



Nr înregistrare: 5941/10.10.2023

# The External Evaluation Report of the Doctoral Study Domain: Medicine

---

“Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad

Elena Raevschi, international evaluator

10/10/2023



Anexa 3  
**Raport de evaluare externă  
în vederea înființării unui domeniu  
de studii universitare de doctorat**

## **Contents:**

- I. Introduction
- II. Methods used
- III. Analysis of performance indicators
- IV. SWOT Analysis
- V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations
- VI. Conclusions and general recommendations
- VII. List of additional requested annexes

## **I. Introduction<sup>1</sup>**

The present report was performed as the result of the Doctoral study domain of Medicine external evaluation of “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad in the period of 25-27 September 2023 based on terms of reference and methodology of ARACIS.

The total list of the Experts' Panel in the Medicine Domain was, as follows:

1. Prof. dr. Daniela Adriana ION - Universitatea de Medicină și Farmacie "Carol Davila" București - coordinator;
2. Prof. dr. Maria PUIU - University de Medicină și Farmacie "Victor Babeș", Timișoara
3. Prof. Elena RAEVSCHI, international evaluator, Nicolae Testemitanu State University of Medicine and Pharmacy from the Republic of Moldova;
3. Gianluca MAROS, student-evaluator, George Emil Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology of Târgu Mureș.

The Doctoral School of Medicine (SDM) is part of IOSUD - UVVG, as a separate doctoral school, established by the Order of the Minister of Education and Research no. 4811/17.08.2005 with a single scientific domain - MEDICINE.

IOSUD-UVVG affiliated the two Doctoral Schools of Medicine and Biology to the Doctoral Studies Council of the Association of European Universities (CDE-EUA) since 2009. IOSUD also affiliated the Doctoral School of Medicine to the ORPHEUS network (Organization of Doctoral Schools in Bio -Medicine and Health Sciences in the European System) since 2016.

Starting December 2015, IOSUD-UVVG has affiliated the Doctoral Schools of Medicine and Biology to 4 doctoral research networks CEEPUS (Central European Exchange Program for University Studies).

SDM is continuously improving the management of the doctoral students' and supervisors' research results. The quality assurance process is based on ISO 9001: 2015 / ISO 9001: 2015

## **II. Methods used**

The evaluation activities were performed according to the timetable of the institutional evaluation visit – IOSUD Doctoral study domain of Medicine at the of “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad for the period of 25-27 September 2023.



In the preparation period was analyzed the Self-Evaluation Report Domain of Doctoral Studies Medicine of “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad (27 pages) and its annexes (n<sup>o</sup> 32). There were analyzed documents, data and information available on the IOSUD / Doctoral School’s website [www.uvvg.ro](http://www.uvvg.ro) , as well.

On-site visit was performed to obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of the university, to clarify the content of the Self-Evaluation Report. During the onsite visit it was required additional clarification for performance indicators, as follows: A.1.1.1.(e); A.1.2.1; A.2.1.1.; A. 3.1.1; A.3.1.2; A.3.2.1; A. 3.2.2; B.2.1.3.; C.1.1.1.

1) onsite meetings were held with:

- Representatives of the University’s Management;
- Representatives of the CSUD and of the Doctoral School;
- The contact person for the doctoral study domain under evaluation and the team;
- Academic staff members who are Doctoral advisors;
- Members of Research Ethics Commission;
- Commission for Quality Evaluation and Assurance (CEAC) members;
- Doctoral School Council members;
- Doctoral students, Graduates of Doctoral program in Medicine;
- Directors of the research centers/laboratories.

2) there was visited in person the following educational and research infrastructure units:

- The laboratory animal biobank with animal housing areas;
- Histopathology, light microscopy, fluorescence and confocal microscopy laboratory;
- Electron Microscopy Laboratory;
- Molecular Biology Laboratory;
- Plant Biotechnology Laboratory.

### III. Analysis of ARACIS’s performance indicators

#### Domain A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

The institutional capacity of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad as IOSUD Doctoral study domain Medicine was found as a compliant field.

**Criterion A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources**  
*Standard A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.*

The “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad as IOSUD Doctoral study domain Medicine provided all necessary evidence in order to confirm the implementation of the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.1.** *The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:*

---

<sup>1</sup> Each time when applicable the information shall be presented gender-wise.

The Doctoral School of "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad elaborated according with the legal regulations in place, approved by the Senate of the University:

(a) the internal regulations at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s): (1) *Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral academic studies at Vasile Goldis University of the West in Arad - revision 2; Senate decision no. 67/13.05.2016 (Annex 1, Self-Evaluation Report)*; (2) *Regulation on the organization and operation of the Doctoral School of Medicine - revision 2; Senate decision no. 238/31.10.2019 (Annex 2, Self-Evaluation Report)*;

(b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives was confirmed: (1) *The methodology regarding the process of establishing and choosing management structures and functions at the Vasile Goldis Western University in Arad for the term 2020-2024-rev.1; Senate decision no. 17/02/02/2021; Senate decision no. 31/18.02.2021 regarding the nominal component of the committee for appointing the directors of the Doctoral School of Medicine, as well as the election of members in the Councils of the Doctoral Schools; Senate decision no. 31/18.-2.2021; Documents proving the 2016 elections; Documents proving the 2021 elections (Annex 3, Self-Evaluation Report)*;

(c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies: (1) *The methodology for admission to doctoral university studies at the Vasile Goldis Western University in Arad for the academic year 2019-2020; Decisions of the University Senate no. 122/06.07.2016, 45/27.04.2017, 90/04.06.2018, 68/19.03.2019, 146/08.07.2020, 8/0.2.02.2021 (Annex 4, Self-Evaluation Report)*; (2) *The methodology for completing doctoral academic studies at Vasile Goldis University of the West in Arad - revision 1; Senate decision no. 195/25.09.2020 (Annex 5, Self-Evaluation Report)*;

(d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad: (1) *Procedure on the automatic recognition by the Vasile Goldis Western University of Arad of the quality of doctoral supervisor awarded by an accredited higher education institutions from abroad - revision 1; Senate decision no. 47/27.04.2017 (Annex 6, Self-Evaluation Report)*; (2) *Procedure regarding the recognition within the Vasile Goldis Western University of Arad of the doctor's degree and the title of doctor in sciences or in a professional field, awarded abroad - revision 1; Senate decision no. 46/27.04.2017 (Annex 7, Self-Evaluation Report)* ;

(e) functional management structures CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School with evidence of the regularity of meetings: *Centralizer of the Doctoral School of Medicine Council activity 2016-2022 (Annex 8, Self-Evaluation Report)*;

(f) the contract for doctoral studies: *Template framework contract for doctoral university studies; Senate decision no. 60/13.03.2020*;

(g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies: *University Senate decision no. 198/26.10.2021 regarding the approval of the Medicine Program for Advanced Academic Training -PPUA- curriculum*;

For point (e), additionally was required the Minutes of Council of the Doctoral School meetings (Additional Annex 1, The External Evaluation Report) along with provided planification documents in Annex 8 of Self-Evaluation Report.

**Recommendations:** To update according to the legislation in force the:

1) Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral academic studies at Vasile Goldis University of the West in Arad - revision 2; Senate decision no. 67/13.05.2016;



(2) Regulation on the organization and operation of the Doctoral School of Medicine - revision 2; Senate decision no. 238/31.10.2019;

**The indicator is fulfilled partially**

**Performance Indicator A.1.1.2.** *The doctoral school's Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.*

The Regulation for the organization and functioning of the Doctoral School Regulation establish the way in which the doctoral study programs are organized within the Doctoral School of "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad and include mandatory criteria, procedures and standards for the items specified in Art. 17, para. 5 of GD 681/2011 of the Government Decision No. 681/2011.

The institutional regulation and the regulation of the Doctoral School (Internal Report Annex 2) include criteria, procedures and mandatory standards for the matters specified in art. 17 para. (5) of the Code of doctoral studies, approved by Government Decision no. 681/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions, as follows:

- a) acceptance of new thesis supervisors and the manner whereby a thesis supervisor may excluded from the doctoral school;
- b) mechanisms for deciding on the adequacy, make-up and contents of the advanced university studies programme;
- c) procedures for replacing a doctoral student's thesis supervisor and conflict mediation procedures;
- d) conditions for interrupting a doctoral programme;
- e) the ways to prevent research fraud, including plagiarism;
- f) ensuring access to research resources;
- g) doctoral students' attendance requirements, based on a methodology developed by the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sports.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

*Standard A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad as IOSUD provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the presence of the logistical resources necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.1.** *The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academics.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad in order to keep track of doctoral students is using the "Academis" IT system, which includes the organizational management represented by general data tracking: students list by academic year, students' status and financial situation (Additional Annex 2, The External Evaluation Report).

The "Academis" IT system does not provide the tracking of academic background of students with access to doctoral students and supervisors the field of doctorate Medicine. Along with this, the doctoral school has a virtual secretariat module facility within the university website which provides relevant information on the doctoral study organizational process.



**Recommendations:** To accelerate the actions of digitalization of the tracking of academic background of students with access to doctoral students and supervisors of the Doctoral School in Medicine Domain.

**The indicator is fulfilled partially**

**Performance Indicator A.1.2.2.** *The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.*

The checking of the similarity percentage of doctoral theses is carried out by means of the software sistemantiplagiat.ro provided by SC Plagiat-Sistem Antiplagiat prin Internet SRL (Annex 12 Self-Evaluation Report).

All publicly defended theses have been checked in this computer program. In the period 2018 - 2021, 19 verifications were performed for the doctoral theses in the field of Medicine (Annex 13, Self-Evaluation Report). The checking of the similarity is performed according to the Regulations on generating and analyzing the similitude report for the doctoral thesis (Annex 23, Self-Evaluation Report).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Criterion A.2. Research infrastructure**

*Standard A.2.1. The IOSUD has a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.

**Performance Indicator A.2.1.1.** *The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly.*

The logistic resources made available to IOSUD-UVVG are located in the Vasile Goldis University Campus (Arad, 86L. Rebreanu St.) represented by 2 offices, meeting room, rooms for presentation of doctoral students' reports (C7), lecture halls (B4, B5, each with 150 seats), computer rooms (A23 - library with free access to computers for access to Scientometrics databases -20 computers; A26 and A27 - each with 35 computers) where the doctoral students' practical training on the use of electronic databases and the practical part of the biostatistics subject is carried out, conference hall (100 seats) for the public defenses of the doctoral theses provided with videoconferencing system. *Medical library* - reading rooms with 110 seats and 25 fixed computers connected to the internet, free wi-fi, provides the required conditions for individual study having 5 international databases (Annex 14, Self-Evaluation Report).

The preclinical research activity of PhD students is mainly carried out in the Institute of Life Sciences "Aurel Ardelean", established in 2008 (HS no. 81/12.04.2008) and accredited by the Academy of Medical Sciences, which is an interdisciplinary research unit, structured in 3 departments - Experimental and



Applied Biology, Biotechnologies, Ecology/Ecotoxicology and Environmental Protection. According to the Internal Report the infrastructure included:

- The laboratory animal biobank ([http://erris.gov.ro/animal\\_facility-ILS-UVVG](http://erris.gov.ro/animal_facility-ILS-UVVG)).
- Histopathology, light microscopy, fluorescence and confocal microscopy laboratory <http://erris.gov.ro/Histology-ILS-UVVG>
- Electron Microscopy Laboratory [https://erris.gov.ro/Electron\\_Microscopy\\_Facility|ILS](https://erris.gov.ro/Electron_Microscopy_Facility|ILS)).
- Molecular Biology Laboratory <https://erris.gov.ro/Molecular-biology--Institute>

The doctoral students' clinical research is carried out in the clinical research centers of the university, as well as in private clinics or university clinics and the annexed structures of the Emergency Clinical County Hospital of Arad (<http://www.scjarad.ro/>).

Most of the equipment in the ISV is acquired after 2010, some of which in the last 5 years. The research infrastructure and the provision of research services of the "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad are presented to the public through a specific platform <http://www.uvvg-ils.ro/laboratoare.html>

The Research infrastructure developing within the past 5 years evidences was required additionally (Additional Annex 3, The External Evaluation report). During the onsite visit, the research infrastructure development was found to be in line with the assumed mission and objectives corresponding to those described above.

**Recommendations:** To ensure better information of the doctoral students and supervisors regarding the research infrastructure facilities in order to make its use more efficient.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

### **Criterion A.3. Quality of Human Resources**

*Standard A.3.1. At the level of each domain there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure the conduct of doctoral study program.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the sufficiency of qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.

**Performance Indicator A.3.1.1.** *Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.*

At the time of the visit, out of 7 doctoral advisors, 5 of them meet the minimum CNATDCU standards in force: The verification sheets of the doctoral supervisors on meeting the minimum necessary and mandatory standards of CNATDCU for obtaining the qualification certificate according to Order no. 6129/2016 (Additional Annex 4, External Evaluation Report; Centralization).

There is a proportion of 71% of doctoral thesis advisors in Medicine meeting the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force.

**Recommendations:** To strengthen the HR strategy for Research motivation activities in order to increase the proportion of doctoral advisors which meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**



**Performance Indicator \*A.3.1.2.** *At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.*

At the time of the visit, the list of doctoral advisors having a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD and associates of the doctoral school of medicine for the academic year 2023-24 was reformulated. According this, out of the 7 doctoral supervisors, 4 are full-time for an indefinite term contract and 3 are full-time with extension for one year (Additional Annex 5, The External Evaluation Report)

**Recommendations:** To strengthen the HR strategy for Research motivation activities in order to increase the proportion of doctoral advisors who have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator A.3.1.3.** *The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proved expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.*

The disciplines in the training program based on advanced university studies are taught by professors who have the quality of doctoral / habilitated advisor, university professor or associate professor.

All subjects in the doctoral education program based on advanced higher education studies in Medicine are taught by certified doctoral thesis advisors. All those responsible for the discipline are professors and associated professors (Annex 21, Self-Evaluation Report).

**Recommendations:** To increase the professional standards for teaching faculties responsible for advanced doctoral study program. The course sheet Statistical processing of experimental data (II) cannot be found. The bibliography in the course sheets must be updated.

**The indicator is fulfilled partially.**

**Standard A.3.2.** *The Doctoral advisors within the domain are carrying out a scientific activity visible at international level.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the visibility of scientific activity at the international level.

**Performance Indicator A.3.2.1.** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of*





*professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.*

At the time of the visit, In the Doctoral School Medicine domain undergoing evaluation, all doctoral supervisors have a minimum of 5 Web of Science indexed publications in journals with impact factor or other relevant contributions to the domain of Medicine and other contributions and activities that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. Doctoral advisors meet the indicator requirements in 100%. (Additional Annex 6, External Evaluation Report).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

***Performance Indicator \*A.3.2.2.*** *At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimal CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years.*

At the time of the visit, out of 7 doctoral advisors, 6 of them meet the minimum CNATDCU standards in force There is a percentage of 85.7% of the doctoral advisors meeting the minimum CNATDCU standards in force at least 25% of the score requested. (Additional Annex 7, External Evaluation Report; Centralization).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Domain B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS**

The educational effectiveness of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain was found as a compliant field.

### **Criterion B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates enrolled for the admission contest**

***Standard B.1.2*** *Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance.*

The “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the academic, research and professional performance of admitted candidates.

***Performance Indicator \*B.1.2.1.*** *Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.*

The admission of candidates for doctoral studies is carried out based on clear criteria which are set out in the admission methodology (Annex 4, Self-Evaluation report).

Admission to doctoral study programs is organized based on selection criteria including: previous academic status, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. A written specialist examination and interviewing the candidate are mandatory.



**Recommendations:** The updated Admission Methodology is requested according to the provisions of Law 199/2023.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Criterion B.2. The content of doctoral degree programs**

*Standard B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain provided all necessary evidences in order to confirm the training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.1.** *The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.*

The training program based on advanced university studies includes disciplines relevant to the field of medicine, which contribute to the development of professional and transversal skills. The program includes the following mandatory subjects: Scientific Research Methodology, Ethics and European Legislation of Medical Research, Design and Writing of a Scientific Paper, Statistical Processing of Experimental Data (I and II), Management of Research Projects, Essential Principles in the Use of Information Technology for Research. The curriculum also includes elective subjects: Personal Development, Development of Entrepreneurial and Technology Transfer Skills (Annex 10, Self-Evaluation Report).

The training program based on advanced academic is in accordance with the requirements of the performance indicator in question.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.2.** *At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.*

The training program based on advanced university studies includes: Ethics and European Legislation of Medical Research (Annex 10, Self-Evaluation Report). There is completed performance indicator in question.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

**Performance Indicator B.2.1.3.** *The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities<sup>2</sup>.*

---

<sup>2</sup> Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology of 17 March 2017 regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.



All mandatory disciplines for the scientific training of doctoral students are provided according to their Syllabus (Annex 24, Self-Evaluation report).

The Syllabus of the disciplines include the competencies, skills and attitudes acquired by PhD students. The proficiency, abilities and aptitudes for scientific research is verified at the end of each curricular unit by an assessment method with a final mark. The results obtained by the doctoral student during his/her studies are recorded in the Individual Training Program and in the Matricula Register (Additional Annex 8-9, The External Evaluation Report) documents managed by the Doctoral School Secretariat.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Domain C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

The quality management of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain as was found as a compliant field.

### **Criterion C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system**

*Standard C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.*

**Performance Indicator C.1.1.1.** *The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory:*

- (a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;*
- (b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;*
- (c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;*
- (d) the scientific activity of doctoral students;*
- (e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students;*
- (f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counseling made available to doctoral students.*

In order to cover the requirements of points (a-f) of Performance indicator C.1.1.1., the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain has provided all necessary evidences in the Internal report. The University's performance in terms of the quality of the delivered services has been officially recognized by the certification of the quality management system according to the provisions of ISO 9001:2015 standard, initially awarded on 25.08.2014 and was recertified ISO in 2020, and 2023 (Additional Annex 12, the External Evaluation Report)

The “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine demonstrates the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance by applying approved Regulations, Procedures and Methodology accordingly to ISO 9001-2015. IOSUD-UVVG has developed and applies a procedure for the internal evaluation and follow-up of the doctoral school's development (Annex 25, Self-Evaluation Report and Additional Annexes 10-17, External Evaluation Report).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**



**Performance Indicator \*C.1.1.2.** *Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.*

The measurement of the satisfaction level of the PhD students towards the quality of the organization and development of the doctoral program is made on the basis of two evaluation mechanisms:

1. Identifying the doctoral students' degree of satisfaction with the doctoral program (Annex 26, Self-Evaluation Report);

2. Identifying the quality of the advanced training program (Annex 27, Self-Evaluation Report).

The feedback evaluation is assured according to the standards of ISO 9001-2015. (Additional Annex 17, External Evaluation Report)

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## **Criterion C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources**

*Standard C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine provided all necessary evidences covering the requirements of interest information to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information being available for electronic format consultation.

**Performance Indicator C.2.1.1.** *The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:*

(a) *the Doctoral School regulation;*

(b) *the admission regulation;*

(c) *the doctoral studies contract;*

(d) *the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;*

(e) *the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;*

(f) *the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;*

(g) *the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);*

(h) *information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;*

(i) *links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.*

- *description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself*

The "Vasile Goldis" Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine is publishing on the website the documents specified in points (a-i).



The documents published on the website of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine are considered the proof for points (a-i). All these documents are published on the university website ([www.uvvg.ro](http://www.uvvg.ro)).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

*Standard C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.*

The “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine domain provided all necessary evidences in order to demonstrate the presence of the access for doctoral students to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.***

All PhD students have free access to a platform with academic databases relevant to the field of Medicine: ScienceDirect Freedom Collection, Elsevier; SpringerLink Journals, Springer; Web of Knowledge, Clarivate Analytics; Wiley Journals; Nature Journals and 2 platforms with e-books: De Gruyter e-books (2855 e-books in all domains) and CAB e-books (240 e-books), and will have access for the year 2023, 2024 and 2025 to the following databases: Elsevier Science Direct Freedom Collection Journals, Springer-Nature, Clarivate Analytics (Wos, JHCD, DII), Wiley Journals, Cambridge Journals, Sage Journals-Full, Elsevier Clinical Key (Annex 14, Self-Evaluation Report).

All doctoral students have free access to 5 platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.***

Each doctoral student, subsequent to the approval of the doctoral advisor, has access to the electronic system of plagiarism checking: sistemeantiplagiat.ro approved and countersigned by the Ministry of Education and Research in 2016.

Each doctoral student has access, upon request, to the electronic system (sistemeantiplagiat.ro) for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works according the internal regulation of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad Doctoral School for Medicine (Annex 28, Self-Evaluation Report).

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

***Performance Indicator C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.***

The Regulations of the Doctoral School of Medicine (Annex 2, art 22) mention the doctoral students’ rights and obligations, including the access to scientific research laboratories and learning resources (libraries, online databases), also provided for in the contract of studies.



The access of doctoral students to scientific research laboratories or other facilities are provided according to the internal Regulation and mentioned in the doctoral studies contract.

Recommendations: There are no recommendations.

**The indicator is fulfilled.**

## IV. SWOT Analysis

### **Strengths:**

1. The existence of institutional capacity based on functional institutional regulatory framework and modern research infrastructure;
2. The research infrastructure is well represented for the field of doctoral studies;
3. The program based on advanced university studies;
4. The transparency of decision making and students' information.
5. Implementation of Quality management System Standard (ISO 9001:2015).

### **Weaknesses:**

1. The number of relatively young mentors does not cover the need for existing PhD students, providing real support for them and assuring the updated-on time program, as well.
2. Lack of an appropriate IT system dedicated to the Doctoral School in terms of students' academic status monitoring and evaluation.

### **Opportunities:**

1. Development of interdisciplinarity by strengthening relationship capacity of Doctoral School Biology Domain and Doctoral School Medicine Domain of IOSUD-UVVG
2. Development of international visibility of Doctoral school activities;
3. Implementation of Open Sciences approaches;
4. The European Commission recognition: the 'HR Excellence in Research' Award.

### **Threats:**

1. Migration of young researchers due to the country's economic situation.

## V. Overview of judgments awarded and of the recommendations

No	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
1.	PI	<p><b>A.1.1.1.</b> The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the Doctoral School of the respective university doctoral study domain:</p> <p>a) the internal regulations of the Doctoral School;</p> <p>b) the Methodology for conducting elections for the position of director of the Council of doctoral school (CSD), as well as elections by the students of their representative in CSD and the evidence of their conduct;</p> <p>c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);</p> <p>d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;</p> <p>e) functional management structures (Council of the doctoral school), giving as well proof of the regularity of meetings;</p> <p>f) the contract for doctoral studies;</p> <p>g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals regarding the training for doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.</p>	<i>Partially Fulfilled</i>	<p>To update according to the legislation in force the:</p> <p>1) Regulation for the organization and conduct of doctoral academic studies at Vasile Goldis University of the West in Arad - revision 2; Senate decision no. 67/13.05.2016;</p> <p>(2) Regulation on the organization and operation of the Doctoral School of Medicine - revision 2; Senate decision no. 238/31.10.2019;</p>
2.	PI	<p><b>A.1.1.2.</b> The doctoral school's Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
3.	PI	<p><b>A.1.2.1.</b> The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.</p>	<i>Partially Fulfilled</i>	<p>To accelerate the actions of digitalization of the tracking of academic background of students with access to doctoral students and supervisors of the Doctoral School in Medicine Domain.</p>

No	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
4.	PI	<b>A.1.2.2.</b> The existence and use of an appropriate software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
5.	CPI	<b>A.2.1.1.</b> The venues and the material equipment available to the doctoral school enable the research activities in the evaluated domain to be carried out, in line with the assumed mission and objectives (computers, specific software, equipment, laboratory equipment, library, access to international databases etc.). The research infrastructure and the provision of research services are presented to the public through a specific platform. The research infrastructure described above, which was purchased and developed within the past 5 years will be presented distinctly	<i>Fulfilled</i>	To ensure better information of the doctoral students and supervisors regarding the research infrastructure facilities in order to make its use more efficient.
6.	CPI	<b>A.3.1.1.</b> Minimum three doctoral thesis advisors within that doctoral domain, and at least 50% of them (but no less than three) meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force at the time when the evaluation is carried out, which standards are required and mandatory for obtaining the enabling certification.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	To strengthen the HR strategy for Research motivation activities in order to increase the proportion of doctoral advisors which meet the minimum standards of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNATDCU) in force.
7.	PI *	<b>A.3.1.2.</b> At least 50% of all doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	To strengthen the HR strategy for Research motivation activities in order to rise the proportion of doctoral advisors have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.
8.	PI	<b>A.3.1.3.</b> The study subjects in the education program based on advanced higher education studies pertaining to the doctoral domain are taught by teaching staff or researchers who are doctoral thesis advisors / certified doctoral thesis advisors, professors / CS I or lecturer / CS II, with proven expertise in the field of the study subjects they teach, or other specialists in the field who meet the standards established by the institution in relation with the aforementioned	<i>Partially Fulfilled</i>	To increase the professional standards for teaching faculties responsible for advanced doctoral study program. The course sheet Statistical processing of experimental data (II) cannot be found. The bibliography in the Course Sheets must be updated.



No	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		teaching and research functions, as provided by the law.		
9.	CPI	<b>A.3.2.1.</b> At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in the evaluated domain have at least 5 Web of Science- or ERIH-indexed publications in magazines of impact, or other achievements of relevant significance for that domain, including international-level contributions that indicate progress in scientific research - development - innovation for the evaluated domain. The aforementioned doctoral thesis advisors enjoy international awareness within the past five years, consisting of: membership on scientific boards of international publications and conferences; membership on boards of international professional associations; guests in conferences or expert groups working abroad, or membership on doctoral defense commissions at universities abroad or co-leading with universities abroad. For Arts and Sports and Physical Education Sciences, doctoral thesis advisors shall prove their international visibility within the past five years by their membership on the boards of professional associations, membership in organizing committees of arts events and international competitions, membership on juries or umpire teams in artistic events or international competitions.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
10.	PI *	<b>A.3.2.2.</b> At least 50% of the doctoral thesis advisors in a specific doctoral study domain continue to be active in their scientific field, and acquire at least 25% of the score requested by the minimale CNATDCU standards in force at the time of the evaluation, which are required and mandatory for acquiring their enabling certificate, based on their scientific results within the past five years	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
11.	PI *	<b>B.1.2.1.</b> Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	The updated Admission Methodology is requested according to the provisions of Law 199/2023.

No	Type of indicator (PI, PI*, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
		Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.		
12.	PI	<b>B.2.1.1.</b> The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
13.	PI	<b>B.2.1.2.</b> At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
14.	PI	<b>B.2.1.3.</b> The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses „the learning outcomes”, specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
15.	PI	<b>C.1.1.1.</b> The Doctoral school in the respective university study domain shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the IOSUD, the following assessed criteria being mandatory: a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors; b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity; c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized; d) the scientific activity of doctoral students; e) the training program based on advanced academic studies of doctoral students; f) social and academic services (including for participation at different events, publishing papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-

No	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
16.	PI *	<p><b>C.1.1.2.</b> Mechanisms are implemented during the stage of the doctoral study program to enable feedback from doctoral students allowing to identify their needs, as well as their overall level of satisfaction with the doctoral study program in order to ensure continuous improvement of the academic and administrative processes. Following the analysis of the results, there is evidence that an action plan was drafted and implemented.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
17.	CPI	<p><b>C.2.1.1.</b> The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) the Doctoral School regulation;</li> <li>b) the admission regulation;</li> <li>c) the doctoral studies contract;</li> <li>d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis;</li> <li>e) the content of training program based on advanced academic studies;</li> <li>f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data;</li> <li>g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; advisor);</li> <li>h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis;</li> <li>i) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.</li> </ul>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
18.	PI	<p><b>C.2.2.1.</b> All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-
19.	PI	<p><b>C.2.2.2.</b> Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.</p>	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-



No	Type of indicator (PI, PI *, CPI)	Performance indicator	Judgment	Recommendations
20.	PI	<b>C.2.2.3.</b> All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.	<i>Fulfilled</i>	-

## VI. Conclusions and general recommendations

As a result of the evaluation performed based on the performance indicators, it is found that the activity of the “Vasile Goldis” Western University of Arad as IOSUD Doctoral study domain Medicine is in accordance with the requirements of ARACIS and legislation in force, and can be recommended for accreditation.

**Raevschi Elena,**

*ARACIS International evaluator,*

*MD, PhD habilitate, MPH, Associate professor,*

*Head of the Research Department,*

*Head of the Department of Social Medicine and Health Management,*

*Nicolae Testemitanu State University of Medicine and Pharmacy of the Republic of Moldova*

## List of Additional Requested Annexes

Nr.	Title
1.	Procese-Verbale ședința Consiliul Școlii Doctorale (A .1.1.1.e);
2.	Screen shot profil Interfața Sistemului informatic (A1.2.1);
3.	Centralizator achiziționare/dezvoltare Infrastructura Cercetare ultimii 5 ani (A. 2.1.1);
4.	Centralizator standarde minimale Anexa nr.20-Comisia de Medicină, la Ordinul 6129/2016 (A. 3.1.1);
5.	Lista conducătorilor de doctorat titulari în IOSUD-UVVG în cadrul școlii doctorale de medicină domeniul de doctorat medicină pentru anul universitar 2023-2024 (A.3.1.2);
6.	CV: Conducători de doctorat conform listei aprobate pentru anul 2023-2024 (A.3.2.1);
7.	Centralizator standarde minimale Anexa nr.20-Comisia de Medicina, la Ordinul 6129/2016, 2018-2022 (A. 3.2.2);
8.	Programul individual de pregătire al studentului-doctorand (B 2.1.3);
9.	Registrul Matricol (B 2.1.3);
10.	PO-08: Admiterea în ciclul de studii universitare de licență, de masterat și de doctorat(C.1.1.1);
11.	PO-10: Finalizarea studiilor la ciclul de studii universitare de doctorat (C.1.1.1);
12.	PO-22: Procedură pentru desfășurarea studiilor universitare de doctorat (C.1.1.1);
13.	PO-41: Procedura pentru întocmirea și aprobarea statelor de funcții ale personalului didactic și de cercetare (C.1.1.1);
14.	PO-47: Organizarea și desfășurarea procesului de obținere a atestatului de abilitare (C.1.1.1);
15.	Regulament de evaluare anuală a activității conducătorilor de doctorat (C.1.1.1);
16.	Regulament de evaluare anuală a activității membrilor comisiilor de îndrumare (C.1.1.1);
17.	Certificat ISO 2014, 2020, 2023 (C.1.1.1).