ROMANIAN AGENCY FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN HIGHER EDUCATION
*Full member of the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education - **ENQA***
*Listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education - **EQAR***

Annex No. 3

The External Evaluation Report of an Institution Organizing Doctoral Study Programs (IOSUD)

Contents
I. Introduction
II. Methods used
III. Analysis of performance indicators
IV. SWOT Analysis
V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations
VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

I. Introduction[1]

This doctoral review was conducted from 6 September 2021 to 10 September by nine members of the academic community both from inside and outside of the country. The objective was to conduct an internal evaluartion of the doctoral degree program at "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy. Thi Academy operates Institution Organising University Doctoral Studies (IOSUD ANIMV) under the provisions of the Law of National Education no. 1/2011, Law no. 288/2004 on organising university studies, Law no. 87/2006 on education quality assurance, Government Decision no. 681/2011 for the approval of the Doctoral Studies Code, Government Decision no. 966 of 01.10.2011 and MEC Order no. 667/28.03.2007, based on which ANIMV was accredited as IOSUD. University doctoral studies are the third cycle of university studies offered by ANIMV, whose aim is to develop competent human resources in the field of intelligence and national security, able to accede to the high qualification labour market, involving university teaching activities, scientific research activities, research, development and innovation activities. Doctoral studies ensure the acquisition of knowledge specific to the 8th level of the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF), and of the National Qualifications Framework (CNC), for the highest level in a professional or study field; ensure the acquisition of skills, and advanced and specialised techniques, including synthesis and evaluation skills, necessary to address critical research and/or innovation issues and to extend and redefine the existing knowledge and professional procedures; give the opportunity to prove a high level of authority, innovation, autonomy, scientific and professional integrity, and of a determined pledge to develop new ideas or processes in the vanguard of either a work instance or of a study and research instance. For

---

[1] Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.

conducting doctoral studies, IOSUD ANIMV operates Doctoral Studies Council (CSUD), which coordinates the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School (SDISN).

During a period from 06.09.2021 to 10.09.2021, was the evaluation. During this period we had many online meetings with some of the administrators, faculty and students involoved in the Doctoral program at the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy. We had activities every day with different groups of subjects from the Academcy involved in the evaluation.

On 03.09.2021 the committee met for the first time via zoom. The meeting of panel members was to discuss main methodological aspects related to the evaluation of doctoral studies. All evaluation panel members were required to attend and it was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform. The meeting was held 1700 to 1800 hours (Bucharest Time)

- On 06.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. It was an online preliminary meeting for the preparation and harmonization of evaluation steps, in hybrid mode, of doctorial study domain and IOSUD. All evaluaiton panel members were required to attend. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1600 to 1645 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 06.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was with representatives of the institution and of the Council for Academic Doctoral Studies (CSUD). Attended this online meeting include all evaluation panel members, and representatives of the University's management representatives of the CSUD and of the Doctoral School. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1700 to 1645 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 06.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The meeting evaluation activities with with Doctoral University Studies Council (CSUD) members and Doctoral School Council (CSD members). The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and CSUD/ CSD's members. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1800 to 1845 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 07.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The meeting was a online meeting with the contact person for the doctoral study domain under review and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report. This online meeting with the contact person for the doctoral study domain under review and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report. The meeting included domain evaluation panel members, and the doctoral studies domain contact person and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1200 to 1245 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 07.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The meeting was a online meeting with the academic staff corresponding to the IOSUD / doctoral study domain. The meeting included all evaluation panel members and Doctoral coordinators. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1300 to 1345 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 07.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The meeting was a online meeting with the director of CSUD / director of doctoral school and the team who drafted the internal evaluation report. The meeting included the IOSUD evaluation panel, and representatives of

CSUD and of doctoral school. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1600 to 1645 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 07.09.2021 the committee met via zoom. The meeting was a online meeting with the members of the Ethics Commission. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and Ethics Commission members. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1700 to 1745 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 08.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was with PhD students. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and selected Academy PHD students. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1800 to 1845 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 09.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was with the Directors in charge of the research centers/ laboratories within IOSUD. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and Directors of the research centers/ laboratories. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1000 to 1045 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 09.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was with graduates for the with the Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) members / Quality Assurance Department. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and representatives of Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) / Quality Assurance Department. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1600 to 1645 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 09.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was with employers of doctoral graduates. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and employers' representatives of doctoral graduates. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1800 to 1845 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 10.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was Online meeting for conclusions. The meeting included all evaluation panel members. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1700 to 1745 hours (Bucharest Time).

On 10.09.2021. the committee met via zoom. The online meeting was a meeting with representatives of the institution under review to discuss on the conclusions of the evaluation process and the main reccomandations. The meeting included all evaluation panel members, and Academy represenatives. It was broadcast using ARACIS Zoom as the platform and the meeting was held 1800 to 1845 hours (Bucharest Time).

This evaluation is based on written documentation, and information and interviews obtained through online zoom/ video meetings with the senior administrators, students, employers. A site visit was conducted by some members of the committee, but for this report, it does not include any observations since no site visit was done.

The written material included two internal evaluation reports, evaluation reports, and other date to incude enrolment frequency, dissertations, course participation etc. The general objectives of the doctoral fields aim at the acquisition of in-depth knowledge in the areas of fundamental disciplines, as well as basic knowledge regarding the approach, planning and completion of research activities. Other itimes of such a program incude the development of transversal competencies related to complex documentation, substantiation, research planning, as well as the elaboration of research reports, the usage of specific research equipment, as well as the acquisition of skills on data collection and acquisition techniques, their processing and interpretation of results, the use of software tools and systems specific to the research activity. The specific research objectives of the doctoral programs are associated with the training of specialists with high research capacity in the areas. Any doctoral study program should include training highly qualified researchers for activities in the doctoral fields. Finally, doctoral research opens perspectives of knowledge and innovation for new technologies.

The Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has the mission to organize and conduct doctoral studies from the fundamental field 40 Social Sciences, Science branch 60 Military Sciences, intelligence and public order, the doctoral field 10 Intelligence and National Security, starting 2011.

Doctoral studies in the Intelligence and National Security field aim to: a) supply knowledge of the highest level in the intelligence and national security field; b) form the most advanced and specialized skills and techniques necessary to address specific issues in research and development, in order to extend and redefine professional knowledge and practice in the intelligence and national security field; c) ensure professional autonomy and responsibility that reveal authority, innovation, professional integrity, sustained commitment in developing new mindsets and processes that can be applied in the professional field of intelligence and national security.

The doctoral studies programme in the field of intelligence and national security is characteristic of scientific PhD, and has as objectives to identify new solutions and interpretations to address major and current issues in the professional field of intelligence and national security, using advanced scientific research methods. The doctoral studies programme in the field of intelligence and national security intends to address interests and opportunities in the scientific and academic environment on behalf of the Romanian Intelligence Service and of the national security, defence and public order system, on behalf of the economic, cultural and social environment, in regard to issues specific to strategic intelligence, intelligence processes, fields of national security. The curriculum is developed for a 3-university-year period (6 semesters) and is structured as follows: a) the training programme based on advanced studies, which usually runs during the first semester of the doctoral programme; b) the individual scientific research programme, which usually runs in semesters 2-6 of the doctoral programme.

The curriculum displays the professional competences and the transversal competences achieved by the doctoral students, the compulsory and optional curriculum subjects and research activities, organisational and methodological provisions of the doctoral course for the doctoral students.

In the field of Intelligence and National Security doctoral studies there currently are (September 2020) 4 doctoral supervisors, of which 3 doctoral supervisors tenured within ANIMV [33.33% women / 66.66% men] and 1 associated doctoral supervisor [100% men], tenured at "Henri Coandă" Air Force Academy, Braşov. All 4 doctoral supervisors hold the teaching degree of professor and affiliated to the ISN Doctoral School after having met the provisions required by the standards of the doctoral studies in the field on intelligence and national security.

During October 2015 - September 2020, 60 doctoral students were enrolled for doctoral studies in the field of Intelligence and National Security, as follows [46.66% women / 53.33% men] . Currently, in September 2020, there are 56 doctoral students registered for the Intelligence and National Security doctoral studies [44.64% women / 55.36% men]. During October 2015 - September 2020, 17 graduate doctoral students completed the doctoral studies by public defense of their doctoral theses and achieved PhD in the field of Intelligence and National Security, as follows [29.41% women / 70.59% men]

In the field of Intelligence and National Security doctoral studies, doctoral students and doctoral supervisors use the following research centers as research-documentation resources: the University Library, the National Institute for Intelligence Studies, the National Center for Modelling and Simulation in Intelligence, as well as a series of laboratories established within the INTELIGENT project (POC-financed, contract no. 156/16.12.2016, P_36_562): the Laboratory for fundamental research in intelligence, the Laboratory for intelligence history, the Laboratory for strategic communication in crisis situations, the Laboratory for competitive intelligence, the Laboratory for security policies, the Laboratory for local, regional, global security, the Laboratory for experimental psychology, the Laboratory for information-documentation-research in the field of Intelligence and National Security. The administrative and logistic resources of these structures are supplied by the administrative department of ANIMV.

Between April 2015 and April 2020, at the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School, the doctoral students elaborated 20 doctoral theses, defended, each of them, no more than 3 scientific research papers, published, each of them, at least 3 scientific articles

in specialty journals and in publications of scientific events. During the same period, each of the doctoral supervisors at the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School elaborated 1 scientific paper annually, published, each of them, at least 1 article in specialty journals and in publications of scientific events. During the aforementioned period, at the ISN Doctoral School there have been organised 5 scientific conferences, one each year, and 5 other scientific activities - scientific seminars, thematic conferences etc.

II. Methods used

The objectives of the quality assurance system for the doctoral studies aim to ensure a high quality level of the advanced doctoral studies programme and of the individual scientific research programme, in order to address critical research issues and/or professional specialization in the field of intelligence and national security, extending and redefining knowledge and/or current professional practices in the field of intelligence. IOSUD ANIMV uses a periodic evaluation and monitoring procedure for the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School, stated in the Regulation on the organisation and conduct of university doctoral studies in the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy (2020).

According to the aforementioned methodologies and regulations, the quality assurance policy is based on the activities of the doctoral supervisors and doctoral students, and it entails transparent and fair evaluation procedures. The evaluation process of their activities includes self-evaluation and evaluation performed by the doctoral students. The infrastructure and the logistics necessary for the doctoral research activity, and the subsequent procedures and regulations according to which doctoral studies are organised are stipulated in the Doctoral School Regulation. The procedures, the beneficiaries and the responsibilities of the institutional actors who take part in the evaluation process are set and enforced according to the Methodology for quality assurance and evaluation of the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy teaching staff (2015).

The quality assurance committee for ANIMV submits to the Director of the Doctoral School and to the Director of CSUD the quality evaluations performed by the doctoral students for the doctoral supervisors and the doctoral study programme in the field of Intelligence and National Security doctoral studies. The evaluations of the teaching staff and doctoral supervisors who ensure the development of the doctoral study programme contribute to the assessments included in the annual professional evaluations.

The results of the quality evaluation activities for the university processes pertaining to the Intelligence and National Security doctoral study programme have been considered arguments to draw up new standards and new guiding marks for the activities of the doctoral supervisors, teaching staff, and doctoral students. Based on these, quality standards for doctoral research products have been set - a) evaluation criteria for scientific research papers and doctoral theses; b) maximal accepted values of similarity coefficients- that doctoral students must achieve and interaction standards between doctoral supervisors and doctoral students.

Monitoring, evaluation and continuous development of the internal quality assurance system is an ongoing concern of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School. This activity is conducted according to the provisions of the Methodology for quality assurance and evaluation of the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy teaching staff (2015) and Regulation on the organisation and operation of the Quality Evaluation and Assurance Committee in the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy.

III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY
CRITERION A.1 Institutional, administrative, managing authorities and financial resources

STANDARD A1.1 The Institution Organising University Doctoral Studies (IOSUD) implemented efficient functioning mechanisms according to the provisions of specific laws on conducting doctoral studies.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATIOR A.1.1.1. Existence and implementationof specific regulations within IOSUD, and respectively, the Doctoral School, during October 2015 - September 2020

During October 2015 - September 2020, IOSUD ANIMV conducted its activity according to the provisions of the *Regulation on the organisation andconduct of doctoral studies in "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy(2015)*, and *Regulation on the organisation and conduct of doctoral studies in "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy (2020)*, and the activity of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School is regulated by the *Doctoral School Regulation (2015), Doctoral School Regulation (2019)*.

CSUD management is provided by the CSUD director, position occupied by contest, according to the provisions of the Government Decision no. 681/2011, art. 11. In 2018 the contest for this position was organised, according to the *Methodology on the organisation and conduct of the contestto occupy the management position of the Council of University Doctoral Studies* (2018), but following the contest no director was appointed. CSUD was managed by an interim director, appointed by the ANIMV Rector, from among the CSUD members.

CSUD is founded under the *Regulation on the organisation and conduct of university doctoral studies in the "Mihai Viteazul"* (2015, art. 8), respectively the *Regulation on the organisation and conduct of university doctoral studiesin the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy (2020, art.6)*, at least one CSUD member is designated by the vote of doctoral supervisors, and one CSUD member is designated by the vote of doctoral students. Currently,September 2020, CSUD is organised according to the minimum scheme under GD no. 681/2011, art. 9, par. (3): 6 members + CSUD director (vacant)[16.66 % women / 83.33% men], of which 1 doctoral supervisor [100% men](14.28% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the vote of the doctoral supervisors, 1 doctoral student [100% women] (14.28% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the vote of the doctoral students, 4 external doctoral supervisor experts [100% men] (57.16% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the ANIMV Rector. The vacant position (14.28% of the total members of CSUD) is for the CSUD director.

According to the Government Decision no. 681/2011, art. 14, par. (9);*Doctoral School Regulation (2015, Art. 12, par. (1)); Doctoral School Regulation (2019, art. 21, par. (1)),* the

director the doctoral school isappointed by the CSUD from among the doctoral supervisors of the doctoralschool. Within the ISN Doctoral School, the CSDISN members are elected by universal, direct, and secret vote of the doctoral supervisors (for maximum 50% of all the CSDISN members), and, respectively, of the doctoral students(for at least 20% of all the CSDISN members), according to the provisions ofthe *Doctoral School Regulation (2015, Art. 12)*; respectively the *Doctoral School Regulation (2019, art. 16)*.

The admission for university doctoral studies is held according to the *Doctoral School Regulation* (2015) (Art. 55-59); respectively, the *Doctoral School Regulation* (2019) (Art. 37-44) and to the *Methodology on the organization and conduct of the contest for the admission for doctoral studiesat the „Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy.*

Within IOSUD ANIMV, the recognition of the doctoral supervisor title and the equivalence of the PhD degree achieved in other states shall be conducted according to the *Methodology regarding the recognition of PhD diploma and doctorate title obtained in accredited universities from abroad* (2017).

The CSDISN meetings are held on a regular basis, at least once a month, according to the meeting calendar approved by CSDISN, at the beginning ofthe academic year. The CSDISN meetings are lawful when 2/3 of the members participate in the meeting, with at least one student. The resolutionsare taken by simple majority, according to the CSDISN Regulation. The CSDISN resolutions are registered in Decisions, which are validated by CSUD, the ANIMV Senate or by the ANIMV Board of Directors, according to their decision-making powers.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

STANDARD A.1.2 IOSUD has the necessary logistical resources to fulfill the mission of doctoral studies.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.1.2.1 The existence and efficiency of a proper IT system to keep the record of doctoral students and their academic career The Secretariat of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has a database which highlights the position and status of each doctoral student throughout the doctoral study programme, and also the accomplishments of each doctoral student throughout the advanced training programme and the individual scientific research programme.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.1.2.2 The existence and utilization of an IT programme and evidence of it being used to verify the degree of similarity along all doctoral theses The Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has a service subscription to the antiplagiat.ro platform, recommended by the Ministry of Education, by Order no.

5229/2020, in order to check the degree of similarity of all scientific products elaborated under the aegis of the ISN Doctoral School. Each doctoral supervisor runs the similarity check for all scientific papers (doctoral theses, scientific research reports, scientific articles, scientific communications and other types of scientific papers) of the doctoral students, and the Secretariat of the ISN Doctoral School runs the check for the final version of the doctoral theses.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION A.2. Research infrastructure

STANDARD A.2.1. IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure, which supports the implementation of activities specific to doctoral studies

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.2.1.1. IOSUD/The doctoral school must submit proof regarding the ownership or renting of facilities for the research activities conducted as part of its doctoral programmes (laboratories, experimental plots, research stations etc.) IOSUD-ANIMV owns the facilities where the research activities included in the doctoral studies programme of the Doctoral School on Intelligence and National Security are conducted, as follows: 1. The National Institute of Intelligence Studies (INSI); 2. The National Center for Modeling and Simulation in Intelligence (CNMSI) 3. The Laboratory for information, documentation and research in the field of Intelligence and National Security 4. The online documentation center of the National Intelligence Academy's Library. The National Intelligence Academy's virtual library.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.2.1.2. IOSUD/The doctoral school has signed cooperation agreements with other higher education institutions, with research institutes and research networks regarding the joint operation of various research infrastructures and it publicly displays its research services via a specialized platform. IOSUD ANIMV signed 18 institutional cooperation agreements with universities, academies in the national higher education system and 1 institutional cooperation agreement with a US university. The detailed list of partnership agreements is included in Appendix A.2.1.2.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.2.1.3. IOSUD/The doctoral school expresses its interest in the permanent renewal of the research infrastructure which ensures the access of doctoral students to the existing research resources, by applying to various competitions for

the financing of the research infrastructure and by making acquisitions in research infrastructure from IOSUD's own revenues. During the evaluation period (October 2015 – September 2020), the research infrastructure of IOSUD ANIMV underwent the following innovations and improvements: - In the structural field: in 2015, the National Center for Modelling and Simulation in Intelligence (CNMSI) was established as part of the ANIMV, to meet the need to increase the role of the interdisciplinary scientific research and the use of information technology in understanding the current security environment. - In the technical equipment field: in 2015, the Laboratory for Information   Documentation-Research in the field of Intelligence and National Security was created; through the INTELLISEC Project (with POC national funding), 3 laboratories in the field of OSINT, data analysis, and modelling and simulation in intelligence were developed and equipped. - In the research infrastructure field, the INTELIGENT Center was projected and it is about to be finalised, which consists of 7 laboratories specialised in intelligence and national security field: the Laboratory for fundamental research in intelligence, the Laboratory for intelligence history, the Laboratory for strategic communication in crisis situations, the Laboratory for competitive intelligence, the Laboratory for security policies, the Laboratory for local, regional, global security, the Laboratory for experimental psychology; Pagina 21 din 45 and the Laboratory for information-documentation-research in the field of Intelligence and National Security. - In the access to databases field: from October 2015 to September 2020 access to international databases was ensured through the ANELIS platform.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION A.3 The quality of the human resource

STANDARD A.3.1. Within each Doctoral School there is enough qualified personnel so as to provide a high quality educational process.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.3.1.1. The ratio of doctoral supervisors that coordinate simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, who are attending university doctoral studies1 does not exceed 20%. In accordance with the provisions of GD 681/2011 and with the Regulation of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School (2019), doctoral supervisors can coordinate a maximum of 8-10 doctoral students who attend doctoral studies, including doctoral students who applied for an extension period. During the academic year 2019-2020, the four doctoral supervisors of the Doctoral School on Intelligence and National Security have each supervised between 2 and 13 students. The ratio of doctoral supervisors who coordinate more than 12 doctoral students simultaneously is 25%>20% (1 doctoral supervisor).

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR A.3.1.2. At least 50% of the teaching/research staff involved in teaching and research activities included in the advanced doctoral studies programme or in individual scientific research or artistic creation are tenured professors at IOSUD on an indefinite period employment contract. According to the Distribution of Teaching Tasks within the Doctoral School for the academic year 2019-2020, the teaching subjects comprised in the advanced studies programme are imparted during the first semester of the doctoral studies programme and amount to 756 conventional hours. The hours are distributed to the 4 doctoral supervisors; three of them [33.33% women / 66.66% men] are tenured professors at IOSUD ANIMV and impart 89.81%>50% of the classes, and one [100% men] is an associate professor, who imparts 10.19% of the subjects in the Curriculum. The teaching activities that are part of the advanced studies programme are included in the basic teaching workload of IOSUD ANIMV tenured professors. The scientific research activities from the individual research programmes of each doctoral student are coordinated by the doctoral supervisor and by a guidance committee, consisting of 3 teaching staff /research members. The guidance committees of the 56 doctoral students are composed of 11 university professors [36.36% women / 63.63% men] (84.61%) and 2 scientific researchers [50% women / 50% men] (15.39%), of which: 11 university professors and scientific researchers (84.61%>50%) are tenured at IOSUD ANIMV and 2 university professors (15.39%) are associated professors.

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is fulfilled***

DOMAIN B. EDUCATIONAL EFFICIENCY

CRITERION B.1. Number, quality and diversity of the candidates who applied for the admission contest

STANDARD B.1.1. The candidates admitted to doctoral studies prove academic, research and professional performance and are of the highest quality and are diverse in terms of gender and social representation.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral studies programmes relies on several selection criteria, such as: the candidates' previous professional achievements, their interest in scientific research or artistic/sports activities, publications on relevant topics and the submission of a research subject proposal. Interviewing the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure. Admission to doctoral studies is granted in accordance with the provisions of the Doctoral School Regulation and with the Methodology on the organization and conduct of the contest for the admission for doctoral studies at the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy. Admission is based on the evaluation of the candidates' previous research activities in the field of intelligence and national security (Art. 17, par. (1)(b)); the evaluation of the candidates' interest in the field of intelligence and

national security (Art. 17, par. (1)(a)); and the evaluation of the research proposal, submitted in the form of a Preliminary Investigation Report on the Research Topic. The evaluation consists of a mandatory interview (Art. 18) of the candidate by the admission committee, which weighs 50% of the final grade, and the doctoral supervisor's evaluation, which weighs 50% of the final grade.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.1.1.2. IOSUD/the doctoral school has a policy of stimulating the enrollment of doctoral students from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating special places for admission and/or granting social scholarships or organizing support programmes aimed at preventing university dropout. The Doctoral School Regulation (Anexa A.1.1.1-a4) encourages candidates from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating places financed from the State budget and by awarding scholarships to doctoral students, in line with the Regulation on the granting of scholarships for the doctoral students enrolled in the IOSUD ANIMV Doctoral School.

CRITERION B.2. The content of the doctoral studies curriculum

STANDARD B.2.1. The training programme based on advanced university studies is intended for the improvement of the research abilities of the doctoral students and for strengthening the scientific ethical behavior

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.2.1.1. The training programme based on advanced university studies includes at least three subjects with relevance to the doctoral students' scientific research, of which at least one subject is intended for the in-depth methodology research and/or statistical data processing. According to the Curriculum of the doctoral study programme, the training programme based on advanced university studies is scheduled for the first semester. Within the training programme based on advanced university studies, all the PhD students go through the compulsory subject The scientific research methodology and at least three other relevant subjects for the doctoral studies domain Intelligence and National Security: compulsory subjects - Intelligence Studies, Security Studies; optional subjects - Strategic Communication, Intelligence Analysis, Security and New media, The contemporary terrorist phenomenon.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.2.1.2. There is at least one discipline committed to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property or well defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the training programme. According to the Curriculum of the doctoral studies programme, the training programme based on advanced university studies is scheduled for the first term. Under the training programme based on advanced university

studies, all doctoral students go through the compulsory subject Ethics and academic integrity, in which ethics in scientific research, intellectual property right, copyright, scientific and academic conduct, scientific research and deontology are encompassed.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.2.1.3. IOSUD has created the mechanisms through which it makes sure that the training programme based on advanced university studies, related to the assessed domain, targets "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, the skills and the accountability and autonomy the doctoral students should acquire after attending each discipline or through research activities. The mechanisms that address the learning outcomes, put into practice by the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School, refer to: what a graduate knows, understands and what he is capable of doing upon completion of the doctoral studies programme. The learning outcomes indicators shall be expressed in knowledge, abilities and skills. The knowledge acquired by the doctoral studies programme graduate are highlighted by the assimilation level of data within the advanced university studies programme, which is mandatory and the disciplines of which shall be completed by exam and the assessment shall be made by grades and granting of transferable credits. Through the knowledge passed on within the disciplines of the advanced studies programme, the principles, theories and essential practices of the intelligence and national security field of studies with specific focus on intelligence studies are strengthened. The objectives to be achieved are detailed in the discipline sheets. The skills acquired by the doctoral programme graduates refer to the ability to apply the assimilated knowledge and to use it to fulfill tasks and to solve problems. According to the Curriculum of the doctoral studies programme, the knowledge acquired within the mandatory disciplines are verified with the implementation by the research project in order to develop the doctoral thesis, by producing scientific articles, scientific research papers. The acquired abilities are laid down in the research activity sheets. Skills are assessed in scientific activity situations specific to the Intelligence and National Security field, that doctoral students solve using knowledge, assimilated and acquired abilities (personal, social, professional, methodological) throughout the doctoral training programme. These professional activities refer to activities from the teaching workload that doctoral students must complete (4 hours per week), to involvement in planning of didactic and research activities of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School: the BraInt Thematic School, the Student scientific Conference Intelligence and Security Culture.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION B.3. Results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation

STANDARD B.3.1. The research is capitalized by the doctoral students through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, through technological transfer, patents, products, service demands

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.3.1.1. The doctoral school launched various initiatives designed to capitalize on the results of doctoral studies taking into consideration the specific nature of each field (e.g., technology transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services in the case of social sciences and humanities; festivals, competitions, recitals, sports competitions; cultural and artistic activities in the vocational field; participation in national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international journals, involvement of doctoral students in the conception of research-development projects etc.) Capitalization on the results of the doctoral studies undertaken by the doctoral students enrolled in the Doctoral School on Intelligence and National Security is achieved via the publication of the research results in the form of articles in the Romanian Intelligence Studies Review and the participation of doctoral students in national and international conferences. Likewise, in order to capitalize on the results of doctoral research in a professional and institutional context, the Doctoral School maintains a permanent dialogue with SRI structures in order to identify operational and scientific needs and tendencies in the field of national security. Such dialogue results in the identification of subjects and topics for doctoral research that are proposed to doctoral candidates. The doctoral students are involved in the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School's extracurricular and scientific research activities: BraInt Thematic School, the Student scientific Conference Intelligence and Security Culture and in research teams of INTELIGENT Center.

> *Recommendation:*
> **The indicator is fulfilled**

CRITERION B.4. Quality of doctoral theses

STANDARD B.4.1. The doctoral theses meet high quality standards

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR B.4.1.1. Within IOSUD, the percentage of invalidated theses, for which there is no possibility of correction or of resuming the public defense process at the level of the CNATDCU General Council, has not surpassed 5% in the last five years. The status of doctoral theses in the period subject to evaluation (October 2015 - September 2020) is as follows: - number of doctoral theses completed and validated by CNATDCU = 17 - number of doctoral theses corrected and validated by CNATDCU = 0 - percentage of invalidated theses = 0%

> *Recommendation:*
> **The indicator is fulfilled**

DOMAIN C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

CRITERION C.1. The existence and regular progress of the internal quality assurance system.

STANDARD C.1.1. There is an institutional framework and relevant internal quality assurance policies and procedures are applied.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.1.1.1. IOSUD has developed and periodically applies a procedure aimed at assessing and monitoring the evolution of the activities within the doctoral schools, based on the following mandatory evaluation criteria:

a) scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors: The scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors is evaluated every 5 years, according to the Methodology on the evaluation of SDISN doctoral supervisors.

b) infrastructure and the logistics required to carry out the research activity: The doctoral research activity is properly ensured through databases access and by doctoral supervisors and doctoral students engagement in the research projects of the National Institute of Intelligence Studies and in the activities of IOSUD ANIMV's special laboratories.

c) procedures and regulations on which doctoral studies are organized:

The doctoral university studies are organized in accordance with the provisions of the Law of National Education (Law no.1/2011), as amended and supplemented, the Code of Doctoral Studies (Government Decision no. 681/2011), as amended and supplemented, IOSUD ANIMV Regulation and ISN Doctoral School Regulation. The MEN Orders bearing on doctoral studies are taken into account in the planning and organization of the doctoral studies programme. d) social and academic support services (including participation in different manifestations, publication of articles etc.) and counseling available to doctoral students: doctoral students can receive social or academic scholarships (Appendix C.1.1.1-d1), Erasmus+ mobility programmes or internships (Appendix C.1.1.1-d2); they have access to free of charge social services (health, food and sports) offered by ANIMV; access to ANIMV library; access to Internet and to personal accounts on animv.eu educational platform. Doctoral students have access to the ANIMV free of charge psychological counseling services. The doctoral supervisor ensures counseling for future university career opportunities or scientific research opportunities.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.1.1.2. Student associations and /or representative students organize elections among doctoral students for positions in CSUD, by universal, direct and secret ballot, and all doctoral students have the right to elect and be elected. According to the provisions of the IOSUD ANIMV Regulation (art. 6, par. (3), (5)), doctoral students are represented in the management structure which is specific to doctoral

studies within IOSUD ANIMV: the Doctoral Studies Council (CSUD). Doctoral students are represented in CSUD by one student. The representative of doctoral students in CSUD is designated by universal, direct and secret ballot, and all doctoral students enrolled in the ISN Doctoral School, in the individual advanced training programme or in the research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis have the right to participate (as candidates or as voters). The mandate of the representative of doctoral students in the university management structure comes to an end either at the end of the mandate or upon completion of the scientific research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis.

Recommendation:

The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.1.1.3. Student associations and /or representative students organize elections among doctoral students, at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the doctoral school councils, by universal, direct and secret vote, and all doctoral students have the right to elect and be elected. According to the provisions of the ISN Doctoral School Regulation (art. 16, par. (2)), doctoral students are represented in the management structure which is specific to doctoral studies: the ISN Doctoral Studies Council. In CSDISN doctoral students have at least 20% representation from the total number of CSDISN members, meaning two doctoral students. The representatives of doctoral students in CSDISN are designated by universal, direct and secret vote, and all doctoral students enrolled in the ISN Doctoral School, in the individual advanced training programme or in the research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis have the right to participate (as candidates or as voters). The mandate of the representatives of doctoral students in the CSDISN university management structure comes to an end either at the end of the mandate or upon completion of the scientific research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis.

Recommendation:

The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, both IOSUD and the doctoral schools develop strategies and action policies in order to remedy the reported deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance within IOSUD. Following the internal evaluation conducted in 2016, IOSUD ANIMV drafted a report establishing the strategies and action policies needed in order to remedy the reported deficiencies. As part of this strategy, the AISM Ethics Committee analyzed all the doctoral theses defended at IOSUD ANIMV up to that moment, in order to eliminate the theses that were suspected of plagiarism. In 2019 a new Doctoral School Regulation was adopted, establishing key performance indicators for the doctoral supervisors and for doctoral students in order to increase the level of scientific performance. The doctoral students who failed to meet the minimum performance level were expelled. The supervising committees were made aware of their role, and their working methods in terms of supervising doctoral students were regulated and monitored.

Recommendation:

The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION C.2. Data transparency and accessibility to learning resources.

STANDARD C.2.1. The information of interest for doctoral students, future candidates, respectively public interest information is available for viewing in electronic format.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.2.1.1. IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, subject to the general rules on data protection, information regarding:

a) the IOSUV ANIMV Regulation and SDISN Regulation are published on animv.ro website; see link; b) the methodology and the procedure for admission to doctoral studies are published on animv.ro website;

c) the contract for doctoral studies is published on animv.ro website, in the Doctoral School Regulation;

d) the procedure for public defense of the doctoral thesis is published on animv.ro website, in the Doctoral School Regulation;

e) the contents of the doctoral studies programme in Intelligence and National Security is published on animv.ro website;

f) the scientific profile and the thematic areas/research topics of doctoral supervisors in the school, as well as their institutional contact details are published on animv.ro website; see link

g) the list of registered doctoral candidates from the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School, with basic information (year of registration, supervisor) is published on animv.ro website;

h) information about the standards of drafting the doctoral thesis are published on animv.ro website, in the Doctoral School Regulation;

i) links to summaries of the doctoral theses to be publicly defended, as well as date, hour and location where they will be defended, are published at least 20 days prior to presentation on animv.ro website;

STANDARD C.2.2. IOSUD / The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed to conduct their doctoral studies.

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is fulfilled***

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to at least one platform with relevant academic databases in the fields of the doctoral studies provided ANIMV, as IOSUD, makes available to the doctoral students the necessary facilities for attending the training programme through advanced studies, as well as for the individual

research programme. In that regard, the doctoral students have access to the research database of ANIMV central library, to INSI library, as well as to the online version of the periodicals:

- ANTHROPOLOGY NOW

- CRITICAL STUDIES ON SECURITY

- EUROPEAN JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY

- FAR EASTERN AFFAIRS

- JOURNAL FOR THE STUDY OF RADICALISM

For the doctoral students performing activities within ANIMV access shall be provided to the virtual library of the Academy.

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is partial fulfilled***

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, on demand, to an electronic system for checking the level of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works. The software used within ISN Doctoral School to establish the degree of similarities is sistemantiplagiat.ro, agreed upon by ME, which checks the similarity degree for all the papers elaborated by the doctoral students, on demand, and every single time when a paper of a doctoral student is presented to the guidance committee. Sistemantiplagiat.ro software is validated through the Ministry of Education Order no. 3485/24.03.2016 and the Ministry of Education Order no. 5229/2020 regarding the list of programmes recognized by CNATDCU and used within higher education institutions which organize doctoral studies and by the Romanian Academy. Each doctoral supervisor has access to the platform in order to oversee the theses of the doctoral students they supervise.

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is partial fulfilled***

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.2.2.3. All doctoral students shall have access to the scientific research laboratories or other facilities according to the particular features of the field/fields within the Doctoral School, in accordance with internal regulations IOSUD ANIMV makes available to the doctoral students the necessary facilities within the specific field of doctoral studies Intelligence and National Security, for attending the training programme through advanced studies, as well as for the individual research programme. In that regard, the ISN Doctoral School provides the necessary premises to perform the teaching activities within the advanced training programme. It involves two classrooms equipped with the necessary teaching devices: computers, video projectors, printers. Doctoral students of the ISN Doctoral School have access conditioned by the access rules to classified information, specific to SRI, into the INSI, CNMSI premises, into the ANIMV study and simulation labs.

Access to the ANIMV libraries is free and unrestricted by the access rules to classified information.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION C.3. Degree of internationalization

STANDARD C.3.1. IOSUD/ the Doctoral School has a strategy in place and it is applied in order to increase the degree of internationalization of the doctoral studies

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for each doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies which perform activities within the studied field, which aims at the mobility of the doctoral students and the academic staff (e.g. ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies programme). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or any other form of mobility, such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements plans and policies in order to increase the number of doctoral students that participate in internship programmes abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target of the European Higher Education Arena IOSUD ANIMV has a strategy of internationalization of the doctoral studies which is applied through the IOSUD ANIMV Regulation regarding the conclusion of the co-tutelage agreements (Appendix C.3.1.1.)

Considering the specific activity of IOSUD ANIMV and the limitations imposed by the regulatory framework which governs the organization and the activity of the institution, no agreements for the internationalization of the doctoral training were concluded until 2017. Since 2017, the ISN Doctoral School has enrolled doctoral students coming from both EU countries and non-member countries. Since 2017, ANIMV, in collaboration with a consortium of other research academic entities - University of Malta, Norwegian University of Science and Technologies, University of Groningen (The Netherlands), Edith Cowan University (Australia), Netherlands Forensic Institute, National Research Council (Italy)-, organizes the doctoral programme ESSENTIAL, a European Joint Doctorate (EJD) type of study programme, which seeks to obtain excellence in the field of academic studies and encourages the development of innovative research projects, associated with complex problems in the field of security sciences. The novelty concepts for the Doctoral School are its multidisciplinary nature (law - IT&C - national security), mobility and international experience. The major research themes proposed within the programme are elaborated in accordance with four fundamental disciplines - Socio-economic sciences and humanities, Sociology, Legal sciences, Law, Communication sciences and mass-media study, Information Security, Digital Forensics and Cyber Security. They successfully combine elements belonging to IT sciences, but also to security and intelligence studies, within a partnership agreement. By international co-tutelage doctoral supervision, within ESSENTIAL programme, Professor Irena CHIRU, PhD, is assistant doctoral supervisor for students from

the University of Malta and University of Groningen, enrolled within the ESSENTIAL project.

Out of the total number of 56 doctoral students within the doctoral training programme, a number of 30 doctoral students, i.e. 53.57%>35%, took part in international conferences, where they presented scientific works.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.3.1.2. The Doctoral School supports, including financially, the organization of international co-tutelage doctoral studies, namely inviting renowned experts to lecture for the doctoral students IOSUD ANIMV and the Doctoral School in the field of Intelligence and National Security supports and encourages the organisation of international co-tutelage doctoral studies, by applying IOSUD ANIMV Regulation regarding the conclusion of co-tutelage agreements (Appendix C.3.1.1.). Since 2017, an international co-tutelage doctoral programme is operational within IOSUD ANIMV, attended by: University of Malta, Norwegian University of Science and Technologies, University of Groningen (The Netherlands), Edith Cowan University (Australia), Netherlands Forensic Institute, National Research Council (Italy). On behalf of the Doctoral School, Professor Irena CHIRU, PhD, takes part as co-tutelage doctoral supervisor. Within the conference programme of the Doctoral School, doctoral students had the opportunity to hear lectures of some renowned doctoral specialists from abroad.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the Ph.D theses within the Doctoral School are written and/or defended in an international language or are drafted in co-tutelage. The 6 doctoral students in the ESSENTIAL programme, enrolled in 2017 are writing all their papers in English, and the PhD theses will be also in English, representing 10.71%>10% of the total number of students enrolled in the ISN Doctoral School. At the same time, these theses will be drafted in co-tutelage.

Recommendation:
The indicator is partial fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.3.1.4. Internationalization of the activities within the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through practical measures (for instance, taking part in educational fairs in order to attract international doctoral students; inclusion of international experts in guidance or defense doctoral theses commissions, etc.)

Due to the specific educational activity of ANIMV and the limitations imposed by the regulatory framework that governs the organization and the activity of the institution, only 6 doctoral students coming from EU countries or non   member countries have been enrolled until now. The same limitations prevent ANIMV from concluding mobility agreements for doctoral students and teaching staff with foreign universities, or from taking part in

educational fairs in order to recruit foreign doctoral students. Teachers from the ESSENTIAL consortium were invited to lecture within the conference programme of the Doctoral School, and the doctoral students had the opportunity to hear lectures of some renowned doctoral specialists from abroad. Due to the specific activity of ANIMV and the limitations imposed by the regulatory framework that governs the activity, the doctoral supervisors of the Doctoral School have a relatively limited international experience as supervisors, guest professor or guest researcher.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

CRITERION C.4. The system ensuring the observance of academic

ethical and integrity norms.

STANDARD C.4.1. IOSUD/The Doctoral School has a functional and efficient system in place, in order to prevent and ensure the observance of academic ethical and integrity norms

KEY PERFOMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.1. IOSUD/The Doctoral School implements the provisions of a code of ethics and academic deontology/integrity meant to defend the academic values of academic freedom and integrity, and of university autonomy:

The management of IOSUD ANI and ISN Doctoral School started a plagiarism detection process for all PhD theses publicly defended between 2013 and 2018. The detection process was insured by the ANIMV University Ethics Committee. Following that process, 40 theses came under suspicion of plagiarism, two of them being written in the period of time that was under evaluation (October 2015 - September 2020). With the results of the University Ethics Committee, IOSUD ANI notified the CNADTCU to decide upon the identified suspicions of plagiarism. By the date of drafting the Self Evaluation Report of the ISN Doctoral School (September 2020), CNADTCU ruled over a number of 32 PhD theses, two of them being written in the period of time that was under evaluation (October 2015 - September 2020), which were found to be plagiarism. CNATDCU is currently carrying out the plagiarism detection process, following the IOSUD ANIMV notification. As the Doctoral School Regulation and Procedure on Completing the PhD

Studies stipulate, all the results of the research carried out by students of the Doctoral School students - articles, scientific communications, research reports, PhD theses - are subject to content similarity detection. The similarity coefficients admitted until December 2019 were: $CS1 = 5\%$; $CS2 = 25\%$. Since January 2020, the maximum admitted similarity coefficients are: $CS1 = 10\%$, $CS2 = 3\%$; $BDL = 10\%$; $CIT = 15\%$. The similarity reports for each PhD thesis are part of the PhD thesis file. They are presented to the Doctoral Advisory Committees and Thesis Defense Committees, and signed by the PhD thesis coordinator and the PhD candidate. In order to prevent any infringement of principles and practices of academic deontology and integrity, all the students must pursue the Academic Ethics and Integrity classes during the advanced study programme. On the same topic, in February 2020, the ISN

Doctoral School organized the BraInt2020 online thematic classes with a thematic module dedicated to academic integrity practices.

The ISN Doctoral Schools included in its regulation the sanction of expulsion for PhD students committing intellectual frauds and having research misconduct.

The transparency in analyzing and debating upon PhD students' papers has become a current practice of the ISN Doctoral School. The PhD students can participate, even online, in defending their reports and research theses, and some coordinators have even adopted a transparent and open coordination and advising manner, allowing all PhD students to have access to papers and advice, recommendations, observations made for each PhD student in the advisory process. IOSUD ANIMV efforts for the observance and strengthening of academic deontology and integrity became public through reports, through ANIMV Rector's media interviews on that topic, and by ensuring access to the evaluation documents.

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is fulfilled***

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.2. All notifications on suspicion of plagiarism related to PhD theses were analyzed and settled by IOSUD within the stipulated legal term for issuing a written point of view to the received notification Between October 2015 and September 2020, notifications of suspicion of plagiarism against a PhD thesis were filed in September 2020. The thesis defense was cancelled, as the ANIMV University Ethics Committee is currently (September 2020) evaluating the notification. In this case, also the PhD coordinator and the Thesis Defense Committee Chair were those who filed the notification. The notifications filed at the initiative of IOSUD ANIMV, as shown above, are checked and analyzed by CNATDCU and by legal courts, had CNATDCU finally ruled that the PhD theses were plagiarized. All the parties involved in those processes were notified in writing on each step of that process. Those activities were and still are carried out by observing the GDPR provisions and norms alongside the normative acts in force.

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.3. The annual reports of IOSUD Ethics Committee contain information on the stage of the settlement process of each case built on a notification or self-notification, relevant to the doctoral studies, regarding the infringement of some ethical norms and issues, their description revealing no delays in the legal term for settling such cases provided by national and institutional regulations. The annual reports of ANIMV Ethics Committee contain references to the activity of verifying the PhD theses and notifications on suspected plagiarism (website animv.ro).

> *Recommendation:*
> ***The indicator is fulfilled***

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.4. IOSUD measures taken following CNATDCU final decision to withdraw the PhD title in the wake of plagiarism notifications targeted all the aspects mentioned in the CNATDCU decision and the legislation in force:

All CNATDCU decisions have been completely respected, according to the legislation in force. For the plagiarized theses and for the ones the Ministry of Education decided to withdraw the PhD titles, IOSUD ANIMV filed an action in court requesting the cancellation of PhD diplomas.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.5. Measures meant to prevent academic fraud within university doctoral studies, approved by IOSUD

a) the doctoral supervisors who guided the PhD theses declared as plagiarized and suspected of plagiarism ceased their affiliation to the ISN Doctoral School, were banned from coordinating the PhD students - who were entrusted to other professors -, were no longer invited in the Doctoral Advisory Committee or Thesis Defense Committee;

b) the entire PhD admission process was reconsidered, and for the next two years the admission to ISN Doctoral School was for full-time attendance only, in order to ensure the control and engagement of PhD students and doctoral supervisors in the academic environment.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.6. Scientific reviewers who were part of the Thesis Defense Committee for two or more theses which resulted in the withdrawal of the PhD title through a final decision were no longer appointed in such committees for at least three years.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATOR C.4.1.7. IOSUD posted on the institution's website (animv.ro) the public situation of the theses defended since the set up of IOSUD ANIMV. As of 2016, the PhD theses defended within the institution can be publicly accessed, according to the law, on the REI platform of MEN.

Recommendation:
The indicator is fulfilled

IV. SWOT Analysis

Strengths:	Weaknesses:
- The existence and efficiency of a proper IT system to keep the record of doctoral students and their academic career The Secretariat of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has a database which highlights the position and status of each doctoral student throughout the doctoral study programme, and also the accomplishments of each doctoral student throughout the advanced training programme and the individual scientific research programme. - IOSUD/The doctoral school has signed cooperation agreements with other higher education institutions, with research institutes and research networks regarding the joint operation of various research infrastructures and it publicly displays its research services via a specialized platform. - At least 50% of the teaching/research staff involved in teaching and research activities included in the advanced doctoral studies programme or in individual scientific research or artistic creation are tenured professors at IOSUD on an indefinite period employment contract. - The training programme based on advanced university studies includes at least three subjects with relevance to the doctoral students' scientific research, of which at least one subject is intended for the in-depth methodology research and/or statistical data processing - IOSUD has created the mechanisms through which it makes sure that the training programme based on advanced university studies, related to the assessed domain, targets "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, the skills and the accountability and autonomy the doctoral students should acquire after attending each discipline or through research activities.	- In some of the interviews with students in the program, most have very good to excellent English language skills. However, not all student's English language skills seem at the same level. This report did not address such issues and may not be pertinent. - Members of the Ethics Committee were only focused on, or unsure of their ability to handle any student's ethical dilemma outside of plagerisim. - There are three Doctorial student supervisors assigned to the Academy; yet, the distribution seems out-of-balance. One supervisor is monitoring over 50% of the elegibile students while the other two supervisors are splitting the difference. This is an unacceptable disparity.
Opportunities:	**Threats:**
- Students have online access to international databases and electronic scientific resources (databases / platforms of full-text scientific journals and bibliographic and bibliometric databases), assessed institution, the uniqueness of the study programs and their relevance to the local/national market, the overall attractiveness of the study programs etc. However, it a short sample listing, NONE of the journals were related to 'intelligence and national security' There are many other journals	- Many schools outside of the country are beginning to offer degrees in intelligence and national security. While this is an extremely unique program, some students may decide getting such a degree outside of the country may be worth more of their time and money. - Educaitonal platforms available within the IT environment do not seem to be incorporated into the curriculum as seamlessly as seems evident.

that are available, and it is hoped that such online datesbases to include: *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence; Intelligence and National Security; International Journal of Intelligence, Security, and Public Affairs; Journal of Intelligence History; Journal of Policing, Intelligence, and Counterterrorism.*
-Much more of student and faculty research needs to be emphasized in the international security enviroment. This is a very good program that the international community is unaware. A much stronger presence on the world stage must be initiated with a public compaign to promote this institution.	

V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
1.	A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain: a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School; b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct; c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies); d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad; e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings; f) the contract for doctoral studies; g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.	Existence and implementation of specific regulations within IOSUD, and respectively, the Doctoral School, during October 2015 - September 2020 During October 2015 - September 2020, IOSUD ANIMV conducted its activity according to the provisions of the Regulation on the organisation and conduct of doctoral studies in "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy (2015), and Regulation on the organisation and conduct of doctoral studies in "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy (2020), and the activity of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School is regulated by the Doctoral School Regulation (2015), Doctoral School Regulation (2019). CSUD management is provided by the CSUD director, position occupied by contest, according to the provisions of the Government Decision no. 681/2011, art. 11. In 2018 the contest for this position was organised, according to the	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		Methodology on the organisation and conduct of the contest to occupy the management position of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (2018), but following the contest no director was appointed. CSUD was managed by an interim director, appointed by the ANIMV Rector, from among the CSUD members. Currently, September 2020, CSUD is organised according to the minimum scheme under GD no. 681/2011, art. 9, par. (3): 6 members + CSUD director (vacant) [16.66 % women / 83.33% men], of which 1 doctoral supervisor [100% men] (14.28% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the vote of the doctoral supervisors, 1 doctoral student [100% women] (14.28% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the vote of the doctoral students, 4 external doctoral supervisor experts [100% men] (57.16% of the total members of CSUD), designated by the ANIMV Rector. The vacant position (14.28% of the total members of CSUD) is for the CSUD director. The admission for university doctoral studies is held according to the Doctoral School Regulation (2015) (Art. 55-59); respectively, the Doctoral School Regulation (2019) (Art. 37-44) and to the Methodology on the organization and conduct of the contest for the admission for doctoral studies at the „Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy. Within IOSUD ANIMV, the recognition of the doctoral supervisor title and the equivalence of the PhD degree achieved in other states shall be conducted according to the Methodology regarding the recognition of PhD diploma and	

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		doctorate title obtained in accredited universities from abroad (2017). The CSDISN meetings are held on a regular basis, at least once a month, according to the meeting calendar approved by CSDISN, at the beginning of the academic year. The CSDISN meetings are lawful when 2/3 of the members participate in the meeting, with at least one student. The resolutions are taken by simple majority, according to the CSDISN Regulation. The CSDISN resolutions are registered in Decisions, which are validated by CSUD, the ANIMV Senate or by the ANIMV Board of Directors, according to their decision-making powers.	
2.	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.	The existence and efficiency of a proper IT system to keep the record of doctoral students and their academic career The Secretariat of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has a database which highlights the position and status of each doctoral student throughout the doctoral study programme, and also the accomplishments of each doctoral student throughout the advanced training programme and the individual scientific research programme	**Indicator is fulfilled.**
3.	A.1.2.2. The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	The existence and utilization of an IT programme and evidence of it being used to verify the degree of similarity along all doctoral theses The Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School has a service subscription to the antiplagiat.ro platform, recommended by the Ministry of Education, by Order no. 5229/2020, in order to check the degree of similarity of all scientific products elaborated under the aegis of the	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		ISN Doctoral School. Each doctoral supervisor runs the similarity check for all scientific papers (doctoral theses, scientific research reports, scientific articles, scientific communications and other types of scientific papers) of the doctoral students, and the Secretariat of the ISN Doctoral School runs the check for the final version of the doctoral theses.	
4.	**A.3.1.1.** Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.	**The ratio of doctoral supervisors that coordinate simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students, but not more than 12, who are attending university doctoral studies1 does not exceed 20%. In accordance with the provisions of GD 681/2011 and with the Regulation of the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School (2019), doctoral supervisors can coordinate a maximum of 8-10 doctoral students who attend doctoral studies, including doctoral students who applied for an extension period. During the academic year 2019-2020, the four doctoral supervisors of the Doctoral School on Intelligence and National Security have each supervised between 2 and 13 students. The ratio of doctoral supervisors who coordinate more than 12 doctoral students simultaneously is 25%>20% (1 doctoral supervisor).**	**Indicator is fulfilled**
5.	**A.3.1.2.** At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.	At least 50% of the teaching/research staff involved in teaching and research activities included in the advanced doctoral studies programme or in individual scientific research or artistic creation are tenured professors at IOSUD on an indefinite period employment contract. According to the Distribution of Teaching Tasks within the Doctoral School for the academic year 2019-2020, the	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		teaching subjects comprised in the advanced studies programme are imparted during the first semester of the doctoral studies programme and amount to 756 conventional hours. The hours are distributed to the 4 doctoral supervisors; three of them [33.33%] women / 66.66% men] are tenured professors at IOSUD ANIMV and impart 89.81%>50% of the classes, and one [100% men] is an associate professor, who imparts 10.19% of the subjects in the Curriculum. The guidance committees of the 56 doctoral students are composed of 11 university professors [36.36% women / 63.63% men] (84.61%) and 2 scientific researchers [50% women / 50% men] (15.39%), of which: 11 university professors and scientific researchers (84.61%>50%) are tenured at IOSUD ANIMV and 2 university professors (15.39%) are associated professors.	
6.	**B.1.1.1.** The ratio between the number of graduates of masters' programs of other higher education institutions, national or foreign, who have enrolled for the doctoral admission contest within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget, put out through contest within the doctoral domain is at least 0.2 or the ratio between the number of candidates within the past five years and the number of seats funded by the state budget put out through contest within the doctoral studies domain is at least 1,2.	Admission to doctoral studies programmes relies on several selection criteria, such as: the candidates' previous professional achievements, their interest in scientific research or artistic/sports activities, publications on relevant topics and the submission of a research subject proposal. Interviewing the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure. Admission to doctoral studies is granted in accordance with the provisions of the Doctoral School Regulation and with the Methodology on the organization and conduct of the contest for the admission for doctoral studies at the "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy. Admission is based on the evaluation of the candidates' previous research activities in the field of intelligence and national security (Art. 17, par.	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		(1)(b)); the evaluation of the candidates' interest in the field of intelligence and national security (Art. 17, par. (1)(a)); and the evaluation of the research proposal, submitted in the form of a Preliminary Investigation Report on the Research Topic. The evaluation consists of a mandatory interview (Art. 18) of the candidate by the admission committee, which weighs 50% of the final grade, and the doctoral supervisor's evaluation, which weighs 50% of the final grade.	
7.	**B.1.2.1.** Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.	IOSUD/the doctoral school has a policy of stimulating the enrollment of doctoral students from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating special places for admission and/or granting social scholarships or organizing support programmes aimed at preventing university dropout. The Doctoral School Regulation (Anexa A.1.1.1-a4) encourages candidates from disadvantaged social backgrounds, by allocating places financed from the State budget and by awarding scholarships to doctoral students, in line with the Regulation on the granting of scholarships for the doctoral students enrolled in the IOSUD ANIMV Doctoral School.	**Indicator is fulfilled**
8.	**B.2.1.1.** The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.	The training programme based on advanced university studies includes at least three subjects with relevance to the doctoral students' scientific research, of which at least one subject is intended for the in-depth methodology research and/or statistical data processing. According to the Curriculum of the doctoral study programme, the training programme based on advanced university studies is scheduled for the first semester. Within the training programme based on advanced university	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		studies, all the PhD students go through the compulsory subject The scientific research methodology and at least three other relevant subjects for the doctoral studies domain Intelligence and National Security: compulsory subjects - Intelligence Studies, Security Studies; optional subjects - Strategic Communication, Intelligence Analysis, Security and New media, The contemporary terrorist phenomenon.	
9.	**B.2.1.2.** At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	There is at least one discipline committed to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property or well defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the training programme. According to the Curriculum of the doctoral studies programme, the training programme based on advanced university studies is scheduled for the first term. Under the training programme based on advanced university studies, all doctoral students go through the compulsory subject Ethics and academic integrity, in which ethics in scientific research, intellectual property right, copyright, scientific and academic conduct, scientific research and deontology are encompassed.	**Indicator is fulfilled**
10.	**B.2.1.3.** The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.	IOSUD has created the mechanisms through which it makes sure that the training programme based on advanced university studies, related to the assessed domain, targets "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, the skills and the accountability and autonomy the doctoral students should acquire after attending each discipline or through research activities. The mechanisms that address the learning outcomes, put into practice by the Intelligence and National Security Doctoral School, refer to: what a graduate knows,	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		understands and what he is capable of doing upon completion of the doctoral studies programme. The learning outcomes indicators shall be expressed in knowledge, abilities and skills. The knowledge acquired by the doctoral studies programme graduate are highlighted by the assimilation level of data within the advanced university studies programme, which is mandatory and the disciplines of which shall be completed by exam and the assessment shall be made by grades and granting of transferable credits. Through the knowledge passed on within the disciplines of the advanced studies programme, the principles, theories and essential practices of the intelligence and national security field of studies with specific focus on intelligence studies are strengthened. The acquired abilities are laid down in the research activity sheets. Skills are assessed in scientific activity situations specific to the Intelligence and National Security field, that doctoral students solve using knowledge, assimilated and acquired abilities (personal, social, professional, methodological) throughout the doctoral training programme.	
11.	**B.3.1.1.** For the evaluated domain, the evaluation commission will be provided with at least one paper or some other relevant contribution per doctoral student who has obtained a doctor's title within the past 5 years. From this list, the members of the evaluation commission shall randomly select 5 such papers / relevant contributions per doctoral study domain for review. At least 3 selected papers must contain significant original contributions in the respective domain	The doctoral school launched various initiatives designed to capitalize on the results of doctoral studies taking into consideration the specific nature of each field (e.g., technology transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services in the case of social sciences and humanities; festivals, competitions, recitals, sports competitions; cultural and artistic activities in the vocational field; participation in national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		journals, involvement of doctoral students in the conception of research-development projects etc.) Capitalization on the results of the doctoral studies undertaken by the doctoral students enrolled in the Doctoral School on Intelligence and National Security is achieved via the publication of the research results in the form of articles in the Romanian Intelligence Studies Review and the participation of doctoral students in national and international conferences. Likewise, in order to capitalize on the results of doctoral research in a professional and institutional context, the Doctoral School maintains a permanent dialogue with SRI structures in order to identify operational and scientific needs and tendencies in the field of national security	
12.	**C.1.1.1.** The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory: a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity; c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized; d) the scientific activity of doctoral students; e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students; f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.	. IOSUD has developed and periodically applies a procedure aimed at assessing and monitoring the evolution of the activities within the doctoral schools, based on the following mandatory evaluation criteria: a) scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors: The scientific activity of the doctoral supervisors is evaluated every 5 years, according to the Methodology on the evaluation of SDISN doctoral supervisors. b) infrastructure and the logistics required to carry out the research activity: The doctoral research activity is properly ensured through databases access and by doctoral supervisors and doctoral students engagement in the research projects of the National Institute of Intelligence Studies and in the activities of IOSUD ANIMV's special laboratories. The doctoral university studies are organized in accordance	**Indicator is fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		with the provisions of the Law of National Education (Law no.1/2011), as amended and supplemented, the Code of Doctoral Studies (Government Decision no. 681/2011), as amended and supplemented, IOSUD ANIMV Regulation and ISN Doctoral School Regulation. The MEN Orders bearing on doctoral studies are taken into account in the planning and organization of the doctoral studies programme. d) social and academic support services (including participation in different manifestations, publication of articles etc.) and counseling available to doctoral students: doctoral students can receive social or academic scholarships, Erasmus+ mobility programmes or internships (Appendix C.1.1.1-d2); they have access to free of charge social services (health, food and sports) offered by ANIMV; access to ANIMV library; access to Internet and to personal accounts on animv.eu educational platform. Doctoral students have access to the ANIMV free of charge psychological counseling services. The doctoral supervisor ensures counseling for future university career opportunities or scientific research opportunities.	
13.	C.1.1.2. Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.	Student associations and /or representative students organize elections among doctoral students for positions in CSUD, by universal, direct and secret ballot, and all doctoral students have the right to elect and be elected. Doctoral students are represented in CSUD by one student. The representative of doctoral students in CSUD is designated by universal, direct and secret ballot, and all doctoral students enrolled in the ISN Doctoral School, in the individual advanced training programme or in	**Indicator is fulfilled**

34

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		the research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis have the right to participate (as candidates or as voters). The mandate of the representative of doctoral students in the university management structure comes to an end either at the end of the mandate or upon completion of the scientific research programme for the drafting of the doctoral thesis.	
14.	C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.	All doctoral students have free access to at least one platform with relevant academic databases in the fields of the doctoral studies provided ANIMV, as IOSUD, makes available to the doctoral students the necessary facilities for attending the training programme through advanced studies, as well as for the individual research programme. In that regard, the doctoral students have access to the research database of ANIMV central library, to INSI library.	One database is now enough for doctoral studies and is limiting and dependent on possible bias or economic factors. Students must be given more choices. However, the limited titles that were offered in the report, none were focused on intelligence or national secruty, but, rather general news type media resources. Better academic-intelligence journals are required for this program. **Indicator is Partial Fullment**
15.	C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.	Each doctoral student shall have access, on demand, to an electronic system for checking the level of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works. The software used within ISN Doctoral School to establish the degree of similarities is sistemantiplagiat.ro, agreed upon by ME, which checks the similarity degree for all the papers elaborated by the doctoral	Ethics committee could not provide a standard for plagerisum and this software only provides a percentage of similarities...not a detailed summary or analysis. Students still rely on advisor to determine if they committed a wrong, does not prepare the student.

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		students, on demand, and every single time when a paper of a doctoral student is presented to the guidance committee. However, when asked by the Ethics Committee to provide a scale of line that determines wha this is plagerisum, they could not do it. Consequently, this software determines plagerisum but the students do not know the limites provided by this system. Each doctoral supervisor has access to the platform in order to oversee the theses of the doctoral students they supervise.	**Indicator is** **Partial Fulfilled**
16.	**C.2.2.3.** All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	All doctoral students shall have access to the scientific research laboratories or other facilities according to the particular features of the field/fields within the Doctoral School, in accordance with internal regulations IOSUD ANIMV makes available to the doctoral students the necessary facilities within the specific field of doctoral studies Intelligence and National Security, for attending the training programme through advanced studies, as well as for the individual research programme. In that regard, the ISN Doctoral School provides the necessary premises to perform the teaching activities within the advanced training programme. It involves two classrooms equipped with the necessary teaching devices: computers, video projectors, printers. Doctoral students of the ISN Doctoral School have access conditioned by the access rules to classified information, specific to SRI, into the INSI, CNMSI premises, into the ANIMV study and simulation labs. Access to the ANIMV libraries is free and unrestricted by the access rules to classified information.	**Indicator is** **Fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
17.	**C.3.1.1.** IOSUD, for every evaluated domain, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.	IOSUD, for each doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with foreign universities, with research institutes, with companies which perform activities within the studied field, which aims at the mobility of the doctoral students and the academic staff (e.g. ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies programme). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or any other form of mobility, such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD develops and implements plans and policies in order to increase the number of doctoral students that participate in internship programmes abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target of the European Higher Education Arena IOSUD ANIMV has a strategy of internationalization of the doctoral studies which is applied through the IOSUD ANIMV Regulation regarding the conclusion of the co-tutelage agreements. Considering the specific activity of IOSUD ANIMV and the limitations imposed by the regulatory framework which governs the organization and the activity of the institution, no agreements for the internationalization of the doctoral training were concluded until 2017. Since 2017, the ISN Doctoral School has enrolled doctoral students coming from both EU countries and non-member countries. Since 2017, ANIMV, in collaboration with a consortium of other research academic entities - University of Malta, Norwegian University of Science and Technologies, University of Groningen (The Netherlands), Edith Cowan University (Australia), Netherlands Forensic Institute, National Research Council (Italy)-,	**Indicator is** **Fulfilled**

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		organizes the doctoral programme ESSENTIAL, a European Joint Doctorate (EJD) type of study programme, which seeks to obtain excellence in the field of academic studies and encourages the development of innovative research projects, associated with complex problems in the field of security sciences. The novelty concepts for the Doctoral School are its multidisciplinary nature (law - IT&C - national security), mobility and international experience. Out of the total number of 56 doctoral students within the doctoral training programme, a number of 30 doctoral students, i.e. 53.57%>35%, took part in international conferences, where they presented scientific works.	
18.	**C.3.1.2.** In the evaluated doctoral study domain, support is granted, including financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.	The Doctoral School supports, including financially, the organization of international co tutelage doctoral studies, namely inviting renowned experts to lecture for the doctoral students IOSUD ANIMV and the Doctoral School in the field of Intelligence and National Security supports and encourages the organisation of international co-tutelage doctoral	**Indicator is Fulfilled**
19.	**C.3.1.3.** The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).	At least 10% of the Ph.D theses within the Doctoral School are written and/or defended in an international language or are drafted in co-tutelage. The 6 doctoral students in the ESSENTIAL programme, enrolled in 2017 are writing all their papers in English, and the PhD theses will be also in English, representing 10.71%>10% of the total number of students enrolled in the ISN Doctoral School. At the same time, these theses will be drafted in co-tutelage.	Ten percent is *extremly low* for graduates in doctoral degree program, and should be significally higher. For most schools at this level of education, foreign language is almost required at this of study.

Language courses and some level of compendency |

No.	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
			should be considered part of graduating requirement

Indicator is Partial fulfilled |

The recommendations contained in the report shall be resumed in the indicators' analysis. Other general recommendations may be made that do not fit within a particular indicator.

VERY IMPORTANT!!! – Each identified weakness must be correlated with at least one recommendation to improve the situation!

VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

After full evaluation of the doctoral degree program at "Mihai Viteazul" National Intelligence Academy, which included documents and talking with professors, graduates, current students and after reading the plans and programs, annexes, and all other documents, I have only one decision. The doctoral degree program offered by "Mihai Viteazul National Intelligence Academy is an extremely high-quality insitution of higher learning. All indicators are fulfilled. In the future, more collaboration activities both within and outside of the country would benefit this program. Although I was not able to determine the quality of resources for study through information technology, the school must keep up with this ever changing eviornment. This would include the investment of online and virtual learning resources.

I would also recommend investing and improving the role of foreign language as part of the Doctoral study, specifically English as well as other languages such as Manaderine Chinese for economic intelligence study. Although this program seems to be exclusive to in-country citizens, the possibility of expanding the student population to English speaking countries (UK, USA, Commonwealth Countries, etc..) would internationalize the program. A separate domestic component can focus on internal security. This would provide a new oreign dimension for both the students and the faculty. Without a doubt, this is an excellent doctoral studies program and it has great potential.

Date: 04.10.2021

ARACIS International Evaluator
Professor Jan Goldman