

Prof. Grzegorz Kurzyński blue = recommendations red = commendations

National University of Music in Bucharest

The External Evaluation Report of an Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IOSUD)

I. Introduction

- the context in which this external evaluation report was drafted (the type of evaluation, the period of the evaluation visit, the composition of the Experts Committee etc.);

Periodic evaluation of doctoral studies in National University of Music in Bucharest IOSUD was conducted in a blended format, 15-18.09.2021. In the evaluation took part:

OPRE Adrian Universitatea - „Babeş-Bolyai” din Cluj-Napoca

BOUREANU Alexandru - Universitatea din Craiova

KURZYNSKI Grzegorz - Karol Lipiński Academy of Music in Wrocław_ Poland

BĂDOI Victor Alexandru - Universitatea Națională de Artă Teatrală și Cinematografică „I.L. Caragiale” din București

NEDELCUT Nelida - Academia de Muzică “Gheorghe Dima” Cluj-Napoca

- details about the institution organizing the doctoral studies (number of Doctoral Schools, number of students, institutional context, short history etc.);

The National University of Music in Bucharest (UNMB) is a higher music education institution in Romania, coordinated by the Ministry of Education, which operates in accordance with the National Education Law, the legislation in force, the University Charter and its own regulations. The first official document is the "Decree establishing the Conservatory of Music and Declamation" signed by "His Eminence Alexandru Ioan Cuza", on October 6, 1864

Over time, the university's title has changed. The current name, namely the National University of Music in Bucharest, was adopted by Romanian Government Decision no. 23 of January 4, 2001 on the organization and functioning of the Ministry of Education and Research,

Currently, UNMB comprises two faculties, a doctoral school and directorates, research centers, administrative services, as follows:

-Faculty of Music Performance (3 departments)

-Faculty of Composition, Musicology and Music Pedagogy (3 departments)

-„Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School

-Department for Teacher Training (DPPD)

-International Relations and Community Programs (SRIPC)

-Center for Continuing Music Education and Postgraduate Studies (CEMCSP)

-Directorate for Research, Innovation and Information (DCII):

-Center for Electroacoustic Music and Multimedia (CMeM)

-Romanian Music Information Center (CIMRO)-Early Music Center (CMV)

-Administrative services

The National University of Music in Bucharest carries out undergraduate studies, master's studies and doctoral studies. Starting with the academic year 2016-2017, the National University of Music in

Bucharest organizes the postgraduate program of training and continuous professional development, full-time education, Music Directing. All study programs of the National University of Music in Bucharest are accredited, according to the legislation in force and the methodologies developed by the Romanian Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education, and at the institution level, UNMB is institutionally accredited, both nationally and internationally, with maximum rating -high degree of confidence.

- ***The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the IOSUD and its Annexes;***

Before the evaluation visit internal evaluation report was very precisely and deeply verified and analyzed. No other documents have been requested.

Within the evaluation visit the buildings and other parts of institution's property have been visited in the on-site format: classrooms, the institution's library, research center, the Career Counseling and Guidance Center, lecture halls for students, the student residences, the student cafeteria, sports ground etc.

The following meetings have been held in online format:

- Meeting of panel members for discussing main methodological aspects related to the evaluation of doctoral studies
- Online meeting with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD) to the doctoral study domain
- Online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission
- Online meeting with PhD students
- Online meeting with university representatives involved in internal quality assurance of doctoral studies
- Online meeting with IOSUD graduates
- Online meeting with employers of doctoral graduates
- Meeting with representatives of the institution under review to discuss on the conclusions of the evaluation process and the main recommendations

- ***Application of questionnaires to doctoral students or academic staff in the doctoral study domain under review. – I did not receive it.***

IOSUD-UNMB uses questionnaires assessing the satisfaction of doctoral students during doctoral studies, as well as at the end of doctoral studies, which aims at the level of satisfaction with the doctoral program as a whole, in order to continuously improve the activities and services offered. The level of satisfaction in relation to the learning environment and the possibilities of professional and personal development offered by the university is appreciated by doctoral students as being positive in proportion of 90%.

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies. - general description of the standard analysis.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s):*

(a) the internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulations for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies programs, the regulation(s) of Doctoral School(s);

In accordance to the Regulation on the organization and development of the doctoral study programs and of the Doctoral School within UNMB

(b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct;

In accordance with the Organization of the elections for the Director of the Doctoral School position and the Council of Doctoral Studies.

The elections for the position of representative of PhD students for Doctoral School Council are organized by the student association. All PhD students have the right to choose and be elected. The choice is made according to its own regulations, elaborated and voted by the students. A doctoral student is a member of the Doctoral School Council.

c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);

The methodology regarding the organizing, conducting and defense of the doctoral thesis has been approved in the meeting of the UNMB Senate of May 18, 2016, with the completion in the meeting of the UNMB Senate of March 17, 2021 (included in the Regulation on the organization and development of the doctoral study programs and of the Doctoral School within UNMB -Annex A.1.1.1.a, at chapter VII Doctoral thesis).

d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;

Currently, the Doctoral School comprises a number of 16 doctoral supervisors who obtained the right to conduct a doctorate before the entry into force of Law no. 1/2011 on national education and GD no. 681/2011 and 4 teachers who obtained this right in accordance with Law no.1/2011.

e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the regularity of meetings;

The management of the Doctoral School is ensured by a Director of the Doctoral School - appointed by the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD) among the doctoral supervisors within the Doctoral School - and by a Council of the Doctoral School (CSD). The number of CSD members is 7 (one of which is a representative of doctoral students).The Council of the Doctoral School meets, regularly, in meetings in order to solve its attributions: enrollment and expulsion of doctoral students (at the proposal of doctoral supervisors), decision-making regarding the approval of the list of positions, approval of doctoral commissions to support theses and other specific tasks.

f) the contract for doctoral studies;

The rights and obligations of doctoral students, doctoral supervisors, as well as IOSUD-UNMB (through the Doctoral School), are established by the doctoral studies contract. The doctoral studies contract is concluded with each doctoral student, regardless of the type of doctorate and the form of financing and is signed by the doctoral student, the doctoral supervisor and the rector of IOSUD-UNMB.

g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.

The Training Program based on advanced university studies aims to meet the objectives of the Doctoral School; doctoral students can opt for teaching courses / workshops, as well as participation in lectures / conferences held within the Doctoral School.

The courses provided in the curriculum are approved by the UNMB Senate. The disciplines in the training program are supported by doctoral supervisors from the Doctoral School and are based on a thorough analysis of cognitive needs and the specifics of each doctoral topic chosen by PhD students in the field of Music.

The analysis of the disciplines proposed within the training program is also based on the degree of participation of doctoral students in the proposed courses / conferences and the feedback of doctoral students. Conferences / lectures other than the courses provided in the curriculum approved by the UNMB Senate, held within the training program also aim to provide doctoral students with the conditions, knowledge and information to maximize the chances of completing the doctoral program.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions

The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria.

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator*A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.*

Within IODS there is only one doctoral school related to the MUSIC field.

Fulfilled

Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.

IOSUD-UNMB holds records of all doctoral students within the UNMB Doctoral School. The doctoral students submit, when registering for the admission contest for doctoral studies, an electronic file (CD / DVD) containing personal data, the course of studies, the list of scientific activity / artistic creation, the proposed research topic, etc.

The Official Academic Record, drawn up annually, includes the record of all doctoral students (enrolled in the respective academic year), data on the doctoral student, schooling, previous student training, administrative data, university data, curriculum (the running program based on advanced university studies and the scientific research program) as well as other specific data (this document is prepared in both printed and electronic format)

The data on the issued study documents and the doctoral supervisors are entered in the REI-RMU platform, the sections "Graduates" and "Doctoral supervisors".

I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.

The doctoral school within UNMB uses a program, recognized by CNATDCU, in order to establish the degree of similarity for all doctoral theses. Thus, from 2015 to September 2020, the SEMPLAG program was used, and after this date, in accordance with OMEC no. 5229 of August 17, 2020, the Sistemantiplagiat.ro program was used. In order to verify the similarity percentage, the doctoral thesis is submitted (accompanied by the application of the doctoral student, approved by the doctoral supervisor and the members of the guidance committee) to the Doctoral Service.

Fulfilled

Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)

The National University of Music in Bucharest has adequate spaces for teaching, artistic creation and scientific research. The university complex comprises five building blocks (blocks A, B, C, D, E), the Media Library, a student dormitory and other adequate spaces for all didactic activities, scientific research and artistic creation.

All PhD students have free access to the data platform and online journals that can be accessed on computers in the Electronic Collections room. The ratio between the available learning resources and the doctoral students is monitored, constantly improved within the university. The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.*

The National University of Music in Bucharest is constantly expanding its circle of partnerships, according to the field of doctoral studies, which helps to ensure the high level of training of doctoral students, both scientifically and artistically.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.3. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.*

The doctoral school is concerned with the permanent renewal of the research / artistic creation infrastructure, which ensures doctoral students access to current research / artistic creation resources. Each doctoral student has free access to any resources, according to the requirements of the study programs. The UNMB media library provides the educational process with all the material it needs, in the necessary quantity and on time. The media library has supplemented its fund of learning resources which support the modernization and permanent adaptation of curricula.

I would recommend widening access to more foreign databases.

Fulfilled

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resource

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.

Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1. *The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.*

The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. *At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

Of the 16 doctoral supervisors, in "Constantin Brăiloiu" Doctoral School UNMB, 9 (56%) are tenured within IOSUD-UNMB (Prof. Dana Borșan, PhD, Dan Dediu-Sandu, PhD, Prof. Valentina Sandu-Dediu, Ph.D., Prof. Nicolae Gheorghită, PhD, Prof. Adrian Iorgulescu, PhD, Prof. Olguța Lupu, PhD, Prof. Șerban Dimitrie Soreanu, Phd, Prof. Ionuț-Bogdan Ștefănescu, PhD).

For the development of the doctorate, the doctoral student is supported by a guidance commission, composed of 3 other members. The guidance commissions, established by the doctoral supervisor following the consultation with the doctoral students, are formed in proportion of over 90% of the teachers who have an indefinite employment contract with UNMB.

Fulfilled

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest

Standard B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance and are diversified as social representation and by gender

Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.

In IOSUD-UNMB the admission competition is carried out according to the “methodology of the admission competition for UNMB doctoral studies” based on selection criteria that include the previous academic, research and professional performance of the candidates (also proven by the list of titles of published scientific papers and / or, as appropriate, the presentation of artistic creation and / or interpretation, documents submitted in the registration file). The interview with the candidate assessing knowledge from the area of interest of the prospective student in the doctoral studies, personal qualities of the candidate, documented artistic performances and relevant qualifications of the candidate plays a crucial role in the exam and is a mandatory part of the admission procedure. From the moment of registration, the candidate submits in the personal file the proposal of a topic with the justification of its importance, as well as the bibliographic list on the proposed topic.

I commend UNMB on the thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organizing support programs to prevent drop-outs.

Given the specifics of the field of Music, vocational education, the admission exams are unitary for all candidates. UNMB grants 10 budgeted places within the approved schooling figure to graduates with a baccalaureate degree from the social protection system, according to the legislation in force.

At UNMB Doctoral School, the dropout rate of PhD students, 2 years after admission, is very close to zero (one dropout in the last 5 years).

Fulfilled

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

Within the Training Program based on advanced university studies, according to the Curriculum, PhD student can participate in a series of relevant courses which are scheduled for the training in scientific research and artistic creation:

-the course *Cultures and musical mentalities* aims to develop the area of knowledge of the musical field by approaching several styles and cultural epochs, constituting a lever in deepening the research methodology;

-the course *Cognitive models in advanced musical research* aims to develop the capacity of conceptual modeling on ontology, stylistics, aesthetics and musical interpretation;

Besides - PhD students can opt for teaching / workshop courses as well as participation in conferences held within DS, aiming to increase the scientific level of their theoretical and practical training.

Also within the Training Program based on advanced university studies, the Doctoral School offers doctoral students a series of conferences / lectures given by personalities from the world of music both in the country and abroad.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program*

From the beginning of the doctoral activity, the doctoral supervisors and the guidance commissions offer as much information as possible related to the research ethics and the explanation of the methodology for drawing up a scientific paper.

Also, the Training Program based on advanced university studies includes, in the Curriculum, a discipline entitled *Ethics and Academic Integrity*, which takes place during the first year of study.

The role of the course is to provide the knowledge and skills necessary for an academic and research activity, in accordance with the requirements of university ethics and deontology.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities .*

OSUD-UNMB has created the mechanisms through which the training program based on advanced university studies aims at "learning outcomes", being a tool available to the doctoral student for the enrichment of knowledge, which serve him/her for the good development of the scientific research program and for acquiring of advanced competencies specific to the cycle of doctoral studies.

Though until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes, but not necessarily). I would recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.

Fulfilled

Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations on national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)

Within the professional doctorate at least two live artistic presentations with public (recital / concert / opera performance / conducting performances / works performed in concerts or recorded audio / video) accompanied by theoretical arguments are mandatory (there is also 2nd version). Within the Individual Scientific Research Program publications -articles, studies, books, scores. public appearances -participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs) are mandatory.

The ratio between the number of prestigious artistic presentations / international events of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period 2015-2020 and the number of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies in the evaluated period is greater than 2.

Fulfilled

Criterion B.4. Quality of doctoral theses

Standard B.4.1. Doctoral theses fulfill high quality standards

Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.

At the level of the General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Titles, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) no doctoral thesis were invalidated without the right to remake and resume the process of public support.

Fulfilled

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. *The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- (d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counseling made available to doctoral students.*

IOSUD-UNMB has developed and periodically applies a procedure for the evaluation and internal monitoring of the evolution of the doctoral school. All obligatory evaluation criteria are taken into account.

Within UNMB operates the Quality Assessment and Assurance Commission (CEAC) - a structure responsible for promoting the culture of quality, establishing qualitative and quantitative benchmarks, developing, implementing, coordinating and applying quality evaluation and assurance procedures and activities.

The regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral university studies are organized in IOSUD-UNMB are constantly updated, in accordance with the legislation in force.

I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement. More generally recommendation should be about the formal policy that needs to be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the Academy is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. *Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.*

In accordance with the legislation in force, the Student Association appoints representatives from among doctoral students for positions in the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD), by universal, direct and secret ballot of the students.

The election of the representatives of doctoral students in CSUD is made according to its own regulation, elaborated and voted by the Student Association.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.

The elections for the position of representative of PhD student for Doctoral School Council are organized by the student association. All PhD students have the right to choose and be elected. The choice is made according to its own regulations, elaborated and voted by the students. A doctoral student is a member of the Doctoral School Council.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.

IOSUD-UNMB uses Questionnaires on assessing the satisfaction of doctoral students during doctoral studies, as well as at the end of doctoral studies, which aims at the level of satisfaction with the doctoral program as a whole, in order to continuously improve the activities and services offered. The level of satisfaction in relation to the learning environment and the possibilities of professional and personal development offered by the university is appreciated by doctoral students as being positive in proportion of 90%.

The National University of Music in Bucharest, through its Doctoral School, but also through its faculties and departments, is in contact with both graduates and students. The experience gained at work, in the projects and collaborations in which they are employed is useful for improving doctoral study programs.

I would recommend to have formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives of Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, etc.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.

Partially fulfilled

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:

- (a) the Doctoral School regulation;
- (b) the admission regulation;
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;
- (e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;

- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;
- (i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.

The doctoral school updates and manages on the university website information related to the activities of the doctoral school and ensures access to regulations, procedures and other information related to the activities of the doctoral school, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.

I shell command UNMB DS on the extensive resources and methods of delivery it uses in sharing information with public.

Fulfilled

Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.

The access of doctoral students to subscriptions, to periodicals in the field, in the country and abroad, to databases including international (JSTOR and Journal of Research in Music Education) and to the Internet is unrestricted.

I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases: Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge , EBSCO, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Companions to Music etc.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.

All doctoral students have access, upon request, to the system for verifying the degree of similarity of their own works. Starting from September 2020, in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Research no. 5229 of August 17, 2020, IOSUD-UNMB uses the *Sistemantiplagiat.ro* platform, approved by CNATDCU (until now, the SemPlag.ro platform has been used).

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.

All PhD students have free access to the material base of scientific research and artistic creation in IOSUD-UNMB: the data platform and online journals that can be accessed on computers in the Electronic Collections room. The ratio between the available learning resources and the doctoral

students is monitored and constantly improved within the university. The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.

Fulfilled

Criterion C.3. Internationalization

Standard C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator *C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

UNMB focuses on the creation of an international educational environment, the institution's engagement in international projects, international strategic partnerships and benchmarking initiatives. This implies participation in international activities as well as hosting of international experts.

In the period 2015-2020 the number of partnerships with profile institutions in Europe and in the world was still growing as well as the diversity of projects and programs carried out either as a coordinator or as a partner. A particularly important activity, reflecting the process of internationalization of artistic activity and scientific research, is carried out by the Service of International Relations and Community Programs (SRIPC) and the ERASMUS + Office. ERASMUS + KA103, ERASMUS + KA107 and Strategic Partnership (KA2) individual mobility projects were carried out.

OSUD-UNMB applies a strategy to increase the internationalization of doctoral studies. More than 35% of doctoral students either completed training internships abroad or participated in international scientific conferences, international artistic events. Also, a series of projects were carried out during which conferences, international symposia were held with the participation of teachers, doctoral supervisors, students, doctoral students.

I would commend UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.

The institution offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.

In order to ensure the necessary knowledge base for the development of doctoral studies, IOSUD-UNMB invites personalities from the world of music, with international recognition, to give courses / lectures for doctoral students. On the list of experts from prestigious universities in other states, invited to take courses for doctoral students, there are many famous artistic personalities.

The university also supports, including financially, the development of research and artistic activities provided in the doctoral study programs, as follows:

- staging works / concerts, competitions, festivals;
- publishing books and scores;-online magazine Musicology Today, Acord newspaper, AkadeMuzica publication;
- audio-video recordings of some interpretive activities;
- holding conferences, lectures, workshops, master's courses (travel expenses, accommodation, fees), prestigious artistic personalities being invited;
- purchase of specialized books and software

Students can participate in a large number of short-term projects (conferences, joint projects or ensembles) as well as study abroad.

I would commend UNMB on its wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations

Fulfilled

*Performance Indicator * C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.*

The doctoral university studies are carried out in IOSUD-UNMB in Romanian. According to the legislation in force, foreign students follow, before enrolling in doctoral studies, a preparatory year of Romanian language, carried out in a university in the country, established by the Ministry of Education.

Theses written in Romanian contain a summary in an international language, and theses written in an international language must contain a summary in Romanian.

In the case of the professional doctorate, the doctoral thesis is accompanied by a full live show, recital and/or concert and/or recorded video and audio (DVD), respectively a large composition presented in concert or audio/video recorded. More than 60% of the theses are elaborated on the professional doctorate type.

There are only a few examples of thesis written in international language (English).

Partially fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees' etc.).

The acquired knowledge can be presented both through publications - articles, studies, books, scores and through public appearances-participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs). In addition to the activities carried out

through the Service of International Relations and Community Programs-UNMB, ERASMUS, IOSUD-UNMB concludes partnerships with profile institutions that carry out activities of international prestige, creating the possibility for doctoral students to participate in and to assert themselves at such international level events.

I would commend IOSUD-UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.

Fulfilled

Criterion C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity

Standard C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:

- policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public postionings, studies, analyses or measures taken;
- practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;
- practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;
- administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions;
- mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind;

IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.

In IOSUD-UNMB operates the University Ethics Commission. "UNMB Code of Ethics and Academic Integrity" is published on the university's website. In accordance with the legislation in force, starting with undergraduate studies, continuing with master's and doctoral studies, the curricula of all study cycles include the discipline "Ethics and academic integrity". Throughout the doctoral studies, doctoral students receive information related to the research ethics and the explanation of the methodology for drawing up a scientific research from the doctoral supervisors and the guidance commissions.

Also, IOSUD-UNMB uses anti-plagiarism programs, respectively the Sistemantiplagiat.ro program, in order to prevent possible violations of the Code of Ethics and Academic Integrity. For the validation of the presentation form of any texts included in the doctoral program I.O.S.U.D-U.N.M.B. adopted editorial standards. Compliance with these standards is constantly monitored by the doctoral supervisor and the members of the guidance committee, in order to avoid copying, plagiarism, "fabrication" of research results, etc. They are prohibited and sanctioned when there is evidence that they occur.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.

The doctoral theses, before the pre-defense, are sent, in electronic format, to the commission verifying the degree of similarity. In IOSUD-UNMB there were no complaints regarding the suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.3. The annual reports of the IODS Ethics Commission contain information on the status of each case in which there was a complaint or self-notification relevant to doctoral studies regarding the violation of certain rules and ethical issue.

The Ethics Commission publishes, annually, on the university website the "Report of the University Ethics Commission"; the report is validated by the university Senate. There were no complaints or self-notifications regarding plagiarism. Ethics issues are a major concern of the Ethics Commission, and the annual reports contain all the situations discussed and resolved. There were no issues of violation of research ethics.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.

In IOSUD-UNMB there were no withdrawals of the doctoral degree

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:

- a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;
- b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;
- c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism.

There were no withdrawals of the doctoral degree / there was no suspension of the right to coordinate new doctoral students / exclusion from IOSUD-UNMB of the doctoral supervisor / suspension of the organization of the admission process for the doctoral field.

Fulfilled	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
	Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. Performance Indicator A.1.1.6 of Specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s)	fulfilled	The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.

In UNMB there were no cases of scientific references, to be part of the commissions for public defense of (a) doctoral thesis / theses, with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).

The summary of the thesis in electronic format, the doctoral student's CV, as well as the CVs of the members of the commission for public defense of the doctoral thesis are published on the UNMB website.

Fulfilled

IV. SWOT Analyzis

<p>Strengths:</p> <p>The thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.</p> <p>Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.</p> <p>Extensive and active participation of IOSUD-UNMB in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and its broad artistic and cultural offer.</p> <p>Wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations.</p>	<p>Weaknesses:</p> <p>Lack of the formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences</p> <p>Lack of the formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives if Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, etc.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.</p> <p>Foreign databases are rather poor.</p>
<p>Opportunities:</p> <p>Preparation to the challenges pertaining to the Fourth Industrial Revolution.</p> <p>Creating new and updated ways of knowledge transfer.</p>	<p>Threats:</p> <p>According to the opinions of interlocutors at the meetings – there are not threats at all.</p>

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

	Performance Indicator A.1.1.2 <i>The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17,</i>	fulfilled	The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria
	Performance Indicator A.1.1.3 <i>Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158</i>	fulfilled	Within IODS there is only one doctoral school related to the MUSIC field
	Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. <i>The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.</i>	fulfilled	The data on the issued study documents and the doctoral supervisors are entered in the REI-RMU platform, the sections "Graduates" and "Doctoral supervisors". <i>I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni.</i>
	Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. <i>The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.</i>	fulfilled	From August 17, 2020, the Sistemantiplagiat.ro program was used.
	Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. <i>The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)</i>	fulfilled	The institution has appropriate resources to support student learning and delivery of the programmes.
	Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. <i>The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.</i>	fulfilled	The National University of Music in Bucharest is constantly expanding its circle of partnerships, according to the field of doctoral studies, which helps to ensure the high level of training of doctoral students, both scientifically and artistically.
	Performance Indicator A.2.1.3 <i>The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide</i>	fulfilled	The institution's financial resources enable successful delivery of the study programmes.

		<i>doctoral students access to updated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.</i>		
		Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1. <i>The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.</i>	fulfilled	The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.
		Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. <i>At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.</i>	fulfilled	Of the 16 doctoral supervisors, in “Constantin Brăiloiu” Doctoral School UNMB 9 (56%) are tenured within IOSUD-UNMB
		Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1. <i>Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.</i>	fulfilled	I shell commend UNMB on the thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.
		Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. <i>The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.</i>	fulfilled	UNMB grants 10 budgeted places within the approved schooling figure to graduates with a baccalaureate degree from the social protection system, according to the legislation in force.
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. <i>The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research</i>	fulfilled	Within the Training Program based on advanced university studies, according to the Curriculum, PhD student can participate in a series of relevant courses which are

		<i>training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.</i>		scheduled for the training in scientific research and artistic creation.
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. <i>At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program</i>	fulfilled	From the beginning of the doctoral activity, the doctoral supervisors and the guidance commissions offer as much information as possible related to the research ethics and the explanation of the methodology for drawing up a scientific paper. Example of discipline: <i>Ethics and Academic Integrity</i> which takes place during the first year of study.
		Performance Indicator B.2.1.3 <i>The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities .</i>	fulfilled	I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes, but not necessarily). I would also I would recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.
		Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. <i>For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents.etc.</i>	fulfilled	Within the professional doctorate at least two live artistic presentations with public (recital / concert / opera performance / conducting performances / works performed in concerts or recorded audio / video) accompanied by theoretical arguments are mandatory (there is also 2nd version). Within the Individual Scientific Research Program publications -articles, studies, books, scores. public appearances -participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs) are mandatory.
		Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. <i>At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of thesis non-validated, at the level of General</i>	fulfilled	At the level of the General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Titles, Diplomas and Certificates

		<i>Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.</i>		(CNATDCU) no doctoral thesis were invalidated without the right to remake and resume the process of public support.
		Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. <i>The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:</i>	fulfilled	The institution has a strong internal quality culture, supported by clear and effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures. I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement. More generally, I would recommend a formal policy be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the UNMB is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.
		Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. <i>Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</i>	fulfilled	The election of the representatives of doctoral students in CSUD is made according to its own regulation, elaborated and voted by the Student Association.
		Performance Indicator C.1.1.3. <i>Students' associations and, according to the case,</i>	fulfilled	The choice is made according to its own regulations, elaborated and voted by the students. A doctoral

		<i>representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</i>		student is a member of the Doctoral School Council.
		Performance Indicator C.1.1.4. <i>Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.</i>	partially fulfilled	I would recommend the long-term strategy be prioritized to become a veritable road map, integrating a time line within which specific goals can be achieved. I would recommend to have formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives of Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, etc.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.
		Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. <i>The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</i>	fulfilled	I shell command UNMB on the extensive resources and methods of delivery it uses in sharing information with public. Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.
		Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. <i>All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.</i>	fulfilled	I would recommend widening access to this type of foreign databases: <i>Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge, EBSCO, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Companions to Music, etc.</i>
		Performance Indicator C.2.2.2 <i>Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.</i>	fulfilled	From August 17, 2020, IOSUD-UNMB uses the <i>Sistemantiplagiat.ro</i> platform, approved by CNATDCU
		Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. <i>All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School,</i>	fulfilled	The access of students, doctoral supervisors and teachers to any resource is unrestricted.

		<i>according to internal order procedures.</i>		
		Performance Indicator C.3.1.1. <i>IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies).</i>	fulfilled	I shell commend UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and on its broad artistic and cultural offer. The institution offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective
		Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. <i>IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.</i>	fulfilled	I shell commend UNMB on its wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations.
		Performance Indicator C.3.1.3 <i>At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.</i>	partially fulfilled	As far as I know there are only a few examples of thesis written in international language (English).
		Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. <i>The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees² etc.).</i>	fulfilled	I would commend IOSUD-UNMB on its extensive and active participation in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level and on its broad artistic and cultural offer.
		Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. <i>IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:.....</i>	fulfilled	In IOSUD-UNMB operates the University Ethics Commission."UNMB Code of Ethics and Academic Integrity" is published on the university's website.
		Performance Indicator C.4.1.2. <i>All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been</i>	fulfilled	The doctoral theses, before the pre-defense, are sent, in electronic format, to the commission verifying the degree of similarity.

		<i>analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.</i>		in IOSUD-UNMB there were no complaints regarding the suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.</i>	fulfilled	The Ethics Commission publishes, annually, on the university website the "Report of the University Ethics Commission"; the report is validated by the university Senate. There were no issues of violation of research ethics.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.</i>	fulfilled	In IOSUD-UNMB there were no withdrawals of the doctoral degree
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:.....</i>	fulfilled	There were no withdrawals of the doctoral degree / there was no suspension of the right to coordinate new doctoral students / exclusion from IOSUD-UNMB of the doctoral supervisor / suspension of the organization of the admission process for the doctoral field.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.</i>	fulfilled	In UNMB there were no cases of scientific references, to be part of the commissions for public defense of (a) doctoral thesis / theses, with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the</i>	fulfilled	The summary of the thesis in electronic format, the doctoral student's CV, as well as the CVs of the members of the commission

	<i>institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).</i>	for public defense of the doctoral thesis are published on the UNMB website.
--	--	---

Wrocław, 27.09.2021