



ASIIN Seal

Accreditation Report

Bachelor's Degree Programme
Veterinary Science

Professional Programme
Veterinary Professional Education

Provided by
Institut Pertanian Bogor (IPB)

Version: 22th September 2023

Table of Content

A About the Accreditation Process.....	3
B Characteristics of the Degree Programmes	5
C Peer Report for the ASIIN Seal	7
1. The Degree Programme: Concept, content & implementation	7
2. Exams: System, Concept and Organisation.....	19
3. Resources	22
4. Transparency and documentation.....	26
5. Quality management: quality assessment and development	28
D Additional Documents	32
E Comment of the Higher Education Institution (24.08.2023)	32
F Summary: Peer recommendations (31.05.2023)	38
G Comment of the Technical Committee 14 - Medicine (08.09.2023)	40
H Decision of the Accreditation Commission (22.09.2023)	41
Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula	43

A About the Accreditation Process

Name of the degree programme (in original language)	(Official) English translation of the name	Labels ap- plied for ¹	Previous ac- creditation (is- suing agency, validity)	Involved Technical Commit- tees (TC) ²
Sarjana Kedokteran Hewan (SKH)	Bachelor of Veteri- nary Sciences (BVS)	ASIIN		14
Pendidikan Profesi Dokter Hewan (PPDH)	Veterinary Profession Education (VPE)	ASIIN		14
Date of the contract: 23.09.2022 Submission of the final version of the self-assessment report: 11.04.2023 Date of the onsite visit: 14.-15.06.2023 at: IPB University				
Peer panel: Prof. Dr. Helen Louton, University Rostock Dr. Vista Budiariati, Universitas Gadjah Mada Christian Gruber, Mag.med.vet., MME, veted-consulting München Nadja Wacimin, Universitas Gadjah Mada, student				
Representatives of the ASIIN headquarter: Dr. Natalia Vega				
Responsible decision-making committee: Accreditation Commission for Degree Pro- grammes				
Criteria used: European Standards and Guidelines as of May 15, 2015 ASIIN General Criteria, as of December 10, 2015				

¹ ASIIN Seal for degree programmes.

² TC: Technical Committee for the following subject areas: TC 14: Medicine.

Subject-Specific Criteria of Technical Committee 09 – Chemistry, Pharmacy as of March 29, 2019 ASIIN Additional Criteria for Structured Doctoral Programmes as of March 15, 2021	
---	--

B Characteristics of the Degree Programmes

a) Name	Final degree (original/English translation)	b) Areas of Specialization	c) Corresponding level of the EQF ³	d) Mode of Study	e) Double/Joint Degree	f) Duration	g) Credit points/unit	h) Intake rhythm & First time of offer
Sarjana Kedokteran Hewan/ Bachelor of Veterinary Science	SKH/B.V.Sc.	Veterinary Science	Level 6	Full time	-	8 Semester	237 ECTS/158 SCH (semester credit hours)	-
Pendidikan Profesi Dokter Hewan/ Veterinary Professional Education	drh./D.V.M.	Veterinary Professional	Level 6	Full time	-	3 Semesters	55.5 ECTS/37 SCH (semester credit hours)	-

Name	Intake rhythm	Intake Capacity per cohort	Average starting cohort size	Average number of graduates per cohort	Average time required to complete studies
Sarjana Kedokteran Hewan/ Bachelor of Veterinary Science	Annually	Max. 260 students	205 students	207 students	8.3 semesters / 49.5 months
Pendidikan Profesi Dokter Hewan/ Veterinary Professional Education	Each semester	Max. 100 students	100 students	100 students	4 semesters / 24.39 months

Institut Pertanian Bogor (IPB) is a state agricultural university located in the regency of Bogor, Indonesia, which has a population of around 1,114,018 inhabitants. It was founded as independent institute on 1st September 1963. Currently, the university has ten faculties (Faculty of Agriculture, Faculty of Fisheries and Marine Science, Faculty of Animal Science, Faculty of Forestry and Environment, Faculty of Agricultural Technology, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Economics and Management, Faculty of Human Ecology, School of Business, School of Veterinary Medicine and Biomedical Sciences).

³ EQF = The European Qualifications Framework for lifelong learning

The School of Veterinary Medicine and Biomedical Sciences of IPB was first established in 1907. After several locations and names, it was officially merged in 1950 to University of Indonesia, located in Bogor. The vision of the school is to establish superior veterinary and biomedical study programmes based on innovative human resource development and research in science and technology in order to produce highly competitive graduates. In this Faculty, topics like animal health, biomedicine, comparative medicine, public health, and environment conservation play an important role.

For the Bachelor's and Professional degree programmes in the area of **Veterinary Medicine** the institution has presented the following profile in the faculty's website:

“Vision

To be an excellent higher education institution related to the development of science, technology, and human resources in the area of veterinary medical sciences and biomedicine in the levels of regional and international.

Mission

To conduct veterinary medical and biomedical education to meet the current and future need.

To support a sustainable livestock development through the area of animal, human, and environment health.

To increase the standard of living of the society through the improvement of animal health and livestock.

Objective

The main objective of veterinary medicine education at FVM IPB is to produce bachelor in veterinary medicine (SKH) and veterinarians (drh) with high skills, competency, and entrepreneurship spirit and possessing high competitiveness in regional as well as international levels.”

C Peer Report for the ASIIN Seal

1. The Degree Programme: Concept, content & implementation

Criterion 1.1 Objectives and learning outcomes of a degree programme (intended qualifications profile)

Evidence:

- Module Handbooks
- Learning Outcomes-Courses Matrices
- Self-Assessment-Report (SAR)
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussion during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The experts refer to the learning-module-matrices for each degree programme, and the modules as a basis for judging whether the intended learning outcomes of the degree programmes under review correspond with the competences as outlined by the SSC.

The Learning Outcomes for each programme are described in the SAR and in the Diploma Supplement (see Appendix). According to the university website, graduates of the programmes under review are capable to work in several professions, for example, as or an independent veterinarian, as researcher, consultant, and teaching staff at the government as well as private offices, as government employees in central government as well as regional offices. In addition, they are able to support private companies, particularly in the area of animal medicine, pharmacies, and biomedicine or in production sector (livestock) as well as in the field of animal product processing as well as food and beverages companies.

As stated in the SAR, the programmes' objectives are developed in line with the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework, Indonesian National Work Competency Standards, the OIE Day 1 Graduate Competency from the World Organization for Animal Health (WOAH), the stakeholders' requirements, and the vision and mission of IPB University. These are

reviewed periodically. The expert team take note that within the framework of the calibration, which is carried out every five years before the mid and end examination by a special team, the learning outcomes of the degree programmes are verified. They conclude that is an adequate procedure to review the learning outcomes and improve the quality of the exams.

After reviewing the learning outcomes and discussing them with the various stakeholders, the experts conclude that the descriptions of the qualification objectives are comprehensive and include the competences achieved and the possible career opportunities for graduates. The objectives and learning outcomes are made available to all stakeholders as they can be found on the IPB website. In addition, they are anchored and published in a transparent manner, making them available to students, lecturers and interested third parties. On the basis of Objectives-Learning Outcomes Matrix and Learning Outcomes-Modules Matrix delivered by the university, the expert group considers that the intended learning outcomes of the programmes are suitable for producing qualified graduates. Moreover, they are regularly reviewed and systematically revised.

Criterion 1.2 Name of the degree programme

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment-Report (SAR)
- Discussion during the audit
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The experts consider that the names of the programmes correspond to the intended programme and learning outcomes, as well as to the main language of the course. The experts agree that the teaching and learning content and the competence profile are consistent with the proposed title of the programmes.

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

Evidence:

- Module Handbooks
- Self-Assessment-Report (SAR)
- SOP (Standard operational procedure)
- Curriculum Structure

- Semester Study Plan
- List for international mobility
- Multiactivity Enrichment Course
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The Doctor of Veterinary Medicine Program consists of two study programmes, i.e., the **Bachelor of Veterinary Science (BVS)** and **Veterinary Professional Education (VPE)**.

BVS is a four-year programme, upon completion of which graduates are awarded a Bachelor of Sciences (B.Sc.). **VPE** consists of three semesters and gives the title of Doctor of Veterinary Medicine. The curriculum consists of “first common”, preclinical, paraclinical, clinical subjects, and a final project. The students further clinical courses in VPE. The VPE programme focuses on increasing hard skill competencies for veterinarians.

Some courses include basic and general competencies, e.g., basic veterinary sciences and clinical veterinary sciences. Specific competencies are too taught such as Epidemiology, Transboundary Animal Diseases, Zoonoses (including Food Borne Diseases), Emerging and Re-Emerging Diseases, Disease Prevention and Control Program, Basic Food Hygiene, Veterinary Products, Animal Welfare, Veterinary Legislation and Ethics, and General Certification. These competencies are obtained in courses in the BVS program. Meanwhile, students obtain communication skills and leadership during the VPE program. In addition, elective courses are included in the fifth and seventh semester of BVS and in the third semester of VPE. This elective course is implemented in semester 3 at VPE program partner locations.

According to the SAR, both programmes include a high amount of practical courses. Practicum activities for BVS are carried out in the laboratory, in experimental conditions, and outside the campus. The VPE student courses and internship activities are carried out both on campus and at SVMBS partner sites. Extramural activities in large animals consist of 2 credits, which will be carried out for four weeks. In this activity, students are expected to be able to diagnose and treat internal diseases, surgery, reproductive and obstetric disorders, artificial insemination, check pregnancy, and analyse the relationship between feed nutrition and environmental sanitation with livestock production. Students can gain competence in academic partners such as cooperatives and dairy cattle companies. The number of cows used by students is approximately 2,174 heads, with a ratio of 1:10, so students are free to learn in the field.

During the audit, the experts discuss the contents of the modules. The programme coordinators explain that many courses focus on veterinary clinical diagnostic and animal health (pathology, surgery, final diseases, and parasitology) and the elective courses complement some contents. For instance, there are courses about wild animals including reptiles. In VPE, there are also courses to animal health e.g., cattle. The student can choose the animal on which they want to practice. The expert group learn that in third semester of VPE, five courses are extramural and structured like an internship during the semester break. Regarding the electives, the programme coordinators explain that students are free to choose the elective courses. However, there is a limitation in BVS, the course can only start with a minimum of 20 students. For VPE, there is not a minimum of students registered, but all courses are open.

Periodic Review of the Curriculum

According to the SAR provided by IPB, the curriculum is every five years reviewed in accordance with the requirement of all the stakeholders. The last curriculum review was carried out in 2019. It is carried out through five stages:

1. Evaluation and assessment of graduate profiles
2. Evaluation and assessment of the primary competencies of the study program
3. Evaluation and assessment of teaching materials competence against the suitability of the scientific realm, which is the mandate of the department
4. Evaluation and study of teaching materials on the distribution of complete courses with depth and time distribution (covering the number of credits and semesters)
5. Curriculum workshops

In the curriculum workshops, the dean, vice dean, education commission, department heads, division heads, course coordinators, and lecturers as well as external stakeholders, including alumni, private practitioners, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, the non-territorial association of Indonesian Veterinary Medical Association (IVMA) and the vice chancellor for academics are involved. The faculty senate discuss and approve the results of the curriculum workshop.

During the audit, the programme coordinators ask about the changes due to the curriculum reform. The programme coordinator explain that the reform brought more flexibility to the curriculum structure. For instance, the management and selection of elective of courses is flexible and offers the enhancement of the development of student's soft skills. In addition, the internship becomes mandatory in VPE. They believe that the curriculum match with the

needs of the industry. Furthermore, the students express their satisfaction with the curriculum and the electives offers. Moreover, they emphasize the importance of the student's association, because, in this way, they can develop their interpersonal and communication skills.

Student mobility

In its self-report, it is emphasized that the university has a broad network of collaboration with several universities that allow the international mobility of IPB students to universities abroad. The IISMA (Indonesian International Students Mobility Awards) from the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture provides opportunity to all Indonesian undergraduate students to have international mobility. In addition, IPB University offers the IISMA program which is organized by ICO and covers all expenses such as tuition fees, accommodation and transport. Seminars, conferences, and competitions that are organized by the International Veterinary Student Association (IVSA) and other organizations give students opportunities for international mobility. The university highlight that all information about student's mobility is also disseminated through social media such as Instagram @ico_ipb.

According to the university, in the third semester of VPE, the elective courses allow the international mobility of students, based on their interest. If the courses taken by the students in foreign institutions have similar Learning Outcomes (LO) to the courses in the curriculum of BVS, the credits can be transferred to their transcript.

During the audit, the representatives of the Rector's office emphasize that internationalisation plays an important role for IPB. They want to promote student's mobility more through different ways. For instance, they create the international students contest as incentive to promote the student's mobility. They also mention among others: the Indonesian Student Mobility Fond, for which students can apply for six months academic stay abroad; the University Consortium between three Indonesian and three Japanese universities, the International Student Programme in Japan, an interchange programme with South Korea financed by the state. In addition, IPB is a member of the Asian international mobility community. Students can also apply for an internship e.g., in companies in Japan, Malaysia or for an internship in agriculture area in Netherlands. Moreover, the students confirm the wide range of offers for academic mobility and the university support us for carrying out the internship abroad. Furthermore, the experts notice during the on-site visit that there are many international students from Malaysia.

Altogether, the auditors are satisfied with the curricula of all programmes and are of the opinion that the bachelor and professional programmes both cover the important subjects.

They see that the programmes are well structured and that the modules build on each other in a reasonable way, enabling the students to effectively reach the learning outcomes as laid down for the programmes as a whole. Learning outcomes are also defined for each module, which, in total, enable the achievement of the overarching programme objectives. The electives offered in both programmes provide opportunity for individual focal points and courses of study. Furthermore, they appreciate that the curriculum is periodically reviewed. The experts also recommend that suggestions and input from stakeholders should always be used as important considerations in the curriculum review process in line with developments in the competency requirements for veterinarians based on WOA recommendations and national as well as international standards. The expert group conclude also that IPB promotes international student mobility in an adequate way. Additionally, the experts highlight that the students have very good English skills.

Criterion 1.4 Admission requirements

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report (SAR)
- Government Regulations
- Standard Operational Procedure (SOP)
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussion during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The university has described the different admission criteria in their self-assessment report. Admission of new undergraduate students at IPB University is carried out with the principle of “education for all (education for everyone)” for which there are different pathways as follows:

“1. National Selection of State University Entrance. The SNMPTN pathway is a national student selection system by all state universities attended by participants from all over Indonesia. This SNMPTN path is based on academic achievement screening using report cards and other achievements.

2. Joint Entrance Selection of State Universities. The SBMPTN path is one of the forms of admission by State Universities (PTN) through written examinations held nationally by the

Indonesian State University Rector Board. Written exams are composed of questions developed 61 to meet the requirements of validity, difficulty level, and adequate differentiation.

3. Special invitation for graduates who have International and National Achievement Path (International and National Achievement, PIN). The PIN scheme is a specified path for entering IPB University that is provided to prospective high school graduates majoring in Natural Sciences who demonstrated outstanding achievements both on a national and international level.

4. Selection of students for Scholarship of Regional Representative Path (Regional Representatives Scholarship, BUD). The BUD scheme is a way of receiving IPB University undergraduate students under the recommendation and fully funded by the central government, provincial government, and district/city governments. Students who graduate via this scheme are expected to return to their hometowns to build regions, companies, and private institutions.

5. IPB University Talent Test (Independent Talent Test, UTM). The UTM program is a way of receiving IPB University undergraduate students based on leadership, entrepreneurship, and love or passion for agriculture. Prospective students must take a written examination organized by IPB University according to the schedule.

6. Affirmation program. The affirmation program is carried out to provide greater access for Indonesian citizens in higher education age groups in the leading regions (Indonesian border with other countries) to form excellent human characters who will accelerate development in the leading regions.

7. International students. Prospective international students who apply to IPB University can be divided into two groups, namely those who will enrol in the first year of the education program or international students from other universities who will move to study at IPB University. The recruitment and selection system of prospective students by SVMBS IPB University follows a selection process based on a central system applied by IPB University.

Approximately 36% students are selected from invitation based on high school academic performance (National Selection of State University Entrance/SNMPTN), 36% from the national written test (Joint Selection for State University Entrance/SBMPTN), 10% are international student, and 18% for the others entrance options.

The admission process for VPE Program is conducted every semester. The candidates have to be graduates of veterinary medicine from SVMBS IPB University or from other veterinary faculties with superior accreditation, good English skills (TOEFL/IELTS 450 certificate) and

evidence of physically and mentally health by a health certificate from a general practitioner and a psychiatrist.

As following table shows, about 205 new students were admitted to study the BVS programme per year, from which the average female students (135, 65.9%) was more than the average male students (70, 34.1%) and 29 (14.1%) foreign students.

Table 1.5 Proportion of new students of BVS Program based on gender and nationality

Entrance Year	Number of applications	Student numbers	Gender		Nationality	
			Male (%)	Female (%)	Indonesia (%)	Foreign (%)
2016	2466	195	69 (35.4)	126 (64.6)	175 (89.7)	20 (10.3)
2017	2379	235	84 (35.7)	151 (64.3)	200 (85.1)	35 (14.9)
2018	2852	182	65 (35.7)	117 (64.3)	157 (86.3)	25 (13.7)
2019	2233	212	67 (31.6)	145 (68.4)	175 (82.5)	37 (17.5)
2020	1984	199	63 (31.7)	136 (68.3)	173 (86.9)	26 (13.1)
Average	2383	205	70 (34.1)	135 (65.9)	176 (85.9)	29 (14.1)

The average number of new students entering the VPE programme per year is 188 students. Female students (119, 63.3%) are the majority, while male students are approx. 69 (36.7%) and an average of 18 foreign students (9.6%).

The admission requirements are, according to the university, published on the university website. The website should inform potential students in detail about the requirements and the necessary steps to apply for admission into the programmes. Since the rules are based on official regulations, the auditors deem them binding and transparent. The experts found a very open and innovative mindset when it comes to account for disadvantages, e.g., given in the admission of applicants from remote areas of Indonesia. Still, when it comes to the topic of disabled students or students with chronic diseases, the experts could not find a consistent policy or strategy of where IPB is aiming to go to. This also applies to a concept for gender equality, which should be reviewed and adapted.

Based on the discussions during the on-site visit, it has come to the expert's attention that the current admissions policy does not align with the principles of inclusivity and equal opportunities for all students. The university's policy explicitly excludes students with colour blindness from the admission process. This exclusionary practice undermines the university's commitment to creating a diverse and accessible learning environment. In order to meet accreditation standards, it is imperative for the university to revise their admissions policy and eliminate any discriminatory practices against colour-blind students. By adopting a more inclusive approach, the university can ensure that all qualified applicants, re-

ardless of color blindness or any other visual impairment, have equal access to higher education opportunities. The experts recommend that IPB is proactively addressing at least the most common topics of diversity (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)abilities, amongst others).

Criterion 1.5 Workload and Credits

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- Module handbooks
- Survey of student satisfaction related to the workload
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

As states in the SAR, semester credit hours (SCH) at BVS IPB University are 158 credits in 8 semesters. Nationally, credits for undergraduate graduates in Indonesia are 144-160 credits. At IPB University's VPE, students must complete 37 credits in 3 semesters. Determining the number of credits for each course refers to the national curriculum set by AIVS and IVMA (documents for revitalizing Indonesian veterinary education). In the VPE program, the course credits are taken in packages.

According to IPB standards, 1 credit for the lecture is equal to 1.5 ECTS (European Credit Transfer System), while 1 credit for the practicum is equal to 3.75 ECTS. So that graduates of the Bachelor of Veterinary Medicine and VPE program complete 480.5 credits that consist of 341.75 credits in the Bachelor programme (lecture: 107 credits (sch) = 160.5 ECTS, Practicum: 51 credits (sch) = 181.25 ECTS, and in the professional programme is the Practicum 37 credits (sch) = 138.75 ECTS.

The workload is regularly checked and updated, in particular, the issues of compliance with credits for each module, the actual workload of students and the distribution of workload over all semesters is carried out. Courses and credit load is guided and approved each semester by the academic supervisor. The maximum credit load that can be taken according to the previous semester's IP can be seen in Table 1.7. The minimum study load for students is 12 credits per semester. Students can take less than 12 credits if there is a valid reason, or the remaining study load is less than 12 credits.

The university presents following table that shows the progress of studies in the VPE program. According to this, there is a stable GPA average per year, but the length of study is decreasing since 2019/2020.

Academic Year	Students admitted in Academic Year	Students graduated in Academic Year	Average GPA in Academic Year	Length of Study of Graduates in Academic Year	Students drop out in Academic Year
2016/2017	143	146	3.71	23.78 months	0
2017/2018	143	151	3.73	23.41 months	0
2018/2019	150	143	3.71	24.18 months	0
Odd 2019/2020	100	100	3.75	16 months	0
Even 2019/2020	108	108	3.75	17.08 months	0
odd 2020/2021	96	96	3.8	15.33 months	0
Even 2020/2021	82	82	3.85	15 months	0
Odd 2021/2022	105	104	3.84	15.11 months	1 (resign)
Average	116	116	3,78	18,74 months	0,125

During the discussions on-site, the students express their satisfaction with the workload and the distribution of credits between the semesters. They also feel supported by the academic supervisor. The experts are satisfied with the fact that the amount and composition of the workload are described in detail for every module in the module handbook. However, they conclude that the workload has to be revised and reviewed and the credits awarded for the modules need to correspond with the actual workload of the students. Furthermore, the awarded credits have to be coherent in all documents e.g., module handbooks, curriculum, transcript of records, diploma supplement, university website etc.

Criterion 1.6 Didactic and Teaching Methodology
--

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- Module handbooks
- Example Class Contract
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

According to the SAR, different teaching and learning methods are applied in the programmes under review, particularly, a collaborative learning method as well as a problem/inquiry-based learning or case studies in lectures. Most of the courses consist of lecture sessions and laboratory/practical learning. Due to the pandemic situation, online-courses and the use of digital tools in the classes has been implemented and developed. Various online learning platforms were used and the capacity of the Learning Management System (LMS) was increased. In addition, there is a mini studio used for online learning and creating learning videos.

Student's writing and communication skills are trained not only in the courses, but also in student activities and scientific competitions held at the university. Furthermore, independent scientific work is trained. All students must conduct research and write independent papers as a condition of graduation and obtaining a bachelor's degree. Research can be in the form of research results in laboratories, field surveys, case studies, or literature reviews.

Various training and workshops are held regularly to improve the ability and knowledge of lecturers in learning methodologies and technology. All lecturers are required to attend Applied Approach (AA) training, which is training to improve pedagogic competence for lecturers. Various learning method competition grants are offered as a driver in developing learning methodologies. For the use of the online learning platforms, training for lecturers is offered. During the audit, the lecturers express their satisfaction with the didactic training that is offered by IPB.

Additionally, the expert group discuss about the Learning Management System. The teaching staff confirm that they integrate the system in the courses. They are satisfied with the design and the features e.g., for uploading the course materials, videos, communication and assessment of students. In their opinion, the LMS enrich their courses. In addition, they

emphasized that the pandemics, the communication ways changed and they get acknowledged with WhatsApp and other ways to communicate with the students. According to the lecturers, in the future, the LMS will be further integrated into the learning environment.

The experts appreciate that a variety of teaching methods are applied and both digital and face-to-face teaching are used. They also observe that teaching staff is qualified enough and very motivated. Furthermore, a brief insight into the Learning Management System (LMS) was provided showing a BVS course. Based on this, it seems that the faculty makes use of the LMS in its courses by providing contents (e.g., slides) and assignments for grading. However, the content provided in the LMS seems to stay isolated and not well integrated into the courses, as there were no focusing questions coming with the slides (so that students can prepare for class discussions) and/or following up from previous classes. The system seems to be parallel, not integrated. The experts strongly recommend a revision of the teaching process in the light of the possibilities of the Moodle LMS, trying to source out not only the delivery of facts into the LMS in a guiding manner, so that students can bring the information in a context, but also providing supportive learning paths, self-evaluation, group exchange, to foster self-paced and self-directed learning in the students.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 1:

In its response statement regarding the requirement to ensure that students with color blindness are not excluded and that color blindness must not be an exclusion criterion from studying, IPB states that the university student admission regulation does not include any specific requirement about colour blindness for students who would like to enrol to IPB University. The university has sent a link to its university policy and explains that the principle of “education for all” in student admission has been implemented. In addition, they emphasize that SVMBS according to the university regulation do not practice discrimination against color blindness and other disabilities in the admission process to BVS and VPE programmes. The experts take note of these explanations. Nevertheless, they remark that, according to SOP POB-IPB-S1-1 (pt. 5.6.4), IPB requests a health certificate for the admission. Furthermore, during the discussions with the programme coordinators, they confirmed that color blindness is a reason for exclusion. For these reasons, the experts consider that requirement A1 must be maintained.

Concerning the experts’ judgement that the credits awarded for the modules need to correspond with the students’ actual workload, IPB explains that the modules of BVS and VPE have been revised and can be found on its website (<https://svmbms.ipb.ac.id/academic-sops/>). The experts appreciate this revision and update of the module handbooks. However, they are of the opinion that there is just a fixed ratio between SCH and ECTS and it is

not clear how 94.5 hours of workload can sum up to 6.75 ECTS (called ECTH for some reason) when one ECTS is minimum 25 hours of workload. Therefore, the experts stick to their previous assessment and consequently to the requirement A2.

With regard to the experts' recommendation E 1 to revise the teaching process in the light of the possibilities of the Learning management System, IPB states that since the beginning of 2023, the Moodle LMS has been expanded into two platforms: "class" for lectures and "exam" for tests and quizzes. The university explains that in these current platforms, all features for supportive learning paths, self-evaluation, and group exchange, to foster self-paced and self-directed learning, are available and suitable for the new curriculum that has been implemented since 2020. The auditors appreciate that these measures are taken by the university. Nevertheless, they believe that the recommendation (E1) has to be maintained, since more possibilities of the Learning management System could be explored, e.g. providing supportive learning paths, self-evaluation, and group exchange, in order to foster self-paced and self-directed learning in the students.

2. Exams: System, Concept and Organisation

Criterion 2 Exams: System, concept and organisation

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report (SAR)
- Standard Operational Procedures (SOP)
- Module Handbooks
- Samples of student's work (projects, exams and thesis)
- Implementation Of Final Project Procedure For Undergraduate Programme Veterinary Medicine Study Programme
- Sample of calibration
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

Exams in the degree study programmes under review follow the examination rules as stated in the "Standard Operational Procedures (SOP), Undergraduate programme implementation" of IPB (POB-IPB-S1-9). According to this, various examination methods can be applied. The type of exam is usually written, with multiple-choice questions and short answers. The type of exam form for each subject module follows student levels from multiple

choice to essays. In each course, there is a face-to-face schedule along with the topics. The exam conducted both offline and online platforms

The information on exam materials, type, and exam time is given at the beginning of the class oral and written by a “course contract”. IPB schedules the exams for the BVS Programme centrally. Exams are scheduled for two weeks for each mid-semester exam and final semester exam in such a way, that students take one exam daily for theory and practicum. Students in one course are divided into two rooms to ease supervision. Before the final exam, one week is provided for the preparation. Lecturers are 14 days to correct and announce grades. Examinations for VPE is scheduled for the 4th week at the end of each station of each course. The exam for each subject at each station is carried out orally with a question adapted to the learning outcomes. The Veterinary Professional Education/VPE Program has activities outside the campus, known as extramural courses. As it is being held outside campus, lecturers will conduct supervision and examinations at the internship site to ensure the quality of education.

In BVS, there are Mid-Semester Examination (UTS) and the Final Semester Examination (UAS). However, some courses include additional examinations at Mid-UTS and Mid-UAS. The score of each course is the cumulative result of the components of structured assignments, practicum (for courses with practicum), mid-semester exams, end-of-semester exams, and other exams with percentages according to the respective course contracts.

According to the SOP, the assessment for each course is based on three alternative assessments, namely (1) using the benchmark reference assessment (PAP) system, namely by determining the graduation limit, (2) using the normal reference assessment (PAN) system, namely by comparing the score of a student with the score of his group, or (3) using a combined system between the PAP and PAN, namely by determining the graduation limit first, then comparing the grades that pass relative to the grades of the group. The final grade of the course is presented as a quality letter (HM) and Quality Score (AM) as follows: A = 4; AB = 3.5; B = 3; BC = 2.5; C = 2; D = 1, and E = 0. A is excellent, AB very good, B good, BC fairly good; C = fair; D = conditionally pass. Students who get grade D in a course may be given a remedial exam with the approval of the course coordinator. The remedial exam can only be carried out 1 (one) time. Students who get a grade D because of their absence in the exam or lecture are not allowed to take the remedial exam. The deadline for the remedial exam is no later than 1 (one) week after the final exam. The grade of the remedial exam results is sent by the course coordinator to the Academic and Student Affairs Office maximum one week after the remedial exam is carried out. If they still failed in the remedial exams, the course can be re-taken in the next semester (short or regular semester). For VPE students, if they got a low grade in written examination (under B grade it's mean com-

petence according the learning outcome) so that they do not meet the standards. The student who failed to pass the standard will have oral examination, at the time they will notify their mistakes or incorrect answers and allowed re-exam until the competency skills of the LO are achieved.

Students are allowed to refute the results of the assessment if there are assessment results that are considered inappropriate and could consult with their lecturers about the results of their exams. Re-examination is given to students that are absent because of sick and other appropriate reasons. The information concern about re-taking the course has been written in appendix 2.1 SOP Undergraduate Student IPB University. Re-taking of courses in the POB-IPB-S1-7: Practicum and Lecture Implementation. Repeated course can be taken by the students who get the E grade for the course programmes. Students who get grade D for all categories of course subjects with the approval of the academic coordinator can re-take the course.

Regarding the final thesis or project in the BVS program, students choose the topic of the final project under supervision of the academic supervisor. Under the guidance of a final project supervisor, students independently prepare proposals, carry out research, process and analyse data and write the undergraduate thesis in semesters 7 to 8. The final project can be in the form of research, literature study, internship and case study. The final project supervisor test also students in the final examination of veterinary medicine together with other examiners appointed by the Dean and assess colloquiums, seminars and student final project.

In VPE, passing the "Student Competency Examination of the Veterinary Professional Education Program (UKMPPDH)" is a graduation requirement. This is carried out nationally in the form of computer-based test (CBT) questions and is classified as an exit exam to obtain professional certificates nationally. At the same time, graduation from the institution is determined by the Final Examination of the Veterinary Professional Education Program (UASDH).

During the audit, the students report that they are satisfied with the examination forms and their organisation and lecturers' feedback. In addition, the expert team take note that within the framework of the calibration, which is carried out every five years before the mid and end examination by a special team, the learning outcomes of the degree programmes are verified. They conclude that is an adequate and excellent procedure to review the learning outcomes and improve the quality of the exams. The auditors review the exam and thesis samples provided by the HEI. According to them, the documents prove that the level of the students' academic performance and the modules' contents is sufficient for the

respective programme. Furthermore, they are of the opinion that the number and distribution of exams ensure an adequate workload as well as sufficient time for preparation. In addition, the experts conclude that the VPE programme belongs according to the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) to Level 6, due to the fact that the programme does not include a final thesis or project. Therefore, VPE has to be accredited under Level 6 and it is not equivalent to a Master's degree programme.

3. Resources

Criterion 3.1 Staff and Development

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- Staff handbook
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

According to the SAR, the School of Veterinary Medicine and Biomedical Sciences of IPB University consists of 105 teachers (56.2% male and 43.8% female) as permanent staff. All are involved BVS and 75.24% in VPE programme. Most of the teaching staff are holder of a PhD degree, for BVS 84.3% and for VPE 87.3%, while the remaining have Master's degree. For BVS program, 20.4% of the teaching staff are professors, 24.8% associate professors, 31.4% assistant professors and the rest are instructors or assistant instructors. 21.5% of the academic staff in the VPE programme are professors, while 24.1% are associate professors, 27.8% assistant professors, 22.8% instructors and 3.8% assistant instructors. The total number of supporting staff of is 105, consisting of administrative and laboratory staff.

As stated in the SAR, the ratio between lecturers and for the BVS programme is 1:7.30, with the minimum of 1:5.98 and the maximum of 1:8.13, while the average ratio of VPE is 1:2.14, with the minimum of 1:0.67 and the maximum of 1:3.83.

In the SAR, IPB University highlight its offers for improvement of the staff's professional skills e.g., training in teaching techniques for young staff, English- language training for academic staff and various technical training related to expertise in each field of science. For new teaching staff, who want to get the certification of a qualified lecturer, it is compulsory

to attend a training. Various training and workshops are held regularly to improve the ability and knowledge of lecturers in learning methodologies and technology. All lecturers are required to attend Applied Approach (AA) training, which is training to improve pedagogic competence for lecturers. Various learning method competition grants are offered as a driver in developing learning methodologies. For the use of the online learning platforms, training for lecturers is offered. Lecturers, who do not have doctoral degree, are given opportunity to continue their education. In addition, many scholarship opportunities are provided by the Indonesian and international governments and other non-profit organizations for the academic staff. IPB University also allows the academic staff to do post-doctoral work. The institution also allows the teaching staff to develop their professional skills to be structural officers in professional associations, as well as reviewers in highly reputable journals. IPB University also offers incentives to lecturers who publish in highly reputable journals, especially those indexed by Scopus (for linked authors publishing at the Q1 level IDR 20,000,000/USD 1,400).

During the discussions on-site, the lecturers express their satisfaction with the didactic and professional training that are offered by IPB. They emphasize that the training regarding student's assessment included in the teaching training is very useful for them. The lecturers are satisfied with the support and offers from the university to further develop their professional and didactic skills. The University and faculty give them chance for looking for competitive research grants and offer grants for young researchers. They highlight that IPB has collaborations with many institutions. In addition, they have a form of sabbatical to improve their skills, in case they do not have a PhD degree, and for research activities.

The expert group take note that only full-time positions are available in IPB and discuss with the representatives of the Rector's office and the programme coordinators how this is in line with particular living situations e.g., professors having small children. They explain that IPB has a children care center that the teaching staff uses, as confirmed by them. The experts appreciate that several measures have been undertaken to support female staff (e.g., child care) and employees with disadvantages (new central unit to take care of these). Nevertheless, no general strategy, pathways or objectives were shown by IPB in gender equality. The fact that only full-time positions (even for the non-civil servant positions) are offered seems to be one of the limiting factors for women to apply for a position at IPB. Therefore, the experts recommend that IPB is proactively addressing at least the most common topics of diversity (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)abilities, amongst others), not only prohibiting discrimination based on them but actively fostering diversity.

Support and assistance for students

IPB University offers a comprehensive advisory system for all students. Academic advisors are assigned to students. They provide academic counselling based on monitoring the progress of student academic performance. Other lecturers can act also as counsellors for students providing academic advice and guidance at the University. Both counsellors and academic advisors give advice regarding academic and non- academic issues. The Academic Committee, which is under the coordination of Vice Dean of Academic and Student Affairs, has the responsibility for the implementation of the education process. Students, besides consulting with their academic advisors, may also ask for consideration and input to the University Academic Committee which is coordinated the Vice Dean of Academic and Student Affairs. The education and student capability enhancements are also carried out through the process of mandatory undergraduate thesis assignment, to be done under the minimum of one Thesis Advisor. The students confirm during the discussion with the experts that they all have an academic advisor.

In conjunction with the academic and mental support, IPB provides financial support for students with economic difficulties. In addition, the University manages and distributes scholarships to assist students with high academic performance. The University also provides student counselling services and medical center services for personal problems a student might face. Students' interests and talents are furthermore facilitated through several centers, such as the career development center or the scholarship information portal. In order to provide students with sufficient information about the available support and assistance, IPB distributes a Guidance Book for Bachelor's degree students that is regularly updated. All necessary information can also be found on IPBs websites.

The experts notice the good and trustful relationship between the students and the teaching staff. They believe that the faculty have enough human resources available to provide individual assistance, advice and support for all students. They also observe that teaching staff is qualified enough and very motivated. The support system helps the students to achieve the intended learning outcomes and to complete their studies successfully and without delay. The students are well informed about the services available to them.

Criterion 3.2 Funds and equipment
--

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- Visitation of the university and laboratories

- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

According to the SAR, the funds for the equipment of undergraduate programmes (BVS and VPE) are obtained, for the most part, from the central and local governments (49% yearly), and partly from the tuition fees, the Institutional and facility development fee, from own businesses (16%), including funds from companies, professional collaboration services, hospitals, continuing professional development (CPD) training programmes, and business units as well as from cooperation funds, grants, and alumni donations.

The School of Veterinary Medicine and Biomedical Sciences consist of the main building, animal facilities, and veterinary teaching hospital (VTH) (24.300 m²), Reproductive Rehabilitation Unit (URR) (16.200 m²), Laboratory Animal Management Unit (Unit Pengelola Hewan Laboratorium, UPHL) (5.400 m²), Insectary Unit at UKPHP (145 m²), laboratory for quality assurance of meat and poultry slaughterhouses (Rumah Potong Unggas, RPU), incinerator, and cold storage.

During the on-site visit, the experts visit the facilities of the university and the faculty as well as the laboratories. Following laboratories are inspected by the experts:

1. Anatomy Laboratory
2. Pathology Laboratory
3. Surgery room
4. Microbiology Laboratory
5. Veterinary Teaching Hospital
6. Veterinary Clinical Skills Center
7. Horse training hall
8. Diagnostic Center

The Veterinary Teaching Hospital also has classrooms, 3 meeting rooms, a dormitory, guestrooms, and co-working space to support their academic activities. In addition, there are also one cafeteria, student center rooms, student cyber rooms, a necropsy room, directory, a museum, experimental animal cages, an equestrian park, a large ruminant shed, a small ruminants pen, crematoriums, and a library and advanced laboratory in university level.

Altogether, the experts conclude that the university has secure funding and reliable financial planning. The facilities and infrastructure are very good and sufficient. The experts conclude that the Veterinary Teaching Hospitals is adequate to train students and enable them to achieve the PLOs of their respective degree programmes. However, they think that the equipment of the laboratories could be improved and increased. Furthermore, regarding the large animal (horse) operating room, the hygiene of the intended surgical rooms for

horses needs to be ensured according to international standards, in order to carry out surgeries in this place. This would include necessary equipment for surgeries (sterile) and should be separated from the usual examination rooms. The experts suggest that the university can consider more efficient and effective financial administration procedures so that planning related to updating laboratory facilities and equipment can be carried out without waiting for a long time to anticipate bottlenecks that may occur

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 3:

In its statement, IPB states with regard to the experts' recommendation to improve the equipment and safety conditions of the laboratories according to international standards that funds have been allocated to improve and update laboratory equipment at SVMBS, to increase supporting equipment at animal hospitals and the construction of an equestrian park, the construction of an Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) room, an auditorium, and student support facilities and equipment. The experts appreciate these improvements. Nevertheless, since these improvements are not fulfilled and the hygiene and laboratory equipment has not reached international standards yet, the experts are of the opinion that the recommendation (E2) needs to be maintained.

4. Transparency and documentation

Criterion 4.1 Module descriptions
--

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Module handbook of each study program
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

After reviewing the module descriptions, the experts confirmed that they contain all the essential general information, including module coordinators, teaching methods, workload, credit points awarded, intended learning outcomes, content coverage, applicability, admission and examination requirements, as well as assessment methods and a comprehensive explanation of how the final grade is calculated. However, the experts noted that

some of the module descriptions submitted were out-dated and not in line with accreditation requirements. To remedy this, the experts are asking IPB to revise and update the module handbooks. The updated module descriptions must include all modules taught in the programmes to ensure comprehensive coverage. In addition, it is essential to include the correct allocation of ECTS credits for each module to ensure accurate credit calculation and workload assessment.

In addition, it is crucial to demonstrate the changes and improvements made in the new curricula. Updated versions of the module handbooks must be uploaded to the relevant websites and be accessible to all stakeholders.

Criterion 4.2 Diploma and Diploma Supplement

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Samples of diploma supplements
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussion during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The experts confirm that all students receive a diploma supplement, transcript of records and an accompanying Bachelor's Certificate after the graduation. The accompanying Bachelor's Certificate contains information about the fulfilment of graduate competencies and soft skills. The transcript of records lists all the courses taken by the graduate, the Indonesian credits earned, the grades and the cumulative GPA. The Diploma Supplement contains the relevant information about the degree programme, including the classification of the degree programme with regard to the education system.

The experts based on the samples of these documents confirm that the students of the programmes under review are awarded a Diploma Supplement as well as a Transcript of Records. However, no statistical data about the actual percentage of students that receive each 'local' grade and information on the ECTS credits earned, which is necessary for potential employers to be able to properly assess a student's performance, is provided currently. Therefore, IPB has to add this information according to the ECTS Users' Guide.

Criterion 4.3 Relevant rules

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- University website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussion during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The university website contains the main information about the programmes and regulations. The auditors confirm that the rights and duties of both IPB and the students are clearly defined and binding. All rules and regulations are published on the university's website and hence available to all relevant stakeholders. In addition, the students receive all relevant course material in the language of the degree programme at the beginning of each semester.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 4:

Regarding the experts' judgement that the respective module handbooks need to contain all relevant information and to be available online for all interested stakeholders, IPB state in its statement that the module handbooks of BVS and VPE have been revised and are published on the university website. The experts verify the published module handbooks and, based on it, conclude that this requirement is fulfilled.

5. Quality management: quality assessment and development

Criterion 5 Quality management: quality assessment and development

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report (SAR)
- Samples of survey questions
- University Website: <https://ipb.ac.id/>
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The experts learn that there are two levels of quality assurance. The first level is external quality assurance, which consists of an external review of IPB's study programmes by various accreditation bodies, such as the BAN-PT (Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi, BAN-PT), AUN-QA (ASEAN University Network-Quality Assurance), and ISO 9001:2015, to ensure that the study programmes at SVMBS-IPB University meet objectives on both a national and international level. The second level consists of an internal quality assurance system carried out by different actors. The first actor at the university level is the Quality Management and Internal Audit Office (KMMAI). Its role is to develop and monitor the university's quality assurance system in order to continuously improve the quality and accountability of academic and non-academic programmes throughout the university.

At faculty level, IPB has established Quality Assurance Groups (Gugus Penjamin Mutu, GPM) that work in close collaboration with the Quality Control Units (Gugus Penjamin Mutu, GPM) at departmental level. While the Vice-Dean coordinates the GPMs, the Secretary of the Department coordinates the GKMAs.

The IQAS mandates regular monitoring, assessment, and audit of quality achievement, involving students, alumni, and graduate users. Students are involved in assessing the learning process, while alumni and graduate users evaluate the outcomes of graduates through tracer studies.

Two important tools highlighted by IPB are the curriculum evaluation and development process and the evaluation of teaching and learning. Every five years, SVMBS-IPB holds curriculum workshops to evaluate the implemented curriculum and its supporting infrastructure. Stakeholders in the area of veterinary medicine, including numerous government and non-government institutions, as well as society, are involved. The review process of the curriculum are conducted by the stakeholders of IPB University, composed of a) Educational staffs/lecturers; b) Head of the study programmes, departments, and faculties of IPB; c) The Academic Senate; d) Students and parents/guardians of the students through the mechanism of questionnaire; e) Other higher education institutions with the same or similar study programmes – through the mechanism of benchmarking; f) Partnering High Schools of IPB whose graduates have become IPB students in a large number; g) Employers of IPB graduates, such as private corporations, government in regional and central levels, state-owned corporations, regionally-owned enterprises, etc.

The evaluation of the learning process in every course by student (EPBM) is held twice in each semester. In addition to EPBM, there are surveys provided to every student in each semester to evaluate all academic aspects. During the audit, the experts discuss the quality management system at IPB with the rectorate representatives, programme coordinators

and the students. They concluded that the IPB wide evaluation system for lectures and lecturers, EPBM, is applied. It consists of several questions concerning the lectures as well as the involved lecturers and must be filled in obligatory twice per semester from every student for every course/ lecture and every lecturer. In addition to the EPBM, the students have the possibility to approach a lecturer directly who is assigned to each student (as a kind of mentor), and to take part in an open discussion with the dean held every semester. Furthermore, there is a drop box for suggestions students can (and do) use to suggest improvements or complain about shortcomings. Through the students' representatives, opinions and wishes can also be uttered at the weekly "Rabuan" that is held as a discussion forum in the faculty. The students express their satisfaction with this direct and open communication with the Dean and the teachers.

Given the many and rich ways in which students can give feedback to the faculty, the experts doubt that the effort in the EPBM is yielding worthwhile results. Forcing people to give feedback will in many cases result in answers that lack validity. IPB may reconsider its way of gaining feedback data in a more differentiated way to save students' time when filling in the surveys and the universities resources when handling the huge amount of data collected. In addition, it is noteworthy that students mention not receiving any feedback on the evaluations, leaving them unaware of any improvements derived from their written comments. Hence, it is crucial for IPB to address this issue and ensure effective communication of the results to enhance the feed-back process.

The experts learn from the representatives of IPB's partners from public institutions and private companies that there are regular meetings with the partners on faculty level, where they discuss the needs and requirements of the employers and possible changes to the degree programmes. The experts see that changes in the curriculum are implemented as a result of feedback from employers.

The experts found a very open and innovative attitude to addressing disadvantage, for example in recruiting candidates from remote areas of Indonesia. Several measures have been taken to support female staff (e.g. childcare) and staff with disabilities. IPB has created a new central unit to meet their needs. However, when it comes to students with disabilities or chronic illnesses, the experts could not find a consistent policy or strategy on the direction IPB is taking. Similarly, in the area of gender equality, no pathways or objectives were identified. The fact that only full-time positions are offered seems to be one of the limiting factors for women to apply for a position at IPB. Therefore, the experts recommend that IPB proactively addresses at least the most common diversity issues (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)ability, etc.), not only prohibit discrimination on these grounds, but actively promote diversity.

In summary, the expert group confirms that the quality management system is overall suitable for identifying weaknesses and improving the programme. All stakeholders are involved in the process, but the closure of the feedback loop with students needs to be ensured.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 5:

With regard to the experts' observation to ensure an effective communication of the courses/teaching evaluation results to enhance the feedback process, IPB give following statement:

"All feedbacks from students are seriously considered by the Dean through regular meeting with the representatives of students. The improvement of facilities is planned and made based on student's request. However, the improvement made sometimes is not directly informed to the students. We plan to mention all the changes and improvements made in every meeting with students, website, and social media."

The auditors appreciate the regular meeting with the Dean and this direct and open communication way. However, they are of the opinion that the results of the courses evaluations have to be discussed in the courses between teachers and students and be clearly communicate to them. Therefore, they conclude that this requirement is not fulfilled and has to be maintained.

On the experts' requirement to improve the awareness of supporting disabled and to enhance diversity, IPB comments that the full-time positions of both academic and supporting staff are offered for men and women without discrimination. In addition, the university explains that they have a full-time staff and a part-time (non-permanent) academic staff which have a lower workload and target than the permanent academic staff. IPB also states that there is not differentiate treatment based on gender, ethnicity, religion, race, or group. According to the university, they are working on the implementation of gender equality and mention the "Center for Gender and Child Studies", a research center that focuses on the development of gender equality, family, and community. The experts appreciate that IPB implements strategies of no discrimination and gender equality. However, they believe that IPB needs to adopt a more inclusive approach and to ensure that all qualified applicants, regardless of colour blindness or any other visual impairment, have equal access to higher education opportunities and improve some aspects e.g. exclusion of persons with a handicap (see above 1.4).

D Additional Documents

- No additional documents needed.

E Comment of the Higher Education Institution (24.08.2023)

“Criterion 1.1: CONFIRMED

Criterion 1.2: CONFIRMED

Criterion 1.3:

The experts also recommend that suggestions and input from stakeholders should always be used as important considerations in the curriculum review process in line with developments in the competency requirements for veterinarians based on WOAH recommendations and national as well as international standards

Comment:

The last curriculum evaluation was held in 2019 and several external stakeholders were invited, such as the representatives from the Ministry of Fisheries and the poultry industry association. During the evaluation, it was agreed that the courses that covered poultry health management already fulfilled the stakeholder’s expectations and graduate competencies. However, the course for aquatic health management needs to be improved. One output of the evaluation is the decision to change the “Aquatic Health Management” course from an elective to a mandatory course in the new curriculum that has been implemented since 2020.

Criterion 1.4:

Based on the discussions during the on-site visit, it has come to the expert’s attention that the current admissions policy does not align with the principles of inclusivity and equal opportunities for all students. The university’s policy explicitly excludes students with colour blindness from the admission process. This exclusionary practice undermines the university’s commitment to creating a diverse and accessible learning environment. In order to meet accreditation standards, it is imperative for the university to revise their admissions policy and eliminate any discriminatory practices against colour-blind students. By adopting a more inclusive approach, the university can ensure that all qualified applicants, regardless

of colour blindness or any other visual impairment, have equal access to higher education opportunities

Comment:

As it can be seen in the university student admission (<https://admisi.ipb.ac.id/international-class-for-foreign-citizen/>), there is no specific requirement about colour blindness for students who would like to enroll to IPB University. Since 2022, IPB University has implemented the principle of “education for all” in student admission. In this [university policy](#), IPB University gives same access for Indonesian and foreign students. SVMBS also follows the university regulation for student admission and no discrimination against color blindness and other disabilities to enroll in BVS and VPE programs.

Criterion 1.5:

The experts are satisfied with the fact that the amount and composition of the workload are described in detail for every module in the module handbook. However, they conclude that the workload has to be revised and reviewed and the credits awarded for the modules need to correspond with the actual workload of the students.

Comment:

The modules [of BVS](#) and [VPE](#) have been revised and can be found on our website (<https://svmbms.ipb.ac.id/academic-sops/>).

Criterion 1.6:

The experts strongly recommend a revision of the teaching process in the light of the possibilities of the Moodle LMS, trying to source out not only the delivery of facts into the LMS in a guiding manner, so that students can bring the information in a context, but also providing supportive learning paths, self-evaluation, group exchange, to foster self-paced and self-directed learning in the students.

Comment:

In the [new curriculum](#), the learning process is more interactive. Since the beginning of 2023, our Moodle LMS has been expanded into two platforms: [“class”](#) for lectures and [“exam”](#) for tests and quizzes. In these current platforms, all features for supportive learning paths, self-evaluation, and group exchange, to foster self-paced and self-directed learning are available and suitable for the new curriculum that has been implemented since 2020. The use of all these features is encouraged.

Criterion 2: CONFIRMED

Criterion 3.1:

Nevertheless, no general strategy, pathways or objectives were shown by IPB in gender equality. The fact that only full-time positions (even for the non-civil servant positions) are offered seems to be one of the limiting factors for women to apply for a position at IPB. Therefore, the experts recommend that IPB is proactively addressing at least the most common topics of diversity (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)abilities, amongst others), not only prohibiting discrimination based on them but actively fostering diversity.

Comment:

The full-time positions of both academic and supporting staff of IPB University (civil servant and non-civil servant positions) are offered for men and women without discrimination. Both genders, males, and females, have the same opportunity for applying as staff of IPB University. In addition to full-time staff, IPB also has part-time (non-permanent) academic staff (that have NUPI, “Nomor Urut Pendidik IPB” and/or NIDK, “Nomor Induk Dosen Khusus”). This position can be accessed by both men and women without any discrimination. These staff have a lower workload and target than the permanent academic staff. Management of employees at IPB University, by the Rector of IPB University Regulation No. 7 of 2021, concerning the Management of Employees of IPB University is carried out based on the principles of (1) professionalism, (2) transparency, (3) accountability, (4) participation, (5) fairness and equality, (6) proportional, and (7) non-discrimination. The principle of fairness and equality includes that the management of employees reflects a sense of justice and equality in obtaining opportunities to act as employees. In addition, the non-discriminatory aspect means that employee management does not differentiate treatment based on gender, ethnicity, religion, race, or group.

In addition, IPB University is concerned about gender equality. There is a research center (Center for Gender and Child Studies) that focuses on the development of gender equality, family, and community.

Criterion 3.2:

Furthermore, regarding the large animal (horse) operating room, the hygiene of the intended surgical rooms for horses needs to be ensured according to international standards, in order to carry out surgeries in this place. This would include necessary equipment for surgeries (sterile) and should be separated from the usual examination rooms. The experts suggest that the university can consider more efficient and effective financial administration procedures so that planning related to updating laboratory facilities and equipment can be carried out without waiting for a long time to anticipate bottlenecks that may occur.

Comment:

In addition to external funding from the government, IPB also obtains funding internal from the student (BPIF) that has a more flexible financial administration. Several updating laboratory facilities and equipment are covered by BPIF funding. The Rector of IPB University has a policy of providing total financing (100%) to all units within IPB University, including SVMBS, for the revitalization of equipment and facilities. Our planning for facilities improvement is described in our strategic plan for 2021-2026.

The improvement of our facilities and infrastructure was initiated in 2021. The total budget allocated for overall infrastructure and facility upgrades and improvements in SVMBS are 45 billion IDR or **2,615,995.97 EUROS**. The total cost of revitalizing facilities and equipment in **2021** was 5.1 billion (IDR) or 318,750 Euros. The funds have been allocated to improve and update laboratory equipment at SVMBS and to increase supporting equipment at animal hospitals (such as X-ray units and telemedicine equipment). The investments also allocated from these funds included the construction of an equestrian park, the construction of an Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) room, an auditorium, and student support facilities and equipment.

In 2022, the SVMBS also allocated 100% of the BPIF funds (2.98 billion or 172,903 EURO) to update equipment and facilities for 11 divisions, two units (Reproductive Rehabilitation and Laboratory Animal Management), and the Veterinary Teaching Animal Hospital. Furthermore, SVMBS also improves the facilities and equipment of 4 (four) academic laboratories, animal laboratory units, veterinary teaching hospital, and reproductive rehabilitation units, as well as all divisions in SVMBS. In addition to BPIF support, SVMBS (2021 and 2022) obtained collaboration funds from JAPFA (Poultry Health Research Center), Tropical Forest Conservation Act (TFCA) (Rp 16.5 billion or 986.370 euro), Horse Embryo Transfer Unit (Rp 1 billion or 59.780 euro), and Equestrian Park (1 billion or 59.780 euro).

In 2023, SVMBS plans to implement BPIF funds to revitalize 11 laboratories (large capacity), (excluding the four laboratories that were renovated in 2022) as well as equipment procurements (microscope, electrocardiogram (ECG), spectrophotometer), the total cost was 6 billion IDR or 360,827.03 Euros. In addition, based on the suggestions and recommendations from the assessors, this year we are working to improve the facilities of the large animal/horse surgery room and several other surgery rooms at Veterinary Teaching Animal Hospital so that the existing facilities and equipment will meet international standards.

Criterion 4.1:

However, the experts noted that some of the module descriptions submitted were out-dated and not in line with accreditation requirements. To remedy this, the experts are asking IPB to revise and update the module handbooks. The updated module descriptions must include

all modules taught in the programmes to ensure comprehensive coverage. In addition, it is essential to include the correct allocation of ECTS credits for each module to ensure accurate credit calculation and workload assessment. In addition, it is crucial to demonstrate the changes and improvements made in the new curricula. Updated versions of the module handbooks must be uploaded to the relevant websites and be accessible to all stakeholders.

Comment:

The modules of BVS and VPE have been revised and can be found in our website (<https://svmbms.ipb.ac.id/academic-sops/>).

Criterion 4.2:

However, no statistical data about the actual percentage of students that receive each 'local' grade and information on the ECTS credits earned, which is necessary for potential employers to be able to properly assess a student's performance, is provided currently. Therefore, IPB has to add this information according to the ECTS Users' Guide.

Comment:

The actual percentage of earned grades and ECTS is provided in the diploma supplement that is received by students upon the graduation of bachelor and veterinarian degrees. In the Diploma Supplement, there is information about the grading scheme and statistical data on the relative position of the graduate's GPA and credit system.

Criterion 4.3: CONFIRMED

Criterion 5-a:

IPB may reconsider its way of gaining feedback data in a more differentiated way to save students' time when filling in the surveys and the university resources when handling the huge amount of data collected. In addition, it is noteworthy that students mention not receiving any feedback on the evaluations, leaving them unaware of any improvements derived from their written comments. Hence, it is crucial for IPB to address this issue and ensure effective communication of the results to enhance the feedback process.

Comment:

All feedbacks from students are seriously considered by the Dean through regular meeting with the representatives of students. The improvement of facilities is planned and made based on student's request. However, the improvement made sometimes is not directly informed to the students. We plan to mention all the changes and improvements made in every meeting with students, website, and social media.

Criterion 5-b:

However, when it comes to students with disabilities or chronic illnesses, the experts could not find a consistent policy or strategy on the direction IPB is taking. Similarly, in the area of gender equality, no pathways or objectives were identified. The fact that only full-time positions are offered seems to be one of the limiting factors for women to apply for a position at IPB. Therefore, the experts recommend that IPB proactively addresses at least the most common diversity issues (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)ability, etc.), not only prohibit discrimination on these grounds but actively promote diversity.

Comment:

Since 2022, IPB University has implemented the principle of “education for all” in student admission. In this [university policy](#), IPB University gives same access to Indonesian and foreign students, regardless of their diversity.

In addition to IPB’s concern with diversity equality, there is a research center in IPB ([Center for Gender and Child Studies](#)) that focuses on the development of gender equality, family, and community.”

F Summary: Peer recommendations (31.05.2023)

Taking into account the additional information and the comments given by IPB, the experts summarize their analysis and final assessment for the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Bachelor Veterinary Science	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029
Veterinary Professional Education	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029

Requirements:

For all degree programmes

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.4) Ensure that students with colour blindness are not excluded from studying.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.5) Ensure that the credits awarded for the modules correspond with the actual workload of the students.
- A 3. (ASIIN 5) Increase the awareness of supporting disabled and enhance diversity, proactively addressing at least the most common topics of diversity (such as age, gender, race, religion, sexual orientation, physical and mental (dis)abilities, amongst others). This include the teaching and studying environment (e.g. building).
- A 4. (ASIIN 5) Ensure effective feedback to students on the results of course evaluations.

Recommendations

For all degree programmes

- E 1. (ASIIN 1.6) It is recommended to revise the teaching process in the light of the possibilities of the Learning management System, e.g. providing supportive learning paths,

self-evaluation, and group exchange, in order to foster self-paced and self-directed learning in the students.

- E 2. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to ensure the hygiene of the intended surgical rooms for horses and to improve the equipment and safety conditions of the laboratories according to international standards.

G Comment of the Technical Committee 14 - Medicine (08.09.2023)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the ASIIN seal:

Technical Committee 14 – Medicine (08.09.2023)

In the course of its consideration of the procedure, TC14 discusses above all requirement 3 ("Increase the awareness of supporting disabled and enhance diversity, proactively addressing at least the most common topics of diversity (...)"). The TC members see this requirement first of all as imprecise with regard to its phrasing and point out in this context that "awareness" is a variable that is difficult to measure, and a possible fulfilment of the requirement would therefore be problematic. Furthermore, the FA members see the requirement - although they consider it to be valuable in terms of content - as too harsh in view of the university's apparently already existing efforts, and are therefore in favour of downgrading it to a recommendation instead.

The Technical Committee 14 – Medicine recommends the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Bachelor Veterinary Science	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029
Veterinary Professional Education	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029

H Decision of the Accreditation Commission (22.09.2023)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the subject-specific ASIIN seal:

The Accreditation Commission discusses the procedure and has chosen to eliminate A3 due to the absence of discernible concerns in connection with this matter, while emphasizing that IPB is already actively striving towards a more inclusive direction. The Accreditation Commission decides to award the following seals:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Bachelor Veterinary Science	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029
Veterinary Professional Education	With requirements for one year	30.09.2029

Requirements:

For all degree programmes

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.4) Ensure that students with colour blindness are not excluded from studying.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.5) Ensure that the credits awarded for the modules correspond with the actual workload of the students.
- A 3. (ASIIN 5) Ensure effective feedback to students on the results of course evaluations.

Recommendations

For all degree programmes

- E 1. (ASIIN 1.6) It is recommended to revise the teaching process in the light of the possibilities of the Learning management System, e.g. providing supportive learning paths,

self-evaluation, and group exchange, in order to foster self-paced and self-directed learning in the students.

- E 2. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to ensure the hygiene of the intended surgical rooms for horses and to improve the equipment and safety conditions of the laboratories according to international standards.

Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula

According to the SAR the following **objectives** and **learning outcomes (intended qualifications profile)** shall be achieved by the programmes under review:

The program objectives of a **Bachelor of Veterinary Sciences (BVS)** are as follows:

“(PO-1) Implement and integrate natural sciences, sciences and methods in veterinary medicine needed for the development of veterinary medicine.

(PO-2) Carry out research in medicine and to veterinary medicine.

(PO-3) Carry out public administrative tasks in veterinary medicine and other related fields.

(PO-4) Continue further studies in professional degree in veterinary medicine (veterinarian) dan/or further studies in a higher research degree.

The Learning outcomes of a Bachelor of Veterinary Sciences (BVS)

(LO-1) Graduates will be able to apply science and technology in biomedicine and categorize healthy and unhealthy animals based on anatomical and physiological features, clinical signs, pathological changes, and laboratory diagnostic techniques accurately and according to the law of the art.

(LO-2) Graduates will be able to explain the prevention, control, eradication, and treatment of animal diseases, including zoonotic diseases, and promote animal health and welfare.

(LO-3) Graduates will be able to describe the animal structure, animal health, laboratory diagnostics, and zoonotic diseases for working as a researcher, lecturer, quality assurance, quality control, entrepreneur, and government officer.

(LO-4) Graduates can demonstrate leadership and entrepreneurship, practice good communication, perform independently and teamwork in working and perform responsibility, persistence, and commitment.”

The program objectives of a **Veterinary Professional Education (VPE)** are as follows:

“(PO-1) Fulfill the Indonesian Qualification Framework (IQF) in Veterinary Medicine, and Day-1 Competencies of Graduating Veterinarians from the World Organization for Animal Health (WOAH), and have a spirit of entrepreneurship in the national and international level.

(PO-2) Develop basic and applied research and strategic and innovative strategies for supporting sustainable national development.

(PO-3) Implement innovations in the field of veterinary medicine and biomedical sciences for the human, animal, and environmental health.

(PO-4) Continue to further studies in the higher degree.

The Learning outcomes of a Veterinary Professional Education (VPE)

(LO-1) Graduates will be able to examine the diagnosis of diseases and perform medical measures.

(LO-2) Graduates will be able to solve problems and apply the prevention, control, eradication, and treatment of animal diseases, including zoonotic diseases.

(LO-3) Graduates will be able to mastering veterinary science and technology, regulation, professional attitudes, and entrepreneurial abilities as a veterinarian practitioner, researcher, consultant (animal husbandry, food products, drug, and vaccine companies), bureaucrats/government employees, and entrepreneurs.

(LO-4) Graduates will be able to demonstrate leadership and entrepreneurship, practice good communication, perform independently and teamwork in working, adhere to the veterinarian oath and code of ethics and perform responsibility, persistence, and commitment.”

The following **curriculum** is presented for the programmes under review:

Bachelor of Veterinary Sciences (BVS)

No	Code	Subject Courses	SCH		ECTS		Total ECTS
			Theory	Practicum	Theory	Practicum	
1st Semester							
1	IPB1110	Religion	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
2	STK1111	Statistical and Data Analysis	3	0	4,5	0	4,5
3	IPB1106	Indonesian Language	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
4	BIO1102	Basic Biology	2	0	3	0	3
5	FIS1104	Engineering Physics	2	0	3	0	3
6	IPB1108	English	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
7	IPB1113	Innovative Agriculture	2	0	3	0	3
8	IPB1112	Sport	0	1	0	3,75	3,75
9	FKH1101	Veterinary Profession and Animal Welfare	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
2nd Semester							
1	IPB110D	Pancasila Education	1	0	1,5	0	1,5
2	IPB110E	Citizenship Education	1	0	1,5	0	1,5
3	MAT1102	Mathematics and Logical Thinking	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
4	EKO1101	Economy	2	0	3	0	3
5	KPM1131	Sociology	2	0	3	0	3
6	KOM1100	Computational Thinking	2	0	3	0	3
7	KIM1104	Chemical Science and Technology	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
8	AFF1111	Veterinary Anatomy I	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
3rd Semester							
1	STA1211	Statistics	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
2	AFF1212	Veterinary Histology I	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
3	AFF1221	Veterinary Physiology I	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
4	AFF1214	Veterinary Anatomy II	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
5	IPH1221	Veterinary Bacteriology and Mycology	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
6	BIK1201	Biochemistry	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
7	AFF1213	Embryology and Developmental Genetics	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
8	FKH1201	Scientific Methodology	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
4th Semester							
1	AFF1215	Veterinary Histology II	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
2	AFF1222	Veterinary Physiology II	2	1	3	3,75	6,75

0 Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula

3	AFF1216	Topography Anatomy	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
4	IPH1231	Veterinary Parasitology: Ectoparasites	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
5	IPH1331	Veterinary Parasitology: Endoparasites	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
6	AFF1223	Medical Biochemistry	2	0	3	0	3
7	NTP1271	Principle of Nutrition Science	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
8	IPH1222	Veterinary Virology	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
5th Semester							
1	AFF1331	Pharmacology I	2	0	3	0	3
2	IPH1311	Veterinary Public Health	1	0	1,5	0	1,5
3	KRP1311	Veterinary Clinical Diagnostics	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
4	KRP1321	Veterinary General Surgery	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
5	KRP1341	General Pathology	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
6	KRP1331	Veterinary Reproductive Science and Technology	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
7	IPH 1323	Medical Immunology	2	0	3	0	3
8	FKH1301	Aquatic Animal Health Management	2	0	3	0	3
9	FKH...,	Elective courses	2	0	3	0	3
6th Semester							
1	AFF1332	Pharmacology II	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
2	IPH1312	Veterinary Hygiene of Animal Origin	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
3	KRP1342	Veterinary Systemic Pathology I	2	0	3	0	3
4	KRP1312	Internal Medicine I	2	0	3	0	3
5	KRP1332	Obstetrics and Gynecology	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
6	KRP1322	Veterinary Special Surgery I	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
7	KRP1313	Clinical Pathology	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
8	IPH1324	Bacterial and Mycological Diseases	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
9	IPH1325	Viral Disease	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
10	IPB1400	KKNT	0	4	0	10	10
7th Semester							
1	AFF1433	Veterinary Toxicology	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25

0 Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula

2	IPH1413	Zoonoses	2	0	3	0	3
3	IPH1414	Veterinary Epidemiology and Economy	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
4	KRP1443	Veterinary Systemic Pathology II	2	1	3	3,75	6,75
5	KRP1414	Veterinary Internal Medicine II	2	0	3	0	3
6	KRP1423	Veterinary Special Surgery II	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
7	KRP1424	Veterinary Radiology	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
8	FKH1405	Colloquium	0	1	0	3,75	3,75
9	KRP1415	Clinical Dietetics	2	0	3	0	3
10	FKH ...	Elective Courses	2	0	3	0	3
8th Semester							
1	KRP1444	Poultry Pathology	2	0	3	0	3
2	KRP1416	Clinical Demonstration	0	1	0	3,75	3,75
3	KRP1451	Veterinary Pharmaceutical Preparation and General Therapy	1	1	1,5	3,75	5,25
4	FKH1401	Veterinary Legislation and Ethics	2	0	3	0	3
5	FKH1406	Seminar	0	1	0	3,75	3,75
6	FKH1407	Undergraduate Thesis	0	4	0	10	10
Total			107	51	160,5	181,25	341,75

Veterinary Professional Education (VPE)

No	Code	Subject Course	SCH* (practical)	ECTS
1st Semester				
1	FKH510	Prescription and Drug Applications	3	11,25
2	FKH512	Veterinary Surgery and Radiology	4	15
3	FKH513	Veterinary Internal Medicine & Clinical Pathology	4	15
4	FKH514	Reproduction and Obstetrics	4	15
5	FKH517	Diagnostic Laboratory	4	15

2nd Semester				
6	FKH515	Diagnostic Pathology	4	15
7	FKH516	Veterinary Public Health and Epidemiology	2	7,5
8	FKH522	Cattle Health Field Practice	2	7,5
9	FKH523	Animal Hospital Field Practice	2	7,5
10	FKH524	Poultry Farm Field Practice	2	7,5
11	FKH526	Slaughter House Management & Veterinary Public Service	2	7,5
3rd Semester				
12	Elective Course		2	7,5
	FKH521	Horse Health Field Practice		
	FKH525	Preferred Professional Field Practice		
	FKH528	Quarantine Field Practice		
	FKH529	Veterinary Industry Field Practice		
	FKH530	Wildlife Health Field Practice		
	FKH532	Aquatic Animal Health Field Practice		
	FKH533	Animal Laboratory Field Practice		
13	FKH527	Animal Welfare Field Practice		
14	FKH531	Comprehensive Examination	1	3,75
TOTAL			37	138,75