

ROMANIAN AGENCY FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN HIGHER EDUCATION

Full member of the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education - **ENQA**Listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education - **EQAR**

Annex No. 3

The External Evaluation Report of a Doctoral Study Domain

Table of Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Summary of Ratings and Recommendations
- VI. Conclusions and General Recommendations
- VII. Annexes

I. Introduction¹

This report was drafted during the evaluation visit of the doctoral study field in MANAGEMENT at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad. The visit took place between the 27th and the 28th of July 2023, and the expert evaluation committee consisted of:

- Prof. Cosmin DOBRIN, PhD.
- Prof. Constanţa POPESCU, PhD.
- Prof. Lilia ŞARGU, PhD
- Stud Ştefan Rusu

The Management doctoral field is set to become a part of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad. The university, initially known as the "Institute of Higher Education," was established through Government Decision nr. 567/18.05.1990.

In 2008, "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad received accreditation as an Institutional Organizer of Doctoral Studies (IOSUD) by the Minister of Education, Research, and Youth, as specified in the Order and presently, there is a single doctoral school called the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School within the IOSUD-UAV. This school oversees three doctoral study fields, namely Philology, and Environmental Engineering.

The coordination of doctoral activities within the doctoral school is carried out by the Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD). As of now, "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad remains an Institutional Organizer of Doctoral Studies (IOSUD-UAV) and operates in accordance with the National Education Law (1/2001) and Government Decision 681/2011, which is the Code for Doctoral Studies.

In the academic year 2022-2023, a total of 92 doctoral students were enrolled in the Interdisciplinary School, comprising:

- 84 Romanian students, with 21 students on a state-funded basis and 63 students on a tuition-based (self-funded) basis.
- 8 international students, including 3 students funded by the Romanian state (EU students, Romanian students from all over the world), 1 student on a self-funded basis in Romanian currency (EU student, Romanian students from all over the world), 3 students on a self-funded basis in foreign currency, and 1 student on a self-funded basis in a non-

convertible currency.

During the year 2022, a total of 22 doctoral theses were defended. Out of these, 14 theses were analyzed by the National Commission for Granting Academic Titles and Diplomas (CNATDCU), and all 14 were confirmed through ministerial orders. Additionally, 8 theses were raised on the National Doctoral Platform for final evaluation by CNATDCU.

Furthermore, in the year 2020, within the IOSUD-UAV, two teaching staff members successfully defended their habilitation theses and obtained the habilitation certificate. In 2021, another teaching staff member who obtained the habilitation certificate also defended their habilitation thesis.

The primary mission of this doctoral program is to offer scientific preparation to doctoral students, fostering their expertise in the realm of management in sync with the dynamic changes in the economic and social landscape. Moreover, the program seeks to cultivate advanced research skills, promoting effective managerial practices and staying abreast of the latest trends in performance management.

The introduction of the doctoral program in Management seeks to provide candidates with the opportunity to cultivate proficiency in this intricate and ever-changing domain. By doing so, it aims to foster the acquisition of essential skills to effectively address present-day challenges in both the corporate sector and public administration.

The primary mission of the doctoral research program in Management is to ensure that doctoral students receive comprehensive scientific training that aligns with the ever-evolving economic and social landscape. The program also aims to foster the development of sophisticated research skills in the field, while promoting effective managerial practices and embracing emerging trends in performance management.

The general objective of doctoral university studies in Management is to impart advanced knowledge and skills relevant to the management of private or public organizations. This is achieved through the utilization of contemporary scientific research methodologies, thus equipping students to effectively address challenges in the management realm.

II. Methods

In the context of external evaluation procedure, both in the preparatory phase and during the evaluation visit, the following methods and tools were used:

- An assessment of the Internal Evaluation Report was carried out for the proposed doctoral studies program in Management.
- Documents, data, and electronic information available on the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School's website were analyzed.
- The institution's heritage buildings, such as classrooms, laboratories, the library, research center, and student reading rooms, were visited.
- A meeting with employers supporting the establishment of the doctoral studies program was held in room D13, Faculty of Economic Sciences (FSEco).
- Productive meetings and discussions were conducted with the management of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad, focusing on the functioning of the Management doctoral studies field.
 - Engaging discussions were held with doctoral supervisors within the Management doctoral studies field.
- Meetings were arranged with the responsible person overseeing the doctoral studies field under evaluation, as well as the team involved in preparing the Internal Evaluation Report.
- Fruitful meetings took place with directors and responsible individuals from research centers associated with the Management doctoral studies field.
 - Extensive meetings were conducted with representatives from various structures of the Interdisciplinary

Doctoral School, where the Management doctoral studies field will be housed.

III. Analysis of ARACIS's performance indicators

Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

The UAV Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (IOSUD) consists of a singular doctoral school called the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (ŞDI). This school encompasses three doctoral study fields: Theology, Philology, and Environmental Engineering. Recently, in 2023, accreditation was successfully obtained for the Social Assistance field, and its operation is scheduled to commence in the academic year 2023-2024.

UAV IOSUD possesses the necessary organizational capacity, material and financial resources, human resources, and expertise required to function in full compliance with the relevant legal provisions.

Criterion A.1. Institutional Administrative and Managerial Structures, and Financial Resources

Standard A.1.1. The organizing institution of doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented efficient functioning mechanisms as provided by the specific legislation regarding the organization of doctoral studies.

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (IOSUD) at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has successfully sanctioned and put into effect the regulations mandated by the specific legislation concerning the structure and management of doctoral studies.

Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.

The existence of specific regulations and their implementation at the level of the doctoral school to which the doctoral study field belongs includes:

- a) The Doctoral School's Regulations.
- b) The Methodology for conducting elections for the position of the Doctoral School Council (CSD) Director, as well as the election of the student representative in the CSD, along with evidence of their conduct.
- c) Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (admission of doctoral students, completion of doctoral studies).
- d) Mechanisms for recognizing the quality of doctoral supervisors and the equivalence of doctoral degrees obtained in other countries.
- e) Functional leadership structures (Doctoral School Council), including evidence of regularity in convening meetings.
- f) The Doctoral Study Contract.
- g) Internal procedures for analyzing and approving proposals regarding the thematic content of the training program based on advanced university studies.

Within the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, the following specific regulations exist and are applied:

- a) Regulation R63 governs the organization and functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at UAV.
- b) The methodology for electing and appointing CSUD members at UAV is established according to specific guidelines.
- c) Methodology M09 sets forth the criteria and procedures for admission to doctoral studies, while Operational

Procedure PO 54 outlines the evaluation process for doctoral students within the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at UAV. Additionally, Regulation R75 addresses the organization and conduct of the final examination for doctoral studies.

- d) Within the Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, Article 19 to Article 24 describes the process for recognizing the status of a doctoral supervisor. Moreover, there exists a methodology, found in Annex_A29.pdf, which deals with the recognition and equivalence of doctoral degrees earned in other countries, as well as the status of a doctoral supervisor obtained abroad.
- e) The Educational Management Information System (REI) contains records of functional leadership structures and evidence of regular convening of meetings at specified intervals. The establishment of the Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD) is documented in HBPS no. 48 on May 13, 2021.
- f) The Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, specifically Article 16 to Article 17, governs the Doctoral Study Contract. A model of the Doctoral Study Contract, along with an Additional Act, is presented in Annex_A30.pdf.
- g) The procedure for establishing the thematic content of the training program based on advanced university studies is outlined in the Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, encompassing Article 53 to Article 59.

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (IOSUD) at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has established the Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD) along with its leadership structures following an approved methodology and calendar. The Doctoral School Council comprises the director of the doctoral school and members, with 75% representing doctoral supervisors or other scientific and socio-economic figures from outside the university and 25% being representatives of doctoral students.

The completion of doctoral studies at the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (IOSUD) at "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad follows the guidelines outlined in the Regulation on the Organization and Conduct of the Completion of Doctoral Studies within the Doctoral Schools of the IOSUD-UAV. This regulation was endorsed by HCA no. 18/05.03.2021 and approved by Senate Decision no. 84 on 16.03.2021.

The public defense of the doctoral thesis is conducted in accordance with various documents, including the Code of Doctoral Studies (Government Decision no. 681/2011 and Government Decision no. 134/2016 for amendments), the Methodology on the Public Defense of the Doctoral Thesis at the IOSUD - UAV (approved by Senate Decision no. 140 on 29.09.2020), the Procedure for the organization and conduct of the public defense session of the doctoral thesis at UAV (approved by the Council for Doctoral Studies (CSUD) on 09.05.2016), and the Procedure for the online defense of doctoral theses at UAV (approved by Senate Decision no. 80 on 29.04.2020).

Regarding recognition, the university follows the Methodology for the automatic recognition of the qualification of doctoral supervisor obtained in foreign accredited higher education institutions, as well as the recognition of the doctoral degree and the title of doctor obtained abroad. These methodologies are adopted in accordance with the respective orders issued by the Ministry of National Education and Scientific Research.

The internal evaluation reports of the doctoral school are public and available for consultation on the IOSUD website.

First-year doctoral students are required to undergo the advanced university training program and documentation, tailored to their respective doctoral fields and approved by the "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad's Board of Directors and Senate Decision no. 160 on 24.11.2020. Those enrolled in the budgeted form of education with a scholarship are also involved in teaching activities (4-6 hours per week).

Upon enrollment, all doctoral students sign a Doctoral Study Contract at the start of each academic year. This contract encompasses the activities during the doctoral studies of the doctoral student, the fulfillment of the Individual Doctoral Study Program under the authority of IOSUD-UAV and the Doctoral School. The contract outlines the relationships between the University, the doctoral student, and the doctoral supervisor, defining their rights and obligations according to the prevailing legislation. Additionally, it covers the contract's duration, language of the doctoral thesis drafting and defense, chosen research topic, rights and obligations of IOSUD-UAV, the doctoral student, and the doctoral supervisor, conditions for extension and termination of the study contract, conflict resolution mechanisms between the doctoral student and the doctoral school, and a special clause concerning intellectual property rights over results obtained during doctoral studies. If necessary, this study contract is accompanied by additional documents that regulate specific contractual clauses.

Recommendations:

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School should enhance its efforts to consistently update its web pages, ensuring that both PhD supervisors and candidates seeking admission or current PhD students can access all essential information. It is advisable for IOSUD to establish a comprehensive system of regulations, procedures, and tools that encompass the entire doctoral studies process, considering the diverse range of doctoral fields.

The indicator is fulfilled

The performance indicator A.1.1.2.

The School Doctoral Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures, and standards for the following aspects specified in Article 17(5) of the Doctoral Studies Code, approved by Government Decision No. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions.

The School Doctoral Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures, and standards for:

- The procedures for changing the doctoral supervisor of a specific doctoral student and the processes for mediating conflicts can be found in the "Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School," specifically in article 32.
- Providing access to research resources is ensured by granting doctoral students access to research centers and the documentary resources of the university library, as well as online scientific databases such as ANELIS.
- The "Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at UAV" (2020), articles 53 to 59, outlines the mechanisms for making decisions regarding the opportunity, structure, and content of the training program based on advanced university studies.
- The conditions under which the doctoral program can be interrupted are mentioned in article 51 of the "Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School." In case of interruptions, the doctoral study program can be extended accordingly, following the provisions of HG 681/2011, as specified in article 51.
- The acceptance of new doctoral supervisors and the regulations concerning the process of removing a doctoral supervisor's membership in the doctoral school are covered in the "Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at UAV" (2020), specifically in articles 19 to 24, with a particular focus on article 21.

- The attendance obligations of doctoral students are outlined in the "Regulation on the Organization and Functioning of the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School," in articles 52 to 65.
- To prevent research fraud, including plagiarism, the use of similarity reports obtained from sistemulantiplagiat.ro is implemented.

Recommendations:

Continuously updating the regulations of the doctoral school in accordance with existing legislation, ensuring regular discussions among all members to address quality matters and incorporate specific concerns into the updates. Monitoring and endorsing the successful practices currently implemented, while consistently integrating compulsory performance criteria, procedures, and precise standards into the Doctoral School's regulations, with a commitment to transparency by making them publicly available.

The indicator is fulfilled

Standard A.1.2. The Doctoral School has the necessary logistical resources to fulfill the mission of doctoral studies.

After analyzing the submitted documents and conducting an on-site visit, "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has determined that the Doctoral School (IOSUD) possesses the essential logistical resources to effectively carry out its mission in providing doctoral studies in the field of Management.

The performance indicator A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of a suitable computer system for recording doctoral students and their academic progress.

"Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has been utilizing an academic management platform (SUMS - https://core.uav.ro) for all three study cycles, including the doctoral program. The functionality of the platform was thoroughly assessed during the visit and was found to be suitable for accurately recording and managing doctoral students' information and academic advancements.

Recommendation:

Generating reports that encompass pertinent performance and quality data concerning the activities within the doctoral field and ensuring their accessibility on the doctoral school's website.

The indicator is fulfilled.

The performance indicator A.1.2.2. Existence and utilization of a suitable computer program and evidence of its usage for checking the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.

"Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has implemented operational procedures, regulations, and methodologies for undergraduate, master's, and doctoral programs that mandate the use of an anti-plagiarism system, following the technical specifications of the platform Sistemantiplagiat.ro (https://sistemantiplagiat.ro/clienti/educatie/), (Anexa_A31 Sistem antiplagiat).

At the CSUD level, it has been established that the similarity coefficient value of 2 (15-word fragments) should not exceed 5%. From June 2016 until present, a total of 58 doctoral students have been enrolled for the public defense of their doctoral thesis, and it is noteworthy that all candidates (100%) have been admitted for defense due to the verification of the similarity coefficient.

Recommendations:

Maintaining a comprehensive record of the software platform's usage, ensuring easy accessibility of the obtained results to applicants.

Consistently employing the anti-plagiarism software and regularly updating it to expand the database of verifiable sources, thereby enhancing the originality of doctoral theses and research papers.

The indicator has been fulfilled.

Criterion A.2. Research Infrastructure

Standard A.2.1. IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure that supports the implementation of specific activities related to doctoral studies.

The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad is equipped with a high-quality research infrastructure that effectively supports various activities associated with doctoral studies.

The performance indicator A 2.1.1. The spaces and material equipment of the Doctoral School allow for the accomplishment of research activities in the evaluated domain, in accordance with the assumed mission and objectives. The facilities include computers, specialized software, laboratory equipment, library resources, access to international databases, and other necessary equipment. The research infrastructure and the range of research services are publicly presented through a dedicated platform. It is important to highlight the distinct research infrastructure that has been acquired and developed over the past 5 years, which has contributed significantly to enhancing the research capabilities of the Doctoral School. This includes the acquisition of state-of-the-art equipment, the implementation of advanced software and technology, and the establishment of specialized research laboratories and centers. The continuous improvement and development of the research infrastructure demonstrate the commitment of the institution to providing a conducive environment for high-quality research and ensuring the successful completion of doctoral studies.

One of the key strategic priorities of "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad is dedicated to research, development, and scientific innovation, aimed at supporting high-quality higher education with dynamic, flexible, efficient, and reality-adapted management. This approach adds significant value to the university and seeks to enhance its national and international visibility.

The preparation programs are based on advanced studies and individual scientific research, forming the foundation for the elaboration of the doctoral thesis. Doctoral students actively participate in scientific projects established by their respective doctoral supervisors. The research activities are evaluated by both the doctoral supervisors and the guidance committees. The spaces include well-equipped classrooms, lecture halls, seminar rooms, and laboratories with advanced computer technology and multimedia systems, such as video and overhead projectors, projection screens, and smart boards.

The doctoral school's material equipment facilitates the proper conduct of research activities within both ŞDI and DSUD - MAN.

In specialized disciplines' study plans, practical application hours take place in well-equipped laboratories with computer technology, multimedia systems, and specific equipment.

Recommendations:

Creating and implementing a mechanism at the interdisciplinary Doctoral School level to attract resources and

funds from the private sector.

The indicator has been fulfilled.

Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources

Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain, there is qualified personnel with the necessary experience to carry out the doctoral study program.

The Management domain, to be established within the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School at "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad, boasts qualified personnel with the requisite experience to ensure the successful implementation of the doctoral study program.

Performance Indicator A.3.1.1. Within the doctoral domain, a minimum of 3 doctoral supervisors are actively involved, and at least 50% of them (but not fewer than 3) meet the minimum standards set by the National Council for Titles, Diplomas, and University Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time of evaluation, which are necessary and mandatory for obtaining the habilitation certificate.

Recommendations:

The continuous monitoring and encouragement of members within the academic community are essential to ensure they meet the minimum criteria and to empower them. Additionally, efforts will be made to identify potential foreign doctoral supervisors who can be affiliated with the field of Management.

The indicator is fulfilled.

The performance indicator A.3.1.2. states that at least 50% of doctoral supervisors in the evaluated doctoral domain are full-time employees with indefinite contracts within the IOSUD.

Within the newly established Management doctoral field, there are 3 doctoral supervisors responsible for conducting didactic activities as per the specific education plans for each university doctoral study. Among these supervisors, 2 hold positions in the Faculty of Economic Sciences (FSEco) at "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad. These individuals are Prof. univ. PhD SILVIU-GABRIEL SZENTESI and Assoc. habilitated doctor LAVINIA DENISIA CUC.

Recommendations:

The ongoing monitoring and support of members within the academic community are vital to ensure they meet the minimum criteria and to empower them in their academic pursuits. Furthermore, efforts will be made to identify potential foreign doctoral supervisors who can be associated with the field of Management. These actions aim to enhance the quality and international collaboration of the Management doctoral program.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator A.3.1.3. The subjects in the training program based on advanced university studies related to the field are supported by teaching staff or researchers who have the capacity of PhD supervisor/qualification, professor/CS I or university lecturer/CS II with proven expertise in the field of taught subjects or other specialists in the

field who meet the standards established by the institution for the previously mentioned teaching and research functions, in accordance with the law.

The field of doctoral university studies in Management will be supported by the following tenured and associate teaching staff, all of whom have the qualification and experience as doctoral supervisors and possess proven expertise in the field of the taught subjects.

Recommendations:

The selection of disciplines for each doctoral student must consider the unique aspects of the Management field, the selected research topic, and the relevant knowledge required to develop their doctoral thesis.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Standard A.3.2. The PhD supervisors in the field carry out an internationally visible scientific activity.

The **Management** doctoral field to be established within the ŞDI of the "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad has doctoral supervisors with an internationally visible scientific activity.

Performance indicator A.3.2.1. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the field subject to evaluation present at least 5 Web of Science or ERIH indexed publications in journals with an impact factor or other achievements with relevant significance for the respective field, in which international level contributions are found that reveal a progress in scientific research-development-innovation for the evaluated field. The PhD supervisors mentioned have international visibility in the last 5 years, consisting of: membership in scientific committees of international publications and conferences; membership in the boards of international professional associations; guest status at conferences or expert groups held abroad or membership of committees supporting doctoral theses at foreign universities or in joint supervision with a foreign university. For the branches of science Arts and Science of sport and physical education, PhD supervisors will prove their international visibility in the last 5 years through membership in the boards of professional associations, through membership in the organizing committees of artistic events and international competitions, respectively through membership in juries or arbitration teams in artistic events or international competitions.

All coordinators within the Management field meet the criteria of scientific publishing quality, with each presenting a minimum of 5 papers indexed in Web of Science or ERIH recognized journals, having an impact factor, or showcasing other notable achievements relevant to their respective field. In terms of international visibility, including the number of citations in Web of Science and Google Scholar, membership in professional associations, and involvement in the editorial boards of international or national journals listed in international databases.

Recommendations:

The performance achievements of PhD supervisors, as well as the international visibility of PhD students, are continuously monitored. Additional efforts are made to enhance the international visibility of doctoral supervisors and attract supervisors with strong international presence in the Management field.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator * A.3.2.2. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be active scientifically, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the CNATDCU minimum standards in force on the evaluation date, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the qualification certificate, based on the scientific results of the last 5 years.

Out of the three doctoral supervisors assigned to the Management field, all of them obtained their qualification in Management between 2021 and 2023. Additionally, they were scientifically active with a 100% compliance with the CNATDCU minimum standards during the assessment period, even in the five years preceding their qualification. They achieved more than 25% of the score required by the CNATDCU minimum standards at the time of the assessment, which was necessary and mandatory for obtaining their qualification certificate.

Recommendations:

Continuous analysis to ensure that each doctoral supervisor adheres to the CNATDCU minimum standards. Additionally, efforts should be made to promote research activity among the supervisors to maintain a high standard of doctoral supervision in the field.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

The "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad and the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School (IOSUD) demonstrate a commendable educational effectiveness, providing an environment conducive to conducting doctoral studies under optimal quality conditions.

Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates who appeared for the admissions competition

Standard B.1.2. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.

Performance indicator* B.1.2.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: candidates' academic, research and professional performance, their interest in scientific or artistic/sports research, publications in the field and a proposed research topic. An interview with the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure.

"Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad has a transparent and rigorous policy for recruiting and admitting doctoral students, ensuring equal opportunities for all candidates. Admission is solely based on academic skills, without any discriminatory criteria. The admission procedure follows the Methodology and specific criteria for admission to doctoral university studies, which can be found on the university's website. Participation in the admission procedure for doctoral university studies is open to graduates holding a master's degree or its equivalent, both from within the country and abroad. The admission competition is held annually in September.

	•									
ŀ	łρ	ന	m	m	ρı	าก	m	חוד	ns:	_

The indicator is fulfilled

Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral degree programs

Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is suitable to improve the research skills of PhD students and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

The training program based on advanced university studies in the field of **Management** is appropriate and designed to improve the research skills of PhD students and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

Performance indicator B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced university studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students, of which at least one discipline is intended for the in-depth study of research methodology and/or statistical data processing.

The doctoral field of Management offers doctoral students a comprehensive training program, consisting of advanced university studies and various activities conducted within institutionalized study groups, courses, and seminars.

To pursue doctoral university studies in Management, students are required to complete an advanced university training program in the first semester of the first year. This program includes courses on Scientific Research Methodology, Ethics, and Academic Integrity. The overall doctoral university study program in Management comprises two components: (a) the doctoral student's advanced university training program, and (b) the doctoral student's individual research program, supervised by a scientific advisor. The standard duration of the doctoral program is three years, but with valid reasons and approval from the university senate, it can be extended by 1-2 years within the constraints of available resources.

Recommendations:

The consistent adaptation and exploration of novel concepts to enrich the content of pertinent disciplines aimed at enhancing the scientific research training of Management PhD students. Additionally, the incorporation of specialized seminars within the educational curriculum to address research methodological challenges (both qualitative and quantitative) specific to the field of Management.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator B.2.1.2. There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property or well-defined themes on these topics within a discipline taught in the training program.

The Ethics and Academic Integrity course offered in the Education Plan of DSUD focuses on the ethical aspects of scientific research and intellectual property. This discipline includes a comprehensive training program that aims to equip doctoral students with the necessary skills to conduct research with integrity, adhering to research ethics and professional standards. The topics covered in this course encompass matters concerning originality, plagiarism, citation methods, and more. Its main objective is to cultivate an honest research approach among the students.

Recommendations:

Organization of periodic seminars/workshops on ethical issues in research..

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator B.2.1.3. IOSUD has created the mechanisms to ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the evaluated field, targets "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through research activities¹.

At the IOSUD-UAV level, study programs, including doctoral programs, are initiated, approved, monitored, and evaluated through an internal mechanism. According to the Regulation governing the initiation, approval, monitoring, and periodic evaluation of study programs (Art. 6, para. (3)), the process involves several stages. The initiation of new study programs is proposed by the department, approved by the faculty council, further endorsed by the Board of Administration, and finally approved by the UAV Senate. This approval process is based on comprehensive analyses of both external and internal factors affecting the university.

The curriculum for the doctoral program is approved by CŞDI (specific entity) (Art. 54.). The courses offered within the program are organized for all doctoral students undergoing advanced university studies.

Additionally, IOSUD-UAV conducts periodic annual evaluations of its activities following a procedure approved by the University Senate. This evaluation process includes periodic self-evaluations of the study programs offered, as well as the evaluation of the entire IOSUD activity, covering all aspects related to the third cycle of university studies. This evaluation aims to assess compliance with the relevant legislation and performance indicators for a doctoral/IOSUD field. The self-evaluation report is subsequently approved by the University Senate and made available on the IOSUD page.

An essential aspect of the internal evaluation involves students providing feedback on teaching staff, and doctoral students evaluating their supervisors. The purpose is to gauge the level of satisfaction of doctoral students within the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School regarding the support and mentoring provided by their supervisors. This assessment is carried out through the SUMS IT platform, and the results are analyzed and published on the institution's website.

Recommendations:

Enhancing and extending these mechanisms to encompass doctoral studies in Management is essential to establish a connection between the learning outcomes of individual courses and those that are specific to the field, while also aligning them with EU standards.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT

The IOSUD, part of the "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad, along with its interdisciplinary Doctoral School, showcases effective quality management that ensures favorable conditions for doctoral studies. However, there is room for enhancing internationalization efforts at the doctoral school level.

¹ Or by what the graduate must know, understand and be able to do, in accordance with the provisions of the Methodology for enrollment and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Higher Education Qualifications (RNCIS), approved by Order of the Minister of National Education 3.475/2017, with subsequent amendments and additions

Criterion C.1. The existence and regular development of the internal quality assurance system

Standard C.1.1. The institutional framework is in place and policies and procedures are in place for relevant internal quality assurance.

The "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad's IOSUD has established and continues to develop an institutional framework for internal quality assurance. The implementation of quality assurance procedures is carried out consistently and systematically.

Performance indicator C.1.1.1. The doctoral school in which the field of university doctoral studies falls provides proof of the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal assurance of its quality in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at the level of IOSUD, among the criteria evaluated, the following must be found:

- a) scientific activity of doctoral supervisors;
- b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;
- c) the regulations and procedures based on which doctoral studies are organized;
- d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;
- e) the training program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students;
- f) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling services available to doctoral students.

The "Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad maintains a strong commitment to evaluating and ensuring internal quality across all three study cycles (bachelor, master, doctorate) through a well-established system of procedures.

To ensure the quality of doctoral studies, several key practices are in place:

- a) Each year, the scientific activity of doctoral supervisors is thoroughly assessed within the ŞDI, with supervisors conducting self-evaluations.
- b) The necessary infrastructure and logistics for research activities are thoroughly addressed in separate sections of the self-evaluation reports on the \$DI's activity.
- c) The regulations and procedures governing the organization of studies are transparently available on the university's website.
- d) The scientific activity of doctoral students undergoes annual evaluations based on factors such as accumulated ECTS credits, progress on their scientific research plans, and the implementation of corrective measures if needed. This progress is assessed using operational procedure 54. Doctoral students' scientific achievements are documented as a dedicated chapter in the self-evaluation reports of the ŞDI.
- e) The training programs for doctoral students are periodically analyzed to ensure their relevance and effectiveness in preparing students across all doctoral fields.
- f) The university provides essential social and academic support services for PhD students, including scholarships, access to specialized scientific literature, career counseling, guidance, and accommodation in dedicated dormitories. Additionally, access to funds for mobility and publication is similar to that for teachers and is generally tied to available grants.

Recommendations:

To embed continuous monitoring of the university's quality assurance processes and operations in line with existing regulations, making it an integral aspect of the university's organizational culture.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator* C.1.1.2. During the doctoral training internship, evaluation mechanisms are implemented aimed at identifying the needs, as well as the general level of satisfaction with the doctoral university study program of the doctoral students, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the obtained results, the development and implementation of a plan of measures is proven.

Based on the report sent and the observations made during the field visit at IOSUD-UAV, it is evident that the institution has established and implemented procedures focused on continually enhancing academic and administrative processes. These procedures involve measuring the satisfaction of doctoral students, addressing both academic and administrative aspects. The evaluation of satisfaction is conducted through the SUMS IT platform, and the generated reports provide valuable insights.

Recommendation

To enhance the effectiveness of this procedure, it is advisable to ensure a more thorough implementation of its provisions and to revise the action plan for continual improvement of academic and administrative processes. Currently, at IOSUD-UAV, a questionnaire is being utilized to gauge the satisfaction level of doctoral students concerning their experiences within the doctoral studies program. This questionnaire serves as a valuable instrument for identifying the specific needs of students at the doctoral school level. However, it is equally important to consider examining the management studies program separately to gain a comprehensive understanding of its unique requirements and areas for improvement.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility to learning resources

\$DI within the UAV shows transparency in the presentation of information and accessibility to learning resources.

Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates, respectively information of public interest is available for consultation in electronic format.

For the establishment of **the Management field** within the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, relevant information for current doctoral students and prospective candidates, as well as information of public interest, will be made accessible in electronic format. This information can be accessed through the "Aurel Vlaicu" University website, which will feature a dedicated section specifically for the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School. By providing this electronic platform, individuals will have easy access to valuable resources related to the Management field within the Doctoral School, ensuring transparency and convenience for all stakeholders.

Performance indicator C.2.1.1. IOSUD publishes, on the website of the higher education institution, in compliance with the regulations in force regarding data protection, information such as:

- a) regulations of the doctoral school;
- b) admission regulations;
- c) the doctoral studies contract;
- d) the regulations for completing the studies, including the procedure for public defense of the thesis;
- e) the content of training programs based on advanced university studies;

- f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the PhD supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact details;
- g) list of doctoral students in the field with basic information (year of registration, supervisor);
- h) information about the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;
- i) links to the summaries of the doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense.

IOSUD UAV has published on the official website information of public interest for the Interdisciplinary Doctoral School, such as the regulations, methodologies and procedures specific to doctoral university studies, as mentioned above.

Recommendations:

Monitoring and constantly updating the web page of IOSUD-UAV, including the English version in order to increase the level of internationalization.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Standard C.2.2. IOSUD/Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources necessary to carry out their doctoral studies.

Doctoral candidates are provided with the essential resources required for conducting their doctoral studies under favorable conditions. These resources include access to platforms hosting academic databases relevant to their field of study, availability of scientific research laboratories, and various other facilities to support their research endeavors.

Performance indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the analyzed doctoral field of study.

Doctoral students have access to the ANELIS-PLUS database platform), Science Direct, Web of Science.

Recommendations:

Periodic initiation and notification, especially for freshman PhD students students, regarding free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the field of Management.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator C.2.2.2. Every doctoral student has access, upon request, to an electronic system for checking the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations.

"Aurel Vlaicu" University of Arad utilizes the plagiarism detection software - SISTEMANTIPLAGIAT.RO. Doctoral students have the option to request a verification of the similarity index of their doctoral thesis to ensure

compliance before it is eligible for support or publication.

Recommendations:

The university should make changes to the platform's accessibility to enhance convenience for doctoral students.

These modifications aim to streamline the process of verifying scientific works conducted throughout their doctoral studies, including scientific articles and research reports.

The indicator is fulfilled.

Performance indicator C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities, depending on the specifics of the field/fields within the doctoral school, according to internal regulations.

Doctoral students have access to the scientific research laboratories and facilities of the "Aurel Vlaicu" University in Arad, according to art. 12, lit. c from the regulation on the professional activity of students (Annex_C10.pdf, Regulation on the professional activity of students based on transferable credits).

Recommendations:

Online information on how to access the existing research infrastructure to inform the PhD students who have been newly admitted.

The indicator is fulfilled.

IV. The SWOT ANALYSIS

Strong points:

- The scientific research results of doctoral students are disseminated in journals with an impact factor and presented at national and international conferences.
- The existing infrastructure within IOSUD-UAV provides support for the mission and objectives within the doctoral field.
- The prominence of doctoral supervisors in the Management doctoral field and their research contributions.
- There is a significant number of graduates from 1st and 2nd cycle university studies in the field of economic sciences.

Weaknesses:

- The level of internationalization is rather limited
- The ongoing effort to identify researchers specializing in Management to be affiliated with IOSUD-UAV continues.
- There is a decline in the number of partnerships with foreign institutions, hindering the organization of cosupervision doctorates.
- The number of foreign doctoral students and supervisors is low.
- Low number of full-time teaching staff holding a doctorate in Management.

Opportunities:

- The relevance of the proposed research topics, which hold appeal within the PhD field of Management.
- The presence of numerous collaboration agreements with partners from the socioeconomic sphere in the realm of PhD Management.

Threats:

- The limited count of doctoral supervisors possessing IOSUD-UAV credentials.
- The diminished global recognition resulting from the scarcity of coguardianship agreements.

V. Synthesis of the qualifications awarded and the recommendations

No. Crt.	Indicator type (IP, IP*, IPC)	Performance Indicator	Qualifying	Recommandations
1.	PI	A.1.1.1. The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the doctoral school of which the field of university doctoral studies is a part: a) regulations of the doctoral school; b) the methodology for conducting the elections for the position of director of the Doctoral School Council (CSD), as well as the students' choice of the representative in the CSD, and evidence of their conduct; c) methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral university studies (admission of doctoral students, completion of doctoral university studies); d) the existence of mechanisms for the recognition of the quality of doctoral supervisor and for the equivalence of the doctorate obtained in other states; e) functional management structures (Council of the Doctoral School), proving including the regularity of convening meetings; f) the doctoral university studies contract; g) internal procedures for analysis and approval of proposals regarding the subject of the training program based on advanced university studies.	Fulfilled	The Interdisciplinary Doctoral School should enhance its efforts to consistently update its web pages, ensuring that both PhD supervisors and candidates seeking admission or current PhD students can access all essential information. It is advisable for IOSUD to establish a comprehensive system of regulations, procedures, and tools that encompass the entire doctoral studies process, considering the diverse range of doctoral fields.
2.		A.1.1.2. The regulations of the doctoral school include mandatory criteria, procedures and standards for the aspects specified in art. 17, para. (5) from Government Decision no. 681/2011 regarding the approval of the Code of doctoral university studies, with subsequent amendments and additions.		Continuously updating the regulations of the doctoral school in accordance with existing legislation, ensuring regular discussions among all members to address quality matters and incorporate specific concerns into the updates. Monitoring and endorsing the successful practices currently implemented, while consistently integrating compulsory performance criteria, procedures, and precise standards into the Doctoral School's regulations, with a commitment to transparency by making them publicly available.
3.	I PI	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an adequate computer system for the record of	Fulfilled	Generating reports that encompass pertinent performance and quality data concerning the

No.	Indicator type	Performance Indicator	Qualifying	Recommandations
Crt.	(IP, IP*, IPC)			
		doctoral students and their academic progress.		activities within the doctoral field and ensuring their accessibility on the doctoral school's website.
4.	PI	A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a computer program and evidence of its use for checking the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	Fulfilled	Maintaining a comprehensive record of the software platform's usage, ensuring easy accessibility of the obtained results to applicants. Consistently employing the anti-plagiarism software and regularly updating it to expand the database of verifiable sources, thereby enhancing the originality of doctoral theses and research papers.
5.	СРІ	A.2.1.1. The spaces and material endowment of the doctoral school allow the realization of research activities, in the evaluated field, in accordance with the mission and the assumed objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases, etc.). The research infrastructure and the research service offer are presented publicly through a profile platform. The research infrastructure described above, acquired and developed in the last 5 years, will be highlighted.		Creating and implementing a mechanism at the interdisciplinary Doctoral School level to attract resources and funds from the private sector.
6.	СРІ	A.3.1.1. Within the doctoral field, at least three doctoral supervisors work and at least 50% of them (but not less than three) meet the CNATDCU minimum standards in force at the time of the evaluation, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the qualification certificate.		The continuous monitoring and encouragement of members within the academic community are essential to ensure they meet the minimum criteria and to empower them. Additionally, efforts will be made to identify potential foreign doctoral supervisors who can be affiliated with the field of Management.
7.	PI*	A.3.1.2. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors in the evaluated doctoral field are tenured within IOSUD, employed with the conclusion of an employment contract for an indefinite period.	Fulfilled	The ongoing monitoring and support of members within the academic community are vital to ensure they meet the minimum criteria and to empower them in their academic pursuits. Furthermore, efforts will be made to identify potential foreign doctoral supervisors who can be associated with the field of Management. These actions aim to enhance the quality and international collaboration of the Management doctoral program.
8.	PΙ	A.3.1.3. The subjects in the training program based on advanced university studies related to the field are supported by teaching staff or researchers who have the capacity of PhD supervisor / qualification, professor / CS I or university lecturer / CS II with proven expertise in the field of taught subjects or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution for the previously mentioned teaching and research functions, in accordance with the law.	Fulfilled	The selection of disciplines for each doctoral student must consider the unique aspects of the Management field, the selected research topic, and the relevant knowledge required to develop their doctoral thesis.
9.	СРІ	A.3.2.1. At least 50% of the PhD supervisors in the field under evaluation present at least 5	Fulfilled	The performance achievements of PhD supervisors, as well as the international visibility

No.	Indicator			
Crt.	type (IP, IP*, IPC)	Performance Indicator	Qualifying	Recommandations
		Web of Science or ERIH indexed publications in journals with an impact factor or other achievements, with relevant significance for the respective field in which international level contributions are found that reveal a progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated field. The PhD supervisors mentioned have international visibility in the last five years, consisting of: membership in scientific committees of international publications and conferences; membership in the boards of international professional associations; guest status at conferences or expert groups held abroad or membership of committees supporting doctoral theses at foreign universities or in joint supervision with a foreign university. For the branches of science Arts and Science of sport and physical education, PhD supervisors will prove their international visibility in the last five years through membership in the boards of professional associations, through membership in the organizing committees of artistic events and international competitions, respectively through membership in juries or arbitration teams in artistic events or international competitions.		of PhD students, are continuously monitored. Additional efforts are made to enhance the international visibility of doctoral supervisors and attract supervisors with strong international presence in the Management field.
10.	PI *	A.3.2.2. At least 50% of the doctoral supervisors assigned to a field of doctoral studies continue to be scientifically active, obtaining at least 25% of the score required by the CNATDCU minimum standards in force at the time of the evaluation, necessary and mandatory for obtaining the qualification certificate, based on the scientific results of the last five years.	Fulfilled	Continuous analysis to ensure that each doctoral supervisor adheres to the CNATDCU minimum standards. Additionally, efforts should be made to promote research activity among the supervisors to maintain a high standard of doctoral supervision in the field.
11.	PI *	B.1.2.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria that include: candidates' academic, research and professional performance, their interest in scientific or artistic/sports research, publications in the field and a proposed research topic. An interview with the applicant is a mandatory part of the admission procedure.	Fulfilled	
12.	PI	B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced university studies includes at least three disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students, of which at least one discipline is intended for the indepth study of research methodology and/or statistical data processing.	Fulfilled	The consistent adaptation and exploration of novel concepts to enrich the content of pertinent disciplines aimed at enhancing the scientific research training of Management PhD students. Additionally, the incorporation of specialized seminars within the educational curriculum to address research methodological challenges (both qualitative and quantitative) specific to the field of Management.

No. Crt.	Indicator type (IP, IP*, IPC)	Performance Indicator	Qualifying	Recommandations
13.	PI	B.2.1.2. There is at least one discipline dedicated to ethics in scientific research and intellectual property or well-defined themes on these topics within a discipline taught in the training program.	Fulfilled	Organization of periodic seminars/workshops on ethical issues in research.
14.	PI	B.2.1.3. IOSUD has created the mechanisms that ensure that the training program based on advanced university studies, related to the assessed field, aims at "learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills and responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through research activities	Fulfilled	Enhancing and extending these mechanisms to encompass doctoral studies in Management is essential to establish a connection between the learning outcomes of individual courses and those that are specific to the field, while also aligning them with EU standards.
15.	PI	C.1.1.1. The doctoral school in which the field of university doctoral studies falls provides proof of the constant development of the process of evaluation and internal assurance of its quality in accordance with a procedure developed and applied at the level of IOSUD, among the criteria evaluated, the following must be found: a) scientific activity of doctoral supervisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity; c) the regulations and procedures based on which doctoral studies are organized; d) the scientific activity of doctoral students; e) the training program based on advanced university studies of doctoral students; f) social and academic support services (including participation in various events, publication of articles, etc.) and counseling services available to doctoral students.	Fulfilled	To embed continuous monitoring of the university's quality assurance processes and operations in line with existing regulations, making it an integral aspect of the university's organizational culture.
16.	PI*	C.1.1.2. During the doctoral training internship, evaluation mechanisms are implemented that aim to identify the needs, as well as the general level of satisfaction with the doctoral university studies program, of the doctoral students, in order to continuously improve the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the obtained results, the development and implementation of a plan of measures is proven.	Fulfilled	To enhance the effectiveness of this procedure, it is advisable to ensure a more thorough implementation of its provisions and to revise the action plan for continual improvement of academic and administrative processes. Currently, at IOSUD-UAV, a questionnaire is being utilized to gauge the satisfaction level of doctoral students concerning their experiences within the doctoral studies program. This questionnaire serves as a valuable instrument for identifying the specific needs of students at the doctoral school level. However, it is equally important to consider examining the management studies program separately to gain a comprehensive understanding of its unique requirements and areas for improvement.
17.	PCI	C.2.1.1. IOSUD publishes, on the website of the higher education institution, in compliance with the regulations in force regarding data protection, information such as: a) regulations of the doctoral school;	Fulfilled	Monitoring and constantly updating the web page of IOSUD-UAV, including the English version in order to increase the level of internationalization.

No. Crt.	Indicator type (IP, IP*, IPC)	Performance Indicator	Qualifying	Recommandations
		b) admission regulations; c) the doctoral studies contract; d) the regulations for completing the studies, which also include the procedure for public defense of the thesis; e) the content of training programs based on advanced university studies; f) the scientific and scientific profile, thematic areas / research topics of the doctoral supervisors in the field, as well as their institutional contact details; g) list of doctoral students in the field with basic information (year of registration; supervisor); h) information about the standards for developing the doctoral thesis; i) links to the summaries of the doctoral theses to be defended publicly, as well as the date, time, place where they will be defended, at least 20 days before the defense.		
18.	PI	C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the analyzed doctoral field of study.	Fulfilled	Periodic initiation and notification, especially for freshman PhD students, regarding free access to platforms with academic databases relevant to the field of Management.
19.	PI	C.2.2.2. Every doctoral student has access, upon request, to an electronic system for checking the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic creations.	Fulfilled	The university should make changes to the platform's accessibility to enhance convenience for doctoral students. These modifications aim to streamline the process of verifying scientific works conducted throughout their doctoral studies, including scientific articles and research reports.
20.	PI	C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specifics of the field / fields within the doctoral school, according to internal regulations.	Fulfilled	Online information on how to access the existing research infrastructure to inform the PhD students who have been newly admitted.

VI. General conclusions and recommendations

The primary mission of the Management doctoral university study program is to provide doctoral students with comprehensive scientific training aligned with the evolving economic and social landscape. The program aims to cultivate advanced research skills while fostering excellence in managerial practices and embracing emerging trends related to high-performance management and the compulsory indicators are fulfilled.

Detailed schedule of the evaluation visit

Documents requested by IOSUD during the assessment visit

Expert Evaluator Prof. Lilia ŞARGU, PhD