

The External Foreign Evaluator Report of an Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IOSUD)

Ion Ionescu de la Brad University of Life Sciences (ULS) of Iasi

Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Recommendations
- VI. Conclusions
- VII. Annexes

I. Introduction¹

In this chapter, the following shall be summarized:

- the context in which this external evaluation report was drafted (**the type of evaluation, the period of the evaluation visit, the composition of the Experts Committee** etc.);

This is the periodic evaluation of the IOSUD, as performed by an external foreign expert.

The Evaluation was performed in a period from 20-24 September 2021.

The international expert for this IOSUD evaluation was:

Univ. Prof. Dr Dušan PALIĆ

The ARACIS comission national members were:

Prof. univ. dr. IANOS Ioan (evaluation director)

Prof. univ. dr. APAHEDIAN Silviu (Coordinator of the IOSUD committee)

Orasa-Alic Sergiu Aurel (PhD Student Expert for the IOSUD evaluation)

- details about the institution organizing the doctoral studies (number of Doctoral Schools, number of students, institutional context, short history etc.);

ULS Iași (Formerly UASVM Iasi) is an organizing institution for doctoral studies in two fundamental fields, Engineering Sciences and Biological and Biomedical Sciences. The branches of science corresponding to the two fields are Plant and Animal Resources Engineering, and Veterinary Medicine, respectively. The doctoral university studies are carried out in a well-established framework, by decisions of the Board of Directors and by decisions of the ULS Iași Senate, in two doctoral schools: the **Doctoral School of**

¹ Each time when applicable the information shall be presented genderwise



Engineering Sciences (SDSI) and the **Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine** (SDMV). The coordination of the two schools is performed by the Council for University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), subordinated to the Board of Directors of the university (Annex II.01). Each doctoral school is run by a Council of the Doctoral School and is composed of doctoral fields and, within them, doctoral specializations. The fields of doctoral studies in which the doctorate is organized at ULS Iași, are: Agronomy, Horticulture, Animal Husbandry, Engineering and management in agriculture and rural development and Veterinary Medicine (Annex II.01).

Currently, the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences has 29 doctoral supervisors (Annex II.01). As of 1.10.2020, the following numbers of PhD students were reported: Agronomy - 47 (Annex II.51); Horticulture - 57; Animal Husbandry - 33; Engineering and management in agriculture and rural development -17.

In the field of Veterinary Medicine (SDMV), during the evaluation period, the doctoral training was carried out in 6 specializations (Infectious Diseases, Parasitic Diseases, Microbiology-Immunology, Normal and Pathological Morphology, Veterinary Obstetrics and Andrology, Semiology and Medical Pathology, under the guidance of 9 doctoral supervisors (Annex II.02).

II. Methods used

In order to evaluate and prepare external foreign evaluation report of the IOSUD of UASMV Iași, the commission of expert evaluators used methods and tools according to the Guide for the process of periodic external evaluation of doctoral studies. The methods used included review and analysis of self evaluation reports and respective annexes (in English and Romanian). The UASMV Iasi structured the self evaluation reports as two separate reports (one for Doctoral School of Engineering, and second for the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine).

During the week of 20-24.09.2021, a series of online meetings was attended and recorded. The external foreign evaluator was not physically participating in the on-site visit on Thursday, 23.09.2021, however, the on-site committee members were providing all necessary information in a form of video and photo materials, and also telephone communication for clarifications. Finally, the doctoral student commission members have shared the survey result. During the visit, the colleagues from the UASMV Iasi provided updated and corrected versions of the institutional reports, that were further reviewed by the evaluator.

III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators²

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

- *general description of the domain analysis.*

Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

² Each time when applicable the information shall be presented genderwise



Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

The existence of regulations, procedures and other specific documents for the organization of doctoral studies according to the legal provisions was analyzed.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-reports (Internal evaluation reports) of the IOSUD doctoral schools (as corrected/re-submitted during the visit) as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s):*

(a) the internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulations for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies programs, the regulation(s) of Doctoral School(s);

At the level of IOSUD / doctoral school there are internal regulations of the administrative structures (Institutional Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies, regulations of doctoral schools): Institutional Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies (Annex II.03), adopted by The decision of the USAMV Iași Senate on 15.09.2011, was updated and completed by the Senate Decisions of 27.06.2012, 12.09.2013, 29.09.2014, 24.10.2018 and 20.01.2021, being available for consultation on the USAMV Iași website

(https://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2021/Regulament-IOSUD_2021.pdf).

The Regulation of the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (Annex II.02) was approved by the UASVM Iași Senate on 28.08.2016 and amended in the meeting of 24.10.2018, being available for consultation on the UASVM Iași website (https://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2019/Regulament_SD_MV_2019.pdf).

(b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct;

Within IOSUD, the process of establishing and electing the management structures and functions is carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the organization and conduct of elections in the management structures and functions of IOSUD from UASVM Iași (Annex II.55). Methodology for organizing and conducting elections for management structures and functions in USAMV Iași, mandate 2020-2024 (Annex II.56); Election procedure, mandate 2020 - 2024 (Annex II.57). All the documents that regulate the conduct of the elections were approved in the meeting of the UASVM Iași Senate on October 24. 2019 and can be consulted on the UASVM Iași website

(https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/alegeri_2020.html).

The Regulations and Methodology regulate the legal framework of these elections. Section IV of the Regulation describes the particularities of the elections in the structures and management functions of IOSUD: CSUD (Art. 14) and CSD (Art. 15). Within the Election Methodology, Art. 62-80 regulates the organization of elections at the level of doctoral schools, and art. 81-89 - Election of CSUD members.



The public competition for the position of CSUD director took place on the basis of a specific Methodology and Procedure (Annex II.61; Annex II.62), approved in the Senate meeting of 11.05.2020. The vacant CSUD director position was published in the M.O. 103, part III, from 31.01.2020. The announcement regarding the competition and the calendar of the competition (Annex II.63), as well as the result of the competition (Annex II.64) are published on the UASMV Iași website (https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/alegeri_2020.html).

The candidatures for the positions of member in the Doctoral School Council and CSUD (Annex II.58) and the election results (Annex II.59; Annex II.60) are published on the web (https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/alegeri-2020_candidaturi-CSUD.html; https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_conducere_IOSUD.html).

The director of SDSI was appointed by Decision of the Rector of USAMV Iași (Annex II.60b).

c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);

The general framework for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (admission of doctoral students, completion of doctoral studies; structure and duration of studies; content and completion of doctoral programs) at UASMV Iași is regulated by the Institutional Regulation for organizing and conducting doctoral programs. doctoral studies (Annex II.03), as follows: Selection, admission of doctoral students and employment in doctoral programs (Chapter VII); Structure and duration of doctoral studies (Chapter VIII); Content and completion of doctoral study programs (Chapter XI). The way of organizing the didactic activity for the doctoral education is described in a specific procedure (UAIASI.POB.03) (pg. 150 in Annex II.46). Admission is made by the Admissions Commission, in accordance with the law, on the basis of a competition, according to the specific regulations and norms developed by CSUD and UASMV Senate Iași: Specific norms regarding admission to doctoral studies (Annex II.65), Admission Regulations for doctoral studies (Annex II.66); Methodology for conducting admission to UASMV Iași (Annex II.67: table 1-pg. 3; section F, pg. 14-15); Methodology for admitting foreign citizens to university studies (Annex II.68; Annex II.68b). All these documents, together with the Admission Calendar and other relevant information, are published on the UASMV Iași website (<https://www.uaiasi.ro/admitere/doctorat.php>; Annex II.69) and on the CSUD notice board with at least six months before application.

The number of places allocated for each doctoral supervisor is established on the basis of the Procedure for conducting the competition between doctoral schools for the distribution of doctoral grants - UAIASI code. POB. 32 (Annex II.10, 31). In applying this procedure, the observance of the principle of the demand / supply relationship, regulated by competitiveness criteria, is taken into account; the request is formulated by the doctoral schools, and the offer is presented by IOSUD, based on the distribution of doctoral places received from the Ministry. The registration of doctoral students is done by the Decision of the Rector of UASMV Iași (Annex II.25). Completion of doctoral studies is carried out according to chap. XI (Art. 50-63) of the Institutional Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral university study programs (Annex II.01, 03), chap. VII (Art. 42-53) of the SDSI/SDVM Regulation (Annex II.04, 02, respectively), of



the Norms regarding the elaboration and drafting of the doctoral thesis (Annex II.18, 32) and of the Procedure regarding and defense of the doctoral theses (Annex II.20, 34);
https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_doctorat_procedura.html).

d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;

The recognition of the quality of doctoral supervisor, the activity of doctoral supervisors, their status, the way in which they are evaluated, as well as their rights and obligations are regulated in Art. 3h, 19-25) of the Institutional Regulation for organizing and carrying out doctoral studies (Annex II.03), as well as in Art. 10-13 of the SDSI Regulation (Annex II.04). In order to conduct doctorates, the teaching and research staff within the international community, who have acquired this right, must have an employment contract with OIDAS - UASVM Iași and be members of the doctoral schools from UASVM Iași (**Art. 20** in Annex II.01). The recognition of the quality of doctoral supervisor and of the equivalence of the doctorate obtained in university institutes accredited abroad is made according to the Methodology regarding the automatic recognition of the quality of doctoral supervisor (Annex II.70), respectively the Methodology regarding the recognition of doctoral degree and doctoral degree in science or in a professional field obtained abroad (Annex II.71).

e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the regularity of meetings;

IOSUD / CSUD / CSD management structures have operated regularly within IOSUD. The functionality of these management structures is demonstrated by the agendas of the CSUD and CSD meetings containing the debated documents (Annex II.72; Annex II.72b) and their resolution, the signature of the participants confirming the participation and approval of the resolution on the debated documents.

In accordance with *Regulation of institutional organization and development of academic doctoral studies* (Annex II.01) UASVM structures involved in organizing and conducting doctoral studies are: the University Senate, Board of Directors, Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CADS) (at university level); Doctoral School Council (in the Doctoral School) (Annex II.02). In these structures, meetings are convened regularly (at least 3 / year) in which all aspects related to the management of doctoral studies are debated and decisions are made according to the regulations in force. The management positions corresponding to these structures are: President of the Senate, Rector (supervisor and legal representative of OIDAS), manager of CADS (in university), manager of doctoral school (in Doctoral School) (Annex II.01). The administrative management structure of OIDAS - UASVM Iași (Annex II.01) responsible for the development and application of institutional practices for academic doctoral studies is the Council for Academic doctoral studies - CADS.

Within OIDAS - UASVM Iași, there are two doctoral schools - as organizational and administrative structures for doctoral fields and doctoral specializations (Annex II.01): the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences (DSVM) and the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM). The application of institutional practices for doctoral studies in the field of Veterinary Medicine is done within the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM). The Council of the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) meets at least 3 times a year, at the request of the manager of the doctoral school or of at least one third of its members.



The attributions of the management structures in the doctoral university education at UASVM Iași are provided in the *Institutional Regulation for the organization and development of academic doctoral studies* (Annex II.03), the *DSVM Regulation* (Annex II.02), as well as in the *Procedure for the operation of management structures and functions* - UAIASI.POM.03 (Annex II.06).

f) *the contract for doctoral studies;*

In accordance with the *Regulation of institutional organization and development of academic doctoral studies* (Annex II.01) the right and obligations of doctoral students, doctoral supervisors and OIADAS-UASVM are set in the doctoral study contract (Annex II.16, 59).

g) *internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.*

The proposals regarding the doctoral study programs, as well as the composition of the guiding commissions are analyzed at the beginning of each academic year, in a working meeting of the Doctoral School Council, convened (Annex II.72; Annex II.72b) and chaired by the CSUD director, in which the SDSI director participates, as well as the affiliated doctoral supervisors.

At the level of UASVM Iași Faculties, there are Development Strategies and annual operational plans (<https://www.uaiasi.ro/agricultura/documente/ro>) that have direct specifications for the third cycle of doctoral training.

In the process of analysis and approval of the proposals on the topic of doctoral study programs, the following aspects are taken into account (Art. 19 (2) in the SDSI Regulation -Annex II.02, 04): "the curriculum of the doctoral study program of SDSI/DSVM must either at the level of similar top institutions in the field; research topics to be relevant at national / international level; the methodology of their approach must be made to international standards; the result of doctoral study programs must enter the international circuit, both in terms of visibility and especially in terms of impact".

The existence of the documentation submitted to support indicator A.1.1.1. is confirmed.

Recommendation:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. *The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

The regulations of the doctoral schools have been documented and are in accordance with the requirements for the indicator A.1.1.2.

a) Acceptance of new doctoral supervisor members, as well as regulations on how a doctoral supervisor may withdraw his / her membership of the doctoral school;

Regulation of the Doctoral School of Agronomy, Horticulture and Animal Husbandry (Annex II.04) (name changed by UASVM Iași Senate Decision no. 8 of 28. Sept. 2016 (Annex II.03) in the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences) as well as the *Regulation of the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences* (Annex



II.02) includes at art. 10 specific references to the way of accepting new doctoral leading members (para. 1-4) as well as to the way in which the quality of member of the doctoral school can be withdrawn (para. 5) (Annex II.02). Similar references are present in *the Institutional Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral academic studies*, chap. VI) (Annex II.01). At the same time, there is an *Instruction on the withdrawal of affiliation to DSES for doctoral supervisors* (Annex II.58).

The Regulation of the Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) (Annex II.02) includes in **Art. 10** references regarding the way of accepting new leading members of the doctorate (paragraphs **1-4**) as well as the way in which it can be withdrawn. membership of the doctoral school (para. **5**) (Annex II.02). Similar references are present in the *Institutional Regulation for the organization and development of doctoral studies*, Chap. VI) (Annex II.03). The quality of doctoral supervisor at DSVM is granted, by order of Ministry of National Education, at the proposal of CNATDCU for granting the habilitation certificate, in accordance with the standards and procedures developed by Ministry of National Education.

The status of doctoral supervisor obtained in accredited higher education institutions in other countries is recognized automatically (for EU Member States) or on the basis of an international mutual recognition convention, concluded at intergovernmental or interuniversity level (Annex II.15).

The doctoral supervisor becomes a member of DSVM following the submission of an application, endorsed by the manager of DSVM and approved by the manager of CADS, on the basis of which the Employment Contract is concluded. Following the internal evaluation of the doctoral supervisors, DSVM may decide to extend or terminate the employment contract of a doctoral supervisor and may request the Ministry of National Education to withdraw the title of doctoral supervisor. Professors and researchers who conduct doctorates, retire at the age of 65 and can conduct doctorates in progress on the date of retirement, until their completion. By terminating the employment contract, except for retirement, the quality of doctoral supervisor is automatically lost, and the doctoral students are redistributed by DSVM to other doctoral supervisors in the field.

Withdrawal of affiliation to DSVM can be done at the request of the doctoral supervisor (voluntary withdrawal) or can be proposed motivated by the DSVM Council, respectively by the Faculty Council (Faculty Councils), according to the specific procedure (Annex II.17).

(b) The decision-making mechanisms regarding the appropriateness, structure and content of the training program based on advanced academic studies;

The opportunity to organize an advanced university training program, as well as its structure and content are at the discretion of the doctoral school, according to *the Doctoral School Regulations* (Art. 52, para. 2, in Annex II.01). In accordance with Art. 1 of the *Regulations of the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences* (Annex II.02), doctoral studies aim to develop knowledge through original scientific research (para. 1), in order to acquire scientific research skills and abilities to use the knowledge (para. 7), both for a career in research and for the wider labor market framework (para. 8). *The Regulations of the Doctoral School* (Annex II.02) contain clear provisions regarding the **structure and content** of the training program based on advanced academic studies and the decision-making mechanism in this regard. The Doctoral Academic studies Program (DASP) has a duration of three years and includes a Training Program based on advanced academic studies (TPAAS) and a Scientific Research Program (SRP). The content of the training program based on advanced academic studies (TPAAS) and that of the scientific research program (SRP) must comply with the quality criteria approved by the Council for Doctoral Studies (CDAS) and approved by the UASVM Iași Senate (**Art. 1, para. 2**). The doctoral academic study program (DASP),



with its two components (TPAAS and SRP) has a unique format and is part of the *Contract for doctoral academic studies* (**Art. 1**, para. **3**). The general framework of TPAAS and SRP are elaborated by the Doctoral School Council and approved by CDAS (**Art. 1**, para. **4**).

The opportunity to organize a doctoral training program in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), as well as its structure and content are at the discretion of the *Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM)*, according to the *Institutional Regulation for organizing and conducting doctoral studies* (**Art. 10-11**, in Annex II.01). According to **Art. 1** of *Regulation Doctoral School of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM)* (Annex II.02) organized doctoral studies in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) have as purpose the development of knowledge through original research, in order to acquire research skills and knowledge, both for a research career and for the wider labor market framework.

The *DSVM Regulation* (Annex II.02) contains clear provisions on the **structure and content** of the training program based on advanced academic studies and the decision-making mechanism in this regard. The Academic Doctoral Study Program (ADSP) has a duration of four years and includes a Training Program based on advanced academic studies (AASP) and a Scientific Research Program (SRP). The content of the training program based on advanced academic studies (AASP) and that of the research program (SRP) must comply with the quality criteria approved by the Council for Doctoral Studies (CADS) and approved by the UASVM Iași Senate. The Academic Doctoral Study Program (ADSP), with the two components (AASP and SRP) has a unique format and is part of the *doctoral study contract*. The general framework of AASP and SRP is elaborated by the Doctoral School Council and approved by CADS. For the doctoral field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), the curricula for the advanced university training program (AASP) and the research programs (SRP) are elaborated by the DSVM Council, in consultation with the doctoral supervisors. The two programs, AASP and SRP, prepared individually, under the guidance of the scientific manager, are endorsed by the DSVM Council and approved by the CADS. The choice of disciplines and their thematic content within the AASP is regulated by **Art. 19** of the *DSVM Regulation* (Annex II.02). **The content** of the Academic Doctoral Study Programs is made on account of the specific rules described in the *Regulation DSVM* (Annex II.02).

c) The procedures for changing the doctoral supervisor of a certain doctoral student and the procedures for mediating conflicts;

According to Art. 40 (5) of the *Doctoral School Regulations* (Annex II.02), and Art. 5 (paragraph 5, letters m, n) of the *Study Contract* (Annex II.41 ; Annex II.42); as well as According to the *DSVM Regulation* (Annex II.02), and to the *Study Contract* (Annex II.59), the doctoral student has the right to request the doctoral school council / university management to change the doctoral supervisor (in the same field) if he / she is unavailable, does not comply with the clauses of the study contract, has lost his / her doctoral supervisor, in case of his / her death or in other situations provided by law.

On the other hand, according to Art. 13 (paragraph 3, letters g and h) of the *Doctoral School Regulations* (Annex II.02) the doctoral supervisor has the right to refuse the guidance of a doctoral student in the conditions in which he is placed without his will in a conflict of interest and to request the Council of the Doctoral School to interrupt the supervision of a doctoral student. The resolution of the conflicts between the doctoral student and the Doctoral School, between the doctoral student and the doctoral supervisor or between the doctoral supervisor and the Doctoral School is the competence of the Council for Doctoral



Academic studies (CDAS) (Art. 5, paragraph 8, letter m in Annex II.01) and is carried out on the basis of a specific procedure (Annex II.48).

d) The conditions under which the doctoral program can be interrupted / extended;

Both DSES and DSVM Regulations (Annex II.02) specifies that the doctoral student may **interrupt his / her doctoral studies** for medical reasons, for raising a child or for other good reasons (**Art. 3, para. 6**), such as trips abroad for studies, etc. (**Art. 40, para. 1**), for a maximum period of 2 years (**Art. 1b; Art. 3, para. 7; Art. 40, para. 2**), and that the interruptions are approved by the CDAS Manager, at the doctoral student's request, with the approval of the doctoral supervisor and of the doctoral school and is validated by OIDAS-UASVM Iași (**Art. 3, para. 8**). All these elements are also specified in the Study Contract (Annex II.41 ; Annex II.42 ; Annex II.43), at **Art. 5 (5)**. In case of interruptions, the duration of the doctorate is extended according to the cumulative period of the interruptions approved by the university management (**Art. 40, para. 3**). The maximum duration of doctoral studies, calculated from the date of enrollment of the doctoral student until the completion of the thesis, including the extension periods granted in accordance with the DSES regulations, may not exceed five academic years. The doctoral student who has not completed his / her doctoral studies in the five years can receive, upon request, a grace period of two years, and in case of exceeding this term he / she is expelled (**Art. 3, para. 3**). Regarding the **withdrawal from the doctorate**, it is made on the basis of a request, for justified reasons, with the approval of the doctoral supervisor, the management of the doctoral school and CDAS and the approval of the rector of UASVM Iași. The withdrawn doctoral student can re-register for the doctoral admission competition only for tuition-fee paying positions (**Art. 26, para. 5**). Both the extension and the interruption of the doctoral academic studies are assumed by the parties (the doctoral student and OIDAS-UASVM Iași) through additional documents to the Study Contract (Annex II.45, respectively Annex II.46).

e) Ways to prevent fraud in scientific research, including plagiarism;

According to the *Regulation* (Annex II.02), the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences and Doctoral School of Veterinary Sciences promote transparent activities to combat fraud in scientific research, including plagiarism, by implementing appropriate methods to identify, prevent and sanction them (**Art. 6, para. 6**); the observance of the scientific, professional and university ethics represents an explicit criterion of continuous and final evaluation of the doctoral student's activity (**Art. 58, para. 2**). The regulation of all aspects related to the prevention of fraud in scientific research, including plagiarism, as well as the relations between all members of the academic community is made at OIDAS-UASVM Iasi through specific codes and procedures: *Code of Academic Ethics and Integrity* (Annex II.49), *Procedure for the Operation of the University Ethics Commission - UAIASI.POM.02* (pg. 17 in Annex II.05), *Code of Student Rights and Obligations* (Annex II.50), *Code of Ethics in Scientific Research* (Annex II.51); *Procedure for submitting and defending doctoral theses* (Annex II.36).

f) Ensuring access to research resources

According to Art. 36 (letters G and, h) of the *Doctoral School Regulations* (Annex II.02), as well as Art. 5 (paragraph 5, letter d) of the *Study Contract* (Annex II.41 ; Annex II.42), the doctoral student has the right to benefit from logistics, documentation centers, libraries and equipment UASVM Iași for his training, for the elaboration of the research project, research reports and doctoral thesis, and to be included, with the consent of the doctoral supervisor, in research projects carried out in UASVM Iași.



g) Attendance obligations of doctoral students, according to a methodology developed by the Ministry of National Education.

According to the DSES/DSVM Regulation (Annex II.01 and 02) (**Art. 4, para. 1**), the frequency obligations are established by the doctoral supervisor (performance standards included in the subject sheet), endorsed by the Doctoral School Council and approved by CDAS, according to the legal provisions. During the cycle of doctoral studies, the doctoral student has the obligation to carry out the activities provided in the individual plan of doctoral studies, in accordance with the provisions of the *Contract of studies* (Annex II.59). Participation in these activities is included as a minimum performance requirement in the *Discipline Sheet* (Annex II.51). The doctoral student undertakes to respect the schedule by signing the study contract (**Art. 5 (6)** in Annex II.41; Annex II.42). For the general subjects of the first semester (*Modern Research Methods, Career Management, Academic Ethics and Integrity*) the schedule is established in the Doctoral School (Annex II.77), and for the specialized disciplines the schedule is established together with the doctoral supervisor, with the approval of the Doctoral School and the approval of the CDAS, as an annex to the discipline file (eg Annex II.82a).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator* A.1.1.3³. *Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.*

The component doctoral schools of OIDAS are organized on doctoral fields that promote disciplinary and interdisciplinary topics within the fundamental hierarchical fields Engineering Sciences and Biological and Biomedical Sciences. The doctoral school program is based on academic courses of advanced training (methods of scientific research for the doctoral school, academic writing, ethics and integrity and specialized disciplines) and scientific research (annual research reports consisting of bibliographic study and scientific results) (Annex II.82 and Annex II.82a). In addition, according to ch. I, art. 5 (1) of the Doctoral School Regulation, academic doctoral studies promote interdisciplinarity (Annex_II_02), and chap. 1, art. 2 (1-3) stipulates that the Doctoral Schools aim at the formation and development of two types of skills, focused on research-based learning: professional skills and transversal skills..

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the USAVM lasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as

³ The indicators marked with an asterisk (*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral schools, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation In case they are not fulfilled, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.



applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.

The record of doctoral students and their academic background is achieved through the University Management System (UMS) (Annex II.21, 83). UMS is a tool dedicated to the administration of the activities of existing educational processes in academic environments. UMS is organized in several modules, each module comprising one or more submodules. This modular structure allows the addition or system detachment of one or more modules / submodules, depending on the requirements and financial possibilities of the client. Due to the importance and sensitivity of the information managed by UMS, security was one of the first premises from which it started. By using advanced technologies, and monitoring access to the UMS server (access both through web browsers and through a normal client) it was possible to offer unique security mechanisms, avoiding possible attacks via the Internet or local network.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.

The verification of the similarity of doctoral theses is done, starting with 2016, on the Sistemantiplagiat.ro platform (Annex II.22, 84). Sistemantiplagiat.ro is a computer program for comparing documents in text format. It was created in 2002 by the Polish company Plagiat.pl, and in 2012 it was launched in Romania. The connection to the System is made by accessing the address www.sistemantiplagiat.ro, and the data processing takes place on the servers of the system provider. Users upload texts to the system and their content is compared with the databases that the system has available, such as: Internet Resources (all texts and files available for free on the Internet), Internal Database (with documents uploaded to UASVM System Iasi), External Databases - (of other institutions that use the system), Legislative Database (contains all Romanian and European legislation), RefBooks (contains over 3,500,000 texts in different languages, taken from databases such as Arvix. org, Paperity.com and Termedia.pl.). Following the analysis, the system issues a Similarity Report, which contains several elements that help to evaluate a text (Annex II.85).

The access of doctoral students to this system is made on the basis of a written request, with the approval of the doctoral supervisor, approved by the Doctoral School Council. The person appointed by CDAS for the verification of doctoral theses in the anti-plagiarism system notes on each thesis, under signature, the similarity coefficients (CS) and issues a summary table with the results of the verifications. In order to be accepted, the verified theses must not exceed a rate of 15% (CS 1), respectively 10% (CS 2). In Annex II.52 or 73 are the results of plagiarism checks during 2016-2020 for TEZEL supported under the DSES/DSVM.

The indicator is fulfilled



Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral schools (as amended and re-submitted during and immediately after the visit period) as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. *The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)*

Laboratories/research centers/equipment. OIDAS / Doctoral schools have the appropriate assets for conducting doctoral studies, high-performance equipment, special equipment in accordance with the mission and objectives assumed. In USV of Iași – legal representative of OIDAS, the faculties have research laboratories corresponding to the doctoral fields (Annex_I_103 and Annex_I_104). Each of the university's four faculties has a research center. OIDAS provides doctoral research with the material basis of research centers and laboratories.

http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/4_infrastructura-cercetare.html

The research infrastructure of UASVM Iași includes research centers / laboratories equipped with modern equipment, which allow for high-performance research in all doctoral fields: (Annex II.52 and Annex II.95),

http://www.uaiasi.ro/Laborator_Carne_Rediu/index.html

http://www.uaiasi.ro/Laborator_Lapte_Rediu/index.html

http://www.uaiasi.ro/laborator_control_calitate_nutreturi/index.php?pagina=pagini/acasa.html

http://www.uaiasi.ro/laborator_oenologie/Laborator_Oenologie/Acasa.html

https://www.uaiasi.ro/laborator_pomicultura/ACASA.html

<http://www.uaiasi.ro/Agrolab/>

<https://icamiasi.ro/>

Of these, some are used with priority by PhD supervisors and PhD students (Annex II.52; Annex II.95a). The research activity of doctoral students also takes place in the laboratories of the disciplines that are equipped with high-performance equipment, computer technology, software, etc. (Annex II.54).

One of the most important centers within UASVM Iași where research activities are carried out is the Research Institute for Agriculture and Environment. This unit is equipped with state-of-the-art research equipment, through which physical and chemical analyzes can be performed for soil, plants, water and air (Annex II.53). The Institute operates a phytotron, a greenhouse and a vegetation house. The research activity of doctoral students also takes place in the laboratories of the disciplines that are equipped with high-performance equipment, computer technology, software, etc. (Annex II.54).



OIDAS provides the necessary space for studies and research and provides doctoral research infrastructure and research services of practical application and production centers, teaching and research farms within SDE, with the experimental fields they have: V. Adamachi Horticultural Farm, Ezăreni Agricultural Farm, Rediu Zootechnical Farm. (http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/cercetare/IV_3.pdf)

The endowment related to the faculties with the doctoral fields within OIDAS-USV from Iași is registered on the EERIS platform (Anexa_II_108). The research activity of doctoral students also takes place in the laboratories of the disciplines that are equipped with high-performance equipment, computer technology, software, etc. (Anexa II.54).

Laboratories / research centers / equipment. UASVM Iași enjoys a high-performance research infrastructure (https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/4_infrastructura-cercetare.html) for conducting scientific research in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), as well as the financial means to support the implementation of research and development projects, in accordance with the undertaken mission and objectives, as well as an environment conducive to research and scientific development. UASVM Iași supports the development of scientific research centers and laboratories, around which doctoral schools have been created. The research infrastructure of UASVM Iași includes research centers/laboratories equipped with state-of-the-art facilities, which allow for high-performance research in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM).

One of the most important facilities of UASVM Iași where research in Veterinary Medicine is conducted, is the REGIONAL CENTER FOR ADVANCED RESEARCH IN EMERGING DISEASES, ZONOOSES AND FOOD SAFETY – **ROVETEMERG**. The ROVETEMERG Regional Research Center is a complex project, which bears a high degree of novelty in Romania, as it is the only one of its kind in the region. Thanks to the highly performant technology and equipment of this Research Center, DSVM will be able to enhance its research activity relying on findings worldwide in the field of microbiology (bacteriology, virology, mycology). The ROVETEMERG Research Center provides the infrastructure needed to study host cell-pathogen interactions at the molecular level. In the integrated virology laboratory, special emphasis will be placed on emerging and re-emerging diseases: arboviroses, vector diseases, hepatitis E virus. The integrated bacteriology laboratory provides the premises for fundamental and applied research of contagious bacterial diseases in humans and animals. The 3rd level biosafety experimental modeling laboratory is unique in our country. This laboratory, designed for experimental in vitro (cell culture) and in vivo (experimental animal) studies, will conduct research on viral and bacterial infections using the most versatile and advanced imaging system, providing detection studies combined with trans- and epi-illumination, bioluminescence and fluorescence. The immunology and cell imaging laboratory will carry out research on the immune mechanisms of viral and bacterial diseases in animals.

The next-generation sequencing (NGS) technique infrastructure provides the opportunity to deepen research down to the nucleotide level for all the above-mentioned directions. Proteomics and immunohistopathology allow in-depth studies on the pathogenetic and dissemination mechanisms of the pathogens mentioned above. A total of 714 CD components, 66 IT components and a mobile laboratory have been purchased for the ROVETEMERG center. More specifically, 270 CD components, of which 153 CD equipment and 117 items of laboratory furniture and CD holder, and 48 pieces of IT equipment have been and will be purchased for the BSL3 platform. For the BSL 2 platform, 444 CD components will



be purchased, of which 161 CD equipment and 283 items of laboratory furniture and CD holder, plus 18 IT equipment items. (https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/4_infrastructura-cercetare.html),

(<https://eiris.eu/?&sm=module.org.erris.app.infra&ddpN=3245192760&we=a5ba74f6d75889ea8c62a266f3e019f6&wf=dGFCall&wtok=4840dcc633fc66ff0a154071763453311904b779&wtkps=JY3REkMwEEX/Zd+ZWBKsr0EiTGliU2J0+u8tfTsP557bUkHvQDIBmDQ0gWRGUDqhXec3xX49B+vJiozWrGKyMfoLO+tUcl+hn3RCfNxpP2algTTc+D2HyolskLi3SSlr8ccLs6RwGRi6LCWBrEUneplXehcokRhggqxv7yFfs0NimBxeptN6timhnkKaet9en9B8/kC&wchk=0eb62e01ecf2f7cd475e1e1e2d2ac21754c380a3>)

The research work of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) doctoral students is also conducted in specialized **Laboratories / research centers / equipment**. In UASVM in Iași there is a high-performance research infrastructure (https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/4_infrastructura-cercetare.html; Annex II.11) for conducting research in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), as well as a financial capacity to support the implementation of research and development projects, in accordance with the undertaken mission and objectives, as well as a favorable climate for research and scientific development. UASVM Iași supports the development of research centers and laboratories, around which doctoral schools have developed. The research infrastructure of UASVM Iași includes research centers / laboratories equipped with modern equipment, which allow for high-performance research in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) (Annex II.26; Annex II.27). 65

The research of doctoral students in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) also takes place in the laboratories of the disciplines that are equipped with high-performance equipment, computer technology, software, etc.

Library, access to international databases. UASVM from Iași has a modern Library, which operates based on the regulations of the University and its own Regulations (Annex II.55). The UASVM Iași library has 4 reading rooms with a total of 180 seats and a total area of 1,650 sqm, with the following structure: 2 reading rooms on the ground floor, with 120 seats and 16 computers with internet access; 1 reading room on the first floor, with 30 seats and 4 computers with internet access; 1 multimedia room on the 2nd floor, with 30 seats and 30 computers with internet access. At the level of UASVM disciplines / departments there are numerous other study and documentation rooms.

Through the UASVM Iași Library, students have free access to at least 8 general databases, with publications relevant to the field of Agronomy. Thus, through the facilities offered by the ANELIS Plus platform, from the UASVM Library in Iași (http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/10_biblioteca.html), a series of platforms - collections of scientific research journals relevant to the field of Agronomy, in full text format, or international bibliographic and bibliometric databases, such as (Anexe II/Anexa_II_56_ANELIS PLUS.pdf): Elsevier (<https://www.sciencedirect.com/>), SpringerLink (www.springerlink.com); Claryvate Analitics (<http://apps.webofknowledge.com/>), CaBI (<https://www.cabdirect.org/>).

Other relevant online databases for PhD students in the field of Agronomy accessible free of charge through the UASVM Iași Library are



(http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/10_biblioteca.html): Scopus (<https://www.scopus.com/search/form.uri?display=basic>); Cambridge Core (<https://www.cambridge.org/core>); SAGE Pub (<https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/students>), ResearchGATE (<https://www.researchgate.net/>).

The library's collections are encyclopedic and include books, courses, magazines, manuscripts, floppy disks, CDs, videotapes. The annual bibliographies of the documents entered in the Library, between the years 2006-2020, are available at <http://www.uaiasi.ro/biblioteca/>. The UASVM Iași Library provides a large number of subscriptions to Romanian and foreign publications and periodicals, corresponding to the assumed mission (Annex II.86). At the National and International Exchange and Cooperation Service, in 2016, they worked with 52 internal and 29 external partners, the publications obtained through exchange and donations being 879 library units (UB) (741 books 138 magazines), representing 639 titles (585 books, 54 magazines), in total amount of 32926.74 lei (Annex II.57). The library is part of the European Consortium of Libraries for Agricultural Sciences and Veterinary Medicine, as well as the Balkan Libraries Union (founding member).

Hardware and software resources. UASVM Iași has a Center for data and applied information communications (CCDIA) through which the hardware and software resources of the university are managed and exploited (Internet and Intranet network, applications and information systems for accounting, payroll, cashier, student records) and Advanced 3D Visualization Center, unique in higher education in Romania at the time of acquisition. Within the Advanced Visualization Center, objects and 3D scenarios specific to the activity profile and the general educational profile were developed. The team of developers also supported the promotion process of the University with the help of new pedagogical techniques and learning technologies through 3D virtual simulation programs. In 2011, the online collaboration platform integrated with the e-Learning system (Computer Assisted Learning) was created on the telepresence infrastructure with interactive 3D support, composed of a portal - accessible online for all system users, as a single access interface for the systems. collaboration and communication between users and for training management systems (LMS) and content management (LCMS), graphic stations and video projectors with the possibility of viewing 3D objects and telepresence systems. The platform was developed through the project POSDRU / 86/ 1.2 / S / 62723, entitled Online University Collaboration Network in order to develop the capacity to provide skills and competitiveness for the labor market. In order to carry out the didactic activities from the disciplines of informatics and technological design, 5 laboratories equipped with IT equipment of appropriate level are organized. UASVM has software corresponding single harmful disciplines of learning plans ATA jacketed license to use (Annex II.54).

The research infrastructure presented complies with the standards necessary for the activity of doctoral students. In the last 5 years, purchases of laboratory furniture, computers, apparatus' and equipment have been made. PhD students have access to IOSUD libraries and international databases.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access



for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.

UASVM Iași entered into collaboration agreements with universities abroad based on which it exploits in partnership parts of the research infrastructure (Annex II.113). The research infrastructure and the offer of research services are presented publicly through the platform <https://erris.gov.ro>

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator A.2.1.3. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.*

The endowment of the research infrastructure in OIDAS of UASVM Iași is currently at a level able to ensure scientific performances (Annex II.52; 52a; 53; 95). At the same time, there is the interest to develop this infrastructure by participating in domestic and international competitions, as a guarantee of obtaining outstanding scientific results. During the meetings, researchers and students mentioned that more funding is needed for new equipment and infrastructure. Annex_II_95a presents the use of OIDAS's own funding resources for the development of the research infrastructure in the last five years. Also, in Annex_II_109 are presented the research contracts coordinated by the doctoral supervisors, and the doctoral students were part of the research team.

The existing research infrastructure of OIDAS of UASVM Iași is state-of-the-art scientific equipment allowing high scientific performance. At the same time, by participating in domestic and international competitions, we are continuously seeking to develop and keep this infrastructure updated, the best example of which is the ROVETEMERG Center, funded from Structural Funds obtained through competition. The current academic Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) research infrastructure of OIDAS-UASVM Iași (which consists of research centers/laboratories endowed with highly performant hardware and software equipment and resources, etc.) fully allows the carrying out of research work, in line with the undertaken mission and objectives (Annex II.26; Annex II.27; Annex II.28). This is also possible thanks to access to international databases by means of the library of UASVM Iași (Annex II.25, Annex II.25a).

Here are the main research centers/laboratories used by our doctoral students and thesis advisors in the Veterinary Medicine field (DSVM) of OIDAS-UASVM Iași for their scientific research: **Laboratory of Veterinary Imaging, Laboratory of Parasitology and Parasitic Diseases, Laboratory of Reproduction and Reproductive Pathology, Laboratory of the Medical Clinic, Laboratory of Microbiology, Laboratory of Immunology, Laboratory of Histology and Embryology, Laboratory of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy** and the recently implemented ROVETEMERG Research Center. (Annex II.27) and on eerris.eu

The indicator is fulfilled.

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resource



Standard A.3.1. At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.

For the IOSUD, the activity of the doctoral supervisors, the degree of fulfillment of the minimum CNATDCU standards, and the international visibility of the teachers are analyzed through thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the USAVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral schools (as amended and re-submitted during and immediately after the visit period) as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel.

The doctoral schools address permanent concern with the quality of human resources with development of a Methodology on teaching and research positions (Annex_I_48), doctoral degree and doctoral degree (Annex_II_39) of the quality of doctoral supervisor obtained in educational institutes accredited abroad (Annex_II_38) which demonstrates the permanent interest in the quality of human resources in the field of doctoral studies. Doctoral supervisors are admitted to the doctoral school based on the criteria established by NCAADDC (teaching activity, research activity, scientific contribution, professional prestige). Within these criteria, special importance is given to research activity and scientific contribution, there is a methodology (Annex_II_62) and specific evaluation sheets (Annex_II_89 and Annex_II_90).

Performance Indicator * A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies⁴ does not exceed 20%.

The doctoral supervisors within DSES who coordinate at the same time more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12, during the doctoral studies, are not more than 20%, (Annex_II_102). In the case of Prof. PhD Cotea V. Valeriu, his total number of doctoral students is 15, but in the first 3 years there are only 8 doctoral students (Annex_II_79).

During the period subject to assessment (2016-2020), a total of **9** thesis advisors worked in the doctoral field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), who obtained this qualification in accordance with legal provisions. All 9 thesis advisors were/are affiliated to DSVM at the time of the in-house assessment report (Annex II.35; Annex II.36; Annex II.36a). All the thesis advisors currently affiliated to the Veterinary Medicine field (DSVM) (100%) meet all the minimum CNATDCU standards, which are necessary and mandatory for obtaining the certificate of habilitation, in force at the time of the assessment, and the mandatory minimum score required by the standards (Annex II.42; Annex II.42a). The score obtained by thesis advisors in the Veterinary Medicine field (DSVM) over the last 5 years exceeds the minimum mandatory score provided for by the standards in force for obtaining the certificate of habilitation (Annex II.42a).

The indicator is fulfilled.

⁴ 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. *At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

The doctoral supervisors within the fields managed by the doctoral school are persons who have obtained the right to supervise doctorates (Annex_II_92), according to the law, are holders within UASVM from Iași (Annex_II_80). The doctoral supervisors from the doctoral school within OIDAS guide the doctoral students only in the field for which they obtained this right (Annex_II_72 and Annex_II_78). All thesis advisors in the Veterinary Medicine field (DSVM) (100%) are tenured professors within OIDAS-UASVM Iași (Annex II.35).

The indicator is fulfilled

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

- *general description of the domain analysis.*

Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest

Standard B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance and are diversified as social representation and by gender.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the USAVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator * B.1.1.1. *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

In accordance with *the Doctoral Admission Regulations* (Annex II.24), *the Admission Methodology* (Annex II.25), *the Foreign Admission Methodology* (Annex II.26) and *the Doctoral Admission Procedure* (Annex II.27), the timetable is established. admission (Annex II.28), the number of places (Annex II.29) and the documents required to enter the competition (Annex II.30 ; Annex II.31 ; Annex II.32) are distributed. The admission contest, established by CDAS and the Doctoral School, takes place in the form of a colloquium, consisting of two tests, based on a specific topic and bibliography, announced by the doctoral supervisors, completed with an examination of linguistic competence for a language of international circulation. The selection of candidates, through the admission colloquium, is made by the colloquium commission.

- a. general knowledge in the doctoral field;
- b. presentation and substantiation of a research topic.

Candidates are assessed by the colloquium commission, with grades from 10 to 1, separately on the two tests, analyzing the level of knowledge of the doctoral field and the ability to take theoretical, experimental and methodological initiatives. The grade from the colloquium is calculated as the arithmetic mean of the



grades obtained in the two tests. The criteria for distinguishing between candidates are established on the basis of the following results:

- a. the arithmetic mean resulting from the averages of the years during the faculty and the one from the bachelor / final examination = 50%;
- b) grade of colloquium = 50%;

Admission to the doctorate is made in descending order of the averages obtained by the candidates in the admission competition, within the limit of the vacancies filled in the competition. The minimum admission average is 8.00. The doctoral supervisor proposes to the Doctoral School Council for approval, the admission of a number of doctoral students at most equal to the number of vacancies filled in the competition, based on a document regarding the competition situation.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.*

In the Regulation of the DSES/DSVM it is specified at art. 8, lit. c the support granted to doctoral students from disadvantaged social backgrounds by providing accommodation in the OIDAS-UASVM Iași dormitories and by granting social scholarships to doctoral students enrolled on a regular basis (Annex II.02).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iași of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

The training program for the first year of doctoral studies includes three **compulsory** subjects (DSVM and DSES), two (DSES) or four (DSVM) **specialized** disciplines, and a Scientific Research Project, all of which are relevant for the training of PhD students in scientific research (Annex II.47, 51, 59a, 82). **The**



compulsory subjects are represented by: Modern research methods, Career Management and Ethics and Academic Integrity (the latter was introduced in the curriculum starting with the academic year 2018-2019) (Annex II.51, 59a, 82). The discipline **Modern research methods** is intended for the in-depth study of the research methodology and / or statistical processing of experimental data (Annex II.51, 59a, 82). **The specialized disciplines** are chosen by the doctoral supervisor, in consultation with the doctoral student and the guiding committee, from a package of three disciplines relevant to the topic of the doctoral thesis (Annex II.51, 59a, 82).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

Starting with the univ. 2018-2019, in the training program of the first year of doctoral studies for the DSVM and DSES the course on Academic Ethics and Integrity was introduced as a compulsory subject (Annex II.59a; Annex II.51, also 122). Prior to this year, the topic related to Academic Ethics and Integrity was included in the discipline Career Management courses (Annex II.82).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities⁵.*

The competencies, skills and attitudes that doctoral students should acquire after completing the Training Program are defined in a general sense in **Art. 51** of the OIDAS-UASVM Iasi Regulation (Annex II.01) and **Art. 2** of the DSVM/DSES Regulation (Annex II.02) and are detailed in the Discipline Sheets (Annex II.51, 82a). These sheets are endorsed by the manager of the Doctoral School and approved by the manager of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CADS) (Annex II.82a).

Both the training program based on advanced academic studies and the research program are an integral part (as annexes) of the doctoral study contract (Annex II.59a), being undertaken by the doctoral supervisor and the doctoral student, endorsed by the Doctoral School Council and approved by the manager of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CADS).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

⁵ Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.



Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.

Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. *For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)*

The results of doctoral studies are disseminated in accordance with the specifics of the field of research, and are materialized in the participation of doctoral students in national and international conferences, publication of scientific papers in ISI-rated journals with impact factor, ISI indexed, in BDI international data, awards given to scientific papers of doctoral students, involvement of doctoral students (Annex_II_111), participation in scientific events (Annex_II_110). Each doctoral student has at least one paper presented at scientific events and published. The papers published by doctoral supervisors and doctoral students can also be found on the university website at:

http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/4rezultate_cercetare.html.

For each doctoral student who has obtained the title of doctor in the field of doctoral studies of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) in the last five years and whose title has been validated by CNATDCU, in Annex II.38a and Annex II.38b are presented the representative scientific information, alongside with other information, available also on the webpage https://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_teze_2021.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Criterion B.4. Quality of doctoral theses

Standard B.4.1. Doctoral theses fulfil high quality standards

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits.



Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. *At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.*

The theses defended within DSES/DSVM in the period 2015-2020 were appreciated with good, very good and excellent grades (Annex II.60). No doctoral thesis was resubmitted for the restoration and resumption of the public support process to the CNATDCU General Council. There was no report of doctoral theses invalidated by CNATDCU (Annex II.72).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

- *general description of domain analysis.*

Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

According to the Organization Chart, at the level of UASMV in Iași, the Department for Quality Assurance (DAC) and the Commission for Evaluation and Quality Assurance (CEAC) function (Annex I.31); at the level of each faculty, the Quality Evaluation and Assurance Commission, coordinated by a Quality Assurance Officer, carries out its activity. DAC operates based on the internal regulations of the University and its own organization and functioning regulation (Annex I.37), and CEAC based on the Quality Assurance Regulation in USAMV from Iași (Annex I.26) and its own organization and functioning regulation (Annex I.35). The Quality Assurance Department, together with the Quality Assurance Managers at each faculty, develops the general procedures of the quality management system, which is the basic documentation for implementing and maintaining the quality management system, as well as the operational procedures that specify the objectives and the expected results of the various activities affecting quality. The development of quality procedures envisages compliance with the requirements of ARACIS standards, as well as those specific to other national and international evaluation bodies. Through the activities carried out, all UASMV employees in Iași participate directly or indirectly in maintaining and improving quality.

Performance Indicator C.1.1.1. *The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

(a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;

(b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;

(c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;



d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.

IOSUD-USAMV from Iași has implemented and applies it constantly, the procedure of evaluation and internal monitoring of the evolution of doctoral schools, specified in chap. IX-Evaluation of doctoral schools and doctoral supervisors (Annex A.1.1.).

OIDAS developed and periodically applies methods for evaluation and internal monitoring of the activities within the doctoral schools (Annex_II_64). Mandatory evaluated criteria:

a) the scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors

OIDAS has developed a Methodology for self-evaluation of doctoral schools (Annex II.64), as well as a Methodology for internal evaluation of doctoral supervisors (Annex II.62; Annex II.63), drawing up self evaluation reports (Annex_II_91). Periodically, the doctoral supervisors are evaluated according to the NCAADDC criteria (Annex_II_90).

b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary for carrying out the research activity

The self-evaluation methods of the doctoral schools include at art. 4 the verification and improvement of the assets of UASVM from Iași as a tool for accomplishing the mission of the doctoral schools (Annex_II_64). In recent years, new research equipment was purchased (Annex_II_95a).

c) regulations and procedures based on which the doctoral studies are organized;

The self-evaluation methodology of the doctoral schools includes in art.4 the reference documents based on which the doctoral studies are organized (Annex_II_64). The OIDAS Regulation (Annex_II_01) and the regulations of the doctoral schools (Annex_II_02) stipulate that OIDAS organizes doctoral studies through the DSES and DSVM doctoral schools, according to the law. The internal evaluation of the doctoral study programs is initiated by the Council of the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences (Annex II.40), being carried out by applying the provisions of the Quality Assurance Regulation (Annex II.61) and of the Organization and Operation Procedure of the Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance of UAIASI.POM.04 (pg. 65 in Annex II.05). On the basis of the annual evaluation reports of Doctoral Schools (ex. activity report on doctoral studies (Annex II.66) which includes the analysis of the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors, the infrastructure and logistics necessary for conducting research, updating procedures and rules for organizing doctoral studies, etc. The analyzes and conclusions of this report, including recommendations for improving the quality of doctoral studies, are included in the UASVM Quality Assessment Report prepared by the Quality Assurance Department (Annex II.67), which is presented to the University Senate for approval. The monitoring of the implementation of the recommendations resulting from this analysis is performed by the Council for Doctoral Studies. The doctoral studies within IOSUD-USAMV from Iași are organized based on the following norms: the procedure for admission to the doctorate (Annex A.1.22.), instructions regarding the mediation and resolution of conflicts regarding the doctoral activity (Annex A.1.41.), norms of elaboration and drafting of doctoral theses (Annex A.1.50.), procedure for submitting and defending doctoral theses (Annex A.1.31.). The elements that define the Training Program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students are found in art. 19 (p. 1... 8) and art. 20 (pc. 1... .2) of the SDSI Regulation within IOSUD-USAMV from Iași (Annex A.1.2.).



d) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling made available to doctoral students

OIDAS provides social and academic support to doctoral students in terms of participation in various events, publication of articles (Annex_II_110), Erasmus + agreements (Annex_I_113), financial support for publication, mobility with academic and research institutions abroad (Annex_II_114). At the same time, doctoral students can also benefit from the services offered by the Career Counseling and Guidance Center (C.C.O.C.) of the university: http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/10_ccoc-doc.html

Overall impression is that the doctoral schools undergo constant development of the process of evaluation and internal assurance of its quality.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. *Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.*

According to the *Regulation for elections in OIDAS* (Annex II.06) of the *Methodology specific to elections* (Annex II.07) and of the *procedure* (Annex II.08) doctoral students have the right to be represented in CDAS and in the Doctoral Schools Council. In Annex II.12 presents the list of students voting in the last election in 2020. Annex II.14 are highlighted applications for CDAS students, and Annex II.15 the results voters in 2020. PhD students are represented in the Doctoral School Council, in the Council for Doctoral Studies (Annex II.40), and in the University Senate (Annex II. 68), thus having the possibility to address to the governing forums any requests and proposals regarding their needs, to increase the degree of satisfaction with the doctoral program as a whole, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative services offered

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.3. *Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.*

According to the *Regulation for elections in OIDAS* (Annex II.06) of the *Methodology specific to elections* (Annex II.07) and of the *procedure* (Annex II.08) doctoral students have the right to be represented in CDAS, and in the Doctoral Schools Council. In Annex II.12 presents the list of students voting in the last election in 2020. Annex II.12 presents the list of students voting in the last election in 2020. Annex II.14 highlights student council candidates doctoral schools, and Annex II.15 presents the results of the 2020 elections.



Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator * C.1.1.4. *Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.*

The current problems faced by doctoral students are addressed by them, in a hierarchical way, to the doctoral supervisor, members of the steering committee, secretariat, Doctoral School Council, Council for Doctoral Studies or Rector of the university, being solved operatively, at a level or another, as appropriate.

Currently, in the Council for Doctoral Studies, a specific procedure for collecting feedback from doctoral students is being finalized, by using a questionnaire to assess the satisfaction of doctoral students, needs analysis, etc., according to the model to the annex (Annex II.69). The doctoral supervisors are also consulted (Annex 69a), and following the analysis of the feedback, the CDAS Council establishes which will be the decisions that must be taken to improve the existing situation.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits. This particular standard was verified by visiting every listed link from the self-evaluation report.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- (a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation;*
- (b) the admission regulation;*
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*
- (e) the content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies;*
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor);*
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*
- (i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc.*



(j) links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.

OIDAS ensures the transparency of the selection and admission procedures for doctoral studies and guarantees access to information through various and accessible means, including through the website (http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_doctorat_DSES.html; Anexa II.70) providing the necessary information to the university community and the public. Citizens belonging to other states have access to doctoral studies within the doctoral schools within OIDAS, under the conditions provided by law.

a) OIDAS / doctoral school regulation

- - The institutional regulation for the organization and functioning of the doctoral study programs at UASVM Iași (http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2021/Regulament-OIDAS_2021 ; Anexa II.01)
- Regulations of the doctoral school ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2019/Regulament SD SI 2019](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2019/Regulament_SD_SI_2019) ; Anexa II.02)

b) the admission regulation;

- Doctoral admission regulations (<http://www.uaiasi.ro/admitere/files/doctorat/04-Regulament-admitere-doctorat> ; Anexa II.24)
- Methodology for conducting admission to UASVM Iași for the three cycles of university studies - bachelor, master, doctorate doctorat (http://www.uaiasi.ro/admitere/files/Metodologieadmitere_2021-2022 ; Anexa II.25),
- Procedure for organizing and conducting admission in the doctoral university cycle ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/Procedura 29 admitere-doctorat](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/Procedura_29_admitere-doctorat) ; pag. 688 - Procedure UAIASI.POB.29, in Anexa II.27
- admission conditions (<http://www.uaiasi.ro/admitere/doctorat.php>; Anexa II.30);

c) the doctoral studies contract

- The doctoral studies contract and its annexes
- budget financing with scholarship ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES Contract F-B 2020](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES_Contract_F-B_2020) ; Anexa II.41);
- budget financing, without scholarship (http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES_Contract_FR-B_2021.pdf Anexa II.42);
- with fee (http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES_Contract_FRT_2021.pdf Anexa II.43);
- annexes of the contracts (http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_doctorat_documente.html ; Anexa II.44)

d) the regulation for completing the studies including the procedure for public defense of the thesis;

- Methodology (<http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2021/Metodologiesustinere-teze-doctorat> ; Anexa II.37)



- Procedure (<http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7> doctorat procedura.html ; Anexa II.36);
- Norms for completing the studies that also include the procedure for public defense of the thesis [http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2016/Norme elaborare-redactare-tezadocdoctorat](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2016/Norme%20elaborare-redactare-tezadocdoctorat) ; Anexa II.36a.

e) the content of training programs based on advanced university studies

- The institutional regulation for the organization and functioning of the doctoral university study programs at UASVM Iași ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2021/Regulament-OIDAS 2021](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2021/Regulament-OIDAS%2021) ; Anexa II.01),
- Regulation of the DSES doctoral school ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2019/Regulament SD SI 2019](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2019/Regulament%20SD%20SI%202019) ; Anexa II.02)
- Contract for doctoral studies ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES Contract F-B 2020](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/contracte/DSES%20Contract%20F-B%202020))

f) the academic and scientific profile, the thematic areas / research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the school, as well as their institutional contact data;

- scientific profile <http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7> doctorat DSES.html; Anexa II.94
- the research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the school, as well as their institutional contact data
- <http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7> doctorat contact.html; și Anexa II.59;

g) the list of doctoral students in the school with the basic information

- ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/situatii/Situatie-doctoranzi 01-10-2020](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/situatii/Situatie-doctoranzi%2001-10-2020) ; Anexa II.102);

h) information about the elaboration standards of the doctoral thesis

- Norms regarding the elaboration and drafting of the doctoral thesis ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2016/Norme elaborare-redactare-teza-doctorat](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/doctorat/documente/2016/Norme%20elaborare-redactare-teza-doctorat) ; Anexa II.36a);

i) information on opportunities for doctoral students aimed at attending conferences, publishing articles, awarding scholarships, etc .;

- scientific events and publications of the university
<https://www.usamviasicongres.ro/>
http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=evenimente/manifestari_2020.html
<https://jurnalalse.com/>
<https://www.uaiasi.ro/revagrois/>
http://www.uaiasi.ro/revista_horti
<https://www.uaiasi.ro/zootehnie/revista.html>
- UASVM Iași library



http://www.uaiasi.ro/biblioteca/documente/ro/noutati/Webex-uri__iunie-2021.pdf
http://www.uaiasi.ro/biblioteca/index.php/ro/bd_Anelis-plus
- UASVM Iași International Relations Office
http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5_birou.html
- scholarships abroad
http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5_burse.html

j) links to abstracts of doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense
(http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7_teze_2018.html; Anexa II.71);

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. *All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*
- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled/partially fulfilled/not fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. *Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*
- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled/partially fulfilled/not fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*
- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Recommendations:



The indicator is fulfilled/partially fulfilled/not fulfilled.

Criterion C.3. Internationalization

Standard C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iasi of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel, and video calls and other photo/video information from remote visits. This particular standard was verified by visiting every listed link from the self-evaluation report.

Performance Indicator * C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

During the analyzed period (2015-2020), at the level of UASVM Iași on the DSES fields, a number of 61 mobility agreements were concluded targeting doctoral students and supervisors within the ERASMUS program with similar universities abroad, with research institutes or centers research (Anexa II.75 și Anexa II.113). All these mobility agreements can be consulted in Annex II.75 and Annex II.113, or on the web page of UASVM Iași, at the address: [http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5 programul erasmus-plus acord.html](http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5%20programul%20erasmus-plus%20acord.html) There are also 37 bilateral interuniversity agreements in the fields of DSES, in which doctoral students can also participate. These can be found at [http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5 agreements int.html](http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5%20agreements%20int.html) (Anexa_II_75a)

Compared to this number of students, a number of 12 students participated in the external mobilities carried out in the period 2016-2020 (ERASMUS or other mobilities) (Anexa II.114). The participations in international scientific conferences outside Romania were 57, of which 20 were in the field of Agronomy, 21 in the field of Horticulture, 14 in the field of Animal Husbandry and 2 in the field of IMADR (Anexa_II_110). To these can be added 117 participations in scientific events organized in Romania with international participation ((Anexa_II_110). It results that during this period out of the total of 462 interns (146 -Agronomy, 151 - Horticulture, 116 - Zootechnics and 34 IMADR) (Anexa_II_98) participated in training courses abroad or other forms of external mobility 69 students, which percentage 66 represents 14.93%. If we add the 117 participations in international events organized in Romania, the percentage is 40.26%. The number of students is not very high because with the Covid-19 pandemic they were banned from placements abroad, many scientific events being held online. In the OIDAS regulation chap. IV art. 15 it is stipulated that through doctoral schools financial support can be granted to doctoral students for internships abroad (Anexa_II_1).



In the last five years, there have been a number of **35** partnership agreements for the mobility of PhD students and teaching staff in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM), concluded within the ERASMUS + program or other partnerships with foreign universities, research institutes or companies carrying out activities in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM)

(http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/5_programul_erasmus-plus_acord.html). In the same period, a number 25 PhD students in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) performed **48** research or perfecting mobilities in ERASMUS, or other programs. (Annex II.60).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. *IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

In the OIDAS Regulation at chap. VI, art. 21 and art. 22 stipulates the organization of the doctorate in international co-supervision and the granting of financial support for this aspect (Anexa_II_1). Doctoral students in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) who had ERASMUS grants during 2016-2020 (Annex II.60) benefited from the guidance of international experts from the host institutions. Also, doctoral students participated in the presentations made by many external specialists/experts invited to the Congress with international participation organized annually by OIDAS-UASVM Iasi, on various topics in Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) (Annex II. 62).

In 2017, two professors from the University of South Bohemia in České Budějovice gave lectures to PhD students from DSES on: Influence of farming system on greenhouse gas emissions within cereal cultivation and, respectively, Agroecology development in Eastern Europe - Cases in Czech Republic and Slovakia (Annex II.117). In the doctoral specialization Viticulture and Oenology, doctoral supervisor Prof. Dr. Valeriu V. Cotea, was invited to give a presentation for PhD students, Professor Emeritus, Economist Mike Veseth from the International Political Economy at the University of Puget Sound in Tacoma, Washington, with the theme - The evolution of wine-growing potential of vineyards in the context of global warming - 2018 (Annex II.123). At the doctoral specialization Vegetable Farming, PhD supervisor Prof. PhD Vasile Stoleru was invited to give a presentation for doctoral students Michelina Ruocco, Gianluca Caruso - CNR Rome, Italy, with the topic - A new approach in using microorganisms in Horticulture - 2018 (Annex II.123).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator * C.3.1.3. *At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.*

In each of the doctoral schools of the IOSUD (DSES and DSVM) there are several published doctoral theses in English, as well as there is evidence of co-mentoring with international experts. However, it is



very difficult to extract exact numbers of published theses in Romanian vs foreign language, especially in context of international doctoral committee memberships. The self evaluation reports refer to annexes in Romanian and also to repositories in Romanian that are not easily (or not at all) readable by non-Romanian speaking reviewers. It is the opinion of this reviewer that a satisfactory number of checked dissertations have been drafted or submitted in English, as they refer or include the publications of dissertation results in international journals. However, it is not possible based on the available information to conclude if at least 10% of the theses in period between 2016-2020 is written in a foreign language. It appears yes, but without providing simple count (e.g. X theses total/ Y theses in foreign language) in the self evaluation reports or in annexes, it will remain a recommendation to do so.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees⁶ etc.).*

Doctoral students in the field of Veterinary Medicine (DSVM) who had ERASMUS scholarships between 2016 and 2020 (Annex II.60) enjoyed guidance from international experts from the host institutions. Doctoral students have also participated in presentations made by many foreign specialists/experts who were guests of the Congress with international participation held each year by OIDAS-UASVM Iasi on various topics in the Veterinary Medicine field (DSVM) (Annex II. 62). Total of 15 doctoral students have had international committee members (supervisory or defense) involved at the level of DSVM.

An international expert was recruited as a member of the steering committee of two PhD students in the field of Agronomy (Annex II.97a). In the field of doctoral studies in Horticulture, OIDAS-UASVM Iași entered into a collaboration agreement with the Department of Agricultural Sciences, University of Naples Federico II, Italy, represented by the Manager, Prof. Dr. Matteo Lorito, for a doctorate in cosupervision, doctoral student Carmen - Simona Caba (Inculeț), specialization in Vegetable Farming, PhD supervisor Prof. Dr. Vasile STOLERU (Annex II.124) In the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences, in the field of Horticulture (Scientific leader Prof. Dr. Valeriu Cotea) there were 2 PhD students in co-supervision with the University of Cordoba, Spain under the guidance of Prof. Dr. Rafael Andres Peinado Amores and Prof. Dr. Juan Jose Moreno -Vigara (Annex II.124).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

⁶ Doctoral studies are completed by presenting the doctoral thesis in public session in front of a committee whose members hear and judge the final public presentation of the thesis



Criterion C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity

Standard C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms

Thorough review and evaluation was conducted during preparation and visit to the UASVM Iași of the following: available self-report (Internal evaluation report) of the IOSUD doctoral; schools as well as applicable annexes, meetings with respective University and Domain contact personnel.

In IOSUD-UASVM Iași the main structure with direct attributions in the field of quality is the Commission for Evaluation and Quality Assurance (CEAC), established based on the decision of the Senate (Annex I.34). The Commission is constituted in accordance with the law, operating under its own regulation (Annex I.35), and its current structure is in accordance with the law regarding quality assurance in education. The operational management of the CEAC is ensured by a coordinator appointed by the rector. CEAC has responsibilities in the field of quality corresponding to the study programs of UASVM Iași. CEAC implements in organizational subdivisions the regulations and procedures specific to quality management, approved by the UASVM Iași Senate. The Department for Quality Assurance (DAC) is organized and operates in accordance with the provisions of the National Education Law no. 1/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions, the university charter, and the internal regulations of the university (Annex II.67).

Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. *IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:*

- *policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public postionings, studies, analyses or measures taken;*
- *practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;*

In IOSUD-UASVM Iași, there is the Code of University Ethics and Deontology (Annex I.13) which addresses the relations between all members of the academic community, as well as the Code of Rights and Obligations of the UASVM student (Annex II.50). There is also the Ethics Commission (Annex I.11) which operates according to its own regulations (Annex I.12) and which prepares an annual activity report (Annex I.14) which specifies the possible incidents regarding the violation of these normative acts.

- *practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;*

In accordance with the legal provisions, the evaluation of doctoral theses is done before the approval for the public defense of theses, using the anti - plagiarism programs recognized by the Ministry of Education and made available by UASVM Iași (www.sistemantiplagiat.ro) (Annex II.84). The doctoral student is the author of the doctoral thesis and takes responsibility for the correctness of the data and information



presented in the thesis and for the opinions and demonstrations expressed in the thesis, and the doctoral supervisor is responsible together with the thesis author for compliance with quality standards or professional ethics. Ensuring the originality of the content, according to the provisions of art. 170 of Law no. 1/2011 (Annex II.85). The doctoral theses together with their annexes are public documents and are also written in digital format. The summary of the doctoral thesis in Romanian and English is published on the UASVM Iași website (Annex II.71), and the thesis and its annexes are published on a website administered by the Ministry of Education in compliance with the laws in effect in the field of copyright. The capitalization of the copyright and / or of the industrial property rights over the original product or creation made within the doctoral academic study program at OIDAS UASVM Iași is made in accordance with the provisions of the legislation in the field (Annex II.51)

- *administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions;*

The doctoral university contract describes the rights and obligations as well as the totality of the conditions in which the doctoral academic studies are carried out within the doctoral schools from OIDAS UASVM Iași. Contracts for university type all forms et schooling (Annex II.41 ; Annex II.42 ; Annex II.43).

- *mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind;*

The foundation of the competitive performances of IOSUD-UASVM Iași is the organizational culture of excellence. Consequently, the development within the university of a culture of excellence characterized by creativity, deep involvement, flexibility and adaptability, attachment to the university, competition, cohesion, obtaining high scientific and educational performance is essential. The basis of this culture is a system of European values, focused on work, dedication, team spirit, fairness and high individual, organizational and social responsibility, appropriated by all members of the academic community. The design, implementation and continuous improvement of the Quality Management System in UASVM Iași was one of the priorities of the institution's management (Annex II.05). This concern was accentuated by the emergence of legislation in the field of quality education, when the university's Senate approved the establishment of the Quality Assurance Department (Annex II.37 and Annex II.36) and the Quality Assessment and Assurance Commission (Annex I.34 and Annex I.35), structural elements with responsibilities in the field of design, implementation, improvement, evaluation of the quality assurance system in the institution, both in education and research, and in institutional administration.

IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.

Reports of the bodies involved in quality assurance are published annually on the university's website. They are public documents accessible on the university's website (www.uaiasi.ro).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.



Performance Indicator C.4.1.2. *All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.*

In the last five years, there have been no proven accusations of plagiarism regarding the doctoral theses defended at OIDAS-UASVM Iași

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.3. *Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

In 2015 and 2017, respectively, there were notifications on the research reports prepared by a doctoral student. These were analyzed by the competent bodies and departments within UASVM Iași, respectively the University Ethics and Deontology Commission, the University Doctoral Studies Council and the Doctoral School of Engineering Sciences. As a result, the members of the commission proposed, based on art. 28 paragraph 1 letter (c) of the Rules of Procedure of the University Ethics and Ethics Commission, in conjunction with art. 5 paragraph 1 letter (a) of Annex 1 of the same Regulation and art. 319 of Law 1/2011 on National Education, sanctioning the doctoral student with a warning and canceling the doctoral student's reports, with the obligation to restore them ([http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/management/etica/Raport Comisie Etica 2017](http://www.uaiasi.ro/ro/files/management/etica/Raport%20Comisie%20Etica%202017)).

There have been no such situations at SDMV during the period under survey.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. *The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.*

There have been no CNADTCU decisions to withdraw the Ph.D. degree following plagiarism notifications. No thesis defended at OIDAS-UASVM Iași (SDMV) has been rejected by CNADTCU, during the last five years.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.5. *The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:*



- a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;
- b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;
- c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism.

As per the self-evaluation reports, there were no such measures to be taken on by IOSUD in the evaluation period. The IOSUD has all of the above options to implement as measures if the situation presents itself with necessity to prevent academic fraud cases. The DSMV regulations punish scientific fraud and plagiarism (Annex II.02). In the last five years, no thesis defended at IOSUD-UASVM Iași (DSES) has been rejected by CNATDCU. All 52 theses were accepted with grades: excellent 1 thesis (1.92%), very good 48 theses (92.31%) and good grade 3 theses (5.77%) (Annex II.60).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.6. *The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.*

This case did not exist at IOSUD-UASVM Iași (DSES/DSMV). In Annex II.96 are the decisions with the doctoral commissions of the 52 theses defended, all theses being accepted and validated by CNATDCU. References from other units to IOSUD-UASVM Iași are presented in Annex II.116. As there were no theses with charges of plagiarism, it was not necessary to restrict their appointment to doctoral commissions.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled/partially fulfilled/not fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. *IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).*

OIDAS-UASVM Iași does have such database. The website designed especially for defended doctoral theses contains the following information, classified by year and month: doctoral student’s CV, list of published works, thesis title, thesis abstract in Romanian and English, peer reviewer committee, place, date and time of thesis defense (<http://www.uaiasi.ro/index.php?lang=ro&pagina=pagini/7teze> 2020 .html

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled.



IV. SWOT Analysis

<u>Strengths:</u>	<u>Weaknesses:</u>
<p>USAMV Iași is a high-performing university that enjoys prestige among Romanian universities;</p> <p>Diverse educational offer, specific to the field at all three cycles of studies;</p> <p>ARACIS accreditation for all study programs: bachelor's, master's, doctorate;</p> <p>High-performing teaching and research staff, with meritorious activities in the field of professional training based on skills and abilities, but also in guiding the activity of doctoral students;</p> <p>Human resource represented by doctoral supervisors with proven skills in scientific research, in university management - a fundamental condition for conducting scientific research at a high scientific level;</p> <p>IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure that can support the development of activities specific to doctoral university studies;</p> <p>Consistent university library in terms of the number and diversity of books and publications, access to scientific literature in the field, databases provided free of charge to doctoral students;</p> <p>Effective communication with doctoral students;</p> <p>The existence of quality assurance policies and strategies targeting doctoral schools, as well as their fields;</p> <p>Existence of specific measures to promote professional ethics and deontology, avoidance of plagiarism;</p> <p>Transparency in the selection, admission and enrollment of students in doctoral university study programs;</p> <p>The university financially supports doctoral students for carrying out the scientific activity;</p> <p>The research directions are topical, and the results obtained have practical applicability.</p>	<p>Number of teachers / researchers from abroad who participate in the guidance commissions, respectively public defense of the doctoral theses of the doctoral schools could be increased;</p> <p>Doctorates in co-tutoring mode are not used, leading to low visibility of leading PhD teachers;</p> <p>Low number of foreign doctoral students;</p> <p>Publication of research results of PhD students in ISI listed journals should be improved;</p> <p>Few PhD students have benefited from training courses abroad or Erasmus-type mobility;</p>

<u>Opportunities:</u>	<u>Threats:</u>
<p>Increasing participation in international cooperation programs for doctoral students that offer doctoral students the opportunity to carry out training courses in the form of various external mobilities for their professional development;</p>	<p>The tendency of demographic decrease, with a negative impact on the dynamics of the number of students and the gradual increase of the costs that contribute to the lack of interest for university studies;</p>
<p>Increasing the degree of internationalization of doctoral studies based on the existing strategy at IOSUD-USAMV in Iasi;</p>	<p>Lack of interest in accessing doctoral training programs due to slowing down of the labor market;</p>
<p>The availability of the private sector to hire PhD students due to their skills, knowledge, etc. with consequences on the interest for doctoral studies and the facilitation of the collaboration between the university and companies (investments, additional financing, joint projects, possibility of financing doctoral students);</p>	<p>Decrease of the master's graduates who want to advance their professional training through doctoral studies;</p> <p>International competition for attracting students and the aggressive policy of European universities;</p>
<p>The possibility of collaboration with foreign research centers involved in the international network of agricultural research centers;</p>	<p>Reduced pay compared to the private sector;</p> <p>Low budget available for research and academia;</p>
<p>Development of new European programs such as "Life Long Learning" and e-Platforms that offer the possibility of doctoral theses in international co-supervision, as well as stimulating doctoral students to carry out external training courses;</p>	<p>Reduced research duration to 3 years which, in certain situations, does not allow the timely completion of doctoral theses.</p>
<p>Constant adaptation of research topics, in accordance with existing research directions at national and international level;</p>	
<p>Additional funding based on performance criteria, which also includes the results of doctoral students' research;</p>	
<p>Unlocking the potential for cross - border cooperation with Moldova republic.</p>	

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
1.	PI	<p>A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s):</p> <p>a) the internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulations for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies programs, the regulation(s) of Doctoral School(s);</p> <p>b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct;</p> <p>c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);</p> <p>d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;</p> <p>e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the regularity of meetings;</p> <p>f) the contract for doctoral studies;</p> <p>g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
2.	PI	<p>A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
3.	PI *	<p>A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
4.	PI	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
5.	CPI	A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
6.	PI	A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)	The indicator is fulfilled.	
7.	PI	A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
8.	PI	A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
9.	PI *	A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
10.	CPI	A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
11.	PI *	B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional	The indicator is fulfilled.	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.		
12.	PI	B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
13.	PI	B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
14.	PI	B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
15.	PI	B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
16.	PI	B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications,	The indicator is fulfilled.	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)		
17.	CPI	B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
18.	PI	C.1.1.1. The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory: a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity; c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized; d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
19.	PI	C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
20.	PI	C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
21.	PI *	C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate	The indicator is fulfilled.	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.		
22.	CPI	<p>C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation; b) the admission regulation; c) the doctoral studies contract; d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis; e) the content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies; f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data; g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor); h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis; i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc. j) links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation. 	The indicator is fulfilled.	
23.	CPI	C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
24.	PI	C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.	The indicator is fulfilled.	
25.	PI	C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	The indicator is fulfilled.	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
26.	PI *	<p>C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
27.	PI	<p>C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
28.	PI *	<p>C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
29.	PI	<p>C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
30.	PI	<p>C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public positionings, studies, analyses or measures taken; - practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as 	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		<p>well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community; - administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions; - mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind; <p>IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.</p>		
31.	PI	<p>C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
32.	PI	<p>C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	
33.	CPI	<p>C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.</p>	<p>The indicator is fulfilled.</p>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
34.	PI	<p>C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:</p> <p>a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;</p> <p>b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism;</p> <p>c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism.</p>	The indicator is fulfilled.	
35.	PI *	<p>C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.</p>	The indicator is fulfilled.	
36.	PI	<p>C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).</p>	The indicator is fulfilled.	

The recommendations contained in the report shall be resumed in the indicators’ analysis. Other general recommendations may be made that do not fit within a particular indicator.

VERY IMPORTANT!!! – *Each identified weakness must be correlated with at least one recommendation to improve the situation! No weakness can be identified without formulating at least one recommendation regarding the way it could be corrected!*



VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

After careful review of different information sources (self-evaluation reports, applicable annexes, meetings, video calls, web pages, and further clarifications) about the IOSUD of the UASVM Iași, the foreign evaluator Prof. Dušan Palić offers following comments and recommendations:

The overall organization of the evaluation by the ARACIS and UASVM Iași was excellent. Specifically the participation in the online meetings was exceptional, and very useful for international evaluators was availability of simultaneous translation. The schedule for the meetings was intense, especially if the colleagues were involved in more than one domain or in a domain in parallel with institutional level evaluation. While there are some components of in-person visit that make evaluators job easier, having video conferences is a viable alternative. Along the same lines, review of the research facilities and infrastructure is always better to be conducted in person, as video and photo materials can only get you so far. The ARACIS staff did a very good job to coordinate meetings with UASVM Iași representatives. I am satisfied with the evaluation process, and hope that future evaluations will have more in-person opportunities.

The colleagues representing the UASVM Iași have been very cooperative and trying to accommodate our questions within the limitations of the remote/video communication. I am very satisfied with their attitude and praise their openness and patience during the meetings.

Regarding the overall evaluation of the doctoral domains, and based on the reports of my colleagues in this evaluation, I am impressed by the infrastructure and facilities that are at student's disposal for practical and experimental parts of their doctoral work. I am also satisfied with the quality of doctoral work performed in previous 5 years, as the number of Q1/2 peer reviewed publications produced by the doctoral students is very good.

It is understood that number of doctoral students strongly depends on availability of funding, and it is especially important that UASVM Iași appears to have mechanisms of supporting doctoral students in different areas and providing finances for promoting student visibility and international connectivity. This was evidenced in significant number of doctoral students that have participated in Erasmus program exchanges. Considering available research center infrastructure and equipment, it appears that the material base for doctoral training is under-utilized. Therefore, my general recommendation is that UASVM Iași, possibly through coordination with the local or state government, increases effort toward expanding funding opportunities for doctoral students from Romania, and explore opportunities for recruitment of international doctoral students who would add to the diversity of the doctoral programs. Possible future venues for increasing doctoral student resources at national level are participation of the Romanian government in the program of EU Partnerships (https://ec.europa.eu/info/research-and-innovation/funding/funding-opportunities/funding-programmes-and-open-calls/horizon-europe/european-partnerships-horizon-europe/candidates-food-security_en)

Specific comments and recommendations for improvement are related to limitations of current quality control / quality assurance procedures and protocols. While it is not in the list of critical indicators, it is of importance to note that formal QA/QC procedures have to be continuously recorded and available for



review in format of scheduled meetings with written agendas, formal collection and circulation of meeting minutes and follow-up on action items associated with respective decisions. As mentioned in the report, the QA/QC structure is in place and the progress has been made to improve the processes. It is my suggestion to make a conscious effort to use the structure to document the QA/QC process in a more formal way, whenever it is possible.

With best regards,

Prof. Dr Dušan Palić,
LMU-Munich, Chair for Fish Diseases and Fisheries Biology

Munich, 05.10.2021