

To the Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care  
October 27, 2022

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE**  
**EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**  
**7R01112 "DERMATOVENEROLOGY (ADULT AND CHILDREN)"**  
**OF THE RSE ON REM "KAZAKH SCIENTIFIC CENTER OF**  
**DERMATOLOGY AND INFECTIOUS DISEASES" OF THE MINISTRY OF**  
**HEALTH OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN**  
**FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF**  
**POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY**  
**SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

**external expert evaluation period: October 17-October 19, 2022**

**Almaty, 2022**

## CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4-6
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty-7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)"	4-5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	5-6
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	6-10
4.	Results of a survey of teachers and residents	10-15
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)»	15-34
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)»	34
7.	Recommendations to the Accreditation Council	35
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and the educational programme of residency in the specialty of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)»	36
	Attachment 2. List of documents to be submitted to the Accreditation Council studied as part of an external expert assessment	37

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH of RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD	Government Decree
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
KSCD&ID	Kazakh National Center for Dermatology and Infectious Diseases
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
OHPE	Organization of Higher and Postgraduate Education
AC	Academic Council
SC	Scientific Council
DPE	Department of Postgraduate Education
AMP	Administrative and managerial personell
TS	Teaching staff
EP	Educational programme
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CMI	Control and measuring Instruments
AC	Attestation Commission
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
IWR	Independent work of a student (resident)
EPI	Educational plan (curriculum)
WC	Working curriculum
TEPI	Typical Educational plan
RW	Research work
EEC	External Expert Commission
NLA	Normative legal acts
LEB	Local executive bodies
FA	Formative assessment
SA	Summative assessment
FA	Final assessment

## 1. Composition Of The External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 26 of October 06, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children)" in the period of October 17-19, 2022, consisting of the following members:

<b>№ n /</b>	<b>a Status in the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Academic degree / title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty</b>
1	Chairperson	BALMUKHANOVA AIGUL VLADIMIROVNA	MD, Professor, corresponding member. NAS RK, Head of the Department of International medical school Caspian University
2	Foreign expert	GULNARA IBADOVA	MD, Professor, Head of the Department of "Infectious and Parasitic Diseases of Childhood" of the Center for the Development of Professional Qualifications of Medical Workers, Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan
3	Academic expert	IMASHEVA BAGDAT SAKENOVNA	MD, Professor, Adviser to the Chairperson of the Board National Center for Public Health of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, member of the EMA in the direction: "Health care", member of the EMA under the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the group of specialties: "Health care and Social Security (medicine)", Deputy Editor-in-Chief of the journal: "Topical issues of healthy lifestyle formation, disease prevention and health promotion"
4	Academic expert	AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Acting Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases, Dermatovenerology and Immunology of the Semey Medical University NJSC
5	Representative of employers	AMANZHOLLOVA MERUERT TEMIRTASOVNA	Head of the skin and venereal dispensary department of the Pavlodar Regional Hospital named after G.Sultanov", freelance dermatovenerologist of Pavlodar region
6	Resident representative	SAKHABAYEVA ELVIRA	second-year resident in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University

Observer for ECAQA – Makpal Umarova, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the Director general of the ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the Dermatovenerology (adult, children's) educational programme for compliance with the Standards of Accreditation of Postgraduate Education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as

Accreditation Standards), EEC recommendations for further improvement of approaches and conditions for implementing the above-mentioned educational programme, and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Dermatovenereology (adult, children's)"

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	RSE on REM "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (KSCD&ID) BIN 181240026355
Management body	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first head	Abishev Asylkhan Turekhanovich
Date of establishment	28.12.2018
Location and contact details	MoscowAlmaty, Raiymbek Avenue, 60
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	IS-C # 0002 dated June 25, 2018
Information about branches and subsidiaries (if any)	There are no subsidiaries
Year of start of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2018
Duration of study	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of implementation of the EP	65 residents
Number of residents on the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	58 residents
Full-time teachers / part-time employees involved in the implementation of the EP, including %	of graduation rate 8/7 % of graduation rate-53%

KSCD&ID was formed in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 565 dated September 14, 2018 "On certain issues of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan" by combining two organizations of the RSE on REM "Republican AIDS Center" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and RSE on REM "Scientific Research Skin and Venereal Institute" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Since the beginning of the programme, 65 resident dermatovenereologists have been trained and graduated, and 57 more are currently being trained. All graduates successfully passed the IGA, gaining good scores-79 -100 points. Employment of graduates is 100%.

The KSCD&ID has an organizational structure of a research center and an educational process management structure. The Supervisory Board established by Order No. 387 of July 17, 2019 is functioning. Since 2019, KSCD&ID has been operating normally and has stepped up the search for sources of funding, including grant and targeted orders from employers for training specialists in the dermatovenereological service.

## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

The previous specialized accreditation of the residency programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology, including children's " was carried out by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA) with the issuance of IS-C certificate No. 0002 dated June 25, 2018.

## **2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the self-assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialty) of medical educational organizations and conclusions**

The report on the self-assessment of the residency programme in the specialty "Adult and children's Dermatology" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 85 pages of the main text, 13-page appendices, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner>.

The report is characterized by complete responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured according to the guidelines for conducting a self-assessment of an educational programme provided to an educational organization by the Accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Asylkhan Turekhanovich Abishev, Director of KSCD&ID, which confirms the accuracy of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, and information about the organization's representative.

Representative of the organization of Education and Science responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Ospanova Sanimbala Almeshevna, Ph. D., Head of the Department of Postgraduate Education of the KSCD&ID.

The self-assessment of the educational programme "Dermatovenerology for adults and children" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Director of the KSCD&ID No. 108-P dated 13.04.2022 "On the preparation and implementation of procedures for institutional and specialized accreditation".

The report was reviewed by accreditation experts: foreign expert, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of "Infectious and Parasitic Diseases of Childhood" of the Center for the Development of Professional Qualifications of Medical Workers, Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan Ibadova Gulnara Aliyevna and Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases, Dermatovenerology and Immunology of the Semey Medical University Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna.

The reviews highlight strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes that were taken into account during the feedback process with the KSCD&ID representative and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly.

All the standards present the actual practice of the KSCD&ID for training residents in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2018, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of educational programme tasks, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the KSCDH and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (associations, clinics), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc. etc.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a complete form, with data corrected for the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, described in accordance with the standards criterion, the tables contain links in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure – external evaluation. Experts plan to validate the report data, compare the

information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e., verify quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### 3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112-"Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA and in accordance with the programme approved on 06.10.2022 by the Director general of the ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S. S. and agreed with the director of the KSCD&ID Abishev A. T.

Organization visit dates: October 17-19, 2022

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of implementation of the visit within 3 days is described in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the ECAQA documentation. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external expert evaluation.

The following methods and their results were used to obtain objective information by the members of the EEC:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 5 people;
- interviews with residents – 10 people;
- exploring a website - Kncdiz.kz;
- interviewing – 11 employees, including 6 teachers and 5 clinical mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents-11 and 36, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending 3 practical classes:
  1. Topic: "Bullous epidermolysis", teacher Idrisova A. S., contingent of students: residents of the 1st year of study, venue: study room, clinical building;
  2. Topic: "Podological solutions for chronic dermatoses", teacher Arinova A. N., contingent of students: residents of the 2nd year of study, venue: study room, administrative building of the KSCD&ID;
  3. Topic: "Prevention of HIV infection and rapid testing", teacher Musina Zh. Zh., residents of the 2nd year of study, venue: study room, administrative building of KSCD&ID;
- Review of resources in the context of implementation of accreditation standards: 4 bases of practice/clinical engagement were visited, including: KSCD&ID Clinic, clinical building, 62 Raiymbek Ave.; Vitiligo and Skin Health Center LLP, Almaty-Rodnik Residential Complex, 284/1 Zharokova str.; Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education LLP, Almaty – 118 Shevchenko St.; National Center for Additional Medical Professional Education "YES" LLP - 75/1 Bukhar Zhyrau St., where training is conducted under an accredited educational programme with the participation of 8 full-time teachers/ part-timers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 23 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (see Attachment 2 for the list of documents studied).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews is ensured (Table 1).

**Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and interviews with EEC members**

No	Position	Number
1	Management of KSCD&ID	5
2	Management of the educational sector	6
3	Management of the scientific sector	7
4	Heads of educational programmes	6

5	Personnel Department employees	4
6	Heads and employees of auxiliary (supporting) divisions	8
7	Residents	10
8	Graduates of residency programmes	13
9	Teachers and mentors	11
10	Students of additional education programmes	4
11	Employers of graduates of programmes residencies and add-ons educational institutions	5

During the visit to the departments of the KSCD&ID, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: the availability of a sufficient number of basic bases and related specialties for theoretical and practical development of the educational programme, equipped with basic and modern equipment, including for mastering the most popular techniques and techniques in the specialty (modern methods of vitiligo therapy, phototherapy of various dermatoses, transplantation methods in dermatology and dermatocosmetology, availability and opportunities to use modern methods of HIV diagnosis/AIDS – 3 devices immunoblot, Immunochemiluminescent research method, 2 devices real time PCR, sequencer, SOPs for rapid diagnosis of HIV, etc.). There is also modern equipment for performing podological procedures, including nail prosthetics, standard approaches to patient training, etc.

The strengths are the relatively low cost of resident training, with good quality, which ensures a large flow of applicants for admission and competitive admission to the residency programme.

Particularly noteworthy is the presence of a telemedicine cabinet and the possibility of participating in international webinars, conferences, and forums on online platforms. Also, a strong point is the availability of modern laboratories for conducting dermatocosmetological and dermatological procedures, equipped with modern drugs, samples of therapy and care products, as well as providing hygiene procedures. It necessary to point out that one of the strengths is the professional passion of the teaching staff and clinical mentors, which motivates residents to actively study both special disciplines and related ones: HIV infection, gastroenterology, etc. Our strengths also include attracting residents to participate in specialized conferences, round tables, clinical rounds, and consultations. International organizations, such as the CDC, the Global Fund, and others, with which KSCD&ID has close ties and cooperation agreements, play a major role in providing equipment and equipment, which also creates additional conditions for the development of new techniques in dermatology, dermatocosmetology, and infectious diseases.

A strong point should be considered the presence and publication on an ongoing basis of its own printed publication-the Journal of Dermatovenenrology, in which you can publish both your own results and study the experience of colleagues. I would like to emphasize the continuing connection of young specialists-former residents - with their teachers and mentors, both to share their success and to consult on difficult issues.

The strong point is the friendly warm atmosphere in the institution, mutual assistance and support between teachers, attentive and friendly attitude towards residents, which creates additional motivational factors for professional growth. An important factor is patient - directed training of residents and trainees, which instills in residents a special attitude to patients with personalized prescribed diagnostic and therapeutic procedures.

There are departments that are directly related to the educational programme (podiatric unit, trichological office, vitiligo center, HIV diagnostic unit/AIDS, a dermatological clinic with a full set of diagnostic and therapeutic procedures), which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, a comprehensive examination of patients with possible hospitalization in a dermatological clinic, where training in ointment therapy methods, training in nail prosthetics, phototherapy and skin grafting for vitiligo, setting up an express test for HIV, etc. This conclusion was made because we were directly present at the classes where residents performed their own procedures for prosthetics of nails, testing for HIV infection in each other, were trained and prepared equipment for phototherapy in the physiotherapy



unit. During the work of the EEC, EEC members met with the management, namely with the director of the KSCD&ID, the Deputy Director for organizational, methodological and anti - epidemic work, the head of the HR management, Public Procurement and legal Support Department, the methodologist of the information and analytical monitoring and strategic development department, as well as with the management of the educational sector.

Interviews were conducted with managers of residency programmes, residents, teachers, employers and graduates of the residency programme. As a result of meetings and conversations, compliance with the criteria **of standard 1 was established**. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, participated in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, and the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and informational letters to medical organizations.

From interviews with residents, it is established that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plan of the educational organization, where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases. This indicates compliance **with standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents include educational programmes, a Master's manual, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, and funding. The experts examined the documents of residents (portfolios, results of the residents' assessment-checklists, results of the residents' survey).

The conversation with the head of the Department of Postgraduate Education of KSCD&ID Ospanova S. A. and the researcher of the Department of Postgraduate Education Sukhanberdiyeva Z. M. included such issues as cooperation with clinical bases, Regulations on clinical bases, Regulations on clinical mentors, about the rules of admission to residency and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (in total, such teachers in dermatovenerology – 5 people), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information security of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in human resource management and development, since part-time employees need training in teaching methods and evaluating residents.

Interviews with 5 teachers on the EP "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical documentation, independent work). Experts received answers about the teacher training programme, funding for this training, and whether teachers have certification in teaching methods.

On the same day, the experts examined the materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance **with standard 4**.

In order to verify the data **of standard 5**, external experts obtained opinions on the personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation

During visits to clinical bases where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, availability for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical Health care. The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

Interviews with 5 employers were conducted on-line and off-line, and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the KSCD&ID, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary knowledge and skills resources for practical training

and the formation of clinical thinking, the percentage of employed graduates of the residency programme, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, one of the main clinical bases was visited: the KSCD&ID clinic with a total bed capacity of 50 inpatient beds, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of training residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, state-of-the-art equipment and accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of an external assessment. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was conducted. EEC members have started drafting the final EEC report. Generalizations of the results of external evaluation are made.

Experts individually filled out the "Quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the educational programme 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson of the Board, A.V. Balmukhanova, held a final open vote on the recommendation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit the educational residency programme "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for **a period of 3 years**.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of KSCD&ID, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

#### **4. Survey results.**

During the period from 17.10-19.10.2022, an online survey was conducted by the ECAQA observer on the website <https://webanketa.com/>.

The survey of residents includes 23 questions.

A total of 36 resident dermatovenereologists responded. It was determined that more than half of the respondents are residents of the 1st year of study (20 people/55.5%), 16 people (44.4%) in the second year of study. The overwhelming majority of respondents - 31 people (86.1%) - recommend training in KSCD&ID to their environment, 3 people (8.3%) partially agreed with this statement.

35 residents (97.2%) believe that educational programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. According to 31 residents (86.1%), programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees).

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and equipment of classrooms and auditoriums of KSCD&ID showed that 32 people out of 36 (88.9%) are fully satisfied with the conditions provided and 4 people (11.1%) are partially satisfied.

34 (99.4%) noted that students have access to participate in research work in the KSCD&ID, 2 people (5.6%) partially agree. The majority of residents were fully satisfied with the library's resources, including 33 people (91.7.5%).

According to 35 residents (97.2%), " Teachers provided me with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes."

The response of 19 residents (52.8%) showed that they are engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor; 6 people (16.6%) have started planning research; 8 people (22.2%) have not yet decided on the topic of research.

24 people (66.6%) were fully satisfied with the library fund of the KSCD&ID, 7 (19.4%) were partially satisfied, and 5 (13.9%) did not give an answer.

To the question " Are you satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the place of seminars, the topics of seminars)", 34 respondents (94.4%) said that they are completely satisfied.

According to 34 respondents (94.4%), they have sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assisted operations); they are satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills; teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom.

To the question " After completing classes, does the teacher give you feedback (listen to your opinion, conduct a mini-questionnaire, work on mistakes)", 32 people (88.9%) answered yes, constantly. 3 residents (8.3%) noted "sometimes", 1 person (2.8%) "never"

12 people (33.35%) answered "once a week", 15 people (41.7%) "2-3 times a week", 3 people (8.33%) answered "1-2 times a month" to the questionnaire "How many seminars are held with residents during the month within the educational programme?", 1 resident (2.8%) answered "once a month", 2 residents (5.56%) answered "daily", 1 resident (2.8%) answered "very rarely", 2 residents (5.56%) could not give an answer.

35 students (97.2%) are confident that the organization of education allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in their chosen specialty.

The organization of clinical training was rated as "excellent" by 31 people (86.1%), 4 people (11.1%) rated as "good", 1 (2.8%) "satisfactory"

35 people (97.2 %) fully agree with the statement that the teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for me as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech).

To the question "Do you think accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency", 35 residents (97.2%) answered "yes, it is so", 1 resident (2.8% -- "I don't know what it is"

To the question "Choose one or several answer options that characterize the most important tool for external expert evaluation, which allows you to draw conclusions about the quality of educational programmes", 20 residents (55.5%) answered that this is an interview with the management of KSCD&ID, 18 people (50.5%) answered "an interview with teachers", 15 (41.7%) It was noted that interviews with resident mentors, 6 (16.6%) - interviews with graduates of KSCD&ID, 8 (22.2%) - study of documentation on the educational programme, 15 (41.6%) -interviews with residents, 11 (30.5%)-review of the resource base for training residents, 18 (50.5%) -attending practical classes and seminars and 4 residents (11.1%) - answered "I can't answer this question".

### **The teachers ' survey included 25 questionnaire questions**

A total of 113 teachers were surveyed, including 28.3% with up to 5 years of work experience, 22.12% with 5-10 years of experience, and 49.6% with more than 10 years of experience. 58.4% noted that they teach in residency.

74.3% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution, 22.1% are partially satisfied, and 2.65% are partially dissatisfied.

In this educational organization, ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management, 86.7% of respondents noted, while 11.5% partially agreed. 75.2% are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, 23.0% partially agree. The organization offers opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies, which was noted by 70.8% of respondents.

75.2 % of respondents fully agree that in this educational organization they have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results.

46.9% of respondents are completely satisfied with the salary, 5.3% disagree with it, 83.2% are completely satisfied with the work of the service, and 13.3% are partially satisfied.

49.6% of teaching staff were trained in professional development courses (programmes) during this year, 31.0% were trained more than 5 years ago, and 7.1% do not remember when it was. They believe that the subject taught by the respondent is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment) - fully -73.5% of respondents, partially-22.1%. They personally participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline taught: yes, 63.7% of teaching staff actively, no, 15.0% did not participate, they were only electives- 7.1%, 6.2% were not involved in the work.

Respondents noted that the educational organization supports the participation of teaching staff in conferences (international, national)- payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fee -21.2% of the staff, payment of only travel - 2.7%, does not pay any expenses - 2.7%, did not contact the management about this-30.9%. We fully agree that students have free access to patients at the clinical bases of educational organizations to improve their practical skills - 85.8%.

Teaching staff assess their publication activity on a scale of 5 points (from 1-low to 5-high) - 17.1% as "1", 7.1% as "2" points, 19.5 % as "3" points, 23,9% - "4", 26,6 % - "5", they didn't give it to me the response rate was 17.7%.

To the question "Do educational organizations implement social support programmes for teachers?" - 38.9% answered that such programmes exist, 2.65% - have already used it, 44.3 % do not know about it, 10.6% doubt the answer.

65.5% of respondents said that the organization's management systematically listens to their opinion on the educational process, research and clinical work.

To the question "What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of training residents", 48.7% of people answered that they conduct lectures more often. Oral analysis of the topic of the lesson - 72.6%, Rewriting of thematic information from monographs-10.6%, Problem-oriented training-40.7%, Interactive training-46.9%, Implementation of research papers-34.5%, Practical classes on clinical skills in the training and clinical center-56.6%, Analysis of situational problems-75.2%, Compilation and solution case studies - 38.9%, Oral questioning of students-61.1%, Solving tests-48.7%, Working in small groups-53.9%, Writing tasks - 28.3%

70.8% of respondents fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the organization's key areas of activity, while 14.2% partially agree.

31.9% of respondents said that they were involved in preparing for the accreditation of the educational programme; 16.81% were engaged in technical support before the meeting of the external expert commission; 12.4% wrote sections of the self - assessment report; 15.9% collected information for appendices to the self - assessment report; and 23.9% of respondents were not involved in preparing the organization for accreditation.

53.1% of respondents believe that the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of educational programme implementation. According to 35.4% of people, the external expert commission examines all the main processes of implementing the educational programme; the programme of the commission's visit is rich and covers all key aspects of education - 28.3%. The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with interested parties, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training - 34.5%.

Respondents noted the activities of external expert work on accreditation, which are the most important and allow to obtain evidence of compliance with accreditation standards: interview with the management of the organization -7.96%; interview with the heads of educational programmes - 13.3%; interviews with students -11.5%; interviews with graduates of programmes - 3.5%; interviews with employers ' representatives - 1.8%; visit to the University of practical training bases-3.5%; survey of educational resources-0.88%; study of educational and methodological documentation-0%; interviews with teachers-1.8%; reviewing the programme self-assessment report-0%; attending practical classes - 2.7%; study of administrative documentation-0.88%; All of the above - 45.1%.

The results of the survey are presented in the Attachment and generally demonstrate the positive aspects of training in the residency programme, while at the same time identifying areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers and their participation in scientific conferences, increasing the publication activity of teaching staff, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

## **5. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the residency training programme in the specialty 7R01112 -"Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission statement and final results**

Mission of the Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases: "Improving the health of citizens through the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of HIV infection, parenteral viral hepatitis in people living with HIV and the quality of medical care for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of dermatovenerology".

Vision: "An affordable specialized service with a wide range of high-quality services for the diagnosis, prevention and treatment of HIV infection and viral hepatitis, providing high-tech medical services to the population with dermatovenereological pathology, integrating clinics, science and practice."

The mission of KSCD&ID is reflected in the Strategic Plan of KSCD&ID for 2020-2024, approved at the production meeting and agreed by the Vice-Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan E. K. Zhumatayev (No. 01-1-0 / 4973-ext dated 10.07.2020). The strategic plan of KSCD&ID and the main documents necessary and regulated for the analysis and determination of the quality of education are available on the Center's website - [www.kncdiz.kz](http://www.kncdiz.kz)

The mission, goals and objectives correspond to the mission of the educational organization, the current management system, the main programme documents in the field of education and health, and the quality assurance policy of the KSCD&ID.

The values / ethical principles of KSCD&ID presented in the mission, namely: 1. Patient-oriented; 2. Resident-oriented approach to learning; 3. Accessibility; 4. Professionalism and Responsibility; 5. Confidentiality; 6. No stigma and discrimination; 7. Innovation and creativity; 8. Responsibility and reliability; 9. Integrity and transparency, fully respected and cultivated in the learning process, both teachers and residents themselves.

It should be noted that the points stated in the self-assessment report for the first standard correspond to reality. We have not noted any elements of discrimination or stigmatization both in relation to the patients we observed when visiting clinical bases, and between teachers and residents.

As for the professional competence and responsibility of the teaching staff and mentors, I would like to note that, despite the relatively young staff of teachers, the level of their professionalism is quite high. This is confirmed by the analysis of the residents 'knowledge when attending classes during the work of the accreditation commission, and indirectly-by the employers' feedback, which testified at the on-line interview about the good professional training of persons who completed their residency at the KSCD&ID.

The integrity and transparency presented in the ethical principles of the KSCD&ID can be judged by the documents provided on the public website of the SC, as well as by the results of an anonymous survey of residents (36 people), teachers and mentors (11 people).

There is a Press service in KSCD&ID, which provides information not only through the official website, but also through social networks about all the news, including educational and clinical events, such as charity for leprosy patients (the last Sunday of January is World Leprosy Day), February 16 is World Day of Struggle STIs, open days-June 25-World Vitiligo Day; Academy of Multidisciplinary

Dermatovenerology dedicated to World Psoriasis Day-October 29, World AIDS Day-December 1, "Dermatological Readings named after Zh. A. Orazymbetova".

Based on the analysis of the health needs of society and the system of medical care provided by the dermatovenerological service, as well as taking into account the aspects of social responsibility, the mission of the KSCD&ID educational programme is to train professional personnel for the health infrastructure of dermatovenerologists based on an optimal combination of traditional and innovative educational technologies, whose professional and personal competence meets the needs of the state, the professional community and the population at the present stage with a view to the future.

During the implementation of the programme activities, namely, following an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Academic Council of the KSCD&ID and the Supervisory Board established by Order No. 387 of July 17, 2019 "On approval of the composition of the National Council of the RSE on the REM "KSCD&ID" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan", in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, most of them took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, and the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website of the Scientific Center - [www.kncdiz.kz](http://www.kncdiz.kz)

From interviews with residents, it is established that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training bases. Also, 91.7% of residents answered that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees), which provides feedback from students and teachers.

However, it should be noted that the presented formulation of the mission of KSCD&ID is somewhat vague, not all the areas indicated in the mission are currently being developed (treatment of HIV infection, parenteral viral hepatitis in people living with HIV). During the discussion of this issue with the management of the National Center, it was said that these areas are currently being actively developed, and in confirmation of this, laboratories for complex diagnostics of HIV and parenteral hepatitis, fully equipped and ready for the educational process, were shown.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

The Lima Declaration of 1988 defines academic autonomy as "the freedom of members of the academic community, individually or collectively, to contribute to the generation and transfer of knowledge through research, study, discussion, production, creativity, teaching, lectures and printed works" [International Law Documents... 2003]. Based on the essence of this document and based on the results of an external assessment, it is established that the KSCD&ID is indeed professionally autonomous. First, in the formulation of the mission, through the mechanism of ensuring the security of the research and educational process. For this purpose, KSCD&ID has 2 buildings of 5 and 3 floors, completely renovated and adapted both for scientific research (there are scientific laboratories and a number of specialized units, including a 3-storey clinical building) and for the educational process: study rooms for standard thematic theoretical classes, practical offices and clinical units (own clinic on the territory of the University of Moscow). 50 places, physiotherapy, epidemiology, diagnostic departments, etc.), as well as modern conditions in the form of distance learning and telemedicine (fully equipped hall for 30 people), computer testing room.

Especially noteworthy is the presence of its own library with its own "Questions of dermatology and venereology". KSCD&ID had 3-year accreditation and certification in 2019-2021, which allowed to develop educational programmes taking into account the State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the needs of Health care in the Republic of Kazakhstan and potential employers.

For example, KSCD&ID has developed unique programmes for the treatment of vitiligo together with the VITILIGO Center, with which a cooperation agreement has been drawn up and there is an agreement on cooperation and the educational process as a basic clinic. Experts visited the VITILIGO center and we were able to make sure on the spot about cooperation.

All issues related to the development and approval of training programmes, the involvement of related specialists and new bases for the educational process are carried out both by the Academic Council of the KSCD&ID, Faculty, administrative staff, residents, as well as by attracting reviewers from other organizations and independent institutions on the basis of available accreditation documents (IA-C No. 12 of June 25, 2018 to June 23, 2023, with annual confirmation by the independent agency for quality assurance in education – "Egar").

KSCD&ID is autonomous in developing the final results of training in an accredited educational programme, and S. A. Ospanova, Head of the Department, is responsible for this section. Department of Postgraduate Education, management of the KSCD&ID, based on regulatory documents in the form of annual accreditation confirmation for Dermatovenerology (adult, children's), confirmed by Certificates for 2019, 2020, 2021, 2022.

The autonomy of the educational organization in choosing the appropriate educational programme and clinical bases is justified by the License issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for educational activities under the code 7R091 – Health care (medicine) with an Attachment to the License dated 23.07.2019. Relationships and cooperation with the clinical bases necessary for conducting practical classes and mastering practical skills are fixed by mutual contractual relations (Memorandum with the PSE on REM "Regional Infectious Diseases Hospital" of the State Department of Health of the Almaty region dated 25.03.2021).

Professional autonomy of a specialist (resident, student) in KSCD&ID is determined by the ability to choose a teacher, mentor, elective subjects, clinical bases for training, participate in scientific research, publish in the open press, participate in the discussion of educational programmes, choose an employer after completing the residency. According to the surveyed residents, 69.45% of them are either already engaged in scientific research, or they have started to develop a topic of interest to them. In 22.22% of cases, residents have not yet decided in which direction they would like to engage in scientific research. Only 2 out of 36 residents answered that they were not offered to participate in scientific research, and one resident refused to engage in scientific research due to lack of interest in science.

Also, the strength of the accredited organization is that the KSCD&ID assesses and monitors the competitiveness of residents annually, in the section of young specialists at the RPC, residents of KSCD&ID have repeatedly taken first places among residents of other organizations.

In KSCD&ID, residents have the right to choose a teacher and mentor, both at the beginning of training and at its stages. This aspect is controlled by head of the Department of Education Ospanova S. A., which finds out the reasons for changing a teacher or mentor.

The content, scope and sequence of the course of the educational programme in the specialty of residency correspond to the standards of education (State Educational Standard and TEP in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, approved by the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated 31.07.2015).

It should be noted that all items and sections presented in this standard corresponded to the description in the self-assessment report. There are no fundamental comments to this section.

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

The end results include knowledge, skills, the need for analysis, communication skills and ongoing training of the resident, which form the backbone of the knowledge and skills of a dermatovenerologist. The educational programme, with its structure and teaching methods, creates the need to keep abreast of current medical trends, use evidence-based medicine data for the diagnosis and effective practice of diseases, thus developing the ability of residents to continue learning throughout their lives. The final results of training in the KSCD&ID are regulated by the certification of residents and trainees at the end of the full course of study (<https://elicense.kz/>).

When analyzing the level of training of residents, we took into account the year of study of the resident and the degree of possession of practical skills and theoretical knowledge. We evaluated practical skills during visits to clinical bases, as well as during the practical part of classes in the form of independent work of residents: setting up a rapid HIV test in the corresponding class (residents

conducted research on each other and also tested themselves, previously the whole procedure was explained to them step-by-step and shown by the curator of the group), as well in podology, we observed the work of residents on nail prosthetics (the curator previously explained the entire process and showed the entire procedure step-by-step, while explaining the basics of safety techniques, the residents each performed a similar procedure on dummies, which are available in sufficient quantities at the KSCD&ID training base). Theoretical knowledge on the topic of the lesson was evaluated by an oral survey: What is post-exposure prophylaxis of HIV infection, when and how it is performed; what diseases and conditions of the body can be accompanied by dermatological manifestations and what is the approach to the treatment of such manifestations. Classes were conducted according to the programme, residents answered well to the questions asked, expressed their own opinions and were able to enter into a discussion, which may indicate autonomy of thinking, knowledge of the material, interest in the chosen specialty and sufficient basic knowledge.

An important component of the anti-corruption policy implemented by the KSCD is the availability and constant updating and addition of information on the Corporate website (Kncdiz.kz), the main resource of the KSCD&ID, which contains information in three languages: state-Kazakh, Russian, and English. KSCD&ID has links with public organizations in Kazakhstan in the field of Health care, which allows you to use additional educational and informational resources. Heads of structural divisions under the control of the higher management of the Center with system administration of monitoring site visits are responsible for analyzing and distributing site information.

When anonymously interviewing 36 1st and 2nd year residents, an important indicator was the self-assessment of the level of training and education in the KSCD&ID. Residents were asked a number of questions:

- I am satisfied (satisfied) with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and auditoriums of this educational organization-88.9% answered "fully", 1.1% - "partially";
- I personally have access to equipment (educational and real-world) in order to master practical skills in my specialty – all 100.0% of residents answered "I fully agree with this statement";
- I am provided with the necessary educational literature – 91.7% fully agreed with this statement, 5.6% partially agreed, 1 resident-partially disagreed;
- Are you satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the location of seminars, the topics of seminars)? 94.4% of the surveyed residents answered this question positively, in one case the answer was negative and in 1 case – doubtful;
- There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assisted operations) - 94.4% answered positively, 1 resident answered partially satisfied, 1-not satisfied;
- I am satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme-97, 2% - answered- "completely", 1-is not satisfied;
- Evaluate the organization of clinical training: 86.1% of residents rated it "Excellent", 11.1% - rated it "Good", 1 resident rated it satisfactory.
- There is a sufficient number of patients to be supervised or assisted during operations: 94.4% of residents said that they are fully satisfied, 5.6% - partially satisfied.

Based on the results of checking the educational potential of the KSCD&ID, visiting classes, basic institutions, communicating with residents during classes and on the results of anonymous questionnaires, analyzing the level of providing the educational process with a sufficient number of educational premises and their compliance with the needs of the educational process, the availability of modern laboratory and diagnostic equipment, the availability of office equipment and new technologies in teaching, that section 1.3.1 of the standard complies with the accreditation standard for all points of analysis.

#### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

According to the results of interviewing residents, anonymous questionnaires, and communication with teachers and mentors, the participation of residents, teachers, and mentors in the process of forming the KSCD&ID mission and determining the final learning outcomes along with the KSCD&ID



administration was confirmed. So, according to the results of an anonymous survey, the question: Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees) - in 86.1% of cases, they answered "constantly", in 5.6% they answered "sometimes", 3 residents did not know about it, doubted or were not interested in it. not involved.

Similar answers were obtained based on the results of a survey of 11 teaching staff members, to the question: do the managers of the organization listen to your opinion regarding questions on the educational process, research, clinical work: 100.0% answered positively.

At the same time, the participation of practical Health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, expert evaluation is formalized and reviews of practical Health care are not collected when forming components of choice.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: fully - 16, partially-1, do not meet-0.

**Standard 1:** completed

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Specify the mission statement, taking into account educational goals in dermatology, dermatocosmetology, and certain infectious diseases (point 1.1).

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **2.1 Key parameters of the postgraduate medical education programme**

The accredited residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is implemented in accordance with the State mandatory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated 05.07.2022.

The organization's documents include educational programmes, a Master's manual, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established. Attending a practical lesson on the topic: "Bullous epidermolysis", the amount of hours - 6, experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill of skin treatment in patients with butterfly syndrome, study new dressings and solutions for skin treatment. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as experts have studied the resident's code of ethics published on the KSCD&ID website.kz and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

When attending a practical class on the topic: "Podological solutions for chronic dermatoses", a 6-hour course and a conversation with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on dermatological equipment (podiatrist's chair). At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in the classroom.

This indicates the adaptation of training at the KSCD&ID to the needs of residents and that residents are provided with the academic knowledge and skills needed in their future careers (**ESG G 1.2**). Thus, the overwhelming majority of residents surveyed (86.1%) recommend training in the KSCD&ID to their environment. And 97.2% believe that KSCD&ID allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty.

After completing 2-year training, a resident is issued a state-issued certificate with a transcript that corresponds to the 7th level of the National Qualification Framework (**ESG 1.2**). The specialty code is 7R01112. When talking to residents, the experts received confirmation that before entering the residency

programme, an employee of the Postgraduate education Department provides explanations on the final results and qualifications.

## **2.2 The scientific method**

When preparing residents, the organization uses the opportunities of formal training and informal events aimed at providing access to updated reliable data and evidence, scientific research results and achievements in practical Health care by working with professional websites and platforms (n-r: <https://www.eadv.org/>, <https://www.dermatology.ru/>, <https://dermatologicalbeauty.loreal.com.ru/> etc.), as well as mandatory participation in all scientific events Research centers and international research centers for dermatovenerology and related specialties (Ana men Bala, Allergology and Immunology, Urology, Pediatrics, Orphan Diseases, etc.).

Residents are provided with access to the Internet, via WIFI network in classrooms and at the clinical base, which allows teaching staff to provide timely handouts and electronic teaching materials and provide up-to-date literature, access to scientific data for analysis and development of clinical thinking by working with professional websites <https://www.eadv.org/>, <https://www.dermatology.ru/>. However, there is no access to evidence-based medicine databases (Cochrane Library, UpToDate, etc.) It is recommended to include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data in the educational programme of the residency.

## **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

The content, scope and sequence of disciplines of the EP residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" strictly correspond to the State Educational Standard. The achievement of the objectives of training in the specialty is based on the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies, profiling (PGE) disciplines of the main component and the elective component (CC). The educational programme for training residents in this specialty is designed for 140 credits. A model of resident competencies was introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for developing and approving the residency programme is clearly defined and regulated by the Department of Postgraduate Education and approved by the Academic Council

## **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

The structure of the EP residency in the specialty 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is formed from various types of educational, scientific, clinical activities and practices that determine the content of education, and reflects their correlation, measurement and accounting. The EP is implemented in accordance with the State Budget for 2022 and provides the necessary level of training for residents, including relevant specialized disciplines.

The educational programme provides a sequence of studying disciplines based on their continuity, a rational distribution of disciplines by semester from the point of view of uniformity of the student's academic work. For a more complete development of the discipline, residents are provided with a catalog of elective subjects, including 16 topics, compiled taking into account the opinion of stakeholders.

## **2.5 Organization of training**

The staff of teachers who teach residents is represented mainly by young teachers. But at the same time, both teachers and mentors represented by the staff of clinical bases, despite their professional level, do not fully master pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. Teachers of departments use a variety of methods of active (clinical analysis, case study, etc.) and traditional (oral analysis, mini-lectures) training.

However, it should be noted that there are no contracts with clinical bases where residents are trained in related disciplines (gastroenterology, clinical pharmacology, oncology, infectious diseases), which in the opinion of the commission reduces the quality of training of residents.

## **2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care delivery**

The organization, being the main institution for the dermatovenerological profile in the Republic of Kazakhstan, has a good clinical base for residents (hospital and polyclinic of KSCD&ID). Students spend most of their training time in close contact with patients and medical documentation, including automated Health care systems (in which they work together with mentors). Patient supervision allows

residents to master diagnostic and therapeutic procedures during their daily clinical activities. The clinic has state-of-the-art diagnostic equipment, as well as implemented modern treatment methods (phototherapy, podiatric care, laser therapy, etc.), which allows residents to see and monitor a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies that correspond to the cycle of disciplines conducted.

When conducting interviews with residents, experts were convinced that the organization of training and work is focused on patients, at the same time, there is not always a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for theoretical analysis of complex topics and studying literature in modern databases.

Thus, the educational programme of the residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, including children's" demonstrates the integration between training and medical care.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: fully -29, partially -1, do not meet-0.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) In the educational programme of residency and additional non-formal education, include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data (paragraphs 2.2.1, 2.2.2);
- 2) Document relationships with third-party clinical databases (conclude a contract) where residents study in related disciplines (gastroenterology, clinical pharmacology, oncology, infectious diseases) (point 2.5.3., 2.5.4).

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

##### **3.1 Evaluation methods**

Internal regulatory documents have been developed for the assessment of residents in the KSCD&ID: "Academic policy in the residency programme", "Regulations on the educational process in the residency programme", "Handbook-guide for the student of the residency programme".

In order to ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the assessment process, KSCD&ID has developed checklists for conducting current, milestone and final control in the discipline (Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE). evaluation criteria based on the point-rating system were developed and approved.

As an additional method of evaluating residents, we use portfolios that experts have reviewed during the work of the Higher Economic Commission. Residents are engaged in research work, the results are reported at scientific and practical conferences.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022 for residency specialties.

The study of control and measurement tools (50 tests, 10 tasks) showed that the organization has implemented a proper assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, residents said that they receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of assessment results is reflected in the document "Regulations on Residency" and there was no appeal during the period of work of the organization of education of applicants.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with an employee, S. A. Ospanova, the Head of the Educational Department, commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents, educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates, certificates and certificates.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents: the Rules of admission to the residency programme, the QED, the Code of Honor of the resident, and there is information for applicants that is regularly updated.

### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in KSCD&ID are defined in syllabuses for disciplines, but it is necessary to describe the ratio of formative and summative assessment to obtain a final assessment.

Assessment methods are fully comparable to teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all students' competencies both during practical classes and during exams. Various types of control and measurement tools developed by departments are used in the assessment of educational achievements (control questions, test tasks, situational tasks, practical and communication skills, etc.). The analysis of the results of training of students of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is carried out systematically at the KSCD&ID&ID. Department of Postgraduate Education, analyzing the results of intermediate and final attestations, with discussion at the Academic Council with the formation of a plan for improving the quality of the educational process.

But it should be noted that it is necessary to introduce a computer-based assessment of knowledge for an objective assessment of the resident, use the Anti-plagiarism system to check tasks for independent work of the student.

***The conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Out of 11 standards conform: fully – 11.

***Standard 3: completed***

***Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:***

- 1) In the syllabus, include a detailed description of the methods of evaluating residents (FA, SA, Final Attestation) (paragraph 3.1.2);
- 2) Apply MCQ, TBL, PBL in the methods of assessment and self-assessment of residents (point 3.1.4);
- 3) Document the assessment of the validity and reliability of control and measurement instruments (CMI) with a view to their continuous improvement (paragraph 3.1.6);
- 4) Methods for assessing the academic performance of residents should include computer forms and verification of completed independent work of residents under the "Anti-plagiarism" system (item 3.2.1).

### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

The policy of admission of students to the residency programme at KSCD&ID is reflected in the "Regulations on the educational process for the selection of students and trainees, including those with disabilities". The university's policy of admission and transfer of students from other national or international programmes in KSCD&ID corresponds to the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31.10.2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education".

The criteria for applicants entering the residency programme are determined by the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master the educational programmes of residency: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

Questions about admission to educational residency programmes are posted on the website of the KSCD&ID (Kncdiz.kz) and at the admissions office.

The EEC noted that admission to the residency programme is carried out by the method of an oral survey using tickets. Admission to the exam is conducted on a commission basis by three examiners.

This form of entrance examinations does not ensure transparency and objectivity in the selection of residents and does not exclude the element of corruption.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

In order to ensure a balance between the existing capacity and opportunities for training students of the residency programme, the availability of EP resources is monitored in preparation for the new academic year. The number of places in the residency programme is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical Health care. A special feature of admission to the residency **programme** "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" in this organization and other medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan is that there is no admission for educational grants for this specialty for 15 years. Accordingly, it is necessary to find opportunities for training residents in this specialty on grants from local executive bodies (LEB).

But, despite this, 34 residents are studying on a paid basis in the current academic year, and another 23 residents of the 2nd year of study, which, according to the commission, exceeds the limit, since there is not a sufficient number of highly qualified teaching staff. A total of 65 residents have been issued during the residency programme's existence since 2018.

#### **4.3 Support and advice to residents**

In KSCD&ID, curators, mentors, teaching staff and employees of the Public Educational Institution provide support and advice to residents on the social, financial and personal needs of students. There is a blog of the Director.

Student support focused on social, financial and personal needs is based on mutual assistance, mutual understanding, and relationships that are revealed during personal conversations with teaching staff, colleagues, and employees of the KSCD&ID. For this purpose, business breakfasts with students are organized, trips up the health stairs to Medeo, Terrencourt, First President's Park, Bauman Grove, etc.

The very structure and idea of the residency implies a long-term day-long presence of the teacher on the basis of the KSCD&ID, both students and teachers themselves, which contributes to the formation of a trusting relationship between the curator and the resident. The policy of the teaching staff of KSCD&ID is aimed at creating a friendly environment within the educational process in order to avoid conflict situations that may lead to a professional crisis.

#### **4.4 Resident representation**

Students' participation in solving issues related to the educational programme and other issues related to the residency programme (for example, discussion of QED, availability of targeted grants from specialized organizations) is achieved through round-table discussions, meetings at scientific and practical conferences, congresses, master classes, with the definition of further focus and professional orientation. But the organization does not have an advisory body of residents (n-r Council of Residents), which would unite students in solving some issues or problems.

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

The presence of its own clinical databases at KSCD&ID creates a unique opportunity for students to improve their practical and theoretical skills, a certain number of patients (unique cases, taking into account the national scale of the organization), patient counseling through the project "Telemedicine" under the guidance of leading specialists of the Center. Good living conditions have been created for residents on the basis of KSCD&ID: in addition to training rooms, there is a self-training and recreation room, a place for eating. Proper safety of residents is ensured when working with patients.

In case of forced breaks in training, for example: during pregnancy, childbirth, parental leave, long-term illness, family circumstances (moving to another city), training is carried out by attaching the student to a specialized organization, identifying a curator and providing a monthly report of the resident on the work performed and its assessment.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: fully -28, partially -2, do not meet-0.

**Standard 4:** completed

### ***Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:***

- 1) In order to avoid corruption and conflicts of interest, ensure transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to education by introducing electronic testing, since oral exams do not guarantee this (paragraph 4.1.4);
- 2) Document the representation of residents for participation in the development of the educational programme, the residency admission policy (for example, the Council of Residents) (clause 4.1.8).

## **Standard 5: FACULTY**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and selection policy**

Labor relations in KSCD&ID are regulated by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the collective agreement, as well as labor contracts concluded between the organization and each employee individually.

For conducting classes for residents in the specialty 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", the main requirements for the teacher are the presence of a higher medical education and an academic title. Advantages when applying for a job are: the presence of an academic degree/academic title. Teachers who are attracted from practical Health care are additionally required to have a number of requirements: practical experience in the specialty, the presence of a medical qualification category. The competence of teaching staff when applying for a job is established on the basis of documents on education, training, skills and experience (diploma, certificate, entries in the employment record), as well as on the basis of an individual interview in the HR department.

The number of employees with academic degrees is 15: Doctor of Medical Sciences-1, Candidate of Medical Sciences-8; Master of Medicine-6; with the highest category -1.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes information on professional and pedagogical professional development. All teachers are certified at certain intervals.

The conversation with the head of the Department of Postgraduate Education S. A. Ospanova included such issues as staffing of the residency programme, settling down of teaching staff, improving pedagogical competencies, part-time work and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (there are 5 such teachers in total), strategies and tactics for recruiting residents, information security of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in human resource management and development, since most part-timers do not know the teaching methodology or have insufficient professional training to conduct classes in the residency programme, due to the fact that they have little experience and do not have sufficient clinical experience.

#### **5.2 Teacher commitment and development**

The implementation of the programme for improving the professional and pedagogical competencies of teachers and mentors is regulated on an ongoing basis by the administration of the KSCD&ID. Teachers who conduct classes with residents submit supporting documents on their professional development to the HR department, as well as form their own portfolio. Teaching staff and staff of the KSCDH are involved in the development of Clinical protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of certain dermatoses and HIV infection.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received opinions on approaches to developing teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes improving pedagogical skills and clinical competencies, participation in international conferences and congresses.

Experts received answers about the teacher training programme, which is held annually, and 5 young teachers participating in the implementation of the educational programme were trained in pedagogy for 2022. These events are funded by the accredited organization.

Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation, and have joint publications with residents.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 7 standards conform: fully - 6, partially-1.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Strengthen the staff of teachers who have an academic degree (PhD or MD) or a master's degree (clause 5.1.1);
- 2) Conclude contracts with teachers and mentors in sub-specialties (related) - oncology, gastroenterology, clinical pharmacology, infectious diseases (clause 5.1.3).

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

KSCD&ID has a well-developed material and technical base for professional training of residents in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)". KSCD&ID has 2 buildings of 5 and 3 storeys, with a total area of 9,344. 1 sq. m.. For the implementation of the residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", there are enough healing rooms equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material, including electronic form, methodological developments in each discipline, and innovative technologies for interactive teaching methods (hall for distance learning and telemedicine). This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards.

To implement the EP, the KSCD&ID of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan has a lecture hall with 250 seats, a training dermatological laboratory "Corneo", equipped with the necessary technical support facilities – a stationary multimedia projector and designed for 50 seats, special equipment for interactive classes. The study rooms can accommodate up to 40 people.

According to the residents, when interviewing them, the material and technical support of the educational process is quite sufficient and makes it possible to study the specialty at a modern level. Also, in the course of an anonymous survey of residents to the question: I am satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and auditoriums of this educational organization: 88.9% of residents answered- "completely", 11.1% - partially satisfied.

A similar question in relation to teaching staff was asked during their anonymous survey: "... I believe that the organization has enough equipment and resources to train residents in accredited programmes": 81.8% - answered "fully agree", 18.2% - "partially agree".

It should be noted that during the accreditation, we visited the departments of the main and clinical buildings of the KSCDH. Everything described in the relevant sections of the self-assessment report was available. Of particular interest were the state-of-the-art units equipped with the latest equipment (physiotherapy with phototherapy booths, a podiatric unit with modern equipment and supplies for therapy, an HIV diagnostic laboratory fully equipped up to the sequencer). All of the above gives reason to believe that KSCD&ID has a well-equipped material and technical base that contributes to a high modern level of the educational process.

#### **6.2 Clinical databases**

The clinical bases of KSCD&ID for residents studying in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" are: own clinic with a bed capacity of 50 inpatient beds, as well as an advisory polyclinic, the Vitiligo Center-with an operating unit, 6 wards, auxiliary units of phototherapy, examination, physiotherapy, etc. In addition to the above, KSCD&ID has an agreement with the regional Infectious Diseases Hospital and the Center for Postgraduate Education, where residents have the opportunity to study related specialties (gastroenterology, gynecology, emergency therapy and resuscitation, etc.).

During the visit to the clinical base, it was revealed that some of the equipment is outdated, in order to improve the quality of the educational process, it is necessary to update the basic equipment, as well as purchase new, more technologically advanced means of modern diagnostics, therapy and prevention of dermatological, venereal and infectious diseases.

#### **6.3 Information technology**

Information support for the work of residents is provided through: Mass media (Facebook, Telegram, etc.) website of KSCD&ID ([Kncdiz.kz](http://Kncdiz.kz)); television monitors in classrooms, interactive whiteboards, an Internet resource, official information boards of the residency department and the KSCD&ID. KSCD&ID has the opportunity to use the services of an electronic library. Students have the opportunity to receive all educational and methodical literature in electronic form, both in the classroom and in the library. Open access databases: 1. PUBMED 2. eLIBRARY.RU 3. Unified Electronic Library 4. Polpred. Com Media Review 5. BioMed Central 6. RMS PabMedCentral 7. MedlinePlus 8. Evidence-based Medicine TripDatabase 9. National Institutes of Health 10. JAMA Network 11. Kaz NEB. These conditions also apply to residents.

However, during the visit of the library experts, it was found that there is no access to the Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence databases.

#### **6.4 Clinical teams**

The resident training programme in the specialty 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" includes skills of teamwork and effective interaction with other Health care professionals. Residents work together with the staff of clinical bases to develop professional skills in all areas of their activity: participation in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams.

The training part of the KSCD&ID provides training for residents in an interdisciplinary team by conducting master classes, classes in the form of a "standardized patient", team-oriented training, clinical reviews, and pathoanatomical conferences.

Participation in regional training forums "20 regions of dermatovenerologists, dermatocosmetologists", the Academy of Multidisciplinary Dermatovenerology, Dermatological readings named after Zh. A. Orazymbetova, Open Door Days (<https://Kncdiz.kz/ru/press-sluzhba/press-relizy/>), conducted on a regular basis by the CDC, and promotes networking with colleagues and other health professionals.

B KSCD&ID practices the formation of clinical (multidisciplinary) teams with the inclusion of students and students of the residency programme to participate in solving professional problems, where they can show their professional, ethical, communication and analytical skills in such events as field trips within the framework of the "Year of Children-2022" in the villages of Merke and Makhambet, Taraz, Atyrau and Shu.

It should be noted that teamwork is noted at all levels: teamwork of teaching staff-teachers+mentors, teachers+residents, residents+residents, employers+teaching staff, employers+residents. These connections could be observed both in the process of interviewing these categories of people, and in the process of anonymous questioning. So to the question: Currently I am engaged in scientific work under the guidance of my teacher or mentor-52.8% of residents answered "yes, it is so"; 16.8% - said that they planned scientific work; 22.2% of residents have not yet decided on the topic of scientific research; only two residents noted that the teacher did not offer them to engage in scientific research, 1 resident replied that he did not want to engage in science, although the teacher suggested it to him.

To the question: "...after completing classes, does the teacher give you feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaires, works on mistakes)" - 88.9% of residents answered "constantly", 8.3% - noted that "sometimes", 1 resident answered negatively - "never".

On the part of the teaching staff, the answer to the question: "...in this educational organization, ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management" was indicative – 100.0% of respondents answered with full consent,

To the question: "...in the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies" - 100.0% answered positively,

To the question: "...in this educational organization, I have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish research results" - 100.0% answered "yes",

To the question: "...do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, and clinical work" - 100.0 % answered positively. All this indicates



the absence of an authoritarian type of management, teamwork and the democratic principle of relations in the team.

### **6.5 Medical research and development**

The scientific interests of KSCD&ID employees are determined by the profile of the clinical base and specialty. The research work of the KSCD&ID is regulated by the research plan and grant proposals. The priority areas of research of the KSCDH staff are theoretical and practical issues of diagnostics of skin diseases and sexually transmitted diseases, HIV infection and parenteral hepatitis in people living with HIV. The result of the work is publications of residents together with teachers, participation in research grants and presentations at conferences. Residents also actively participate in the project "National programme for the introduction of personalized and preventive medicine in the Republic of Kazakhstan" in order to identify the genetic predisposition of people with Kazakh nationality to atopic dermatitis in filling out questionnaires of patients with atopic dermatitis with the calculation of SCORAD and DLQI.

The development and support of the feedback system with the institutions of the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan of the dermatological service is carried out. So, when leaving the project, 15 patients were selected from Atyrau, 40 patients in Nur-Sultan, 15 patients in Kokshetau, as well as an appointment with dermatologists for clarification on questions of interest regarding their condition and nosology. Documents confirming this fact are presented on the website of the KSCD&ID <https://Kncdiz.kz/ru> и на Google диске: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner>

It is recommended to increase funding in the field of scientific research by financing participation in foreign conferences of teaching staff and residents

### **6.6 Expertise in the field of education**

Examination of the quality of the implemented residency training programme is a mandatory stage of the educational process and is carried out by the following structures of the KSCD&ID: internal audit and the work of the Supervisory Board: (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), CEP (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), invitation to review the EP by external experts from similar organizations by specialty of institutions.

The technology of educational monitoring of KSCD&ID allows us to introduce and expand the specialized scope of care and services in postgraduate education, which led to innovative changes in the dermatovenereological service in the form of the development of podology, trichology, and dermatosurgery, including for such diseases as Vitiligo.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

For the organization and implementation of academic mobility, KSCD&ID actively works to establish partnerships with Kazakhstani and foreign institutions of a similar profile.

A special place in the educational programme of KSCD&ID is training in related specialties (gastroenterology, gynecology, emergency therapy), which is carried out on additional bases (contractual relations (Memorandum with the PSE on REM "Regional Infectious Diseases Hospital" of the State Department of Health of the Almaty region dated 25.03.2021) (see <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner>).

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 21 standards conform: completely -20, partially-1.

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Provide access to the Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence databases (point 6.1.1.);
- 2) Provide residents with the opportunity to study in alternative organizations within or outside the country and improve funding mechanisms (paragraphs 6.7.1, 6.7.3., 6.7.4., 8.3.3.).

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

All issues related to the development and approval of training programmes, the involvement of related specialists and new bases for the educational process are carried out both by the Academic Council of KSCD&ID, the Supervisory Board, the Faculty, administrative staff, residents, as well as by attracting reviewers from other organizations and independent institutions on the basis of available accreditation documents (IA-C No. 12 dated June 25, 2018 to June 23, 2023, with annual confirmation by the independent agency for quality assurance in education – "Egar").

Monitoring and evaluation of the EP includes the following stages: discussion, review, revision, taking into account suggestions and comments formulated by employers and other stakeholders, recommendation for approval, approval procedure

A separate section of the annual report of the structural division reflects the work carried out during the academic year to improve the material and technical base of the educational division of clinical bases and the material equipment of the department.

One of the important conditions for continuous monitoring and improving the quality of the educational process is the correction of the EP based on feedback with the participation of interested parties (teachers, students, employers and other stakeholders).

The assessment of the quality of educational programmes of KSCD&ID can be indirectly assessed by analyzing the responses to the survey of residents and teaching staff. So, to the question: Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of residents and / or trainees related to training – 97.1% of residents fully agree with this statement; 1 resident disagreed with this statement. To the question: Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees) - 86.1% of residents answered "constantly", 5.6% - answered "sometimes"; 3 residents either did not know, doubted the answer or did not agree with this statement. For approval: I am satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme – 97.2% of residents answered in the affirmative, 1-no. To the question: I am satisfied with the methods of evaluating my knowledge and skills-94.4% of residents answered-completely; 1- "partially"; 1-would like to change. To the question: Do you think that this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty? 97.2% - residents answered that they are sure of this; 1 resident-said that they began to doubt it.

A similar survey was conducted with teachers of KSCD&ID, who answered yes to the question: I am satisfied with the work of the Department of postgraduate education - in 100.0%. To the question: ".do the managers of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research and clinical work" - 90.9% answered in the affirmative, 1 teacher noted "sometimes".

Based on the above, as well as based on the results of interviews with residents who completed the residency course at KSCD&ID, teaching staff, and employers during the accreditation assessment of the quality of education, the opinion objectified by the above was formed that the level and quality of postgraduate education at KSCD&ID meets the requirements of the Accreditation Guide and, in general, this section of the standard has no fundamental comments.

#### **7.2 Faculty and resident feedback**

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through various feedback channels. Confirmation of the effectiveness of the education received is also based on the results of feedback - an annual survey of students to assess the level of satisfaction with educational programmes. As a result of the survey analysis, changes and additions are made to the EP. Providing feedback from employers about graduate clinical practice is done through face-to-face meetings on the ground during field trips <https://www.instagram.com/p/CWuzIDyN582/>.

It is particularly worth emphasizing the opinion of employers who expressed satisfaction with the work of graduates of the residency programme during on-line interviews. The list of interviewees is

presented in the corresponding tables above. There are no comments on this section of the standard.

### **7.3 Results of residents and graduates**

The Department of Postgraduate Education collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, organizes the educational process in the form of questionnaires, monitors requests to the center's website, and discusses topical issues in the social network (<https://www.instagram.com/dr.turlybekovna/>, <https://www.instagram.com/dr.nazgen/>, [https://www.instagram.com/your\\_skin\\_doctor/](https://www.instagram.com/your_skin_doctor/), [https://www.instagram.com/dr.toktarova\\_/](https://www.instagram.com/dr.toktarova_/)), As well as an annual survey of graduates of the residency of the EP "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" (questionnaires are developed and approved).

Analyzing the results of interviews with residency graduates who attended the meeting with the commission, it should be noted that all residents are employed, have a job in their specialty in the relevant departments of Dermatological, Venereological and dermatocosmetological services. A number of graduates of the residency programme were employed in the KSCD&ID, including as teaching staff. There are no comments on this section.

### **7.4 Stakeholder engagement**

In the assessment of the EP, stakeholders are primarily employers. Based on the results of feedback, nonconformities are analyzed, the causes of nonconformities are determined, the need for corrective measures is evaluated, correction is made (a corrective action plan is drawn up), and then the effectiveness and effectiveness of the actions taken are recorded and analyzed. The results of feedback and corrective actions are heard at meetings of the Academic Council, the Supervisory Board, at planning meetings and meetings of the Department of Postgraduate Education.

When communicating with employers, some of their wishes were revealed, which gives grounds to plan training in elective subjects that are in demand in the modern period and at the request of employers.

There are no comments on this section.

### **7.5 Procedure for approving educational programmes**

The KSCD&ID of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan has developed mechanisms for approving educational programmes, providing for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of implementing the educational programme, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems. The educational programme developed in the department of postgraduate education in the specialty 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is checked for compliance with the content, structure and design, then passes the procedure of external examination and review, then is discussed at the production meeting, and approved by the director of the KSCD&ID and developed in accordance with the State Educational Standard 2015 of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

All documents confirming the monitoring system are presented both in the form of extracts from the meetings of the Academic Council, and on [the website <url>: https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner)

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully -13, partially -2.

**Standard 7: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Pay more attention to the development of the HIV infection area, taking into account the existing conditions for training in this area;
- 2) Strengthen the resident-teacher feedback to identify the degree of assimilation of the material.

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

When implementing postgraduate education, KSCD&ID is guided by the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "On approval of the state educational order for training specialists with higher and postgraduate education", the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

"On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency", Standard Rules for Admission to Training in educational organizations, State residency programmes that regulate the number of state educational orders for training residents in the field of Health care and Health care in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, approved by the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015, reflecting the requirements for the level of training of persons who have completed educational residency programmes in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", elective programmes; which regulate the amount of the state educational order for training residents in the field of Health care.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

To implement the goals of academic leadership, the Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases conducts and participates in scientific, practical, organizational events, including in online format: <https://youtu.be/r6PQOgS13vc>; <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/83162632996>; <https://youtu.be/rUubr-Zuajs>; <https://youtu.be/nTJqhsy5lwg>; <https://www.oddl.kz/pages/schedules>; <https://youtu.be/vt5rxBq7i7A>;

The Department of Education of the KSCD&ID is responsible for the educational process (Candidate of Medical Sciences S. A. Ospanova). Especially noteworthy are the reviews of interviewed specialists who completed residency at the KSCD&ID. According to the respondents, the head of the education department not only helps residents in finding employers, but also keeps in touch with specialists who have completed their residency, helps in solving various issues, including assistance in making a diagnosis, determining patient management tactics, choosing research areas, etc.

## **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The budget of the KSCD&ID is formed from three sources: the republican budget (providing a basic clinic on a state budget basis), the provision of paid educational services (residency, advanced training of students), and grant funding for the implementation of scientific projects. Despite the fact that there is no educational grant for the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" in the last 15 years, education is only paid, however, it should be noted that the KSCD&ID has minimized payments for residents by almost 2 times compared to similar educational institutions, thus making training in the KSCD&ID more attractive in terms of the number of students in the region. pricing policy, with a good quality of education, as can be evidenced by the answers of residents to the question:

I will recommend studying at this educational organization to my acquaintances, friends, and relatives: - 86.1% answered unequivocally "yes", 8.3% partially agree with this statement, 1-doubted, and only 1-gave a negative answer. However, this creates an insufficient level of funding for mentoring (bonuses on an irregular basis, other types of incentives). This may reduce the interest and motivation to conduct high-quality mentoring activities.

It should be noted as a strong point in this section of KSCD&ID, close and strong ties with foreign partners who provide gratuitous assistance in equipping the center with the most modern equipment, for example: an HIV diagnostic laboratory (3 immunoblots, an IHL device, specialized boxes for conducting SOP, freezers, real-time PCR, sequencer, etc. auxiliary equipment and supplies).

There are no comments on this section. It is recommended to increase the share of state budget funding, including the creation of specialized scientific laboratories.

## **8.4 Administration and Management**

Every year, changes and additions to the organizational structure are made in the KSCD&ID, educational programmes of residency are regularly updated and supplemented, the staffing table and the involvement of teachers are approved annually, taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan " On Education " dated 27.07.2007, No. 319-Sh, the total number of faculty members is formed based on the average ratio of residents and teachers-3: 1. The KSCD&ID defines the general strategy, main directions, priorities and objectives of the KSCD&ID policy in the field of improving the quality of education in accordance with the mission, vision and the strategic plan for the development of the Scientific Educational Center.

## **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The regulation on residency is developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Concept of Development of medical Education and defines the procedure for training medical personnel in residency in organizations of medical education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regardless of the form of ownership that have a license for this type of educational activity and clinical bases.

Interaction of KSCD&ID with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in the residency programme is carried out through the development and implementation of the State Educational Standard 2022 (Head of the Education Department S. A. Ostanova) under the supervision of the Supervisory Board, taking into account the opinion of the teaching staff and students.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully -14, partially - 1.

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:**

- 1) Increase the share of state budget funding, including the creation of specialized scientific laboratories, and regulate the financing of mentors.

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

Based on the analysis of the reform in the field of education and Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management, the organizational structure of management is revised if necessary. Over the years, new structural units have been created and added, such as the Supervisory Board, the Diagnostic Department and the HIV reference Laboratory, whose functional tasks are aimed at ensuring the quality and expansion of educational programmes.

The study, monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is carried out at all levels, including the Academic Council of the KSCD&ID, the Supervisory Board, the Department of Postgraduate Education, external reviewers in the main and related specialties.

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: fully – 4.

**Standard 9: completed**

**6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme "Dermatovenerology (adult, children):**

- 1) Specify the mission statement, taking into account educational goals in dermatology, dermatocosmetology and certain infectious diseases (point 1.1);
- 2) In the educational programme of residency and additional non-formal education, include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data (paragraphs 2.2.1, 2.2.2);
- 3) Document relationships with third-party clinical databases (conclude a contract) where residents study in related disciplines (gastroenterology, clinical pharmacology, oncology, infectious diseases) (point 2.5.3., 2.5.4).
- 4) In the syllabus, include a detailed description of the methods of evaluating residents (FA, SA, final attestation) (paragraph 3.1.2);
- 5) Apply MCQ, TBL, PBL in the methods of assessment and self-assessment of residents (point 3.1.4);
- 6) Document the assessment of the validity and reliability of control and measurement tools (CMI) with a view to their continuous improvement (paragraph 3.1.6);
- 7) To include computer-based forms and verification of completed independent works of residents under the "Anti-plagiarism" system in the methods of assessing the academic performance of residents (item 3.2.1);
- 8) In order to avoid corruption and conflicts of interest, ensure transparency of the selection process and equal access to education by introducing electronic testing, since oral exams do not guarantee this (paragraph 4.1.4);
- 9) Document the representation of residents to participate in the development of the educational programme, the residency admission policy (for example, the Council of Residents) (item 4.1.8);
- 10) Strengthen the staff of teachers who have an academic degree (PhD or MD) or a master's degree (point 5.1.1);
- 11) Conclude contracts with teachers and mentors in sub-specialties (related) - oncology, gastroenterology, clinical pharmacology, infectious diseases (clause 5.1.3);
- 12) Provide access to the Up to Date and Cochrane Library evidence databases (point 6.1.1.);
- 13) Provide residents with the opportunity to study in alternative organizations within or outside the country and improve funding mechanisms (paragraphs 6.7.1, 6.7.3., 6.7.4., 8.3.3.);
- 14) Pay more attention to the development of the HIV infection area, taking into account the existing conditions for training in this area;
- 15) Strengthen the resident-teacher feedback to identify the degree of material assimilation;
- 16) Increase the share of state budget funding, including the creation of specialized scientific laboratories, and regulate the financing of mentors.

## 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members found compliance with the Standards of Institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional and non-formal education and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit the programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" of the RSE on REM "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan as an organization that meets the Standards of Accreditation of educational programmes of residency in medical educational organizations for a period of 3 years

### EEC chairperson

Balmukhanova AYGUL

Foreign Expert Gulnara Ibadova

Academic Expert Imasheva Bagdat Sakenovna

Academic Expert Almira Akhmetova

Expert Employer Amanzholova Meruert Temirtasovna

Expert Student Elvira Sahabieva

63  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (summary)

	Assessment Criteria	Number of standards	Assessment		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Non compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	10/6	0/1	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	22/7	0/1	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	7/4	0	
4.	STUDENTS	30	18/10	0/2	
5.	FACULTY	7	5/1	0/1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10/10	0/1	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	10/3	0/2	
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8/6	0/1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	1/3	0	
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>141*</b>	<b>9**</b>	
			<b>150</b>		

\*of the 141 standards that have shown full compliance, 50 relate to improvement standards.

\*\*partial inconsistency of improvement standards.



**List of documents studied by the EEC members as part of the external evaluation of the residency training programme**

<b>No</b>	<b>. Name of documents</b>	<b>Quantity</b>	<b>Date of approval</b>
1.	Report on Institutional accreditation of KSCD&ID 2022	1	September 2022
2.	Report on specialized accreditation of KSCD&ID 2022	1	September 2022
3.	Licenses educational activity of kaz/rus with Attachment	5	23.07.2019
4.	Previous FA and CA certificates	1 archive	25.06.2018
5.	Certificate of scientific accreditation	1	05.08.2022
6.	Data on scientific activities of	KSCD&ID 1	17-19. 10. 2022
7.	Regulations on the clinical mentor	1	26.09.2021
8.	GCP	2 certificates	19.01.2021 01.10.2021
9.	Memorandum agreement with the Regional Infectious Diseases Hospital	1	25.03.2021
10	Certificates of advanced training teachers	3+1 archive	Indicated in accordance with obtaining certificates
11	Government Decree on reorganization	1	14.09.2018
12	Photos	1 Archive	17-19. 10. 2022
13	Memorandum agreement with the Medea multidisciplinary Center	1	
14	Memorandum agreement with the International Academy of Postgraduate Education LLP"	1	25.09.2019
15	Memorandum agreement with Vitiligo and Skin Health Center LLP	1	22.08.2022
16	Information on the residency EP	programme 1	17-19. 10. 2022
17	Information on the additional EP	programme 1	17-19. 10. 2022
18	EADV Membership certificate	1	01.01.2022- 01.01.2023
19	Certificate of attendance EADV	2	02.10.2021
20	Certificate of dermatoscopy resident	1	16.05.2022
21	Memorandum agreement with "YES" LLP	1	01.07.2021
22	Employment of graduates	1	18.10.2022
23	Strategic plan of KSCD&ID 2020-2024	1	13.07.2020