

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Education and Health care

April 27, 2023

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAM
7R01152 "PATHOLOGICAL ANATOMY"
NJSC "ASFENDIYAROV KAZAKH NATIONAL MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY
SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: April 18-April 20, 2023

Almaty, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	6
2.1	Presentation of the NJSC “Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University” (KazNMU) and the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01152 “Pathological Anatomy”	6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	8
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01152 “Pathological Anatomy” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	9
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 “Pathological Anatomy” KazNMU	16
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 “Pathological Anatomy” KazNMU	38
6.	Recommendations to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	38
7.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 “Pathological Anatomy” KazNMU for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards	39
8.	Attachment 2. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation	40

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

Abbreviation	Designation
GPA	Weighted average assessment level of educational achievements of a student in the chosen specialty
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team-based learning
AIS – NJSC "KazNMU"	Automated information system of KazNMU
AC KazNMU	Academic Council of KazNMU
JSC RIC&IM	Joint Stock Company "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine"
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
BD (O)	Basic disciplines (training)
GD	General doctor
University	Higher educational institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
Civil Defense and Emergencies	Civil defense and emergencies
SCES	State compulsory education standard
DAD	Department of Academic Development
DS&HR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DET	Distance educational technologies
DEMW	Department of educational and methodical work
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care
FSA	Final state certification
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IEW	Individual educational work (resident)
KazIOR	Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology
CVI	Coronavirus infection
COC	Component of choice
CEP	Committee for educational programmes
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CEL	Clinical and experimental laboratory
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical education organization
MJ RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
NJSC "KazNMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
RI	Research Institute
Research Institute FAM	Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov

RWR	Research work of a resident
IQAA	Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education
SSC	Scientific student circle
STP	Scientific and technical programme
NCIE	National Centre for Independent Examination
SC	Science Centre
SCS	Scientific Centre of Surgery
SCOGP	Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology
SCP&PS	Scientific Centre for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery
FA&ER	First aid and emergency response
PO	Public organization
EP	Educational programme
DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
IC	Intermediate certification
MG (O)	Major disciplines (training)
PHC	Primary health care
FAS	Faculty and academic staff
NCDMP	Noncommunicable Disease Management Programme
RSE on REM	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management
WC	Working curricula
MM	Mass media
QMS	Quality Management System
SOP	Standard operating procedures
IWR	Independent work of residents
IWR	Independent work of resident
SC	Simulation centre
IWRST	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
TC	Typical curriculum
ERWR	Educational and research work of residents
EMA	Educational-methodical association
UC	University clinic
AC	Academic Council
CCU	Centre of collective usage
GCV	Graduate Career Centre
STE	School of teaching excellence

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" (KazNMU) and the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint-stock company (NJSC) «Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University». Since 2018 at KazNMU reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company (NJSC) in accordance with the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5, 2018 No. 166) and received the status of a research university (decree of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.11.2018).
Management body	Board
Full name of the chief executive officer	Shoranov Marat Edigeevich.
Created in	Order of the People's Commissariat of Public Health of the KASSR No. 206 dated November 30, 1930
Location and contact details	Almaty city, Tole bi street, 94, Tel/Fax: 8727/3387090 e-mail: info@kaznmk.kz Official website: www.kaznmk.kz
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	Attachment No. 002 of the State license for engaging in educational activities of the state license <u>No. KZ74LAA00017008</u> , received on September 19, 2019, Nur-Sultan from the 2023-2024 academic year.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Start of implementation in 2022
Duration of training	2 years
Number of residents in the current academic year	1 resident
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	The total number of trainers is 26, including full-time trainers - 15, part-timers - 11. Degrees, % - 46,5 % Category, % - 80

Since 2018 at KazNMU reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company (NJSC) in accordance with the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5, 2018 No. 166) and received the status of a research university (decree of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.11.2018).

KazNMU conducts training of students on the basis of 106 health care organizations, including 5 research centres affiliated with the university. There are also 4 university clinics: Aksai clinic, internal medicine clinic of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

The university successfully implements dual training with involvement in the development and implementation of educational programmes of employers and field training of interns and residents in

the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, branches of KazNMU in Taldykorgan, Taraz and Kyzylorda and other regions of Kazakhstan.

The first admission **to residency was held in 2022**. According to the LEA (Local executive authority), one resident was admitted to residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy".

Currently, in accordance with the state license No. KZ74LAA00017008 of 19.09.2019, training is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English at undergraduate and postgraduate levels of training in **44 specialties of residency**.

In KazNMU from 2016 to 2022, 5422 people received postgraduate education, including **719 residents**.

There was no employment of residency graduates in the last 5 years in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy". In other specialties, employment is 100%.

The staff of the University is 2099 people. Of these, the teaching staff - 1283, incl. academicians - 9, doctors of sciences - 151, candidates of sciences - 401, doctors of PhD - 20. The teaching staff of KazNMU has a high scientific and pedagogical potential. The holders of the grant of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "The best teacher of the Republic of Kazakhstan" are 17 university teachers.

In the international institutional rating ARES among Kazakhstani universities in 2020, KazNMU took the fourth place in the overall ranking of universities, and a leading position among medical universities of the republic.

According to the results of the rating assessment of medical universities, research institutes, scientific centres of the Republic of Kazakhstan, conducted by the Republican Centre for Health Development, according to indicators of scientific and innovative activities for 2019 and an assessment of the dynamics of rating indicators over the past three years, KazNMU took 1st place. In November 2019, KazNMU became the owner of the independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan" according to the international information and analytical platform Web of Science.

According to a social online survey, according to the information of the President of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan Ilyas Tustikbaev of NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU" entered the TOP 10 best universities in Kazakhstan.

According to the results of the National rating of the best universities in Kazakhstan -2019, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (IQAA), KazNMU took 1st place in the institutional rating in the category of medical universities. In the institutional rating of the IAAR in 2019, KazNMU took 2nd place in terms of demand.

In the published Webometrics Ranking of World Universities, which evaluates more than 30 thousand educational institutions around the world, KazNMU entered the four best sites in the country and in the 11 best sites in the world.

Currently, 40 educational programmes at 4 levels of education are accredited by the IAAR. Since 2018, KazNMU has a certificate of institutional accreditation for 5 years.

KazNMU is one of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty.

KazNMU is a member of the following international associations: **AMEE, Siberian Open University Association, UNAI**.

During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 124 cooperation agreements were concluded with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 34 countries of near and far abroad.

For the period from 2015-2016 academic years to 2019-2020 academic years, 107 visiting professors were invited. External outgoing and incoming academic mobility for the reporting period amounted to 59 university employees and **172 residents**. (different specialties).

KazNMU was visited by visiting professors from Turkey, Russia, Lithuania, Warsaw, Georgia, Ukraine, and Belarus. Academic mobility of professors and teachers –16. Outgoing external academic mobility **residents - 22** (different specialties).

In the framework of the Erasmus + program in 2015, agreements were signed with universities in Europe - Finland, Lithuania, Spain, and Estonia. In 2020, KazNMU won 4 grants for projects: AccelEd, HARMONE, LMQS, FOR21, aimed at promoting the modernization and sustainable development of the education and training system.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of KazNMU, which coordinates training in residency, is the **dean's office of internship and residency**, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the faculty of postgraduate education.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

EP 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" was developed and entered into the Register of Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education in 2022. Accreditation of the educational program of residency 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out for the first time.

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions.

Self-assessment report educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" (hereinafter - the report) presented on 89 pages of the main text, 9 attachments, copies and electronic versions of documents via the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/10y0AhpXymKMu9etl6Dag5FnGDwNv-I?usp=sharing>

The report is characterized by complete responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured according to the guidelines for conducting a self-assessment of an educational programme provided to an educational organization by the Accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector Shoranova M.E., confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains a list of 22 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment and writing a report. The self-assessment of the educational program of residency EP 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" was carried out on the basis of the order No. 41 dated 18.01.2023 «On the creation of a working group to prepare a self-assessment report and conduct primary specialized accreditation of educational programs for bachelor's, master's and residency programs». Responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program is Ph.D. Balapanova A.Kh. Chairman of the internal commission for self-assessment: Bayldinova C.Zh., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector of the Academic Block. Members of the internal commission, including representatives of students and employers, amounted to 5 people.

The report was reviewed by the national accreditation expert: MD, Professor Shabdarbayeva D.M. The review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback and appropriate changes and additions, were made to the self-assessment report.

All the standards provide real practice for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy", taking into account the beginning of student admission in 2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement and etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and

understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert assessment and conclusion

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and in accordance with the programme approved on April 10, 2023 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Board Chairman - Rector of the NJSC "KazNMU" Shoranov M.E.. Dates of the visit to the organization: April 18 – 20, 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 25 people, including employees related to the accredited educational program;
- interviews with residents – 8 people, including – 1 resident in pathology;
- study of the website info@kaznm.kz;
- interviewing 22 employees, 16 teachers (3 of them in pathology), 6 mentors (2 of them in pathology);
- questionnaires of teachers and residents – 16 and 8, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards:
- visits to the simulation center, library,
- clinical base
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 31 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in **Attachment 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, with EEC members

№	Ф.И.О.	Должность
1	Bayldinova Clara Zhenisovna	Vice Rector for Academic Affairs
2	Sultangazieva Svetlana Yeleusizovna	Vice-Rector for Clinical Affairs
3	Baimakhanov Abylai Niyatovich	Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education
4	Shopayeva Gulzhan Amangeldiyevna	Dean of the School GM 2
5	Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna	Head of the Department of Academic Work
6	Muhamedzhanova Symbat Allabergenovna	Head of Graduate Career Centre
7	Nagasbekova Bayan Serikkanovna –	Head of the Department of Development of Human Resources
8	Sapakova Madina Mukhtarovna	Head of HR Department
9	Tuleyev Bakyt Izyadinovich	Head of the Department of Clinical Work
10	Ensegenova Zoya Zharbulatovna	Chairman of the Committees of Educational

		Programmes (Postgraduate Education Division),
11	Saliev Timur Muydinovich,	Head of the Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov
12	Smailova Dariga Sansyzbaevna	Head of the Department of Science
13	Iskakov Serikzhan Sagimzhanovich	Financial director
14	Amangeldinova Gulzhan Anuarbekovna	Chief accountant
15	Balapanova Anar Khairzhanovna	Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine
16	Talkimbayeva Nailya Anuarovna	Head of the Simulation Center
17	Utebaliyeva Aliya Khakimzhanovna	Acting Head of the Library
Resident Program Teachers		
1	Shumkova Elmira Nikolaevna	Associate Professor of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine
2	Alsherieva Uldana Alsherievna	Associate Professor of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine
3	Serikbai Mereili Karmantaevna	Associate Professor of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine
Employers		
1	Khasanov Rufat Mirshatovich	Deputy Director of the MSE on REM "City Pathological and Anatomical Bureau" of Almaty
2	Satbayeva Elvira Bolatovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Center for Morphological Research at the Almaty Cancer Center
Mentors		
1	Dairbekova Zhibek Dairbekovna	Head department of the pathoanatomical department of JSC " Central Clinical Hospital "
2	Efimenko Irina Gennadievna	Head Department of Morphology of the Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology
Residents		
1	Simtikova Zhazira Kuttybaykyzy	Pathological anatomy

The sequence of the visit during April 18-20, 2023 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the Attachment to this report.

The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Bayldinova K. Zh. was introduced to the EEC and given information about the purpose of the visit. This interview provided evidence that the mission of the residency programme and the mission of the university are fully consistent with each other. The vice-rector voiced the strategy for the development of postgraduate education, including residency programmes, which indicates a clear vision of the university and an interest in improving residency programmes, taking into account the needs of practical health care. The experts asked questions about the academic workload of teachers, clinical mentors.

Meeting with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Baimakhanov A.N. and Deans of the Schools of Dentistry and GM2 allowed the experts to find out how the Internal Quality Assurance Policy in postgraduate education works in the context of the ESG. To search for evidence of compliance with standard 4, experts asked questions about the current status of a resident in accordance with the Health Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The following tasks of the dean's office were also analyzed - the formation of state orders for specialties, the admission of residents, the

provision of resources, the assessment of educational programmes of residency. It has been established that the dean's office closely cooperates with the departments that train residents. The resources of the residency program are provided by cooperation with such foreign partners as the Saratov State Medical University, as well as within the framework of the "Mevlana" academic exchange program. From the conversation with the dean, it was determined that the residents work in the clinics in a safe environment.

When interviewing the head of the Graduate Career Centre Muhamedzhanova S.A., the experts evaluated the approaches to the implementation of monitoring the employment of residents. In general, the employment rate is very high and amounts to 100%, at the same time it is necessary to conduct monitoring over several years. Residential graduates are employed in medical organizations in Almaty city, Almaty, Kostanay, Kyzylorda regions and other regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, due to which continuous feedback is maintained with practical healthcare. In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 22, 2016, the Supervisory Board operates at the university. The University organizes purposeful meetings with employers - when coordinating educational programs, catalogues of elective disciplines (CED); representatives of employers are members of the Clinical Council of KazNMU, at the meetings of which issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed. The experts studied the results of a survey of graduates and employers about the level of satisfaction of employers and other stakeholders with the quality of training of residents.

As a result of an interview with the head of the human development department resources Nagasbekova B.S. and the head of the personnel management department Sapakova M.M., the information was received on providing staff of the departments of residency, compliance with qualification requirements for teaching staff. Also, the policy of recruiting mentors, the system of motivation of teaching staff and mentors used in the university and its results were analyzed.

Head of the Department of Clinical Work Tuleyev B.I. reported to the experts on provision of resources for clinical practice and the work of residents, about cooperation with clinical bases. Residents in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy", will be trained at the following clinical bases: MSE on REM "City pathoanatomical bureau" of Almaty; Pathological Anatomical Department of JSC "Central Clinical Hospital". Clinical bases are equipped according to modern requirements for the pathoanatomical service. MSE on REM "City Pathological Bureau" of Almaty is located in a 5-storey new building, where there are therapeutic, surgical, oncological, gynecological, pediatric, cytological and other departments. The volume of surgical, biopsy and cytological materials is available in large quantities, which makes it possible to train residents from 10-15 people. All departments are equipped with modern equipment, to which there is free access. When visiting the clinical bases, we were impressed by the presence of a crematorium, which is the only one in Kazakhstan. The structure of the MSE on REM "City Pathological Bureau" of Almaty is also unique and the only one in the Republic of Kazakhstan and meets international standards. Clinical bases are accredited and have the US Gold Standard mark. ***The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the qualitative organization of the educational process and pathoanatomical assistance to the population of the region.*** A characteristic was given to mentoring in residency, representation of residents in the advisory and consultative agencies (ACAs) of the university - CEPs, Academic Committee.

During the interview with the chairmen of the committees of educational programs Baskakova I.V. and Ensegenova Z. Zh., they reported on the stages of development, examination and further analysis of the effectiveness of educational programs, monitoring for additions and changes. During the interview, issues of the work of committees, the functioning of internal working groups, the inclusion of residents and employers in their composition were discussed. Also, the chairmen of the CEP described the work of independent experts, a group of testologists who monitor the quality of classes, the quality of writing tests.

Interviews with residents were held,

The interview with 8 residents took place offline and it was possible to get answers to such questions as the possibility of using the library and other electronic resources, the availability of communication with teachers and clinical mentors, safety compliance during the COVID-19 pandemic at clinical sites using PPE, the implementation scientific works, the possibility of visiting residency and academic mobility, the availability of accommodation in a hostel. In general, all residents noted the sufficiency of library and electronic resources, compliance with protective measures, the availability of communication with university staff and representatives of practical healthcare, the conduct of scientific projects and the possibility of completing an on-site residency as part of an educational program in relevant medical institutions. Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of education, assessment of their skills, and advisory support. At the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and holding international events.

Interview with the head of the library Utebaliyeva A.Kh. made it possible to assess the availability of the residency program with educational, methodological and scientific literature, including electronic forms. The total number of basic recommended literature is 5 million 406 thousand, of which 235 thousand 14 are textbooks and manuals by Kazakh authors, the share of e-books is 0.6%. Thus, there are textbooks and monographs for the accredited program; however, it is necessary to update them with more recent editions. It is necessary to purchase textbooks and manuals for pathologists. There is access to 9 international databases, which provides the opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and other events.

The library provides remote access via the Internet to its electronic catalog fund, to world electronic resources, catalogs of leading foreign centres, universities, publishing houses, which provides an opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and other events. On an ongoing basis, the library organizes webinars and lectures.

Interview with the manager of SRIFM named after Atchabarov Saliev T.M. and Head of the Department of Science Smailova D.S. allowed the experts to learn about the scientific directions of the university, the system of motivation and participation in R&D of teachers of the departments of residency and residents, about the organization of R&D by residents on practice bases, the possibility of publishing R&D results of residents and teachers in journals, including the university Bulletin of KazNMU. In 2022, the University carried out 12 projects, 6 - within the framework of grant funding (MOH RK, MES RK), 6 - with other sources of funding for a total of 58,500 million tenge. ***A resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" performs research work together with a clinical mentor and with the staff of the department on an initiative topic and prepares scientific articles for publication.***

One of the important tools for accreditation expertise is the conducting interviews with employers - representatives of practical health care, who are not affiliated with KazNMU. During the interview process, it was possible to establish that, in general, employers are satisfied with the competencies of graduates. Interviews with employers for all educational programs of KazNMU residency applied for accreditation were conducted offline and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals to the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies of KazNMU, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, interaction with departments and the university as a whole, 100% employment of residency graduates. Thus, during the first day of the visit, the expert validated the data of the self-assessment report of the educational program according to standards 1,4,7,8,9,5,3 and partially 6.

The second day of the visit is April 19, 2023.

In order to assess the resources that ensure the effective implementation of the educational program, the expert visited the clinical bases of the MSE on the REM "City Pathological and

Anatomical Bureau” in Almaty; Pathological and anatomical department of JSC "Central Clinical Hospital". Clinical bases are equipped according to modern requirements for the pathoanatomical service. The MSE on REM “City Pathological Anatomical Bureau” in Almaty is located in a 5-storey new building, where there is a sectional hall equipped with modern exhaust systems, therapeutic, surgical, oncological, gynecological, pediatric, cytological and other departments. All laboratories are equipped with modern exhaust system equipment, which ensures the safety of training in residency. The volume of surgical, biopsy and cytological materials is very large, which allows training residents from 10 to 20 people. The cadaveric material is also available in the required quantity for training in residency in the specialty 7R01152 - Pathological Anatomy. All departments are equipped with modern equipment, to which there is free access. When visiting the clinical bases, I was impressed by the presence of a crematorium, which is the only one in Kazakhstan.

The structure of the MSE on REM "City Pathological Bureau" of Almaty is also unique and the only one in the Republic of Kazakhstan and meets international standards. Clinical bases are accredited and have the US Gold Standard mark. The clinical base has study rooms of the department, a conference room for 80 people, a room for residents, a room for rest and eating for residents, a shower room, a locker room, etc. Each resident has personal lockers for storing overalls and personal belongings. During a visit to the clinical base of the Pathological Anatomical Department of JSC “Central Clinical Hospital”, various laboratories with modern equipment, a large amount of cadaveric, biopsy, surgical and cytological materials of various directions were demonstrated. A resident in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" works with mentors on a wide range of pathoanatomical material, which allows you to gain high-quality knowledge and acquire practical skills at a good level. The rich and versatile in terms of nosologies, the pathoanatomical material of clinical sites can be a good help for clinical internships and academic mobility for residents of other medical universities in the specialty 7R01152 - Pathological Anatomy.

The clinic is equipped with modern equipment of the latest generation for a full and in-depth pathoanatomical diagnosis. Modern laboratories of clinical bases perform all types of laboratory research - histological, immunohistochemical, cytological and others.

The review of resources showed that the clinical base of the university for the implementation of the accredited educational program 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy", available for review at the time of the external visit, corresponds to the goals and objectives, as it has a sufficient number of thematic pathological materials (corpses, biopsies, surgical and cytological materials), modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the role of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality teaching in an ethical and deontological manner. Before the start of the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training.

The experts examined the documentation on the educational programme 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" by the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkTdJ5p-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing>., which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards, **including documentation about 3 teachers and 2 mentors of residents and at the request of EEC members.**

The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-check-lists, results of a questionnaire survey of residents).

The program of the expert's visit included a visit to the simulation center of KazNMU, equipped with 500 units of modern equipment. The area of the center is more than 2.7 thousand square meters. To implement the residency program in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy", the simulation center has: An adult model for mastering cardiopulmonary resuscitation, a Child model for mastering cardiopulmonary resuscitation; Harvey Plus - an advanced simulator for the physical examination of a cardiac patient; [A simulator for practicing injection skills in the shoulder joint with a mobile feedback device](#); where residents can form and develop the skills of a physical examination of a patient, emergency care, preparation for Independence attestation. In a conversation with the head of

the simulation center, MD. Talkimbayeva Nailya Anuarovna found out that the residents' classes are held according to the schedule and the topics are integrated into the working curricula. ***However, the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy", having its own specific features and a large amount of material at clinical sites, does not need mannequins and other equipment of the simulation center of KazNMU.***

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and teaching and methodological documentation is the Dean's office of postgraduate education, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentoring. In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained information about personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents and stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and teaching and methodological documentation is the **Dean's office of postgraduate education**, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentoring. In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained information about personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents and stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

In order to assess compliance with Standard 6, the experts were shown the distance learning platform and showed how it is used in training residents. For example, AIS-KazNMU, digital services.

Further, a meeting of the members of the EEC was held following the results of the external evaluation, and the experts came to the conclusion that during the second day of the visit it was possible to find evidence of the implementation of standards 2,3,6,7.

The third day of the visit is April 20, 2023.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation, the study of documents, the results of interviews, questionnaires was conducted. Generalizations of the results of external evaluation are made. The EEC members have started to draft the final report of the EEC. Experts have individually completed the "Quality profile and external evaluation criteria for the residency training programme in specialty **7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy"** for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards".

No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate sector of education in general and the department implementing the educational program were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

The chairman of the EEC prof. Kabyldina N.A. held a final open vote on recommendations for improving the residency educational program **7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy"** and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created; access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the Institute's corporate culture and the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to EEC members.

When conducting a survey of residents, the majority (78.9%) of respondents believe that accreditation of an educational institution and educational programs is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency, 21.1% doubt the answer. 42.1% of

residents believe that the interview with the university management is the most important tool for external peer review, 52.6% chose the "interview with teachers" option, 31.6% consider interviews with graduates as such, 36.8% answered that the interview with mentors of residents, 52.6% - interviews with residents, 26.3% - review of the resource base for training residents, 31.6% - attendance at practical classes and seminars., 5.3% of residents could not answer this question.

In the opinion of 78.6% of the teachers surveyed, they fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key activities of this organization, 14.3% partially agree with this, 7.14% found it difficult to answer.

Of all respondents, 78.6% believe that accreditation of educational programs is an important and effective mechanism for ensuring the quality of postgraduate education, 21.4% expressed the opinion that yes, it is, but in combination with other mechanisms (attestation, audits, independent assessment of students' knowledge).

At the end of the program of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations to the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment as part of specialized accreditation.

Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by the expert during the study of the self-assessment report, during the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, during the implementation of the activities of the **visit programme was analyzed at KazNMU** from April 18 to April 20, 2023. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, the information was validated for each criterion of the accreditation standards and the indicators of the Attachment to the self-assessment report were verified, which made it possible to ensure the reliability of the provided the university information and 31 documents confirming compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Before visiting the organization by examining the attachments to the report provided by the postgraduate education department and access to 31 documents in googledisk <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkTdj5p-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing>, experts reviewed more than 30 documents, as well as during an external expert evaluation by members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2025, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolios of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2023-2025 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal programme quality assurance systems, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), resources on residency on the website <https://kaznm.kz/>, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

The accredited educational program **7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy"** according to the current SCES was developed for the first time and is being implemented for 2 academic years, and at this time there is 1 student, admitted in 2022 on a grant from the local executive authority. The entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base is rated at compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students in other specialties, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development, evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of residents, the development of the content of individual plans of residents and the selection of mentors.

Recommendations for improving activities in the field of implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty **7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy"** for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on April 20, 2023.

The programme of the 3-day visit (April 18-20, 2023) of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the university staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created; access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of the employees of KazNMU responsible for the postgraduate education, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy".

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and final results

The mission of the educational program (hereinafter EP) in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" is aimed at realizing the mission of the University by preparing a qualified physician specialist in pathological anatomy and possessing a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity, organization and provision of qualified and specialized pathological care. The university is the largest medical university in the country, which trains specialists at all levels of higher and postgraduate education, in all areas of healthcare. The activity of the University is based on the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities to provide high-quality and modern medical care to the population and train professional personnel.

When implementing the activities of the visit programme, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, in interviews with residents and teachers compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, informational letters to medical organizations. The organization's 3-year strategic plan, which confirms compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrates the organization's goals, objectives, and prospects, was reviewed. From interviews with residents, it is established that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases. The University has all the resources necessary to develop professional qualities and achieve the final results stated in the mission of the educational program in accordance with national and international requirements and the needs of the healthcare sector.

The educational program in the specialty 7R01152 - Pathological Anatomy была developed in accordance with the State Educational Standards of residency in medical specialties, the standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of residency (Attachment 2). The educational program for the first year of residents who entered in 2022 was developed collegially (minutes of the meeting of the department No. 6 dated January 21, 2022) and approved at the meeting of the CEP of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education (No. 6 dated February 1, 2022) and the Academic Committee of the University (No. 10 dated June 21, 2022).

The mission of the EP was brought to the attention of all department employees, residents by posting syllabuses and information about residency on the University website (www.kaznmu.kz, Residency web page).

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational residency programme in specialty 7R01152 - Pathological Anatomy, and the educational process are built in accordance with SCES and current Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and health care.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Visiting the clinical base, attending open classes, meeting with teachers and residents allowed us to see that by adhering to a patient-centered approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism. The formation of professionalism is formed on the basis of direct training in the workplace, where residents are faced with clinical situations of post-mortem practice of various levels of complexity, learning from the experience of senior colleagues, and thereby building their own behavior model.

Based on the Law on Education RK, which establishes the autonomy of higher and postgraduate education organizations, which gives the right, based on the standard rules, SCES 2022, University determines independently the development of the educational programme, assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection of teachers, employment conditions and resource allocation. Freedom in composing EP is achieved when composing syllabuses, ESC, IEP, Working Curriculum, the form, structure and order of development of which is determined by the organization independently. All educational and methodological documentation is reviewed and approved at meetings of the CEP, Academic and Scientific Councils.

19 residents participated in the survey and questioning. Of these, 52.6% are residents of the first year of study, 47.4% are residents of the 2nd year of study. Including there was one resident in the specialty of Pathological Anatomy. According to the results of the survey (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), 73.7% of the respondents fully agree that they will recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives, partially agree - 21.0%, but not completely 5.3% agree with this statement. Fully agree with the statement that program managers and teachers are aware of the problems of residents related to education, 84.2% of residents, 15.8% partially agree. According to the survey results, 73.7% of respondents believe that program managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programs), 10.5% answered no, they do not, while 10.5% do not know about it, 0% doubt the answer, and 5.3% expressed the opinion that they are sometimes involved in this work. 68.4% of residents are fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, and 31.6% are partially satisfied. 78.9% of residents answered that they personally have access to equipment (training and real) in order to master practical skills in their specialty, partially agree - 21.1% During the interview, the resident pathologist expressed the opinion that there are no applicants for the specialty in "Pathological Anatomy" due to the fact that the interns do not consider this specialty attractive. But the resident and staff of the department are ready to carry out career guidance work.

28 teachers were interviewed, including those with experience from 5 to 10 years - 10.7%, over 10 years - 89.3%. Of all respondents, 78.6% are full-time teachers, 7.1% are part-time teachers, 3.6% are not involved in teaching residents, and 10.7% are mentors. 85.7% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 10.7% are partially satisfied, 3.6% completely disagree. 89.3% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and the workplace, and 10.7% are partially satisfied. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization: 71.4% fully agree, 25% partially agree, 3.6% partially disagree. 78.6% of respondents among the teachers surveyed in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" were highly qualified pathologists with academic degrees and extensive experience in this field.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

In the EP of residency in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy", developed on the basis of the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. MoH RK-63 dated July 4, 2022 "On approval of state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare", which takes into account the main end results of training resident.

At the end of the training, the resident should be able to:

- perform an autopsy using various methods, take autopsy material for histological, bacteriological, serological, virological testing, etc.
- maintain pathoanatomical documentation: write an autopsy report, a pathoanatomical epicrisis, formulate and rubricate a pathoanatomical diagnosis for various pathologies, be able to fill out a medical death certificate.
- carry out clinical and anatomical analysis and the principles of making a pathoanatomical diagnosis according to the section data. Explain data with additional research methods. Formulate, explain, express oral and written speech of a pathologist, and respond to clinical and anatomical conferences and medical control commissions.
- apply in system practice the skills of working with a microscope, a built-in digital camera of a microscope, illustrate slides, make presentations, write abstracts, articles. Participate in scientific research; analyze data from histochemical, immunohistochemical, morphometric and other scientific studies.
- having mastered this specialty, make the correct cutting of surgical material, mark and take pieces for histological examination, diagnose, differentiate, study, distinguish changes in organs and tissues in the study of surgical biopsy and cytological materials, interpret the results of immunohistochemical studies using knowledge of the pathogenesis and pathomorphology of a number of disease, including molecular biology in oncology.
- use communication skills and legal knowledge when analyzing the discrepancy between clinical and pathological diagnoses. Determine, interpret, classify, and formulate the causes and categories of discrepancies in diagnoses.
- demonstrate the skills of working with complex medical information systems, provide pathoanatomical documentation to the health authorities. Plan preventive measures aimed at improving the health of the population.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programmes.

Unanimously, 100% of teachers-respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

At one time, when talking with residents and employers, experts received a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, the educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational programme?". To these questions, residents answered that two residents are members of the Educational and Methodological Board, where the mission and final results of the EP were discussed, and employers answered that they are members of the Supervisory Board, at whose meetings issues related to the implementation of the Mission and final results are discussed.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 17 standards conform: fully – 17.

Standard 1: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Proof of compliance:

2.1 Key parameters of the postgraduate medical education programme

The educational process at KazNMU is organized in accordance with the “Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of training” (Order No. 152 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.04.2011).

For the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01152 Pathological Anatomy, the organization's documents contain EMCDs, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements is established. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, as the experts studied the Academic Policy and during the interview, the residents answered that they were aware of the content of this document.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in the classroom. Training in residency is carried out taking into account the principles of continuity of basic medical education, postgraduate and continuing medical education throughout the professional life.

The educational program of the residency in the specialty «Pathological Anatomy» follows the continuity of education based on the established final learning outcomes in undergraduate and internship programs. The transparency of the process of preparing residents, including methods, teaching and assessment tools is implemented by informing on the university website, AIS “Sirius”, the “Moodle” portal, “tester.kz”.

The mentoring system described in the document "Regulations on Clinical Mentoring" was evaluated. There are 3 mentors in total, whose tasks are to assist the resident in mastering and improving the necessary clinical skills – "on-the-job training".

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the “Academic Policy”.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. At the same time, the principles of quality and academic honesty are described in the “Academic Policy” document. KazNMU, in order to ensure the principles of academic honesty, in accordance with paragraph 37 of Appendix 5 of the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 3 595 “On approval of the Model Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations of the Relevant Types”, checks theses, master's theses, articles, monographs, methodological recommendations, textbooks, etc. for elements of plagiarism and to determine the level of originality using the StrikePlagiarism electronic software.

2.2 The scientific method

At the KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, scientific research is a mandatory component of training and involves the integration of educational, practical and research processes, with the result in the form of publications of scientific papers, speeches at conferences of various levels. All students of the residency programme are actively involved in the recruitment, analysis and statistical processing of material by employees of clinical divisions and the Department of Science.

Knowledge of the basics of evidence-based medicine is mandatory in the course of studying for a residency in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological anatomy". As part of the implementation of the IWR, the EP provides for training residents in the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data by writing essays, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline on topical problems of diagnosis and treatment of the most common oncological diseases. However, the criteria for the implementation of research and development activities by residents were not presented.

When talking to residents, experts learned that they use scientific data in training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. Teachers said that they teach residents the methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, as well as the application of scientific developments.

During interviews with residents, the resident pathologist noted his active participation in scientific work with the staff of the department and directly with the clinical mentor performs research work and prepared two scientific articles for publication. When questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

The content, scope and sequence of EP disciplines of the residency in specialty 7R01152 "Pathological anatomy" correspond to SCES, 2022. At the heart of achieving the objectives of training in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies, major disciplines (MD) of the main component and the component of choice.

Training in the residency 7R01152 "Pathological anatomy" is carried out on a full-time basis, the training period is 2 years in accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022. The educational program for the training of resident pathologists is designed for 140 credits: major disciplines (mandatory component) - 134 credits, optional component - 4 credits, final certification - 2 credits. Major disciplines are represented by the following:

General and private pathology - 30 credits; Forensic-histological pathomorphology-1, - 4 credits; Forensic-histological pathomorphology-2, - 13 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in surgery with cytopathology - 16 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in therapy - 14 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in obstetrics-gynecology with cytopathology - 14 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in pediatrics - 13 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in oncology with cytopathology - 20 credits; Clinical pathomorphology in dentistry - 10 credits.

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including a standard programme for specialty 7R01152 "Pathological anatomy" in 2022. The responsibility for selecting and implementing innovations in the educational process is borne by the Department and teachers of specialized disciplines.

For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy", there are sufficient resources to organize the assessment of the practical skills of residents (powerful clinical facilities that have in their arsenal comprehensive pathoanatomical material in the form of corpses, biopsy, surgical and cytological materials in large quantities and covering all nosologies listed in the SES 2022).

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. 89.5% of residents fully agree that the teachers provided them with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes.

2.4 Program structure, content and duration

The working curricula contain all the disciplines of the mandatory component of the standard curricula developed by the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan in this specialty, on the basis of which training is conducted. The distribution of disciplines by hours, semesters is carried out by the CEP and the dean's office of internship and residency in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard, Standard Curricula and the list of elective disciplines, agreed with the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. An individual working curriculum is formed for each resident for the entire period of study, agreed with the curator and approved by the dean of internship and residency. The individual work plan reflects the training schedule, class schedule (number of hours per day), a list of sections and disciplines, and the number of hours for sections and disciplines, types of training sessions, forms of knowledge control. The syllabuses indicate the place and time of training consultations for each resident.

The academic year provides for one academic period ending with intermediate certification (or final certification in the final year). Holidays are granted to students once during the academic year, the total duration of which is at least 5 weeks, with the exception of the final year.

Training in the residency programme includes classroom work, independent clinical work under the guidance of a teacher/clinical mentor, and the student's own independent work (hereinafter referred to as ISW). The volume of classroom work is 10% of the volume of each discipline, independent clinical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor-75%, ISW-15%.

The schedule of classes in the disciplines of the EP is completely satisfied by 94.7% of the residents surveyed.

2.5 Organization of training

The vice-rector for academic activities is the responsible vice-rector for the educational activities of the residency. Clinical sites are selected by the department, and their suitability for training in the residency program is determined by the department of clinical work. Training of residents in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" at the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a course of forensic medicine, is carried out at the MSE on the REM "City Pathological and Anatomical Bureau" in Almaty; Pathological and anatomical department of JSC "CCH". "City Pathological Anatomical Bureau" in Almaty is multidisciplinary and allows residents to work with versatile pathoanatomical material corresponding to the cycles of disciplines. The clinic has been accredited. Drawing up an agreement and a comprehensive plan for joint work with clinical sites is under the control of the Department of Clinical Work of KazNMU.

The management of the educational process reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Postgraduate Education Center and conversations with the manager and employees. At the same time, the verification of **standard 2** showed that there is all the necessary documentation for the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy".

The experts got acquainted with the work of the pathoanatomical departments of the clinical bases, visited the libraries, a total of 11 meetings were held and during the cross-interview it was established that the implementation of the educational program meets the requirements.

In a conversation with residents, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

When conducting a survey of residents - to the question about the number of seminars that are held within a month within the framework of the residency program, 52.6% answered that the seminars are held once a week, 26.3% answered, 21.1% answered that the seminars are held daily.

73.7% of residents are sure that this educational organization allows to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty, 10.5% cannot answer this question yet, 15.8% answered that they would like to believe in it.

Of all the respondents, 78.9% rate the organization of clinical training excellently, 10.5% had a good impression, and 10.6% were not satisfied.

They fully agree that the teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for them as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech), 89.5% of residents, 10.5% answered that they completely disagree.

84.2% of respondents are completely satisfied with the number of patients for curation or assistance in operations, 10.5% are completely dissatisfied, 5.3% did not answer. 100% of residents believe that there is enough time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assisting in operations).

Most of the interviewed teachers (85.7%) fully agree that residents have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving practical skills, 14.3% agree partially.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. Residents are trained directly in the pathoanatomical departments of clinical bases. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in KazNMU (Regulations on mentoring).

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully -29, partially-1, do not meet-0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance by residents (2.2.1.).

Standard 3: EVALUATION OF STUDENTS

Proof of compliance:

3.1 Evaluation methods

The applied system of evaluation of knowledge, skills and abilities, studying at KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov corresponds to the accepted practice at the national level and is defined in the SOP "Development and approval of a system for evaluating educational achievements." According to the Academic Policy of KazNMU, the syllabuses for each discipline indicate the types of final control and the calculation of the final grade for the discipline / module. The indicated calculations of the admission rating evaluation (ARE), final control evaluation (FCE) of the discipline/module are entered into the AIS "Sirius" by the employees of the EMA, the Department and the Department of Digitalization and are used in the system when generating the statement of the ARE and final grade. The type of control, teaching method and evaluation methods are taken into account when filling out the electronic journal of the teaching staff of the departments in the AIS "Sirius" and determines the peculiarity and originality of the electronic journal SOP "Maintaining an electronic journal".

To validate the evaluation of residents, employees of basic institutions, patients (360-degree assessment) are involved. Scientific work is reviewed and evaluated when residents speak at conferences, articles are published. Review of control and measuring instruments is carried out at several levels - within the department - from an employee of the department, within the university - from a university employee or external review, when employees of external organizations, associations or employers act as reviewers. Reviews are recorded at a meeting of the department or meetings of the CEP.

The study of control and measurement tools (tests, situational tasks, control questions) showed that KazNMU has implemented a proper evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, residents talked about the evaluation forms, such as the use of evaluation sheets to evaluate practical skills and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of evaluation results is reflected in the document "Academic Policy" and during the period of work of the educational organization, there were no applicants to appeal.

So, to verify the data of **Standard 3**, the experts asked the Heads about where the rules for conducting current, intermediate and final certification are prescribed, and checked the documents and methods for evaluating residents. There is a database of 250 test tasks compiled by EP developers and approved at the AC meeting. Control and measurement tools are reviewed by internal and external experts. The head of the Department of Education replied that additions and updates of the CIS (Corporate information system) are planned to be carried out annually..

During a visit to the clinical base and during an interview with the head of the department of pathological anatomy with a course of forensic medicine Balapanova A.Kh., the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents, in full educational and methodological documentation (EP, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, sheets), certificates and certifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary EMCD for residents and there is information that is regularly updated.

The survey showed that 89.5% of residents are completely satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, and 10.55% would like to change.

Of all respondents, 94.7% answered that teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom, 5.26% expressed the opinion that such teaching methods are used only occasionally.

According to the results of the survey, 73.7% answered that after the completion of classes, the teacher constantly conducts feedback with them (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes), 26.3% believe that sometimes.

3.2 Relationship between evaluation and learning

During the visit to KazNMU, the EEC members confirmed that the methods of evaluation of residents are comparable to the methods of teaching and learning and cover the evaluation of all competencies of students, both during practical classes and during exams.

The results of the residents' evaluation are documented as follows: evaluation sheets are filled in; the evaluation is displayed, and entered in the journal.

The Department evaluates the reliability and validity of assessment methods by examining evaluation sheets on an ongoing basis, analyzing and approving tests.

When conducting interviews with teachers regarding evaluation methods, experts received convincing information that an objective evaluation of theoretical knowledge should be carried out using an oral survey and testing, practical skills using checklists. Residents also shared their opinion on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting counselling before exams, understanding the entire evaluation procedure and its fairness.

During the visit, the management was asked: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?". And the answer was received that during the Final state certification of residents, leading specialists from practical health care are involved as Chairperson and members of the SAC. In the specialty "pathological anatomy" there has not yet been a graduation of residents.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the evaluation of knowledge and practical skills, namely, a simulation centre with evaluation sheets for each practical skill.

The interviewed 11 representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of KazNMU graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since residents are trained in a clinic with all powerful human resources and the necessary full equipment to provide qualified and high-tech care to cancer patients. Employers said that they themselves participate in the evaluation of residents, as they are included in the examination boards. But the educational organization did not conduct systematic feedback with them. Employers believe that the skills of graduates of the residency programme, such as critical thinking and communication skills, they wanted to see the strongest.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria. Out of 11 standards conform: fully-11.

Standard 3: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 4: Residents

Proof of compliance:

4.1 Admission and selection policy

The admission policy is detailed on the KazNMU website. The resident consulting service is represented to the admission committee, the dean's office (dean, deputy dean, chief specialist, and specialist), and employees of the registrar's office, DIT, libraries, curators, clinical mentors, the military department, accounting, head of legal and passport and visa work. The head of the Department spoke about the policy of accepting residents. Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, Admission to the residency programme is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of RoK" On approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education " dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, SCES RoK-2022.

Applications for the residency programme are accepted from July 3 to July 25. Entrance examinations for the residency programme are held from August 8 to August 16, and enrollment is

held until August 28. Residency classes start on September 01. Admission of citizens to the residency programme is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance exams. Applicants to the residency programme pass an entrance exam in their specialty. When applying for a residency programme, the applicant's personal achievements, results of research work, etc. are also taken into account. The key role in assessing the previous level of education is played by the entrance exam in the specialty, which includes 4 sections evaluated on a 100-point assessment scale, where:

- 30% is the sum of the average GPA score for the internship period (15%) and the average GPA score in the bachelor's degree (15%) or GPA for all 6-7 years of study (if there is no GPA in the transcript, the average score for the application is calculated (converted to a 4-point scale));

- 30% - evaluation of the 1st stage of the final state certification (FSA) of course 6-7 (independent testing conducted by NCIE); an applicant from another university brings an assessment of the first stage of independent testing signed by the head and stamped by the training organization; if the applicant did not have an independent testing assessment in the year of completion of the internship, the applicant passes testing in NCIE according to the selected EP before submitting documents to the admissions committee.

- 30% - entrance exam in the specialty in the scope of the previous education programme, which includes situational tasks in the profile specialty, related disciplines and is formed on the basis of standard programmes in higher education disciplines on the issues posted on the website;

- 10% - availability of scientific publications in peer-reviewed journals (including CCES) with an electronic link to the publication.

Admission to the residency programme is carried out based on the results of the entrance exam for the profile and those who have scored at least 50 points out of a possible 100 points for the paid department. Persons who have scored the highest points in the entrance exam are eligible for training under the state educational order on a competitive basis: for residency - at least 75 points. Evaluation of knowledge based on a point-rating system, taking into account all forms of activity – scientific, educational, etc. - ensures the validity of the resident admission procedure and guarantees the availability of the necessary basic knowledge of applicants.

According to the Rules of admission to the residency programme in the 2022-2023 academic years, in the case of the same indicators of competitive points, the persons who have the highest score in the specialty receive a preferential right to enroll, in the case of the same indicators of the entrance exam in the specialty.

The duration of mastering the educational programme of residency in specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" is 2 years. Changes regarding admission to residency are reflected in the Academic Policy of the university (p. 15), in the admission rules. So, for example, in 2020, in accordance with the circular letter of the Ministry of Health (ref. No. 14-02-11 / 3875-I dated 16.07.2020), 2020 internship graduates must be employed in medical institutions by July 22 of this year in accordance with the decision of the Republican commission on the personal distribution of young professionals dated June 30, 2020. A prerequisite for admission to residency in 2020 and 2021 is the availability of a job in medical organizations. Persons working in provisional, infectious disease hospitals, polyclinics, ambulance stations will have the priority right in the competitive selection.

On the KazNMU website <https://onco.kz> / information materials on admission are presented – a list of documents, programmes for admission; Academic policy, catalog of elective subjects, academic calendar, schedules. The page is accessible to an external user.

The number of residents is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical health care.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all the criteria meet, there are no shortcomings. Experts got acquainted with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the "Academic Policy". Experts interviewed clinical mentors about the practice of academic counseling, personal support for residents, and the development of other professional skills. The organization has a resident development programme that includes residents in advisory bodies such as CEP, AC and the Council of Young Scientists.

4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the MoH RoK State Order for the Training of Medical Personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical and practical training, the maximum allowable load on the Institute's teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, as well as the material and technical resources of the University.

Since the program 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" is new, the admission of residents was in 2022 under the grant of the local executive authority, only 1 resident.

4.3 Support and advice to residents

During the conversation of EEC experts with a resident pathologist, it was established that KazNMU has created and provides safe training conditions for residents. To protect the interests of residents and provide them with assistance in academic, scientific, and extracurricular activities, there is provided various services for organizing counseling, psychological, social, and medical support for students. EEC experts have confirmed that experienced teachers and professors are involved in the consultation. In addition, before the start of each module, the group teacher informs its residents about the schedule of their work, the time when residents can seek advice on this discipline.

For personal growth and development, sports and creative events, the team has a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% WIFI coverage of the centre's territory, library, computer classes, reconstructed and improved territories of the centre's buildings). The study rooms are equipped with projectors, a screen, a video wall, and all necessary office equipment.

Implementation of the residency training programmes in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" will be ensured by free access of each resident to information resources and library collections, availability of methodological manuals and recommendations for all modules, disciplines and all types of academic work.

To develop the intellectual level of residents and expand their knowledge in various scientific fields, residents take an active part in the International Scientific and Practical Conference and Congresses of Oncologists and Radiologists, which is held annually by the Institute. Residents are involved in the work of the Council of Young Scientists, which also addresses emerging issues.

According to the survey data: in the process of teaching residents, various teaching methods are used: lectures (39.3%), oral discussion of the topic (53.6%), problem-oriented learning (78.6%), interactive learning (60.7%), essay writing (7.1%), implementation of projects, term papers (17.9%), practical training in clinical skills in the educational and clinical center (53.6%), analysis of situational tasks (82.1%), compilation and solution of cases (50%), oral survey of students (64.3%), solving tests (67.9%), working in small groups (50%), writing assignments (39.3%). 32.1% of the teachers who passed the survey conduct seminars with residents once a week, 3.6% - daily, 25% - 2-3 times a week, 10.7% - 1-2 times a month, 14.2% are engaged only in clinical training of residents, 3.7% - have nothing to do with it, 10.7% - could not answer this question.

4.4 Resident representation

During the conversation with representatives, it was found out that the quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the EP mission, which is available through posting on the KazNMU website. Along with supervisors and teachers, includes residents to participate in the review of issues related to the educational process and approval of training materials for residency, the development of an individual working curriculum and elective subjects. This fact was also confirmed by residents during their interviews. *According to the survey results, 73.7% of respondents believe that program managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programs), 10.5% answered no, they do not, while 10.5% do not know about it, 0% doubt the answer, and 5.3% expressed the opinion that they are sometimes involved in this work.*

When visiting the EEC experts, it is confirmed that feedback is collected from residents at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of studying the discipline), as well as on issues related to learning/working conditions, problem situations.

4.5 Working conditions

Combining training with work (no more than 0.5% of the rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty, in his free time, is allowed with the consent of the curator, head of the department and curator.

If you have a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd year of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, during extracurricular hours.

During a visit to the clinical base by EEC experts, it was established that residents have unlimited access to pathoanatomical materials and objects, all types of medical equipment and to all departments of clinical bases. 78.9% of residents answered that they personally have access to equipment (training and real) in order to master practical skills in their specialty, partially agree - 21.1%. There are rooms for conducting theoretical classes with residents, there is a separate room for changing clothes, for eating, etc.

68.4% of residents are fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, and 31.6% are partially satisfied.

During their training, residents of the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" actively participate in pathoanatomical conferences, master classes, scientific and practical conferences.

The academic load of residents is planned in accordance with the RoK Law "On Education". The class schedule from 08.00 to 17.00 hours is regulated by the EP developed on the basis of SCES 2022, sanitary and epidemiological rules and regulations, curricula and recommendations of health and education authorities.

Residency work is the main and dominant responsibility of a resident.

In EP, a balance of all types of activities is observed: autopsy of corpses, cutting of cadaveric, biopsy and surgical materials, description of glass preparations, registration of a protocol for a pathoanatomical examination of a corpse, etc., participation in clinical and anatomical conferences, etc. A schedule is drawn up for the stay of a resident in a certain pathoanatomical unit of the clinical base, according to the discipline. For residents with work experience, an individual learning path can be provided (when rotating by department), and the choice of elective discipline also affects to the learning path.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully-30.

Standard 4: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

Proof of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

The EEC experts confirmed that, according to the SCES (as amended in 2022), persons assigned to resident doctors to master the necessary theoretical and practical skills are appointed from among the teaching staff and/or practical health workers with an academic degree, first or highest qualification category, who have appropriate training in the field of medical education.

Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine has a sufficient number of teachers for the successful implementation of the educational program for residency in the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy». To work with residents in the 2022-2023 academic year, 3 employees were involved, who are certified and qualified pathologists with extensive work experience, 3 mentors with the highest qualification category in their specialty. Clinical and research work experience of teaching staff is over 5 years. The main indicators that characterize specialists engaged as teaching staff for residents are the following characteristics: the presence of an academic degree and title, scientific and pedagogical experience and experience in the occupying position,

activity in scientific and methodological and research work, etc. The selection of teaching staff in accordance with the established requirements, analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of teaching staff, monitoring and evaluation of teaching activities are the objects of constant attention on the part of the centre's management. The staff of the residency teaching staff is determined in accordance with the main provisions of the Order of the Minister of Health RoK of June 14, 2004 No. 474 "On approval of the norms for calculating the cost of training for one student, residency student, master's student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order".

In order to verify the data of **standard 5**, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the policy of recruitment and admission of teachers and clinical mentors, stimulation and motivation of practical health professionals. The conversation with the Head of HR Department of KazNMU, included such questions as how specialists are involved and motivated in educational activities and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of the clinical base for teaching (there are 11 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers, information support of the educational programme, as well as identify problems related to management and development of human resources, as most part-timers do not know the teaching methodology.

When questioning teachers, it was found that 89.3% are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and the workplace. In this organization of education, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 78.6% completely agree. Respondents who satisfied with wages - 57.1% fully agree, 25% disagree. There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization: 71.4% fully agree, 25% partially agree, 3.6% partially disagree.

5.2 Teacher commitment and development

During the conversation between the EEC experts and representatives of the management staff, it was established that the personnel policy of the KazNMU for Development of Personnel consists in planning, developing measures to encourage and reward achievements in work. Types of incentives and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

One of the priority areas of development of teaching staff is to improve the level of pedagogical skills. Teaching staff have the opportunity to take various scientific and practical trainings and internships. During the reporting period, advanced training in pedagogy in the following cycles was received: "Methodology of education in healthcare", "Effective communicator", "Development of communication skills of teachers of clinical disciplines in higher education institutions", "Training of teaching staff of clinical departments of higher education institutions", etc.

In order to verify the data of **standard 5**, during a meeting with the head of the HR department, and during an interview with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes organizing cycles of improvement of pedagogical qualification (certificate of completion of a cycle of 60 hours), financial incentives in the form of employee bonuses. However, given the level of EP - residency, the experts identified a limited opportunity for international professional internships for teaching staff. *Regarding support for participation in conferences (international, republican), 39.3% of teachers paid travel, business trip, registration fees, 10.7% - only travel, 21.4% did not pay expenses, 10.7% found sponsors, 7.1% did not contact the management about this, 10.7% did not answer.* Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. Confirmation of this fact was obtained during a conversation with residents.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 71.4% of the surveyed teachers answered that they agree with this. 39.3% studied at professional development programs during this year, 53.6% from one year to 5 years. 53.6% of

respondents studied at professional development courses from 1 to 5 years ago, 39.3% - during this year, more than 5 years 7.1%.

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 57.1% answered that “yes, such programs exist”, 17.9% of respondents answered that they doubt it, and 25% of respondents do not know about it.

Of all the respondents, 75.0% note that the management of the organization systematically listens to the opinion of teachers regarding questions on the educational process, research, clinical work, 14.3% believe that sometimes, 10.7% did not give an answer.

According to the results of the survey, 82.1% of teachers fully agree that they can be realized as professionals in their specialty in this educational organization, and 17.9% agree partially.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: fully – 6, partially-1, do not meet-0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

1) Increase the number of international clinical internships (5.2.4.).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Proof of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

University has a well-developed material and technical base for professional training of residents in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological anatomy". The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, cultural and social facilities, university clinics, clinical bases - leading medical institutions in Almaty.

Auditorium fund. Lecture halls are equipped with the necessary technical support - stationary multimedia projectors and are designed for 2040 seats. To develop a unified corporate culture among students and employees of the University, 9 lecture halls are equipped.

All clinical bases have training rooms that are equipped for classes; they have the necessary furniture, teaching aids, including personal computers and multimedia projectors.

Questioning of teachers showed that 71.4% of respondents fully agree that the organization has enough equipment and resources to conduct training for residents on accredited programs, 25% agree partially, 3.6% doubted the answer.

The teachers answered that during the lessons, they have a syllabus and EMCD (96.4%), control and measuring tools (75.0%), an educational journal (60.7%), monographs (46.4%), a journal of registration of working off (25.0%).

The level of previous training of residents upon admission to training programs is fully satisfied by 57.1% of respondents, partially - by 39.3%, 3.6% did not give an answer.

85.7% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, 10.7% are partially satisfied, 3.6% completely disagree.

6.2 Clinical databases

Review of the resources of the clinical bases of the MSE on REM "City Pathological Bureau" of Almaty; The pathological department of JSC "CCH" showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and employees provide a collegial and ethical relationship with medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of resident pathologists. A sufficient number of thematic pathological materials (corpses, biopsies, surgical and cytological materials) is provided, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the role of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality teaching in an ethical and deontological manner. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills they should acquire and develop during their training.

During a visit to the clinical base, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with the training programme of resident pathologists, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts have obtained evidence of compliance with **Standard 6**, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of EP residency «Pathological Anatomy», interviews were conducted with resident pathologists. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for the section, work with glass slides, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and teacher qualifications, social and moral support, participation in "Magazine Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature as a resource. In general, residents are satisfied with the training and assessment methods, and purposefully enrolled in KazNMU, as they believe that this educational organization has good resources, image and international connections. Residents showed their commitment to the University, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, financing. Experts studied residents' documents (portfolio, results of resident assessment-check lists, and results of residents' surveys).

6.3 Information technology

In order to implement the tasks of digital transformation with the use of modern IT technologies, KazNMU developed and approved the Program "Informatization Roadmap - 2021" (Order of the Acting Rector No. 30 dated February 7, 2017 based on the decision of the University Council dated January 31, 2017, Protocol No. 3). Information support for the work of residents in the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» is carried out through: the media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.), the website of the university and the clinical base; electronic running letters; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the administration, deans.

When preparing educational and methodical literature, teachers use the library's educational resources (electronic textbooks, electronic manuals, and scanned educational literature), the Internet, as well as the results of their own scientific and research activities. *63.2% of residents are fully and 15.8% partially satisfied with the library fund of KazNMU, while 21.0% are partially dissatisfied. 84.2% of residents are fully provided with the necessary educational literature, 5.3% answered that they were partially provided, while 10.5% believe that they were not provided with the necessary literature.*

In the clinical bases of the MSE on REM "City Pathological Bureau" of Almaty; Pathological and anatomical department of JSC "CCH", there are opportunities to hold conferences, meetings, classes in a remote format. For this purpose, special Microsoft teams 365 and Zoom programmes are used, which provide free communication between teachers and residents via the Internet.

6.4 Clinical teams

Every day, the resident pathologist participates in reviewing glass preparations with mentors on biopsy, surgical pathoanatomical materials. If there is a section, they open corpses, cut out cadaveric material, draw up protocols for pathoanatomical autopsy, etc. Residents themselves also conduct seminars on topical problems of pathological anatomy, where students are both students of all levels, and healthcare professionals and teaching staff.

Students and residents develop coordination skills to work with colleagues and other healthcare professionals during examination, patient care, and especially when providing care to patients.

Students have free access to patients on clinical bases and all conditions for improving their practical skills-85,7 % of teachers fully agree with this.

6.5 Medical research and achievements

Scientific research of the employees of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a course of forensic medicine underlies the scientific work of the residents. During the conversation with the residents, it was found out that they are actively involved in the implementation of the scientific work of the department and clinical sites. *78.9% of residents confirmed that they are currently engaged in*

scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor, 10.5% have started planning the implementation of research, 10.5% of residents have not been offered research by the teacher.

Interviews with teachers showed that there are no problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (access of residents to the equipment, a sufficient number of thematic pathoanatomical materials, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

Examination of the quality of the implemented educational program for residency at the University is a systemic process and is carried out by the following structures: DAD (approval of the EP), Dean's Office of Internship and Residency (implementation of the EP), Committee of Educational Programs (CEP) (planning, development and evaluation of the EP), DEMW (monitoring OP), Quality Management System Department. The CEP includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, and students. The Accreditation and Rating Department monitored various aspects of educational activities in order to obtain independent information aimed at improving the quality of the organization of the educational process. In the process of each study, recommendations were formed for making amendments in order to improve the organization of the educational process at the departments and modules of the university.

Expertise is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of the methods of training residents, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. *According to the results of the survey, 94.7% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the location of the seminars, the topics of the seminars), 5.3% are partially satisfied.*

6.7 Training in other institutions

The possibility of training residents in other medical organizations is provided by the concluded agreements of the University with the Health Departments of 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 16 agreements / memorandums with foreign universities and research centres in 27 countries of the world. The possibility of academic freedom is determined by the fact that the EP is developed on the basis of the National Qualifications Framework, corresponding to the qualifications framework for the European Higher Education Area.

Experts have established that there is no jointly developed EP residency in the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» with partner universities.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully-21.

Standard 6: completed

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

After analyzing the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy», the experts of the EEC found that Monitoring and evaluation of the EP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including the profiling / graduating and related departments, specialized CEP, DAD, Academic Council, Senate, student government, Centre for Admission and Career Guidance of Students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programs through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students)).

Created by a team of authors of the EP in the specialty 7R01152 "Pathological Anatomy" was discussed at the level of the department staff (discussion in the working group, at the meeting of the department (Minutes No. 6, 21.01.2022), in the CEP of the School of General Medicine-2 (Minutes No. 01.02.2022), Academic Committee (Minutes No. 10, 21.06.2022) and approved by order of the Vice-Rector of the Academic Block No. 24/2, 21.07.2022. The EP was introduced for the first time,

when uploaded to the Republican Register of Educational Programs, it was reviewed, adjusted with the participation of external reviewers.

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education (as amended and supplemented as of July 7, 2020)", "Rules for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of teaching staff and researchers of KazNMU", The University has a quality control system for educational and methodological documentation, including the content of educational programs.

In order to monitor the implementation of the EP and as problems are identified, including those related to resource provision, the following documents are approved and updated at the University: [Regulations on educational programs of KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarova](#), SOP "[Formation, discussion of educational programs \(EP\)](#)" (order No. 600 of 02.08.2018). SOP "[Formation, discussion, approval of CED](#)" (order No. 12 of 25.08.2022), SOP "[Monitoring the quality of the educational process, the use of active teaching methods and multilingualism in departments](#)" (order No. 4 of 14.01.2020), SOP "[Assessment and analysis of educational programs of KazNMU](#)" (order No. 3 of 26.11.2020), IND "[Regulations on methodological work](#)" (order No. 498 of 26.11.2020), "[Regulations on educational programs of KazNMU](#)" (order No. 12 of 12.07.2021).

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational program on a regular basis through various [feedback channels](#). Feedback on the EP of the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» at the Department is carried out once a year, the head of the department and the teacher responsible for residency are responsible for collecting and processing the results of the discussion.

The QMS department monitors the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university. In the 2022 academic year, [the degree of satisfaction with the educational programs](#) of graduate students was 90%, a high level of satisfaction was noted with regard to the state of clinical facilities, technical equipment, and the attitude of teaching staff.

The results of the feedback are analyzed, discussed at meetings of the departments, CEP, AC, published on the university website (www.kaznmu.kz). The main principles of the survey of consumers of educational services are:

1. Compliance of the questionnaire content with the strategic goals and objectives.
2. Anonymity of participation.
3. Systematic and consistent survey procedures.
4. Use standardized survey procedures and criteria.
5. Continuity.
6. Informative content.

The survey is conducted according to the following types: "Teacher through the eyes of students", "Students' satisfaction with the conditions and results of training", "Satisfaction with infrastructure", "Graduate satisfaction with the quality of training", "First-year student questionnaire". The survey is conducted online via Google, as well as on paper. The coverage of respondents in various questionnaires ranged from 75% to 95%.

Based on the results of the survey "Teacher through the eyes of students", a report and reference are compiled for each teacher with an assessment of students. Materials of the survey of all interested parties (students, employers, and teachers) are discussed at the Department and an analytical report based on the results of the survey is considered. The report data is analyzed, compared with real facts, cause-and-effect relationships are clarified, and then a decision is made to make changes to the organization of the educational process, EP.

For the purpose of feedback, an annual survey of employers is conducted. Thus, the degree of satisfaction of employers with graduates of the Institute is assessed to determine whether the educational programme meets the real requirements of the labour market, opportunities for its improvement, as well as the degree of compliance of graduates' competencies with workplace positions.

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by the results of the final certification of residents conducted at the testing stage by the National Independent Examination Centre, as well as the results of certification exams conducted by the Control Committee for Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» the final state certification is planned to be carried out in 2 stages: determining the level of theoretical training in disciplines in the form of testing; certification of practical skills on a corpse and glass preparations.

The QMS department monitors the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university. In the 2022 academic year, [the degree of satisfaction with the educational programs](#) of graduate students was 90%, a high level of satisfaction was noted with regard to the state of clinical facilities, technical equipment, and the attitude of teaching staff. There has not yet been a graduation in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy".

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

The participation of a wide range of stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement of educational programs at KazNMU is provided by authorized bodies in the field of education and health (MoH RoK), members of the public, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education:

1. MoH RoK - independent assessment of knowledge residents.
2. Employers.
3. Representatives of the Committee for the Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Services and representatives of practical healthcare.

However, EEC experts noted an insufficiently broad representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies.

All interested parties (teaching staff, residents, employers) are involved in the program evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational program is regulated by the Charter of the university, the strategic plan for the development of the university, annual plans and reports of the university, as well as the relevant QMS procedures. The evaluation results are heard at meetings of the Clinical Council, Schools, MC and the Academic Council, published in the university newspaper and on the university website.

Interviews with employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approving educational programmes

The educational programme for the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» is developed in accordance with the SCES and the Standard Curriculum for this specialty.

University has developed mechanisms for [approving educational programmes](#) that provide for evaluating programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analyzing results and implementing changes, which allows monitoring the EP implementation process and the progress of residents, and provides identification and timely resolution of emerging problems.

The EP is examined for compliance with SCES, approves the CED according to the proposals of stakeholders and taking into account pre - and post-requirements, and evaluates the choice of methods for evaluating residents' learning outcomes. A systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP is carried out in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the

requirements of employers, the effectiveness of training methods), as well as evaluating the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process, and evaluating the quality of the EP. For this purpose, an external assessment of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

Questioning of teachers showed that 75% confirmed that they are personally involved in the development of methodological materials for the residency program, 21.4% participate partially, 3.6% answered that they are provided with ready-made methodological developments.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully – 14, partially-1, do not meet-0.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies. (7.4.2.)

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Proof of compliance:

8.1 Management

The guarantee of implementation of EP specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» is its strict compliance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the learning process, evaluation of knowledge and skills, established learning outcomes, programme management, which are regulated in the Republic of Kazakhstan by the MoH RoK and MES RoK regulations.

Graduates who have completed the EP of residency in the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» and successfully passed the FSA will be issued a state document confirming the qualification of a pathologist. In accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of RoK dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of types and forms of state-issued educational documents and their Rules" in accordance with subparagraph 6-3) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 a certificate of completion of residency will be issued, and after passing the FA, the NCIE a certificate of a specialist without a category in the specialty will be issued.

All activities related to the implementation of the EP are carried out under the direct control of the educational departments, members of the committee of educational programs, dean's office, and independent experts.

The transparency of the management of the EP is carried out by discussing the educational and methodological documentation for the residency program at meetings of the departments / modules of the CEP, AC of the KazNMU and, after receiving their positive conclusion, is approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. Syllabuses, test tasks will be placed in [AIS "Sirius"](#).

In order to quickly bring useful information to residents and teachers, there is an electronic moving news line in the centre of the University campus, the information for which is updated daily. In KazNMU, the [rector's blog](#), once every two months, a meeting of the rector with students is held.

Questioning of teachers showed that 82.1% of respondents were completely satisfied with the work of the postgraduate education department, 10.7% - partially, 7.1% doubted the answer. According to the survey, 96.4% of teachers fully agree that KazNMU observes ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers and management; the remaining 3.6% completely disagree.

89.3% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and the workplace, and 10.7% are partially satisfied.

8.2 Academic leadership

Management of the educational process, including at the postgraduate level, is carried out in accordance with the [organizational structure of KazNMU](#). The executive body of the University is its Rector, Chairman of the Board. The Rector, the Chairman of the Board of the University is personally

responsible for the financial and economic activities, the safety of the property of the University, for organizing the fight against corruption, establishes the competence of the provost, vice-rectors and other senior officials of the University, resolves all issues of the University's activities in accordance with its competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and The Charter of KazNMU. Residency issues are under the supervision of the vice-rector for academic activities in terms of the educational process and the provost in terms of clinical activities.

Direct management of residency programs and coordination of the activities of residents from the moment of the existence of the residency will be carried out by the Dean's Office of the FPE (Faculty of Postgraduate Education). The activity is managed by the dean, who is appointed to the post by order of the rector. The general management of the dean's office is carried out by an elected representative body - the Faculty Council, which organizes its work under the guidance of the dean of internship and residency. The composition of the Council is approved by order of the vice-rector. The Dean's Council consists of the following positions: Dean of the Faculty of Internship and Residency (Chairman of the Council); heads of departments, professors and associate professors of departments; representatives of stakeholders (interns, residents, employers). The dean's office is responsible for making the following decisions: the development and approval of the mission of the programs, the rules for organizing the educational process in residency, recommendations for the recruitment of residents, which train residents. The dean's office exercises control over residents, maintains relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of residency programs (DAD (DP&CEP and EMA), DIT). For the purpose of effective management of the educational process, the CEP is functioning.

75% of the teachers answered yes to the questionnaire «Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work?».

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of the university is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of university and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Financing of the residency program depends on the formation of the annual state order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the financing of undergraduate, graduate, doctoral and residency programs by type of educational institutions, is determined.

8.4 Administration and Management

The University annually makes amendments and additions to the organizational structure. The staffing of departments/modules that provide educational residency programs is approved annually, taking into account changes in the number of residents. According to Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-III, the total number of faculty members is formed based on the average ratio of residents and teachers - 3:1.

In order to ensure the organization of the activities of the University and the training of personnel to the needs of the labour market, since 2005 the University has established and operates a quality management system. In the same year, the QMS department was organized. Until 2011, the QMS was certified by NQA Russia No. 21225 versions. In 2019, KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov successfully passed the re-certification audit for compliance with the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001:2015, conducted by the international certification body SGS (Switzerland), UKAS management systems.

The system of internal evaluation, monitoring of the work of the teacher and the achievement of the intermediate and final results of educational programs is carried out through the certification of teaching staff for all types of activities.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The University determines and approves the educational programme for the specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy» according to SCES MoH RoK No. 647 dated 20.07.2022. The programme is approved in close cooperation with all interested parties. The structure and content of the WC correspond to the SCES specialty 7R01152 «Pathological Anatomy», the programmes of the disciplines is developed at the proper scientific and methodological level. The sequence of studying the residency disciplines is constructed using a system of pre - and post-requirements.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 15 standards conform (including 8 basic, 7 upgrade standards): fully – 15.

Standard 8: completed.

There are no recommendations for improvements identified during the external session.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Proof of compliance:

KazNMU always strives to respond in a timely manner to changing internal and external conditions. In order to continuously improve the educational process, in accordance with the best practices of the world educational management, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare of the RoK, which is under reform, it regularly initiates a review and update of processes.

The resident selection policy, resident selection and admission methods are adapted annually to changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in basic medical education and curriculum requirements.

The regulation on mentoring is updated annually in accordance with the changing needs in postgraduate education. A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of educational residency programs is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the Institute for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of information and communication technologies, as well as the strengthening of public health care.

Develop organizational structure, management to address the changing circumstances and needs of post-graduate training, and collect the interests of various stakeholder groups over time.

One of the significant changes aimed at improving work with graduates of KazNMU, on the basis of the Division for the distribution and employment of graduates, the Graduate Career Centre was created.

Conclusions of the EEC on criteria. Out of 4 standards conform: fully-4

Standard 9: completed

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.

Conclusion: When conducting an external evaluation of the educational program, it was found that out of 147 standards (including 91 basic standards and 56 improvement standards), 144 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 90 basic standards and 54 improvement standards. There are partially achieved 1 basic standard and 2 improvement standards. No non-compliance with standards has been established. The implementation of improvement standards indicates the compliance of the educational organization with international consensus in such areas as education, clinic and science.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme “ Pathological Anatomy ”:

1. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D performance (2.2.1)
2. Increase the number of international clinical internships for teaching staff (5.2.4)
3. Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies (7.4.2)

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

EEC members determined the compliance of the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01152 – «Pathological Anatomy» with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	ФИО	Подпись
Председатель	Кабилдина Найля Амирбековна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Катрова Лидия Георгиевна	
Академический эксперт	Алдабергенова Тауржан Калибековна	
Академический эксперт	Султанова Гулнар Достановна	
Академический эксперт	Маукаева Сауле Боранбаевна	
Академический эксперт	Шабдарбаева Дария Муратовна	
Представитель работодателей	Вовк Виктор Евгеньевич	
Представитель резидентов	Абылгазиева Айдана Бакытжановна	

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01152 - "Pathological Anatomy" (generalization)

Standard	Evaluation criteria	Number of standards	Basic standards / Standards Improvements	Rating		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	10/7	10/7		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	30	22/8	21/8	1	
3.	EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS	11	7/4	7/4		
4.	RESIDENTS	30	18/12	18/2		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF	7	5/2	5/1	1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10/11	10/11		
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	15	10/5	10/4	1	
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8/7	8/7		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1	1/0	1/0		
	Total:	147	91/56	90/54	3	
				144	3	

**List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of the primary specialized accreditation of
the educational program
7R01152 - «Pathological Anatomy»**

№	Наименования документов	Количество	Дата утверждение
1.	КИС	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 07.06.2022
2.	Силлабус	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 07.06.2022
3.	Положение о педагогической нагрузке	1	Протокол АС № 12 от 25.08.2022
4.	Положение о клинических наставниках	1	16.09.2019
5.	Выписка об обсуждении ОП	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 21.01.2022
6.	Выписка об утверждении КЭД	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 28.10.2022
7.	Каталог элективных дисциплин	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 07.06.2022
8.	Рецензии на ОП	3	Протокол заседания кафедры от 07.06.2022
9.	Образовательная программа резидентуры	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 21.07.2022
10.	Анкеты от обучающихся по формированию КЭД	1	Протокол заседания кафедры от 28.10.2022
11.	Портфолио резидента	1	Резидентов – 1
12.	Оценочные листы	5	Резидентов – 1
13.	Договор с клинической базой между КазНМУ и КГП на ПХВ «Городское патологоанатомическое бюро» г. Алматы; Патологоанатомическое отделение АО «ЦКБ».	2	От 01.09.2022
14.	Выписка из протокола заседания кафедры об утверждении годового отчета за 2021-2022уг	1	от 07.06.2022
15.	Сертификаты о прохождении повышения квалификации по педагогике	5	Наставник Балапанова А.Х.
16.	Анкеты от работодателей	5	