

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance
in Education and Healthcare
March 6, 2024

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
7M10108 “MANAGEMENT IN HEALTHCARE”
(Profile direction)
OF NJSC "WEST KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY NAMED AFTER
MARAT OSPANOV" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION
STANDARDS OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES OF MASTER'S
SPECIALTIES IN HEALTHCARE

period of external expert evaluation:
03/04/2024 – 04/06/2024

Aktobe, 2024

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the master's educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	8
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the master’s educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of educational programs of master’s specialties in healthcare and conclusions on completion	8
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	10
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the master’s educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)	11
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational program of the master's degree 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)	36
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council on Accreditation	36
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of the master’s program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)	37
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	38

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AC – Academic Committees
AC – Academic Council
AIS - Automated Information Systems
DB-database
HEI - higher education institution
UC - university component
WFME - World Federation of Medical Education
SCES RK - State Compulsory Education Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
DAA – Department of Academic Affairs
HRMD - Human Resource Management Department
ESG - Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area
ECAQA - Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
WKMU - West Kazakhstan Medical University
IPDP - Individual professional development plan
IWP-individual work plan
End-of-course assessment - End-of-course assessment
FCC - final certification commission
CIS-control and measurement tools
EC - elective component
CED – catalogue of elective disciplines
MoH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
CT – comprehensive testing
MES RK - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MR - methodological recommendations
MEP - modular educational program
MoH RK – Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MSHE RK – Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MSE-medical and social examination
NJSC - non-profit joint stock company
IAAR - Independent accreditation and rating agency
SPC – Scientific and Practical Centre
SRWS - scientific research work of students
SRWM - research work of a master's student
DMDS - department of master's and doctoral studies
EP - educational program
OSCE – Objective Structured Clinical Examination
DMDS - department of master's and doctoral studies
MD - major disciplines
Academic staff – Academic staff
P WKMU – WKMU procedure
CBL – Case-based learning
IWM - independent work of a master's student
IWS - independent work of students
IWS - independent work of students
IWS - independent work of students with a teacher
QMS - quality management system
CIS - Commonwealth of Independent States
TBL – team-based training
SC - Scientific Council

EMCD – Educational and methodological complex of discipline
CNE - Centre for Nursing Excellence
IDEC – Identification Data Exchange Centre
CPS - Centre for Practical Skills
ERWM - experimental research work of a master's student

ECAQA

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 5_ dated 02/09/2024, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation during the period from 03/04/2024 of the master's educational program in the specialty "EP 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	KAMALIEV MAKSUT ADILKHANOVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Academic and Scientific Activities of the Kazakhstan Medical University "HSPH". Chairman of the State Unitary Enterprise for the training program for health specialists and other public health specialists of the EMA in the direction of training - Health Care of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Expert of the National Centre for Independent Examination. Visiting Professor at the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences.
2	International expert	MOISEEVA KARINA YEVGENIEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Associate Professor of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "St. Petersburg State Paediatric Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
3	Academic expert	NARMANOVA ORYNGUL ZHAKSYBAEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Public Health of NJSC "Astana Medical University", excellent student of healthcare, winner in the nomination "Best Coach of the Year in the Field of Health 2023"
4	Academic expert	DANIYAROVA ANARA BAKHITKEREVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Higher School of Public Health, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University
5	Academic expert	TALIEVA GULBANAT NURGALIEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the School of Public Health of the Karaganda Medical University
6	Academic expert	KAYNARBAEVA MAYKUL SAIDULLAEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of "Nutritiology", NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov". Member of the Expert Council on dietary supplements of the NJSC "Kazakh Academy of Nutrition". Deputy Chairman of the Committee "Nutritiology" at the Educational and methodological association-project management group of the Republican

			Educational and Methodological Council of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
7	Academic expert	SHRAPIEVA ALUA MURATBEKOVNA	PhD, assistant at the Department of Nursing, NJSC “Semey Medical University”
8	Expert employer	KUANTAEVA LILIYA VYACHESLAVOVNA	Deputy Chief Physician for Economic Work of the MSE "Multidisciplinary Regional Hospital" at the REM of the Health Administration of the Aktobe Region, doctor of the highest qualified category in social hygiene and healthcare organization
9	Expert learner	BEKTEMIR MARTA AKBERENKYZY	4th year student of the Faculty of Natural Sciences, specialty “Training of teachers in biology” of Aktobe Regional University named after K. Zhubanov

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC.

The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusion of an external evaluation of the master’s educational program “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of educational programs of master’s specialties in healthcare and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for Accreditation.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the master’s educational program in the specialty “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)”

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint-stock company "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
Government	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first manager	Kaliev Aset Askerovich
Date of creation	1957
Location and contact details	Country: Kazakhstan Region/region: West Kazakhstan region Postal code: 030019 City: Aktobe Street: Maresyeva, 68 Phone: 8 (7132) 56-34-25 Fax: 8 (7132) 56-32-01 E-mail: info@zkmu.kz Official website: https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/
State license for educational activities in undergraduate education (date, number)	KZ26LAA00016029 May 04, 2019
Inclusion in the Register of educational programs of higher and postgraduate education of the National Centre for the Development of Higher Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the	11.07.2023

Republic of Kazakhstan	
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	2023
Duration of training	1 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	No - primary accreditation
Number of master's students in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	No - primary accreditation
Full-time teachers/Part-time workers involved in the implementation of the educational program, including % sedate	The total number of teachers is 19, including full-time teachers - 19, part-time teachers - no (planned). Of these, 3 are PhD doctors, 4 are candidates of medical sciences, and 10 are masters. Graduation for master's degree - 90%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://zkmu.edu.kz https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/kafedra-obshhestvennogo-zdorovya-i-zdravooxraneniya/ https://www.facebook.com/zkgmu.kz/

The implementation of the educational program (EP) 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) with a training period of 1 years is planned for the 2023-2024 academic year on the basis of license No. KZ26LAA00016029 May 04, 2019. The EP was compiled in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022 for higher and postgraduate education.

The development of the EP is carried out by specialized departments of public health and healthcare, discussed at the meeting of the Academic Committee (AC) “Master’s and Doctoral Studies” (protocol No. 3 of 01.26.2023), as well as at the meeting of the University Academic Council (AC) (protocol No. 4 of 02.24. .2023), Scientific Council (protocol No. 7/804 dated April 26, 2023), went through the stages of coordination with the Department of Academic Affairs (DAA), employers and was approved at a meeting of the University Board of Directors (Protocol No. 10 dated October 20, 2023). The revision of the EP is provided for when the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan changes; according to the requests of employers, elective disciplines are updated. EP 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) was included in the Register of educational programs on July 11, 2023.

The main goal of the EP is to train scientific and pedagogical personnel for the healthcare industry, capable of making decisions and conducting research activities to improve modern management methods in healthcare.

NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov" (hereinafter referred to as the University) has a sufficient number of qualified Academic staff and personnel necessary for the introduction and implementation of the educational program EP 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction).

The academic policy of the University provides for the proper relationship between medical and non-medical teachers, responsibility and balance of academic staff/teachers of all disciplines necessary for the implementation of the educational program.

Admission of academic staff is carried out taking into account the level of qualifications, profile and experience within the framework of regulations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan, state programs of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, achievements of science and practice in the field of education and medicine.

At the University, the implementation of educational programs is provided by 47 departments, of which 27 are clinical departments, 20 are general education and basic departments. There are total of 171 teachers, including 20 Doctors of Science, 120 Candidates of Science, and 31 PhDs.

The heads of all structural units are responsible for ensuring that the activities of the units comply with certain goals, objectives and functions.

Number of Academic staff at the department: 19 full-time teachers, in the main staff: PhD doctor - 3, candidates of medical sciences - 4, masters - 10. The share of teachers with academic degrees and titles from the number of full-time teachers for teaching master's degrees is 90%. The professional level of Academic staff meets the requirements and level of training in accordance with the Model Qualification Characteristics of the Positions of Pedagogical Workers of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The goals for developing the competencies of teachers are laid down in the University Development Program approved for 2019-2023, where it is planned to develop the key competencies of university staff and increase the quality of research and Academic staff.

Broadband Internet, including wireless technologies, is available at the University for the Implementation of educational programs at all levels. The equipment of the library and computer rooms and computers corresponds to the submitted self-report. The University website has a third-level domain name in the edu.kz zone.

In order to evaluate the progress of students, the University in the educational process is focused on the quality of control and measurement tools and forms of control. Control and measurement tools (CIS) have been developed for conducting midterm and intermediate control of master's students' knowledge. The university provides access to modern, high-quality information resources in Russian and English.

To carry out scientific activities, the university has a joint task group, a local commission on bioethics, a council of young scientists, a department for scientific work, and a scientific and practical centre. To carry out scientific projects, the University has a clinical laboratory and pathology department of the Medical Centre, a Scientific and Practical Centre, and a morphological laboratory.

Scientific topics of doctoral and master's students are part of the departments' scientific projects. The university staff constantly takes part in competitive grant and program-targeted funding programs.

In the period 2020-2025, the University completed (7 of them are carried out before 2025) a total of 22 scientific and technical projects with external grant funding. Of these scientific works, 20 projects were funded by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the rest were carried out in integration with other medical universities of the country (NJSC "KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov", NJSC "KMU"). The head of the department of public health and public health carries out planning and organization of educational, methodological, research and educational work of the Academic staff, and is responsible for the development, monitoring and improvement of educational programs.

The Department of Public Health and Health Care is located on the 2nd floor of the second building, fully equipped with the necessary educational premises, educational equipment, materials and visual aids as a structural unit of the university that ensures the educational process. It has technical training tools. The university library has basic educational, educational and methodological and scientific literature, presented in the syllabuses of disciplines as required and additional literature.

Material and technical base of NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov" according to the educational program "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" consists of 4 educational and laboratory buildings with lecture halls and study rooms on the basis of which the main basic, specialized and general educational disciplines are taught. The university has a scientific and practical centre (SPC), the necessary material support (equipment, reagents, materials, etc.) for carrying out research work.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

This external evaluation is part of the initial specialized accreditation.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the report on self-assessment of the master's educational program "EP 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of educational programs of master's specialties in healthcare and conclusions about completion

The report on self-assessment of the master's educational program "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 119 pages of the main text, applications on 20 pages, copies or electronic versions of 113 documents located on the website <https://zkmu.edu.kz/> and on Google Drive https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1S_DK7dPqmVL7vElak0yT201gRvOWOr06 <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1yb0gVdWrXVbHBeRtRkUy8ACISwTZIZef> https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1fr6NNN0VHyJcXGVY64zmRwurDBt0IPOr?usp=drive_link https://drive.google.com/file/d/10tEmJ43aO1SXz62uk6jOOq4O2T5hwOhR/view?usp=drive_link https://drive.google.com/file/d/1pbXhXsuHf8kanRrmEONj4EmL7bBHIH77/view?usp=drive_link https://drive.google.com/file/d/1XrjZtlTH99VDBogrKQvBXubOvo-K8J7r/view?usp=drive_link https://drive.google.com/file/d/1pVCD4EbyP4DF3dcE69fIPAA7uqhk1Z5O/view?usp=drive_link https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1iuQ8RCfDBnLtraF50_OIKIXnuLt12dbB?usp=drive_link

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Rector Aset Askerovich Kaliev, who confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 4 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program: Chairman of the internal self-assessment commission: Koshmaganbetova G.K. - PhD, head of the department of master's and doctoral studies

Members of the commission: Koyshanova Raikhan Musalievna is a candidate of medical sciences, chief state sanitary doctor, head of the Department of Sanitary and Epidemiological Control of the Aktobe Region of the Committee of the SEC of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Kulbaeva Ainur Beyimbetkyzy is a 1st year master's student of West Kazakhstan Medical University named after M. Ospanov; Yermukhanova L.S. is a Candidate of Medical Sciences, Ass. Professor, director Departments of Public Health and Healthcare; Kubekova Gulnara Urazgalievna is a head of the quality management system service, representative of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov", responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program.

Self-assessment of the master's educational program in the specialty "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the university rector No. 13/2-18-588-n/k dated 09/22/2023 "On the creation of a commission and subcommittee for specialized self-assessment of educational programs."

All standards contain the actual practice of the university in preparing master's students in the specialty "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)", taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills, educational resources and practical learning environment, practice bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations), financial information, plans for the development and improvement of undergraduate training and timely completion of dissertation research.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a complete form, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure is an external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA and in accordance with the program. Dates of visit to the organization: 03/04/2024 – 03/06/2024

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 36 people;
- interviews with master’s students and graduates – 11 people
- study the website <https://zkmu.edu.kz>;
- interviewing 20 employees, 10 teachers, 5 scientific supervisors;
- survey of master's and master's degree teachers - 6 and 8, respectively;
- review of training: attended 1 practical lesson by students of the Faculty of Public Health, course 3, total of 4 students, teacher Gulya Amirzhanovna Isengalieva, candidate of technical sciences, associate professor. The topic of the lesson is “Types of hygienic regulation of chemicals in the environment.”
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 4 bases of clinical training and scientific research were visited, including the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, the MSE on the REM “Municipal Polyclinic No. 4”, the MSE on the REM “Municipal Polyclinic No. 1”; Department of Sanitary and Epidemiological Control for the Aktobe Region Committee of the SEC of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan;;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 68 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC

Rector	1
Vice-Rector	2
Heads of Departments	5
Heads of centers	6
Executive Director	1
Head of Office Registrar	1
Head of the Scientific and Medical Library	1
Heads of Services and Commissions	3
Dean	1
Chairmen and members of Councils and Committees (Scientific Council, Dissertation Council, Academic Committees)	15

Scientific supervisors	5
Teachers	10
Master's students	7
Representatives of practical healthcare (employers)	5
Master's graduates	4

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, talks, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and Criteria for external evaluation of the educational program “EP 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." Members of the EEC made no comments regarding the accredited EP. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program were discussed and the chairman - Maksut Adilkanovich Kamaliev - held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

When conducting a survey of undergraduates, 81.2% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 9.09% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (81.2%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.

According to 59.09% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with Accreditation Standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the master’s educational program “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)”

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission Statement, Goals and Learning Outcomes

The university has formulated the mission and goal of the educational program, which includes the training of highly qualified competitive specialists capable of promoting the academic and practical development of the healthcare industry, based on the trinity of science, practice and education. This formulation is presented in an accessible form for undergraduates and employers and ensures the attractiveness of the educational program.

When implementing program activities, namely, based on the results of interviews with the first head of the organization, vice-rectors, members of the Academic Committee (hereinafter referred to as AC) “Master’s and Doctoral Studies”, the Department of Academic Affairs (hereinafter referred to as DAA), in interviews with teachers, compliance with the criteria of the standard was established 1.1, since the final learning outcomes contain both theoretical knowledge and the formation of analytical thinking (through the disciplines/modules "General Education" and "Management and Benchmarking in Healthcare"), as well as communicative skills (through the disciplines/modules "Technological Management and Personnel Management" and "General Education").

The educational program aims to develop practical skills through mastering disciplines such as "Quality Management and Risk Management in Healthcare (PD KV)", "Change Management", "Biostatistics and Research Methods in Management", "Technological Management", and "Regulatory

Policy in Healthcare". The main goal of the program is to prepare professionals for practical healthcare who can make managerial decisions in market conditions.

One of the strengths recognized by experts is the high demand for University graduates when it comes to employment. Undoubtedly, one of the best practices is that upon completing the program, graduates have the opportunity for employment in higher and postgraduate educational institutions; research organizations; healthcare management bodies, information and analytical centers. Master's graduates can work as experts, consultants in healthcare and social welfare organizations, and as specialists in health promotion and disease prevention.

Upon completing the Master's program and successfully passing the final certification, graduates are awarded the degree of "Master of Medical Sciences" in the educational program 7M10108 "Healthcare Management" (professional direction) and receive a postgraduate education diploma with an appendix (transcript). Additionally, the University issues a European Diploma Supplement to graduates, which is also recognized as one of the strengths by experts (joint educational programs and dual degree programs, dual training).

The university applies ethical approaches to teaching undergraduates. The experts familiarized themselves with the Code of Business Ethics for Students and Teachers (approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov", Protocol No. 1 of January 15, 2020). Due to the fact that accreditation is primary, no interviews were held with undergraduates. While talking with teachers, experts were convinced that the teachers of the department knew the Code of Ethics.

1.2 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final learning outcomes

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program and took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission (clause 1.2). Due to the fact that accreditation is primary, the experts focused on the participation of other undergraduates in the formation of the mission. For example, Zhaksybay Zarina, master's student of M144 group "Medicine" is a member of the Academic Committee, and master's student Nazik Yerbolat of M145 group "Medical and Preventive Affairs" is a member of the Scientific Council. The mission and goal of the EP, after all the discussion procedures, were approved by the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Committee "Master's and Doctoral Studies" No. 3 dated January 26, 2023. The experts were personally acquainted with the document.

Experts have established that the mission of the educational program is in the public domain, brought to the attention of potential undergraduates, employers through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations and is available for review to a wide range of interested parties, including practical healthcare organizations, heads of healthcare departments, chief doctors of medical organizations, representatives of the public (<https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/magistraturany%d2%a3-bilim-beru-ba%d2%93darlamalaryny%d2%a3-missiyasy/>).

From interviews with undergraduates, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission and work plans of the university, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

During the visit to the university departments, experts noted:

The University has departments that are directly related to the master's educational program "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely the Academic Committee "Master's and Doctoral Studies", Academic Council, which includes employees from both basic and specialized departments, students, and representatives of practical healthcare who are interested parties.

Due to the fact that accreditation is primary, there were no conversations with undergraduates of the department.

1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom

To verify standard 1.3, a meeting was held with the Rector of the university A.A. Kaliev and vice-rectors: for strategic development, science and international cooperation, for educational work. During the conversation, experts asked the following questions: How is autonomy supported when

developing EP? Who is responsible for the development of an accredited EP? During the answers, the rector and the vice-rector confirmed that the University has autonomy in the development of educational programs, including a master's program in the specialty "7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)." The program was developed by the staff of the department - head of the department of public health and healthcare Yermukhanova L.S. Candidate of Medical Sciences, Ass. professor, reviewed by the Academic Committee for Master's and Doctoral Studies, Academic Council, Scientific Council, agreed with the Department of Academic Affairs, with representatives of practical healthcare and approved at a meeting of the University Board of Directors Decision No. 4 of October 20, 2023, (Minutes No. 10 of October 20, 2023).

The EP was compiled in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022 for higher and postgraduate education.

The program development process is regulated by the document "Internal Quality Assurance Policy of Educational Activities" (Internal Quality Assurance Policy P WKMU23-30, approved by Protocol No. 26 of 08/24/2021), https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1GpKhqrZoey_Uey1HhpaXzBef8rm4Z9Pu?usp=drive_link Chapter 3. Development and approval of educational programs, paragraphs 3.1-3.10 regulate the requirements and principles in relation to: development of an educational program; use of allocated resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program. Also, in the document "Procedure for Educational and Methodological Work (PRO-WKMU 703-2022, approved by the decision of the Board of Protocol No. 27 of 01.09.2022) in Chapter 7 "Development and approval of a modular educational program (MEP)" the development procedure, requirements, and basic principles are determined. (clauses 7.1-7.12).

It is mandatory to take into account the opinions of employers. The elective components were developed taking into account the opinions of representatives of practical healthcare.

Responsibility for the high-quality preparation of the EP and the distribution of resources necessary for its implementation lies with the University management and teachers of the department.

Autonomy and academic freedom in the preparation of EP is achieved through the university component and the elective component. The department is given the opportunity to independently distribute hours within one discipline, freedom to change, adjust and supplement the program within the framework of the policy of academic independence. The master's program development plan is presented on the university website.

To conduct research/production practice, a practice base is determined that corresponds to the profile of the specialty being trained or related organizations that have.

Clinical bases are organizations that have qualified personnel to manage professional practice and a material and technical base, with which an agreement has been concluded to conduct internships for students.

When choosing a base for practical training, the choice was made in favour of the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 1", the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 4", which are characterized by good capacity (950 visits per shift), the presence of qualified personnel to manage professional practice and material and technical base.

Master's students are provided with all the necessary resources for preparing dissertation research (library, access to international databases - see more in section 6.) There is the necessary staff of teachers in the amount of 19 people in order to maintain a teacher: master's student ratio of 1:3.

1.4 Name and description of the program

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program coincide in terms of goals and end results, and the educational process is structured in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare.

Experts examined 99 pieces of documentation, including those directly related to the accredited program (Annex 2).

To implement the educational program in the specialty “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction),” the organization’s documents contain educational documents, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with State Compulsory Educational Standards and standard requirements has been established.

Information is provided on teaching methods in master's programs, including the possibility of creating an individual training program if necessary.

The purpose of the educational program, objectives, results and content of training are regulated by the university document “Modular educational program (MEP), protocol No. 10 of October 20, 2023. The document “Academic Policy” (in section 4 “Master’s, doctoral studies”, chapter 1 “Structure and content of educational programs for master’s and doctoral studies”, organization of the educational process in master’s and doctoral studies, paragraphs 1.1-1.44) presents the structure of the EP, its content, number academic credits for basic and specialized disciplines, types of internships, evaluation policy, conditions for extending master's studies (for example, during academic leave). The document “Regulations on Master's Degree” specifies the requirements for a master's student's research work (Chapter 7, research results, Chapter 8, end-of-course assessment, Chapter 9, requirements for a Master's thesis).

The support system for undergraduates is described in the document “Academic Policy” (approved on August 21, 2023), as well as in syllabuses, which are approved by the decision of the Academic Council. For example, technical support for students in master's programs is provided by free access to a specially designated page on the university website dedicated to master's degree programs (academic calendar, schedule, work plans, regulations on master's programs, academic policy, list of master's students indicating topics, scientific supervisors, Legal acts, information about educational programs implemented at the university, development plan for master's and doctoral programs). The syllabuses of disciplines describe the methods and techniques of teaching in master's programs, including teaching methods, evaluation methods, forms of conducting classes, the amount of allocated hours, forms of students' independent work and forms of control, evaluation criteria, and links to the necessary literature. Master's students are also supported by Academic staff teaching the relevant disciplines; they provide consultations on training and development of academic skills (including presentation of written assignments, references to literature), as well as training in time management.

The plagiarism detection policy is presented on the university website, in the “Science and Research” section; Dissertation Council; Anti-plagiarism.”

The principles of academic integrity are described in document P WKMU 23-04 “Rules for checking for the presence of borrowings at the NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov.”

The conditions for selecting and enrolling a master's student are contained in the document “Rules for admission to the master's program at the NJSC “West Kazakhstan University named after Marat Ospanov” The reasons for expulsion are described in the Academic Policy, section 8 “Exclusion of students.” The expulsion of a master's student is carried out by order of the Chairman of the Board - Rector. Information about expulsion is sent to the authorized body through the Documentolog through the IDEC.

The procedure for filing complaints and applications from undergraduates is included in the document in the Academic Policy document (approved on August 21, 2023).

The experts are familiar with the approved Policy on ensuring the quality of education (protocol No. 26 of 08/24/2021).

The procedure for informing undergraduates about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Agreement for the provision of educational services on a state educational order and on a paid basis, which are concluded after admission.

During a visit to the university and during an interview with employee L.S. Yermukhanova, head of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, the commission was convinced that there was a documentation system that was transparent and accessible to all faculty and staff, and included

documents such as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and undergraduates and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for master's students ("Academic Policy" (section 4. "Master's, doctoral studies", master's development plan) and there is information on the accredited educational program, which is regularly updated.

Experts reviewed: "Development program of NJSC "WKMU named after M. Ospanov" for 2019 – 2023", approved by the decision of the Board of Directors (Minutes No. 2 dated March 31, 2021), where 4 directions of strategic development of the university are presented, including the direction for the development of postgraduate education – Improving the quality of training of specialists based on the integration of education, science and practice;

According to experts, this confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the university.

The survey of master's students of the accredited EP was not conducted in connection with the initial accreditation. *When conducting a survey of 32 students (of which 6 were master's students from other educational programs), 39 questions were asked, a number of which were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 77.27% of respondents would recommend studying at the university to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 77.27% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think the university allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 86.36% of undergraduates answered positively, 4.55% were not sure about this, 9.09% could not yet answer this question and 0% would like to believe this.*

The surveyed 25 teachers, of which 8 were master's degree teachers, (25 survey questions) also answered that 81.82% were satisfied with the organization of labour and workplace at the university, and 13.64% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the university has a healthy microclimate, since the director is quite accessible to both undergraduates and employees and responds promptly to requests and suggestions. In the questionnaire, 95.45% of teachers noted that the University respects ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management, and 4.55% partially disagreed. According to 95.45% of respondents, they have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals in their specialty. Teaching experience up to 5 years are 18.18%, 5-10 years are 13.64%, over 10 years are 68.18%.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 5 basic standards: completely - 5, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Learning and teaching methods

For the effective implementation of the master's program in the specialty 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction), the Department of Public Health and Healthcare uses teaching methods such as lectures, small group training, problem-based learning (PBL), training based on clinical cases (CBL), practical and laboratory classes, distance learning technologies (web technologies) on university information educational platforms (Moodle, AIS Platonus). The choice of these teaching methods is due to the fact that they make it possible to create an innovative learning environment that is student-cantered, creating opportunities for the formation of individual learning trajectories based on the motivations and needs of students. Thus, the problem-based learning (PBL) method is aimed at developing master's students' responsibility for their professional development and the development of independent skills.

The department uses various forms of conducting classes using innovative teaching methods in EP - the development of interactive cases, video lessons, video lectures on the portal dl.zkgmu.kz

where all departments of the Faculty of Healthcare Management actively work with the interactive learning portal. All departments of the university have developed and implemented educational videos in 2 languages. One of the innovative pedagogical technologies is the team-based learning method (TBL).

The university organized training for undergraduates in the non-game simulation active method of specific situations CBL (Case-based learning), thanks to which they form and develop practical skills such as solving clinical problems based on facts from real life.

Experts did not attend practical classes in the accredited program, due to the fact that accreditation is primary and there are no master's students.

In a conversation with master's students from other educational programs, experts saw that the university promotes the development of practical competencies of master's students, including introducing the above-described and innovative methods and forms of training. At the same time, undergraduates deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The training of master's students in the specialty 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction) is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since when analysing the shortage of specialists as of 01.2024, it was established: in the Aktobe region - 202 specialists, in the Mangistau region - 225, in Western Kazakhstan - 198, Kyzylorda region - 158, Atyrau region - 165. Therefore, the University provides sufficient opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists both within the University and outside it. So, during a conversation with the head of the department of master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies Koshmaganbetova G.K. experts received the following information: employee of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare Abdikadirova I.T. over the past 5 years she has been trained 6 times, and Kenzhebaeva I.B. received 5 certificates for training, 2 of which were foreign, and the teachers confirmed that the methods of teaching and training of master's students correspond to the content and final results of training, and the master's program is aimed at strengthening and expanding the managerial and scientific-pedagogical competencies of managers in practice.

When surveying students of other educational institutions, 72.73% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 18.18% noted "sometimes" and 9.09% - "rarely". When visiting the university, experts did not identify any problems with the introduction of new teaching methods.

2.2 Development of academic skills

Experts received evidence that the educational program develops academic skills in undergraduates, including independent thinking, analytical skills, critical thinking, and the ability to make decisions in complex practical situations.

Due to the fact that the accreditation is primary, no interviews were held with undergraduates of the accredited EP.

The structure of the IPWM is described in P WKMU 50-06 "Regulations on the Master's Degree" (minutes of the Board No. 32 of 08/21/2023).

Teachers provide undergraduates with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 86.36% are completely satisfied, 9.09% are partially satisfied.

2.3 Contents of the program, scope of application

There are documents containing requirements for the content of educational programs, including State Compulsory Educational Standards, "Modular educational program", "Academic policy" and "Regulations on master's programs", "Regulations on sending master's and doctoral students to internships". Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the Academic Quality Department of the DAA and the Academic Committee. They draw up a schedule, organize and conduct visits to open classes and evaluate teaching methods used in the master's program.

Each topic of the master's program includes basic and advanced theories and models, such as: theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic and core disciplines; practical training of

undergraduates - research practice; experimental research work, including writing a master's thesis for scientific and pedagogical master's programs.

The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including qualified scientific and pedagogical, nursing, healthcare management specialists with in-depth professional knowledge, in combination with solving socially important problems of practical healthcare and medical education, as well as the specifics of research in and scientific achievements of teachers of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare. These include the following (over the last 5 years):

- 2 grants for research (Prof. Yermukhanova L.S.) “Studying the effectiveness of independent nursing care at the level of primary health care”, “Comprehensive evaluation of persons caring for the elderly at home” (Koshmagambetova G.K.).

- 12 articles in peer-reviewed journals

- 2 - Publishing books, monographs, teaching aids

- 2 - Members of national research and professional associations, committees, dissertation councils in the field

- 1 - Members of the editorial boards of scientific journals.

Master's students have the opportunity to be co-executors of funded STP at the university. (Regulations on the organization of a competition for grant funding of research work financed from the own funds of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov").

As part of the research work of a master's student, IPWM provides for mandatory completion of a scientific internship in scientific organizations and (or) organizations in relevant industries or fields of activity.

While developing the master's program, the developers relied on professional medical literature, including domestic and foreign literature in recent years.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of the previous training of master's students (prerequisites) and training in the master's program, as well as subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The university has developed 116 additional education programs, 13 master's programs, including for the specialty “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction).”

A survey of master's students of the accredited EP was not conducted due to their absence (primary accreditation).

To implement the program “7M10108 “Management in Health Care” (profile direction),” the University has its own clinical bases - 2 clinics (MSE on the REM “City Polyclinic No. 4”, MSE on the REM “City Polyclinic No. 1”) for a total of 950 outpatients visits per shift.

2.4 Research and grants

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The Master's program in "Healthcare Management" (professional direction) includes the course "Biostatistics and Research Methods in Management" worth 5 credits, which teaches critical analysis skills in research. Understanding the social, contextual, and historical foundations of theories, hypotheses, and ideas in conducting research is developed through the course "Psychology of Management" worth 2 credits.

The university is implementing a total of 22 scientific and technical projects with external grant funding (7 of them are being implemented and 9 intra-university scientific and technical programs until 2025), the results of which can become the basis for the research practice of undergraduates.

When surveying students, incl. Master's students from other educational programs found that the university has access to students' participation in research work and 90.91% are completely satisfied with this, 9.09% partially agree with this statement.

2.5 Program structure and duration

The program duration is 1 year, totaling 60 credits – 1800 hours. In the professional direction Master's program, the volume of the Basic Disciplines (BD) cycle is 6 academic credits, with 20 academic credits allocated to the University Component (UC). The professional direction Master's program has a volume of 20 academic credits – 600 hours in the overall volume of the Master's educational program. One academic credit equals 30 academic hours for all its types, and one academic hour for all types of academic work equals 50 minutes. The ratio of time between student contact work with the teacher and independent work (IW) for all types of academic activity is determined by the University. At the same time, the volume of classroom work is at least 30% of the volume of each discipline.

The academic year begins on September 1 and ends at the end of June. Basic disciplines (BD) constitute 8 credits (180 hours), with the University Component (UC) comprising 6 credits (180 hours). The University Component of the BD cycle of all Master's educational programs in the professional direction includes the disciplines "Management", "Psychology of Management", and "Foreign Language (Professional)". The industrial internship consists of 5 credits – 150 hours.

The program describes approaches to formative (current) and summative (final) assessment of a master's student. Feedback from undergraduates is expected, which includes questions, for example, students' satisfaction with the acquired knowledge and skills in the discipline being studied.

Providing feedback: the university has implemented a system for collecting and analysing feedback from undergraduates through internal and external monitoring. Feedback from teachers and undergraduates is maintained through questionnaires. Additionally, the placement of boxes for complaints and suggestions in educational and laboratory buildings is used.

Upon completion of training, the master's student is issued a diploma of postgraduate education with a supplement (transcript), (the University additionally issues the graduate a pan-European diploma supplement, Diploma Supplement) and is awarded the qualification "Master of Medical Sciences," which corresponds to level 7 of the European Qualifications Framework. Requirements for completion of the program;

The procedure for extensions and breaks in studies is described in the document "Academic Policy".

For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction), the University has resources for organizing the evaluation of practical skills of undergraduates (4 educational and laboratory buildings with lecture halls and study rooms on the basis of which the main basic, specialized and general education disciplines. The university has a scientific and practical centre (SPC), the necessary material support (equipment, reagents, materials, etc.) for carrying out research work.

The educational program of the profile master's degree includes two types of internships:

- 1) pedagogical in the BD cycle - at a university;
- 2) research in the MD cycle - at the place where the dissertation was completed.

Practical training of master's students of the department in an accredited EP is carried out in the conditions of such medical organizations as the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 4", the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 1", which guarantees the acquisition of skills by undergraduates in various aspects (research, supervision, examination, management, teaching) of the chosen field of health care. The duration of the internship is determined in weeks based on the standard time the student works in practice during the week, equal to 30 hours (6 hours per day with a 5-day working week).

The duration of practice for 1 credit in weeks is 1 week for teaching, industrial and research internships.

2.6 Educational program development process

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed when visiting the department of master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies and conversations with the head and employees.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments and councils involved in the development of the master's educational program 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile

direction), including the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, the Academic Committee “Master’s and Doctoral Studies”, the Academic Council, the Department of Academic Affairs, Academic Committee “Public Health”. A total of 5 meetings were held and during a cross-sectional interview it was determined that the facts indicated in the self-report were true.

The process of developing an educational program includes an evaluation of the needs for specialists (for example, the need for graduates of the 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” program (profile direction), however, due to the fact that accreditation is primary, it implies the availability of resources for training in an accredited EP. Cost training is 1,231,889.00 tenge.

The master's program was developed at the Department of Public Health and Healthcare and approved by the Academic Committee for Master's and Doctoral Studies (Minutes No. 3 of 01.26.2023), the Academic Council (Minutes No. 4 of 02.24.2023), and the Scientific Council (Minutes No. 7/804 of 04.26. 2023) and approved at a meeting of the University Board of Directors (Decision No. 4 of October 20, 2023, Minutes No. 10 of October 20, 2023). The master's program was reviewed by Ibraeva S.T. Deputy Chief Physician for Organizational and Methodological Work of the MSE on the REM “City Polyclinic No. 1”, medical organizer of healthcare of the highest category. Recommendations to stakeholders were not noted during the development and writing of the educational program. Thus, the experts analysed the hierarchy and sequence of development and approval of the master's program.

A survey of students from other educational programs showed that undergraduates are fully satisfied with the schedule of classes: yes, completely 86.36%, partially 9.09%, no 4.55%.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Match out of 21: completely - 21.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To strengthen career guidance work to attract students to the program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction);
2. To ensure regular replenishment and updating of the catalogue of elective disciplines of the educational program.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

3.1 Assessment methods

The University has defined and approved in the documents - “Academic Policy”, “Assessment Policy”, “Regulations on Master’s Degree” - principles and methods used to evaluate master’s students, including criteria for admission to exams, the number of exams, the number of permitted retakes. The choice of various methods for evaluating master's students is based on the results of an opinion poll, interviews of master's students and potential employers, evaluation of the work of teachers, the performance of master's students, a review of curricula, and a study of the activities of graduates. The criteria for evaluating learning outcomes are reflected in the discipline syllabus and are brought to the attention of students in the first lesson (clause 1.8.).

To make the results of the assessment of master's students available to external experts, they are posted in the Platonus automated information system.

Responsibility for the development of documents for the evaluation of undergraduates and the process of documenting the evaluation results is assigned to the Academic Committees. Examiners and department heads are responsible for filling out the examination sheet, for the content of the CIS and entering them into the Platonus AIS.

The results of the evaluation of master's students are documented as follows: recorded in the AIS "Platonus", current and rating statements, minutes of department meetings, meetings of the AC "Master's and Doctoral Studies", where the results of academic performance, intermediate and end-of course assessment are discussed.

Objectivity and transparency of evaluations and the grading process is ensured through syllabuses, individual study plans of undergraduates and their reports.

The study of control and measurement tools (tests, tasks, oral interview, written exam, and testing, practical skills) showed that the university has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of the educational achievements of undergraduates.

The system for appealing evaluation results is reflected in the document “Academic Policy”, Chapter 3, paragraph 3.41, 3.42.

After completing the course, the undergraduate gives feedback by filling out a questionnaire. The master’s program “Management in Healthcare” (profile) was opened this year, but there was no enrolment, and therefore no survey in this area was conducted among master’s students.

To verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked questions to the head of the department of master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies and checked the documents and methods for evaluating master's students. The organization has 34 CISs, which were compiled by department employees in accordance with the developed methodological recommendations for the compilation of CIS for disciplines (MR WKMU 23-15, approved by AC protocol No. 3 of 10/02/2020). CISs have been reviewed - report and conclusion - Link on Google drive <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1C2I9bWXII3-XSiBGzrXHMXeF6yqdiTZv?usp=sharing>; review - link on Google Drive <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/15CvyocLW61SKuOWsHrOI3wxHma4aodRv?usp=sharing>.

Reviewers are Nazarbayeva R.K. – c.m.s., associate professor of the department “Evidence-Based Medicine and Scientific Management”, Tazhbenova S.T. – Associate Professor, PhD, CIS expert

3.2 Evaluation system

The evaluation of academic skills is appropriate to the master's level, using methods such as a balance between summative and formative evaluation, written and oral examinations, criteria-based and reasoning evaluation methods, rating admission evaluation and evaluation of end-of-course assessment.

Evaluation methods and results avoid conflicts of interest, because the “Academic Policy” document spells out the reliability, validity and fairness of methods for evaluating undergraduates.

The evaluation system for master's students includes the principles of anti-plagiarism (document Agreement No. 361 dated May 22, 2023 has been introduced) and academic integrity, which includes verification of documents for borrowing.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the evaluation of knowledge and practical skills, namely, the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, clinical sites, the Platonus system, EMCD, CISs, expert opinions, acts and reviews, the rector’s order on the creation of an appeal commission.

3.3 Feedback from undergraduates

The experts received information that each undergraduate provides feedback through individual and detailed written feedback (or oral feedback with a written report) after formative and summative evaluations. Questionnaires were developed and located on Google Drive.

The master’s program in the EP “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) was opened this year, but there was no enrolment, and therefore no survey in this area was conducted among master’s students

3.4 Quality assurance of the evaluation system

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of evaluation methods by involving in the evaluation external specialists with academic degrees, academic titles, academic degrees of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor of specialization or master's degree from third-party organizations, whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the master's thesis/master's project being defended.

During a visit to the university, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?” And the answer was received that they were involved.

When conducting interviews with teachers of the Department of Public Health and Healthcare regarding evaluation methods, experts received convincing information that the high quality of the

undergraduate evaluation system is firmly embedded in everyday practice and is ensured by the implementation of the principles prescribed in the Academic Policy.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria correspond to 10 basic standards: completely – 10.
Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 4: STUDENTS

4.1 Admission and selection policy

The organization has a policy for the admission of master's students, which is called "Rules for admission to the master's program of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov" approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors of the Western Kazakhstan Medical University.

Koshmaganbetova G.K. - PhD, head of the department of master's and doctoral studies, spoke about the policy for admitting master's students. Approaches to the admission of master's students are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On Education", with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 18, 2011 No. 407-IV "On Science", in accordance with the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing professional educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, as well as the "Rules for admission to the master's program of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors of the NJSC "WKMU".

Due to the lack of enrolment of master's students in the accredited program, the experts did not familiarize themselves with the documents and personal files of the master's students.

Regarding the practice of academic counselling, personal support for undergraduates and the development of not only professional skills, experts interviewed the head of the department of public health and healthcare Yermukhanova L.S.

The University has a development program for master's students, which is reflected in the individual work plan of master's students and includes a curriculum, internships, and a plan for carrying out research, publications, and internships.

There is a plan for the development of educational programs, which is approved by the Vice-Rector for Educational Management.

Master's students are included in such advisory bodies as the Scientific Council and the Academic Committee. For example, Zhaksybay Zarina, master's student of M144 group "Medicine" is a member of the Academic Committee, and master's student Nazik Yerbolat of M145 group "Medical and Preventive Affairs" is a member of the Scientific Council.

4.2 Recruitment of master's students

The university has implemented a policy and process for admitting undergraduates based on their previous achievements, the principles of equality and objectivity. Admission of master's students is based on the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, in accordance with which the financing of master's programs is determined by type of educational institution, in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III "On education", with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 18, 2011 No. 407-IV "On Science", in accordance with the Model Rules for admission to education in educational organizations implementing professional educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31 October 2018 No. 600, as well as internal regulations: "Rules for admission to the master's program of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University".

The “Rules for Admission to Master’s Degrees” describe the practice of admitting master’s students with disabilities in accordance with the current laws and regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On social protection of persons with disabilities in the Republic of Kazakhstan” dated 01/01/2023). The right to receive a grant is for people with disabilities of the first and second groups, as well as people with disabilities since childhood, for whom, according to a medical report, education is not contraindicated, as well as orphans and children left without parental care, as well as young people who have lost or been left without parental care before coming of age. There are no restrictions on admission to master's programs based on gender, ethnic origin and language of instruction, and there is no discrimination against low-income people or representatives of national minorities.

4.3 Support and counseling for undergraduates

The University provides undergraduates with a scholarship in the amount of - 111,579 tenge (in accordance with the document “On approval of the Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships”, Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 N 116). Other types of support for undergraduates include the following: payment for participation in conferences , payment for publications, preparation for IELTS, provision of socio-psychological assistance, development of creative and artistic abilities, participation in sports sections, participation in seminars, master classes, modules on research methodology, biostatistics, conducted at the university and beyond, within the framework of the “vising-professor” programs, both offline and online free of charge.

Master's students who participate in international conferences, training courses and scientific internships are exempt from discipline work, while maintaining the average rating (clause 3.16 of the academic policy). The University pays their expenses in accordance with the following documents: P-WKMU 50-05 “Regulations on sending undergraduates and doctoral students to internships” Chapter 4, paragraphs 4.2, “Rules on the procedure and conditions for sending students to cultural, sports and recreational events, scientific -practical conferences, olympiads and other events” (P WKMU 01-01-26, 04/24/2023 Minutes No. 16).

On the University website there is a blog of the rector, there are help boxes, a helpline, which are continuously functioning and provide assistance.

Master's students are provided with counselling on academic, social and personal needs in the department of socio-psychological support, which is enshrined in the document "Academic Policy", and the department of master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies is responsible.

Preparation for comprehensive testing (CT) is planned for 2024 on a free basis through the academic quality department by attracting Academic staff from specialized departments for training. Non-resident master's students are allocated places in the university dormitory upon application.

Due to the lack of enrolment of master's students in an accredited program, when talking with master's students from other educational programs, experts received evidence that they were provided with academic, financial (including assistance in publications and participation in conferences) and psychological support through the department of socio-psychological support.

4.4 Representation of undergraduates

Master's students are included in the work of advisory bodies to participate in the development, management and evaluation of educational programs, as well as other issues relevant to master's students.

The representation of undergraduates and their respective participation in the development, management and evaluation of educational programs, as well as other issues, is regulated by the document “Procedure “Educational and Methodological Work” (PRO-WKMU 703-2022, approved by the decision of the Board, protocol 27 of 01.09.2022), (Chapter 7 “Development and approval of a modular educational program (MEP)”, paragraph 7.5). Representatives of master's students are members of the collegial governing bodies of master's educational programs (Academic Committee (AC) - Zhakysbay Zarina, master's student of M144 group "Medicine" (Minutes No. 1 of the meeting of the Academic Council of the NJSC “WKMU” dated 08.28.2023), Scientific Council (SC) - master's

student Nazik Yerbolat of M145 group “Medical and preventive care” (Order No. 13/2 dated 13/2 – 18-251 dated 04/28/2023).

4.5 Requirements for graduates

Requirements for master's students regarding the completion of the program (projects, dissertation, practice, portfolio, transcripts, etc.) are described in the document “Regulations on Master's Degree” P-WKMU 50-06 (approved by Minutes of the Board No. 22 of 08/21/23). The pre-defence procedure is described in the “Regulations on the conduct of pre-defence (approbation) of dissertations for master’s and PhD degrees on problem committees”, approved by the Decision of the Board of the NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov”, Minutes No. 8 dated March 18, 2020.

Requirements for the preparation of an individual work plan for a master’s student are included in P WKMU 50-06 “Regulations on master’s programs” (Minutes of the Board No. 32 of 08/21/2023)

Due to the lack of enrolment in the accredited program, the conversation with master's students did not take place.

4.5 Indicators of progress and reasons for lag

The requirements for the progress of a master’s student are described in the document “Academic Policy”, Chapter 3 “System for monitoring educational achievements and evaluating students’ knowledge” (clause 3.1.-3.75) and approved by the protocol of the University Board Decision No. 32 dated 09.21.2023.

If there is academic debt and/or failure to complete the dissertation work within a certain time frame, the university has developed a document “Academic Policy”, Chapter 3 “System for monitoring educational achievements and evaluating students’ knowledge” (clause 3.1.-3.75), as well as “Regulations on Master’s programs”, chapter 7 research results, chapter 8 “End-of-course assessment”, chapter 9 “Requirements for a master’s thesis” to predict such situations and help the master’s student overcome them.

Accounting for the progress and attendance of master's students is carried out by a unit - the department of master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies in accordance with the document "Academic Policy", Chapter 3 "System for monitoring educational achievements and assessing students' knowledge, clause 3.1.-3.75." The results are registered in the AIS Platonus. System control is carried out by the Dean's Office, the testing department and the Registrar's office.

An analysis of the performance indicators of master’s students in the program “EP 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)” was not carried out over time, since the accreditation is primary.

There is a monitoring system for master's students whose progress gives cause for concern, for example, the University has established monitoring of the progress and quality of knowledge of master's students: departments provide information on the certification of master's students, the Department of Master's, Doctoral and Postdoctoral Studies analyses the progress and quality of knowledge based on the results of the sessions; scientific supervisors of master's students control the process of mastering the master's degree program by analysing reports through the AIS Platonus and the portfolio of master's students; Issues of academic performance and quality of knowledge based on the results of sessions are discussed at meetings of the Academic Committee and the Academic Council of the university.

Over the past three years, the University has not had any master's degree students in other EPs whose progress caused any cause for concern.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 12 basic standards: fully – 12.

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

5.1 Selection policy

At the West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov, the implementation of educational programs is ensured by:

- clinical disciplines - 27 clinical departments (275 full-time Academic staff).
- general education, basic disciplines - 20 departments (215 full-time Academic staff).

In total, there are 19 employees at the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, of which 19 are full-time teachers, and there are no part-time teachers due to primary accreditation. The experts are familiar with the personnel policy (“Regulations on Personnel Policy” of the NJSC “WKMU” named after Marat Ospanov), the Regulations on scientific leadership (In the document “Regulations on the Master’s program” P-WKMU 50-06 (Minutes of the Board No. 22 of 08/21/23), the Regulations on qualification requirements for positions of Academic staff and persons equivalent to them at the NJSC “WKMU named after M. Ospanov”, Rules on competitive filling of vacant positions of heads of medical clinics/centres, structural divisions of the NJSC “WKMU named after M. Ospanov” and the Regulations on the certification of professors. teaching staff and researchers of the NJSC “WKMU named after M. Ospanov”).

External experts received the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, indicating that the University’s personnel policy complies with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the above documents, which includes issues of labour organization and workplace in educational organizations, opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies. The conversation with the head of the Department of Human Resource Management - Valiakhmetova Rita Bolatovna included such issues as personnel policy, criteria for selection and recruitment of teaching staff, scientific supervisors, mentors, development and motivation programs for Academic staff, mentors, training of scientific supervisors, feedback from students on the quality of teaching and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical sites for teaching (there are 54 such teachers at the University), about the strategy and tactics of student recruitment, the information security of the educational program, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most part-time workers do not mature, not engaged in science.

In a conversation with teachers, the following was noted, according to the “Regulations on remuneration, bonuses, provision of material assistance and other social payments for employees,” the university provides bonuses to the official salary for an academic degree: candidates of sciences, doctors of philosophy (PhD), doctors of sciences in profile in the presence of a corresponding diploma issued by an authorized body in the field of certification of highly qualified scientific personnel. This provision also provides for bonuses for hazardous working conditions for specialized departments: from 5% to 20% of the official salary.

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1SSPv8UtWwzz8BmAeJB8P126ypVCTK375/view?usp=sharing>

The following document, the Regulation “On awards and on the procedure for nominating employees of the NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov”, is a form of encouragement and stimulation of the work of University employees for their merits and achievements in their work activities and significant contribution to the development of the University. The main types of incentives are declarations of gratitude, bonuses, nominations for awards, certificates of honour, and promotions.

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1IU476yCg9vbKwYOmSDqdsBuPrSXeiSJD/view?usp=drive_lin

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (81.82%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at the university, but 13.64% were partially satisfied. At the university, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 86.36% completely agree, 4.55% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 68.18% completely agree, 31.82% partially agree. Satisfied with wages - 36.36% completely agree, more Yes than No - 31.82%, 18.18% - not satisfied, more No than Yes - 9.09%.

5.2 Commitment and staff development

During a meeting with the head of the HR department and during an interview with teaching experts, information was received on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with undergraduates, implementation of scientific leadership, which

includes the development of key competencies of university staff, increasing the quality of research and teaching staff, a set of motivational measures, including incentive payments for employees.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is held annually, and 9 teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program were trained in 2022-2023. These events are funded by the university. The expert verified teacher certificates on such topics as “Current issues of epidemiology”, “Biology safety and measures to reduce biological risks”, “Current issues of public health and health care”.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for undergraduates stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

The quality management system service ensures proper monitoring of the activities of teachers through certification with a frequency of once every five years in order to ensure that the employee meets the position held based on the results of his activities, level of qualifications, professionalism, adherence to the mission, values of the university and professional culture. Based on the results of measurement indicators achieved by the teaching staff of the department, key performance indicators (KPIs) are calculated and incentive payments are made to employees. Feedback on issues of satisfaction with the educational process, professional and personal development is carried out once a year in accordance with clause 5.3 “Questionnaire of teaching staff of departments on satisfaction with the quality of work of AMP” of the section “Business Process Management” of the Roadmap for the implementation of the development plan of NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanova” for 2023-2025. Responsible department is Quality Management System Service.

Teacher satisfaction rates in 2023 are 86.8%.

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 95.45% of surveyed teachers responded, and 4.55% partially agreed with this. They studied in professional development programs - 68.18% during this year, 22.73% over 5 years ago and 9.09% answered “I don’t remember when it was.”

Studied in professional development programs - 68.18%, more than 5 years ago 22.73%, no answer 9.09%

The university implements social support programs for teachers - yes, such programs exist 50%, yes, I have already taken advantage of this 4.55%, no 4.55%, I don’t know about this 27.27%, I doubt the answer 13.64%

5.3 Number and qualifications of teaching and management personnel

Training of master's students in the specialty “7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction)” is carried out by 19 teachers. Of these, 3 are PhD doctors, 4 are candidates of medical sciences, and 10 are masters.

5.4 Administrative support

Activities have been described and published that provide administrative support for undergraduates and teachers, which include bonus payments for publications in international peer-reviewed journals, for the training of master's students, doctoral students, for conducting research work, bonuses are provided to the official salary for an academic degree: candidates of sciences, doctors of philosophy (PhD), doctors of science in the field in the presence of a corresponding diploma issued by the authorized body in the field of certification of highly qualified scientific personnel. This provision also provides for bonuses for hazardous working conditions for specialized departments: from 5% to 20% of the official salary, announcement of gratitude, bonuses, nomination for an award, certificate of honour, promotion, incentives for employees to improve their skills, improve the quality and efficiency of work and training of personnel based on certification results, mentoring system.

Students of postgraduate education have the right to continue working without interruption from work at a 0.5 rate, which is an example of support.

An example of supporting young faculty members at the university is the "University Hope" program. To incentivize young specialists who are newly employed, they are provided with a room in the university dormitory, a one-time bonus of 1,000,000 tenge (one million tenge), and a monthly

bonus amounting to 50% of the official salary of a full-time assistant professor/lecturer at the department for one year.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 7 basic standards: completely - 7.

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES AND LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

6.1 Learning environment

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical bases of the Department of Sanitary and Epidemiological Control for the Aktobe Region of the Committee of the SEC of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan were visited; MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 1" and MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 4", and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of students. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (tutors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

During a visit to clinical sites, where experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

There is a library with a fund as of November 1, 2023 of 602,220 copies of educational, educational and methodological, and scientific literature, including a fund of multimedia electronic publications, which amounts to 14,899 items in the state, Russian and foreign languages. <http://biblio.zkgmu.kz:8087/jirbis2/index.php?lang=ru> Electronic information resources are available in the University area and via IP addresses in their own clinics. Book availability in the EP "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction): https://docs.google.com/document/d/1VcAMibA23aRs6hg3lPo380n5rCpEjcDz/edit?usp=drive_link&oid=114264195139645921085&rtpof=true&sd=true.

Validation of the implementation of self-assessment report data and obtaining evidence on the quality of programs in the specialty "EP 7M10108 "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction)" was not carried out by experts due to the lack of master's students - primary accreditation.

A survey of teaching staff showed that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills - 77.27% of teachers completely agree with this, 18.18% partially agree.

An interview with 3 teachers, including 3 full-time teachers, showed that there are no problems in education management that depend on a specific base (admission of undergraduates to equipment, a sufficient number of case patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work).

6.2 Information technology

A policy has been introduced that is aimed at the effective use and evaluation of information, communication and distance technologies in the preparation of master's students. It is regulated by the document "Internal Quality Assurance Policy".

The IT department is functioning. The territory of the university is provided with the Internet and WI-FI.

The university has 930 computers, 159 laptops, 20 interactive whiteboards. The library has a network of computers and individual tablets with Internet access. Computer, laptop, interactive whiteboards

For distance learning there is: AIS Platonus, video broadcasts, Moodle portal <http://dl.zkmu.kz/>, digital education portal <https://zkmu.edu.kz/portal-cifrovogo-obrazovaniya/>, lectures in the form of webinars or providing access to lectures previously recorded by teachers; conducting seminar classes

in the form of remote completion of tasks during seminars. Teachers demonstrate the material in a clearly accessible format through their Youtube profile.

https://studio.youtube.com/channel/UCRU31a_StwPf8yz3FT0z96A/videos/upload?filter=%5B%5D&sort=%7B%22columnType%22%3A%22date%22%2C%22sortOrder%22%3A%22DESCENDING%22%7D.

To conduct research, write a dissertation, self-study and access to the necessary information, undergraduates have access to international databases, including the Electronic Subscription of the Central Scientific Library named after Sechenova, EBS "Bookapp", DB, "eLibrary.ru", Platform "WebofScience", DB "EBSCO eBook Clinical Collection", EB "EduPort Global", DB "Access Medicine", DB "Cochrane Library", "Scopus" Sciencedirect" (http://biblio.zkgmu.kz:8087/jirbis2/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=19&Itemid=446&lang=ru).

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 4 basic standards: fully – 4.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. To ensure the annual replenishment of the library with modern literature according to the program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare (profile direction).

Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATING THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

7.1 Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

There is a program for monitoring educational activities, including evaluation: monitoring the provision of educational process with resources (clinical facilities, educational literature, classroom fund, equipment, Academic staff: teachers, mentors, practice managers, advisers); monitoring the compliance of curriculum with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard, including a description of the discipline, teaching methods, learning and evaluation methods. The objects of monitoring of the components of the master's degree program "Management in Healthcare" (profile direction) are WCs, EMCD (syllabuses, CIS disciplines, syllabuses of professional practice), teaching and learning methods, evaluation methods, competencies and educational achievements of students.

The adequacy of the existing educational environment is evaluated through Interim Certification, carried out in accordance with the schedule and academic calendar of the educational program, which provides for the collection of materials and evaluations about all student achievements in the learning process.

The results of the evaluation of the master's program are posted on the University website and are available to all interested parties: teachers, experts in the field of medical education, employers, students.

Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Nursing, Public Health and Preventive Medicine G.D. Sultanova said that control over the attendance and performance of students is carried out by the departments and the dean's office. Every month, departments provide information to the dean's office about student absences and low-performing students. The dean's office regularly discusses student performance and attendance with group leaders.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and undergraduates

The university collects, analysis and provides teachers and undergraduates with feedback on the quality of implementation of the educational program. This process is carried out by the Quality Management System Service, Department of Public Health and Healthcare. The frequency of collecting feedback is once a year. Also, at the end of the semester in the academic year, a survey of students is conducted on the examination session of postgraduate education.

The master's program in the EP “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) was opened this year, but there was no enrolment, and therefore no survey was conducted in this area among master's students. Despite the lack of enrolment of students, questionnaires were prepared: for Academic staff - 1 questionnaire “Questionnaire for studying the level of satisfaction of Academic staff with the

implementation of EP at the university”, for students – 3 questionnaires: “Satisfaction with the quality of the organization of the educational program”, “Questionnaire for evaluating the quality of teaching the discipline”, “Questionnaire for master's students for conducting the examination session”

https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1larxwe8DT-7-ORcUyGcNBEoqdvGcT13G?usp=drive_link

7.3 Activities of undergraduates and graduates

Primary accreditation.

The Master's program in 7M10108 "Healthcare Management" (professional direction) implements educational programs for the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel for the healthcare sector, capable of making decisions and conducting research activities while improving modern management methods in healthcare.

The University has determined and coordinates the connection between the final learning outcomes required upon completion of the educational program and those required in postgraduate studies; determined the results of involving undergraduates in conducting research in healthcare.

The final learning outcomes of postgraduate education are the acquisition by graduates of key and specialized competencies. Master's studies leading to an academic master's degree provide master's students with the competencies that will enable them to become qualified teachers and researchers, in accordance with the principles of best research practice.

A master's degree graduate must have fundamental professional training, master modern information technologies, including methods of obtaining, processing and storing scientific information, be able to formulate and solve modern scientific and practical problems, organize and conduct experimental research and scientific research activities in the chosen direction, successfully implement research and management activities.

During a visit to the Test Centre, Gataullina Bagia demonstrated journals in the “Electronic Journal” module of AIS Platonus. The final results of student learning are evaluated by a point-rating system within the framework of current, intermediate and end-of-course assessment, which takes into account academic performance, attendance at lectures and practical classes, evaluations of practical skills, practical training, re-training and retaking exams.

During a visit to clinical sites, employers noted that university employees ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and management of medical organizations in order to provide the most effective and comfortable conditions for students to achieve their final learning outcomes. Clinical site staff, who serve as both educators and practice managers, ensure quality learning and application of learning outcomes.

The interview with 5 employers was conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in the training of undergraduates through mentoring, providing the department and undergraduates with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, the percentage of employment of master's graduates, etc.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 8 basic standards: fully – 8.

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management (supervising vice-rector's office)

According to the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. 595 “On approval of the Standard Rules for the activities of organizations of higher and (or) postgraduate education (with amendments and additions as of October 12, 2023),” the organizational structure of the university is approved by the Board of Directors. The main structural divisions of the university are: dean's offices, departments, centres, offices, departments,

laboratories, etc., which has certain functional responsibilities. There are connections between departments that can be horizontal and vertical.

The highest body of corporate governance is the Board of Directors, which is formed from representatives of the authorized body, representatives of business, employers, and public organizations. The activities of the Board of Directors are regulated by the “Regulations on the Board of Directors of NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov”, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2020 No. 200.

The collegial body for managing current activities at the university is the Board, the activities of which are regulated by the “Regulations on the Board of the NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov” (P WKMU 01). The functions of the Board include approval of internal documents of the University, developed for the purpose of organizing the activities of organizations, approval of the staffing table, taking into account the number of staff and organizational structure of employees approved by the Board of Directors.

The main educational, scientific and administrative structural unit that carries out the implementation of the master's educational program, as well as the management of all types of activities of the departments that implement the training of master's students in educational programs, is the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies. According to the approved structure of WKMU named after Marat Ospanov, which came into force on January 4, 2023, the Department of Master's and Doctoral Studies is part of, which in turn is part of the structure of the Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Science and International Cooperation.

Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Science and International Cooperation - Zhurabekova Gulmira Atagullovna noted that an annual analysis of the degree of achievement of the mission and goals of the university is carried out. The input data for the analysis are the results of monitoring the implementation of the activities of the University Development Plan, internal audit of departments, reports of external and internal commissions. The results of the analysis are heard at a meeting of the Academic Council and are the basis for measuring and improving the efficiency of the university as a whole. In accordance with the annual plans for meetings of collegial bodies (SC, AC), Deputy Chairmen of the Board, deans, and managers' report on the implementation of university processes, on the fulfilment of quality goals, providing information on achievements, problems and solutions. Information about meetings held is posted on the local network and on the website.

8.2 Program manager (dean's office/department)

The Department of Master's, Doctoral and Postdoctoral Studies (DMDS) is a division that is part of the Department of Strategic Development and International Cooperation (hereinafter referred to as the Department) (the structure of the West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov was approved on 01/04/2023). The Director of the Department reports to the Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Science and International Cooperation, and works closely with the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and the Rector. The functions of the DMDS in relation to the master's program are the systematic organization of training of highly qualified scientific, pedagogical and scientific personnel in the postgraduate education system through master's and doctoral programs, and improving the quality of postgraduate education. The effectiveness of the work of the DMDS is evaluated by the quality of training of scientific, pedagogical and scientific personnel.

To the question of the questionnaire “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work: yes, systematically - 72.73%; yes, sometimes - 9.09%; no answer - 18.18%

8.3 Academic leadership (department)

The Master's program in the specialty 7M10108 "Healthcare Management" (profile direction) is implemented by the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, which has a staff of 19 people, with 90% holding advanced degrees. Faculty members from the Department of Foreign Languages are also involved.

8.4 Program management

The academic directors (program leaders) are the Academic Committee for “Master's and Doctoral Studies”, the DMDS and the Department of Public Health and Healthcare. The employees have the appropriate qualifications: doctors and candidates of medical sciences, PhD, masters. In their work they are guided by the Regulations on the Master's program and job descriptions. The main functions of the Academic Committee “Master’s and Doctoral Studies” are updating the educational program in accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, analysis and control of the content of educational and methodological complexes of disciplines, examination, discussion and recommendation for approval at a meeting of the Academic Council of educational and methodological publications.

8.5 Training budget and resource allocation

The main sources of the University's income are funding from the republican budget for the implementation of state orders, the provision of social support to students in higher and postgraduate education programs and the receipt of funds from paid educational and other activities in accordance with statutory activities. Revenue from the provision of services is determined on the basis of contract prices, measured at the fair value of the consideration received or receivable, taking into account the amount of discounts provided by the University.

Students studying under the state educational order are trained at the expense of budget funds; accepted in the direction of enterprises, organizations, as well as citizens from near and far abroad countries - on a contractual basis with full compensation for training costs.

The university, at its own expense, provides educational activities with the appropriate material and technical base, qualified teaching staff, library collections, access to the Internet and other information resources, and dormitories for students.

The University annually, at its own expense, holds an intra-university research competition among staff and students among teaching staff, staff and students. In 2023, a total of 5 scientific projects are being implemented with total funding of more than 137 million tenge.

For example, in a conversation with the Executive Director - Zhienalin Yerlan Shuenishbaevich and the Director of the Department of Economics and Planning - Kuzhaniyazova Gulmira Bakkalievna, experts learned that in 2023 they additionally purchased an electronic library and access to databases in the amount of 56,379,511 tenge. Equipment was also purchased - 36 types of dummies, exercise equipment and equipment for the Practical Skills Center, 19 types of dummies, exercise equipment and equipment for the children's center.

8.6 Administration

The process of administering educational activities and the process of managing an accredited educational program at the University is ensured and monitored in accordance with the LSI of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Model rules for the activities of educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education” and the document “Regulations on qualification requirements for positions of teaching staff of NJSC “West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov” According to this, the University independently forms its structure and approves it by decision of the Academic Council. At the same time, structural units must cover all areas and types of activities of the university.

Based on the regulations on structural divisions, job descriptions for all university employees were developed and approved, indicating qualification requirements, job responsibilities, rights and responsibilities.

During a conversation with the Vice-Rector for Strategic Development, Science and International Cooperation - Zhurabekova Gulmira Atagullova, Director of the Department of Academic Work - Alekenova Nurgul Umirbekovna, experts learned that the University plans to develop and deepen interaction with a wide range of business structures, including both medical institutions and non-medical organizations (not providing direct medical services) actively involved in the healthcare sector. It is planned to pay special attention to cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, medical equipment manufacturers, medical technology and pharmaceutical clusters. For example, in the Aktobe region it is planned to create a medical and pharmaceutical cluster.

8.7 Requirements and legal documentation

The University, in the process of managing and implementing an accredited EP, strictly complies with the requirements of the state in the field of education and healthcare. For this purpose, the University has approved the “Internal Quality Assurance Policy” (P WKMU 01-01-22), https://drive.google.com/file/d/16FAeU6-ByyTiWze7o_wmFDyfqCnLS8aQ/view?usp=sharing based on standards and guidelines to ensure the quality of higher and postgraduate education in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The evaluation of the implementation of the master's educational program is carried out from the perspective of the quality management system (QMS) in accordance with the documented procedures PRO WKMU 502-19 “Management Analysis”; PRO WKMU 801-19 “Internal inspections”; PRO WKMU 727-19 “Questioning”; PRO WKMU 708-19 “Quality control of the educational process”; PRO WKMU 803-19 “Corrective and preventive actions”, etc.

https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1OegNIM58gBnq4vbrYzo7M97UDsNu_hMf?usp=sharing

Responsibility for compliance with relevant regulatory requirements rests with the University management. *The experts examined the above documents.*

8.8 Review and approval process

A documented process of planning, discussion and updating of the educational program in the specialty 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) with a training period of 1 years was introduced; it was approved at a meeting of the University Board of Directors, Decision No. 4 of October 20, 2023, (Minutes No. 10 of October 20 2023), responsibility for which lies with the Department of Public Health and Healthcare, DMDS, everything is recorded in the protocols. The revision of the EP is provided for when the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan changes; according to the requests of employers, elective disciplines are updated. The educational program is updated every year.

Documentation of joint events with other educational organizations is carried out through the conclusion of memorandums and cooperation agreements. The university has concluded 103 agreements, of which 46 are with republican institutions and 16 agreements with foreign organizations and associations, 41 with neighbouring countries, where undergraduates can do internships.

Admission of master's students is carried out on the basis of the results of comprehensive testing and is reflected in the document “The provisions regulating the procedure for admission of master's students are reflected in the Rules for admission to master's programs.” The Department of Master's, Doctoral and Postdoctoral Studies is responsible. (P WKMU 50-03) <https://zkmu.edu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2024/01/%D0%A0%D0%A3%D0%A1%D0%A1-%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%92%D0%98%D0%9B%D0%90-%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%98%D0%95%D0%9C%D0%90-%D0%92-%D0%9C%D0%90%D0%93%D0%98%D0%A1%D0%A2%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A2%D0%A3%D0%A0%D0%A3-%D0%97%D0%9A%D0%9C%D0%A3-2023.pdf>

<https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/postuvayushhim/>

8.9 Financing

The university has financial stability, which is ensured by the state order for the training of masters in the specialty 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) and training on a paid basis (tuition cost is 1,231,889.00 tenge per year). According to the “Model Rules for the Activities of Organizations of Higher and (or) Postgraduate Education” in universities established in the form of a non-governmental joint-stock company, the approval of the amount of tuition fees for educational programs of higher and (or) postgraduate education is approved by the Board of Directors. Financing of the master’s educational program is carried out at the expense of the given contingent according to cost approved in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan:

- training at the expense of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approved by Decree for the academic year;

- expenses for scientific internship, according to the Order of the Acting Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2021 No. MoH RK-6 “On approval of the methodology for determining the cost of training for education programs in the field of healthcare (with amendments and additions as of December 12, 2023)”;

- expenses for paying teachers, paying for utilities, purchasing supplies, purchasing educational and methodological literature by financing the cost of training

There are no students due to initial accreditation.

The salary fund for master's degree teachers is 3,921,036 tenge per year. The average salary of a teacher is 326,753 tenge. (254.445 tenge in 2021) In dynamics, teachers' salaries increased by 28.4%.

The costs of purchasing equipment and replenishing the library collection in 2023 amounted to 1,287,403,550 tenge, which is 237,028,890 tons more than in 2019 (1,050,374,660 tenge).

8.10 Financial management and integrity

WKMU named after Marat Ospanov has appropriate internal and external mechanisms for evaluating financial condition and financial management and maintains its integrity and uses the results of these activities for improvement. The owner of the financial management process is the Executive Director, under whose subordination the Department of Economics and Finance operates. This structure analyses the financial and economic activities of the university, evaluates possible risks, etc. The main document for assessing financial condition is the balance sheet, compiled once a year.

The distribution and expenditure of financial resources is carried out in accordance with the Development Plan of the NJSC "WKMU named after Marat Ospanov", the University Development Program, and operational plans.

The audit and evaluation of financial and economic performance indicators, evaluation of the efficiency of budget use, evaluation of the reliability, completeness, objectivity of the accounting system and the preparation of financial statements of the university on its basis is carried out with the involvement of independent audit companies, as well as the Internal Audit Service.

At a meeting with the Executive Director - Zhienalin Yerlan Shuenishbaevich and the Director of the Department of Economics and Planning - Kuzhaniyazova Gulmira Bakkalievna, the experts got acquainted with reports on the implementation of the development plan for the reporting period, target indicators of the University Development Program, and the results of an independent audit of financial activities.

8.11 Program information

Full information about the educational program is available from the Department of Public Health and Public Healthcare and is posted on the university website to be accessible to interested parties. There are various communication channels, including a website, social networks (Facebook, Instagram), leaflets and brochures containing reference information have been developed.

On the University website in the state, Russian and English languages, in the “Applicants” section, information for admission to the master’s program is posted.

<https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/postuvayushhim/>

<https://zkmu.edu.kz/ru/2023/04/05/sh%d2%b1%d2%93yl-a%d2%9bparat/> (https://zkmu.kz/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/info_dlya_post_v_magistr-ru.pdf)

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 19 basic standards: fully – 19.

Recommendations for improvement: no.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The University initiates regular review procedures in the form of internal audits and external examination (accreditation, audits). Internal evaluation is carried out as part of self-assessment and during certification of undergraduates. Responsible division is a Department of Master's, Doctoral and Postdoctoral Studies.

Based on the results of the self-assessment of the program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction), areas requiring improvement were identified:

according to Standard 2 - Strengthen career guidance work to attract students to this EP.

according to Standard 7 - Regular updating of the catalogue of elective disciplines.

According to Standard 8 - Regular updating of the material and technical base

According to Standard 9 - Implementation of a joint educational program.

Strengths identified for improving the training program:

The University is the only medical university in Western Kazakhstan that provides training at bachelor's, master's, doctoral levels, and CDP;

- high demand for graduates;
- has the form of ownership of the NJSC, which gives it more independence in the disposal of funds in economic activities;
- developed system for evaluating and stimulating the work of Academic staff;
- international cooperation (Poland, Lithuania, Great Britain, Russia, Uzbekistan, Hong Kong, Azerbaijan, Tajikistan);
- high-quality Academic staff: doctors and candidates of science, PhD;
- high image of teaching staff and employees in the region;
- system for training in-demand Academic staff: selection, payments, dormitory;
- social support for students: dormitories, personal scholarships;
- developed socio-psychological service;
- a modern library with a high level of stock availability and technical equipment;
- integration with practical healthcare and its own clinical bases;
- joint educational programs and double degree program with Lithuanian University of Health Sciences;
- dual training;
- internationalization of education;
- scientific activity is actively developing: research work on program-targeted and grant funding,

The organizational structure was approved by a decision of the Management Board dated March 7, 2023 (minutes No. 2 by decision of the Board of Directors).

In the new approved organizational structure of the NJSC “WKMU named after Marat Ospanov”, the staffing number of employees became 2437.75 units (in the old version 2204 units), new structures were created (the department of master's and doctoral studies was transformed into a centre for master's, doctoral and postdoctoral studies, the centre of pedagogical excellence was transformed into a centre pedagogical skills and distance technologies, an information and analytical department was created under the Department of Economics and Finance). The basis for increasing staffing levels is an increase in the number of students, an increase in the staff of the Medical Centre due to the addition of beds for neurosurgery and maxillofacial surgery, with the opening of Arrhythmology beds and with an increase in the volume of purchases for 2024, an increase in the population and the opening of 10 GP and 3 nurses per 1 GP at the Family Medicine Clinic.

Risk management in the educational process is regulated by the internal regulatory document “Risk Management Policy” dated September 18, 2020. Each structural unit of the DAA, department of master's and doctoral studies, departments, registrar's office, etc., involved in the implementation of the EP, develop a risk passport and a plan-report of measures to prevent the emergence of risks.

The following risks have been identified in relation to the master's program: the risk of closure of master's educational programs due to lack of enrolment of students.

The University allocates resources for continuous renewal, which is documented in the university's strategic development plan for 2019 - 2023 and 2024 – 2026 and in the financial plan (budget) for 2024.

At a meeting with the University teachers, the experts received the following information: The university annually, on average, updates the material and technical base of the university by 20-30%: computers, laptops, office equipment, soft and hard equipment, etc. are purchased. For preclinical training, an online laboratory has been installed, a technology park is being created, and technical training tools are being updated. University departments, according to submitted applications, are

provided with the necessary material resources to ensure the educational process.

Based on the analyses carried out, the university constantly allocates resources for continuous improvement. Educational literature is purchased annually, laboratories are equipped with new equipment and comfortable conditions are created for students.

EEC conclusions based on the criteria. Complies with 4 basic standards: fully – 4.

Recommendations for improvement:

1. Development and implementation of the joint educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction).

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external evaluation of the educational program, it was found that out of **90 standards** (including 88 basic standards and 2 improvement standards), 90 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 88 basic standards and 2 improvement standards. Partially were met 0 basic standards and 0 improvement standards. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction):

- 1) To strengthen career guidance work to attract students to the program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare (Standard 2);
- 2) To ensure regular replenishment and updating of the catalogue of elective disciplines of the educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare (Standard 2);
- 3) To ensure annual replenishment of the library with modern literature according to the program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (Standard 6);
- 4) Development and implementation of the joint educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (Standard 9).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend that the Accreditation Council accredit the educational program 7M10108 “Management in Healthcare” (profile direction) of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", which complies with the Accreditation Standards of the educational programs of master’s specialties in medicine and healthcare of medical educational organizations for a period of 5 years.

Chairman of the EEC
Kamaliyev Maksut Adilkhanovich



International expert
Moiseeva Karina Yevgenievna



Academic expert
Narmanova Oryngul Zhaksybaevna



Academic expert
Danilyarova Anara Bakhitkereeovna



Academic expert
Taliyeva Gulbanat Nurgaliyevna



Academic expert
Kaynarbaeva Maykul Saidullaevna



Academic expert
Arapieva Alua Muratbekovna



Expert employer
Kuantaeva Liliya Vyacheslavovna



Expert learner
Bektemir Marta Akberenyzy



Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки по стандартам аккредитации образовательной программы магистратуры 7М10108 «Менеджмент в здравоохранении» (профильное направление)

стандарт	Критерии оценки	БС/СУ*	Всего стандартов	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	5/0	5	5	0	0
2	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПРОГРАММЫ	19/2	21	21	0	0
3	ОЦЕНКА МАГИСТРАНТОВ	10/0	10	10	0	0
4	МАГИСТРАНТЫ	12/0	12	12	0	0
5	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ	7/0	7	7	0	0
6	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ, СРЕДА ОБУЧЕНИЯ, ДОСТИЖЕНИЯ	4/0	4	4	0	0
7	МОНИТОРИНГ И ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	8/0	8	8	0	0
8	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	19/0	19	19	0	0
9	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	4/0	4	4	0	0
	*БС – базовые стандарты, СУ – стандарты улучшения Итого	88/2	90	90	0	0

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы магистратуры

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1.	Лицензии для занятия образовательной деятельностью	1
2.	Образовательная программа 7М10107 «Менеджмент в здравоохранении» (научно-педагогическое направление)	1
3.	Протоколы заседаний АК, АС, УС, Совета директоров, Решения Правления	20
4.	Программы развития вуза на 2019 – 2023 годы, на 2024-2028 годы	2
5.	Политика внутреннего обеспечения качества	1
6.	Кодекс этики	1
7.	Положение об Академическом комитете	1
8.	План развития ОП магистратуры	1
9.	Модульная образовательная программа	1
10.	Положение о магистратуре	1
11.	Договора о закупках	10
12.	«Правилах приема в магистратуру в НАО «Западно-Казахстанский университет им. Марата Оспанова»	1
13.	Договора с клиническими базами	3
14.	Положение о направлении на стажировку магистрантов и докторантов	1
15.	Положение об организации конкурса на грантовое финансирование научно-исследовательских работ, финансируемых из собственных средств НАО «ЗКМУ им. Марата Оспанова	1
16.	Положение о практиках	1
17.	Политика оценивания	1
18.	Положение «О квалификационных требованиях к должностям педагогических работников и приравненных к ним лиц НАО «ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова»,	1
19.	Правила о конкурсном замещении вакантных должностей руководителей медицинских клиник/центров, структурных подразделений НАО «ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова»,	1
20.	Положение об аттестации профессорско-преподавательского состава и научных работников НАО «ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова»	1
21.	Положение о профессиональной направленности деятельности ППС НАО «ЗКМУ им. М. Оспанова	1
22.	Положение о Кадровой политике» НАО ЗКМУ имени Марата Оспанов	1
23.	Положение о профессиональной подготовке, переподготовке и повышении квалификации работников НАО ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова»	1
24.	Положением «О временных научных коллективах	1
25.	Положение об оплате труда, премировании, оказании материальной помощи и иных социальных выплатах для работников НАО «ЗКМУ имени Марата Оспанова	1
26.	Положение «О наградах и о порядке представления к награждению сотрудников НАО «ЗКМУ имени Марата Оспанова»	1
27.	Методические рекомендации по составлению контрольно-	1

	измерительных средств дисциплин	
28.	Правила к проведению письменного экзамена	1
29.	Положение об экзаменационной и апелляционной комиссии по проведению промежуточной аттестации в НАО ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова	1
30.	Положение о Совете директоров НАО «ЗКМУ имени Марата Оспанова	1
31.	Положение о Правлении НАО «ЗКМУ имени Марата Оспанова	1
32.	Положение об академических комитетах,	1
33.	Положение о совете по академическому качеству	1
34.	Положение об академическом комитете специальности НАО «ЗКМУ им. М.Оспанова	1
35.	Силлабусы	34
36.	КИСы	34
37.	Всего	133