

To the Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance  
in Education and Healthcare  
June 20, 2025

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE BACHELOR'S DEGREE  
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 6B10107 "PHARMACY" OF THE NEE  
"KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH  
THE STANDARDS FOR EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION  
OF BASIC MEDICAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR'S DEGREE) OF ECAQA**

**external expert assessment period: June 3–5, 2025**

**Almaty, 2025**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" (Double-degree programme) of the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the analysis results of the self-assessment report of the educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" (Double-degree programme) and conclusions on its completion	6
3.	Description of the external expert assessment and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis for compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external assessment of the educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" (Double-degree programme))	9
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" (Double-degree programme))	32
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council for accreditation	33
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational programme in 6B10107 "Pharmacy" (Double-degree programme)	34
	Annex 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert assessment	35
	Annex 3. Organization visit programme	

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<b>Abbreviation</b>	<b>Designation</b>
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
ECTS	European Credit Transfer System
PBL	Problem-Based Learning
TBL	Team-Based Learning
AC	Academic Council
AC	Attestation Committee
AMP	Administrative and Managerial Personnel
BD (L)	Basic Disciplines (of learning)
University	Higher Education Institution
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
H&E	Hygiene and Epidemiology
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DET	Distance Educational Technologies
DEMWW	Department of Educational and Methodological Work
DASD	Department of Audit and Strategic Development
ESG	Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area
FC	Final Certification
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
ISC	Individual Student Curriculum
EC	Elective Component
CEP	Committee of Educational Programmes
CED	Catalog of Elective Disciplines
MH RK	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical Educational Organization
MJ RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
University	Non-State Educational Establishment "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
RI	Research Institute
SC	Scientific Center
CIME	Continuous Integrated Medical Education Programme
NSMU	Novosibirsk State Medical University
HPEO	Higher and Postgraduate Education Organization
PH	Public Healthcare
EP	Educational Programme
MA	Midterm Assessment
MD (O)	Major Disciplines (of learning)
TS	Teaching staff
RSE on REM	Republican State Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 13 dated May 15, 2025, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment in the period of June 3–5, 2025, as part of the accreditation of the double-degree educational programme of the NEE “Kazakh-Russian Medical University” jointly with the Novosibirsk State Medical University. The following members are included:

No.	Status on the EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairperson	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department “Public Health and Healthcare” of NJSC “West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov”, Chairperson of the “Public Healthcare” Committee at the State Unitary Enterprise
2	International Expert	Suyunov Nizom Davurovich	Doctor of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of “Pharmaceutical Business Organization” of Tashkent Pharmaceutical Institute, Member of the International Society for Pharmacoeconomic Research and Results, Tashkent, Republic of Uzbekistan
3	International Expert	Oleynikova Tatyana Anatolyevna	Candidate of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Head of the Education Quality Management Department, Educational and Methodological Department, Associate Professor of the Department of Pharmacy Management and Economics of “Kursk State Medical University”, Nominated by the partner organization "Association for Certification Russian Register"
4	Kazakhstani Academic Expert	Mirzabayev Marat Zhumabekovich	Doctor of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of “Neurosurgery” of NJSC “Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov”
5	Kazakhstani Academic Expert	Boshkayeva Assyl Kenessovna	Doctor of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Acting Professor of the Department of Pharmaceutical and Toxicological Chemistry, Pharmacognosy and Botany of NJSC “Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov”
6	Kazakhstani Academic Expert	Almabayeva Aigul Ydyryssovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Human Anatomy of NJSC “Astana Medical University”
7	Kazakhstani Academic Expert	Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Orthopedic and Pediatric Dentistry of NJSC “Astana Medical University”
8	Kazakhstani Academic Expert	Babayeva Gulzhan Sairanbekkyzy	Master of Pharmacy, Lecturer of the Department of Biochemistry and Chemical Disciplines named after Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor S.O.

			Tapbergenov of NJSC “Semey Medical University”
9	Employer Expert	Saltayev Aidar Amantayevich	Dentist, Orthopedist, Implantologist, Director of the “Infinity Dental Clinic” in Almaty
10	Student Expert	Bozhbanbayeva Guzel Zharassovna	First-year Master's student in “Pharmacy” of “Al-Farabi Kazakh National University”
11	Student Expert	Abdrasil Amina Asilbekkyzy	Fifth-year student in “Dentistry” of School of Dentistry of NJSC “S.D. Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University”

The EEC's work was conducted in accordance with the EEC Regulations.

The EEC report includes a description of the results and conclusions of the external assessment of the educational programme 6B10107 “Pharmacy” (double-degree programme) for compliance with the Standards for Educational Programmes Accreditation of basic medical education (bachelor’s degree) of medical educational organizations as well as conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for Accreditation), the EEC's recommendations for further improvement of the approaches and conditions for implementing the aforementioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for accreditation.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of double-degree educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" of Non-State Educational Establishment "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-state educational establishment "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" <b>BIN:</b> 970 240 002 300
Governing body	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation
Full name of the first director	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Date of establishment	1992
Location and contact information	Address: Almaty, Abylai Khan 51/53.  Admissions Call Center: <u>+7 707 946 5931</u> Office: <u>+7 727 250 83 75</u> E-mail: <u>info@medkrmu.kz</u>
State license for bachelor’s degree educational activities (date, number)	June 2, 2010 AB No.0137388
Year of commencement of the accredited educational programme (EP)	August 19, 2022
Duration of study	5 years
Number of students in the EP since the beginning of the current year	Bachelor's degrees – 4
Employment	Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: <i>The "Pharmacy" EP (double-degree education with Novosibirsk State Medical University) will be implemented starting in the 2023-2024 academic year.</i>
Full-time teachers/ Part-time employees involved in the EP implementation, including % of	Total teachers: <u>38</u> , including <u>37</u> full-time and <u>1</u> part-time faculty. Percentage of academic degree holders rate: 40.5%.

academic degree holders rate	
Website	<a href="https://new.krmu.edu.kz">https://new.krmu.edu.kz</a>
Instagram	<a href="https://www.instagram.com/medkrmu">https://www.instagram.com/medkrmu</a>
Facebook with active pages	<a href="https://www.facebook.com/KazakhRussianMedicalUniversity">https://www.facebook.com/KazakhRussianMedicalUniversity</a>

## 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Until now, the double-degree educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" implemented by the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" jointly with the Novosibirsk State Medical University (Russian Federation), has not been accredited. The expert assessment of the self-assessment report for the educational programme and the external on-site assessment of the university relate to the Kazakhstani component of the educational programme.

## 2.3 Brief description of the self-assessment report of the double-degree educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" and conclusions on its completion

The self-assessment report of the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 115 pages of main text, 22 pages of annexes and copies or electronic versions of 30 documents located at the link: <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1iAeQbmh8H3M7Xm7WHuYV2VFo3aJ8CV1A?usp=sharing>.

The report is characterized by complete responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, a structured approach that takes into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center – ECAQA and internal information divisions. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Head Nurlan Temirbekovich Dzhainakbayev, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, confirming the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report includes a list of 20 members of the internal self-assessment committee, indicating the responsibilities of each employee and information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Zhanat Amandykovna Liang, Head of the Audit and Strategic Development Department.

The self-assessment of the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy" was conducted based on the order of the head No.05-05-02-16-n/k dated "06.02.2025" "On the creation of a working group to conduct a specialized self-assessment and write a report."

All sections of the report present the actual practice of the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" in training undergraduate students in the 6B10107 "Pharmacy" specialty during the first two years of study, as well as one semester of the 5-year of study. The programme is offered in the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> years and one semester of the 5<sup>th</sup> year of study at Novosibirsk State Medical University (Russian Federation). The first student admission is scheduled for 2023.

All sections of the report present the actual practice of the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" in training undergraduate students in the "Pharmacy" specialty, along with substantiated data, examples of the implementation of educational programme objectives, national and international events and methodological support, confirming compliance with requirements of accreditation standards. The self-assessment report provides a comprehensive and up-to-date description in the number of students, teachers and administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, the university's physical facilities and clinical settings, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations and settings), financial information, development and improvement plans and etc.

The report was submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations. It is written in a competent manner, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and is described in accordance with the criteria of the standards. Tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and are numbered consecutively.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving on to the next stage of the accreditation process - external assessment. Experts plan to validate the report data and compare the information from the report with the information obtained during a visit to educational organization, i.e., verify quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### 3. Description of the external expert assessment

The external expert assessment of the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA and the programme approved by Resolution No.13 dated May 15, 2025, by the Director General of the ECAQA S.S. Sarsenbayeva and agreed upon with the Rector, N.T. Dzhainakbayev. Dates of the organization visit: June 3–5, 2025.

The external assessment is aimed at validating the self-assessment report data and verifying indicators demonstrating the degree of compliance with accreditation standard criteria.

The sequence of the 3-day visit is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is included in the accreditation center's documentation and in Annex 3 to this report. The Programme serves as evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the external expert assessment.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- conversation with management and administrative staff - 25 people in total;
- interviews with students - 44 people in total, including international students
- website review: <https://new.krmu.edu.kz>;
- interviewing 25 employees and 25 teachers;
- questionnaires for teachers and students - 41 and 72, respectively;
- resource review in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 3 practice/clinical engagement settings were visited, including: 1) LLP "Medservice Plus", located at 4A Tyulkubasskaya Street; 2) Almaty Branch of the Republican state budget-supported enterprise "Forensic Examination Center of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan" "Forensic Examination Institute". Address: 117V Kazybek Bi Street; 3) State-owned utility enterprise based on the right of economic management "City Clinical Hospital No.1." Learning will be conducted by 4 full-time teachers;
- review of 30 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the divisions (the list of documents reviewed is in Annex 2).

The accredited organization's staff ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit programme and by the lists of interview and conversation sites (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and categories of participants in meetings, interviews and conversations with EEC members**

No.	Full name	Position
<b>Teachers:</b>		
1	Kayupova Farida Yeleusizovna	Candidate of Philological Sciences, head of the department "Pharmacy"
2	Zhumalina Klara Zhumaliyevna	Candidate of Philological Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the department "Pharmacy"
3	Amirkhozhayeva Dabyrgul	Candidate of Philological Sciences, Associate Professor of the department "Pharmacy"
4	Satin Madina Kaldybaikyzy	Master's Degree, Lecturer of the department "Pharmacy"
<b>Students:</b>		
5	Aliyeva Asmar Rustamovna	2-year student, "Pharmacy" EP
6	Nauryzbayev Temirlan Askaruly	2-year student, "Pharmacy" EP

7	Sadygul Yersin Beibituly	2-year student, "Pharmacy" EP
8	Chekai Anzhelika Alexandrovna	2-year student, "Pharmacy" EP
<b>Employers:</b>		
9	Bodrov Nuraly	Director of LLP "Low price Pharmacy"
10	Usipbayeva Ulbosyn Saginbekovna	HR Director, "INKAR" Group of Pharmaceutical Companies
11	Nursaule	Rom Pharm

On the last day of the visit to organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held to discuss the external assessment results. A final discussion was held regarding the results of the external assessment of the educational programme, document review, results of conversation, interview and questionnaires. The EEC members began drafting the final EEC report. The external assessment results were summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the Bachelor's degree educational programme for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation standards". The standards for educational programmes accreditation of basic medical education were applied, based on the World Federation for Medical Education's International Standards for quality improvement in basic medical education (2020 version) and harmonized with the standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 2015). ESG standards will be further noted in the report. Given that the initial accreditation of a new educational programme, implemented at two universities with double degrees - in Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation - is being conducted, this external assessment primarily included an assessment of the quality of the Kazakhstani component of the educational programme, with visits to the facilities of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University and a review of the documentation. The external assessment programme included interviews with representatives of the Novosibirsk State Medical University and a review of the educational programme documentation compiled by the Russian university.

Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson L.S.Yermukhanova held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the EEC's work with access to all necessary information and material resources. The commission notes the high level of the University's corporate culture and the high level of openness of the team in providing information to the EEC members. The University demonstrated a willingness to openly discuss issues arising during the review process and expressed interest in receiving feedback to improve its activities. The EEC members had the opportunity to directly interact with management, teachers, students and employers, ensuring a comprehensive assessment of the educational programme. The commission's work took place in a constructive and friendly atmosphere, which contributed to an objective and productive review.

*In a student survey, 88.89% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, while 8.33% rated it as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (93.06%) believe that educational organizations or educational programmes should be accredited.*

*According to 78.05% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of the accredited educational organization's activities.*

At the end of the visit programme, the Chairperson of the EEC presented recommendations to the educational organization's management and staff based on the results of the external assessment as part of the specialized accreditation process.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with Accreditation standards based on the external assessment of the double-degree educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy"**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND VALUES**

##### **1.1 Stating the mission**



The mission of the "Pharmacy" EP (a double-degree programme with NSMU) is to train comprehensively developed, competent and competitive bachelor's students in pharmacy who possess high professional and ethical responsibility, is prepared for effective pharmaceutical practice, scientific research and continued education in postgraduate programmes and meet the modern requirements of the healthcare system and societal expectations. The mission of the educational programme is harmoniously aligned with the mission of the university, reflecting its strategic priorities and values.

*The mission of the double-degree programme is not published on the website of the Kazakh university and is not available on the website of the Novosibirsk State Medical University (hereinafter referred to as NSMU).*

All participants in the educational process are aware of the educational programme's mission and participated in formulating proposals for its formulation. The mission is communicated to potential students through the website, social media and informational letters to medical organizations. The organization's 5-year strategic plan, which includes areas such as mission, goals, objectives and strategic development plan, was reviewed, confirming compliance with accreditation standards and demonstrating the organization's goals, objectives and prospects. Interviews with students revealed that before classes begin, teachers inform students about the mission and work plans of the educational organization, and advise them on where to obtain necessary information about the educational programme, teachers and training facilities.

The NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" has structural divisions directly involved in the implementation of the "Pharmacy" educational programme (a double-degree programme with the Novosibirsk State Medical University). Experts highlighted this programme as an example of effective educational practice, combining international approaches to pharmaceutical personnel training, academic mobility and the integration of practice-oriented learning.

The following strengths were noted:

- *the implementation of a double-degree education in partnership with Novosibirsk State Medical University, ensuring the international competitiveness of graduates;*
- active student engagement in research, project work and participation in academic mobility programmes;
- strong connections with the professional community and pharmaceutical organizations, facilitating graduate employment.

The results of the documentation review demonstrate that the university's mission and the mission of the educational programme are interrelated, and the educational process is structured in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current regulatory and legal acts in the field of postgraduate education and healthcare.

*Experts identified several problematic issues, including the lack of a mission placement for the educational programme on the university's official website, which limits access by potential applicants, employers and other stakeholders to information about the goals and priorities of specialist training.*

*The university should highlight the influence of global and regional trends in pharmacy on the development of the educational programme's mission.*

## **1.2 Participation in mission formulation of the educational programme**

The university ensures the participation of key stakeholders, including students, in the development of the mission and intended learning outcomes. This process is implemented through collegial university bodies such as the Committee of Educational Programme and the Academic Council, which include teachers, department heads and representatives of employers and students.

To ensure that the opinions of all stakeholders are taken into account, regular discussions, questionnaires and surveys are conducted, the results of which are used to revise the educational goals and programmes. Information about the mission and intended learning outcomes is communicated to teachers at departmental meetings and to students during mentoring hours, meetings with deans and through posting on the university's official website.

*At the same time, during conversation with students and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question "Are you involved in formulating the mission and goals of the organization and the educational programme?" Students responded that they are aware of the mission and goals of the educational programme and participate in its improvement through surveys, course feedback and student self-governance mechanisms.*

Employers indicated that they are involved in developing and updating the educational programme by participating in meetings of the CEP, providing feedback on internship and employment results and making suggestions for improving course content based on the requirements of the professional environment.

### **1.3 Institutional autonomy and academic freedom**

An external assessment revealed that the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" in implementing the "Pharmacy" educational programme (a double-degree programme with the Novosibirsk State Medical University), demonstrates a high level of institutional autonomy, which facilitates flexibility and the high-quality development of the educational process. Institutional autonomy is implemented in four main areas:

Academic autonomy - independently determining the content of educational programmes, teaching methods, the list of disciplines, the goals and forms of scientific research and the awarding of degrees.

Financial autonomy - the formation and distribution of financial resources, setting tuition fees and managing extra-budgetary funds.

Organizational autonomy - the creation and reorganization of structural divisions, approving staffing schedules, concluding employment contracts and electing leaders.

Personnel autonomy - establishing policies for the hiring, promotion and salary determination of teaching staff.

The mission statement is approved by the University's Academic Board and is preliminarily discussed at departmental and methodological meetings (CEP, the Academic Council). It is regularly updated to reflect changes in the pharmaceutical industry and the requirements of its international partner, NSMU.

The educational programme is being developed based on the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022, No.KR DSM-63, taking into account the requirements of the Novosibirsk State Medical University and the Russian Standard for the specialty "Pharmacy."

The stated mission of the educational programme is based on taking into account the opinions of all key stakeholders, including:

- employers — through participation in the faculty council, review of educational programmes, participation in the CEP and surveys;

- students — through surveys, participation in methodological councils and committees, discussion of individual trajectories and proposals for elective courses;

- teachers — through department and working group meetings.

The catalog of elective disciplines is compiled annually, taking into account the student's profile, student requests and employer recommendations.

Students have the opportunity to create an individual educational trajectory, taking into account the specialization that will be in demand in practical healthcare and in the field of pharmaceutical distribution after graduation. A catalog of elective disciplines (CED) is being developed, consisting of elective courses for each course, specialty and area of study. The selection of elective disciplines is based on the principle of complementing the competencies required for future professional activities.

The programme's intended learning outcomes are defined based on professional standards, expressed through competencies and formulated both at the programme-wide level and at the module and individual discipline levels.

The EP's working groups are responsible for developing the intended learning outcomes, which are then reviewed and approved by the CEP and the Academic Board.

Cooperation agreements with the settings are drawn up taking into account the University's needs for patient profiles, the level of medical care provided by medical institutions and the availability of classrooms and laboratories. When signing agreements, special attention is paid to the availability of accreditation certificates from medical organizations, certifying the setting's compliance with accreditation standards in the field of healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Department of Professional Practice and Clinical Work has signed joint cooperation agreements for the "Pharmacy" educational programme with 9 settings, including 8 pharmacies.

Teaching staff selection is conducted on a competitive basis in accordance with internal regulations. The Career Center, in conjunction with the deans, appoints tutors from among experienced faculty members in the graduating departments. Tutoring is implemented by assigning academic supervisors to student groups.

In a survey of 72 students (on the website <https://webanketa.com/>), out of the 22 questions, several focused on the quality of the educational process and educational programme. It was found that 86.11% of students would recommend studying at this educational institution to their acquaintances, friends and relatives and 11.11% of students partially agreed with this statement. Furthermore, 81.94% of respondents believed that the educational programme heads and teachers are aware of students' learning needs and 15.28% of students partially agreed with this statement. To the question, "Do you think this educational institution allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 90.28% of students answered positively, 2.78% were unsure, 2.78% could not yet answer this question and 4.17% would like to believe so.

The 41 teachers surveyed (21 survey questions) also stated that 75.61% were satisfied with the work and workplace organization at this educational institution and 24.39% partially agreed. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy working environment, as the head is readily accessible to both students and staff, responds promptly to requests and facilitates resolution of any issues that arise. In the survey, 85.37% of teachers were satisfied with the organization's working environment and 14.63% were partially satisfied. According to 87.8%, teachers at the educational institution have the opportunity to develop as professionals in their field. A total of 72 respondents responded, with 24.39% having up to 5 years of teaching experience, 24.39% having up to 10 years and 48.78% having over 10 years of teaching experience.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 8 standards, 7 - fully, 1 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) Publish the mission of the educational programme on the university website (1.1.1).

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **2.1 Intended learning outcomes of educational programme**

During the external assessment, experts determined that the intended learning outcomes are reflected in the educational programme in full compliance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Standard of Higher Education and are adapted to the programme's profile, objectives and current labor market demands.

Analysis of documentation and interviews with students and teachers confirmed that the intended learning outcomes are aimed at implementing the principles of a practice-oriented approach, which positively impacts the quality of specialist training. The principles of practice-oriented learning are clearly outlined in the university's Academic Policy.

The experts confirmed that students are informed of their intended learning outcomes through tools such as the catalog of elective disciplines, working curriculum, discipline syllabus, the university portal and through mentoring support. This information is accessible, systematized and communicated to students at all stages of their studies, confirming the transparency and openness of the educational process.

### **2.2 Educational programme organization and structure**

The development and approval of educational programmes is conducted in accordance with the "Instructions for the development of educational programmes for higher and postgraduate education at the NEE "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" dated June 30, 2023 (Protocol No.11 of Academic Board) (ESG 1.2)

The structure of the educational programme in the specialty "Pharmacy" is presented in the working curriculum and discipline syllabus. These documents reflect the code and title of the disciplines, their distribution across semesters, their volume in hours and credits, the types of academic workload (lectures, practical classes, seminars, IWS and IWSST) and the phased distribution of these activities across semesters.

An analysis of the working curriculum revealed that the structure and content of the educational programme meet the requirements of the State Compulsory Standard of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2200028716>), learning outcomes are based on the Dublin Descriptors of the corresponding level and are expressed through competencies.

The intended learning outcomes are based on the Dublin Descriptors of the corresponding level and are expressed through a competency system.

To implement the educational programme, approved teaching materials are available. These materials contain objectives, a description of the integration of theoretical and practical components and assignments for student independent work. The teaching materials' compliance with the requirements of the SCES and standard educational programmes has been established.

Based on an analysis of internal documentation, including the "Academic Policy" (dated August 24, 2024, No.1) and the "Code of Academic honesty for students and staff" <https://medkrmu.kz/politika-akademicheskoy-chestnosti/> it was established that the university forms students' responsibility to teachers, patients and their families, ensuring the ethical and professional orientation of the educational process.

Individuals who complete the educational programme and successfully pass the final assessment are awarded the academic degree of "Bachelor of Healthcare" by the Kazakh-Russian Medical University and receive a diploma of higher education with a transcript <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2200028716> (ESG 1.2). Graduates receive a diploma of "Pharmacist" with a transcript in accordance with the Russian Educational Standard (FSES) by the Novosibirsk State Medical University. The diploma supplement from KRMU will include all disciplines completed in the Kazakhstani part of the programme and credits earned at NSMU. The workload indicated in the KRMU diploma supplement is 303 credits. The diploma supplement from NSMU will also include all disciplines from NSMU and credits earned in the Kazakhstani part of the programme.

### **2.3 Educational programme content**

The content of the educational programme in the specialty "Pharmacy" corresponds to the stated goals and objectives of the educational programme, reflecting the mission of the university, the needs of the healthcare system and the requirements of professional standards. The programme is aimed at training competitive specialists with practice-oriented skills and a scientific mindset.

To ensure the content of academic disciplines at all levels of study and the achievement of learning outcomes for each discipline of the curriculum, syllabuses are developed. These syllabuses are developed, reviewed and analyzed by departments and CEP, and approved at meetings of the Academic Council. Teaching materials are developed for each discipline of the working curriculum for all specialties. These materials are compiled annually by the teaching staff, reviewed and approved at department meetings, compiled and posted on the MOODLE platform.

After the Academic Council approves the catalog of elective disciplines and completes the registration process for students in the disciplines, the departments develop and approve educational and methodological complexes at meetings of the educational programmes committee of the Faculty of "Pharmacy" (NSMU).

Documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes are available, including the State Compulsory Education Standard, standard educational programmes, educational and methodological recommendations and the university's internal regulatory documents.

Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the university administration and the Academic and Methodological Administration together with the departments.

During a university visit and through interviews with teachers and students, the following was confirmed:

- compliance of the programme structure with SCES requirements and Dublin descriptors;
- availability of updated syllabuses integrating theory and practice;
- content focused on developing professional competencies in demand in the labor market;
- transparency and accessibility of information for students through the university portal and mentoring.

To determine student satisfaction level with the quality of teaching, the Audit and Strategic Development Department conducts student feedback through surveys and meetings. The survey is conducted in accordance with the regulations "On the organization and conduct of student surveys."

*Based on the results of the focus group study "Assessment of the educational experience of students in the 6B10107 "Pharmacy" double-degree programme" dated February 27, 2025 (AC Protocol No.4), it was established that the programme is generally well-received by students and meets their expectations. 4 students surveyed noted the high quality of teaching, the importance of the double-degree format and the development of key professional competencies. However, certain problem areas were identified: an overcrowded curriculum, limited practical focus in some disciplines, a lack of comprehensive mentoring and the need for improved coordination between partner universities.*

The programme has high potential and if these shortcomings are addressed, it could become an effective model for transnational pharmaceutical education.

Experts determined that the structure of the "Pharmacy" EP includes three academic cycles (2 general education modules, 6 basic modules and 2 basic disciplines and 4 specialized modules) and is fully reflected in the working curriculum and teaching materials developed by the Educational and Methodological Administration jointly with the relevant departments, student A.Abdurakhimova and employer D.Adambayev. The programme was approved by the decision of the Academic Board (minutes No.0/1 dated August 19, 2022).

The availability of a catalog of elective disciplines was confirmed during an on-site assessment: experts reviewed its content and noted its compliance with the programme profile and the requirements of practice-oriented learning.

*Teachers provide students with teaching and methodological materials, as well as additional literature to prepare for classes. 87.5% were completely satisfied, 9.72% were partially satisfied and 2.78% were dissatisfied.*

*In response to the survey question "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)?", 73.61% of students responded with complete agreement, 15.28% partially agreed and 2.78% disagreed. Furthermore, 76.39% of students stated that the teacher provides feedback after classes (listening to their opinions, conducting a mini-survey and an error analysis session).*

*At the same time, the expert commission concluded that the scope of the joint educational programme "Pharmacy" implemented by KazRusmedUniversity and NSMU should be ensured to comply with the requirements of the Federal State Standards of Higher Education (FSSES HE) of Russia 33.05.01 Pharmacy.*

*Infographics should be developed including a diagram of the educational programme structure, intended learning outcomes and discipline integration.*

*Documentation should be provided for stakeholder involvement, including representatives of Novosibirsk State Medical University, at all stages of the "Pharmacy" educational programme's life cycle: design, development, implementation, updating, assessment and improvement.*

## **2.4 Basic biomedical sciences**

Experts have confirmed that the double-degree programme in "Pharmacy" specifically includes key biomedical disciplines: "Medical Biophysics", "Higher Mathematics", "Inorganic Chemistry",

“Anatomy”, “Physiology”, “Botany”, “Molecular Biology” and “Medical Genetics”, “Microbiology and Immunology”, “Biological Chemistry”, “Pathological Physiology” and “General Hygiene and Epidemiology”. Their placement primarily in the first two years of the curriculum ensures that students develop a solid foundation of theoretical knowledge, skills and abilities. This creates the necessary foundation for in-depth mastery of subsequent clinical disciplines and is consistent with the principles of step-by-step development of professional competencies.

## **2.5 Clinical sciences**

Experts noted that the department ensures a high level of training for students in the “Pharmacy” EP through a comprehensive approach to developing professional competencies. The curriculum includes elective disciplines focused on patient safety (“Ethics and Deontology”, “Pharmaceutical Care”, “Modern Pharmacy Information Technologies” and “Clinical Pharmacy”) enabling future pharmacists to develop the necessary ethical and clinical skills.

The teaching staff is actively involved in professional retraining and advanced training: seminars and training sessions are held in key areas (“Pharmaceutical Engineering”, “Biotechnology”, “Digitalization and Automation in Healthcare” and “Business Analytics”) and roundtable discussions with employers ensure the EP is regularly updated to meet industry needs. The university provides access to leading specialized online resources (The Republican State Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management “the National Center for expertise of medicines and medical devices” of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Association for the support and development of pharmaceutical activities and LLP “Vi-ortis”), enhancing the educational information base.

Practical training is organized in stages and integrated with theory: beginning with botanical practical training in the 1<sup>st</sup> year and progressing to industry-specific practical training in the 5<sup>th</sup> year (pharmaceutical activities, pharmaceutical and industrial technologies, quality control and toxicological chemistry). Interaction with pharmaceutical companies, research laboratories and the university's clinical settings ensures that students develop skills in demand in the labor market and is consistent with the best international practices in pharmaceutical education.

## **2.6 Scientific method**

Experts have determined that the “Al-Farabi” Student Research Club, which includes 32 students from the Department of Pharmacy, is actively working in four areas: pharmacognosy (3 student projects), toxicological chemistry (3 projects), pharmaceutical chemistry (2 projects) and clinical pharmacy (3 projects), with a total of 11 projects. Under the leadership of Academic Supervisor D.A. Amirkhodzhayeva, the best R&D projects of students are being selected on the initiative topic “Theoretical and experimental research in the field of production and standardization of drugs.” This academic year, 8 students presented oral presentations at the faculty scientific and practical conference and all selected projects were presented at the International Conference dedicated to University Day.

During the visit, experts noted that the university systematically integrates research activities into the educational process: students demonstrate an understanding of research methodology, critically evaluate information and present their findings in publications and presentations. This approach ensures that students develop key research competencies that meet state standards and the requirements of modern pharmaceutical practices.

## **2.7 Behavioral and social sciences and medical ethics**

An analysis of the curriculum for the “Pharmacy” programme shows that the disciplines of behavioral and social sciences, medical ethics and medical jurisprudence are integrated into the educational process. This meets modern requirements for the training of pharmaceutical personnel and reflects an interdisciplinary approach that ensures the comprehensive development of professional competencies.

Thus, the inclusion of humanities and social sciences in the programme structure promotes responsible, ethical and professionally mature behavior in future specialists, consistent with international standards for pharmacist training.

## **2.8 Educational technologies, learning methods and practical training**



Learning methods and the organization of practical training in the “Pharmacy” educational programme (a double-degree programme with Novosibirsk State Medical University) are regulated by an internal regulatory document - the methodological instruction for teachers "Learning methods at the Medical University," approved at the Academic Committee meeting on August 26, 2021. The document presents and systematizes 29 modern teaching methods, including “snowball effect”, project-based learning, case-based learning, team-based learning and others.

Particular attention is paid to developing practical skills, clinical and pharmaceutical thinking, communication with patients and the competent application of knowledge in pharmacology, pharmacotherapy, drug technology and pharmaceutical management. Practical training takes place in pharmacies, manufacturing facilities, clinics and research laboratories.

The use of interactive platforms, electronic resources, simulation programmes and virtual laboratories enables students in “Pharmacy” to more deeply acquire the theoretical knowledge and practical skills necessary for future professional work in the modern pharmaceutical industry.

## **2.9 Educational programme management**

The educational programme approval procedure is carried out in accordance with the University's Academic Policy and the Guidelines for the development of educational programmes (Annex 1 to the Order of the Director of the National Center of Higher Education Development of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 4, 2023, No.601 n/q). The programme is developed by the CEPs with the mandatory participation of employers. The draft of educational programme is then reviewed at a meeting of the Academic Council, agreed upon and then approved by the University's Academic Board. All stages of the development process are accompanied by protocol decisions. **(ESG G1.2)**

Documentary support for the process includes:

- University Academic Policy dated August 24, 2024, No.1
- Guidelines for the development of the educational programme dated June 30, 2023, No.11
- Minutes of meetings of the CEP, Academic Council and Academic Board;
- Professional standards, State Compulsory Educational Standards and the National Qualifications Framework;
- Feedback from external and internal stakeholders (review for the educational programme from the employer).

*During an interview with Mikhail Nikolayevich Drovosekov, Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry at Novosibirsk State Medical University (NSMU) and Tatyana Fedorovna Izvekova, Director of the Center for International Education and Language Communication at NSMU, it was established that compulsory disciplines such as Russian History and others will be mastered by Kazakhstani students through additional or advisory classes.*

## **2.10 Connection with medical practice and the healthcare system**

The graduate department for the “Pharmacy” educational programme ensures continuity of the educational trajectory, creating a strong connection between the undergraduate programme, subsequent levels of professional training and practical experience.

Since the beginning of 2024, the university has implemented large-scale transformations aimed at shifting from theoretical to practice-oriented learning and implementing a competency-based approach. A set of 10 key competencies for student success has been developed, including humanism, ambition, clinical and ethical thinking and social responsibility. This reflects a focus on developing not only the professional but also the personal qualities of future specialists.

Practical training is enhanced by integrating students into real-world work environments at cancer centers, hospices, children's institutions, pharmacies and pharmaceutical companies, building a bridge between the academic environment and the healthcare system. These measures promote early professional self-determination and socialization for students, consistent with best international practices in training medical and pharmaceutical personnel.

Academic support is provided through an advisory system: each student is assigned an advisor who oversees their academic development and adaptation to the university environment. Advisors'

activities are coordinated at the dean's office level, ensuring consistency and effectiveness. This mentoring, especially in the junior years, helps students develop resilience to academic and professional challenges, as well as a sense of belonging and responsibility, which is fully consistent with \_\_\_\_\_.

*Out of the 72 students surveyed, 79.17% responded that their teachers use active and interactive learning methods quite often in their classes, while 19.45% said they rarely or sometimes use them.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 36 standards, 34 - fully, 2 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) The educational programme management should (2.3):
  - ensure that the scope of the joint educational programme "Pharmacy" implemented by KazRusmeduniversity and Novosibirsk State Medical University complies with the requirements of the Federal State Educational Standards of Higher Education (FSSES HE) of Russia 33.05.01 Pharmacy.
  - develop infographics: a diagram of the educational programme structure, intended learning outcomes and discipline integration.
- 2) Ensure documented evidence of stakeholder participation, including representatives of Novosibirsk State Medical University, at all stages of the life cycle of the educational programme "Pharmacy": design, development, implementation, updating, assessment and improvement. (2.9)

## **Standard 3: STUDENT ASSESSMENT**

### **3.1 Assessment policy and system**

Experts have determined that the Kazakh-Russian Medical University has implemented a comprehensive system for assessing student academic achievement based on the principles of transparency, objectivity and academic honesty. The system includes both formative (continuous and midterm) and summative (final) assessments. It is conducted on a point-rating letter scale with numerical and percentage equivalents and covers all levels of competency development: theoretical knowledge, practical skills, relationships, communication and legal aspects. Independent assessment is also used in the form of objective structured examinations and with the participation of external experts on appeals committees.

The assessment system is governed by internal regulations, including the "Academic Policy", "Appeals Regulation", "Regulations on assessing students' knowledge", "Regulations on continuous, midterm and final assessments", "Regulations on the Certification Committee" and the "Regulations on internal quality assurance in educational activities." All documents were approved at meetings of the Academic Board and updated in 2022–2024.

During the visit, the experts reviewed the discipline working curriculum, syllabuses with clearly defined assessment criteria (posted in the Moodle system and on the educational portal), academic journals, reports in the "Platonus" system, assessment checklists and appeals committee materials. It was confirmed that assessment results are promptly entered into the "Platonus" automated information system, and students have access to them through their personal accounts.

A study of control and measuring equipment (tests, case problems, practical assignments, case studies, oral and written exams, portfolios and individual projects) revealed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive and objective assessment of student academic achievement. During interviews, students described assessment methods, such as continuous monitoring, midterm tests, clinical cases, group error analysis and project defenses, and indicated their satisfaction with the assessment system. Students also receive regular feedback from teachers, including comments in the "Platonus" system, oral discussions after midterm



examinations and individual recommendations. The assessment results appeal system is outlined in the "Appeal Regulation," and there have been no previous appeals since the organization's operation.

During a organization visit and a conversation with Liang Zh.A., the head of the Department of Audit and Strategic Development, the commission confirmed that a documentation system is in place that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff. This includes documents such as annual operational plans, annual reports, division regulations, teacher and student agreements, orders on main activities, academic board meeting minutes, department reports, research and educational and methodological plans, as well as educational and methodological documentation (work programmes, curriculum, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, reports), certificates, verifications and credentials.

A review of the website revealed that its pages contain documents necessary for students, including admissions rules, the academic calendar, academic schedules, examination schedules and a list of elective courses.

### **3.2 Assessment in support of learning (formative assessment)**

The double-degree programme in "Pharmacy" uses a formative assessment method to assess knowledge and skills, which facilitates and supports learning. In addition to continuous (daily) assessments, midterm examinations are conducted based on the number of credits earned in a given discipline. The choice of formative assessment method is based on developing students' skills for self-assessment.

Assessment results are documented in electronic transcripts, stored in the university's information system, reflected in individual student trajectories and discussed at department and methodological council meetings.

Reliability and validity assessment are based on the internal regulatory framework, specifically the approved document "Assessment methods in Medical University" dated August 26, 2021, which defines the principles, criteria and procedures for assessing the quality of assessment tools.

During the external assessment, during interviews with teachers of departments implementing the disciplines of "Pharmacy" educational programme (a double-degree programme with Novosibirsk State Medical University), the experts obtained convincing evidence that student assessment procedures are systematically organized, aligned with learning outcomes and ensure objectivity and transparency. The teachers demonstrated proficiency in approved assessment methods and confirmed the use of uniform criteria for knowledge assessment.

Students also shared their opinions regarding the assessment procedures. In particular, they noted the timely provision of tests and assessment materials, pre-exam consultations, the accessibility of assessment criteria and the transparency of the entire process.

For example, students reported that all assignments and assessment criteria are posted in advance on the online portal and that teachers provide detailed explanations of the exam structure and, if necessary, individual consultations. They also expressed satisfaction with the fairness of the assessment process, emphasizing that exam results are discussed and substantiated in the event of an appeal.

Employers surveyed - representatives of pharmacy chains, pharmaceutical companies and clinical diagnostic institutions - also noted that graduates' training is aligned with the current state of medical science and practice, as the educational process incorporates modern pharmacotherapeutic approaches, practice-oriented learning and familiarizes students with new technologies and standards for pharmaceutical care.

Employers reported that they themselves participate in student assessments by including them on state examination committees and final certification committees and by inviting students to work experience internships where they can assess their professional readiness.

### **3.3 Assessment in support of decision-making (summative assessment)**

Based on documentation analysis, interviews with administration, teachers and students, experts have determined that the university has a structured, fair and transparent student assessment system aligned with the learning outcomes and educational objectives of the "Pharmacy" programme.

The assessment system includes summative assessment, which is key to assessing student learning outcomes. The assessment is recognized as fair and objective, encompassing all areas of student competence, and the final grades accurately reflect the level of acquired knowledge, skills and abilities. This is evidenced by the conformity of the grades awarded with the stated learning outcomes and training quality standards.

Assessment results are recorded in the “Platonus” automated information system, ensuring transparency and accessibility for students on the day of assessment. The student's personal account contains a complete set of individual data: curriculum, schedule, academic calendar, current and final academic performance and history of achievement. This helps students understand their academic trajectories and level of performance.

Teachers and students maintain constant, open feedback on academic performance. This fosters trust in the assessment system and increases student motivation. An appeals procedure is provided for all assessments, ensuring the protection of student rights and academic fairness. An extension of the examination period is also permitted for valid reasons.

All admission, assessment, recognition and student graduation procedures are formalized, maintained up-to-date and available for review on the university's official website, consistent with the principles of transparency and student-centeredness.

### **3.4 Quality control**

The Kazakh-Russian Medical University (KRMU) has implemented an effective quality control system for student assessment procedures in the “Pharmacy” educational programme (a double-degree programme with NSMU). The system encompasses planning, implementation, monitoring and regular updating of assessment approaches.

Responsibility is distributed among the vice-rectors, the Department of Academic Policy, Audit and Strategic Development Department, Department of educational and methodological work, DRE, the Testing Center, the deans and the Academic Committee. Internal audits are conducted annually; teaching staff reports as well as feedback from students and employers (including through surveys and roundtables) are analyzed.

The results are used to adjust the educational programme and improve assessment methods. The system ensures the transparency, validity and objectivity of procedures consistent with the mission and goals of the EP.

*At the same time, the experts did not obtain evidence of the application of validity and reliability assessment methods used in the educational process.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria** Comply with 13 standards: 12 - fully, 1 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

#### ***Recommendation for improvement:***

- 1) Ensure evidence-based validity and reliability of assessment methods used in the educational process. Develop digital transformation in assessment and learning support. (3.4).

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **4.1 Student selection and admission policy**

Applicants are admitted to the university in accordance with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan: The Law "On Education" and the Standard Rules for admission to educational organizations implementing higher education programmes, No.3, dated July 20, 2022. Based on these documents, internal admissions rules ("Rules for admission to bachelor's degree programmes" dated June 28, 2025) were developed. These rules were approved by the university and posted on the official website as "Rules for admission to a medical educational institution."

The admissions policy is open and transparent: applicants and interested parties can access it through the university's official website (<https://new.krmu.edu.kz>), information stands, "Applicant-2025" brochures and social media (Instagram, Facebook). For career guidance, off-site meetings with the participation of teachers and student-volunteers are held in schools and colleges.

The Admissions Committee is formed annually by order of the rector as an independent division. The committee's work is governed by the "Regulations on the work of the Admissions Committee."

During an interview with the responsible secretary of the Admissions Committee, G.B. Kaliyeva, the experts received confirmation of a transparent and fair admissions procedure. This year, the Admissions Committee accepted applications for participation in the competition for the state educational grant from 2024 graduates of general education schools who passed the Unified National Test (UNT) and applicants who passed the comprehensive testing, with points on certificate of at least 70, including at least 5 points in specialized subjects and the History of Kazakhstan and at least 3 points in other subjects.

Admission to the first year of undergraduate programmes is formalized by order of the rector in accordance with the Standard Rules for admission to educational institutions implementing higher and (or) postgraduate education programmes, approved by Order No.600 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018, as amended by Order No.212 of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 3, 2024, based on the decision of the Admissions Committee and the concluded agreement for the provision of educational services.

During the 2023–2025 period, 7 students were admitted to the educational programme in specialty "Pharmacy" (a double-degree programme with NSMU). Currently, study is provided only in the first and second years, where 4 students are enrolled.

The University's student admissions and selection policy is focused on the healthcare priorities of Almaty, the Almaty region, Taraz, the Zhambyl region and the Republic of Kazakhstan as a whole.

Students are transferred from other programmes and medical universities in accordance with the "Rules for the transfer and readmission of students" dated August 27, 2021, approved at the national level. The criterion for student transfer from one course to another is achieving the established pass grade (GPA). The pass grade, approved by the decision of the Academic Board (Minutes No.7 dated July 7, 2020), reflects an improvement in the quality of education and its level from course to course and has an upward trend.

This data was confirmed through documentation analysis and conversations, and the information was fully validated according to Standard 4 by experts.

#### **4.2 Student counseling and support**

The university implements a comprehensive student development and support programme based on the "Regulations on social support for students" dated June 21, 2019. Creating a favorable educational environment and an atmosphere of interaction between teachers and students is a university priority.

The university has a Youth Policy Center, a Family KRMU Center, a youth volunteer movement, a social assistance committee, a student support service, including technical support for online learning and a Moodle platform with access to the EMD.

Mentors accompany students throughout their studies, providing advice and informing the dean's office about difficult social situations. The university has an adaptation programme for first-year students. Support is provided with an individualized approach.

Particular attention is paid to psychological support: a university psychologist monitors and consults students. Issues related to educational trajectories, social and financial support and career planning are discussed at departmental meetings, the dean's office and the Academic Council.

Rector Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev holds two annual meetings with students, during which they have the opportunity to express their opinions and make suggestions. All requests are reviewed and resolved promptly.

The University provides graduates with documents confirming their qualifications, conferring the academic degree of "Bachelor in Healthcare" and issues a diploma of higher education (with a transcript). **(ESG G 1.4).** Novosibirsk State Medical University issues to graduates a diploma of "Pharmacist" with a transcript in accordance with the Russian Educational Standard (FSES).

*At the same time, experts have found that students in the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy" are not actively involved in research, lack the skills to analyze and process scientific information and do not participate in research clubs.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 15 standards, 13 - fully, 2 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) Expand the student body for the double-degree educational programme in "Pharmacy" by using various approaches, including career guidance. (4.1.1.)
- 2) Ensure more active participation of students in the "Pharmacy" educational programme in research activities, with publication of research results in collections and conference proceedings, student scientific journals, including international ones. (4.2)

## **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF**

### **5.1 Academic staff development policy**

The experts noted that the university uses effective and transparent criteria for teachers' recruitment and appointment, ensuring equal employment opportunities in accordance with legislation and established requirements. Teacher responsibilities, performance evaluation procedures, promotion criteria and tenure are clearly defined, which contributes to the development of a stable and professionally oriented faculty.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, the total teaching staff number was 1,151, including 849 full-time faculty and 302 part-time faculty. 68 faculty members held Doctors of Science (DSc), 116 - Candidates of Science, 14 – PhD and 131 - Master's degrees. The average age of the teaching staff was 47 years.

In the 2023-2024 academic year, the total teaching staff number was 1,173, including 984 full-time faculty and 189 part-time faculty. 119 faculty members held Doctors of Science, 319 - Candidates of Science, 26 – PhD and 84 - Master's degrees. The average age of the teaching staff was 47.5 years.

In the 2024-2025 academic year, the total teaching staff number was 1,129, including 679 full-time faculty and 450 part-time faculty. There were 139 Doctors of Science and 284 Candidates of Science. There were 29 PhD students and 164 master's students. The average age of the teaching staff was 44.5 years.

The experts were familiar with the university's Personnel Policy dated December 25, 2020, the Mentor Regulation dated April 25, 2025 and the Regulation on competitive filling of teaching staff and research staff positions dated April 29, 2022.

The "Pharmacy" educational programme has 67 teaching staff, including 61 full-time and 6 part-time faculty members. 28 hold an academic degree. The staffing rate for the "Pharmacy" EP is 91% and the academic degree holder rate is 42%.

To verify Standard 5 data, external experts obtained faculty opinions on the implementation of the HR policy, including consideration of aspects such as the effectiveness of recruitment, selection, motivation and development mechanisms, as well as the conditions for professional self-development within the educational programme.

A conversation with Verevkina Vera Ivanovna, Head of the Human Resources Department, covered topics related to teacher recruitment for the educational programme implementation, teaching staff motivation, advanced training mechanisms and the development of a talent pool. This conversation allowed the experts to gain a clear understanding of the university's human resources policy.

When selecting teaching staff, applicants' merits are considered, measured by qualifications, professional experience, research results, teaching achievements, recognition by the professional community and other important criteria. Priority is given to individuals with scientific and pedagogical, scientific and clinical experience who recognize the university's mission.

The university offers learning in Kazakh, Russian and English; 82% of faculty members teach in Kazakh. There are no hiring restrictions based on gender, race, nationality or language. The university's multinational workforce facilitates intercultural integration and creates a favorable educational environment for all participants.

Thus, the university's HR policy, developed in accordance with current documents - the HR Policy dated December 25, 2020 and the Regulation on competitive filling of teaching staff and research staff positions dated April 29, 2022 - ensures the development of a professionally strong faculty focused on achieving the university's mission. Departments have created conditions for the effective implementation of the educational process and are equipped with the necessary tools, equipment and facilities to achieve planned educational outcomes.

*A survey of teachers revealed that the majority (75.61%) were fully satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace at this educational institution, while 24.39% were partially satisfied. At this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in research and publish their R&D results - 78.05% completely agree, 19.51% - partially. 87.8% were fully satisfied with the work of the HR service - fully agree, 9.76% - partially. Satisfied with the salary: 51.22% completely agree, 17.07% - partially.*

## **5.2 Academic activities and professional ethics of teachers**

Experts note that the university has developed and is implementing an effective system of internal quality assurance of educational activities (Regulations of the NEE "KRMU" dated September 27, 2024), clearly regulating teacher responsibilities for the implementation of the educational programme, research and clinical activities and monitoring the implementation of individual plans.

At the beginning of each academic year, a staffing schedule is approved that ensures an optimal balance of teaching staff for the implementation of the educational programme: the teacher-to-student ratio is 1:6, the share of specialized (clinical) disciplines is at least 150 credits, which ensures an equal balance (1:1) with basic and behavioral/social disciplines. To improve the effectiveness of the educational process in 2021–2025, a total of 1,186 teachers successfully passed the competitive selection process (280 in the 2021–2022 academic year, 118 in 2022–2023, 331 in 2023–2024, and 457 in 2024–2025), which contributes to the development of a strong, balanced teaching staff to implement the programme.

The system ensures a clear definition of functional responsibilities, regular performance monitoring, motivation and continuous growth of faculty professional competencies in accordance with ESG requirements and the university's internal quality standards."

## **5.3 Continuing professional development of academic staff**

Experts note that the university implements a clear, systematic policy for teacher development and motivation, focused on fulfilling the university's mission and achieving its intended learning outcomes. To advance the training and develop the teaching competencies of teaching staff, the University implements tools such as the "Teacher's School" and an annual advanced training plan, implemented through short-term courses and internships at leading universities and medical

organizations. Thus, in 2022, 460 teachers completed training in the "Inclusive Education" programme; in 2024, 137 completed the Winter School; in 2025 - 55 completed the programme; and in April 2024, advanced training courses were held for staff and teachers in "Strategic Management in Education." Additionally, a training programme for teachers in modern educational technologies was implemented at the beginning of the 2024–2025 academic year.

To motivate staff, the University uses a system of moral and material incentives. Moral incentives include expressions of gratitude, awarding certificates of merit and nominations for state and departmental awards. Material incentives include bonuses for research, teaching and organizational performance, including publications in top-ranked journals and participation in conferences, congresses and symposia. These incentives are enshrined in the "Regulations on material incentives" dated August 25, 2023, approved by the University's Academic Board.

Since 2020, 8 teachers have been awarded the academic title of KRMU Professor, 17 have been awarded the title of KRMU Associate Professor and 10 have been awarded the title of Honorary Professor. Experts note the active participation of teachers in research: over the past three years, at least 65% of the teaching staff has presented papers annually at city, national and international conferences. The greatest effectiveness of the development and incentive policies is demonstrated by creating conditions for continuing advanced training, actively integrating employees into research and educational activities, implementing programmes to support young scientists and building a talent pool.

*The results of a teachers' survey conducted by an observer from the accreditation center revealed the following: the university offers opportunities for career growth and competency development for teachers: 85.37% of surveyed teachers strongly agreed, while 12.2% partially agreed. 85.37% had attended professional advanced training programmes during the current year, while 9.76% had attended programmes more than five years ago.*

*The university implements social support programmes for teachers: 56.1% responded "yes, such programmes exist", 9.76% responded "no", 31.71% were unaware and 2.44% responded "unsure."*

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 8 standards: 5 - fully, 3 - partially, 0 – not compliant.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) Develop and implement assessment criteria for teachers' performance (5.1.1).
- 2) Ensure the participation of teaching staff in academic mobility programmes, including international internships and exchanges (5.3.1).
- 3) Increase teacher publication activity in international indexed journals. Ensure the integration of teacher research findings into the curriculum of the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy". (5.3)

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Physical facilities for teaching and learning**

The University has sufficient physical facilities for the proper implementation of the educational programme in "Pharmacy". The educational institution is equipped with modern technical resources that support classroom instruction, independent student work and administrative and organizational functions. This includes computers, laptops, office equipment and other resources necessary for an effective educational process and information support for educational activities.

To implement the "Pharmacy" educational programme, the following facilities are used:

- classrooms with a total area of 868.8 m<sup>2</sup> (including classrooms with an area of 587.3 m<sup>2</sup>);
- 26 specialized classrooms;
- laboratories with an area of 44.6 m<sup>2</sup> and 70.1 m<sup>2</sup>;
- equipment and supplies valued at 8,466,199 tenge;
- 120 computers used in the educational process.

## 6.2 Resources for clinical learning

To implement the “Pharmacy” educational programme, the university has 9 internship facilities with which it has signed formal cooperation agreements. Of these, 8 facilities are specifically designed for internships in the accredited educational programme “Pharmacy.”

The facilities cover the retail and wholesale distribution of medicines and medical devices, manufacturing activities, storage and warehousing. All student training facilities are licensed and several production facilities are accredited:

- LLP “Sadykhan Social Pharmacy” - pharmaceutical license No.14002858 dated March 4, 2014, accredited according to Standard GPP.
- LLP “Low Price Pharmacy” - license No.1.2.245/61 issued by the Agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan for Regulation and Development of the Financial Market of the Republic of Kazakhstan, accredited according to Standard GPP.
- LLP “Medservice Plus” - license No.392 dated May 27, 2015; certificate of conformity for Standard GOST ISO 22000-2019, GDP, GMP (2021).
- LLP “INKAR” - License No.354 dated April 21, 2021, accredited according to Standard GDP.
- LLP “Fitoleum” - License No.18012719 dated June 26, 2018; Certificate of Conformity No.KZ 7100936.07.08098 dated June 24, 2011, GDP, GSP.
- LLP “AKNIET GROUP” - License No. PP65900264DX dated December 21, 2006, accredited according to Standard GDP.
- LLP “JNK PHARM” - License No. FD65003098DM, accredited according to Standard GPP.
- State-owned utility Enterprise on the right of Economic Management “The Institute of Botany and Phytointroduction” - does not have a license or accreditation for pharmaceutical activities.

Thus, all internship facilities in the “Pharmacy” educational programme except one are licensed for pharmaceutical activity and have confirmed accreditation according to professional standards (GPP, GDP, GMP, etc.). This ensures that the facilities meet the requirements for organizing students' practical training.

## 6.3 Medical research and scientific achievements

Student participation in research work at the university is voluntary. Organizational conditions have been created for this purpose: information about existing student research clubs and groups is posted on the university website, along with the contact information of the responsible faculty members. Students can voluntarily join such associations, demonstrating an interest in research. Winners of national and international student research conferences, olympiads and competitions receive support and encouragement from the university administration.

Since 2025, the university has been implementing programme BR27310319 “Development of preventive and rehabilitation programmes to improve the quality of life of the population in the post-COVID period,” funded by the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2025–2026). The project is being implemented with the active participation of teaching staff, researchers and clinicians. It covers all stages of scientific activity - from planning and conducting research to data analysis, publication preparation and the implementation of results in the educational process.

The university actively participates in research projects funded by government grants and conducts joint research with partner organizations in Kazakhstan, Russia, Belarus, Turkey and other countries. Teachers and students publish in journals indexed in Scopus, Web of Science and the Russian Science Citation Index (RSCI) and regularly present their research results at various conferences and competitions.

It is worth noting the participation of Kayupova Farida Yeleusizovna, Head of the Pharmacy Department and Associate Professor, PhD in Pharmaceutical Sciences, in the research project “Creation of a new domestic medicinal product from plant-based raw materials with complex actions—cholesterol, diuretic and anti-inflammatory effects.” This reflects the department's high level of scientific activity and the integration of the educational process with applied scientific research.

## 6.4 Information resources

The library collection used for the “Pharmacy” educational programme includes print and electronic publications. Students are provided with educational and methodological literature both at the department and in the library. According to data from the reporting period, the programme enrolled 4 students, with 196 visits per year and 512 books issued, 434 of which were textbooks. During the reporting period, the library received 140 copies of literature, including 120 textbooks.

The university provides access to modern international and national databases: Scopus and Science Direct (through a national subscription); Web of Science by Clarivate Analytics; the Russian IPRbooks electronic library system (under a license agreement); trial access to the BookUp database; and the Kazakhstan National Electronic Library (KazNEB).

The library has the ALLmaibook electronic library programme and is creating an electronic catalog. There is a scientific literature room featuring encyclopedias, dictionaries, works by teaching staff, periodicals and book exhibitions.

The information technology facilities include 40 computers with Wi-Fi internet access, scanners, printers, copiers and multifunction devices. All computers are equipped with the necessary software (Word, Adobe Reader, ABBYY FineReader, etc.).

During my visit to the university, I verified and confirmed the availability of access to Scopus and Web of Science databases, the functioning of the Moodle distance learning system and the use of these resources in the educational process.

## 6.5 Educational expertise

The university conducts a systematic expertise of educational programmes and educational research to improve the quality of education. The “Pharmacy” EP (NSMU) undergoes internal expertise twice a year with the participation of students, teachers and employers. The results of surveys, interviews and discussions at CEP meetings are used to adjust and update the programme, followed by approval and posting in the electronic registry.

Thematic analyses are conducted on student satisfaction with learning, the effectiveness of teaching methods, the quality of practical training and knowledge assessment methods (OSPE, mini-exams). International and domestic experience in medical education is taken into account.

To motivate teachers, a rewards system has been implemented: bonuses, reimbursement for expenses and participation in the "Best University Lecturer" competition, which facilitates the development of educational initiatives and the implementation of innovative methods.

During the visit, the availability of minutes of the CEP meetings, analytical reports on surveys, reviews of educational programmes and materials from thematic reviews was confirmed, demonstrating the use of expertise results to improve the quality of the educational programme.

## 6.6 Educational exchange

The Kazakh-Russian Medical University has significant opportunities to organize training for students at other institutions, including abroad. The University has concluded approximately 47 international agreements with medical universities and organizations in Belarus, Greece, Israel, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Russia and Turkey. Academic mobility programmes for students and teachers, internships, clinical rotations, summer schools and participation in international grants (including Erasmus+, Mevlana and intergovernmental agreements) are implemented.

Exchange mechanisms are regulated by internal documents: academic mobility is carried out on the basis of regulations, formalized by the rector's orders, and partial or full funding of travel expenses is provided.

During the visit, supporting materials were obtained: copies of international agreements, a mandate for participation in Erasmus+, reports on student and teacher participation in exchange programmes and internships and documents on the university's support in international rankings.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 18 standards, 16 - fully, 2 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

**Recommendations for improvement:**



1) To carry out additional equipment of the control and analytical laboratory of pharmaceutical chemistry and pharmacognosy, technology of dosage forms and equip it with modern equipment (6.1.1, 6.1.3)

## **Standard 7: QUALITY ASSURANCE**

### **7.1 Quality assurance system**

The university systematically and effectively monitors the quality of the “Pharmacy” educational programme. A continuous programme improvement cycle is implemented based on internal audits, employee and student satisfaction assessments and external procedures (accreditation, certification, independent assessments of graduates and employers). Based on the monitoring results, adjustments are made to the curriculum, links with clinical sites are strengthened, and the efficiency of the educational process is improved. The system ensures the programme's compliance with national standards and ESG requirements, as confirmed by self-assessment documents and external expertise results.

### **7.2 Programme monitoring and assessment mechanisms**

Based on the analysis of the monitoring and assessment of the quality of the “Pharmacy” educational programme (a double-degree programme with Novosibirsk State Medical University), it was found that the university has implemented a comprehensive system for assessing the programme's effectiveness, covering all key stages - from developing the content and selecting elective courses to verifying the achievement of learning outcomes. Quality assessments are regularly conducted through open classes, mutual visits, student and employer surveys and the involvement of external experts.

To improve the quality of education, a mechanism for selecting an individual trajectory (through the Elective Course Fair and advisor consultations) is used, and learning outcomes are assessed through midterm and final assessments, independent knowledge assessments, state examinations and graduate career monitoring. Based on the feedback received, adjustments are made to programme content, learning methods and assessments, and the connection with practical healthcare is strengthened.

Thus, the university has developed an effective system for monitoring and assessing the quality of the “Pharmacy” EP (a double-degree programme with Novosibirsk State Medical University), focused on the requirements of state standards, ESG and modern professional standards, which ensures continuing improvement of the programme and a high level of graduate training. **(ESG S1.7)**

### **7.3 Teacher and student feedback**

The committee reviewed the results of the focus group study among second-year students of the double-degree educational programme 6B10107 “Pharmacy” documented in Academic Council Minutes No.4 dated February 27, 2025, as well as the results of the student and teacher survey conducted as part of the midterm and final assessments in the 2024–2025 academic year.

The data obtained shows that students note the strategic importance of studying in two educational systems (“I chose this programme because I wanted more than just a diploma, but opportunities both in Kazakhstan and abroad”), the practical focus of the programme (“For me, the most important thing is the teaching system, a more practical approach, so that I can really understand how to work later”), the importance of an environment in which student opinions are taken into account (“I feel that we are not just learning, but developing along with the programme”), and the programme's ability to develop a broad, systemic understanding of the professional field (“I was attracted by the idea of studying simultaneously in two systems... We are beginning to compare, to think more deeply”).

At the same time, in their feedback, students identified a number of problems: the programme's overload (“...we are moving faster than we can learn”), the insufficient integration of individual modules from the two universities (“...it's as if we are learning two different approaches”), and the formal nature of the use of modern educational technologies (“...Moodle is used more as an archive than as a full-fledged tool”).

In their surveys, teachers also noted the importance of integrating the educational modules of the two universities to create a unified, logically connected learning structure, the need to increase the proportion of practical classes and develop modern simulators and the active use of case study technologies to develop applied skills. *They also emphasized the need to optimize the teaching load to enhance learning and increase student motivation.*

*The experts concluded that the university needs to ensure transparency regarding the impact of the surveys and questionnaires conducted with employers, students and teachers, which formed the basis for revising the mission and content of the educational programme.*

#### **7.4 Academic achievements of students and graduates**

The expert committee reviewed the results of educational programme 6B10107 - Pharmacy (a double-degree educational programme between KRMU and NSMU) in terms of developing professional and research competencies. The educational process is implemented in accordance with the stated mission of the programme: training highly qualified specialists in pharmacy to improve the quality of medical services and promote public health.

Special attention is paid to student research in the programme. Research projects are conducted in specialized departments under the guidance of academic advisors, the results of which are compiled into articles for publication in professional journals and presented as papers at scientific conferences at various levels. To develop scientific activity, the university has established and operates the “Student Scientific Society and the Council of Young Scientists”, the composition of which was approved by the rector's order dated September 16, 2024. Students are active members of these organizations, which fosters their ability to conduct independent scientific research, integrate acquired knowledge into professional practice and participate in the implementation of modern scientific projects in the field of pharmacy.

#### **7.5 Stakeholder engagement**

An expert analysis of the organization of monitoring and quality assessment of the educational programme at the Kazakh-Russian Medical University suggests that all key stakeholders are integrated into this important process. Its implementation is multi-level and transparent, ensuring the timely collection of reliable information for management decision-making.

The Dean's Office ensures operational oversight of programme implementation, reviews the results of midterm and final assessments, ensures learning conditions and implements mechanisms for receiving student feedback. At the department level, the content and results of individual courses are reviewed: student survey results, teacher feedback, the effectiveness of internship and final assessment methods - all of this is considered by the department council for prompt adjustments to the educational process. The Educational Programme Committee provides an integrated analysis of feedback from all participants in the educational process - students themselves, teachers, employers and representatives of professional organizations - and develops proposals for updating curricula and programmes.

The Faculty Council and the University Academic Council review strategically important programme implementation results - student satisfaction with learning conditions, the effectiveness of achieving the programme's mission and goals, and the results of the state final assessment. Recommendations from State Certification Commissions, the results of monitoring the quality of education and feedback from external experts - representatives of practical healthcare, professional organizations and authorized bodies in the fields of education and pharmacy - are also considered.

Particular attention is paid to the transparency and objectivity of programme quality assurance. To this end, representatives from the practice sector - specialists from pharmacy organizations and professional associations - are included in examination committees, ensuring that current industry requirements are taken into account. Additionally, feedback from employers and graduates is reviewed by the CEP council and serves as the basis for adjusting programme content, enhancing the effectiveness of practical training and improving learning and assessment technologies.

An online interview with 3 employers revealed a high level of employer engagement in the development of the educational programme. Employers demonstrated knowledge of the university's mission and participated in developing proposals for the strategic plan and the work of advisory

bodies. They expressed satisfaction with the level of students' basic knowledge and skills and emphasized the importance of mentoring and providing departments with the necessary resources for developing clinical thinking. However, certain issues in interaction with departments and the university as a whole were identified that require further improvement.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 12 standards: 11 - fully, 1 - partially, 0 - not complaint.

**Recommendation for improvement:**

- 1) Ensure transparency of the impact of the results of survey and questionnaires of employers, students and teachers, which formed the basis for revising the mission and content of the educational programme. (7.3)

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Governance**

The University is governed through a clearly defined organizational structure approved by Rector's Order No.5 dated December 27, 2024. Several collegial bodies participate in the governance of educational activities, including the Academic Board (AB), Academic Council (AC), the Scientific and Clinical Council (SCC) and the Local Ethics Commission (LEC). These bodies make key decisions on the organization of the educational process, including the accreditation of educational programmes.

The "Pharmacy" programme at NSMU is directly overseen by a faculty responsible for the implementation and quality of the educational programme. Those responsible for the programme operate within the university's internal regulatory system, including documents such as Rector's Order No.5 dated December 27, 2024, and adhere to approved plans and regulations, regularly updated at meetings of the Academic Board and Academic Council.

During the university visit, representatives of several divisions directly related to the quality of the educational programme were met, including the Academic Board and Academic Council, as well as the "Pharmacy" Faculty at NSMU. Information obtained during the meetings concerns internal quality assurance mechanisms, such as internal audits, student and teacher surveys, and regular updates of curricula and teaching materials.

The quality assurance process for the educational programme is carried out in accordance with internal regulations governing educational activities, including documents confirming the implementation and improvement of educational processes, such as orders, minutes of meetings of collegial bodies and official internal audit reports.

*In response to the survey question "Do the organization's management listen to your opinions regarding issues related to the educational process, R&D and clinical work?", 65.85% of teachers responded that they do so systematically, while 19.51%.*

### **8.2 Student and academic staff representation**

University students actively participate in key advisory bodies and working groups, such as the Academic Board, the Academic Council and the Educational Programmes Committee, as well as in various working groups. They participate in updating the catalog of elective disciplines, career fairs, employer visits and the analysis of examination sessions, which helps improve the educational programme.

Their participation is documented by the Rector's Order dated September 16, 2024, approving the composition of the Student Scientific Society and the Council of Young Scientists, which consolidates students' participation in the university's scientific and educational activities.

The students' role is to actively contribute to the development of educational programmes and to improving practical training, thereby ensuring timely changes that meet labor market requirements.

### **8.3 Administration**

The administration of educational activities and management of the accredited "Pharmacy"

educational programme (NSMU) at the University is organized through a comprehensive system of interaction and monitoring, which includes regular consultations, meetings and collaboration between various university divisions.

Responsibility for ensuring the quality of the educational programme rests with the leadership of the “Pharmacy” Faculty (NSMU), which actively collaborates with the university's departments, committees and academic councils. During visit to the educational institution, I personally witnessed a clear management structure, where each stage of the educational programme is monitored and analyzed with an eye to ensuring its quality.

The administrative process includes:

- Defining and analyzing educational goals and objectives consistent with the university's mission through the work of the Academic Council and the Academic Board.
- Coordinating the work of departments and divisions through regular meetings and reports, which allows for prompt response to changes and improvements to the content and structure of the educational programme.
- Monitoring student performance, which is analyzed at every level (from department to university), as well as engaging students in feedback through surveys and participation in research projects.
- Evaluating the performance of teachers and administrative support through the participation of teaching staff in university collegial bodies, which guarantees transparency and equality in the governance process.

Evidence of this process includes:

- Minutes of Academic Board and Academic Council meetings confirming key decisions on educational programme development.
- Reports and analyzes of the effectiveness of educational activities, which are regularly discussed at department meetings, as well as updates to curricula and programmes.
- Monitoring mechanisms, such as internal audits, analysis of student testing and assessments and employer feedback results.

#### **8.4 Learning budget and resource allocation**

Based on an analysis of the self-assessment report, a review of internal regulations and conversation with university management and financial divisions, the following has been established:

The university's financial and economic activities are regulated at a high organizational level. The Rector, the Director of the Financial Services Department and the Chief Accountant are responsible for budget formation and implementation. The budget is formed annually with the participation of the Budget Committee, taking into account department and faculty requests consistent with the strategic development plan.

Since the launch of the “Pharmacy” educational programme, positive trends in financial support have been noted. The University has allocated funds for: expanding access to scientific and educational databases; support for teaching staff, including additional payments for academic degrees (up to 50 MCI), for teaching in English (50% of salary) and for hazardous working conditions (6,636 tenge); salaries for external part-time workers (e.g., a professor—172,200 tenge for 0.5 of a full-time position); and the implementation of advanced training programmes.

Teaching staff salaries are determined based on regulatory documents and official salaries (from 240,000 to 420,000 tenge), taking into account their position, degree, rank and additional workload.

Funding comes from the national budget and tuition fees. Financial reporting is conducted in accordance with the Accounting Policy and the requirements of the regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Funding for the “Pharmacy” educational programme is sustainable, with positive trends in logistical support, teacher motivation and resource support.

#### **8.5 Interaction with the healthcare sector**

The university ensures a high level of practical training and integration of the educational programme into practical healthcare. Currently, a wide network of clinical facilities and professional

practice facilities is used to implement the “Pharmacy” educational programme (a double-degree programme with NSMU). Agreements have been concluded and updated with eight key organizations in the pharmacy, warehouse and manufacturing sectors in Almaty and the Almaty region for the 2024-2025 academic year.

These facilities include a major research and production center (“the Institute of Botany and Phytointroduction”), pharmacy chains (“Sadykhan Social Pharmacy” - 10 pharmacies, LLP “Low Price Pharmacy” - 8 pharmacies, LLP “AKNIET GROUP” - 10 pharmacies), warehousing and manufacturing enterprises (LLP “Medservice Plus” - 18 pharmacies and its own warehouse, LLP “INKAR” - warehouse space for the sale of medicines and medical devices, LLP “Fitoleum” - manufacturing) and pharmacy chains (“JNK PHARM” - 25 pharmacies).

All organizations possess the necessary documents to ensure the quality of practical training - valid licenses for medical and pharmaceutical activities, as well as certificates of compliance with GPP, GDP, GMP, GSP and GOST ISO 22000–2019 standards. Each facility is equipped with the necessary educational infrastructure - classrooms, lecture halls, cloakrooms and auxiliary spaces - to ensure the full development of practical skills.

From 2020-2021, the number of clinical and pharmacy sites increased from 85 to 127 in the 2024–2025 academic year, demonstrating the university's active work in developing partnerships and creating modern conditions for developing students' professional competencies.

Professional internship is a mandatory component of the educational programme and is implemented in accordance with Order No.4 of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 9, 2023. All agreements with clinical sites are updated annually by the Department of Professional Practice and Clinical Work to ensure compliance with stated standards and modern requirements.

***Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.*** Comply with 16 standards, 16 - fully, 0 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

An analysis of the strategic plan and plans of the divisions responsible for implementing the “Pharmacy” educational programme at NSMU revealed the presence of a systematic practice for continuing improvement of the educational programme. The programme was implemented in 2023 and, from the outset, has been focused on ensuring high-quality training of specialists, taking into account current trends in pharmaceutical education and healthcare reforms in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

To monitor and improve the educational process, the university implements a multi-level quality assessment system. These include tools such as individual teacher work plans, internal audits, surveys of students, teachers and employers, as well as institutional and specialized accreditations of educational programmes. All these mechanisms enable the timely identification and remediation of deficiencies, as well as the adjustment of the educational programme based on current requirements.

Significant changes have already been implemented since the educational programme's implementation in 2023. Specifically, the research component of the “Pharmacy” educational programme was strengthened, and the number and diversity of internship sites for students was increased, improving the quality of practical training. Regular curricular reviews and updates were also introduced, emphasizing a competency-based approach and interdisciplinary approach.

An important milestone was the conclusion of the Agreement with the Novosibirsk State Medical University on April 5, 2022, which opened up additional opportunities for joint educational activities, which in turn contributed to improving the quality of the programme and expanding professional contacts.

Thus, the “Pharmacy” educational programme (NSMU), implemented since 2023, has already demonstrated a systematic approach to improving the quality of education, a focus on the requirements of the modern pharmaceutical market and a commitment to training highly qualified specialists.

**Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria.** Comply with 3 standards, 3\_ - fully, 0 - partially, 0 - not compliant.

**Conclusion:** During the external assessment of the educational programme, full compliance with 118 accreditation standards was established out of 129. 11 standards were partially met. No non-compliance with standards was found.

The expert committee noted the following strengths of the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy":

1. Strategic alignment of the mission, goals and values of the "Pharmacy" educational programme with the mission of the university.
2. The programme structure is described in detail, including the forms of internships, assessment systems and electives.
3. Use of modern learning methods (TBL, PBL, OSCE, etc.).
4. Stakeholder participation in the development and revision of the "Pharmacy" educational program.
5. Admission, transfer and appeal mechanisms are described in detail, including the regulatory framework, quotas and conditions for individuals with disabilities.
6. The principle of openness and equal opportunities for admission to the university is implemented.
7. Accessibility of consulting and support services for students has been proven: advisors, mentors, curators, a psychologist and the Career Center. Forms of interaction with students through job fairs, career training and mentoring programmes are presented.
8. Sufficient resource provision for the educational programme: a simulation center, laboratories.
9. Availability of a multi-level risk management system.
10. Resource allocation is linked to the achievements and needs of the educational programme.
11. The university has developed and implemented a system for maintaining academic ethics.

**5. Recommendations for improving the double-degree educational programme "Pharmacy":**






<b>Standard</b>	<b>Implementation</b>	<b>Recommendation for improvement</b>
1.1.1	Partially implemented	Publish the educational programme's mission on the university website
2.3	Partially implemented	The educational programme's management should: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Ensure that the scope of the educational programme "Pharmacy," jointly implemented by KazRusmeduniversity and NSMU, complies with the requirements of Federal State Standards of Higher Education (FSSES HE) of Russia 33.05.01 Pharmacy.</li> <li>– Develop infographics: a diagram of the educational programme's structure, intended learning outcomes and discipline integration.</li> </ul>
2.9	Partially implemented	Documentary evidence of stakeholder participation, including representatives of Novosibirsk State Medical University, should be provided at all stages of the life cycle of the educational programme "Pharmacy": design, development, implementation, updating, assessment and improvement.
3.4	Partially implemented	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Ensure evidence-based validity and reliability of assessment methods used in the educational process.</li> <li>– Develop digital transformation in assessment and learning support.</li> </ul>
4.1.1	Partially implemented	Expand the student body for the double-degree educational programme in "Pharmacy" using various approaches, including career guidance.
5.1.1	Partially implemented	Develop and implement assessment criteria for teacher performance.
5.3.1	Partially implemented	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ensure the participation of teaching staff in academic mobility programmes, including international internships and exchanges.</li> <li>- Implement a mechanism for assessing the effectiveness of teacher advanced training.</li> </ul>
5.3	Partially implemented	Increase teacher publication activity in international indexed journals. Ensure the integration of teacher research findings into the educational process for the double-degree educational programme in "Pharmacy".
6.1.1 6.1.3	Partially implemented	To carry out additional equipment of the control and analytical laboratory of pharmaceutical chemistry and pharmacognosy, technology of dosage forms and equip it with modern equipment
7.3	Partially implemented	Ensure transparency regarding the impact of the results of survey and questionnaires from employers, students and teachers, which formed the basis for revising the mission and content of the educational programme.

## 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members determined that the double-degree educational programme 6B10107 "Pharmacy" complies with the Accreditation Standards and unanimously recommended that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairperson	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeyevna	/signed/
International expert	Syunov Nizom Davurovich	/signed/
International expert	Oleinikova Tatyana Anatolyevna	/signed/
Academic expert	Mirzabayev Marat Zhumabekovich	/signed/
Academic expert	Boshkayeva Assyl Kenessovna	/signed/
Academic expert	Almabayeva Aigul Ydyryssovna	/signed/
Academic expert	Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna	/signed/
Academic expert	Babayeva Gulzhan Sairanbekkyzy	/signed/
Expert-employer	Saltayev Aidar Amantayevich	/signed/
Expert-master's student	Bozhbanbayeva Guzel Zharassovna	/signed/
Expert-student	Abdrasil Amina Asilbekkyzy	/signed/



	<b>ФИО</b>	<b>Подпись</b>
Председатель	Ермуханова Людмила Сергеевна	
Международный эксперт	Суюнов Низом Давурович	
Международный эксперт	Олейникова Татьяна Анатольевна	
Академический эксперт	Мирзабаев Марат Жумабекович	
Академический эксперт	Бошкаева Асыл Кенесовна	
Академический эксперт	Алмабаева Айгуль Ыдырысовна	
Академический эксперт	Алдабергенова Тауржан Калибековна	
Академический эксперт	Бабаева Гульжан Сайранбеккызы	
Эксперт-работодатель	Салтаев Айдар Амантаевич	
Эксперт-магистрант	Божбанбаева Гузель Жарасовна	
Эксперт-студент	Абдрасил Амина Асилбеккызы	

**Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки двудипломной образовательной программы «Фармация» (обобщение)**

Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	Оценка		
			Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	<b>МИССИЯ И ЦЕННОСТИ</b>	8	7	1	
2.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА</b>	36	34	2	
3.	<b>ОЦЕНКА СТУДЕНТОВ</b>	13	12	1	
4.	<b>СТУДЕНТЫ</b>	15	13	2	
5.	<b>АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ</b>	8	5	3	
6.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ</b>	18	16	2	
7.	<b>ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЕ КАЧЕСТВА</b>	12	12		
8.	<b>УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ</b>	16	16		
9.	<b>НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ</b>	3	3		
	<b>Итого:</b>	<b>129</b>	<b>118</b>	<b>11</b>	

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК во время визита в организацию

№	Наименования документов	Количество	Дата утверждение
1.	Политика в области качества НУО «Казахстанско-Российский медицинский университет»	1	26.01.2025
2.	Кодекс чести преподавателя	1	12.12.2017
3.	Образовательная программа 6В10107 «Фармация» (двудипломная программа с НГМУ)	1	19.08.2022
4.	Методы обучения в медицинском университете	1	26.08.2021
5.	Положение о тестовом комитете	1	28.10.2021
6.	Методы оценки в медицинском университете	1	26.08.2021
7.	Положение о проведении текущего контроля успеваемости, промежуточной и итоговой аттестации обучающихся	1	27.08.2021
8.	Положение о социальной поддержке обучающихся	1	21.06.2019
9.	Договор о совместной образовательной деятельности между НГМУ и КРМУ	1	05.04.2022
10.	Приказ об утверждении состава студенческого научного общества и совета молодых ученых	1	16.09.2024
11.	Дорожная карта новая регуляторная Политика «С Чистого Листа» для кафедры Фармации	1	
12.	Положение о материальном стимулировании	1	25.08.2023
13.	Протоколы рассмотрения миссии		15.08.2022
14.	Протоколы рассмотрения ОП от кафедры Фармации	1	12.08.2022
15.	План заседаний КОП	1	28.08.2024
16.	Список ППС по ОП «Фармация» (двудипломная программа с НГМУ)	1	
17.	Рабочий учебный план	1	
18.	Состав Академического Совета	1	12.09.2024
19.	План мероприятий по содействию трудоустройству выпускников	1	01.09.2024
20.	Квалификационные характеристики должностей ППС	1	23.08.2024
21.	Положение о Комитете образовательных программ	1	06.12.2021
22.	Положение об Академическом совете	1	06.12.2021
23.	Положение о кафедре	1	27.09.2024
24.	Положение о внутреннем обеспечении качества образовательной деятельности НУО КРМУ	1	27.09.2024
25.	Академическая политика	1	24.08.2024
26.	Положение о порядке разработки, утверждении и экспертизе образовательных программ	1	30.06.2023
27.	Оценка образовательного опыта студентов, Результаты фокус-группового исследования	1	27.02.2025

28.	Кадровая политика	1	25.12.2020
29.	Положение о конкурсе на замещение должностей профессорско-преподавательского состава	1	29.04.2022
30.	Правила приема в бакалавриат	1	28.06.2024

ЕСАРА