

To the Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare  
05.06.2023

**REPORT**  
**EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION**  
**ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE**  
**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**  
**8D10101 "NURSING SCIENCE"**  
**OF NON-PROFIT JSC "ASTANA MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"**  
**FOR COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF**  
**PHD EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN HEALTH CARE**

**external expert evaluation period: May 16-18, 2023**

**Astana, 2023**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 8D10101 "Nursing Science"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" for compliance with the Accreditation standards of PhD Educational Programmes in Healthcare and conclusions	
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science"	
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science"	
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and PhD educational programme in the specialty of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
AIS	automated information system
LBC	library and bibliographic classification
DB	Database
IRD	internal regulatory document
SAC	state attestation commission
SCES RK	state compulsory educational standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
ECAQA	NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare"
RS	Research School
IEP	Individual education plan
QAC	Quality Assurance Committee
CED	catalog of elective disciplines
HM	Management in healthcare
MH RK	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC "AMU"	Non-profit joint stock company "Astana Medical University"
RI	Research Institute
NET	new educational technologies
STP	scientific and technical programme
PC	professional competencies
TS	teaching staff
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
EDM	extended meeting of the department
WC	working curriculum
IWM	Independent work of master students
IWMT	Independent work of master students under the guidance of a teacher
MC	model curriculum
UDC	Universal Decimal Classification
EMCD (teaching materials)	educational and methodological complex of the discipline
ELS	Electronic library systems
CST	training in clinical situations
GPA	GPA
PBL	problem-based learning
TBL	team-oriented learning

## 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 12 dated May 05, 2023, the EEC was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" of Non-profit JSC "Astana Medical University" in the period May 16-18, 2023, as follows:

No.	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree / title, position, place of work / place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	YERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEYEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of public health and healthcare NJSC "West-Kazakhstan medical university named after Marat Ospanov"
2	Foreign expert	D.R. ALENKA BRAČEK LALIĆ	PhD in Human Resource Management and labor relations. Managing Director of the AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP Institute (since 2021). Vice Dean for Research Institute AUTHENTIC LEADERSHIP (2017-2021); Associate Professor in Management (2022 - 2027) Ljubljana Business School; Director of International CEEMAN Quality Accreditation (IQA) (2015-2021), Republic of Slovenia
3	Foreign expert	KODIROVA SHAKHLO SALOMOVNA	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Traditional Medicine and Occupational Diseases of Bukhara State medical institute, the Republic of Uzbekistan
4	National academic expert	ZHAKIPBEKOV KAIRAT SAPARKHANOVICH	PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Management and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov"
5	National academic expert	DANIYAROVA ANARA BAKHITKEREVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Higher School of Public Health Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
6	National academic expert	YERZHANOVA FARIDA NURMUKHAMBETOVNA	The highest medical category in public healthcare, Master in Healthcare; Head of the Department of Science and Vocational Education Republican State enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Hospital of the Medical Center for Administrative Affairs of the

			President of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, Deputy Chairperson of the State Unitary Enterprise for additional education under Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council in the direction of training "Healthcare"
7	National academic expert	AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASSOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of Department of dermatovenereology and cosmetology of NJSC "Semey Medical University"
8	National academic expert	NURZHANYAT TATUKHANOVNA ABLAIKHANOVA	Candidate of Biological Sciences, Associate Professor, Deputy Head of the Department of Biophysics, Biomedicine and Neuroscience for Educational and Methodological Work of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
9	National academic expert	RAKHMANOV ELTAY UTEMURATOVICH	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Program in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, organizer of educational, practical and research work of master's students in sports medicine and rehabilitation.
10	Expert - representative of practical healthcare	ZHUKUBAYEVA ALMIRA ASETKYZY	Master in Pedagogy and Psychology, the highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, the first medical category in public healthcare. Head of the Department of Education, LLP "National Scientific Cancer Center"
11	Representative of doctoral students	ESENBKOVA NAIRA ADILKHANOVNA	Doctoral student of the second year of study in the specialty "Biology" NJSC "Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilev"

ECAQA Observer – Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The EEC work was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC.

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Educational Programmes for PhD specialties in Healthcare and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Astana Medical University", BIN: 080940008218
Management body	Directors and members of the Management Board
Full name of the first head	Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich
Date of establishment	1964
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan 010000 Astana, Beibitshilik st., 49a, phone: +77001539447 Call-center (WhatsApp), +7 (7172) 53 94 47 Call-center, +7 (7172) 53 95 12 Undergraduate admissions committee, +7 (7172) 53 94 24 Rector's reception, fax: +7 (7172) 53 94 53, mail: rektorat@amu.kz
State license for educational activities in PhD doctoral studies (date, number)	No. KZ93LAA00014823 dated 19.03.2019
Year of the implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2020
Duration of study	3 years
The total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	No
The number of doctoral students at the EP since the beginning of the current year	4
Full-time teachers/ Part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of degree	Total: 4, no part-timers, degree - 100%
Link to the website of the university, where information about the educational programme is posted	<a href="https://amu.edu.kz/ru/postupayushchim/abiturientam/obrazovatelnye-programmy/">https://amu.edu.kz/ru/postupayushchim/abiturientam/obrazovatelnye-programmy/</a>

Currently, the university has a state license of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 19.03.2019, No. KZ93LAA00014823, for an unlimited period, for the right to carry out educational activities in programmes of higher and postgraduate professional education, according to which it has the right to issue documents on state education.

The doctoral educational programme "Nursing Science" was developed in 2020. The first accreditation took place in 2020 for a period of 3 years <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/Accreditation/Specialized-accreditation/>

The doctoral educational programme 8D10101 - "Nursing Science" has a connection with other programmes implemented in NJSC "AMU". The university trains students in the master's programme in EP 7M110300 - "Nursing".

The main achievements of NJSC "AMU" in the implementation of the educational programme of doctoral studies in EP 8D10101 "Nursing Science":

- highly qualified teachers teach at the university, of which 1 (33.3%) have a doctorate degree, 1 (33.3%) have a candidate degree, 1 (33.3%) have a PhD

- The level of infrastructure of NJSC "AMU" allows to provide a high quality of education and scientific research. The infrastructure of NJSC "AMU" includes classrooms equipped with interactive equipment, a scientific library with reading rooms and an electronic library room, 4 laboratories equipped with modern equipment for research work. NJSC "AMU" publishes the journal "Astana Medicinal Journals", the clinical bases for the implementation of this programme are the Unitary Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management city polyclinics No. 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, the Unitary Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management "City Multidisciplinary Children's Hospital No. 3", LLP "Green clinic", medical center "Meyir", LLP "Center of traditional medicine".

The subdivision responsible for the implementation of the PhD EP are: Research School, Department of Nursing, Department of Biostatistics, Bioinformatics and Information Technology. The university has the opportunity for continuous professional development due to the established stable three-level education system from undergraduate to doctoral studies, which allows you to get modern knowledge and practical skills in educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education.

It should be mentioned that the AMU has strong ties and is striving to develop cooperation with practical healthcare. To carry out PhD scientific research, doctoral students on priority topics use 70 clinical bases of the university: medical and preventive organizations subordinate to the State Institution "Public Healthcare Department" of Astana and the Local Administration of Astana, as well as Republican centers, research institutes, clinics subordinate to the Ministry of Healthcare, the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The University has 19 laboratories: the Testing Laboratory of Radiochemistry and Radiospectrometry, the Laboratory of Radiation Safety and Hygiene, the Laboratory of Radiation Epidemiology and Medical Dosimetric Registry under the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection; Analytical Laboratory, Scientific Research Laboratory, Chemical Laboratory under the Department of General and Biological Chemistry; Educational and hygienic laboratory under the Department of Public Health and Hygiene; Laboratory of Toxicological Chemistry, Laboratory of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Laboratory of Technology of Dosage Forms, Laboratory of Pharmacognosy under the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines; Educational - research laboratory under the Department of General Pharmacology; Interdepartmental Educational and Scientific Morphological Laboratory under the Department of Systematic Anatomy with OPH; Educational - microbiological laboratory under the Department of Microbiology and Virology named after Sh.I.Sarbassova; Educational and research histological laboratory under the Department of Histology and Cytology; Dental laboratory under the Department of Orthopedic and Pediatric Dentistry; Health Diagnostics Laboratory under the Department of Preventive Medicine and Nutrition, Educational and Biology Laboratory under the Department of Molecular Biology and Medical Genetics; Vivarium.

## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

The first accreditation of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" was held in 2020 for a period of 3 years. Certificate No. KZ93LAA00014823 dated 19.03.2019. Registration number AB 4124 at the link <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/about-university/Accreditation/Specialized-accreditation/> The certificate is valid for the period of 09.06.2020 – 08.06.2023.

Information about the accredited programme is posted on the website of the Republican State Enterprise with the right to engage in economic activities "National Center for the Development of Higher Education" of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (<https://enic-kazakhstan.edu.kz/ru>).

## **2.3 Conclusion on the results of the reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of PhD Educational Programmes in Healthcare and conclusions**

The self-assessment report of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 70 pages of the main text and contains 1

attachment with 22 tables according to the relevant standards on 27 pages located at the link [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VyMe\\_BNVpCQdR2uz1Mpu5SH3\\_gQfo2cr](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1VyMe_BNVpCQdR2uz1Mpu5SH3_gQfo2cr).

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector Nadirov Kamalzhan Talgatovich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 24 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, data about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Zhunussova Aigul Bitimbayevna, vice-rector for academic work, candidate of medical sciences, physician - pediatrician of the highest category.

The report contains a list of 6 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Zhunussova A.B.

The self-assessment of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" was carried out based on the order of the head No. 11-Н/К dated January 10, 2023 "On conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science".

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes. In the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, the experts received answers to the questions that arose, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report based on the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards provide the actual practice of NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the preparation of doctoral students in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science", reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of doctoral students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, databases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables, diagrams contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e., verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of ECAQA Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes (approved by the order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme approved on May 05, 2023 by ECAQA General Director Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector of NJSC "Astana Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as the University) Nadyrov Kamalzhan Talgatovich. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 16-18, 2023



The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit implementation within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in **Attachment 3** to this report. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- Conservation with management and administrative staff - 4 and 87 people respectively;
- interviews with doctoral students – 4 people, including 0 foreign ones;
- study of the website <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/>;
- interviewing 4 employees, 3 teachers;
- questioning of teachers and doctoral students - 3 and 4, respectively;
- Observation of the training of doctoral students: in the current year there were no admissions under this programme;
  - review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 1 practice base was visited - this is the Unitary Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management "City Polyclinic No. 5", the department of "General Medical Practice with a Course of Evidence-Based Medicine", where training is provided under the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" with the participation of 4 full-time teachers;
    - study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 41/13 units, both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents examined is in Attachment 2).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and conversations was ensured (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with the EEC members**

No.	Position	Quantity
1	Meeting with vice-rectors of NJSC "AMU"	4
2	Meeting with members of the academic council, the committee of educational programmes by levels of education (bachelor's, master's, PhD)	71
3	Meeting with employees of departments responsible for the acceptance of students / auditors	3
4	Meeting with the head and employees of departments responsible for educational programmes	9
5	Meeting with employees of departments responsible for the employment of graduates	2
6	Meeting with HR staff	2
7	Interviews with students	51
8	Interviews with teachers	46
9	Interviews with employers of graduates	25
10	Interviews with graduates	26

In the process of visiting the departments of the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: all teachers are highly qualified, degree teachers; all conditions are created for passing teaching staff in the pedagogical direction, a research school has been created to support doctoral students on academic and scientific work.

The University has departments that are directly related to the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science".

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of conversation, interviews, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of Educational Programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science" for Compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years was held by the chairwoman Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the EEC members.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science"**

##### **Standard 1: RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT**

###### **Evidence of Compliance:**

When implementing the programme activities, namely, based on the results of a conversation with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory and consultative body (members of the academic council, the committee of educational programmes by levels of education), in interviews with doctoral students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established.

Scientific and Research activities and the implementation of educational programmes (EP) of doctoral studies are carried out by a team of professionals: highly qualified teaching staff of the university, researchers, employees of administrative and managerial personnel within the framework of the assigned job descriptions.

Educational resources satisfy the development of the doctoral programme, all disciplines of credits of the main and elective components are performed by teachers with academic degrees on the basis of the university. It should be noted that there is a clear relationship between scientific research and the educational programme, individual modules within the elective disciplines are developed in areas of research and doctoral students are trained at the bases, taking into account the necessary resources.

Employees of specialized departments are participants in the international Acceld programme, within the framework of this programme, foreign internships for teaching staff, doctoral students, master classes, seminars, conferences are implemented. One of the final products of this project is the developed Criteria for Evaluation of Doctoral (PhD) Dissertations.

Since 2015, international cooperation has been developing with the Universities of Applied Sciences JAMK, HAMK, LAMK (Finland). Within the framework of the Erasmus + Acceled Project (Accelerating Master and PhD level Nursing Education Development in the Higher Education System in Kazakhstan) for the development of master's and doctoral programmes in Nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan, Vilnius University, the School of Medicine (Lithuania), the University of Tampere (Finland) joined this cooperation. Various memorandums have been concluded with more than 63 foreign universities.

Despite the participation of researchers in international projects, the 3rd year doctoral student Uakkazy Gani, with the topic of his doctoral dissertation: "Improving the organization of nursing for

patients with deep brain stimulation in inpatient and outpatient settings", supervisor - *Shashkin Ch.S. has not yet completed a foreign internship, according to the educational programme.*

During a visit to the practice base – the Unitary Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management "City Polyclinic No. 5", the experts were shown 1 training room, where a theoretical discussion is held with students and 1 assembly hall for conferences with doctoral students. A visit to the Department of General Medical Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine made it clear to the experts about the available resources for training in the accredited programme, the teachers presented syllabuses on the studied disciplines, according to the modular educational programme, and conducted a short interview with students. The experts obtained evidence of full and partial compliance with standard 1, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 6 standards: fully - 5, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 1: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To ensure timely foreign internships for doctoral students in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.07.2022 No. 63 (On approval of state general educational standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare).

## **Standard 2: OUTCOMES**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The outcomes of the disciplines are applicable in the course of writing a dissertation, the formation of the goals and objectives of the researcher, the methods of scientific search and the implementation of the research, and also form critical thinking, the implementation in practice of nursing projects based on the principles of evidence-based medicine and evidence-based nursing practice. Key competencies include: knowledge of the main terms of scientific research, types of clinical trials, use of an evidence-based medicine database, the ability to critically evaluate medical information using DM filters.

For example, the discipline "Clinical Research in Nursing", 5 credits, basic discipline: provides doctoral students with the formation of competencies that will allow them to become confident researchers, executors of clinical research and projects in nursing science in the future. The discipline contributes to the expansion of knowledge on the methodology and methods of clinical research in nursing, deepening knowledge on the methodology and methods of scientific research in nursing, critical evaluation of publications/recommendations in nursing at the national or international level, which undoubtedly contributes to the formation of basic research competencies of doctoral students.

As part of the study of elective disciplines, the learning outcomes are related to specific topics of dissertations and contribute to an in-depth understanding of the issues from the point of view of modern nursing science and observation in the field of research.

The results of the research work will have a positive impact on quality and affordable medical services in the field of healthcare; to meet the needs of the population in quality medical services at the PHC (primary healthcare) level; on the provision of high-quality educational services (improving the educational programme of the bachelor's programme in the EP Nursing, introducing an evidence-based nursing practice guide for applied and academic bachelors, advanced training for practicing nurses).

In the future, to improve the educational programme 8D10101 "Nursing Science", the university plans to provide feedback to employers (questionnaires, interviews). The analysis of the results obtained is planned to be carried out after the completion of the full course of study, the final results of the course will be analyzed taking into account the opinions of employers, if necessary, the educational programme of doctoral studies in the EP "Nursing Science" will be updated.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 5 standards: fully - 4, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 2: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To ensure timely foreign internships for doctoral students in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad countries, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.2022 No. 63 (On approval of state general educational standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare).

### **Standard 3: POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR ADMISSION**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

From interviews with doctoral students, it was established that before admission, the Admissions Committee conducts consultations and orientation in specialties, the Research School provides support and counseling, including academic, personal, psychological, social, supports the safety of training, both on the territory of the educational organization and on the bases of practitioners, conducted an acquaintance with the university website, the rights and obligations of doctoral students. This indicates compliance with standard 3 in terms of policy and admission criteria for doctoral studies.

The policy and criteria for admission to doctoral studies comply with the State Compulsory Educational Standards and Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education", and is periodically reviewed. The latest change was to conduct entrance exams in a computer format at the National Center for Independent Examination with writing an essay, passing a readiness test and answering exam questions. The selection takes into account work experience, scientific and professional achievements and compliance with the previous level of education.

Currently, 4 doctoral students are studying under the accredited programme: 1 doctoral student of the 3rd year of study, 1 doctoral student of the 2nd year of study and 2 doctoral students of the 1st year of study.

**The conclusions of the EEC by the criteria** compliant with 6 standards: fully - 6.

**Standard 3: implemented.**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no**

### **Standard 4: PHD PROGRAMME**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The educational programme "8D10101 Nursing Science" in the amount of 180 credits consists of theoretical training, including the study of basic and major disciplines, as well as pedagogical / professional internship.

The cycle of major disciplines consists only of disciplines of the elective component. The educational programme "8D10101 Nursing Science" provides for the following learning paths: "Nurse - Researcher", "Nurse - Leader", "Nurse - Clinical Expert".

For example, the "Nurse-Research" trajectory includes the discipline "Leadership in Science: the Role of the Nurse Scientist" to strengthen the development potential of nursing science that serves the various needs of the practice area and professional communities. Also, this learning path includes the study of the discipline "Methods for assessing the economic efficiency of scientific research", which contributes to an increase in the level of scientific research and development.

The educational programme "8D10101 Nursing Science" includes the research work of a doctoral student, including an internship and a doctoral dissertation (Research work of a doctoral student). This work contributes to the acquisition of individual research experience, drawing up a plan of research work, defining research objectives and mastering the methods of analysis.

To ensure the implementation of the educational programme of doctoral studies under

structured scientific guidance, NJSC "Astana Medical University" has developed and has relevant work instructions and regulations.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence about the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with doctoral students of the accredited specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, enough time to collect material for a thesis, work with documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and teachers' qualifications, social and moral support for doctoral students in need, participation in scientific work, availability of resources from international databases of professional literature. The skills of using these resources were assessed when visiting the library and the department of pharmaceutical disciplines.

In general, doctoral students are satisfied with the training and scientific guidance, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international relations.

Doctoral students showed their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training and the provision of conditions for performing a dissertation research, submitting a dissertation for defense, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in educational organization events, funding, demonstrated English proficiency when answering questions from foreign expert Alenka Braček Lalić. The experts studied the documents of doctoral students (portfolio, assessment results, survey results, dissertations).

This programme makes it possible for everyone to study in accordance with the previous education and does not affect the age of the applicant. So, for example, under this programme, one of the doctoral students is 52 years old, who has a long practical work experience and purposefully entered doctoral studies.

Interviews with 25 potential employers were conducted online and included such questions as: participation in the development of proposals in the EP, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of students, providing doctoral students with the necessary resources for scientific and practical training and the formation of critical and research thinking.

The experts studied the materials on the admission of doctoral students and the selection of teachers and found compliance with standard 4.

***Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.*** Compliant with 10 standards: fully - 10.

***Standard 4: implemented***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.***

## **Standards 5: SCIENTIFIC LEADERSHIP**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The requirements for providing each doctoral student with the main scientific supervisor are reflected in the Regulations of the NJSC AMU "On training in PhD of the NJSC "Astana Medical University" - PL-MUA-120-20 (hereinafter - the Regulation, approved by the decision of the Board of the NJSC "Astana Medical University" No. 4 dated February 4, 2020). According to paragraph 6.7.3 of this Regulation, the doctoral student, within 2 months after enrollment, approves the topic of doctoral dissertations and is assigned a scientific supervisor. The scientific leadership and research topic of the doctoral candidate is approved at the department, at the scientific inter-departmental meeting, at the meeting of the Academic Council.

According to this educational programme, all scientific consultants comply with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015 No. 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities of organizations providing higher and (or) postgraduate education, and a list of documents confirming compliance with them".

Supervisors/consultants conduct consultations on dissertation work and monitor the degree of implementation with their doctoral students several times a month. During such consultations, the degree and quality of the scientific research being carried out, their compliance with the individual

plan of the doctoral student are assessed, recommendations are given on theoretical and other issues of research.

During interviews with 4 teachers, experts received answers about the professional development programme for teachers and supervisors, the availability of certification for teachers in teaching methods and research, as well as all scientific consultants and doctoral students completed a cycle of good clinical practice, in accordance with the Code "On health and the healthcare system", Art. 238, item 2.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received an opinion on the personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers and the leadership skills of scientific advisers of doctoral students, motivation to work with doctoral students, and the implementation of the scientific leadership system (total 4 people).

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 11 standards: fully - 10, partially - 1, not compliant - 0.

**Standard 5: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To organize training for scientific supervisors of doctoral students on scientific leadership.

## **Standard 6: PHD DISSERTATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

A doctoral dissertation must meet the following requirements: contain new evidence-based theoretical and (or) experimental results that allow solving a theoretical or applied problem or are a major achievement in the development of specific scientific areas; correspond to the main issues of the EP, on which the doctoral dissertation is defended; be relevant, contain scientific novelty and practical significance; be based on modern theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of science, technology and production; contain specific practical recommendations.

The topic of a doctoral dissertation with justification and structure, a plan for completing a doctoral dissertation indicating the deadlines for completing work on a dissertation, a plan for scientific publications, internships (if necessary) are reflected in the individual work plan of a doctoral student (paragraph 1.11 of the Requirements).

When visiting the university, we reviewed the individual plans of 4 doctoral students.

Currently, there were no defenses of doctoral dissertations under this educational programme.

But, despite the positive aspects, there is a weak relationship between the research school and doctoral students. Insufficient control on the part of the research school has led to the fact that doctoral students do not fulfill the approved requirements within the EP in a timely manner. So, for example, the publication activity of doctoral students is poorly and untimely.

In order to support the academic and scientific activities of scientists, library staff provide qualified advice on providing electronic access to information sources, as well as on bibliographic literacy - the site <https://elib.amu.kz/> contains an instruction-slide for the correct design of the list of references according to GOST R7.0.100-2018.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Compliant with 9 standards: fully - 7, partially - 2, not compliant - 0

**Standard 6: implemented**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To ensure control and implementation of publications by doctoral students, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 127 (On approval of the Rules for awarding degrees).
- 2) To ensure coordination and monitoring of the interaction of doctoral students with the research school of the university for the timely development and implementation of the doctoral programme.

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The requirements for writing a dissertation work for submission to reviewers and final consideration by the dissertation council are published in the working instruction "Requirements for the content and design of a PhD doctoral dissertation" RI-MUA-48-20

[https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1MXmf\\_YWFMS-WeQ2ANvvTPCc6fZGnpKmR](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1MXmf_YWFMS-WeQ2ANvvTPCc6fZGnpKmR)

The procedure for oral defense is described in the internal regulatory document "On training in PhD of NJSC "Astana Medical University" PL-MUA-120-20".

During a visit to the organization and during an conversation with an employee Ashikbayeva M.A., senior methodologist of the research school, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports , regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and doctoral students, memorandums with bases of practice and internships, portfolios, individual plans for doctoral students, curricula for doctoral students (for other EPs) and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, grade record books for other EPs ), assessment tools (examination questions and encrypted answers, statements), evidences, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for doctoral students: Academic policy, Rules for the state registration of dissertations defended for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in profile, Rules for sending a specialist to work, granting the right to self-employment, exemption from the obligation or termination of the obligation to work by citizens who studied based on the state educational order and there is information, Law on Science, Regulations on business trips of employees and students' trips, Regulations on PhD, Regulations on the competence model of a PhD graduate, Regulations on the formation of a student's portfolio, etc. and there is information on 15 NLAs, which is regularly updated.

*Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.* Compliant with 7 standards: fully - 7.

*Standard 7: implemented*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no*

## **Standard 8: ORGANIZATION STRUCTURE**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

Today NJSC "AMU" is a modern, rapidly developing University, which includes 1 institute, 8 schools, 64 departments. The university has a developed material and technical base, multimedia equipment, free Wi-Fi zones in the buildings and in the dormitory, methodological complexes, methodological support for distance education, modern educational programmes, educational websites, electronic teaching aids, virtual excursions, a modern library with electronic book lending and electronic full-text resources, etc.

Having studied the organizational structure, as well as the website of the organization, the commission concluded that the site serves as the hallmark of the University, and is also a tool for prompt and objective informing the public about the activities of the University. The site contains widely available information for employers, the medical community as a whole, potential applicants for admission to doctoral studies, as well as corporate documents in the "Employees" section, accessible by login and password.

Since August 2022, a separate structural unit has been allocated in the structure of the university - the Admission Committee for organizing career guidance, selection and enrollment at all levels, including doctoral studies in EP 8D10101 "Nursing". For the effective management of the academic and scientific component of EP 8D10101 "Nursing", a research school was created.

Registration of educational achievements is carried out by the staff of the Office of the Registrar. Scheduling and methodological support is provided by the Center for the Development of Academic Activities. The Center for the Development of Research Activities provides support to students and teaching staff in participating in international, republican conferences, and advises on research design.

The library contributes to information provision. The responsibilities of management and administration are reflected in job descriptions. The issues of quality control and regular revision of the curriculum in order to improve quality are spelled out in the university's internal standard SU-MUA-15-22 "Educational programmes: development, evaluation and updating".

On the official website of NJSC "AMU" in the section of postgraduate education - doctoral studies - for applicants, students, graduates <https://amu.edu.kz/ru/postlevuzovskoe-obrazovanie/>, there is information necessary for admission, training and graduation of a doctoral candidate. Doctoral students here can also give suggestions for improving the content of the site to the Research School. In accordance with the rules for transferring credits to doctoral students, credits received in open mass online courses in other educational institutions may be taken into account if they correspond to the declared learning outcomes.

The interview with the teaching staff and students showed that the participants in the educational process, doctoral students and teaching staff of the university have a direct interest in the implementation of the educational programme, and can express their opinion by using the trust boxes or the rector's blog. Educational programmes are regularly studied and evaluated by receiving feedback not only from doctoral students, teaching staff, *but also from stakeholders, including employers*. Feedback is monitored and is the basis for revising the goals, objectives and activities of the University and the content of the EP.

***Insufficient control on the part of the research school has led to the fact that doctoral students do not fulfill the approved requirements within the framework of the EP in a timely manner. So, for example, the publication activity of doctoral students is poorly and untimely.***

***Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.*** Compliant with 9 standards: fully - 8, partially - 1, not compliant - 0

***Standard 8: implemented***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

- 1) To ensure coordination and monitoring of the interaction of doctoral students with the research school of the university for the timely development and implementation of the doctoral programme.

## **5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of PhD 8D10101 "Nursing Science":**

1. To ensure timely foreign internships for doctoral students in leading universities and research institutes of far abroad countries, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No. 63 (On approval of state general educational standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare (Standards 1 and 2).

2. To organize training for supervisors of doctoral students in scientific supervision (Standard 5).

3. To ensure control and timely execution of publications by doctoral students, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 127 (On approval of the rules for awarding degrees) (Standard 6).

4. To ensure coordination and monitoring of the interaction of doctoral students with the research school of the university for the timely development and implementation of the doctoral programme (Standard 8).

## **6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

The EEC members have established the compliance of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10101 "Nursing Science" with Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.



<b>№ p/p</b>	<b>Status in the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>
1	Chairperson	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna
2	Foreign expert	Dr. Alenka Braček Lalić
3	Foreign expert	Kodirova Shahlo Salomovna
3	Academic Expert	Zhakypbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich
4	Academic Expert	Daniyarova Anara Bakhitkereyevna
5	Academic Expert	Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna
6	Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapassovna
7	Academic Expert	Ablaykhanova Nurzhanyat Tatukhanovna
8	Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Yeltay Utemuratovich
9	Employers' representative	Zhukubayeva Almira Asetkyzy
10	Representative of doctoral students	Yessenbekova Naira Adilkhanovna

  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  
  


**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS/IS*	Evaluation		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT	6	4/2	3/2	1/0	0/0
2.	OUTCOMES	5	5/0	4/0	1/0	0/0
3.	POLICY AND CRITERIA FOR ADMISSION	6	3/3	3/3	0/0	0/0
4.	PhD PROGRAMME	10	8/2	8/2	0/0	0/0
5.	SCIENTIFIC LEADERSHIP	11	7/4	7/3	0/1	0/0
6.	PhD DISSERTATION	9	6/3	5/2	1/1	0/0
7.	EVALUATION	7	6/1	6/1	0/0	0/0
8.	ORGANIZATION STRUCTURE	9	8/1	7/1	1/0	0/0
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>63</b>	<b>47/16</b>	<b>43/14</b>	<b>3/2</b>	<b>0/0</b>
<b>*BS - Basic standard, SU - Improvement standard</b>						

**List of documents reviewed by EEC members as part of an external evaluation of the educational programme**

<b>№</b>	<b>Document names</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1.	K-MUA-02-19 Code of Ethics for students of NJSC "AMU"	1
2.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Council No. 1	1
3.	Development strategy of NJSC "AMU" for 2022-2026	1
4.	Survey analysis for 2020	2
5.	Survey analysis for 2021	1
6.	Survey analysis for 2022	1
7.	Petitions for 2021	1
8.	Petitions for 2022	
9.	SU-MUA-22-19 Organization of the educational process on credit technology of training	1
10.	SU-MUA-14-22 Introduction of new educational technologies	1
11.	SU-MUA-35-12 Stakeholder analysis	1
12.	Handbook-guide for students of advanced training cycles and certification courses in the framework of additional and non-formal education of NJSC "AMU"	1
13.	RI-MUA-68-21 Working instructions for the development of an educational and methodological complex of disciplines of the NJSC AMU	1
14.	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE ORGANIZATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF ADDITIONAL EDUCATION IN THE FIELD OF HEALTHCARE	1
15.	Policy of JSC "Astana Medical University" in the field of scientific activity	1
16.	<b>The work plan of the center of additional education for 2023</b>	1
17.	KC-MUA-05-22 Development of effective technologies and teaching methods in NJSC AMU	1
18.	Personnel policy of NJSC "AMU"	1
19.	DI-MUA-3.2/03-22 Job description of the leading methodologist of the center of additional education	1
20.	Annual Plan of Advanced Training Cycles and Certification Courses for Healthcare Professionals for 2023	1
21.	The act of introducing the results of a new educational technology	1
22.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Council No. 1	1
23.	Order on approval of the composition of the commission for quality assurance of educational programmes for residency and additional education	1
24.	Methodical materials	1
25.	Journal of attendance and progress of students.	3
26.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes of Residency and Additional Education No. 7	1
27.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Committee for Quality	1

	Assurance of Educational Programmes of Residency and Additional Education No. 2	
28.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes of Residency and Additional Education No. 2 dated 06.10.2021	1
29.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes of Residency and Additional Education No. 1	1
30.	Extract from the minutes of the meeting of the Committee for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes of Residency and Additional Education No. 1 dated 08.09.2021	1
31.	Questionnaires and survey analysis	7
32.	P-MUA-17-20 Academic Policy	1
33.	Questionnaire form	1
34.	Order on approval of the composition of the commission for quality assurance of educational programmes for residency and additional education	1
35.	Agreement on the provision of services for a fee No. 19-D-184	1
36.	Agreement on the provision of services for a fee No. 19-D-187	1
37.	Agreement on the provision of services for a fee No. 19-D-192	1
38.	Form of act of completed works 2023	1
39.	RI-MUA-68-21 Working instructions for the development of an educational and methodological complex in NJSC AMU	1
40.	PL-MUA-76-20 Regulations on remuneration, bonuses and social security of employees of NJSC AMU	1
41.	PSP-MUA-3.2-22 Regulations on the center of additional education	1
42.	PL-MUA-03-20 Regulations on paid services of NJSC AMU	1
43.	PL-MUA-142-22 Regulations on awards	1
44.	Work plan of teaching staff	1
45.	On amendments to the Regulation on paid services	1
46.	Articles on additional education	9
47.	The composition of the section on additional and non-formal education of Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council in the direction of training - Healthcare for the 2022-2023 academic year	1
48.	Advanced training programme of NJSC AMU	1
49.	EP Improving special medical care for children	1
50.	Agreement on joint activities No. 522-D-211	1
51.	Agreement on joint activities No. 522-D-79	1
52.	Clinical bases	1
53.	Integrated programme of the seminar on SARS	1
54.	Agreement on joint activities No. 0240	1
55.	Agreement on joint activities No. 522-D-175	1
56.	Agreement on joint activities No. 177-18	1
57.	Agreement on the activities of clinical bases	1
58.	Memorandums	1
59.	Feedback from employers	1
60.	SU-MUA-81-21 Internal quality assurance system of NJSC AMU	1