At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

All the leaders in the evaluated doctoral field are holders within IOSUD UBB (Anex A.3.1.2.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.3.*** *The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.*

At the Doctoral School Physical Education and Sports from the 6 teachers in the field of sports and physical education sciences 5 support disciplines from the training program based on advanced university studies in the field of sport and physical education sciences and are university professors and



lecturers, doctoral / qualified leaders. From the documents is clear that everyone teacher has expertise in the field in which they take the courses. There are as proving the curricula from 2016-2020, the files of the disciplines assumed by the incumbents as well as the schedules that certify the holding of the courses and seminars (Anex A.3.1.3.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.4.*** *The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs<sup>3</sup> does not exceed 20%.*

None of the 6 doctoral coordinators related to the field of sport and physical education sciences coordinates more than 8 PhD students in internship and 12 in the grace period and/or extension. This is certified by Anex B.2.1.4. from the period 2016-2020.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Standard A.3.2.*** *The Doctoral advisors within the domain are carrying out a scientific activity visible at international level.*

*All doctoral advisors are very active at international level.*

***Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.*** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.*

In the field of Sports Science and Physical Education over 50% of PhD supervisors have at least 5 publications indexed WoS or ERIH in journals with impact factors or other achievements with relevant significance in the field subject to accreditation. All articles are published in peer-reviewed and open access scientific journals in world-renowned databases (Web of Science, Scopus, ERIH Plus, Index Copernicus, and others). All doctoral advisors have published articles in indexed journals (Anex A.3.1.1., CV of the supervisors, Anex A.3.2.1.). Doctoral advisors participate in lectureships within the international projects in which they are involved.

---

<sup>3</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

**Performance Indicator \*A.3.2.2.** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

All doctoral coordinators within the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports have had a significant scientific activity in the last 5 years, so a number of 6 out of 6 have a score higher than 37.5 points, so they have accumulated more than 25% of the minimum score in the period 2016-2020. At the level of the School representing 25% of the minimum score according to the habilitation standards in force.

At the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports, among the 6 PhD supervisors in the field of Sports and Physical Education Sciences 2 have a score higher than 37.5 points, respectively they have over 25% of the minimum score accumulated in the period 2016-2020. (Anex A.3.2.2.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## **Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS**

*The UBB has a well-developed educational structure and content that corresponds to modern trends in education.*

### **Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest**

*Standard B.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or a number of candidates exceeding the number of seats available.*

*The university is an attractive educational institution for candidates who have graduated from other universities.*

**Performance Indicator \*B.1.1.1.** *The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.*

The ratio between the number of master's degree graduates of other higher education institutions in the country and abroad, who have entered the competition for admission to doctoral studies in the last 5 years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition within the doctoral schools subject to accreditation and which have registered for the competition for admission to doctoral studies in the last five is at least 0.2.

The ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2 - the doctoral school has 2,89.

*Recommendations:*



***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard B.1.2 Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.*

*Candidates who apply to the doctoral school of the university demonstrate good academic and scientific achievements in the professional field.*

***Performance Indicator \*B.1.2.1.*** *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

A. Evaluation criteria:

Test a) Specialized written test: The evaluation will be done by grading with marks from 1 to 10;



Test b) Interview: The evaluation of the candidates will be done by grading with marks from 1 to 10. The scientific and research concerns of the candidate (50%) and the quality of the topic proposed for the doctoral thesis (50%) will count in the assessment.

The final grade is the arithmetic mean of the grades from the two tests

B. Selection criteria:

1. The selection will be made in descending order of the average of the marks obtained in the two tests.
2. In the situation where it is not possible to make the distinction based on this criterion, the candidate with the highest grade in test b) interview, has the priority.
3. In case of equality, the candidate with a bachelor's and master's degree in the same doctoral field or its equivalent has the priority.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.1.2.2.*** *The expelling rate, including renouncement/dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4, years after admission<sup>4</sup> does not exceed 30%.*

For the period 2016-2019 the following dropout rates was seen: 2016 – 0.00%, 2017 – 11.00%, 2018 – 20 % and 2019 – 0.00% (Anex B.1.2.1). The fulfillment of the standard can be observed, the percentage being well below 30%.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## **Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs**

*Students are trained in quality educational programs that reflect the development of sports science.*

*Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.*

*The curricula are aimed at developing research skills and ethical behavior in the scientific field.*

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.*** *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

The training program for accredited doctoral schools contains 6 + 1 (optional) subjects, 4 in the first semester and 2 + 1 (optional) in the 2nd semester, for the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports (Anex B.2.1.1.). The curriculum of the doctoral school includes 4 compulsory subjects, relevant for scientific research in the field of sports science and physical education, the discipline "Techniques for studying human movement" includes research and statistical processing techniques, available for consultation on the website (ubbcluj.ro).

The thematic disciplines mentioned above are essential for the scientific research of PhD students in the field of sports and physical education sciences. There is, as required by the ARACIS standards in force, a discipline for the in-depth study of research methods.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

---

<sup>4</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.** *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

Within SDEFS it was decided to include in the course “Study Techniques of Movement” a distinct section on academic ethics (Anex B. 2.1.2 *Discipline Ethics and academic integrity*) (electronic annex on the website for indicator B.2.1.2). There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a discipline taught in the doctoral program. As it results from the "Discipline sheet" related to this course, sub-topics are addressed, such as plagiarism, correct citation and avoidance of information collage technique, rules of ethics when research, are co-authored, presentation of regulations in force concerning them directly on doctoral students, examples of good practice from international universities in this field.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.3.** *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities<sup>5</sup>.*

For each subject in the curriculum, a discipline sheet (Anex B.2.1.3) is drawn up, in a standardized format, in which the scientific and transversal competencies that the doctoral student acquires at the moment of completing the course are obligatorily registered. The competencies and skills are defined in terms of learning outcomes for each course. Each head of the discipline considers at the time of writing the learning outcomes that must be acquired by PhD students.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.4.** *All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counselling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting.*

Throughout the doctoral studies, the student benefits from the support of a guidance committee.

Each doctoral student has appointed a steering committee that includes teachers with experience in the topic approached by the student. At the end of the first year of doctoral studies, each doctoral student supports in front of the guidance commission a research project, through which he finalizes his research theme and design, in the light of the disciplines covered during the first year. At the end of the second and the third study year students submit to the guidance committee research reports that highlights the progress made. The guidance commission draws up a report in which observations and recommendations are included regarding the approached topic and the student's

---

<sup>5</sup> Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology of 17 March 2017 regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.





progress. All members of the commission shall sign the minutes. The list of guidance committees for each student is available (Anex B.2.1.4.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.5.*** For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.

The ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teachers/researchers who provide guidance for students in the SDEFS doctoral school, the criterion is met. The number of teachers is 16 and the number of students is 18 or the ratio is 1.125 (Anex B.3.2.1).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

### **Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation.**

*The results of the doctoral study are visible and there are clear procedures for their evaluation.*

*Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.*

*The results of the research of the doctoral students are presented at scientific conferences and projects, published in scientific journals.*

***Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.*** For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.

In the field of Sports Science and Physical Education in the period 2016-2020 31 of the 33 doctoral students who defended the thesis have scientific contributions in the form of articles, chapters in collective volumes, and volumes by a single author. The articles are dedicated to current topics in the field of sports science. Many articles are published in peer-reviewed and open access scientific journals in world-renowned databases (Web of Science, Scopus, ERIH Plus, Index Copernicus, and others). Some of the articles are published in a scientific journals with a relatively high impact factor and citation index. The publications meet all contemporary criteria as methodology, data analysis, scientific results and others.

For all students who obtained the title of doctor in the period 2016-2020 a complete list of publications can be found (Anex B.3.2.2.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*B.3.1.2.*** The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.



In the field of Sports Science and Physical Education in the period 2016-2020 30 of the 33 doctoral students who defended the thesis participated in at least one presentation at a prestigious international scientific event in the country or abroad. Therefore the standard is met (Anex B. 3.1.2 the list of presentations of doctoral students who obtained the title of doctor in the period 2016-2020). The activity of participating in conferences continued even after the completion of the doctoral program.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard B.3.2. The Doctoral School engages a significant number of external scientific specialists in the commissions for public defense of doctoral theses in the analyzed domain.*

*The Doctoral School relies on a sufficient number of external scientific specialists in the commission for public defence of doctoral theses.*

***Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.1. The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.***

The composition of the commissions for the defence of doctoral theses can be found in Anex B. 3.2.1. No doctoral supervisor had nominated the same referent to the support committees more than twice in the same year.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.2. The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defense on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analyzed.***

No scientific reviewer was invited to be part of the commissions for the defence of doctoral theses in the last 5 years in more than 30% of the commissions. Therefore, the criterion is met (Anex B 3.1.2).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## **Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

### **Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system**

*Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.*

*Clear and transparent procedures and policies for educational quality management have been established.*

***Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance***



following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:

Article 67 of the UBB Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies refers to the evaluation and internal monitoring of doctoral schools. According to al. 3, the internal evaluation procedures on the quality of a doctoral university study program are elaborated by CSUD and they follow: a) the mission and objectives of the doctoral study program; b) the content and curriculum of the doctoral study program; c) compatibility of the doctoral university study program with the description of the qualification registered in RNCIS; d) the results of the research undertaken by the doctoral students and their doctoral supervisors, materialized through publications, patents, participation in scientific events; e) presentation on the Internet of the results of the research activity of doctoral students f) cooperation relations with other institutions; g) specific requirements of the different teaching methods and forms of development; h) the existence of the means of documentation, learning and research, as well as of the logistics that the doctoral students benefit of; i) the staff involved in the development of the doctoral university study program; j) ways to assess the knowledge and test the skills of PhD students, as well as to monitor progress during training; k) the degree of involvement of doctoral students in ensuring the quality of the doctoral university study program; l) the existence of a code of ethics with clear provisions on the definition and sanctioning of various academic and professional frauds, including plagiarism; m) fulfilling the specific requirements of the external evaluation indicators of the doctoral university study programs. These documents are provided by the doctoral schools and the doctoral supervisors, respectively.

At the UBB level, there is an elaborated procedure approved by HCA no. 1639/4 Feb 2019 (which must be updated according to OM 3200/2020). Also, in 2021 at the UBB level, new criteria for allocating places to doctoral schools were developed, included in HCA 1633/18.02.2021. (Anex C.1.1.1., Anex 1.3.10.).

Students are fully provided with various social and academic services such as participation in scientific conferences and seminars, consulting, etc. Students have access to all available administrative services of the university.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator \*C.1.1.2. Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.***

At the UBB level, for all cycles and forms of education, a system of teacher evaluation by students is used. Students evaluate the quality of the course, the teacher's performance and can offer suggestions and recommendations. The evaluation is anonymous and is done through the platform Academic Info (Anex C.1.1.2.).

In addition to this method, at the level of the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports there are also mechanisms through which feedback can be collected from doctoral students:

- The red button, a mechanism for signalling deficiencies in the academic or administrative process.



- The evaluation of the courses by the students, performed by each teacher, in addition to the Academic Info.

- Annually, during the workshop dedicated to doctoral students, the director of the doctoral school discusses with them in 1-2 h section.

The evaluation of the teachers' activity is performed.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## **Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources**

*Full transparency of information and access to learning resources is ensured.*

*Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.*

*All necessary public information for access to the doctoral school and for the doctoral students is published online.*

**Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.** *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

Information of public interest for doctoral students and potential candidates, respectively, can be found both on the IOSUD website within the UBB (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/despre-institutul-de-studii-doctorale/>), as well as in a special section of the FEFS website dedicated to doctoral schools (UBB – Educatie Fizica si Sport – Cluj – Napoca ([ubbcluj.ro](http://ubbcluj.ro)), section *Specializations* from the main page). Moreover, in the case of Doctoral Schools, the Items requested in the performance indicator C.2.1.1. can be found and are available at the following addresses:

a) Regulations of doctoral schools (Regulament Scoala doctorala EFS actualizat mai 2021.pdf) ([ubbcluj.ro](http://ubbcluj.ro))

b) Admission regulations - UBB methodology (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/metodologia-de-admitere-la-studiile-universitare-de-doctorat/>); and other admission information (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/date-importante/>)

c) The doctoral studies contract (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/desfasurarea-studiilor-de-doctorat/>)

d) Regulation for completing studies: UBB Regulation (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/desfasurarea-studiilor-de-doctorat/>); other information about completing doctoral studies (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/sustinerea-publica-a-tezelor/>)

e) The content of the study programs (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/scolile-doctorale/>)

f) The scientific profile of the leaders and the doctoral topics ([https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/conducatori-de-doctorat/PROFILUL\\_STIINTIFIC\\_AL\\_CONDUC\\_DE\\_DOCTORAT\\_EFS.pdf](https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/conducatori-de-doctorat/PROFILUL_STIINTIFIC_AL_CONDUC_DE_DOCTORAT_EFS.pdf)) ([ubbcluj.ro](http://ubbcluj.ro))

g) List of doctoral students (Anex\_1\_3\_47\_academicinfo\_evidenta\_doctoranzilor\_in\_baza\_de\_date)

h) Information about the elaboration of the thesis (Ghid-redactare-teza-doctorat-EFS-Cluj-Napoca-2018.pdf) ([ubbcluj.ro](http://ubbcluj.ro))



i) Links to the abstracts of the doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/sustinerile-publice-ale-tezelor-de-doctorat/arhiva/>).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

*Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.*

*The doctoral school provides access to all necessary resources for conducting the training.*

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.***

Through BCU, PhD students have access to 86 databases, of which 23 are accessible online, of which JSTOR, A to Z - Resurse electronice în BCU, EBSCO, SpringerLink, Emerald, ProQuest, Cambridge, ScienceDirect, Wiley Online Library, ADT (Arcanum Digitalis Tudománytár), EISZ (Elektronikus Információszolgáltatás), LEX Legislative basis, Refinitiv (Thomson Reuters) Eikon, Euromonitor International Passport, Statista, Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, cover the fields of interest of doctoral students of the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports. The subscribed databases can be consulted both from the buildings of Babeş-Bolyai University, and remotely, based on the library permit for the current academic year.

In addition to the databases of books and electronic journals, students have access through the ANELIS PLUS project (project implemented at national level by the Association of Universities, Research-Development Institutes and Central University Libraries in Romania - ANELIS PLUS and co-financed by POC 2014-2020 <http://www.anelisplus.ro/>), both to databases Science Direct Journals, SpringerLink Journals, Wiley Journals, IOP, AIP, APS, ACS, MatSciNet, IEEE/IEL, Emerald, SAGE HSS, CAB Abstracts cu fulltext, CABI Forest, CABiVetMed, Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, SciFinder ProQuest Central, Cambridge Journals, Nature, as well as to the National warehouse (<https://portal.anelisplus.ro/content/depozite-institutionale-si-relatia-cu-depozitul-national>).

Starting with April 2020, the Central University Library has started a project to digitize course bibliographies, a project in which the FEFS Library is also involved and which is in progress. On the BCU platform *Bibliography courses by faculties and fields of specialization* <https://public-view.bcuculuj.ro/> 28866 documents were uploaded, of which 1630 related to the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports (Anex C.2.2.1.).

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.***

The CSUD Decision of 3933 / 08.03 / 2017, which integrates CSUD Decision 1237 / 29.06 / 2016, details the conditions under which the doctoral student has access to the electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity, before defending the thesis before the guidance committee. The CSUD decision from 2017 (Anexa\_1\_2\_16\_1, <https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Completare-12327.pdf>). At the request of doctoral students, with the approval of the doctoral supervisor, the Doctoral School may at any time request access to the electronic system



for verifying the degree of similarity iThenticate. For the public defence of the doctoral thesis, the verification is mandatory.

Babes-Bolyai University recently acquired a license to use Turnitin Feedback Studio, a documents management platform with anti-plagiarism detection capability, as part of the institutional development project "Strategic infrastructure at Babes-Bolyai University in the context of new and emerging technology development 2018-2020", in order to offer the university academic community a new tool that can be used in the education process. The CSUD Decision of 3933 / 08.03 / 2017, which integrates CSUD Decision 1237/29.06./2016, details the conditions under which the doctoral student has access to the electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity, before defending the thesis before the guidance committee (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Completare-12327.pdf>).

The software used to calculate the similarity ratio is Ithenticate.

The similarity report is uploaded for each thesis defended on the national platform available at <https://rei.gov.ro/>

Moreover, Turnitin is also integrated in the Moodle e-learning platform used at FEFS level, where doctoral supervisors can give access to doctoral students to scan their own papers/texts to verify the similarity.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.*** *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

PhD students have access at UBB level to a relevant research infrastructure, which is sufficient to ensure their training needs. Students have access to the general infrastructure of UBB, which is summarized in Anex C.2.2.3. Doctoral students also have access to the FEFS infrastructure which is summarized in the same annex.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

### **Criterion C.3. Internationalization**

*Standard C.3.1. There is a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.*

*A strategy for improving the internationalization process of the doctoral school has been adopted and is being implemented.*

At the UBB level, there is a strategy for internationalization adopted in 2021 (Anex C.3.1.1. and Anex 3.1.1.). Protocol de colaborare which explicitly targets doctoral studies is done. At the level of the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports Sciences, in the strategic plans for the periods 2016-2020 and 2020-2024, there is a specific objective dedicated to the internationalization and attraction of international students, especially from non-EU countries.

For the 2020, in the conditions of choosing a new managerial team at the level of UBB, which launched the strategic concept of *world class university*, each faculty developed a faculty project integrated in this concept. At FEFS, doctoral studies and their internationalization are considered as priority strategic areas (Anex C. 3.1.3.).





**Performance Indicator \*C.3.1.1.** *IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

There are several categories of agreements concluded with foreign universities that also target doctoral students:

1. General MOU (Memorandum of Understanding), targeting a wide range of activities, including the mobility of PhD students
2. Interuniversity agreements in the field of sports and physical education sciences
3. Erasmus + agreements, which also include the doctoral cycle.

As part of internationalization efforts, the departments of which the PhD coordinators in the field of sports and physical education sciences are part of, are institutional and individual members in numerous professional networks, e.g. ECREA, International Communication Association (ICA), American Academy of Advertising (AAA) and the European Academy of Advertising (EAA). These networks give doctoral students access to resources and research activities that are addressed to all members.

The mobility of doctoral students may also take the form of participation in international conferences or other similar scientific events (Anex C.3.1.1.).

2 Erasmus students from Spain and 2 foreign students from Italy and Israel studied at the Doctoral School during the evaluation period.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is partially fulfilled.***

**Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.** *In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

The FEFS Faculty within Babes - Bolyai University Cluj - Napoca, is part of the *Consortium* together with the "A. I. Cuza" University from Iași and "Universitatea de Vest" from Timișoara. In this Consortium, an International Conference is organized every year at each of the 3 partner Universities, starting 2004, dealing with themes from Sport Science.

In recent years, the FEFS Doctoral School is organizing an extensive workshop dedicated to doctoral students during this conference. In this workshop are invited every year professors from foreign universities who give lectures and work individually with PhD students. Some activities aim at the formation of transversal competences (scientific writing, critical thinking, research methods) and others aim at different thematic areas that cover the doctoral topics of doctoral students.

In addition to the lectures at the annual workshop, there is a wide range of presentations given by international experts during the academic year, which are also open to doctoral students (Anex C.3.1.2.).



Doctoral students in the field of sports science and physical education can also participate in lectures organized at the UBB level within the UBB Star Institute.

7 invited professors from Greece, Italy, Spain and France gave lectures to the doctoral students in the Doctoral School of Physical Education and Sports.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.*** *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees, etc.).*

The University as well as the faculties that host the doctoral schools, participate in educational fairs where marketing activities are carried out regarding the doctoral programs. FEFS and the doctoral school subject to accreditation are extremely active in this field. In addition to effective participation in fairs, there are also activities aimed at discussions and negotiations with international recruiters, mostly from the EU and outside the EU, especially Israel.

There are also efforts made to include foreign referrers in the commissions for the defense of doctoral theses (Anex C.3.1.3., Anex C.3.1.3.).

The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies was supported by IOSUD by the participation of the employees of the institute in activities for the promotion of the doctoral programs offered by IOSUD UBB, within the ERASMUS+ mobilities: International Staff Exchange week, Ljubljana, Slovenia 2017 and 1st International Staff Week 4th-8th June 2018, Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński University in Warsaw, Poland. Leaflets and brochures containing information about doctoral programs were presented at the educational fairs.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

#### **IV. SWOT Analysis**

<b>Strengths:</b>	<b>Weaknesses</b>
<p>The existence of a trained and competent teaching staff</p> <p>Collaboration relations with personalities from the European academic environment</p> <p>Encouraging doctoral students to apply for research mobility abroad, facilitation by doctoral coordinators of contacts with foreign professors</p> <p>Material, didactic and performance research base</p> <p>Sufficient number of computer rooms and research laboratories</p> <p>Availability of a significant updated bibliographic fund</p> <p>Access to prestigious international databases</p> <p>Possibility of research and education internships in foreign universities</p>	<p>Difficulties in selecting future PhD students in the sense that interest in scientific research is low</p> <p>Small number of Erasmus mobility for students</p>

Close collaborations with universities in the country	
<p><b>Opportunities:</b>          The realization of more applied research in the doctoral works          Strengthening the interest of employers and creative companies in scientific researches in the field of physical education and sports          Attracting more foreign students and students from other universities in Romania          Creation of new joint educational programmes and collaboration with similar European universities</p>	<p><b>Threats:</b>          Competition from similar universities and faculties          Increasing the requirements of employers and insufficient satisfaction of their needs          Reducing the number of graduates in the coming years.          Declining interest in scientific research</p>

#### V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

Crt No.	Indicator type (*, IPC)	Performance indicator	Ratings	Recommendations
A.1.1.1.		The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD	Positive evaluation	
A.1.1.2.		The Regulation of the School for Doctoral studies includes criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art. 17, paragraph 5, from the Code of doctoral studies, approved by HG 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions	Positive evaluation	
A.1.2.1.		The existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic background.	Positive evaluation	
A.1.2.2.		The existence and use of a computer program and proves of its usage in order to check all the doctoral theses percentage of	Positive evaluation	

		similarity		
A.1.3.1.		The existence of at least one research or institutional development / human resources grant in implementation at the time of submitting the self-assessment file, per field of doctoral studies or the existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grants per field of doctoral studies obtained by doctoral supervisors in the evaluated field in the last 5 years.	Positive evaluation	
A.1.3.2.	*	The proportion of doctoral students existing at the time of assessment, who benefit for a minimum of six months from sources other than government funding, through scholarships granted by individuals or legal entities or are financially supported by research or institutional development / human resources grants, is not less than 20%.	Positive evaluation	
A.1.3.3.	*	At least 10% of the total amounts related to the doctoral grants obtained by the university through the institutional contract and tuition fees collected from doctoral students are used to reimburse the training expenses of doctoral students (participation in conferences, summer schools, internships abroad, publication of specialized articles or other specific forms of dissemination, etc.).	Positive evaluation	
A.2.1.1.	IPC	The spaces and material endowment of IOSUD/The Schools for Doctoral studies allow	Positive evaluation	

		<p>the research activities to be carried out, in the evaluated field, in accordance with the mission and objectives assumed (computers, specific software, installations, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases, etc). The research infrastructure and the research service offer are publicly presented through a profile platform. The research infrastructure described above, acquired and developed in the last 5 years, will be highlighted separately.</p>		
A.3.1.1.	IPC	<p>Within the doctoral field, at least three doctoral supervisors carry out their activity and at least 50% of them (but not less than three) meet the minimum CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the habilitation certificate.</p>	Positive evaluation	
A.3.1.2.	IPC	<p>At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated doctoral field are postholders within IOSUD, hired based on an unfixed-term contract. The status of holder within the IOSUD analyzed means that doctoral supervisor who has a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period in the IOSUD' coordinating higher education institution or in one of the component institutions of the consortium that forms IOSUD or the partnerships concluded under the conditions of art. 6 of GD no. 681/2011, with subsequent</p>	Positive evaluation	

		amendments and completions.		
A.3.1.3.		The courses of the program based on advanced university studies related to the field are held by professors or researchers who have the title of doctoral/habilitated supervisor, professor/CS I or associate professor/CS II with proven expertise in the field of the taught courses or other specialists in field that meet the standards established by the institution for the aforementioned teaching and research positions, under the law.	Positive evaluation	
A.3.1.4.	*	The share of doctoral supervisors who sumiltaneously supervise at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, during their doctoral studies 3 or 4 years, depending on the field, to which are added the extension periods granted according to art. 39, para. (3) of GD no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions), does not exceed 20%.	Positive evaluation	
A.3.2.1.		At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the field, subject to evaluation, present at least 5 publications indexed Web of Science or ERIH in journals with impact factor or other achievements, with significant relevance to the related field, in which there are international contributions that reveal a progress in scientific research-development-innovation for the evaluated field. The mentioned doctoral supervisors have had international visibility in the last	Positive evaluation	



		<p>five years, consisting in: membership in the scientific committees of the international publications and conferences; membership in the boards of international professional associations; as guest at conferences or groups of experts held abroad or as a member of committees for the presentation of doctoral theses at foreign universities or in joint supervision with a foreign university. For the fields of science: Arts and Sports and Physical Education Science, the doctoral supervisors will prove the international visibility in the last five years by being a member of the boards of international professional associations, by being a member of the organizing committees of artistic events and international competitions, respectively by membership in juries or arbitration teams in artistic events or international competitions.</p>		
A.3.2.2.	*	<p>At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be scientifically active, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the CNATDCU minimum standards in force at the time of evaluation, necessary and mandatory to obtain the habilitation certificate, based on scientific results in the last five years.</p>	Positive evaluation	
B.1.1.1.	*	<p>The ratio between the number of master graduates of other national and international higher</p>	Positive evaluation	

		education institutions who registered for admission to doctoral studies in the last five years and the number of seats financed by the state budget put up for competition within the school for doctoral studies is at least 0.2		
B.1.2.1.	*	The dropout rate of doctoral students 2 years after admission does not exceed 30%.	Positive evaluation	
B.2.1.1.		The training program based on advanced university studies comprises at least three relevant courses for preparing the doctoral students in scientific research, among which at least one course is intended for the in-depth study of the research methodology and / or statistical data processing.	Positive evaluation	
B.2.1.2.		There is at least one course dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a course taught in the doctoral program	Positive evaluation	
B.2.1.3.		IOSUD has created mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated field, focus on "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should achieve after completing each course or by research activities	Positive evaluation	
B.2.1.4.		Throughout the doctoral stage, doctoral students in the field benefit from the advice / guidance of functional supervision committee, aspect reflected by	Positive evaluation	

		guidance and written feedback or regular meetings.		
B.2.1.5.	IPC	For a field of doctoral studies the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of professors / researchers who supervise should not exceed 3:1.	Positive evaluation	
B.3.1.1.	IPC	For the evaluated field, at least one article or another relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained the doctoral degree in the last 5 years is made available to the evaluation committee. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission select for analysis, randomly, 5 such relevant articles / contributions per field of doctoral studies. Articles, thus selected and analyzed, will receive a rating on the original contribution to the development of the field, on a scale of 1 to 5. At least three articles must reach the threshold of 3.	Positive evaluation	
B.3.1.2.	*	The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last 5 years), including posters, exhibitions, made at prestigious international events (held in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period (last five years) is at least equal to 1.	Positive evaluation	
B.3.2.1.	*	The number of doctoral theses assigned to a particular referent from a higher education institution,	Positive evaluation	

		other than the evaluated IOSUD, must not exceed two (2) for theses coordinated by the same doctoral supervisor, in a year.		
B.3.2.2.	*	The ratio between the number of doctoral theses assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution than the one in which the doctoral thesis is organized and the number of doctoral theses defended in the same doctoral field within the doctoral school must not be higher than 0.3, compared to the situation recorded in the last five years. Only those doctoral fields in which at least ten doctoral theses have been defended in the last five years are analyzed.	Positive evaluation	
C.1.1.1.		The School for Doctoral Studies in which the field of doctoral studies falls proves the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal quality assurance in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at IOSUD level, among the evaluated criteria being mandatory:  (a) the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors;  (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;  (c) the procedures and subsequent norms on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized;  (d) the scientific activity of the	Positive evaluation	

		<p>doctoral students;</p> <p>(e) training program based on advanced university studies of the doctoral students.</p>		
C.1.1.2.	*	<p>During the doctoral training, feedback mechanisms from the doctoral students are implemented by which their needs are identified, as well as their general level of satisfaction towards the doctoral program, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes.</p>	Positive evaluation	
C.2.1.1.		<p>IOSUD, publishes on the organising institution's website, in compliance with the general regulations of data protection, information such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) school for doctoral studies regulation;</li> <li>b) admission regulation;</li> <li>c) doctoral studies contract;</li> <li>d) the regulation for completing studies which also includes the procedure for publicly presenting the thesis;</li> <li>e) the study programs' content;</li> <li>f) the scientific profile and thematic areas/ research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact details;</li> <li>g) the list of doctoral students in the field with basic information (year of enrollment, doctoral supervisor);</li> <li>h) information regarding the drafting standards of the doctoral thesis;</li> <li>i) links to abstracts of the doctoral theses to be publicly presented</li> </ul>	Positive evaluation	

		as well as the date, time and place where they will be presented, at least 20 days prior the presentation.		
C.2.2.1.		All doctoral students are granted free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the fields of organized doctoral studies.	Positive evaluation	
C.2.2.2.		Each doctoral student is granted access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations.	Positive evaluation	
C.2.2.3.		All doctoral students are granted access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific of the field / fields within the school for doctoral studies, according to internal regulations.	Positive evaluation	
C.3.1.1.	*	IOSUD, for each doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with companies that carry out activities in the studied field, which focus on the mobility of doctoral students and professors (for instance, ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies cycle). At least 35% of doctoral students have carried out an internship abroad or other form of mobility, such as participating in international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher	Partially positive evaluation	To extend the Erasmus students' mobility



		Education Area.		
C.3.1.2.		IOSUD supports, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of recognized experts to give courses / lectures for PhD students.	Positive evaluation	
C.3.1.3.		The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported by concrete measures (for instance, participating at educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; including international experts in supervising or presenting committees for doctoral theses, etc.).	Positive evaluation	

## VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

The Doctoral school in PE and Sport at UBB has highly qualified teaching staff to ensure the student education in this area and to provide scientific researches.

The doctoral students are encouraged in different ways to participate in scientific conferences, congresses in the country and abroad, workshops and project activities and to publish their scientific articles and reports in famous national and international scientific journals and proceedings.

The doctoral school partners with foreign related universities, through which a number of international activities and cooperation are carried out.

The doctoral school has modern base, facilities, information and resources for carrying out its main activities. The school uses the base and facilities of the University. All doctoral students have access to the facilities, resources and laboratories necessary for the educational and research process.

The official website of the doctoral school provides full and detailed information of candidate students, doctoral students and employers.

The doctoral school works with many international professors and experts in the area of physical education and sport.

The graduates of the doctoral school find good professional realization in the country and abroad.



**Based on the assessments made on the individual criteria and performance indicators, the following recommendations can be provided:**

- to increase the number of doctoral students who participate in scientific conferences and events abroad;
- to extend the Erasmus students' mobility;
- to create new joint educational programmes with other European universities.