



The External Evaluation Report of the Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IOSUD)

"George Emil Palade" University of Medicine,
Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu
Mures (UMPhST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureș)

Raevschi Elena, international evaluator

9/18/2021



Contents:

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Recommendations
- VI. Conclusions

I. Introduction¹

The present report was performed as the result of the IOSUD level external evaluation of the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures in the period of 06-10 September 2021 based on terms of reference and methodology of ARACIS.

The total list of the IOSUD Experts was, as follows:

1. Prof. univ. dr. IANOȘ Ioan, the evaluation director;
2. Prof. univ. dr. MOGOANȚĂ Laurentiu, the Coordinator of the IOSUD committee;
3. Prof. univ. dr. RAEVSCHI Elena, international expert for IOSUD evaluation;
4. PETRILĂ Larisa-Maria, PhD student expert;
5. Prof.univ.dr. ION Daniela, IOSUD expert for BIOLOGICAL AND BIOMEDICAL SCIENCES - fundamental domain of science;
6. Prof. univ. dr. ing. TONȚ Gabriela, IOSUD expert for ENGINEERING SCIENCES - fundamental domain of science;
7. Prof.univ.dr. FELECAN Oliviu, IOSUD expert for HUMANITIES AND ARTS - fundamental domain of science;
8. Prof.univ.dr. PĂUN Paul Andrei, IOSUD expert for MATHEMATICS AND NATURAL SCIENCES - fundamental domain of science.

George Emil Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureș (UMPhST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureș) is a higher education institution dedicated to teaching, learning and research, with study programs in Romanian, Hungarian and English, integrated into the European system of higher education.

The Institute of Medicine and Pharmacy of Târgu Mureș was established after the Decision of the Council of Ministers, no. 1160 of August 3, 1945. In 1991, the Institute of Medicine and Pharmacy of Târgu Mureș became University of Medicine and Pharmacy. The University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology of Târgu Mureș was established by Government Decision no. 735 of September 13, 2018, as a result of the merger by absorption between the University of Medicine and Pharmacy of Tîrgu Mureș and the "Petru Maior" University of Tîrgu Mureș. According to the Government Decision no. 707/2019, published in the Monitorul Oficial, no.795 of October 1, 2019, Part I, the University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureș, changes its name to „George Emil Palade” University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureș.

¹ Each time when applicable the information shall be presented genderwise



The Institution for Organizing University Doctoral Studies (IOSUD) within UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş was formed by the merger of the Doctoral Schools of UMPH and UPM.

IOSUD organizes and coordinates scientific doctoral programs, of 4 and 3 years, in the form of full-time. Within the IOSUD, doctoral studies are offered by two Doctoral Schools: The Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy (SDMF) for Medicine, Dentistry and Pharmacy and the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences (SDLS) for Philology, History, Computer Science, Engineering and management.

IOSUD is led by the Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD) as a collective governing body, and the two Doctoral Schools are led by the Doctoral School Council (CSD). The structure of the three Councils follows the legal provisions of the Code of doctoral studies and the Institutional Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/UMFST-REG-06.pdf. IOSUD is led by a director whose appointment has met the requirements of the legal methodology: https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/doctorate/concurs/2017/Decizie_Director_CSUD.pdf

On September 30, 2020 the IOSUD noted a total of 99 doctoral advisors, 78 from the Medicine and Pharmacy Doctoral School and 21 from the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences (SDLS).

At the end of the academic year 2019/2020, the number of 229 of doctoral students of the Medicine and Pharmacy Doctoral School were registered and 73 from SDLS.

The Internal Quality assurance system of UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş are based on all legal requirements on the awareness regarding the quality and the ISO 9001:2015.

II. Methods used

The evaluation activities were performed according the timetable of the institutional evaluation visit – IOSUD at the George Emil Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureş for the period of 06-10 September 2021. On the preparation period was analyzed The Internal Evaluation Report IOSUD George Emil Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureş (74 pages) and its annexes (n^o36).

Along with that were analyzed documents, data and information available on the IOSUD / Doctoral Schools website.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of self-assessment Internal Evaluation Report, meetings were held with:

- Representatives of the Institution
- Representatives of the CSUD and the Doctoral School
- Doctoral study medical field coordinator
- Academic staff members who are Doctoral advisors
- Members of Ethics Commission
- Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance
- Doctoral students
- Graduates of Doctoral program in Medicine
- Directors of the research centers/laboratories
- Doctoral schools' Council in Medicine doctoral study domain
- Employers of Doctoral graduates.



III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

- general description of the domain analysis.

The institutional capacity of the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures (UMFST) as IOSUD was found as a compliant field.

Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources

Standard A.1.1. *The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

- general description of the standard analysis.

The George Emil Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures (UMPhST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş) as IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the implementation of the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1. *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s):*

"George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures (UMFST) elaborated according with the legal regulations in place, approved by the Senate of the University and posted on the web page of the Institution:

(a) the internal regulations of the at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s) (Senate Decision No 12 of 15 January 2019);

(b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct; (Approved Senate 01/15/2019)

(c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies) – Operational procedure approved 04/29/2021

(d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad; – Operational procedure approved 12/02/2019

(e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the *regularity of meetings*;

(f) the contract for doctoral studies;

(g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.

The mentioned above specific regulations (a-g) are formulated in accordance with the National and International Regulations and are applied accordingly.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled



Performance Indicator A.1.1.2. *The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The IOSUD institutional Regulation and Regulation for the organization and functioning of the Doctoral School Regulation establish the way in which the doctoral study programs are organized within the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures doctoral schools.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The IOSUD institutional Regulation and Regulation for the organization and functioning of the Doctoral School regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions, as follows:

- a) acceptance of new thesis supervisors and the manner whereby a thesis supervisor may be excluded from the doctoral school;
- b) mechanisms for deciding on the adequacy, make-up and contents of the advanced university studies programme;
- c) procedures for replacing a doctoral student's thesis supervisor and conflict mediation procedures;
- d) conditions for interrupting a doctoral programme;
- e) means for preventing research fraud, including plagiarism;
- f) providing access to research resources;
- g) doctoral students' attendance requirements, based on a methodology developed by the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sports.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator* A.1.1.3². *Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD's Doctoral Schools are organized on disciplines and interdisciplinary disciplines or themes according to the legislation in force.

² The indicators marked with an asterisk (*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral schools, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation In case they are not fulfilled, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies.



- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The topics of the doctoral theses have an interdisciplinary character and the interdisciplinarity of research topics is highlighted by jointly supervised doctorates, organized between study domains.

Recommendations: To increase the interdisciplinary research between the fields of the two doctoral schools, especially the Biological and Biomedical Sciences fundamental domain and Informatics.

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures as IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the presence of the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

Performance Indicator A.1.2.1. *The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

"George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures has an integrated software in order to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background (Annex 41-00-13 Internal Report).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

"George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures integrated software provides real-time analysis and synthesis information needed in the decision-making process based on evidence about:

- 1) Academic Organization
- 2) Admission of Candidates
- 3) Web Teachers
- 4) Scholarships
- 5) Examinations
- 6) Administration
- 7) Export RMU
- 8) Reports and Analyses
- 9) Fees

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.1.2.2. *The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*



- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

"George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures are applying the following software for verifying the similarity percentage of doctoral theses: by using the official System sistemeantiplagiat.ro (Annex 41-00-14 Internal Report).

Out of a total of 183 doctoral students, 100% were accepted for the defence of doctoral theses, as a result of the anti-plagiarism check. (Annex 41-00-15, Internal Report)

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD of UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş strongly promotes a pro-active attitude regarding the prevention of fraud in Research by detection of:

- ▶ Data fabrication
- ▶ Counterfeiting
- ▶ Plagiarism (is regulated additionally by https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/UMFST-REG-81.pdf)
- ▶ Conflict of interes - is done in accordance with the UMPHST policy and is regulated by the Code of Ethics and Professional Conduct
https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/UMFSTREG-02.pdf respectively the Regulation of the Ethics Commission of UMPHST
https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/UMFST-REG-22.pdf

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

Performance Indicator A.2.1.1. *The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The situation of the spaces made available to SDMF is presented in Annex 41-00-16 of Internal Report. For each of the 3 accredited fields, in addition to the central building of UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş, there are both spaces and research infrastructure being represented mainly by:

- ▶ Centre for Advanced Medical and Pharmaceutical Research (CCAMF)
- ▶ Centre for Advanced Medical and Pharmaceutical Research
- ▶ Scientific Research and Technological Development Unit
- ▶ Centres, laboratories, the Experimental Station, the Biobase (Laboratory of Diagnosis and Translational Research in Infections, with molecular diagnostic equipment for PCR syndromic diagnosis, Centre for Experimental Studies, Simulation and Practical Skills Centre)



- ▶ Pharmaceutical Research Centre
- ▶ Integrated Centre for Pharmaceutical Education - Botanical Garden
- ▶ Integrated Centre for Dentistry- CIMD Simulation Centre

In the University there are laboratories and research centres that can be found on the ERRIS platform.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the functionality and services quality of the mentioned above infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.2. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD is an integral part of the UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş's institutional agreements signed with other academic institutions, prestigious research institutes and centers.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The UMPHST G.E. Palade provides the access for using laboratories and research centers that have state-of-the-art equipment. UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş offers doctoral students the opportunity to conduct research within the doctoral program in laboratories and relevant centers at the national level and the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform, as well as internationally in ERRIS platform.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.2.1.3. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD offers doctoral advisors the opportunity to develop the research infrastructure by applying and winning national and international institutional grants. Within the IOSUD there are 14 ongoing research grants. In the past 5 years, 45 research grants, won by doctoral advisors, have been completed.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

In the last 5 years, according to the specific standards of high-performance education, modern research equipments and softwares were purchased through research grants.



Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resource

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures as IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the sufficiency of qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.

Performance Indicator * A.3.1.1. *The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies³ does not exceed 20%.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy, as of September 30, 2020, the share of doctoral advisors who coordinate more than 8 Doctoral students, but not more than 12, at the same time is 8.97% according to Annex 41-00-20 from the Internal Report.

Within the The Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences, the share of doctoral advisors who coordinate more than 8 Doctoral students, but not more than 12 is 14% according to Annex 41-00-21 from the Internal Report.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Witin the both Doctorals Schools of The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD, the share of doctoral advisors who coordinate more than 8 Doctoral students, but not more than 12 is less than 20%.

Recommendations: To strength continuously the HR strategy for Research motivating and involving young researchers in Doctoral School activities.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator A.3.1.2. *At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy, 73.07% of the doctoral advisors are active and tenure holders, employed with an indefinite employment contract within UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureş.

³ 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.



Within the The Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences, 68% of the teaching and research staff involved in academic and research activities related to the program of advanced university studies or to the individual scientific research programs are employed with an indefinite employment contract.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Witin the both Doctorals Schools of The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD, the proportion of teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD are more than 50%.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

- *general description of the domain analysis.*

The educational effectiveness of the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD was found as a compliant field.

Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest

Standard B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance and are diversified as social representation and by gender.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The educational effectiveness of the The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD was found as a compliant field.

Performance Indicator * B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

UMPhST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureș's procedure of admission to doctoral studies includes:a practical test, an interview to present a research project on a subject accepted by the doctoral advisor according to the specialized domain and the evaluation of the professional and scientific activity of candidates.

The admission procedure of the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences consists of two tests: a written test and an oral test (interview).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Admission to doctoral study programs is organized according to the Code of doctoral university studies, approved by Government Decision no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions and the Regulation on the organization and conduct of doctoral studies at the UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg. Mureș's IOSUD.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.1.1.2. *The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Candidates from disadvantaged social backgrounds, whose income per household member doesn't exceed the minimum basic salary, benefit from a 50% reduction of the registration fees for doctoral studies (Annex 41-00-23 from Internal Report). SDMF also gives citizens belonging to Roma Minority and to other ethnic groups the possibility to enroll in a doctoral program on special positions granted by MEC.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD fulfilled the requirements of the indicator in question

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Performance Indicator B.2.1.1. *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The doctoral study program is carried out according to the curriculum approved by the University Senate. The training program based on advanced university studies contains relevant mandatory disciplines for the scientific training of doctoral students: Biostatistical basics in medical research, Clinical research methodology, Management of research projects, Fundamental and preclinical scientific research).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The training program based on advanced academic studies includes necessary number of disciplines relevant to the scientific research training.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled



Performance Indicator B.2.1.2. *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The training program based on advanced university studies includes a discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property, namely Ethics and academic integrity. (Annex 41-00-26 from Internal Report).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD doctoral schols training program include one discipline dedicated to Ethics and academic integrity in scientific research.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator B.2.1.3. *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities⁴.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All mandatory disciplines for the scientific training of doctoral students are provided according to their Curriculums.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The Curriculums are specifying the knowledge and skills that doctoral students must acquire after completing each discipline. <https://www.umfst.ro/doctorat/scoala-doctorala-de-litera-stiinte-umaniste-si-aplicate/studenti-doctoranzil/fisele-disciplinelor.html>

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

Standard B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm that Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer.

⁴ Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.



Performance Indicator B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)

- description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy there are a number of initiatives regarding the quality of the doctoral studies' results. Relevant articles are published in ISI-rated journals with impact factor and in national and international BDI journals and students participate with oral presentations and posters at national and international conferences. Doctoral students can participate to the internal grant competition as project coordinators or members of the research team.

At the level of the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences, scientific research is capitalized by presenting papers at conferences, congresses, symposia, and by publishing studies in BDI indexed journals or in collective volumes.

- analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

For both doctoral schools of The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD were found mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.4. Quality of doctoral theses

Standard B.4.1. Doctoral theses fulfil high quality standards

- general description of the standard analysis.

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to demonstrate the high quality of completed doctoral thesis.

Performance Indicator B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.

- description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy the criterion is fulfilled. None of the 120 theses publicly defended in the last 5 years have been invalidated by CNATDCU.

- analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

There is no non-validated thesis at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled



Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

- *general description of domain analysis*

The Quality management is performed based on ISO 9001:2015 and legislation in force.

Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

It was identified institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies of "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD which are applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.

Performance Indicator *C.1.1.1. *The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Doctoral advisors are regularly assessed, in accordance with the legislation in force. There are three major research centres: CCAMF, Integrated Centre for Dentistry- Simulation Centre CIMD, Integrated Centre for Pharmaceutical Education - Botanical Garden.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The organization of doctoral studies within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy is done according to the procedures developed based on the national legislation: Institutional Regulation of IOSUD of Organization and Conduct of University Doctoral Studies, Regulation of Organization and Functioning of The Doctoral Schools within The IOSUD, Operational Procedure Regarding the Admission Process for University Doctoral Studies, Operational Procedure Regarding The Conduct of University Doctoral Studies, Operational Procedure Regarding The Completion of University Doctoral Studies within IOSUD. All mentioned documents are dedicated to assure continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.2. *Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral studnets having the right of electing or being elected.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*



In "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD the methodology for election is public and can be consulted at: https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/UMFSTREG-64.pdf.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The proportion of doctoral students in CSUD is 20%, being based on the legal provisions elaborated by M.E.C., assuring the universal vote, direct and secret, providing to all doctoral students the right of electing or being elected.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.1.1.3. *Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD organizes elections among doctoral students, for positions in the Doctoral School Council. All doctoral students have the right to vote and to be elected (throughout the entire doctoral program, this right ending at the date of the doctoral thesis defence).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The elections took place according to the legislation in force and the results were recorded in the minutes. <https://www.umfst.ro/doctorat/noutati/2016/alegeri-IOSUD-si-scoala-doctorala.html>

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator * C.1.1.4. *Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

In order to identify the level of satisfaction of doctoral students regarding the doctoral program, SDMF prepared a questionnaire to measure satisfaction with the services provided. The questionnaire consisted of 11 items. (Annex 41-00-30 from Internal Report of IOSUD)

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The analyses provided by institution is based on the one survey of 43 participants (all of them are doctoral students from Medicine domain) that do not allowed to analyze the dynamics of satisfaction during the evaluation period of 5 years. As well as, other beneficiary (than doctoral students): graduates, academic staff, and employers were not considered in the analyses provided in the Internal Report. In additional discussions was found that mentioned beneficiary are evaluated.



Recommendations: It is recommended to increase the participation rate of satisfaction evaluation survey, involving all doctoral study domains. To ensure the systematic analysis of the dynamics of the satisfaction level for the period of 5 years in the annual Internal reports.

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources

Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD provided all necessary evidences covering the requirements of interest information to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information being available for electronic format consultation.

Performance Indicator C.2.1.1. *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

- (a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation;*
- (b) the admission regulation;*
- (c) the doctoral studies contract;*
- (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*
- (e) the content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies;*
- (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*
- (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor);*
- (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*
- (i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc.*
- (j) links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD is publishing on the website the documents specified in points (a-i)

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The documents published on the website of the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD are considered the proof for points (a-i).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*



The "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Sciences and Technology from Targu Mures IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to demonstrate the presence of the access for doctoral students to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. *All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All doctoral students are enabled, via their institutional email accounts, with access to online platforms of relevant academic databases for each doctoral field.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. *Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Each doctoral student, subsequent to the approval of the doctoral advisor, has access to the electronic system of plagiarism checking: sistemeantiplagiat.ro approved and countersigned by the Ministry of Education and Research in 2016.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Each doctoral student have access, upon request, to the electronic system (sistemeantiplagiat.ro) for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works according the Anti-Plagiarism Regulation of the "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureş,

https://www.U.M.F.S.T..ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/regulamente/U.M.F.S.T.-REG-81.pdf

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. *All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities within the interdisciplinary Doctoral Schools according the affiliated domiane.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The access of doctoral students to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending in the domain within the IOSUD Doctoral Schools are provided according to the internal Regulation. The



access of doctoral students to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending in the domain of Medicine within the Doctoral School are provided according to the internal Regulation is a part of the ERRIS platform.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion C.3. Internationalization

Standard C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

The IOSUD "George Emil Palade" University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureş, provided all necessary evidences in order to proof the application of strategy to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator *C.3.1.1. *IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, wich is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

UMPhST G. E. Palade Tg. Mureş encourages and supports international programs such as Erasmus +, Leonardo da Vinci, CEEPUS, RECIF, etc., and their achievement is ensured by the activity carried out within the Department of International Relations, with which IOSUD has a fruitful collaboration. During the evaluated period, doctoral students have published annually 58 articles as first authors. International visibility is one of the key priorities of IOSUD. (Annex 41-00-17 from Internal Report).

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

There is 36,76% of doctoral students have completed a training course or another form of mobility abroad, such as participation in international scientific conferences. (Annex 41-00-31 form Internal Report).

Recommendations: It is recommended to increase the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad to ensure continously the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.3.1.2. *IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Annually, 4 doctoral students admitted to tuition places, in international jointly supervised doctorates, benefit from the financing of the tuition fee by the University. The funding is granted considering the



position of the partner university in the Shanghai ranking of universities. (Annex 41-00-32 from Internal Report). At the same time, in order to stimulate research in international jointly supervised doctorates, candidates who prove enrollment through international jointly supervised doctorates, benefit from a 5% bonus, added to the admission final score for doctoral studies, according to the Admission Procedure. A number of 24 Doctoral students are enrolled in international joint supervision, with annual mobilities at joint supervision university centres. A number of 26 of personalities have visited IOSUD in recent years, and some of them have teaching activities within the training program of the first doctoral year.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Aware of the importance of international collaboration, IOSUD encourages doctoral students applying for jointly supervised doctorates assuring the quality improvement of performed research.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator * C.3.1.3. *At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy, during the evaluated period, 31 theses (13.53%) were written and defended in a language of international circulation, or carried out in jointly supervised doctorates. (Annex 41-00-34 from Internal Report). Within the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences, in the evaluated period no theses were defended.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Within the Doctoral School of Medicine and Pharmacy, during the evaluated period, 13.53% of theses vs. required 10% were written and defended in a language of international circulation, or carried out in jointly supervised doctorates. Within the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences, in the evaluated period no theses were defended vs. required 10%

Recommendations: It is recommended to increase the number of doctoral theses organised in international co-tutelage, especially in case of the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences.

The indicator is partially fulfilled.

Performance Indicator C.3.1.4. *The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees⁵ etc.).*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

⁵ Doctoral studies are completed by presenting the doctoral thesis in public session in front of a committee whose members hear and judge the final public presentation of the thesis



IOSUD/The Doctoral School has an institutionally funded, secure online platform for international jointly supervised doctorates specific activities. This platform allows permanent interaction between doctoral students and co-advisors or members of the supervision committees from abroad. IOSUD has a Procedure for the recognition of doctoral diplomas, respectively of the quality of doctoral advisor, which facilitates the integration of researchers from abroad in the Doctoral School.

https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/proceduri/PCUe/UMFST-PO-SDR-10.pdf

https://www.umfst.ro/fileadmin/documente_oficiale/proceduri/PCUe/UMFST-PO-SDR-07.pdf

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD provided the evidences confirming the concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees⁶ etc.).

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity

Standard C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms

- *general description of the standard analysis.*

IOSUD/The Doctoral School provided all necessary evidences in order to proof the existence of functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms.

Performance Indicator C.4.1.1. *IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:*

- *policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public postionings, studies, analyses or measures taken;*
- *practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students;*
- *practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community;*
- *administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions;*
- *mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind;*

IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

⁶ Doctoral studies are completed by presenting the doctoral thesis in public session in front of a committee whose members hear and judge the final public presentation of the thesis



IOSUD applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed the requirements according the points specified by PI in question.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to proof the requerements according the points specified by PI in question.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.2. *All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

For complaints regarding plagiarism, IOSUD has internal procedures in order to analyse the existing theses in the institution's library on the basis of which the doctor title was granted.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The mentioned internal procedure respect the requirement of the PI in question.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.3. *Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-intiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

The annual reports of the IOSUD's Ethics Committee contain information on the status of each case in which there has been a relevant notification for doctoral studies regarding some norms and ethical aspects. The information is posted on the University's website at:

<https://www.umfst.ro/universitate/comisii-de-etica/comisia-de-etica-sideontologie/decizii-ale-comisiei-de-etica.html>

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to proof the requerements according the points specified by PI in question.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.4. *The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.*



- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD has implemented institutional measures, in accordance with the legislation in force, addressed to the doctoral advisors who coordinated one or more doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the doctor title for non-compliance with professional ethics standards, including plagiarism.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All the measures are mentioned within the Procedure regarding the measures taken by I.O.S.U.D, following the revoking of a doctoral degree by the Ministry of Education and Research, code UMFST-PO-SDR-11.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.5. *The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:*

- Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;*
- Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism;*
- Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

IOSUD has implemented institutional measures, in accordance with the legislation in force, addressed to the doctoral advisors who coordinated one or more doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the doctor title for non-compliance with professional ethics standards, including plagiarism.

- *analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

All the measures are mentioned taken by I.O.S.U.D, following the revoking of a doctoral degree by the Ministry of Education and Research, code UMFST-PO-SDR-11.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator *C.4.1.6. *The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.*

Within IOSUD there were no doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the title of doctor for plagiarism.



- analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

Within IOSUD there were no doctoral theses with a final decision to withdraw the title of doctor for plagiarism. There is a regulation on this.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

Performance Indicator C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).

- description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

Details regarding the public defence of theses elaborated within IOSUD can be accessed on the institutional website of UMPHST G.E. Palade Tg Mureş at: <https://www.umfst.ro/doctorat/sustineri-teze-de-doctorat.html>.

- analysis of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.

The doctoral thesis can be accessed in full format, with a copyright protection license, on the REI platform. The platform is administrated by the Ministry of Education and Research <https://rei.gov.ro/teze-doctorat>.

Recommendations:

The indicator is fulfilled

IV. SWOT Analysis

Strengths:

1. The existence of institutional capacity based on modern research infrastructure and quality of human resources;
2. The program based on advanced university studies;
3. Interdisciplinarity of the University;
4. Implementation of Quality management System Standard (ISO 9001:2015).

Weaknesses:

1. Lack of research in the international co-tutelage in the Humanities and Arts fundamental domain of science.

Opportunities:

1. Development of international visibility of Doctoral school activities;
2. Local and national decision makers communication;
3. Implementation of Open Sciences approaches;
4. The European Commission recognition: the 'HR Excellence in Research' Award.

Threats:

1. Migration of young researchers due to country economic situation.

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
1.	PI	A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s): a) the internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulations for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies programs, the regulation(s) of Doctoral School(s); b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct; c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies); d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad; e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the regularity of meetings; f) the contract for doctoral studies; g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
2.	PI	A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
3.	PI *	A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	To increase the interdisciplinary research between the fields of the two doctoral schools, especially the Biological and Biomedical Sciences fundamental domain and Informatics.
4.	PI	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
5.	CPI	A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.		
6.	PI	A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of possessing or having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
7.	PI	A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
8.	PI	A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
9.	PI *	A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies does not exceed 20%.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	To strength continuously the HR strategy for Research motivating and involving young researchers in Doctoral School activities.
10.	CPI	A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
11.	PI *	B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
12.	PI	B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organising support programs to prevent drop-outs.		
13.	PI	B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
14.	PI	B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
15.	PI	B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses “the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
16.	PI	B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorification of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.)	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
17.	CPI	B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non-validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.		
18.	PI *	<p>C.1.1.1. The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity; c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized; d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publication of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students. 	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
19.	PI	<p>C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
20.	PI	<p>C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organise elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
21.	PI *	<p>C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	It is recommended to increase the participation rate of satisfaction evaluation survey, involving all doctoral study domains. To ensure the systematic analysis of the dynamics of the satisfaction level for the period of 5 years in the annual Internal reports.
22.	CPI	<p>C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation; b) the admission regulation; 	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		c) the doctoral studies contract; d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis; e) the content of the training study program based on advanced academic studies; f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data; g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor); h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis; i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc. j) links to the doctoral theses's summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.		
23.	CPI	C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of the their thesis.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
24.	PI	C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
25.	PI	C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
26.	PI *	C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, wich is the target at the level of the European Higher	<i>Fulfilled</i>	It is recommended to increase the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad to ensure continously the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		Education Area.		
27.	PI	C.3.1.2. IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
28.	PI *	C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organised in international co-tutelage.	<i>Partially Fulfilled</i>	It is recommended to increase the number of doctoral theses organised in international co-tutelage, especially in case of the Doctoral School of Letters, Humanities and Applied Sciences.
29.	PI	C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
30.	PI	<p>C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public positionings, studies, analyses or measures taken; - practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, from an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students; - practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community; - administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions; - mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind; <p>IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
31.	PI*	C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analysed and resolved by the IOSUD	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received.		
32.	PI*	C.4.1.3. Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own-initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
33.	CPI	C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
34.	PI*	C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be: a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism; b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism; c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	
35.	PI*	C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers members in the commissions for public defense of two or more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the "doctor" title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defence of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	



No.	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
36.	PI	C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).	<i>Fulfilled</i>	

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

Raevschi Elena,

ARACIS International evaluator ,

MD, PhD habilitate, MPH, Associate professor,

Head of the Research Department,

Head of the Department of Social Medicine and Health Management,

Nicolae Testemitanu State University of Medicine and Pharmacy of the Republic of Moldova