

I. Introduction:

In the period 12th of July – 16th of July 2021, the Romanian Agency for Quality Assurance in the Higher Education (ARACIS) has carried out the assessment visit of the Doctoral School with the National University of Political Studies and Public Administration (SNSPA) of Bucharest. The verification of the fulfilment of mandatory normative requirements, of the criteria, standards, and performance indicators, and of the specific standards has been performed by the Commission of specialty permanent experts, having the following members:

1. **Mission Manager - IOSUD, Professor Seghedin Eugen Neculai, PhD**, Gheorghe Asachi" Technical University of Iasi;
2. **Coordinator of the expert assessors' team – IOSUD, Professor HORGĂ Ioan, PhD**, University of Oradea;
3. **Foreign Expert - IOSUD, Prof.Dr. Krzysztof Kozłowski** - Warsaw School of Economics;
4. **Doctoral Student – IOSUD, Stavarache Răzvan Cosmin** - "Gheorghe Asachi" Technical University of Iasi;
5. **Technical Secretary – IOSUD, Professor Mihail Anton, PhD** - „Carol I“ National University of Defence of Bucharest.

The self-assessment report has been elaborated in compliance with the Order of the Minister of Education no. 3651 of 12th of April 2021, published in the Official Journal, part I, no. 414 of 20th of April 2021, including both the Methodology for the assessment of doctoral studies, and the System of criteria, standards, and performance indicators used in the accreditation and periodical assessment of doctoral schools and their fields. The assessment has complied with the mixed work method imposed during the emergency period, determined by the spreading of the SARS-CoV-2 virus. The meetings have been organized both online, through the Zoom platform, and physically at the office of the University, while complying with all the enforceable norms imposed by the pandemic context.

Since 2000, SNSPA has been an *Institution Organizing Doctoral Studies (IOSUD)* in the field of *Political Sciences*, and starting from the academic year 2001-2002, it becomes an institution organizing doctoral studies also in the field of *Administration Sciences*. Starting from 2008, SNSPA has been organizing doctoral studies for the fields of *Sociology* and *Communication sciences*, and since 2019, for the *Management* field. At the level of IOSUD-SNSPA, it is implemented a European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System for the period of doctoral studies of minimum 180 ECTS, before the presentation of the doctoral thesis. On 1st of October 2020, the Doctoral School of SNSPA has registered students for all the 5 doctoral programs, at the time of the vising, having 37 thesis advisors, as follows:

Field of doctoral studies	Total advisors	Number of doctoral advisors meeting the CNATDCU criteria	Percentage of doctoral advisors meeting the CNATDCU criteria
Management	5	5	100%

Administration sciences	3	2	67%
Communication sciences	10	8	80%
Political sciences	15	9	60%
Sociology	4	3	75%
TOTAL IOSUD	37	27	73%

During this academic year, the Doctoral School of SNSPA has a number of 353 students, doctoral field of Sociology – 25; doctoral field of Communication Sciences – 74; doctoral field of Administration Sciences – 54; doctoral field of Political Sciences – 176; doctoral field of Management – 24.

II. Used methods:

Before the assessment visit of IOSUD-SNSPA, the Commission of specialty permanent experts analysed the internal assessment file of IOSUD, and the filed appendices. During the visit, the ARACIS commission analysed the required documents, and also the data and information presented in electronic format from the site of the Doctoral School (<http://doctorat.snspa.ro/>). Furthermore, there were executed visits at the office of SNSPA, during which the space designed for the process of learning and research, but also for the administrative activities, were observed. There were more than 15 meetings with online support with the representatives of the management of the university and doctoral school, with the responsible people from the doctoral studies field, with the doctoral advisors, with the representatives of the Ethics Commission, and of the Commission of Assessment and Quality Assurance within SNSPA, with the doctoral students, graduates, but also with employers from public and private space.

III. Analysis of performance indicators

During the visit for the assessment of the Doctoral School of SNSPA, the Commission of specialty permanent experts analysed the accomplishment level of standards and criteria, according to the Methodology for the assessment of doctoral studies. We finally summarise the accomplishment level of the assessed standards and criteria.

A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

A.1.1. The National University of Political Studies and Public Administration, as an institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD SNSPA, respectively at the Doctoral School:

SNSPA applies at the IOSUD level, the specific regulations:

a) Internal regulations:

- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs (in Romanian, and in English);
- Regulation for the Selection and Admission of Researchers at the Post-doctoral School of SNSPA;
- Regulation regarding the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS).

b) Methodology for conducting elections at the level at the IOSUD-SNSPA level (CSUD and election by the students of their representatives in CSUD):

- Methodology regarding the development of the elections at the level of the Board for Doctoral Studies;
- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs (in Romanian, and in English);
- SNSPA Carta, art. 29, paragraph 2.

c) methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies):

- Regulation and Methodology for the Organization of the Admission Contest at SNSPA;
- Regulation for the Organization of the Admission Contest at the Doctoral Study Program;
- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs.

d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad:

- Methodology regarding the recognition of the doctor's diploma, and title of doctor in sciences, or in a certain professional field, obtained abroad;
- Methodology regarding the automatic recognition by the National University of Political Studies and Public Administration of the capacity of doctoral coordinator obtained in academic institutions accredited abroad;
- Methodology for the recognition of the teaching positions from the academic education obtained in academic institutions accredited abroad;
- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs.

e) functional management structures [IOSUD/CSUD/Council of doctoral school (the regularity of meetings)];

- In June, the elections for the formal set-up of CSUD was made, and the CSUD has now the following members: CSUD principal - Professor Nicoleta Corbu, PhD, members representing the fields: Political sciences: Professor Andrei Țăranu, PhD, Lecturer. Miruna Burnaru-Troncotă, PhD; Communication sciences: Professor Diana Cismaru, PhD; Sociology: univ. assistant Alfred Bulai, PhD; Administration sciences: Professor Emil Bălan, PhD; Management: Professor Mădălina Vătămănescu., PhD

f) contract for doctoral studies;

- Contract for doctoral studies, places with budget financing, with scholarship;
- Contract for doctoral studies, places with budget financing, without scholarship;
- Contract for doctoral studies, places with tuition fee;
- Contract for doctoral studies, places assigned to foreign students.

g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies;

- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs, chapter XIII, Assessment and internal and external monitoring of Doctoral School;

- The internal quality assessment of a doctoral study program is periodically performed by CEAC based on the self-assessment report drawn up by the Board for Doctoral Studies, for each doctoral field.

The requirement is met.

A.1.1.2. The doctoral school's Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.

- The Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Development of Doctoral Study Programs, includes in the Chapter XV, the mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.

The requirement is met.

A.1.2. The National University of Political Studies and Public Administration, as an institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the mission of the doctoral studies.

A.1.2.1. Existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background

- The proper digital system for the track of doctoral students and their academic background, the ORACLE 8i database;
- Hardware and software equipment: server Fujitsu-Siemens Primergy TX200; operating system Windows 2000; server database Oracle 8i DataBase Server; server Oracle WebDB.

The requirement is met.

A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses;

- The Sistemantiplagiat.ro service, a digital program for the verification of the similitude percentage in the doctoral theses, and the check results is notified in a similitude report included three coefficients.

The requirement is met.

A.2. Research Infrastructure

The analysis of all the information made available for the Aracis Commission by IOSUD-SNSPA emphasises the fact that the spaces and material endowment of IOSUD SNSPA allow the execution of research activities from the assessed field, in compliance with the mission and assumed objectives.

A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school presents proof of its own possession or of having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies

- The office of SNSPA is in Bucharest, 30 A Expozitie Blvd., Sector 1. The building has a height regime of 2S + P + 8E. The office of SNSPA was put into service on 1st of October 2014, it has 3 auditoriums with a capacity of 228 places each, seminar and classrooms, 4 IT laboratories, a library with a study hall, and an electronic library, parking space for the vehicles, bikes and motorcycles;
- The Batistei Conferences International Centres (CIC) of Bucharest, 2 Emanoil Bacaloglu Street, Sector 2, having an auditorium with a capacity of 90 places and two seminar/classrooms.
- The SNSPA Library has the office in the university building in 30 A Expozitie Blvd., sector 1, and it has the following spaces: Study Hall of 174 sqm with 52 places of study with a loan office, the Centre of European Documentation with an area of 107 sqm and 12 places; The Book Warehouse with an area of 143 sqm.

The requirement is met.

A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school has collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.

- IOSUD-SNSPA is part of the partnership exploitation system of the research infrastructure offered by EERIS-UEFISCDI platform;
- At the level of each field, there are partnership agreements with different international research centres, developed in time, adjusted by international mobilities.

The requirement is met.

A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school proves that it is concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own IOSUD resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.

- The software products of SNSPA designed for the research are: SPSS Advance licenses, the licenses for the analysis of the project data, etc., own software products (*PlatOn-line*– e-learning platform, *Test Expert Manager*, *TextLink*);
- The infrastructure and logistics necessary for the performance of the research activity is supported by periodical acquisitions of hardware devices;
- The book stock owned by the SNSPA Library is of 24,170 titles in 40,434 volumes of monographic publications;
- The online scientific databases internationally recognised: EBSCO, JSTOR, ProQuest, ScienceDirect Freedom Collection, Cambridge Journals, ScienceDirect, Springerlink, Wiley Journals, Clarivate Analytics -Web of Science (Core Collection, InCites Journal Citation Reports, Derwent Innovations Index), SCOPUS.

The requirement is met

A.3. Quality of Human Resource

A.3.1. At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process

- Out of the total of 37 teaching staff coordinating doctoral studies, 27 met the CNATDCU criteria, meaning 73%.

A.3.1.1. The percentage of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies [3 or 4 years, depending on the field, plus the extension periods granted according to the art. 39 par. (3) from the Code approved by the Government Resolution no. 681/2011, with subsequent modifications and additions], does not exceed 20%.

- Currently, the percentage of the doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 12 works is of 16,21% (6 advisors out of 37).

The requirement is met.

A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD, in compliance with the enforceable legislation regarding the level of loading the norm with teaching and research activity.

- Out of the 37 doctoral advisors, 30 are university tenure teachers, meaning 81%.

The requirement is met.

B. Educational effectiveness

B1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates who submitted for admission contest

B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate the highest performance, and they are diversified as representation gender and social representation.

- Number of candidates admitted to doctoral studies:

Academic Year	No. of vacant posts for the admission contest		No. of candidates who submitted for admission contest	No. of Romanian students admitted		No. of foreign students admitted		No. of students in joint supervision	No. of Roma students admitted	Total students in the 1 st year
	budget	tuition		budget	tuition	Scholars of the Romanian state	UE tuition fee non UE			
2016-2017	65	7	72	60	5	1	2	0	0	68
2017-2018	60	19	94	59	16	1	3	2	2	79
2018-2019	52	18	83	52	10	2	8	0	0	72

2019-2020	56	21	92	56	17	3	4	1	1	80
2020-2021	52	17	133	52	15	2	2	0	1	71

B.1.1.1 Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria, including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.

- Regulation and methodology for the organization of the admission contest;
- Regulation for the organization of the admission contest at the doctoral studies;
- Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Performance of Doctoral Study Programs;
- Phases of the admission contest: checking the candidates' files (the previous professional experience of the candidates is analysed, their interest on the scientific research, publications in the field, proposal for the research subject) and an interview with the applicant (both in Romanian, and in an international language).

The requirement is met.

B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school has a policy for stimulating the enrolment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organizing support programs to prevent drop-outs.

- There are developed practices for stimulating the enrolment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating, for example, special places for Roma candidates;
- There are regulations stipulating measures for the social integration or support of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments (doctoral students coming from fosters houses, family houses and orphans of both parents).

The requirement is met.

B.2. The content of doctoral programs

B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behaviour in science.

- Significant problems of ethics and academic deontology are approached – plagiarism, production and data counterfeiting, *ghostwriting*, norms on working with vulnerable people, etc.;
- The class subjects use the bibliography and recent examples from the international academic environment, and also public resources.

B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least three disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the

statistical data processing.

- The disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students: *Mindful* research in the politics and international relationships, Qualitative research in social sciences – Interview Methods, Academic writing techniques, Methodology of social research, Research Methodology in social sciences, Academic drawing up, Qualitative and Quantitative methods in the research from economic sciences.

The requirement is met.

B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.

- The training program based on advanced studies include a subject dedicated to the ethics in scientific research and intellectual property: **Ethics and academic integrity.**

The requirement is met.

B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility, and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.

- The disciplines files in standardised format are elaborated;
- Each doctoral student benefits from the support of an advice commission composed of three members (other people than the doctoral advisor);
- The advice commission continuously assesses the academic and research performance of the doctoral student, and also the achievement of the publication criteria, and the participation to conferences;
- IOSUD-SNSPA promotes the education through skills, passing to learning centred on the student, in which the results of accumulated learning is transformed into skills allowing the graduate to face the requirements of the labour market, and to integrate in the society.

The requirement is met.

B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorisation of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international

publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.).

- The doctoral students prepare the scientific materials (books, chapters in academic volumes, articles) based on their doctoral research;
- The works elaborated by the doctoral students are published in the scientific magazines in the country and abroad, indexed in international databases, with high visibility and notoriety in the scientific environment (Web of Science, Scopus, Ebsco, ProQuest, DOAJ, ERIH, Index Copernicus, JournalSeek, Science Direct, SpringerLink, SSRN etc.);
- The research exploitation is made through the scientific events organized within SNSPA, or through the participation of its members at prestigious national and international conferences;
- The existence of specialty magazines, oriented towards the publication of original researches carried out by the SNSPA teams, presents, for information purposes, the information about the scientific activity of doctoral students/graduates of IOSUD-SNSPA.

The requirement is met.

B.4. Quality of completed doctoral theses

B.4.1. Completed doctoral theses fulfil high quality standards.

- The completed theses within the Doctoral School of SNSPA are checked for similitude through the application Sistemantiplagiat.ro;
- The application generates a report allowing the quantification of the similitude level of the assessed thesis with already published materials;

B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of CNADTCU, without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 year.

- In the assessed period, within IOSUD-SNSPA no doctoral theses were invalidated, with no right to be redone and the process of public defence resumed, at the level of the General Council of CNADTCU.

The requirement is met.

C. Quality Management

C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system

- The strategies for the quality assurance are consistent in every department, they stimulates the participation of each member of the teaching and research staff, and also of the students.
- The current performance levels and the action on some key factors are measured for the subsequent improvement of the results.

C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

- The strategic directions for the quality assurance are defined in the Strategic Plan of Assessment and Quality Assurance;
- The rules and procedures presented in the Regulation regarding the initiation, approval, monitoring and periodical assessment of the study programs, are applied;
- Methodology regarding the internal quality system regulating the functioning of the internal quality assurance system.

C.1.1.1. IOSUD developed and periodically applied a procedure for the assessment and internal monitoring of the evolution of the doctoral schools, among the assessed criteria the following criteria are mandatorily included:

a. the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;

- The Regulation regarding the initiation, approval, monitoring and periodical assessment of the study programs includes the procedures on the initiation, approval, monitoring and periodical assessment of the study programs and performed activities;
- The Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Development of Doctoral Study Programs regulates the monitoring of the study programs;
- The assessment of the doctoral coordinator teachers is made annually, in the months of February-March, for the previous academic year. The assessment implies: the Self-Assessment; the Assessment by the students; Collegial Assessment; Assessment by the field coordinator.

b. the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;

- Periodical acquisitions of software and hardware devices applications;
- Assuring the access to ANELIS databases;
- The doctoral students benefit from specific rooms where they can perform in the best conditions the activities of documentation and elaboration of scientific works;
- The doctoral students have access to specialty resources of the SNSPA libraries and research centres.

c. procedures and norms in sequences based on which the doctoral studies are organized

- The Institutional Regulation for the Organization and Development of Doctoral Study Programs presents the norms in sequences based on which the doctoral studies are organized;
- It is implemented a European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System for the period of doctoral studies of minimum 180 ECTS, before the presentation of the doctoral thesis;
- The ECTS credits can be obtained throughout the 3 years of the doctoral study program, in a flexible manner, depending on the provisions of the doctoral program of each doctoral student, by mutual agreement with the doctoral coordinator.

The requirement is met.

C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.

- According to the provisions of the art. 120 from the Carta, the students are represented in all the consultative, deliberative, and leading structures, and they have the right to democratically elect by free vote, directly expressed, their representatives from the leading structures of SNSPA, according to the law;
- Following the elections of June, the students' representative in CSUD are: Miahai Claudiu Gavrilesco (2nd year, field of Political Sciences), and Rareş Dimitrie Rădoi (1st year, field of Communication Sciences).

The requirement is met.

***C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.**

- According to the Regulation for the election of students' representatives in the leading structures of SNSPA, the doctoral students have the right to set up student organizations, the right of electing and being elected in leading structures at the faculty level'
- At the fields level, no students are elected within the boards.

The requirement is met.

***C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools' draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.**

- The objectives of the strategies and action policies of IOSUD-SNSPA are: Institutional development and human resources, Digitalization, Internalization, Quality Assurance, Opportunities for the students.

The requirement is met.

C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

- The permanent update of the information is made on the official site of the institution, www.snsa.ro, on the site of the Doctoral School, doctorat.snsa.ro.

C.2.1.1. The Doctoral School, through IOSUD, publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information about:

- a1) regulation of the doctoral school in Romanian - <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Regulament-Scoala-Doctorala-2020.pdf>;
- a2) regulation of the doctoral school in English <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/ENG-Regulament-IOSUD.pdf>;
- b) admission regulation - <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/Regulament-organizare-concurs-de-admitere.pdf>;
- c) contract of doctoral studies

Contract of doctoral studies at budget: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Contract-Loc-buget-cu-bursa-sau-fara-bursa.pdf>;

Contract of doctoral studies with tuition fee: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Contract-Loc-taxa.pdf>;

Contract for foreign students: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Contract-studenti-straini.pdf>;

d) regulation for the studies completion, also including the procedure of public defence of the thesis:

<http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Regulament-Scoala-Doctorala-2020.pdf>;

e) Content of studies programs: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Regulament-Scoala-Doctorala-2020.pdf>;

f) scientific profile and thematic areas/research themes of the doctoral leader within the school, and also their contact institutional data:

- Political Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/admitere/coordonatori-si-teme/>;

- Administration Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/admitere/coordonatori-si-teme-stiinte-administrative/>;

- Communication Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/admitere/profesori-si-teme-stiinte-ale-comunicarii/>;

- Management Field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/admitere/profesori-si-teme-management/>;

- Sociology Field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/admitere/profesori-si-teme-sociologie/>.

g) list of doctoral students within the school with the basic information (registration year, leader):

- Political Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/domenii-de-doctorat/stiinte-politice/doctoranzi/>;

- Administration Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/domenii-de-doctorat/stiinte-administrative/doctoranzi/>;

- Communication Sciences field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/domenii-de-doctorat/stiinte-ale-comunicarii/doctoranzi/>;

- Management Field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/domenii-de-doctorat/management/doctoranzi/>;

- Sociology Field: <http://doctorat.snsa.ro/domenii-de-doctorat/sociologie/doctoranzi/>.

h) information about the standards for the elaboration of the doctoral thesis:

<http://doctorat.snsa.ro/parcurs-doctorat/ghid-de-redactare-a-tezei-de-doctorat/>.

i) links to the summaries of the doctoral theses that are about to be publicly presented, and also the data, time and location where the theses will be defended at least 20 days before the presentation:

<http://doctorat.snsa.ro/sustinerea-tezei-de-doctorat-prin-interguvernamental-spre-supranational-rolul-parlamentului-european-si-parlamentelor-nationale-intr-un-model-sincretic-de-functionare-a-ue-de-catre-candid/>.

The requirement is met.

C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.

- The databases can be consulted here: <http://snspa.ro/cercetare/biblioteca/baze-de-date-electronice/>;
- Their user guide is here: <http://snspa.ro/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/Ghid-acces-baze-de-date-2020-Biblioteca.pdf>;
- Articles with full text from the specialty scientific magazines offered on the following platforms: Cambridge Journals, EBSCO (Academic Search Complete), ProQuest CENTRAL, ELSEVIER ScienceDirect – Journals – Freedom Collection, SPRINGER, Springerlink Journals, Wiley Online Library – Journals;
- Furthermore, SNSPA has access to famous bibliographic and bibliometric databases: Clarivate Analytics (former Thomson Reuters) Web of Science - Core Collection, InCites Journal Citation Reports, Derwent Innovations Index and Scopus, Elsevier.

The requirement is met.

C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.

- The Sistemantiplagiat.ro service can be accessed on the site www.sistemantiplagiat.ro, based on the authorised identification with username and password;
- In order to check the paperwork, the doctoral students must send an email with the request at the address doctorat@snspa.ro.

The requirement is met.

C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedure.

- The access in the laboratories is allowed to doctoral students, based on an appointment;
- Based on the proven research skills, the doctoral students can be associated, throughout the studies, with one of the teams (or laboratories) within the research centres;
- The doctoral students are part of the research teams within the small activities developed with the research centres;
- The doctoral students can take part at the workshops carried out within international conferences, or they can be part of the teams managing the research projects.

The requirement is met.

C.3. Internationalization level

C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place, and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

- IOSUD-SNSPA implements cooperation instruments as: international partnerships agreements (including here ERASMUS mobilities for doctoral advisors and doctoral students; doctoral research coordinated in joint supervision; exchanges of doctoral

students and teachers with prestigious universities from the field; participation to international consortia;

- The measures taken for the internalization: admission of foreign doctoral students; doctoral programs in joint supervision; co-option of doctoral advisors from abroad; classes in international languages; elaboration of theses in international languages; scientific publications indexed in international databases; participations to international scientific conferences.
- The Doctoral School of SNSPA is part of the CIVICA consortium, through which the doctoral students of SNSPA are admitted at classes from partner universities, and the doctoral students from partner universities can be admitted at the classes of SNSPA.

***C.3.1.1. The doctoral school, through the IOSUD, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences.**

- The international agreement concluded are divided into the following categories: Cooperation agreements concluded for the execution of researches and projects between the teaching staff and the doctoral students from SNSPA and the teaching staff and the doctoral students from other universities; Interinstitutional agreements concluded with the universities participating at the Erasmus+ program (KA 103) for teaching mobilities of the teaching staff and the study mobilities of doctoral students; Erasmus+ interinstitutional agreements conclude with universities partner of Erasmus+ program (KA 107) on the purpose to extend the collaboration possibilities outside the European customs.

The requirement is met.

C.3.1.2. The doctoral school supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international joint supervision or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.

- Cooperation instruments are implemented, as: international partnership agreements; doctoral researches coordinated in joint supervision; exchanges of doctoral students and teachers with the prestigious universities in the field; participation to international consortia;
- Under the auspices of the European academic consortium CIVICA, the Romanian doctoral students can be registered at the lectures of every teacher teaching speciality disciplines with doctoral study programs within partner universities.

The requirement is met.

***C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral school of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organized in international joint supervision.**

Year of defence of the doctoral school, period 2016-2020	Field											
	Communication			Public Administration			Political Sciences			Sociology		
	Total of defended theses	Of which, in English	Of which, in joint supervision	Total of defended theses	Of which, in English	Of which, in joint supervision	Total of defended theses	Of which, in English	Of which, in joint supervision	Total of defended theses	Of which, in English	Of which, in joint supervision
Total	21	1	0	13	0	0	76	13	1	15	1	0
Total of defended doctoral theses: 125												
Out of the total, the theses presented in English or in joint supervision: 15, meaning 12%.												

The requirement is met.

C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.)

- The presentation of the educational offer at the international fair EU Studies Fair, organized by politico.eu in Brussels (<https://www.politico.eu/event/eu-studies-fair-2018/>).

The requirement is met.

C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity

C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms

C.4.1.1. IOSUD/Doctoral School applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:

- policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public positionings, studies, analyses or measures taken;
- practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;
- practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;
- administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions;
- mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind;

IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.

IOSUD/Doctoral School has a policy based on the prevention regarding the eventual violation of the ethics code and academic integrity, demonstrating the same through public positionings, studies, analysis, and measures.

- The ethical code included in the SNSPA Carta promotes the values and principles registered in the SNSPA Carta;

- The Ethics Commission of SNSPA regulates all the acts/activities/actions of the people part of the academic community, or who have relations with the university: students, members of the administrative structures, of leadership structures, tenure and associate professors, institutional partners;
- The Ethics Code of IOSUD-SNSPA, integrant part of the Carta stipulates that SNSPA makes public the check requirements on the plagiarism;
- The Ethics Code of IOSUD-SNSPA contains provisions regarding the measures taken for the prevention of the discrimination and assuring equal opportunities.

The requirement is met.

***C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.**

- The annual reports of the Ethics Commission contain information regarding the resolution of each case where there is a relevant intimation for the doctoral studies.

The requirement is met.

C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own - initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies, and from the description of the facts, there are no delays in respect of the legal term of resolution indicated for such cases through national and institutional regulations.

- In the period 2016-2020, there was only one case belonging to the IOSUD, with a plagiarism suspicion, situation detailed in the report called *Report of the Ethics Commission no. 1/04.06.2018 Regarding the Intimation no. 1/12.03.2018.*

The requirement is met.

C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of doctor following accusations of plagiarism comply with the legislation in force.

- In the period 2016-2020, **there were no** plagiarism cases reported by CNATDCU.

The requirement is met.

C.4.1.5. The measures taken by IOSUD following accusations of plagiarism, aimed at least one of the following actions:

- a) Suspension of the right to admit new doctoral students for a period of 3 years of the doctoral coordinator who coordinated a doctoral thesis with definitive decision of withdrawal of the doctor title for plagiarism;
- b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral coordinator who coordinate two or more doctoral theses with definitive decision of withdrawal of the doctor title for plagiarism;
- c) Suspension of the organization of the admission process for the respective doctoral field, for a period of 2 years, if the respective doctoral field, there was coordinated a doctoral thesis with definitive decision of withdrawal of the doctor title for plagiarism.

- In the period 2016-2020, **there were no** plagiarism cases reported by CNATDCU.

The requirement is met.

***C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers, members in the commissions for public defence of two of more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the doctor title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.**

- In the period 2016-2020, **there were no cases** of final withdrawal of the title of doctor for plagiarism among the reviewers used in the commission for the defence of the theses.

The requirement is met.

C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).

- The SNSPA library stores and manages, for public consultation in the Study Hall, the doctoral thesis presented within the Doctoral School of SNSPA;
- The paper works have visibility from the bibliographic point of view, in the online catalogue of the library;
- Periodically, according to the enforceable legislation, the Romanian National Library receives a printed copy of each doctoral thesis and its appendices, destined for the consultation upon demand, at the office of the Romanian National Library.

The requirement is met.

IV. SWOT ANALYSIS

Strengths

High level of academic culture based on strong academic community bonds.

Openness to development and innovative approaches to pooling didactic resources with other Higher Education Institutions..

Strong links between supervisors, PhD students and alumni.

Opportunities

Further internationalisation on the basis of experiences that will be acquired within CIVICA framework, as well as other forms of cooperation with foreign Academies.

Weaknesses

It seems, that although the University enjoys high academic standards and talent pool it does not always receive the appreciation of the public authorities it deserves (in terms of consulting as well as financing).

Threats

COVID Pandemic, if prolonged, may slow down the very appreciated initiatives taken by the University authorities. It may also impede internationalization.

Macroeconomic situation of the country may negatively influence the public financing of Higher Education Institutions.

V. Overview of judgements awarded and of the recommendations

All requirements are met.

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

1. The visit was prepared professionally, both on the part of ARACIS and on the part of the IOSUD under evaluation. The communication before, during and after the evaluation itself was flawless. I take it as evidence of high professionalism and organizational culture.
2. The most important documents were available in English. The assistance of the ARACIS team and of the IOSUD translators allowed to conduct evaluation in the broader context of both the State and the University regulations.
3. The reality of a relatively new EU member state has to be taken into consideration when it comes to evaluating the strengths, opportunities, weaknesses and threats to IOSUD performance and future. The IOSUD has to function in reality of competing for the best PhD candidates with the market which may offer better business incentives to follow a non-academic career or with foreign Higher Education Institutions which may have a far better financial situation developed in a decades' longer perspective. The discussions during the meetings with the lecturers had shown, that the personnel of the University realizes these facts and tries to address them in day-to-day practice. While the lecturers have exhibited attachment to the University, some remarks indicated, a general disappointment with state policies regarding Higher Education (which is by all means a common feature in most of the states that had joined EU in XXI century).
4. It has to be noted, that the evaluation took place in the pandemic context. Thus, the effectiveness of some steps already taken by the IOSUD representatives may not have yet shown adequate results, especially in terms of obtaining foreign talent in regards to foreign lecturers of PhD students, as the academic mobility declined drastically due to COVID-19.
5. Some policies concerning the internationalization were introduced relatively recently. Thus, it is hard to evaluate their full effects already. However, the decision to join the CIVICA consortium proves that the authorities of the University realize the challenge of much needed internationalization and take effective steps to pool the resources with other Higher Education Institutions to address this issue. This step in particular I would point as a good practice, worth sharing with other Higher Education Institutions.
6. The IOSUD lecturers, students and alumni have shown a great deal of attachment to academic culture emphasising ethical conduct and high academic standards of teacher-student interactions. The IOSUD seems to be in a comfortable situation when the regulations and procedures concerning oversight of academic behaviour in terms of academic ethics and morals follow the already existing informal cultural standards. However, the high academic culture should not slow down the development of ethics' related procedures in the future.
7. The development of the Management branch may indicate an interesting trend to steer the IOSUD more toward strictly business environment. As the results are yet to materialize, the quality of Management offer seems to be promising.

Krzysztof Kozłowski, prof. PhD