

To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian
Centre for Accreditation and Quality
Assurance in Education and Healthcare
July 27, 2023.

**REPORT
OF AN EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
7R01102 “ADULT AND PEDIATRIC RHEUMATOLOGY” JSC “RESEARCH
INSTITUTE OF CARDIOLOGY AND INTERNAL DISEASES” FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTY) OF
MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: June 29-30, 2023

Almaty, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty – 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology”	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology” for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	5
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	6
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational program 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology”	7
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology”	32
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	33
	Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology”	34
	Appendix 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert assessment	35

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
JSC	Joint-Stock Company
SEC	State Examination Commission
State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan	State compulsory education standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
State guaranteed volume of medical care	Guaranteed volume of free medical care
JD	Job description
DPAE	Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
IS	Information Security
FSC	Final state certification
RW	Research work
IEP	Individual education plan
CB	Clinical base
KazNMU	Kazakh National Medical University
CTA	Comprehensive testing of applicants
CIS	Instrumentation assets
CDC	Consultative and diagnostic center
CEP	Committee for Educational Programs
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
KInEH	Kazakhstan information encyclopedic dictionary
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTE	Material and technical equipment
RI	Research Institute
JSC RIC&ID	Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Disease
RW	Research work
RRW	Resident's research work
STP	Scientific and technical program
NGO	NGO
EP	Educational program
EC	Educational services
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
MSHI	Mandatory social health insurance
TRE	Tolerance Rating Evaluation
RSU	Regulations on the structural unit
PBL	Problem-Based Learning
TS	Teaching staff
Ps	Position
MD	Major disciplines
AT	Advanced training
WC	Working curriculum
RAC	Republican Allergy Center

CBL	Case-based-learning
mass media	Mass media
QMS	Quality Management System
IWR	Independent work of a resident
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the guidance of a teacher
TTA	Technical training aids
TC	Typical curriculum
TBL	Team-based-learning (team training)
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
HRMLS	Human resource management and legal support
AC	Academic Council

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare (hereinafter referred to as ECAQA) Order No. 16 dated June 15, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment of the educational program during the period from June 29 to July 1, 2023 residency "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with courses in Allergology, Hematology and Endocrinology of NJSC "Astana Medical University", Vice-President of the Association of Immunologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Chief Children's Allergist-Immunologist of the Astana University Hospital
2	Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of CardioRheumatology of the Institution "National Center for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
3	Academic expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Childhood Diseases with Neonatology of the NAO West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after. M. Ospanova"
4	Academic expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Higher School of Medicine of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Leading Researcher at JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Almaty
5	Employers' representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Director for the Medical Department of the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital of the State Public Enterprise at the RPV "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"

6	Residents' representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhegaliuly	Resident 2 years of study in the specialty "General Surgery" NAO "
---	---------------------------	--------------------------------	--

The observer from ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulations of EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational program 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult And Pediatric Rheumatology”

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Joint Stock Company (JSC) "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine" (JSC RIC&ID)
Management body	Joint-Stock Company
Full name of the first manager	Head of medical educational organization, Chairman of the Board, Ph.D. Pashimov Marat Orunbasarovich
Created in	In 2001, it was transformed into the Research Institute (Research Institute) of Cardiology and Internal Diseases. In 2010, he received the status of a RSE at the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In 2018 received the status of “Research”
Location and contact details	050000, Almaty, st. Aiteke bi 120 Tel: +7 727-233-00-61 Official website: https://ncvb.kz/kz/ E-mail: ncvb-dir@yandex.kz
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	In August 2021 JSC RIC&ID has been accredited by JCI, which is the most prestigious and objective recognition of the quality and safety of services in a medical organization. In October 2021 JSC "RIC&ID " passed National accreditation in the field of healthcare and received the Highest category. A Certificate of the Kazakhstan Book of Records (KINEH) was issued, dedicated to the 30th anniversary of Independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan. December 25, 2021 JSC “RIC&ID” received a certificate of international accreditation of educational programs: 6R112600 – “Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children’s”, 6R110300 – “Cardiology, including children’s”, 6R110900 – “Endocrinology, including children’s”.
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	none
Year of implementation of the accredited educational program (EP)	2023
Duration of training	2 years

Full-time teachers/part-time teachers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % sedate	The total number of teachers is 8, including full-time teachers - 3 part-time teachers - 5. Sedateness,% - 33% Categorization, % -33%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://ncvb.kz/ https://www.instagram.com/nii_cardiology/ https://www.facebook.com/ncvbmzrk/

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, accreditation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the educational residency program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 140 pages of main text, 10 pages of appendices, electronic versions of documents located at the link to the website: <https://ncvb.kz/kz/>

The report is characterized by responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the “Guidelines for self-assessment of the ECAQA residency educational program” provided by the JSC RIC&ID accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Chairman of the Board M.O. Pashimov, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 5 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibilities of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational program:

1. Gulmira Bolatovna Abdugarimova, Ph.D., Head of Quality Management Service and risk management.
2. Shukanov Arunur Saparbaevich - lawyer.
3. Orekhova Elena Farkhatovna - Director of Nursing.
4. Rizvanova Lyazzat - Resident Cardiologist.
5. Ishakbaeva Guzel Parkhatovna - head of the clinical diagnostic centre

Self-assessment of the educational program in the residency specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” was carried out on the basis of order No. 92 dated 04/11/2023 “On conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases”” and No. 96 dated 04/11/2023 "On the creation of a working group on organizing and conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases" and order No. 132P 05/11/2023 "On approval of the internal accreditation commission."

The report was analyzed by accreditation experts (see paragraph 1 of this report).

All standards contain the actual practice of RIC&ID in training residents, as well as planning for the new educational program on the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”, taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023. The developers of the self-assessment report presented reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of educational residency programs (so that later extrapolate this to a new educational program), national and international events, methodological support confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation

standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of teachers, administration, information about the planned selection and admission of residents, how the results of training are analyzed, and the results of assessing knowledge and skills are documented. The material and technical base of JSC RIC&ID is described, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations), financial information, plans for the development and improvement of JSC RIC&ID are presented.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a complete form, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external peer review

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational residency program was organized in accordance with the “Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA” (approved by the ECAQA Expert Council, Protocol No. 1 of May 22, 2023) and in accordance with the program approved by Order No. 16 06/15/2023 General Director of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairman of the Board of JSC RIC&ID M.O. Pashimov. Dates of the visit to the organization: June 30 – July 1, 2023.

External assessment is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external peer review.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 8 people;
- interviews with residents (other specialties) - 10 people;
- study the website: <https://ncvb.kz/>
- interviewing 23 employees, 7 teachers, 3 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents - 7 and 10, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending 3 practical classes in clinical departments (therapy No. 1 and No. 2, department of functional diagnostics, emergency department).
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: visited the 20-bed children's department of the Scientific Center for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery (part-time teachers);
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 53 units. both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Appendix 2**).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

№	Job title	Quantity
1	Management of JSC RIC&ID - Chairman of the Board, deputies for scientific, clinical and innovative work; strategic, financial and economic issues, head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work	4

2	Head of the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education	1
3	Resident teachers	4
4	Employees of supporting services – HR department	1
5	Residency graduates	3
6	Residents	10
7	Employers of residency graduates	3

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external assessment. A final discussion was held on the results of the external assessment of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program in the specialty “adult and pediatric rheumatology” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by members of the EEC; recommendations were given to increase the level of teaching staff. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed by the chairman M.A. Morenko. A final open vote was held on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the research institute and the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

When conducting a survey of residents, 100% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive. The majority of respondents (100%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs. According to 100% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”

Standard 1: MISSION AND RESULTS

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement

Experts have found that JSC RIC&ID has developed a mission for the organization itself, where Teachers (7), residents (10), administration representatives know the mission and strategic goals, which are posted on the website <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/missiya> and information stands. The mission contains the basis for education “training highly qualified specialists based on modern educational programs.” One of the strategic goals is an educational goal, namely, “Goal 3: *Training of highly qualified specialists.*» JSC RIC&ID outlined its tasks in the field of postgraduate education as “the development and implementation of modern educational programs that meet the needs and requirements of modern healthcare,” ensuring access to high-quality education and professional development opportunities for residents; promoting active and continuous learning of medical specialists, including advanced training and participation in research activities.”

The mission and vision of JSC RIC&ID are brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations. Experts are familiar with the strategic plan for the period 2022-2026, in which one of the areas are educational activities, along with such strategic areas as informatization and development of telecommunications,

international activities, educational work with the student population, personnel policy and development of the social sphere.

At the same time, the mission of the educational program “Residency for adults, children” is understood by teachers and staff of DPAAE as the purpose and objectives of training.

When residents were surveyed, they responded that they were not involved in developing mission proposals for educational programs. The teachers claimed that they took part in the development of the mission and strategic plan of JSC RIC&ID (for 2017-2-21 and for the period 2022-2026), since the professors of the department (3) are members of the Academic Council, where strategic plans were discussed and approved documentation.

The patient-oriented training of residents is ensured by the presence of its own clinical base and the active involvement of residents in the clinical process, free access to patients and equipment. The Department of Therapy with a course in Rheumatology has determined the goals of its activities to provide a high level of education, development of professional skills, and ethical behavior. All this information is available on the website <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/o-dpdo>, however, the text posted in this section contains many grammatical errors that require correction.

The implemented 5-component model of resident competencies includes the “legal competence” component. Development of this competency ensures residents know, understand, and apply the fundamentals of patient safety and autonomy. https://ncvb.kz/images/ИСМ_компетентностная_модель_выпускника_резид.pdf

The State General Educational Standard (GOSO) for levels of education in the field of healthcare (No. 28716 MoH RK - 63 dated July 5, 2022) also includes the competencies of residency graduates who are formed at JSC RIC&ID.

Upon completion of training in the educational program, the resident is proficient in therapeutic, diagnostic, organizational, managerial, and research activities and is allowed to engage in independent practice as a specialist doctor.

A survey of residents showed that all 10 people were satisfied with the organization of training, the microclimate at JSC RIC&ID, access to patients and equipment, the opportunity to supervise patients and provide medical care in a highly specialized clinic (level 4).

Before starting training, residents undergo a medical examination and receive a health certificate with permission to perform clinical work. JSC RIC&ID has a full-time psychologist who provides psychological support to teachers, staff and residents. To conduct seminars, JSC RIC&ID has training rooms on the 5th floor of JSC RIC&ID, and in clinical departments, residents can work with medical documentation directly in the resident rooms and have access to computers.

Innovative techniques are constantly being introduced into the educational process so that the resident is interested in learning and absorbing more new and useful information. As a rule, new methods and approaches to teaching are introduced by teachers after participating in international seminars and conferences. During the meeting, residents said that JSC RIC&ID conducts reviews of interesting clinical cases, residents participate in clinical rounds and consultations, and conduct consultations on telemedicine under the supervision of a clinical mentor. Residents expressed a wish to organize training with trips to the regions.

Residents fill out an individual curriculum, which includes an obligation to participate in scientific activities and research, and publish scientific and practical publications. During meetings with the administration, teachers, doctors and residents, experts identified a number of problems: low publication activity of residents, including in the specialized scientific and practical medical journal JSC RIC&ID, which has not been published regularly in recent years.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

JSC RIC&ID demonstrates autonomy in decision-making in key areas such as educational program development, assessment, selection and admission of residents, faculty choice/selection, terms of employment, and resource allocation.

Experts analyzed the training system for residency graduates in various specialties (there has been no recruitment of residents in rheumatology yet), which meets international standards. However,

the experts were not able to see the planned training in pediatric rheumatology, since they visited the clinical base - therapy department No. 2 of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital.

The formation and development of professionalism among residents is guaranteed by a 5-component model of resident competencies.

JSC RIC&ID supports and develops the academic freedom of residents, which is expressed through motivation to publish, speak at conferences, and participate in various educational events. Academic freedom is documented in the Academic Policy. In addition, residents conduct research work, which is part of the educational process of the JSC RIC&ID residency program. At the same time, residents have the right to independently choose the topic of scientific research and the head of the research project. The topic, the resident's supervisor and the calendar plan for carrying out the research work are agreed upon and approved in the DPAA.

Residents participate in the formation of an individual curriculum together with a clinical mentor, which gives the resident the right to choose an individual learning path. Also, residents are given the freedom to choose disciplines included in the catalog of elective disciplines (2nd year of study, 4 credits, see paragraph 2.3 of this report).

Feedback from residents is carried out through a questionnaire, where they can write their suggestions, wishes on educational, organizational and other issues.

During a meeting with the Chairman of the Board of JSC RIC&ID M.O. Pashimov the following questions were asked: What is the human resources potential of the Institute? Percentage of teaching staff graduation? What are the prospects for improving the model of medical specialized education? During the answers, Pashimov M.O. confirmed that JSC RIC&ID is the flagship of cardiological, cardiac surgery and therapeutic services in Kazakhstan, where highly qualified, specialized (SMC), high-tech (HTMC), inpatient replacement (IMC) and outpatient medical care (OMC) is provided to patients with severe and difficult-to-diagnose diseases from all regions of the Republic. The implementation of the main objectives contributes to the development of clinical practice in accordance with international standards of quality and patient safety, meeting the needs of the population.

The activities of employees are based on a trusting relationship between the patient and the doctor, constant professional growth, openness to new technologies, respect and mutual support, and treatment of the assets of JSC RIC&ID as their own.

During an oral interview with 10 residents, a number of questions were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It has been established that 100% of residents will recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances and friends. To the question "Do you think that JSC RIC&ID allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 100% of residents answered positively.

The teachers surveyed also responded that they were all satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace, and the healthy microclimate at JSC RIC&ID. Teachers believe that they have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals. Experts determined that JSC RIC&ID has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final results of the implementation of the residency educational program in the specialty "Rheumatology for adults and children" are defined in the State Educational Standard 2022 and the qualification characteristics.

The surveyed teachers responded that they were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 7 continuing education programs in rheumatology. Residents are informed about this. The faculty respondents surveyed believe that residents have a sufficient level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

Since 2016, JSC RIC&ID has developed and applied a procedure for the development and adoption of legal acts and their management.

At the same time, when talking with residents and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question “Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?” In this regard, it is recommended to ensure the involvement of a broad representation of stakeholders in the development and discussion of the mission of JSC RIC&ID.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully -12, partially -2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 1: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Update the mission of the educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” with the participation of residents and employers, document this process and bring information about the mission to the attention of interested parties.
- 2) Provide conditions and support for resident publications in order to develop skills in analysis, synthesis and preparation of articles and abstracts.
- 3) Correct the text on the JSC RIC&ID website in the “Education” section and add the information necessary for interested parties.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

Proof of compliance:

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” was developed on the basis of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569 “On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education” <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017565>

When training residents of all specialties, a 5-component competency model is used (knowledge, practical skills, communication and legal skills, self-improvement).

The purpose and objectives of training residents are reflected in the State Educational Standard for 2022, TC - 2022, the qualification characteristics of a residency graduate in the specialty: “Rheumatology for adults, children,” the educational program (developed in 2022) and educational and methodological complexes of disciplines (EMCD). Educational activities are carried out using credit technology in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 “On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process using credit technology of education.”

Visiting the therapy department No. 2, the experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, they receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills in examining and treating rheumatological patients. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, as experts have studied the Code of Ethics of JSC RIC&ID (posted on the website <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/eticheskij-kodeks>). Residents are well aware of it. Resident curators (in the 1st year) and mentors (in the 2nd year) carry out systematic work on the observance of ethics and demonology by residents. The Syllabus for each discipline describes the Policy of the Department of Therapy with the course of rheumatology.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

Upon completion of a 2-year residency (level 7 of the national qualification framework), a

graduate of JSC RIC&ID is awarded the qualification of an adult or pediatric rheumatologist. **(ESG G 1.2)**. The resident's competencies and the list of practical skills are included in the State Educational Standard 2022, the qualification characteristics (2013) and correspond to the Graduate Professional Competence Model described in the Professional Standard for the provision of specialized rheumatological care (Order No. 45 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 28, 2023).

Experts assessed the practice-oriented approach to training residents at JSC RIC&ID (using the example of training anesthesiologists and resuscitators and cardiology residents). For practical training of resuscitation residents, JSC RIC&ID has a department of therapy, a department of cardiorheumatology at the 2nd City Children's Clinical Hospital in Almaty, and a department of cardiology at the Scientific Centre of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery. In addition to the specialized bed capacity, residents will have the opportunity to examine patients in other clinical departments of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital (therapy No. 1, cardiology, resuscitation and intensive care, etc.), participate in interdisciplinary consultations, conduct differential diagnostics and improve their clinical thinking, participate in clinical discussions, clinical rounds of professors and associate professors, improve diagnostic search skills.

Faculty in the Department of Internal Medicine with a course in rheumatology use a variety of teaching methods, including seminars, oral presentations, video conferencing, interactive teaching methods (case studies), problem-based learning (PBL), case-based learning (CBL), etc.

The experts got acquainted with the developments (introductions into the educational process) made by the teachers of the department on such topics as "Articular syndrome in the practice of a general practitioner", "Osteoporosis. Joint dysfunction", "Respiratory organ damage in systemic diseases", etc. Currently, teaching methods with PBL elements in the discipline "Outpatient Rheumatology" on the topic "Systemic lupus erythematosus" have been prepared for implementation. Algorithm for rational differential diagnosis, management tactics and dynamic monitoring of patients." A development with elements of team-based learning (TBL) on the topic "Seronegative spondyloarthritis: ankylosing spondylitis" has been prepared. The department hosts the "School of Osteoporosis," which can become a good practical platform for residents.

The simulation center of JSC RIC&ID uses modern methods of training and control: imitation of the professional activities of a doctor, mutual training, role-playing clinical situations using full-size interactive mannequins, practicing communication skills on standardized patients, teaching using modern diagnostic and production equipment, as well as using virtual computer games, visualization of video material with analysis of errors.

Collaborating with KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarova, teachers of the Department of Therapy with a course in rheumatology learned interactive teaching methods at the "School of Pedagogical Excellence named after Kh.S. Nasybullina".

In this way, teaching and learning methods are consistent with the content and outcome of training, promote active learning and personal participation of residents in the provision of medical care, develop the ability to take responsibility for their learning process and identify their needs, and promote lifelong learning among students.

At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, JSC RIC&ID does not have an anti-plagiarism system.

Experts trace student-centeredness in learning and residents' understanding of their role and responsibility for learning. In interviews with residents (10), experts determined that residents strive to acquire practical skills at a high level and understand that a 2-year training period is not sufficient to obtain better skills and confidence in independence **(ESG G 1.2)**. But they work on themselves and read a lot of professional literature, participate in all extracurricular events of the department (conferences). The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the syllabus. JSC RIC&ID, in turn, provides residents with educational and methodological materials, additional literature, links to international databases of professional and scientific literature

in the specialty (Cochrane database, PUBMED, MEDLINE), ensure close contact with patients, participation in clinical and scientific events of JSC RIC&ID.

The mentoring system is described in the educational program and the Academic Policy. There are a total of 5 mentors at clinical training sites. Mentors provide appropriate support in the professional and personal formation and development of the resident, share experience, knowledge and support residents.

In the first year of training, residents study clinical cases on an outpatient basis, supervise patients and carry out medical manipulations under the supervision of a teacher (supervisor) with regular assessment and feedback of their knowledge and skills, recorded in a journal, and can receive comments and advice on problematic issues.

JSC RIC&ID adheres to the principles of equality, recognizes the gender, cultural and religious characteristics of both students and patients, and also prepares residents for appropriate relationships with patients. JSC RIC&ID complies with the legislation of Kazakhstan in this area. The majority of JSC RIC&ID teachers are women; residents are accepted for training without taking into account their gender, but on the basis of previous performance and achievements. Training is conducted in Russian and Kazakh; the resident always speaks the “patient’s language.”

2.2 Scientific method

JSC RIC&ID applies the approach of “the trinity of education, practice and science”, as well as the principle of “learning through research”. To improve scientific and clinical activities and exchange experience, JSC RIC&ID teachers participate in scientific and practical conferences and congresses at the republican and international level.

Achievements of medical science (including rheumatology) are being introduced into healthcare practice and the educational process. JSC RIC&ID also attracts residents to participate in scientific projects (not always formalizing such participation), where they master the skills of scientific research, analytical thinking and statistical processing.

During extracurricular time, students assist teachers and practical healthcare doctors in statistical analysis of the activities of clinical base units, analysis and analysis of difficult clinical cases, and in the preparation of publications.

Teachers of the department, together with residents, regularly conduct trainings and seminars on the implementation of clinical protocols and modern scientific achievements based on evidence-based medicine. The educational program 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments.

Considering that the current problems of rheumatology are: tactics of managing patients with rheumatoid arthritis and seronegative spondyloarthropathy; diffuse connective tissue diseases (systemic lupus erythematosus, systemic scleroderma, idiopathic inflammatory myopathies), resistant to standard therapy; tactics for managing pregnant women with rheumatic diseases and drug therapy. The topics of research work (RW) of residents under the guidance of teachers of the department will be devoted to these problems.

During an oral interview with residents, 30% (3) of them responded that they were already engaged in scientific research, and 70% (7) were planning to start.

Despite the data from the self-assessment report and interviews with teachers, experts noted that the scientific activity of residents was insufficiently high.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs. In accordance with the State Educational Standard of specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” DPAE has developed a working curriculum for the entire period of study (2 years), in which 136 credits are allocated to core disciplines (outpatient rheumatology for adults - 26 credits, outpatient rheumatology for children – 26 credits, Rheumatology in an adult hospital and

Rheumatology in a pediatric hospital 40 credits each) and an elective component (4 credits). 2 credits are allocated for intermediate and end-of-course assessment. Total – 140 credits (4200 hours). The number of credits is evenly distributed over 2 years - 70 credits each. In the first year, residents study adult rheumatology in a hospital, adult rheumatology outpatient, in the second year, residents study pediatric rheumatology in a hospital, pediatric rheumatology outpatient.

The approved catalog of elective disciplines in three languages is posted in the AIS (Automated Information System) “Platonus” – JSC RIC&ID. The catalog includes topics such as: “Genetically engineered biological drugs in rheumatology”; “Pregnancy and rheumatic diseases.” The topics of the electives are based on the needs of practical healthcare. *The experts reviewed the catalog of elective disciplines and came to the conclusion that the list of elective disciplines can be expanded taking into account the multidisciplinary nature of the specialty “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology.” For the effective implementation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”, it is recommended to include such elective disciplines as: Economics and financing of health care, Methods and methodology of scientific research, Health economics, Information technology in health care, Epidemiology and research methods.*

The resident training program contains: 1) theoretical training; 2) clinical training; 3) intermediate and end-of-course assessment. Thus, the experts established the compliance of the educational program of the State Educational Standard and the standard curriculum.

The practical training course is carried out in therapeutic department No. 2, which has rheumatological beds, in the functional departments of the Research Institute of Clinical Diagnostics, the clinical diagnostic center, and the disciplines in pediatric rheumatology are based on the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery.

Residency training is carried out taking into account the principles of continuity with basic medical education (bachelor's degree, internship) and continuing medical education in the chosen specialty

The Department of Therapy with a course in rheumatology plans to annually review and supplement the list of recommended literature, clinical periodicals, monographs and national guidelines, and Internet resources. All these changes are usually recorded in methodological materials and teaching materials.

DPAE annually sends a request to the Regional Health Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan about the required number of specialists in various specialties, including in 2023 a request was sent for the specialty “Rheumatology for adults, children.” After processing the data received from the regions of the country, an application (proposal) is drawn up for the required number of specialists in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”.

Experts, using the example of other educational programs, have found that the modification of the educational program is carried out annually on the basis of the inclusion of elective disciplines in the working curriculum in the specialty, changes and additions to the working curriculum in major and elective component disciplines based on scientific achievements, health and social needs, student satisfaction. Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with JSC RIC&ID.

Syllabuses and control and measurement tools (tests, tasks) are reviewed annually, discussed and approved by the department.

The Department of Therapy with a course of rheumatology is located at 4 clinical bases in Almaty. When choosing a clinic, special attention is paid to whether medical organizations have an accreditation certificate. All clinical bases of the educational program “Rheumatology for adults, children” are accredited by the National Accreditation Centre.

To the question of the questionnaire “Is there sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)”, 100% of residents responded with complete agreement. All residents interviewed claim that after completing classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).

To the question “Do resident representatives participate in the development of educational programs?”, the experts received an answer confirming their participation. The residents surveyed are completely satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (100%).

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care.

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the therapy department and conversations with the manager and employees. The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including therapy departments No. 2 and No. 1. A total of 3 meetings were held and during cross-interviews it was established that the educational program complies with regulatory requirements, there is a close relationship with medical care to the population, and innovative teaching methods are being introduced.

When attending a practical lesson, it was established that JSC RIC&ID promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills. JSC RIC&ID is specialized in rheumatology, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists. Teachers confirmed that residents are trained directly in clinical departments (therapy No. 2, therapy No. 1, other clinical sites). Residents in this specialty can supervise patients with systemic autoimmune and rheumatological diseases.

This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out at JSC RIC&ID.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): completely -20, partially -2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents.
- 2) Ensure the motivation and interest of residents in participating and conducting research work with subsequent publication in the form of publications and speeches at the local, national and international levels.
- 3) Strengthen the interdisciplinary approach in organizing resident training to improve professional skills.

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Assessment methods

JSC RIC&ID has developed and approved the “Regulations on ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate and end-of-course assessment of students” (No. 4 of 09/02/2022). The Regulations are presented on the JSC RIC&ID website in the “Education – Internal Regulatory Documents” section. <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/vnutrennie-normativnye-dokumenty>

The current assessment recorded in the electronic journal is applied. A checklist has been developed for the current assessment. At the same time, JSC RIC&ID is independent in choosing the forms, order and frequency of ongoing monitoring of students’ progress in accordance with Article 28, paragraph 7 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education”. Current assessment methods are located in the work program/EMCD and syllabuses of each discipline, which are issued electronically to residents. Residents are assessed on the basis of competency level indicators developed by the department in various forms: test questions, tasks in test form (MCQs, tasks with multiple correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations.

A point-rating assessment is used, where 100 is the maximum score. After completing each discipline, residents undergo a milestone control exam in 2 stages (miniclinical examination at the

patient's bedside and comprehensive testing in the discipline). For this purpose, an examination commission is created, which is approved by order of the Chairman of the Board of JSC RIC&ID. The cycle of major disciplines of the program 7R01102 "Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology" includes 4 disciplines and in the 2nd year of study – an elective component, i.e. 4 boundary controls are provided.

Information about the scoring system is posted on the website. The educational journals provide a sheet for residents to familiarize themselves with the policies of the department/module and the criteria for assessing competencies. The examination schedule is prepared by the DPAE.

After completion of training in all disciplines of the educational program, an intermediate assessment will be carried out, where the average score based on the results of exams in the disciplines is displayed. This information was obtained during a conversation with the head of the DPAE and with residents (of other specialties, since admission to the program "Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology" is planned in 2023).

The experts came to the conclusion that the assessment policy applied at JSC RIC&ID covers the knowledge, skills, professional behavior and attitude of residents towards patients (resident competency model - knowledge, communication skills, practical skills, legal competence). https://ncvb.kz/images/ИСМ_компетентностная_модель_выпускника_резид.pdf

The experts reviewed the residents' portfolios and came to the conclusion that the portfolio is voluminous and informative, and encourages the resident to engage and improve in the profession. The form and structure of the portfolio is borrowed from Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov.

Approaches to the end-of course assessment of residency students are included in the "Academic Policy" (approved on May 16, 2023), which is posted on the website https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf. Experts determined that the end-of course assessment is carried out according to the forms established DPAE is organized by the state educational standard.

The grade for the exam, annual and end-of course assessment is derived as the average of the grades of two stages (theoretical and practical). The results of students' achievements are displayed in educational journals, examination and test reports.

If a resident passes the exam with 50 points or less, then he is given the opportunity to re-study certain disciplines in the summer semester on a paid basis and re-take exams on them. If a resident does not achieve the minimum transfer score, he is excluded from residency. Until now, there have been no such precedents.

Methods for assessing current performance, midterm, intermediate and final control in the disciplines of the educational program are developed by the department and DPAE. Tests are reviewed by external reviewers - employees of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov and undergo testological examination. Tests are placed in the Automated Information System (AIS)-JSC RIC&ID.

During the end-of course assessment of residents, a commission is formed that includes external examiners who are not affiliated with JSC RIC&ID in order to ensure transparency and objectivity of the assessment procedure. Over the past 5 years, deputy chief doctors of medical organizations in Almaty have been involved as members of certification commissions.

During a visit to the organization, management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was "yes". *At the same time, there are difficulties in developing control and measurement tools, including a labor-intensive system for assessing educational achievements that requires daily monitoring.* Employers said that they themselves participate in resident assessments. *But the educational organization did not provide systematic feedback to them.*

At the same time, the mechanisms for validating tests and other assessment materials used during exams and end-of course assessment of residents are unclear.

Thus, JSC RIC&ID has defined, documented, and published a resident evaluation policy. The expert commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as working curricula, syllabuses, journals,

assessment tools (checklists, statements). A review of the website showed that its pages contain documents necessary for residents and contain information that is regularly updated.

The resident keeps an individual journal “Special skills that a resident must master during residency training,” where each skill performed is endorsed by the doctor in whose presence this skill was demonstrated.

The possibility of appealing the results of the intermediate and end-of-course assessment of residents is determined by the Regulations on the Appeal Commission (Order No. 88 of June 15, 2012), which complies with legal and ethical principles.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

Assessment methods were developed in accordance with the Qualification Characteristics of a Resident in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” and the Resident Competency Model. https://ncvb.kz/images/ИСМ_компетентностная_модель_выпускника_резид.pdf

The process of assessing learning outcomes includes formative and summative assessment. Formative assessment is used in the daily training of residents through surveys and questionnaires. For this purpose, the department has developed various questionnaires. Standard scenarios have been developed, assessment criteria (checklists) have been developed. For example, on the topic “Rheumatoid arthritis Still's syndrome” developed an assessment sheet. All rheumatology scenarios have similar assessment sheets, which the experts became familiar with during their visit to the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital.

Experts have established a relationship between the methods and content of resident assessment and training in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”. The end-of course assessment is carried out on the basis of a graduate competency model, consisting of 5 key competencies.

To assess the level of development of the cognitive (knowledge), communicative and operational (practical skills) components of the resident competency model, independent experts (both internal and external) are involved. When conducting an FSC to assess the educational achievements of residents, the commission includes practical healthcare specialists in their specialization profile, external examiners are involved, as well as specialists in related disciplines.

To assess the acquisition of practical and communication skills by residents, the scope of application of the objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) technique has been expanded. Clinical case scenarios are developed and a standardized patient is used. To increase the reliability and validity of the OSCE, piloting of OSCE stations is carried out before it is carried out, which makes it possible to assess the quality of the methodological support of the stations and make the necessary changes.

Assessment of the development of legal competence of residents is carried out constantly and is based on residents’ knowledge of the regulatory framework in healthcare, skills in preparing medical documentation, communicating with patients and their relatives, filling out the patient’s informed consent to diagnostic invasive procedures and treatment methods, and compliance with patient safety requirements, maintaining medical confidentiality. Legal competence is assessed using a checklist; the score is given at the end of the discipline, on a separate page of the journal, taking into account the absence of comments from the administration regarding the maintenance of medical records by the resident.

The resident’s “self-improvement” competence is assessed by the presence of a scientific article, the level of publication or report (international, republican or local) and the assessment is given on a separate page of the journal at the end of studying the discipline. The resident’s individual participation in the preparation of scientific material, a completed portfolio, which is studied by accreditation experts, is assessed. Residents use the self-assessment method and 360° assessment (questionnaires).

During interviews with teachers, experts received evidence of compliance with this section of the standard. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting

counseling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness, and providing feedback on the results of exams and certification.

Interprofessional training is organized properly, since JSC RIC&ID trains residents in 3 specialties and plans to train residents in 5 more specialties. Therefore, there are all conditions for organizing interprofessional training. The teachers told the experts that they organize seminars on related issues - cardiology, anaesthesiology and resuscitation (for the management of patients with acute coronary syndrome), cardiology and endocrinology (cardiopathy in diabetes mellitus), etc.

Thus, JSC RIC&ID guarantees that residents achieve the expected learning outcomes in their chosen specialty, while the graduate can perform different roles in the healthcare system - doctor, manager, consultant, mentor of interns or bachelors, healthcare organizer, effective communicator, patient health advocate.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully 8, partially –1

Standard 3: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the format for assessing residents for validity and reliability.
- 2) Expand the capabilities of the simulation centre in assessing the knowledge and skills of residents.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

Proof of compliance:

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

JSC RIC&ID has developed a document “Academic Policy”, where paragraph 4 describes the admission policy to the institute https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf, which ensures transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to education.

RIC&ID complies with the requirements of the country: when organizing admission to residency, it follows the Model Rules for Admission to Training (Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600); when transferring residents from other educational organizations, follows the order of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 20, 2015 No. 19 “On approval of the Rules for the transfer and reinstatement of students by type of educational organization.”

Experts studied section 6 “Rules for transfer, reinstatement, expulsion of students...”, which is included in the “Academic Policy” of JSC RIC&ID updated and approved on May 16, 2023. Until now, there has been no transfer of residents from JCS RIC&ID to other educational organizations and vice versa.

For the period of entrance exams and enrolment in residency, the institute creates: an admissions committee for specialties and an appeal committee. The selection committee includes: the Chairman of the Board, the supervising deputy, doctors, and candidates of science, leading doctors in their specialty. Applications for residency at the institute are accepted from July 3 to July 25. Entrance exams for residency are held from August 10 to 20, enrolment is until August 25.

The interviewed 10 residents (of other specialties) confirmed the objectivity and transparency of the procedure for admission to the residency program at JSC RIC&ID.

When applying for admission to the educational program “Rheumatology for adults, children”, it will be taken into account that the applicant also has a document confirming completion of an internship with the qualification “Doctor”. When an applicant collects the same competitive scores, a high grade in the specialty “rheumatology”, his personal achievements will be taken into account, for example, participation in scientific work, publication of articles and abstracts, certificates/diplomas for participation in scientific conferences and competitions, training in electives in rheumatology ,

cardiology.

Admission of residents with disabilities who require special conditions, transfer of residents from other national or international programs is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. There are no obstacles for people with special needs to enter JSC RIC&ID. At the same time, experts discovered that JSC RIC&ID has a barrier-free environment for visitors (elevator, special paths for the blind). However, there is no elevator to get to the 5th floor, where the study rooms are located (but you can take the stairs from the 4th floor, since the elevator only works until the 4th floor).

The exam in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” includes basic profile questions, and the applicant will have to receive at least 50 points out of 100. Of course, those who score the maximum number of points will have an advantage. This fact ensures that applicants have a high level of understanding of the biomedical sciences (and rheumatology in particular) achieved during their undergraduate and residency training. The results of the residency program applicant's entrance examination will be recorded on the examination sheet and will be announced on the day of the examination. This mechanism has been worked out quite well in the example of admitting residents to other educational programs (for example, “Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children’s”, “Cardiology, including children’s”, “Endocrinology, including children’s”).

The experts reviewed the documents for the admission of residents to the previously listed educational programs and were convinced of the good practice of JSC RIC&ID.

For the period of entrance examinations to residency, an appeal commission is created at JSC RIC&ID. An applicant who does not agree with the results of the entrance exams has the right to submit an application to the appeal commission. To date, there has been no precedent for appeal.

To involve students in solving their problem situations, JSC RIC&ID has senior resident doctors with expanded powers and are responsible for junior year resident doctors; take part in coordinating work, resolving complex issues, and disputes between resident doctors. For example, when drawing up a duty schedule, the individual circumstances of the resident are taken into account.

Experts received evidence that JSC RIC&ID has a mechanism for periodically reviewing the admission and selection policy and the number of residents. In connection with changes to the mission of JSC RIC&ID, the threshold for admission to residency in a core specialty has increased by 100 points and with the same scores of applicants, their previous experience in conducting research work (publications, participation in conferences with reports) is taken into account.

During a conversation with the head of the DPAE and during a meeting with the deputy chairmen of the board, the experts found out that changes and additions to the JSC RIC&ID Admission Policy can be made by decision of the Board. In this case, changes in the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and new orders of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education and the Ministry of Health must be taken into account.

All information about admission to the program 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” is posted on the JSC RIC&ID website in the “Residency” section <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/rezidentura> and in the “Educational programs” section <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/obrazovatelnye-programmy> posted a passport of educational programs. However, questions for entrance exams for the educational program in the specialty “Rheumatology for adults, children” have not yet been posted (as there are no accreditation results).

4.2 Number of residents

Taking into account the regulated (Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education”, dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-Sh) teacher/resident ratio as 1:3, today JSC RIC&ID can accept up to 18 residents for the educational program in rheumatology (see. clause 5.1, 6 teachers). Thus, JSC RIC&ID has the personnel and educational (paragraph 6 of this report) resources for the admission and training of rheumatology residents.

Due to the coronavirus pandemic and the complications it caused (including those affecting the heart and joints, a trigger for autoimmune diseases), the need for rheumatologists has increased. This

justifies the feasibility of developing and implementing a new educational program in the residency specialty “Rheumatology for adults and children.”

4.3 Support and counseling for residents

In 2023, JSC RIC&ID updated the “Academic Policy” (approved by the decision of the Academic Council, Minutes 2 of 05.16.23) and academic counselling was included in clause 5.3. The main role is assigned to mentors, and in the first year of study, supervisors from among the teachers are appointed. The contact person for the program 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” is Olga Vasilievna Mashkunova, Ph.D., Associate Professor.

Consultations are provided by DPAE staff based on monitoring progress in training, and residents are also consulted by specialists from departments of the institute in order to improve the quality of medical services for patients with cardiovascular and rheumatological diseases, including unintentional incidents, in order to avoid the repetition of mistakes in further educational and professional activities

There is a resident development program.

DPAE and curators ensure the participation of residents in all medical activities of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital. A survey of 10 residents showed that they participate in the provision of medical services, supervising case patients, as well as during night shifts (once a month).

The scholarship to residents is paid in accordance with the Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students studying in educational organizations, approved by Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116. The Academic Policy also includes section 10 “Procedure for payment of state scholarships” for students studying under state orders.

During meetings with 7 teachers, 3 mentors and 10 residents, experts found out that JSC RIC&ID ensures confidentiality in relation to counselling and support provided to residents through correspondence by e-mail DPAE, providing personal telephone numbers of teachers.

The JSC RIC&ID staffs have a psychologist to whom both teachers and residents can turn in the event of a professional crisis. The head of the DPAE said that, first of all, residents can turn to them, since the DPAE employees are in a professional crisis. Residents confirmed this.

Experts were convinced that JSC RIC&ID has a WIFI zone and residents can freely use it by accessing the resources of international databases of literature and scientific articles, can visit the JSC RIC&ID library and the library of KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov for the purpose of continuous improvement and improvement of knowledge, conducting scientific work. At the same time, the library collection of JSC RIC&ID is quite outdated, there is little new scientific literature and monographs, scientific professional journals on rheumatology (for example, the Russian journal “Scientific and Practical Rheumatology” <https://rheumatolog.ru/media/sr/>, and you also need access to foreign / European, American / professional publications).

4.4 Representation of residents

According to the “Academic Policy” (05/16/2023) of JSC RIC&ID, residents have the opportunity to participate in the organization of training and the work of advisory bodies.

Residents are included in the academic council.

4.5 Working conditions

JSC RIC&ID provides access to residents to patients and to all structural units, including clinical departments, operating rooms, intensive care units, and emergency departments, in accordance with the needs of the educational process. Exceptions are determined by the charter of JSC RIC&ID and the Academic Policy (section “Rules for organizing practice”).

The experts familiarized themselves with the contracts for the provision of educational services, which are concluded with each resident and which describe the rights and responsibilities of residents. For example, residents are allowed to work in other medical organizations (night shifts, on weekends and holidays), but not more than 0.5 times the rate and with permitting certificates for clinical activities. The absence of damage to the educational process must be taken into account.

Approaches to organizing individual training for residents during forced breaks in training (pregnancy, childbirth, parental leave, long-term illness, etc.) are defined in the Academic Policy. In April 2020, due to the COVID-19 pandemic, based on the order of the Chairman of the Board of the JSC RIC&ID, resident training was transferred to a distance format. As part of measures to combat coronavirus infection, residents worked as doctors in a pharmacist hospital in 2020 and 2021.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully -19, partially -1, do not comply - 0

Standard 4: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Ensure the representation of residents in advisory bodies in order to involve them in the management of the educational process and in decision-making regarding the improvement of educational programs.

Standard 5: TEACHERS

Proof of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

Honored scientists of the Republic of Kazakhstan and specialists of the first and highest categories are invited to conduct residency training in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”.

The number and composition of teaching staff are planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard teaching load per full-time teacher and student population.

The Institute has a system of qualification requirements for teachers, on the basis of which recruitment is carried out, with further competition according to the schedule approved by the Chairman of the Board of the Institute. JSC RIC&ID has developed uniform job descriptions, which prevents discrimination against teaching staff and creates a favourable environment for academic integrity.

When drawing up the staffing schedule for the new academic year, in order to conduct classes with residents, a mandatory requirement for teachers is to have an academic degree, academic title and work experience. It should also be noted that employees hired to teach residents from practical healthcare are subject to a number of requirements - the presence of a medical qualification category and sufficient experience in their specialty. When carrying out their professional activities, teachers and mentors must comply with the principles of ethical academic integrity.

The employees responsible for the implementation of educational programs are determined by the DPAE staff. There are 9 teachers in total, including 3 doctors of medical sciences, 6 candidates of medical sciences. Of these, 2 are professors and 4 have the academic degree of associate professor (associate professor). A senior methodologist has been included in the DPAE staff. 6 teachers are responsible for the educational program in rheumatology, including 3 who work part-time. Thus, the level of teacher satisfaction is high – 100%.

The teaching staffs for the 2022-2023 academic years were approved by order of the Chairman of the Board of JSC RIC&ID No. 26-2-k dated January 13, 2021. Section 3.5 of the Academic Policy describes the responsibilities of a faculty member (page 53). This document is available to all visitors to the LSC RIC&ID website https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf

At JSC RIC&ID, a personnel policy has been developed, approved and implemented, and the tasks and responsibilities of the mentor have been developed (clause 3.4 “Clinical mentor” in the “Academic Policy”), which the experts became familiar with during the visit. The Regulations reflect the requirements and criteria for hiring teachers, taking into account the balance between teaching and scientific and clinical activities. Clarifying information was obtained during a conversation with the head of the HR department. Recruitment of employees is based on their scientific and clinical achievements (presence of medical category and certification), authority in the academic community.

In order to monitor the activities of teachers, residents are surveyed, their performance is assessed, and the results of an independent examination are conducted. Experts are familiar with the results of a survey of residents of other specialties, and it can be concluded that the organization of the educational process in residency is at a good level. These data can be extrapolated to the planned educational program in rheumatology.

The experts familiarized themselves with the code of ethics of JSC RIC&ID teachers, and the teachers themselves said that knowledge of this document and adherence to its principles are also the main conditions for their work at JSC RIC&ID. Academic detail is fundamental in the implementation of residency programs, since JSC RIC&ID is affiliated with KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, who is a member of the “League of Academic Honesty”. Staff and residents are aware of this and understand that when completing assignments, preparing and passing exams, carrying out independent work, preparing scientific publications, it is necessary to follow the principles of academic particularity. Academic integrity is enshrined in the document “Academic Policy” (approved by the decision of the Academic Council, protocol 2 of 05.16.23), page 12 https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf

The anti-plagiarism system is implemented through the Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, but no precedents of plagiarism were noted.

A survey of teachers conducted by the ECA found that 100% were completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at JSC RIC&ID. At JSC RIC&ID, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish results.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

The main document defining the work of each teacher is an individual plan, which includes the educational (in hours), methodological, scientific, and therapeutic work planned for the current academic year, including advanced training. An individual work plan is considered at a meeting of the DPAE, after which it is approved by its head, and then by the Deputy Director for Postgraduate Education.

JSC RIC&ID ensures that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. Each type of activity accounts for 1/3 of the hours of the total amount of time, and 2/3 of the total number of hours is allocated for independent work of residents.

The organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID has a department that plans and monitors the professional development of teachers. Experts received answers about the teacher training program. These events are financed by JSC RIC&ID. In 2018, 10 teachers underwent advanced training on the topic: “Teacher in medical education and science organizations” and in 2020 on the topic: “Distance educational technologies.”

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation

The organization has opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies. The organization implements social support programs for teachers.

Additional types of incentives are used: announcement of gratitude; rewarding with a valuable gift; awarding a certificate of honour; submission for ranks, medals and badges of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Experts noted that at JSC RIC&ID there are no mechanisms for stimulating (motivating) practicing doctors at clinical sites in order to involve them in training residents not only as teachers, but also for mentoring.

On the one hand, academic mobility is not a mandatory requirement for residency, but at the same time, to improve teaching skills, this is one of the mechanisms for achieving the goal, and teachers can be sent on internships to foreign educational organizations and research centres. The opportunity to exchange residents both within the country and abroad is welcomed in order to strengthen the disciplines of the educational program.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully -7, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

Standard 5: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Development of a motivation (stimulation) mechanism to attract representatives of practical healthcare to teaching and mentoring in residency.
- 2) In terms of professional development for teachers, strengthen the focus on pedagogical skills, new teaching methods, including distance technologies and the use of digitalization opportunities in resident training.
- 3) Document the system of social support for teachers through the development of appropriate regulations and ensure that all interested parties are informed about this.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Proof of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

Residents are provided with appropriate conditions for theoretical and practical training during the 2-year educational program. To conduct a seminar, DPAE has 3 lecture halls, 11 classrooms with a capacity of up to 10-12 people or more, 1 computer class for 10 seats (which is quite enough if JSC RIC&ID has developed a schedule for visiting the class); electronic library room for 10 seats; 3 lecture halls with a capacity of 220 seats, equipped with modern multimedia and sound reinforcement equipment; 2 scientific and methodological rooms. For the development of practical skills by residents (and students of continuous professional development programs), 4 training and simulation centres have been created: endoscopy centre; cardiopulmonary resuscitation centre; Centre for Interventional Cardiology and Arrhythmology; a hybrid laboratory for providing “Emergency Cardiac Care”, providing “Emergency Resuscitation Care”, “Providing Medical Care for COVID-19” in accordance with the implemented educational programs, sanitary and epidemiological norms and rules. Residents of the “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” program will train in a hybrid laboratory.

There are 31 computers in DPAE. JSC RIC&ID has a telemedicine centre where lectures, remote consultations and studies, and conference calls with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan are held.

The adequacy of the material and technical base, clinical bases, number and profile of patients to ensure clinical training of residents is ensured by all structural divisions of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital. Every year at the end of the academic year, the DPAE analyzes the provision of educational program disciplines with the necessary material and technical resources, literature, and bases for clinical training (so that there are thematic patients).

Thus, residents of the program “Rheumatology for adults and children” will be provided with the necessary material and technical resources to conduct theoretical classes, simulation training, and can also participate in telemedicine projects.

6.2 Clinical sites

The practical part of the educational program 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” is planned to be implemented in the therapy department No. 2 with 25 beds. This department has 13 rheumatology beds.

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and the management of the clinical site to achieve the final results of residents. Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills.

A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators

(mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training.

6.3 Information technology

We visited a library with an area of 555 sq. m., which has classical equipment (shelves with books), a catalog, a subscription, and a showcase for the exhibition of new periodicals. The library has a computer class with 10 seats with Internet access, a printer, a copy machine, and a scanner.

The information fund of the library is >30,000 copies, 11,100 titles, including medical scientific journals, monographs, conference materials (5374 copies), educational literature (366 copies), literature in the Kazakh language (670 copies), foreign literature (684 copies), reference literature (982 copies), methodological literature (898 copies), abstracts (1350 copies) and dissertations (256 copies), electronic literature on CDs, DVDs (150 copies), electronic textbooks, monographs and journals (2364 copies).

About 70 copies of periodical journals are issued annually to users, in paper and electronic format, among which 57 titles are of a scientific, medical, and educational nature.

There is e-mail, through which correspondence is conducted with domestic and foreign partners. Free (test) access to databases of educational and scientific literature is provided: “EbscoHost-Medline”, “Springerlink”, “Scopus”, “Web of Science”, “Elsevier”, “Thomson Reuters”, Elibrary.ru. The necessary medical literature is constantly being downloaded for further integration into the automated information and library program AIBS MegaPro.

Distance learning is used only when conducting telemedicine. JSC RIC&ID can organize the development of the theoretical part of the educational program through the programs - zoom and google class, if an emergency situation arises.

6.4 Clinical teams

The program for preparing residents for teamwork skills and effective interaction with other healthcare professionals includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical sites in all areas of their activities, participation in national and city conference calls to discuss various issues of connective tissue diseases in pregnant women, extragenital pathology of rheumatic diseases in pregnant women, reviewing medical histories, outpatient records of rheumatic patients, participation in scientific, practical, pathomorphological conferences.

For interdisciplinary training, JSC RIC&ID has 5 more departments and a day hospital (with 25 beds, including 2 rheumatology beds).

6.5 Medical research and advances

Research work of the Department of Therapy with a course in rheumatology is carried out according to the research work plan and includes topics in rheumatology (issues of diagnosis and treatment of rheumatological diseases, osteoporosis, osteoarthritis, genetic engineering and biological therapy, systemic vasculitis, orphan diseases).

In 2019 – 2021 JSC RIC&ID participated in the implementation of 7 scientific and technical programs, including fragments of projects where rheumatological diseases were studied, on the topic: “Molecular genetic methods of pre-symptomatic diagnosis and methods of treatment of a number of significant diseases”, “Development of models for predicting the epidemiological characteristics of non-communicable diseases at the population level on the example of Almaty and the Almaty region”, “Development of scientific foundations for the formation of a preventive environment in order to preserve public health”.

In 2019-2021 the number of scientific publications by JSC RIC&ID employees in international publications increased 2 times (225%), the index of publication activity (Hirsch index) increased 2 times (235.3%), the average level of citations (citation index) increased 35 times over 3 years.

However, the scientific work of JSC RIC&ID and the results for 2022 are not presented.

6.6 Educational expertise

Examination and evaluation of the educational program in the context of the educational process is carried out based on the results of annual reports, inspections, certifications of structural units and

departments/courses. The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

Examination of the quality of the educational program (EP) of the residency is carried out by the following divisions of JSC RIC&ID department (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), DPAA (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), EMCD (coordination, control of compliance with legal regulations, monitoring, evaluation of EP), Department of Strategic Development and QMS (coordination, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), Academic Council (approval, evaluation, revision of EP). The collegial advisory body (CAB) includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, and students.

There have been no research projects on the quality of postgraduate and additional education at JSC RIC&ID.

6.7 Training in other institutions

JSC RIC&ID cooperates with international clinical centres and universities near and far abroad: Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology of the Tomsk Research Medical Centre, National Medical Research Centre named after V.A. Almazov, Research Medical Centre named after Academician E.N. Meshalkina (Novosibirsk, Russian Federation), Crisis Research Centre (Kaunas, Republic of Lithuania); Seoul National University Hospital (Republic of Korea); Beer Sheva Medical Centre (Israel); Clinic of the University of Milan (Italy). Therefore, residents have great opportunities to participate in international events, visiting professor programs, and academic exchange programs.

The JSC RIC&ID document “Academic Policy” has a section “Academic mobility”, which describes the principles and conditions for implementation.

In 2021, JSC RIC&ID received institutional accreditation and this guaranteed a unified and mutually recognized system for the transfer and offset of residents’ learning results between educational organizations and the use of academic credits.

The procedure for resetting educational loans is carried out on the basis of the “Regulations on the procedure for resetting loans”, which was developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” and is implemented with the aim of establishing rules and regulations for education in the credit system, which considers the basic principles of the European Credit Settlement System (ECTS).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 16 partially -2, do not comply - 0

Standard 6: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop a promising program of cooperation with foreign partners to conduct educational events for residents in order to expand their knowledge and skills in their specialty.
- 2) Plan topics for examination in the field of postgraduate education and use the results to improve the residency training process.

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM EVALUATION

Proof of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

JSC RIC&ID has a monitoring system for educational programs, including those in the specialty “Rheumatology for adults and children.” The implementation of the educational program is regularly monitored by the head of the Department of Cardiology, the head of the DPAA, and the deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities. The results of the inspection are heard and discussed at meetings of the department and DPAA, Academic Council.

A mechanism for evaluating the educational program has been developed, including internal and external control with the participation of all stakeholders (residents, teachers, selective employers).

The experts familiarized themselves with three protocols of the academic council, which reviewed residency educational programs.

Evaluation of an educational program necessarily includes an assessment of goals, objectives, expected final learning outcomes, program content, and sufficiency of resources. The progress of residents is assessed by analyzing the results of the examination and final state certification. The assessment regarding the demand for graduates is assessed by the employment rate, which is 100% over the last 5 years.

External assessment of educational programs is carried out through the process of specialized accreditation by an accreditation body included in the Register 1 of recognized accreditation bodies of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. To date, three residency programs have been accredited and 5 programs are undergoing an external assessment process as part of accreditation.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

To study the level of student satisfaction with the educational process, the following questionnaires were developed: “Resident satisfaction with the educational process”, “DPAE teacher through the eyes of residents”, “Teacher satisfaction”.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

The assessment is carried out on the basis of the final state certification, which demonstrates the quality of training of residents. JSC RIC&ID graduates always show high academic results.

JSC RIC&ID monitors residency graduates for 3 years and provides feedback from employers on the clinical practice of graduates. Feedback with employers is usually carried out verbally, through telephone calls or email correspondence.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

In the process of selecting applicants, in the development, implementation and evaluation of educational policy in residency programs in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”, the participation of all interested parties is provided. The official website of the Institute (<https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/vnutrennie-normativnye-dokumenty>) contains all regulatory documents relating to the educational process, complete information about educational programs (program passports <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/obrazovatelnye-programmy>). It provides for receiving feedback on programs from teachers, residents and employers.

The interview with 3 employers was conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the mission of JSC RIC&ID, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, employment of residency graduates, etc. The experts received comprehensive and detailed answers demonstrating the full awareness of employers about the educational process.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

The “Academic Policy” of JSC RIC&ID describes the stages of resident training, but there is no procedure for approving educational programs. At the same time, during interviews with teachers (7) and DPAE staff, experts found out that the educational program was developed by the department and was initially discussed at a meeting in DPAE, and only after that was approved by the scientific council of JSC RIC&ID. The educational program is undergoing a review process. The examination for compliance with the State Educational Standard is approved by the catalog of elective disciplines (2nd year of study, 2 credits) of the DPAE.

A survey of teachers and students is systematically conducted twice a year during the winter and summer sessions, which includes questions about the quality of the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -8, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Standard 7: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the assessment of the quality of the educational program and monitoring of its implementation by documenting this process with recording of the results, including recommendations for improving the educational program.
- 2) Ensure the systematic conduct, collection and analysis of feedback from residents, graduates and employers, ensuring access to the results to all interested parties.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Proof of compliance:

8.1 Management

JSC RIC&ID has updated the organizational structure posted on the website.

Documents have been developed and approved defining the terms of reference and powers of the institute in relation to the residency educational program, including obligations to provide the educational process in full with all necessary information sources.

The educational program is conducted in accordance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (see Standard 4), the training process (see Standard 2), assessment of knowledge and skills (Standard 3), established learning outcomes and program management (Standard 2). Ensuring the quality of the educational process in residency is determined by the fulfillment of mandatory requirements for the level of training (State Educational Standards 2022), educational programs) and the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of teachers and the implementation of the resident's individual curriculum (open classes, intra-departmental control).

Thus, JSC RIC&ID is guided by the main regulations in postgraduate education and healthcare, as described in the self-assessment report (section 8.1.1). Thus, the number of accepted residents corresponds to the clinical training capabilities at JSC RIC&ID, the workload on teachers, as well as the material and technical capabilities of the department.

Coordination, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programs in all licensed specialties is carried out by the DPAAE under the supervision of the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities, who in turn is responsible for the strategy for the development of postgraduate education.

Direct management of residency programs and coordination of the activities of residents from the moment the residency exists is carried out by the Department of Postgraduate and Continuing Education. The main goal of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals of educational programs, including residency in an accredited specialty. The department reports directly to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific and Clinical Activities, the Chairman of the Board.

Residents have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of the specialty curriculum during direct discussion and approval of work programs and elective disciplines at meetings of the department and DPAAE.

Graduates of the educational program 7R01102 "Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology" who have successfully passed state certification are awarded the qualification of a rheumatologist and issued a state-issued document. An application is also issued, which lists all the disciplines studied with the amount of hours and the qualification assigned.

8.2 Academic leadership

The organization of the educational process is the responsibility of the department of therapy with a course in rheumatology, which has 3 teachers and 3 part-time teachers, all of whom have an academic degree and a medical category. The department draws up a schedule of training sessions and an individual resident plan. The activities of teachers are regulated by job descriptions developed and approved by the Academic Council of JSC RIC&ID.

Reception and monitoring of the activities of teachers is carried out in accordance with the "Rules for competitive filling of positions of teachers and researchers of universities" and is carried

out on a competitive basis, the procedure of which is regulated by the Personnel Policy of JSC RIC&ID.

For the purpose of effective management of the educational process and successful implementation of the Medical Education Model, the Committee of Educational Programs (CEP) functions at JSC RIC&ID. The CEP consists of experienced methodological experts from among qualified teachers, representatives of students and practical healthcare.

The Academic Council organizes and considers the implementation of various forms of methodological work aimed at improving the educational process.

Responsibilities and powers in relation to the educational program in residency specialties are regulated by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulatory documents of JSC RIC&ID.

To the survey question “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, and clinical work,” all teachers answered in the affirmative.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The executive body of JSC RIC&ID is the Chairman of the Board. The Chairman of the Institute's Board is personally responsible for financial and economic activities. The budget of JSC RIC&ID is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training personnel in postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and the provision of paid educational services.

Responsibility and authority for managing the budgets of residency programs is assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Financial and Economic Affairs, the Planning and Economic Analysis Department, and the Accounting and Reporting Department.

The distribution of resources for resident training is regulated by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Budget Program 006). Calculation of training costs is regulated in accordance with the Acting Order. Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2021 No. MoH RK-6. “On approval of the methodology for determining the cost of training for education programs in the field of health”, the Development Plan of the Research Institute of Higher Biology for 2022-2026, the Public Procurement Plan of the Scientific Research Institute of Higher Biology for the current year.

Financial activities are transparent and the results (reports) are published on the website <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/finansovaya-otchetnost> (*no reporting documentation is posted for 2022*).

8.4 Administration and management

JSC RIC&ID has appropriate administrative units and staff operating on the basis of Regulations and job descriptions. <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/struktura> The administration has received a license for educational activities. https://ncvb.kz/images/Corporate_admission/лицензия/Образовательная_деятельность.pdf

According to the process approach, all activities of JSC RIC&ID are divided into main processes, management processes and supporting processes. The main processes include scientific and educational processes. https://ncvb.kz/images/Капра_процесса.pdf

An independent internal audit system has been created and is functioning. DPAE controls all stages of training. The results of the analysis of assessing the educational achievements of residents are discussed at meetings of departments, DPAE, and the Academic Council.

An independent internal audit system has been created and is functioning. Based on the results of the audit, management makes decisions on the effectiveness and efficiency of the quality management system, on improving and improving educational management, and justifying the need to make changes to the education quality management system, including updating educational documentation.

A quality management system has been introduced to comply with the requirements of the international standard (ISO 9001:2008), *i.e. an outdated standard is still used. The management system according to ISO 9001:2015 should be updated.*

For this purpose, a document has been developed and used since 2016, updated in 2021 https://ncvb.kz/images/Карта_процесса.pdf

External assessment of educational activities is carried out through the process of accreditation of educational programs (in 2021, institutional accreditation was carried out and 3 residency programs were accredited by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education <https://ncvb.kz/files/2021-сертификат%201%20рус.pdf>).

External assessment of the final learning outcomes of residency graduates is carried out by the National Centre for Independent Examination.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

Residency education in the specialty “7R01102 Rheumatology, adult, pediatric” is carried out on the basis of the annex to the license for educational activities KZ 10LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018 https://ncvb.kz/images/Corporate_admission/лицензия/Образовательная_деятельность.pdf and compliance with state requirements in the fields of education and health care.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 10, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Standard 8: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Apply information and communication technologies in the educational process through the introduction of electronic document management, expanding the capabilities of AIS-Platonus in residency.
- 2) Strengthen interaction with potential employers of residency graduates to receive feedback and improve the educational program.

Standard 9. CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID has been updated and includes a direction related to educational activities under the supervision of the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities (C&IA). <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/struktura>

The department and DPAE are responsible for the process of continuous improvement of the educational program.

The residency program “7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology”” is undergoing initial accreditation, so there has been no update of the program. However, DPAE monetizes any changes occurring in the legislative field (education and healthcare) and makes appropriate changes to educational and methodological documentation. To this end, the Deputy Chairman of the Board for C&IA collaborates with the financial sector, represented by the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic and Financial Economic Affairs, to plan resources for continuous improvement in order to adapt to changing circumstances and needs in postgraduate education.

The map of processes of educational services for postgraduate professional and additional education programs (hereinafter referred to as the Map) was developed in 2016 and revised in 2021 (CP-EP-12-2016) and contains a description of the processes of planning, approval, implementation of educational programs, performance indicators process and resources for the functioning of the process. *At the same time, the content of the Map is outdated and contains clerical errors and information not related to JSC RIC&ID.*

The annual work plan of the Academic Council includes the question “Annual report of the Head of DPAE on the work done and tasks for the new academic year,” which contains a complete analysis of the work of the department.

The process of updating and restructuring is based on prospective research, analysis of results, personal experience and study of literature on postgraduate medical education. JSC RIC&ID is constantly improving the program evaluation procedure at the level of departments involved in the

educational process, including all aspects (context, resources, performance indicators, consumer satisfaction, etc.) and a wider range of stakeholders.

Experts noted the transparency of the management system and decisions made at the level of postgraduate education. The responsibility of the academic leadership (DPAE and department) in relation to the development and management of the educational program is determined. The stable financial position of JSC RIC&ID was noted.

JSC RIC&ID has planned to create an Academic Council, the main purpose of which will be to determine the list of educational programs, design, develop and improve training programs for residents and students of continuous professional development programs. It is planned to introduce a risk management system in educational activities.

It is planned to train heads of structural divisions of JSC RIC&ID on management issues in education and science, and to annually improve the qualifications of employees and teachers in their areas of activity.

In the 2nd quarter of 2023, it is planned to sign a memorandum with the Kazan State Medical University (including for the implementation of academic mobility), with the Aegean University (Izmir, Turkey)

Experts noted that since 2016, JSC RIC&ID has maintained a certified quality management system (QMS) and has national accreditation.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard improvement): completely – 2.

Standard 9: done

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Update the process map taking into account changes in the organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID and new regulations in postgraduate education and healthcare.
- 2) Automate the process of planning, implementation, monitoring and documentation of educational activities to ensure greater transparency and efficiency of work.
- 3) Expand the range of cooperation with medical educational and healthcare organizations in order to effectively implement the educational program and the possibility of training residents at alternative bases.

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external assessment of the educational program, it was found that out of **114 standards** (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards) full compliance is demonstrated by 102 accreditation standards, including 75 basic standards and 27 improvement standards. 12 standards were partially met, including 7 (9%) basic and 5 (17%) improvement standards.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program “Rheumatology for adults, children”

Standard 1:

- 1) Update the mission of the educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” with the participation of residents and employers, document this process and bring information about the mission to the attention of interested parties.
- 2) Provide conditions and support for resident publications in order to develop skills in analysis, synthesis and preparation of articles and abstracts.
- 3) Correct the text on the JSC RIC&ID website in the “Education” section and add the information necessary for interested parties.

Standard 2:

- 4) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents.
- 5) Ensure the motivation and interest of residents in participating and conducting research work with subsequent publication in the form of publications and speeches at the local, national and international levels.
- 6) Strengthen the interdisciplinary approach in organizing resident training to improve professional skills.

Standard 3:

- 7) Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the format for assessing residents for validity and reliability.
- 8) Expand the capabilities of the simulation centre in assessing the knowledge and skills of residents.

Standard 4:

- 9) Ensure resident representation in advisory bodies in order to involve them in the management of the educational process and in decision-making regarding the improvement of educational programs.

Standard 5:

- 10) Development of a motivation (stimulation) mechanism to attract representatives of practical healthcare to teaching and mentoring in residency.
- 11) In terms of professional development of teachers, strengthen the focus on pedagogical skills, new teaching methods, including distance technologies and the use of digitalization opportunities in training residents.
- 12) Document the system of social support for teachers through the development of appropriate regulations and ensure that all interested parties are informed about this.

Standard 6:

- 13) Develop a promising program of cooperation with foreign partners to conduct educational events for residents in order to expand their knowledge and skills in their specialty.
- 14) Plan topics on examination in the field of postgraduate education and use the results to improve the learning process in residency.

Standard 7:

- 15) Improve the assessment of the quality of the educational program and monitoring of its implementation by documenting this process with recording of the results, including recommendations for improving the educational program.
- 16) Ensure the systematic conduct, collection and analysis of feedback from residents, graduates and employers, ensuring access to the results to all interested parties.

Standard 8:

- 17) Apply information and communication technologies in the educational process through the introduction of electronic document management, expanding the capabilities of AIS-Platonus in residency.
- 18) Strengthen interaction with potential employers of residency graduates to receive feedback and improve the educational program.

Standard 9:

- 19) Update the process map taking into account changes in the organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID and new regulations in postgraduate education and healthcare.

- 20) Automate the process of planning, implementation, monitoring and documentation of educational activities to ensure greater transparency and efficiency of work.
- 21) Expand the range of cooperation with medical educational and healthcare organizations in order to effectively implement the educational program and the possibility of training residents at alternative bases.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01102 “Adult and Pediatric Rheumatology” with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 3 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairperson of EEC	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	
Foreign Expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
National Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
National Academic Expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	
Employers' Representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	
Residents' Representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhegaliuly	

**Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program in the specialty
“Rheumatology for adults, children” (generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS*/SI	Rating		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END RESULTS	14	9/5	12	2	0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	22	19/3	20	2	0
3.	RESIDENT ASSESSMENT	9	6/3	8	1	0
4.	RESIDENTS	20	14/6	19	1	0
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	8	7/1	7	1	0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	16	2	0
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	10	7/3	8	2	0
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	10	1	0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	2	0	0
				75/27	7/5	0
		114	82/32	114		

List of documents studied by members of the EEC as part of an external assessment of the residency educational program

№	Documents name	Quantity
1.	Academic policy	1
2.	Involved residents in science	1
3.	Agreement with city clinic No. 5	1
4.	Agreement with JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy	1
5.	Agreement with NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	1
6.	Job description of a resident doctor (Kazakh, Russian)	2
7.	IMS competency model of graduate resident	1
8.	Personnel policy	1
9.	Process map	1
10.	Code of honor	1
11.	Bed capacity	1
12.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1
13.	Memorandum with NJSC "Astana Medical University"	1
14.	Opinions of employers about JSC RIC&ID graduates 2019	2
15.	On approval of the price for paid services provided during residency training from 08/11/2022	1
16.	Educational program "Allergology and Immunology"	1
17.	Employment report	1
18.	Work plan of the educational programs committee	1
19.	Teacher training plan for 2023-2024	1
20.	Regulations on Clinical Preceptors	1
21.	Regulations on the Council of Young Scientists	1
22.	Regulations on DPAE (departments)	1
23.	Regulations on conducting ongoing monitoring of the progress of intermediate and end-of course assessment of students	1
24.	Regulations on the development and approval of EP	1
25.	Rules for admission to residency for the 2022-2025 academic year	1
26.	CEP Order	1
27.	Order on the creation of an appeal commission	1
28.	Order on employment of a resident	2
29.	Protocol of the Academic Council	1
30.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/20/23	1
31.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/27/23	1
32.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the Mission	1
33.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the educational program	1
34.	Review of the educational program	1
35.	Certificate in Pedagogy Nurpeisova T.T.	1
36.	SOP on the development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements	1
37.	SOP-Rules-for-current-control-of-student-progress	1
38.	Strategic indicators 2022-2026	1
39.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 3 of 03/28/2023	1

40.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 5 dated 05/24/2023	1
41.	Agreement with the Eureka Press library	1
42.	Teacher Code of Ethics	1

ECAQA