

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare  
May 5, 2023

**REPORT  
OF EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME  
7R01151 "PHTHISIATRY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN"  
NON-PROFIT JSC "KAZAKH NATIONAL MEDICAL UNIVERSITY NAMED  
AFTER N. S.D. ASFENDIYAROV FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE  
ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION  
PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL  
EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

**External expert evaluation period: April 18-20, 2023**

**Almaty, 2023**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2-3
1	Composition of the external expert commission	4-5
2	General part of the final report	5-9
2.1	Presentation of the Non-profit JSC “Kazakh National Medical University named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov” (KazNMU) and an educational programme in the specialty - "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	5-7
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions	8-9
3	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9-16
4	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	16-33
5	Recommendations for improving the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	33
6	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	34
7	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	35
8	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	36-37

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

Abbreviation	Designation
GPA	Weighted average assessment level of educational achievements of a student in the chosen specialty
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team-based learning
AIS – NJSC "KazNMU"	Automated information system of KazNMU
AC KazNMU	Academic Council of KazNMU
JSC RIC&IM	Joint Stock Company “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine”
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
BD (O)	Basic disciplines (training)
GD	General doctor
University	Higher educational institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
Civil Defense and Emergencies	Civil defense and emergencies
SCES	State compulsory education standard
DAD	Department of Academic Development
DS&HR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DET	Distance educational technologies
DEMW	Department of educational and methodical work
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care
FSA	Final state certification
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IEW	Individual educational work (resident)
KazIOR	Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology
CVI	Coronavirus infection
COC	Component of choice
CEP	Committee for educational programmes
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CEL	Clinical and experimental laboratory
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical education organization
MJ RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
NJSC "KazNMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
RI	Research Institute
Research Institute FAM	Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov

RWR	Research work of a resident
IQAA	Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education
SSC	Scientific student circle
STP	Scientific and technical programme
NCIE	National Centre for Independent Examination
SC	Science Centre
SCS	Scientific Centre of Surgery
SCOGP	Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology
SCP&PS	Scientific Centre for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery
FA&ER	First aid and emergency response
PO	Public organization
EP	Educational programme
DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
IC	Intermediate certification
MG (O)	Major disciplines (training)
PHC	Primary health care
FAS	Faculty and academic staff
NCDMP	Noncommunicable Disease Management Programme
RSE on REM	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management
WC	Working curricula
MM	Mass media
QMS	Quality Management System
SOP	Standard operating procedures
IWR	Independent work of residents
IWR	Independent work of resident
SC	Simulation centre
IWRST	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
TC	Typical curriculum
ERWR	Educational and research work of residents
EMA	Educational-methodical association
UC	University clinic
AC	Academic Council
CCU	Centre of collective usage
GCV	Graduate Career Centre
STE	School of teaching excellence

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint stock company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, BIN 181240006407
Management body	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first head	ShoranovMaratYedigeyevich
Date of establishment	1930
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan postal code 050012, Almaty, Tole bi street, 94 Tel/Fax: 8727/3387090 e-mail: info@kaznmu.kz Official website: www.kaznmu.kz
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	State license No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated September 19, 2019
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Operational management of the Zhambyl Higher Medical College and the West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College (Uralsk).
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	The educational programme is undergoing initial accreditation, which is a condition for the admission of residents in 2023.
Duration of study	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the educational programme	The first release is planned for 2025
The number of residents at the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	No
Full-time teachers/ part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % degree	The total number of teachers is 11, including full-time - 11, part-time - 0. Degree, % - 72 Category, % - 100 H
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	www/ kaznmu.kz, Instagram - @kaznmu, Facebook - @КазНМУИМ.Асфендиярова

Since 2018, KazNMU has been reorganized into a non-profit joint-stock company (Non-profit JSC) in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5, 2018 No.166) and received the status of a research university (Decree of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 12, 2018). Non-profit joint stock company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" provides high-quality training of specialists at all levels of higher and postgraduate education in all areas of healthcare. The status of a research university creates conditions for the integration of scientific activities, the educational process and clinical activities.

KazNMU trains students on the basis of 106 healthcare organizations, including 5 research centers affiliated with the university. There are 4 clinics of the university: the clinic "Aksay", the clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, the professorial clinic of KazNMU, the dental clinic.

The university successfully implements dual training with the involvement of employers in the process of developing and implementing educational programmes and field training for interns and residents in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, branches of KazNMU in Taldykorgan, Taraz and Kyzylorda and other regions of Kazakhstan.

The first admission to residency was held in 2008. The first release of residents was carried out in 2010.

Currently, in accordance with the state license No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated September 19, 2019, training is provided in Kazakh, Russian and English at undergraduate and postgraduate levels of education in 44 residency specialties.

In KazNMU, from 2016 to 2022, 5422 people received postgraduate education, of which 719 people were residents. The employment of residency graduates over the past 5 years was 100%.

The staff of the University is 2099 people. Of these, the teaching staff - 1283, incl. academicians - 9, doctors of sciences - 151, candidates of sciences - 401, doctors of PhD - 20. The teaching staff of KazNMU has a high scientific and pedagogical potential. The holders of the grant of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "The Best Teacher of the Republic of Kazakhstan" are 17 teachers of the university.

In the international institutional ranking ARES among Kazakhstani universities in 2020, KazNMU took the fourth place in the overall ranking of universities, and the leading position among the medical universities of the republic.

According to the results of the rating assessment of medical universities, research institutes, scientific centers of the Republic of Kazakhstan, conducted by the Republican Center for Healthcare Development, in terms of scientific and innovative activities for 2019 and an assessment of the dynamics of rating indicators over the past three years, KazNMU took 1st place. In November 2019, KazNMU became the owner of an independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan" according to the international information and analytical platform Web of Science.

According to a social online survey under the information of the President of the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan Tustikbayev Ilyas, NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" entered the TOP 10 best universities in Kazakhstan"

According to the results of the National Ranking of the Best Universities in Kazakhstan - 2019, conducted by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IAQAE), KazNMU took the 1st place in the institutional ranking in the category of medical universities. In the institutional rating of the Independent agency of accreditation and rating 2019, KazNMU took the 2nd place in terms of demand.

In the published rating Webometrics Ranking of World Universities, which evaluates more than 30 thousand educational institutions around the world, KazNMU entered the top four sites in the country and the 11 best sites in the world.

Currently, 40 educational programmes at 4 levels of education are accredited by the Independent agency of accreditation and rating. Since 2018, KazNMU has a certificate of institutional accreditation for 5 years.

KazNMU is one of the founders of the League of "Academic exactingness", the purpose of which is to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty.

KazNMU is a member of the following international associations: AMEE, Siberian Open University Association, UNAI.

During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 124 cooperation contracts were concluded with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 34 countries of near and far abroad.

For the period from 2015-2016 academic year to 2019-2020 academic year, 107 visiting professors were invited. External outgoing and incoming academic mobility for the reporting period amounted to 59 university employees and 172 residents.

KazNMU was visited by visiting professors from Turkey, Russia, Lithuania, Warsaw, Georgia, Ukraine, Belarus. Academic mobility of professors and teachers -16. Outgoing external academic mobility of residents - 22.

In the framework of the Erasmus + programme in 2015, contracts were signed with universities in Europe - Finland, Lithuania, Spain, Estonia. In 2020, KazNMU won 4 grants for projects: AccelEd, HARMONE, LMQS, FOR21, aimed at promoting the modernization and sustainable development of the education and training system.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of KazNMU, which coordinates training in residency, is the dean's office of internship and residency, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the faculty of postgraduate education.

EP 7R01151 - "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" was developed and entered into the Register of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education in 2022. Residency programmes at the University are implemented in accordance with Attachment No. 002 of the State License for Educational Activities No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated September 19, 2019. The structure and content of the EP are developed in accordance with the requirements of the State compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes for medical and pharmaceutical specialties, approved by order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No.ПДСМ-12/2020. Accreditation of the educational programme of residency 7R01151 "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" is carried out for the first time. The enrollment of students is planned for the 2023-2024 academic year.

The mission of the University was first formulated in 2012, revised in 2017. The latest version of the mission of the University, in connection with receiving the status of a research university, developed by the Development Programme for 2019-2023, was updated and approved by the Board of Directors. The mission of the University is published on the KazNMU website.

The mission of the educational programme (EP) 7R01151 - "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" is aimed at realizing the mission of the University by training a qualified physician specialist in adult and pediatric phthiisiatry and possessing a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity, organization and provision of qualified and specialized TB care.

## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

The educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults and children" was developed and introduced into the Register of Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education in 2022. Accreditation of the educational programme of residency "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" is carried out for the first time.

## **2.3 Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" for compliance with the accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions**

The self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 82 pages of the main text, attachments on 6 pages, copies or electronic versions of 3 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/10y0qAhpXymKMku9etl6Dag5FnGDwNv-I?usp=sharing>

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to the criteria of all 9 accreditation standards, criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is

accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector Shoranov Marat Yedigeyevich, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the self-assessment report provided by the accredited organization.

The report contains a list of members of the internal commission on self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Baimakhanov A.N., Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

The Chairperson of the internal commission for self-assessment: Baidinova K.Zh., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector of the Academic Block.

**Members of the internal commission, including representatives of students and employers**

1. Sultangazyieva S.Ye. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector
2. Davletov K.K. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector
3. Karibayev K.B. - Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry named after Kh.Dosmukhamedov
4. Sakipova Z.B. Doctor of Sciences in Philology, Dean of the School of Pharmacy
5. Ivanchenko N.N. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies
6. Baimakhanov A.N. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education

**The composition of the internal commission for self-assessment according to the criteria of specialized accreditation**

Rakisheva A.S. Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Phthysiology

Syzdykova N.S. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Phthysiology

Usatayev M.M. Head of the Department of Strategic Development and International Cooperation

Masanova A.A. head of QMS department

Tashetova A.B. Head of the Department for Academic Work

Tazhiyeva A.Ye. PhD, Head of National Project and Programme Management

Kutyshcheva A.T. head of the educational and methodological department

Alchimbayev A.B. Head of Digitalization Department

Nabiyeva G.S. Head of Registrar's Office

Tazhiyeva A.Ye. PhD, Head of National Project and Programme Management

Talkimbayeva N.A. Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Simulation Center

Iskakova S.S. Head of Student Admissions Office

Makhmutov S.K. head of the Department of social and educational work

Abubakirov A.Ya. Master of Medicine, Assistant of the Department of Phthysiology

Nagasbekova B.S. Head of Human Resources Development Department

Sapakova M.M. Head of Human Resources Office

Utesheva G.S. Acting Head of the Department of Clinical Work

Saliyev T.M. head of the Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B.Atchabarov

Oradova A.Sh. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Head of DAD

Modovov N.A. head of the Scientific Library

Abylgazina A.Ye. Candidate of historical sciences, Head of Academic Quality Department

Kodekova G.S. Deputy Head of DAD

Aimakhanova A.Sh. Chairman of quality assurance commission (QAC), Head of the Department of Biostatistics and Fundamentals of Scientific Research

The self-assessment of the educational programme "Phthysiatry for adults, children" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of the university No. 31 dated January 18, 2023 "On the creation of a working group to prepare a self-assessment report and conduct primary specialized accreditation of educational programmes for bachelor's, master's and residency programmes."



The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert MaukayevaSauleBoranbayevna and the reviews noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback from the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards provide the actual practice of KazNMU in training residents in the specialty “Phthiisiatry for adults, children”, taking into account the start of enrollment of students in 2023. The self-assessment report contains reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of teachers, mentors, administration, information on selection and admission, methods for assessing knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (medical organizations, universities, associations, practice bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear, understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables are referenced in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults and children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and in accordance with the programme approved on March 30, 2023 by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector of KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov Shorayev Marat Yedigeyevich. Dates of the visit to the organization: April 18-20, 2023

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- conversation with management and administrative staff - 25 people;
- interviews with residents - 8 people;
- study of the website - [www.kaznm.kz](http://www.kaznm.kz);
- interviewing 22 employees, 16 teachers, 6 mentors;
- questioning of teachers and residents - 16 and 8, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visits to the simulation center, library, clinical base - National Center for Phthiisiatry, Bekkhozhin Str. 5, where residency training "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" is conducted with the participation of 7/4 full-time teachers / part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 31 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of examined documents is in **Attachment 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with EEC members**

<b>№</b>	<b>FULL NAME</b>	<b>Jobtitle</b>
1	Baildinova Clara Zhenisovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
2	Sultangazieva Svetlana Yeleusizovna	Vice-Rector for Clinical Affairs
3	Nakhanov Abylai Niyatovich	Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education
4	Altynbekov Kubeisin Duisenbaevich	Acting Dean of the School of Dentistry
5	Shopaeva Gulzhan Amangeldievna	Dean of the School OM 2
6	Tashetova Aigul Balabekovna	Head of the Department of Academic Work
7	Mukhamedzhanova Symbat Allabergenovna	Head of the Alumni Career Center
8	Nagasbekova Bayan Serikkanovna	Head of Human Resources Development Department
9	Sapakova Madina Mukhtarovna	Head of Personnel Department
10	Tuleev Bakyt Izyadinovich	Head of the Department for Clinical Work
11	Ensegenova Zoya Zharbulatovna	Chairperson of the Committee for Educational Programmes (Postgraduate Education Faculty),
12	Baskakova Irina Valentinovna	Chairperson of the Committee for Educational Programmes the school of Dentistry
13	Saliev Timur Muydinovich	Head of Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov
14	Smailova Dariga Sansyzbaevna	Head of the Department of Science
15	Iskakov Serikzhan Sagimzhanovich	Financial Director
16	Amangeldinova Gulzhan Anuarbekovna	Chief Accountant
17	Kaidarova Dilyara Radikovna	Head of the Department of Oncology named after prof. S.N. Nugmanov
18	Adenov Malik Moldabekovich	Acting Head of the Department of Phthisiopulmonology
19	Balapanova Anar Khairzhanovna	Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine
20	Ruzuddinov Turetai Beksautovich	Head of the Department of Pediatric Dentistry
21	Menchisheva Yulia Alexandrovna	Head of the Department of Surgical Dentistry,
22	Aldasheva Maya Akhmetovna	Head of the Department of Therapeutic Dentistry
23	Altynbekov Kubeisin Duisenbaevich	Head of the Department of Orthopedic Dentistry
24	Talkimbayeva Nailiya Anuarovna	Head of the Simulation Center
25	Utebalieva Aliya Khakimzhanovna	Acting Head of the Library
	<b>Residency programme teachers</b>	16, including phthisiatry - 3, including:
1	Rakisheva Anar Saduakasovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Phthisiopulmonology
2	Syzdykova Nurbibi Syzdykovna	Candidate of Medical Science, Associate Professor of the Department of Phthisiopulmonology
3	Abubakirov Amanzhan Yarmagametovich	Assistant of the Department of Phthisiopulmonology, Master
	<b>Employers</b>	11, including in the direction of phthisiatry - 0
	<b>Mentors</b>	6, including in the direction of phthisiatry - 0
	<b>Residents</b>	8 (other specialties)

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external

evaluation, the study of documents, the results of conversations, interviews, and questionnaires was held. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. The expert individually completed the “Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme of Residency in specialty “Phthiisiatry for Adults, Children” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards”.

EEC members made no comments. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, the chairperson prepared a draft report with recommendations and the chairperson of the EEC prof. Kabildina N.A. held a final open vote on recommendations for improving the educational programme of the residency "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council - to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years. Then, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external evaluation as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

When conducting a survey of residents, 92% rated the work of the External Expert Commission for Accreditation positively, 8% - satisfactory. The majority of respondents - 78.9% believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programmes.

According to 78.6% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations to the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation. The sequence of the implementation of the visit during 18-20.04.2023 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the attachment to this report.

The EEC members were introduced to Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Baidinova K.Zh.; information about the purpose of the visit was given. This interview provided evidence that the mission of the residency programme and the mission of the university are fully consistent with each other. The Vice-Rector announced a strategy for the development of postgraduate education, including residency programmes, which indicates a clear vision of the university and an interest in improving residency programmes, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare. The experts asked questions about the academic workload of teachers, clinical mentors.

Meeting with Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education Baimakhanov A.N. and the Deans of the Schools of Dentistry and OM2 allowed the experts to find out how the Internal Quality Assurance Policy in Postgraduate Education functions in the context of ESG. To search for evidence of compliance with standard 4, the experts asked questions on the current status of a resident in accordance with the Health Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The following tasks of the dean's office were also analyzed - the formation of a state order for specialties, the admission of residents, the provision of resources, the evaluation of residency educational programmes. It has been established that the dean's office closely cooperates with the departments that train residents. The resources of the residency programme are provided by cooperation with such foreign partners as the Saratov State Medical University, as well as within the framework of the “Mevlana” academic exchange programme. A conversation with the dean determined that residents work in clinics in a safe environment.

During an interview with the head of the Alumni Career Center Mukhametzhanova S.A. experts assessed approaches to monitoring the employment of residents. In general, the employment rate is very high at 100%, while it is necessary to monitor for several years. Residency graduates are employed in medical organizations in Almaty city, Almaty, Kostanay, Kyzylorda regions and other regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, due to which continuous feedback is maintained with practical healthcare. In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 22, 2016, the Supervisory Board operates at the university. The University organizes focused meetings with employers - when coordinating educational programmes, catalogs of elective disciplines (CED); representatives of employers are members of the Clinical Council of KazNMU, at the meetings

of which issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed. The experts studied the results of a survey of graduates and employers on the level of satisfaction of employers and other stakeholders with the quality of training of residents.

Interview with the head of the human resources development department Nagasbekova B.S. and the head of the department for personnel work Sapakova M.M. included obtaining information on staffing the residency department, compliance with qualification requirements for teaching staff. The policy of recruitment of mentors, the system of motivation of teaching staff and mentors used in the university and its results are analyzed.

Head of the Department for Clinical Work Tuleyev B.I. reported to the experts on the availability of resources for clinical practice and the work of residents, on cooperation with clinical bases. Residents in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" will be trained at the clinical base: National Scientific Center for Phthiisopulmonology(NSCP). The equipment of clinical bases contributes to the qualitative organization of the educational process and the provision of specialized and highly specialized inpatient and outpatient care to the population of the region. A characteristic was given to mentoring in residency, representation of residents in the advisory and consultative bodies (ACB) of the university - CEP, Academic Committee.

Interview with the chairpersons of the committees of educational programmes Baskakova I.V. and Yensegenova Z. Zh.; they reported on the stages of development, examination and further analysis of the effectiveness of educational programmes, monitoring for additions and changes. During the interview, issues of the work of committees, the functioning of internal working groups, the inclusion of residents and employers in their composition were discussed. Also, the chairperson of the CEP described the work of independent experts, a group of testologists who monitor the quality of classes, the quality of writing tests.

Interview with the acting head of the library Utebaliyeva A.Kh. made it possible to assess the availability of the residency programme with educational, methodological and scientific literature, including electronic forms. The total number of basic recommended literature is 5 million 406 thousand, of which 235 thousand 14 textbooks and manuals of Kazakhstani authors, the share of e-books is 0.6%. Thus, according to the accredited programme, there are 6 textbooks on phthiisiatry edited by Muminov T.A., edited by Rakisheva A.S. and others in sufficient quantity (460), more than 30 monographs, quarterly journals on phthiisopulmonology, there is access to 9 international databases, which provides an opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and other activities.

The library provides remote access via the Internet to its electronic catalog fund, to world electronic resources, catalogs of leading foreign centers, universities, publishing houses, which provides an opportunity for residents and teachers to participate in research and development and other events. The library regularly organizes webinars and lectures.

The programme of the visit of the expert included a visit to the simulation center of KazNMU, equipped with 500 units of modern equipment. The area of the center is more than 2.7 thousand square meters. To implement the residency programme in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children", the simulation center has: An adult model for mastering cardiopulmonary resuscitation, A child model for mastering cardiopulmonary resuscitation; Harvey Plus - an advanced simulator for the physical examination of a cardiac patient; A simulator for practicing injection skills in the shoulder joint with a mobile feedback device; where residents can form and develop the skills of a physical examination of a patient, emergency care, preparation for Independence attestation. In a conversation with the head of the simulation center, Doctor of Medicine Talkimbayeva Nailiya Anuarovna it was found out that the residents will attend the center according to the schedule and the topics will be integrated into the working curricula of the residency.

Interview with the head of the Research Institute of Fundamental and Applied Medicine named after B. Atchabarov Saliyev Timur Muidinovich and the head of the Department of Science Smailova Dariga Sansyzybayevna allowed the experts to learn about the scientific directions of the university, the system of motivation and participation in research and development of teachers of

residency and residents departments, the organization of the implementation of research and development by residents on the bases of practice, the possibility of publishing the results of research and development by residents and teachers in journals, including the university Bulletin of KazNMU. In 2022, the University carried out 12 projects, 6 - within the framework of grant funding (MOH RK, MES RK), 6 - with other sources of funding for a total of 58,500 million KZT.

One of the important tools of accreditation expertise is interviews with employers - representatives of practical healthcare who are not affiliated with KazNMU. A total number of interviewed people is 16. During the interview process, it was possible to establish that, in general, employers are satisfied with the competencies of graduates. Interviews with employers for all educational programmes of residency of KazNMU applied for accreditation were conducted offline and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of consultative bodies of KazNMU, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates. Employers also made a proposal to expand the base for residents to undergo on-site residency not only in central city clinics, but also in district ones, subject to the possibility of implementing an educational programme, since this expands the range of key competencies of a resident and allows early formation of independence in managing patients and forming a clinical thinking.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and educational and methodological documentation is the Dean's Office of Postgraduate Education, and teachers are more involved in the practical training of residents and mentorship. In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received information about the personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation for working with residents, and mentoring. The experts revealed that teachers will initiate research and development topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical records.

Interviews were held with 8 residents, which took place offline. During the interview, it was possible to get answers to such questions as the possibilities of using the library and other electronic resources, the availability of communication with teachers and clinical mentors, safety during the COVID-19 pandemic at clinical bases using PPE, performing scientific work, the possibility of on-site residency and academic mobility, availability of accommodation in a dormitory. In general, all residents noted the sufficiency of library and electronic resources, compliance with protective measures, the availability of communication with university staff and representatives of practical healthcare, the conduct of scientific projects and the possibility of completing an on-site residency as part of an educational programme in relevant medical institutions. Residents showed their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the educational organization, assessment of their skills, and advisory support. At the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and holding international events.

In order to assess compliance with standard 6, the distance learning platform was demonstrated to the experts and how it is used in the training of residents. For example, AIS-KazNMU, digital services.

To assess the resources that ensure the effective implementation of the educational programme, the expert visited the clinical base of the National Scientific Center for Phthisiopulmonology (NSCP). NSCP is deployed for 350 beds and is represented by 3 therapeutic departments, 2 surgical departments: bone surgery and children's and adolescents, an admission and consultation department, a modern reference laboratory, a pathomorphological department, an X-ray tomography department, a

clinical and biochemical laboratory, an ECG, ultrasound, blood room, resuscitation, bronchology department, epidemiological, organizational and methodological department, monitoring department.

The review of resources showed that the clinical base of the university for the implementation of an accredited educational programme, available for review at the time of the external visit, meets the goals and objectives, as it has a sufficient number of case patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the role of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he/she should acquire and develop during the training. Employees have prepared educational and methodological documentation and a resource base. The clinical base has conference rooms with Internet access, classrooms equipped with multimedia installations for conducting the theoretical part of the lesson, and a sufficient number of case patients.

The experts studied the documentation on the educational programme "Phthisiatry for adults, children" at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkTdJ5p-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing>, which confirmed the compliance with the accreditation standards, including documentation on 7 teachers and at the request of EEC members.

On April 19, 2023, an ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of residents and teachers on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

#### **Conclusion based on the results of the external evaluation:**

The EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by the expert during the study of the self-assessment report was analyzed, during the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of the activities of the visit programme of KazNMU from April 18 to April 20, 2023. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, there was a validation of information for each criterion of accreditation standards and verification of the indicators of the attachment to the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided by the university and confirming 31 documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Before the visit to the organization, by studying the attachments to the report provided by the Department of Postgraduate Education and access to 31 Google Drive documents <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FjbOSq-JcHvquVn42DkTdJ5p-VCFLmbb?usp=sharing>, more than 30 documents were reviewed by experts, as well as during an external expert evaluation EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2025, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring tools, checklists, portfolios of residents, individual plans of residents for 2023-2025 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal quality assurance system programme, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of the departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), resources on residency on the website <https://kaznm.kz/>, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the activities of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

During the external examination, it was found that the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency are observed (order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. ҚРДСМ-16). The volume of the teaching load and treatment and preventive work in the sections of the educational programme is determined by the individual work plan of the resident for one year and is monitored by the resident's monthly reports in any form. Record for completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of Order No. 647 "On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties" dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 20, 2022 "Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a reference on

learning outcomes”), there have been changes and additions to the educational programme in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, who should participate in the work of the research team.

In accordance with Article 222 Residency, paragraph 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On the health of the people and the healthcare system dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, external experts studied the activities and held conversations with mentors and residents, and found that each resident is provided with a mentor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme "Phthisiatry for adults, children" according to the current State Compulsory Educational Standard was developed for the first time and is being implemented for 2 academic years, and at this time there are no students, however, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through conversations with teachers and interviews with students in other specialties, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development, evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical bases, elective topics, participation in appeal commissions for the admission and evaluation of residents, development of the content of individual plans of residents and the choice of mentors.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the residency educational programme in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults and children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management on April 20, 2023.

The programme of the 3-day visit (18-20.04.2023) of the external expert evaluation of the EEC was fully completed. The university staff ensures the participation of all persons indicated in the programme.

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the ECAQA medical education organization.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all the necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of the employees of KazNMU responsible for postgraduate education, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to EEC members.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children"**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

##### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement**

When implementing the activities of the educational programme, namely, based on the results of an interview with the university management, AC members, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while this mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website ([www.kaznmu.kz](http://www.kaznmu.kz), web page "Residency"), social networks, information letters to medical organizations, with participation in scientific and practical conferences, joint master classes. The strategic plan of the organization for a period of 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as the integration of scientific activities, the educational process and clinical activities at the level of postgraduate education and in all organizations of Non-profit JSC KazNMU, which confirms the

implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

Interviews with residents found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, they tell them where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training facilities.

In the process of visiting the subdivisions of KazNMU, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: an equipped clinical base, highly qualified teaching staff, stable relations with international partners, regional authorities and healthcare organizations.

The university has departments that are directly related to the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults, children", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the educational and clinical center, the library. This conclusion was made, since the Training and Consulting Center is equipped with modern equipment and residents have access to classes at the center according to the schedule, the library provides residents with modern literature, provides access to modern databases of evidence-based medicine, including at clinical bases, and constantly conducts seminars and trainings.

The results of the study of the documentation demonstrate that the mission of KazNMU and the mission of the educational programme "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" are formulated taking into account the proposals of interested parties, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and the current normative legal acts (NLA) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, in the process of meetings with teaching staff, mentors, experts identified a number of problems, including stigma when choosing a specialty by residents.

The experts also determined that the building of the clinical base is outdated, but it is planned to build a new standard hospital with all auxiliary units that will ensure timely diagnosis and treatment of patients and, as a result, high-quality training of residents.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

To verify standard 1, a meeting was held with the vice-rector for the academic block BaildinovaK.Zh. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: "How is the autonomy of the university implemented in the formulation of the mission of the university." In the course of responses, the vice-rector of the university confirmed that the autonomy of the university gives the right, on the basis of the standard rules, State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022, to independently develop an educational programme, evaluate, select and admit residents, admit/select teachers, employment conditions and distribution of resources. Freedom in the preparation of the EP is achieved when compiling syllabuses, CED, IEP, Working curricula, the form, structure and procedure for the development of which is determined by the organization independently. All educational and methodological documentation is reviewed and approved at meetings of the CEP, the Academic and Board of Studies.

When conducting a survey of 19 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 24 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. It has been established that 73.7% of residents will recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. 84.2% of respondents believe that the leaders of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "In your opinion, does this organization of education allow you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 73.7% of residents answered positively, 10.5% still cannot answer this question, 15.8% answered that they would like to believe it.

Among the interviewed 28 teachers (25 questions of the questionnaire) 89.3% answered that are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and the workplace in this educational organization, 10.7% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the head is quite accessible to both residents and employees, responds promptly to requests and proposals. In the questionnaire, 85.7% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 10.7% are partially satisfied. According to the opinion of 71.4% in the



educational organization, the teacher has the opportunity to realize himself/herself as a professional in his/her specialty. For information, a total number of people answered is 28 (in total, there are 78.6% of full timers), while teaching experience from 5 to 10 years - 10.7%, over 10 years - 89.3%.

### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

The EP of the residency in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children", developed within the framework of the State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022 and the Qualification characteristics for the specialty "Phthisiatry", takes into account the main end outcomes of the resident's training, which stakeholders can find on the website of the university.

Among the interviewed teachers 57.1% answered that they are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 39.3% are partially satisfied.

The experts established a clear continuity between the outcomes of the residents' previous training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programmes. The organization has developed additional educational programmes, including for the specialty "Phthisiatry". Residents are informed about this.

### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

At a meeting with employers, it was found that the university, together with them, is discussing the educational programme in terms of choosing compulsory majors and CED. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of the EP, participation in the discussion of the results at the meetings of the CEP, scientific and practical meetings of the University.

During a conversation with residents, experts received an answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, the educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational programme?". Residents answered these questions that they participate in the preparation of the EP by offering elective disciplines.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 17 standards (including 10 basics, 7 improvement standards): fully - 17, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 1: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none**

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **2.1 Framework parameters for the postgraduate medical education programme**

For the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" in the documents of the organization there are teaching materials, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work.

Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements was established. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, which is confirmed by the study of the Academic Policy, the Code of Ethics. During the interview, the residents responded that they were aware of the content of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the teaching materials and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system, which is described in the document "Regulations on Clinical Mentoring", was evaluated. The tasks of the mentors are to assist the resident in mastering and improving the necessary clinical skills - "on-the-job training".

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the "Academic Policy". The objectivity of the process of teaching residents, including teaching and assessment methods, is reflected on the university website, AIS "Sirius", the "Moodle" portal, "tester.kz".

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

## **2.2 Scientific method**

At the university, scientific research is an obligatory component of education and implies the integration of educational, practical and research processes, with the result in the form of publications of scientific papers, speeches at conferences of various levels. All residency students are actively involved by the staff of the clinical departments and the Department of Science in the selection, analysis and statistical processing of material.

The educational programme "Phthysiatry for adults, children" as part of the implementation of the IWR (Independent work of resident) provides for training residents in the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data by writing abstracts, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline, essays on topical problems of diagnosis and treatment of pulmonary and extrapulmonary forms of tuberculosis. However, criteria for R&D performance by residents were not presented.

When talking with residents, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their education and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents the methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of "Journal club", which is held 1 per month.

When questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work. In the questionnaire, 78.9% of residents wrote that they are already engaged in research, 10.5% plan to start, 10.6% do not.

Residents should engage in R&D. However, the experts were not presented with the criteria for the implementation of R&D by residents.

## **2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency programme**

The content, volume and sequence of the courses of the residency educational programme "Phthysiatry for adults, children" strictly comply with the State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022. At the heart of achieving the objectives of training in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies, major disciplines (MD) of the main component and the component of choice

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including a standard programme in the specialty "Phthysiatry for adults, children" in 2022. Responsibility for the choice and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the teachers of the department and major disciplines.

The content of the work programmes and the catalog of elective disciplines reflected the needs of the healthcare system, including the training of tuberculothorapists, as well as the specifics of R&D and scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following elective disciplines: "Tuberculosis Prevention", "Differential Diagnosis of Pulmonary Tuberculosis", "Tuberculosis and HIV Infection", "Tuberculosis and Motherhood". For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the specialty "Phthysiatry for adults, children", the organization has resources to organize the assessment of the practical skills of residents (simulation room, assessment of practical skills at the patient's bedside).

However, there are problems in offering residents a variety of electives based on integration with other clinical disciplines.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 89.5% are completely satisfied, 10.5% completely disagree.

The organization has its own clinical base with 350 beds and 20-25 outpatient visits per day. KazNMU has concluded 124 cooperation contracts with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 34 countries of near and far abroad. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (follow-up of patient, etc.)", 100% of residents answered in full agreement. 94.7% of residents are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the location of the seminars, the topics of the seminars). At the same

time, 73.7% of residents claim that after the completion of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, error analysis session).

At the same time, to the question “Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programmes?”, the experts received the following answer. 73.7% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, Board of Studies, committees of educational programmes), 10.5% answered that no, they do not involve, while 10.5% do not know about it, 0% doubt the answer, and 5.3% expressed the opinion that they are sometimes involved in this work.

The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (94.7%).

## **2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the medical care delivery**

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (standard 2) and the general approaches to management, were confirmed during a visit to the educational and methodological department and conversations with the head and employees. At the same time, the verification of standard 2 showed that the distribution of disciplines by hours, semesters is carried out by the CEP of the faculty of postgraduate education in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard, Typical curriculum and the list of elective disciplines, agreed with the vice-rector of the academic unit. The distribution of disciplines by semesters is implemented by the Curriculum & Instruction Department.

An individual working curriculum is formed for each resident for the entire period of study, agreed with the curator and approved by the dean of internship and residency.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, a total of 12 meetings were held and during the cross-interview it was found that the university manages the educational process and promotes the development of practical competencies of residents.

The training of residents in the specialty “Phthiatriy for adults and children” is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analyzing the shortage of specialists for 2022, a shortage of phthiologists was established. Therefore, this organization is specialized in the field of phthiatriy, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of phthiatriy specialists. So, during a conversation with the management of the organization, the experts received information about the staff of clinics, and the teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical facilities of the phthiopolunology center, on an outpatient basis. Residents of this specialty can manage patients with diseases such as pulmonary and extrapulmonary tuberculosis. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in the organization.

Among the 19 residents surveyed, 94.7% answered that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 5.3% believe that rarely or sometimes. The schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the EP is completely satisfied by 94.7% of the residents surveyed.

During the visit of the EEC, an insufficient number of elective disciplines was revealed.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 30 standards (including 22 basic, 8 improvement standards): fully - 28, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

**Standard 2: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Develop quantitative indicators for the implementation of research and development (Standard 2, paragraph 2.2.1.).
- 2) Increase the list of elective disciplines on an interdisciplinary basis (Standard 2, paragraph 2.4.2.).

## **Standard 3: EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **3.1 Evaluation methods**

KazNMU uses a system for assessing knowledge, skills and abilities, which corresponds to the accepted practice at the national level and is defined in the SOP “Development and approval of a

system for assessing educational achievements”. The syllabuses of each discipline indicate the types of summative assessment and the calculation of the final grade. The indicated calculations of the admission rating evaluation (ARE), final control evaluation (FCE) of the discipline/module are entered into the AIS "Sirius" by the employees of the EMA, the Department and the Digitalization Office and are used in the system when generating the statement of the ARE and final grade. The type of assessment, teaching method and assessment methods are taken into account when filling out the electronic journal of the teaching staff of the departments in the AIS "Sirius" and is reflected in the SOP "Maintaining an electronic journal".

The study of control and measuring tools - test tasks, situational tasks, control questions showed that the university has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents said that assessment sheets, feedback from the teaching staff are used for assessment and that they are satisfied with everything. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Academic Policy" and there were no applicants for the period of work of KazNMU.

So, to verify the data of standard 3, the experts asked the head of the department of postgraduate education about the rules for conducting current, midterm and end-of-course assessment and checked the documents and methods for evaluating residents. The department has a database of test tasks in the amount of 300, which are compiled by the developers of the EP and approved at the meeting of the AC. The control and measuring tools are peer-reviewed by internal and external experts. Additions and updates to the CIS (Corporate information system) are carried out annually in the amount of 30%.

During a visit to the clinical base and during an interview with an employee of the department Syzdykova Nurbibi Syzdykovna Commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents, educational and methodological documentation in full (EP, working curricula, syllabuses, gradebooks), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidences, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents of the teaching materials necessary for residents and there is information about the residency, which is regularly updated.

### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training**

During the visit to KazNMU, EEC members confirmed that the methods of assessing residents are comparable to the methods of learning and teaching and cover the assessment of all competencies of students, both during practical classes and during exams.

The results of the assessment of residents are documented as follows: assessment sheets are filled in, an assessment is displayed, and recorded in a gradebook.

The university assesses the reliability and validity of assessment methods by examining assessment sheets on an ongoing basis, analyzing and approving tests. Methods of training and assessment in residency should be appropriate for the level of training.

When conducting interviews with 10 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts obtained convincing information that an objective assessment of theoretical knowledge is being carried out using an oral survey and testing, practical skills are being carried out using checklists. Residents also shared their opinion on the timeliness of providing tests, counseling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents reported that formative assessment is done through feedback from a teacher and mentor.

During the visit, the management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?”. And the answer was received that during the Final State Attestation of residents, leading specialists from practical healthcare are involved as chairpersons and members of the State certification commission.

The experts examined resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, a simulation center with assessment sheets for each practical skill.

The interviewed 11 representatives of employers also indicated that the training of KazNMU graduates is in line with the modern development of medical practice and science, as residents are

trained in the clinic with all powerful human resources and the necessary full equipment to provide qualified and high-tech care to patients. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, as they are included in the examination committees. But the organization of education did not conduct systemic feedback with them. Employers believe that skills such as critical thinking and communication skills they wanted to see as strongest in residency graduates.

At the same time, there are difficulties in the development of control and measuring tools, including for independent examination.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria** Compliant with 11 standards (including 7 basic, 4 improvement standards): fully - 11, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 3: implemented**

***There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.***

#### **Standard 4: RESIDENTS**

##### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

Admission to residency is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On approval of the Standard rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education” dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022.

The residency admission policy is presented on the KazNMU website. The site contains information materials on admission - a list of documents, programmes for admission; Academic policy, catalog of elective disciplines, academic calendar, schedules.

The head of the department spoke about the policy for the admission of residents. The resident consulting service is represented by the admission committee, the dean's office (dean, deputy dean, chief specialist, specialist), employees of the registrar's office, DIT, libraries, curators, clinical mentors, the military department, accounting, head of legal and passport and visa work.

The number of residents is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. Given the stigma, it is recommended to strengthen guidance counseling to attract interns to residency in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults and children."

Thus, the experts validated the data according to standard 4. In general, all criteria are met, there are no shortcomings. The experts got acquainted with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the "Academic Policy".

Regarding the practice of academic counseling, personal support for residents and the development of not only professional skills, the experts interviewed clinical mentors. The organization has a programme for the development of residents, which includes residents in the advisory bodies, such as CEP, AC, Council of Young Scientists.

##### **4.2 Number of residents**

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum allowable workload for teaching staff, the provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature, as well as the material and technical resources of the University.

Since the EP "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" is new, there has not yet been an admission of residents.

##### **4.3 Support and advice to residents**

KazNMU has created and provides safe training conditions for residents. To protect the interests of residents, to provide them with assistance in educational, scientific, and extracurricular activities, various services are provided for organizing advisory, psychological, social, and medical support for students. EEC experts confirmed that experienced teachers and professors are involved in the

consultation. In addition, before the start of each module, the teacher of the group informs his/her residents about work schedule, the time when residents can seek advice on this discipline.

For personal growth and development, holding sports and creative events in the team, there is a sufficient resource base (Internet, 100% coverage of the territory of the WIFI center, a library, computer classes, reconstructed and improved areas of the center buildings). The study rooms are equipped with projectors, a screen, a video wall, and all the necessary office equipment.

The implementation of residency educational programmes in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" will be provided with free access for each resident to information resources and library funds, the availability of textbooks of methods and recommendations for all modules, disciplines and for all types of educational work.

To develop the intellectual level of residents of expanding knowledge in various scientific fields, residents take an active part in the International Scientific and Practical Conference held annually by the university. Residents are involved in the work of the Council of Young Scientists, where emerging problematic issues are also resolved.

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

During the conversation with representatives, it was found out that the quality of the implementation of the educational programme is ensured by the participation of residents in the discussion of the mission of the EP, access to which is open through posting on the KazNMU website. Along with the leaders and teachers, residents are included to participate in the consideration of issues related to the educational process and the approval of teaching materials for residency, the development of an individual working curriculum and elective disciplines. This fact was also confirmed by the residents during their interviews.

When visiting EEC experts, it was confirmed that feedback from residents is being collected at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of the discipline), as well as on issues related to training / working conditions, problem situations.

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

Work in residency is the main and dominant duty of the resident. Combining training with work (no more than 0.5 rate) in areas of activity close to his/her future specialty, in his/her free time, is allowed with the consent of the curator, head of the department and curator.

In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd year of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, outside of school hours.

During a visit to the clinical base EEC expertsestablished that residents will have unlimited access to patients, all types of medical equipment and to all departments of clinical bases. The center has rooms for conducting theoretical classes with residents, there is a separate room for shift of clothes, for eating, etc.

During the training, residents of the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" will actively participate in consultations, MDG(Multidisciplinary groups), medical conferences, pathoanatomical conferences, clinical reviews, master classes, scientific and practical conferences.

The teaching load of residents is planned in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education". The class schedule from 08.00 a.m. to 05.00 p.m. is regulated by Epsdeveloped on the basis of the State Compulsory Educational Standard 2022, sanitary and epidemiological rules and regulations, curricula and recommendations from healthcare and education authorities.

The EP maintains a balance of all types of activities: follow-up of patient in a hospital, work in the hospital ward, work in an outpatient-polyclinic conditions. A schedule is drawn up for the stay of a resident in a specific clinical unit of the clinical base. Residents with work experience may have an individual learning trajectory (with rotation by department), and the choice of an elective discipline also affects the learning trajectory.

*Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards (including 18 basic, 12 improvement standards): fully - 30, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

*Standard 4: implemented*

*There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.*

## **Standard 5: TEACHERS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and selection policy**

The staff of the residency teaching staff is determined in accordance with the main provisions of the order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 14, 2004 No. 474 "On approval of the norms for calculating the cost of education for one student, residency student, undergraduate, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country according to state educational order.

EEC experts confirmed that, according to the State Compulsory Educational Standard (as amended in 2022), persons assigned to resident physicians in order to master the necessary theoretical and practical skills are appointed from among the teaching staff and/or practical healthcare workers with an academic degree, the first or highest qualification category, who have appropriate training in medical education. The experts are familiar with the personnel policy, Regulations on mentors.

The Department of Phthisiopulmonology has a sufficient number of teachers for the successful implementation of the residency educational programme "Phthisiatry for adults and children". The department has 2 Doctors of Medicine, professors, 6 Candidates of medical sciences, associate professors, 1 master. At the department, 11 teaching staff has the highest medical category and one teacher has the first one. All teachers are current specialists in their field, carry out clinical work in basic institutions (manage or consult patients, conduct instrumental studies, expert evaluation of case histories, conduct scientific work, have scientific publications).

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the policy of recruitment and admission of teachers and clinical mentors, stimulation and motivation of practical healthcare professionals. The conversation with the head of the HR department of KazNMU included such questions as attracting and motivating specialists for educational activities and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of the clinical base for teaching (there are 9 teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers, information support of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since the average age of teaching staff at the department is over 50 years old and it is necessary to use material and non-material motivational incentives to attract young specialists to the department.

When questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (89.3%) are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, but 10.7% are partially satisfied. In this organization of education, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research and development - 78.6% fully agree, 21.4% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 57.1% completely agree, 25% - dissatisfied, 7.1% - More NO than YES, 10.8% - More YES than NO.

#### **5.2 Obligations and development of teachers**

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during the conversation of EEC experts with the head of the HR department, it was established that the HR policy of KazNMU for personnel development consists in planning, developing measures to stimulate and reward for achievements in work. Types of rewards and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

At a meeting with the leadership of the university and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the competencies of teachers, motivation for working with residents, mentoring, which includes the organization of cycles for improving pedagogical qualifications (a certificate of completion of a 60-hour cycle), material incentives in the form of

employee bonuses. However, the experts identified a limited possibility of international clinical internships for teaching staff who work with residents and must have high clinical competencies,

The experts received answers about the advanced vocational training programme for teachers, which is held annually. These events are funded by the university. The expert checked the certificates of teachers of the department. During the reporting period, 5 employees of the department underwent advanced vocational training in pedagogy in the following cycles: "Development of communication skills of students in clinical disciplines", "Teaching practical skills using simulation technologies", "Fundamentals of developing MCQ test tasks", "Specialist teacher of modular disciplines", "Massive Open Online Courses: Development and Application", "Distance Technologies in Education".

Experts found that teachers initiate research and development topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical records. Confirmation of this fact was obtained during a conversation with residents.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 71.4% of the surveyed teachers answered, and 25% partially agree with this. 39.3% studied at advanced vocational training programmes during this year, 53.6% from one year to 5 years.

The organization implements social support programmes for teachers - 57.1% answered that "yes, such programmes exist", 17.9% of respondents answered that they doubt it, and 25% of respondents do not know about it.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards (including 5 basic, 2 improvement standards): fully - 6, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 5: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Increase the number of international clinical fellowships for teaching staff (5.2.4)

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The University has a developed material and technical base for the professional training of residents in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults and children." The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and scientific research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, cultural and social facilities, university clinics, clinical bases - leading medical institutions in Almaty.

Lecture halls are equipped with the necessary technical support - stationary multimedia projectors and are designed for 2040 seats. To develop a unified corporate culture among students and employees of the University, 9 lecture halls are equipped.

The clinical base of the department has conference rooms, classrooms that are equipped for classes, they have the necessary furniture, technical teaching aids, including personal computers and multimedia projectors.

#### **6.2 Clinical bases**

Review of resources - National Scientific Center for Phthisiopulmonology(NSPC) of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Municipal state enterprise on the right of economic management "Children's Rehabilitation Center for Phthisiopulmonology" showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and employees provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of phthisiologist-residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and clinical mentors provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he/she should master and develop during the training.



During a visit to the clinical base, the experts identified the compliance of the resources with the training programme for residents, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts obtained evidence of the implementation of standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence about the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, enough time to manage patients, work in Damumed with medical records, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in the "Journal club", availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered KazNMU, as they believe that the university has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients.

Residents showed their commitment to the university, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research and development, funding. The experts studied the documents of the residents (portfolio, the results of the assessment of residents-check-lists, the results of the survey of residents). The experts studied the documents of the residents (portfolio, the results of the assessment of residents-check-lists, the results of the survey of residents).

### **6.3 Information technology**

In order to implement the tasks of digital transformation using modern IT technologies, KazNMU developed and approved the Programme "Informatization Roadmap - 2021" (Order of the Acting Rector No. 30 dated February 7, 2017 based on the decision of the University Council dated January 31, 2017, Protocol No. 3). Information support for the work of residents in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" is carried out through: the media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.), the website of the university and the clinical base; electronic running letters; television monitors in the foyer of educational buildings; boards of official information of the university administration, deans.

To master practical skills, residents will be able to visit the Center for Practical Skills, where skills are developed on breadboard models, mannequins, simulators, and computer training programmes.

When preparing educational and methodological literature, teachers use the educational resources of the library (electronic textbooks, electronic manuals, scanned educational literature), the Internet, as well as the results of their own scientific and research activities.

The scientific library of KazNMU provides access to such popular databases as: Web of Science - [webofknowledge.com](http://webofknowledge.com); Scopus - [scopus.com](http://scopus.com); ScienceDirect; Cochrane Library "Wiley"; BMJ Best Practice; BMJ Learning; eBooks Clinical Collection; Dentistry & Oral Sciences Source Alumni Edition; CINAHL database; "Epigraph" database; Aknurpess- a digital library.

Also, the clinical base of the department has an opportunity to hold conferences, meetings, classes in a remote format. For this, special programmes Microsoft teams 365, Zoom are used, which provide free communication between teachers and residents via the Internet.

### **6.4 Clinical teams**

Residents will daily participate in joint medical rounds with mentors, consultations, MDGs, consulting other specialized departments. Residents will conduct seminars on topical issues of phthisiatry, where students are both students of all levels, as well as healthcare professionals and teaching staff.

Students and residents develop teamwork skills with colleagues and other healthcare professionals during the examination, treatment of the patient, and, especially, in the provision of care to the sick.

Competencies in the management of the training process will be formed among residents by involving them in lectures to the public, students, schoolchildren on healthy lifestyles, prevention of respiratory tuberculosis.

84.2% of respondents are completely satisfied with the number of patients for follow-up or assistance in operations, 10.5% are completely dissatisfied, 5.3% did not answer.

### **6.5 Medical research and Advances**

The Department of phthisiopulmonology conducts diverse research in the field of studying the problem of latent tuberculosis infection, modern methods of diagnosis, treatment of widely drug-resistant forms of tuberculosis with new anti-tuberculosis drugs. Scientific research of the staff of the department will underlie the scientific work of the residents.

The Department of phthisiopulmonology will involve residents of the EP "Phthisiatry for adults, children" in conducting scientific medical research on grant funding from the Global Fund on the topic "Studying the prevalence of latent TB infection and the effectiveness of its preventive treatment in sensitive and M/XDR-TB among contact and high-risk groups."

Interviews with teachers showed that the majority of respondents (85.7%) fully agree that residents have free access to patients at clinical bases and all conditions for improving practical skills, 14.3% agree partially.

### **6.6 Expertise in the field of education**

Expertise of the quality of the implemented educational programme for residency at the University is a systemic process and is carried out by the following structures: DAD (approval of the EP), Dean's Office of Internship and Residency (implementation of the EP), Committee of Educational Programmes (CEP) (planning, development and evaluation of the EP), (DEM)W Department of educational and methodical work (monitoring of the EP), Quality Management System Department. The CEP includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, and students. The department of accreditation and rating monitors various aspects of educational activities to obtain independent information aimed at improving the quality of the organization of the educational process. In the process of each study, recommendations are formed for making changes in order to improve the organization of the educational process at the departments and modules of the university.

The expertise is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of the methods of teaching residents, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

In addition to clinical research, it is necessary to stimulate mechanisms for motivating employees of the phthisiopulmonology Department to conduct research in the field of postgraduate education.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

The possibility of training residents in other medical organizations is provided by the concluded contracts of the University with the Healthcare Administrations of 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 16 contracts/memorandums with foreign universities and research centers in 27 countries of the world. The possibility of academic freedom is determined by the fact that the EP is developed on the basis of the National Qualifications Framework, corresponding to the qualification framework for the European Higher Education Area.

The experts found that there is no jointly developed residency EP in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" with partner universities.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 18, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

**Standard 6: implemented**

**There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.**

## **Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education (as amended and supplemented as of July 7, 2020)", "Rules for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of teaching staff and researchers of KazNMU", the University has a quality control

system for educational and methodological documentation, including the content of educational programmes.

In order to monitor the implementation of the EP and as problems are identified, including those related to resource provision, the following documents are approved and updated at the University: Regulations on educational programmes of KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarov, SOP "Formation, discussion of educational programmes (EP)" (order No. 600 dated August 02, 2018). SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of CED" (order No. 12 August 25, 2022), SOP "Monitoring the quality of the educational process, the use of active teaching methods and multilingualism in departments" (order No. 4 dated January 14, 2020), SOP "Assessment and analysis of educational programmes of KazNMU" (order No. 3 dated November 26, 2020), IRD(internal regulatory documentation) "Regulations on methodological work" (order No. 498 dated November 26, 2020), "Regulations on educational programmes of KazNMU" (order No. 12 dated July 12, 2021 .)

When analyzing the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children", the EEC experts found that monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including profiling/graduating and related departments, specialized CEP, DAD, Academic Council, Senate, student government, Center for Admission and Career Guidance of Students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

Created by a team of authors, the EP "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" was reviewed and approved at meetings of the Department of phthiisipulmonology(Minutes No. 9 dated April 20, 2022), CEP of FPE, Academic Committee, Senate of the University.

### **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through various feedback channels. Feedback on the EP of the specialty "Phthiisiatry for adults, children" will be held at the department annually. The QMS department monitors the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university.

The results of the feedback are analyzed, discussed at meetings of the departments, CEP, AC, published on the university website ([www.kaznm.kz](http://www.kaznm.kz)).

Questioning is carried out according to the following types: "Teacher through the eyes of students", Satisfaction of students with the conditions and training outcomes, "Satisfaction with infrastructure", "Satisfaction of the graduate with the quality of education", "Freshman Questionnaire". The survey is conducted online through Google, as well as on paper. The coverage of respondents in various questionnaires ranged from 75% to 95%.

Based on the results of the "Teacher through the eyes of students" survey, a report and certificate is compiled for each teacher with the assessment of students. The survey materials of stakeholders (students, employers, teachers) are discussed at the department, an analytical report is considered based on the results of the survey. The report data are analyzed, compared with real facts, cause-and-effect relationships are clarified, and then a decision is made to make changes to the organization of the educational process, EP.

For the purpose of feedback, a survey of employers is conducted annually. Thus, the degree of satisfaction of employers with University graduates is assessed in order to identify the compliance of the educational programme with the real requirements of the labor market, the possibilities for its improvement, as well as the degree of compliance of graduates' competencies with positions in the workplace.

### **7.3 Results of residents and graduates**

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by the results of the end-of-course assessment of residents, conducted at the testing stage by the National Center for Independent Examinations, as well as the results of certification exams conducted by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Healthcare and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults and children", the final state attestation is planned to be carried out in 2 stages: determining the level of theoretical training in disciplines in the form of testing; certification of practical skills with a standardized patient.

In the course of communication about the quality of knowledge and practical skills of residency graduates, experts and employers note their level is an order of magnitude higher than graduates of other universities. The QMS department monitors the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university.

#### **7.4 Stakeholder engagement**

The participation of a wide range of stakeholders in the evaluation and improvement of educational programmes at KazNMU is provided by authorized bodies in the field of education and healthcare (MH RK), public representatives, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education.

All stakeholders (teaching staff, residents, employers) are involved in the programme evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is regulated by the Charter of the university, the strategic plan for the development of the university, annual plans and reports of the university, as well as the relevant QMS procedures. The results of the assessment are heard at meetings of the Clinical Council, Schools, MC and SC, published in the university newspaper and on the university website. However, EEC experts noted that the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies was not broad enough.

Interviews with employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, provision of the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

#### **7.5 Approval procedure for educational programmes**

The educational programme in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards and the Standard Curriculum for this specialty.

The University has developed mechanisms for approving educational programmes that provide for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of implementing the EP and the progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems.

An examination of the EP is carried out for compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards, is approved by the CED according to the proposals of stakeholders and taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the training outcomes of residents. A systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP is carried out in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of teaching methods), as well as assessing the educational and methodological support and maintenance of the educational process, evaluation of the quality of the EP. For this purpose, an external evaluation of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical healthcare.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 15 standards (including 10 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 14, partially - 1, not compliant - 00

**Standard 7: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies (7.4.2)

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

The guarantee of the implementation of the EP of the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" is its strict compliance with the requirements of the regulatory rules for the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the training process, assessment of knowledge and skills, established training outcomes, programme management, which are regulated in the Republic of Kazakhstan by the regulatory legal acts of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The EP meets the needs of public health and the provision of medical services

Students who have mastered the residency EP in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" and successfully passed the state attestation will be issued a state document on the qualification of "Tuberculotherapist", "Phthisiopediatrician". On the basis of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of the types and forms of documents on state education and the Rules for their issuance", in accordance with subparagraph 6-3) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007, a certificate of completion of residency will be issued, and after passing the FA, the National Center for Independent Examination will issue a certificate of a specialist without a category in the specialty. The implementation of the quality assurance programme for postgraduate training is carried out by the Alumni Career Center

All activities for the implementation of the EP are carried out under the direct control of the educational departments, members of the committee of educational programmes, the dean's office, and independent experts.

The transparency of the management of the EP is carried out by discussing the educational and methodological documentation for the residency programme at meetings of the departments / modules of the CEP, AC of KazNMU and, after receiving their positive conclusion, is approved by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. Syllabuses, test tasks will be placed in "Sirius" AIS

In order to quickly bring useful information to residents and teachers, there is an electronic news ticker in the center of the University campus, the information for which is updated daily. KazNMU has the rector's blog, once every two months, a meeting of the rector with students is held. KazNMU has introduced the principles and approaches of periodic evaluation of management and employees in relation to the achievement of the mission

#### **8.2 Academic leadership**

Management of the educational process, including at the postgraduate level, is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure of KazNMU. The executive body of the University is its Rector, Chairperson of the Board. The rector is personally responsible for the financial and economic activities, the safety of the property of the University, for organizing the anti-corruption activity, establishes the competence of the provost, vice-rectors and other senior officials of the University, resolves all issues of the University's activities in accordance with its competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of KazNMU. Residency issues are under the supervision of the vice-rector for academic activities in terms of the educational process and the provost in terms of clinical activities.

Direct management of residency programmes and coordination of the activities of residents from the moment of the existence of the residency will be carried out by the dean's office of the FPO. The activities are managed by the dean appointed to the position by the order of the rector. The general management of the dean's office is carried out by an elected representative body - the Faculty Council, which organizes its work under the guidance of the dean of internship and residency. The composition of the Council is approved by order of the vice-rector. The Dean's Council consists of the following positions: Dean of the Faculty of Internship and Residency (Chairman of the Council); heads of departments, professors and associate professors of departments; representatives of stakeholders

(interns, residents, employers). The dean's office is responsible for making the following decisions: the development and approval of the mission of the programmes, the rules for organizing the educational process in residency, recommendations for the recruitment of residents, which train residents. The dean's office exercises control over residents, maintains relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of residency programmes (DAD (DP&CEP and EMA), DIT). For the purpose of effective management of the educational process, the CEP is functioning.

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding the issues of the educational process, research and development, clinical work", 75% of teachers answered yes, 14.3% believe that sometimes, 10.7% did not give an answer.

### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The budget of the university is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Financing of the residency programme depends on the formation of the annual state order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the financing of undergraduate, graduate, doctoral and residency programmes by type of educational institutions is determined.

### **8.4 Administration and management**

The University annually makes changes and additions to the organizational structure. The staffing of departments/modules that provide educational residency programmes is approved annually, taking into account changes in the number of residents. According to Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III, the total number of teaching staff is formed based on the average ratio of residents and teachers - 3:1.

In order to ensure the organization of the activities of the University and the training of personnel to the needs of the labor market, since 2005 the University has established and operates a quality management system. In the same year, the QMS department was organized. Until 2011, the QMS was certified by NQARussia No. 21225. Versions. In 2019, KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov successfully passed the recertification audit for compliance with the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001:2015, conducted by the international certification body SGS (Switzerland), UKASmanagementsystems.

The system of internal evaluation, monitoring of the work of the teacher and the achievement of the interim and final results of educational programmes is carried out through the certification of teaching staff for all types of activities.

### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The University determines and approves the educational programme in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children" in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 20, 2022. The programme is approved in close cooperation with all stakeholders. The structure and content of the Working curricula correspond to the State Compulsory Educational Standard in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults and children", the programmes of disciplines are developed at the proper scientific and methodological level. The sequence of studying residency disciplines is built using a system of pre- and post-requisites.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 15 standards (including 8 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 15, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

**Standard 8: implemented**

**There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.**

## **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

KazNMU always strives to respond in a timely manner to changing internal and external conditions. In order to continuously improve the educational process, in accordance with the best practice of world educational management, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which is under reform, regularly initiates a review and update of processes.

The resident selection policy, resident selection and admission methods are adapted annually to changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in basic medical education and curriculum requirements.

The regulation on mentoring is updated annually in accordance with the changing needs in postgraduate education. A convincing example of the process of continuous improvement of approaches to the implementation of residency educational programmes is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the Institute for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of achievements of information and communication technologies; and promotion of public health.

Development of organizational structure, control and management to cope with the changing circumstances and needs of postgraduate education, and over time gather the interests of various stakeholder groups.

One of the significant changes aimed at improving work with graduates of KazNMU, on the basis of the Division for the distribution and employment of graduates, the Alumni Career Center was created.

*Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.* Compliant with 1 standard (including 1 basic): fully - 1, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

*Standard 9: implemented*

*There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.*

### **CONCLUSION:**


When conducting an external evaluation of the educational programme, it was found that out of **147 standards** (including 91 basic standards and 56 improvement standards), 143 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 89 basic standards and 54 improvement standards. 2 basic standards and 2 improvement standards are partially implemented. No non-compliance with standards has been established. The implementation of improvement standards indicates the compliance of the educational organization with international consensus in such areas as education, clinic and science.

### **5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme “Phthisiatry for adults and children”:**

1. Develop quantitative indicators for the implementation of research and development (Standard 2, paragraph 2.2.1)
2. Increase the list of elective disciplines on an interdisciplinary basis (Standard 2, paragraph 2.4.2)
3. Increase the number of international clinical fellowships for teaching staff (Standard 5, paragraph 5.2.4)
4. Expand the representation of stakeholders in advisory and collegiate bodies (Standard 7, paragraph 7.4.2)

## 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Center

EEC members have established the compliance of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Phthisiatry for adults, children"

	ФИО	Подпись
Председатель	Кабилдина Найля Амирбековна,	
Зарубежный эксперт	Катрова Лидия Георгиева	
Академический эксперт	Алдабергенова Тауржан Калибековна	
Академический эксперт	Султанова Гулнар Достановна	
Академический эксперт	Маукаева Сауле Боранбаевна	
Академический эксперт	Шабдарбаева Дария Муратовна	
Представитель работодателей	Вовк Виктор Евгеньевич	
Представитель резидентов	Абылгазиева Айдана Бакытжановна	



**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteriaforevaluation	Numberofstandards	Basicstandards*/StandardsImprovements	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	17	10/7	10/7		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	22/8	20/8	2	
3.	EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS	11	7/4	7/4		
4.	RESIDENTS	30	18/12	18/2		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	7	5/2	5/1	1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10/11	10/11		
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	15	10/5	10/4	1	
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8/7	8/7		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1	1/0	1/0		
		147	91/56	89/54	4	
				143	4	

**List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of an external evaluation of the residency educational programme 7R01151 - "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"**

<b>№</b>	<b>Documentnames</b>	<b>Quantity</b>	<b>DateApproval</b>
1.	Syllabus - Residency "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	1	Notyetapproved, form
2.	Educational Residency Program in the specialty 7R01151 "Phthiisiatry for adults, children"	1	21.07.2022
3.	Certificates of advanced training of clinical mentors in pedagogical competencies	5	4 - from 16-27 May 2022 (120 hours) 1 - from 5 to 23 December 2022 (72 hours)
4.	Documents on SSRP (Student Scientific Research Project)	4	1. Plan -07.09.2023 2. Diploma of MES RK 3 (2021, 2022), 3. Diploma Int. – 2022, 2023, 4. Diploma of KazNMU - 1 degree
5.	Agreementswithclinicalbases		1. NATIONAL SCIENTIFIC CENTER OF PHTHISIOPULMONOLOGY- 02.09.2019 - (for an indefinite period) 2. GP No. 10 - 09/01/2022 (for an indefinite period)
6.	Bookavailabilityofresidents	5	2020, 2021
7.	Regulationsonteachingload	1	No. 486 dated 09/14/2020
8.	Regulationsonmentoring	1	No. 231 dated 09/16/2020
9.	Electroniclogging	1	No. 1 datedOctober 31, 2022
10.	Academic policy of NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" for 2022-2023 academic year	1	No. 418 09/01/2022
11.	Code of Academic Integrity for Students	1	No. 418 09/01/2022
12.	Regulations on the organization of inclusive education in NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1	No. 11 dated 06/28/2021
13.	Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students in NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
14.	Regulations on business trips of employees of NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1	No. 3 July 17, 2019
15.	Procedure and forms of feedback	1	No. 53 datedFebruary 8, 2021
16.	The procedure for registration of academic mobility of students	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
17.	Compilation, discussion, approval of Syllabuses	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
18.	Regulationsonthedepartment	1	No. 495 datedSeptember 22, 2022

19.	Development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
20.	Monitoring the quality of educational processes, the use of active teaching methods and multilingualism in the departments	1	No. 36 dated 14.01.2020
21.	Regulations on methodological work	1	No. 498 dated November 26, 2020
22.	Development and approval of the system of educational achievements	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
23.	Formation, discussion, approval of CED. Write to a component of your choice.	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
24.	Formation, discussion, approval of the academic calendar	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
25.	Formation, examination and approval of control and measuring instruments in the testing format	1	No. 1 dated October 31, 2022
26.	Rules for conducting ongoing monitoring of progress	1	No. 301 dated November 11, 2019
27.	Organization and conduct of an exam in the form of testing, including remotely	1	No. 200 dated April 26, 2021
28.	Norms of time for planning and accounting for the teaching load of teaching staff	1	No. 486 dated November 14, 2020
29.	Formation, discussion, approval of working curricula	1	No. 12 dated 08/25/2022
30.	Code of honor of the teaching staff of NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"	1	No. 615 dated November 24, 2021