

ESTONIAN QUALITY AGENCY FOR HIGHER AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

Assessment Report on Meeting the Requirements of the Secondary Condition

Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences

Study programme group of Business and Administration

Table of contents

Introduction	3
General progress report since last assessment of study programme group	1
Report on meeting the requirements of the secondary condition, Estonian Entrepreneurship	
University of Applied Sciences	
5	

Introduction

Background. Aim of the assessment

Quality assessment of a study programme group involves the assessment of the conformity of study programmes and the studies and development activities that take place on their basis to legislation, national and international standards and developmental directions with the purpose of providing recommendations to improve the quality of studies.

The goal of quality assessment of a study programme group is supporting the internal evaluation and self-development of the institution of higher education. Quality assessment of study programme groups is not followed by sanctions: expert assessments should be considered recommendations.

Quality assessment of a study programme group takes place at least once every 7 years based on the regulation approved by EKKA Quality Assessment Council for Higher Education Quality Assessment of Study Programme Groups in the First and Second Cycles of Higher Education.

In 2017, international expert panel assessed the quality of the study programme group of Business and Administration at the Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences (EEK Mainor hereinafter). As a result, EKKA Quality Assessment Council for Higher Education decided at its meeting on June 12, 2017, that the next assessment is to take place in seven years if the HEI meets certain requirements set by the Council.

The aim of the current assessment committee was to evaluate whether the requirements (secondary condition) set by the Quality Assessment Council for Higher Education have been met by the EEK Mainor.

The following persons formed the assessment team:

Anne Perkiö	Head of Business Administration Programme, Metropolia
	University of Applied Sciences (Finland)
Markus Breuer	Professor, SRH University Heidelberg (Germany)

Assessment process

The higher education institution sent its self-evaluation report on fulfillment of the secondary conditions to EKKA on June 14, 2019.

The members of the assessment committee wrote the report based on the written materials presented by the university and the information obtained in the interviews at site visit that took place (December 10).

In the following sections, the assessment committee summarises their findings regarding the fulfillment of the secondary condition, and provides feedback on the progress the HEI has made in connection with experts' recommendations made in their report in 2017.

The current report is a public document and made available on <u>EKKA website</u> after EKKA quality assessment Council has made its decision.

General progress report since last assessment of study programme group

General assessment of the actions taken by the Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences with regard to improvement areas presented in the EKKA Council 12.06.2017 decision.

Comments

1) It is necessary to develop strategies to address an existing demographic situation and a related decline in potential student numbers.

At the moment, the number of students is about 1,600 and according to the strategy of EUAS they are aiming at a total number of 1,800 students. Increasing student numbers are not common in Estonia. Thus, EUAS is not only benefitting from an overall increase in the demand for higher education but seems to be more attractive to students than other universities.

EUAS has addressed the challenges of the demographic situation and based on the report and the site visit it can be stated that the admission numbers have increased and seem to be increasing in the future according to the strategy of EUAS. The increase is based on the new study programmes conducted in English and Russian. Offering programmes with tuition in Russian seem to be a niche for EUAS. The possibility to study and work at the same time attracts students. The students reported that they appreciate the flexibility EUAS offers with individual study plans. An increase in the number of international students is a reality. EUAS also focuses on processing the applications promptly. Marketing efforts have been increased by employing a person responsible for marketing and EUAS also partners with Study in Estonia.

2) Pedagogical development of the teaching staff must be strengthened in order to implement outcome-based learning in practice.

Centre for Excellence in Learning and Teaching (CELT) is an in-house unit offering training and mentoring for staff members. There are three full time employees in CELT: the Head of CELT, the Educational Technologist and the Learning Designer. CELT has implemented a semi-compulsory introductory course for new staff members and they also offer a variety of pedagogical courses for teachers and lecturers. The materials and introduction presented to the panel stated that the Centre offers basic training for lecturers, training on methodology, workshops, support in developing digital competences, consulting, mentoring, training for supervisors and peer feedback program. One-to-one sessions are provided e.g. to support the digital competences of lecturers. These topics in training were mentioned by the staff during the on-site visit: cross cultural issues, teaching methods, outcome-based learning, mentoring foreign students, how to give and take feedback and work-based learning.

Beside the trainings offered by CELT lecturers have the chance to participate in external trainings as well.

The Heads of Curriculum (Study Programme) gather the lecturers in one programme together regularly to discuss the development needs in the programme.

3) Entrepreneurship-related topics should be reflected more widely in the module descriptions.

The curriculum Entrepreneurship and Business Innovation (180 ects) has been created by merging two curricula and now it contains two specialties Start-up Entrepreneurship and Creativity and Business Innovation. The modules in Entrepreneurship and Business Innovation programme have entrepreneurship-related and small business management topic embedded.

4) The study programmes are excessively focused on Estonia, more international topics should be considered. It is necessary to expand an international outreach of study programmes, learning materials and lecturers in order to prepare students for the global labour market. Given the University's plans for wider internationalisation, detailed study programme descriptions should be available in English on the University's website.

The detailed study programme descriptions with course names are available on the website. In the discussions with the staff members and students during the site visit, it was emphasized that EUAS aims to prepare the students for the global labour market. Materials, cases, articles and books in English are broadly used as course material. Lecturers provided some examples of international topics covered in current study programs (e.g. international accounting, international corporate finance). The fact that Estonia is a small country and internationalization is an important topic for most companies (as well as for most graduates) was stressed.

The number of international staff members is minimal but in recruitment processes, they prefer candidates who have worked abroad or have other kind of international experience. EUAS has not been successful in attracting qualified international applicants but their strategy is to support their existing lecturers to become more international and network with international partners. Guest lecturers from international partner institutions visit EUAS as guest speakers.

5) The Start-up Entrepreneurship study programme is strongly focused on the participants' own start-up companies. At the same time 90% of start-up companies fail and the goal should be the employability of the graduates of the programme in the long term. Greater emphasis should therefore be placed on 'traditional' fields of business administration.

The curricula Entrepreneurship and Business Innovation has been renewed and merged in to one programme. In the new curriculum, there is a wider variety of business studies, during the first year before the students specialize in Creativity and Business Innovation or Start-Up Entrepreneurship. Unfortunately, the materials provided about the curriculum varied a little. The appendix Curriculum Structure with detailed module and course descriptions was different from the allocation plan and the more general structure of the curriculum illustrated in the report. The Start-Up Entrepreneurship Programme and the Creativity and Business Innovation Programme are still presented on the web pages as independent programmes. Part of the General Modules are Business administration 30 ects and Business Function Module 26 ects, which include a set of general business administration studies that include for ex. accounting, economics, ethics and CSR, law, management, sales and marketing.

6) Since the graduates of the Start-up Entrepreneurship and the Creativity and Business Innovation programmes can continue their studies in a master's programme, students should also learn about theoretical aspects and how to use them in their own research. It is therefore desirable to combine traditional economic theory and the scientific literature with the topics of start-up companies.

Students ability to work on own research projects is strengthened by a stronger focus on research tools, including but not limited to quantitative methods and capital market simulations.

In the discussion during the site visit, both the lecturers and the students confirmed that theory and practice are embedded in the courses. The staff members described examples from their courses how different models ant theoretical frameworks are presented in study courses in order to analyze the practical solutions (e. g. in corporate finance or marketing). The students are given appropriate material that they are required to read about the theme before the lectures and then it is discussed and applied during the lectures.

7) According to the Start-up Entrepreneurship study programme, practical training counts for 32 ECTS credits completed in the student's own company. It is unclear how this practical training is supervised or what happens if the student's start-up fails in an early stage. The University should clearly formalise the rules for achieving the learning outcomes in practical training. The University should also put in place conditions under which practical training can be completed in other companies.

The Internship materials, which were provided to the panel included guidelines with the intended learning outcomes for the students and the internship institution, guidelines for reporting the internship and instructions and form for the assessment of the internship. In the guidelines, the learning outcomes are clearly defined and in Internship I they include the perspectives of applying the knowledge, developing their own competences, analysing the company's functions based on the theoretical knowledge they have acquired and proposing development ideas. The learning outcomes for Internship II contain more strategic approach to the organization and assessment of its functions based on theoretical frameworks.

The internships are supervised by an instructor from the EUAS and an instructor appointed by the internship organization. The tasks of both of the instructors are defined as well as the rights and responsibilities of the intern. A Student Intern Evaluation Sheet is provided to the instructor of the internship organization. The Internships are evaluated on pass/fail basis.

During the site visit the students reported that completing the internship is not problematic because the businesses in the area provide lots of possibilities for the students to complete this internship.

8) The main focus of the Management of Enterprise study programmes is upon the application of practical knowledge, but research and its methodology are underrepresented.

Though the different materials about the content of the curriculum were slightly different, it can be concluded that 2 ects of Academic Writing and 5 ects of Research Methods have been added to the Internship and Final Paper -module. The management of the school emphasized that applied research is a strategic goal. The Head of Research position is vacant at the moment but they are in the process of hiring someone. Head of Research is not directly influencing the curricula but shall play an important role in supporting the lecturers' own research projects and their capabilities and thus, has indirect impact on teaching quality. For additional information on his role please refer to section 2.2 of this report.

During the interviews students confirmed that different research methods are part of the curricula (depending on the study field).

9) Within the framework of the Management of Enterprise study programmes, a large number of cooperation projects with companies are carried out. To strengthen the academic profile of the University, the results of those projects should be published in peer reviewed journals.

Information provided in the documents is just naming a couple of projects (e. g. Nordplus Study Tour). Based on the information provided during the visit of the university, it can be said that the overall number of projects (including excursions, etc.) is much bigger (especially with companies from the Ülemiste City). Projects with non-academic partners are highly appreciated and students as well as lecturers will certainly benefit from it.

Overall, the publication output differs strongly between the lecturers. Whereas some show in impressive activity, including but not limited to journals and presentations on international conference, others are not publishing at all. Total number of publications in peer reviewed journals can be found to be rather low and is only published by few lecturers.

On the other hand several lecturers have been attending international conferences in the past. Obviously, the university supports the lecturers in doing so. Conference participation allows the participants to exchange ideas, realize current trends in research (topics, as well as research methods) and in some cases allows publications as well (in conference editions, books of abstracts, etc.). Therefore, participation in conferences is a good indicator for an increasing research orientation.

Based on the information provided and the information that is publically available at www.etis.ee it can be seen that some (but not all) of the lecturers that are responsible for projects with external partners are frequent publishers. However, it is doubtful if the cooperation projects are usually used for publication purposes.

Thus, the university should keep on focussing on the transfer between cooperation projects, the involvement of students in these projects and the publication of results. Processes that have been introduced in the last years seem to support this approach.

10) The University's own library is very small and it mainly relies on the libraries of public universities. This area needs to be invested in, especially considering the planned increase in student numbers.

University stated that the library has expanded since 2017. Some materials are ordered on demand (lecturers have the opportunity to make orders to support their research projects and/or their lectures). EUAS mainly relays on electronic databases. Students have full access to electronic resources at the university but also remote access. This focus is reasonable since a major part of the students is studying part-time and remote access to electronic resources adds significant value to this group. Moreover, electronic resources can be used by several students at the same time (avoiding problems resulting from increased student numbers).

External big libraries (including but not limited to the National Library) are still open for students. Tours to the National Library are offered at the beginning of the year.

According to the student's comments access to academic resources can be considered to be sufficient although EUAS' own library seems to be of little importance. Increased student numbers in the last years have obviously not resulted in a lack of resources. This aspect underpins the university's strategy to focus on online resources instead of hard copies to be left in the library.

In the future EUAS should set up an explicit long-term strategy for the development of its own electronic library. This strategy could be considered as one part of the stronger focus on research.

11) Assessment of students' assignments and final theses requires further attention. According to alumni and students, the level of difficulty of their works is not sufficiently taken into account and marking ranges are too narrow.

According to the report prepared by EUAS the university set clear criteria to final papers and master theses. Criteria are based on the EUAS guidelines for composing and formatting of undergraduate research papers. Thus, guidelines are obviously applicable to all kind of academic works prepared by students.

Grading is based on the following criteria (whereas for each criterion a 6-point scale is used):

- Research problem, structure and balance
- Theoretical overview
- Empirical part
- Defense
- References and form of paper

It can be stated that the selection/definition of criteria is in line with general acknowledged standards for grading academic papers. Since the methodology is public students have the chance to prepare their works and themselves in an appropriate way.

The weight of each criterion (e. g. 25% for the empirical part) could be subject to discussions. But i) there is no international standard that the university could rely on and ii) these discussions would only focus on the quantitative adequacy. The qualitative adequacy of the overall concept would be undisputed.

Based on this setting and the fact that an unfair grading has not been mentioned by the students this issue should not play a major role in upcoming audits. However, EUAS should – like any other institution – keep on evaluating their grading methodology and consider the student's feedback.

12) As student mobility is hampered by a number of problems, it is necessary to involve more international lecturers for longer terms, recruit more international students, increase the number of subjects taught in English and use more MOOCs in teaching and learning.

Outgoing mobility (study abroad) is still quite restricted. According to our understanding there are two main reasons:

- Most domestic students are part-time working. Due to their limited time frame they usually are not interested in studying abroad respectively do not have the chance to do so.
- Incoming, degree seeking students mostly benefit from comparatively low tuition fees and cost of living in Estonia (compared to Western European countries or the US). Studying abroad is possible for them (students are supported by the international office) but financial restrictions might limit the options.

EUAS is working on alternative concepts e. g. summer schools to allow some kind of international experience for those students that have no possibility to study abroad. However, summer schools are only lasting for several days and do not provide the opportunity to gain the same intercultural competencies as a semester abroad.

English lectures are common in several programs but according to our understanding these are pure English classes. So, there is no exchange between the English students and those that are studying in Estonian/Russian language. Mixing these groups could be another option to deal with the low student mobility.

In 2018/19 EUAS was able to welcome four incoming teachers that provided lectures in several programs. Moreover, EUAS pointed out that most lectures have gained working experience in an international environment before being contracted by the university. This international environment (i. e. working abroad or being involved in cross border transactions) plays an important role in the selection process.

Against the background of Estonia being a small country this strategy can be regarded to be reasonable.

Overall, EUAS was able to show its commitment in respect to this issue and, for sure, progress was made during the last years. However, additional efforts, especially regarding incoming lecturers, are highly appreciated for the upcoming years.

Detailed information on MOOCs was not provided. However, EUAS pointed out that it used in different courses.

13) Although the University has a practical orientation, the number of lecturers with PhDs is too small. Teaching staff should be supported while completing their PhDs and higher standards for the staff should be established, for example, with regard to publishing in peer reviewed journals. At present, some members of the teaching staff have no publications at all.

i) Quantitative Development

The number of teaching staff holding a PhD has significantly increased over the last 2.5 years. Currently, 11 lecturers are holding a PhD (24% of full-time lectures), 5 hold a qualification between Masters and PhD (11% of full-time lecturers) and another 7-8 are working on their project (2-3 are expected to graduate in the upcoming 12 months).

ii) Qualitative Development

Overall, EUAS has made significant contributions towards strengthening its academic performance:

- Attendance of scientific conferences (including presentation) is supported (e. g. by covering the costs for travel and accommodation).
- University offers several internal trainings how to assess the quality of publications.
- The position of the Head of Research has been established and staffed (but is vacant at the moment).
- Lecturers can apply for a free (but paid) semester to word on their projects. However, no one has applied for that so far.

General Comments

EUAS asserted that research is major topic at the moment. Current actions to increase the scientific output are highly appreciated and should not be cancelled in the near future. The position of the Head of Research should be staffed as soon as possible.

Overall number of journal publications is still low and still some lecturers have no publications at all. Since an increased research output can be considered as a long term project the actions and their efficiency should be evaluated in the upcoming audits.

For additional information please refer to section "Meeting the Requirements of Secondary Condition" of this report.

14) The number of international lecturers is too small and staff mobility is low. International cooperation must be strengthened and clear goals in this area set. As the number of (international) students increases, new lecturers with international profiles should be recruited.

For 2018/19 six lecturers (i. e. 13% of full-time lectures) participated in staff-mobility programs. Considering the total number of EUAS lecturers this number can be considered to be appropriate.

For additional information, please refer to comments on issue 12.

15) While planning further expansion, the University should consider that along with the increase in student numbers some aspects that students currently like may disappear – flexibility, personal approach, etc.

Currently, EUAS has about 1,600 students. Self-assessment presents the strategic aim to reach 1,800 students in the future. This number is defined as the optimal maximum for good quality using the current resources. For future growth EUAS will be able to use an additional school building from 2022 on.

Admission numbers from the last years show that the number of 1,800 students might be reached in 3-4 years. The growing student numbers in the past are not in line with the overall development of the Estonian higher education sector but can be regarded as a proof of quality. Students would not be willing to pay tuition fees if their expectations would not be met but admission numbers would decrease over time.

During the interviews students expressed their satisfaction with the university in general and with the open door policy that enables them to contact the lecturers in particular. The overall organisation seems to be working very well; schedules are fixed at the beginning of the semester and are not subject to changes during the semester.

Thus, increasing student numbers between 2017 and 2019 have not let to a lower student satisfaction. However, self-report does not provide information on the long-term strategy, i. e. after reaching the strategic goal of 1,800 students. Probably, the following options could be considered:

- Increasing tuition fees in order to lower admission numbers
- Changing admission requirements in order to lower admission numbers
- Admission of more students and increasing overall student numbers

Options one and two would not impact the ratio between lecturers and students and would not require additional resources (e. g. infrastructure). However, option three would require a more detailed strategy.

Commendations

- EUAS has taken measures based on the feedback the Assessment Panel provided in spring 2017.
- The number of student intake has increased.
- Pedagogical support for lecturers is offered by Centre for Excellence in Learning and Teaching.
- The mission of EUAS is the orientation to entrepreneurship and the entrepreneurial mindset.
- Yearly curriculum renewal process is in place.
- Replacement of major parts of the senior management in the last 2.5 years has had a significant impact on the university's culture. Research and academic excellence play a much more important role than in 2017.
- Both, students as well as lecturers are highly committed to the university (indicating a high satisfaction).
- International office is highly appreciated by students and can be seen as one step towards a more international university in the future.
- Large number of internal and external trainings for lecturers is highly appreciated.

Further considerations

- Internationalization is a challenge.
- Student mobility is very low.
- Internationalization is just growing. The amount of international staff members is minimal. At the moment EUAS is only employing one foreign full time lecturer.
- Position of the Head of research is vacant at the moment. If no new head can be contracted on short notice, university might name an interim head from the current teaching staff. Since the Head of Research is, among others, responsible for the administration of research related funds, EUAS should find an appropriate solution.
- Part-time students mentioned a very high workload since they have to pass exams while they are already working on their theses.
- International students asked for more language courses (in Estonian language). University management should double check if there is a substantial need for additional courses.

Report on meeting the requirements of the secondary condition, Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences

General background

At its meeting on June 12, 2017, EKKA Quality Assessment Council for Higher Education decided that the next assessment of the study programme group of Business and Administration at the Estonian Entrepreneurship University of Applied Sciences will take place in 7 years (maximum term) but set a secondary condition that the EEK Mainor should meet in 2 years.

Based on the Assessment Report of the international panel and the Decision of EKKA Quality Assessment Council for Higher Education, EEK Mainor submitted the Report to EKKA on June 14, 2019.

Meeting of the requirements of secondary condition

The following are the requirements set by the Quality Assessment Council to be met by EEK Mainor, and the committee's assessment on the developments EEK Mainor has made in this regard.

According to clause 6 (7) 1) of the Standard of Higher Education, the conduct of studies conforms to the requirements if the teaching is performed by ordinary teaching and research staff who meet the qualification requirements established in legal instruments and whose number, based on their responsibilities, loads of conducted studies and research, and numbers of students supervised, is sufficient to achieve the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme. Although the University has a practical orientation, the number of lecturers with doctorates is too small, especially for conducting master degree studies. Teaching staff should be supported while completing their PhDs and higher standards for the staff should be established, for example, with regard to publishing in peer-reviewed journals. At present, some members of the teaching staff have no publications at all.

Assessment of the committee: the secondary condition is substantially met

Facts and Circumstances

- Since 2017 the number of lecturers holding a PhD has significantly increased to 11; another 5 hold a qualification between Masters and Ph.D.
- 7 lecturers are currently enrolled in a Ph.D. programme, 2-3 are expected to graduate within a year. The lecturers that are enrolled are experienced teachers as well as younger researchers that have recently graduated from their master programs.
- A new position ("Head of Research") was established. One of the tasks of this position is to make decision on the distribution of research related funds.
- Since autumn 2018 all staff with research responsibilities need to publish at least one scientific publication (on average) to pass internal academic attestation.
- EUAS offers significant funding for research. Funds are e. g. used for attending international conferences, academic proof reading, etc.
- Lecturers have the chance to participate in various research related workshops.
- Total number of publications proves the university's scientific activities.
- Research output measured in publications is still unequal distributed: Whereas some lecturers are regularly publishing (in an international environment) and attending international conferences, some others are not taking this chance at all.
- The number of journal publications is still limited. Many publications are in Estonian language (setting limits regarding the potential audience); some are in Russian (which is in line with the university's strategy of offering programs in Russian).
- The information provided does not cover third party funded projects and their volume.
- Research seems to play an adequate role in EUAS' curricula. Quantitative research methods are explicitly considered, qualitative research is at least discussed. Moreover, some effort is made to deal with research in finance.
- The university offers a free, but paid semester to work on research projects.
- EUAS is running some joined projects with companies located in Ülemiste City.

Evaluation of the facts and circumstances

- Both, the self-assessment as well as the visit of the university were able to show that the general attitude towards research (including but not limited to publications, conferences, and third party funded projects) has significantly changed during the last 2.5 years.
- Strengthening research is part of the long-term strategy of the university. Results from the last 2.5 years are considerable and highly appreciated. However, the senior management needs to keep on working on this strategy in the future. Especially those staff members that are not publishing regularly (that have not published during the last couple of years) might need additional support and or stronger incentives.

Recommendations

- It is strongly recommended to hire a new Head of Research. An interim solution might be to nominate on of the current staff members to make sure, that e. g. the role of research is maintained and the administration of the research related funds is still possible.
- Since the strategic focus of EUAS is on English programs more results of research activities should be published in English as well.
- Internal attestation of staff with research responsibilities requires one publication per year on average. This rule should be subject to discussion. If a lecturer publishes e. g. three papers in a single year he would not be requested to do any more research in the following years. The introduction of a limitation ("maximum number of publications to be carried forward") might support the university in reaching its goals.
- EUAS should have a stronger focus on third party funded projects in the future. This would strengthen its position in academia as well as in the Estonian/Baltic market since it will probably have the chance to work together with international companies/partner institutions.
- So far, no lecturer has applied for the free semester. Especially for those working on their Ph.D. this offer is an excellent option either to start their thesis or to finish it. The fact that no one has applied for it so far might have several reasons. Anyway, the university's management needs to make sure that the lecturers i) are aware of this option and ii) are able to apply for it as well.

Further considerations

- EUAS spends a considerable amount of money for research funding. Based on the information provided this sum includes the salaries for research related staff as well. For future investigations and in order to make the university's cost and performance accounting more precise it is recommend to separate the salaries from other expenditures.
- The Heads of the Curriculum might think of a stronger collaboration between lecturers and students. Students might e.g. support their lecturers in collecting data during a research project.

According to subsection 6 (3) of the Standard of Higher Education the objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme shall be equal and comparable with the learning outcomes of the cycles of higher education level described in Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher Education. According to point 3.1 of Annex 1 to the Standard of Higher, in order to be awarded a Master's degree, students shall, inter alia, have systematic overview and broad knowledge of concepts, theories and research methods of the field of study; know the theoretical development trends, current problems and potential applications in that field of study; and be able to independently and creatively identify and formulate problems and/or research questions related to their fields of study and be able to solve them with appropriate measures within given timeframes and with limited information, using knowledge from other fields as necessary. The main focus of the Management of Enterprise study programmes is upon the application of practical knowledge, but research and its methodology are underrepresented. The graduates of the Start-up Entrepreneurship and the Creativity and Business Innovation programmes can continue their studies in a master's programme, students should therefore also learn about theoretical aspects and how to use them in their own research.

Assessment of the committee: the secondary condition is substantially met.

Facts and Circumstances

- Entrepreneurship and Business Administration: The following courses covering theoretical aspects are currently considered in the curriculum:
- Academic writing
- Research methodology
- Creativity as a scientific field of study
- Knowledge
- Philosophy of science

Moreover, a broad understanding of business administration and management is taught in the modules Business Administration (30 ECTS) and Business Function (26 ECTS).

- All Master programs (Management of Enterprise in Estonian language, Management of Enterprise in Russian language, International Business Administration) include a module (41 or 50 ECTS) that is explicitly dedicated to research methods (including the thesis).
- Master Programmes include research methods (5 ects) and master seminar (6 ects). Elements of general business administration have also been included into the curriculum.
- Theory and practice are both embedded into courses.
- Overall research activities of the lecturers are supported by the university and have been included in their target agreement. Significant funds (e. g. for conferences) have been provided (and used) during the last years.

Evaluation of the facts and circumstances

- Based on the curricula research and dealing with theoretical issues plays a much more important role than in 2017.
- Modules explicitly dealing with those issues have been introduced.
- However, due to time restrictions it was not possible to have a serious discussion of all research related modules, the individual learning outcomes and the examinations.

- The increased number of lecturers holding a PhD and those that are currently working on their thesis is a solid ground for the ongoing process of the curriculum development.
- Research activities have increased with support and incentive system.

Recommendations

- EUAS should set stronger incentives for lecturers to involve students in their research projects (e. g. during the collection of data). It was mentioned that some teachers tell the students about their projects which can be seen as a first step. Even if student involvement is not possible, the research process (definition of a research questions, selection of methods, setting up a time frame, etc.) could be subject to discussions with the students.
- Lecturers should publish a list of potential topics from which the students can select a topic for their own thesis. Topics should be in line with lecturer's current research interests.
- EUAS should prepare a detailed description of the master seminar (6 ECTS).

Further considerations

- Are the profiles of the programmes different enough?
- What is the role of a curriculum or specialization module within a curriculum?
- Master Programme Management of Enterprise not presented on web pages?
- If possible, students from different programmes could work on research projects together. Especially for the graduate students a joined research seminar (in English) could help them to gain not only research but also intercultural skills.
- Project with external partners (companies) are an amazing opportunity for the students to
 prepare for their working life. For companies it might be interesting to contract students for
 applied research projects (e. g. market research, data collection, etc.). EUAS might set up a
 standardized process to attract potential partners and how to consider their wishes in the
 study programmes.