

**Nr: 6396/09.11.2021**

**Prof. Grzegorz Kurzyński**

**blue** = recommendations

**red** = commendations

**National University of Music in Bucharest**

## External evaluation report for accreditation and periodic evaluation of the field of doctoral studies Music

### I. Introduction

**- the context in which this external evaluation report was drafted (the type of evaluation, the period of the evaluation visit, the composition of the Experts Committee etc.);**

Periodic evaluation of doctoral studies in National University of Music in Bucharest IOSUD was conducted in a blended format, 15-18.09.2021. In the evaluation took part:

Coordinator: NEDELCUȚ Nelida – Academia de Muzică “Gheorghe Dima” Cluj-Napoca

International expert: KURZYNSKI Grzegorz - Karol Lipiński Academy of Music in Wrocław, Poland

PhD student: LĂCRĂRU Andrei - Universitatea Națională de Artă Teatrală și Cinematografică „I.L.Caragiale” din București

**- details about the doctoral school(s) of which the doctoral domain under review is part (number of doctoral advisors, number of students, institutional context, short history etc.);**

In UNMB there is only one Doctoral School in the field of Music and starting with 2020 it is called “Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB.

The doctorate in Music was established in UNMB in 1990. Initially conceived as a scientific doctorate, since 2005 the university doctorate in Music has been carried out on two coordinates: scientific doctorate and professional doctorate.

The management of the Doctoral School is ensured by a Director of the Doctoral School - appointed by the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD) from among the doctoral supervisors within the National University of Music in Bucharest and by a Council of the Doctoral School (CSD). The number of CSD members is 7 (one of which is a representative of doctoral students). The Council of the Doctoral School meets regularly in order to solve its attributions: enrollment and expulsion of doctoral students (at the proposal of doctoral supervisors), decision-making regarding the approval of the list of positions, approval of doctoral commissions to support theses and other specific tasks. Starting from a pertinent analysis of the doctoral research topics (within UNMB) since the establishment of the doctorate in UNMB university, UNMB initiated the establishment in Bucharest an Institute of Advanced Musical Doctoral Studies (MIDAS) - POSDRU Project/89/1.5/S/62923 - organized within the National University of Music in Bucharest, in partnership with “George Enescu” University of Arts in Iași, “Gheorghe Dima” Academy of Music in Cluj - Napoca and CESPE - Romanian Academy,

The main points of reference of the project were the three main areas of music research: interpretation, composition and musicology.

The total number of doctoral supervisors who have worked in UNMB since 1991 is 31.

Initially, the doctoral supervisors were certified by CNATDCU (appointed by Ministerial Order) based on the proposals made by the university Senate. Subsequently, they became members of the Doctoral School and persons who acquired this right according to the provisions of art.166 of Law no.1 / 2011.

Currently, the Doctoral School comprises a number of 16 doctoral supervisors.

From 1990 to December 31, 2020, a number of 678 doctoral theses defended in UNMB were confirmed by CNATDCU by order of the Minister of Education. Among them are doctoral presences from Austria, France, Germany, Greece, Switzerland, Mexico, Portugal, Serbia-Montenegro, Japan, Poland, Korea, Vietnam, Lebanon, Moldova, United States of America.

In the last five academic years (2015-2020) the number of confirmed theses is 88.

## **II. Methods used**

- The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain under review and its Annexes

Before the evaluation visit internal evaluation report was very precisely and deeply verified and analyzed. No other documents have been requested.

Within the evaluation visit the buildings and other parts of institution's property have been visited in the on-site format: classrooms, the institution's library, research center, the Career Counseling and Guidance Center, lecture halls for students, the student residences, the student cafeteria, sports ground etc.

The following meetings have been held in online format:

- Meeting of panel members for discussing main methodological aspects related to the evaluation of doctoral studies
  - Online meeting with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD)
  - to the doctoral study domain
  - Online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission
  - Online meeting with PhD students
  - Online meeting with university representatives involved in internal quality assurance of doctoral studies
  - Online meeting with IOSUD graduates
  - Online meeting with employers of doctoral graduates
  - Meeting with representatives of the institution under review to discuss on the conclusions of the evaluation process and the main recommendations
- Application of questionnaires to doctoral students or academic staff in the doctoral study domain under review.

IOSUD-UNMB uses Questionnaires on assessing the satisfaction of doctoral students during doctoral studies, as well as at the end of doctoral studies, which aims at the level of satisfaction with the doctoral program as a whole, in order to continuously improve the activities and services offered. The level of satisfaction in relation to the learning environment and the possibilities of professional and personal development offered by the university is appreciated by doctoral students as being positive in proportion of 90%.

## **III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators**

## **Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY**

### **Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources.**

**Standard A.1.1.** *The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.** *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:*

*(a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;*

*(b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;*

**In accordance with the Organization of the elections for the Director of the Doctoral School position and the Council of Doctoral Studies.**

**The elections for the position of representative of PhD students for Doctoral School Council are organized by the student association. All PhD students have the right to choose and be elected. The choice is made according to its own regulations, elaborated and voted by the students. A doctoral student is a member of the Doctoral School Council.**

*c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);*

**The methodology regarding the organizing, conducting and defense of the doctoral thesis has been approved in the meeting of the UNMB Senate of May 18, 2016, with the completion in the meeting of the UNMB Senate of March 17, 2021 (included in the Regulation on the organization and development of the doctoral study programs and of the Doctoral School within UNMB -Annex A.1.1.1.a, at chapter VII Doctoral thesis).**

*d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;*

**Currently, the Doctoral School comprises a number of 16 doctoral supervisors who obtained the right to conduct a doctorate before the entry into force of Law no. 1/2011 on national education and GD no. 681/2011 and 4 teachers who obtained this right in accordance with Law no.1/2011.**

*e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings;*

**The management of the Doctoral School is ensured by a Director of the Doctoral School - appointed by the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD) among the doctoral supervisors within the Doctoral School -and by a Council of the Doctoral School (CSD). The number of CSD members is 7 (one of which is a representative of doctoral students).The Council of the Doctoral School meets regularly in meetings in order to solve its attributions: enrollment and expulsion of doctoral**

students (at the proposal of doctoral supervisors), decision-making regarding the approval of the list of positions, approval of doctoral commissions to support thesis and other specific tasks.

*f) the contract for doctoral studies;*

The rights and obligations of doctoral students, doctoral supervisors, as well as IOSUD-UNMB (through the Doctoral School), are established by the doctoral studies contract. The doctoral studies contract is concluded with each doctoral student, regardless of the type of doctorate and the form of financing and is signed by the doctoral student, the doctoral supervisor and the rector of IOSUD-UNMB.

*g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.*

The Training Program based on advanced university studies aims to meet the objectives of the Doctoral School; doctoral students can opt for teaching courses / workshops, as well as participation in lectures / conferences held within the Doctoral School.

The courses provided in the curriculum are approved by the UNMB Senate. The disciplines in the training program are supported by doctoral supervisors from the Doctoral School and are based on a thorough analysis of cognitive needs and the specifics of each doctoral topic chosen by PhD students in the field of Music.

The analysis of the disciplines proposed within the training program is also based on the degree of participation of doctoral students in the proposed courses / conferences and the feedback of doctoral students. Conferences / lectures other than the courses provided in the curriculum approved by the UNMB Senate, held within the training program also aim to provide doctoral students with the conditions, knowledge and information to maximize the chances of completing the doctoral program.

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.2.** The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions*

The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria.

**Fulfilled**

***Standard A.1.2.** The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.** The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background*

IOSUD-UNMB holds records of all doctoral students within the UNMB Doctoral School. The doctoral students submit, when registering for the admission contest for doctoral studies, an electronic file (CD / DVD) containing personal data, the course of studies, the list of scientific activity / artistic creation, the proposed research topic, etc.

The Official Academic Record, drawn up annually, includes the record of all doctoral students (enrolled in the respective academic year), data on the doctoral student, schooling, previous student training, administrative data, university data, curriculum (the running program based on advanced university studies and the scientific research program) as well as other specific data (this document is prepared in both printed and electronic format)

The data on the issued study documents and the doctoral supervisors are entered in the REI-RMU platform, the sections "Graduates" and "Doctoral supervisors".

**I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.**

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.** The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

The doctoral school within UNMB uses a program, recognized by CNATDCU, in order to establish the degree of similarity for all doctoral theses. Thus, from 2015 to September 2020, the SEMPLAG program was used, and after this date, in accordance with OMEC no. 5229 of August 17, 2020, the Sistemantiplagiat.ro program was used. In order to verify the similarity percentage, the doctoral thesis is submitted (accompanied by the application of the doctoral student, approved by the doctoral supervisor and the members of the guidance committee) to the Doctoral Service.

**Fulfilled**

***Standard A.1.3.** The IOSUD makes sure that financial resources are used optimally, and the revenues obtained from doctoral studies are supplemented through additional funding besides governmental funding.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.** Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years. The grants address relevant themes for the respective domain and, as a rule, are engaging doctoral students.*

There is a lot of projects or development grants (subsidies). For example OSUD-UNMB has developed an important project, namely the POSDRU Project - Institute of Advanced Doctoral Music Studies - MIDAS ID 62923, developed in partnership with "G.Enescu" University of Arts in Iasi, „G.Dima” Academy of Music in Cluj-Napoca and CESPE - Romanian Academy. For two years, the MIDAS Institute allocated 50 postdoctoral fellowships for Romanian researchers in the field of music (graduates of doctoral studies). I can mention also other projects:

- The strategic project ERASMUS + KA2 VOXearlyMUS
- The MUSIC OF POWER project.
- The project International Musicological Conference Musical and Cultural Osmoses in the Balkans

- FDI project Elites and Their Musics: East and West in the music of the princely and boyar salons from the Romanian Principalities in the 19th century
- The Romanian Music Platform project.
- FDI project Educational-artistic routes: performance, improvement and career direction for young musicians from disadvantaged area
- Project FDI Center for Nineteenth-Century Music Studies Project - CNCMS (2020).

## Fulfilled

**Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.2.** *The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional / human resources development grants is not less than 20%.*

More than 20% of doctoral students benefit from sources of funding other than government funding. IOSUD-UNMB provides special forms of support. For example the possibility of making free recordings, components of the doctoral thesis in professional doctorates, is a way of financial support. The same with free loan of instruments, the use of audio-video equipment, props, computers, chamber music studio, concert studio, the Opera and Multimedia Studios, ect.

## Fulfilled

**Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.3.** *At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).*

At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.). OSUD-UNMB provides an access to virtual libraries and international databases (Jstor, Oxford Music Online - Grove) which include periodicals, encyclopedias and other prestigious publications in order to improve the quality of scientific research.

## Fulfilled

### Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

**Standard A.2.1.** The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

**Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.** *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of*

*research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

The National University of Music in Bucharest has adequate spaces for teaching, artistic creation and scientific research. The university complex comprises five building blocks (blocks A, B, C, D, E), the Media Library, a student dormitory and other adequate spaces for all didactic activities, scientific research and artistic creation.

All PhD students have free access to the data platform and online journals that can be accessed on computers in the Electronic Collections room. The ratio between the available learning resources and the doctoral students is monitored, constantly improved within the university. The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.

**Fulfilled**

### **Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources**

**Standard A.3.1.** At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.1.** Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.*

UNMB has sufficiently qualified teaching staff with appropriate qualifications to effectively deliver its PhD programmes.

Currently, the Doctoral School comprises a number of 16 doctoral supervisors who obtained the right to conduct a doctorate before the entry into force of Law no. 1/2011 on national education and GD no. 681/2011 and teachers who obtained this right in accordance with Law no.1 / 2011. ???

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.2.** At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD*

Of the 16 doctoral supervisors, in “Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB, 9 (56%) are tenured within IOSUD-UNMB (Prof. Dana Borșan, PhD, Dan Dediu-Sandu, PhD, Prof. Valentina Sandu-Dediu, Ph.D., Prof. Nicolae Gheorghită, PhD, Prof. Adrian Iorgulescu, PhD, Prof. Olguța Lupu, PhD, Prof. Antigona Rădulescu, Phd, Prof. Șerban Dimitrie Soreanu, Phd, Prof. Ionuț-Bogdan Ștefănescu, PhD).

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.3.** The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists*

*in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.*

The disciplines in the training program are delivered by highly qualified PhD supervisors: Prof. Dan Dediu-Sandu, PhD, Prof. Valentina Sandu-Dediu, Ph.D., Prof. Nicolae Gheorghită, PhD, Prof. Adrian Iorgulescu, PhD, Prof. Olguța Lupu, PhD, Prof. Antigona Rădulescu, PhD, Prof. Șerban Dimitrie Soreanu, PhD, Professor Dan Buciu, PhD.

The efficiency of the didactic activity is also done by holding lectures / conferences during the whole year of training. These lectures / conferences are given not only by doctoral supervisors from the Doctoral School within UNMB, but also from other musical personalities from the university or from outside. Some of these lectures are audio-video recorded and published by the UNMB printing house and publishing house and they can be purchased by doctoral student.

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.4.** The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs does not exceed 20%.*

The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.

**Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.** At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.*

All doctoral supervisors, within the UNMB Doctoral School, meet more than 25% of the score required by the minimum CNATDCU standards in force. Numerous examples of teacher's awards, memberships (Members of the organizing committees of artistic events and international competitions, Members of professional association boards, Members of juries or artistic events or international competitions, Authors of volumes, university courses, edition care, study essays, articles, published compositions, ect.).

**Fulfilled**



**Performance Indicator \*A.3.2.2.** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

The PhD supervisors from the UNMB Doctoral School are musicians with recognized value in the field. Currently, the UNMB Doctoral School has a number of 16 doctoral supervisors. Numerous examples exist of teachers participating in international conferences, symposia and forums, and these are followed by debriefings to share knowledge gained with other staff. Presentations of relevant, impactful activities / contributions (analyzed period: 2015-2020) show that all doctoral supervisors within the UNMB Doctoral School meet more than 25% of the score required for the minimum applicable CNATDCU standards.

**Fulfilled**

## **Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS**

**Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest**

**Standard B.1.1.** The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or a number of candidates exceeding the number of seats available

**Performance Indicator \*B.1.1.1.** *The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.*

The ratio between the number of master's degree graduates of other higher education institutions in the country or abroad who have registered for the competition for admission to doctoral studies in the last 5 years and the number of places financed from the state budget put up for competition is greater than 0.2.

**Fulfilled**

**Standard B.1.2** Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.

**Performance Indicator \*B.1.2.1.** *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

In IOSUD-UNMB the admission competition is carried out according to the "methodology of the admission competition for UNMB doctoral studies" (approved by academic years), on the two types of doctorate: a) scientific doctorate b) professional doctorate.

Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include the previous academic, research and professional performance of the candidates (also proven by the list of titles of published scientific papers and / or, as appropriate, the presentation of artistic creation and / or interpretation, documents submitted in the registration file). The interview with the candidate assessing knowledge from the area of interest of the prospective student in the doctoral studies, personal qualities of the candidate, documented artistic performances and relevant qualifications of the candidate plays a crucial role in the exam and is a mandatory part of the admission procedure. From the moment of registration, the candidate submits in the personal file the proposal of a topic with the justification of its importance, as well as the bibliographic list on the proposed topic.

**I commend UNMB on the thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.**

**Fulfilled**

*Performance Indicator B.1.2.2. The expelling rate, including renouncement / dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4 years after admission does not exceed 30%.*

At UNMB Doctoral School, the dropout rate, respectively expulsion of doctoral students, is very small.

The content and the guidance methodology are mainly adapted to the fields of artistic creation (interpretive art / composition - professional doctorate) and musicology (scientific doctorate). Therefore, the permanent connection between the doctoral supervisor, the guidance committee and the doctoral student, an exceptional material base leads to a very low dropout/waiver rate, respectively expulsion.

**Fulfilled**

**Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs**

**Standard B.2.1.** The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

*Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

Within the Training Program based on advanced university studies, according to the Curriculum, PhD student can participate in a series of relevant courses which are scheduled for the training in scientific research and artistic creation:

- the course Cultures and musical mentalities aims to develop the area of knowledge of the musical field by approaching several styles and cultural epochs, constituting a lever in deepening the research methodology;
  - the course Cognitive models in advanced musical research aims to develop the capacity of conceptual modeling on ontology, stylistics, aesthetics and musical interpretation;
- Besides - PhD students can opt for teaching / workshop courses as well as participation in conferences held within DS, aiming to increase the scientific level of their theoretical and practical training.

The courses and conferences / lectures provided by the UNMB Doctoral School are a tool for enriching the knowledge of the doctoral student and serving him/her for the good development of the scientific research program and for the acquisition of advanced competencies specific to the doctoral university cycle.

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.** *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

From the beginning of the doctoral activity, the doctoral supervisors and the guidance commissions offer as much information as possible related to the research ethics and the explanation of the methodology for drawing up a scientific paper.

Also, the Training Program based on advanced university studies includes, in the Curriculum, a discipline entitled *Ethics and Academic Integrity*, which takes place during the first year of study. The role of the course is to provide the knowledge and skills necessary for an academic and research activity, in accordance with the requirements of university ethics and deontology.

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.3.** *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.*

OSUD-UNMB has created the mechanisms through which the training program based on advanced university studies aims at "learning outcomes", being a tool available to the doctoral student for the enrichment of knowledge, which serve him/her for the good development of the scientific research program and for acquiring of advanced competencies specific to the cycle of doctoral studies.

Though until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes, but not necessarily).

I would recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.4.** *All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counseling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting*

According to the legislation in force, for the development of the doctorate each doctoral student is supported by a guidance commission. Doctoral students benefit from consultancy and guidance support from the doctoral supervisor and the guidance committee, from the moment of admission to doctoral university studies until the submission of the doctoral thesis (inclusively). Each guidance committee consists of 3 members and is established by the doctoral supervisor after

consultation with the doctoral student. The evaluation of scientific / artistic performances is carried out throughout the entire period of doctoral studies through periodic assessments and grading.

#### **Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.5.** *For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.*

**For the Music field / „Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teachers / researchers who provide guidance is not higher than 3: 1. It is approximately 0,5 : 1**

#### **Fulfilled**

#### **Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation.**

**Standard B.3.1.** Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

**Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.** *For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.*

**In the field of arts, the capitalization of the doctoral experience has a special social status, which is reflected in the musicological research activity or in the quality of the recitals, concerts and performances held afterwards.**

**I did not receive randomly selected 5 papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review**

#### **Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.1.2.** *The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.*

**Within the professional doctorate at least two live artistic manifestations, with public (recital / concert / opera performance / conducting performances / works performed in concerts or recorded audio / video) accompanied by theoretical arguments are mandatory. Within the Individual Scientific Research Program publications -articles, studies, books, scores. public appearances -participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs) are mandatory.**

The ratio between the number of prestigious artistic presentations / international events (of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period, 2015-2020) and the number of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period is greater than 2.

**Fulfilled**

**Standard B.3.2.** The Doctoral School engages a significant number of external scientific specialists in the commissions for public defense of doctoral theses in the analyzed domain.

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.1.** *The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.*

In order to evaluate the doctoral thesis, the doctoral supervisor proposes a commission composed of 5 members (3 referents, of which at least 2 from outside the university, the chairman of the commission and the doctoral supervisor). The official referents have the doctoral title and the didactic function of at least a university associate professor or a second degree scientific researcher

The small number of specialists in the field of Music, with the degree of associate professor / professor, in accordance with the topics of doctoral research may lead, in certain academic years, to the repetitive use of specialists in commissions. Considering the specifics of the Music field, it is found that for the analyzed period (2015-2020) the criterion is met.

**Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.2.** *The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defense on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analyzed.*

At the UNMB Doctoral School, in the doctoral field of Music, in the last 5 years 89 theses were defended. The ratio between the number of doctoral theses assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution and the number of doctoral theses defended in the last 5 years within the UNMB Doctoral School is less than 0,3.

**Fulfilled**

## **Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

### **Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system**

**Standard C.1.1.** There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

**Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.** *The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- (d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;*
- e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students;*
- f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counseling made available to doctoral students.*

IOSUD-UNMB has developed and periodically applies a procedure for the evaluation and internal monitoring of the evolution of the doctoral school. All obligatory evaluation criteria are taken into account.

Within UNMB operates the Quality Assessment and Assurance Commission (CEAC) - a structure responsible for promoting the culture of quality, establishing qualitative and quantitative benchmarks, developing, implementing, coordinating and applying quality evaluation and assurance procedures and activities.

The regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral university studies are organized in IOSUD-UNMB are constantly updated, in accordance with the legislation in force.

I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement. More generally recommendation should be about the formal policy that needs to be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the Academy is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.

## **Fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator \*C.1.1.2.** *Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.*

OSUD-UNMB uses Questionnaires on assessing the satisfaction of doctoral students during doctoral studies, as well as at the end of doctoral studies, which aims at the evaluation of level of satisfaction with the doctoral program as a whole, in order to continuously improve the activities and services offered. The level of satisfaction in relation to the learning environment and the possibilities of professional and personal development offered by the university is appreciated by doctoral students as being positive in 90%.

I'd recommend introducing visible changes after student's survey.

## Partially fulfilled

### Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

**Standard C.2.1.** *Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.*

**Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.** *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- (a) the Doctoral School regulation;*
- (b) the admission regulation;*
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*
- (e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;*
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);*
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*
- (i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.*

The doctoral school updates and manages on the university website information related to the activities of the doctoral school and ensures access to regulations, procedures and information related to the activities of the doctoral school, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.

The doctoral school updates and manages on the university website information related to the activities of the doctoral school and ensures access to regulations, procedures and other information related to the activities of the doctoral school, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.

**I shell command UNMB DS on the extensive resources and methods of delivery it uses in sharing information with public.**

## Fulfilled

**Standard C.2.2.** The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.** *All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis*

The access of doctoral students to subscriptions, to periodicals in the field, in the country and abroad, to databases including international (JSTOR and Journal of Research in Music Education) and to the Internet is unrestricted.

**I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases: Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge , EBSCO, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Companions to Music, etc.**



## Fulfilled

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.2.** *Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.*

All doctoral students have access, upon request, to the system for verifying the degree of similarity of their own works. Starting from September 2020, in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Research no. 5229 of August 17, 2020, IOSUD-UNMB uses *the Sistemantiplagiat.ro* platform, approved by CNATDCU (until now, the SemPlag.ro platform has been used).

## Fulfilled

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.** *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

All PhD students have free access to the material base of scientific research and artistic creation in IOSUD-UNMB: the data platform and online journals that can be accessed on computers in the Electronic Collections room. The ratio between the available learning resources and the doctoral students is monitored and constantly improved within the university. The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.

## Fulfilled

### Criterion C.3. Internationalization

**Standard C.3.1.** There is a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies

**Performance Indicator \*C.3.1.1.** *IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

UNMB focuses on the creation of an international educational environment, the institution's engagement in international projects, international strategic partnerships and benchmarking initiatives. This implies participation in international activities as well as hosting of international experts.

In the period 2015-2020 the number of partnerships with profile institutions in Europe and in the world was still growing as well as the diversity of projects and programs carried out either as a coordinator or as a partner. A particularly important activity, reflecting the process of internationalization of artistic activity and scientific research, is carried out by the Service of International Relations and Community Programs (SRIPC) and the ERASMUS + Office. ERASMUS + KA103, ERASMUS + KA107 and Strategic Partnership (KA2) individual mobility projects were carried out.



IOSUD-UNMB applies a strategy to increase the internationalization of doctoral studies. More than 35% of doctoral students either completed training internships abroad or participated in international scientific conferences, international artistic events. Also, a series of projects were carried out during which conferences, international symposia were held with the participation of teachers, doctoral supervisors, students, doctoral students.

**I would commend UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.**

## **Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.** In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

In order to ensure the necessary knowledge base for the development of doctoral studies, IOSUD-UNMB invites personalities from the world of music, with international recognition, to give courses / lectures for doctoral students. On the list of experts from prestigious universities in other states, invited to take courses for doctoral students, there are many famous artistic personalities.

In order to ensure the necessary knowledge base for the development of doctoral studies, IOSUD-UNMB invites personalities from the world of music, with international recognition, to give courses / lectures for doctoral students. On the list of experts from prestigious universities in other states, invited to take courses for doctoral students, there are many famous artistic personalities.

The university also supports, including financially, the development of research and artistic activities provided in the doctoral study programs, as follows:

- staging works / concerts, competitions, festivals;
- publishing books and scores;-online magazine Musicology Today, Acord newspaper, AkadeMuzica publication;
- audio-video recordings of some interpretive activities;
- holding conferences, lectures, workshops, master's courses (travel expenses, accommodation, fees), prestigious artistic personalities being invited;
- purchase of specialized books and software

Students can participate in a large number of short-term projects (conferences, joint projects or ensembles) as well as study abroad.

**I would commend UNMB on its wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations**

**I would recommend that UNMB formalize agreements with its partners, and that explicit procedures be implemented to allow for feedback from stakeholders so as to monitor the ongoing needs of the profession.**

## **Fulfilled**

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.** The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).*

The acquired knowledge can be presented both through publications - articles, studies, books, scores and through public appearances-participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs).In addition to the activities carried out through the Service of International Relations and Community Programs-UNMB, ERASMUS, IOSUD-

UNMB concludes partnerships with profile institutions that carry out activities of international prestige, creating the possibility for doctoral students to participate in and to assert themselves at such international level events.

Fulfilled

#### IV. SWOT Analysis

<p><b><u>Strengths:</u></b></p> <p>The thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.</p> <p>Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.</p> <p>Extensive and active participation of <b>IOSUD-UNMB</b> in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and its broad artistic and cultural offer.</p> <p>Wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations.</p>	<p><b><u>Weaknesses:</u></b></p> <p>Lack of the formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences</p> <p>Lack of the formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives if Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, ect.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.</p> <p>Foreign databases are rather poor.</p>
<p><b><u>Opportunities:</u></b></p> <p>Preparation to the challenges pertaining to the Fourth Industrial Revolution.</p> <p>Creating new and updated ways of knowledge transfer.</p>	<p><b><u>Threats:</u></b></p> <p>According to the opinions of interlocutors at the meetings – there are not threats at all.</p>

#### V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

Doctoral school				
No.	Type of indicator (*, C)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. <i>The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s)</i>	fulfilled	<b>The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.</b>
		Performance Indicator A.1.1.2 <i>The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17,</i>	fulfilled	<b>The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria</b>
		Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. <i>The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The records of doctoral students and their academic background can be found in the REI-RMU platform, the sections "Graduates" and "Doctoral supervisors".</b> <b>I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.</b>

		Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. <i>The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.</i>	fulfilled	<b>From August 17, 2020, the Sistemantiplagiat.ro program was used.</b>
		Performance Indicator A.1.3.1. <i>Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years.</i>	fulfilled	<b>There is a lot of projects or development grants (subsidies).</b>
		Performance Indicator *A.1.3.2. <i>The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional / human resources development grants is not less than 20%.</i>	fulfilled	<b>More than 20% of doctoral students benefit from sources of funding other than government funding.</b>
		Performance Indicator *A.1.3.3. <i>At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses</i>	fulfilled	<b>At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students</b>
		Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. <i>The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the</i>	fulfilled	<b>The institution has appropriate resources to support student learning and delivery of the programmes. The ratio between the available</b>

		<i>evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.</i>		<b>learning resources and the doctoral students is monitored, constantly improved within the university. The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1. Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.</i>	fulfilled	<b>UNMB has sufficiently qualified teaching staff with appropriate qualifications to effectively deliver its PhD programmes.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD</i>	fulfilled	<b>Of the 16 doctoral supervisors in “Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB, 9 (56%) are tenured within IOSUD-UNMB Members of the teaching staff are qualified for their role and are active as artists/pedagogues/ and researchers.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator A.3.1.3. The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved</i>	fulfilled	<b>The disciplines in the training program are delivered by highly qualified PhD supervisors and also by other musical personalities from the university or from outside.</b>

		<i>expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.</i>		
		<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.4. The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs does not exceed 20%.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator A.3.2.1. At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences;</i>	fulfilled	<b>The PhD supervisors from the UNMB Doctoral School are musicians with recognized value in the field. Currently, the UNMB Doctoral School has a number of 16 doctoral supervisors. Numerous examples exist of teachers participating in international conferences, symposia and forum, concerts, recital, ect.</b>

		<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.2.2. At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.</i>		<b>All doctoral supervisors, within the UNMB Doctoral School, meet more than 25% of the score required by the minimum CNATDCU standards in force</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1. The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The ratio is greater than 0.2.</b>
		<i>*B.1.2.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.</i>	fulfilled	<b>I shell commend UNMB on the thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator B.1.2.2. The expelling rate, including renouncement / dropping out</i>	fulfilled	<b>At UNMB Doctoral School, the dropout rate, respectively expulsion of doctoral students, is very small.</b>

		<i>of doctoral students 3, respectively 4 years after admission<sup>4</sup> does not exceed 30%</i>		
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. <i>The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.</i>	fulfilled	<b>Within the Training Program PhD student can participate in a series of relevant courses which are scheduled for the training in scientific research and artistic creation.</b> <b>Also the courses and conferences / lectures provided by the UNMB Doctoral School are a tool for enriching the knowledge of the doctoral student and serving him/her for the good development of the scientific research program and for the acquisition of advanced competencies specific to the doctoral university cycle.</b>
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. <i>At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program</i>	fulfilled	<b>From the beginning of the doctoral activity, the doctoral supervisors and the guidance commissions offer as much information as possible related to the research ethics and the explanation of the methodology for drawing up a scientific paper.</b> <b>Example: discipline entitled <i>Ethics and Academic Integrity</i>, which takes place during the first year of study</b>
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.3 <i>The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities .</i>	fulfilled	<b>Though until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework.</b> <b>I would recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.</b>
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.4. <i>All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counseling/guidance from functional guidance</i>	fulfilled	<b>According to the legislation in force, for the development of the doctorate each doctoral student is supported by a guidance commission.</b>



		<i>commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting</i>		
		<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.5. For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.</i>	fulfilled	<b>For the Music field / „Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teachers / researchers who provide guidance is not higher than 3: 1.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor’s title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.</i>	fulfilled	<p><b>In the field of arts, the capitalization of the doctoral experience has a special social status, which is reflected in the musicological research activity or in the quality of the recitals, concerts and performances held afterwards.</b></p> <p><b>I did not receive randomly selected 5 papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review but I presume that their level is very high.</b></p>
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.3.1.2. The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The ratio between the number of prestigious artistic presentations / international events and the number of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period is greater than 2.</b>
		<i>*B.3.2.1. The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses</i>	fulfilled	<b>Considering the specifics of the Music field (the small number of specialists in the field of Music with the degree of associate professor / professor) it is found that for the analyzed period (2015-2020) the criterion is met.</b>



		<i>coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.</i>		
		<i>Performance Indicator *B.3.2.2. The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defense on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analyzed.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The ratio between the number of doctoral theses assigned to a certain scientific referent from another higher education institution and the number of doctoral theses defended in the last 5 years within the UNMB Doctoral School is less than 0,3.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:</i>	fulfilled	<p><b>The institution has a strong internal quality culture, supported by clear and effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.</b></p> <p><b>I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement.</b></p> <p><b>More generally, I would recommend a formal policy be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the UNMB is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.</b></p>
		<i>Performance Indicator *C.1.1.2. Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral</i>	partially fulfilled	<b>The level of satisfaction in relation to the learning environment and the possibilities of professional and</b>

		<i>study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.</i>		<p>personal development offered by the university is appreciated by doctoral students as being positive in 90%.</p> <p><i>I'd recommend introducing visible changes after student's survey.</i></p>
		Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. <i>The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</i>	fulfilled	<b>I shell command UNMB on the extensive resources and methods of delivery it uses in sharing information with public.</b>
		Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. <i>The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</i>	fulfilled	<p>Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.</p> <p><b>I shell command UNMB on the extensive resources and methods of delivery it uses in sharing information with public.</b></p>
		Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. <i>All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.</i>	fulfilled	<p>The access of doctoral students to subscriptions, to periodicals in the field, in the country and abroad, to databases including international (JSTOR and Journal of Research in Music Education) and to the Internet is unrestricted.</p> <p><i>I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases: Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge, EBSCO, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Companions to Music</i></p>
		Performance Indicator C.2.2.2 <i>Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.</i>	fulfilled	<p>All doctoral students have access, upon request, to the system for verifying the degree of similarity of their own works.</p> <p>From August 2020, an access to the <i>sistemantiplagiat.ro</i> platform can be obtained at the request of students.</p>

		<i>Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.</i>	fulfilled	<b>The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies).</i>	fulfilled	<b>I shell commend UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.</i>	fulfilled	<b>I shell commend UNMB on its wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations.</b>
		<i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.3. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).</i>		<b>I shell commend IOSUD-UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.</b>