

## **Accreditation Report**

Master's Degree Programme

Vinifera EuroMaster – European Master in Viticulture and

Enology

Jointly provided by

**Hochschule Geisenheim University** 

Montpellier SupAgro (Institut national d'études supérieures agronomiques de Montpellier)

Bordeaux Sciences Agro (Institute of Agricultural Sciences) Consortium of Universities of Turin, Milan, Palermo, Foggia and Sassari)

Cortium of Universities of Udine, Padova, Verona and Bolzano

University of Lisbon Polytechnical University of Madrid

Version: 07 December 2018

## **Table of Contents**

Α	About the Accreditation Process	. 3
В	Characteristics of the Degree Programme	. 5
C	Peer Report	. 7
D	Additional Documents	30
Ε	Comment of the Higher Education Institution (14.11.2018)	31
F	Summary: Peer recommendations (22.11.2018)	32
G	Comment of the Technical Committee 08 – Agriculture, Nutritional Sciences and Landscape Architecture (19.11.2018 preliminary decision; confirmation after final assessment of peers)	33
Н	Decision of the Accreditation Commission (07.12.2018)	34
Αı	opendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula	36

## **A About the Accreditation Process**

Name of the degree programme	Labels applied	Previous accredi-	Involved
	for	tation	Technical
			Commit-
			tees (TC) <sup>1</sup>
European Master of Science in Viti-	AR <sup>2</sup>	29.06.2012 –	FA 08
culture and Enology (Vinifera Euro-		30.09.2018, in-	
Master)		cluding extension	
		of accreditation	
		for the purpose	
		of reaccreditation	

Date of the contract: 08.06.2017

Submission of the final version of the self-assessment report: 02.03.2018

**Date of the onsite visit: 25./26.09.2018** 

at: Montpellier SupAgro

## Peer panel:

Prof. Dr. Jochen Bogs, Weincampus Neustadt a. d. Weinstraße (Compound of Bingen University of Applied Sciences);

Dr. Reinhard Eder, Höhere Bundesanstalt und Bundesamt für Wein- und Obstanbau Klosterneuburg (Austria);<sup>3</sup>

Prof. Dr. Peter Witzgall, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences;

B.Sc. Moritz Dragosits, Master student at Wirtschaftsuniversität Wien

Representative of the ASIIN headquarter: Dr. Siegfried Hermes

**Responsible decision-making committee:** Accreditation Commission for Degree Programmes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> TC: Technical Committee for the following subject areas: TC 08 – Agronomy, Nutritional Sciences and Landscape Architecture.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> AR: Siegel der Stiftung zur Akkreditierung von Studiengängen in Deutschland

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Participation based on a desktop review.

## Criteria used:

European Standards and Guidelines as of 15.05.2015

Rules for the Accreditation of Study Programmes and for System Accreditation of the Accreditation Council as of 20.02.2013

## **B** Characteristics of the Degree Programme

a) Name	Final degree (origi- nal/Eng- lish transla- tion)	b) Ar- eas of Spe- cial- iza- tion	c) Cor- re- spond- ing level of the EQF <sup>4</sup>	d) Mode of Study	e) Double/Joint Degree	f) Du- ra- tion	g) Credit points/unit	h) In- take rhythm & First time of offer	i) con- secutive Master's Degree Pro- grammes and Master's Degree Pro- grammes provid- ing further educa- tion	j) Study Pro- gramme Profile
European Master of Science in Viticulture and Enology (Vinifera Euro-Master) / M.Sc.	Master of Sci- ence	n/a	7	Full time	EMaVE-consor- tium	4 Se- mes- ter	120 ECTS		consecu- tive	applica- tion-ori- ented

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> EQF = The European Qualifications Framework for lifelong learning

According to the "Study And Examination Regulations of the Vinifera Euromaster Degree Program" the overall objective of the degree programme aims at training "motivated people at a high technical and scientific level for manager positions or advisory/scientific career in viticulture, enology and wine economics in the sector".

## **C** Peer Report

## Criterion 2.1 Qualification Objectives of the Study Programme Concept

## **Evidences:**

- Respective Chapter of the SAR
- Sec. 2.1 of "Study and Examination Regulations"; see Appendix A3.1 of the SAR; also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Report of the Vinifera tracer survey 2018, available at: <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/pro-grammes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20report%202018.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/pro-grammes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20report%202018.pdf</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Diploma Supplement
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The qualification objectives of the Master's programme are thoroughly defined and presented in the Self-Assessment Report (SAR) as well as in the Diploma Supplement. They picture the degree programme as providing the students with the ability to work responsibly in the production, marketing, and / or consulting fields of viticulture and winemaking. According to the expected competence profile, graduates should be qualified "to identify, analyse and communicate issues regarding grapes and wine production or estate/cellars technical management." Furthermore, they should be "able to analyse and solve problems of advisory or policy related activities within viticulture and winemaking development, in national or international companies or organisations". Taking in account the particular profile of a joint master degree programme, offered by consortium of European universities renowned for their highly recognized academic teaching and research in the field, it is comprehensible that the qualification profile has been defined rather broadly. After deepening the oenological and viticultural knowledge basis of the Vinifera students in the first study year at Montpellier SupAgro, the second study year is reserved for specialising in the areas of wine production, consulting, marketing etc. at one of the partner universities with expertise in the related field. Consequently, the programme objectives aptly aim at a broad understanding of viticultural and winemaking issues and at the same time give students the opportunity to specialise in one field of oenology and viticulture. In view of a variety of individual qualification profiles depending on the students' choice of university for the second study year, it appears reasonable to do without a further specification of the programme learning outcomes. In fact, experiencing a deepened fundamental education in oenology and viticulture with an option to specialise or even further broaden the already achieved expertise in the second study period is a unique selling point of the joint degree programme. The chosen qualification objectives do illustrate this adequately. Consequently, the peers consider them well defined and aptly underlining the diverse spectrum of possible career opportunities, as for instance directors/managers of vine & wine estates and laboratories, Cellar Managers, Consultants in Oenology and Vineyard Management, Market & Trade Consultants, Researchers and Teachers. During the audit discussions, students and graduates have confirmed that its broad and generic approach is seen as a vital strength of the degree programme and, in combination with its interdisciplinary, intercultural and international scope serves as major argument in favour of the Vinifera Master.

From the view of the expert panel, the ability "to analyse and solve problems of advisory or policy related activities within viticulture and winemaking development, in national or international companies or organisations" well contributes to the development of the graduates' personality as well as their capacity to work on behalf of the society at large. However, the impact of the international and intercultural prospect of the Vinifera Master on the students' personal development might still be made more visible in the qualification profile, all so more so, since students select the Master's programme for this reason. Programme coordinators should think about implementing this issue into the competence profile of the Vinifera Master programme more transparently. The qualification objectives are visible in the SAR and the Diploma Supplement, but are apparently not presented publicly on the Vinifera website or included into the main documents of the programme and thus not accessible for the main stakeholders. Therefore, the peers expect the coordinators to ensure the availability of the qualification objectives of the programme.

Results of a Vinifera tracer survey 2018 (graduates batch 1 to 7) published on the Erasmus+ Project Results Platform leave the expert panel with the impression that the profile of the Vinifera Master adequately adapts to the demands of the relevant international employment market. The graduates' competence profile appears to be well positioned within the labour market, mainly within the private sector branches of wine-making and wine business.

In summary, the expert panel also concludes (with a view to the curriculum for the two study years) that the study objectives are essentially equivalent to the learning outcomes for the Master level 7 of the European Qualification Framework (EQF).

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.1:

The peers consider the above-mentioned criterion as *largely fulfilled*.

They acknowledge the positive and constructive comments of the Higher Education Institutions operating the Vinifera programme. However, they still consider it a necessity that the qualification objectives (intended learning outcomes) of the programme shall be made accessible to all relevant stakeholders, as argued above in more detail (for example through the publication on the website; see below, section F, A 1.).

## Criterion 2.2 (a) Conceptual Integration of the Study Programme in the System of Studies

The analysis and assessment of the requirements of the Framework of Qualifications for German Degrees is made within criterion 2.1, in the following detailed analysis and assessment of the compliance with the Common Structural Guidelines of the Länder as well as in connection with criterion 2.3.

## Criterion 2.2 (b) Conceptual Integration of the Study Programme in the System of Studies

## **Evidence:**

- Agreement for Extensive Cooperation within the EMaVE Consortium as of 25 September 2015; cf. Annex A1 of the SAR
- Study and Examination Regulations of the Vinifera EuroMaster Degree Programme as of 28 November 2017; cf. Annex A3.1 of the SAR
- National Study and Examination Regulations (referring to study year M2); cf. Annex A3.2 of the SAR
- Exemplary Diploma Supplement

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The Vinifera degree programme is a joint degree programme offered by a consortium of several European HEI's. It consists of two study years, with the first year (M1) conducted jointly by all partners at Montpellier SupAgro in France and the second year (M2) at a partner university of the consortium at the choice of the student. Differences in the respective higher education systems notwithstanding, the Vinifera Master complies with all major requirements for programme accreditation of the German Conference of Ministries of Education (KMK). The Master programme spans over 4 semesters with 30 ECTS credits each, 120 ECTS credits in total. The programme consecutively follows a relevant first cycle degree and is completed with a Master thesis of 30 ECTS.

Programme coordinators have waived the option to explicitly designate the profile of the Vinifera Master as either "application-oriented" or "research oriented". Indications for both profiles may be found in the purported competence profile of the graduates. However, the expert panel agrees with the programme coordinators that an assignment to one of the profiles in advance would be inappropriate, since the profile of each graduate very much depends on the selection of the university and modules of the second study year.

The Vinifera Master is a consecutive degree programme building on a pertinent first cycle degree (Bachelor, Diploma). Only one (joint) degree is awarded upon successful completion of the programme. According to the admission requirements, a first-cycle degree in a discipline-related field is a prerequisite for the award of the Master degree. The "Master of Science" degree is granted in accordance with the respective regulation of the German KMK.

The study regulations do foresee that graduates are entitled to receive a Diploma Supplement along with the Diploma Certificate and the Transcript of Records. The sample of the Diploma Supplement included in the SAR contains adequate information about the structure, content and intended learning outcomes of the Vinifera Master programme as well as of the individual study achievements.

The peer panel therefore states that the relevant provisions of the KMK referred to in this section are met satisfactorily.

The admission requirements of the degree programme (A2 of the Common Structural Guidelines of the German Federal States) is assessed within criterion 2.3.

Compliance with the "Framework Guidelines for the Introduction of Credit Point Systems and the Modularisation of Study Courses" of the programme is assessed within criterion 2.3 (modularization incl. module size), module descriptions, mobility, and recognition), 2.4 (credit point system, student workload, exam load), and 2.5 (exam system: competence-oriented exam).

## Criterion 2.2 (c) Conceptual Integration of the Study Programme in the System of Studies

### **Evidence:**

• Landesspezifische Strukturvorgaben des Landes Hessen als Handreichung zu den "Ländergemeinsamen Strukturvorgaben für die Akkreditierung von Bachelor- und Masterstudiengängen"

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The peers confirm that following the specific structural guidelines for the accreditation of Master degree programmes in the German federal state Hessen, the degree programme allows for a completion of Bachelor and Master studies within ten semesters. The partner universities of the EMaVE consortium have defined appropriate entrance regulations for the Vinifera Master degree programme in line with the above-mentioned structural guidelines. Consequently, the peers consider the requirements of the German federal state Hessen to be fulfilled.

## Criterion 2.2 (d) Conceptual Integration of the Study Programme in the System of Studies

The study programme complies the binding interpretation and summary of (a) to (c) by the Accreditation Council.

No binding interpretations by the Accreditation Council must be taken into account at this point.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.2:

From the peers perspective all relevant requirements treated in this chapter are *adequately addressed* in the Vinifera Master programme.

## **Criterion 2.3 Study Programme Concept**

## Evidence:

- Relevant chapters of the SAR (curriculum, modularization, didactical approach)
- Curriculum according to Appendix 3 of the "Study and examination regulations of the Vinifera EuroMaster degree program"; study plan for the study year M1 also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Module descriptions for both study years (M1 and M2), Appendix A2.1 and A2.2 of the SAR; also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euro-master.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euro-master.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- "Study and examination regulations of the Vinifera EuroMaster degree program" in conjunction with national study and exam regulations for the Vinifera EuroMaster, Appendix A3.1 and A3.2 of the SAR (structure of the study course, recognition of achievements and conversion of (national) grades, internships, admission requirements).

- Detailed information about admission requirements and the application process are available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=14&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=14&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- "Guide for students interviews" and "Evaluation grid for admission in Vinifera Euro-Master, documents added during the onsite-visit
- Detailed information about the language requirements and the language policy in general can be found at: <a href="http://vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=13&idl=21">http://vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=13&idl=21</a>
   (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Survey in 2017 regarding the relevance of the Vinifera programme, Appendix A6.1 of the SAR
- Report of the Vinifera tracer survey 2018 (graduates batch 1 to 7), available at: <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20re-port%202018.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20re-port%202018.pdf</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Concept / qualification objectives: The Vinifera Master is viewed as an ambitious and welcomed cross-disciplinary Master programme in the field of viticulture and enology that apparently sparks the interest of a truly international student spectre. In the eyes of the peer panel the study programme is well designed: The first study year M1 aims at levelling the field-related knowledge of students of different educational backgrounds and at the same time deepens fundamental skills and competences in core areas of viticulture and enology. The second year M2 then provides students with the opportunity to gain specialized expertise or broaden their already gained expertise in viticulture and enology at one of the EMaVE partner universities. The conceptual approach to initially build, broaden and deepen fundamentals in the field and after that let students choose to further develop or specialise seems adequate given the multitude of job perspectives in wine world. Results from the tracer study 2017 and from the 2017 survey regarding the relevance of the Vinifera programme are obviously attesting to this assessment. So did students in their general judgments of the programme during the audit talks. Established strategies to educate students of different disciplinary and cultural backgrounds on Master level (language policies, immersion period, internship, curriculum design) do leave the peers with the impression that these are well suited to support the demanding study objectives and intended learning outcomes of the Vinifera Master. Concerning this, it must be noted that the programme has been running now for more than a decade (intake of the first batch in 2007) and has been established since as a European "success story" - as the European Commission as

long-time funding institution puts it. This is not least due the programmes' ability to continually improve and adapt with regard to the needs of the different stakeholders, as the available statistics indicate (cf. employment data). The students confirmed this in the audit discussions.

In general, the expert panel therefore concludes that the curriculum design, the content of the modules as well as the organisational two-year-structure of the programme are adequately composed to ensure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes ("qualification profile" as set out in sec. 2.1). This applies to a more research-oriented qualification profile of graduates as well as to more management or consultancy-related competences.

Regarding these overall study objectives and the respective curricular content, some aspects of the programme have nevertheless drawn particular attention in the audit discussions.

- a) Some students felt that depending on the prior knowledge they were less prepared to do experimental work in the course of their Master thesis, for instance due to lacking skills in statistics or statistics-related programming languages like "R" respectively. Supporting courses or tutorials embracing that issue would be regarded helpful from their point of view. The expert panel considers this important for achieving the intended scientific and methodical competences. Responding appropriately to better prepare students for experimental work (in particular in the Master Thesis), is therefore deemed recommendable.
- b) Concerning the subject-related qualifications aimed at in the Vinifera Master the peers wonder whether the curriculum addresses fungal resistance of grapes, which they consider an important issue in modern viticulture. Programme coordinators principally subscribe to this assessment and point to the module *Wine biology* in M1 and different modules in M2 that, inter alia, treat topics related to fungal resistance. The peers accept this explanation.
- c) Students also mention that, depending on their previous academic training, knowledge in ampelography might be strengthened. Peers generally are of the opinion that groundwork in ampelography belongs to the first cycle education of students. They also took note that the curriculum at least foresees a partial unit ampelography in the module *Vine biology* in the first study year, and consider this sufficient. To immerse on this knowledge in their view is up to the students' self-study.

Modularization / module descriptions: The curriculum of the Vinifera Master consists of modules, which the expert panel generally sees as thematically self-contained teaching and learning units. In addition to this, the sequence and block-like structure of the modules in

the first study year help to achieve the overall study objectives. In particular, the modules of the first study year lay the basis to complete the Master profile in different subject-related directions in the second study year at one of the EMaVE partner universities. The peers conclude that the thematically broad array of modules in the first study year is quite reasonable for this purpose, although students indicate that the curriculum of M1 is already densely packed. Students on the other hand generally laud the curriculum design and apparently would hardly like to waive any of the modules / courses of M1 (as to this see also sect. 2.4 with regard to the students' workload). The peers found a "M1 calendar of Modules" on the Vinifera website, but would suggest for reasons of transparency and better orientation of both applicants and students to additionally provide a more detailed study plan for M1 and M2 (exemplary).

Concerning the module descriptions, the peer panel found them overall comprehensive and instructive. They principally give a fair account of the intended learning objectives and the content of the modules or the respective partial components. The stated learning outcomes alleviate comprehending how the overall learning objectives are achievable. However, regarding modules segmented in several parts, it might be even more convincing to not strictly differentiate the description of content and learning outcomes along the lines of the partial units<sup>5</sup> but to frame the description of both more comprehensive. This would considerably contribute to a better understanding of the units' merging into one module. Furthermore, it is obvious that the workload ratio of ECTS and calculated student working hours vary in the M2 modules according to different national practice. This is generally acceptable and within the recommendations of the ECTS User's guide, but could be made more transparent in the module descriptions (for instance through explanation in a preface of the module handbook). Some module descriptions appear to be incomplete with some columns left empty. In the course of the regular revision process for the Module handbooks missing information should be supplemented. It also comes up that the consistency and homogeneity of the Vinifera module descriptions of the University of Turin as a member of the EMaVE consortium could be improved. As to this, the expert panel acknowledges the generally big challenge to keep module handbooks up to date, let alone in a joint programme of multiple European universities. Consequently, the peers stress the already good shape of the module descriptions and recommend improving on the mentioned issues in the further development of the programme.

*Practical relevance*: As has been stated previously in this report, the Vinifera Master programme consists of research- as well as practice-oriented objectives. Regarding the latter, the three-week stay at Bordeaux Sciences Agro at the end of the first study year (course

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Which applies especially to the modules of the first study year at Montpellier SupAgro.

unit *Terroir and Company Auditing*) has been described convincingly as a mirror of the integrative aspect of the Vinifera degree programme. Programme coordinators have reasonably explained that the Bordeaux course is basically designed to integrate the manifold theoretical and methodical knowledge students have acquired before in a comprehensive and essentially application-oriented course. Even the timing of this course at the end of M1 makes good sense considering the residence of students in Montpellier at the time (accommodation or even travelling to Bordeaux during this period apparently did not cause difficulties in the past) and the possible necessity of retaking exams of the first study year.

Another crucial element of practical exposure of students to the wine world is the obligatory internship. According to the SAR, it can be performed at any industry in Europe and overseas. Its objective is to make students familiar with the different operations of companies, in particular the decisional-making processes, thereby understanding the underlying criteria in relation to the type of wine to be produced.

Peers acknowledge that the internship is a credited and principally well-integrated part of the curriculum, supervised and supported by the teaching staff and completed with an individual report. Nevertheless, the expert panel also sees that the status of the internship differs between the M2 consortium partner universities. It encompasses seven ECTS points at one time and eight ECTS points at another, directly linked to, or even part of the Master thesis at one institution (Italian universities) or treated as a precondition for the Master thesis at the other (Geisenheim University). In case of the Portuguese and Spanish universities, neither the module descriptions nor the SAR made it clear whether a mandatory internship is embedded in the curriculum at all, although programme coordinators have been pointing in this direction. The expert panel considers is necessary that respective module descriptions not only need to detail the learning outcomes and content of the internship, but also the minimum duration, volume of ECTS and calculated student workload.

In spite of this shortcoming, the students highly value the benefit of the practical experience and professional competence they acquire in both the Bordeaux course and during their internship. Results of the 2017 survey regarding the relevance of the Vinifera programme emphasize the weight of fieldwork skills in preparing for the professional world and thus reaffirm this finding.

Didactical Concept: The peer panel considers the theoretical and practical teaching methods applied in the Vinifera Master well suited to support the achievement of the intended qualifications of graduates. The mixture of (face-to-face) lectures, practical exercises, seminars, study trips, projects, and internships ensure that theoretical and practical parts of the curriculum are approached by appropriate didactical means. The two-part curriculum

with mandatory courses in M1 and an individual study plan for M2 clearly enables an altogether individual qualifications profile of graduates.

Admission requirements: According to the admission requirements submitted on the Vinifera Website, applicants need to be holder of (at least) a Bachelor degree (180 ECTS) in the fields of "Agronomy / Agricultural Sciences", "Plant Sciences and Technologies", "Food Sciences and Technologies" or "closely related fields", in order to be eligible to the programme. The EMaVE partners reserve the right to make exceptions from this rule under prescribed conditions: Thus, Bachelor graduates with other Bachelor degrees can exceptionally be admitted, provided the academic and/or professional background shows potential for a successful completion of the Vinifera Master programme. In these cases, conditional admission can be granted. Candidates are then advised to follow an internship or work in a vineyard prior to applying, and to obtain some training in a few of the scientific fields that will be studied.

The expert panel regards the admission requirements as reasonable, which includes the principles applying to potential exceptions from the rule. Admissions and study success in the previous accreditation period advocate in favor of admitting an altogether small number of applicants, which may not have the best-suitable educational background but qualify by other experiences and competencies presumably contributing to the successful completion of the Vinifera programme. With respect to this, it is also worthwhile mentioning that interviews for each pre-selected applicant have been introduced recently which contributes to electing applicants fitting best for the degree programme and, basically, to ensuring the quality of the Vinifera Master.

Language requirements for the mostly English taught courses/modules are adequate. Supporting language courses for the place of study in M2 respective in French, when speaking about M1, are considered as supportive for students and can generally facilitate their everyday life on the campus and outside.

With respect to the diverse educational and subject-specific background of students, the expert panel lauds the introductory "immersion period" integrated in the curriculum as the first part of the module *Company and Terroir auditing*. According to the SAR, the course aims at building a common basic level for the subjects of study of the Vinifera EuroMaster programme and bringing the students with their different cultural backgrounds together. In the view of the peers, the immersion period is a desirable instrument to introduce students of heterogeneous backgrounds into the Vinifera Master programme by establishing

16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> This module will be completed by the Bordeaux course at the end of the study year M1.

a common knowledge framework. As to this, the panel perceives that the students strongly confirm this assessment.

Rules of recognition / student mobility: All partner HEIs of the EMaVE consortium have in place rules of recognition of academic achievements gained at other universities in line with the Lisbon Convention. In this programme, such rules are of little practical relevance, since the mutual recognition of academic achievements is implicit in the joint nature of the Vinifera programme and endorsed by the accompanying "Arrangement for Extensive Cooperation within the EMaVE Consortium".

As the Vinifera programme is already an international joint programme where students spend time in at least two different countries, the peers welcome that further offers for international mobility, though not requested, are possible in case of conducting the Master thesis at one of the associate partner universities.

Study organisation: Apart from the small restrictions mentioned above, the peers conclude that the general study organization is adequate to ensure the achievement of the defined learning outcomes.

For the consideration of the interests of handicapped students please refer to the assessment and analysis made within criterion 2.4.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.3:

The peers consider the requirements of the above-mentioned criterion as largely, yet not completely fulfilled.

As discussed in detail above, a more transparent presentation of the internship and its prerequisites at all partner HEIs has to be ensured (see below, section F, A 2.).

The expert panel is thankful for the positive and constructive comment of the HEIs concerning some further deficits of minor weight (regarding preparatory units, particularly in statistics, some details of the module descriptions, and the transparency of the complete study plan). The peers confirm the provisional recommendations drafted to this end during the audit visit (see below, section F, E 1., E 2. and E 3.).

## **Criterion 2.4 Academic Feasibility**

## **Evidence:**

Relevant chapters of SAR

- Curriculum according to Appendix 3 of the "Study and examination regulations of the Vinifera EuroMaster degree program"; study plan for the study year M1 also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Module descriptions for both study years (M1 and M2), Appendix A2.1 and A2.2 of the SAR; also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euro-master.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euro-master.eu/pages/?page=469&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- "Study and examination regulations of the Vinifera EuroMaster degree program" in conjunction with national study and exam regulations for the Vinifera EuroMaster, Appendix A3.1 and A3.2 of the SAR (examination rules).
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Consideration of entry qualifications: The issue has already been discussed in sec. 2.3 of this report.

Workload: The modules of the M1 study year are awarded between 6 and 8 ECTS point, but stretch in the M2 study year between 2 and 10 ECTS points according to the national "ECTS culture" displayed at the respective place of study. This deviation from the German KMK provision (5 ECTS points at the minimum) seems reasonable to the peers, since it does not interfere with the generally meaningful composition of the respective modules and, apparently, does not raise the number of examinations per semester extraordinarily. Student workload per semester on average amounts to 30 ECTS points.

The expert panel takes note that the student workload is evaluated on a regular basis in both study years. As reported by teaching staff members, adjustments in the ECTS numbers respectively the content of modules have been made occasionally according to the feedback of students. However, as it appears no record has been kept so far about quality assurance measures like these, which leads the expert panel to suggest improving the documentation of the quality assurance process (cf. sec. 2.9 for a more detailed analysis and resulting suggestions).

Frequency and organization of exams: This issue will be discussed in sec. 2.5 of this report.

Consultancy and course guidance: In general, the peers see that the programme coordinators, the teaching staff and the Vinifera secretariat are working together to provide the best support and assistance possible to the students. Individual solutions can usually be found and with the limited number of students in the programme, every one of them can be individually supported. The peers explicitly support that especially the study trips and internships are a helpful instruments to bring students into contact with employers and

industry in general. Concerning the compilation of individual study plans and, in particular, the students' choice of study place for M2, peers acknowledge that comprehensive information is provided on the Vinifera website, by the Vinifera secretariat, and the M1 teaching staff of the various EMaVE partner universities. The students confirm that they receive general information and individual support in scheduling their study plan as well. As the programme aims at very different occupational fields in the wine world and at the same time accepts students with different cultural and occupational backgrounds, the peers agree that the students themselves have to decide about their possible specialisation. In conclusion, the support and assistance for the students is considered adequate.

The peers understand that measures have been taken within the framework of the general policy of Universities to facilitate access for disabled teachers and students to the Vinifera classroom in Montpellier SupAgro (host of the M1 Vinifera Class). They also take for granted the programme coordinators' word that for the M2 partners too these issues are of importance. Applicable regulations for compensating disadvantages of handicapped students are in place in each of the EMaVE partners national regulations for higher education.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.4:

The expert panel concludes that the requirements of the above-mentioned criterion are fully met.

#### Criterion 2.5 Examination System

#### **Evidence:**

- Module descriptions (type and number of exams)
- Study and Examination Regulations of the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme as of 28<sup>th</sup> November 2017, Appendix A3.1 of the SAR
- National Regulations concerning the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme (relating to the second study year M2), Appendix A3.2 of the SAR
- During the onsite-visit: Inspection of a sample of assessments, project works and Master theses
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Competence orientation: The module descriptions reveal that most compulsory modules of the first study (M1) year are assessed through a written examination, depending on the specific content of the module components or accompanying laboratory exercises often combined with reports and/or oral presentations. The methods of examination in the modules of the second study year (M2) depend largely on the student's choice of specialisation and place of study. Thus, oral examinations are – according to the module descriptions – the preferred exam type at the Italian partner universities of both consortia, while in the partnering Portuguese universities written examinations, often in combination with reports, appear to be the dominant assessment type. Having discussed the issue of whether the chosen assessment types adequately address the intended learning outcomes of the modules with both lecturers and students, the expert panel finds that the examinations overall can be considered competence-oriented. General remarks of the lecturers that they seek to reduce the weight of written exams merely covering the knowledge of students in favour of, for instance, project work so as to more accurately measure a comprehensive understanding of the subject at hand also points to this direction.

The inspection of a sample of project works, examinations and Master theses broadly confirms that the students achieve the intended learning outcomes at Master level and, concerning the Master thesis, proves their ability to work on and solve a complex task individually and within a set time frame.

Examinations per module and semester: Module coordinators do not strictly adhere to the principle of one assessment usually covering the entire module. The peers observe that assessments of many modules of the first study year at Montpellier SupAgro as well as in the second study year at the different partner universities of the EMaVE consortium consist of a major written or oral examination plus report and/or presentation. Since the latter are predominantly provided during or at the end of the semester but not in the regular examination period, they do not necessarily rise the number and frequency of exams during this period. Nor have the students voiced concern about this. In sum, the peers consider the composition and number of exams per semester adequate.

Frequency and organisation of exams: Obviously, students experience the organisation of exams as well functioning, not least due to the clear assignment of related issues to the course/module coordinators, the Examination and Assessment Board, and the Vinifera Secretariat ("Study and examinations regulations of the Vinifera Euromaster Degree Programme", Chap. 6.2.1, 6.2.6 and 6.2.7).

Exam and re-sit sessions (periods), re-sits of examinations, grading criteria and guidelines, rules for the Master thesis and defence etc. are transparently laid out in the "Study and

examination regulations". It is also clearly defined therein that for the modules of the second study year (M2) the rules of the respective EMaVE partner university apply. Should second re-sits be necessary, they are to be organized under the responsibility of the M2 partner, although according to the rules of the first study year. In the audit discussions, students judge re-sits of examinations as generally fair in terms of level, method and duration of exams. They also emphatically state that any sort of deficiency occurring during the examinations can easily be communicated to the responsible course/module coordinator in order to fix it more or less informally. In addition to that, the programme coordinators report about an altogether very low rate of retakes and, in line with that, very few cases of dropouts resulting from a definitively failed exam.

With regard to the regulations for compensating disadvantages of handicapped students please refer to criterion 2.4. For the binding force of the submitted rules and regulations refer to the analysis and assessment within criterion 2.8.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.5:

The expert panel concludes that the requirements of the above-mentioned criterion are fully met.

## **Criterion 2.6 Programme-related Co-operations**

#### **Evidence:**

- Relevant chapter of the SAR
- Cooperation agreements between the EMaVE-consortium and associated partners, Appendix A4 of the SAR; list of associate partners also available at: <a href="http://www.vinif-era-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=191&idl=21">http://www.vinif-era-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=191&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Audit discussions

#### Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The Vinifera Master comes as a joint degree programme with a commonly designed curriculum consisting of a joint Vinifera curriculum for the first study year (M1) and a more flexible curriculum for the second year, depending on the area of specialisation and the related place of study within the EMaVE partner countries. Accordingly, the programme demands a very high degree of cooperation and coordination between the different partner institutions, which the expert panel readily acknowledges.

In this respect, the overall coordination and management lays with Montpellier SupAgro, and special boards take charge of specific issues such as admission, programme development and coordination, examination and assessment. The peers see that these provisions have been put into practice thoughtfully and that the arrangements to this are working very well. It fits into this picture that they have encountered an atmosphere of mutual respect among the teachers and the partner institutions.

Furthermore, since the inception of the Vinifera Master the EMaVE consortium partners have succeeded in establishing a network of associated international partners (universities and institutes) renowned for their expertise in viticulture and enology. In the eyes of the peers, these associate partners to a considerable degree not only enrich the scope of the curriculum (via scholarships and the exchange of lecturers) but also provide additional opportunities for students to enrich their intercultural background and competences.

One of the great assets of the Vinifera Master is its close links to companies and professional organizations in the international vine and wine world. According to the SAR, the establishment of an International Advisory Board (IAB) of wine industry representatives is supposed to adequately express this strength. Obviously, the board could function as a backbone for the recruitment of future Master and PhD students and for the further development of the Vinifera programme regarding the needs of the professional world. However, as it turns out in the audit talks, the IAB is still a committee in the making. In favor of the EMaVE partners' strategy, the expert panel strongly supports the idea of a more institutionalized relationship between the Vinifera programme and the related industry branches ("Advisory Board").

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.6:

The expert panel considers the requirements of the above-mentioned criterion as *principally fulfilled*.

As discussed previously, the peers are nevertheless of the opinion that the relationship between the Vinifera programme and the related industry branches could be made more robust. They propose a recommendation for this purpose (see below, section F, E 4.).

#### **Criterion 2.7 Facilities**

#### **Evidence:**

Relevant chapter of the SAR

- Staff list and handbooks, Appendices A5.1 and A5.2; staff CV's also available at: <a href="http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=472&idl=21">http://www.vinifera-euromaster.eu/pages/?page=472&idl=21</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Label success story, Appendix A8 of the SAR; information available at: <a href="http://ec.eu-ropa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/projects/eplus-project-details/#project/09bd1aff-5665-4425-b0bc-b836dfa03698">http://ec.eu-ropa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/projects/eplus-project-details/#project/09bd1aff-5665-4425-b0bc-b836dfa03698</a>
- <u>In the course of the onsite-visit</u>: Inspection of degree-related laboratories and infrastructure at Montpellier SupAgro
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Quantity and quality of teaching staff: The Vinifera Master programme is already running successfully for years and is, admittedly, one of the most prestigious and highly esteemed Erasmus+ programmes of the European Commission, inter alia distinguished as an exemplary "success story" by the Directorate-General for Education, Youth, Sport and Culture of the European Commission. Each of the partner universities of the EMaVE consortium offering the Vinifera programme has extensive experience and exceptional expertise in the fields of viticulture and enology. All partners are currently running national Master's programmes in related areas, most of them already accredited by national accreditation authorities. Since the academic staff of the Vinifera Master largely stems from the mentioned national master programmes, the expert panel in general has little doubt, that its quantity and qualification is very good to ensure the high quality of the programme for the upcoming accreditation period.

According to those responsible for the degree programme, the module coordinators and lecturers either fulfil their teaching obligations within their regular teaching load or otherwise are paid extra honorarium out of the Vinifera summary budget. The expert panel therefore concludes that the operation of the master programme is guaranteed with regard to the number and availability of the teaching staff. This is confirmed during the audit talks by the coordinators indication that all EMaVE partner HEIs have explicitly declared their willingness to support the Vinifera Master programme. Adding to this assessment, students do not complain about any sensible degree of unreliability or absence of teaching staff during the lecture period. They rather voice the opposite perception that all staff (teaching as well as administrative) act extremely reliable, trustworthy and conducive in order to support the students' efforts towards study progress. Appreciable in this context is moreover that lecturers from a broad array of associated partner institutions occasionally supplement the actual teaching staff (primarily in the first study year and supported by scholarship funding).

Further development: According to the SAR, the teaching staff is actively engaged in research and cooperate through subject-specific international networks. This obviously contributes to the individual expertise and at the same time provides opportunities to consolidate and even raise the quality of the Vinifera Master through the frequent influx of new research findings in the curriculum. Concerning didactical further education, programme coordinators persuasively declare that each partner institution of EMaVE consortiums offers plenty of courses and workshops aiming at improving the staff members teaching capabilities and their openness to apply new and innovative didactical methods wherever appropriate. The audit talks leave the expert panel with the impression that lecturers do make good use of those opportunities.

Financial and physical resources: The exemplary budgetary plan 2016 – 2018 and forecast 2018 – 2020 leads to the general assumption that the financial basis of the Vinifera Master can be considered sufficient, although EU funding is expiring. A relatively stable intake of 30 to 35 students since 2012 and thus a predictable amount of study fees add to the impression of a generally solid financial fundament regarding the budgetary calculation.

As to the physical basis for the Master programme, the expert panel made an inspection tour through Montpellier SupAgro labs and spaces. Regrettably, the laboratories were not in use at the time, and some were even closed hampering to a certain degree a more rounded picture. Notwithstanding, the Montpellier infrastructure is deemed to be adequate for educational and research purposes. Likewise, the expert panel assumes that adequate infrastructure and equipment is available in the laboratories of the consortium partners responsible for the second study year. However, documentation to substantiate this assumption has not been provided along with the SAR. In order to finally comment on this, the peers therefore ask for an overview of the main laboratories and lab equipment of the Vinifera consortium partners with relevance to the second study year (M2).

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the HigherEducation Institution regarding criterion 2.7:

As the above findings suggest, the expert panel considers the resources of the Vinifera Master programme as *generally sufficient* in terms of personnel, budget and physical equipment.

More detailed information about the laboratory equipment provided by the EMaVE consortium foster this assumption with regard to the M1 study year in Montpellier. In addition, the expert panel accepts the presentation of each consortium partner as evidence of the generally good infrastructure and equipment of the European partner institutions of the

M2 study year, also because most of them have a long tradition in viticulture and vinemaking degree programmes.

## **Criterion 2.8 Transparency and Documentation**

#### **Evidence:**

- Arrangement for Extensive Cooperation within the EMaVE Consortium as of 25 September 2015, Appendix A1 of the SAR
- Study and Examination Regulations of the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme as of 28<sup>th</sup> November 2017, Appendix A3.1 of the SAR
- National Regulations concerning the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme (relating to the second study year M2), Appendix A3.2 of the SAR
- Sample of the Certificate for the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme, Appendix A3.3 of the SAR
- Sample of the Diploma Supplement of the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme,
   Appendix A3.3 of the SAR
- Sample of the Transcript of Records of the VINIFERA EuroMaster Degree Programme,
   Appendix A3.3 of the SAR

#### Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The study programme, course of study, examination requirements and the prerequisites for admittance including the regulations for compensating disadvantages of handicapped students are documented and published.

The peers acknowledge that the EMaVE consortium has carefully drafted the relevant rules and regulations. The provisions for the study and examination process do not only cover the first study year but also, by reference to the applicable national regulations, the second study year which students have to complete at the in a Vinifera consortium partner country different from that of the first year (France, Montpellier and Bordeaux). Moreover, responsibilities and authorities for the management of the degree programme in both study years are fixed clearly and unambiguously. Thus, responsibilities rest with special coordinators and boards established by the respective provisions of the general Study and Examination regulations for the Vinifera Master programme (see above sec. 2.6).

The available samples of the Certificate, the Diploma Supplement and the Transcript of Records do fully fit with the accreditation criteria. They transparently inform external stake-

holders about the individual study progress and final study success. In particular, the grading tables in the Diploma Supplement and the Transcript of Records allow for a comparison of the given marks in view of the different grading systems of the participating European partner universities. In addition, the Diploma Supplement contains information about the curricular structure of the programme and the qualifications the graduates have acquired in their studies.

The peers also note that students of the programme do not only receive a comprehensive introduction into the management- and content-related details of the Vinifera Master but that this information together with other useful links is easily accessible on the website of the degree programme as well.

In sum, the panel appreciates the transparency of the Vinifera Master and deems the respective requirements largely met. As mentioned above (see sec. 2.1), the qualification objectives need yet to be made accessible to the relevant stakeholders.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.8:

The peers consider the demands of transparency *mostly fulfilled*. The only exception are the qualification objectives, which still have to be made publicly accessible as argued in section 2.1 (see below, A 1.).

## **Criterion 2.9 Quality Assurance and Further Development**

### **Evidence:**

- Respective Chapter of SAR
- Evaluation Questionnaires concerning M1 and M2 study years as well as course evaluation, see Appendix 6.2 of the SAR
- Survey in 2017 regarding the relevance of the Vinifera-programme, see Appendix A6.1 of the SAR
- Report of the Vinifera tracer survey 2018 (graduates batch 1 to 7), available at: <a href="http://ec.europa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20re-port%202018.pdf">http://ec.europa.eu/programmes/erasmus-plus/project-result-content/21240e2a-442b-4edb-8c10-db75d6bc6b99/VINIFERA%20tracer%20survey%20re-port%202018.pdf</a> (Download: 2018-10-04)
- Exemplary evaluation results of the module/course Vine Ecology and Physiology, additional document provided during the course of the onsite vis

- Report pedagogic meeting "Green modules", additional document provided during the course of the onsite visit
- SWOT Analysis, Appendix A7 of the SAR
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The EMaVE partners have agreed on maintaining a quality assurance system for the Vinifera Master programme, primarily by using course/module and programme evaluations respectively.

The evaluation forms submitted along with the SAR and obviously in use in the evaluations of courses or study years respectively provide meaningful information about the student's perception of study related issues such as admission process, study conditions, organisation of study and examinations, content and coordination of courses/modules etc. With several so-called pedagogic meetings under the guidance of the programme coordinator, taking place on a yearly basis, a deliberate consideration of the evaluation results seems to be ensured. Even more important is that the students are carefully included in this quality assurance process, since each Vinifera batch has several elected representatives, who do have easy access to the permanent Vinifera team at Montpellier in the first study year (M1) (full-time coordinator and part-time secretary as well as the Vinifera Master academic director). Peers highly value that these student representatives generally are invited to the regular pedagogic meetings in order to identify shortcomings or deficiencies in the programme or courses respectively and to find appropriate solutions to remove them.

In the second study year, in principle the quality assurance procedures of each EMaVE partner universities apply for those students who choose to follow the related study path. Results are disseminated to the lecturers according to the relevant national rules and processes and to the annual pedagogic meetings as well in order to define necessary improvements. In the audit discussions, the students emphatically confirm that the quality procedures in place are appropriate and working very well. The peers receive the impression that students have very close and trusting ties to the Vinifera staff, the module coordinators and the lecturers, thus enabling immediate measures if problems of whatever kind arise.

In this context, it can hardly be overrated that not only each study year is subject to an evaluation of the students but also the coordination of both study year in terms of both organisation and curriculum / content. A comprehensive evaluation like this sheds light on the overall programme and facilitates the quality improvement on the more general level of curriculum design.

Concerning the external quality assurance of the Vinifera Master, it also works in favour of the programme's presumptive quality that it is subject to a national accreditation or some equivalent kind of quality procedure in the countries of the EMaVE consortium partners. In addition to that, all of these partners offer (national) Master degree programmes in the field of viticulture and enology, which often share a part of the courses/modules with the second study year of the Vinifera Master and normally have to undergo regular national accreditation procedures.

In sum, the expert panel concludes that the quality assurance measures put in place of the Vinifera Master are adequate and functioning effectively. However, despite describing some major changes in the programme – vis-à-vis its previous design – in a general manner, the report does entail very few statistics concerning for instance applicant, student, graduate, drop-out rate or information about the average study period. In addition, it remains unclear how the reported changes are responding to the quality assurance cycle and if perhaps other important improvements are due to the results of – say – the different evaluation methods. This is why the expert panel recommends principally to better document the results and the follow-up processes of the quality assurance cycle.

On an exemplary basis, the panel also asks the programme coordinators to provide the evaluation results of the most recent study year (not the shear results but their analysis!) and indications of how they are proceeded, for instance in the pedagogic meetings (follow-up process).

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.9:

In general, the peers consider the requirements concerning the quality assurance of the degree programme as *fulfilled*.

They are grateful for the additional material provided by the HEIs (student evaluations of modules M1 2017-2018, Summaries of the Pedagogic Meetings). The exemplary evaluation results and their discussion in the pedagogic meetings of programme coordinators and lecturers demonstrate that an effective quality cycle has been established. This confirms the favourable impression the expert panel gained in the audit discussions that the quality assurance mechanisms in place do adequately contribute to the quality development of the Vinifera Master.

However, as the peers pointed out in their preliminary assessment, the EMaVE consortium should be able to refer to the results of the quality assurance processes at any time and to

present them to the public in an adequate manner. To this end, they recommend to improve the documentation of the results and processes related to the quality development of degree programme (see below, section F, E 5.).

## Criterion 2.10 Study Programmes with a Special Profile Demand

The Vinifera Master is a joint degree programme offered by the so-called EMaVE-consortium of European universities from France, Germany, Italy, Portugal and Spain. Accreditation requirements relevant for the award of the seal of the German Accreditation Council are discussed in the respective chapters of this report. A separate treatment of special profile demands is therefore dispensable.

## Criterion 2.11 Gender Justice and Equal Opportunities

#### **Evidence:**

- Relevant chapter in the SAR.
- Audit discussions

## Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Every participating university offers a variety of support services for students in order to improve on gender justice and equal opportunities. Generally, these offers are also available to the Vinifera Master students. Moreover, the universities show considerable consciousness and related measures to facilitating access for disabled teachers and students to the classroom and labs of the degree programme. The relatively balanced ratio of male and female students/graduates strikingly confirms the success in attracting applicants for the Vinifera Master regardless of gender. Students from other home countries than the European EMaVE partners are particularly assisted in the student visa application process.

Concerning the compliance in dealing with the interest of handicapped students please refer to criterion 2.4.

## Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2.11:

From the perspective of the peers, the politics of gender and diversity followed by the Vinifera Master *fully* meets the above-mentioned criterion.

## **D** Additional Documents

Before preparing their final assessment, the panel ask that the following missing or unclear information be provided together with the comment of the Higher Education Institution on the previous chapters of this report:

- 1. Overview of the main laboratories and lab equipment of the Vinifera consortium partners with relevance to the second study year (M2) [AR 2.7]
- 2. Analysis of the evaluation results of the most recent study year and (planned) follow up-process [AR 2.9]

# E Comment of the Higher Education Institution (14.11.2018)

The institution provided a statement as well as the following additional documents:

- List of equipment M1 (together with photos)
- Summaries of the Pedagogic Meetings in 2018 including: enology, green modules and economics
- Student independent module evaluations / year 2017 2018 (M1 of batch 11)

## F Summary: Peer recommendations (22.11.2018)

Taking into account the additional information and the comments the partner universities of the Master programme the peers summarize their analysis and **final assessment** for the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	Seal of German Council of Accreditation	Maximum duration of ac- creditation
European Master of Science in Viticulture and Enology (Vinifera EuroMaster)	With one requirement for one year	30.09.2026

## Requirements

- A 1. (AR 2.1, 2.8) Make the qualification objectives accessible for all relevant stakeholders and ensure that the stakeholders can refer to them.
- A 2. (AR 2.3) Ensure that the integration of the internship in the curriculum and its prerequisites are communicated transparently (most importantly in respective module descriptions).

## Recommendations

- E 1. (AR 2.2, 2.3) It is recommended to further improve the module descriptions (content and learning outcomes of segmented modules at module level, ECTS/Workload ratio for the different Consortial partners, Consistency and homogeneity of information).
- E 2. (AR 2.3) It is recommended to act appropriately to better prepare students for experimental work, especially for the statistics module block and particularly with respect to the Master Thesis.
- E 3. (AR 2.3) It is recommended to make the complete study plan as provided in the study regulations available on the website of degree programme.
- E 4. (AR 2.6) It is recommended to further promote the institutionalization of the relationship between the Vinifera programme and the related industry branches ("Advisory Board").
- E 5. (AR 2.9) It is recommended to better document the results and the follow-up processes of the quality assurance cycle.

# G Comment of the Technical Committee 08 – Agriculture, Nutritional Sciences and Landscape Architecture (19.11.2018 preliminary decision; confirmation after final assessment of peers)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the ASIIN seal:

The Technical Committee discusses the procedure. It appreciates the apparent quality development of the Master's programme in the previous accreditation procedure, in particular with respect to serious deficiencies leading to a suspension back then. The Technical Committee agrees with the recommended resolution of the peers without changes.

The Technical Committee recommends the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN-seal	Maximum duration of ac- creditation
European Master of Science	With requirements for one	30.09.2024
in Viticulture and Enology (Vinifera EuroMaster)	year	

# H Decision of the Accreditation Commission (07.12.2018)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the ASIIN seal:

The Accreditation Commission discusses the procedure and agrees with the recommended resolution of the peers and the responsible Technical Committee.

The Accreditation Commission for Degree Programmes decides to award the following seals:

Degree Programme	ASIIN-seal	Maximum duration of ac- creditation
European Master of Science in Viticulture and Enology (Vinifera EuroMaster)	With requirements for one year	30.09.2024

## Requirements

- A 1. (AR 2.1, 2.8) Make the qualification objectives accessible for all relevant stakeholders and ensure that the stakeholders can refer to them.
- A 2. (AR 2.2, 2.3) Ensure that the integration of the internship in the curriculum and its prerequisites are communicated transparently (most importantly in respective module descriptions).

#### Recommendations

- E 1. (AR 2.2, 2.3) It is recommended to further improve the module descriptions (content and learning outcomes of segmented modules at module level, ECTS/Workload ratio for the different Consortial partners, Consistency and homogeneity of information).
- E 2. (AR 2.3) It is recommended taking appropriate measures to better prepare students for experimental work, especially for the statistics module block and particularly with respect to the Master Thesis.
- E 3. (AR 2.3) It is recommended to make the complete study plan as provided in the study regulations available on the website of degree programme.

- E 4. (AR 2.6) It is recommended to further promote the institutionalization of the relationship between the Vinifera programme and the related industry branches ("Advisory Board").
- E 5. (AR 2.9) It is recommended to better document the results and the follow-up processes of the quality assurance cycle.

## Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula

According to SAR and the Diploma Supplement, the following **objectives** and **learning out-comes** shall be achieved in the Vinifera Master programme:

Sec. 4.2 "The science-based programme provides detailed knowledge in Viticulture, Enology and Wine Economics as well as key competences (soft skills) at Master level. Research oriented modules and the preparation of a Master Thesis qualify the graduates for critical scientific working.

The mobility scheme of the programme and the option to prepare the Master Thesis at selected oversees partners offer the possibility for the students to gain in-depth experience of the European and also global diversity of Viticulture, Enology and the Wine Industry.

Furthermore, the cultural heterogeneity of the student group and the integration in national programmes during the second academic year provide the necessary conditions for intercultural learning and for building up an international network."

Sec. 5.2 "The programme 'Master of Science in Viticulture and Enology (M.Sc.)' qualifies the graduates to identify, analyse and communicate issues regarding grapes and wine production or estate/cellars technical management. They are able to analyse and solve problems of advisory or policy related activities within viticulture and winemaking development, in national or international companies or organisations."

#### Additionally, the SAR states:

"The course is characterized by the goal of quality-oriented, economical and sustainable vine cultivation, grape processing and wine marketing. The graduates have the ability to solve professional questions on the basis of a deepened engineering and economic sciences expertise.

The specific structure of the Master's degree enables the students to develop their chosen skills profile based on a scientifically oriented basic education. Students should gain insight into ongoing research work and/or participate in current projects. Furthermore, the graduates are qualified for a scientific career. The Vinifera EuroMaster degree opens to PhD applications.

Depending on the students' interests, it is feasible for them to continue an academic career by enrolling in post-graduate PhD programmes offered by the partners."

The following **curriculum** is presented:

## Degree Program of the Vinifera EuroMaster - M1 and M2

## Degree Program of the first academic year (M1) - commonly delivered at <u>Montpellier SupAgro (academic year 2017-18)</u>

Module Title	ECTS credits
Terroir and Company auditing	5
Languages	4 joint credits for
- French as a Foreign Language	both languages, with one final average
- Second language (LV2)	oue man average
Project management in Science	6
Vine Biology	5
Vine Ecology and Physiology	8
Viticulture	7
Enology	7
Wine Analysis	5
Wine Processing	7
Economics for the Wine Industry	6
Additional Module	
Study Trip	1*
* not counted for the degree program	
ECTS points (total) for the degree program	60
2010 points (total) for the degree program	00

## 2. Degree Programs of the second academic year M2: 3rd and 4th semester

## 2.1 <u>Degree Program of the Consorzio tra le Università di Torino, Milano, Pa Foggia e Sassari (curriculum 2017)</u>

Module Title		
Teaching language : English	ECTS credits	Place
10 ECTS choice from:		
Enography	5	Asti
Fermentation microflora and territorial characterization	5	Asti
Packaging in the wine industry: performance, safety and sustainability	5	Milano
Microbial biotechnology in denology	5	Milano
Foods and beverages in the balanced diet	5	Milano
Enological techniques for Mediterranean and warm/arid zones	5	Palermo
Agrid-food technologies	5	Palermo
Microbial biotechnology	5	Sassari
Physical and chemical analysis of food	5	Sassari
5 ECTS choice from:		
Grapevine ecophysiology	5	Alba
Vineyard management, environment and ripening	5	Alba
Sustainable viticulture	5	Milano
Vineyard management in Mediterranean warm and arid zones	5	Palermo
Studies on vineyard environments	5	Sassari
5 ECTS choice from:		
Viticultural pedology	5	Asti
Mechanics for precision viticulture	5	Asti
Advanced machinery and plant engineering in viticulture and enology	5	Milano
Soil management in warm-arid environments	5	Palermo
Insights into grapevine pathology	5	Sassari
Free Choice modules (see below)	10	
Internship	5	
Master thesis	25	
TATAL COUNTS	co	

TOTAL CREDITS 60

free choice modules	ECTS credits	Place
Enology in warm/dry climates	5	Foggia
Wine starter microbiology	5	Foggia
Viticulture and enology policy/regulations	5	Foggia
Marketing strategies for improving Sicilian wines	5	Palermo
Vineyard mite control	5	Foggia
Physiology and quality of grapevine production in warm & dry climates	5	Foggia
Basics of Remote Sensing for Agriculture	5	Asti
Secondary metabolites in the grapevine	5	Alba

## 2.1.2 M2 TABLE GRAPE GROWING CURRICULUM

Module Title	ECTS	place
Table grape protected cultivation	5	Foggia
Table grape processing	5	Foggia
Table grape innovation	5	Palermo
Plant protection	5	Palermo
Free Choice modules (see below)	10	
Internship	5	
Master thesis	25	
	60	- I

 Free choice modules
 ECTS
 place

 Economics of food safety and nutrition
 5
 Foggia

 Plant growth regulators
 5
 Palermo

 Table grape soilless cultivation
 5
 Palermo

## 2.2 Degree Program offered by the Consorzio tra le Università di Udine, Balzano, Padova e Verona

Students of Vinifera EuroMaster degree program will follow the courses of the Laurea Magistrale in Viticoltura, Enologia e Mercati vitivinicoli" (Master in Viticulture, Enology and Wine Market, offered according to the Italian regulations by the consortium among the four universities).

They have to follow the second academic year (M2) courses:

•	One specialization (to choose one out of four)	20 ECTS
•	Optional courses* of an equivalent of	10 ECTS
•	Language training (Italian for foreigners)	3 ECTS
•	Master Thesis	27 ECTS
•	Internship (included in the thesis)	7 ECTS

#### Options for specialisation:

## a) Specialisation: Research and development in Enology (UDINE) (20 ECTS)

	ECTS Credit
Module group: Biotechnology for enological techniques	10
Biomolecular techniques for microorganism identification	5
Advanced analytical techniques in wine analysis	5
Module group: Techniques of separation, stabilization and packaging in enology	10
Stabilization techniques in enology	4
Physical processes for juice and wine conditioning and packaging technologies	6

## b) Specialisation: Research and development in Viticulture (UDINE) (20 ECTS)

	ECTS credits
Module group: Grapevine physiology 2	10
Applied physiology: Case studies	3
Environmental factors and secondary metabolism	4
Molecular physiopathology	3

(continued over nage)

Module group: Agronomical techniques and territory	10
Vineyard mechanization and quality	4
Fertilisers and grapevine nutrition	3
Soil and irrigation management	3

## c) Specialisation: Research and development in Wine Economics (VERONA) (20 ECTS)

Module	ECTS Credits
Module group: Marketing and Communication of Wine	10
Advanced tools for marketing and communication	5
New wine marketing tools	5
Module group: Winery management took	10
Financial statement analysis and planning	5
Investment analysis and appraisal in the wine sector	5

Optional Modules
Modules covering 10 ECTS have to be chosen from other programs of the University of Udine (in case of the specialisations "Research and development in Enology" or "Research and development in Viticulture") or of the University of Verona (in case of the specialisation Research and Development in "Wine Economics")

#### d) Specialisation: Sustainable management of mountain viticulture and alpine landscape valorization

(BOLZANO) (October to February) (20 ECTS)

Teaching language: English

	ECTS credits
Module group: Vineyard management and wine production in mountain areas	10
Vineyard management in mountain areas	3
Vineyard mechanization in mountain areas	4
Wine production processes and plants	3
(continued over page)	

	ECTS credits
Module group: Agrochemicals in vineyard pest management and environment landscape in mountain areas	10
Plant pathology defence in vineyard in mountain areas	3
Management and use of agrochemicals and their fate in the environment	3
Mountain viticulture and landscape	4
Optional Courses:	
Management of soil fertility in mountain vineyards	5
Chemistry of fertilizers and mineral nutrition of the grapevine	3
Characterization of mountain wines	5
Fermentation processes for the production of mountain wines	2
Soil and water management in grapevine production	2
Sensory analysis approaches for mountain wines	3

#### Optional Modules (10 ECTS)

Modules covering 10 ECTS have to be chosen from other programs of the University of Udine (in case of the specialisations "Research and development in Enology" or "Research and development in Viticulture") or of the University of Verona (in case of the specialisation Research and Development in "Wine Economics") or of the University of Bolzano (in case of the specialization "Sustainable management of mountain viticulture within the Alpine landscape valorisation").

The three universities (Udine, Verona and Bolzano) offer courses in English to allow the choice of these optional  $10\ ECTS$ .

## 2.3 Degree Program at Hochschule Geisenheim University

Module Title	ECTS
Total Control of the	credits
Teaching language: English	
German language class (optional)	
And 1 4th	
3 <sup>rd</sup> and 4 <sup>th</sup> semester	
Advanced Viticulture	6
Advanced Enology	6
Product- and Project Management in Wine Business (Advanced Wine Business)	6
Research Project	12
•	
Master Thesis with Defense	30
Modules of other degree programs of the Hochschule Geisenheim University - and of the Master programs "Oenology" "Weinwirtschaft" and "Getränketechnologie" can be chosen as additional modules.	
The grades and the ECTS credits obtained in these additional modules are displayed on the Transcript of Records on request of the student.	
The grades obtained for these additional modules do not count in the calculation of the global grade and the ECTS Points do not count in the calculation of the minimum ECTS points required for the completion of the degree.	
ECTS credits (total)	60

## 2.4 Degree Program at Universidade de Lisboa, Portugal

Module Title	ECTS
	credits
Teaching language: English	
3 <sup>ra</sup> semester	
Professional Winery training and study visit	3
Stabilisation and wine ageing	6
Grape and wine derived products and by-products	3
Mountain and semi-arid tropical viticulture	3
Advanced Viticulture	6
Fortified Wines	3
Master Seminar (in Viticulture and Enology Engineering)	6
Portuguese language (optional)	
4th semester	
Master Thesis with Defense	30
ECTS credits (total)	60

## 2.5 Degree Program at Universidad Politécnica de Madrid – Escuela Técnica Superior de Ingeneros Agrónomos

Module Title	ECTS
	credits
Teaching language: Spanish	
3 <sup>rd</sup> semester	
Wine Technology in Wines from Dry Mediterranean Regions	4
Microbiological and Physicochemical Stabilization of Wines from Dry Regions	6
Marketing and Diffusion in Spanish Wine Sector	6
Viticulture in Dry Mediterranean Regions /	4
Spanish Grape Cultivars	
Training Design and Practices for Viticulture in Dry Regions	5
Vine Pests and Diseases in Dry Regions	3
Study Trip - Spanish Wines	2
Spanish language (4 ECTS, optional)	
4 <sup>th</sup> semester	
Master Thesis	30
ECTS credits (total)	60