

# **The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain Doctoral Field: Marketing – Bucharest University of Economic Studies**

## Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations
- VI. Conclusions and general recommendations
- VII. Annexes

## **I. Introduction<sup>1</sup>**

The process of Periodic External Evaluation of Doctoral Study Domain in the field of **Marketing** was a part of the Periodic Evaluation of Doctoral Studies at **Bucharest University of Economic Studies (ASE)**. In the evaluation process the following expert panel members participated: Coordinator of the Expert Panel, who is also an expert evaluator (member of academic staff listed in the National Register of Evaluators and has the status of doctoral advisor in the same doctoral study domain), an international expert (member of ARACIS International Evaluators' Register, operating outside Romania) and one doctoral student (member of the National Register of Student Evaluators). The evaluation was organised and coordinated by ARACIS.

The Periodic External Evaluation of Doctoral Study Domain in the field of Marketing took place **from 26<sup>th</sup> - 30<sup>th</sup> of July, 2021** in a hybrid mode (mostly online and partially on the site, due to the Covid – 19 pandemic situation). During the week of evaluation there were online zoom meetings held with various stakeholders. Some meetings were held together with IOSUD members and some only for the domains Marketing. The following meetings were organised separately for the doctoral study domain Marketing:

1. The meeting with the Doctoral studies domain contact person and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report
2. The meeting with Doctoral coordinators
3. The meeting with Doctoral Schools Council (CSD members)
4. The meeting with PhD students
5. The meeting graduates for the Doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing
6. The meeting with the Directors/ persons in charge of the research Centres/laboratories
7. The meeting with employers of Doctoral graduates in the field of Marketing

---

<sup>1</sup> Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.



8. On Wednesday, 28<sup>th</sup> of July, the on-site visit to Bucharest University of Economic Studies took place with the purpose to evaluate educational and research infrastructure. The visit was attended only by Romanian members of the evaluation committee/members.

The ASE has a long and reputable history, dated from 1913, at that time known as the Academy of Higher Commerce and Industrial Studies. The new name, Bucharest University of Economic Studies was established in 1967<sup>th</sup>.

In 1997, ASE was accredited as an Institution Organizing Doctoral Studies, for 8 doctoral programs, in the fields of sciences: Economic Sciences and Law: Cybernetics and Economic Statistics, Accounting, Economics, Finance, Management, **Marketing**, International Economic Relations and Law. In 2011, ASE was re-accredited as an Institution Organizing Doctoral Studies-IOSUD for 10 doctoral programs, in the following areas: Economic Sciences and Legal Sciences. The doctoral fields include the following: Business Administration, Cybernetics and Statistics, Accounting, Economics, Economics and International Business, Finance, Economics, Management, **Marketing** and Law.

Teaching and research take place in educational areas owned by ASE. Teaching rooms, lecture theatres, seminar rooms and laboratories are equipped with appropriate computers, multimedia systems (video projectors and projectors, projection screens, flipcharts, etc.)

The Doctoral School Marketing is an institutional constitutive part of Marketing field. The Doctoral School Marketing (SDMK) started in 1968<sup>th</sup>, founded by Professor Constantin Florescu who was the founder of the Romanian school of marketing and the first PhD supervisor in marketing in Romania.

## II. Methods used

Methods used in this External evaluation process are as follows:

- Analysis of the periodic SER provided by IOSUD Bucharest University of Business Studies for the Doctoral study domain in the field of **Marketing**
- Analysis of the Annexes listed in the periodic SER and available on the cloud of ARACIS with online access to the cloud
- Analysis of additional documents provided and explained during the meetings in the week of evaluation
- The analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD's/SDSE's website, in electronic format;
- The analysis of the notes taken by external expert evaluator and information gathered during online zoom meetings with various stakeholders (with doctoral domain contact person/person who drafted SER, PhD supervisors and academic staff, director of the research, PhD students, PhD graduates, employers of the PhD graduates; Doctoral School Council members, IOSUD's representatives and Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD), on-line preparatory, organizational and technical meetings of all Expert Panels, and its members.

## III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

### ***Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY***



In the process of external evaluation and the analysed documents and other applied methodology, there were evidence of the institutional capacity, including administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources, research infrastructure and quality of human resources. The institutional capacity is positively assessed and perceived and the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing. All of the performance indicators are fulfilled thanks to the specific regulation that is in place and applied on the level of IOSUD and doctoral domain. The criteria and standards are applied, procedures implemented according to legislation, there is adequate software for the record of PhD students and there is also antiplagiarism software called Ssitemantiplagiat.ro. Research grants are not in place. According to data available in SER there is only 0.675% of the funds given to students for their professional training, attending conferences, etc. The required amount should be at least 10% of the grants and tuition fees. The facilities are sufficient, well equipped. The academic staff and supervisors on the level of doctoral study domain Marketing are competent, with fulfilled national criteria and committed in terms of students support. They are scientifically active with proved record of publishing activity in the recognised hi-indexed publications too. The academic staff and supervisors show commitment, enthusiasm and professionalism.

### **Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources**

On the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing, the mechanisms of efficient functioning related to the relevant law and legislation are fully implemented. It is evident from the SER and provided information the level of adequate logistics, including software for monitoring PhD students, and antiplagiarism software enabling to check the similarity of the research projects, papers and dissertations. The financial sources are the only standard here that is not fulfilled and the Doctoral Domain Marketing should work on finding solutions to increase the funds to students, in supporting students for publishing, participation in the conferences, training, etc. and to reach at least the minimum of 10%.

*Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.** *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:*

- (a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;*
- (b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;*
- (c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);*
- (d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;*
- (e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings;*
- (f) the contract for doctoral studies;*



*g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.*

The institutional regulations and methodologies of IOSUD related to organization and functioning or doctoral study programmes are implemented. The IOSUD has elaborated the evidence in the SER (pg. 13-16) and Annexes listed under the part A.1.1.1.

There is an evidence of the institutional regulation for the organizing and development of the doctoral study programmes and regulation.

There is a detailed list and explanation of the procedures related to point a) to g) in terms of satisfactory implementation of the criteria and indicators. At the level of IOSUD there are regulations specific for doctoral studies and they are applied. Therefore, the organization and functioning of the doctoral studies at IOSUD is done according to the Institutional regulation concerning the organization and functioning of the doctoral studies within the doctoral schools adopted by the Senate. According to the table 7 of SER (pg. 13) there is a list of Annexes regulating the admission to doctoral studies from the year 2015 to 2021.

According to SER, the academic doctoral studies in the Doctoral School Marketing operate on the basis of legal regulations in force regarding academic doctoral studies, on internal regulations in ASE and the Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies – Doctoral School Marketing - Annex SDMK-01. All regulations are elaborated in accordance with legal regulations in place, approved by the University's Senate and posted on ASE' website (see <http://senat.ase.ro/hotarari>).

The election process in CSUD and in doctoral schools takes place based on Election methodologies-Annex IOSUD-35a and Annex IOSUD-35b, and operational procedure PO\_SSUD-08 Organization and conduct of the election process at the PhD School level–Annex IOSUD-36.

CSUD Director was appointed as a result of a public competition, the evidence being included in-Annex IOSUD-37, and the evidence for the selection of students for the CSUD in Annex IOSUD-38. Elections for the position of Director of the Doctoral school as well as those for members of the Doctoral School Board Marketing took place in accordance with the operational procedure PO\_SSUD-08–Annex IOSUD-36.

There is a recruitment and admission policy for all candidates without discrimination, all of which are detailed in the Methodology for the organization and conduct of admission to doctoral studies. The admission contest is organized according to an admission methodology provided by the CSUD, authorized by the Board of Trustees and approved by the University's Senate. The methodologies are updated annually for all academic education cycles and are made public by presentation on the official university website at least 6 months before the date of the admission.

As per the Table 8 (Methodologies to organize and carry out admission to doctoral studies) available in the SER (pg. 14), there is a list of evidence of the admission methodologies and Annexes supporting the evidence from the year 2015 to 2021.

The appointment of PhD supervisors is done by the Minister's of Education order, in accordance with legal provisions in the field, in force at that moment. In the Annex IOSUD-52 we can find the "Methodology to organize and carry out the habilitation". ASE applies existing legal regulations consisting in the procedures elaborated by the National Centre for Recognition and Equivalence of Diplomas (<https://cnred.edu.ro/ro/studii-universitare>), an operational procedure being in force, as par the Annex CSUD-53. The Council for Doctoral Studies works within IOSUD and Doctoral School Council works at the level of each doctoral school. These structures work in accordance with the provisions of the Law of



Education, the Code of Doctoral Studies and the Regulation to organize and carry out doctoral studies, decisions being made within CSUD meetings as per the Annex CSUD-54, Annex CSUD-55, Annex CSUD-56, Annex CSUD-57, Annex CSUD-58. The Doctoral School Marketing Council meets regularly, at least three times a year, at the request of the Director of the Doctoral School or of at least one third of its members, and whenever necessary in order to resolve common problems, as stated in the SER pg. 15 and Annex SDM-06. In regards to study contracts, candidates are registered when the academic year starts, and sign a study contract with ASE. The contracts entails the rights and obligations of the parties and it is signed on 1st October each academic year as per Annex CSUD-59.

In accordance with national and internal regulations, research themes and number of places are announced for each PhD supervisor of the Doctoral School Marketing. The syllabi of the four subjects in the curricula are elaborated for the study of PhD students in the first year.

According to SER and data provided in the meeting with various stakeholders there is a process which determines the research themes. It is as explained in the SER, as follows: each PhD supervisor send the Director of the Doctoral school the themes and proposed places; once centralized, proposals are discussed in a general meeting of the Doctoral school members; the final version of proposals is approved, in turns, by the Council of the Doctoral school, CSUD, the Faculty Council and the board; proposals are approved by the ASE Senate and become public on the CSUD website.

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.***

The Regulation of Doctoral School in the field of Marketing and as per the Annex SDM-01 includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards for issues specified in Article 17, Paragraph 5 of the Government Decision no. 681/ 2011, including subsequent amendments and additions as follows:

(a) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.16-20 specific mentions about the acceptance of new PhD supervisors, while article 21 refers specifically to the way the title of a member of the doctoral school can be withdrawn;

(b) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.39-46 specific mentions to the mechanisms based on which the opportunity, structure and content of the training programme based on advanced studies are decided on;

(c) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art. 11, l.10, letter g-i specific mentions regarding how a certain PhD student can change his/her PhD supervisor and procedures to mediate conflicts;

(d) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.11, l.10, letter k specific mentions on how the doctoral programme can be interrupted;

(e) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.49, 50 and 54 specific mentions about the way to prevent fraud in scientific research, including plagiarism;

(f) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.40 specific mentions on ensuring access to research;

(g) Regulation of Doctoral School Marketing includes in art.7 and art.39-48 mentions about PhD students needing to attend PhD training courses, for PhD students in their first year, in the area of



advanced research, with the aim to develop skills and competences towards empirical studies and use of quantitative models and techniques of advanced research in marketing.

*The information is provided in the SER, pg. 16 and confirmed during the meetings with various stakeholders as well as from the official website of ASE.*

*Recommendations: Continue with good practices and always include mandatory criteria, procedures and standards in the Doctoral school's Regulations and keep them public.*

**The indicator is fulfilled**

*Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.*

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.** *The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.*

The effective and adequate software for keeping track of PhD students and their academic background is in place. All data and information about students academic achievements is recorded and kept in electronic format. ASE has an IT system able to collect, process and analyse data and information relevant to quality institutional assessment and assurance. The IT Department is in charge of database management, including Information and Network Office. The evidence is available in Romanian language in the Annex IOSUD-19. Most of the processes in ASE are computerized: student admission, allocation in on-site campus accommodation, scientific research management, student records, academic records, grade transcripts, scholarships, and intra-community mobility. The evidence is provided during the meetings with academic staff, supervisors and students and in the Annex IOSUD-20.

*Recommendations: Continue with a good practice in implementing effective and appropriate IT system and update it to new versions and new technological possibilities.*

**The indicator is fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.** *The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

The software program which aims to identify and verify the similarity index of all doctoral thesis is in use since 2015 at the level of the IOSUD. The software named Sistemantiplagiat.ro indicates how to use the anti-plagiarism system in accordance with the technical specifications of the Sistemantiplagiat.ro platform. The procedure applies to all doctoral theses, books and articles supported by/published in ASE -Annex IOSUD-60. For theses defended in the Doctoral School Marketing in the last five years, the similarity coefficient 1 is 4,160% (the maximum being 30%), while the similarity coefficient 2 is 0,885% (the maximum accepted value being 5%). All the 40 PhD theses were approved.

*Recommendations: Continue with using the antiplagiarism software and search for updates and improved versions of it, in order to increase the data base of sources to be checked by the software and to increase the level of originality of doctoral thesis and research papers.*

**The indicator is fulfilled**





*Standard A.1.3. The IOSUD makes sure that financial resources are used optimally, and the revenues obtained from doctoral studies are supplemented through additional funding besides governmental funding.*

***Performance Indicator A.1.3.1.*** *Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years. The grants address relevant themes for the respective domain and, as a rule, are engaging doctoral students.*

According to SER and data provided during the meetings with the PhD coordinators it is evident that the Doctoral Domain in the field of Marketing supported state funding with the research grants. There were 5 grants granted in the past 5 years while the 2 are completed and 3 are still ongoing (Annex SDMKG-08).

*Recommendations: Continue to search, develop, attract and participate in research and development grants by acquiring projects and beside supervisors involve also PhD students.*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

***Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.2.*** *The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional / human resources development grants is not less than 20%.*

*The data available in SER and confirmed in the meetings, there is a total of 81 PhD students in the doctoral field of Marketing at the date of submission date. Out of them, 43 are under training, while 38 completed their doctoral training. Depending on their status during the training, 29 PhD students got state-funded scholarships (out of whom the category of "Romanians abroad"), 27 PhD students got state-funding but no scholarship, while 25 attended paid doctoral studies –Annex SDMKG-09.*

*The number of PhD students who have benefitted from/benefit from other funding sources for at least six months raises to 17, which represents 20,99% –Annex SDMKG-10.*

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

***Performance Indicator \*A.1.3.3.<sup>2</sup>*** *At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students*

---

<sup>2</sup> The indicators marked with an asterisk (\*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral studies domains, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation. In case they are not met, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.



*(attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).*

Within the field of Marketing doctoral domain, PhD students benefit from funding from the state budget PhD but not reaching the minimum of at least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants and tuition fees. Out of the total amount for the reported period, only 0,675% fundings is allocated to students. Annex SDMK-11. At CSUD level, the case of expenditures for PhD students goes in Annex CSUD-61.

*Recommendations:*

*There is a need to increase the funding of students when it comes to funding them for the following: attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc. The management have to find ways to support students and reach the potential in funding them with at least the minimum of 10%. The additional funds can be also obtained by participation in projects and introducing university entrepreneurship, spin offs, collaboration with business sector, other research institutions etc.*

**The indicator is not fulfilled.**

## **Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure**

*The research infrastructure and facilities of doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing are sufficient for the realisation of doctoral studies, including research laboratories, computers, software, books and international database. As evidenced from the SER and resented during the meeting with the research director there is a lot of evidences that the research infrastructure ensures students to conduct quality research and projects.*

*Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.*

**Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.** *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

The facilities of the IOSUD and Doctoral School are adequate for the realization of research activities and they follow the mission and objectives of the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing. According to data retrieved from SER and the presentation provided during the meeting with research centre director, it is evident that this indicator is fulfilled.

The key objective of the individual scientific programme is to elaborate the PhD thesis, but this program also implies the participation of the PhD student in scientific projects set by the PhD supervisor, research being evaluated by the supervisor and advisory board. Scientific research in ASE holds sufficient financial, logistic and human resources to accomplish the proposed objectives. Teaching





and research activities in the study programs take place in educational establishments owned by ASE: lecture rooms, lecture theaters, seminar rooms, laboratories, online platforms –adequately equipped with appropriate computers and multimedia systems (video and overhead projectors, projection screens, flipcharts, etc.). Teaching/training rooms have technical equipment, appropriate to the current state of development of scientific knowledge including learning, teaching and communication, which facilitates teaching and the receptiveness of each student (video projector, computer, projection screen, video conferencing equipment, TV studio, flipchart - Annex IOSUD-19 and Annex IOSUD-20.

ASE has facilities for Internet wireless access, including suitable furniture. Software applications used in ASE have basic software licenses (operating systems, antivirus programs), specialized software licenses (SPSS, CIEL, EVIEWS, SAS/R) and application software licenses (Microsoft Office, MS SharePoint, MS SQL Server, other dedicated programs: Eviewports, Stata, etc.). In order to carry out research, PhD students in SDMKG have access to the infrastructure part of IOSUD-ASE resources. In addition, access is permanent to the halls and laboratories of Marketing Department in the Faculty of Marketing, where scientific meetings and examinations take place -Annex SDMKG-12. In the last year, during the emergency and alert generated by Covid-19 pandemic, all activities in the Doctoral school Marketing took place online. Both PhD supervisors and other specialists involved in these activities, as well as PhD student had the hardware and software needed to carry out work, so no kind of issues were recorded. By analysing all these documents and sources it can be concluded that this indicator is fulfilled. During the meeting with the director of the research centre it is noted his strong commitment, professionalism and enthusiasm when it comes to quality issues and further development of the research facilities.

*Recommendations: Continue keeping and updating research and facility infrastructure.*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

### **Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources**

Quality of human resources at the doctoral domain in the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing is high. This is one of the strengths of the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing, too. There are 19 PhD supervisors and 14 of them meet the CNATDCU minimum standards mandatory to obtain the certificate. All 14 are employed fully and they have expertise in the field they are teaching. The number of students they supervise is in line with standards and their publishing activity is indexed in Web of Science with significance in the field of Marketing.

*Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.*

*All performance indicators under the A.3.1. at the level of the domain are fulfilled and there are sufficient number of qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.*

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.1. Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.***



According to SER, it is evident there are 19 PhD supervisors in the Doctoral School of Marketing - Annex SDMK-05. Out of the PhD supervisors currently affiliated to Doctoral school in the field of Marketing there are 14 PhD supervisors, respectively 73,68% comply with CNADTCU minimal standards needed and mandatory to get the habilitation diploma, in place at the moment of evaluation Annex SDMK-14. Therefore, this indicator is fulfilled.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.***

The total of 19 PhD supervisors at ASE were affiliated to the Doctoral school marketing in the same field. Out of 19 PhD supervisors in SDMK, 14 are ASE staff, which represents 73,68%. Out of the other five PhD supervisors in SDML, four were ASE staff, currently retired, and one is from the Romanian-American University –Annex SDMK-13. This indicator is fulfilled and there is a good ratio of permanently employed doctoral advisors.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

***Performance Indicator A.3.1.3. The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.***

The subjects of training in the education program at the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing are taught by teaching staff with PhD supervisor status and they have the proven expertise in the field of the subjects they teach. Annex CSUD-65.

Subjects in the training programme based on advanced studies are delivered, in the field of Marketing, by teaching staff being PhD supervisors/habilitated, professor/scientific researcher I or associate professor/scientific researcher II or other specialists with proven expertise in the field of advanced studies –Annex SDMK-15

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled***

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.4. The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs<sup>3</sup> does not exceed 20%.***

---

<sup>3</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education



According to data provided in SER, the PhD supervisors coordinate simultaneously, at the moment of internal reporting, in average, 2,63 PhD students during their ordinary course interval of the doctoral programme. The share of PhD supervisors in the Doctoral School Marketing who coordinate simultaneously over 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies (3 years plus extension periods granted under Article 39(3) of the Code approved by Government Decision No 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and additions) does not exceed 20%, being 5,26% -Annex SDMK-16 and Annex SDMK-17. By analysing this data it is evident that this indicator is fulfilled.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

*Standard A.3.2. The Doctoral advisors within the domain are carrying out a scientific activity visible at international level.*

*The Doctoral advisors within the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing have reached significant scientific activity visible at international level.*

**Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defence commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.*

According to information provided in SER, in Doctoral School Marketing, 15 of the 19 PhD supervisors (78,95%) have at least 5 Web of Science or ERIH publications and other achievements presenting relevance for the field, including contributions at the international level, which indicate progress in research-development-innovation - Annex SDMK-18.

Out of 15 PhD supervisors affiliated with Doctoral field Marketing, who published at least five ISI articles, 14 confirmed their international visibility in the last five years, enjoying at least one of the following: member in the scientific committees of publications and international conferences; member in the boards of international professional associations; guest at conferences or expert groups taking place abroad, member in PhD viva committee at universities abroad, PhD supervisors in cotutelle at universities abroad etc. In total, 14 out of the 19 PhD supervisors complete both criteria (minimum five ISI articles and international notoriety in the last five years) which represents 73,68%. –Annex SDMK-18.

---

No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator \*A.3.2.2.** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

PhD supervisors affiliated to doctoral field Marketing carry out intense research and according to data available in SER and the Annex SDM 19, 17 out of the 19 PhD supervisors (89,47%) reached at least 25% of the score requested by CNATDCU minimal standards in place at the date of the assessment, needed and mandatory to get habilitation, based on scientific results in the last five years.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS**

*From the perspective of the educational effectiveness the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing is well assessed in the majority of the standards and performance indicators. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest is fulfilled and the institution attracts candidates successfully and sufficiently, while the content of the doctoral program fulfilled all the criteria but partially the one related to „the learning outcomes”, not specifying adequately the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities, especially in relations to specific learning outcomes, students workload and assessment of learning outcomes.*

### **Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest**

*Standard B.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies has the capacity to attract candidates from outside the higher education institution or a number of candidates exceeding the number of seats available.*

*The standard B.1.1. is fulfilled as per the data available in performance indicator B.1.1.1.*

**Performance Indicator \*B.1.1.1.** *The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.*



*In the Faculty of Marketing, doctoral field of Marketing, the ratio between the number of MSc graduates from other higher education institutions, outside IOSUD-ASE, enrolling for admission in the last five years and the number of state-funded places available for admission in the Doctoral School Marketing shows that average of the five years is 0,48, which is more than the minimum of 0,2. This standard is fulfilled and ASE at the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing has the capacity to attract candidates which is larger than the number of available places.*

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

*Standard B.1.2 Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.*

*The candidates admitted to doctoral program in the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing are of sufficient quality and the selection is based on the selection criteria as described in the following performance indicator. The dropout rate of PhD students does not exceed 30%.*

**Performance Indicator \*B.1.2.1.** *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

Admission to doctoral study programs is based on the selection criteria that include various elements.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.1.2.2.** *The expelling rate, including renouncement / dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4, years after admission<sup>4</sup> does not exceed 30%.*

The dropout rate for PhD students at the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing reached from 16% in 2015 to 8% in 2019/2020. The data is retrieved from the SER and it shows that it does not exceed 30%.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs**

*The training program, the curriculum and disciplines included in the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing as well as guidelines, consultancy and publishing of PhD students with their committees is fulfilled. Students receive sufficient number of meetings and consultancy with the committees and they*

---

<sup>4</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



*benefit from those meetings. There are also the disciplines dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property where students can gain competencies in terms of being able to apply it in their research projects and thesis writing. The major observation when it comes to performance indicator concerning the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities, is that it is only partially fulfilled due to lack of specific learning outcomes, distribution of ECTS and students workload including also the lack of clear assessment methods of each specific learning outcome.*

*Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behaviour in science.*

The training programs on the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing is based on the advanced academic studies and they do include at least 3 subjects relevant for the development of the scientific advancements of PhD students and they do aim to improve the students research skills.

There is a room for improvements in the syllabuses and the creation of learning outcomes of the courses as well as the ECTS understanding from the perspective of students and the relationship between ECTS and the students workload. Students do receive the guidelines and consultancy from the advisory committees and number of PhD students and the number of teachers/researchers who provide guidance is not larger than 3:1. It has been from 0.82 to 1.61.

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.*** *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

The doctoral field of Marketing offers to the doctoral students a Training Program based on advanced university studies, made up of activities carried out in institutionalized study formations, through courses and seminars. There are four disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students included: Academic ethics and integrity, Applying quantitative and qualitative methods in scientific research, Current issues in marketing and New trends in marketing research. Out of the four subjects, two go in the advanced study of the methodology of scientific research and interpreting statistics in marketing – Annex CSUD-66, Annex CSUD-67, Annex SDM-22, Annex SDM-23, Annex SDM-24, and Annex SDM-25. According to this, the indicator is fulfilled.

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.*** *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

*According to the data provide in SER there is ONE discipline included in the advanced university training and documentation program. The “Ethics and academic integrity” is a specific subject dedicated to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property, included in the annual curriculum of the academic year 2019-2020 -Annex SDM-22, Annex SDM-23*





*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.3.** *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities<sup>5</sup>.*

Specific professional and transversal competences are notable in skills grids and syllabi included in the curricula of the Doctoral School Marketing – Annex SDMKG-24, Annex SDMKG-25, Annex SDMKG-26, and Annex SDMKG-27. The learning outcomes are presented in syllabuses but there is a need to improvement when it comes to detailed explanation of ECTS evaluation and their relationships to learning outcomes. The concept of learning outcomes at the level of the doctoral studies must be specific and according to EU guidance. Both groups of representatives on the meetings (the academic staff/supervisors and students) are not familiar with the full concept and meaning of learning outcomes, their relationship with the ECTS allocation and the students workload. During the meetings conducted with them, there is no evidence of understanding the concept of Bloom’s taxonomy of knowledge. It is necessary to improve syllabuses accordingly and adjust the workload as well as the methods how to check/examine each learning outcome. Specific learning outcomes can be checked in one of more exams, research papers and students activity. It should be clearly explained in syllabuses. The syllabuses must also include the correlation between each learning outcome on the level of the course and the level of study program. There is usually 5-6 specific learning outcomes per each syllabus. Each one determines the competencies and skills that students will gain once they accomplish each learning outcome. The concept provided in the syllabuses in the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing should be improved in terms of clear explanation how will each learning outcome be tested and how many ECTS it will be allocated to each learning outcome. The syllabuses should be revised, adjusted to the EU standards and communicated to students in order to be aware of their meaning, requirements and to know what is necessary to pass each learning outcome.

*Recommendations: To revise the concept of syllabus development including the EU standards when it comes to following: allocate the number of ECTS for each learning outcome and incorporate specific methods how they will be measured/tested and fulfilled by the students. The workload must be clear and explained in the syllabuses but also communicated to students. The Bloom’s taxonomy of knowledge can be helpful here and the level of learning outcomes should be appropriate with the doctoral level of study. There is a need to explain the methods of accomplishing each learning outcome and to measure its quality. There is also the need to implement the correlation between each specific learning outcome on the level of the course with the learning outcomes of the doctoral program in the field of Marketing. It is a strong and necessary recommendation for this performance indicator which will ensure compliance with EU standards.*

**The indicator is partially fulfilled.**

---

<sup>5</sup> Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology of 17 March 2017 regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.



**Performance Indicator B.2.1.4.** *All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counselling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting.*

According to the data provided in SER and from the meeting with students and supervisors, there are benefits for PhD students from the supervisors and from the other members of the guidance commission. For the whole duration of doctoral studies PhD students in the field of Marketing benefit from, in addition to the supervision covered by their supervisor, by counselling / mentoring of operational advisory boards, boards decided upon together with the PhD supervisor at the very moment of registration. The advisory board advises students via either written or oral feedback, activities complementing those provided by the PhD supervisor. The effectiveness of advisory boards operate is demonstrated through publications or scientific papers of PhD students together with the board, electronic correspondence focusing on feedback provided to students by the members of the board - Annex SDM-K-28, as well as organizing of scientific seminars during the academic year where the board is also present - Annex SDM-K-29.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.5.** *For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.*

For the period of five years, from 2015-2020, the number of PhD students and the number of teachers/researchers who provide guidance (the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teachers who provide guidance ) is not higher than 3:1. For the doctoral field of Marketing, the 62 advisory boards related to the students who have not presented their work at the viva have 37 teaching staff members / various 23/ 31 researchers. The ratio between PhD students and the number of staff/researchers engaged in advising is 1,68 which is lower than the maximum of 3,00 - Annex SDM-K-30.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

### **Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation.**

*The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation are fulfilled. The students present research papers in scientific conferences and their papers do represent the contribution in the field of Marketing as well as their participation in international events is higher than 1 which also complies with the required performance indicator.*

*Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.*



*\*general description of the standard analysis.*

**Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.** *For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.*

In the doctoral domain of Marketing field there were 23 representative scientific papers presented in an ISI listed journal. The publishing was done by 16 out of 40 PhD students. Selected articles have a relevant contribution for the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing and all 5 selected contain significant original contribution in the respective domain which is higher than 3 as required in this indicator.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.1.2.** *The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.*

All the 40 PhD students receiving the PhD title in the last five years in the field of Marketing, validated by CNADCU by 30 September 2020, attended at least one prestigious international scientific event (in or outside the country), considering that this is stipulated in the minimal criteria for their viva. Highly relevant is that 16 out of the 40 PhD students published at least one paper listed in ISI listed Proceedings, and the total number of papers is 144 - Annex SDM-32. The ratio between the number of participations to prestigious international events and the number of PhD students getting a PhD title validated by CNADCU by 30 September 2020 is 3,65. This information is retrieved from the SER and proves the compliance with this indicator.

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled**

**Standard B.3.2.** *The Doctoral School engages a significant number of external scientific specialists in the commissions for public defence of doctoral theses in the analysed domain.*

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.1.** *The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.*

*As reported in the SER, during the reported period, a number of 20 external members participated in the vivas of the doctoral theses. During this period, there were 19 cases when, in one year, two theses were allocated to the same external referee, while for the remaining cases one referee was used only once.*



There were no cases when a PhD supervisor appealed to three or more than three times to the same external referee - Annex SDM-33.

Recommendations:

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator \*B.3.2.2.** *The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defence on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analysed.*

The maximum ratio between the number of doctoral theses allocated to a particular scientific referee coming from another higher education institution than IOSUD-ASE and the number of doctoral theses presented during the reported period in the Doctoral School Marketing is 0,275, lower than 0,3 for this period - Annex SDM-34. The data is retrieved from the SER and shows the compliance with the requirements.

Recommendations:

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

*The quality assurance system of the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing is in place from the perspective of the existence of the procedures and norms and also from the implementation of the internal quality assurance system. The various evidence is presented in the SER, Annexes and also explained during the meeting with all stakeholders. The evaluation system by using questionnaires to get the valuable feedback from the students is also in place and the feedback is taken into account in order to improve further quality of the domain, study programs, students support and other important issues students address and require. The transparency of information and availability of resources online and on the website (to all future students, current students and public) is ensured on the level of IOSUD and doctoral domain. There is also free access to scientific and academic research and publications, databases and e-books, and there is a software available to students upon request to check similarity with other existing scientific sources with the assistance of supervisors who have access to such software, Sistemantiplagiat.ro approved by CNTDCU.*

### **Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system**

*On the level of the IOSUD and doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing there is a proof of existence of periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance as well as the implementation of the system*



*in terms of different standards being evaluated and monitored and collecting feedback from the PhD students, important for further improvement of the domain and study program.*

*Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.*

*The institutional framework is present on the level of the IOSUD and the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing and there are evidences for that. There is evaluation and monitoring process in place in regards to major activities starting with scientific work of advisors and students, the infrastructure, procedures and rules for students, training programs and other social and economic activities.*

**Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.** *The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- (d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;*
- (e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students;*
- (f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.*

*IOSUD-ASE has developed and applies regularly an internal procedure to assess and monitor the progress of doctoral schools. This includes the scientific activity of the PhD supervisors, the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out research, the procedures and regulations regulating doctoral studies, the scientific activity of doctoral students, as well as the training program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students - Annex CSUD-68. The information provided in SER and during the meeting with various stakeholders it was evident that there are procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies are applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.*

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator \*C.1.1.2.** *Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.*

*According to SER and data provided, there are mechanisms to collect feedback from PhD students (PhD students satisfaction questionnaire assessment) - Annex SDM-35. The action plan to improve deficiencies pointed out and stimulate scientific and academic performance of the Doctoral School*



*Marketing - Annex SDMK-36 were implemented. Annually, the level to achieve the adopted action plan together with the strategy is evaluated, at the start of the mandate, which turns this plan into an effective monitoring instrument of internal quality assurance.*

*Recommendations:*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

## **Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources**

*There is a transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources at the level of the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing is achieved official website which provides all (PhD candidates and PhD students) with all important information related to all aspects of the study programs but also of the learning resources. All other stakeholder can also access the information important for the study program and specific requirements, regulations, learning resources, anti-plagiarism software and other needed facilities.*

*Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.*

*The information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest is available for electronic format consultation.*

**Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.** *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- (a) the Doctoral School regulation;*
- (b) the admission regulation;*
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*
- (e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;*
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);*
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*
- (i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.*

All methodologies and regulations regarding how admission takes place and any other information of public interest are available to those interested on [www.ase.ro](http://www.ase.ro), complying with general provisions about data protection. Table 13 on page 24 of SER shows the list of internal regulations with the links where





each can be accessed. Information on Doctoral School Marketing is available on the IOSUD-ASE website (see <http://www.doctorat.ase.ro/>) and on the Faculty of Marketing website.

*Recommendations: To publish all relevant documents in English language in order to be better promoted in the international environment and to attract more foreign students.*

**The indicator is fulfilled**

*Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.*

*The IOSUD and Doctoral Study Domain in the field of Marketing provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies which consists of the access to academic databases (scientific and e-books) in the field of Marketing, antiplagiarism software Sistemantiplagiat.ro and access to research laboratories and other needed facilities.*

*ASE provides learning resources (textbooks, treatises, bibliographic references, anthologies, etc.), through its libraries, free of charge, both in print and electronic format, for each organized study program, regardless of level (Bachelor's, Master's, Doctorate). ASE library has, in addition to electronic access, an appropriate number of domestic and international books, and subscriptions to the main specialized journals in Romania and abroad for each subject that defines a study program (see [www.biblioteca.ase.ro](http://www.biblioteca.ase.ro)).*

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.** *All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.*

*According to the data provided in SER, ASE provides learning resources (textbooks, treatises, bibliographic references, anthologies, etc.), through its libraries, free of charge, both in print and electronic format, for each organized study program, regardless of level (Bachelor's, Master's, Doctorate). ASE library has, in addition to electronic access, an appropriate number of domestic and international books, and subscriptions to the main specialized journals in Romania and abroad for each subject that defines a study program (see [www.biblioteca.ase.ro](http://www.biblioteca.ase.ro)).*

*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.2.** *Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.*

*According to SER and meeting with students and supervisors, each student, including the PhD students of the Doctoral School Marketing can access similarity coefficient of their scientific papers. Thus, doctoral students have access, upon request, to this electronic system to check the similarity with other existing scientific or artistic productions, at <http://dmci.ase.ro/index.php/antiplagiat>.*



*Recommendations:*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.** *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

All PhD students in the Doctoral School Marketing have permanent access to the rooms and laboratories of the Faculty of Marketing, scientific research laboratories being also available - Annex IOSUD -10 and Annex IOSUD-11. The information is retrieved from SER and also discussed during the meetings with students and supervisors. The satisfaction with the scientific research laboratories is high.

*Recommendations: The students expressed their opinion on the lack of communication between students and recommended the improvement in terms of the need to be introduced to each other and to have more interaction with others, especially in the first year and the beginning of the study program. Some students were not familiar with statistics and data analysis and they find important to interact with other in order to improve their skills or to exchange knowledge with others who are more into certain subjects. On the level of the domain it is advised that the communication is initiated by supervisors with aim to introduce students by creating group domain or channel where students can meet each other and work together in certain projects or just exchange knowledge and ideas. This is also good way to improve the communication and overall educational experience during the online studies and Covid pandemic.*

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

### **Criterion C.3. Internationalization**

*Internationalisation of the IOSUD and doctoral domain in the field of Marketing is mostly accomplished but there is a room for improvement especially in the performance indicators C. 3.1.2. and C.3.1.3. The co-mentorship should be introduced with international experts in the future. There is a need to implement the curriculum in English language and other languages, and to increase the level of promotion of Erasmus+, cooperation with other institutions, international doctoral schools, supervisors, guest lecturers, etc.*

*Standard C.3.1. There is a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.*

*The strategy of internationalisation exists at the level of IOSUD and it concerns also the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing.*

**Performance Indicator \*C.3.1.1.** *IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies*



*and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

On the level of IOSUD of Bucharest University of Economic Sciences there are agreements on the Mobility with foreign universities, research institutes and with companies carrying out activities in the field of study with the aim to attract and improve the competencies of the PhD students and teachers. There is also Erasmus incoming and outgoing mobility realisation in the last 5 years. The list of Universities can and numbers of total incoming and outgoing mobility can be found in Annexes IOSUD – 71 and IOSUD 72. The internationalisation strategy exists and it is provided in the Annex IOSUD – 05. It aims to cover the period from 2016 to 2027. The idea presented during the meeting with management, supervisors and academic staff shows that internationalization is an important part of the whole strategy of the University and it is perceived as very important in the Doctoral Domain in the field of Marketing too. There were difficulties in the period of Covid pandemic but the internationalisation is done now mostly online with the plans to be improved in the future too.

*Recommendations: To continue participation in Erasmus+ mobility and international cooperation and find models to cope with Covid-19 pandemic by introducing hybrid models of Erasmus+ and other international collaborations. The pandemic gives us more opportunities to adjust to the online models of common projects, research, lectures provided in both ways – outgoing and incoming and those opportunities need to be improved and leveraged in the future.*

***The indicator is fulfilled.***

***Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.*** *In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

*As per the information provided in SER for the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing there was no co-mentorship organised with international experts. There is an intention and plan to do it in the future. During the reported period, international experts were invited to lecture for doctoral students at the Doctoral School SDM. For example, Professor Alexandru Minea, Université d'Auvergne in Clermont-Ferrand joined it - Annex CSUD-73. Doctoral School Marketing is open to cooperate with external specialists, an example in this sense being the presence in the examination panel of PhD student Alexandru Bosînceanu of Prof Lucian Turcescu, Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada.*

*Recommendations: To continue good practice in guest lecturing of international experts and further develop the co-mentorship on the international level as well as guest lectures and international cooperation with international lecturers, professors, supervisors and academic staff in order to enhance and increase the quality of doctoral study program.*

***The indicator is partially fulfilled.***



**Performance Indicator C.3.1.3.** *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).*

*The internationalization activities are carried out during the doctoral studies and they are supported by IOSUD. There is an evidence in the SER which indicates the participation in educational fairs to attract international PhD students and signing partnerships with prestigious universities with the aim to support internationalization SDMK – Annex CSUD-74. Doctoral School Marketing is open to cooperation with foreign specialists, one example being the involvement in the advisory board of PhD student Alexandru Besancenot Prof Lucian Turcescu, Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada. By analysing the information provided in SER and during the meetings with various stakeholders it is evident that there is a room for improvement in the internationalisation aspect.*

*Recommendations: Bucharest University of Economic studies supports internationalisation and aims to accomplish more in the future in all aspects, especially in promoting the doctoral study domains, amongst also the domain in the field of Marketing. The recommendation is to involve more in the promotion of the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing to foreign universities and institutions. The models of cooperation must be adjusted to Covid-19 pandemic too, and some courses can be delivered in English online. The full set of documents, rules and regulations related to study program should be in English. The whole set of documents and procedures should be created and the whole infrastructure (including administrative issues and other supportive documents important for students on the international level) should be adopted to meet requirements of international students' need, including quality assurance, etc. Promotion should be done through different media from word of mouth, academic staff, supervisors, students, Alumni association, social networks and media such as LinkedIn, Instagram, Facebook, websites, workshops, round tables, exhibitions, online events and presentation of the IOSUD and doctoral domain, etc. To promote internationalization in both ways (incoming and outgoing, co-mentorships, attract more international guest lecturers and offer more guest lectures abroad as well as trainings and WS within and beside Erasmus+ program) it is very important to create action plan with specific goals and measures. The curriculum must be offered in English language, the syllabuses should be available in English language with correlation and improved learning outcomes corresponding to EU standards of higher education and doctoral level. There should be list of courses available completely in English language with academic staff that can perform in English language. All documents should be published on the website and promotion can be done also by more engaging in international projects and participation in different international fairs even if still online. There is many international conferences that offer online participation and it is possible to participate and at the same time promote the University, doctoral domain Marketing and attract more students, more professors, guests, projects and common research activities. The cooperation with employers of PhD students and more active Alumni association can also contribute in the promotion on the national but also international level.*

**The indicator is partially fulfilled.**

## **IV. SWOT Analysis**

<p><b><u>Strengths:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- quality assurance system</li> <li>- development strategy</li> <li>- reputation and experience of the IOUSD</li> <li>- long history of the IOSUD</li> <li>- quality of academic staff and supervisors</li> <li>- motivated academic staff</li> <li>- motivated and committed PhD supervisors</li> <li>- motivated and satisfied students</li> <li>- research facilities and infrastructure (excellent presentation of head of the research centre)</li> <li>- research and scientific activity of supervisors and students</li> <li>- willingness of management to improve Doctoral Domain</li> <li>- committed management</li> <li>- good cooperation with employers of students</li> <li>- rules and regulations applied and existence of procedures in accordance to the national law of education</li> <li>- good ratio of students/supervisors</li> <li>- satisfied students with PhD supervisors and research facilities</li> </ul>	<p><b><u>Weaknesses:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- lack of internationalisation from the perspective of the website information in English language</li> <li>- lack of documents in English language on the website</li> <li>- insufficient promotion activities in order to attract more international students and increase incoming and outgoing mobility</li> <li>- lack of the activities of Alumni club</li> <li>- low official involvement of Alumni to the development of IOSUD</li> <li>- lack of employers survey and formal feedback on the satisfaction with PhD students</li> <li>- lack of formalised inclusion of employers in the revision and improvements of study programme</li> <li>- lack of English courses and syllabuses in English</li> <li>- lack of examination methods related to learning outcomes according to Bloom's or other taxonomy of knowledge (in syllabuses)</li> <li>- students support in financial grants</li> <li>- insufficient communication with the students in terms of connecting them with other students</li> </ul>
<p><b><u>Opportunities:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- cooperation and development of joint doctoral study programs with international universities and doctoral schools</li> <li>- internationalization – more Erasmus and contract based cooperation with international and EU institutions of higher education</li> <li>- improve courses in English and promote them abroad</li> <li>- increase the self funding activities by increased participation in projects</li> <li>- funding from projects and contracts with public and private sector</li> <li>- create learning incubators or entrepreneurial incubators</li> <li>- establish university entrepreneurship and include doctoral domain to the research and implementation</li> </ul>	<p><b><u>Threats:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- competition in the private university sector if private institutions will provide doctoral study programmes</li> <li>- competition of other institutions on the national level - international universities who can attract local students to work, live and study abroad</li> <li>- general economic situation and crisis influenced by Covid-19 pandemic</li> <li>- general economic situation and lack of governmental funding</li> <li>-</li> </ul>

<p>- formalised cooperation with employers including them in the creation and improvement of doctoral study domain, curriculum and reviews of syllabuses</p> <p>- active Alumni club and initiative in promotion of the University and the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing and development of common projects/research and business projects</p>	
--	--

## V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator (*, C)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
A.1.1.1.		The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.1.1.2.		The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.1.2.1.		The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.1.2.2.		The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.1.3.1.		Existence of at least one research or institutional / human resources development grant under implementation at the time of submission of the internal evaluation file, per doctoral study domain under evaluation, or existence of at least 2 research or institutional development / human resources grant for the doctoral study domain, obtained by doctoral	<b>fulfilled</b>	



		thesis advisors operating in the evaluated domain within the past 5 years. The grants address relevant themes for the respective domain and, as a rule, are engaging doctoral students.		
A.1.3.2.		The percentage of doctoral students active at the time of the evaluation, who for at least six months receive additional funding sources besides government funding, through scholarships awarded by individual persons or by legal entities, or who are financially supported through research or institutional / human resources development grants is not less than 20%.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.1.3.3.		At least 10% of the total amount of doctoral grants obtained by the university through institutional contracts and of tuition fees collected from the doctoral students enrolled in the paid tuition system is used to reimburse professional training expenses of doctoral students (attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc.).	<b>Not fulfilled</b>	<i>There is a need to increase the funding of students when it comes to funding them for the following: attending conferences, summer schools, training, programs abroad, publication of specialty papers or other specific forms of dissemination etc. The management have to find ways to support students and reach the potential in funding them with at least the minimum of 10%. The additional funds can be also obtained by participation in projects and introducing university entrepreneurship, spin offs, collaboration with business sector, other research institutions etc.</i>
A.2.1.1.		The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.3.1.1.		<i>Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	

A.3.1.2.		<i>At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.3.1.3.		<i>The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.3.1.4.		<i>The percentage of doctoral thesis advisors who concomitantly coordinate more than 8 doctoral students, but no more than 12, who are themselves studying in doctoral programs<sup>6</sup> does not exceed 20%.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
A.3.2.1.		<i>At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defence commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	

<sup>6</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

A.3.2.2.		<i>At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.1.1.1.		<i>The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.1.2.1.		<i>Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.1.2.2.		<i>The expelling rate, including renouncement / dropping out of doctoral students 3, respectively 4, years after admission<sup>7</sup> does not exceed 30%.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.2.1.1.		<i>The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.2.1.2.		<i>At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.2.1.3.		<i>The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes“, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral</i>	<b>partially fulfilled</b>	<i>To revise the concept of syllabus development including the EU standards when it comes to following: allocate the number of ECTS for each learning outcome</i>

<sup>7</sup> 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

		<p>students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities</p>		<p>and incorporate specific methods how they will be measured/tested and fulfilled by the students. The workload must be clear and explained in the syllabuses but also communicated to students. The Bloom's taxonomy of knowledge can be helpful here and the level of learning outcomes should be appropriate with the doctoral level of study. There is a need to explain the methods of accomplishing each learning outcome and to measure its quality. There is also the need to implement the correlation between each specific learning outcome on the level of the course with the learning outcomes of the doctoral program in the field of Marketing. It is a strong and necessary recommendation for this performance indicator which will ensure compliance with EU standards.</p>
B.2.1.4.		<p>All along the duration of the doctoral training, doctoral students in the domain receive counselling/guidance from functional guidance commissions, which is reflected in written guidance and feedback or regular meeting.</p>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.2.1.5.		<p>For a doctoral study domain, the ratio between the number of doctoral students and the number of teaching staff/researchers providing doctoral guidance must not exceed 3:1.</p>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.3.1.1.		<p>For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain.</p>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.3.1.2.		<p>The ratio between the number of presentations of doctoral students who completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period</p>	<b>fulfilled</b>	

		<i>(past 5 years), including posters, exhibitions made at prestigious international events (organized in the country or abroad) and the number of doctoral students who have completed their doctoral studies within the evaluated period (past 5 years) is at least 1.</i>		
B.3.2.1.		<i>The number of doctoral theses allocated to one specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the evaluated IOSUD should not exceed two (2) in a year for the theses coordinated by the same doctoral thesis advisor.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
B.3.2.2.		<i>The ratio between the doctoral theses allocated to one scientific specialist coming from a higher education institution, other than the institution where the defence on the doctoral thesis is organized, and the number of doctoral theses presented in the same doctoral study domain in the doctoral school should not exceed 0.3, considering the past five years. Only those doctoral study domains in which minimum ten doctoral theses have been presented within the past five years should be analysed.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
C.1.1.1.		<i>There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance. The institutional framework is present on the level of the IOUSUD and the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing and there are evidences for that. There is evaluation and monitoring process in place in regards to major activities starting with scientific work of advisors and students, the infrastructure, procedures and rules for students, training programs and other social and economic activities.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
C.1.1.2.		<i>Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	
C.2.1.1.		<i>The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as: (a) the Doctoral School regulation; (b) the admission regulation;</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	

		<p>(c) the doctoral studies contract;</p> <p>(d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;</p> <p>(e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;</p> <p>(f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;</p> <p>(g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);</p> <p>(h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;</p> <p>(i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.</p>		
C.2.2.1.		All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
C.2.2.2.		Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.	<b>fulfilled</b>	
C.2.2.3.		All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	<b>fulfilled</b>	The students expressed their opinion on the lack of communication between students and recommended the improvement in terms of the need to be introduced to each other and to have more interaction with others, especially in the first year and the beginning of the study program. Some students were not familiar with statistics and data analysis and they find important to interact with other in order to improve their skills or to exchange knowledge with others who are more into certain subjects. On the level of the domain it is advised that the communication is initiated by supervisors with aim to introduce students by creating



				group domain or channel where students can meet each other and work together in certain projects or just exchange knowledge and ideas. This is also good way to improve the communication and overall educational experience during the online studies and Covid pandemic.
C.3.1.1.		<i>IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.</i>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<i>To continue participation in Erasmus+ mobility and international cooperation and find models to cope with Covid-19 pandemic by introducing hybrid models of Erasmus+ and other international collaborations. The pandemic gives us more opportunities to adjust to the online models of common projects, research, lectures provided in both ways – outgoing and incoming and those opportunities need to be improved and leveraged in the future.</i>
C.3.1.2.		<i>In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.</i>	<b>partially fulfilled</b>	<i>To continue good practice in guest lecturing of international experts and further develop the co-mentorship on the international level as well as guest lectures and international cooperation with international lecturers, professors, supervisors and academic staff in order to enhance and increase the quality of doctoral study program.</i>
C.3.1.3.		<i>The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).</i>	<b>partially fulfilled</b>	<i>Bucharest University of Economic studies supports internationalisation and aims to accomplish more in the future in all aspects, especially in promoting the doctoral study domains, amongst also the domain in the field of Marketing. The recommendation is to involve more in the promotion of the</i>

			<p>doctoral domain in the field of Marketing to foreign universities and institutions. The models of cooperation must be adjusted to Covid-19 pandemic too, and some courses can be delivered in English online. The full set of documents, rules and regulations related to study program should be in English. The whole set of documents and procedures should be created and the whole infrastructure (including administrative issues and other supportive documents important for students on the international level) should be adopted to meet requirements of international students' need, including quality assurance, etc. Promotion should be done through different media from word of mouth, academic staff, supervisors, students, Alumni association, social networks and media such as LinkedIn, Instagram, Facebook, websites, workshops, round tables, exhibitions, online events and presentation of the IOSUD and doctoral domain, etc. To promote internationalization in both ways (incoming and outgoing, co-mentorships, attract more international guest lecturers and offer more guest lectures abroad as well as trainings and WS within and beside Erasmus+ program) it is very important to create action plan with specific goals and measures. The curriculum must be offered in English language, the syllabuses should be available in English language with correlation and improved learning outcomes corresponding to EU</p>
--	--	--	--

			<p><i>standards of higher education and doctoral level. There should be list of courses available completely in English language with academic staff that can perform in English language. All documents should be published on the website and promotion can be done also by more engaging in international projects and participation in different international fairs even if still online. There is many international conferences that offer online participation and it is possible to participate and at the same time promote the University, doctoral domain Marketing and attract more students, more professors, guests, projects and common research activities. The cooperation with employers of PhD students and more active Alumni association can also contribute in the promotion on the national but also international level.</i></p>
--	--	--	---



## VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

*The evaluation process on the doctoral domain in the field of Marketing at Bucharest University of Economic Studies resulted in the overall good performance and positive assessment of the majority of the standards and performance indicators. During the assessment week and online zoom meetings there were many information distributed and available to external and internal evaluators. The SER was as source of most of the vital information in regards to performance indicators together with Annexes available, but only in Romanian language. Out of 35 performance indicators, 31 indicators are assessed as fulfilled, 3 as partially fulfilled and 1 as not fulfilled.*

*The recommendations are given in all performance indicators which need major improvements and doctoral domain in the field of Marketing should carefully implement the recommendations in the future period.*

*The major strengths of the doctoral study domain in the field of Marketing is long reputable history background of the Bucharest University of Economic Studies, committed employees, staff and supervisors, management and head of the research centre as well as members of different councils. There is a high level of satisfaction of students with academic staff/PhD supervisors and strong legislative support, procedures and their implementation. The infrastructure including research environment and infrastructure is also good. Research activity is good and scientific contribution of the supervisors and students are high. The infrastructure and research facilities are of high quality.*

*The program is well constructed/designed but needs improvement on the level of specific learning outcomes, assessment of learning outcomes, workload of students and understanding of relationship between learning outcomes ECTS and workload on all levels (academic staff and students). It is important to adjust syllabuses with the recent trends in the EU and clearly define assessment of each learning outcome. The students were not familiar with the correlation between ECTS, learning outcomes and specific requirements how each learning outcome will be tested and assessed.*

*The communication with students should be improved with the aim to connect students with other students in order to be able to exchange information, work together on the project and assist each other in the areas that some are weaker than others (statistics, data analysis, etc). During the meetings with students that was a major weakness and it was mentioned few times.*

*The level of internationalisation and promotion, activities and participation in international mobility, supervision and doctoral study program in English language could be improved. The study program and syllabuses should be available in English language on the website as well as other important documents. The program should consist of courses that can be delivered fully in English language. The online possibilities can be utilised to overcome the constraints of travel restrictions during the pandemic.*

*More international experts, supervisors and professors should be involved in different activities on the doctoral domain level especially in terms of co-supervision and courses delivery. This is also one of the weaknesses and it is stated in the SER that it will be improved in the future.*

*The opportunities are seen in the future expansion on the national and international level. The doctoral domain Marketing should aim to attract students from the whole area of Romania and international students, but also support students to participate more in the Erasmus mobility abroad.*

*The cooperation with private sector as well as other governmental institutions in Romania could be increased and Alumni organisation should be officially established and become proactive. It would have many benefits for current and former students, for employers, for the institutional level and doctoral domain level.*



*The employers of students should be more involved in the creation and improvement of the doctoral domain with their feedback and input concerning market needs and competencies of students. The formal methodology should be created and implemented in order to get feedback from employers. There should be questionnaire and research conducted on the yearly basis with the aim to find out the level of satisfaction of employers with students competencies, skills, knowledge and other related issues, together with their suggestions for improvements or changes in the study program. The opinion and suggestions of employers should be incorporated in the revision of study program. Employers can also participate in WS, research projects, guest lecturing, open tables, etc.*

*There should be more projects on the level of the domain in order to gain more funds and improve financial situation of the domain, to support students with grants and fees for the research activities, to participate in international conferences, trainings and workshops. This criteria is very low, partially fulfilled and it should be increased in the near future.*

*The cooperation with other institutions and participation in projects on national and international level could increase self-funding and so called "university entrepreneurship" could be implemented on the level of the domain to establish start-ups and spin offs collaborating with students and other partners (employers, business and public sector, etc).*

*The doctoral study domain has lots of opportunities to become leader in the Marketing field in Romania but also on the international level amongst other Universities in Romania. It is important to continuously monitor the quality level of the institutional capacity, study program, infrastructure and human resources. There is a possibility to improve international marketing and promotion due to possibilities offered in online models of cooperation and the IOSUD level as well as doctoral domain level should take advantage and use those opportunities. The competition in Romani and neighbouring countries is growing and therefore it can be seen as a threat. It is important to set goal and work on their accomplishments.*

*Assist. Prof. **Marina Gregoric**, PhD  
Faculty of Economics  
University North, Croatia*

*ARACIS International Expert Evaluator*

## **VII. Annexes**

*The detailed schedule of The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain Marketing*

*Additional documentation:*

*N/A*