

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare
08.06.2023

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
7M10105 "MANAGEMENT IN HEALTHCARE"
OF THE NJSC "ASTANA MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS
OF MASTER'S EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN HEALTHCARE**

external expert evaluation period: May 16-18, 2023

Astana, 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in healthcare"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for Master's Educational Programmes in Healthcare and conclusions	7
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	11
4.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in healthcare"	28
5.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	28
	Attachment 1. Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation and Educational Programme of the Master's Degree in the Specialty 7M10105 "Management in healthcare"	31
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	32

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
AIS	automated information system
LBC	library and bibliographic classification
DB	Database
IRD	internal regulatory document
SAC	state attestation commission
SCES RK	state compulsory educational standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
ECAQA	NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare"
RS	Research School
IEP	Individual education plan
QAC	Quality Assurance Committee
CED	catalog of elective disciplines
HM	Management in healthcare
MH RK	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC "AMU"	Non-profit joint stock company "Astana Medical University"
RI	Research Institute
NET	new educational technologies
STP	scientific and technical programme
PC	professional competencies
TS	teaching staff
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
EDM	extended meeting of the department
WC	working curriculum
IWM	Independent work of master students
IWMT	Independent work of master students under the guidance of a teacher
MC	model curriculum
UDC	Universal Decimal Classification
EMCD (teaching materials)	educational and methodological complex of the discipline
ELS	Electronic library systems
CST	training in clinical situations
GPA	GPA
PBL	problem-based learning
TBL	team-oriented learning

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 15 dated May 05, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" in the period May 24-26, 2023, in the following composition:

No.	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree / title, position, place of work / place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	YERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEYEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of public health and healthcare NJSC "West-Kazakhstan medical university named after Marat Ospanov"
2	Foreign expert	D.R. ALENKA BRAČEK LALIĆ	PhD in Human Resource Management and labor relations. Managing Director of the AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP Institute (since 2021). Vice Dean for Research Institute AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP (2017-2021); Associate Professor in Management (2022 - 2027) Ljubljana Business School; Director of International CEEMAN Quality Accreditation (IQA) (2015-2021), Republic of Slovenia
3	Foreign expert	KODIROVA SHAKHLO SALOMOVNA	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Traditional Medicine and Occupational Diseases of Bukhara State medical institute, the Republic of Uzbekistan
4	National academic expert	ZHAKIPBEKOV KAIRAT SAPARKHANOVICH	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Management and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov"
5	National academic expert	DANIYAROVA ANARA BAKHITKEREVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Higher School of Public Health Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
6	National academic expert	YERZHANOVA FARIDA NURMUKHAMBETOVNA	The highest medical category in public healthcare, Master in Healthcare; Head of the Department of Science and Vocational Education Republican State enterprise on the Right of Economic Management

			"Hospital of the Medical Center for Administrative Affairs of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan", Deputy Chairperson of the State Unitary Enterprise for additional education under Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council in the direction of training "Healthcare"
7	National academic expert	AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASSOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of Department of dermatovenereology and cosmetology of NJSC "Semey Medical University"
8	National academic expert	NURZHANYAT TATUKHANOVNA ABLAIKHANOVA	Candidate of Biological Sciences, Associate Professor, Deputy Head of the Department of Biophysics, Biomedicine and Neuroscience for Educational and Methodological Work of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
9	National academic expert	RAKHMANOV ELTAY UTEMURATOVICH	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Program in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, organizer of educational, practical and research work of master's students in sports medicine and rehabilitation.
10	Expert - representative of practical healthcare	ZHUKUBAYEVA ALMIRA ASETKYZY	Master in Pedagogy and Psychology, the highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, the first medical category in public healthcare. Head of the Department of Education, LLP "National Scientific Cancer Center"
11	Representative of doctoral students	ESENBKOVA NAIRA ADILKHANOVNA	Doctoral student of the second year of study in the specialty "Biology" NJSC "Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilev"

ECAQA Observer – Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The EEC work was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC.

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the master's educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Educational Programmes for PhD in Healthcare and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the master's educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in healthcare":

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint stock company "Astana Medical University";
Management body	Directors and members of the Management Board
Full name of the first head	Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich
Date of establishment	1964
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan 010000 Astana, Beibitshilik st., 49a, phone: +77001539447 Call-center (WhatsApp), +7 (7172) 53 94 47 Call-center, +7 (7172) 53 95 12 Undergraduate admissions committee, + 7 (7172) 53 94 24 Rector's reception, fax: +7 (7172) 53 94 53, mail: rektorat@amu.kz
State license for educational activities in the magistracy (date, number)	MES RK dated 19.03.2019, No. KZ93LAA00014823, code 7M101 in the direction of training "Healthcare"
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Astana, Saryarka Ave., 33
Year of the implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2020
Duration of training	2 years
The total number of graduates since the implementation of the EP	1
The number of master students on the EP since the beginning of the current year	6 master students
Full-time teachers/ Part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of degree	Full-time teachers - 12, 100%-degree, part-time teachers involved in the implementation of EP - 2, 50%-degree
Link to the website of the university, where information about the educational programme is posted	https://amu.edu.kz/ru/postupayushchim/abiturientam/obrazovatelnye-programmy/ https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/7db/7dbeccf04f6d3ec899cd0966b2e3574f.pdf

NJSC "AMU" was the first medical university in Kazakhstan to begin multi-level training of medical and scientific and pedagogical personnel (the system of continuous higher education) in the following areas: bachelor's degree - internship - residency; bachelor's degree - master's degree - PhD doctoral studies.

In 2020, the master's programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" was developed: it was compiled in accordance with the requirements of foreign universities. The educational programme is built on the basis of a competency-based approach.

The purpose of the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare": "training of highly qualified healthcare managers with a high level of professional competence, capable of assisting in improving the healthcare system in the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as possessing pedagogical and research skills."

The subdivisions responsible for the implementation of the programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" are Research School, Department of Public Health and Management. The university has the opportunity for continuing professional development due to the established stable three-level education system from bachelor's degree to doctoral studies, which allows you to get modern knowledge and practical skills in educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education.

Personnel potential: leading associate professors and professors with practical experience and knowledge. 2 Doctors of Science, 3 Doctors of PhD, 5 Candidates of Science were involved. Practical healthcare professionals from the world's leading universities are also invited as visiting professors.

Material and technical base: for the implementation of the educational programme, the "Department of Public Health and Management" has contractual relations with leading clinics in Astana, where master students master a number of disciplines. The duration of training 7M110105 - "Management in Healthcare" is 2 years with the development of disciplines with a total volume of 120 credits. The educational programme retains the disciplines aimed at the formation of professional competencies, there is a block of disciplines of personal development and the formation of leadership qualities, each of which includes the disciplines of the university component and the elective component. 48% of the educational programme contains the disciplines of the elective component, allowing future masters to choose the direction of their specialization and gain knowledge on modern concepts and theories in the management field. In order to provide students with a choice, a CED is compiled annually for all levels of education, after which students are given time to make a choice in their personal account.

In order to establish the level of understanding by master students of the social, contextual and historical basis of the content of the programme, after each academic period, a survey is conducted on the subject of satisfaction with the educational process as a whole.

Upon completion of training for master students 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", the following main types of professional activity of the graduate are possible:

- University lecturer in specialty "Management in Healthcare" and/or "Public Healthcare";
- an employee of healthcare departments and other administrative bodies;
- research associate of research institutes;
- manager of scientific projects;
- continue training at doctoral studies.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

The educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" was accredited in 2020 by the IAAR accreditation agency for a period of 3 years.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Educational Programmes of the Master's Degree in Healthcare and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme 7M10105 " Management in

healthcare" (hereinafter - the report) is presented on 104 pages of the main text, attachments on 76 pages, copies or electronic versions of 24 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1o-GV7qQ3Li-NwMrAcARTL2yHLUtmh5J> .

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector Nadirov Kamalzhan Talgatovich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 24 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, data about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Zhunussova Aigul Bitimbayevna, vice-rector for academic work, candidate of medical sciences, physician - pediatrician of the highest category.

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 8- н/к dated 09.01.2023 "On the establishment of a working group for conducting a specialized self-assessment and writing a report" "On conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10105 "Management in healthcare." In accordance with Article 9-1 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III.

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Daniyarova A.B., and the review noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes. In the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, the experts received answers to the questions that arose, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report based on the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards provide the real practice of NJSC "Astana Medical University"; for the preparation of master students in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2019, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of doctoral students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, database), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables, diagrams contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e., verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 6B10115 "Kinesitherapy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and in accordance with the programme approved under No. 12 dated 05.05.2023 by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 16-18, 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- conversations with management and administrative staff - 17 people;
- interviews with master students - 6 people;
- studying the website <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/>;
- interviewing 12 employees, 11 teachers;
- questioning of teachers and master students - 12 and 6, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 2 bases of practice/clinical engagement were visited, including Clinic "Alanda", MPI City Polyclinic No. 6, where training is provided under the educational programme "7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", with the participation of 4 part-time workers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of *** units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents examined is in Attachment 2).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and conversations was ensured (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with EEC members

No	Job title	Quantity
1	Meeting with vice-rectors of NJSC "AMU"	4
2	Meeting with members of the academic council, committee of educational programmes by levels of education (bachelor's, master's, PhD)	71
3	Meeting with employees of subdivisions responsible for the admission of students/listeners	3
4	Meeting with the head and employees of subdivisions responsible for educational programmes	9
5	Meeting with employees of subdivisions responsible for the employment of graduates	2
6	Meeting with HR staff	2
7	Interviews with students	51
8	Interviews with teachers	46
9	Interviews with employers of graduates	25
10	Interviews with graduates	26

In the process of visiting the subdivisions of the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, including.

The University has subdivisions that are directly related to the educational programme "7M10105" Management in Healthcare", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the Research School. This conclusion is made, taking into account the analysis of the activities of the school, which is a tool for ensuring the transparency of the management system and decisions made on the educational programme, to ensure the quality of the educational programmes of the University.

The Committee for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes (hereinafter referred to as the QAC) of the University is a collegiate body of the University that carries out planning and

coordination of educational and methodological activities, as well as control over the implementation of the EP at all levels of education.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of conversations, interviews and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 6B10115 "Kinesitherapy" for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years was held by the chairwoman Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyena.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

In order to confirm the information presented in the self-assessment report, the working documentation of the university was requested and analyzed by external experts. Along with this, the experts studied the Internet positioning of the university through the official website of the university <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/> .

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation.

3. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the master's educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare"

Standard 1: "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"

Evidence of Compliance:

1.1 Statement of mission, goals and training outcomes

The mission of NJSC "AMU" is to train competitive specialists who are able to respond to existing and new challenges to public health, generate new knowledge and innovation, promote the scientific and technological development of national and global healthcare <https://amu.edu.kz> .

The outcomes of training in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" are determined in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES RK). The outcomes are a prerequisite for doctoral programmes, motivate for lifelong learning.

From interviews with teachers, it was found that the mission of the educational programme (EP) 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" is the training of highly qualified personnel who own certain innovative approaches using leadership qualities and meet modern labor market requirements. The mission was discussed at a meeting of the Department of Public Health and Management, where employers took part. The mission is posted on the university website. Thus, the experts were convinced that the mission reflects the specifics of training for this programme and is formulated in accordance with the strategic goals of the university.

https://docs.google.com/document/d/11JrGpbstvg6ukEVQT_YqBX5WJs4juyf2/edit .

1.2. Participation in the formulation of the mission and training outcomes

The head of the city polyclinic No. 6, Candidate of Medical Sciences Beiserkina D.S., head of the Republican State enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Research and Production Center for Transfusiology" of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Astana – Candidate of Medical Sciences Abdrakhmanova S.A., head of the "Alanda clinic" Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Ibrayev S.Ye., Deputy Head of the State Institution "Central Hospital with a Polyclinic of

the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan" Tursynbet Ye.A. PhD (Minutes dated 11.01.2023 under No. 6) took part in the formulation of the Mission and the outcomes of the training,

On the recommendation of the employer, the list of outcomes was supplemented with the following: "...demonstrate knowledge on the issues of the organization of the mechanisms and their interaction with interested parties (stakeholders), the principles of working in an external context in the long term, the practical skill to be able to develop a strategic plan for the development of an organization."

During the meeting with the university head, the leaders of the programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", the experts were convinced of the responsibility of the administrative and managerial staff of the university and the understanding of the importance of strategic planning in achieving the goals and objectives, that the university has a strategic development plan, the corresponding mission and vision of the university. The University analyzes the achievement of development targets, monitoring and improvement activities.

1.3. Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

In the legal status of "NJSC" (non-profit joint stock company), the university has real institutional autonomy to make decisions on planning, developing, implementing and monitoring the master's educational programme. To do this, the university has established divisions (Research School, Dean's Office) and advisory and consultative bodies (committees and councils), which include representatives of employers and students (but the master student is not included). The experts found that the autonomy of the university manifests itself in all strategic directions, especially in relation to the educational process (where to teach, how to teach, with whom to cooperate, who to include as examiners, etc.), as well as in relation to the admission of teachers of the master's programme. The positive practice of this university can be considered the staffing of the departments with teachers in the profiles corresponding to the disciplines of the educational programme, the use of dual education, as well as the provision of literature, the financial fund.

The University monitors the degree of implementation of the educational programme (EP), conducts self-assessment in all its areas, surveys of master students, employers, teachers (teaching staff), and also takes into account the needs of society. The experts found the presence of internal regulatory documents that ensure the quality of the educational process in accordance with the Mission, goals and objectives.

1.4 Name and description of the programme

The Programme 7M10105 "Management in healthcare" was developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard. The University has developed and approved curricula (working curricula), individual education plan for students) and syllabuses for disciplines/modules.

It has its own form of syllabus. For all interested persons, a catalog of elective disciplines (CED) is available, which contains a description of elective disciplines, so that master students can choose the most appropriate additional programme.

Based on the results of a conversation with the rector and vice-rectors of the university, members of the Research School, in an interview with master students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the Mission of the organization and the educational programme, the main goals of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, at the same time, the content of strategic documents was brought to the attention of master students through the website, social networks, newsletters to medical and scientific organizations.

The strategic plan of the organization for a period of 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as:

1. Training of competitive and professionally competent healthcare professionals in popular specialties and specializations
2. Transformation into a research university and its development as a leading center for translating new knowledge and innovations into healthcare practice and policy
3. Development of the university as an integrated academic medical center operating on the basis of the trinity of education, science and practice

4. Development of human resources and improvement of the university management and financing system
5. Development of the infrastructure and material and technical base of the university <https://amu.edu.kz>, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

During the meetings with the university staff, the experts were able to see the responsible attitude of teachers and obtain evidence of their participation in the development of the educational programme and the allocation of resources necessary for its implementation, the participation of teachers in the development and review of the SCES, model curricula of disciplines at the republican level, work programmes of disciplines.

During meetings with master students, based on the results of their survey, EEC experts established that master students know the training outcomes, competencies that will allow them to become qualified teachers or researchers in accordance with the principles of best research practice.

6 master students participated in the survey. To the question: "Have you recommended studying in this educational organization to your acquaintances, friends, relatives" - 86.67% of respondents answered positively; to the question about the awareness of programme managers about the problems of students related to training - 85.33% of respondents showed interest and awareness of the organization's leaders in the problems of master students. When asked about the involvement of students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, scientific council, committees of educational programmes), 49.33% of respondents answered that they participate constantly.

During a visit to the supervising department, clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, assessed their compliance with the training programme, accessibility for teachers and master students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare/business/production. The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 1, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 6 standards: fully -6.

Standard 1: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To systematically monitor the needs of employers and regularly include them in the educational programme.

Standard 2: "EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME"

Evidence of Compliance:

2.1 Learning and teaching methods

The analysis of educational activities showed that the implementation of the programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" is provided by the departments of the School of Public Health. The graduating department is the Department of "Public Health and Management". The personnel potential is made up of highly qualified personnel with a degree - 84%. More than half (65%) of teachers (teaching staff) are fluent in English. The teachers of the department are the leading experts of Kazakhstan in the field of public health, management, Bioethics/ethics, nephrology, assessment of the quality of medical services/accreditation of medical organizations, are members of Supervisory Boards, Governmental and non-governmental organizations. The Association of Healthcare Managers of Kazakhstan includes 92% of the teachers of the department, as well as the associations ASPHER, ISPOR.

The content of the educational programme includes general education, basic disciplines and major disciplines. The goals reflected the specifics of this educational programme, achieved, among other things, through elective disciplines.

From interviews with teachers, it was found that at all levels of education, a lot of work is being done to introduce new forms and methods of teaching into the educational process, means of enhancing cognitive activity: - multimedia lectures; problematic lectures (PBL); case-based learning

(CBL), incl. analysis of specific situations (ASS or case study); team-based learning (TBL), incl. work in small groups; role-playing, business games; creative tasks (video films, crossword puzzles, quizzes, etc.); the use of problematic and case tasks in practical classes; - e-learning.

2.2 Development of academic skills

An analysis of educational activities showed that the emphasis is on teaching master students the skills to use the methodology of scientific research in practical healthcare, the ability to be able to train their colleagues and use this skill in their future teaching activities. Financial management, information management, leadership, etc. are defined as major disciplines.

From interviews with master students, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, the work plan. Teachers tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases.

To the question of the questionnaire about the provision of students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature for preparing for classes - 85.33% answered positively; 58.67% of respondents spoke positively about access to participation of students in research work; to the question about satisfaction with the library fund/resources - 69.33% of respondents answered that they were completely satisfied. For 70.67% of survey participants, electronic educational resources are available. Thus, approximately 30% of survey participants demonstrate partial satisfaction in these matters, which is a necessity for the university to analyze shortcomings and take corrective actions.

2.3 Content of the programme, scope

The documents contain work programmes, a catalog of elective disciplines, teaching materials, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements was established. The university ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme. The experts got acquainted with the Code of Ethics for Students (approved by the Decision of the Board of NJSC "AMU" on December 26, 2019) and during the interview, the master students answered that they were aware of the content of this document.

The working curriculum and the content of the disciplines were developed based on the Order of the acting Minister of Healthcare and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 under No. 647 "On approval of state mandatory standards and standard professional training programmes for medical and pharmaceutical specialties."

There are disciplines aimed at the formation of professional competencies, there is a block of disciplines of personal development and the formation of leadership qualities, each of which includes the disciplines of the university component and the elective component.

2.4 Research and grants

There is a scientific component in the training of master students. Evidence was obtained of training master students in the skills to use the methodology of scientific research in practical healthcare. Each master student has the right to independently choose a supervisor and, if necessary, a scientific consultant. The subject of the upcoming research is formulated by the students independently, and, if necessary, together with the supervisor.

The main directions of scientific research within the framework of the educational programme, conducted at the Department of Public Health and Management, are presented in the passport of the educational program. Scientific projects are funded by the World Healthcare Organization and are also carried out within the framework of the Erasmus Plus project.

During the interviews, master students showed an understanding of doing research in education. It has been established that before the start of classes, teachers inform master students about the scientific directions of the department. This indicates compliance with **standard 2**.

2.5 Structure and duration of the programme

The educational process at the University is organized in accordance with the University Standard "Planning the educational process" SU-MUA-25

<https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Wqw01VYDINzY4X6FLeNvANhMSygWmTeH>, according to which the planning of the educational process is carried out on the basis of curricula.

The educational programme contains the labor intensity of each academic discipline of the main component, the elective component and the university component. All this is indicated by the total number of hours; the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work in accordance with the SCES and standard requirements are taken into account.

The major disciplines are defined as financial management, information management, leadership, etc.

The educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" provides for the development of the trajectory "Management", which is formed from practice-oriented disciplines. For example, such disciplines as: "Corporate management", "Personnel management", etc. An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography, and scientific supervisors apply them when working with master students. The disciplines aimed at the formation of professional competencies have been preserved, there is a block of disciplines of personal development and the formation of leadership qualities, each of which includes the disciplines of the university component and the elective component. The programme contains both theoretical training and various types of practices, foreign internships, experimental research work, midterm and end-of-course assessment.

2.6 Educational programme development process

The experts found that all interested parties are involved in the process of developing the educational programme - teachers, representatives from among potential employers. At the stage of discussion and agreement at the meeting of department and at the meeting of the Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) of the university, representatives from among the students participate. The procedure for reviewing the educational programme is carried out throughout the entire process of developing and approving the programme. The development of elective disciplines is carried out with active work with potential employers, representatives of practical healthcare through regular consultations, joint meetings. So, during a meeting with experts, employers noted their participation in the revision of the training outcomes of master students, when making changes and additions to the educational programme. Interviews with 25 potential employers of university graduates were conducted online and included such questions as: *participation in the development and submission of proposals to the educational programme, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, providing master students with the necessary resources for scientific and practical training and the formation of critical and exploratory thinking.*

Master students noted the possibility of independent choice of elective disciplines, which will contribute to their individual development in a given direction. Consideration and approval of the catalog of elective disciplines (hereinafter referred to as CED) goes through the following stages: consideration at meetings of departments, QAC.

CED is available on the official website of the university (https://www.amu.kz/info/student/catalogue_of_elective_subjects.php)

At the same time, experts noted that, despite its scientific and practical orientation, representatives of foreign partners of the university, foreign scientific supervisors and consultants of master students do not take part in the planning and development of the master's educational programme. Given the desire of the university to introduce the best international practices into the training of master students, such participation would be strategically useful.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 3 standards: fully - 3

Standard 2: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To involve international experts in the process of developing, evaluating and monitoring the quality of the educational programme, as well as foreign teachers for the implementation of some components of the educational programme.

Standard 3: "MASTER STUDENT ASSESSMENT"

Evidence of Compliance:

3.1 Assessment methods

The recruitment of master students for the programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" depends on the needs and is determined by the allocation of the state order by the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Updating educational resources occurs when changing normative and regulatory documents (state compulsory educational standards, model curriculum), when updating catalogs of elective disciplines, as well as when introducing innovative technologies into the educational process.

The experts found that the university has a well-established work on assessing the competencies of a graduate; assessment of knowledge at all levels of training, and the educational programme is aimed at the training outcomes. All information about the assessment policy, assessment methods, including assessment criteria, examination criteria, the weight and progress criteria of students, the appeal procedure, the number of allowed retakes and the conditions for retaking the exam is contained in the "Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU" P-MUA-17-20 <https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/211/21105fcacd058206105e152b3873b613.pdf> . Having studied this document, the experts found that it includes a policy in the field of quality assurance, rules for the admission of applicants, internal regulations for students, a rating system for assessing students' educational achievements, end-of-course assessment of students, rules for organizing and conducting repeated visits to students' classes, as well as various requirements of the educational process.

Control and assessment of students' knowledge is carried out according to the point-rating system. Checking the educational achievements of students is carried out by conducting ongoing monitoring of progress in the form of a test or exam at the end of each discipline, midterm and end-of-course assessment. In a conversation with the staff of the Research School (RS), it was found that regular monitoring of the development of training outcomes is carried out through a questionnaire.

From interviews with master students, it was found that, in accordance with the Academic Policy, the forms of conducting classes and midterm control are determined taking into account the specifics of the discipline and are prescribed in the syllabus. The schedule is brought to the attention of students and teaching staff by publishing it on the university website. Admission to the exam is carried out on the basis of assessments of current progress control, while the exam is allowed to persons who do not have tuition arrears, as well as those who have received an admission rating of at least 50 points.

3.2 Grading system

An appropriate balance has been ensured between the formative and summative assessment provided for in the Academic Policy of the University, according to which the summative assessment of students' academic achievements in a discipline or module includes an assessment of the rating admission and an assessment of the summative assessment. When calculating the summative assessment, the weight share of each component is taken into account: the admission rating assessment is 60%, the summative assessment is 40%. The summative assessment in the discipline is carried out in the form of an exam or a grading test in accordance with the working curriculum of the educational programme and the academic calendar. The end-of-course assessment of master students is carried out according to the forms established by the State Compulsory Educational Standard. Students who have fully completed the theoretical and practical course in accordance with the requirements of the working and individual curriculum are allowed to the end-of-course assessment. The end-of-course assessment is carried out in the form of defending a master's thesis, as established in the State Compulsory Educational Standards. To consider a master's thesis, a state attestation commission

(SAC) is created. All students defend their thesis in accordance with the working curriculum and working education programmes common for medical universities.

According to SCES, the main results of the master's thesis are presented in at least one publication and (or) in one speech at a scientific and practical conference. There are attestation files of master students in the RS, including the documents presented in the “On training in the magistracy of the

NJSC

“AMU”

PL-MUA-121

<https://amu.edu.kz/upload/iblock/8d8/8d8b461666672e9c34cfa767ac0ca895.pdf>

Employees of the RS, in a conversation with experts, said that the assessment based on the results of defending a thesis is made by members of the SAC collectively and takes into account the point-rating system. The report of the chairperson of the SAC is published on the official website of the University. Leading specialists of practical healthcare, representatives of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan and teachers of other medical universities are involved in the composition of the SAC as chairpersons. A master student who does not agree with the result of the end-of-course assessment (State Attestation) has the right to appeal to the Chairperson of the Appeal Commission of the University on the day the results are announced, indicating the discipline and describing the issue requiring commission consideration. Based on the received application for appeal, the Research School (RS) issues an official order to conduct an appeal, indicating the composition of the appeal committee, discipline and date of consideration. The decision made at the extended meeting on the preliminary discussion of the thesis of the master student is peremptory. If the thesis is not ready for official defense, the master student is given time to eliminate comments and make additions.

3.3 Feedback from master students

From interviews with master students, it was found that feedback from the teacher is provided to students during and at the end of each practical lesson, in the process of scoring in the evaluation rubrics. All written and oral appeals and claims of master students are recorded, summarized and analyzed. Written appeals received by the University are distributed for consideration to departments and officials.

Currently, a safe environment for employees and students is one of the most relevant in the professional activities of medical staff. The university has created conditions that ensure the safety of employees and students: information and compliance with safety regulations in the workplace is carried out. Fire alarm systems are located in all buildings of the university. Employees and students are regularly briefed, each floor has an evacuation plan and there are shields with firefighting equipment.

3.4 Quality assurance of the assessment system

In a conversation with RS staff, it was found that the university guarantees the participation of a qualified academic external examiner in the assessment of master students to verify approaches, assessment criteria and results, as well as to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process. The Chairperson of the SAC is approved by the order of the Chairperson of the Board - the Rector from among the most experienced production specialists, scientists, teachers and teaching staff with extensive practical experience, corresponding to the profile of graduates.

In the questionnaires of master students, they wrote about the existence of a student career counseling service at the university - 50.67% of respondents know about it; 78.67% of respondents noted the well-established system of self-study of master students. When asked whether there is enough time for practical training at clinical bases, 70.67% of master students answered positively. 84% of those surveyed are satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme; Satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills - 89.33% of respondents; compliance of the content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty with the expectations of master students was noted by 80% of the respondents; the use of active and interactive teaching methods by teachers in the classroom was rated positively by 81.33% of master students. Do teachers provide feedback to master students after completing classes - 84% answered that they do it regularly. Thus, the results of the survey indicate that the university provides a

proper assessment of academic knowledge and skills corresponding to the master's level. However, there are shortcomings with respect to the graduate career counseling service.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria Compliant with 6 standards: fully -6.

Standard 3: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no

Standard 4: "MASTER STUDENTS"

Evidence of Compliance:

4.1 Admission and selection policy

In a conversation with the staff of the RS, it was established that persons with a bachelor's degree are admitted to the magistracy. The organization of admission, counseling, organization of the entrance exam for applicants to the magistracy, is carried out by the admissions committee. Acceptance of applications coming to the magistracy is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules. Testing is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for Comprehensive Testing, approved by Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 8, 2019 under No. 190.

4.2 Recruitment of master students

Admission of students to the programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" is planned taking into account the total area of educational premises, the availability of teachers, the provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of the practical bases of the university, the availability of social and living conditions for training students.

During interviews with employees of the employment department, it was found that the university constantly analyzes the employment of graduates.

There are work programmes, teaching materials, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work are taken into account. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements was established. Visiting the clinical bases for the training of master students, for example, the "Alanda" Clinic and the city polyclinic No. 6, the experts received convincing evidence that the training in the magistracy is carried out according to the plan, students receive feedback from teachers, and have the opportunity to improve their skills in accordance with the training outcomes. The university ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, listens to the opinion of master students.

4.3 Support and advice for master students

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the teaching materials and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom. In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with master students of the accredited educational programme. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, the sufficiency of time to collect material for a thesis, work with documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for master students who need it, participation in scientific work, availability of resources from international databases of professional literature. Skills in using these resources were assessed during visits to clinical bases and during conversations with employers.

During an interview with employees of the "e-University" Service Center, it was found that the center serves all categories of students (including master students), teachers and employees of the University in order to optimize and automate processes in the provision of services on the principle of "one office", minimizing corruption risks, converting paper services into electronic format.

In general, master students are satisfied with the training and scientific guidance, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, as they believe that the university has good

resources, image and international relations. At the same time, the wishes of master students include: the organization of a timely foreign internship by the university in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad countries with payment for tuition, travel and accommodation.

4.4 Master student representation

Master students showed their commitment to the university and teachers, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training and providing conditions for completing a dissertation research, submitting a dissertation for defense, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in educational organization events, funding, demonstrated proficiency in English. The experts studied the documents of master students (portfolio, assessment results, survey results, master's theses).

Interviews with 2 potential employers of master students - graduates of the university were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of doctoral students, providing the supervising department located in the clinic and doctoral students with the necessary resources for scientific and practical training and the formation of critical and research thinking, about the problems of interaction with the departments, 100% employment of graduates upon completion of the master's degree, etc.

Participation in the development and evaluation of the educational programme is carried out by master students by providing systematic feedback, representation in the QAC, the Scientific Council.

The departments collect feedback from master students at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of the discipline). Master students, by providing feedback, contribute to the most adequate development of the educational programme, other regulatory documents in order to achieve the expected training outcomes.

The University has trust boxes, a helpline, which are continuously functioning and are one of the important types of socially significant services.

4.5 Graduate requirements

An individual agreement concluded before the start of the academic period with each student has a number of clauses according to which the University has the right to expel the student, however, the student has the right to expel at his/her own request in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 under No. 595 "On approval of the Standard Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations of the Relevant Types".

Thus, the system of admission, selection and involvement of master students to improve the educational programme is carried out at the university at the proper level.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 10 standards: fully -10.

Standard 4: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To provide timely foreign internships for master students in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad with payment for tuition, travel and accommodation.

Standard 5: "ACADEMIC STAFF"

Evidence of Compliance:

5.1 Selection policy

The university has developed a personnel policy, documented in the form of the "Regulations on the personnel policy of NJSC "AMU"" (approved on March 10, 2018, updated on August 20, 2020). Experts in a conversation with employees of the HR service found that the university has effective management and development of human resources, the number and quality of employees, their professional and social development are maintained at an optimal level, as well as a reasonable combination of processes for updating and retaining staff capable at high professional level to ensure the solution of the set strategic tasks. The selection and placement of teaching staff is carried out on

the basis of competitive selection for filling vacant positions. Evaluation of the activities of teachers is carried out according to the results of educational, methodological, scientific, clinical, tutorial work and social activities.

According to the personnel policy, employment in NJSC "AMU" is carried out through competitive selection. All information about the upcoming competition for filling vacancies is posted on the university website (<https://amu.edu.kz/>) and through the media (electronic exchange <https://www.enbek.kz/>).

Teachers of the master's programme are: employees of the Department of Public Health. The implementation of the master's programme also involves employees responsible for the scientific work of the university and strategic development, the center for the development of academic activities, the Registrar's Office, the Staff and Student Service Center, the Department of Digitalization, and, of course, the master students themselves.

Employment of professors and teachers at NJSC "AMU" is carried out in compliance with the norms of legislation and legal documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 23, 2015 under No. 414-V, Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated July 27, 2007 No. under 319 -III, Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 230 dated April 23, 2015 "On approval of the rules for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and researchers of higher educational institutions", Rules for competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and researchers (14.05.2018) and the Rules for the competitive replacement of vacant positions of administrative and managerial personnel (5.06.2020)).

5.2 Responsibilities and staff development

Experts in a conversation with employees of the HR service found that the certification of teaching staff includes two successive stages: testing and (or) assessment by the "360-degree" method in accordance with the position held. The teaching staff (professor, associate professor, senior lecturer, lecturer, assistant) is tested to assess pedagogical and scientific competencies. The head of the department is tested and assessed "360 degrees". Teaching and support staff (laboratory assistants and senior laboratory assistants) are tested to assess the knowledge of information and communication technologies.

In order to stimulate teachers for high pedagogical skills, scientific results and dedication, the university has introduced a KPI system, which is based on the principles of transparency and measurability of indicators; the relationship of differentiated additional payment with the fulfillment of tasks that meet the interests of the University; equal opportunities in obtaining differentiated remuneration for all university employees, regardless of their position; close relationship with the project management of the university.

5.3 Number and qualifications of teaching and management staff

In 2018, at the initiative of the rector, an HR service was created, a trade union committee and a psychological assistance office are functioning. The corporate culture aims to support the well-being of employees, a healthy work environment and team spirit.

Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Zhunussova A.B. noted that measures are being taken to increase the level of motivation of teaching staff by distributing material resources based on the results of the work of each employee, as well as stimulating the individual contribution of the teacher through financial incentive payments, taking into account criteria that allow evaluating the effectiveness and quality of work. For example, bonus payments are made for publications in international peer-reviewed journals, based on the results of the teaching staff rating.

The experts checked the teachers' documents and made sure that the supervisors of master students have such indicators as: academic and scientific degree of teaching staff, work experience in the medical field, experience in writing scientific papers, preparation or participation in scientific events.

5.4 Administrative support

The experts were presented with documents that ensure the quality of education: schedules for certification of teaching staff for knowledge of languages in order to improve the quality and monitor knowledge. The system of motivation and evaluation of personnel performance to achieve strategic goals and objectives is represented by the KPI system and differentiated remuneration. In order to motivate and stimulate activities and improve the performance of employees, the university directs significant financial resources to the formation of the payroll.

During a visit to the university and during a conversation with the staff of the Academic Council, the Committee of Educational Programmes, the expert commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers/supervisors and staff, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, grade record books), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), evidences, certificates and verifications.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents “Academic Policy”, “Student's Code of Ethics”, a catalog of elective disciplines, a schedule and information about the educational process, which is regularly updated, necessary for master students. This information was obtained from conversation with HR employees. *At the meeting, the experts asked the following questions: How is teaching staff accepted? How do teaching staff combine academic and scientific activities? Is there a reward system? Is there help for young professionals? How are the priority tasks in the master's programme determined for each academic year?*

The answers to the above questions allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting scientific supervisors from among the employees of clinics in Astana (there are 2 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers for this specialty, information support of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in managing and development of human resources.

An interview with 11 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on the specific base (acceptance of master students to equipment and office mechanization facilities for typing material for a thesis, medical data and patient documents, reporting documentation of medical organizations).

The experts received answers about the advanced training programme for teachers (in five years 100% were trained) and scientific supervisors, the presence of 100% of teachers of certification in teaching methods and research.

The experts studied the materials on the admission of master students and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 5.

Thus, the experts obtained evidence of a successful personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, the development of the skill of managing master students, and motivation to work with master students.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 14 standards: fully -14.

Standard 5: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To strengthen the international component of the educational programme through regular (planned) academic mobility of teachers and master students, inviting visiting professors from leading foreign universities, joint project activities with leading scientific and educational centers of the world.

Standard 6: "EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, LEARNING ENVIRONMENT AND ACHIEVEMENTS"

Evidence of Compliance:

6.1. Learning environment

An appropriate educational, methodological and scientific learning environment has been organized for master students, allowing them to conduct research corresponding to the level of the master's degree, collect enough analytical information to prepare a thesis and defend it.

One of the conditions for the successful implementation of the master's programme is a modern and regularly updated library fund, both on paper and on electronic media. During a visit to the library, the experts got acquainted with the system of library and information services, noted access to modern databases in the field of fundamental and applied medicine. Based on the applications of the departments and structural divisions of the university, the library annually updates and replenishes the library fund with new publications at the expense of the allocated financial resources: in 2021 - 5083 copies were purchased, including 2375 copies in Kazakh, 2300 copies in Russian, 408 copies in English; in 2022 - 1841 copies were purchased, of which in the Kazakh language - 614 copies, in Russian - 1145 copies, in English - 82 copies.

There are 5 educational buildings, 3 of which were visited by experts. The work of computer classes is organized, but almost all master students have their own laptops and they are connected to the university's WIFI network.

Distance learning at the University is implemented on the basis of the information and educational platform LMS Moodle (<https://dl.amu.kz/>), where all educational materials are uploaded.

The classroom fund of the department is also sufficient for the training of master students (**ESG 1.6**). Research center, 2 laboratories were visited (22 in total, including 2 research and 20 educational laboratories).

6.2 Information technology

The University has a Studio of multimedia electronic textbook. It is organized to create conditions for teaching staff, introduce new multimedia technologies, modernize existing educational and research developments and obtain acts of introducing new educational technologies (NET) for multimedia electronic textbooks. The university has access to the programme "Anti-plagiarism. University" to check text documents and dissertations of master students for the presence of borrowings from open sources on the Internet and other sources.

The experts were shown access to the Cochrane Library, the "Paragraph" database, to the national subscription of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the Scopus and Science direct databases of the Elsevier publishing house, to the open platform Web of Sciens, Springer, EBSCOhostCinal, Jaypee digital, "IPRSmart", to the electronic resources of Epigraph publishing houses, Aknur-press, to the developed training courses and instructions for teachers and students on preparing materials and posting them on temporary Internet channels ("How to create a YouTube channel correctly", "How to upload a video to YouTube", etc.). All materials are available on the remote portal of the University at the link <https://dl.amu.kz/>

The University has a web portal www.amu.kz, which contains information, including about the programme "7M10105 – Management in healthcare". The portal is available for students, employees, teachers, applicants, employers, university partners. The official website of the University is presented in 3 languages.

There are portals with authorized access: automated information system AIS Platonus, electronic library (bibl.amu.kz), electronic library catalog (kb.amu.kz), distance learning platform (dl.amu.kz) openlabyrinths (<http://olab.amu.kz:5181/>).

In order to form and improve the digital skills of teachers, training activities are carried out using DET. Training courses and instructions for teachers and students on preparing materials and posting them on temporary Internet channels have been developed.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 11 standards: fully - 11.

Standard 6: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To ensure the publication of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" (as well as all educational programmes of the university) in English on the website of the university in order to attract foreign students.

Standard 7: "MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME"

Evidence of Compliance:

7.1. Programme monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

During a conversation with members of the academic council, it was found that the university has an effective, continuous monitoring mechanism, which consists in constantly monitoring the attendance of disciplines, the progress of the student, writing a master's project (thesis), etc. Midterm assessment, carried out in accordance with the schedule and academic calendar of the educational programme, provides for the collection of materials and assessments about all the achievements of master students in the learning process.

The evaluation of the educational programme (EP) of master students is carried out on the basis of the following principles: continuity, succession, focus on consumer requirements, systematicity, transparency and constant feedback evaluation. All interested parties take part in the process of evaluation and improvement of the EP: teachers, experts in the field of medical education, employers, students.

The study and evaluation of the EP includes the following types of work: monitoring the provision of the educational process with resources (clinical bases, educational literature, classroom fund, equipment, teaching staff: teachers, clinical mentors, scientific supervisors); monitoring the compliance of curricula with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standards.

The monitoring of the implementation of the EP is carried out within the framework of the intra-departmental control of the graduating department and within the university control; the graduate department, the Research School, which work in close cooperation with practical healthcare and potential employers, the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, participate in the monitoring and evaluation of the EP.

The meeting with the heads of structural units responsible for the educational process and the teaching staff demonstrated the existence of a sustainable practice at the university for reviewing, discussing and making decisions to improve the educational programme.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and master students

During the interview, master students spoke about the forms of training, counseling and assessment. The master students noted an effective, continuous monitoring mechanism, which consists in constantly monitoring the attendance of disciplines, the progress of the student, writing a master's project. Midterm assessment, carried out in accordance with the schedule and academic calendar of the educational programme, provides for the collection of materials and assessments about all the achievements of master students in the learning process. It should be noted that master students receive regular feedback from teachers and scientific supervisors.

During a visit to the clinical bases (Clinic "Alanda", city polyclinic No. 6), employers noted that the university staff provide collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of medical organizations in order to provide the most effective and comfortable conditions for master students to achieve the outcomes. Clinical bases provide a sufficient number of thematic patients to collect research material, modern equipment and are available to master students. Employees who serve as both teachers and scientific supervisors ensure quality teaching and clinical research.

7.3 Activities of master students and graduates

The experts analyzed the progress of master students of the programme "Management in healthcare", reviewed the annual report on the implementation of plans. The experts reviewed the following documents:

1. Syllabuses of disciplines (dated August 28, 2022, protocol No. 1 of the meeting of the department);

2. Individual plans of master students (dated August 28, 2022 approved by the dean of the faculty);
3. Order for the approval of master's theses;
4. Report of the chairperson of the SAC (dated September 12, 2022 Protocol of the Scientific Council No. 9);
5. Plan of the MCB of the graduate department (dated August 28, 2022, protocol No. 1 of the meeting of the department);

The University has developed the Standard "Feedback Monitoring" SU-MUA-12. Feedback to master students from the teacher is provided during the lesson and at the end of each practical session, as well as in the process of scoring in the evaluation rubrics. Master students can verbally or in writing contact the head or the supervising vice-rector on the quality of the educational programme and on the results of the implementation of the curriculum. The results of the conducted feedback of students influence the organization and implementation of the educational programme (the choice of elective disciplines, teaching staff, educational bases, etc.).

Participants in the educational process (students and teaching staff of the university) showed a direct interest in the implementation of the educational programme, and expressed their opinion on ways to improve. For example, organizing and conducting foreign internships. They can show their interest by using a QR link or by contacting the rector's blog. The results of the analysis of QR links requests also reflect the mechanisms for the participation of students and teaching staff in monitoring the programme.

During a visit to the university and following a meeting with Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Zhunussova A.B., the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, agreements with teachers and master students, internal regulations (Student Code of Ethics), educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, catalog of elective disciplines, grade record books), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), evidences, certificates and verifications.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for master students in Kazakh and Russian: educational programme, work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, a catalog of elective disciplines, and there is information on academic mobility, research scientific training, which is regularly updated. However, there is little information in English. Head of the Department of Healthcare Organization and Management Turgambayeva A.K. confirmed that the lack of sufficient information about the educational programme in English reduces the attractiveness of the programme for foreign students.

To the question of the questionnaire, which was filled out by 6 master students, whether they would recommend studying at the university to their acquaintances, friends, relatives - 86.67% of respondents answered positively; When asked about the awareness of programme managers about the problems of students related to education, 85.33% of respondents answered that teachers are interested in the success of master students. Half of the respondents (49.33%) believe that master students are regularly involved in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, scientific council, committees of educational programmes). More than half (61.33%;) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and lecture rooms. As the results of the survey showed, the university has room for improvement - the involvement of master students in the work of committees and councils to review and approve the educational programme, improve the equipment of classrooms.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 10 standards: fully -10.

Standard 7: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no

Standard 8: "MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION"

Evidence of Compliance:

8.1 Leadership (supervising vice-rectorate)

The University periodically evaluates academic leadership in relation to the achievement of the mission of the educational programme and the training outcomes. The experts noted the continuous organizational, coordinating and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission of the educational programme. Decision-making on the management of the educational process is quite transparent, as well as sustainable funding of the state of the university.

Monitoring of the implementation of the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare" is carried out on the basis of: monitoring the progress and quality of knowledge of master students (based on statements); collecting and analyzing feedback from master students through questionnaires, organizing focus groups; control of the organization of independent examinations at the stage of midterm assessment of master students, analysis of the results of independent examinations conducted by departments; conducting "benchmarking" and marketing research on the organization of the educational process in the magistracy; collecting and analyzing feedback from master's graduates and their employers through questionnaires.

8.2 Programme head (dean/department)

The Center for the Development of Academic Activities develops and implements a comprehensive system for assessing the educational programme 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", which includes: the development of an educational programme and its implementation, assessment of the compliance of the tools for assessing the achievements of master students in the profile direction with the established learning objectives and analysis of the degree to which students achieve the training outcomes.

The Center for the Development of Academic Activities performs the following tasks: compiling the study schedule and academic calendar for master students in coordination with the Research School and the Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development; drawing up working curricula for the master's degree; control of the movement of the contingent of master students; formation of orders in general for the magistracy and for individual master students; planning the teaching load of teachers of the magistracy and scientific supervisors; completion of master's degrees.

8.3 Academic leadership (department)

The supervising department carries out the formation of the educational trajectory 7M10105 "Management in Healthcare", the development of Working curricula in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards and the catalog of elective disciplines, conducting training sessions using modern educational technologies, planning and managing the professional practices of students; provides regular distribution of newly adopted and updated documents to the chat rooms of master students, and also provides an opportunity to discuss and comment on the components of these regulatory documents, considers the topics and content of master's projects submitted for approval.

Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development Koikov V.V. noted that an annual analysis of the degree of achievement of the mission and goals of the university is carried out. The input data for the analysis are the results of monitoring the implementation of the activities of the University Development Plan, the internal audit of the departments, the report of external and internal commissions. The results of the analysis are heard at a meeting of the Scientific Council and are the basis for measuring and improving the efficiency of the university as a whole. In accordance with the annual plans of meetings of collegial bodies (SC, AC), Deputy Chairpersons of the Board, deans, managers report on the implementation of university processes, on the implementation of quality goals, providing information on achievements, problems and solutions. Information about the meetings held is posted on the local network and on the website.

8.4 Programme management

During a conversation with experts, master students said that training in the magistracy is carried out under the guidance of experienced teachers.

The experts found that the university has the following requirements for teachers: the academic

degree "candidate of science", or "doctor of science", or "doctor of philosophy (PhD)", or "doctor by profile", or the academic degree "doctor of philosophy (PhD)", or "Doctor in profile", or the degree of "Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)", or "Doctor in profile", corresponding to the profile of the requested direction, with at least three years of experience in scientific and pedagogical work,

The university guarantees systematic control by top leadership and various management structures. Monitoring and control of educational processes is carried out by the Research School. Monitoring of the assessment of the updated teaching materials of the master's programme "Management in Healthcare", as well as control and analysis of the effectiveness of the introduction of innovative teaching methods and control of knowledge of master students is carried out by the Academic Committee.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 9 standards: fully - 9.

Standard 8: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no

Standard 9: “CONTINUOUS RENEWAL”

Evidence of Compliance:

Internal assessment of the quality of education is carried out by various procedures, including through self-assessment in preparation for institutional and specialized accreditation of educational programmes.

The mission of the university is adapted to the socio-economic, scientific and cultural development of society, is constantly improving in connection with state reforms in the field of education and healthcare.

In accordance with [SU-MUA-15-22](#) the update of the educational programme (EP) is discussed at a meeting of the department with the participation of employers, at a meeting of the QAC and approved by the Academic Council. The decision to update the educational programme is published on the university website. In connection with the latest changes in [SU-MUA-15-22](#) the EP is being updated, in particular, after the EP is agreed with employers; the mission, the goal of the educational programme is updated, and an analysis of the teaching staff, material and technical base, practical training resources, information technology which is filled in the form of tables at the end of the EP is carried out.

NJSC "AMU" has a sufficient material and technical base that ensures the high-quality implementation of educational programmes. Evidence of the constant improvement and enhancement of the material and technical base of NJSC "AMU" is the use of updated resources of educational and scientific and research laboratories in the educational and scientific processes; annual replenishment of the book fund of the library in Kazakh, Russian and English; introduction of innovative, information and communication technologies.

NJSC "AMU" determines and establishes mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of ongoing educational programmes and ensures the quality of their management process.

The target indicators of the University's Strategic Development Plan for 2019-2025 have been developed, on the basis of which the Tactical Work Plan for the current academic year has been developed. Agreements on cooperation in the field of healthcare, medical education and science were signed with medical universities in Kazakhstan and foreign universities.

Every year, the Center for Planning and Economic Analysis (CP&EA), as well as the Department of Infrastructure and Enterprise Development form the Development Plan for the next year.

The department analyzes its material and technical condition and determines: the necessary

equipment, scientific literature, the cost of advanced training, academic mobility, rental of practice bases, practice guidance, publications, participation in conferences. After that, an application is formed, which is analyzed by the CP&EA for expediency and validity, the formed University Development Plan is reviewed and approved by the Scientific Council of the University.

Programme 7M10105 - "Management in healthcare" is periodically updated to adapt to developments in the field of biomedical, behavioral and social sciences, as well as to the changing needs of the healthcare system, employers and society. According to the internal documents on feedback monitoring conducted by the CAR, constant monitoring and analysis of stakeholder satisfaction is carried out. The university quickly responds to comments and inconsistencies.

Master students and teaching staff of the university noted a direct interest in the implementation of the EP and that they can express their opinion by using trust boxes or the rector's blog. The results of the analysis of the contents of the trust boxes reflect the mechanisms for the participation of students and teaching staff in monitoring the programme.

Feedback is taken from all stakeholders, including employers. Feedback is monitored and is the basis for revising the goals, objectives and activities of the University and the content of the EP. To revise the EP, a working group is created from among the teaching staff of the departments, then the revised EP is submitted for approval.

In order to effectively use the human resources potential of the university, ensure the selection and replacement of a teacher, employees of leading organizations of science and practice are involved.

Teachers of the Research School are trained in doctoral studies, and also improve their skills by studying at advanced training courses, master classes and seminars.

The management of the university motivates employees for individual development, including the passage of advanced training at NJSC "AMU", in other medical and educational organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad at the expense of the university without interruption from work (including distance learning), with a separation or partial separation from work.

The experts studied the current organizational structure of the university, approved by order of the rector in 2023.

Experts' conclusion: thus, in the process of studying the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7M10105 - "**Management in healthcare**" and conducting an external assessment with a visit to the university, the expert commission did not find a single inconsistency with the accreditation standards of the Eurasian Accreditation Center and states the successful implementation of the above educational programme. All 69 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance. At the same time, experts offer recommendations for improving the educational programme, which will make the educational process more attractive and increase its competitiveness in the international academic environment.

6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7M10105 - "Management in healthcare"

1. To systematically monitor the needs of employers and regularly include them in the programme. (1.2.).
2. To involve international experts in the process of developing, evaluating and monitoring the quality of the educational programme, as well as foreign teachers for the implementation of some components of the educational programme (2.6).
3. To provide in the educational programme time and resources (tuition fees, travel and accommodation) for organizing foreign internships for master students in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad countries (4.4.2.).
4. To strengthen the international component of the educational programme through regular (planned) academic mobility of teachers and master students, invitation of professors from

English-speaking countries, joint project activities with leading scientific and educational centers of the world (5.2.1).

5. To ensure the publication of the educational programme in the specialty "Management in healthcare" (as well as all educational programmes of the university) in English on the website of the university, in order to attract more foreign students (6.1.1).

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

EEC members established the compliance of the educational programme 7M10105 - "Management in Healthcare" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

№ p/p	Status in the EEC	Full name
1	Chairperson	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna
2	Foreign expert	Dr. Alenka Braček Lalić
3	Foreign expert	Kodirova Shahlo Salomovna
3	Academic Expert	Zhakypbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich
4	Academic Expert	Daniyarova Anara Bakhitkereyevna
5	Academic Expert	Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna
6	Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapassovna
7	Academic Expert	Ablaykhanova Nurzhanyat Tatukhanovna
8	Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Yeltay Utemuratovich
9	Employers' representative	Zhukubayeva Almira Asetkyzy
10	Representative of doctoral students	Yessenbekova Naira Adilkhanovna

Handwritten signatures of the EEC members corresponding to the table rows. The signatures are written in blue ink on horizontal lines. The first signature is for the Chairperson, and the others are for the various experts and representatives listed in the table.

Attachment 1.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	Evaluation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT	6	6	0	
2.	OUTCOMES	3	3	0	
3.	ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA	6	6	0	
4.	PhD PROGRAMME	10	10	0	
5.	SCIENTIFIC LEADERSHIP	14	14	0	
6.	PhD DISSERTATION	11	11	0	
7.	EVALUATION	10	10	0	
8.	ORGANIZATION STRUCTURE	9	9	0	
9.	SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT	6	6	0	
	Total:	69	69	0	
			69		

List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of an external evaluation of the educational programme

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Приказ «Об утверждении состава Локальной комиссии по биоэтике НАО «Медицинский университет Астана»».	
2.	Приложение к приказу. Состав Локальной комиссии по биоэтике НАО «Медицинский университет Астана».	1
3.	ПЛ-МУА-57-20 Положение об этическом комитете.	1
4.	ПЛ-МУА-57-22 Положение о локальной комиссии по Биоэтике.	1
5.	КП-МУА-ПП-22-13 Управление информационными ресурсами Библиотеки.	1
6.	КП-МУА-ПП-21-16 Управление информационно-коммуникационными системами	1
7.	КП-МУА-ПП-20-16 Управление медицинским оборудованием и средствами измерения	1
8.	КП-МУА-ПП-16-16 Управление персоналом	1
9.	К-МУА-02-19 Этический кодекс обучающихся НАО «МУА»	1
10.	К-МУА-01-20 Кодекс об академической честности	1
11.	ПЛ-МУА-17-22 Формирование портфолио обучающегося НАО «МУА»	1
12.	Образовательная программа программы 7М10105 – «Менеджмент в здравоохранении»	1
13.	ПЛ-МУА-122-20 Положение о компетентной модели выпускника магистратуры	1
14.	П-МУА-17-20 Академическая политика	1
15.	ПЛ-МУА-51-20 Положение об организации педагогической и исследовательской практики магистрантов/докторантов.	1
16.	Об утверждении форм учетной документации в области здравоохранения, а также инструкций по их заполнению	1
17.	Об утверждении Типовых правил приема на обучение в организации образования, реализующие образовательные программы высшего и послевузовского образования	1
18.	СУ-МУА-15-22 Образовательные программы: Разработка, оценка и обновление	1
19.	Справка по оценке удовлетворенности процессом обучения	1
20.	Результаты ОПРОСА PhD ЛИГИ АКАДЕМИЧЕСКОЙ ЧЕСТНОСТИ	1
21.	Результаты ОПРОСА ППС ЛИГИ АКАДЕМИЧЕСКОЙ ЧЕСТНОСТИ	1
22.	ПЛ-МУА-09-20 Правила конкурсного замещения вакантных должностей административно-управленческого персонала НАО МУА	1
23.	Политика АО «Медицинский университет Астана» в области научной деятельности	1
24.	Кодекс корпоративной культуры и этики	1
25.	Кадровая политика НАО МУА	1
26.	Изменения в Правила конкурсного замещения вакантных	1

	должностей административно-управленческого персонала НАО МУА	
27.	Изменения в Правила конкурсного замещения вакантных должностей заведующего кафедрой НАО МУА	1
28.	РИ-МУА-48-20 Требования к содержанию и оформлению PhD докторской диссертации	1
29.	ПЛ-МУА-102-14 Положение о диссертационном совете НАО «МУА»	1
30.	РИ-МУА-18-21 Требования к содержанию, оформлению и защите магистерской диссертации и проекта	1
31.	СУ-МУА-14-17 Внедрение новых образовательных технологий	1
32.	ПЛ-МУА-121-21 Положение об обучении в магистратуре НАО МУА	1
33.	К-МУА-02-19 Этический кодекс обучающихся НАО «МУА»	1
34.	СУ-МУА-15-22 Образовательные программы: Разработка, оценка и обновление	1