

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality assurance in Higher education and Healthcare
18.05.2023

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
7M10112 "PHARMACY" (PROFILE DIRECTION)
OF NJSC "ASTANA MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS
OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF MASTER SPECIALTIES IN
HEALTHCARE**

external expert evaluation period: May 16-18, 2023

Almaty, 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Educational Programmes of Master Specialties in Healthcare and Conclusions	7
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"	9
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"	33
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	34
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and the educational programme of the master's programme in the specialty of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"	35
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	36

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
MH RK	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD RK	Government Decree
NEI	Non-state educational institution
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
University	higher education institution
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Committee for Educational Programmes
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
TS	Teaching staff
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DPCEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CMI	Control measuring instruments
EPQ	Educational process quality
QC	Qualifying commission
RIEP	Resident's Individual Education Plan
RIWT	Resident Independent work under the supervision of a teacher
RIW	Independent work of a student (resident)
EP	Education plan
WC	Working Curriculum
SC	Standard Curriculum
RW	Research work
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Normative legal acts
EMC	Emergency medical care
PHC	Primary Health Care
MED	Medicine of emergencies and disasters
MTB	Material and technical base
MD	Major disciplines
AMU	Astana Medical University

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission (EEC)

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 12 dated May 05, 2023, the EEC was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" in the period of May 16-18, 2023, in the following composition:

No.	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree / title, position, place of work / place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	YERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEYEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of public health and healthcare NJSC "West-Kazakhstan medical university named after Marat Ospanov"
2	Foreign expert	D.R. ALENKA BRAČEK LALIĆ	PhD in Human Resource Management and labor relations. Managing Director of the AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP Institute (since 2021). Vice Dean for Research Institute AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP (2017-2021); Associate Professor in Management (2022 - 2027) Ljubljana Business School; Director of International CEEMAN Quality Accreditation (IQA) (2015-2021), Republic of Slovenia
3	Foreign expert	KODIROVA SHAKHLO SALOMOVNA	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Traditional Medicine and Occupational Diseases of Bukhara State medical institute, the Republic of Uzbekistan
4	National academic expert	ZHAKIPBEKOV KAIRAT SAPARKHANOVICH	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Management and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov"
5	National academic expert	DANIYAROVA ANARA BAKHITKEREVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Higher School of Public Health Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
6	National academic expert	YERZHANOVA FARIDA NURMUKHAMBETOVNA	The highest medical category in public healthcare, Master in Healthcare; Head of the Department of Science and Vocational Education Republican State enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Hospital of the Medical Center for

			Administrative Affairs of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, Deputy Chairperson of the State Unitary Enterprise for additional education under Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council in the direction of training "Healthcare"
7	National academic expert	AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASSOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of Department of dermatovenereology and cosmetology of NJSC "Semey Medical University"
8	National academic expert	NURZHANYAT TATUKHANOVNA ABLAIKHANOVA	Candidate of Biological Sciences, Associate Professor, Deputy Head of the Department of Biophysics, Biomedicine and Neuroscience for Educational and Methodological Work of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
9	National academic expert	RAKHMANOV ELTAY UTEMURATOVICH	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Program in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, organizer of educational, practical and research work of master's students in sports medicine and rehabilitation.
10	Expert - representative of practical healthcare	ZHUKUBAYEVA ALMIRA ASETKYZY	Master in Pedagogy and Psychology, the highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, the first medical category in public healthcare. Head of the Department of Education, LLP "National Scientific Cancer Center"
11	Representative of doctoral students	ESENBKOVA NAIRA ADILKHANOVNA	Doctoral student of the second year of study in the specialty "Biology" NJSC "Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilev"

ECAQA Observer – Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The EEC work was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC.

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for Postgraduate Education Programmes (Master Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the master educational programme in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Astana Medical University", BIN: 080940008218
Management body	Directors and members of the Management Board
Full name of the first head	Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich
Date of establishment	1964
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan 010000 Astana, Beibitshilik st., 49a, phone: +77001539447 Call-center (WhatsApp), +7 (7172) 53 94 47 Call-center, +7 (7172) 53 95 12 Undergraduate admissions committee, +7 (7172) 53 94 24 Rector's reception, fax: + 7 (7172) 53 94 53, mail: rektorat@amu.kz
State license for educational activities in the magistracy (date, number)	KZ93LAA00014823 от 19.03.2019
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2020
Duration of training	1 year
The total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	-
The number of master students in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	1
Full-time teachers/ part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of degree	The total number of teachers is 6, including full-time - 6, part-time - 0. Degree,% - 100 Category, % - 100
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://amu.edu.kz/ru/ @amu_mua_official https://www.facebook.com/MeduniverAstana/

The educational programme of the profile master's programme in the specialty 7M10112 "Pharmacy" was first approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University on August 29, 2019. It was approved in the register of educational programmes on May 1, 2020. This programme is accredited for the first time. The first admission for the programme took place in 2022. In total, 1 master student entered the first year in 2022 on a paid basis.

Self-assessment of the master educational programme in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" (profile direction) was carried out within the framework of the NLA of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of education and healthcare and was based on the results of work for the period 2022 - 2023.

As part of the EP accreditation, an external audit was carried out in accordance with the approved external audit programme on May 16-18, 2023. The expert group visited the laboratories of pharmacognosy, pharmaceutical chemistry, toxicological chemistry and drug technology under the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, City Polyclinic No. 5, Department of General Medical

Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine. During the accreditation, practical classes on the EP were not held, but the commission got acquainted with all the educational and methodological documents of the training.

During the meeting and interviews with master students, graduates and employers, EEC received high marks from all participants in the educational process, both in terms of teaching and assessment methods, and in terms of mastering their competencies by master students. The Master's educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" has a connection with other programmes implemented in NJSC "AMU". The university trains students in the bachelor's degree. Graduates of the master's programme can continue their further education in the doctoral programme "Pharmacy", which is also implemented within NJSC "AMU".

The main achievements of NJSC "AMU" in the implementation of the educational programme of the profile master's programme in the specialty 7M10112 "Pharmacy":

- highly qualified teachers at the university, of which 3 (37.5%) have a doctoral degree, 2 (25%) have a candidate's degree, 1 (12.5%) have a PhD and 2 (25%) specialists with a master's degree;
- among the teaching staff there are the Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Clinical Pharmacologists of Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Managers in Kazakhstan.

The level of infrastructure of NJSC "AMU" allows to provide a high quality of education and scientific research. The infrastructure of NJSC "AMU" includes classrooms equipped with interactive equipment, a scientific library with reading rooms and an electronic library room, 4 laboratories equipped with modern equipment for research work. NJSC "AMU" publishes the magazine "Astana Medicinal Magazine". Also, the following bases are used for the implementation of the profile magistracy: LLP "Longevity" and the network of pharmacies "Alfamed".

It should be mentioned that the AMU has strong ties and is striving to develop cooperation with practical healthcare. To carry out PhD scientific research, doctoral students on priority topics use 70 clinical bases of the university: medical and preventive organizations subordinate to the State Institution "Public Healthcare Department" of Astana and the Local Administration of Astana, as well as Republican centers, research institutes, clinics subordinate to the Ministry of Healthcare, the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University has 19 laboratories: the Testing Laboratory of Radiochemistry and Radiospectrometry, the Laboratory of Radiation Safety and Hygiene, the Laboratory of Radiation Epidemiology and Medical Dosimetric Registry under the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection; Analytical Laboratory, Scientific Research Laboratory, Chemical Laboratory under the Department of General and Biological Chemistry; Educational and hygienic laboratory under the Department of Public Health and Hygiene; Laboratory of Toxicological Chemistry, Laboratory of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Laboratory of Technology of Dosage Forms, Laboratory of Pharmacognosy under the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines; Educational - research laboratory under the Department of General Pharmacology; Interdepartmental Educational and Scientific Morphological Laboratory under the Department of Systemic Anatomy with OPH; Educational - microbiological laboratory under the Department of Microbiology and Virology named after Sh.I. Sarbassova; Educational and research histological laboratory under the Department of Histology and Cytology; Dental laboratory under the Department of Orthopedic and Pediatric Dentistry; Health Diagnostics Laboratory under the Department of Preventive Medicine and Nutrition, Educational and Biology Laboratory under the Department of Molecular Biology and Medical Genetics; Vivarium.

The subdivision responsible for the implementation of the master's degree EP are: Research School, Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, Department of Philological Disciplines, Department of Public Health and Management.

The EEC members conducted interviews with an authorized person, vice-rectors, members of the academic council, the EP committee on levels of education, the head of the admissions committee, employees of the Student Service Center, the dean of the Research School, the head of the Department

of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, heads of various structural divisions of the University, teaching staff, master students and employers. During a personal meeting and interview with the EEC members, there was no doubt that both the educational process and the achievement of all competencies by master students correspond to the stated mission, vision of the University and are attractive to all participants in the educational process.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Until now, the accreditation of the educational programme (7M10112 - "Pharmacy" (profile direction) has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Educational Programmes of Master's Degrees in Healthcare and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" (profile direction) (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 104 pages of the main text, attachments on 40 pages, copies or electronic versions of 29 documents located at the link https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VyMe_BNVpCQdR2uz1Mpu5SH3_gQfo2cr.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 17 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Raisova Karlygash Askerovna, dean of the research school.

Self-assessment of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" (profile direction), was carried out based on the order of the rector of the university No. 7-Н/К dated January 9, 2023 "On the self-assessment of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10112 "Pharmacy".

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Zhakipbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich, and the reviews noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback from the representative of the university and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables, diagrams contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e., verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and in accordance with the programme approved under No. 12 dated 05.05.2023 by the ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 16-18, 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- conversation with management and administrative staff - 4/87 people;
- interviews with master students - 14 people;
- study of the website <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/> ;
- interviewing 6 employees, 6 teachers;
- questioning of teachers and master students - 2 and 5, respectively;
- observation of the master students' training: during the accreditation there were no practical classes, lectures;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visited the Laboratory of Toxicological Chemistry, the Laboratory of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, the Laboratory of Technology of Dosage Forms, the Laboratory of Pharmacognosy, which operate at the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines of NJSC "Astana Medical University", where training is conducted on the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" with the participation of 5 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 29 units, both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of examined documents is in Attachment 2).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with the EEC members

№	Job title	Quantity
1	Head of department of rehabilitation and sports medicine (SM)	1
2	Associate Professor of department of rehabilitation and SM	3
3	Senior Lecturer of department of rehabilitation and SM	1
4	Assistant of department of rehabilitation and SM	3
5	Teacher of department of rehabilitation and SM	1
6	Bachelor degree students	18
7	Administrative staff	14

In the process of visiting the departments of the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: there are highly qualified teachers, among the teaching staff there are the Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Clinical Pharmacologists of Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Managers in Kazakhstan, all conditions have been created for passing teaching staff in the pedagogical direction, a research school has been created to support doctoral students on academic and scientific work.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of conversations, interviews, and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Bachelor's Educational Programme 6B10114 «Ergotherapy» for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation

Council for the period of accreditation was held by the chairperson Professor Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation.

Analyzing the relationship of all interested parties, the commission established the need to involve representatives of public and professional organizations, associations in the field of ergotherapy (for example, the Kazakhstan Association of Ergotherapy - KAE) and complementary medicine on a regular basis in the development, improvement and evaluation of the educational programme and/or its components (electives) and to the assessment of students. The activities of the KAE are aimed at the implementation of international standards established by the World Federation of Occupational Therapists.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of conversations, interviews and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 6B10114 «Ergotherapy» for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years was held by the chairwoman Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

Evidence of Compliance:

1.1 Statement of mission, goals and training outcomes

When implementing the programme activities, namely, based on the results of conversation with vice-rectors, members of the advisory and consultative body (members of the academic council, committee of educational programmes by levels of education (bachelor's, master's, PhD), in interviews with master's students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential master students through the website, social networks, newsletters to medical organizations.

The Development Strategy of NJSC "AMU" for 2022-2026, approved by the decision of the Board of Directors of NJSC "AMU" No. 17 dated May 30, 2022, was studied. The document includes such areas as the training of competitive and professionally competent healthcare professionals in popular specialties and specializations, transformation into a research university and its development as a leading center for translating new knowledge and innovations into healthcare practice and policy, development of the university as an integrated academic medical center operating based on the trinity of education, science and practice, development of human resources and improvement of the university management and financing system, development of the infrastructure and material and technical base of the university, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with master students, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, they say where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases.

The survey conducted by the teaching staff showed that 62.96% of teachers believe that the disciplines are provided with the necessary resources. At the same time, 62.96% of the respondents answered that requests for the purchase of materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational programme are completed in a timely manner.

NJSC "AMU" has divisions that are directly related to the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy", which can be noted as the best practice in education.

When developing the Mission of the EP, "Professional standards for pharmaceutical activities" were taken into account. This conclusion was made by experts, since the goals and outcomes of the 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" programme are aimed at mastering all the processes of pharmaceutical activity, the practice of scientific research in drug development, pharmaceutical marketing and management. The mission was discussed at a meeting of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines with the participation of employers, approved by protocol No. 7 dated January 6, 2023, included in the text of the educational programme (EP) and posted on the university website for wide access to interested parties. The mission was reviewed and approved at a meeting of the Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) of master's degree educational programmes (Minutes No. 2 dated March 14, 2023).

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" correspond to each other. The educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and the current normative legal acts (NLA) in postgraduate education and healthcare.

At the same time, the experts determined that the outcomes of training do not fully reveal the mission and vision of NJSC "AMU" in the context of modern healthcare development.

1.2 Participation in the formulation of the mission and training outcomes

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with Koikov V.V., Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: ways and mechanisms for informing employers and master students about the mission and goals of the EP; the relationship of training outcomes with the subsequent preparation of graduates and the commitment to lifelong learning; linking the training outcomes with the existing and emerging needs of the society in which graduates will work. In the course of the answers, Vice-Rector Koikov V.V. confirmed that the mission and the outcomes of the training are formulated in accordance with the strategic goals of NJSC "AMU", which, after discussion at a meeting of the department in the presence of employers and master students, are considered at a meeting of the QAC of master's degree educational programmes, approved by the Academic Council.

When developing the EP Mission, the Professional Standards for Pharmaceutical Activities, as well as the Development Strategy of NJSC "AMU" for 2022-2026, were taken into account.

When conducting a **survey of 5 master students** (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 39 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational programme. *It has been established that 86.67% of master students will recommend studying at the university to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 85.33% of respondents believe that the leaders of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "In your opinion, does the university allow you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 82.67% of master students answered positively, 1.33% are not sure about this, 12% could not answer this question yet and 4% would like to believe it.*

At the same time, when talking with master students and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the NJSC "AMU", the educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of master students to improving the educational programme?". To these questions, master students answered that the educators are members of the CEP and AC, but could not answer which of the master students is included in these councils. And the employers answered that they partially involved in the formulation of the mission and goals of NJSC "AMU".

1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

The interviewed teachers answered that 77.78% are fully satisfied with the level of organization of the educational process in NJSC "AMU", and 22.2% are partially satisfied.

Within the framework of the provided academic freedom, the University Standard SU-MUA-15-22 "Educational Programmes: Development, Evaluation, Update" was developed, which regulates the procedure for developing educational programmes.

The experts established a clear continuity between the outcomes of the previous master's students' studies (prerequisites) and training in the master's degree, and subsequent postgraduate programmes. The organization has developed doctoral programmes, including for the specialty 8D10104 "Pharmacy". Master students are aware of this.

70.37% of teachers-respondents believe that students have free access to patients at the clinical bases of the university or to the resources of practice bases (for pharmacy and healthcare) to improve their practical skills, and 14.81% partially agree with this.

The 27 surveyed teachers of postgraduate education (including master's degree students) answered that, 81.48% were satisfied with the organization of labor and the workplace at the university, and 14.81% partially agreed with this statement. The experts determined that the university has a healthy microclimate, since the head is quite accessible to both master students and staff, responds promptly to requests and suggestions from the teaching staff and students. 85.19% of teachers are satisfied with the observance of ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers, management, and 14.81% are partially satisfied. According to 81.48% of respondents, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself/herself as a professional in his/her specialty. For information, a total of 27 people answered (there are 46 staff in total), while teaching experience up to 5 years - 22.2%, up to 10 years - 14.8%, over 10 years - 63%.

1.4 Name and description of the programme

NJSC "AMU" has developed its own form of Syllabus. In addition to the EP itself, Syllabus, Working curricula, there is a catalog of elective disciplines (CED), which contains a description of the elective disciplines available for the choice of master students.

EPs are developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard, reflects the RO, on the basis of which curricula (working curricula), individual curricula of students) and syllabuses for disciplines/modules are developed.

The goals and requirements for the preparation of a dissertation, including design, structure, volume, style, approaches to monitoring and evaluation, are determined by the internal regulatory document (IRD) RI-MU A-18-20 "Requirements for the content, design and defense of a master's thesis."

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 5 standards (basic): fully - 3, partially - 2, not compliant - 0.

Standard 1: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To revise the outcomes of master student training in connection with the new challenges and needs of the specialty and society as a whole (clauses 1.1.2., 1.2.1)

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of Compliance:

2.1 Training and teaching methods

For the implementation of the educational programme in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" in the documents of the organization there are teaching materials, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements was established.

Visiting the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, the experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the start of the class, master students

answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills in the main areas of practical pharmacy. The University ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as the experts studied the Code of Ethics for Students of NJSC "AMU", approved by the decision of the Board No. 28 dated December 26, 2019, and during the interview, the master students answered that they were informed about the content of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the educational basis and all the achievements of practice in advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the teaching materials bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The management system was assessed, which is described in the regulation "On training in the magistracy of NJSC "AMU", approved by the decision of the Board No. 18 dated 18.06.2021. There is only 1 supervisor, whose tasks are to guide and control the implementation of the dissertation work of the master student during training.

The procedure for informing master students about their rights and obligations is reflected in the regulation "On training in the magistracy of NJSC "AMU", approved by the decision of the Board No. 18 dated 18.06.2021.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of master students. At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the Code of Academic Integrity, approved by the decision of the Board No. 29 dated 08.10.2020, there is no monitoring by the research school in the organization.

2.2 Development of academic skills

In the structure of the educational programme of the master's degree, a significant place is given to the independent work of master students (IWM), which contributes to increasing their responsibility for their professional development and lifelong learning. The EP also describes teaching and assessment methods.

When talking with master students, the experts learned that research skills are achieved through the applied teaching and assessment methods: Problem-based learning (PBL), Research-Based Learning (RBL), analysis from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that the main skills and competencies acquired by master students are reflected in the Regulations on the Competence Model of the Master's Graduate of NJSC "AMU" (PL-MUA-123-21). These skills and competencies are formed by the master student in the course of studying the disciplines of the university component, the disciplines of the elective component, as well as such components of the EP as work experience internship, experimental research work of the master student. The student chooses disciplines in AIS Platonus using the instructions posted on the portal. The student is responsible for the formation of an individual education plan (IEP) and the completeness of mastering the course of study in accordance with the requirements of the working curriculum of the specialty/educational programme. The volume and content of the studied disciplines, as well as the requirements for the form and timing of assignments, the form of interim assessment and assessment criteria are determined by the working individual plan and the syllabuses of disciplines.

The management of the educational process reflected in the self-assessment report (**standard 2**) and the general approaches to management were confirmed by visiting the Registrar's Office, the research school and talking with the head and staff. At the same time, the verification of **standard 2** showed that the research school needs to more widely monitor the implementation of the master student's individual education plan, since in the course of the survey, 64% of the master students indicated that they were not engaged.

The experts got acquainted with the work of departments, including the Registrar's Office, the Test Center, the Simulation Center, the Admissions Committee, and the Student Service Center. A total of 6 meetings were held and during the cross-interview it was found that the teaching staff is not sufficiently motivated to be scientific supervisors.

When talking with master students, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of master students, including in educational laboratories. At the same time, master students deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

Training of master students in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical pharmacy. The shortage of specialists in 2022 amounted to more than 50 units. Therefore, the university provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in the field of practical pharmacy. So, during a conversation with the management of NJSC "AMU", the experts learned that master students are fully provided with internship bases, and teachers confirmed that the training of master students is carried out directly in pharmaceutical organizations ("Medical Center AMU" LLP, "Biosphere", "Terra Pharm").

Of the 75 master students surveyed, 81.33% answered that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 6.67% believe that rarely or sometimes. When visiting the Department of Pharmaceutical Discipline, the experts identified problems in the implementation of new teaching methods, including *the lack of interactive whiteboards* that would facilitate the further introduction of active and interactive teaching methods.

2.3 Content of the programme, scope of application

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including the Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU" (P-MUA-17-20), Regulations on training in the magistracy (PL-MUA-121-21), Educational programmes: development, evaluation, updating (SU-MUA-15-22). The Research School is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programmes and the catalog of elective disciplines (CED) reflected the needs of the healthcare system, including in the personnel of practical pharmacy, as well as the specifics of experimental research work (ERW) and the scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following analysis and review of professional literature, identification of key issues, planning of experimental research activities, conducting research, correct interpretation of data and presentation of results. For the successful implementation of the educational programme 7M10112 - "Pharmacy", the university has resources for assessing the practical skills of master students (Training laboratories for pharmacognosy, pharmaceutical chemistry, toxicological chemistry, drug technology, as well as a training pharmacy).

Teachers provide master students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, *in which 85.3% are completely satisfied, 5.3% are partially satisfied.*

NJSC "AMU" has 4 educational laboratories at the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, and also signed 7 contracts with pharmaceutical organizations, including 3 foreign ones (Belarusian State Medical University, Tashkent Pharmaceutical Institute, St. Petersburg Chemical and Pharmaceutical University). *To the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training", 70.7% of master students answered in full agreement, 9.3% partially agree, 27% disagree. At the same time, 84% of master students claim that after the completion of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to the opinion of the master student, conducts a mini-questionnaire, error analysis session).*

At the same time, to the question *"Do representatives of master students participate in the development of educational programmes?"*, the experts received the following answer - *yes, they participate, but could not answer in what format they participate, and also could not name the representatives of master students in commissions and councils. The surveyed master students are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (84%).*

2.4 Research and grants

The educational programme includes the achievements of biopharmaceutical and pharmaceutical sciences, which contribute to the formation of the methodology of pharmaceutical research among students, experimental research knowledge, which is fundamental for the development and improvement of pharmaceutical research and the formation of research thinking in the section of independent work with a teacher.

Experimental research work of master students is a mandatory component in training. When talking with master students, the experts learned that during the period of study master students show their publication activity, which reflects the qualifications of master students in the field of mastering the methods of critical analysis when doing research, as well as understanding the social, contextual and historical basis of theories, hypotheses and ideas when doing research. The teachers said that they teach master students the methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and experimental data, the use of pharmaceutical developments. University staff actively participate in international conferences and congresses.

NJSC "AMU" holds a conference of young scientists and students, where master students present the results of their experimental research work in the form of oral, poster reports, publications, they also participate in various republican and international scientific and practical conferences.

When questioning master students, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work and 58.7% of people fully agree with this, 10.7% partially agree, 5.3% completely disagree.

2.5 Structure and duration of the programme

The structure and duration of the educational programme (EP) corresponds to the State Compulsory Educational Standard, which is reflected in the educational programme. According to the academic calendar, the start of master student studies in 2022 is from September 1, the deadline for the defense of the master's work is June 2023.

In the master's programme of the profile direction, the volume of the cycle of major disciplines (MD) is 71% of credits from all hours of study in the master's programme, of which 36% is allocated to the disciplines of the university component and 64% - to the disciplines of the elective component. 28% of credits from all hours of training are allocated for work experience internship and the implementation of experimental research work of a master student (ERWM). 12 credits are allocated for the end-of-course assessment. In addition to the cycles of the university component, prescribed in the structure of the educational programme, there are elective components that are developed by departments based on the demand for the labor market. An integral part of this master's degree educational programme is experimental research work for the profile direction. The number of credits in the EP of the profile direction in ECTS is 60, the number of hours is 1800.

In order to change the content of the EP, feedback is being studied in the form of a questionnaire and a QR survey. Each classroom and laboratory are equipped with QR screening, which allows you to get instant feedback on the quality of the lesson. The evaluation of the programme is carried out in accordance with SU-MUA-15-22 "Educational programmes: development, evaluation and updating". The procedure for extension and interruption in training, if any.

The main base for training a master's student in "Pharmacy" is the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, the Department of Philological Disciplines, the Department of Public Health and Management, "Europharma" LLP, "Longevity" LLP, "AlfaMed" Pharmacy Network. Educational laboratories, free access to the databases of the electronic library, consultations of the teaching staff are available for the master student.

When questioning master students to the question "Does the content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meet their expectations", 80% answered in full agreement, 18.67% partially.

2.6 Educational programme development process

The EP is developed in accordance with SU-MUA-15-22 "Educational programmes: development, evaluation and updating". The most highly qualified specialists from among teachers and prominent scientists of relevant profiles and disciplines are involved in the process of developing and compiling programmes. Employers such as Duysebayeva S.S., Senior Manager of the Department of Drug Provision of NJSC "Social Medical Insurance Fund", Mukazhanova M.U., Radiochemist-technologist of the Nuclear Medicine Unit of the Diagnostic Center of the Hospital of the Medical Center of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Smagulova F.M., head of

the medicinal department of the Administration of the city of Astana took part in the development of the EP.

Schools present the developed project of the EP for discussion at the QAC. After discussion at the QAC, the EP draft with an extract of the protocol of the QAC is submitted for approval by the Academic Council. The EP was first entered into the Register of EP of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education dated 01.05.2020.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards (including 19 basic, 2 improvement standards): fully - 20, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

Standard 2: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To conduct an annual assessment of the needs for specialists in pharmacy and, based on this, plan the content and structure of the educational programme and the admission of master students.

Standard 3: EVALUATION OF MASTER STUDENTS

Evidence of Compliance:

3.1 Evaluation methods

The general policy, principles, methods for evaluating master students are reflected in the following internal legal documents: Academic policy of the AMU. The regulation on the ongoing monitoring of progress, interim and end-of-course assessment of master students of NJSC "AMU" are prescribed in the Academic Policy, approved by the decision of the Board No. 29 dated 08.10.2020, amended and supplemented by the decision of the Board No. 23 dated 09.29.2022.

All types of training activities (practical studies, independent work of a master student with a teacher, independent work of a master student and midterm examination) are evaluated as one summative assessment of the section in the midterm examination. Students who have scored 50 points for the admission rating evaluation, who have attended practical classes and do not have passes without a good reason, debts for practical classes, independent work of a master student with a teacher, independent work of a master student and midterm examination are allowed to the summative assessment. The principles, methods and practices used to evaluate master students include peer review and defense of the master's project. The control and assessment of the knowledge of master students of the University is carried out according to the grade-rating system. Verification of educational achievements of master students is carried out by conducting ongoing monitoring of progress in the form of an exam at the end of each discipline, interim and end-of-course assessment of master students.

The study of control and measuring tools (60 case problems, 60 examination questions) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of master students. During the interview, master students spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, using interactive technologies in the study of situational cases in the form of a discussion, and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system for appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document of the Academic Policy and there were no precedents for appeal during the period of work of NJSC "AMU".

So, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked the head of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines Atymtaikyzy Ainash and checked the documents and methods for evaluating master students. Control and measuring tools are reviewed by employers. The head of the department replied that additions and updates to the CIS are planned to be made next year.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with an employee Ashikbayeva M.A. (senior methodologist of the research school), the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, unit regulations, contracts with faculty and master students, memorandums with bases of practice and internships, portfolios, individual plans for master students,

curricula of master student, and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, grade record books), assessment tools (check-lists, statements), attestations, certificates and verification.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for master students: Academic policy; Decree No. 390; Regulations on business trips; About training in a magistracy; On the competence model of a master's degree graduate; On the formation of a portfolio; On the organization of pedagogical and research practices of magistracy and doctoral studies; About employment of the graduate; Requirements for the content, design and defense of a master's thesis; Grade-rating system of assessments and there is information from 15 NORMATIVE LEGAL ACTS, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with the head of the department of pharmaceutical disciplines.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and training

The results of the assessment of master students are documented as follows, the results of the current academic performance and midterm examination in the disciplines are reflected in the gradebook of master student. The exam score, annual and end-of-course assessment scores are derived as an average of the scores of the two stages (theoretical and practical). The results of the achievement of the master students are put in the academic record. After each discipline passed, a survey of master students is conducted. The student's progress is also assessed based on the results of the submission of semi-annual reports of master students, internship reports, as well as the results of the preparation and defense of master's thesis. When passing the experimental research work, the master student keeps a diary. After the master's student passes the experimental research work, the supervisor puts an assessment in the Platonus automated information system.

When conducting interviews with 46 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts obtained convincing evidence that there is an adequate assessment of educational achievements. Master students also shared their opinion on the timeliness of submitting examination questions, consulting before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness.

During the visit to the organization, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to increase the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?". And a positive response was received.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, 4 laboratories at the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, where microscopes, scales, a viscometer, a granulator, a refractometer, a spectrophotometer, a thermostat, testers, a photometer, a tablet press, a chromatograph, a polarimeter were presented.

3.3 Feedback from master students

The leaders of the EP, teachers, managers, university administration receive feedback from students after passing the assessment procedure. The survey includes an assessment of the satisfaction of master students with the teaching methods used, the quality of the educational process, the assessment procedure by conducting a survey (questionnaire, focus group method, etc.). The lecturers shared their problems with the experts regarding a small number of students, but they periodically conduct a focus group in the form of an oral interview with a master student. The survey data is used to analyze the existing problems in the process of implementing the EP, including the assessment system. In the 2022-2023 academic year, only 1 master student entered the educational programme of the master's degree.

Within the framework of the meetings of the department, the School Council, the Quality Assurance Committee of the magistracy, the academic council of the university, the results of the midterm and end-of-course assessment of students are discussed, the results of feedback are analyzed, the issues of approbation and implementation of new, evidence-based methods of assessing knowledge are discussed.

After the end of each academic period, the master student presented semi-annual reports at the meeting of the department and the school council, in which he/she presented the main results on the

implementation of the work plan, orally presented an analysis of the problems that arose during the implementation of the plan.

3.4 Quality assurance of the assessment system

NJSC "AMU" has adopted the Policy in the field of the quality of the educational process, which is spelled out in the Academic Policy of NJSC "AMU".

During the end-of-course assessment (defence of master's theses), NJSC "AMU" provides participation as an external examiner of a qualified specialist in the practical field. The chairperson of the end-of-course assessment in the report gives own assessment not only of the level of competence of the graduates of the programme, but can also reflect shortcomings in the approaches, evaluation criteria and results in the form of comments and recommendations. Candidates for the Chairperson and members of the end-of-course assessment Commission are considered at a meeting of the graduate department and research school, discussed at a meeting of the Academic Council and approved by the Rector's Order. The end-of-course assessment of the master student will take place at the end of the 2022-2023 academic year.

When questioning master students, 89.33% answered that they were satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, 6.7% were partially satisfied.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria compliant with 10 standards (basic): fully - 10.

Standard 3: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.

Standard 4: MASTER STUDENTS

Evidence of Compliance:

4.1 Admission policy and selection

NJSC "AMU" has a policy for the admission of master students, which is called the Rules for admission to the magistracy (PR-MUA-04-21), approved by the decision of NJSC "AMU" No. 18 dated 18.06.2021.

Zhilkiybayeva K.T., the head of the Admissions Committee, spoke about the admission policy for master students. Approaches to the admission of master students are built on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, the Order of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education" dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan - 2022.

For the period 2022-2023, 1 master student was accepted for the educational programme in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy".

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all the criteria are met, at the same time, some shortcomings are identified: approaches and benefits for admission to the magistracy of persons from multi-member families, orphans and the disabled are not defined. The experts got acquainted with the documentation on the admission of master students, including the Rules for admission to the magistracy. Many documents are well drawn up.

Experts interviewed master students about the practice of academic counseling, personal support for master students and the development of not only professional skills. NJSC "AMU" has a programme for the development of master students, which includes the participation of a master student in the public life of the University, experimental research work. Master students are included in the composition of such advisory bodies as the meeting of the department, the school council, CEP, AC.

During the meeting with the experts, the master students said that before entering NJSC "AMU", they took all the necessary information regarding the choice of specialty, the period of study, allocated educational grants, tuition fees, from the Admissions Committee and employees of the research school. The teachers answered that they annually carry out guidance counseling among

students and healthcare professionals so that they enter the scientific, pedagogical and specialized master's programme

4.2 Recruitment of master students

The state order for the training of master students in the specialty of specialized Pharmacy will not be allocated. Training takes place on a paid basis. In the 2022-2023 academic year, 1 person entered.

4.3 Support and advice for master students

The university has developed and is implementing the "Regulations on the student support service of NJSC "AMU". During a conversation with master students, the experts revealed that information support is provided by various Internet resources of the university: on the website, which provides general information about the university, information about student support services, about the organization of the educational process at the university, the policy for assessing knowledge, skills and abilities of students, about the rules of internal (labor) regulations, the rights and obligations of students, the code of honor of the student of the AMU, an information guide for foreign citizens receiving education at the university, the academic calendar of the specialty and other information necessary for the student.

The master students said that information on specific disciplines (discipline policy, thematic plans, assessment tools, library resources) is presented in the syllabuses of disciplines that are available in AIS Platonus in the teaching materials section. After enrolling in a Master's programme, the Research School creates a chat on the WhatsApp platform, where Master students are informed about the services.

Operational information support on all issues of organizing the educational process is provided by the Research School, teachers. During a conversation with an employee Ashikbayeva M.A. (senior methodologist of the research school), the experts found out that the school informs master students about the class schedule, exam schedule, consultation schedule for all disciplines of the working curriculum, etc. When checking the site by experts, this information was posted on the website of NJSC "AMU".

Catalogs of elective disciplines, updated annually, are available to master students in the AIS Platonus.

The university has a corporate e-mail with an address book, which contains the e-mail addresses of the rector, vice-rectors, deans, heads of structural divisions, heads of departments, teaching staff, employees and students.

To resolve all academic issues and social problems, the student can contact the Research School during certain consultation hours. On the website of the university, there is an "Online Rector's Reception Room", where each visitor to the site can ask a question, submit their proposals for optimizing the management processes of the structural divisions and services of the university. Students can send their proposals to deans and other representatives of the administration via corporate e-mail. *In addition, there are and are being implemented social programmes to support students, which is confirmed by 56% of the surveyed master students.*

To the question of the questionnaire "Are programme managers and teachers aware of the problems of students related to training", 85.33% answered that they agree with this wording. 94.67% of respondents answered that teachers and university staff respect students. The Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines organized quarterly meetings to advise and support master students.

4.4 Master student representation

NJSC "AMU" has created conditions for the representation of students of all levels of education (bachelor's, master's, doctoral studies) in advisory bodies for their participation in determining the Mission of the organization of education, developing, managing and evaluating educational programmes, and resolving other issues affecting the interests of students. During interviews with master students, the experts received exhaustive answers about the role of representation of master students in the advisory bodies of the university.

Under the programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy" one master student is studying and he/she was not involved in the work of advisory bodies, but has information from master students of other EPs. The master student took part in the discussion of the mission of the EP, as well as issues related to the educational process and the approval of teaching materials for the master's programme.

When questioning master students, the experts determined that 49.33% of the respondents know that master students participate in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programmes committees), 10.67% partially have information about this, 22.67% answered that they do not know about it.

4.5 Graduate requirements

The master student after completing the training under the programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy" and defending the master's project receives a master's degree in pharmacy.

There has not yet been a master's degree for this EP.

After visiting the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, the experts determined that the master's project should be written individually, contain a set of new and reliable results for public defense, have internal unity, determined by the presence of a connection between the results obtained in the work within the framework of the developed or studied theoretical or applied task, testify to the student's personal contribution to practice, the new solutions proposed by him must be strictly reasoned and critically evaluated in comparison with known solutions. The main results of the master's project submitted for defense must be presented in at least one publication and/or reported at a scientific and practical conference. Abstracts of conferences, symposiums, meetings, overview information reports, analytical reviews, information sheets with a volume of at least 0.3 p.s. and provisional patents (patents) can be equated to publications.

The master's project must be checked for plagiarism in accordance with the "Rules and Procedure for Checking Works for the Degree of Originality of NJSC "AMU"". Upon completion of the end-of-course assessment of master students, the Chairperson of the end-of-course assessment draws up a report on the results of the end-of-course assessment of master students and submits it to the rector of the university.

A master student who has mastered the EP and passed the end-of-course assessment in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" is awarded the degree "Master of Pharmacy" and is issued a state diploma with an application. The transcript records all academic disciplines and (or) modules that the student has studied, indicating the final grade, including grades "FX" and "F".

4.6 Indicators of progress and reasons for falling behind

The university management provides comprehensive support to master students in the form of discounts on medical care at university clinics, on vouchers for university recreation areas; financial resources are allocated, and support is provided to needy master students. There is free Internet access in all university buildings and dormitories, services are provided without traffic restrictions. Each master student has own individual identification number and password to enter and work on the Internet. The reading rooms of the university are equipped with a sufficient amount of computer equipment, which master students can use to work with the electronic resources of the library and to prepare assignments.

Master students are annually provided with holidays lasting at least 6 weeks, after the final state certification, lasting at least 4 weeks.

The monitoring system for the current and final academic performance of master students is ensured by the timeliness of grading in the electronic journal, filling in the examination records. Current academic performance is under the control of the research school.

All types of assessments are recorded in the electronic journal on the "Platonus" platform by the teacher who is assigned to the corresponding group. The current rating and the final grade are calculated automatically by a special programme. On a monthly basis, teachers submit to the School the results of attestation of master students reflecting current performance problems: absences from lessons, not completed assignments, poor academic performance. The nature of the disciplinary

sanction is determined by the Internal Labor Regulations (PR-MUA-25-17), approved by the decision of the Board No. 22 dated May 19, 2017.

Master students pass all exams in strict accordance with the working individual curriculum, as well as the curriculum of the discipline. If a student, after two retakes of the summative assessment, received an “FX” or “F” grade, then he/she is subject to expulsion from the university. During the implementation of the programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy" there were no cases of expulsion of master students.

A master student who has mastered the full theoretical course of study of the educational programme of the master's degree, but who has not defended his/her master's thesis within the prescribed period, may be extended the term of study in the master's programme on a paid basis.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 12 standards (basic): fully - 11, partially - 1, not compliant - 0

Standard 4: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To include in the master student admission policy a section on the practice of accepting students from low-income families, national minorities and persons with special health needs.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

Evidence of Compliance:

5.1 Selection policy

There are 9 employees of the profile department in total, of which 8 are full-time teachers, part-time - 1. Experts are familiar with the personnel policy (Decision of the Board No. 23 dated 08.20.2020), the Rules for the competitive replacement of positions of teaching staff and HR (PR-MUA-20-18, decision of the Board No. 26 dated 14.05.2018) and the Regulation on training in the magistracy (PL-MUA -121-21, decision of the Board No. 18 dated 18.06.2021).

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes certain requirements: persons with an academic degree of a doctor of science or a candidate of science and a PhD degree, masters or specialists with the highest qualification category that correspond to the profile of the discipline. Conversation with the head of the HR Department Zikenov I.I. included questions: how and in what way is the stimulation and motivation of AMU employees to involve master students in scientific supervision? *The answers allowed the experts to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most part-time workers do not have teaching methods and pedagogical competencies.*

The answers of the teachers of the department allowed the experts to learn about the strategy and tactics of recruiting master students, information support of the educational programme, as well as

When questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (77.8%) are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in the university, but 22.2% are partially satisfied. Teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 92.6% fully agree, 3.7% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service (personnel) - 70.4% fully agree, 22.2% partially. Satisfied with wages - 11.1% fully agree, 37% disagree.

5.2 Teacher Commitment and Development

At a meeting with the head of the personnel department and during interviews with teachers, experts obtained an opinion on approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with master students, the implementation of scientific leadership, which involves hiring employees with pedagogical competencies and corresponding qualification requirements. It should be noted that the main task is to create and develop the own scientific and innovative potential of teachers. The formation of the staff is based on the needs of the educational programme, as well as the academic load. The degree of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines is 100%, among the teaching staff there are the Laureate of the State Prize of the Republic of

Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Clinical Pharmacologists of Kazakhstan, members of the Association of Managers in Kazakhstan.

The experts received answers about the professional development programme for teachers, which is held annually and the last training was in 2022. These events are funded by the university. Experts verified teachers' certificates in such areas of professional development as an effective teacher, researcher/scientist, communication skills, leader/organizer, and professional.

Experts found that teachers initiate research & development and experimental research work topics for master students, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, apparatus and equipment for pharmaceutical research and development of pharmaceutical substances and drugs.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies at the university - 88.89% of the respondents fully agree, and 7.41% partially agree with this. 62.96% studied at advanced vocational training programmes during this year, 14.81% more than 5 years ago and 7.41% answered "I don't remember when it was".

The organization implements social support programmes for teachers - 63% answered that "yes, such programmes exist", 3.7% "I have already used it", 3.7% of respondents answered that there are no such programmes, and 22.2% of respondents do not know about it. 92% master students are satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, supervisors, 2.67% - partially.

5.3 Number and qualifications of teaching and managerial staff

In accordance with the Plan for advanced training of the academic teaching staff of NJSC "AMU" for five academic years, the number of trained teachers is: for the 2017-2018 academic year - 309; 2018-2019 academic year - 457; 2019-2020 academic year - 597; 2020-2021 academic year - 623; 2021-2022 academic year - 619. During the reporting period, 258 teachers were trained at the young teacher's school.

To increase the level of both professional and pedagogical competence, personal potential and readiness to solve non-standard tasks in education, 13 training events were organized for the period from 2018 to 2022 with the invitation of foreign and domestic specialists.

In order to implement the State Healthcare Development Programme of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Densaulyk" for 2016-2019 and the Roadmap, the project "Development and implementation of a programme for the development of medical ethics and communication skills of medical workers" was carried out, which was successfully implemented at the University, where 616 teachers (547 teachers of clinical departments and 69 teachers of theoretical departments) studied at seminars on the topics: "Development of communication skills of students in clinical disciplines" and "Development of communication skills of students in theoretical disciplines".

The scientific supervisor of the master student is Doctor of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Professor Arystanov Zh.M., with more than 48 years of experience, having more than 100 publications on the profile of the master's programme in international journals, including leading journals of the near abroad and publications in journals included in the international bases of the RSCI.

In order to ensure the quality of scientific management of master students (and doctoral students), NJSC "AMU" has established the number of master students (and doctoral students) per 1 supervisor: no more than 2 doctoral students and 3 master students.

5.4 Administrative support

The personnel policy of NJSC "AMU" is published on the university portal and it is recorded that it is designed to strengthen the confidence of employees in the demand for their work, a fair assessment of activities to ensure the long-term economic potential of the university, preserve and increase its intellectual capital.

During a conversation with the heads of structural divisions and teachers (Teaching staff), the experts determined that the general management of the educational programme is carried out by the Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. The vice-rector at meetings with postgraduate students maintains regular feedback on design issues when developing an individual education plan, planning scientific internships, academic mobility, etc., managing and evaluating master's programmes

(meetings with teaching staff, meetings, questionnaires). The experts got acquainted with such documents as the Regulation on remuneration, bonuses and social security of AMU employees (PL-MUA-76-20, decision of the Board No. 39 dated 30.12.2020).

For feedback with stakeholders, online blogs are maintained by the Chairperson of the Board - the Rector and the Dean of the Research School, where master students can put their direct questions. As the meetings with the administration, teachers and master students showed, they are quite accessible for master students and ordinary teachers. Information on the University website is updated in a timely manner. The corporate mail of the University runs faultlessly. Appointment to positions is carried out on a competitive basis.

When conducting a conversation with the teaching staff, the experts determined that scientific supervisors are not sufficiently motivated to take leadership over master students.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards (basic): fully - 6, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

Standard 5: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To determine the incentive mechanisms for scientific supervisors of master students and teachers responsible for the development and management of the educational programme and implement them at the university.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND TEACHING ENVIRONMENT

Evidence of Compliance:

6.1 Teaching environment

The University has a developed material and technical base for conducting educational and scientific and educational processes under the "Pharmacy" EP. The University provides every student with free access to information resources, library funds and material and technical equipment in the form of a classroom fund, laboratory equipment, multimedia equipment, and rooms where practical skills can be developed.

The university has 19 laboratories: Testing Laboratory of Radiochemistry and Radiospectrometry, Laboratory of Radiation Safety and Hygiene, Laboratory of Radiation Epidemiology and Medical Dosimetric Registry under the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection; Analytical Laboratory, Scientific Research Laboratory, Chemical Laboratory under the Department of General and Biological Chemistry; Educational and hygienic laboratory under the Department of Public Health and Hygiene; Laboratory of Toxicological Chemistry, Laboratory of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Laboratory of Technology of Dosage Forms, Laboratory of Pharmacognosy under the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines; Educational - research laboratory under the Department of General Pharmacology; Interdepartmental Educational and Scientific Morphological Laboratory under the Department of Systemic Anatomy with OPH; Educational - microbiological laboratory under the Department of Microbiology and Virology named after Sh.I. Sarbassova; Educational and research histological laboratory under the Department of Histology and Cytology; Dental laboratory under the Department of Orthopedic and Pediatric Dentistry; Health Diagnostics Laboratory under the Department of Preventive Medicine and Nutrition, Educational and Biology Laboratory under the Department of Molecular Biology and Medical Genetics; Vivarium.

A Local Ethics Commission has been created and is functioning, which considers research projects (including master students) in medical and pharmaceutical specialties that require the conclusion of the Ethics Commission.

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines was visited with 4 specialized laboratories with a total area of 200 m². A sufficient number of modern equipment and devices are provided, which demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and leaders provide quality training in compliance with safety regulations. Before

starting the corresponding discipline of the EP, the master student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

The Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines was visited, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and master students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts obtained evidence of the implementation of standard 6 in relation to the material and technical base of the master's programme in pharmacy.

The Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines was visited, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and master students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts obtained evidence of the implementation of standard 6 in relation to the material and technical base of the master's programme in pharmacy.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with master students (different specialties). The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, enough time to conduct an experiment, work with data, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, availability of international databases of professional literature as a resource. In general, master students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the university has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, master students would like more independence in conducting research, holding international events.

The master students showed their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, financing, demonstrated English proficiency when answering questions from foreign expert Alenka Braček Lalić. The experts studied the documents of master students (portfolio, the results of the assessment of master students-check-lists, the results of the survey of master students).

A survey of master students on the conditions and equipment of training rooms, classrooms showed that 61.3% are completely satisfied, 20% are partially satisfied. In addition, experts found that 62.7% of respondents fully agree with the statement about the availability of office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) for students in classrooms and practice bases; 10.7% partially. The same opinion is confirmed by the data of questioning teachers: 63% fully agree, 33.3% partially agree. Teachers claim that the disciplines they teach are provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment).

6.2 Information technology

There is a library, reading rooms, a coworking room, where everyone can get absolutely free. The organization of the work of these offices is carried out according to the work schedule. In addition, in 2010 the WEB-IRBIS module was mastered and an electronic catalog was posted on the library website (<http://bibl.amu.kz>).

The general fund of the library has more than 26,800 copies of literature (3596 in Kazakh, 21454 in Russian, 1750 in English), including 2238 textbooks (435 in Kazakh, 877 in Russian, 926 in English), 124 scientific literature (18 in Russian, 106 in English), 9717 periodicals (239 in Kazakh, 9381 in Russian, 97 in English), electronic editions 10292 (2297 in Kazakh, 7374 in Russian).

To date, the library has implemented a system of electronic lending of literature to library users in all courses and specialties of the university.

Electronic databases are updated annually. The number of issued periodicals on the profile of the university is constantly increasing. At the moment, the library has 59 computers with access to electronic databases.

For master students, 12 electronic databases are available via the local Internet network, purchased at the expense of the university budget and received by national subscription through the National Center for State Scientific and Technical Expertise, including the following: Aknur,

Epigraph, Books-up.ru, Pubmed, Jaypeedigital, WebofKnowledge, DynaMed, ScientificandMedical ART, Sciencedirect, Springerlink, Geotar-Media, Polpred.com.

Access to the “Paragraph” database, Emerald, “Thomson Reuters”, “Springer” publishing houses, OvidSP, PubMed, “Doctor's Consultant”, “Student's Consultant” platforms is open in the Electronic Information Hall.

Thanks to the equipment of the library and each department with computers, laptops, office equipment and other technical teaching aids, each master student has the opportunity for independent access to information.

Questioning of master students showed that 69.33% of respondents are satisfied with library funds/resources, 9.33% are partially satisfied. 70.67% of master students answered that they were satisfied with access to electronic educational resources, 16% were partially satisfied.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards (basic): fully - 4.

Standard 6: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To ensure the internationalization of the educational programme by developing a joint educational programme with a leading university or scientific center of the near or far abroad.

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of Compliance:

7.1 Programme monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring and evaluation of the EP includes general monitoring of the quality of the EP through a survey of stakeholders (employers and students), feedback from stakeholders, review and discussion with stakeholders at the Academic Council with the participation of employers and students.

The interviewed teachers answered that 77.8% are fully satisfied with the level of organization of the educational process in NJSC "AMU", and 22.2% are partially satisfied. 77.3% of master students indicated that they like studying at the university (20% partially agree), and 82.67% are satisfied with their studies at the university (9.33% partially).

When visiting the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines and getting acquainted with the documents, the experts found **that the university lacks QMS documentation.**

7.2 Feedback from teachers and master students

For feedback with teachers and master students, the rector's blog is used. Representatives of master students are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in discussing the implementation of the educational programme.

In order to verify the data of standard 7, the experts were familiarized with the standard "Monitoring feedback" SU-MUA-04-21. At a meeting with the teaching staff and during interviews with master students, the experts obtained information that feedback is provided to master students from the teacher during the lesson and at the end of each practical lesson, in the process of scoring in the evaluation rubrics. All written and oral appeals and claims of master students and teachers are recorded, summarized and analyzed. Written appeals received by the University are distributed for consideration to departments and officials. *The use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of stakeholders and is systematic when making changes to the educational programme.* The results of the survey are regularly reported to the head of the audit and quality of the educational process group, at the operational meetings of the Rector and the Academic Council.

7.3 Activities of master students and graduates

Assessment of satisfaction with the quality of the implementation of the EP is carried out by the university regularly in the form of a survey (questionnaire) of all participants in the educational process (teaching staff, master students) and other interested parties (employers). When meeting with master students, the experts found that feedback analysis, the opinion of students often affect the assessment of individual fragments of the educational process. NJSC "AMU" receives feedback from

employers in the form of feedback on graduates, as well as from members of the commission - representatives of practice during the end-of-course assessment (reports of the chairmen of the end-of-course assessment).

The EP in the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" is being implemented for the first time, so there are no reviews from employers yet.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 8 standards (basic): fully - 7, partially - 1, not compliant - 0

Standard 7: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To implement a quality management system in the work of structural units responsible for pharmacy programmes.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of Compliance:

8.1 Leadership (supervising vice-rectorate)

During the visit to the AMU, the experts found that the implementation of the specialty 7M10112 - "Pharmacy" is carried out in accordance with the regulatory documents governing postgraduate education, including the state compulsory educational standard 2022 and meets the needs of public health and the provision of pharmaceutical services.

The activities of the academic management regarding the fulfillment of the mission and the solution of tasks are studied and evaluated on the basis of the analysis and formation of reports and plans, the analysis of the fulfillment of the goals and objectives of the strategic plan, internal audit reports, the results of the work of internal and external commissions.

The main structural subdivisions involved in the direct implementation of the EP of the master's programme are profile departments and the Research School (RS). For the effective functioning of all structures, relevant Regulations have been developed that determine the interaction of various departments, including on the implementation of the EP.

The Research School is responsible for the organization and implementation of the educational process, which is under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. Issues of improving the EP are considered and discussed at the Quality Assurance Committee.

To determine the units involved in ensuring the quality of the master's degree educational programme, the experts were familiarized with the section of the website "Corporate management", as well as with the document - the map of the process "Infrastructure and Production Environment Management" (KP-MUA-PP-19-13, decision of the Board No. 52 dated December 5, 2013). *The experts found that the documents do not contain a criterion for appointing the head of the EP.*

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the leaders of the university listen to your opinion on the problems and improvement of the educational process, research, clinical work" - 85.19% of teachers answered that they systematically, 7.41% answered "sometimes", 3.7% "quite rarely", 0% "never".

8.2 Programme head (dean/department)

During a conversation with an employee Ashikbayeva M.A. (senior methodologist of the RS), the experts determined that the RS is a scientific and administrative structural unit of the University, which trains specialists in higher professional postgraduate education. The general management of the work of the RS is carried out by the dean, who reports to the Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. The experts were familiarized with the Regulations on the School Council (PL-MUA-37-23, decision of the Board, No. 06 dated 15.03.2023).

When conducting a conversation with the leaders of the EP, the experts determined that the role and mission, the criteria for selecting the leader and the relationship with the leadership of the AMU were not fully identified. The head of the master's programme is appointed by order of the rector of the

University on the proposal of the graduate department and the dean of the Research School based on the decision of the Academic Council of the University.

The transparency of the educational programme management system is confirmed by the participation of the entire team in making managerial decisions through participation in extended meetings of the Academic Council, meetings of the QAC, meetings of departments, where decisions are discussed and made on educational, pedagogic, scientific activities, as well as personnel issues, etc.

When conducting interviews with master students, the experts identified the following problem - lagging behind the individual education plan in terms of the timeliness of publications in scientific journals, as this is one of the conditions for admission to the defense of the project (dissertation).

8.3 Academic leadership (department)

Responsibility for the development and management of the educational programme rests with the deans of the Schools.

When conducting interviews with the heads of structural units, the experts determined that the implementation of educational, methodological and research work in one or more related/ cognate disciplines, educational work among students, as well as the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel are assigned to the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines. The department is the main educational and scientific structural subdivision of the University. The department reports to the dean.

The experts asked questions to the head of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines Atymtaikyzy Ainash and checked the document "Regulations on the Department" (PSP-MUA-2019 dated 04.12.2019). The head of the department replied that, in accordance with the plans of the University, schools, educational and methodological work of departments, and normative documents are annually checked. An internal audit of the divisions on the integrated quality management system is carried out annually (*however, the experts found that there was no QMS at the time of the external evaluation*).

The University has developed mechanisms and criteria for a systematic assessment of the effectiveness of teachers, the level of competence, the professional potential of staff and readiness to solve the strategic tasks of our organization, and a plan for the future development of employees has been formed.

8.4 Programme management

When reviewing the documents, the experts determined that, according to the "Regulations on studying in the magistracy", training sessions in the magistracy are conducted by persons who have the academic degree of a doctor or candidate of science, an academic degree of a doctor of PhD or a master of science and pedagogy. Education in the magistracy is carried out under the guidance of an experienced teacher-researcher (supervisor), who meets the requirements of order No.390. Simultaneous leadership can be carried out by no more than 3 master students.

The administrative staff involved in the training of masters is formed on the basis of competitive selection and has a higher education. Unit heads have at least a master's degree or a higher science or academic degree, as well as experience in administrative work at the university. The experts were provided with information on the professional training and professional experience of the administrative staff. These data are posted in the relevant sections of the university website, reflecting the organizational structure of NJSC "AMU".

The competence of the management bodies of the university is determined by the current Laws on education, on science, the Charter and internal regulatory documents of NJSC "AMU". NJSC "AMU" developed and approved regulations for each structural unit of the University, defining the structure, management and accountability, goals, objectives and functions of structural units, as well as job descriptions for each position provided for by the staffing table. Duties and powers in NJSC "AMU" in relation to the educational programme in the specialties of the magistracy are regulated by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulatory documents of NJSC "AMU".

8.5 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of the university is formed from several sources: the republican budget (the state order for the training of postgraduate education, advanced training of medical and pharmaceutical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Determining the budget and management structure of the university is the responsibility of the first head of the university - the Rector - Chairperson of the Board. The position of the Vice-rector for financial, economic and administrative work is provided for conducting financial matters, his/her powers and duties are defined. The Vice-Rector supervises the following structures responsible for budget management: Accounting, Planning and Economic Analysis Center, Digitalization Department, Infrastructure and Entrepreneurship Development Department.

The system of financing medical educational organization is based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency. The cost of education for 1 student for the corresponding academic year, which includes all types of expenses under the programme is determined by the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan and is allocated in accordance with the Agreements for the provision of services for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education.

Teachers are provided with material assistance (through the trade union system), the scientific activities of the teaching staff are stimulated (payment for articles with a high impact factor, participation in scientific and technical progress), which affects the introduction of innovations in the educational process in the magistracy.

8.6 Administration

During the visit to the AMU, the experts found that the management bodies of NJSC "AMU" are the Board of Directors, the Management Board and the internal audit service. The size and composition of the administrative staff included in the structural units for the implementation of operational management is approved by NJSC "AMU" independently in accordance with the Charter. Thus, the determination of the staff of the internal audit service, the appointment of its head and members, their term of office is carried out by the Board of Directors. The Management Board approves the staffing table, determines the organizational structure of branches, taking into account the staffing approved by the Board of Directors. The Chairperson of the Board - the Rector directly hires and dismisses or relocates employees. The administrative staff is distributed in the form of relevant structural divisions and their constituent departments and centers. Qualification requirements of employees of structural divisions and their functional duties are enshrined in the relevant regulations on their activities, as well as job descriptions. The procedure for filling vacant positions in the position of the administrative staff is carried out by the HR department, which ensures the placement of information about vacant positions, participates on an equal basis with the leadership of the University and relevant structural units in holding a competition for positions with control over the applicants' compliance with qualification requirements.

To verify standard 8, a meeting was held with Koikov V.V., Vice-Rector for Research and Strategic Development. In the course of the responses, the vice-rector confirmed that information on the administrative composition of the structural units is posted on the university website, where the public is provided with information about the qualifications of the staff, their work experience, including in administrative positions.

8.7 Requirements and legal documentation

The mechanism of interaction between the university and the authorized bodies (Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the healthcare sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; implementation of State programmes, Decrees and orders; contracts and agreements with healthcare authorities; contracts and agreements with healthcare organizations; written appeals of authorized state bodies and medical organizations. The interaction of the AMU with the authorized bodies is consistent with the priority areas of national legislative and policy papers: The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated June 27, 2007 No. 319-III (as amended and supplemented as of

07.07.2020), the State Programme for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025.

During the conversation with vice-rectors Koikov V.V. and vice-rector for academic work Zhunussova A.B., the experts determined that all activities in the field of training in the magistracy are organized in accordance with regulatory requirements. This fundamental principle is demonstrated in the key documents of the University of the highest level (Charter, Regulations on the US), as well as the Regulations on the Master, which contains section 1.1, describing the regulatory framework for its creation. In addition, the guarantee of compliance with the principle of compliance with general state regulations is demonstrated on the University's web page in the section for "Master's applicants". Control over the compliance of the activities of the university with regulatory requirements is carried out by the HR Department.

8.8 Review and approval process

From an interview with Vice-Rector Zhunussova A.B. the experts determined that the main issues of planning and implementing curricula are considered at meetings of the Academic Council (AC). The work of the AC is carried out in accordance with the plan approved for the calendar year. The vice-rector replied that every year at the first meeting, the composition and work plan for the academic year are discussed and approved, responsible persons are appointed, including those under the Master's programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy". The composition of the AC is formed from among the teachers of specialized departments, heads of structural units responsible for educational and methodological work at the University, leading healthcare professionals, employers, and students. The composition is approved at the meeting of the AC.

Admission of master students is carried out based on the Rules for admission to the magistracy (PR-MUA-04-21, decision of the Board No. 18 dated 18.06.2021). The rules for accepting documentation for the magistracy are indicated on the website of the university at the link: <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/>.

8.9 Funding

When analyzing documents and talking with the heads of structural divisions, the experts determined that the cost of tuition for one master student on a contractual basis is approved by the university annually in the context of specialties in agreement with the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan within the average tuition costs. For the 2022-2023 academic year, the cost of studying in a specialized master's programme amounted to 1,020,000 million KZT. Terms of payment and the size are specified in the bilateral contract.

The university website contains documents on the costs and expenses for the implementation of the main activities. The volume of receipts and expenditures for specific budgetary and extrabudgetary programmes as well as the final profit of the university is displayed. The experts revealed that the income of the university in 2020 amounted to 6 659 617 thousand KZT, in 2021 – 7 750 457 thousand KZT, in 2022 – 9 498 317 thousand KZT. Cash balances on the current account as of December 31, 2022 amounted to 236 355 586.83 KZT.

During a conversation with master students, the expert commission revealed insufficient financial support for master students in relation to publications in peer-reviewed journals, internships in organizations near and far abroad.

8.10 Financial management and integrity

The University plans and allocates the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational programme and distributes educational resources in accordance with their needs.

In terms of planning and spending the allocated funds, the university is guided by normative and regulatory acts, which delineate the standards for planning expenses per 1 student and their financial support. The experts familiarized themselves with such documents as the Order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 14, 2004 No. 474 “On approval of the norms for calculating the cost of education for one student, residency student, master student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order” (as amended and supplemented in accordance with the order

of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 8, 2011 No. 510, as of August 8, 2011); Order No. 221 dated June 30, 2005 “On approval of the Rules for planning expenses for training personnel with higher and postgraduate medical and pharmaceutical education” (as amended and supplemented in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 8, 2011 No. 510, as of August 08, 2011); Order of Acting Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 7, 2009 No. 374 "On approval of financial standards for higher and postgraduate education."

The experts received confirmation of compliance with the above regulatory documents: there is an adequate financial and economic calculation of the cost of training a master student, the rational use of funds allocated for the training of specialists with pharmaceutical education.

The volume of funding over the past 5 years has a steady growth trend due to an increase in the number of students and the cost of education, attracting more students to paid educational services. Thus, the library stock was increased to 24 747 600 KZT (for 2019), computer equipment – 82 529 600 KZT (for 2020), Equipment and devices – 37 534 800KZT (for 2020).

The experts found that ensuring the implementation of the EP consists of the salary fund of teachers, providing students with educational resources (educational and scientific literature, access to the Internet and international information databases of literature, information and communication technologies), strengthening the EP at the expense of invited foreign teachers, academic mobility programmes and the opportunity for students to participate in international and republican conferences, seminars.

Control and evaluation of indicators of the financial and economic activities of the university, audit of risk management of the internal control system, execution of documents in the field of corporate governance and consulting in order to improve the activities of the organization are entrusted to the Chairperson of the Board - the rector of the AMU and the Internal Audit Service, which are directly subordinate and accountable to the Board of Directors (Regulations on the internal audit service of the AMU, approved by the decision of the Board of Directors No. 3 dated 12.06.2020). A report on the financial, economic and commercial activities of the University for the year and long-term work plans for the next year is heard at the Academic Council of the university. The experts got acquainted with the Work Plan of the Academic Council of the AMU for 2023.

8.11 Programme information

NJSC "AMU" pays great attention to ensuring the transparency of the educational process in the magistracy, including the programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy". All information related to the processes of the magistracy is compiled in the Regulations "On training in the magistracy of NJSC "AMU", approved by the decision of the Board No. 18 dated 18.06.2021.

During the meeting and interviews with master students and teaching staff, the experts highly appreciated all participants in the educational process regarding their awareness of the “Regulations on Education in the Master's Programme”, as well as the educational process in the Master's Programme.

The experts got acquainted with the AMU website <https://amu.edu.kz/ru> and determined that a special information page is provided for potential students of the master's programme with a step-by-step algorithm for the procedure for submitting documents and the rules for enrolling in training. In addition, this tab contains contacts of responsible specialists who provide clarifications and consult on all emerging issues. Head of the Admissions Committee Zhilkibayeva K.T. confirmed that information about the state order for grant training in the magistracy in the form of colorful infographics is regularly posted on social networks.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 19 standards (basic): fully - 12, partially - 7, not compliant - 0

Standard 8: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To develop criteria for appointing the head of the educational programme and draw up a map of his/her interaction with the top management of the university and key departments.

2) To ensure systematic monitoring of the implementation of the individual plan by the master student.

3) To provide appropriate conditions for master student publications in peer-reviewed journals, as well as provide master students with a choice for internships in organizations near and far abroad.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Evidence of Compliance:

The educational programme is updated taking into account the needs of employers and the labor market, as well as in accordance with new normative legal acts.

In accordance with the Standard "Educational programmes: development, evaluation and updating" (SU-MUA-15-22, decision of the Board No. 14 dated 08.06.2022, as amended and supplemented by the decision of the Board No. 29 dated 02.12.2022), the update of the educational programme is discussed at a meeting of the department with the participation of employers, at a meeting of the QAC and approved by the Academic Council.

The decision to update the educational programme is published on the university website. In connection with the latest changes in the Standard "Educational Programmes: Development, Evaluation and Update", the EP is being updated. After the EP is agreed with employers, the mission and the purpose of the educational programme are updated, and an analysis of the teaching staff, material and technical base, practical training resources, information technology is carried out, which are filled in in the form of tables at the end of the EP. A competency matrix, a curriculum and an assessment of the educational achievements of students, information about the disciplines are compiled.

Monitoring, evaluation of effectiveness, revision of the policy in the field of quality assurance of the EP based on information management is carried out depending on the requirements of the labor market and the environment. The implementation of the educational programme is based on the maintenance and development of the principles of academic honesty.

An objective assessment of the educational programme is provided through the participation of students, teaching staff, university administration and employers in the discussion of the plan for the implementation of the educational programme; functioning of the feedback system; formation of a base of legal documentation on the university portal and its availability for teaching staff and students. Along with this, such indicators as the state of the material and technical base of NJSC "AMU", the availability of training resources, and the qualitative composition of the teaching staff are taken into account.

NJSC "AMU" determines and establishes mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of ongoing educational programmes and ensures the quality of their management process.

Effective management decisions are based on the analysis of facts, measurement data and information.

The process of constant renewal is carried out through the introduction of innovations and the use of information technologies, problem-based learning, the development of assessment methods, the organization of education based on competencies, the expansion of academic mobility, the revision of personnel policy, the increase in the efficiency of operational processes and the transparency of the decision-making process. The curriculum is assessed and approved, analyzing the degree to which teaching and research methods meet European requirements and the requirements of the national healthcare system.

Monitoring of the application of the educational programme is carried out based on the results obtained: academic performance, feedback based on the survey, protocols of departments, reporting units.

The system for making changes to the EP is regulated in the Standard "Educational Programmes: Development, Evaluation and Update". All internal regulatory documents of the university can be amended and supplemented, which are considered at meetings of the relevant collegiate bodies, and

approved by the Board of the university. If it is necessary to make changes to the EP in the amount of less than 70%, a decision is made to update the EP.

Continuous renewal and improvement of all types of activities of NJSC "AMU" is based on a regular and thorough study of models and trends of development and innovation in medical education in different countries. This is achieved by studying specialized literature, inviting international experts, applying the experience and skills acquired during the academic mobility of students, teachers and administration representatives in leading centers and medical universities in the world. Heads of the EP, all interested persons have the opportunity to participate in conferences, seminars and trainings dedicated to the development of pharmaceutical education, self-assessment and accreditation processes at the programme and institutional levels, issues of quality assurance in education.

When visiting the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines and holding a conversation with the head of the department, Atymtaikyzy Ainash, the experts determined that the department annually analyzes its material and technical condition and determines: the necessary equipment, scientific literature, the cost of advanced training, academic mobility, rental of practice bases, practice guidance, publications, participation in conferences, to apply for the CPU and EA until October 1. All applications are analyzed by the CPU and EA for expediency and validity. After that, the University Development Plan is considered by the Managing Board and approved by the Board of Directors.

In general, standard 9 demonstrates compliance with the requirements for accredited programmes.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards (basic): fully - 4.

Standard 9: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external evaluation of the educational programme, it was found that out of 90 standards (including 88 basic standards and 2 improvement standards), 77 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 75 basic standards and 2 improvement standards. 13 basic standards are partially implemented. No non-compliance with standards has been established.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy":

1. To revise the outcomes of master student education in connection with the new challenges and needs of the specialty and society as a whole (1.1 and 1.2.).

2. To conduct an annual assessment of the needs for pharmacy specialists and, based on this, plan the content and structure of the educational programme, and the admission of master students (2.6).

3. To include in the master student admission policy a section on the practice of accepting students from low-income families, national minorities and persons with special health needs (4.1).

4. To determine the incentive mechanisms for scientific supervisors of master students and teachers responsible for the development and management of the educational programme and implement them at the university (5.4).

5. To ensure the internationalization of the educational programme by developing a joint educational programme with a leading university or scientific center of the near or far abroad (6.1).

6. To implement a quality management system in the work of structural units responsible for pharmacy programmes (7.1).

7. To develop criteria for appointing the head of the educational programme and draw up a map of his/her interaction with the top management of the university and key departments (8.1)

8. To ensure systematic monitoring of the implementation of the individual plan by the master student (8.2).

9. To provide appropriate conditions for master student publications in peer-reviewed journals, as well as provide master students with a choice for internships in organizations near and far abroad (8.9).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members established the compliance of the educational programme of the Master's degree in the specialty 7M10112 "Pharmacy" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

№ p/p	Status in the EEC	Full name
1	Chairperson	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna
2	Foreign expert	Dr. Alenka Braček Lalić
3	Foreign expert	Kodirova Shahlo Salomovna
3	Academic Expert	Zhakyzbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich
4	Academic Expert	Daniyarova Anara Bakhitkereyevna
5	Academic Expert	Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna
6	Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapassovna
7	Academic Expert	Ablaykhanova Nurzhanyat Tatukhanovna
8	Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Yeltay Utemuratovich
9	Employers' representative	Zhukubayeva Almira Asetkyzy
10	Representative of doctoral students	Yessenbekova Naira Adilkhanovna



**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS*/IS	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially Compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	5	5/0	3/0	2/0	0/0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	21	19/2	18/2	1/0	0/0
3.	EVALUATION OF MASTER STUDENTS	10	10/0	10/0	0/0	0/0
4.	MASTER STUDENTS	12	12/0	11/0	1/0	0/0
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF	7	7/0	6/0	1/0	0/0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND TEACHING ENVIRONMENT	4	4/0	4/0	0/0	0/0
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	8	8/0	7/0	1/0	0/0
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	19	19/0	12/0	7/0	0/0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4/0	3/0	1/0	0/0
		90	88/2	75/2	13/0	0/0

List of documents studied by EEC members as part of an external evaluation of the educational programme of the master's degree 7M10112 - "Pharmacy"

№	Document names	Quantity
1.	SU-MUA-15-22 Educational programmes: Development, evaluation and renewal	1
2.	Changes and additions to SU-MUA-15-22	1
3.	Development strategy of NJSC "AMU" for 2022-2026	1
4.	P-MUA-17-20 Academic policy of NJSC "AMU"	1
5.	Educational programme 7M10112 "Pharmacy"	1
6.	K-MUA-01-20 Code of Academic Integrity	1
7.	PR-MUA-04-21 Rules for admission to the magistracy of NJSC "AMU"	1
8.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines No. 7	1
9.	PL-MUA-123-20 Regulations on the Competent Model of a Master's Degree Graduate	1
10.	PL-MUA-146-22 Regulations on the appointment, payment and size of state scholarships for students	1
11.	RI-MUA-18-21 Requirements for the content, design and defense of a master's thesis and project	1
12.	SU-MUA-14-17 Introduction of new educational technologies	1
13.	PL-MUA-121-21 Regulations on training in the magistracy of NJSC AMU	1
14.	PL-MUA-51-21 Regulations on the organization of pedagogical, research and industrial practice of master students / PhD students	1
15.	PR-MUA-25-17 Internal labor regulations of JSC "AMU"	1
16.	PL-MUA-42-20 Regulations on Honored Professor	
17.	PL-MUA-16-21 Regulations on the Admissions committee	1
18.	PL-MUA-09-20 Rules for the competitive filling of vacant positions of administrative and managerial personnel of NJSC AMU	1
19.	PL-MUA-142-22 Regulations on awards	1
20.	PL-MUA-48-20 Regulations on the assignment of the corporate award "Zhas Daryn"	1
21.	PL-MUA-42-20 Regulations on Honored Professor	1
22.	PL-MUA-76-20 Regulations on remuneration, bonuses and social security of employees of NJSC AMU	1
23.	Changes and additions to the Regulations on remuneration, bonuses and social security of employees of NJSC AMU	1
24.	Changes and additions to the Rules for the competitive replacement of the position of the head of the department of NJSC AMU	1
25.	Information about cooperation with foreign partners	1
26.	SU-MUA-04-21 Feedback monitoring	1
27.	International cooperation policy of NJSC AMU	1
28.	PSP-MUA-2019 Regulations on the department	1
29.	PL-MUA-132-22 Regulations on postdoctoral studies	1