

The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain

Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations
- VI. Conclusions and general recommendations
- VII. Annexes

I. Introduction¹

This report of the evaluation was drawn up following the visit for periodic external assessment of educational fields University of PhD Marketing within IOSUD the "Babes-Bolyai" University of Cluj-Napoca (UBB).

The evaluation visit took place between 02.11.2021-05.11.2021, and the composition of the committee of expert evaluators was as follows:

- Coordinator: Prof. Dr. MANOLICĂ Adriana - Alexandru Ioan Cuza University of Iași
- International expert: Prof. Dr. KATSONI Vicky - University of West Attica Greece
- PhD student: MINCIU Mihaela - Academy of Economic Studies in Bucharest

The evaluated doctoral field of study - Marketing - is part of the Doctoral School of the "Babeş-Bolyai" University of Cluj-Napoca (UBB).

The doctoral university studies are organized by IOSUD-UBB only within the accredited doctoral university study programs, offered by the *Institute of Doctoral Studies of UBB*, are carried out based on the National Education Law no. 1/2011, of Law 49/2013, of the Code of Doctoral University Studies approved by GD 681/2011, of the UBB Charter, of the UBB Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral university studies approved by Senate Decision no. 483/2020 (Annex 1.1.17), of the regulations of the doctoral schools from UBB, with the subsequent modifications and completions.

Currently, doctoral studies are being carried out in 31 doctoral schools covering 32 doctoral fields (Annex 1.1.18). Each doctoral school is subordinated to one of the 20 faculties, having the rank of department, with a list of positions and its own curriculum.

The dynamics of the number of PhD students was favorable to UBB, with a stabilizing trend. If in the academic year 2015/2016 434 doctoral students were

¹ Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.



enrolled, in the academic year 2020-2021 436 doctoral students were registered (in different stages of the doctoral training program), and in the previous year, 2019/2020, being 405. regarding the number of doctoral supervisors, we can say that this is also favorable to UBB, noting an increasing trend. Thus, if in 2015 there were 335 PhD supervisors (of which 321 teachers and researchers and 14 scientists), in 2020 their number increased to 384 (of which 370 teachers and researchers and 14 scientists)

The mission of the doctoral university program subject to periodic evaluation is to train specialists (doctors) in the field of Marketing, able to work at the highest levels in both scientific research and practical professional activity, ensuring the insertion of a resource on the labor market. competent human beings in carrying out scientific research and with a rich professional experience, accumulated by granting the title of doctor.

The Marketing field was established as a field in which doctoral university studies can be organized through OMEN no. 4969 of 31.7.2008, being organized and operating within the Doctoral School of Economic Sciences and Business Management (SEGA) (**Annex MK 1 Establishment of Marketing 37499 of 4.8.2008** and **Annex MK 2 OMEN 5842 of 4.11.2008**). The fundamental objective of the doctoral field of Marketing within SEGA is limited to that of SEGA, that of promoting high quality fundamental and applied research, visible internationally.

In the period under review, five advisers (of which 3 are holders DAI) have worked in the field of studies university of PhD Marketing. According to specialized training three teachers conducting doctoral guides students doctoral students in the field of Marketing in the DAI-UBB, SEGA (prof. DC Dabija and profit. CM Pop) and Communication Sciences Public Relations and Advertising -CRPP (Prof. SA Cosma).

The evolution of the number of PhD students in the field of Marketing in the period 2015/2016 - 2019/2020 was increasing: 4 PhD students in 2015/2016, 5 PhD students in 2016/2017, 6 PhD students in 2017/2018, 7 PhD students in 2018/2019 and 4 PhD students in 2019/2020. Out of the 26 doctoral students enrolled between 01.10.2015 and 30.09.2020 in the field of Marketing, three doctoral students withdrew in 2019, and one in 2020 , which leads to a total number of active doctoral students on 30.09.2020 of 22 people . At the same time, during the analyzed period, 8 PhDs in Marketing were awarded.

II. Methods used

The methods and tools used in the external evaluation of the Domain of studies university of PhD Marketing - before and in the visit of evaluation - met:

- Analysis Report of evaluation internal to the field of studies university of Ph.D.

Marketing and its annexes ;



- Analysis of documents made available by the DAI in form physically on during the visit of

evaluation (if they have been requested so the documents);

Analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD / UBB website , in electronic format ;

- Visit to buildings from the institution's patrimony, which include:

- halls of course;

- laboratories;

- UBB library

B-dul Mărăști no. 59, sect. 1, Bucharest, tel. 021.206.76.00, fax 021.312.71.35

Email: office@aracis.ro , www.aracis.ro

- Meeting of reading for students;

- student dormitories ;

- student canteen ;

- sports base

- Meeting / discussion with students doctoral students in the field of education university of PhD Marketing;

- Meeting / discussion with graduates in the field of education university of PhD Marketing;

- Meeting / discussion with employers of graduates in the field of education university of PhD Marketing;

- Meeting / discussion with the leadership of the Institute for Doctoral Studies of the "Babes-Bolyai" University of Cluj-Napoca - in the work field of studies university of PhD Marketing;

- Meeting / discussion with leaders of doctorate in the field of education university of PhD Marketing;



- Meeting / discussion with representatives of various structures of DAI / BBU in the work field of studies university of PhD Marketing:

- Council School Doctoral Senate University, Board of Directors, Committee for Quality Assurance and Development in the University Senate Commission for evaluation and quality assurance, the Commission of Ethics (including with students representatives in these structures);

- StudHub Learning Center;

- student organizations ;

- secretariats;

- various departments / administrative offices (Social / Homes-Canteens etc.)

- Application of questionnaires to doctoral students.

All online and offline meetings were conducted in accordance with the program of the institutional evaluation visit - IOSUD and the fields of doctoral studies.

III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

The analysis of the standard considers, for the field of doctoral studies Marketing: institutional administrative, managerial structures and financial resources - from the perspective of implementing the efficient functioning mechanisms provided by the specific legislation, the logistical resources necessary to fulfill the mission of doctoral studies, and the use optimal financial resources; research infrastructure - necessary to support the development of specific activities; and the quality of human resources - from the point of view of the existence of qualified staff with the necessary experience to carry out the doctoral study program and the international visibility of the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors. The analysis of the standard considers, for the field of doctoral studies Marketing: institutional administrative, managerial structures and financial resources - from the perspective of implementing the efficient functioning mechanisms provided by the specific legislation, the logistical resources necessary to fulfill the mission of doctoral studies, and the use optimal financial resources; research infrastructure - necessary to support the development of specific activities; and the quality of human resources - from the point of view of the existence of qualified staff with the necessary experience to carry out the doctoral study program and the international visibility of the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors.



Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

The doctoral studies at the “Babeş-Bolyai” University of Cluj-Napoca are carried out in accordance with the following national regulations: National Education Law no. 1/2011, updated with GEO no. 4/2016; Emergency Ordinance no. 75/2005 on ensuring the quality of education; Law no. 87/2006; Emergency Ordinance no. 75/2011 for the amendment and completion of the emergency ordinance no. 75/2005 on ensuring the quality of education; Government Decision no. 681/2011 regarding the approval of the code of doctoral university studies, updated with GD no. 134/2016; Guide of activities for evaluating the quality of university study programs and higher education institutions - ARACIS; Order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sports no. 3850 / 02.05.2012 regarding the approval of the Methodology for external evaluation in view of the provisional authorization, accreditation and for the periodic evaluation of doctoral schools, by fields; Order of the Ministry of National Education and Scientific Research 3482 / 24.03.2016 regarding the approval of the organization and functioning regulation of the National Council for Attestation of University Titles, Diplomas and Certificates; Order of the Ministry of National Education and Scientific Research no. 6129 / 20.12.2016 regarding the approval of the minimum necessary and obligatory standards for conferring the didactic titles in higher education, of the Professional degrees of research-development, of the quality of doctoral supervisor and of the habilitation certificate; Order of the Ministry of National Education no. 5110 / 24.09.2018 regarding the approval of the minimum national standards for granting the title of doctor.

SDSEGA also operates on the basis of its own regulations:

- Babeş-Bolyai University Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies no. 483/2020 of January 13, 2020 available online at <https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/Anexa-la-HS-nr.-46-Regulament-UBB-de-organizare-si-development-of-doctoral-studies.pdf> ;
- other UBB regulations aimed at doctoral studies (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/reglementari-ale-universitatii-babes-bolyai/>);
- its own Regulation approved in the CSUD Meeting of 11/21/2018 (<https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2018/Regulamentu%20scolii%20doctorale%20FEGA-2018.pdf>).
- Charter of the “Babeş-Bolyai” University of Cluj-Napoca (Annex 1.1.2)
- The Code of Ethics and Professional Ethics of UBB adopted by Senate decision no. 24.051 / 10.12.2019 (Annex 1.1.4)
- Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies at the “Babeş-Bolyai” University of Cluj-Napoca with the methodologies and procedures specific to the doctoral activity (Annex 1.1.17).



IOSUD UBB has implemented the efficient functioning mechanisms provided in the specific legislation regarding the organization of doctoral studies .

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.

Existence of specific regulations and their application at school level

Doctoral of which is part of the field of studies university of PhD:

- a) doctoral school regulations ;
- b) the methodology for conducting the elections for the position of director of the Doctoral School Council (CSD), as well as the election by the students of the representative in the CSD, and evidence of their development ;
- c) methodology of organizing and conducting the studies graduate of PhD (for admission of students Ph.D., the completion of studies university for doctoral);
- d) the existence of mechanisms of recognition of the quality of leadership by PhD and the equivalence of the doctorate obtained in other states;
- e) structures for driving functional (Council school doctoral), proving including regularity of convening meetings;
- f) contract of studies university of PhD;
- g) internal procedures for analysis and approval of proposals on the subject of the training program based on advanced university studies .

At the DAI-BBU of which is part of the field of studies university of PhD Marketing and implemented regulations specific as follows:

- a) Regulation on the organization and conduct of doctoral studies, updated in 2017 and 2020, respectively. Regulation on Babeş-Bolyai University for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies no. 483/2020 of January 13, 2020 is available online at <https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/RegulamentDoctorat-final-Senat-1-2020.pdf>

The regulation has 12 chapters and two annexes and includes aspects related to principles and fields of application, IOSUD, interdisciplinary doctoral school, admission and enrollment of doctoral students, study contract, doctoral supervisors, doctoral students, funding, completion of studies, etc. The regulation was elaborated in compliance with the provisions of: National Education Law no. 1/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions; Code of doctoral university studies published in GD no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions.

- b) Based on national regulations and internal methodologies developed by the Institute of Doctoral Studies, such as the CSUD Election Methodology, from September 2016 (**Annex 1.1.20**) - updated in 2020 (**Annex 1.1.21**), in 2020, at the most recent elections of CSUD members, the 16 new members of the Council for Doctoral University Studies were appointed (**Annex 1.1.22**). In order to fill the position of CSUD Director, a position competition is organized according to the Methodology for conducting the competition for the position of CSUD Director 2016 (**Annex 1.1.23**), methodology updated in 2020 (**Annex 1.1.24**).

Following the organization of the competition for the position of CSUD director in 2016, he was appointed CSUD Director by Senate Decision no. 17157 of



September 19, 2016 (**Annex 1.1.25**), and in 2020 a new CSUD director was appointed by Senate Decision no. 15476 of 19.10.2020 (**Annex 1.1.26**).

Regarding the ŞDSEGA Council, the last election of the members took place in September 2017, according to the regulations in force at that time, they being started following the address received on 30.08.2017 from IOSUD UBB (available in **Annex MK 26 Elections SEGA Doctoral School**). The election process took place according to art. 27 of the UBB Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies (no. 7622 / 08.05.2017). Records and other evidence confirming the legality of the elections are in **Annex Mk 27 Minutes ŞDSEGA**)

According to the legal regulations, there is a representative student in the composition of CSD, this being known by the majority of doctoral students within the doctoral school. The methodology for appointing the members of the board for doctoral studies at IOSUD - "Babeş-Bolyai" University of Cluj-Napoca is mentioned both in the regulations regarding the UBB elections available at: <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/FSEGA%20Regulamento%20alegeri%202020.PDF> , as well as in the Methodology for conducting the CSUD elections, from September 2016 (**Annex 1.1.20**) - updated in 2020 (**Annex 1.1.21**).

The methodology also takes into account the choice of student representatives. (**Annex MK 28 Elections of doctoral students 23.3.2021**)

- c) The last methodology for admission to doctoral university studies was approved by HS UBB no. 5938 / 16.04.2020

https://senat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Hotarare5938_Metodologia-de-admitere-la-doctorat-si-calendarul-admiterii-la-doctorat.pdf

and Annex

https://senat.ubbcluj.ro/wpcontent/uploads/2020/04/Anexa_Metodologie_doctorat_admitere_final.pdf . It establishes the procedure for admitting students

from the EU, the European Economic Area, the Swiss Confederation, non-EU and Romanians everywhere. The methodology for completing doctoral studies can be found both in the Regulation of Babeş-Bolyai University for organizing and conducting doctoral studies, in Articles 48-60 (UBB Regulation), and in the SDSEGA Regulation, in Articles 43-55

<https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGAreactualizat%202018.pdf>

respectively in the SDCRPP Regulation [P1] for the organization and development of doctoral university studies in 2018 (<http://sdcropp.ro/admitere.html>). The SDSEGA regulation additionally brings some elements that increase the quality of the evaluation of doctoral theses. Thus, in Art. 47 (3) at point c), all members of the commission for public defense of the doctoral thesis must meet the requirements of CNATDCU for the position they hold.

- d) IOSUD has implemented a mechanism for recognizing leadership and equivalence of doctorates obtained in other states. Detailed information is available at the link: <https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/recunoasterea-automata-in-ubb-a-calitatii-de-conducator-dedoctorat-obtinue-in-institutii-de-invataman-universitar-acreditate-from-abroad/> .

- e) At the SDSEGA level, the main management structure is the SDSEGA Council. All decisions are taken by simple majority. It met with a high



frequency, even several times a month, according to the PV of **Annex Mk 27 ŞDSEGA Minutes** .

- f) The contract for doctoral studies is exemplified in **Annex MK 20 The contract for doctoral studies** , and the additional contract for the extension of university studies can be accessed at the link: https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Act_Additional_Prelungire_oct-2020.pdf , respectively is presented in **Annex MK 29 Additional Act** . The contract contains the rights and obligations of IOSUD-UBB, doctoral students and doctoral supervisors. The study contract is concluded with each doctoral student, regardless of the place where he is admitted, for the entire duration of the doctoral student's training. For the extension periods and for the grace periods, granted according to the regulations in force, additional documents to the study contract are drawn up.
- g) According to the Regulation on the organization and development of doctoral studies at Babeş-Bolyai University (Annex 1.1.17), in force at the time of the internal evaluation, being adopted by Senate Decision no. 483 of January 13, 2020, being available for consultation on the website: <https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wpcontent/uploads/2020/01/RegulamentDoctorat-final-Senat-1-2020.pdf> , I at the level of each field the doctoral supervisors in the respective field analyze the training program based on advanced university studies and on the topics related to the individual training programs, ensuring the novelty, clarity and impact of the topics proposed for research.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that all the decisions of the Doctoral School Council be published on the doctoral school's website.

It is recommended to continue constantly updating the website of the Doctoral School so that both doctoral supervisors, doctoral students and candidates for admission can find all the necessary information on the site.

It is recommended that the activity of the doctoral student representative be disseminated as much as possible among the students, so as to increase the transparency regarding the decisions that directly involve the students.

The indicator is met

Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. *The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

ŞDSEGA

Regulation <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGAreactualizat%202018.pdf> respectively, for the CRPP Doctoral School (<http://sdcrpp.ro/admitere.html>), refer to criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for: a) the acceptance of new doctoral supervisors, as well as regulations regarding the manner in which a doctoral supervisor can be withdrawn as a member of the doctoral school (*ŞDSEGA Regulation in Art. 15 (2); and Art. 21; Article 65*); b) the mechanisms through which decisions are taken regarding the opportunity, structure and content of the training program based on advanced university studies (*SDSEGA Regulation in Art. 33-38*); c) the procedures for changing the doctoral



supervisor of a certain doctoral student and the procedures for mediating conflicts (*ŞDSEGA Regulation in Art. 59 (2); Art. 68*); d) the conditions under which the doctoral program may be interrupted (*ŞDSEGA Regulation in Art. 7*); e) ways to prevent fraud in scientific research, including plagiarism (Code of Ethics of *the SEGA Doctoral School available at the link: <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2019/Informatii%20referitoare%20la%20disciplina%20Etica%20si%20integritate%20academica.docx>*); f) ensuring access to research resources; g) the attendance obligations of the doctoral students.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to constantly update the doctoral school regulations in accordance with existing legislation;

It is recommended to manage the quality issues within the doctoral school board with the participation of the members of the doctoral school in the field of economics in order to periodically update the operating regulations.

The indicator is met

Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.

The mission of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School within IOSUD UBB is to train researchers and specialists (doctors), able to work at the highest levels both in scientific research and in practical professional activity, ensuring the insertion on the labor market of a competent human resource in carrying out scientific research and with a rich professional experience, accumulated by granting the title of doctor, in all 31 doctoral schools covering 32 doctoral fields (Annex 1.1.18). UBB has IOSUD logistical resources necessary to accomplish the mission studies PhD - system of tracking students and their academic journey, software for checking the percentage of similarity in all theses of doctorate.

There is an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic career managed by the IOSUD-UBB secretariat, by the one of ŞDSEGA <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGA-reactualizat%202018.pdf>, respectively RA CRPP (<http://sdcrrp.ro/admitere.html>). All PhD students in Marketing received an institutional email address on the domain @econ.ubbcluj.ro, respectively @fspac.ro, and from 2020 for PhD students and leaders on the field @ubbcluj.ro through which they could create accounts for accessing electronic resources from international databases. The doctoral students were also trained in this regard by their coordinators in order to access the relevant databases. For the record of doctoral students, the Doctoral School benefits from the computer system of Babeş-Bolyai University, called Academic Info <https://academicinfo.ubbcluj.ro/Info/>, where the personal data of students are stored, the courses they enroll in and the situation of grades and credits accumulated. Additionally, within the Faculty of Economics and Business Management, PhD students have a direct, dedicated, integrated and digitized information system that allows everyone to manage their administrative relations with the faculty through their own electronic devices (laptop, smartphone) with access



Internet. The FSEGA SIS application (Student Information System) <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/sis/> includes a series of functionalities such as: - direct access to the latest announcements of interest - the possibility of submitting applications for issuing certificates - choosing optional subjects - direct access to the Academic Info application system.

Recommendations:

Publication on the website of the doctoral school related to each field within the socio-human sciences of performance and quality information from the student management system.

The indicator is met

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.

Regarding the existence of a computer program to verify the percentage of similarity, the university uses the iThenticate program, recognized according to the relevant standards and described as functionality. At the same time, each doctoral supervisor has an institutional account on Turnitin, being able to verify any document written by his doctoral students. Page 44 of 74 The Council for Doctoral University Studies adopted a Decision on the approval of the Procedure regarding the generation and analysis of the Similarity Report no. 12327 dated 29.06.2016. The procedure defines how to use the programs for establishing the degree of similarity (anti-plagiarism) within the UBB in accordance with the technical specifications of the programs recognized by CNATDCU. This procedure applies to all doctoral theses that are defended in UBB, using the computer program - iThenticate ([http://qa.ubbcluj.ro/aracis/Acreditare%20scoli%20si%20domeni%20doc torat 2019 Anexa/Anexa%201.2.20%20-% 20Program% 20de% 20analiza% 20de% 20similitudine% 20 \(soft% 20antiplagiat\)% 20iThenticate.pdf](http://qa.ubbcluj.ro/aracis/Acreditare%20scoli%20si%20domeni%20doc torat 2019 Anexa/Anexa%201.2.20%20-% 20Program% 20de% 20analiza% 20de% 20similitudine% 20 (soft% 20antiplagiat)% 20iThenticate.pdf))

The report provides one or more Similarity Coefficients. These Coefficients of Similarity differ from one system to another, but generally have the following meanings:

- Coefficient of Similarity 1 = the percentage of the text with all similar phrases discovered by the system in other documents;
- Similarity Coefficient 2 = the percentage of the text with similar fragments that exceed a given number of words (for example 25).

The Similarity Report is an integral part of the file that is submitted to FDI in order to defend the doctoral thesis. The statistical situation regarding the doctoral theses verified for similarity in the last 5 years, for SEGA and each doctoral supervisor is presented at the level of IOSUD UBB. Also, as can be seen from the figure below, over 40% of PhD students in Marketing stated that they have free access, to a very large extent, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity of scientific papers / doctoral thesis with other existing scientific or artistic creations

Recommendations:

Make a strict record of the use of this software platform, so that the results obtained can be easily accessed by applicants.

Consider improved versions of this software in order to expand the database to increase the level of originality.

The indicator is met



Standard A.1.3. The IOSUD makes sure that financial resources are used optimally, and the revenues obtained from doctoral studies are supplemented through additional funding besides governmental funding.

Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.

The existence of at least one research or institutional development / human resources grant in implementation at the time of submitting the internal evaluation file, for the analyzed doctoral university field, or the existence, at the level of the field, of at least 2 research or development grants institutional development / human resources obtained by doctoral supervisors in the field evaluated in the last 5 years. The grants address topics relevant to the field and, as a rule, are carried out with the involvement of doctoral students.

Regarding the existence of doctoral research grants, for the field of doctoral studies Marketing were obtained by prof.univ. dr. DC Dabija a Young Teams grant at UEFISCDI (1.10.2015-30.9.2017) continued until 30.9.2018 from the Direction of this project related to UBB; 2 Star UBB Advanced Fellowship grants; 7 grants to support the competitiveness of UBB employees and a mobility project for UEFISCDI researchers. Information on existing grants is provided in **Annex MK 11 Grants to marketing coordinators** . It is noteworthy that the doctoral students involved work on various topics related to the researched topic, in fact the grants of doctoral supervisors addressing marketing topics .

Recommendations:

It is recommended to constantly update the list of national and international research grants or institutional development / human resources as well as to expand the list.

It is recommended to expand public-private partnerships.

The indicator is met

Performance Indicator *A.1.3.2. *The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional / human resources development grants is not less than 20%.*

Annex MK 32 The list of doctoral student grants, as well as the additional POCU Annex provided during the evaluation visit provide information on the situation of doctoral students. As can be seen from them, it results that there are a number of 7 students (a percentage of 31.81%) who have benefited or benefit for a period of at least 6 months from an active scholarship, from sources of funding other than government funding. .

The revenues [P2] obtained by the institution from doctoral grants by contract and tuition fees collected from doctoral students in the form of fee-paying education, as well as the level of settlements for vocational training are presented in **Annex MK 32 List of doctoral student grants.**



Recommendations:

Better support for PhD students is recommended in order to obtain additional funding. A more rigorous record of the types of funding obtained by doctoral students is recommended.

It is recommended to involve the private sector in awarding scholarships for doctoral students, taking into account the fact that the employers' representatives expressed their availability during the meeting with the evaluation committee.

The indicator is met

Performance Indicator *A.1.3.3.² At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).

According to the information and documents presented during the monitoring visit, the training costs of PhD students in the field of Marketing varied from one academic year to another. Thus, for the evaluated period, these expenses were averaged 25.61%, namely:

- 2015-2016: 9.33%;
- 2016-2017: 0.99%;
- 2017-2018: 0.00%;
- 2018-2019: 81.93%;
- 2019-2020: 35.8%

Recommendations:

It is recommended to make available to each doctoral school a budget in relation to the number of doctoral students and their development needs.

Introduction and development of university entrepreneurship by forming spin-offs and starting start-ups at university level to increase funding sources.

The indicator is partially fulfilled.

Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

DAI / UBB has a research infrastructure to support the development activities specific studies university PhD - facilities, equipment material, research infrastructure and offer services - in line with the mission and objectives set and made public through a platform profile.

² The indicators marked with an asterisk (*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral studies domains, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation. In case they are not met, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.



Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

Regarding the research infrastructure at the level of the Marketing field, it is represented, both at the level of IOSUD and SEGA, respectively:

- access to international databases;
- material equipment: computers, specific software, apparatus, laboratory equipment (video projection system, internet connection);
- titles of books and periodicals at the library;
- spaces.

In accordance with the general and specifically established objectives, the Doctoral School provides a sufficient material basis for the proper conduct of doctoral studies. The institution meets the requirements of volume, quality, technical condition and safety rules, having the necessary resources and high-performance equipment to ensure and streamline the educational process, as well as for information transfer and collaborative learning. Each laboratory includes computers connected to licensed internet sources and specialized software, as well as technical equipment and high-performance means (video projectors and projection screens), in order to create an environment conducive to the development of skills for documentation, elaboration and capitalization of scientific papers. Also, a significant volume of portable laptops is regularly added to ensure the continuity of the research process and outside the laboratories provided by the institution, as needed by this facility. Information on these aspects can be found in **Annex MK 33 Material endowment** , **Annex MK 34 space insurance situation** ; **Annex MK 35 Proof of ownership**.

With regard to SDCRPP, the list of equipment can be found in the Annex List of equipment provided, by functional categories, own or rented SDCRPP, List of software products and computer systems used, own or rented SDCRPP and Scientific Documentation Services and SDCRPP library, BCU CULT Report, respectively SDCRPP Infrastructure Description (**Annex MK 36 CULT Report** and **Annex MK 37 SDCRPP Library**).

The doctoral activities characteristic of the Marketing study program are carried out in educational spaces adequately equipped with equipment according to the imposed requirements, including in the room for doctoral students - 322 Campus . Ask if they have access to laboratories / research spaces or other facilities within UBB, respectively research centers / experimental units for conducting research, as can be seen from the figure below over 65% of students in Marketing have stated that they have access to a large extent, and 25% to a very large extent.

Also , UBB and FSEGA have signed numerous cooperation agreements with universities abroad. Marketing PhD students can access the BCU resources and the EBSCO database through the institutional email address, as well as the international databases that are available through www.e-nformation.ro, to which UBB is subscribed. Marketing PhD students have access to the Euromonitor and Statista databases through a subscription available at the faculty level: <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/stire.php?id=658> . At the same time, there is access from



the faculty building and to the Refinitive database <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/stire.php?id=315>. In addition, PhD students have access to a laboratory (room 411) where there are licenses for various computer programs (PLS; SPSS; State, etc.), but also access to EIKON (**Annex MK 38 Access to other FSEGA databases**).

Recommendations:

It is recommended to continue investments for equipment and especially for new database processing software.

It is recommended to develop a mechanism for attracting resources / funds from the private sector.

The indicator is met.

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.

Performance Indicator A.3.1.1. *Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.*

At the time of the evaluation, within the Marketing field there are 3 full-time PhD supervisors: 2 coordinators are affiliated to SEGA (prof.univ.dr. DC Dabija and prof.univ.dr. CM Pop), and one is affiliated to the Doctoral School of CRPP (prof.univ.dr. SA Cosma). Of the three teachers with the status of doctoral supervisor, Mrs. prof.univ.dr. Smaranda Adina Cosma obtained the qualification in November 2014, and the professors prof.univ.dr. Ciprian-Marcel Pop and Dan-Cristian Dabija obtained the habilitations in 2015 (**Annex MK 3 OMECS Pop habilitation; Annex MK 4 OMECS habilitation Dabija; Annex MK 5 OMECS habilitation Cosma**). Therefore, 100% of the PhD supervisors in the Marketing PhD field meet the CNATDCU minimum standards (**Annex MK 6 CNATDCU Standards all activity Cosma SA , Annex MK 7 CNATDCU Standards all activity Dabija DC , Annex MK 8 CNATDCU Standards all activity Pop**). It is also worth mentioning that at the time of the evaluation there are two more qualifications in progress in the field of Marketing, namely: Assoc. Ovidiu I. Moisescu; Assoc Alt Monika Aneta. Thus, in the future, the PhD Marketing will be much better represented in SDSEGA.

<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/ovidiu-ioan-moisescu/>

<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/monika-anetta-alt/>

Recommendations:

It is recommended to support the habilitation for other members of the academic community.

It is recommended to identify possible foreign doctoral supervisors who can join the Marketing field.

The indicator is met.



Performance Indicator *A.3.1.2. *At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

At the time of the evaluation, within the field of doctoral studies Marketing there are 3 tenured leaders, of which 2 are affiliated to SEGA (prof.univ.dr. DC Dabija and prof.univ.dr. CM Pop), and one is affiliated to the Doctoral School of CRPP (prof.univ.dr. SA Cosma). Therefore, 100% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated field are holders for an indefinite period within IOSUD UBB. In addition, there is also a doctoral supervisor in the person of Mr. Professor Ioan Plăiaș, retired, employed for a determined period.

Recommendations:

Continuous identification of empowerment capacity for members of the academic community.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator A.3.1.3. *The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.*

According to the Curriculum of the Doctoral School available at the link: https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/Scoala_Doctorala/Plan%20de%20invatamat%20Scoala%20Doctorala%20FSEGA%202020-2021.pdf, the disciplines from the training program based on university studies advanced in the field of Marketing are supported by doctoral supervisors from the Institute of the UBB Doctoral School, who meet the national minimum qualification standards in force. Example:

Prof. univ. dr. Dan-Cristian Dabija: Marketing Strategies and Policies in Retail Trade (**Annex MK 17 FD Marketing Strategies and Policies in Retail Trade**)

Prof. univ. dr. Ciprian Marcel Pop: Marketing applied in the tertiary sector. A holistic approach (**Annex MK 18 FD Marketing applied in the tertiary sector: A holistic approach**)

Prof. univ. dr. Smaranda Adina Cosma: Entrepreneurial approaches in communication (**Annex MK 19 FD Entrepreneurial approaches in communication**)

All Marketing disciplines in the doctoral program in the field of Marketing are delivered by tenured teachers of IOSUD UBB.

Recommendations:

Ongoing monitoring of the courses and the staff who support them is recommended.

The indicator is met.



Performance Indicator *A.3.1.4. *The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs³ does not exceed 20%.*

At the level of Marketing, the situation broken down by coordinators on 30.12.2020 is the following:

- prof.dr. SA Cosma 8 doctoral students, of which 3 during the internship and 5 during the grace period;
 - prof.dr. DC Dabija 9 PhD students, of which 8 in internship and one PhD student in the grace period;
 - prof.dr. CM Pop 6 doctoral students, of which 2 during the internship and 4 during the grace period;
 - prof.dr. I. Plăiaș 6 doctoral students, of which 1 during the internship and 5 during the grace period.
- Thus, analyzing the evolution of each doctoral supervisor as can be seen, none of the doctoral supervisors exceeds the number of PhD students admitted to be coordinated simultaneously.

Recommendations:

Continuous monitoring of the number of doctoral students coordinated by each doctoral supervisor.

The indicator is met.

Standard A.3.2. *The Doctoral advisors within the domain are carrying out a scientific activity visible at international level.*

Conducătorii a PhD in the area conducted a business SCIENTIFIC high profile international - perhaps through articles / studies published in prestigious international journals, participation in international conferences, quality reviewer and / or members of the Scientific Committees / editorials of journals and conferences, Google Hirsh clues.

Performance Indicator A.3.2.1. *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and*

³ 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.

At the time of the evaluation, the centralized documents at the level of the doctoral studies field of Marketing regarding the titular doctoral supervisors attest that 100% of them (prof.univ.dr. SA Cosma, DC Dabija, CM Pop) published at least 5 indexed articles Web of Science in journals with impact factor and have achievements for the field of Marketing. The list of publications of the Marketing leaders can be found in the annexes: **Annex MK 12 Publication List Cosma** , **Annex MK 13 Publication List Dabija** , **Annex MK 14 Publication List Pop**.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to monitor the performance of doctoral supervisors and doctoral students with international visibility.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator *A.3.2.2. *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

Regarding the evaluated field, respectively the Marketing field, it can be stated that 100.00% of the team of doctoral supervisors are scientifically active and obtain the score required by the minimum CNATDCU standards, based on scientific results. Information in this regard can be found in the Annexes Summary sheet for meeting the CNATDCU minimum standards for all activity **Annex MK 6 CNATDCU Standards all activity Cosma SA, Annex MK 7 CNATDCU Standards all activity Dabija DC, Annex MK 8 CNATDCU Standards all activity Pop** , respectively on last five years **Annex MK 42 CNATDCU Standards 2016-2020 SA Cosma, Annex MK 43 CNATDCU Standards 2016-2020 DC Dabija, Annex MK 44 CNATDCU Standards 2016-2020 CM Pop**). In fact, in the last 5 years the doctoral supervisors of the Marketing field have obtained the following score, this being much higher than the level of 25% of the minimum score of the CNATDCU standards (1 point):

- prof.dr. SA Cosma: 11.70333 points (292.58%);
- prof.dr. DC Dabija: 17,2032 points (430.08%);
- prof.dr. CM Pop: 5.27 points (131.75%).

Recommendations:

Continuous monitoring of compliance with the minimum CNATDCU standards in force for each doctoral supervisor.

The indicator is met.

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

The analysis of the educational effectiveness of the Marketing Doctoral Study Field aimed at: IOSUD's ability to attract high-performing candidates (including from outside the higher education institution) - reflected in the number, quality and diversity of candidates who applied for the admission contest;



Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest

Standard B.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or a number of candidates exceeding the number of seats available.

The internal evaluation report indicates that, during the evaluated period, the Marketing Domain demonstrated the ability to attract candidates from outside UBB as well.

Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1. *The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.*

Regarding the number of places financed from the state budget in the field of Marketing, if we analyze the period September 2015-September 2019, it is found that in the field of doctoral marketing were put up for competition 15 places in the budget, there are 29 candidates, which means a ratio of 1.93 candidates / place in the budget. **Annex MK 45 Marketing Candidates Report** presents the detailed situation in this regard.

The doctoral students from the analyzed period come not only from UBB, but also from other Universities (Oradea, USAMV Cluj-Napoca, Germany, Austria or Japan). In the academic year 2018-2019, the ratio between the number of master's degree graduates of other higher education institutions and those from FSEGA is 0.25 when admitted to budgeted places.

Recommendations:

Continuing the policy of attracting master's level graduates from other higher education institutions, especially from abroad.

The indicator is met

Standard B.1.2 Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.

The analysis performed on the PhD Marketing - both from the perspective of admission and selection criteria, and the doctoral path of the admitted candidates - proves the academic, research and professional performance of the candidates admitted to the doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator *B.1.2.1. *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the*



domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.

The methodology for admission to the doctorate at IOSUD UBB level for the academic year 2020-2021 is available at the link:

<https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/MetodologieAdmitere%20Doctorat.pdf>

In the conditions of the suspension of the face-to-face activity, a special online admission methodology was developed:

<https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/Metodologie%20admitere%20doctorat%2020-2021.pdf>

The admission regulations on the Marketing field, including the selection criteria for the 2020-2021 admission to the SEGA Doctoral School are available at the link: <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/Regulamentu%20pentru%20admiterea%20online%20la%20Scoala%20doctoral%20SEGA.docx>

The admission regulations in the field of Marketing, including the selection criteria for admission 2020-2021 to the CRPP Doctoral School can be found at the link: <http://sdcrrp.ro/admitere.html> .

ŞDSEGA Regulation <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGAreactualizat%202018.pdf>

Starting with the academic year 2015-2016, the admission test consisted of two parts:

- Specialized written exam from a program made public in advance;
- Oral presentation of a research project by candidates.

A detail of the admission criteria for each doctoral supervisor can be found in the Annexes: **Appendix MK 46 B.1.1.1. - 2015, Appendix MK 47 B.1.1.1. - 2016, Appendix MK 48 B.1.1.1. - 2017, Appendix MK 49 B.1.1.1. - 2018, Appendix MK 50 B.1.1.1. - 2019, Appendix MK 51 B.1.1.1. - 2020** . At the same time, public information on the admissions from 2019 and 2020 can be found online at: https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/n2.php?id_c=24&id_m=4

Recommendations:

Continuous publication of relevant information on the website of the Doctoral School.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator B.1.2.2. *The expelling rate, including renouncement / dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4, years after admission⁴ does not exceed 30%.*

According to the information presented during the visit, the expulsion rate of doctoral students 3 years after admission is very low, 4 doctoral students out of 26 dropped out during the evaluation period (15.38%):

- Doctoral students enrolled in 2015: 2 at SEGA + 2 CRPP (1 SEGA doctoral student withdrawn on 11.11.2019 + 1 restricted doctoral student CRPP (Appendix MK 52 1 PhD Student CRPP));
- Doctoral students enrolled in 2016: 2 at SEGA + 3 CRPP (1 SEGA doctoral student retired 2019);

⁴ 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



- Doctoral students enrolled 2017: 5 at SEGA + 1 CRPP;
- Doctoral students enrolled in 2018: 6 at SEGA + 1 CRPP (1 SEGA doctoral student retired on 30.9.2020);
- PhD students enrolled 2019: 3 at SEGA + 1 CRPP.

It is also worth mentioning that at UBB level there is an elaborated strategy to reduce the risk of abandonment, presented in **Annex MK 53 Abandonment strategy at UBB level** , **Annex MK 55 Abandonment strategy at UBB level** .

Recommendations:

Monitoring the evolution of doctoral students and identifying solutions to solve problems that may slow down or stop their research;

Active involvement of doctoral guidance committees and the Career Guidance and Counseling Center in order to prevent and avoid research failure.

The indicator is met.

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

The training program based on advanced university studies is suitable to improve the skills of research of PhD students and for the strengthening behavior ethics in science - the disciplines proposed (fundamental domain fundamental Economics and specialty choice), setting up and functioning of the steering committees.

3 years for programs of studies university of doctoral the time specified in art. 159, p ara. (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university study programs with the duration specified in art. 174, para. (3) of the National Education Law no. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and completions

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.

During the first semester of the first year of doctoral studies, the training program based on advanced studies of doctoral students within SEGA [P3] is carried out . The program contains 4 disciplines of which at least 2 disciplines are part of the category of fundamental and the rest of the specialized disciplines. Within the fundamental disciplines are provided: a discipline for the study of scientific methodology, research methodology and academic writing techniques and a discipline that deals with statistical data processing, Advanced Econometrics (Curriculum Annex https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n3.php?id_s=178&id_c=106&id_m=3). Within the specialized disciplines there are at least three other disciplines that deal with statistical data processing adapted to some doctoral fields. All disciplines in the SEGA offer for the training program based on advanced university studies specified the



competencies, skills and aptitudes that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline **Annex MK 17 FD Marketing Strategies and Policies in Retail** , **Annex MK 18 FD Marketing applied in the tertiary sector: A holistic approach** , **Annex MK 19 FD Entrepreneurial approaches in communication**.

Also, following the interpretation of the answers provided by the PhD students in the field of Marketing surveyed, it resulted, as can be seen from the figure below, that they consider to a large extent that the specialized disciplines included in the Advanced University Training Program are relevant. for research undertaken as a doctoral student.

Recommendations:

Permanent updating of the content of the relevant disciplines for the training in the scientific research of the doctoral students in the field of Marketing.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.

The discipline of ethics in scientific research, in the SEGA curriculum is included in the various disciplines taught, there are well-defined topics on these topics in a discipline taught in the doctoral program, respectively in the Scientific Research Methodology (Annex Discipline Sheets).

[https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/Scoala_Doctorala/programe_analitice/2018/Research%20methodology%20academic%20writing%20techniques%20\(Metodologia%20cercetarii%20si%20tehnici%20de%20scriere%20academica\)%20- Prof.univ.dr.%20Gheorghe%20Cosmin%20Silaghi%20si%20Conf.univ.dr.%20Szasz%20Levente.p df \[P4\] \)](https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/Scoala_Doctorala/programe_analitice/2018/Research%20methodology%20academic%20writing%20techniques%20(Metodologia%20cercetarii%20si%20tehnici%20de%20scriere%20academica)%20-Prof.univ.dr.%20Gheorghe%20Cosmin%20Silaghi%20si%20Conf.univ.dr.%20Szasz%20Levente.pdf)

Recommendations:

Conducting meetings / workshops with PhD students on research ethics issues.

Introduction of a discipline intended exclusively for ethics in scientific research .

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities⁵.

⁵ Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology of 17 March 2017 regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.



The results of doctoral studies are capitalized by : publishing articles in national and international scientific journals; participation in national and international scientific conferences; participation in the teams of scientific research projects. As a procedure for the annual evaluation of the results of the doctoral students' research, the activity of publishing the doctoral students in the evaluation of the leaders was included with a separate point. Thus, the allocation of budgeted places with and without scholarships on doctoral supervisors is done according to a set of transparent performance criteria that initially consider to a large extent and now exclusively Web of Science publications in journals in JCR Core Economics. Leaders score from their own doctoral students' publications. These procedures can be found in: **Annex MK 30 Procedure for allocating driver seats 2019 ; Annex MK 31 Information for allocation of SD 2020 places** . The procedure for the general evaluation of FSEGA members is presented in **Annex MK 54 Procedure for the evaluation of FSEGA teaching staff** .

Through the disciplines included in the training program based on advanced university studies related to the doctoral field of Marketing, it is ensured:

- understanding the way of critical analysis, evaluation and synthesis of new and complex ideas and their integration by respecting the rules of ethics and academic integrity in the scientific papers;
- acquiring and consolidating knowledge on the writing of a scientific article, acquiring the knowledge necessary to design, write and publish scientific papers, correctly citing sources, avoiding plagiarism and constantly pursuing academic honesty;
- knowledge of the characteristics of the models of excellence and of the evaluation criteria of the organizations in relation to these models;
- improving communication, leadership and self-assessment skills for PhD students;
- construction and use of methods and models specific to quantitative and / or qualitative scientific research in doctoral research in marketing;
- assisting PhD students in the formation of strategic marketing thinking, as well as familiarizing PhD students with the methods used to implement strategies and development projects in the sector relevant to their research topic.

By completing the training program based on advanced university studies, any doctoral student:

- will be familiar with the fundamental requirements of writing a scientific paper (doctoral thesis, scientific articles, papers for international conferences) by considering and including the elements of ethics and academic integrity in the scientific research activity carried out;
- will understand the conceptual and methodological framework regarding excellence in marketing, highlighting the critical factors, methods and techniques specific to this desideratum, for the sustainable development of organizations, in the context of globalization;
- will be able to use the fundamental research methods that are applied in the field of quantitative and qualitative scientific research;
- will be able to substantiate development strategies for the services sector, highlighting the factors of competitiveness in the new economy, priority areas and strategic objectives for the sustainable development of marketing. The specific professional and transversal competences are highlighted in the competences grids



and the files of the disciplines included in the annual curricula of the SEGA Doctoral School.

Recommendations:

Maintaining and improving these mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the field of Marketing, aims at learning outcomes.

Monitoring the subject sheet for all disciplines in the doctoral school curriculum.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.4. *All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counselling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting.*

Throughout the doctoral training period, PhD students in Marketing benefit, in addition to the coordination provided by the scientific director and the advice / guidance of functional guidance commissions, established from the moment of enrollment of doctoral students (**Annex MK 9 Guidance Commissions**). The involvement of the guiding commission in advising doctoral students is materialized in written feedback and in regular meetings, finalized by signing a report made available to all parties involved. The activities of the steering committee are complementary to those offered by the scientific doctoral supervisor. The functionality of the steering committees is demonstrated through joint scientific publications and / or communications of doctoral students with the members of the steering committee, electronic correspondence focused on feedback provided to doctoral students by committee members (**Annex MK 25 Articles published with doctoral students**). Also, 83% of the Marketing students surveyed answered that they benefit greatly from the support of the members of the guidance committee for the research activity and the realization of the doctoral thesis (online meetings, onsite meetings, asynchronous communication), while 17 % stated that they received a lot of support from the commission.

At the same time we can highlight here the organization of workshops with the participation of PhD students in Marketing with specialists from academia and research in Romania and abroad (**Annex MK 22 Doctoral Workshop 4-5 February 2019 ; Annex MK 23 Doctoral Workshop Program 4-5 February 2019 ; Annex MK 24 Doctoral Workshop March 14, 2019**).

Recommendations:

Further monitoring of these meetings and the results of collaborations between doctoral students and members of the steering committees.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.5. *For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.*

For the Marketing field, the situation is presented in **Annex MK 55 Report of doctoral students-members of the guidance commissions** . It is found that this



ratio in the field of Marketing is 1.08333 (26 students / 24 teachers). The 26 doctoral students enrolled between 1.10.2015 and 30.9.2020 are guided by 24 distinct teachers, of which a university professor. German (Barbara Kreis-Engelhardt), a university professor at ASE Bucharest (Nicolae Al. Pop).

Recommendations:

The need for an electronic record of the composition of the guidance commissions at the level of the Doctoral School.

Continuation of the inclusion in the steering commissions of specialists from other university centers or from abroad.

The indicator is met.

Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation.

Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

The research is capitalized by PhD students in the field of Marketing mainly through presentations at scientific conferences (international) and scientific publications (indexed in international databases). Each of the doctoral students (including those who have graduated from the doctoral program) has at least one article / participation in an international scientific conference. There are, as annexes to the Internal Evaluation Report, articles prepared by doctors.

Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. *For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.*

In **Annex MK 56** is a list of the Marketing PhD work who earned his Ph.D. in the period under review (2015-2020). For each doctor there is at least one paper in PDF format, as follows:

Annex MK 56.1 Cacovean Article

Annex MK 56.2 Cotirlea Denisa Article

Annex MK 56.3 Dobocan Florin Article

Annex MK 56.4 Lala Fador Article

Annex MK 56.5 Nemțeanu Sefora Article

Annex MK 56.6 Pop Alexandra Article

Annex MK 56.7 Sanda Grigore Article

Annex MK 56.8 Tarța Corina Article Criterion

Recommendations:

It is recommended to increase the number of papers published by PhD students to make significant contributions in the field of Marketing.

The indicator is met.



Performance Indicator *B.3.1.2. *The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.*

The doctoral students who obtained the doctorate in the period 2015-2020 met the minimum standards established by CSUD for defending the thesis at that time. These criteria also include articles in journals indexed in international databases, as well as other relevant papers. After defending the thesis, some PhD students published their theses in prestigious publishing houses and continued to be active in the field of research, participating in prestigious international conferences. For most doctors, a representative paper is specified. The list of presentations, including posters, made by doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in 2015-2020, can be found in the **Marketing Annex 57 List of presentations at doctoral conferences Marketing** g, the ratio between the number of presentations and the number of doctoral students in the field of Marketing who completed their doctoral studies in the period 2015-2020 is over 1.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to create a platform to collect all the results of doctoral students during their doctoral internship, as well as access to this information on the doctoral school website.

The indicator is met.

Standard B.3.2. The Doctoral School engages a significant number of external scientific specialists in the commissions for public defense of doctoral theses in the analyzed domain.

The analysis of the standard on external scientific references in the commissions for public support of doctoral theses for Marketing took into account the number of doctoral theses allocated to a specific scientific referent from a higher education institution other than IOSUD evaluated - starting from the composition commissions for public defense of theses.

Performance Indicator *B.3.2.1. *The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.*

Annex MK 58 Theses assigned to external references , presents statistics on the number of doctoral theses assigned to a specific referent from a higher education institution, other than IOSUD UBB, by doctoral schools and doctoral supervisors. On average over the evaluated period, this report does not exceed two evaluated theses for any of the invited external references. In the field of Marketing this indicator is met (**Annex MK 59 List of references and doctoral commissions Marketing 2015-2020**), with a maximum of 2 participations of an external referent on the doctoral supervisor.



Recommendations:

Permanent monitoring at the level of the Doctoral School of the commissions for public support of the doctoral theses for the observance of this criterion.

The indicator is met

Performance Indicator *B.3.2.2. *The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defense on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analyzed.*

At the level of the PhD field of Marketing, during the evaluation period (1.10.2015-30.09.2020), **8 doctoral theses** were defended, 7 of them being appreciated with the grade Very Good, and 1 with the grade Good. All theses were subsequently confirmed by Ministerial Order (**Annex MK 59 List of references and doctoral commissions Marketing 2015-2020**). Their distribution by calendar years and by doctoral supervisors is presented in **Annex MK 60 PhD Defense Commissions**, with a total of 8 theses and data representing public statements. In these 8 commissions for public defense of doctoral theses participated 9 external scientific references: UBB from ASE Bucharest (3); USAMV Cluj-Napoca (1); Alexandru Ioan Cuza University of Iași (2); West University of Timisoara (2); University of the Lower Danube Galati (1). This ratio varies between 0.063 and 0.25, and is set out in **Annex MK 60 PhD Defense Commissions**.

Recommendations:

Permanent monitoring at the level of the Doctoral School of the commissions for public support of the doctoral theses for the observance of this criterion. It is recommended a greater diversification of the referents invited to participate in the commissions for the defense of doctoral theses.

The indicator is met

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Domain analysis aimed for the Marketing: The existence and implementation periodică the system of insurance internă of calității - institutional framework, policies and procedures for internal quality assurance; Transparency of information and accessibility to resources for learning; - willingness to consult information of interest electronically insurance PhD students access to resources; and Degree of internationalization - the existence and application of a strategy to increase the degree of internationalization.

Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system



Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

Information on the institutional framework, on procedures for monitoring internal quality assurance, as well as on relevant internal quality assurance policies at the level of IOSUD UBB and SEGA are derived from **Annex MK 61 Strategic Plan at FSEGA level**, respectively **Annex MK 62 Operational Plan at FSEGA level**, being included in the ȘDSEGA

Regulation <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGA-reactualizat%202018.pdf>

At the level of the CRPP Doctoral School, these aspects are contained in the SDCRPP Regulation (<http://sdcropp.ro/admitere.html>).

Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. *The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;*
- e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students;*
- f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.*

The procedures for evaluation and internal monitoring of the activities within UBB also apply to IOSUD, ȘDSEGA, and the accounting field. (Annex HCA no. 1639/4 Feb 2019 updated cf.OM 3200/2020 and HCA 1633 / 18.02.2021) https://www.ubbcluj.ro/ro/infoubb/files/InfoUBB_2021_02/2021_02_18_HCA_1633_privind_apro_barea_criteriilor_stabilite%20C4%2083r%20C8%209Birea_granturilor,_locurilor_buget_etate_pe_%20C8%99coli_doctoralr_%20C8%99i_conduc%20C4%2083tor_de_doctorat_-2021.pdf)

- a) Starting with the academic year 2020-2021, the teachers and researchers employed for a determined period have the obligation to draw up an individual career / academic development plan, during the contract, but not more than 3 years (**Annex 1.3.42**). This plan is a tool that records the personal choice / career project and measures the level of commitment of teachers in academic activity. Depending on their specificity, the faculties may make changes to the set of indicators included in the model adopted at institutional level, after these have been brought to the attention of CEAC-UBB. The evaluation of the planned achievements is done annually, within the process of evaluation of the professional activity of the teachers and researchers by the management.
- b) Other procedures and mechanisms for the periodic development of the internal quality assurance of doctoral studies, at the level of the Domain are listed below:



- annual review of the content of the specialized disciplines offered within the Domain, by integrating the latest information and professional standards
- teaching English subjects and using English language courses and resources for the other, available on the Moodle platform

c) Within the UBB, quality assurance and competitiveness is regulated by a series of internal decisions on quality principles, criteria and indicators (Annex 1.3.8) as well as competitiveness standards and indicators (Annex 1.3.9). The Qualitas Center annually develops a quality assurance program at university level (Annex 1.3.10). In turn, the faculties carry out their own annual quality assurance programs, by developing the quality objectives from the operational plans. Both the program developed at the university level and those developed by the faculties refer to the quality of teaching-learning, scientific research and internal services and to the community. Within these dimensions, quality programs include the objectives pursued, the actions envisaged to achieve the objectives, the quantification of the achievement of the objectives, the responsibilities and the estimated deadlines for the completion of each objective. At the end of the period covered by these programs, the fulfillment of the assumed objectives is evaluated.

d) The scientific activity of doctoral students is constantly monitored by their coordinators, according to the needs of each student and the teacher's own methods. Within the field, the periodical evaluation of the learning and research results of the doctoral students takes place, based on the procedure of evaluation of the activity of the doctoral students described in art. 64 of the Regulation of the Faculty of Economics and Business Management of Organization and Conduct of Doctoral University Studies.

The evaluation procedures and criteria are established by the SDSEGA Council and aim to ensure:

- the correct measurement of the performances of doctoral students, including the differences in performance between them;
- analysis of the progress of doctoral students in acquiring the knowledge and skills associated with the professional qualification concerned;
- administrative and academic verification to ensure the correctness of the procedures;
- transparency and information on the criteria for assessing doctoral students;
- informing the doctoral students about the evaluation strategy, the methods, the evaluation criteria and the expected performances.

e) The evaluation criteria of the doctoral thesis are found in art. 45 of the Regulation of the Faculty of Economics and Business Management of Organization and Conduct of Doctoral University Studies, and the procedure for public defense of the doctoral thesis is described in art. 50-55 of the mentioned document. All this information is made available to students in advance and doctoral supervisors prepare customized development plans for coordinated students, in order to meet scientific requirements (eg minimum number of publications and their type).

f) At the level of SDSEGA, each doctoral supervisor establishes with his doctoral students their needs for equipment, consumables, access to databases and additional data to those offered by the institution and other acquisitions. These can be found in the annual estimate formalized in specific documents.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to make a clearer record of the application of the said Operational Procedure.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator *C.1.1.2. Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.

At the level of SDSEGA, each doctoral supervisor establishes with his doctoral students their needs for equipment, consumables, access to databases and additional data to those offered by the institution and other acquisitions. These can be found in the annual estimate formalized in specific documents.

PhD students provide feedback to doctoral supervisors through regular meetings. For the courses they follow within the university training program, the doctoral students evaluate through their institutional account each holder of the discipline.

Recommendations:

It is recommended a better operationalization of the provisions of this procedure and the elaboration of a plan of measures for the continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes.

It is recommended to prepare and distribute to students a feedback questionnaire on their level of satisfaction with the doctoral program, in order to continuously improve academic and administrative processes .

The indicator is met.

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

Details regarding the availability of information of interest for doctoral students, future candidates, respectively of information of public interest at the level of IOSUD UBB and SEGA, https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n2.php?id_c=24&id_m=4 , respectively SDCRPP Regulation (<http://sdcrpp.ro/admitere.html>)



Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- (a) the Doctoral School regulation;*
- (b) the admission regulation;*
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*
- (e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;*
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);*
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*
- (i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.*

All information of interest to doctoral students, potential candidates, future doctors and PhD supervisors is available in electronic format, online, at the following addresses:

- (a) the IOSUD / doctoral school regulations;
<https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2018/Regulamentu%20scolii%20doctorale%20FEAGA2018.pdf>
- (b) the rules of admission;
<https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/Regulamentu%20pentru%20admiterea%20online%20la%20Scoala%20doctorala%20SEGA.docx>
- (c) the doctoral study contract;
https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/Contract_de_studii_2018.pdf
- (d) the regulation for the completion of studies including the procedure for the public defense of the thesis;
<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/ro/formulare/>
- (e) the content of training programs based on advanced university studies;
https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n3.php?id_s=178&id_c=106&id_m=3
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas / research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the school, as well as their institutional contact details;
<https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2020/Regulamentu%20pentru%20admiterea%20online%20la%20Scoala%20doctorala%20SEGA.docx>
- (g) list of doctoral students in the school with basic information (year of enrollment; leader);
[Appendix MK 63 List of Students with Basic Information](#)
- (h) information on the standards for the elaboration of the doctoral thesis;
https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/Scoala_Doctorala/Ghid%20de%20redactare%20a%20tezei%20de%20doctorat.pdf



i) information on opportunities for doctoral students aimed at attending conferences, publishing articles, awarding scholarships, etc .;

https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n3.php?id_s=313&id_c=106&id_m=3

(j) links to abstracts of doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, location where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense.

https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n3.php?id_s=274&id_c=106&id_m=3

IOSUD publishes on its website all the useful information for doctoral students, potential candidates and other information of public interest (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/eng/>). Regarding the transparency of information of public interest, the SDSEGA website (<http://econ/ubbcluj.ro>) offers complete, up-to-date and easily accessible public information on the objectives, the teaching-learning process, the resources, the results and the management system. All the information provided publicly can be consulted synthetically through the website map (https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/harta_site.php). SDSEGA publishes on the FSEGA website general information on doctoral studies, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection. This information is available by accessing the functional link found on the Faculty's website (https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/n2.php?id_c=106&id_m=3)

Recommendations:

Continuous updating of the web pages of IOSUD and the Doctoral School.

The indicator is met.

Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.

Marketing PhD students can access the BCU resources and the EBSCO database through the institutional email address, as well as the international databases that are available through www.enformation.ro, to which UBB is subscribed. Also, as can be seen from the figure below, 50% of the students surveyed in the field of marketing stated that they have access to a large extent to international databases for consulting bibliographic sources in the field, free of charge.

Recommendations:

Permanent information of doctoral students on free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the field of Marketing.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.

Verification of the degree of similarity of the manuscripts and / or scientific texts made by the doctoral students is done with the help of the institutional account to which each doctoral supervisor has access in the Turnitin software. The doctoral supervisor uploads here the doctoral student's text / manuscript / research report, the software



indicating the existing degree of similarity. Before the admission for the public defense of the doctoral thesis, IOSUD UBB performs the verification of its similarity in an approved software.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to support doctoral students and to verify the scientific work done.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

At the IOSUD level, there are mechanisms for the prevention of plagiarism through the subscription-based use of iThenticate and Turnitin services. SDSEGA offers upon request access to the verification of the thesis originality through the Turnitin application managed by the Faculty. Each doctoral supervisor has an account in Turnitin and can verify the degree of similarity of other theses at the request of the doctoral student.

Also, SDSEGA has a Guide for the elaboration of doctoral theses (https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/Scoala_Dctorala/Ghid%20de%20redactare%20a%20tezei%20de%20doctorat.pdf). Before the presentation before the guidance commission, the thesis is verified with the help of the software from IOSUD level. The steps for verifying the similarities are performed by IOSUDUBB, according to the updated Procedure regarding the generation and analysis of the Similarity Report of March 8, 2017 brought in Completing the CSUD Decision no. 12327 / 19.06.2016 (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wpcontent/uploads/2018/05/Completare-12327.pdf=#>) and, under special conditions, Hot. Senate no. 5939 din 16.04.2020 (<https://doctorat.ubbcluj.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/Anexa-3-la-Regulament-de-organizare-%C8%99i-desf%C4%83%C8%99urare-a-studiilor-deddoctorat-final.pdf>)

For the Marketing field, as well as for the rest of SEGA's doctoral fields, free access to the subscribed databases is ensured, based on the doctoral student ID card, as it appears from the SDSEGA Regulation <https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/Regulament-FSEGAreactualizat%202018.pdf> , respectively Regulation SDCRPP (<http://sdcrrp.ro/admitere.html>).

Within SEGA, the access of doctoral students to the research laboratories and to the subscribed financial databases available inside the FSEGA Library is made according to the Rules of Internal Order at Faculty level, under the conditions of a prior appointment and of some rules to respect for access and use. . Marketing PhD students have access to the Euromonitor and Statista databases through a subscription available at the faculty level: <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/stire.php?id=658> . At the same time, there is access from the faculty building and to the Refinitive database <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/stire.php?id=315> .

In addition, PhD students have access to a laboratory (room 411) where there are licenses for various computer programs (PLS; SPSS; State, etc.).

Recommendations:



Supporting new doctoral students admitted to the doctorate so that they have access to the existing research infrastructure.

The indicator is met.

Criterion C.3. Internationalization

Standard C.3.1. There is a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

Internationalization is one of the most important strategic directions of the "Babeş-Bolyai" University of Cluj-Napoca. The internationalization strategy proposes a coherent, realistic and pragmatic action plan, with the general objectives of:

- i. Increasing international visibility;
- ii. Building an advisory forum consisting of teachers with experience in internationalizing studies;
- iii. Encouraging faculty representation in international bodies (*Annex MK 61: Strategic Plan at FSEGA Level*

Performance Indicator *C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

PhD students in the PhD field of Marketing have the opportunity to benefit from study mobility within the European Erasmus programs, CEEPUS for the doctoral studies cycle (**Annex MK 64 List of ERASMUS agreements at UBB / FSEGA level**), respectively SDCRPP Regulation (<http://sdcrrp.ro/admitere.html>).

In the field of Marketing, PhD students benefited during the evaluated period from mobility for participation in scientific conferences abroad (**Annex MK 65 List of participation of PhD students in conferences abroad**). These conferences were attended by a total of 9 PhD students out of the 22 active on 30.9.2020 in the field of Marketing (40.90%).

Also, following the analysis of the answers of the students surveyed in the field of Marketing, it resulted that over 40% of them consider that the university offers them the chance to participate in exchanges of experience / international mobility internships during doctoral studies. *Recommendations:*

Stimulating doctoral supervisors through clear and effective measures for the purpose of concluding Erasmus + agreements or other types of mobility agreements or grants.

Stimulating by clear and effective measures the doctoral students in order to carry out at least one mobility within the doctoral internship.

The indicator is met.



Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. *In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

In the School of Doctoral SEGA have been invited experts who have held lectures including the field of PhD Marketing in the Seminar Scientific periodically organized by FSEGA, CEBS (<https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/stire.php?id=14>). Among the guests in the field of Marketing are prof.univ.dr.pr.prof.hc Bernhard S. Swoboda (University of Trier, Germany); Professor Marko Sarstedt (University of Magdeburg Germany); Professor David B. Grant (Hanken School of Economics, Helsinki, Finland). Also, the students present at the evaluation meetings of the Marketing field confessed that during the doctoral studies different experts in the field were invited, who provided them with a lot of useful information for their future research activity.

It may be mentioned conferences and other scientific events organized within the faculty and especially the annual conference of the Department of Marketing: Marketing from Information to Decision to the doctoral field of PhD Marketing presents works and enter into dialogue with other participants and guests, getting feedback valuable on the topic of their research thesis: <https://econ.ubbcluj.ro/mid/conference> .

In the field of Marketing, various workshops were organized with marketing research experts from the country (Bucharest Academy of Economic Studies, University of Bucharest, University of Pitesti) and abroad (University of Hamburg, Germany) (**Annex MK 22 Doctoral Workshop 4-5 February 2019 ; Annex MK 23 Doctoral Workshop Program 4-5 February 2019 ; Annex MK 24 Doctoral Workshop 14 March 2019**).

In the scope of Marketing have been concluded two agreements of coordination in joint supervision of doctoral students Stefan Heid German Michael Philip Martin HEIDE in cooperation with the University of Nürtingen-Geislingen, Germany (**Annex 15 Joint Supervision MK Michael P. Heide , Annex MK 16 Joint Supervision Martin S. Heide**).

Recommendations:

Encouraging doctoral supervisors and doctoral students to complete doctoral theses in international workshops.

Inviting international experts for presentations in the field of Marketing.

The indicator is met.

Performance Indicator C.3.1.3. *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).*

The internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported through the specialized structures and their actions at the UBB level, both within the SEGA Faculty and in the one of the SDSEGA stipulated in the SDSEGA Regulation https://www.econ.ubbcluj.ro/documente2021/FEGEGA_Regulation-



updated% 202018.pdf respectively SDCRPP Regulation
 (<http://sdcropp.ro/admitere.html>).

The doctoral coordinators of the Marketing field participated in the evaluated period in teaching and research internships through Erasmus + programs, CEEPUS and other funding abroad. Their stated purpose, in addition to teaching and / or research activities, was also to attract foreign doctoral students to study in Romania (**Annex MK 10 Internships abroad marketing coordinators**).

The internationalization of doctoral studies in the field of marketing is also ensured by:

- 2 doctoral students coordinated by prof.univ.dr. CM Pop is doing his doctoral thesis in English;
- two of the doctoral students coordinated by prof.univ.dr. DC Dabija are German citizens and are doing their doctoral thesis in German;
- a doctoral student coordinated by prof.univ.dr. DC Dabija is an Austrian citizen and is doing his doctoral thesis in German;
- an international expert is included in the coordination commissions of two doctoral students (Prof. Barbara Kreis-Engelhardt, PhD, Nürtingen-Geislingn University);
- 5 PhD students (22.72%) out of the 22 PhD students active on 30.9.2020 in the field of Marketing carry out doctoral theses in English and German.

Recommendations:

The need to adopt an internationalization plan with clear and specific measures. These should be part of the mission of doctoral studies and not left to the level of doctoral supervisors.

The indicator is met

IV. SWOT Analysis

<u>Strengths:</u>	<u>Weaknesses:</u>
<p>Educational offer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comprehensive profile of scientific research as well as research areas and topics; - Relevant results of the research undertaken by the active doctoral supervisors of the field, who prove competences for guiding the doctoral theses; - Supporting internationalization through the activities of doctoral supervisors in the field (Prof. Dan-Cristian Dabija, PhD, coordinates three German citizens starting with the 2018/2019 academic year); - Encouraging multiculturalism by concluding joint agreements: - 	<p>Educational offer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A unitary policy to attract new doctoral students, including from abroad; - Insufficient capitalization of interesting research topics for the professional environment (marketing applied in different sectors of activity). - Lack of an internationalization plan with specific measures. <p>student</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Insufficient financial stimulation of the research of admitted doctoral students, with all its aspects (access to databases, financing of training courses and mobilities); <p>Scientific research</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Providing research conditions at an appropriate level. <p>Scientific research</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Existence of a research center in the field; - Relevant publications in the field of doctoral supervisors; - Use of information technology and databases in the field of economics and business administration; - Covering their own disciplines with didactic and scientific material useful for doctoral students; - Development of research topics in accordance with the shortcomings found in the literature, the topicality of some topics and the requirements of scientific research; - Existing research and institutional projects. <p>Domestic and international cooperation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Continuing the tradition of lasting and beneficial collaborations with profile institutions in the country and abroad (for example, guest speakers and professors); - Concluding co-supervised doctoral agreements with foreign universities; - International visibility of doctoral supervisors who are prerequisites for future cooperation, joint research and development of research infrastructure in the field; - Facilitating the travel of PhD students by coordinating their mobility activities. <p>Material basis</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The existence of material resources at high standards, which ensure adequate research conditions for doctoral students. <p>Information, documentation and libraries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Appropriate equipment with computers, laptops, video projectors necessary for 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - International visibility of doctoral students' scientific results <p>Information, documentation and libraries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Books published in foreign publishing houses. <p>timely</p> <p>Educational offer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Existence of national and international research programs to finance doctoral and post-doctoral research; <p>student</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The digitalization of education and its relocation mainly in the online environment increases the interest of practitioners to enroll in doctoral studies. <p>Scientific research</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The predominantly online organization of national and international conferences facilitates the participation of PhD supervisors and PhD students in prestigious international conferences or provides access to various "networks" for the exchange of best practices, the formation of research clusters <p>Domestic and international cooperation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The interest and openness of all national or foreign Universities for cooperation. <p>Material basis</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In the absence of physical classes and students by moving them online, there is potential to modernize the material base. <p>Information, documentation and libraries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of new technologies accessible to students and useful for the teaching-learning process.
---	--

<p>teaching in the doctoral school and research activities;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Access to information networks, scientific databases and financial information. 	
<p><u>Opportunities:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Offering the possibilities of applied research to specialized companies, professional associations, administration; local public; - favorable economic environment in the proximity of the assessed institution, the uniqueness of the study programs and their relevance to the local/national market, the overall attractiveness of the study programs etc. 	<p><u>Threats:</u></p> <p>Educational offer</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Decreasing the number of places financed from the state budget. - Visible policy of European universities to attract Master's graduates to their own doctoral programs. <p>student</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A decrease in the interest of Master's graduates to continue their studies with Doctoral studies; - Hiring part-time or full-time doctoral students and reducing the time allocated to research; <p>Scientific research</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Insufficient financial resources allocated by government instruments to doctoral supervisors and doctoral students to support the high costs of research. <p>Domestic and international cooperation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lack of a budget for each Doctoral School. <p>Information, documentation and libraries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - High costs for the acquisition of publications and current economic information.

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

Nr.Crt.	Indicator type (*, IPC)	Performance indicator	Qualifying	recommendation
1.		A.1.1.1.	perform	<p><i>It is recommended that all the decisions of the Doctoral School Council be published on the doctoral school's website.</i></p> <p><i>It is recommended to continue constantly updating the website of the Doctoral School so that both doctoral supervisors, doctoral students and candidates for admission can find all the necessary information on the site.</i></p> <p><i>It is recommended that the activity of the doctoral student's representative be disseminated as much as possible among the students, so as to increase transparency regarding the decisions that directly involve the students.</i></p>
2.		A.1.1.2.	perform	<p><i>It is recommended to constantly update the doctoral school regulations in accordance with existing legislation;</i></p> <p><i>It is recommended to manage the quality issues within the doctoral school board with the participation of the members of the doctoral school in the field of economics in order to periodically update the operating regulations.</i></p>
3.		A.1.2.1.	perform	<p><i>Publication on the website of the doctoral school related to each field within the socio-</i></p>

				<p><i>human sciences of performance and quality information from the student management system.</i></p>
4.		A.1.2.2.	perform	<p><i>Make a strict record of the use of this software platform, so that the results obtained can be easily accessed by applicants.</i></p> <p><i>Consider improved versions of this software in order to expand the database to increase the level of originality.</i></p>
5.		A.1.3.1.	perform	<p><i>It is recommended to constantly update the list of national and international research grants or institutional development / human resources as well as to expand the list.</i></p> <p><i>It is recommended to expand public-private partnerships.</i></p>
6.	*	A.1.3.2	perform	<p><i>Better support for PhD students is recommended in order to obtain additional funding.</i></p> <p><i>A more rigorous record of the types of funding obtained by doctoral students is recommended.</i></p> <p><i>It is recommended to involve the private sector in awarding scholarships for doctoral students, taking into account the fact that the employers' representatives expressed their availability during the meeting with the evaluation committee.</i></p>

7.	*	A.1.3.3.	Partially Fulfilled	<i>It is recommended to make available to each doctoral school a budget in relation to the number of doctoral students and their development needs. Introduction and development of university entrepreneurship by forming spin-offs and starting start-ups at university level to increase funding sources.</i>
8.	CPI	A.2.1.1.	perform	<i>It is recommended to continue investments for equipment and especially for new database processing software. It is recommended to develop a mechanism for attracting resources / funds from the private sector.</i>
9.	CPI	A.3.1.1.	perform	<i>It is recommended to support the habilitation for other members of the academic community. It is recommended to identify possible foreign doctoral supervisors who can join the Marketing field.</i>
10.	*	A.3.1.2.	perform	<i>Continuous identification of empowerment capacity for members of the academic community.</i>
11.		A.3.1.3.	perform	<i>Ongoing monitoring of the courses and the staff who support them is recommended.</i>
12.	*	A.3.1.4.	perform	<i>Continuous monitoring of the number of doctoral students</i>

				<i>coordinated by each doctoral supervisor.</i>
13.	CPI	A.3.2.1.	perform	<i>It is recommended to monitor the performance of doctoral supervisors and doctoral students with international visibility.</i>
14.	*	A.3.2.2.	perform	<i>Continuous monitoring of compliance with the minimum CNATDCU standards in force for each doctoral supervisor.</i>
15.	*	B.1.1.1 .	perform	<i>Continue to attract graduates from other higher education institutions, especially from abroad.</i>
16.	*	B.1.2.1.	perform	<i>Continuous publication of relevant information on the website of the Doctoral School.</i>
17.		B.1.2.2.	perform	<i>Monitoring the evolution of doctoral students and identifying solutions to solve problems that may slow down or stop their research. Active involvement of doctoral guidance committees and the Career Guidance and Counseling Center in order to prevent and avoid research failure.</i>
18.		B.2.1.1.	perform	<i>Permanent updating of the content of the relevant disciplines for the training in the scientific research of the doctoral students in the field of Marketing.</i>
19.		B.2.1.2.	perform	<i>Conducting meetings / workshops with doctoral students on research ethics issues. Introduction of a discipline intended</i>

				<i>exclusively for ethics in scientific research .</i>
20.		B.2.1.3	perform	<i>Maintaining and improving these mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the field of Marketing, aims at learning outcomes. Monitoring the subject sheet for all disciplines in the doctoral school curriculum.</i>
21.		B.2.1.4.	perform	<i>Further monitoring of these meetings and the results of collaborations between doctoral students and members of the steering committees.</i>
22.	CPI	B.2.1.5.	accomplished	<i>The need for an electronic record of the composition of the guidance commissions at the level of the Doctoral School. Inclusion in the steering commissions of specialists from other university centers or from abroad.</i>
23.	CPI	B.3.1.1.	accomplished	<i>It is recommended to increase the number of papers published by PhD students to make significant contributions in the field of Marketing.</i>
24.	*	B.3.1.2.	accomplished	<i>It is recommended to create a platform to collect all the results of doctoral students during their doctoral internship, as well as access to this information on the website of the Doctoral School.</i>

25.	*	B.3.2.1.	accomplished	<i>Permanent monitoring at the level of the Doctoral School of the commissions for public support of the doctoral theses for the observance of this criterion.</i>
26.	*	B.3.2.2.	accomplished	<i>Permanent monitoring at the level of the Doctoral School of the commissions for public support of the doctoral theses for the observance of this criterion. It is recommended a greater diversification of the referents invited to participate in the commissions for the defense of the doctoral theses.</i>
27.		C.1.1.1.	perform	<i>It is recommended to make a clearer record of the application of the said Operational Procedure.</i>
28.	*	C.1.1.2.	perform	<i>It is recommended a better operationalization of the provisions of this procedure and the elaboration of a plan of measures for the continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. It is recommended to prepare and distribute to students a feedback questionnaire on their level of satisfaction with the doctoral program, in order to continuously improve academic and administrative processes .</i>

29.	CPI	C.2.1.1	<i>perform</i>	<i>Continuous updating of the web pages of IOSUD and the Doctoral School.</i>
30.		C.2.2.1.	<i>perform</i>	<i>Permanent information for doctoral students on free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the field of Marketing.</i>
31.		C.2.2.2.	<i>perform</i>	<i>It is recommended to support doctoral students and to verify the scientific work done.</i>
32.		C.2.2.3.	<i>perform</i>	<i>Supporting new doctoral students admitted to the doctorate so that they have access to the existing research infrastructure.</i>
33.	*	C.3.1.1 .	<i>perform</i>	<i>Stimulating doctoral supervisors through clear and effective measures for the purpose of concluding Erasmus + agreements or other types of mobility agreements or grants. Stimulating by clear and effective measures the doctoral students in order to carry out at least one mobility within the doctoral internship.</i>
34.		C.3.1.2.	<i>accomplished</i>	<i>Encouraging doctoral supervisors and doctoral students to complete doctoral theses in international workshops. Inviting international experts for presentations in the field of Marketing.</i>
35.		C.3.1.3.	<i>perform</i>	<i>The need to adopt an internationalization plan with clear and specific measures. These should be part of the mission of doctoral studies and not</i>



				<i>left to the level of doctoral supervisors.</i>
--	--	--	--	---

The recommendations contained in the report shall be resumed in the indicators' analysis. Other general recommendations may be made that do not fit within a particular indicator.

VERY IMPORTANT!!! – Each identified weakness must be correlated with at least one recommendation to improve the situation!

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

- It is recommended that all the decisions of the Doctoral School Council be published on the doctoral school's website.*
- It is recommended that the activity of the doctoral student's representative be disseminated as much as possible among the students, so as to increase transparency regarding the decisions that directly involve the students.*
- It is recommended to continue constantly updating the website of the Doctoral School so that both doctoral supervisors, doctoral students and candidates for admission can find all the necessary information on the site.*
- It is recommended to constantly update the doctoral school regulations in accordance with existing legislation;*
- It is recommended to manage the quality issues within the Doctoral School Council with the participation of the members of the doctoral school in the field of economics in order to periodically update the operating regulations.*
- Publication on the website of the doctoral school related to each field within the socio-human sciences of performance and quality information from the student management system.*
- Make a strict record of the use of this software platform, so that the results obtained can be easily accessed by applicants.*
- Consider improved versions of this software in order to expand the database to increase the level of originality.*
- It is recommended to constantly update the list of national and international research grants or institutional development / human resources as well as to expand the list.*
- It is recommended to expand public-private partnerships.*
- Better support for PhD students is recommended in order to obtain additional funding.*
- A more rigorous record of the types of funding obtained by doctoral students is recommended.*



- *It is recommended to involve the private sector in awarding scholarships for doctoral students. Taking into account the fact that the employers' representatives expressed their availability during the meeting with the evaluation committee.*
 - *It is recommended to make available to each doctoral school a budget in relation to the number of doctoral students and their development needs.*
 - *Introduction and development of university entrepreneurship by forming spin-offs and starting start-ups at university level to increase funding sources.*
 - *It is recommended to continue investments for equipment and especially for new database processing software.*
 - *It is recommended to develop a mechanism for attracting resources / funds from the private sector.*
 - *It is recommended to support the empowerment for other members of the academic community.*
 - *It is recommended to identify possible foreign doctoral supervisors who can join the Marketing field.*
 - *Continuous identification of empowerment capacity for members of the academic community.*
- *Ongoing monitoring of the courses and the staff who support them is recommended.*
- *Continuous monitoring of the number of doctoral students coordinated by each doctoral supervisor.*
 - *It is recommended to monitor the performance of doctoral supervisors and doctoral students with international visibility.*
 - *Continuous monitoring of compliance with the minimum CNATDCU standards in force for each doctoral supervisor.*
 - *Continue to attract graduates from other higher education institutions, especially from abroad.*
 - *Continuous publication of relevant information on the website of the Doctoral School.*
 - *Monitoring the evolution of doctoral students and identifying solutions to solve problems that may slow down or stop their research.*
 - *Active involvement of doctoral guidance committees and the Career Guidance and Counseling Center in order to prevent and avoid research failure.*
 - *Permanent updating of the content of the relevant disciplines for the training in the scientific research of the doctoral students in the field of Marketing.*
 - *Conducting meetings with PhD students on research ethics issues.*
 - *Maintaining and improving these mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the field of Marketing, aims at learning outcomes.*
 - *Monitoring the subject sheet for all disciplines in the doctoral school curriculum.*
 - *Further monitoring of these meetings and the results of collaborations between doctoral students and members of the steering committees.*
 - *Inclusion in the steering commissions of specialists from other university centers or from abroad.*
 - *It is recommended to increase the number of papers published by PhD students to make significant contributions in the field of Marketing.*



- *It is recommended to create a platform to collect all the results of doctoral students during their doctoral internship, as well as access to this information on the doctoral school website.*
- *Permanent monitoring at the level of the Doctoral School of the commissions for public support of the doctoral theses for the observance of this criterion.*
- *It is recommended a greater diversification of the referents invited to participate in the commissions for defending the doctoral theses.*
- *It is recommended to make a clearer record of the application of the above-mentioned Operational Procedure.*
- *It is recommended a better operationalization of the provisions of this procedure and the elaboration of a plan of measures for the continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes.*
- *Continuous updating of the web pages of IOSUD and of the Doctoral School of Socio-human Sciences.*
- *Permanent information for doctoral students on free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the field of Marketing.*
- *It is recommended to support doctoral students and to verify the scientific work done.*
- *Supporting new doctoral students admitted to the doctorate so that they have access to the existing research infrastructure.*
- *Stimulating doctoral supervisors through clear and effective measures for the purpose of concluding Erasmus + agreements or other types of mobility agreements or grants.*
- *Stimulating by clear and effective measures the doctoral students in order to carry out at least one mobility within the doctoral internship.*
- *Encouraging doctoral supervisors and doctoral students to write doctoral theses in international co-supervision.*
- *Inviting international experts for presentations in the field of Marketing.*
- *The need to adopt an internationalization plan with clear and specific measures. These should be part of the mission of doctoral studies and not left to the level of doctoral supervisors.*

VII. Annexes

The following types of documents shall be attached:

- *The detailed schedule of the evaluation visit – MANDATORY.*
- *The survey questionnaire applied to doctoral students or academic staff in the doctoral study domain under review, the results - optional (e.g., in graphic form) and their interpretation - if applicable.*
- *Scanned documents – any document requested from the IOSUD during the evaluation visit and received, which is not found in the internal evaluation file received before the visit and referred to in the report.*



- *Pictures – if relevant issues are raised regarding the condition of the student residences, cafeterias, premises for teaching and learning activities, library etc.*
- *Screenshots/Print screens of the Doctoral School/IOSUD website proving specific claims in the report, accompanied by the date when they were accessed and saved.*
- *Any other documents relevant to the evaluation process referred to in the report.*