

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
18.06.2024

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM IN THE SPECIALTY
7R01105 "ONCOLOGY (ADULT)" OF THE RSE " THE MEDICAL CENTRE
HOSPITAL OF THE PRESIDENT'S AFFAIRS ADMINISTRATION OF THE
REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN " ON THE REM FOR COMPLIANCE WITH
THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION
PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS

Period of external expert evaluation: 29.05-31.05.2024

Almaty, 2024

CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)”	4
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)” and conclusions on completion	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)”	8
5.	Recommendations for improvement of the educational program 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)”	32
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council for accreditation of the educational program 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)”	32
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty educational program 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)"	33
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	34

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MCH	Medical Center Hospital
DPA RK	Department of Presidential Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MC PAA RK	The Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Hospital	RSE "The Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM
SCC	Scientific and Clinical Council
DPE	Department of Professional Education
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Examination
IEP	Individual Educational Plan
AIS	Automated Information System
CIS	Control and Measuring tools
R&D	Research Work
PPE	Personal Protective Equipment
EP	Educational Program
Academic staff	Academic Staff
QMS	Quality Management System

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 18 dated 17.05.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational program of residency in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" in the period from 29 to 31 May 2024, consisting of the following members:

№	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	YERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Chairman of the "Public Healthcare" Committee at the State Unitary Enterprise
2	International expert	URYASYEV OLEG MIKHAILOVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy named after Professor V.Ya. Garmash, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlova" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
3	Academic expert	KASENOVA SAULE LAIKOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Residency of the Department of Postgraduate Education of JSC «Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases»
4	Academic expert	YESENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Centre for Postgraduate Education of JSC «Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology»
5	Academic expert	SMAILOVA ALTYNAY NAGIZKHANOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Strategy Department of the Corporate Fund «University Medical Center» Nazarbayev University
6	Academic expert	SALIMBAYEVA DAMILIA NURGAZIEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Science of JSC «Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology»
9	Expert-employer	ZHUKUBAYEVA ALMIRA ASETKYZY	Master of Pedagogy and Psychology, the highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, the first medical category in public health. Head of the Education Department of LLP «National Scientific Oncology Centre»
10	Expert-student	NURGALIYEV ARSLAN ARDAKOVICH	Second-year resident in the specialty «Cardiology for Adults, children» of NJSC «Astana Medical University»

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational program "Oncology (adult)" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for Accreditation.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational residency program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)"

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the right of economic management, 990740002243
Management body	Medical Center of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan (PAA RK)
Full name of the first director	Albayev Rustam Kuanyshbekovich
Date of establishment	06.07.1999
Location and contact details	Kazakhstan 010000 Astana, Yesil district, E-495 street, No. 2 8 (7172) 70-80-11, 8 (7172) 70-79-52
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	License No. KZ87LAA00017356 dated 08.11.2019 Appendix to license No. 001 dated 08.11.2019
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	01.09.2022
Duration of study	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP	-
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	1
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP	Total number of teachers - 8, including full-time - <u>0</u> , part-time - 8. Sedateness, % - 75 Categorization, % - 100
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	kense@bmc.mcupd.kz https://bmcudp.kz/ru/

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

The Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) issued a certificate of accreditation of the educational program AB 4920 dated 06/30/2023, the period of validity of the certificate is from 06/30/2023 to 06/29/2024, the information is posted on the website <https://enic-kazakhstan.edu.kz/ru/accreditation/akkreditovannye-programmy-rezidentury-1>.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational residency program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" and conclusions on completeness

The self-assessment report of the educational residency program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 102 pages of the main text, appendices on 10 pages, copies or electronic versions of 12 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG7IY?usp=sharing>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuring taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the director, Albaev Rustam Kuanyshbekovich, who confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 19 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational program, Shanazarov Nasrullah Abdullaevich, MD, professor, deputy director for strategic development, science and education.

The self-assessment of the educational program "Oncology (adult)" was carried out on the basis of the director's order No. 222 dated 04/05/2024 "On the self-assessment of the educational program 7R01105 "Oncology (adult)".

All standards provide the actual practice of the organization for training residents in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" taking into account the start of student admission in 2022, substantiated data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results, the material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in its completed form, with data adjustments based on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain links in the text and are numbered continuously.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational program "Oncology (adult)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA / Dates of the visit to the organization: May 29-31, 2024. The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - 19 people;
- interviews with residents - 1 person;
- study of the website <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/>;
- interviews with 2 employees, 2 teachers, 3 mentors;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 20 and 49, respectively;
- observation of resident training: visit to the Multidisciplinary Medical Centre observation of the educational process of the 1st year resident of the educational program "Oncology (Adult)" Abildinova Amina Nakhymkyzy according to the schedule;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 2 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including the Consultative and Diagnostic Department of the Multidisciplinary Medical Centre, where training is conducted under the educational program

with the participation of 4 teachers and 6 part-time workers; Administrative building, department of professional education, conference halls, lecture and classrooms, changing rooms, canteen

- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 12 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1	Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education <i>Shanazarov Nasrulla Abdullaevich</i>	1
2	Deputy Director of the MCH for Medical Affairs <i>Doctor of Medical Sciences Karabaeva Raushan Zhumartovna</i>	1
3	Deputy Director of the Clinic <i>Candidate of Medical Sciences Tuleuova Aliya Asylbekovna</i>	1
4	Deputy Director of the MCH for Surgery <i>PhD Berdikhodjaev Mynzhylky Sailauovich</i>	1
5	Deputy Director of the MCH for Finance and Digitalization <i>Hasanov Mustafa Huseyn ogly</i>	1
6	Deputy Director of the MCH for Administrative and Economic Affairs <i>Silnichenko Maxim Grigorievich</i>	1
7	Deputy Head of the Department for Healthcare Technology Evaluation and Strategic Development <i>Turar Olzhas Askaruly</i>	1
8	Head of the Quality Management and Patient Safety Service <i>Sultanbekova Bibigul Malgazhdarovna</i>	1
9	Deputy Head of the Science and Gerontology Department <i>Avdeev Andrey Vladislavovich</i>	1
10	Head of the Department for Interaction with Partner Clinics and Development of Medical Tourism <i>Kazbekov Kairat Turekhanovich</i>	1
11	Head of the Human Resources Management Service <i>Kabdulinov Ruslan Tulegenovich</i>	1
12	Chief accountant <i>Birimkulova Zhazira Bakytovna</i> Deputy chief economist <i>Zhumagulova Samal Akhmetkalievna</i> Head of the public procurement department <i>Mukhamedkaliev Baurzhan Zhanburshaevich</i> Head of the department of standardization, pricing and analytics <i>Nurzhanov Alibek Ablaievich</i>	4
13	Head of the department of professional education of the MCH <i>Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna</i>	1
14	Developer of EP 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)” <i>Seidalin Nazar Karimovich</i> - chief oncologist	1
15	Oncologist of the MCH <i>Akhmetov Kenzhebek Rabilbekovich</i> Deputy Director for Treatment and Preventive Work of the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana (<i>online</i>) <i>Orazbekov Baktybay Seykhadirovich</i> Doctor of Functional Diagnostics of the MCH <i>Baidauletova Zaure Seidakhmetovna</i> Doctor of CT and MRI at the MCH <i>Kapi Raima Ueliollakzy</i>	3
16	Interview with resident 7R01105 “Oncology (adult)” Abildinova Amina	1

	Nakhymkyzy	
17	Interview with employers of MCH graduates online on the ZOOM platform	3

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, examination of documents, interview results, questionnaires was held. The EEC members began to draft the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation were made. The experts individually filled out the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Program "Oncology (Adult)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." The EEC members did not make any comments. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program were discussed and the chairperson of the ECAQA Accreditation Council, Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council/

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the University's corporate culture, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the ECAQA members.

While conducting a survey of residents, 100% rated the work of the External Expert Commission for Accreditation as positive. The majority of respondents (83.7%) believe that it is necessary to conduct accreditation of an educational organization or educational programs.

According to 65% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational residency program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)

Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

During the implementation of the program activities, namely, following the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (write the exact name of the council), in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. The mission of the educational program "Oncology (Adult)" is fully consistent with the mission of the educational organization.

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission is communicated to potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The organization's strategic plan for a period of 5 years has been reviewed, including such areas as the development of innovative and scientific-educational activities, within the framework of which work is being carried out on an ongoing basis to improve and expand the educational services provided, which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, training bases.

During the visit to the departments of the educational organization, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including an established and developing infrastructure and material and technical base and international partnerships with research centres, university clinics of the near and far abroad, which allows attracting leading foreign specialists to the educational process.

The Hospital organization has a division that is directly related to the educational program "Oncology (Adult)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the organization and coordination of the educational process in the Hospital is carried out by the department of professional education, which implements not only residency programs in the field of health care, but also educational programs of additional and non-formal education.

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program "Oncology (Adult)" are in full compliance, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and health care.

The educational organization conducts training of residents in the following clinical bases and departments: RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM, MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana, where a patient-oriented approach is provided through the passage of all structural divisions of the multidisciplinary clinic, which, in addition to supporting the educational process, meets the needs of the contingent in preventive, therapeutic and diagnostic, medical and social, drug care and has its own outpatient service, production of radiopharmaceutical drugs, equipped with modern medical and diagnostic equipment. The educational organization pays due attention to the safety and autonomy of residents through training in JCI standards, instruction on compliance with safety precautions in the workplace, sanitary and hygienic standards, disinfection and sterilization and anti-epidemic regimes, timely vaccination and revaccination.

Experts have established that residents have appropriate working conditions to support their own health, as the educational organization is provided with lecture halls, classrooms, conference rooms, changing rooms, and a canteen.

The educational organization encourages residents to participate in research in their chosen specialty through publications, participation in conferences and educational seminars, symposia, trainings, master classes.

At the same time, experts have determined that along with the introduction of new methods and technologies (innovations) in practical healthcare <https://cloud.mail.ru/stock/8DBi2V79RdV8UmJHWkrCxSU6> there are not enough pedagogical implementations in the educational process.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts have determined that the formation of professionalism includes mastering practical skills within the framework of professional competencies that form the ability to effectively carry out their professional activities in various conditions. The educational organization promotes the professional autonomy of residents by providing them with responsibility for their decisions, the ability to self-development, self-improvement, and opens up broader opportunities for professional growth and development.

The experts established that the educational organization fully exercises autonomy in relation to the selection of residents for the accredited specialty "Oncology (adult)", the development of the educational program (SOP "Algorithm for organizing postgraduate education in residency based on the MCH PAA RK", CEP / SQE ON and PO-8.1, <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG7IY?usp=sharing>, determining approaches to assessing residents "Academic Policy". <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG7IY?usp=sharing>). Responsible employees demonstrated to the experts a document defining the requirements for teachers of the residency program ("Residency Regulations"). At the moment, there are no graduates of the EP "Oncology (Adult)", given the duration of training.

To verify standard 1, a meeting was held with the Deputy Director of the Medical Center Hospital (hereinafter - MCH) for strategic development, science and education, MD Shanazarov Nasrulla Abdullaevich. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: How is the autonomy of the EP ensured? Scientific approaches to the implementation of the EP, incentives for

residents and Academic staff for participation in scientific research? Monitoring the funding of mentors, teachers? During the answers, the Deputy Director of the MCH Shanazarov N.A. confirmed the materials described in the self-report of the organization.

The academic freedom of residents is manifested in the opportunity to take elective courses focused on a specific area of oncology, so EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" includes the following elective courses: "Isotope Methods of Diagnosis and Treatment in Oncology Practice", "Management of Toxicity Associated with Immunotherapy". In order to develop the professional competencies of resident doctors, new technologies have been introduced during the training process at the Hospital: "Implementation of PET/CT studies based on 18F-DOPA of their own production", "Photodynamic therapy for HPV-associated cervical lesions", "Implementation of PET/CT studies based on 11C-Met of their own production for the diagnosis of brain tumours".

While conducting a survey of 49 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational program. It was found that 57.4% of residents would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 63.27% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational program and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 69.39% of residents answered positively, 12.24% are not sure about this, 12.24% could not yet answer this question, and 6.12% would like to believe it.

The 20 teachers surveyed (21 questions in the questionnaire) also answered that 75% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 20% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to residents and employees, responds promptly to applications and suggestions. In the questionnaire, 90% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 10% are partially satisfied. According to 80%, in the educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For information, a total of 49 people responded (4 on staff), while 50% have up to 5 years of teaching experience, 30% have up to 10 years, and 20% have over 10 years.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final learning outcomes are defined and posted in the Register https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/43328. Informing interested parties about the final learning outcomes of residents in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" is carried out by posting on the Hospital website. <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/npr-license/postupayushchim/obrazovatelnye-programmy/obrazovatelnye-programmy.html>. The experts were convinced that the professional behaviour and communication skills of residents are formed and reflected in the "Code of Honour of the Faculty and Resident Doctor of the Hospital", approved by order No. 250 dated July 18, 2019. Teachers and residents are informed about the code of honour.

While determining the final learning outcomes, the employees of the MCH of the Professional Education Department took into account the previous learning outcomes in the bachelor's degree and internship, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The educational organization provides training in additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development), including programs in the specialty of the accredited educational program.

The surveyed teachers responded that 10% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 80% are partially satisfied.

The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of the previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. 80% of the respondent teachers believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 20% partially agree with this.

1.4 Participation in formulating the mission and final outcomes

The following teachers took part in developing the goals and objectives of the educational program "Oncology (adult)": Shanazarov N.A., Seidalin N.K., employers Pivovarova I.A. (LLP "Center of Hematology"), Tuleutaev M.Ye. (MMC), mentors attracted from clinical bases Akhmetov K.R., which is confirmed by the minutes of the meeting of the SCC of the Hospital, protocol No. 2 dated 02.06.2022 while approving the accredited educational program. The following proposals were made, as inclusion of elective disciplines, like "Isotope methods of diagnosis and treatment in oncological practice", "Management of toxicity associated with immunotherapy". During the conversation with residents and employers, experts received a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?". Residents and employers answered these questions that the educational organization conducts regular questionnaires and surveys.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 13, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To apply innovative methods in the process of training residents "Oncology (adult)" taking into account the requirements of modern science and practice, the results of feedback with stakeholders (residents, students, employers, partners).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The model of the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" is determined on the basis of the final learning outcomes of residents, therefore it includes the following: The EP has been developed and is being implemented taking into account the needs of the medical services market for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan in medical personnel of the corresponding profile. <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>. Duration of training is 2 years. EP 7R01105 "Oncology (adult)" was approved at a meeting of the SCC of the Hospital, protocol No. 2 dated 02.06.2022.

The EP is included in the register of the EHEA of the MSHE of the RK and meets international requirements, namely, level 7 of the national qualification framework in medical education and the Framework of qualifications in the European Higher Education Area.

In accordance with the classifier, the specialty is legitimate and the graduate, upon completion of the educational program, is issued a certificate of completion of residency of the state standard with the assignment of the qualification "An adult oncologist", annex to the certificate indicating the list of studied disciplines with grades, the volume of academic hours.

To implement the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)", the organization's documents contain educational and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Conformity with the State Compulsory Educational Standards (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63 "On approval of state compulsory educational standards for levels of education in the field of health care" and standard requirements (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education in organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education"; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No RK MOH- 43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programs"; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 9, 2023 No. 4 "On approval of standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties") has been established.

While visiting the clinical sites of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's

Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM, MSE on the REM "Multi-disciplinary medical centre" of Astana, experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve practical skills as a result of patient supervision, participation in consultations, councils, general rounds, clinical reviews, participation in outpatient appointments under the guidance of clinical mentors. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since the experts studied the code of honour of the teacher / mentor and the Code of Honour of the resident physician of the Hospital (order of the acting director of the Hospital No. 250 dated July 18, 2019) and during the interview, the residents responded that they were informed about the content of this document.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions have been made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom. The mentoring system described in the document "Regulations on the Clinical Mentor" was assessed <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>. There are 8 mentors in total, whose tasks are to develop the resident's practical skills.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the "Residency Regulations".

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the educational program in the specialty "Adult Oncologist" corresponds to level 7 of the national qualification framework (ESG1.2) and has the code 7R01105.

Teachers use such methods of teaching residents as webinars, conferences, cases, discussion of a clinical case (analysis), symposia, and clinical rounds. Thanks to these methods, residents can take part in providing medical care to patients. Teachers can provide a resident with supervision of approximately 2-3 thematic patients per day and 8-10 per month. For example, residents of the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" upon completion of training can perform such manipulations as examination, palpation of the mammary glands, lymph nodes, taking material for biopsy. The experts found that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in the educational organization. This is reflected in the agreement with "PLAGIAT.PL" LLC for providing access to the Anti-plagiarism program No. 1906 dated 08/02/2023. Academic honesty is applicable at such stages of training residents as providing information on the originality of the text indicating the percentage of originality of the text when performing independent work of the resident. Anti-plagiarism is also applicable when residents are engaged in scientific activities.

Residents are trained to promptly collect informed consent from patients for any diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. The experts noted that the medical records contain a corresponding document signed by the patient.

Thus, by the end of the 2nd year of training, residents will acquire the basic skills and abilities in the profession of an adult oncologist, which will allow them to work in oncological institutions (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not find any violations regarding the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since the educational organization complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other regulatory legal acts in the field of education and health care.

The educational organization has a mechanism for regular adaptation of teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as to the current needs of practical health care. This mechanism includes the Scientific Circle "Schools of Young Scientists", which hosts seminars, master classes and conferences, as well as round tables on current topics of research work.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in

the document "Code of Honour of the Academic Staff and Resident Doctor of the Hospital" approved by order, No. 250 dated July 18, 2019.

2.2 Scientific method

The implementation of the educational program includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research. The Hospital staff and invited specialists give lectures to resident doctors on topics of scientific foundations, research methodology, and writing articles: "Tips for writing medical clinical cases", "International practice of writing a clinical case report", "Communication skills, ethical standards and deontology in healthcare", "Principles of epidemiological safety and standards for residents". The Hospital's Catalogue of Elective Disciplines includes disciplines not only in the core area, but also in social and behavioural sciences: "Public Health", "Evidence-Based Medicine", "Legal Regulation of Public Relations in the Sphere of Healthcare", "Dispute Resolution in the Sphere of Healthcare".

During a conversation with residents, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critically evaluating literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of the "School of Young Scientists", which is held once a month.

While questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work and 42.86% of people are completely satisfied with this, 16.33% are partially satisfied, 6% are not satisfied. Residents should engage in R&D and in response to the questionnaire, 16.33% wrote that they are already engaged in R&D, 20% are planning to start, 20.41% are looking for a R&D topic, 6% are not engaged.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of health care" (SCES) and the EP is included in the register of higher and postgraduate education with a coefficient of achievement of learning outcomes of 83.88%. The department of professional education of the MCH is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including "Communication skills, ethical standards and deontology in healthcare", "Principles of epidemiological safety and standards for residents", "Evidence-based medicine", "Legal regulation of public relations in the field of healthcare", "Dispute resolution in the field of healthcare", as well as the specifics of R&D and scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following "International Practice for Writing a Case Report". For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)", the organization has resources for organizing the evaluation of the practical skills of residents. The hospital is accredited by the NGO "Experts and consultants for external comprehensive evaluation in the field of healthcare" of the Accreditation Centre for Quality in Healthcare with the assignment of the highest category No. KZ66VEG00011799 dated November 25, 2021. As part of the rotations of resident doctors, joint activity agreements were concluded with the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP (accredited by the NGO Experts and consultants for external comprehensive evaluation in the field of healthcare of the Accreditation Centre for Quality in Healthcare with the assignment of the first category No KZ70VEG00013182 dated March 10, 2023) and the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre"

The full academic load for the entire period of study is 140 credits / 4200 hours, of which CC PD - 134 credits / 4020 hours, EC PD - 4 credits/ 120 hours, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits/ 60 hours.

The volume of the EP 7R01105 "Oncology (adult)" includes theoretical training (classroom work) - 10%, clinical training (ICWRT) - 70%, independent training (IWR) - 20% of the total curriculum. While forming the subject plan for basic medical and biological, clinical, behavioural and social disciplines, changes in the Protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of the Republic of Kazakhstan,

clinical recommendations of the NCCN, LSI of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan were taken into account.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 69.39% are fully satisfied, 16.33% are partially satisfied, and 4.08% are not satisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base with 212 beds and 500,000 outpatient visits, and has also concluded 2 contracts with medical organizations. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 69.39% of residents answered with full agreement, 24.49% partially agree, 2.04% disagree. At the same time, 77.55% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question "Do residents' representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received a positive answer.

The surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the schedule of classes (75.51%)

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Department of Professional Education (Department) and a conversation with the head and employees. At the same time, the verification of **Standard 2** showed that the tasks of the Department in the field of professional education are:

- 1) implementation of the main provisions of the state policy in the field of advanced training and professional growth of medical personnel in the Hospital;
- 2) coordination of educational activities;
- 3) organization, provision and conduct of educational events, assistance in improving the professional level of the Hospital employees.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the outpatient, surgical, clinical and diagnostic services of the Hospital, interviewed the Deputy Director of the Polyclinic, *Candidate of Medical Sciences, Tuleuova Aliya Asylbekovna*, Deputy Director of the MCH for Surgery *PhD Berdikhodjaev Mynzhylky Sailauovich*, a total of 4 meetings were held and during the cross-interview it was established that the disciplines of the EP "Oncology (Adult)" are held at 3 clinical sites (MCH PAA RK, Multidisciplinary Medical Centre, LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre") in specialized departments according to the thematic plan of the EP syllabus.

Thus, the responsibility for choosing the basis for clinical training and practice of a resident in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" is assigned to the department of professional education and the developer of EP 7R01105 "Oncology (adult)" *Seidalin Nazar Karimovich*. The experts analysed the information on the availability of accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that all clinical sites are accredited, since the Hospital site is equipped with everything necessary, accredited by the NGO Experts and consultants for external comprehensive evaluation in the field of healthcare of the Accreditation Centre for Quality in Healthcare with the assignment of the highest category No. KZ66VEG00011799 dated November 25, 2021, "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLC is accredited by the NGO Experts and consultants for external comprehensive assessment in the field of healthcare of the Accreditation Centre for Quality in Healthcare with the assignment of the first category No. KZ70VEG00013182 dated March 10, 2023).

The training of residents in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare; therefore, this organization is multidisciplinary in various areas of healthcare and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in the field of oncology. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received confirming information, and teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments according to the rotation schedule. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with all oncological diseases.

This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization.

The experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

Integration between training and the provision of medical care (on-the-job training) is carried out by studying practical skills in providing medical care under the guidance of mentors of oncologists with the highest category in the Hospital and at additional clinical bases of the city. The training is conducted in accordance with the clinical protocols for diagnostics and treatment of the Republic of Kazakhstan, NCCN clinical guidelines, and LSI of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Of the 49 residents surveyed, 69.39% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 8.16% and 6.12% believe that they do so rarely or sometimes.

The following employees took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)": employers Tuleutaev Mukhtar Yesenzhanovich - Director of the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana; Pivovarova Irina Alekseevna – LLP "Hematology Center", Astana; Hospital employees - Shanazarov Nasrulla Abdullaevich - MD, Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education; Seidalin Nazar Karimovich – Candidate of Medical Sciences, oncologist, mammologist of the Hospital; Akhmetov Kenzhebek Rabilbekovich – oncologist of the Hospital.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 21, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To expand the list of interactive teaching methods taking into account the practice-oriented training of residents to develop and improve the skills of a practitioner, researcher, manager, and communicator.

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The study of control and measuring tools (100 tests, 20 tasks, 10 cases) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents. During an interview with a 1-year resident of the specialty "Oncology (adult)" Abildinova A.N., it was found out, for example, that the assessment process includes summative and formative, the form of an exam in written and oral form, an assessment of practical skills in the form of an objective structured clinical exam (OSCE) and that she is satisfied with everything. The student also receives regular feedback from teachers. Academic achievements are assessed in points on a 100-point scale, an internationally accepted letter system with a digital equivalent (positive grades, in descending order, from "A" to "D-", and "unsatisfactory" - "FX", "F").

The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the document "Academic Policy" (minutes No. 1 of March 31, 2021) and "Rules for assessing learning outcomes in the implementation of educational programs" (minutes No. 2 of March 28, 2024) and there have been no precedents of appeal during the period of operation of the educational organization. The results of completing tasks are assessed using various simulators and training devices, standardized or real patients, as well as additional diagnostic elements (ECG, X-ray, CT, MRI results). Clinical situations are created for examinees to demonstrate the acquired practical, diagnostic, technical and communication skills. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behaviour and communication skills, which is confirmed by the following: Tasks for interpreting research, criteria in the assessment sheets of communication skills indicators (collecting anamnesis, delivering bad news), as well as technical skills.

The criteria for admission to the end-of-course assessment are a set of Admission rating assessment (ARA) points of 50 or more. This is documented in the "Academic Policy" (minutes No. 1 dated March 31, 2021).

Admission to independent examination of residents is the completion of the educational process in accordance with the IEP. The final certification of resident doctors of the EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" is scheduled only in 2025.

Validation and reliability evaluation of resident assessment methods (tests, tasks, cases) is ensured by the procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and analysing these methods, and is carried out in the form of a study and analysis of control and measuring tools. To determine the reliability and validity of test tasks, a preliminary analysis of the tests is carried out; the compliance of the test questions with the EP is checked with a gradual increase in the complexity of the tasks as the course of study progresses. This process was not carried out for the EP "Oncology (Adult)". The educational organization has a practice of involving external examiners in the assessment of residents, which is documented in the "Academic Policy" (minutes No. 1 of March 31, 2021). This ensures the independence and objectivity of the assessment results. The final certification of resident doctors of EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" is planned for 2025, in this regard, external examiners were not involved.

Thus, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked questions to the head of the professional education department, Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna, and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents.

The organization has 100 test tasks, which were compiled by N.K. Seidalin and approved at a meeting of the Academic staff (minutes No. 1 of January 30, 2023). The control and measuring tools were reviewed by M.E. Tuleutaev. – Director of the MSE on the REM “Multidisciplinary Medical Centre”, Astana; Pivovarova I.A. – LLP “Hematology Center”, Astana. The Head of the Professional Education Department responded that additions and updates to the control and measuring instruments are planned to be made in June 2024.

The results of the resident assessment are documented as follows: all stages of the educational process are recorded in the AIS “Platonus”, upon completion of the cycle and the end-of-course assessment, an examination report is created with the results, which are filed in the register and stored in the Department. The results of the academic period of study of each resident are reflected in the transcript. Upon completion of the full residency course, a certificate is issued using automatic identification and data collection technology (QR code).

To date, there have been no appeals from residents. During a visit to the organization and an interview with an employee, Seidalin N.K., PhD, oncologist, mammologist of the Hospital, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, agreements with clinical sites, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates and credentials. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/npr-license/rezidentura.html> and there is information on the "Academic Policy" of the Hospital; "Residency Regulations"; Algorithm for organizing postgraduate education in residency based on the Hospital; Rules for admission to residency, which is regularly updated.

During the visit to the organization, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And a positive answer was received.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and training

During the interview with 2 teachers regarding the assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that the teaching and learning methods used are comparable with the final learning outcomes and assessment methods. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting consultations before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure

and its fairness. For example, residents said that the assessment of academic achievements is carried out on the basis of measures of the level of competence development developed by teachers in various forms: test questions, assignments in test and oral form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations, etc.

The experts inspected the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, the AIS "Platonus", simulators, the portfolio of the resident doctor A.N. Abildinova.

Experts have determined that the choice of resident assessment methods is based on the final learning outcomes, since the practical part of training is the main one. For example, such methods of ongoing assessment as patient supervision contribute to inter-professional learning. And such a method as training a resident doctor directly in clinical departments at the patient's bedside demonstrates the integration of training and an emphasis on clinical skills. Established assessment methods ensure that the resident has mastered all sections of the educational program and acquired the necessary practical skills.

Feedback from residents based on the results of their assessment is collected in the form of a survey and questionnaire and published at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG7lY?usp=sharing>. In the interview, residents confirmed that they are provided with feedback after completing the training. At the same time, there are difficulties in studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria compliant out of 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -8, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To use assessment methods to determine the validity and reliability of control and measuring tools.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admission and selection policy

The educational organization has a policy for the admission of residents, which is called "Rules for admission to the residency of the MCH PAA RK" (Annex 1 to Order 820 dated October 27, 2023).

Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education." Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to residency programs are achieved through posting on the Hospital website <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/npr-license/postupayushchim/ekzamenatsionnye-voprosy/ekzamenatsionnye-voprosy.html> and inclusion of representatives of third-party healthcare organizations in the examination committee.

While conducting the entrance exam, members of the examination committee take into account the reason for the applicant's choice of EP, his interest in this specialty, active participation in student events, scientific conferences, and the presence of a certain amount of information on the chosen specialty.

In case of equal indicators of the entrance exam results, preferential right for admission is given to persons with medical experience. Further, scientific publications are taken into account, including in top-rated scientific journals; certificates of scientific developments; certificates of awarding scientific scholarships, grants; certificates/diplomas for participation in scientific conferences and competitions. The educational organization has created a barrier-free learning environment, including ramps; call buttons, elevators, and toilets for the disabled.

Approaches to the admission and transfer of residents from other educational organizations are reflected in paragraph 6 of the document "Academic Policy". At the same time, the leading points of achieving GPA while transferring from course to course and portfolio assessment are taken into

account.

The appeal procedure for the results of admission to residency is prescribed in the "Academic Policy" section 6, page 30. To date, there have been no precedents for appeal.

In 2023, the Hospital accredited EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" and for the first time received a state educational order in residency.

The revision of the admission and selection policy, the number of residents is carried out annually; the Department of Professional Education is responsible for this.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met, at the same time, some shortcomings were identified - this is the lack of participation of students in the development of the admission policy for residency in the specialty "Oncology (adult)". The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the "Rules for admission to the residency of the MCH PAA RK".

4.2 Number of residents

Currently, the Hospital is implementing EP 7R01105 "Oncology (adult)" under the state educational order - 1 resident.

The educational organization analysed the need of practical healthcare for specialists, so the staffing of the oncology service with medical personnel according to statistical data: in 2022, the number increased by 2.9%, from 482 to 496 people. The shortage of specialists remains almost everywhere and amounts to 106 people, excluding part-time workers, it amounts to 179 people (Comprehensive plan to combat oncological diseases in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023-2027, Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 05.10.2023 No. 874).

The Hospital departments participating in the implementation of the residency program submit a residency requirement for the upcoming academic year, taking into account the needs of the labour market, taking into account their educational resources, both material and technical, and teaching.

The need for resident doctors in the EP "Oncology (Adult)" was: for the 2022-2023 academic year - 1 resident doctor, for the 2023-2024 academic year - 2 resident doctors, for the 2024-2025 academic year - 4 resident doctors <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing> and determined that the annual admission to the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" will be 4 people. This indicator corresponds to resource capabilities.

4.3 Support and consulting of residents

The practice of academic counselling, personal support of residents and development of not only professional skills were assessed by experts through interviews with residents. The following information was obtained during interviews with residents and graduates: The EP "Oncology (Adult)" did not graduate resident doctors. Since 2021, 18 resident doctors of the EP "Radiology" have completed their residency training at the Hospital, who studied on a fee-paying basis. Of these, 9 are employed in the diagnostic departments of the Hospital. Regardless of the form of training, mentors work to assist in employment in the form of consulting, organizing meetings with employers, representatives of health departments of all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and jointly plan the further employment of their graduate. The Hospital is introducing the practice of including resident doctors in the working groups of the departments when developing or updating the EP, when approving the EP at meetings of the Academic Council. Currently, a resident doctor of the Hospital is included in the FOC (fatal outcomes commission). The resident physician of the Hospital is the secretary of the Quality Management Council of the Hospital. Representatives of resident physicians of all implemented EPs are included in the Academic Council of the Hospital with the right to vote.

Financial support for residents is provided through the issuance of a scholarship in the amount of 111,579 (one hundred eleven thousand five hundred seventy-nine) tenge.

In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions.

The Hospital encourages resident physicians by assisting in publication activity in the quarterly journal "Bulletin of the MCH PAA RK", in providing the opportunity to participate in national and international conferences, master classes and trainings.

4.4 Representation of residents

The following consultative and advisory bodies operate in the educational organization: the Academic Council, the Scientific and Clinical Council, in the work of which the Hospital plans to actively implement the practice of including resident doctors in the working groups of departments when developing or updating the EP, while approving the EP at meetings of the Academic Council. Currently, a resident doctor of the Hospital is included in the FOC (fatal outcomes commission). A resident doctor of the Hospital is the secretary of the Quality Management Council of the Hospital. Representatives of resident doctors of all implemented EPs are included in the Academic Council of the Hospital with the right to vote.

In the supervising departments, resident doctors are involved in working groups for the development and updating of the EP, and resident doctors are also included in working groups for writing a self-assessment report. Proposals on the educational process submitted by resident doctors in oral or written form are necessarily taken into account and taken into account. As an incentive for resident doctors, mentors apply for employment during the training period of the resident doctor in the supervising department.

Based on the results of the survey of resident doctors, the following proposals were made:

- * organization of additional seminars, lectures;
- * supervision of resident doctors in R&D;
- * rotation of resident doctors to external clinical bases;
- * acquisition of individual lockers for changing clothes for resident doctors;
- * acquisition of surgical suits and Academic staff;
- * acquisition of computers with Internet access for the classroom.

The Hospital has taken into account and implemented most of the proposals, which is shown by the work carried out by the Department to analyse the results of the survey of students.

4.5 Working conditions

Residents receive a monthly stipend in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116 "Rules for the appointment, payment and amounts of state stipends for students in educational organizations". Residents are given the opportunity to work outside of school hours, which is reflected in the document - "Residency Regulations". There are no such for residents of the EP "Oncology (Adult)". In total, the educational organization has 3 clinical bases for training residents under the accredited program, and various events are held at each, in which residents participate. For example, during the training, a resident doctor, under the guidance of a mentor, masters practical skills - patient supervision, filling out medical documentation in the "Infomed" electronic medical record, drawing up plans for examination and patient management, participation in clinical reviews and multidisciplinary groups, assisting in operations, calculating drug doses, dermatoscopy, interpreting IHC results, histology, participation in express biopsy, participation in topometric preparation, contouring, participation in intracavitary therapy, remote therapy, etc. As a rule, residents supervise 5-6 patients per day, and 20-25 people per month. They participate in health education work. The educational organization has implemented elements of distance learning for residents in emergency situations at the Hospital based on orders, letters, and requests from the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the Infection Control Service of the Hospital.

In special circumstances (e.g., including maternity/paternity leave, child care, illness, military service upon provision of supporting documents), an individual training program for residents is applied, which includes an individual training program based on the WC corresponding to the academic year, taking into account the difference in the curriculum. This is enshrined in the document - "Academic Policy", Section 6.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully - 18, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To consider the opinion of residents while developing an admission and selection policy.
- 2) To include representatives from among residents in the process of managing residency educational programs.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

The Hospital has implemented and is implementing the Human Resources Management Rules in accordance with the requirements of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and is based on the regulatory acts of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of personnel management. <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>. The responsibilities of clinical teachers and mentors of the Hospital are regulated by internal documents "Regulations on the Clinical Mentor", "Residency Regulations"

The Academic staff of the Hospital implementing EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" includes 8 specialists with certificates in the areas of training and the highest medical category, clinical work experience of at least 5 years - 100%, of which 75% (6 people) have an academic degree, including 50% (4 people) of Doctor of Medical Sciences, 12.5% (1 person), PhD - 12.5% (1 person).

The experts familiarized themselves with the job descriptions of the mentor and the residency regulations. Since teachers / mentors are practicing doctors of the Hospital departments, the evaluation of the professional activity of the employee is carried out in accordance with paragraph 4.22 Evaluation of the professional activity of the employee of Section 4 "Human Resources Management Rules".

The motivation system for teachers and clinical mentors includes the following: at the expense of the organization - systematic referral of employees for advanced training outside the organization in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad; timely payment of wages and payment of incentive bonuses for high-quality work is carried out in accordance with the internal document approved by the order of the Director of the Hospital dated 01.02.2023 No. 65 "Rules for remuneration, bonuses and the provision of financial assistance".

Incentives in the Hospital are based on the principles of legality, transparency, rewarding exclusively for special personal merits and achievements, stimulating the efficiency and quality of work, including state and corporate awards (announcement of gratitude, certificate of honour, nomination for titles, medals and badges of the MCH PAA RK, MC PAA RK, DPA RK and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

The principles of ethics and academic honesty of teachers are reflected in the document - the Code of Honour of the teacher / mentor. During the conversation with the teachers, they confirmed their awareness of this issue.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received the opinion of the teachers on the personnel policy, which includes the need to form job descriptions separately for the teacher. The conversation with Seidalin N.K. - the developer of the EP "Oncology (adult)", PhD, oncologist of the Hospital included such questions as "Financing for educational activities, about the teaching load when working with a resident?" allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (there are 8 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information support of the educational program, and also to identify problems in managing and developing human resources, since most part-time workers do not know the teaching methodology.

While questioning the teachers, it was found that the majority (75%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 20% are

partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 75% completely agree, 20% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 75% completely agree, 20% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 55% completely agree, 15% partially.

5.2 Commitments and development of teachers

In order to verify the data of standard 5, at a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. The experts determined that the organization does not have full-time positions for teachers / mentors.

Teachers and residents have enough time for teaching, mentoring and training. The work schedule of teachers and residents is set from 8.00 to 18.00. Teachers conduct seminars lasting 5-6 hours once a week. Time for clinical reviews, clinical rounds - 7-8 hours, on-call duty according to the schedule.

The experts received responses about the advanced training program for teachers, which are held annually, and 8 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained in the 2023-2024 academic year, including teachers of the accredited educational program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" - 4 people. These activities are financed by the educational organization. The expert checked the certificates of teachers on such topics as "Teaching technologies in the residency training program" (60 hours), "Teaching algorithms of practical skills using simulation technologies" (60 hours), etc.

The salary fund of teachers / mentors in the 2023-2024 academic year amounted to 442,888 tenge (September-March), civil-law contracts were concluded for the amount of 159,384 tenge. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation.

The educational organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 70% of surveyed teachers answered, and 15% partially agree with this. Studied in professional development programs - 70% less than 1 year ago, 20% for 1-5 years_0% over 5 years ago and 10% answered "I don't remember when it was".

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 20% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 0% "I have already used this", 10% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 60% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 7, partially -1, do not comply – 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To make additions to the job descriptions of the teacher, specify functions, tasks, responsibilities. To ensure that all teachers and newly hired teachers at the MCH PAA RK are familiar with and comply with the job descriptions.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical support and equipment

Resident training is carried out on the basis of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM (in the offices of the oncologist, oncologist mammologist of the consultative and diagnostic department; in the diagnostic departments of ultrasound, X-ray, CT, MRI, PET CT, SPECT; in the clinical diagnostic laboratory; in the department of functional diagnostics, in the department of pathological anatomy). There are a total of 212 beds. In the L block of the Hospital on the 6th floor, there are freely available classrooms for resident doctors for classroom training. The classrooms are equipped with modern computers, projectors, necessary furniture, and interactive whiteboards. Also, for the educational process, a large and small conference rooms with multimedia equipment, a conference room for seminars and magazine clubs, laboratories are provided.

The Hospital has signed a Memorandum with the JSC “Astana Medical University”, a Memorandum of Cooperation with the AEO “Nazarbayev University”, and an Agreement on Library and Information Services for 2024 with the JSC “Republican Scientific and Technical Library”. Resident doctors of the Hospital can visit university reading rooms at any time, use professional literature and electronic information resources. In 2024, the Hospital launched a pilot project to provide corporate access to ClinicalKey online resources. The Work Plan of the educational training centre has been approved, which includes a robotic surgery centre (dry and veterinary laboratory), a neurosurgical training class, an expert cryoablation centre, and a training class for emergency care courses (BLS, ACLS, PHTLS, PALS).

Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

6.2 Clinical bases

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM, the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana, with a total bed capacity of more than 500, were visited, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients (for example, in the discipline "Radiation diagnostics in oncology", "Radiation therapy" and "Clinical genetics in oncology"), modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, teachers provide high-quality education in compliance with ethics and deontology.

During a visit to the clinical bases of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM, the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana, the experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficiency of time for patient supervision, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need of it, participation in the "School of the Young Scientist", and the availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients, holding international events.

The training program for resident doctors includes training in a simulation class on emergency care (BLS course). The training is conducted according to international standards of the American Heart Association (AHA) (American Heart Association) by trained instructors of the Hospital who have instructor certificates from the AHA for emergency care courses BLS, ACLS, PHTLS, PALS.

Residents showed their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in R&D, financing. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of resident assessment checklists, and results of the resident survey).

6.3 Information technology

Experts evaluated the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources, including distance learning systems (Zoom, WebEx), GroupWise - Mail server, Novell IManager - Account server, Mail KKK - File Server (for file exchange), Messenger - Message server, KavServer - Server for antivirus, MIS - medical information system, PrintServer - print server (there are large printers that

are located in some departments), WSUS - server for updating the Windows system.

Residents confirmed that they can use the resources, including when preparing for classes.

Also, electronic correspondence with resident doctors in WhatsApp and Instagram chats is actively used. The necessary information about the Hospital's residency is freely available and on the official website of the Hospital in the Department section <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/science-and-education/otdel-nauki-i-professionalnogo-obrazovaniya/otdel-professionalnogo-obrazovaniya.html> in the Residency section <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/science-and-education/otdel-nauki-i-professionalnogo-obrazovaniya/npr-license/rezidentura.html>.

Resident physicians of the Hospital may visit university reading rooms at any time, use professional literature and electronic information resources: <https://elib.amu.kz/ru/elib/>, <https://elibrary.ru/defaultx.asp>, <https://booksmed.info/>, <https://kitap.kz/>, <http://www.medinfo.ru/>, <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/>

6.4 Clinical teams

Resident physicians participate in joint rounds with heads of departments, mentors, participate in discussions of patient treatment tactics at daily conferences, participate in consultations, assist in various surgical operations, under the guidance of clinical mentors, independently perform a wide range of various manipulations and procedures, and consult patients of other specialized departments. Resident doctors, performing daily medical work in the structural units of the hospital, polyclinic undergo practical training in the basics of medical ethics and deontology, being in constant contact with doctors, mid-level and junior medical staff of the clinic.

Inter-professional interaction is also carried out through participation in multidisciplinary groups during clinical analyses of cancer patients.

Residents can conduct health education activities among patients. For example, it depends on the specifics of care and provision of medical care.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 65.31% of teachers completely agree with this, 14% partially agree, 12.24% found it difficult to answer.

6.5 Medical scientific research and achievements

The educational organization carries out research work in the following areas: "Study of genetic markers of aggressive prostate cancer and breast cancer in individuals of the Kazakh population" (2018-2020); "National program for the development of personalized medicine in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2021-2023"; "Development of innovative technologies that improve the efficiency of diagnosis and treatment of background and precancerous diseases of the cervix associated with the human papillomavirus" (beginning in January 2023).

Over the past 2 years, the following have been held: Scientific and practical conference with international participation "Interdisciplinary issues of allergology and immunology" on February 23-24, 2023; Republican scientific and practical conference with international participation "Modern trends in aggressive cardiology" on March 30-31, 2023; Annual International Conference "Treatment of Cardiac Arrhythmias and Cardiac Electrophysiology for Cardiologists" October 13-14, 2023; International Forum "Modern Aspects of Prenatal Medicine" September 29-30, 2023; II National Congress of Respiratory Medicine "Respiratory Medicine of Kazakhstan: Evolution of Views and Solutions" with the support of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan November 9-10, 2023; Congress of Therapists of Kazakhstan "Quality and Safety of Drug Therapy: World Trends and Standards" November 16-17, 2023; II Scientific and Practical Conference with International Participation "Interdisciplinary Issues of Allergology and Immunology" February 15-16, 2024.

Since 2024, the Hospital has had a Council of Young Scientists (CYS), which is a voluntary society of young scientists of the Hospital, including residents, united on the basis of common scientific interests and actively engaged in R&D. If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

An interview with 3 mentors showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, teaching methods, and assessment of academic achievements.

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

The employees of the Department of Professional Education conduct annual monitoring of the quality of educational programs and the results are included in the annual report of the Department <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>.

Sociological surveys, including issues of education quality, could become one of the mechanisms for evaluating the quality of education. *However, the Hospital does not have a QMS department that ensures the quality of educational activities.*

The mechanisms for motivating and developing the interest of the Hospital employees in the educational process and research in the field of postgraduate education are rewards for participation in postgraduate education during the implementation of the residency program in the amount of 40% of the total funds received from the provision of paid educational services. This is documented in the "Rules for the provision of paid educational services and the procedure for using funds received from the provision of paid educational services in the MCH PAA RK" (order of the Director of the Hospital No. 207 dated 12.07.2022), the Academic staff is paid cash rewards for participation in scientific research and their results (publications, patents, copyright certificates, monographs, teaching aids, implementation certificates, etc.) (Order of the Director dated 01.12.2022 No. 462 "On the implementation of a system of motivation of specialists for the development of scientific and innovative activities") the introduction of new teaching methods points are awarded when calculating the rating of the Academic staff. Resources for clinical training are updated annually and in 2023 the residency program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" is provided with the following: The residency program is regularly reviewed and evaluated by receiving external reviews, passing an expert evaluation while registering the program in the Register of the Bologna Process Centre of the MSHE of the RK, receiving feedback from resident physicians, Academic staff and employers, as well as analysing the educational achievements of the resident physician.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The academic policy for training residents includes the possibility of training in alternative organizations if the existing clinical sites do not cover all the topics of the educational program. At the same time, the training of residents in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" is carried out on the basis of the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of Astana (Joint Activity Agreement No. 23/96 dated September 18, 2023), which has the departments "Department of Head and Neck Tumours", "Department of Chemotherapy", "Department of Therapy and Palliative Care" (including 10 hospice beds), "High-tech Centre for Radiation Oncology" with a total bed capacity of 547. Such disciplines of the educational program as "Oncology in a hospital", "Intensive care in oncology", "Oncorehabilitation", "Radiation Therapy", "Palliative Oncology", "Clinical Immunology in Oncology", "Isotope Methods of Diagnosis and Treatment in Oncology Practice", "Management of Toxicity Associated with immunotherapy". Preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the guidance of a teacher and does not require additional training bases. However, residents can participate in academic mobility within the country, for example, memorandums and agreements on cooperation with medical organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of postgraduate education in residency have been concluded: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing> and abroad, for example, there is an agreement with the Asan Medical Center (Republic of Korea) foreign clinical practice of 1st year resident doctors of EP 7R01106 " Otolaryngology for Adults, Children" Suleimenova N. and Rinatova K. is planned from May 7 to June 28, 2024. There is a document on the transfer and offsetting of learning outcomes between educational organizations: when a resident physician is transferred to the Hospital, a transfer committee is created, at a meeting of which the resident physician's application for transfer is considered; if an academic difference in disciplines/credits is detected, the Hospital's transfer committee determines the year (course) of study and assigns a transfer of learning outcomes. In case of a positive decision of the transfer committee meeting, the transfer is formalized by a corresponding order of the Hospital director. A 2nd-year resident physician of the Radiology program, D.K. Kudabayev, was transferred from Astana Medical

University to the Hospital's residency in the 2023-2024 academic year (enrolment order No. 587 dated August 18, 2023).

The academic policy of the Hospital regulates: the procedure for transferring to and from other educational organizations, from paid education to vacant educational grants, and the academic mobility policy.

As part of the rotation, resident doctors of EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" undergo practical training at the clinical sites of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP (agreement No. 23/97 dated September 18, 2023) and the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" (agreement No. 23/96 dated September 18, 2023) in accordance with joint activity agreements <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>.

As part of academic mobility, an agreement was concluded with NJSC "Astana Medical University" No. 19-D-338 dated 01/26/2024. In the 2023-2024 academic year, 5 resident physicians in the specialty "Cardiology for Adults, Children" were enrolled in the Hospital's residency as part of academic mobility by order of the director No. 184 dated 03/26/2024 for the period 03/26-06/25/2024 and 2 resident physicians in the specialty "Urology and Andrology for Adults, Children" for the period 03/26-05/10/2024. Currently, there was no academic mobility in the EP "Oncology (Adult)".

In the specialty of the educational program "Oncology (adult)", scientific and practical events are held on the topics of scientific projects "Development of an analysis methodology using biochip systems in the differential diagnosis of lymphoproliferative diseases", BR18574160 "Development of innovative technologies to improve the efficiency of diagnosis and treatment of background and precancerous diseases of the cervix associated with the human papillomavirus"; AP14871581 "Study of the species structure of intestinal microbiota in insulin resistance in the Kazakh population". Over a period of 5 years, 2 teachers were trained abroad Abildinova Gulshara Zhusupovna "Possibilities of individual selection of drugs for tumour diseases (targeted therapy) based on molecular genetics, molecular cytogenetic characteristics", Israel, Petah Tikva, Institute of Pathology, Beilinson Hospital. Medical Centre named after Rabina, 03.03-14.03.2019; Yelshibaeva Yelmira Serikkalievna "Qualification of equipment and validation of radiopharmaceutical production processes", Russia, Balashikha, PET centre, 18.11-22.11.2019.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 17, partially -1, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To initiate research on issues of educational expertise and publish the results for wide awareness of stakeholders, including country and international partners.

Standard 7: ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

7.1 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation

The mechanisms for implementing and monitoring the educational program include the following stages: Coordination of implementation is assigned to the specialists of the Department (educational and methodological documentation; planning the educational process; drawing up a class schedule; selection of academic staff in accordance with qualification requirements; monitoring and improving the development of teachers/mentors' competencies, organizing advanced training cycles; providing resident doctors with rotation in clinical bases for the period of certain discipline cycles; systematization of the educational process in the AIS "Platonus".

Monitoring the quality of the EP, WC, and CED is carried out by the Scientific and Clinical Council, the Academic Council.

Monitoring of academic performance and attendance is carried out by teachers/mentors, regulated by recording data in an electronic journal.

Monitoring of the implementation of the individual curriculum by a resident doctor is carried out at meetings of the supervising departments through discussions with the mentor and the resident doctor himself. Monitoring of mastering of educational material by a resident physician during the academic

period is carried out by a semi-annual certification at the end of the semester.

Monitoring of assessment of knowledge and practical skills is carried out by an independent assessment of the NCIE during the end-of-course assessment period.

Such multi-stage nature ensures transparency of the process and results. Annual analysis of the educational program will allow the educational organization to make adjustments, update and improve the content. Initially, the educational program was reviewed by employers: General Director of LLP "Hematology Center" PhD Pivovarova I.A. and Director of the Multidisciplinary Medical Center of the Astana Akimat PhD, highest category physician Tuletaev M.Ye. <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>. It is noted that the content of the EP is sufficient to achieve the declared competencies and can be recommended for use in the educational process. Subsequently, the residency program was approved at a meeting of the Scientific and Clinical Council (SCC) of the Hospital (minutes No. 2 dated June 2, 2022). The quality of the educational program is regularly evaluated by the Department of Professional Education by receiving feedback (survey, questionnaire). Reviews of the EP, minutes of meetings of the Academic staff of the EP "Oncology (Adult)" with the involvement of stakeholders, questionnaires of employers are attached <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ak0a0lc72GrSsNECG97f48U8Lr-RG71Y?usp=sharing>

While evaluating the program, the goals and objectives of training, the final learning outcomes (through assessment of residents, independent examination) are taken into account. The process of implementing the educational program is evaluated through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. For example, a survey of residents of the 2023-2024 academic year of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM demonstrated the following: 59.26% of respondents are satisfied with the learning outcomes; 31.48% are partially satisfied; 38.89% for the excellent quality of the educational process; 33.33% for the good; 74.07% noted the high level of training at clinical sites; if problems arise, 68.52% of residents contact their mentor.

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents. *For example, the results of a survey of 54 residents in the 2023-2024 academic year showed that 79.63% are satisfied with their relationships with teachers/mentors.*

An analysis of the methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of residents is carried out using the "Platonus" AIS and demonstrates satisfaction with the learning process. The assessment of the adequacy and quality of educational resources is carried out by the staff of the professional education department and shows that residents want to master more practical skills, use their own library, study in classrooms with computers, and be sent for rotation to other clinical sites. The department and clinical departments took their wishes into account. Classrooms were allocated, rotation is carried out, an application for the purchase of literature was formed (the departments have their own literature).

In the process of evaluating the quality of residency educational programs, it was found that along with achievements (the educational program is brought into line with modern requirements, recommendations, requests, wishes of students, teachers/mentors), there are a number of problems and shortcomings, including the active participation of external stakeholders, especially representatives of practical health care, professional associations.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Feedback from teachers, residents, and employers is regularly collected in the educational organization. Questionnaires are sent to residents twice a year (at the end of the first half of the year and at the end of the second half of the year) and to employers once. The questionnaire contains 17 questions and they are devoted to the quality of the educational process. The results of the employer survey conducted in 2022 and 2023 made it possible to update the catalogue of elective disciplines.

By analysing the survey results, adjustments are made to the educational process: disciplines, syllabuses, teaching and assessment methods are updated, a list of clinical rotation bases for resident doctors is compiled).

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. The hospital has graduation program OP 7R01101 "Radiology" (2021, 2022, 2023). The results of the final certification (FC) are presented in the reports of the chairmen of the Final Certification Commission and are heard at a meeting of the Hospital's NCC. Analysis of the FC results: 2021: excellent - 1 (33%), good - 2 (67%); 2022: excellent - 7 (100%); 2023: excellent - 1 (13%), good - 7 (87%). There were no graduates of residents in the "Oncology (Adult)" program.

Monitoring of graduates of the residency program is carried out through surveys of employers. *Employers are quite satisfied with the quality of both theoretical and practical training of graduates of the Hospital.*

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the Department of Professional Training, the results of the evaluation of the clinical practice of residents and graduates are immediately sent to the responsible persons. The developers and mentors are responsible for the residency programs. In order to improve the educational process in the last 2-3 years, the following has been done: syllabuses have been updated, the list of clinical sites has been expanded, and an application for the purchase of educational literature has been made.

7.4 Stakeholder Involvement

The educational organization has approaches to involving mentors/teachers and residents in the evaluation of the educational program and monitoring its implementation. Thus, mentors are included in the advisory body "Scientific and Clinical Council" and participate in the discussion of all issues of the educational process.

Interviews with 4 employers were conducted in the mode (offline or online) and included such questions as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approving educational programs

The Academic Policy of the Hospital defines the procedure for the development and approval of the residency program, which provides for the stages of planning, approval, and implementation.

Guided by the Procedure for the Development of Educational Programs of the Academic Policy of the Hospital, the development of the EP was carried out by a working group, which included potential teachers/mentors, oncologists of the Hospital and external stakeholders - representatives of practical healthcare. The developed EP was provided to practical healthcare specialists/potential employers for review (feedback).

After receiving the reviews, the EP was submitted for consideration and approval by the meeting of the SCC of the Hospital. Members of the SCC review the residency EP for compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, review the CED according to the specialist training trajectories taking into account the pre- and post-requisites, evaluate the choice of methods for assessing the key competencies of residents, consider the capabilities, resources of the department to implement the program, compliance with the qualification requirements.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 9, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To involve stakeholders in the evaluation of the educational program of residency in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" through peer review, feedback, participation in the assessment of residents, feedback on graduates, discussion of the structure and content of the educational program at round tables, etc. For this purpose, to develop a regulatory document and questionnaires.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

Training in residency is carried out in accordance with the state license for the right to educational activities in residency No. KZ87LAA00017356 dated November 08, 2019. Assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out on the basis of internal regulatory documents governing the process of implementing the residency program (Residency Regulations, Academic Policy);

The management system of EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" is implemented on the basis of the Hospital Charter, structure, Regulations on departments and job descriptions. The deputy director for strategic development, science and education is responsible for the strategy for the development of postgraduate education.

To implement the educational program, the educational organization has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by the department of professional education. The experts familiarized themselves with the documents on the completion of training of residents, so upon completion of training EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" and having received positive results of the end-of-course assessment, graduates are issued a Certificate of Completion of Residency, which subsequently allows them to obtain a certificate of a specialist in the field of healthcare.

8.2 Academic Leadership

The responsibilities and duties of the management and staff for postgraduate medical education are defined and assigned to the Department of Professional Education of the Hospital and are set out in the document "Regulations on the Department of Professional Education". The Department reports to the Director of the Hospital, Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education. The Department carries out its activities in cooperation with other structural divisions of the Hospital.

Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured by the minutes of the meetings of the Scientific and Clinical and Academic Councils with subsequent dissemination to all employees of the Hospital.

The mission of the Department is to implement educational programs of additional and non-formal education and residency programs in the field of healthcare, continuous professional development of employees of the structural divisions of the Hospital in order to improve professional training, knowledge and interpersonal skills. The main goal of the Department is to ensure the development of educational activities on the basis of the Hospital and continuous professional development of the Hospital employees.

The structure and staffing schedule of the Department is approved by the Director of the Hospital.

To the question in the survey "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work?", 45% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 25% answered "sometimes", 0% "rarely", and 30% "never".

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The department responsible for planning and distributing finances in residency programs is the financial and economic block. The immediate management is carried out by the Deputy Director for Finance and Digitalization and the Deputy Director for Administrative and Economic Affairs of the Hospital.

Target indicators, direct result indicators, activities to achieve results and ensure quality are detailed in the Hospital's strategic development plan for 2022-2026.

Financial expenses for training in EP 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" amounted to 8,966,324 tenge for the period 2022-2023, and 5,702,272 tenge in 2023-2024. Most of the funds are spent on the purchase of the Platonus AIS - 4,000,000 tenge and computers - 3,662,400 tenge. During a meeting with employees of the financial sector, experts found out that the salary fund is 602,272 tenge.

Monitoring and analysis of the implementation of the main performance indicators of the entire Hospital or its main divisions are carried out quarterly, which are compared with their planned level. Risks and opportunities for efficient use of resources are assessed, based on the monitoring; an annual

update of the Development Strategy is carried out, agreed with the MC of the PAA RK and approved by the Director of the Hospital.

8.4 Administration and management

The Quality Management and Patient Safety Service carries out activities to manage the quality of medical care for patients. The use of a quality management system is a strategic decision for the Hospital, which helps to improve the results of its activities and provides a solid foundation for sustainable development. The Department has developed and approved the Regulation on the internal system for assessing the quality of education of additional and non-formal education programs and residency implemented in the Hospital.

The experts found that there is no quality management system (QMS) for educational activities. Teachers are aware of the absence of a QMS of education, which is confirmed during their interviews.

Evaluation of the effectiveness of the Strategic Plan is carried out on the basis of monitoring the main indicators of quality and deadlines for the implementation of planned activities, monitoring the effectiveness of processes, internal and external audit of the quality management system.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training personnel with higher and postgraduate education; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), in the educational organization at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year. All educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers/mentors.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 10, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To introduce quality management into educational activities in postgraduate and additional education to systematize documentation, accounting, archiving and, in general, maintain effective recordkeeping.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

An important condition for continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process is the evaluation of the quality of learning outcomes/competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, and the learning environment of the program. The professional competencies of a residency graduate are formed in accordance with the requirements for the qualification of a physician. The competence of a residency graduate includes not only professional skills, but also training in public health issues and participation in the process of providing medical care to patients. Achieving professional competencies is modified in the Hospital by practicing skills and abilities, passing an exam at the end of each specialized discipline

The process of updating and restructuring the Hospital leads to a revision of its policies and practices in accordance with previous experience, current activities and prospects by involving a wide range of stakeholders, further development and improvement, as well as through the active development of educational, scientific and research activities.

As a result of updating and adjusting the current activities of the Department, internal regulatory documents are also updated in order to meet the needs of society, the economy, the labour market; improving the results of educational activities and feedback from stakeholders; annual adjustment of the content of the EP; introduction of new cycles of advanced training for the academic staff.

In the process of updating, the Department plans to annually update the list of residency specialties implemented in the Hospital.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliance out of 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 improvement standard): fully -2.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To ensure regular external and internal evaluation of the implementation of the “Oncology (Adult)” program by developing appropriate regulations (for internal evaluation) and initiating feedback from international partners and a professional association.

CONCLUSION: during the external evaluation of the educational program, it was established that out of 114 standards (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 104 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 80 basic standards and 24 improvement standards. 2 basic standards and 8 improvement standards are partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with standards was found.

Considering that the primary accreditation of the educational program in the specialty "Oncology (adult)" is being carried out and the admission of residents began in 2022, in compliance with the requirements of the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the educational organization initiated specialized (program) accreditation without a contingent of residents. Therefore, the tasks of the external expert commission included evaluating the readiness of the MCH PAA RK to accept residents, studying the existing principles and approaches to the training of residents, mechanisms for ensuring the quality and management of the educational program of residency using the example of other educational programs. Nevertheless, the EEC specifically studied the organization of training in the specialty "Oncology (adult)", including documentation, Academic staff, educational resources and other important issues related to compliance with accreditation.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01105 "Oncology (Adult)" of the RSE "The Medical Center Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM:

- 1) To apply innovative methods in the process of training residents "Oncology (Adult)" taking into account the requirements of modern science and practice, the results of feedback with stakeholders (residents, students, employers, partners) (1.3).
- 2) To expand the list of interactive teaching methods taking into account the practice-oriented training of residents for the development and improvement of the skills of a practitioner, researcher, manager, communicator (2.4).
- 3) To use assessment methods to determine the validity and reliability of control and measuring tools (3.1).
- 4) To take into account the opinion of residents while developing the admission and selection policy (4.1).
- 5) To include representatives from among residents in the process of managing residency educational programs (4.4).
- 6) To amend the job descriptions of the teacher, specify the functions, tasks, responsibilities. To ensure that all teachers and newly hired staff members of the MCH PAA RK are familiar with and comply with the job descriptions (5.1).
- 7) To initiate research on education evaluation issues and publish the results for broad awareness of stakeholders, including country and international partners (6.6).
- 8) To involve stakeholders in the evaluation of the educational program of residency in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" through peer review, feedback, participation in the assessment of residents, feedback on graduates, discussion of the structure and content of the educational program at round tables, etc. For this purpose, to develop a regulatory document and questionnaires (7.4).

- 9) To introduce quality management into educational activities in postgraduate and additional education to systematize documentation, accounting, archiving and, in general, maintain effective recordkeeping (8.4).
- 10) To ensure regular external and internal evaluation of the implementation of the "Oncology (Adult)" program by developing relevant regulations (for internal evaluation) and initiating feedback from international partners and the professional association (9.2).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members established the compliance of the educational program of the residency in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	
International Expert (online)	Uryasev Oleg Mikhailovich	
Academic Expert	Kasnova Saule Laikovna	
Academic Expert	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	
Academic Expert	Smailova Altynay Nagyzkhanovna	
Academic Expert	Salimbaeva Damilya Nurgazievna	
Employer Expert	Zhukubaeva Almira Asetkyzy	
Student Expert	Nurgaliev Arslan Ardakovich	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)

Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС*/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	9/5	9/4	1	
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	22	19/3	19/2	1	
3.	ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ	9	6/3	5/3	1	
4.	РЕЗИДЕНТЫ	20	14/6	13/5	1/1	
5.	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ	8	7/1	6/1	1	
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	18	11/7	11/6	1	
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	10	7/3	6/2	1/1	
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	11	8/3	8/2	1	
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	2	1/1	1/1		
	Итого	114	82/32	104	10	
				114		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов/дата утверждения	Количество
1.	Академическая политика Больницы от 31.03.2021	1
2.	Портфолио резидента 7R01105 «Онкология (взрослая)» Абильдиновой Амины Нахымкызы	1
3.	«Положение о резидентуре БМЦ УДП РК»	1
4.	СОП «Алгоритм организации послевузовского образования в резидентуре на базе БМЦ УДП РК»	1
5.	Кодекс чести преподавателя/ наставника	1
6.	Кодексе чести врача-резидента Больницы	1
7.	Положение о клиническом наставнике	1
8.	Образовательная программа резидентуры 7R01105 «Онкология (взрослая)»	1
9.	Правила приема в резидентуру РГП «Больница медицинского центра Управления делами Президента РК» на ПХВ	1
10.	Лицензия на образовательную деятельность	1
11.	Рецензии на ОП «Онкология (взрослая)»	2
12.	Структура Больницы	1