

Prof. Grzegorz Kurzyński

blue = recommendation, red = commendation

The External Evaluation Report of an Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IODS) - the National Academy of Music "Gheorghe Dima" in Cluj-Napoca

I. Introduction

- the context in which this external evaluation report was drafted (the type of evaluation, the period of the evaluation visit, the composition of the Experts Committee etc.);

Periodic evaluation of doctoral studies in the National Academy of Music "Gheorghe Dima" was conducted in a blended format, 6-8.10.2021. In the evaluation took part:

Director of the evaluation mission Prof. univ. dr. ing. LACHE Simona

Coordinator of the IOSUD evaluation panel Prof. univ. dr. Alexandru BOUREANU

International expert for IOSUD evaluation Prof. univ. dr. Grzegorz KURZYNSKI

PhD student expert Bădoi Victor Alexandru

IOSUD expert for the fundamental domain of science: Music Prof. univ. dr. habil. Olguța Carmen LUPU.

- details about the institution organizing the doctoral studies (number of Doctoral Schools, number of students, institutional context, short history etc.);

Established in 1919, the National Academy of Music "Gheorghe Dima" is a state institution of higher education and research and includes the following forms of education: undergraduate studies, master's studies and doctoral studies. The institution is located in the historical capital of Transylvania, Cluj Napoca, a city where there was, since 1581, a Jesuit College, the first higher education institution established in the current territory of Romania. Multicultural and multi-denominational municipality with an active population of over 400,000 inhabitants, Cluj-Napoca is a university center with 12 state and private universities that enrolls over 80,000 student.

Since 1990, the institution received the name The Music Academy "Gheorghe Dima" and the awarding of the title of Doctor Honoris Causa was established. During this period, the Academy of Music operates with three faculties: the Theoretical Faculty, the Faculty of Musical Interpretation and the Faculty of Performing Arts.

Under the patronage of the "Gheorghe Dima" Academy of Music from Cluj-Napoca, in 1998 the Music College from Piatra Neamț was established (with short-term studies - 3 years, full-time courses), which became in the academic year 2005-2006 the fourth faculty of the Cluj institution. Starting with the academic year 2012 - 2013, the Faculty of Music from Piatra Neamț becomes a University Extension of the Academy of Music „Gh. Dima”.

In 2012 changes were made to the organizational structures of MAGD, wanting to optimize the mechanisms to promote quality at all levels of activity, as follows: two faculties (instead of four, the

Faculty of Performing Arts being included in the Faculty of Music Performance, and the Piatra Neamț Faculty of Music operating as an extension of three undergraduate programs of MAGD Cluj-Napoca) and seven departments (instead of eleven).

In the National Academy of Music „Gheorghe Dima” there are 1223 students (58 foreign students, 66 PhD students) and 204 members of teaching staff (124 tenures, 54 associated and 26 in the Doctoral School).

The structure of the NAMGD

In the National Academy of Music "Gheorghe Dima" there are two faculties, seven departments, a university extension in Piatra Neamț and a Doctoral School, as follows:

Faculty of Musical Performance

- Department of Strings, Woodwinds and Percussion instruments
- Department of Keyboard instruments and musical Ensembles
- Department of Opera Singing and Musical Performing Arts

Faculty of Theoretical Studies

- Department of Musical Composition and Conducting
- Department of Musicology

Department of Teacher Education and Training (DTET)

Department of Distance Learning (DDL)

University Extension of Piatra Neamț

The „Sigismund Toduță” Doctoral School

Within IOSUD there is only one doctoral school which carries out scientific doctoral and professional doctoral programs.

The field of doctoral university studies is MUSIC and the related subdomains are the following:

Musicology;

Stylistics of musical creation -composition;

Stylistics of musical performance - conducted;

Stylistics of musical performance - instrumental performance;

Stylistics of musical performance - vocal performance;

The arts of musical performance - choreographic direction, musical theater direction.

- **the analysis of the internal evaluation report of the doctoral study domain under review and its Annexes;**

Before the evaluation visit internal evaluation report was very precisely and deeply verified and analyzed. No other documents have been requested.

- **the analysis of documents made available by the IOSUD, in physical format, during the evaluation visit (if such documents have been requested);** there were no additional documents
- **the analysis of documents, data and information available on the IOSUD/Doctoral School(s) website, in electronic format;**

- **visiting the buildings included in the institution's property, comprising (indicative and non exhaustive list, which shall be changed according to the context):**

Within the evaluation visit the buildings and other parts of institution's property have been visited in the online format: classrooms, the institution's library, research center, the Career Counseling and Guidance Center, lecture halls for students, the student residences, the student cafeteria, sports ground etc.

The following meetings have been held in online format:

06.10.2021 Wednesday

- 09:00-09:45 Online preliminary meeting for the preparation and harmonization of evaluation steps, in hybrid mode, of doctoral study domain and IOSUD
- 10:00-10:45 Online meeting with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD)
- 11:00-12:00 Online meeting with IOSUD academic staff
- 12:15-13:15 Online meeting with PhD students
- 13:15-14:00 Online technical meeting to identify specific issues that need to be clarified during the on-site visit (if the case)
- 14:00-17:00 Activity within the evaluation panels: IOSUD and doctoral study domain, Travel of evaluation panels representatives for the on-site visit

07.20.2021 Thursday

- 09:00-17:00 Face-to-face working meetings, visiting the educational and research infrastructure

08.10.2021 Friday

- 09:00- 09:40 Online technical meeting to present those found during the onsite visit
- 09:50- 10:30 Online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission
- 10:40- 11.20 Online meeting with university representatives involved in internal quality assurance of doctoral studies
- 11:30-12:15 Online meeting with IOSUD graduates
- 12:25-13:10 Online meeting with employers of doctoral graduates
- 13:10-15:40 Completion of the evaluation documents
- 15:50-16:30 Online meeting for conclusions
- 16:30-17:30 Meeting with representatives of the institution under review to discuss on the conclusions of the evaluation process and the main recommendations

Application of questionnaires to doctoral students or academic staff in the doctoral study domain under review.

Within IOSUD they apply the following documents for quality assurance, including:

- Procedure for monitoring and improving the activities of teachers, researchers and assistants involved in university study programs
- Procedure regarding the periodic evaluation of teachers by management
- Procedure regarding the peer evaluation of teachers
- Procedure regarding the elaboration of curricula
- Procedure for monitoring graduates' careers.

At the level of CDS and the Doctoral School were developed and applied:

- Procedures for internal evaluation of the quality of the doctoral study program.
- Standards for accepting doctoral theses and assigning grades.

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IODS) has implemented the efficient functioning mechanisms provided in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IODS, respectively of the doctoral school, having as reference period the last five years.*

- (a) internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulation for the organization and development of doctoral university studies, the regulations of the doctoral schools);*
- (b) the methodology for conducting elections at the CDS level, for doctoral schools and evidence of their conduct;*
- (c) the methodology for conducting the last competition for the position of CDS director and evidence of its development*
- (d) methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (admission of doctoral students, completion of doctoral studies*
- e) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the quality of doctoral supervisor and for equivalence of the doctorate obtained in other state*
- f) functional management structures [IODS / CDS / Doctoral School Council (regularity of convening meetings)*
- g) the doctoral university contract*
- h) internal procedures for analysis and approval of proposals on the topic of doctoral university study programs*

The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IODS are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. *The regulations of the doctoral school include criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art. 17 para. (5) of the Code of doctoral studies, approved by Government Decision no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions*

The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria,

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator* A.1.1.3. *The doctoral schools of IODS are organized on disciplinary and interdisciplinary disciplines or topics, in accordance with art. 158 paragraph (7) of the LEN*

Within IODS there is only one doctoral school related to the MUSIC field

Fulfilled

Standard A.1.2. IODS has the necessary logistical resources to fulfill the mission of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. . *Existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic background*

IODS holds records of all doctoral students within the NAMGD Doctoral School.

The computer records of doctoral students and their academic background are kept in electronic format in Excel and Word documents. The doctoral school has a dedicated, bilingual site, <https://anmgd.ro/doctordat/>, which has the following structure: the Council for doctoral university studies (CSUD Composition, IOSUD Regulation), the Doctoral School (about the Doctoral School, the Doctoral School Council, Regulations, Doctoral supervisors), Conducting studies (General information, Curriculum, Doctoral studies contract), Admission (Methodologies / Procedures / Regulations, Admission calendar; registration forms, Required documents), Doctoral theses (Public defenses, Documents required, Standards for accepting doctoral theses, Forms), Habilitation, Archive, News

Recommendation:

I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni and gathering data of their employment, countries, geographic areas, other sources of data and how many of them are employed on the music labor market.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. *Existence and use of a computer program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

Starting with 2019, the doctoral theses are evaluated on the *sistemantiplagiat.ro* platform, an IT tool dedicated to comparing documents in text format. The system provides information that allows the identification of the number of loans in the analyzed text, as well as the sources in which they were identified.

The similarity report is sent to the doctoral supervisor who issues a resolution and, depending on the result, the file is forwarded to carry out the next steps of the process of obtaining the doctoral degree.

Fulfilled

Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. IODS / Doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure that supports the development of activities specific to doctoral studies

Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. *IODS / Doctoral school / schools present evidence regarding the possession or rental of spaces for research activities specific to doctoral study programs (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations, etc.*

The NAMGD has adequate spaces for teaching, artistic creation and scientific research. Additionally the new headquarters of NAMGD is financed and is in the construction stage. The value of the investment is RON 140,471,442.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. *IODS / The doctoral school (s) has collaboration agreements signed with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for the exploitation in partnership of various research infrastructures and publicly presents its offer of research services through a platform profile.*

There is a partnership with the National University of Music in Bucharest -Center for Nineteenth-Century Music Studies, which aims at scientific and educational collaboration.

In 2021, the "Sigismund Toduță" Doctoral School concluded a partnership with the Romanian National Opera Cluj-Napoca, with the participation of the French Institute Cluj-Napoca, in order to realize the symposium OPERA INTERNATIONAL APERTA 2021.

The doctoral school signed a partnership with the Sigismund Toduță Foundation regarding the didactic, artistic and scientific activity.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.3. *IODS / Doctoral School (s) demonstrates its concern for the permanent renewal of research infrastructure that provides doctoral students with access to current research resources, through application in various competitions for research infrastructure funding and through procurement for research infrastructure. research from IODS's own revenues.*

The members of the doctoral school coordinated 41 grants and projects, amounting to RON 2,459,797. The part of this sum is spend for the permanent renewal of the research / artistic creation infrastructure, which ensures doctoral students access to current research / artistic creation resources.

The following FDI projects had as objective the development of the doctoral school:

2016 project entitled "International Development in Music and Academics"

2019 project entitled "Development of research excellence in MAGD"

2020 project entitled "Consolidation of Excellence in scientific research and artistic creation in NAMGD".

Next three projects of the Doctoral School were submitted in 2021:

Expanding the virtual space dedicated to doctoral students

Publications of the Doctoral School "Sigismund Toduță"

Personalities of the Doctoral School "Sigismund Toduță": Adrian Pop

Fulfilled

Criterion A.3. Quality of human resource

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each doctoral school there are enough qualified staff so as to ensure a quality educational process

Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1. *The share of doctoral supervisors who coordinate more than 8 doctoral students at the same time, but not more than 12, during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.*

The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. *At least 50% of the teaching / research staff involved in teaching and research activities related to the programs of preparation of advanced university studies or in the individual programs of scientific research or artistic creation are holders of IODS, employed with the conclusion of an employment contract for an indefinite period.*

Out of the 12 doctoral supervisors, 9 are tenured at the NAMGD DS.

Fulfilled

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECIENCY

Criterion B.1. Number, quality and diversity of candidates who applied for the admission competition.

Standard B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance, are diversified as gender and social representation.

Performance Indicator *B.1.1.1. *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: previous academic, research and professional performance of the candidates, their interest in scientific or artistic / sports research, publications in the field and a proposal for a subject of research. An interview with the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure.*

Admission to doctoral studies are made in accordance to Regulation for admission to doctoral university studies and in compliance with the following criteria and standards:

Criteria:

- Training and professional skills (scientific and artistic)of the candidates.**
- Transversal skills:-language and communication skills (oral and written);**
- Respecting the values and principles of scientific research ethics.**

Standards:

- Evaluation of the professional CV,**
- Written test,**
- Presentation of the research project.**

The dropout rate of doctoral students 2 years after admission is 0

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. *IODS / Doctoral school / schools have a policy of stimulating the enrollment of doctoral students from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating special places for admission and / or granting social scholarships, as well as organizing support programs to prevent dropout from university.*

Candidates with a precarious financial situation are exempted from paying admission fees and can benefit from scholarships, according to the Scholarship Regulations. There were no dropouts due to financial reasons.

Fulfilled

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral university study programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve the research skills of doctoral students and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. *The training program based on advanced university studies comprises at least three disciplines relevant for the training in scientific research of doctoral students, of which at least one discipline is intended for the in-depth study of research methodology and / or statistical data processing.*

The training program based on advanced university studies aims to improve the research skills of doctoral students and strengthen their ethical behavior.

PhD students have the opportunity to participate in at least two courses in a package of five disciplines, coordinated exclusively by doctoral supervisors:

1. The stylistics of the music of the 20th century (acad. Prof. Univ. Dr. Cornel Țăranu)
2. Analysis of musical performance (Prof. Univ. Dr. Adriana Bera)
3. Methodology and ethics of scientific research (Prof. Dr. Pavel Pușcaș)
4. Elaboration of institutional research projects (Prof. Dr. Nelida Nedelcuț)
5. Writing, technical editing and presentation of scientific texts (Prof. Dr. Gabriel Banciu)

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. *There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

Ethics in scientific research is a permanent concern of all doctoral supervisors in the activity of guiding doctoral students. Examples of the course may be *Methodology and ethics of scientific research* (Prof. Dr. Pavel Pușcaș). Research ethics is also included in the course of Prof. Univ. dr. Gabriel Banciu (*Writing, technical editing and presentation of scientific texts*), and is a permanent concern of all doctoral supervisors in the activity of guiding doctoral students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. *IODS has created mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated field, aims at "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that PhD students should acquire after completing each discipline or through research activities.*

The study programs ensure the conformity between the competencies acquired in higher education and the learning outcomes related to the occupations in the Classification of Occupations in Romania

For the evaluation of the training programs within the advanced university studies, the following means are used:

- evaluation and approval of the subject sheet within the program;
- evaluation of doctoral students at the end of the courses;
- evaluation of the degree of satisfaction of doctoral students (questionnaire and informal discussions).

Recommendation:

Though until now it is not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023) I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes)
I would recommend also that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.

Fulfilled

Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and their evaluation procedures

Standard B.3.1. The research is capitalized by doctoral students through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technology transfer, patents, products, service orders

Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. *Within the doctoral school there are mechanisms for capitalizing on the results of doctoral studies according to the specifics of the field (e.g. technology transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services in the case of social and humanities; festivals, competitions, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-artistic commands in the vocational field; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, involvement of doctoral students in the development of research and development projects, etc.).*

PhD students were involved in:

- artistic activities (recitals, shows, concerts -352)
 - scientific activities (publications -84,
 - symposia, conferences -32)
 - other activities (judgments, participation in editorial teams and projects) -23
 - research and development projects -18
- and received 47 awards and two diplomas of merit.

Fulfilled

Criterion B.4. The quality of doctoral thesis

Standard B.4.1. Doctoral thesis meet high quality standards.

Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. *At the IODS level, the percentage of invalidated theses, without the right to redo and resume the public support process, at the level of the CNATDCU General Council, is at most 5% in the last five years.*

Within IODS NAMGD no case of invalidation without the right to redo the doctoral thesis was registered from the CNATDCU General Council

Fulfilled

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Criterion C.1. Existence and regular development of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. The institutional framework exists and a procedure for monitoring internal quality assurance as well as relevant internal quality assurance policies is applied

Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. *IODS has developed and periodically applies a procedure for evaluation and internal monitoring of the activities within the doctoral schools, among the evaluated criteria being mandatory:*

- a) the scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors;*
- b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary for carrying out the research activity;*
- c) the regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized;*
- d) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling provided to doctoral students;*

The institution has a strong internal quality culture, supported by clear and effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures. Improving the quality of education consists of actions and corrective measures adopted on the basis of systematic analysis and continuous evaluation of the activity of the institution.

The Quality Manual exists, applies and includes the related procedures, including:

- Procedure regarding the monitoring and improvement of the activities of teachers, research and auxiliary involved in university study programs;
- Procedure regarding the periodic evaluation of teachers by management;
- Procedure regarding the peer evaluation of teachers;
- Procedure regarding the elaboration of curricula
- Procedure for monitoring graduates' careers

Recommendation:

I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement. More generally recommendation should be about the formal policy that needs to be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the Academy is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly

visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. *The student associations and, as the case may be, the representative students organize elections among the doctoral students, for positions in CSUD, by universal, direct and secret ballot, all doctoral students having the right to choose and be elected.*

The CDS Student Election Regulations and Evidence Reports exist and apply.

In accordance with the legislation in force, the Student Association appoints representatives from among doctoral students for positions in the Council of Doctoral Studies (CSUD), by universal, direct and secret ballot of the students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.3 . *Student associations and, as the case may be, representative students organize elections among doctoral students, at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in doctoral school councils, by universal, direct and secret ballot, all doctoral students having the right to elect and be elected.*

There are and apply the Regulations for the election of students in the Doctoral School and Evidence Reports.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.1.1.4. *Following the internal evaluation, both IODS and the doctoral schools develop strategies and action policies in order to remedy the reported deficiencies and to stimulate the scientific and academic performance of IODS.*

It is applied the Procedure for monitoring and improving the activities of teachers, research and assistants involved in university study program and Procedures for internal evaluation of the quality of the doctoral study program, in order to evaluate and stimulate scientific and academic activity.

Recommendation:

I would recommend the long-term strategy be prioritized to become a veritable road map, integrating a time line within which specific goals can be achieved.

Fulfilled

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility to learning resources

Standard C.2.1. The information of interest for doctoral students, future candidates, respectively the information of public interest are available for consultation in electronic format.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- a) the regulations of the doctoral school;*
- b) the admission regulation;*
- c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- d) the regulation for completing the studies, which should also include the procedure for public defense of the thesis;*
- e) the content of the study programs;*
- f) the scientific profile and thematic areas / research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- g) the list of doctoral students in the field with the basic information (year of registration; supervisor);*
- h) information about the standards for the elaboration of the doctoral thesis;*
- i) links to the abstracts of the doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense.*

The doctoral school updates and manages on the university website information related to the activities of the doctoral school and ensures access to regulations, procedures and information related to the activities of the doctoral school, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.

Fulfilled

Standard C.2.2. *The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed to conduct doctoral studies.*

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. *All PhD students have free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the fields of organized doctoral studies*

Students and teachers have access to the following databases:

- 1. Grove**
- 2. RILM –EBSCO host Login**
- 3. Cambridge Journals**
- 4. JSTOR -link:**
- 5. Music and Dance Online**

The access of doctoral students to periodicals in the field, in the country and abroad, to databases including international JSTOR and Journal of Research in Music Education and to the Internet is unrestricted.

Recommendation:

I would recommend access to more databases: *Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge.*

Fulfilled with recommendation

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. *Each doctoral student has access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations.*

Access to the *sistemantiplagiat.ro* platform can be obtained at the request of students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school, according to internal rules.*

The regulations of the Doctoral School stipulate that the research laboratories, the lecture halls, the library, the study rooms equipped with instruments, all the spaces with internet access are at the disposal of the doctoral students.

Fulfilled

Criterion C.3. Degree of internationalization

Standard C.3.1. *There is a strategy and it is applied to increase the degree of internationalization of doctoral studies.*

Performance Indicator * C.3.1.1. *IODS, for each doctoral school, has signed mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies that carry out activities in the studied field, which aim at the mobility of doctoral students and teachers (for example, ERASMUS agreements for the study cycle doctoral degree). At least 35% of PhD students have completed a training course abroad or another form of mobility, such as participating in international scientific conferences. IODS develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

In the period 2015-2020, 53 mobility agreements were concluded with the “Gheorghe Dima” National Academy of Music, also valid for doctoral students. The number of PhD students who wanted and benefited from ERASMUS mobility is 12. The number of mobilities is complemented by the large number of doctoral students who have professional commitments abroad.

Recommendation:

I would recommend a stronger emphasis placed on international educational environment and on the international dimension in curriculum development .

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. *IODS supports, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of first-rate experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.*

In the period 2010-2015, a doctorate was organized in co-supervision with the Sorbonne University in Paris. A number of 18 experts held courses for PhD students.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator * C.3.1.3. *At least 10% of the doctoral theses within each doctoral school within IODS are written and / or presented in an international language or are co-supervised.*

As this performance indicator was not known and applied for most of the evaluated period, several theses that could have been done and presented in international languages, were defended in Romania.

Partially fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. *The internationalization of doctoral studies activities is also supported by IODS through other concrete measures (for example, participation in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; inclusion of international experts in committees to guide or defend doctoral theses, etc.);*

On October 27, 2016, the "Gheorghe Dima" Academy of Music participated in the "Master and More" International Educational Fair in Warsaw.

The acquired knowledge can be presented both through publications - articles, studies, books, scores and through public appearances-participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures, posts on the Internet (specialized or personal blogs). In addition to the activities carried out through the Service of International Relations and Community Programs-UNMB, ERASMUS, IOSUD-UNMB concludes partnerships with profile institutions that carry out activities of international prestige, creating the possibility for doctoral students to participate at such international level events.

Fulfilled

Criterion C.4. The system of ensuring the observance of the norms of ethics and academic integrity

Standard C.4.1. IODS / Doctoral School has a functional and effective system for preventing and ensuring compliance with ethical norms and academic integrity

Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. *IODS implements the provisions in force regarding ethics and deontology / academic integrity, respectively academic freedom and has:*

All these requirements are covered by the provisions of the Code of Ethics, part of the NAMGD Charter, and by the Regulation of the Ethics Commission. There is a document developed by CDS entitled "About plagiarism Procedures to avoid plagiarism." All doctoral theses are verified with the sistemantiplagiat.ro software.

IODS constantly monitors and evaluates these practices and can demonstrate their application to all activities and the involvement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring are made public annually or whenever necessary

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.2. *All the notifications regarding the suspicions of plagiarism related to some doctoral theses were analyzed and solved by IODS within the legal term provided for the expression of the written point of view regarding the received notification.*

There were no notifications or suspicions of plagiarism regarding the doctoral theses of the doctoral students within IODS ANMGD.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.3. *The annual reports of the IODS Ethics Commission contain information on the status of each case in which there was a complaint or self-notification relevant to doctoral studies regarding the violation of certain rules and ethical issue.*

There were no complaints or self-notifications regarding plagiarism. Ethics issues are a major concern of the Ethics Commission, and the annual reports contain all the situations discussed and resolved. There were no issues of violation of research ethics.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. *The measures taken by IODS following the final decisions of the CNADTCU to withdraw the doctor's degree following the plagiarism notifications concerned all the aspects provided in the CNADTCU decision and in the legislation in force.*

There were no such situations.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.5. *The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:*

- a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;*
- b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;*
- c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism.*

The regulations of the Doctoral School provide, at art. 65 (4) the following: „the deviation from good conduct is found in scientific research, the following sanctions shall be applied to the doctoral supervisor:

- a) the suspension of the right to coordinate new doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral supervisors who coordinated a doctoral thesis with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree for plagiarism;**
- b) exclusion from IODS of the doctoral supervisor who coordinated at least two doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree for plagiarism.”**

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.6. *Scientific reviewers who have been part of the public support commissions of two or more doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree for plagiarism have not been appointed to the public support commissions of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.*

There have been no such cases.

Fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. *IODS has a public database that includes all doctoral theses defended in the institution, starting at least in 2016, in a format that contains: field, author, doctoral supervisor, thesis title and doctoral thesis in electronic format (if the author agrees).*

The full list of doctoral theses defended within IODS and the adjacent information is posted on the institution's website.

Fulfilled

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

Fulfilled

IV. SWOT Analyzis

<p>Strengths:</p> <p>The thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.</p> <p>Information provided to the public about the institution is clear, consistent and accurate.</p> <p>Extensive and active participation of IOSUD-UNMB in artistic, cultural and educational instances at the local, national and international level, and its broad artistic and cultural offer.</p> <p>Wide-ranging international activity, with impressive realizations.</p>	<p>Weaknesses:</p> <p>Lack of the formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences</p> <p>Lack of the formalized structure of regular meetings with stakeholders (representatives if Opera, Philharmonic, Musical Theatre, school principals, graduates, ect.) to discuss possible changes and updating of curricula.</p> <p>Foreign databases are rather poor.</p>
<p>Opportunities:</p> <p>Preparation to the challenges pertaining to the Fourth Industrial Revolution.</p> <p>Creating new and updated ways of knowledge transfer.</p>	<p>Threats:</p> <p>According to the opinions of interlocutors at the meetings – there are not threats at all.</p>

Additional question:

To meet the challenges of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, universities will need to take specific actions on foresight and planning. Since the precise skills, competences and knowledge needed in the future are uncertain, curricula will need to be frequently revised and updated. Universities will need to be able to adapt rapidly, and to form broad sets of competences.

What did you do to become more flexible and be adapted to new educational challenges after the Fourth Industrial Revolution?

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		<p><i>Performance indicator A.1.1.1.</i> The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IODS, respectively of the doctoral school, having as reference period the last five years.</p>	fulfilled	<p>The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of IOSUD are mentioned in the Annexes of Internal evaluation report.</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.1.2</i> The regulations of the doctoral school include criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the aspects specified in art. 17 para. (5) of the Code of doctoral studies, approved by Government Decision no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions.</p>	fulfilled	<p>The doctoral university studies are carried out based on the legislation in force as well as on its own procedures / methodologies / regulations, including all mandatory criteria</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.1.3</i> The doctoral schools of IODS are organized on disciplinary and interdisciplinary disciplines or topics, in accordance with art. 158 paragraph (7) of the LEN.</p>	fulfilled	<p>Within IODS there is only one doctoral school related to the MUSIC field</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.</i> Existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of doctoral students and their academic background.</p>	fulfilled	<p>IODS holds records of all doctoral students within the NAMGD Doctoral School. I would recommend the creation of an alumni observatory, integrating a clear institutional policy on data collection and monitoring of alumni and gathering data of their employment, countries, geographic areas, other sources of data and how many of them are employed on the music labor market.</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.</i> Existence and use of a computer program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.</p>	fulfilled	<p>From August 17, 2020, the <i>Sistemantiplagiat.ro</i> program is used.</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.</i> IODS / Doctoral school / schools present evidence regarding the possession or rental of spaces for research</p>	fulfilled	<p>The NAMGD has adequate spaces for teaching, artistic creation and scientific research. Additionally the new headquarters of NAMGD is financed and is in the construction stage.</p>

	activities specific to doctoral study programs (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations, etc.).		
	<i>Performance Indicator A.2.1.2.</i> IODS / The doctoral school (s) has collaboration agreements signed with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for the exploitation in partnership of various research infrastructures and publicly presents its offer of research services through a platform profile.	fulfilled	There are partnerships with the National University of Music in Bucharest - Center for Nineteenth-Century Music Studies, the Romanian National Opera and with the Sigismund Toduță Foundation.
	<i>Performance Indicator A.2.1.3</i> IODS / Doctoral School (s) demonstrates its concern for the permanent renewal of research infrastructure that provides doctoral students with access to current research resources, through application in various competitions for research infrastructure funding and through procurement for research infrastructure. research from IODS's own revenues.	fulfilled	The members of the doctoral school coordinated 41 grants and projects that let them permanently renew of research infrastructure.
	<i>Performance Indicator *A.3.1.1.</i> The share of doctoral supervisors who coordinate more than 8 doctoral students at the same time, but not more than 12, during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20.	fulfilled	The doctoral school does not exceed in the analyzed period the percentage of 20% doctoral supervisors to coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, during doctoral studies.
	<i>Performance Indicator A.3.1.2.</i> At least 50% of the teaching / research staff involved in teaching and research activities related to the programs of preparation of advanced university studies or in the individual programs of scientific research or artistic creation are holders of IODS, employed with the conclusion	fulfilled	Out of the 12 doctoral supervisors, 9 are tenured at the NAMGD DS.

	of an employment contract for an indefinite period.		
	<i>Performance Indicator*B.1.1.1.</i> Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: previous academic, research and professional performance of the candidates, their interest in scientific or artistic / sports research, publications in the field and a proposal for a subject of research. An interview with the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure.	fulfilled	Admission to doctoral studies are made in accordance to <i>Regulation for admission to doctoral university studies</i> and in compliance with the criteria and standards in force. I commend NAMGD on the thoroughness and clarity of admission procedures and information provided to future candidates.
	<i>Performance Indicator B.1.1.2.</i> IODS / Doctoral school / schools have a policy of stimulating the enrollment of doctoral students from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating special places for admission and / or granting social scholarships, as well as organizing support programs to prevent dropout from university.	fulfilled	Candidates with a precarious financial situation are exempted from paying admission fees and can benefit from scholarships, according to the Scholarship Regulations. There were no dropouts due to financial reasons.
	<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.</i> The training program based on advanced university studies comprises at least three disciplines relevant for the training in scientific research of doctoral students, of which at least one discipline is intended for the in-depth study of research methodology and / or statistical data processing.	fulfilled	The training program enables the in-depth study of research methodology and/or statistical data processing. PhD students have the opportunity to participate in at least two courses in a package of five disciplines, coordinated exclusively by doctoral supervisors
	<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.</i> There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and well-defined intellectual or thematic property on these topics within a discipline taught in the doctoral program	fulfilled	Ethics in scientific research is a permanent concern of all doctoral supervisors in the activity of guiding doctoral students. One of the examples: Prof. Dr. Pavel Puşcaş' lecture <i>Methodology and ethics of scientific research.</i>
	<i>Performance Indicator B.2.1.3</i> IODS has created mechanisms to ensure that the training	fulfilled	The study programs ensure the conformity between the competencies acquired in higher education and the

		<p>program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated field, aims at "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that PhD students should acquire after completing each discipline or through research activities.</p>		<p>learning outcomes related to the occupations in the Classification of Occupations in Romania. Competencies are not Learning Outcomes, but until now it was not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023).</p> <p>Though until now it is not obligatory to have formalized Learning Outcomes (it will be introduced in 2023), I would recommend to have formalized Learning Outcomes for PhD programmes integrating knowledge, skills and social competences, and their descriptions aligned with the Romanian Qualification Framework (for example AEC Learning Outcomes)</p> <p>I recommend that the connection between assessment criteria and learning outcomes be clearly visible.</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator B.3.1.1.</i> Within the doctoral school there are mechanisms for capitalizing on the results of doctoral studies according to the specifics of the field (e.g. technology transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services in the case of social and humanities; festivals, competitions, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-artistic commands in the vocational field; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, involvement of doctoral students in the development of research and development projects, etc.).</p>	fulfilled	<p>PhD students were involved in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -artistic activities (recitals, shows, concerts -352) -scientific activities (publications -84, -symposia, conferences -32) -other activities (judgments, participation in editorial teams and projects) -23 -research and development projects - 18 <p>and received 47 awards and two diplomas of merit.</p>
		<p><i>Performance Indicator B.4.1.1.</i> At the IODS level, the percentage of invalidated theses, without the right to redo and resume the public support process, at the level of the CNATDCU General Council, is at most 5% in the last five year.</p>	fulfilled	<p>Within IODS ANMGD no case of invalidation, without the right to redo the doctoral theses was registered from the CNATDCU General Council.</p>

	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.</i> IODS has developed and periodically applies a procedure for evaluation and internal monitoring of the activities within the doctoral schools, among the evaluated criteria being mandatory: a) the scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary for carrying out the research activity; c) the regulations and procedures on the basis of which the doctoral studies are organized; d) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling provided to doctoral students;</p>	fulfilled	<p>The institution has a strong internal quality culture, supported by clear and effective quality assurance and enhancement procedures.</p> <p>I would recommend that portions of internal quality assurance and enhancement results be published, so as to encourage Academy-wide reflection on improving problematic areas: internal quality assurance mechanisms should provide good feedback and thus encourage improvement.</p> <p>More generally, I would recommend a formal policy be implemented to share internal quality assurance results – the UNMB is a relatively small community where people all know each other and as such, there tends to be a degree of informality which can discourage formalizing certain procedures. Were internal assurance quality results to be clearly visible, this could affect internationalization positively: such transparency is appealing to international students.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.1.1.2.</i> The student associations and, as the case may be, the representative students organize elections among the doctoral students, for positions in CSUD, by universal, direct and secret ballot, all doctoral students having the right to choose and be elected.</p>	fulfilled	<p>The CDS Student Election Regulations and Evidence Reports exist and apply.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.1.1.3.</i> Student associations and, as the case may be, representative students organize elections among doctoral students, at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in doctoral school councils, by universal, direct and secret ballot, all doctoral students having the right to</p>	fulfilled	<p>There are and apply the Regulations for the election of students in the Doctoral School and Evidence Reports.</p>

	elect and be elected.		
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.1.1.4.</i> Following the internal evaluation, both IODS and the doctoral schools develop strategies and action policies in order to remedy the reported deficiencies and to stimulate the scientific and academic performance of IODS.</p>	fulfilled	<p>It is applied the <i>Procedure for monitoring and improving the activities of teachers, research and assistants</i> involved in university study program and <i>Procedures for internal evaluation of the quality of the doctoral study program</i>, in order to evaluate and stimulate scientific and academic activity.</p> <p><i>I recommend the long-term strategy be prioritized to become a veritable road map, integrating a time line within which specific goals can be achieved.</i></p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.</i> IODS publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p>	fulfilled	<p>The doctoral school updates and manages on the university website information related to the activities of the doctoral school and ensures access to regulations, procedures and information related to the activities of the doctoral school, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.2.2.1.</i> All PhD students have free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the fields of organized doctoral studies.</p>	fulfilled	<p>Students and teachers have access to the following databases:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Grove 2. RILM –EBSCO host Login 3. Cambridge Journals 4. JSTOR -link: 5. Music and Dance Online <p><i>I would recommend access to more databases: Naxos Music Library, Naxos Video Library and Naxos Library Jazz, Wiley-Blackwell, Elsevier, Springer and Web of Knowledge.</i></p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.2.2.2</i> Each doctoral student has access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations.</p>	fulfilled	<p>Access to the <i>sistemantiplagiat.ro</i> platform can be obtained at the request of students.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.2.2.3.</i> All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school, according to internal rules.</p>	fulfilled	<p>Scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school are at the disposal of the doctoral students, according to internal rules.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.1.</i></p>	fulfilled	<p>In the period 2015-2020, 53 mobility</p>

	<p>IODS, for each doctoral school, has signed mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies that carry out activities in the studied field, which aim at the mobility of doctoral students and teachers (for example, ERASMUS agreements for the study cycle doctoral degree). At least 35% of PhD students have completed a training course abroad or another form of mobility, such as participating in international scientific conferences. IODS develops and implements policies and action plans aimed at increasing the number of doctoral students participating in training courses abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.</p>		<p>agreements were concluded, also valid for doctoral students. The number of PhD students who wanted and benefited from ERASMUS mobility is 12. Additionally a lot of doctoral students have professional commitments abroad. I would recommend a stronger emphasis placed on international educational environment and on the international dimension in curriculum development .</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.2.</i> IODS supports, including financially, the organization of doctorates in international co-supervision, respectively the invitation of first-rate experts to give courses / lectures for doctoral students.</p>	fulfilled	<p>The institution offers a range of opportunities for students to gain an international perspective In the period 2010-2015, a doctorate was organized in co-supervision with the Sorbonne University in Paris. A number of 18 experts held courses for PhD students.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.3</i> At least 10% of the doctoral theses within each doctoral school within IODS are written and / or presented in an international language or are co-supervise</p>	partially fulfilled	<p>As this performance indicator was not known and applied for most of the evaluated period, several theses that could have been done and presented in international languages, were defended in Romania.</p>
	<p><i>Performance Indicator C.3.1.4.</i> The internationalization of doctoral studies activities is also supported by IODS through other concrete measures (for example, participation in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; inclusion of international experts in</p>	fulfilled	<p>On October 27, 2016, the "Gheorghe Dima" Academy of Music participated in the "Master and More" International Educational Fair in Warsaw. The acquired knowledge was also presented both through publications - articles, studies, books, scores and through public appearances- participation in symposia, conferences and public lectures.</p>

		committees to guide or defend doctoral theses, etc.).		
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.1.</i> IODS implements the provisions in force regarding ethics and deontology / academic integrity, respectively academic freedom and has:.....	fulfilled	IODS constantly monitors and evaluates these practices and can demonstrate their application to all activities and the involvement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring are made public annually or whenever necessary.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.2.</i> All the notifications regarding the suspicions of plagiarism related to some doctoral theses were analyzed and solved by IODS within the legal term provided for the expression of the written point of view regarding the received notification.	fulfilled	There were no notifications or suspicions of plagiarism regarding the doctoral theses of the doctoral students within IODS ANMGD.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.3.</i> The annual reports of the IODS Ethics Commission contain information on the status of each case in which there was a complaint or self-notification relevant to doctoral studies regarding the violation of certain rules and ethical issues.	fulfilled	There were no complaints or self-notifications regarding plagiarism and issues of violation of research ethics.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.4.</i> The measures taken by IODS following the final decisions of the CNATDCU to withdraw the doctor's degree following the plagiarism notifications concerned all the aspects provided in the CNADTCU decision and in the legislation in force.	fulfilled	There were no such situations.
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.5.</i> Measures to prevent academic fraud in doctoral studies, adopted by IODS, may be:.....	fulfilled	There were no withdrawals of the doctoral degree
		<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.6.</i> Scientific reviewers who have been part of the public support commissions of two or more doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the doctoral degree for plagiarism have not been appointed to	fulfilled	There have been no such cases.

	the public support commissions of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.		
	<i>Performance Indicator C.4.1.7.</i> IODS has a public database that includes all doctoral theses defended in the institution, starting at least in 2016, in a format that contains: field, author, doctoral supervisor, thesis title and doctoral thesis in electronic format (if the author agrees).	fulfilled	The full list of doctoral theses defended within IODS and the adjacent information is posted on the institution's website.

Additional recommendation and question:

To meet the challenges of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, universities will need to take specific actions on foresight and planning. Since the precise skills, competences and knowledge needed in the future are uncertain, curricula will need to be frequently revised and updated. Universities will need to be able to adapt rapidly, and to form broad sets of competences.

What did NAMGD do to become more flexible and be adapted to new educational challenges after the Fourth Industrial Revolution?

Wrocław, 12.10.2021