

The External Evaluation Report of an Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IOSUD)

I. Introduction

The evaluation was drafted as a periodical external evaluation of the doctoral university studies in order to comply with legal provisions of the Emergency Ordinance no 75/2005, approved with amendments and additions by Law no 87/2006 and Ministerial Order no 3651/2021 at the higher education institution. Evaluated institution was Doctoral School of Visual Arts at The University of Art and Design Cluj-Napoca.

Evaluation took place between November 15 and November 18 2021.

Due to pandemic restrictions evaluation had on-line character using zoom platform.

There was no technical problems so the evaluation process wasn't interrupted.

As an external-foreign evaluator never visited evaluated institution in some areas I have to based on the opinion of the romanian panel team members.

The evaluation team members were:

prof. Grigoras Gheorghe (Alexandru Ioan Cuza University of Iasi)

Evaluation Director

prof. Daniela Danciulescu (University of Craiova)

Coordinator of the IOSUD committee

prof. Piotr Jozefowicz (Academy of Fine Arts in Gdansk, Poland)

international expert for IOSUD evaluation

Cornelia-Florina Fechet (PhD student, Polytechnic University of Timisoara)

PhD student expert

prof. Cornelia Ionita (University of Arts "George Enescu" of Iasi)

IOSUD expert for Humanities and Arts

Octavian Denis Velescu ("Ovidus" University of Constanta)

technical secretary

The structure of UAD Cluj-Napoca includes a single doctoral school - the Doctoral School of UAD Cluj-Napoca - which offers a single doctoral degree programme in the field of visual arts. Between 2003 and 2021, ten PhD supervisors worked in the doctoral school, and 210 PhD theses were defended in the same period. At the time of writing this report 87 PhD students were enrolled in the PhD programme. Doctoral School includes 4 active PhD supervisors and 3 qualified teachers.



The fundamental mission of UAD is to provide an education of the highest quality to those who intend to pursue a career in the visual arts (fine arts, decorative arts and design) and to contribute, through the artistic creation and research carried out by its members, to the development of society by meeting, anticipating and influencing the needs of the community.

Having the same mission Doctoral School within UAD used over 20 professional laboratories well prepared for the artistic research. As a result doctoral institution has all the tools for realising its mission. It has strong and recognised relationship with the contemporary art world. Between 2015 and 2021 Doctoral School members took part in over 100 exhibitions receiving also more than 20 awards on both national and international levels. Having strong position within artistic and academic area University of Art and Design collaborates with large number of respectable and well recognised institutions.

II. Methods used

The analysis of the internal evaluation report of the IOSUD and its Annexes.

The analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD/Doctoral School(s) website, in electronic format.

Online meeting with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD)

Online meeting with the director of CSUD

Online meeting with Doctoral School Council (CSD members) and with Doctoral University Studies Council (CSUD) members

Online meeting with the academic staff corresponding to IOSUD and the doctoral study domain

Online meeting with the Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) members / Quality Assurance Department

Online meeting with PhD students

Online meeting with the Directors/ persons in charge of the research centers/laboratories within the doctoral study domain

Online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission

Online meeting with graduates for the respective doctoral study domain

Online meeting with employers of Doctoral graduates in the domain

Unfortunately, due to pandemic restrictions, I could not travel to Romania as an external evaluator and visit evaluated institution.



III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.

The documents available through the hyperlinks attached in the self-evaluation report, as well as the documents submitted upon request, provide sufficient written evidence that the doctoral degree programme has or is subject to:

- (a) the institutional regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies;
- (b) the regulation of organization and functioning of the Doctoral School;
- (c) methodology for admission to doctoral studies;
- (d) methodology for the appointment of the members of the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD) and the Council of the Doctoral School (CSD);
- (e) the methodology for the conduct of the public competition for the appointment of the Director of the CSUD;
- (f) methodology for the recognition of the status of doctoral supervisor/teaching position/diploma and doctoral degree obtained abroad;
- (g) regulations of the University of Art and Design of Cluj-Napoca on the habilitation and co-optation of PhD supervisors;
- (h) operational procedure - preparation and conduct of the public defense of the doctoral thesis;
- (i) guide for the completion of doctoral theses - doctoral candidate's handbook;
- (j) operational procedure - informing doctoral students about the rules of scientific ethics, prevention of academic fraud and plagiarism;
- (k) internal procedure for the analysis and approval of proposals for the themes of doctoral study programmes;
- (l) functional governing structures (Council of the Doctoral School), while providing evidence of regular meetings;
- (m) the doctoral studies contract;



(n) the internal procedures for reviewing and approving proposals for training for doctoral programmes based on advanced graduate studies;

No major shortcomings have been found. All operating mechanisms are in place.

The indicator is fulfilled.

1Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. The doctoral school regulations includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.

All regulations, structure mechanisms, specific conditions, procedures and obligations specified in the Code of Doctoral Studies are adequate.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

The structure of UAD Cluj-Napoca includes a single doctoral school - the Doctoral School of UAD Cluj-Napoca - which offers a single doctoral degree programme in the field of visual arts. This field includes several specializations within art, design and art history.

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard A.1.2 IOSUD has logistical resources necessary to carrying out doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.

Appropriate and effective information system has been demonstrated.

The full academic career of doctoral students is covered and managed through specific software application.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.

Since 2016 all PhD theses are checked by antiplagiat software.

The indicator is fulfilled



Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

As indicated before due to pandemic restrictions I have been unable to visit the evaluated institution. Although during the on-line meetings we had a possibility to see a lot of existing and working facilities available for doctoral students and academic staff. Majority of those facilities had been purchased within last couple of years. From my personal point of view modern research infrastructure is perfectly mixed with traditional artistic tools. This mixture gives the students the possibility to keep contact with both traditional basics and experimental future research.

Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.).

UAD Cluj-Napoca has seven buildings of its own. The total usable area of all the spaces in the university's own buildings contains over 10,000 sq.m. The University has also its own exhibition hall and creative houses.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.

The self-assessment report stated that Doctoral School has a sufficient number of collaboration agreements with both romanian and international companies.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.

As previously stated majority of up-to-date facilities had been purchased within last couple of years.

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resource

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.



Performance Indicator A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.

At the time of the evaluation visit, no PhD supervisor was supervising more than 12 PhD students. The procedure for co-opting 3 qualified teachers to the Doctoral School was underway, as well as the qualification of one teacher. This will reduce the number of PhD students assigned to a PhD supervisor from 12 to 7 PhD students/doctoral supervisor. Anyway it seems smaller number of students for one supervisor should give more comfort for both sides.

The indicator is partially fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.

According to documents two out of four supervisors are employed full time on indefinite contracts at IOSUD-UAD Cluj-Napoca.

The indicator is fulfilled

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest

Standard B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance and are diversified as social representation and by gender.

Performance Indicator B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.

Admission to Doctoral School is based and realized on required criteria.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.



Doctoral School have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments. Although I couldn't find any information about this in self-assessment report. I couldn't find also any information about policy for people with disabilities.

The indicator is partially fulfilled

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.

The curriculum of the training programme based on advanced university studies comprises three disciplines: Scientific Research Methodology, Ethics and Integrity and Advanced Research in Visual Arts.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.

The training programme includes Ethics and Academic Integrity.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.

The competences acquired through the curriculum subjects are reflected in the quality of the content, structure, quantity and quality of the bibliography of both the dissertation and the thesis. The quality of doctoral studies is analysed through the application of questionnaires and by analysing the feedback from doctoral students.

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.



Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)

Activity of doctoral students of UAD Cluj-Napoca is significant. Self assessment report presented large number of books, published articles, exhibitions, participation in scientific communications, cultural activities, catalogues, awards, residences and conferences.

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.4. Quality of doctoral theses

Standard B.4.1. Doctoral theses fulfil high quality standards

Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.

The indicator is fulfilled

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

- *general description of domain analysis.*

Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. The IOSUD demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school.

Assessed criteria:

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;
- (d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.



IOSUD-UAD Cluj-Napoca has its own self-assessment methodology of the Doctoral School. Within the structure of the institution there is Quality Assurance Department and Evaluation and Quality Assurance Commission.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.

The students representatives organise elections within doctoral students group. All of them have both passive and active electoral rights.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.

As indicated above the students representatives organise elections within doctoral students group. All of them have both passive and active electoral rights.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.

IOSUD-UAD Cluj-Napoca has its own methodology for the self-evaluation of the Doctoral School. During the doctoral training period evaluation mechanisms are implemented to identify the needs as well as the overall level of satisfaction of doctoral students. Doctoral programme continuously eliminates identified deficiencies of the academic and administrative processes.

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.



IOSUD publishes on its website all relevant informations.

Doctoral School regulation, admission regulations, doctoral studies contract, study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis, content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies, academic and scientific profile, thematic areas, research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, institutional contact data, the list of doctoral students within the domain, information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis, information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented.

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.

UAD Cluj-Napoca doctoral students have free access to several database platforms through the Central University Library of Cluj-Napoca.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.

Upon request and with the agreement of the PhD supervisor each PhD student has access to the anti-plagiarism system for checking the degree of similarity.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.

According to the Regulations of the Doctoral School doctoral student has the rights for privileged access to the logistics, documentation centres, laboratories, libraries and equipment of the UAD. Have the rights to participate in the activities organised by the doctoral school, to work, with the agreement of the doctoral supervisor, in artistic (research) teams within the university or within research units that have concluded agreements or institutional partnerships with UAD. Doctoral students are able to participate in communication sessions and group exhibitions organised by the doctoral school or UAD Cluj-Napoca. They can also to receive institutional support to participate in the country or abroad, in artistic/scientific events, workshops and schools in the field of visual arts.



The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion C.3. Internationalization

Standard C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

IOSUD has a strategy to increase internationalization of doctoral studies. Self-assessment report tables confirm large international activity of the evaluation institution.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.

The Doctoral School of UAD Cluj-Napoca supports the organisation of doctoral co-tutelage studies. Anyway since 2016 it was just one case of that support. Doctoral School should try to increase and stimulate that kind of activity.

The indicator is partially fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.

The number of doctoral theses drafted or submitted in an international foreign language or organised in international co-tutelage doesn't meet the 10% level. Doctoral School website updated and translated into english language most relevant documents and informations. UAD is editing also an annual brochure "Doctoral Studies".

The indicator is partially fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to



attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).

As indicated above internationalization of the doctoral studies is not at the advance level yet. Although internationalization is permanently supported.

The indicator is partially fulfilled

Criterion C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity

Standard C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:

- policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public postionings, studies, analyses or measures taken;
- practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;
- practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;
- administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions;
- mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind;

IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.

External evaluation meetings proved that all elements listed above have been met.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.

There were no complaints or suspicions of plagiarism.

The indicator is fulfilled



Performance Indicator C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

There were no issues of that kind.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.

During the evaluated period there were no doctoral theses invalidated due to plagiarism.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:

- a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;
- b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;
- c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism.

All the measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies have been taken.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.

During the evaluated period there were no doctoral theses with elements of plagiarism.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).

The full list of doctoral theses defended at IOSUD is posted on the university website. PhD theses can be viewed on the official website. There is also a short abstract for each thesis. For international reasons it could be also short abstract in english language.

The indicator is fulfilled

IV. SWOT Analysis

<p><u>Strengths:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - high level of artistic research - high level of doctoral supervisors - high level of international mobility of doctoral students - good mixture between tradition and new trends in both art and technology - study programmes strongly based on university mission - modernisation of the laboratories and equipment - active involvement of PhD students in artistic and research projects 	<p><u>Weaknesses:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - low number of PhD supervisors - low number of reasearch grants obtained by the Doctoral School - policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments and for people with disabilities - organisation of doctoral co-tutelage studies - internationalization of the doctoral studies
<p><u>Opportunities:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - increasing number of supervisors - increasing number of international partners - great potential of students and professors connected with UAD Cluj-Napoca and their artistic activity - good relationships of UAD Cluj-Napoca with other institutions around region 	<p><u>Threats:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - low level of internationalization could lead to increasing level of isolation - lowering budget funds - increasing level of bureaucracy within european academic system

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator (*, C)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
1	PI	<p>A.1.1.1. . The documents available through the hyperlinks attached in the self-evaluation report, as well as the documents submitted upon request, provide sufficient written evidence that the doctoral degree programme has or is subject to:</p> <p>(a) the institutional regulation for the</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	

		<p>organization and conduct of doctoral studies;</p> <p>(b) the regulation of organization and functioning of the Doctoral School;</p> <p>(c) methodology for admission to doctoral studies;</p> <p>(d) methodology for the appointment of the members of the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD) and the Council of the Doctoral School (CSD);</p> <p>(e) the methodology for the conduct of the public competition for the appointment of the Director of the CSUD;</p> <p>(f) methodology for the recognition of the status of doctoral supervisor/teaching position/diploma and doctoral degree obtained abroad;</p> <p>(g) regulations of the University of Art and Design of Cluj-Napoca on the habilitation and co-optation of PhD supervisors;</p> <p>(h) operational procedure - preparation and conduct of the public defense of the doctoral thesis;</p> <p>(i) guide for the completion of doctoral theses - doctoral candidate's handbook;</p> <p>(j) operational procedure - informing doctoral students about the rules of scientific ethics, prevention of academic fraud and plagiarism;</p> <p>(k) internal procedure for the analysis and approval of proposals for the themes of doctoral study programmes;</p> <p>(l) functional governing structures (Council of the Doctoral School), while providing evidence of regular meetings;</p> <p>(m) the doctoral studies contract;</p> <p>(n) the internal procedures for reviewing and approving proposals for</p>		
--	--	--	--	--

		training for doctoral programmes based on advanced graduate studies;		
2	PI	A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.	The indicator is fulfilled	
3	PI	A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.	The indicator is fulfilled	
4	PI	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.	The indicator is fulfilled	
5	CPI	A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	The indicator is fulfilled	
6	PI	A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)	The indicator is fulfilled	
7	PI	A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.	The indicator is fulfilled	
8	PI	A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and	The indicator is fulfilled	

		using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.		
9	PI	A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.	The indicator is partially fulfilled	Doctoral School should increase the number of qualified supervisors
10	CPI	A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.	The indicator is fulfilled	
11	PI	B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.	The indicator is fulfilled	
12	PI	B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.	The indicator is partially fulfilled	Doctoral School should specify its policy for disadvantaged and disabled people
13	PI	B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.	The indicator is fulfilled	
14	PI	B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	The indicator is fulfilled	
15	PI	B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced	The indicator is fulfilled	

		<p>university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.</p>		
16	PI	<p>B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	
17	CPI	<p>B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	
18	PI	<p>C.1.1.1. The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:</p> <p>a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;</p> <p>b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;</p> <p>c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	

		<p>are organized;</p> <p>d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.</p>		
19	PI	<p>C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	
20	PI	<p>C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	
21	PI	<p>C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	
22	CPI	<p>C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p> <p>a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation;</p> <p>b) the admission regulation;</p> <p>c) the doctoral studies contract;</p> <p>d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;</p> <p>e) the content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies;</p> <p>f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled</p>	

		<p>the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;</p> <p>g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor);</p> <p>h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;</p> <p>i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc.</p> <p>j) links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.</p>		
23	CPI	C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.	The indicator is fulfilled	
24	PI	C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.	The indicator is fulfilled	
25	PI	C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	The indicator is fulfilled	
26	PI	C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences.	The indicator is fulfilled	

		IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.		
27	PI	C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.	The indicator is partially fulfilled	Doctoral School should increase and stimulate that kind of activity
28	PI	C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.	The indicator is partially fulfilled	All doctoral thesis could contain abstract in english language
29	PI	C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).	The indicator is partially fulfilled	Doctoral School should increase its international activity
30	PI	C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public positionings, studies, analyses or measures taken; - practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students; - practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or 	The indicator is fulfilled	

		<p>observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions; - mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind; <p>IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.</p>		
31	PI	<p>C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.</p>	The indicator is fulfilled	
32	PI	<p>C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.</p>	The indicator is fulfilled	
33	CPI	<p>C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.</p>	The indicator is fulfilled	
34	PI	<p>C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:</p> <p>a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive</p>	The indicator is fulfilled	

		<p>decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;</p> <p>b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;</p> <p>c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism.</p>		
35	PI	C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.	The indicator is fulfilled	
36	PI	C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).	The indicator is fulfilled	

Of the 36 Performance indicators listed in the External Evaluation report evaluated institution fully met 31 of them. Five are partially met. One connected with number of qualified supervisors, one with policy for disadvantaged and disabled people and other three with internationalization.

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

Doctoral School at UAD Cluj-Napoca has a great potential in terms of both artistic and scientific research. There is a lot of very talented and active artists with international reputation. I know that artistic atmosphere and a feeling of affection for an institution are not evaluated factors but sometimes it has more significance than up-to-date equipment. I fully agree with the statement that the overall performance could be assessed as more than satisfactory.



VII. Annexes

Annexes uploaded to the cloud.

Signature