

## **ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME**

### **EXPERT REPORT**

**HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION: Tartu Health Care College**

<b>STUDY PROGRAMME GROUP</b>	<b>Healthcare</b>
<b>ACADEMIC CYCLE</b>	<b>Master's level</b>
<b>JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME WITH KLAIPEDA UNIVERSITY</b>	<b>Radiography</b>

#### **COMPOSITION OF ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE:**

**Liis Rooväli** – Chair of the panel; Lecturer of Health Care Management, Institute of Family Medicine and Public Health, University of Tartu, Estonia  
**Kent Fridell** – Lecturer, Head of Section and Programme Director of Radiography, Karolinska Institute, Sweden  
**Genny Sandon** – Programme Leader for MSc Radiography, Faculty of Health, Education and Life Sciences, Birmingham City University, UK

**PERIOD OF EVALUATION: April – June 2017; assessment visit on 27 April 2017**

**DATE ASSESSMENT REPORT SENT TO INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 12 May 2017**

**DATE COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM INSTITUTION UNDER EVALUATION: 18 May 2017**

**ASSESSMENT BY ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE: THE QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION PARTIALLY CONFORMS TO A REQUIRED STANDARD**

**EXPERT REPORT SUBMITTED: 22 May 2017**

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

### SUMMARY ASSESSMENT OF EXPERT COMMITTEE:

The joint MSc study programme of Radiography complies with requirements and standards of Master level studies, the studies established for joint programmes, and the quality of studies provided in § 6 of the Standard of Higher Education.

There is a need and wide support for opening the Master level studies in Radiography. The programme is needed to give specialisation in the rapidly developing area of radiography, to enhance the professional career of radiographers, to build a sufficient pool of radiography-trained teaching staff for Tartu Health Care College (THCC), to ensure good standard of management skills within the radiography profession and – most of all – to provide a body of research in radiography. All necessary partners were involved in the development of the programme.

There is an excellent body of part-time lecturers to launch and deliver the programme. Lecturers have extensive research experience. There are excellent resources available at both partner institutions. Both institutions have sufficient rooms and infrastructure for the studies. The studies are financed via tuition fee paid by the students; the Erasmus funds are expected to be applied for mobility scheme.

However, several points in the Consortium Agreement should be clarified and THCC should consider the recommendations below in order to further develop the joint programme.

#### Recommendations for further development of the programme:

- To interview applicants in English.
- To consider part-time delivery of study.
- To develop a detailed logistics for internship placements.
- Tartu Health Care College should take into account the recommendations listed in the evaluation report of the professional higher education programme of Radiography, which was evaluated in 2016.
- Confirmation of the procedure of prior learning and work experience in the University of Klaipeda.
- To produce a document about advisory and support systems concerning learning and teaching in partner institution.
- To agree details of procedures for solving disputes at partner institutions.
- The partner institutions should agree on a procedure for the external evaluation of the joint study programme.
- More consideration should be given to additional support from other staff in order to guarantee sufficient research topics and to provide sufficient number of supervisors of Master's thesis. As the MSc programme is reliant on tuition fees and the possible pool of Baltic students reaches saturation point in the future, the overall future marketing of the programme is important.

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

### 1. Study programme

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE COLLECTED	COMMENTS
The joint study programme is based on the needs of the labour market and the target group and promotes the fulfilment of the mission and achievement of the goals of the partner universities in the joint study programme.	Study programme; development plan of educational institution; notes to assessed study programme; meeting with the management, employers and cooperation partners, and leaders and developers of the study programme	<p>In preparation for the development of the MSc Radiography programme surveys were carried out in three Baltic countries to identify the need for Master level education amongst radiography students, alumni and the employers. All three groups that were surveyed expressed the need to provide Master level education in radiography, preferably combining Master studies with narrow specialisation (ultrasound, nuclear medicine, magnetic resonance imaging, computed tomography, radiation therapy, conventional radiography). Currently, there is no Master level programme in radiography in the Baltic States. Thus, as the field of radiography is rapidly developing there is a need for specialisation and professional development and bringing the radiography profession into line with other countries such as the UK.</p> <p>The Estonian Society of Radiographers has presented a support letter specifying the need for Master programme after the in-service specialisation training project “Preparation and implementation of the curriculum for specialist training of radiographers in three areas at Tartu Health Care College in 2009-2011”. A support letter has also been provided by the Lithuanian Society of Radiographers. Within this project a one-year specialisation curriculum for radiographers was developed jointly by the college and hospitals and performed in three areas (ultrasound, radiotherapy, and nuclear medicine). All large hospitals supported the project, 45 radiographers completed it. There is a continuous need for specialisation not only in those areas, but in all radiography modalities and graduates are motivated to achieve Master level education as part of professional development.</p>

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

		<p>The development plan of the College for 2015-2020 has set a goal to launch international Master programmes (radiography being the first one) for 2018 and admit students in 2019. The College has considered the need for a rector with a PhD degree; a new rector was recruited in 2016 and also part time staff with PhD degree has been hired.</p> <p>The College is applying for opening this Master's programme as a joint programme with Klaipeda University in Lithuania.</p>
	Study programme	The name of the programme is appropriate and corresponds to its content.
The joint programme has been developed by all institutions of higher education, which are also involved in its further development. The partner universities have defined the responsibility of the parties in the further development of the study programme.	Consortium agreement, meeting with developers of the study programme from partner universities	<p>There were 3 partner institutions involved in the development of the joint programme. The University of Latvia left the consortium, but still provides teaching staff for the programme. There is no confirmation for future development of the programme in the consortium agreement; however, the developers of the programme expressed willingness to evaluate and develop the programme further according to the need. Not all specialities will be open in the first year; the development of those modules is in process.</p> <p>In the further development of the programme the College should implement the recommendations listed in the evaluation report of the professional higher education programme of Radiography (especially those related with personal tutorship, students feedback, specialist teaching resources and equipment, clinical placements and supervision, dropouts), which was evaluated in 2016.</p>
Employers and other groups connected to the study programme group were involved in developing the joint study programme and their further contribution to the development of the study programme has been ensured.	Meeting with developers of the study programme, incl. employers	Part of the programme was developed during the in-service specialisation training project "Preparation and implementation of the curriculum for specialist training of radiographers in three areas at Tartu Health Care College in 2009-2011" jointly by the College and employers. Employers and the Estonian Society of Radiographers were also involved in developing the current Master programme; the first draft was prepared by

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

		the College and sent for comments to the stakeholders. The further development of the programme is expected to be according to the regulation of the College through the Curriculum Board.
The goals and learning outcomes of the joint study programme are equal and comparable to the learning outcomes of the levels of higher education described in annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education.	Study programme; annex 1 of the Standard of Higher Education; analysis of educational institution regarding conformity of learning outcomes to the Standard of Higher Education, meeting with developers of the programme	All goals and learning outcomes of the joint study programme are equal and comparable to the learning outcomes of the Standard of Higher Education. However, the outcome <i>“Be willing to actively participate in civil society and demonstrate tolerance towards the diversity of attitudes and values”</i> is not explicitly defined in the programme. Developers of the programme explained that tolerance towards the diversity of attitudes and values would be developed via internship module when students interact with colleagues and patients. Participation in civil society will be achieved by providing community services by the students, e.g., giving lectures about breast cancer to the population.
Forms of study and the content and volume of independent and practical work (incl. practical work) support the achievement of the goals of the joint study programme.	Study programme; syllabi of Ultrasound, Computed Tomography, and master thesis; meeting with developers of the programme and teachers	<p>Learning objectives for all the modules are clearly defined and are consistent with EQF level 7 descriptors. The forms of study support the achievement of the goals of the joint study programme.</p> <p>There is evidence of available support from both Estonian and Lithuanian institutions for the supervision of the Master’s theses for students. Consideration has been given to the number of supervisees needed.</p> <p>The learning outcomes all appear to encourage independent and autonomous practice. With regard to the learning outcome <i>“be able to communicate his/her conclusions, and the knowledge and rationale underpinning these conclusions, to specialist and non-specialist audiences clearly and unambiguously”</i> the course documentation should make it explicit that the learning outcomes of the specialist module in Ultrasound does not qualify the successful student to write or issue medical reports of the ultrasound examination. In order to support the ultrasound specialist module student further consideration could be given to develop and offer in the future a core module of advanced professional practice. The Estonian Society of Radiographers and the Estonian Society</p>

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

		<p>of Radiologists should negotiate and agree the issue first.</p> <p>With regard to the specialist modules there is a generic description of the final assessments and the programme study guide would benefit from further details of each specific element of assessment. For example, is the exam an OSCE, a written examination, a portfolio of evidence. Further details of practical assessments are required. For example, how many cases and what is the marking criteria of these assessments. Grading is clearly stated in the course documentation.</p> <p>There is evidence of support for practical work from both Estonia and Lithuania hospitals and clinics. Clinical supervising staff with expertise in radiotherapy, magnetic resonance imaging, conventional radiography, ultrasound, computed tomography, interventional radiography, angiography and nuclear medicine have been identified and are supported by both institutions. It should be acknowledged that these supervisors may be radiologists or radiographers dependent on the chosen modality. Therefore careful consideration should be given to the allocation of practical internships to ensure there is sufficient supervision as some modalities can only accommodate small numbers of students.</p> <p>The language of instruction is English. Consideration has been given to supporting students whilst on practical studies outside their home country. Both higher education institutions have extensive experience of exchange students, so they do not anticipate any language problems during practical studies. In addition to the entry requirements of English language, interviewing of applicants is advised to ensure students are sufficiently proficient in academic writing in English.</p> <p>The MSc programme is a full-time study programme for 2 years. However, in the study carried out in the preparatory phase of the development of the curricula, many respondents indicated their</p>
--	--	---

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

		<p>preference to part-time study. The delivery of a part time form of study in the future should be considered as this would encourage applicants from employed radiographers and would make the programme more affordable. This is the preferred form of study for the UK and other countries who deliver MSc radiography programmes. The College gave feedback to the draft evaluation report promising that the suitability of part-time study will be decided upon after the collection of evidence at the end of the first academic year and based on the experience of other Master programmes.</p>
<p>The joint study programme conforms to the requirements and directions of national and international legislation regulating the profession, and if there is a professional standard, takes into account the obtaining and application of knowledge and skills described in the standard.</p>	<p>Study programme; international legislation regulating specialty; occupational standard of Radiographer (Level 7 of European Qualifications Framework); meeting with developers of study programme</p>	<p>The MSc programme corresponds to level 7 of the national and European Qualifications Framework, and it takes into account the Professional Standard for Radiographers at level 7.</p>
<p><b>SUMMARY ASSESSMENT OF EXPERT COMMITTEE ON STUDY PROGRAMME (areas for improvement):</b></p> <p>There is wide support and need to open the MSc studies in Radiography. All relevant partners were involved in the development of the programme. The programme meets the requirements of the learning outcomes of the Standard of Higher Education, national and international professional standards, corresponding to level 7 of Qualifications Framework. The learning outcomes all appear to encourage independent and autonomous practice. The programme is needed to give specialisation in the rapidly developing area of radiography, to enhance the professional career of radiographers, to build a sufficient pool of radiography-trained teaching staff to the College, and most of all, to provide a body of research in radiography.</p> <p>The study programme, in general, meets the required standards. However, the College should consider the following recommendations when developing the programme further:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To interview applicants in English.</li> <li>• To consider part-time delivery of study.</li> <li>• In the further development of the programme the College should implement the recommendations listed in the evaluation report which also included the professional higher education Radiography programme.</li> </ul>		

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

### 2. Organisation of studies

<p>A significant part of the joint study programme is conducted at another institution of higher education participating in the joint study programme in the extent agreed in the cooperation contract of the joint study programme, wherein studying in all forms of study is deemed studying at the other institution of higher education participating in the joint study programme, and the significant part must form at least 20% of the volume of the joint study programme.</p>	<p>Consortium agreement</p>	<p>The joint Master's programme in Radiography complies with the requirements of at least 20% of the volume of studies at the other institution.</p> <p>However, the consortium agreement states that students participating in the programme shall perform at least 25% (30 ECTS credits) of their total study load in Partner Institutions according to the mobility scheme (II Organisation of studies point 7). The mobility scheme (Annex 2) in the consortium agreement clearly identifies a timetable of studies and the country in which the studies are conducted. However, it identifies the Estonian students are required to study in Lithuania only 26 ECTS credits. The College presented with the feedback to the draft evaluation report the corrected mobility scheme (Annex 2): according to the scheme, Estonian students study 32 ECTS in Lithuania. Comparing to previous version of mobility scheme all students will pass their elective subject courses in Klaipeda University during the last 4 weeks of the first semester.</p>
<p>If part of the joint study programme is conducted at an institution of higher education in a foreign country, the parts of the joint study programme conducted in various countries must conform to the relevant requirements of those countries.</p>	<p>Meeting with managers and developers of the programme</p>	<p>The developers of the joint programme confirmed that the programme conforms to the requirements of both countries.</p>
<p>The organisation of studies of the joint study programme is regulated and takes the specificity of the joint study programme into account, incl. regulating the transfer of studies and taking into</p>	<p>Documents regulating organisation of studies; procedure for taking into consideration previous studies and work experience; meeting</p>	<p>The consortium agreement states that Tartu Health Care College has a procedure for recognition of prior learning and work experience that can be used (Annex 4). Klaipeda University has a similar procedure for accreditation of previous educational learning. Confirmation of a joint procedure is required. The College explained with the feedback to the</p>



## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

consideration previous studies and work experience.	with lecturers	draft evaluation report that a joint procedure for recognition of prior learning and work experience is currently being developed and will be completed and involved in the Student Guide before the first admission.
The rights and obligations of students and lecturers from the educational institutions participating in the joint study programme are clearly defined.	Consortium agreement, meeting with teachers	Student rights and responsibilities are the same as those valid for each degree student in the partner institution where the student is studying at the time. Rights and responsibilities of the teaching staff are the same as those valid for any teaching staff member in the partner institution where the teaching takes place.
Students studying in the joint study programme are provided with advisory and support systems concerning learning and teaching in different institutions of higher education.	Meeting with developers of study programme	Following discussions with the developers of the study programme it was evident that there exists support for students. Students returning from academic leave may need to wait an additional year to perform the mobility scheme, as not all specialities are performed every year. Generally, personal study programmes would be developed to persons returning the academic leave for those whose speciality is not running at the moment. There is the provision of student counsellors and in addition there was discussion about the provision of study skills support for students who may enrol on the MSc radiography programme but who had not been involved in higher education studies for some time. Advisory and support systems are not identified specifically within any written document. The College explained with the feedback to the draft evaluation that the implementation of tutoring was also recommended in the evaluation report in 2016, the tutoring system and the preparation of tutors in the College is currently being prepared and will be implemented in the academic year 2018/19.

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

The cooperation contract clearly sets out the procedure for resolving disputes concerning the execution of the joint study programme, which ensures the protection of the rights of students and lecturers.	Consortium agreement	In cases of disputes, these are resolved by the partner institution where the dispute occurred, following the normal procedures of that partner institution. The details of these procedures are not specifically identified in the consortium agreement. The College explained with the feedback to the draft evaluation report that lawyers are currently preparing amendments and supplements to the consortium agreement with regard to settlement of disputes. These additions will be completed before the first admission.
The partner institutions of higher education have agreed on how to seek feedback from students studying in the joint study programme regarding the organisation and process of studies, who is responsible for analysing the results and how improvements are planned.	Meeting with management team	Following discussions with the management team there was evidence that a regular system for students to submit feedback both during and at the end of the delivery of the programme exists. Normal procedures of student and staff feedback meetings were in place as for the undergraduate radiography programme.
The partner institutions of higher education in the joint study programme have agreed on a procedure for the external evaluation of the joint study programme, which takes into consideration the requirements for external evaluation of participating countries, including taking into consideration the need to participate in the external evaluation of a foreign country.	Meeting with the programme developers	There is no written agreed procedure for external evaluation of the joint study programme, but representatives of both institutions expressed their consent and willingness to provide all necessary information and documents to participate in external evaluation of the partner institution.
<b>SUMMARY ASSESSMENT OF EXPERT COMMITTEE ON ORGANISATION OF STUDIES (areas for improvement):</b>  The study programme partially complies with requirements and standards of master studies and studies established for joint programmes.  <u>Recommendations:</u>		

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

- Confirmation of the procedure of prior learning and work experience in the University of Klaipeda.
- To produce a document about advisory and support systems concerning learning and teaching in partner institution.
- To agree details of procedures for solving disputes at partner institutions.
- The partner institutions should agree on a procedure for the external evaluation of the joint study programme.

### 3. Lecturers

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE COLLECTED	COMMENTS
The qualifications of lecturers and researchers participating in the joint study programme conform to the requirements established in legislation and arising from the specificity of studies at the level of higher education.	Information concerning lecturers involved, CVs, Estonian Research Information System (ERIS)	All the staff CVs that were submitted show extensive research experience and are impressive. There is a lack of lecturers who are qualified radiographers, which may be a concern – in particular for the specialist modalities modules. However, there has been no opportunity as yet for radiographers trained in Estonia to further their professional education within radiography with post graduate studies, and this will be addressed following the successful MSc radiography programme.
The level and volume of research and development activities of participating lecturers and researchers is sufficient for conducting studies and instructing research in studies at the corresponding level of higher education.	Information concerning research and development activities of lecturers (ERIS or additional information provided by institution of higher education)	There is extensive research experience identified in the CVs of the staff included in this documentation. Participating lecturers and researchers are also active in areas of research activity and teaching.
The number of regular lecturers and researchers in the partner institutions of higher education in the joint study programme is sufficient in terms of their tasks, the volume of studies to be conducted and the number of students under their instruction to achieve the	Information concerning qualifications and research and development activities of lecturers involved, meeting with management, developers and teachers	It is anticipated that student admissions will be between 36 and 42 students per academic year. There are 10 part-time lecturers supporting this programme and this is sufficient for the delivery of the taught elements. This includes lecturers from the University of Latvia who will contribute to the MSc programme. Students can perform internship in their home countries. Instructions, requirements and training for clinical supervisors of the internship would

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

goals of the study programme(s) of the corresponding study programme group and to achieve the learning outcomes.		<p>be developed like it is currently with the undergraduate programme in THCC. The College explained with the feedback to the draft evaluation report that training for clinical supervisors of the internship at THCC is currently consisting of 3 modules: basic training, feedback and assessment and cross-cultural issues regarding internship. Trainers of the THCC are ready to carry out this training in English and they are willing to develop the training programme by adding the component of Master level internship. The proposal has been made to Klaipeda University to run the training programme also in their institution.</p> <p>For the Master's thesis the College allows the use of supervisors from the student's home country. However, the College has to ensure that all students will get an appropriate research topic and receive sufficient amount of supervision.</p> <p>More consideration should be given to additional support from other university staff in order to guarantee sufficient research topics and to provide sufficient number of supervisors of Master's thesis.</p>
The lecturers involved are aware of the goals of the joint study programme and of their role in achieving these goals.	Meeting with teachers	<p>There is evidence that the lecturers involved in the proposed MSc radiography programme are very supportive of the programme and have been actively campaigning for this radiographic progression in education for some time. The lecturers are aware of the goals of the programme and their role within it. The lecturers are not radiography professionals but are experts in their fields of education. These lecturers recognise the need for MSc qualified radiographers to not only support future teaching at Tartu Health Care College and Klaipeda University, but also to promote the professional career of Radiographers in Estonia, Lithuania and other countries.</p>
<p><b>SUMMARY ASSESSMENT OF EXPERT COMMITTEE ON LECTURERS (areas for improvement):</b></p> <p>There is an excellent body of part-time lecturers to launch and deliver the programme. Lecturers have extensive research experience. All lecturers are aware of the goals of the programme and their role within it. The lecturers are not radiography professionals but are experts in their fields of education.</p>		

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

### Recommendations:

- Instructions, requirements and training for clinical supervisors of the internship should be developed.
- More consideration should be given to additional support from other university staff in order to guarantee sufficient research topics and to provide sufficient number of supervisors of Master's thesis.

### 4. Resources

REQUIREMENTS	EVIDENCE COLLECTED	COMMENTS
The partner institutions of higher education in the joint study programme ensure the funds necessary to conduct studies. The financial indicators describing the economic sustainability of the institutions are available to the public.	Consortium agreement, Financial information; meeting with management, employers	<p>The studies are financed through tuition fees paid by the students (€ 4,440 per year), which is a quite high fee for Baltic students. The group would not be admitted if there would be less than 36 students. The employers expressed the willingness to support students partially or fully to pay the fee (as with previous in-service training). The interest to participate in the programme, at least during the first years, is very high. The programme is open not only to admit students from Baltic states, but also from EU and third countries (i.e. from Iceland, Ukraine, Russia but the whole world is open).</p> <p>The compulsory mobility costs are not covered by tuition fee. This should be covered by students, and the use of Erasmus funds is expected here. The Ministry of Education and Research has provided special funds via ASTRA project to the College to support the opening of the programme, which means that during first years the College will manage also with fewer number of students.</p> <p>Financial information of the THCC is provided and available.</p>
The partner institutions of higher education in the joint study programme have the necessary rooms for studies and research and development activities (lecture halls, laboratories, seminar rooms and rooms for the independent	Supporting documents about Facilities and resources of University of Klaipeda and infrastructure of THCC provided by institutions, tour in the Tartu Health Care College, meeting	Both partner institutions have necessary rooms and infrastructure for studies, research and development activities as well as access to online scientific literature. Both institutions have a dormitory for students. The College has some initial idea for internship places (mainly in home countries); however, there is no clear detailed logistics developed for that, which is crucial at least for narrow specialities provided in the limited

## ASSESSMENT OF JOINT STUDY PROGRAMME

work of students), the furnishings and equipment in which are sufficient and modern enough to achieve the goals of the study programmes, or specific funding decisions/projects exist to cover additional needs.	with developers	hospitals available. Together with feedback on the draft evaluation report, the College presented Annex 4 “Logistics of internship places”, which demonstrated how many students will be sent to internship in Estonian and Lithuanian hospitals. The details of the list still do not give any deeper understanding how 3 or 4 persons would be managed within a narrow sub-speciality.
<p><b>SUMMARY ASSESSMENT OF EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESOURCES (areas for improvement):</b></p> <p>There are excellent resources available at both partner institutions. Both institutions have sufficient rooms and infrastructure for the studies. The studies are financed via tuition fee paid by the students, and the Erasmus funds are expected to be applied for mobility scheme.</p> <p><u>Recommendations:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To develop a detailed logistics for internship placements.</li> <li>• As the MSc programme is reliant on tuition fees and the possible pool of Baltic students reaches saturation point in the future, the overall future marketing of the programme is important.</li> </ul>		