

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee



3rd Meeting on September 3, 2021

PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

Project Number:	20/055, Cluster 4
Higher Education Institution:	M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University, Higher School of Economics
Location:	Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan
Study Programme:	PhD in Economics
Type of Accreditation:	concept accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decisions:

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) in conjunction with § 9 (4) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from April 2020, the study programme is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: September 3, 2021 until September 2, 2026

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.



Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution (HEI):

M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University, Higher School of
Economics

Doctoral programme:

PhD in Economics

General Information on the Study Programme

Brief description of the study programme:

The PhD programme in Economics is aimed to develop rigorous theoretical knowledge and practical research skills to shape future professional researchers with a focus on empirical research in Economics for academic and research career.

Type of study programme:

PhD programme

Projected study time and number of ECTS credits assigned to the study programme:

3 years, 180 ECTS credits

Mode of study:

full-time

Didactic approach:

study programme with obligatory class attendance

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:

No limitation as of August 2021

Programme cycle starts in:

Fall semester

Initial start of the programmes:

September 2021

Type of accreditation:

concept accreditation

Accreditation in one cluster (cluster 4) with:

Economics (M.Sc.)

Business and Management (M.A.)

PhD in Economics

International Relations (B.A.)

Procedure:

A contract for the initial accreditation of the PhD in Economics was made between FIBAA and the M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University (Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan) on 2nd of December, 2020. On 19th of April, 2021, the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel¹ consisted of:

Prof. Dr. Stefan Fröhlich

University of Erlangen-Nuernberg, Germany

Professor of International Politics

(International Politics, International Relations, Transatlantic Relations, German Foreign Policy, International Organizations, International Political Economy)

Prof. Dr. Petra Jordanov

Hochschule Stralsund, University of Applied Sciences, Germany

Professor of Business Administration and Economics

(Business Administration, especially Financial Management and Human Resource Management, Economics and International Economics)

Ilja Kogan

Wayfair GmbH, Berlin, Germany

Senior Produkt Manager

(Global Operations, eCommerce, Information Technology, Project Management, Business Administration, Economics)

Dr. Maigul Nugmanova

Narxoz University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Director of Gender Economics Research Center

(Economic Theory, Gender Economics)

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Assel Nurgazina

Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Associate professor Higher School of Economics and Business

(Economics, Finance, International Economic Relations, Corporate Finance, Monetary policy)

Esther Tabea Schmidt

Hochschule für Technik und Wirtschaft des Saarlandes, University of Applied Sciences, Germany

Student Management and Leadership (M.A.)

(completed: Business Administration (B.A.))

FIBAA project manager:

Viktoria Tischanski

¹ The names are presented in alphabetical order.

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, as requested by the panel, and an online conference. The online conference took place on June 24th – June 25th, 2021 via the video conferencing tool Zoom. At the end of the online conference, the panel gave a short feedback on its impressions to representatives of the University.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on August 17, 2021. The statement on the report was given up on August 20, 2021. It has been taken into account in the report at hand.

Summary

The PhD programme in Economics offered by M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University, Higher School of Economics, fulfils the FIBAA quality requirements for PhD programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on September 3, 2021 and finishing on September 2, 2026. The programmes are in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

There are some criteria in which the programme exceeds the quality requirements:

- Management Support with regard to process organisation and administration support for students and faculty (see Chapter 4.3),
- Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (see Chapter 5).

For the overall assessment of the programme, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

Information on the Institution

The Joint-Stock Company “M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University” (hereinafter interchangeably referred to as KAZGUU or the University) is a higher education institution established on the strategic initiative of the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev on March 14, 1994. The University performs its activities in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Laws "On Education", "On Science" and other laws and regulations governing the educational, scientific and labour activities, the Standard Rules of higher and postgraduate education and other normative documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES), as well as the Charter of the University². The University is a member of the Kazakhstani Association of Higher Education Institutions³ and the Eurasian Association of Universities⁴. In 2011, the University signed the Magna Charta of the European Universities in Bologna⁵.

The University conventionally occupies the top positions at the Ranking of Higher Education Academic Programmes conducted by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Atameken”⁶ that accounts for the recent university graduates’ career perspectives (entry salaries, employment rate, and job search duration), and the rating based on the industry representatives’ assessments.

In 2018, with a mission to promote the quality of the country’s higher education through the academic integrity principles, KAZGUU initiated the Association of HEIs “Academic Integrity League”⁷. A year after, the University commenced the Adal Bilim project office aimed at detection and prevention of corruption crimes in education supported by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES) and other government bodies.

Currently, the University’s community comprises around 500 academic and administrative staff and more than 3,000 students. The University includes four faculties called Schools: KAZGUU Law School (KLS), Higher School of Economics (HSE), School of Liberal Arts (SLA) and Business School (BS). In total, KAZGUU offers 66 study programmes (25 Bachelor, 37 Master, four PhD programmes).

Higher School of Economics founded in 2004 offers programmes in Economics, Finance, Accounting, Business and Management, International Relations. Starting from 2017 onwards, the HSE fully switched to English as a language of instruction. Higher School of Economics will offer the PhD programme in Economics starting from Fall 2021. This is the first PhD programme at the Higher School of Economics.

KAZGUU Law School is the oldest faculty founded in 1994. It currently offers degree programmes in Law, International Law, and Law Enforcement.

² approved by Protocol No. 9 of the extraordinary General Meeting of Shareholders of «M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University» JSC dated March 06, 2019

³ <http://edurk.kz/>

⁴ <http://www.eau-msu.ru/eng/>

⁵ <http://www.magna-charta.org/magna-charta-universitatum/signatory-universities>

⁶ <https://atameken.kz/ru/>

⁷ <https://adaldyq.kz>

School of Liberal Arts transformed from the School of General Education in 2019 to a degree-awarding school. It currently runs undergraduate programmes in Applied Linguistics, Translation Studies, Tourism, Hospitality, Kazakh-English Languages and Linguistics.

KAZGUU Business School was founded in 2009 and provides educational programmes in Master of Business Administration and Doctor of Business Administration. Every year it enrolls students from diverse professional backgrounds: private entrepreneurs, top managers of the national companies, bank employees, heads of railway enterprises, financiers, and engineers.

Description and Appraisals in Detail

1. Goals and Strategy

1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programmes

During the online conference KAZGUU's Higher School of Economics (HSE) stated that the content of Economics in the most post-Soviet countries is still strongly influenced by the previous Soviet slant. Within the Soviet system under Economics, the area of the company's (enterprise) finance has been understood, which is currently worldwide recognised as corporate finance. This misunderstanding is still typical for many local companies expecting particular applied skills (planning, budgeting, analysing and controlling at a company's level or at a level of public finance) from the university graduates of the Economics major. The vast majority of HEIs in Kazakhstan offer programmes poorly compared with the ones offered by their worldwide counterparts. Along with this, the demand for high-quality research in Economics and Policy Evaluation is emerging, and this is more and more articulated by the relevant stakeholders, including the HSE partner organisations.

In November 2020, the HSE Business Council meeting took place⁸. All participants have mentioned that the country experiences a lack of professional researcher-economists with strong analytical and quantitative skills. This statement was additionally recently confirmed by other HSE external partners, such as the newly established collaborator, the Centre for Labour Force Development under the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection, local office of the Asian Development Bank, the Institute of Economic Research of the Ministry of the National Economy and others.

The demand for highly-qualified academicians and researchers in Economics is indirectly confirmed by a fact that the field constantly appears in the Bolashak list of priority specialities to study abroad (Bolashak is a presidential scholarship programme for international study at a graduate level and post-Doc⁹). Thus, the current KAZGUU and HSE agenda towards research-intensive graduate-level programmes seems to be consistent with the industry expectations. With this, the University invests in its post-graduate programmes and research. In particular, at the HSE, three full PhDs and one PhD Candidate in Economics with degrees from the recognised western universities that are still very rare in Kazakhstan were hired in 2020.

The newly launched PhD programme in Economics is aimed to develop rigorous theoretical knowledge and practical research skills to shape future professional researchers with a focus on empirical research in Economics for both academic and research career.

The graduates of this programme are expected to:

- Demonstrate the ability to apply a wide range of research and project management skills to conduct independent research in Economics and related fields;
- Be able to generate new scientific knowledge and contribute to the relevant field;

⁸ Among the others, the meeting was attended by the Advisor to the Chairman of the National Bank of the Republic of Kazakhstan which office has recently moved from Almaty to Nur-Sultan, Advisor to the Chairman of the Government Agency for Strategic Planning and Reforms, the representative of the Centre for Strategic Research and Analysis under the Administration of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Chairman of the Board of one of the largest commercial bank, and the head of Applied Economics Research Centre – non-government research institution.

⁹ <https://bolashak.gov.kz/en>

- Be able to conceptualise and critically evaluate the main theories in Economics, their evolution and paradigm shifts in economic theory and policy;
- Be committed to high standards of research ethics and academic integrity;
- Be able to apply core principles of science and various epistemological approaches, analyse concepts in terms of philosophical and theoretical underpinnings;
- Demonstrate a systematic understanding of the analytical apparatus used in economic analysis and be able to employ it at an advanced level;
- Be able to evaluate and analyse the key concepts of Economics and their Micro- and Macro- applications;
- Be familiar with various qualitative research methods and be able to apply those of them relevant to Economics;
- Be able to apply advanced econometric methods of analysis and demonstrate proficiency in processing and modelling data, performing estimations and interpreting results at a professional level;
- Understand the process of writing papers and publishing in academia;
- Demonstrate proficient command of English, both writing and speaking, and presentational skills.

Appraisal:

The qualification objectives of the doctoral programmes are explained and convincingly presented by the University in relation to the target group, targeted professional field and societal context of the discipline. They embrace academic proficiency, comprehensive employability, as well as the development of the individual student's personality. They correspond to the requirements of both the NQF and the EQF. The doctoral programmes and the pursued qualification and competency goals are matched with each other.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		

1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programmes in the education market

Currently, there are 33 PhD programmes in Economics in Kazakhstan. Among them, only one is fully delivered in English (KIMEP University). Six programmes are offered by the universities located in Nur-Sultan:

- Gumilev Eurasian National University
- Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade
- Seifullin Kazakh Agro Technical University
- Financial Academy
- University "Turan-Astana"
- Astana International University.

According to the analysis of HSE the vast majority of the offered programmes are not very specialised in Economics and have wider interdisciplinary coverage, for example, Management, Business Studies, etc. At the same time, the offered courses are often narrow-focused, such as, "Modern business models", "Investment policy priorities", "Economics of integrated structures", "Labour migra-

tion”, “Economic growth”, etc. Finally, the delivered courses are often aimed at obtaining broad theoretical knowledge, rather than developing applied research and analytical skills.

The HSE programme focusses primarily on Economics as a field of knowledge and is aimed at developing those competencies that are considered as the “gold standard” for training a professional economist-researcher in the modern world: deep and rigorous theoretical knowledge in key areas of Economics and applied quantitative research and technical skills.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programmes are positioned convincingly in the postgraduate education market due to the described profile and the pursued qualification and competency goals.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the educational market			X		

1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programmes in the Job Market for Graduates

The future research-related job market is expected to be represented by academia and international, public and private research institutions.

During the online conference, HSE representatives shared their view with the panel highlighting that research in Economics and related fields in Kazakhstan is still underdeveloped. According to HSE, the number of articles published at the internationally recognised academic journals is neglectable, the majority of those published are produced by two highly westernised higher education institutions dominating in the field (publicly funded Nazarbayev University and private KIMEP University). Therefore, building on research capacity is not only the KAZGUU's agenda but the country's agenda. The PhD programme in Economics seeks to fill a gap in training professional researchers with in-depth knowledge and skills for both academia and research institutions.

The area for future employment outside of academia and research is expected to be presented by government bodies involved in policy evaluation, and private sector companies specialising in consulting services. As mentioned above, there is an emerging demand for high-quality research not only from academia and higher education authorities but also from various organisations responsible for shaping public policy at a national level. During the online conference HSE mentioned that evidence-based policy-making, though still controversial, became a worldwide recognised phenomenon nowadays. In Economics, it is expected to be based on advanced quantitative research. Despite, owing to a relatively high level of digitalisation, the country authorities collect and store massive datasets that might potentially be used for research to shape the policy. Rigorous training in Applied Economics and continuous research collaboration with the government bodies and various institutions should provide a solid ground for preparing the graduates for future employment outside academia.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme with special focus on professional qualification for science and research is positioned convincingly due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research.

The doctoral programme is also strongly positioned outside the science and research field by taking into account the professional qualification for employment due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	in the research fields			X		
1.3.2	outside the research fields			X		

1.4 Positioning of the Doctoral Programmes in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

The strategic concept of the university and school, in particular, encompasses focus on research, internationalisation, and link with the industry. Promoting applied research beneficial for society and policies is declared as the strategic goals at both KAZGUU and HSE Strategy for the next seven years. KAZGUU deliberately invests in research-supportive environment and intends to nurture its own research “schools” – groups of professional researchers collaboratively working on joint projects. With this, from Spring 2020, the university will launch the research mentorship programme and the scholarship programme. Both aim to develop the young researchers’ community of KAZGUU in the relevant areas, particularly, Economics, Political Economy, Social Policy, and Management. In line with current strategic goals, the PhD in Economics will represent the degree programme providing comprehensive training for future research career.

Appraisal:

The University has an overall development strategy, also with regard to its study programmes. The study programmes’ qualification goals are in line with KAZGUU and HSE mission and strategic planning. The integration of the PhD programmes in the strategic concept of KAZGUU and HSE is described and presented in a comprehensive manner.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.4	The Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		

1.5 Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities

Social equality and inclusion are expected to be achieved via scholarship scheme. The programme will be funded from two sources:

- Government scholarships
- University scholarships.

Both are merit-based but not need-blind. The admission process at the HSE assumes thorough consideration of the individual applications and interviews with the candidates. Therefore, an applicant's socioeconomic background will be explicitly taken into account while accepting the candidates and granting them scholarships.

Gender equality is an issue for PhD studies worldwide, particularly, in Economics. However, this is likely not the case for Kazakhstan where academia in many ways predominantly populated by female employees, including academicians. Poor career perspectives and low salaries are the main reasons for that; with some few notable exceptions of the best-funded universities, a career in academia is not competitive compared to a career in the industry in Kazakhstan over the last 30 years. Therewith it, however, provides somewhat better work-life balance, and this is another reason why most of the academic staff at HEIs in Kazakhstan are females (culturally, responsibility for family chores usually disproportionately falls on women).

In 2019, the KAZGUU University adopted the Policy for Inclusive Education. The Policy states that the University provides equal opportunities to all students and demonstrates zero tolerance towards any form of discrimination. Specifically, the Policy defines the inclusion of the students with special educational needs.

Appraisal:

The University fulfils its tasks to promote gender equality and the enforcement of general prohibitions on discrimination, also with regard to the doctoral programmes at hand. Students in special circumstances are particularly assisted through University scholarships.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		

2. Admission

Admission and enrolment to the Bachelor, Master and PhD programmes is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES) dated 31 October 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model Regulations for admission to undergraduate and postgraduate educational programmes" (Order 2018).

According to the state regulations, only candidates with a two-year research Master's degree or equivalent are eligible for Doctoral programmes. A candidate should provide IELTS 5.5 and above or equivalent. If the candidate completed a previous degree that was entirely taught and assessed in English, he/she might be exempted from submitting English proficiency test certificate.

At HSE, the requirements are set as follows:

1. For candidates with a Master's Degree:

- in Economics and Mathematics – no special requirements
- in relevant areas - if there are completed prerequisites at previous levels of study (calculus, linear algebra, statistics, econometrics, microeconomics, macroeconomics)
- in non-relevant areas – self-study of prerequisites during the first year of study (in a group with HSE MSc in Economics students).

2. English language requirements:

- IELTS 6.0 or alternative qualifications
- or confirmation of an English-taught programme study at one of the previous levels of study.

3. Research proposal – 2000-3000 words.

A candidate should provide his/her documents to the University admission office during the standard admission period (summer). The admission is only possible once a year for the upcoming academic year.

HSE forms an Admission Committee that employs a holistic admission process in which every single application is given a thorough review. HSE Admission Committee for PhD Admissions consists of the School Dean, Vice Dean for Graduate Studies, Research and Development, Economics Programme Coordinator, and HSE professors. Potential supervisors, if outside KAZGUU, and/or foreign advisors might be invited as well. The Committee meeting minutes must be written, rejected candidates must be duly informed by the Tutor Manager for Graduate Studies.

Foreign language proficiency is ensured by asking the candidate for an international certificate confirming foreign language proficiency. The entry subject examination is the preparation of a preliminary research proposal on the proposed future research topic. Assessment will be done against the following criteria:

- Feasibility of research design, preliminary research plan, and data availability
- Relevance, novelty, and clarity of the research question
- Consistency of hypotheses and methodology(ies) proposed
- Clearness of the identification strategy where relevant
- Quality of preliminary literature review
- Written English skills.

The overall result of the selection is based on the preparation of the preliminary Research proposal, since international certificate confirming foreign language proficiency as well as the previous degree serves as a criterion to be eligible for the main examination.

Candidates who get the highest points (but not less than 75 points) are awarded a state scholarship. In case the applicants have similar examination results, other achievements can be taken into account.

Generally, at HSE a limited number of PhD places due to the availability of the faculty expertise is set. Additionally, the PhD enrolment in Kazakhstan heavily depends on the number of scholarships available. Currently, the defined number of scholarships are first allocated across universities by the Ministry of Education and Science. In this setting, if a number of applicants exceeded a number of

scholarship available for allocation, the scholarships would be allocated for the best applicants based on a thorough evaluation of their research proposals and motivation.

If a candidate's research proposal does not meet the faculty's expertise, this candidate's application would be rejected. The letter clearly stating the reasons is communicated to the applicants by the Tutor Manager for Graduate Studies. Co-supervision with potential supervisors with relevant expertise from other universities/institutions might be considered.

Appraisal:

The admission requirements for PhD students, based on the regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science, are properly defined and set out transparently.

The selection procedure is carried out in accordance with the national law and therefore satisfies the legal requirements.

The decision on admission is based on transparent criteria and it is clearly communicated; rejections are reasoned. The responsibilities are clearly regulated.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection Procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

3. Implementation

3.1 Structure

The PhD programme in Economics has the following structure:

Projected study time	6 semesters
Number of Credit Points (CP)	180 ECTS credits
Workload per CP	30 hours
Number of courses	9 (without internships, research work and thesis)
Number of contact hours	486

The Ministry requirements are defined by the State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES). According to the SCES, PhD programme requires 180 ECTS to be completed. Among them, 45 ECTS should be allocated to training, 3 ECTS – to teaching internship, and 5 ECTS - to research practice. The SCES classifies courses in two blocks – Core Courses-I and Core Courses-II. The first block is expected to cover relatively more general competencies while the second – more subject-specific skills. Within each block, a certain number of ECTS should be allocated to required courses and certain – to electives.

Since the programme is designed as Applied Economics, the Core-I includes:

- PHL7201 An Introduction to the Philosophy of Social Sciences (5 ECTS)
- ECN7202 Optimization Theory in Economic Analysis (5 ECTS)
- ECN7305 Advanced Microeconomics (5 ECTS)
- ECN7306 Advanced Macroeconomics (5 ECTS).

The Core-II includes:

- ECN7203 Applied Microeconometrics (5 ECTS)
- ECN7204 Applied Macroeconometrics (5 ECTS)
- ECN7307 Causal Inference and Quasi-Experimental Research (5 ECTS).

The programme is structured as follows:

Core Courses - I	28 ECTS
Required	20 ECTS
Teaching internship	3 ECTS
Electives	5 ECTS
Core Courses - II	25 ECTS
Required	15 ECTS
Electives	5 ECTS
Research practice	5 ECTS
Research work and the- sis defence	127 ECTS
Total	180 ECTS

The advanced theoretical training will be covered during the first year of study. In addition to it, during the Autumn semester, a PhD student is expected to complete his/her detailed PhD project proposal and submit it for approval by his/her supervisor(s) and HSE Academic Quality Committee (AQC). The document should be submitted by the end of the semester, the deadline is set and articulated by the HSE Graduate Programme Handbook.

At the end of every academic year, the PhD students will go through the Annual Progress Review procedure. For that, they should submit via Canvas their written paper along with a brief report. The research supervisor should also submit a brief overview of his/her student's progress. The files for each PhD student then should be submitted by the Vice Dean for Graduate Studies, Research and Development to the HSE AQC for consideration. HSE AQC formally approves that the candidate's performance is satisfactory and the candidate can proceed to the next stage.

The Doctoral Degree is regulated by the following documents:

At the national level:

- Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES), November 1, 2018 #17669.
- Admission Regulations, June 14, 2019, #600
- Provisions on the Expert (Dissertation) Councils, March 31, 2011, #126, amended on September 28, 2018, #512
- Degree Award Rules, March 31, 2011, #127, amended on September 28, 2018, #512.

At the university level:

- Academic Policy
- Handbook on Ensuring Academic Integrity

- University Admission Policy
- HSE Catalogue
- HSE Graduate Programme Handbook
- PhD Thesis Guide.

HSE Graduate Programme Handbook defines time limits on doctoral degree student status, PhD Candidate status and Extension status.

In accordance with the SCES, a doctoral student is expected to complete classroom training (Core Courses I and II) during his/her first year of study. After successful completion (with “Pass” grades for each course), PhD student automatically receives the PhD Candidate (“All But Dissertation” (ABD)) status. This status is not defined by the national level regulations but defined by the HSE policy described at the Handbook. PhD Candidate then is given three years for successful completion of the PhD thesis.

In addition to the thesis, SCES mandates each PhD Candidate to publish academic articles in recognised peer-reviewed journals. A certain number of publications is the requirement to be admitted for the thesis defence procedure. The number of publications depends on the quality of the journals:

International peer-reviewed journals	Local recognised journals recommended by the Quality Assurance Committee of the Ministry of Education and Science
One article published at journal: - with JCR impact factor, or - indexed by Web of Science Core Collection (Arts and Humanities Citation Index), or - indexed by Science Citation Index Expanded (Social Sciences Citation Index), or - having the Scopus CiteScore highest percentile of 25 and above	Three articles
One article published at journal: - with JCR impact factor, or - having the Scopus CiteScore highest percentile of 25 and above and one articles published at journal: - ranked Q2-Q4 JCR, or - having the Scopus CiteScore highest percentile of 50 and above	No articles required
one articles published at journal: - ranked Q1 JCR	No articles required

The “Extension” status is also not defined at the national level. Since the SCES only allows four years to accomplish and in reality many Doctorate students at Kazakhstani universities unable to publish three articles in international peer-reviewed journals with the required impact factor within this period, the majority of Kazakhstani universities send down students with “ABD” status and readmit them again when they are ready for thesis submission. At the HSE, it was decided the extension status to be awarded a maximum of three years. The extension status should be awarded by the HSE Academic Quality Committee (AQC).

According to the HSE policy, the PhD supervisor should hold PhD from the worldwide recognised university or recognised Kazakhstani university fully teaching in English. Considering limited faculty capacity, co-supervisors from the other university or from industry meeting qualification requirements might be assigned where necessary. Additionally, foreign adviser will be assigned to each PhD student. For this, the preliminary agreements with the HSE partner universities have been reached.

The main supervisor is responsible for the appropriate quality of the thesis. He/she has a right to exclude a PhD candidate from the defence if the quality of the work is not acceptable, the review with clearly articulated reasons should be provided to the HSE AQC and the Dean, in this case.

Obligatory content which must be published before the beginning of the course includes the detailed syllabus of courses including information like those about required and recommended readings, details of assignments and examinations, ethical and academic integrity rules.

Appraisal:

In the view of experts, the structure of the PhD programme corresponds with its objectives and it properly connects the range of courses with the research tasks of the doctoral students.

The structure of the programmes takes into account the national requirements (state educational standards) in terms of programmes' components.

The status of the doctoral students, which is defined by law, is regulated properly.

The programme consists of courses and assigns ECTS credits. Course descriptions for the PhD programme were provided and were subject to review by the expert panel. They are informative and contain all necessary information on the content, duration, requirements, recommended reading and the learning outcomes to be achieved.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulations			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		

3.2 Content

The curriculum overview is presented below:

Example 1st Semester

Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit	Credit Points per Semester						Workload		Method of Teaching i.e. lecture course, seminar	Form and Duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study			
PHL7201 (compulsory)	An Introduction to the Philosophy of Social Sciences	5						45	105	Lectures and seminars	Individual Presentations	40%
ECN7202 (compulsory)	Optimization Theory in Economic Analysis	5						45	105	Lectures and seminars	Final Paper	40%
ECN7203 (compulsory)	Applied Microeconometrics	5						45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
ECN7204 (compulsory)	Applied Macroeconometrics	5						45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
NA	Teaching internship	3						81		NA	NA	NA
	Research work	7							210	NA	NA	NA

Example 2nd Semester

ECN7305 (compulsory)	Advanced Microeconomics		5					45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
ECN7306 (compulsory)	Advanced Macroeconomics		5					45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
ECN7307 (elective)	Causal Inference and Quasi-Experimental Research		5					45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
NA	Research Practice		5					150		NA	NA	40%
	Research work		10					300		NA	NA	

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

...

Example 3rd semester

ECN7208 (compulsory)	History of Economic Thought			5				45	105	Lectures and seminars	Written exam	40%
M17	Research work			25				750		NA	NA	

Example 4th semester

ECN7313 (elective)	Labour Economics				5			45	105	Seminars	Project based	100%
ECN7314	Research Work				25			750		NA	NA	NA

Example 5th semester

ECN7313	Research work					30			900	Seminars	Project based	NA
---------	---------------	--	--	--	--	----	--	--	-----	----------	---------------	----

Example 6th semester

ECN7312	Research Work					18			540	NA	NA	NA
---------	---------------	--	--	--	--	----	--	--	-----	----	----	----

PhD	Thesis Defence					12			NA		Final defense	100%
-----	----------------	--	--	--	--	----	--	--	----	--	---------------	------

total		30	30	30	30	30	30	486	4545	5031		
--------------	--	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	------------	-------------	-------------	--	--

To sum up, the programme includes:

- courses aimed at general research capacity building (required course “PHL7201 An Introduction to the Philosophy of Social Sciences”, elective courses “ECN7208 History of Economic Thought”, “PHL7209 Qualitative Methods in Research”, “LNG7210 Academic Writing”, “PHL7211 Let’s Talk Research” Series of Seminars);
- theoretical Economics courses (required courses “ECN7202 Optimization Theory in Economic Analysis”, “ECN7305 Advanced Microeconomics”, “ECN7306 Advanced Macroeconomics”, elective courses “ECN7315 International Trade Theory”, “ECN7312 Game and Contract Theory”, “ECN7313 Labour Economics”, “ECN7314 Advanced Behavioural Economics”, “ECN7316 Public Economic Management”);
- applied Economics methodology courses (required courses “ECN7203 Applied Microeconometrics”, “ECN7204 Applied Macroeconometrics”, “ECN7307 Causal Inference and Quasi-Experimental Research”).

Completing the classroom training as explained above should provide a solid background for further research. During the research work, PhD Candidates are assigned to their supervisors. In accordance with the SCES, each Doctorate student must be given two co-supervisors: a local supervisor and a foreign adviser. Additionally, the foreign advisers are expected to help students with organising their research internships (research practice) at the advisor’s home university/research institution. The aim of the research internship is to get international exposure. The internship is funded by the state scholarship. At HSE, the decision to replace the internship with another support from the foreign advisor might be considered, such as access to datasets, online research seminars, or another relevant training activity conducted at the host university, etc. The research internship might also be organised as a presentation at a recognised international conference abroad.

The PhD programme in Economics at the HSE includes a series of seminars “PHL7211 Let’s Talk Research”. “Let’s Talk Research” series was introduced by one of the HSE professors a few years ago as a series of seminars for emerging and established researchers. For example, in March 2021, within the series, the webinar “How to address the problem of predatory publications?” was organised by HSE. The webinar included three presentations: “Predatory publishing in Scopus” by Dr Martin Srholec (Economics Institute, Charles University, Czech Republic), “Publications of authors from Kazakhstan in predatory journals” by Dr Bulat Kenessov (Al-Farabi Kazakh National University), “Process-focused approach to publication as a strategy to avoid predatory publication” by Dr Ikboljon Qoraboyev (HSE KAZGUU). The series eventually evolved into the fully-fledged course, and with the launch of the PhD programme it will be organised as a training programme intended to increase awareness for research in academia and professional sectors. It will introduce participants to basic skills necessary for carrying out high-quality research in conformity with international standards by offering its participants a set of skills and best practices to start and finish globally competitive research projects. Seminars will be structured around four general topics: the importance of research and profile of a researcher in modern societies; fundamentals of the culture of publishing; European and international vocabulary of research projects; and life hacks for researchers working in developing countries. Participants will also learn how to build and maintain an online research iden-

tity and reputation. PhD student attending all seminars will be granted 5 ECTS credits towards an elective course.

Three key components are expected to assure research-based teaching.

Firstly, half of the taught courses are supposed to explain theoretical frameworks and methodologies using the examples from the recent theoretical and empirical economic literature. These are the following courses: ECN7305 Advanced Microeconomics, ECN7306 Advanced Macroeconomics, ECN7203 Applied Microeconometrics, ECN7204 Applied Macroeconometrics, ECN7307 Causal Inference and Quasi-Experimental Research Design. Specifically, the latter one is based on two famous textbooks by Angrist, J. D., & Pischke, J. S. that in turn are fully based on the real research data. Econometrics courses will also teach Doctorate students to code in R software replicating the codes with the data from that real high-profile research.

Secondly, as explained above, the PhD students will permanently be involved in the research seminars. Although the PhD programme is not launched yet, at the HSE a series of research seminars where researchers present their published and in work papers has been already established. In 2020/21 academic year one or two such seminars were delivered every month via Zoom.

Finally, constant interaction with the research supervisors as required by the programme will certify research-based training. Over the whole period of their study, each PhD researcher will be required to have not less than one meeting per month with their supervisor(s). This will be monitored by programme administrator by skimming over their brief reports uploaded to Canvas after each meeting. During the meeting PhD students are expected to discuss their research in progress.

Every spring every PhD Candidate will be required to present at the HSE Research Showcase organised by the HSE Graduate Programmes Office. Participation will be counted towards the research work credits and would be considered as a part of their research performance evaluated at the end of each academic year.

In addition, a large part of the programme is devoted to developing the future researchers' technical skills. These are, firstly, computational and programming skills. They will be shaped over the theoretical training in such courses as Applied Microeconometrics and Applied Macroeconometrics and Causal Inference and Quasi-Experimental Research. Each of these courses will include the labs where the students will be taught R software to handle and model real data. Further, they will be refined by processing and visualising data, doing estimations with R statistical packages for their own thesis. Since the programme is predominantly focussed on applied quantitative economics due to existing faculty expertise and demand for skills, PhD theses will have to represent high-quality independent and publishable empirical research in quantitative Economics.

The programme additionally will teach Doctorate students to process and model data and supply them with good data management skills useful in data analysis and business analytics. Therefore, the programme covers multidisciplinary qualification through deep advanced subject training.

Appraisal:

The experts formed the view that the curriculum of the study programme reflects the programme objectives, as described in Chapter 1.1, in a way that allows students to develop their research skills based on the scientific state of the art in the respective field.

There is a balanced mixture of courses in terms of content. They are arranged in a logical sequence and aimed at qualification and competency development. The elective modules included in the pro-

grammes provide for an acquisition of an in-depth theoretical, methodological and multidisciplinary knowledge and also practical skills in accordance with the preferences of students.

The goals of a doctoral degree according to the National Qualifications Framework of Kazakhstan and the European Qualifications Framework are fulfilled. The panel has no doubts that the programme corresponds with the PhD level. However, it formed the view that the formulation of the learning outcomes in the syllabuses could be more detailed according to Dublin descriptors for doctoral level and Bloom taxonomy.

The teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with the learning objectives, and it takes into account the associated relevant research. The course offer covers the relevant requirements to achieve the pursued research competency of the doctoral students.

The PhD programme ensures that graduates have methodological competence, are empowered to conduct academic work and can understand and assimilate specialist literature. Methodological competences are acquired by students in a number of modules on research methods and approaches, during the scientific and research work, the research internship, the scientific internship abroad, as well as in the process of preparing PhD thesis under the guidance of scientific supervisors and foreign scientific consultants. The internships and the high amount of research activities are aimed at qualification and competency development.

Multidisciplinary contents are part of the programme. The development of multidisciplinary competences and skills is promoted through the respective courses, the teaching and the research internship. Additionally, students develop communication and rhetorical skills by taking part at conferences, round tables and scientific seminars. Students are enabled to present their work and to discuss the knowledge gained in the specialised fields with their colleagues.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.2	Content					
3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		

3.3 Examination Procedures

In Kazakhstan, the PhD defense and PhD degree award could only be done by the special Expert Councils. There are two types of Expert Councils. National universities that are believed to be most research-intensive have their own Expert Councils and have a right to award PhD degrees. Other uni-

versities can establish their own Experts Councils but only under the permission of the Academic and Research Quality Assurance Committee under the Ministry of Education and Science (further referred to as ARQAC). The thesis defended in these Councils along with the relevant documentation should be sent to the ARQAC which is the degree-awarding body. The ARQAC verifies the quality of the thesis and its compliance with the principles of independence, internal unity, scientific novelty, reliability and applicability, and academic integrity (Degree Award Rules).

HSE has a plan to apply to the ARQAC to establish the Expert Council. The Council is required to be represented by at least six academics with degrees and publications in Economics where at least half of them should be affiliated with external universities or research organisations. Two thirds of the Council members should have the WoS or Scopus Hirsch index three and above or a certain number of publications in international peer-reviewed journals recognised by the ARQAC. Since the Expert Council could only be opened for three years, the application is planned to be submitted a year after the commencement of the PhD programme.

Submission of the thesis is possible after the official approval received from the supervisor(s). In line with the KAZGUU academic policy, it should be done in Canvas which routinely checks all written works via Turnitin. The policy declares zero plagiarism tolerance. The thesis should then be considered by the HSE Academic Quality Committee and recommended for submission to the Expert Council. In case, if no Expert Council was commenced by the HSE at the moment of submission of the first thesis, the PhD Candidate(s) would be recommended another Expert Council (or the list of recommended Councils) to apply to. The candidate will be present at the AQC meeting to address possible questions and receive feedback. The meeting should be also attended by the HSE graduate-level instructors with the relevant expertise, and their feedbacks will be accounted for. The appropriate quality of the thesis must be ensured by the supervisor's approval and is his/her responsibility (main supervisor, in case of more than one supervisor). However, in exceptional cases, the AQC reserves the right to not approve proceeding to the defence. The AQC decision should include a clear and transparent justification for the decision and further recommendations.

The final thesis should be assessed by a supervisor and the AQC against the following criteria:

- the thesis represents an original and independent piece of research generating new knowledge, critically evaluating and exploring relevant ideas, and relating them to a broader knowledge context
- throughout the thesis, the candidate demonstrates a systematic understanding of an academic field, research methods used, and the ability to independently conduct empirical research in Economics
- the thesis is of publishable quality.

The PhD thesis defence is an oral public examination. Universities and the Councils are not granted academic freedom to define a procedure. Each Expert Council member has to read the thesis in advance. Additionally, two non-anonymous reviewers with expertise in the relevant field are assigned. They should provide comprehensive reviews for a thesis before the defense where the reviews should be presented. The defended thesis with the accompanying documents (examination minutes, decisions, etc.) is then sent to the ARQAC for the degree award.

Appraisal:

The scientific and research work of PhD students aims for a systematic understanding of the research discipline and the control of the research methods which are applied in this field of research. The final state attestation, which consists of the comprehensive examination and the subsequent defence of the dissertation, also ensures that the PhD graduates have in-depth knowledge in their field of research and can carry out independent research activities.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examinations			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		

3.4 Didactic Concept

The programme's didactic concept is shaped following the commitment to academic freedom, academic integrity, active involvement of learners in the academic process, increasing responsibility, and the role of educators. The concept integrates various learning experiences to achieve the goal of the programme – to train a professional economist able to independently conduct advanced and potentially publishable applied research.

Every course incorporated into the programme contributes to the development of this knowledge and skills through its subject-specific didactic concept. Completing the academic training should equip the PhD Candidates with a background sufficient to conduct supervised research. Obligatory content which must be published before the beginning of the course includes the detailed syllabus of courses including information like those about required and recommended readings, details of assignments and examinations, ethical and academic integrity rules. Lecturers also upload reading and other course material to Modules section of Canvas which allows uploading material in different formats (pdfs, videos, URLs, etc). This allows students to access and work with course materials from anywhere independently. Independent learner's skills are one of the most important for a future researcher career.

After the course training accomplished, a PhD candidate is expected to fully focus on their research under comprehensive guidance from their supervisor (in some cases, supervisors). Several research capacity-building activities will be available for them over the period of study: research seminars, training activities, activities aimed at building on an understanding of how to write and publish academic papers, how to develop an academic career, scientific networking building events, etc. They are required to present their intermediary results at local and international research events. The outcome of the study is a good quality publishable applied Economics research paper that includes analysis, evaluation and synthesis of new and complex ideas – the thesis. Publication of the thesis or its part(s) in a high-quality peer-reviewed journal will verify the novelty and academic value of the research and ensure its quality.

Adoption of English language as the main medium of education allows students to deepen their knowledge of the subject at the same time helping them to acquire strong foreign language skills. Obligatory use of Canvas and Turnitin platforms strengthens flexibility of teaching and learning process both for professors and students.

Teaching will include academic lectures, discussions, research seminars, workshops and labs. Many courses assume reading and discussing relevant academic literature and cutting-edge research. The

assessments will include writing essays, reviews, reflective writing, coding assignments, modelling and interpreting the econometric outcomes. Generally, all courses' contents and assessments should boil down to preparing a PhD student for doing his/her own research.

Doctoral students will be given an opportunity to work on their thesis in the university premises, particularly, they will be allocated their offices at the HSE open space rooms. This will ensure they can effectively collaborate with each other and with their supervisors and other faculty.

A number of events will be organised throughout their study to create an effective networking and ideas exchange. The HSE Research Showcase is conducted every spring and each PhD researcher from year 2 and above will be required to present the intermediate results of their studies. We expect the showcases to have both poster and podium presentations. The showcase would be attended by PhD candidates, Master students, and senior undergraduate students, as well as the faculty. It will provide a research and ideas exchange platform, to make a community interact and network. The first HSE Research Showcase will take place in April 2021. Considering the current COVID-19 situation, it will be run online with only podium 15 minutes' presentations followed by questions and answers sessions.

Additionally, HSE regularly hosts research seminars where HSE researchers and guest speakers present their research. The guest speakers represent the universities abroad and in Kazakhstan and various research organisations. From 2021, when the situation with COVID-19 restrictions will return to normal, these seminars are expected to be conducted jointly with the Department of Economics of the Nazarbayev University – leading research-intensive and highly internationalised public university in Kazakhstan. The preliminary agreements with the Department have been discussed and achieved.

Last but not least, the PhD students are expected to be involved in faculty life and various team-building activities. This should integrate them into academic life and help them to cope with PhD life stress and anxiety. Additionally, the university psychological help team is available for all students, including PhDs.

Appraisal:

The didactical concept of the PhD programmes is fully aligned with the programmes' objectives. This concept takes into account a diversity of teaching methods.

When conducting scientific work independently or under the guidance of their supervisors and consultants, doctoral students develop skills of analysing, evaluating and synthesising theoretical concepts and practical material and forming professional judgement.

Foreign consultants and international guest lecturers are involved in the programmes; most of them come from partner universities abroad. By organising internships, Chair meetings and further scientific events as well as by encouraging PhD students to participate in conferences and seminars on the national and international level, the HSE promotes the exchange of experiences and research results between the students and researchers from other universities.

Being allocated to a supervisor ensures a continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

3.5 Professional Competencies/Employability

The curriculum is designed to enable students acquiring skills demanded by the future labour market. For that, all academic programmes are reviewed by the external stakeholders, particularly, by members of the HSE Business Council. HSE Business Council is a formal body within the School organisational structure responsible for shaping the strategy and further development. Regular annual meetings of the Business Council take place from 2015. They aim to bring the industry input into the HSE curricula.

For example, the programme in Economics is considered by the representative of the Economic Research Institute and other members of the HSE Business Council.

Specifically, the programme is aimed at developing empirical research competences in the first place. There seems to be emerging demand on high-quality applied research, especially, quantitative research from both academia and non-academic community. The programme will fill the gap in professional training of empirical economists-researchers at a level of PhD, thus ensuring their employability on the local labour market and labour market of neighbouring countries.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme is intended to convey the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research oriented fields of activity. In doing so, the professional qualification is aimed both at a research oriented activity (including teaching) as well as a practical vocational activity.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.5	Professional Competencies / Employability			X		

4. Scientific Environment and Framework conditions

4.1 Teaching Staff

The teaching staff for the PhD in Economics programme only includes the HSE instructors with Academically Qualified (AQ) status (as opposed to Professionally Qualified (PQ)).

To qualify for an AQ status and be eligible to teach in the graduate programme a faculty member should possess:

- A PhD degree from an internationally recognised university. Doctoral students are academically qualified if they are in the ABD (all but dissertation) or PhD Candidate stage,
- At least one published article in internationally recognised journals, such as Emerald journals, Springer journals, Interdisciplinary journals,
- Active involvement in research.

In an attempt to attract more full-time lecturers and strengthen the research capacity, in 2018/19 KAZGUU has introduced the academic ranks scheme providing the frame for academic promotion pathways. It introduced new academic posts called “international academic ranks”: instructor, lecturer, senior lecturer, adjunct professor, assistant professor, associate professor, professor. These posts are intended to be held by academics with internationally recognised credentials. They are better paid and allowed to allocate more time (from 50 % to 75 %) for research rather than teaching.

At the HSE, there are currently four faculty members hired within the “international academic ranks” scheme as Aqs, who have a PhD degree and graduates from a foreign university: University of Bath (UK), Heriot Watt University (UK), University of Toulouse (France), Newcastle University (UK). They will be involved in teaching the PhD programme.

Other faculty members – a PhD Candidate in Economics (Australian National University, Australia), who is expected to finish his PhD by the time of the programme start – and a part-time HSE professor with a PhD in Applied Mathematics and Statistics (University of Toulouse, France) as well as a PhD Candidate in Economics, Glasgow University UK will deliver courses as well.

These faculty members will supervise PhD students. Co-supervisors and foreign advisors will be assigned from the HSE partner institutions. For example, the preliminary agreements are achieved with Dr. Bauyrzhan Yedgenov, PhD in Economics, a senior research associate at the International Centre for Public Policy in the Andrew Young School of Policy Studies at Georgia State University (USA), Igor Kindop, PhD Candidate in Economics at the University of Kiel (Germany) and Daliya Kaskyrbaeva, PhD Candidate in Health Economics at the University of Leeds (UK), Dr Yerzhan Tokbolat, PhD in Finance, lecturer at Queens University Belfast.

All faculty members engaged in PhD programme either hold PhD degrees from the recognised international universities or are the PhD candidates approaching their thesis defence. Though most of them are young or emerging researchers, they are actively engaged in research and research collaboration.

The strategy of involving in PhD training and supervision of only PhDs from recognised foreign universities is chosen on purpose. They are expected to bring in the international research culture and best practices. This is a crucial element for achieving appropriate academic quality of training and research for future PhD students.

All teaching instructors intended to teach at a PhD level have sufficient teaching and Master theses supervision experience. During their studies at PhD level abroad, they have received teaching training, such as Introduction to Learning and Teaching in Higher Education (UK), Training for Postgraduate Teaching Assistants from the Economics Network (UK), and others. Additionally, they have been actively engaged in teaching activities as teaching fellows.

The faculty members will teach the courses linked to their academic background, specialisations, and their own research. The topics selected for PhD supervision will also be linked to research background and interests. This will ensure they have appropriate expertise for both teaching and supervision at a PhD level.

At the moment, the internationality of the teaching staff is represented by the following:

- All instructors who will teach and supervise at a PhD level are graduates of the recognised foreign universities and have international academic and research experience;
- Co-supervisors or advisors represented by the professors from partner universities abroad;
- Visiting professors (funded mostly via Erasmus+ mobility scheme) invited for short-time courses.

With the launch of the programme, there is an intention to enhance the internationality of the teaching staff by inviting visiting scholars for a longer period, among other things.

The programme coordination team is relatively small so far and represented by the faculty involved in the programme, Economics programme coordinator, the Dean who serves as a Programme co-coordinator and the Vice Dean for Graduate Studies, Research and Development. The team was actively engaged in designing the programme, development of the relevant internal regulations and guidance, collaboration with the external stakeholders regarding the programme and promotion of the programme.

The programme coordination team will be jointly involved in assessing the applications, conducting interviews with applicants where appropriate and making relevant decisions. Over the academic year, regular meetings of the team will take place for discussing the programme development and relevant issues. Internal research cooperation also evolves via research seminars where the faculty and graduate students share and discuss their own research.

The faculty selection is done by the HSE Performance Appraisal and Promotion Committee (PAPC). The following step is the University Selection Board. The Faculty appointment is made by the Chairman of the Board. The HR Department helps in announcing a vacancy, searching for appropriate candidates, and organising the Selection Board and hiring process. By the closing date of the vacancy, all the CVs collected by HR shall be handed to the HSE Dean who calls for a meeting of the HSE PAPC for further decision making. The PAPC decision shall be communicated back to the Dean who informs the HR and claims for further processing of the candidates' file.

Appraisal:

The planned structure and number of teaching staff corresponds with the requirements of the doctoral programme. The necessary professional breadth and depth in scientific education and the research sponsorship of the doctoral students is ensured. The contractual situation of the teaching staff guarantees a continuous execution of the doctoral programme.

Qualifications and competencies of staff are rated well to meet the requirements for good teaching. Based on information in the self-evaluation report of the HSE and the CVs of the lecturers involved in the programmes, the panel came to the conclusion that the research activities of the academic staff correspond with the requirements for PhD programmes and support the scientific education of the

doctoral students. During the online conference the panel learned that the University follows the goal of becoming a more research-oriented university instead of teaching-oriented. The newly implemented PhD in Economics and a revised MSc in Economics at HSE are part of this strategic goal.

A considerable number of teachers have relevant experience in international research and teaching abroad. The panel welcomes the international experience of faculty staff and sees potential that HSE might invite more foreign professors for teaching also for a longer term. This would promote students' intercultural competences. In addition, the School might also consider if additional events or classes for students, where intercultural competences can be promoted, can be offered.

The School verifies the academic as well as pedagogical and didactical qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure and in line with the University's regulations. Specific measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. For example, during the online conference the faculty staff confirmed that e.g. in 2020, several training seminars and webinars were held for faculty members on methodological aspects of online teaching.

Internal collaboration and coordination are ensured by the regular meetings of the teaching staff.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		

4.2 Cooperation and Partnership

Preliminary agreements have been achieved with the following external stakeholders:

- Asian Development Bank
- National Bank of Kazakhstan
- Centre for Labour Force Development under the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection
- Institute of Economic Research of the Ministry of the National Economy
- Applied Economics Research Centre
- Centre for Trade Policy Development of the Ministry of Trade and Integration of Kazakhstan
- Agency for Strategic Planning and Reforms
- Foreign and local universities (e.g. Angel Kanchev University (Russia), Arizona University (USA), Erasmus University of Opole (Poland), Geneva Business School (Switzerland), HOF University (Germany), La Rochelle Business School (France), Philipps Universität Marburg (Germany), Universidad de Cordoba (Spain), Université de Liege (Belgium), University of Dubrovnik (Croatia)).

These agreements specifically focus on joint research activities and research capacity building events that will specifically target the HSE PhD community. They include but not limited to the organisation of joint research seminars and participation at the HSE Research Showcase, organisation of research internships, mutual peer-review of the research reports, joint research and participation of the HSE PhD students in the partners’ research projects.

HSE seeks to build a research community that will include faculty, partner research-intensive organisations, and PhD students. For this, a number of joint events will be organised regularly. These events are the HSE Research Showcase, regular research presentations and research capacity-building events, involvement of the HSE professors and PhD students in partners’ research projects.

The networking would be ensured by regular research events as described above and participation of the young and emerging researchers at the research projects run by senior faculty. For example, the participation of junior faculty and PhD students is explicitly articulated in the research proposals recently submitted by the senior faculty members in various funding bodies.

While most of the research events are expected to be organised online due to limited opportunities in Kazakhstan, some of them will be organised in offline mode. The HSE especially relies on a collaboration with the leading research-intensive and highly international public university in Kazakhstan – Nazarbayev University. This collaboration will provide opportunities for beneficial networking for both senior faculty and young researchers. The MoU between institutions has been signed and the initial agreements have been achieved at the departments’ level.

Appraisal:

Cooperation with academic institutions and networks is actively pursued, which can result, among others, in finding suitable foreign scientific consultants for all PhD students, organising joint projects, events and student exchanges, inviting visiting lecturers.

Doctoral students will be encouraged to participate in relevant conferences and further scientific events. The scientific networking of KAZGUU and HSE has a recognisable benefit for future doctoral students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		

4.3 Programme Management

The programme coordination team is relatively small so far and represented by the faculty involved in the programme, Economics programme coordinator, the Dean who serves as a Programme co-ordinator and the Vice Dean for Graduate Studies, Research and Development. The team was actively engaged in designing the programme, development of the relevant internal regulations and guidance, collaboration with the external stakeholders regarding the programme and promotion of the programme.

The programme is intended to be administered by the HSE Graduate Programmes Office represented by the Vice Dean for Academic Support and Employment and Tutor Manager for Graduate Studies.

Support for the faculty would include but not limited to the following:

- At the beginning of each semester induction session and welcome events are organised by the Graduate Programmes Office where all faculty members meet to receive introductory information from the programme administration, ask questions, exchange ideas and discuss possible challenges;
- Didactical seminars for the faculty are organised on topics such as supervision, teaching, etc.;
- All programme and other relevant documentation is available at the “University Life for Faculty” module on Canvas.

Support for future students would be organised as follows:

- Induction and welcome meetings at the beginning of each year;
- Additional meetings with each year cohort for mostly administrative issues;
- Meetings with the Chairmen of the HSE AQC and Ethics Committees where the issues related to academic counselling and academic and research ethics are articulated to the students;
- Consultation hours for drop-in sessions are available for the graduate students once a week;
- Telegram channel (hse_graduate_students) for the graduate students where they can address relevant issues to the administration and their peers.

The following regulations constitute programme documentation:

- Academic Policy
- Handbook on Ensuring Academic Integrity
- University Admission Policy
- HSE Catalogue
- HSE Graduate Programme Handbook
- PhD Thesis Guide.

University Academic Policy, Handbook on Ensuring Academic Integrity and Admission Policy describe main policies, processes and regulations. HSE Catalogue includes a detailed description of the PhD programme, its learning outcomes and courses offered. Since the programme is fully delivered in English, the Catalogue is available in English only. HSE Graduate Programme Handbook describes the academic calendar, programme structure, briefly overviews academic policy specifically with regards to the graduate programmes, explains relevant processes such as thesis submission and other milestones, explain the facilities available for students including a library, Canvas and funding opportunities. Finally, the Thesis Guide outlines thesis requirements and the processes related to thesis writing and submission. Catalogue, Handbook and Thesis Guide are available at the main page of the HSE website.

Appraisal:

The organisation of the study process is based on the University-internal regulations and ensures the smooth operation of the study programmes. The structural organisation, the decision-making processes, competencies and responsibilities are established and implemented accordingly. Those involved are included in the decision-making process.

Faculty members and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of the study programme. During the online conference the panel talked to several persons from administration providing students academic and non-academic support and formed the view that sufficient administrative staff is available. Decision-making processes, authority, and responsibilities are clearly defined.

The requirements in terms of content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations are recognised through suitable documentation and publication. The interested parties also have access to the documentation in electronic form and it provides transparency.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.3	Programm Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support		X			
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

4.4 Material Resources

41 out of 78 university classrooms are equipped with stationary projectors. The University uses the VIA Go multimedia content system in 20 classrooms, which allows transferring images and video content from laptops and iOS / Android mobile devices to the projector wirelessly. Additionally, departments have movable projectors and laptops for teaching in classes without stationary equipment. There are 15 computer classes with 250 desktop and All-In-One computers with Internet access. The University has a free Wi-Fi network for all classrooms.

In 2021 the University opened the Atrium named after the second rector of the university Professor Shaikenov. It includes refurbished and furnished co-working areas, free zones and classrooms occupying more than 1200 square meters and equipped with computers, LCD panels and other equipment.

The online portal of the University has the e-mail address www.kazguu.kz. It has links to Platonus, Canvas, the system of electronic documents management 1C Enterprise and university Outlook.

Platonus – an electronic system designed by the MES and obligatory for use by all Kazakhstani HEIs – is integrated with Canvas and used by students for registering for the courses. It serves as a tool for student academic records. Canvas is used for all other academic purposes, such as exchanging the course materials and reaching students, conducting quizzes and exams, recording students' marks and attendance, running conferences and meetings.

M.S. Narikbayev Library (Library) space is multifaceted, with different social, cultural, and objective meanings, while also fostering, motivating, and inspiring collaborative and informal learning processes. There are nine halls at the library and open rooms. There are more than 60 Computer Workstations with Internet Access and Wi-Fi in the Library. Online booking service for Open Room is provided as well.

The Library provides access to the print collection (including textbook collection for students), licensed electronic book collection, digitized materials collection, rare books collection, periodicals collection and licensed electronic databases collection. The size of the print collection is around 39,000 unique titles of books on a wide variety of subject topics. The total number of copies is around 180,000 copies. As of October 2020, the Library provides trial access to nine high quality databases of scientific journals and books. Among them are Wiley Online Library, Cambridge Core, JSTOR, Hein Online, NexisUni, UNWTO, EL “Lan”.

Currently, there are 66 licensed ebooks in total, including ebooks from the Oxford Scholarship Online series and 41 ebooks available through EBSCO Information Services Aggregator Platform. Bibliographic Information about each library holding's item is available through indexing and bibliographic service at the Online Public Access Catalog at the Library official website¹⁰.

Among subscribed e-resources, there are Westlaw Next International Academics (Thompson Reuters), The Economist, The Wall Street Journal, Science Direct (Elsevier), Scopus (Elsevier), Web of Science (Clarivate Analytics). 66 Ebooks were purchased perpetually for instructors and students. Off-campus access to all e-resources is provided to library users through Proxy-server settings. Online Public Access Catalog (OPAC) is available on the Library website.

Library physical space consists of nine reading halls, Open Rooms and “Abonement” department. Literature Circulation is conducted in “Abonement” department. There is special Hall for PhD students and Professors. Library is open for KAZGUU community members and public from Monday to Saturday, from 9 am until 8 pm. Before the pandemic times the library was opened until 10 pm. During the academic sessions library is opened during 24 hours.

Library provides such services as instructional sessions both online and offline, reference service by online chat, email, online form or phone. Representatives from different Information resources providers are also invited as a guest trainer. Series of short Video instructions on how to use and access electronic catalogue is available on the Library YouTube channel¹¹.

¹⁰ <https://library.kazguu.kz/en/>

¹¹ https://www.youtube.com/channel/UcpVMthUsAWFCo4z0PrjV_UQ/featured

Appraisal:

Since an online conference was conducted, the panel did not have the opportunity to visit the University's building. The University has provided a virtual tour presenting the University's premises and facilities. Based on the materials provided, the panel formed the view that a smooth running of the University is ensured with regard to the capacities for research, studies, teaching and administration as well as the available rooms and facilities.

The library is accessible during most of the day. Access to relevant literature and digital media is available. Qualified library staff is there to advise students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		

4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

The University's sources of funding are:

- Income from educational activities (commercial basis);
- Income from the Ministry of Education and Science;
- Scientific and fundamental research;
- Income from rental of residential and non-residential premises.

Expenditure planning is carried out in accordance with the internal cost classification and legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The central budget is formed by combining the expenditure parts of the local budgets of the units, which is then integrated into a single form by the Department of Financial Development and Control.

One of the main factors of the University, in particular, deficit-free budget, and, at the same time, competitiveness, is the price of educational services. Therefore, each year, before the admission campaign, the Board approves the Register of the cost of educational services.

The Financial Development and Control Department monitors the effectiveness of the university's financial resources. An annual financial report on actual performance is prepared and is publicly available on www.gosreestr.kz (register of state enterprises and institutions, legal entities with state participation in the authorized capital), after approval by the Board of Directors.

Two types of scholarships would be available for the applicants to the PhD programme in Economics.

The state-funded scholarship covers full tuition fee, monthly allowance, travel expenses covering research internship or conference participation and some other expenses. At the moment, the scholarship places are distributed across subjects and universities by the Ministry of Education and Science. Only universities accredited by a recognised international accredited agency are eligible to participate in the scheme. With the change towards voucher-type scholarship funding which might be accepted soon, the student granted a scholarship upon centralised examination results consideration will have a right to choose a university among the list of eligible accredited universities.

For PhD students funded within the public scholarship scheme, the government compensates costs of their training to the university (in addition to the monthly allowance paid directly to the PhDs). Only three years are funded; the fourth year is waived from the scheme since no credit award activities are assumed during the fourth year but thesis writing-up and submission. The current amount is 3,921 thousand tenge or approx. 7,800 Euro for three years. For fee-based PhD students, the amount of tuition fee is not set yet but it should be not less than the government-funded scholarship compensation.

Recently introduced KAZGUU graduate-level scholarship will be allocated within the mentorship programme. The research mentorship programme aims to develop the young research community of KAZGUU in the relevant areas, particularly, Economics, Political Economy, Social Policy, and Management. This would be achieved via the scholarship programme that will offer scholarships to the HSE best achieving and motivated undergraduate and Master’s students interested in research and academic career. The scholarship will provide a waiver from the tuition fee for a further-level study academic programme at KAZGUU. Interested students are expected to contact their potential research mentors/supervisors and develop a research proposal based on a potential mentor’s/supervisor’s expertise. The research proposal along with the statement/motivation and two reference letters then should be submitted to the Award Committee (members of the Committee should include a potential mentor, two lecturers from the Master’s/PhD programme of interest, one member of the HSE Academic Quality Committee).

Additionally, in 2016, KAZGUU has founded the Corporate Fund “KAZGUU Endowment”. The aim of the Fund is to consolidate external financial resources to fund the university’s research, social, and infrastructure projects. For example, a number of classrooms have been refurbished thanks to financial support from Kazakhstani banks and international investors.

Additionally, the Fund supports students in need through charitable assistance. Students eligible for support:

- students from single-parent families;
- students from multi-member families (4 or more children in a family);
- students from low-income families with confirmed status;
- orphans and children left behind;
- students with special needs;
- students whose parent(s) are those with special needs or retirees.

The table below displays the total amount of financial support provided to the eligible HSE students by the “KAZGUU Endowment”:

Year	Number of stu-	Amount of finan-
------	----------------	------------------

	dents	cial assistance, KZT
2016-2017	1	96000
2017-2018	8	3,435,600
2018-2019	19	6,507,626
2019-2020	13	3,293,584
2020-2021	19	3,164,824
TOTAL	58	16,497,634
Note: exchange rate for Dec 2020 – 1 € = 513 KZT		

Appraisal:

Based on the information provided to the panel, the panel formed the view that the study programme is funded for the entire accreditation period so that students will definitely be able to complete their studies. Scholarship programmes and financial support are available.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		

5. Quality Assurance

Quality Assurance (QA) is achieved and managed by QA Policy and the following QA documents:

- Academic and Research Council bylaws
- School Committees bylaws
- Academic Policy
- Handbook on Ensuring Academic Integrity
- Inclusive Education Policy
- Examination Regulations
- Thesis Guidelines
- Academic Integrity League Standards.

Three QA Units are responsible for the implementation of the QA Documents: Academic and Research Council, School Committees and QA Manager (QAM).

Academic and Research Council is the highest academic body of the University that determines the development of academic and research activity at the university level, approves all QA Documents, creates, modifies and eliminates academic units. All powers and responsibilities of the Academic and Research Council are listed in the Academic and Research Council bylaws approved by the Management Board.

School Committees are the collegiate bodies of Schools that determines the development of academic and research activity at the school level, review students' appeals and ensures the quality of the content of all courses taught by school faculty. A school committee is composed of faculty members, one student and school administration.

QAM is responsible for monitoring the implementation of all QA Mechanisms, publishing the latest versions of all QA documents on the official website, reporting data analysis and interpretation to the Academic and Research Council, School Committees, Provost and Chairman of the Management Board. QAM may request any information relating to the academic process from Schools and other departments and provides recommendations to the Academic and Research Council and School Committees.

QA mechanisms are divided into two groups: internal and external.

Internal QA Mechanisms are assured by the QA Documents and include academic programmes' development, course design, registration process, inclusive education, teaching quality, assessment quality, examinations, credit-bearing internships, students' final projects, master theses and doctoral dissertations, student appeal, student satisfaction survey, teacher motivation and job satisfaction survey, alumni survey and employer feedback. Each Internal QA Mechanism represents a cycle consisting of four stages: Plan, Do, Check and Act. In order to ensure quality control and enhancement, at least two QA Units participate in Check and Act stages.

External QA Mechanisms are represented by the following:

- participation of external stakeholders in the design and review of academic programmes
- compliance with the Academic Integrity League's principles and regular monitoring
- participation at the national Ranking of Educational Programmes' carried on by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs
- international accreditations.

The HSE Academic Quality Committee (9 faculty staff (voting), 1 student (voting), 6 administrators (non-voting)) is a QA body of the HSE that is involved in all academic issues related to the programme design, review, assessment and communicating the quality issues to relevant bodies of the university.

Specifically, AQC is responsible for the following:

- Annually reviews all academic issues related to the content and structure of curricula of the HSE programmes, including programme learning objectives, learning outcomes, student workload, assessment methods, graduate employment and stakeholder satisfaction.
- Annually reviews all admission requirements and regulations to ensure better academic standing of the candidates.
- Reviews the procedures and processes related to admission, studying, examinations, academic grievance handling and graduation to ensure that the measures are taken in an appropriate manner.
- Prepares a summary report on a regular basis (after each semester is completed) and submit it to the HSE Dean and QAM for the further review.

One of the main strategic objectives of the Higher School of Economics is to strengthen research component of the School both by promoting research activities of its faculty and by implementing inquiry-based learning strategies in teaching. Developing research at HSE will contribute to improving of teaching quality, increase international recognition of HSE, professional development of its faculty members and also to improve national and international standing of KAZGUU as a whole, among others. This is especially important for the newly launched PhD in Economics programme. Due to this important focus, HSE has taken several substantial steps to achieve this objective. These steps include recruiting full-time faculty members with PhD degrees and strong research profile; promoting international research publications; organising research-capacity building programmes such as 'Let's Talk Research' workshops.

HSE undertakes different measures to maintain research quality and ethics in the context of increasing research activities:

1. Recruiting faculty members with PhD training in internationally recognised Universities directly contributes to ensure research quality.
2. In 2020-2021, HSE transformed existing Disciplinary Committee which was mostly responsible for considering teaching-related cases into Committee of Ethics. It expanded its responsibility to cover promotion of research ethics. HSE faculty members are encouraged to follow KAZGUU and HSE regulations and guides which include strict expectations regarding academic and research integrity. Moreover, KAZGUU is a member of Academic Integrity League which promotes best practices in academic and research integrity.
3. In 2020-2021, HSE established position of Vice-Dean for Graduate Studies, Research and Development in order to promote research development as well as implement inquiry-based learning methods.
4. HSE also offers on continual basis 'Let's Talk Research' workshops. This bottom-up initiative is intended for young lecturers and researchers of HSE where they are provided insights about strategies to ensure research ethics and integrity.
5. HSE established incentives for full-time faculty members to publish in peer-reviewed international journals of good standing (incentives include reduced teaching time, priority recognition of publications during KPI evaluation). Focus on this category of journals (peer-review, high ethical and academic standards) allows avoiding research misbehaviour like predatory publications.

The PhD programme in Economics will be systematically embedded in the quality concept of the University and the HSE. The quality of teaching and research would be assured by a routine overseeing of the following:

- Only PhDs or PhD Candidates with degrees received from the recognised international universities and established or promising research careers will teach in the programme and supervise the PhD students.
- Some required and majority of elective courses are designed in a way to embed the previous and current research agenda and expertise of the HSE researchers.
- Regular research seminars and research capacity building workshops will be specifically organised for the HSE PhD students within the HSE research network established with the leading local public research-intensive university, research institutions, foreign universities and independent researchers.
- Regular meetings with the supervisory teams monitored via Canvas by the programme administration.
- Annual Progress Review procedure will allow to systematically oversee a PhD student's progress and take appropriate measures when needed.
- PhD Candidates will be required to present at the annually organised HSE Research Showcase to develop their research presentation skills and get supportive and constructive feedback from the senior researchers and their peers.
- In accordance with the existing regulations the PhD Candidates are required to have publication(s) including at least one at a recognised international peer-reviewed journal.
- A decision to recommend (or not to recommend) a PhD thesis for the final examination will be considered and made by the HSE Academic Quality Committee represented by the HSE academics.
- The final examination will be carried out by an independent (or partially independent) Expert Council represented by at least six academics with degrees and publications in Economics.
- The degree will be awarded by the independent body - the Academic and Research Quality Assurance Committee under the Ministry of Education and Science.

Regarding the evaluation of the courses, at the end of each semester, a School Committee conducts a teaching quality evaluation survey for each course. A School Committee develops the methodology and questions, which are reviewed by QM. The survey is conducted by a School Committee two weeks before the end of a semester. A School Committee accumulates the data, analyses the results, and then sends the report to School management, ARC and QM. Individual results and recommendations are sent to faculty members whose courses were assessed in the survey.

Additionally, each year the QAM will conduct an anonymous survey specifically developed for future HSE PhD students to evaluate their satisfaction with supervision and research environment. The results of the survey will be processed by QAM and presented to the HSE Dean and AQC. All possible conflicts of interests will be considered, especially due to a few numbers of students and a possibility to identify them with regards to sensitive topics they might raise. The issues raised by the PhD students will be thoroughly considered and addressed.

Once a year (usually, at the end of the academic year), the school dean conducts a meeting with students in the form of an open forum where the dean makes a presentation for students on the HSE performance and goals. The presentation also covers the teaching evaluation results overall, so the students are given feedback on what measures the HSE is taking to address the students concerns and recommendations.

The Annual Progress Review procedure assumes consideration of each Doctoral student's progress by the HSE AQC. The student's supervisor should be present at this meeting and expected to provide feedback on his/her student's progress and reflect on the overall quality of the programme, how smooth it goes on, and raise concern when necessary. The meeting will be attended by the programme coordination team. The AQC will discuss the issue and recommend an area where there is

room for improvement. The meeting's minutes must provide a formal conclusion by the AQC and guide the programme team and administration for further actions to be taken.

HSE Alumni Survey (AS) was introduced in Fall 2014. It is collected annually by the HSE Internship, Career and Employment Centre (ICEC) via Google Forms followed by phone interviews. The survey aims to reveal the graduates' employment data and their level of the competence-industry fit during the first year after graduation. At the HSE level, the survey results are addressed with the AQC at their agenda. The academic quality issues with regard to the programme content and structure are also revealed through the Alumni Club meetings.

The HSE Alumni Club agenda is shown in the HSE Alumni Club bylaws. Alumni Club is aimed to:

- Contribute to the HSE programmes' competitiveness
- Strengthen and further develop HSE Alumni Relations
- Support the HSE Alumni in their further professional development
- Contribute to the HSE strategic decision-making
- Support HSE students in the Internship and job hunting process
- Contribute to the development of the HSE Endowment Fund
- Contribute to the HSE image on the market.

Both tools will be employed for evaluation of the PhD programme by future graduates.

Evaluation by external peers is expected to be achieved via verification of the quality of research through publishing them in the international high-quality peer-reviewed academic journals. As mentioned above, PhD Candidate must publish to be eligible to submit the thesis. Additionally, the thesis will be defended at the external Expert Council.

The programmes' academic quality evaluation by employers is done through a channel of the HSE Business Council. The main aim of the HSE Business Council is to help HSE in bringing the industry input into the HSE curricula. The HSE Business Council general meetings are held at least once a year and the proceedings are documented and communicated to the AQC, academic staff and the relevant HSE offices.

Appraisal:

There is a quality assurance procedure in place which is systematically used for continuous monitoring and further development of quality in terms of content, processes and results. The responsibilities are clearly defined. The quality assurance of the doctoral programme is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the higher education institution. Furthermore, the quality assurance procedure is specifically aimed at promoting the young researchers.

There is a planned regular evaluation concerning the implementation of the programme carried out by the doctoral students as well as supervisors according to a predefined procedure; the results are going to be discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development.

Finally, there is also a planned involvement of third parties; the results will find their way into the process of quality development as well.

Quality Ratings

		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results		X			
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders)			X		

Quality Profile

Institution: M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University, Higher School of Economics

PhD in Economics



Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market			X		
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	In the research fields			X		
1.3.2	Outside the research fields			X		
1.4	The positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		
3.	IMPLEMENTATION					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulation			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		
3.2	Contents					

3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examination			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		
3.5	Professional Competencies/Employability			X		
4.	SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		
4.3	Programme Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		

4.3.2	Management Support		X			
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results		X			
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders)			X		