

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee



4th Meeting on November 26, 2021

PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

Project Number: 21/011, Cluster 3
Higher Education Institution: Universitas Diponegoro
Location: Semarang, Central Java, Indonesia
Study Programmes: Doctor of Economics (Doktor Ilmu Ekonomi)
Type of Accreditation: Initial accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decision:

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from January 1, 2021, the study programme is accredited with one condition.

Period of Accreditation: November 26, 2021 to November 25, 2026

Condition:

The University implements an anonymous evaluation form that collects student feedback about the workload for each course (see chapter 5).

The conditions are fulfilled.

The decision was made by the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee on November 30, 2022

Proof of meeting these conditions is to be supplied by August 25, 2022.

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.

Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution (HEI):

Diponegoro University in Semarang, Central Java,
Indonesia

Doctoral programme:

Doctor of Economics: Doktor Ilmu Ekonomi

General Information on the Study Programme

Brief description of the doctoral programme:

The Doctoral Programme in Economics (PDIE) is a research-oriented degree programme designed for candidates with prior research and training in economics, management, and accounting with strong analytical and critical components, who wish to prepare themselves for teaching and research in academia or for positions in government, research organisations or business enterprises. The programme offers three main specialisations: economics, management and accounting. Upon completion of the programme, students are awarded a PhD degree as a result of their production of a doctoral thesis and publishable research over a period of three years.

Type of study programme:

PhD programme

Projected study time and number of credits assigned to the study programme:

3 years (6 semesters) – 82.3 ECTS credits (52 SKS credits¹)

Mode of study:

full-time

Didactic approach:

study programme with obligatory class attendance

Double/Joint Degree programme:

No

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:

3 classes (one for each concentration: Economics, Management, and Accounting). A maximum of 50 students will be accepted each year across all classes (20, 20, 10 for each concentration, respectively)

Programme cycle starts in:

summer semester (August)

Initial start of the programme:

2002

Type of accreditation:

Initial Accreditation

Accreditation in one cluster (cluster 3) with:

Bachelor of Management (S.M.)

Bachelor of Economics (S.E.)

Master of Management (M.M.)

Master of Economics (M.E.)

¹ *Satuan Kredit Semester* (Semester Credit Units)

Procedure

A contract for the initial accreditation of the Doctor of Economics Programme (PhD) was made between FIBAA and the Universitas Diponegoro on February 16, 2021. On July 5, 2021 the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of²:

Prof. Dr. Reinhard Bachmann

University of London, United Kingdom

Professor of International Management (Business Administration, General Management, International Management, Strategic Management, Public Management, Public Policy, Marketing, Human Resource Management, Entrepreneurship, Leadership)

Dr. Fosa Sarassina

Bisnis Universitas Gadjja Mada, Indonesia

Country Expert and Lecturer (Management, Entrepreneurship)

Esther Tabea Schmidt

Hochschule fuer Technik und Wirtschaft des Saarlandes, University of Applied Sciences, Germany

Student of Management and Leadership (M.A.); completed: Business Administration (B.A.)

Robert Schmitz

Tengelmann Audit GmbH, Germany

Head of the Internal Auditing Department of the Tengelmann Group (Auditing, Business Processes, Human Resources Management, Quality Assurance Economics)

Prof. Dr. Barbara Schnieders

European University of Applied Sciences (EUFH), Bruehl, Germany

Professor of European Economics (Economics, International Relations, Sustainability Management)

FIBAA project manager:

Adriane Janosch

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, as requested by the panel, and an online conference (because of the Covid-19 pandemic). The online conference took place on September 20 till September 23, 2021 with representatives of UNDIP via the video conferencing tool *Zoom*. At the end of the online conference, the panel has given a short feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.

² The names are presented in alphabetical order.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on November 8, 2021. The statement on the report was given up on November 11, 2021, it has been taken into account in the report on hand.

Summary

The PhD programme in Economics offered by Diponegoro University (UNDIP) fulfils with a few exceptions the FIBAA quality requirements for PhD programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on November 26, 2021 and finishing on November 25, 2026, under one condition. The programme is in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

The panel members identified need for improvement regarding the Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results. They recommend the accreditation on condition of meeting the following requirement:

Condition:

The University implements an anonymous evaluation form that collects student feedback about the workload for each course (see chapter 5).

Proof of meeting these requirements is to be supplied by August 25, 2022.

The panel members identified two areas where the programme could be further developed:

- The panel recommends that the description of the objectives of the programme, especially with regard to the three concentrations, be more specifically elaborated with regard to economics, management and accounting (see chapter 1.1).
- The panel recommends that the professional qualification for employment outside the higher education sector be given greater consideration and included in the profile of the programme (see chapter 1.3).

The measures the HEI eventually takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members are to be considered in the context of the next re-accreditation.

For the overall assessment please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

List of Tables

Table 1: Statistical Data	9
Table 2: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Economics)	20
Table 3: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Accounting)	21
Table 4: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Management)	22
Table 5: Development of competences and skills in PhD programme Economics	26
Table 6: Structure and number of teaching staff	35

Information on the Institution

Universitas Diponegoro (UNDIP) is one of the oldest public universities in Indonesia and was established on January 09, 1957. It is located in Semarang, Central Java, Indonesia. Currently, Universitas Diponegoro has eleven faculties, one postgraduate programme, and one vocational school with 56,461 students in total. Since the enactment of the Government Regulation Number 52 of 2015, UNDIP holds the status of Legal Entity State University (PTNBH³).

According to the *4 International College & Universities (4ICU) UniRank*, UNDIP was part of the top three universities in Indonesia in 2021, and according to *Times Higher Education (THE) World University Ranking (WUR) 2021*, UNDIP was ranked fourth among nine universities in Indonesia, and was ranked 1001-1200 internationally. In addition, the *QS World University Rankings* ranked UNDIP 801-1000 in 2020.

UNDIP has a strong commitment to improve the quality of education towards global standards by continuously improving the quality of education for its students, increasing the quantity and quality of research and scientific publications, and contributing to society through community services. Therefore, its vision is that “Universitas Diponegoro is to become an excellent research university” nationally and internationally by being in the Top 500 of the QS World University Rankings. To realise this vision, UNDIP set the following goals:

- Organise education to produce excellent and competitive graduates.
- Conduct research-based publications as well as community services that produce publications, Intellectual Property Rights (IPR), textbooks, policies, and technologies, which are effective and efficient by prioritising local culture and resources.
- Developing professionalism, capability, and accountability in a good university governance, and independence in the administration of higher education.

In order to internationalise, UNDIP is opening international class programmes in various study programmes, allocating scholarship opportunities for applicants from abroad through the *Diponegoro Master Scholarship programme (DISS)* and the *Diponegoro Exchange Experience Programme (DEEP)*, and is also cooperating with leading universities in the world to facilitate UNDIP’s students to study abroad and vice versa.

In terms of quality assurance, most of the study programmes have been nationally accredited with an ‘A’ rating by the National Accreditation Agency for Higher Education (BAN-PT⁴) (cf. p.3 self-evaluation report).

The Doctoral Programme in Economics (hereafter called PDIE), was officially established on March 11, 2002. The establishment of the PDIE was based on the Letter of the Directorate General of Higher Education, Ministry of Education and Culture No. 497 / D / T / 2002 dated March 11, 2002 concerning the Permission to deliver doctoral programme in economics at UNDIP.

The Doctoral Programme in Economics is a research-oriented degree programme designed for candidates with prior research and training in economics, management, and accounting with strong analytical and critical components, who wish to prepare themselves for teaching

³ Perguruan Tinggi Nasional Berbadan Hukum

⁴ Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi

and research in academia or for positions in government, research organisations, or business enterprises. The programme offers three main concentrations (or study majors): economics, management, and accounting. Upon completion of the programme, students are awarded a PhD degree as a result of their production of a doctoral thesis and publishable research over a period of three years.

PDIE has maintained an A (Excellence) accreditation from the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN-PT) as stated in the Decision Letter of BAN-PT Number: 2063 / SK / BAN-PT / Ak-PPJ / D / IV / 2020.

Statistical data

Since 2019, the maximum quota of admitted students has been 50 students per admission period (intake in August, once a year). The total student body at the end of the 2020/2021 academic year was 290 students, two of which were foreign students (from Libya and Yemen). Across the last six years, a total of 238 students have graduated with an average study period of 4.3 years and an average GPA of 3.65 (cf. p.5 self-evaluation report).

Table 1: Statistical Data

		(2018/2019)	(2019/2020)	(2020/2021)
# Study Places		55	55	55
# Applicants	Σ	65	65	66
	f	30	25	29
	m	35	40	37
Application rate		118,18%	118,18%	120,00%
# First-Year Student	Σ	53	45	51
	f	24	20	25
	m	29	25	26
Rate of female students		45%	44%	49%
# Foreign Students	Σ	0	0	2
	f	0	0	0
	m	0	0	2
Rate of foreign students		0%	0%	4%
Percentage of occupied study places		96,36%	81,82%	92,73%
# Graduates	Σ	45	40	44
	f	20	19	21
	m	25	21	23
Success rate		84,91%	88,89%	86,27%
Dropout rate		15,09%	11,11%	13,73%
Average duration of study		4,34	4,10	4,29
Average grade of final degree		3,62	3,66	3,73

Appraisal

During the assessment, the panel was able to observe that UNDIP admits its students selectively, so that despite the high number of applicants, not all study places are allocated to en-

sure that qualified students are admitted. The statistical data also show that the numbers of applicants are relatively stable. Regarding the gender equality the panel notices the number of female and male students is relatively balanced.

Regarding the longer average duration of study of students - four instead of three years - UNDIP explains by the lack of monitoring of dissertation progress and publication. For this reason, since 2020/2021, the additional approach of requiring students and supervisors to record all activities concerning dissertations and their publication in a logbook called as *Buku Kendali Kegiatan Penulisan Disertasi & Publikasi Ilmiah* has been implemented. UNDIP explains that this logbook is used as a medium to evaluate and monitor dissertation and publication progress and identify the need for any necessary action for those experiencing problems with their dissertation and publication. The panel welcomes the fact that measures are already being taken to improve this matter.

Description and Appraisal in Detail

1. Goals and Strategy

1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programme

PDIE is part of the Faculty of Economics and Business of Universitas Diponegoro with the overall vision to be an entrepreneurial faculty with a leading role in transformative development through research, learning, innovation and collaboration in economics and business. The vision and mission of the Faculty of Economics and Business is in line with the vision and mission of Universitas Diponegoro to produce graduates with the profile of a communicator, professional, leader, entrepreneur, thinker and educator. This is specified in the definition of the following skills and attributes which graduates should have:

- a) Communicator means graduates can communicate well orally and in writing.
- b) Professional means graduates carry out their work based on applicable ethics, procedures and rules.
- c) Leader means that graduates have the skills to become a leader who is adaptive, honest, brave, caring and fair.
- d) Educator means graduates can become educators or teachers so that they can effect change in society.
- e) Thinker means that graduates are able to think critically so that their thinking can become a reference for the community.
- f) Entrepreneur means graduates are able to seize opportunities independently according to their fields.

The programme offers three main concentrations (or study majors): economics, management, and accounting.

According to UNDIP, the main objective of PDIE is to produce creative, innovative and transformative graduates capable of developing and disseminating knowledge and solving problems in economics, management or accounting through interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary or transdisciplinary approaches. Graduates of the programme aim for national and international recognition in research and professional fields. The PhD programme is based on the National Standards for Higher Education of Indonesia (Standar Nasional Pendidikan Tinggi) and the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia KKNI) level 9, therefore, the following learning outcomes are defined to obtain these objectives:

1. Research skills: students are trained to become innovative and transformative researchers who are capable of gaining national and international recognition due to their ability to produce high-quality, original and publishable research for both academic and non-academic settings using interdisciplinary, transdisciplinary or multidisciplinary research approaches.
2. Analytical and social skills: students are equipped with the mathematical and statistical tools and socio-cultural understanding necessary for their future careers.
3. Problem-solving skills: students are taught how to solve complex problems in economics, management and accounting through the application of their acquired technical tools and socio-cultural understanding, as well as the identification and correct use of data sources.

4. Presentation and writing skills: students are equipped with the skills needed to present their work in both seminars and written format for the benefit of their future careers.

These objectives are supported by ambition to expand international networks; the Faculty of Economics and Business at UNDIP is currently collaborating with universities in various countries around the world, including Haaga-Helia University of Applied Sciences (Finland), Saxion University of Applied Sciences (Netherlands), Université de Nantes (France), Curtin University (Australia), Tunghai University (Taiwan), Nagoya University (Japan). Moreover, the University wants to expand its collaborations with several universities in Canada and Europe, too.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme corresponds to the goals of the European and national qualification framework. The doctoral programme and the pursued qualification and competency goals are matched with each other. During the online conference, the panel learned from students and alumni that in most cases the graduates get a job as lecturer at Universitas Diponegoro or other universities. This confirms that the objectives the programme meets the required academic expectations and standards. The panel appreciates the PhD programme's goal of focusing on research and academic careers, however, the panel **recommends** that the description of the objectives of the programme, especially with regard to the three concentrations, be more specifically elaborated with regard to economics, management and accounting.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1*	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		

1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market

UNDIP states that there is a lot of competition on the doctoral education market in Indonesia; inter alia due to the government policy that encourages lecturers to hold doctoral degrees. The PDIE, which was founded on March 11, 2002, thus has a strong position in the doctoral education market for economics, management and accounting at the national level. This is reflected by the number of applicants that exceeds the number of study places every year. The applicants not only come from various regions in Indonesia, but also from Libya and Yemen. In terms of content, applications for the programme come from various academic disciplines with a focus on economic and business sciences (e.g., management, accounting, economics), but also engineering and psychology. Moreover, the PhD programme is also considered a reference in the development of economics, management and accounting. A number of textbooks, reference books and scientific articles published in international journals, originating from PDIE, have been cited by other researchers, both nationally and internationally. The PhD programme has access to its own Bloomberg Laboratory through the faculty. This was the first of its kind in Indonesia that provides various financial and business databases for research, publication and business purposes. On top of that, the faculty also

holds an Entrepreneurship Clinic and Business Incubator that contributes to the advantages of the programme. The Faculty of Economics and Business has been ranked among the 600+ of the Time Higher Education-THE World University Ranking-WUR in 2021⁵.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme is positioned convincingly in the postgraduate education market due to the described profile and the pursued qualification and competency goals. The applicants and students come from various regions in Indonesia, some even from other countries.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the educational market			X		

1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates

UNDIP states that PDIE has a very strong position in the doctoral graduate job market, especially for jobs related to education and research, but also business. UNDIP has reviewed the graduates of the last five years regarding the performance in their research fields. Within this time, many PDIE graduates have published their research in Scopus-indexed international journals or SINTA-indexed national journals including citations by other researchers (cf. p. 9 self-evaluation report). In addition, some PDIE graduates hold positions at other universities or institutions and are invited as reviewers of national and international scientific journals. As of 2020, 15 graduates held the position of professor at UNDIP and other universities. Finally, PDIE graduates are also frequently invited to speak at national and international seminars and conferences and frequently win research grants provided by the government, private sector or their own educational institutions.

Even though PDIE graduates in most cases hold positions in research and academia, UNDIP states that there are also opportunities for doctoral graduates in other fields outside of research and science. In addition to graduates who are appointed by their institutions to hold structural positions (Vice Rector, Dean, Vice Dean, Head of Study Programmes and others), graduates also become consultants to government or other public or private organisations.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme with special focus on professional qualification for science and research is positioned convincingly due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research. The majority of graduates make a career in academia and work as lecturers at UNDIP or other universities.

⁵ [Diponegoro University Ranking \(scimaqoir.com\)](https://scimaqoir.com)

The doctoral programme is also strongly positioned outside the science and research field by taking into account the professional qualification for employment due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research. Although most graduates work as lecturers after finishing their PhD, they are qualified for other career paths in terms of skills in research and practice (see chapter 1.1). Some graduates work in public institutions or as consultants in other organisations. As UNDIP (and also other HEIs) in Indonesia encourages its teaching staff to pursue a PhD degree, a large proportion of the graduates are teaching at UNDIP or at another HEI. The panel welcomes the focus on research and academic career of the PhD graduates, but would like to **recommend** that, in addition, the professional qualification for employment outside the higher education sector be given greater consideration and included in the profile of the programme. This could also lead to opening up the applicant market of the PhD programme to more diverse student body.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	in the research fields			X		
1.3.2	outside the research fields			X		

1.4 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

PDIE has an important position within the strategic concept of Universitas Diponegoro. PDIE's vision and mission are in line with the overall vision and mission of the University, which is to become a superior research university. The PhD programme offers graduates from their own and other Master programmes to further qualify for an academic career. Most PDIE graduates go on to work as researchers and lecturers at UNDIP. With their research and findings, they contribute to solve problems and point out phenomena in the research fields of economics, management and accounting. Furthermore, they also represent the University when participating in national seminars and presenting at international conferences, as well as when publishing in international journals. Some PDIE lecturers also have won research grants which support their achievements. The role of PDIE lecturers in the public sphere is well known in Indonesia, which further strengthens the PDIE strategic position. PDIE lecturers hold several roles and participate in numerous events and organisations, e.g.:

1. The Indonesian Association of Economists (ISEI)
2. External examiners and visiting professors at Indonesian and foreign universities
3. The Indonesian Institute of Accountants, Central Java Region
4. Assessors of the National Accreditation Agency for Higher Education – BAN PT
5. Reviewers at the National Accounting Symposium
6. National Defense Institute – LEMHANNAS
7. Speakers at both international and national forums
8. Reviewers for various national and international journals

9. Assessors for ABEST21 international accreditation

10. Chairperson of AFEBI – Association of Indonesian Faculty of Economics and Business

As can be seen from these roles, PDIE lecturers contribute actively to the scientific development in the research fields accounting, management and economics. This makes, according to UNDIP, PDIE an important reference in these research disciplines in Indonesia. Moreover, PDIE international publications (by lecturers and students) have contributed to the achievement of the University in the international university ranking since the Faculty of Economics and Business is included among the 600+ of the Time Higher Education-THE World University Ranking-WUR in 2021. Besides, considering the international publication ranking (the 2021 SCImago Institution Rankings), the Faculty of Economics and Business is ranked 7th (Indonesia), 146th (Asia) and 588th (World) in the subject of business, management and accounting (cf. p. 10 self-evaluation report).

Appraisal:

The goal oriented integration of the programme in the strategic concept of the higher education institution is described and presented in a comprehensive manner. The panel appreciates the PhD programme regarding the strategic concept of UNDIP since this programme expands the University's offerings and enables graduates of a Master's programme to further their academic qualifications in order to pursue an academic career. In addition, UNDIP has the opportunity to train its own lecturers through this programme.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.4	The Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		

1.5 Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities

PDIE strongly promotes gender equality and equal opportunities in doctoral education. It is formalised in the Rector Regulation Number 5/2020 regarding academic regulations for Postgraduate Programmes at Universitas Diponegoro (and amended by the Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020), stating that all interested parties should respect all issues concerning gender equality and equal opportunities both on and off campus. All activities, from student and faculty member recruitment to the appointment of faculty members to the learning process, are carried out with equality and fairness, regardless of gender, religion, ethnicity or personal circumstances. All learning processes and assessment are based purely on academic merit. Thus, all candidates have an equal opportunity to submit and complete their study at PDIE. As a consequence, the student body of the programme consists of 52 % males and 48 % females, who come from different areas of Indonesia (from Aceh to Papua) and from outside Indonesia. PDIE also provides students and faculty mem-

bers who encounter problems with gender equality and equal opportunity with consultation and litigation services. Furthermore, PDIE provides any special educational needs or provisions not only for these students, but also for those with disabilities. Students with disabilities are provided with special access or facilities, such as lifts, to facilitate their learning experience. All academic and administrative rooms are placed on the first floor to enable easy access. PDIE, through UNDIP programmes, also supports students with limited financial resources by providing a number of scholarships.

Appraisal:

UNDIP fulfils its tasks in this doctoral programme by promoting gender equality and the enforcement of general prohibitions on discrimination. A claim for disadvantage compensation for disabled students in terms of temporal and formal requirements in the programme as well as for all concluding or accompanied certificates of achievement and within the framework of aptitude testing procedures is ensured. This procedure is formalised by the University in Rector Regulation Number 5/2020 and is therefore part of their governance.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		

2. Admission

The implementation of new student admissions at Universitas Diponegoro can be seen at UNDIP's website for information and technical entry for university admission for Vocational, Bachelor (Undergraduate), Masters, Profession and Doctoral Programmes. Brief information about the type of entry pathways, applicant requirements, and registration procedures can be obtained by clicking on the menu provided. Information about the time, cost, and type of test for each pathway can also be found by all stakeholders.

To be admitted to the PhD in Economics, applicants must have a Master's degree in economics, management and accounting or similar subject areas. Prospective doctoral students are graduates of a master's degree or equivalent from Higher Education Institutions of which the study programme has at least a national "B" accreditation.

In addition, prospective students must submit

- a research proposal,
- letters of permission from the working institution/agency to continue doctoral studies (for those already working),
- two letters of reference from university teachers with whom he/she has studied or other persons deemed suitable for prospective students and
- provide a minimum TOEFL score of 450 for English language proficiency.

The selection of applicants takes place through an assessment which is based on the Academic Potential Tests (TPA), English test, and Substance Tests of Study Programme (interview or written). The postgraduate (S2/S3) independent selection/examination and UNDIP professional programme is integrated into the MU registration system, which is administered by the Institute for Educational Quality Management and Development (LP2MP) of UNDIP.

The requirements for international students are as follows:

- Graduated from universities accredited by a national accreditation agency of their home countries or accredited by international accreditation agency
- Graduates of Master Programme with minimum GPA of 3.25 (on scale of 0 – 4)
- English Proficiency: ITP TOEFL 525, or IELTS 6.0
- Have an Indonesian Language Proficiency Test / UKBI (in the end of semester 3 students have to have the ability to speak Bahasa Indonesia and have a UKBI score of 375)
- Two Letters of reference from previous academic supervisors or work superiors
- Letter of Statement about study funding
- Curriculum Vitae (including list of research and publication)
- Research Proposal for PhD Thesis.

Languages courses for students who do not speak Bahasa Indonesia are available at UNDIP's faculty of cultural science and are free to use for the students.

Transparency and documentation of procedures and acceptance decisions on test exams specifically organized by UNDIP are implemented in accordance with the Internal Quality Assurance Standards. All admissions of new students from within or outside the country are conducted centrally at the University. Technically, all test management is conducted by a committee appointed directly by the Chancellor.

This committee has duties ranging from test preparation, test implementation, and test results management. The test result data is then submitted to the leaders to be discussed with the Deans for later decisions. The results of the decision are stated in a decree from the Chancellor. To facilitate the implementation of the test and to maintain its quality, a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) has been developed for all new student admissions pathways. However, not everyone can see the test results. The decision to accept or not applies to all applicants, whether undergraduate, postgraduate, and doctoral students. Each applicant can access the announcement individually by using the same account as at the time of registration. The acceptance procedure is then documented and can be accessed by the related parties.

Appraisal:

The admission requirements for PhD students are properly defined and set out transparently. The selection procedure is carried out in accordance with the national law and therefore satisfies the legal requirements. The decision on admission is based on transparent criteria and it is clearly communicated. The responsibilities are also clearly regulated.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1*	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection Procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

3. Implementation

3.1 Structure

Projected study time	6 semesters, 3 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	82.3 ECTS credits/ 52 SKS credits
Workload per CP	1 SKS credits (credit) = 1,58 ECTS credits 1 ECTS credits = 25 hours
Number of courses	4 compulsory courses, 3 elective courses and 4 research-related courses
Number of contact hours	2,058 hours

PDIE offers a research-based programme in Economics with three major specialisations: accounting, management and economics. The curriculum requires that students complete 52 SKS credits or credits (equal to 82.3 ECTS credits, in which one SKS credits equals 2.83 hours x 14 weeks) to graduate and be awarded the degree of PhD in Economics. PDIE's doctoral programme consists of two main parts: the compulsory theoretical courses as well as the research, publication and dissertation writing.

Table 2: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Economics)

COURSE TYPES	COURSE CODE AND NAME	CREDIT	ECTS	SEMESTER
Compulsory Courses (12 credits = 19.2 ECTS)	EKP801: Philosophy of Science	3	4.8	1
	EKP802: Research Methodology in Economics	3	4.8	1
	EKP803: Advanced Microeconomics Theory	3	4.8	1
	EKP804: Advanced Macroeconomics Theory	3	4.8	1
Elective Courses (9 credits = 14.4 ECTS)	EKP811: Multivariate Analysis & Econometrics	3	4.8	2
	EKP812: Development Economics	3	4.8	2
Thesis Supporting Courses (21 credits = 33.6 ECTS)	EKP813: History of Economic Thought	3	4.8	2
	EKP814: Public Economics	3	4.8	2
	EKP815: Monetary Economics	3	4.8	2
	EKP816: Resource Economics	3	4.8	2
	EKP830: Academic Writing & Publication	7	11.2	3
	EKP831: Seminar on Research Proposal	3	4.8	4
	EKP832: Seminar on Research Finding	3	4.8	5
Thesis (10 credits = 16 ECTS)	EKP833: Publication	8	12.8	5
	EKP840: Doctoral Thesis	10	16	6
TOTAL		52	82.3	

Table 3: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Accounting)

COURSE TYPES	COURSE CODE AND NAME	CREDIT	ECTS	SEMESTER
Compulsory Courses (12 credits = 19.2 ECTS)	EKA801: Philosophy of Science	3	4.8	1
	EKA802: Research Methodology in Accounting	3	4.8	1
	EKA803: Theory and History of Economic Thought	3	4.8	1
	EKA811: Multivariate Analysis & Econometrics	3	4.8	1
Elective Courses (9 credits = 14.4 ECTS)	EKA812: Multidisciplinary Research in Accounting	3	4.8	2
	EKA813: Behavioral Research in Accounting	3	4.8	2
	EKA814: Market-Based Accounting Research	3	4.8	2
	EKA815: Current Issues on Fraud Auditing	3	4.8	2
	EKA816: Current Issues on Public Sector Accounting	3	4.8	2
Thesis Supporting Courses (21 credits = 33.6 ECTS)	EKA817: Current Issues on Corporate Governance	3	4.8	2
	EKA830: Academic Writing & Publication	7	11.2	3
	EKA831: Seminar on Research Proposal	3	4.8	4
	EKA832: Seminar on Research Findings	3	4.8	5
Thesis (10 credits = 16 ECTS)	EKA833: Publication	8	12.8	5
	EKA840: Doctoral Thesis	10	16	6
TOTAL		52	82.3	

Table 4: Curriculum PhD programme (specialisation Management)

COURSE TYPES	COURSE CODE AND NAME	CREDIT	ECTS	SEMESTER
Compulsory Courses (12 credits = 19.2 ECTS)	EKM801: Philosophy of Science	3	4.8	1
	EKM802: Research Methodology in Management	3	4.8	1
	EKM803: Marketing Theory	3	4.8	1
	EKM804: Finance Theory	3	4.8	1
	EKM805: Human Resources Management Theory	3	4.8	1
Elective Courses (9 credits = 14.4 ECTS)	EKM811: Multivariate Analysis & Econometrics	3	4.8	2
	EKM812: Consumer Behavior Model	3	4.8	2
	EKM813: Empirical Marketing Model	3	4.8	2
	EKM814: Current Issues on Marketing Theory	3	4.8	2
	EKM815: Behavioral Finance	3	4.8	2
	EKM816: Empirical Finance Model	3	4.8	2
	EKM817: Current Issues on Finance Model	3	4.8	2
	EKM818: Organizational Behavior and Development	3	4.8	2
	EKM819: Empirical Model in Human Resource Management	3	4.8	2
	EKM820: Current Issues on Human Resource Management and Organizational Behavior	3	4.8	2
	EKM821: Strategic Marketing Research	3	4.8	2

Thesis Supporting Courses (21 credits = 33.6 ECTS)	EKM822: Entrepreneurial Marketing Research	3	4.8	2
	EKM823: Culture in Marketing Research	3	4.8	2
	EKM824: Current Issues on Investment Theory	3	4.8	2
	EKM825: Dynamic Asset Pricing Theory	3	4.8	2
	EKM826: Advanced Corporate Finance	3	4.8	2
	EKM827: Social Psychology of Organizations	3	4.8	2
	EKM828: Social Networking Analysis: Structure and Dynamics	3	4.8	2
	EKM829: Social Dynamic Model	3	4.8	2
	EKM830: Academic Writing & Publication	7	11.2	3
	EKM831: Seminar on Research Proposal	3	4.8	4
Thesis (10 credits = 16 ECTS)	EKM832: Seminar on Research Findings	3	4.8	5
	EKM833: Publication	8	12.8	5
TOTAL		52	82.3	

The PhD programme is designed based on the National Standard for Higher Education (Standar Nasional Pendidikan Tinggi) and The Indonesian National Qualification Framework (Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia-KKNI) level 9. Furthermore, the Doctoral degree regulation is stated in Rector Regulation Number 5/2020 regarding Academic regulation for Postgraduate Programmes at Diponegoro (amended by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020). The students must complete 52 sks credits (corresponds to 82.3 ECTS credits) within their chosen specialisation. Moreover, PhD students must write a doctoral thesis and produce publishable research over the period of three years. The publication requirement consists of the following: a) a paper presented at an international conference and b) at least one paper published in an international journal indexed by Scopus or Web of Science. After completion, students are awarded the PhD degree.

During the studies, the assessment of study progress is based on cumulative credits and grade point average. Within the first year of study, students are required to attend the compulsory courses and three electives in order to get 21 sks credits (corresponds to 33.6 ECTS credits). Based on this, the second and third year of the PhD programme focuses on research activities and dissertation writing. In a first step, students undertake a series of research activities to produce a research proposal that could form the basis of one chapter of the PhD dissertation. This proposal is supported by two supervisors with whom the students also have an initial oral examination, where their concept is discussed and tested.

Besides continuing to work on the dissertation, PhD students are obliged to present their research at an international conference and publish at least one paper (for degree by coursework) or two papers (for degree by research) in reputable international journals. The assessment of these papers takes place within the framework of the respective course by the corresponding lecturer.

After submission of the dissertation, students must pass an oral examination defending their PhD theses. The board of examiners consists of three examiners of Universitas Diponegoro (not the supervisors or research advisor) and one external (from any other university). A successful thesis defense will result in the examiners recommending the awarding of the degree of PhD.

The status of doctoral students is regulated by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 5/2020 (amended by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020). All registered doctoral students are full-time students. They are responsible for their own administrative and academic registration every semester and must obey all academic regulations and ethical codes. All registered students will have full access to academic facilities, such as the internet, library, online journals and Bloomberg data.

All courses (compulsory, elective and research-related) within the PhD programme are supported by the Rencana Pembelajaran Semester-RPS (Course Outline/ Syllabus) provided for each semester. The course outline consists of course descriptions, learning outcomes, number of credits assigned to each course, weekly targeted competences/ skills, learning methods, required references and assessment method. All information outlined in RPS is based on the targeted learning outcomes of graduates as stated in the National Standard for Higher Education and The Indonesian National Qualification Framework level 9 (see chapter 1.1).

Appraisal:

The structure corresponds with the objectives of the doctoral programme and it properly connects the range of courses with the research tasks of the doctoral students. The focus of the PhD programme is clearly on research and the student's individual project. The research project is accompanied by courses that support the student in conceptualising and writing his or her dissertation. In addition, students must choose four compulsory content courses and three electives to complete in the first year of study.

The structural requirements of the doctoral programme are accounted for by taking into account the national and higher education specific requirements in a doctoral degree regulation in Indonesia.

In terms of law and of fact the status of the doctoral students is regulated properly.

The range of courses are described according to content, scope/ duration, prerequisites, required reading, learning activities and teaching methods, assessment criteria, as well as degree and the qualifications/ competencies (outcome oriented) to be achieved.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1*	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2*	Doctoral Degree Regulations			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4*	Module Description			X		

3.2 Content

In the context of teaching, PDIE provides students with the knowledge, skills and abilities needed for a future professional career. All offered courses are closely related to each other and arranged in such a way that students receive specialised (professional) knowledge and research skills in a logical order. All activities are based on student-centered learning and research-based learning approaches. The professors supervise the students and guide them in applying scientific standards in their independent work. The learning process is carried out based on the following interactive approaches:

a) Presentation and discussion are the main activities of the first year of the programme. Key important concepts and theories, as well as research paradigms in economics, management, and accounting studies are identified and presented by the students to broaden their perspectives within their research interests. Presentation is then followed by discussion, including small group discussions, to help students identify alternative solutions to research problems. Presentation and discussion also involve the use of mathematical and statistical tools (including advanced statistical software) and a socio-cultural understanding necessary for their research and future career. This method helps students master critical, innovative and transformative thinking skills crucial for dealing economic, business and accounting issues. It also provides students with the critical reasoning skills needed to be independent researchers and problem solvers.

b) Academic Writing and Literature Review Training: This course helps students deeply understand academic writing and how to conduct an effective literature review to identify research gaps for their research agenda. With this training, students are able to successfully present their work both in seminars and in written form, especially for international conferences or publications.

c) Individual Work: Under the supervision of a professor, individual work is carried out in a variety of forms, ranging from presentation of research projects to writing of dissertations and publications. Research work is prioritised as new research products are the main objective.

Students need to present their research projects during their second year. These research projects are individual works that enable students to propose original ideas in the economics, management or accounting fields. The method of presentation of a research project indicates the students' ability to engage in scientific activities. Also, during the second year, students should be involved in many different forms of scientific activities, such as participating in colloquia, attending conferences, writing creative essays, reviewing additional articles and literature and attending analytical tool training. During their third year, students should present a scientific paper at an international conference and publish at least one research paper in an international journal. By the end of the third year, students should be submitting their dissertations and preparing for the oral examination.

All the mentioned learning methods are implemented with the elements of ethics of research that are considered throughout the whole learning process of PDIE.

PDIE is a research-based programme. Thus, to provide students with the optimal research competences and skills, the science and research-based teaching of the academic staff is continuously updated. All courses discuss the most current theoretical and empirical issues in economics, management and accounting. Learning materials are based on empirical papers published by various authors. The curriculum is updated on a regular basis, at least every four years; the course outlines/ syllabi at least annually. PDIE, through the University, provides lecturers with funding to attend teaching workshops and methodology seminars, as well as for their own research projects. All students are supervised by a professor and one other member of the academic staff (must hold a doctoral degree), whose empirical works are published in international journals. Students are obliged to publish their work in an international journal (at least indexed by Scopus or Web of Science). This policy has contributed to the high number of research projects and publications produced by our students and lecturers.

The development of competences and skills as well as the aspired students' qualification is conceptualised following the national regulations.

Table 5: Development of competences and skills in PhD programme Economics

PDIE Qualification	Courses	National Standard and Qualification	Learning Process applied	Assessment method
Research Skills	1. Philosophy of Science 2. Research Methodology	Interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary and transdisciplinary research skills	Research-based learning (lectures and seminars)	Paper exam and seminar paper
Analytical and social skills	Multivariate Analysis & Econometrics	Analytical and technical skills	Research-based learning (lectures and seminars)	Paper exam and seminar paper
Problem solving skills	All courses for each specialisation	Knowledge competence	Research-based cases	Paper exam and seminar paper
Presentation and writing skills	1. Academic writing and publication 2. Seminar on research proposal 3. Seminar on research findings 4. Publication	Dissemination skills	Student-centred learning (seminar)	1. Quality of paper and presentation 2. Oral exam

PDIE provides students with a variety of topic specific technical support to enrich course material. Students are required to be actively involved in academic forums, such as conferences, seminars and workshops. Furthermore, students receive software utilisation training (such as EndNote, Mendeley, SPSS, EVIEW, STATA, LISREL, AMOS and PLS Warp) to support their research projects and publications. In addition, the students have access to the Bloomberg Laboratory of the faculty that provides economic data for research purpose.

To encourage students to complete their dissertations within the standard study period (three years), a colloquium is held every semester. This technical support policy has shown to improve the competences and skills of students in mastering the latest knowledge in economics, management, and accounting as well as scientific publications. In fact, the number of students participating in international conferences and the number of scientific publications indexed by Scopus has increased yearly. In addition, PDIE students have won doctoral research grants provided by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology (Higher Education).

PDIE offers students multidisciplinary qualifications as reflected in the curricula. The qualifications gained do not only concern research and analytical skills, but also problem solving and communication (presentation and writing) skills. In the first, second and third semester of the programme, students are introduced to a variety of compulsory and elective courses. The core courses for all specialisations (12 credits = 19.2 ECTS credits) consists of Philosophy of Science, Research Methodology, Multivariate Analysis and Econometrics, Academic Writing and Publication. These courses train the research, analytical and communication skills of the students. Following on that, they have the freedom to choose elective courses (9 sks credits = 14.4 ECTS credits) based on their specialisation. These courses contribute to the development of qualifications, particularly those concerning problem solving and communication skills. Finally, PDIE students are also provided with thesis supporting courses (21 credits = 33.6 ECTS credits). These courses consist of Academic Writing & Publication, a Seminar on Research Proposals, a Seminar on Research Findings and Publication. What is more, the doctoral students are obliged to attend international conferences and present their research findings, as well as encouraged to exchange information and network with other PhD students and scientists.

Appraisal:

The concept of the doctoral programme and the concrete implementation of the learning objectives are matched with each other. The competency concerning enhanced participation in the research field is the issue at the heart of the implementation.

The teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with objectives and it takes into account the associated relevant research. During the online conference, the panel formed the view that the teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with objectives and it takes into account the associated relevant research. However, given the presented course descriptions the panel noted that the documentation of the used literature resources could be updated more often.

The courses are aimed at qualification and competency development and are linked to one another. The goals of a doctoral degree according to the national qualification framework are fulfilled.

The offer covers the relevant requirements of discipline to achieve the pursued research competency of the doctoral students. It corresponds with the focus of research of the scientists and doctoral students involved in the programme. The courses on different research methods and approaches to science are part of the curriculum. The panel appreciates that students are educated in statistical and mathematical methods and tools. Moreover, the faculty offers its PhD students access to their Bloomberg laboratory with databases for their research projects.

Multidisciplinary qualifications in the doctoral programme are communicated in a target appropriate manner. It especially enables the doctoral students to discuss the knowledge gained in the specialised fields with their colleagues, to present it in front of an academic audience and to communicate it to laymen. The panel welcomes the efforts of the University to encourage students in presenting their research at international conferences, as well as the exchange with other PhD students within and outside UNDIP.

Moreover, the programme promotes the ability to manage a team and to carry forward the social, scientific or cultural progress in their respective professional environment.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.2	Content					
3.2.1*	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2*	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3*	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5*	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		

3.3 Examination Procedures

The types of examination and level of performance in the examination is based on Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 5/2020 (amended by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020). PDIE requires students to take a variety of different examinations: paper exams, seminar papers, a preliminary exam, a research proposal exam, a research finding exam and an oral examination of their doctoral thesis.

1. Paper exams and seminar papers: These types of exams assess the student's competence and skill in conceptual/ theoretical aspects of core courses. All subjects require students to take paper exams and seminar papers; however, these exams may take on different forms, such as take-home exam or in-class exam, depending on the subject.

2. Preliminary (Qualification) exam: This exam assesses the student's competence and skills in identifying current issues in their research field of interest. Students are required to discuss the motivation of their research, identify phenomena and research gaps and propose new ideas to demonstrate the novelty of their proposed research project. This exam can only be taken after a student has finished all compulsory and elective courses in the first and second semester. Three examiners (not including the student's supervisor) are assigned in the examination which will decide the doctoral candidacy of the student.

3. Research proposal exam: This exam assesses the quality of a proposed research project and determines whether it is acceptable for a doctoral thesis. Three examiners (not including the student's supervisor) are assigned to this exam.

4. Research findings exam: This exam assesses the conceptual and methodological aspects of a research project and determines whether the research findings qualify for the minimum requirement of a doctoral thesis (i.e. the quality of the novelty, theoretical/ empirical synthesis, research contribution and academic writing). Four examiners (not including the student's supervisor) are assigned to this exam.

5. Oral examination of doctoral thesis: This is the final exam taken after the submission of the dissertation. Students must complete an oral examination (viva) with four examiners, three internal examiners from the Universitas Diponegoro (not the supervisor or research advisor of the student) and one external (from any other university). This oral examination is arranged using written technical guidance and considers:

- a) The significance and contribution to knowledge of research project.
- b) The extent and depth of the candidate's scholarly awareness and use of related research findings.
- c) The effectiveness of the research methodology used.
- d) The trustworthiness of findings based on the research evidence.
- e) The professional quality of the writing.

All examiners should submit separate and independent written examination reports before the viva exam, which will be combined into one decision report (known as by the Berita Acara Ujian Promosi) by the Exam Committee. The decision will then be made to award the doctorate, to ask the student to revise and resubmit the thesis, making any necessary (minor or major) amendments before it is accepted or to award a down-graded qualification (certificate of participation in learning). After a successful thesis defense, the examiners will recommend the awarding of the degree of PhD.

The examination procedures, especially for paper exams, are included in the syllabi for the respective subjects. Examination procedures for PDIE are organised by the Academic Office of PDIE and based on the Manual of Examination Procedures and criteria stated in Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 5/2020 (amended by Rector Regulation Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020). All paper exams are organised in the mid-term and final sessions. Students must be registered during the exam session, with a minimum class attendance of 75 %, or they will not be allowed to join the exam.

1. The preliminary exam, research proposal exam, research findings exam and oral examination of the doctoral thesis can be done any time the student qualifies for the requirements of the exam. To take these exams, students must first apply online in the corresponding online form on the website or directly to the Academic Office of PDIE. The staff of the Academic

Office will then distribute a list of exam applicants to the Head of PDIE to determine the examiners. These examiners will be sent an invitation letter, along with a proposal/ dissertation and evaluation form, at least one week prior to examination day. On the examination day, the staff prepares the room and manage the examination. Finally, after the examining committee has made and reported a decision on the results, staff will receive the examination reports and archive them for records of administrative and study progress evaluation.

Students facing disadvantages may apply for special accommodations and arrangements, in line with the disadvantage compensation policies of the university which are based on Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 5/2020 (amended by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020). Accommodations include exam modifications (extended time, alternative formats), alternative ways of completing assignments and auxiliary aids and services. Compensation for disadvantages ensures that students with disabilities can take part in examinations on equal terms without lowering the academic standard. Students can apply for such compensation to the Academic Office by including a supporting document for their request.

Appraisal:

The examinations are composed in such a manner that the achieved qualifications and competencies can be determined and assessed. This includes, above all, that the certificates of achievement aim for a systematic understanding of the research discipline and the control of the research methods which are applied in this field of research. In addition, the certificates of achievement are aimed at a contribution of research which expands the frontiers of knowledge and withstands a national/ international assessment carried out by scientists.

The examinations are properly and transparently organised in terms of number, distribution, process and form registration. The disadvantage compensation is regulated by a Rector Regulation of the University to ensure equal opportunities.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1*	Examinations			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		

3.4 Didactical Concept

In order to achieve the targeted learning outcomes, PDIE adopts a research-based learning process which encourages interaction between lecturers and students as well as between students. It is an obligation for students to attend classes in the first three semesters. Hence, all face-to-face courses are designed to involve all students in class activities, through the use of group discussions, individual projects and group projects. As a result, students are required to actively participate in all courses. This also allows students to learn from one another. The semesterly colloquiums further provide students with opportunities to share their ideas with others. Through the encouragement of active student participation, students learn how to critically review, evaluate and synthesize new and complex ideas. PDIE also invites guest lecturers from both Indonesian and foreign universities to share their experiences dealing with current issues in economics, management and accounting. These lectures shall enrich the student's perspectives on the most up to date theoretical and research issues and contribute to the achievement of the targeted learning outcomes.

All face-to-face classes involve a combination of different teaching methods including lectures, seminars, open discussions, and other teaching methods. But the most important aspect is that all teaching methods are focused on research-based learning. All teaching staff and supervisors are required to publish at least one article a year in international journals, especially Scopus-indexed ones. All teaching methods are stated in the syllabi or course outlines to document the teaching processes delivered during one semester.

The development of student intellectual behavior through networking is encouraged through a variety of activities, including:

1. Requiring students to be actively involved in international conferences and publications in international journals.
2. Organizing special discussions, both formal and informal, at the initiative of students and lecturers. This is often carried out when an interesting topic arises that has not been covered in regular lectures. These discussions can take the form of book reviews and scientific articles reviews,.
3. Encouraging students to actively participate in scientific associations, at both the national and international levels, such as AAA (American Accounting Association), BAFA (British Accounting and Finance Association), AMA (American Marketing Association), Social Science Research Network (SSRN), Indonesian Institute of Accountants, Indonesia Marketing Association, and Indonesian Association of Economists.
4. Involving students in various activities held by faculties and departments, such as seminars and workshops.
5. Encouraging students to collaborate with other stakeholders, such as in the form of community service.
6. Encouraging students to be involved in lecturer research, especially those students who have similar research topics as the lecturers.

Based on Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 5/2020 (amended by Rector Regulation of Universitas Diponegoro Number 29 of 2020) and the Manual of Supervisors Appointment, PDIE students who are enrolled as new students are required to immediately submit a proposal for an academic advisor based on their research field. With consideration of the student proposals, the Head of PDIE appoints academic advisors as quickly as possi-

ble. Students are then required to write a dissertation proposal and present it in the Preliminary Examination. Before taking the Preliminary Examination, students must present their proposals in a colloquium (with two examiners). Colloquiums are scheduled semesterly.

Students who pass the Preliminary Examination are then required to propose their Thesis Supervisors (Promoter and Co-Promoter) to the Head of PDIE. Policies of PDIE state that the promoter must hold the position of professor and the co-promoter must possess a doctorate degree and have international publications, which are Scopus indexed at the least.

The responsibilities of the promoter and co-promoter are to ensure the student's 1) originality of dissertation and scientific contribution to research, 2) accuracy of research methodology and depth of reasoning, 3) systematic thinking and research conclusions, and 4) publication in international journals indexed by Scopus or Web of Science. When supervising dissertations and publications, the promoter and co-promoter should follow the Guidelines of Proposal and Dissertation Writing.

The Head of PDIE has the authority to replace the promoter and/or co-Promoter if there is an academic dispute between doctoral candidates and the promoter/co-promoter. Doctoral candidates are required to consult and regularly discuss their work with the promoter and co-promoter, at a frequency of at least four times in one semester. Activities pertaining to dissertation writing must be documented in a log book referred to as *Buku Kendali Kegiatan Penulisan Disertasi & Publikasi Ilmiah*.

Appraisal:

The didactic concept of the doctoral programme is developed in accordance with the objectives. It is particularly aimed at enabling doctoral students to be able to carry out critical analyses, evaluations and syntheses of new and complex ideas. This concept takes into account a diversity of teaching methods.

In accordance with the objectives, the programme promotes the exchange of experiences and research results among the doctoral students and it contributes towards the broadening of the research based knowledge. This networking takes place regularly. In addition, they are encouraged to participate in international conferences and, for their part, seek scientific exchange with doctoral students from other universities.

Being allocated to a supervisor secures a continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students. The supervision is evaluated on a regular basis.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.4	Didactical Concept					
3.4.1*	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactical Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

3.5 Professional Competencies/ Employability

The PDIE programme provides stages and opportunities that are consistent with the targeted learning outcomes described in chapter 1.1 and in the structure of curriculum (chapter 3.2). PDIE aims to produce creative, innovative, and transformative graduates who are recognised nationally and internationally for their ability to develop and disseminate knowledge and solve problems in economics, management or accounting through interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary or transdisciplinary approaches. In other words, PDIE intends to produce doctoral students with professional qualifications in the scientific and research-oriented fields. Consequently, the course descriptions are designed with an orientation toward professional employability. In fact, the targeted learning outcomes are in line with the development of employment skills. The administration of PDIE also aligns its targeted learning outcomes with student needs and conceptualise the courses with regard to improving the employability of the participants with certain qualifications. Courses, such as Philosophy of Science, Research Methodology, Multivariate Analysis and Econometrics, Academic Writing and Publication, as well as Doctoral Thesis aim at building research-oriented capacities in students. Meanwhile, other courses, including Advanced Microeconomics Theory, Advanced Macroeconomics Theory, Public Economics, Monetary Economics, Resource Economics, Marketing Theory, Finance Theory, and Human Resources Management Theory are useful in equipping the students with problem-solving skills for professional work in the Government or industry. Numerous PDIE graduates have been appointed in a variety of managerial positions, especially when they work at a university.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programme is intended to convey the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research oriented fields of activity. In doing so, the professional qualification is aimed both at a research oriented activity (including teaching) as well as a practical vocational activity. For most graduates, a trajectory in research and teaching is guaranteed; the majority of graduates are employed as lecturers at Universitas Diponegoro.

Quality Ratings

		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.5*	Professional Competencies / Employability			X		

4. Scientific Environment and Framework conditions

4.1 Teaching Staff

The faculty (teaching staff) consists of 34 staff members. They are all full-time employees who are assigned to teach and supervise doctoral students. The allocation of staff among concentrations is as follows:

- Accounting = twelve teaching staff (six professors, four senior lecturers and two lecturers)
- Economics = ten teaching staff (six professors, two senior lecturers and two lecturers)
- Management = twelve teaching staff (four professors, six senior lecturers and two lecturers)

Detailed structure and number of teaching staff is displayed in the following Table:

Table 6: Structure and number of teaching staff

Concentration	Professor		Senior Lecturer		Lecturer		Total		
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Total
Accounting	5	1	3	1	2	0	10	2	12
Management	3	1	6	0	0	2	9	3	12
Economic	5	1	2	0	2	0	9	1	10
TOTAL	13	3	11	1	4	2	28	6	34

Based on a regulation from the National Standards of Higher Education, teaching staff of doctoral programmes need to hold doctoral degrees and have experience in education and research. As a result, PDIE has made a clear policy on the appointment of teaching staff. Teaching staff should not only hold doctoral degrees but also have certificates of professional teaching and examples of published scientific articles in international journals or active involvement in professional organisations.

15 lecturers from the teaching staff (44 % of the teaching staff) have graduated from foreign universities. More specifically, staff members have graduated from the following universities: the University of Putra Malaysia (two staff members); the University of Sains, Malaysia (two staff members); Southern Cross University, Australia (one staff member); the University of Wollongong, Australia (three staff members); Macquarie University, Australia (one staff member), Curtin University of Technology, Australia (four staff members), the University of Western Australia (one staff member), and Bonn University Germany (one staff member).

According to UNDIP, all teaching staff of PDIE meets also the pedagogic methodology qualifications as required by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology Republic of Indonesia. To become a lecturer at any higher educational institution in Indonesia, a pedagogical certificate issued by the Ministry of Education and Culture, known as *Sertifikasi Dosen* (Certified Professional Teacher), is required.

UNDIP states that most of the PDIE lecturers are researchers with multiple international publications. Some lecturers have experience providing consultancy services for governmental and non-governmental organisations. In fact, the majority of lecturers are graduates of foreign universities (Australia, Germany, French and Malaysia). The lecturers are also funded by the government, industry, or university to conduct research with the obligation of presenting papers from this research at international conferences and publishing papers in international journals at least once a year. Some of PDIE's lecturers have also been invited as visiting professors in Malaysia, Timor Leste, France, and the Netherlands. Furthermore, several lecturers have been invited to foreign universities (Malaysia, France, and India) as external examiners and three of these lecturers are assessors of international accreditation (ABEST21 Japan) and actively involved in professional organisations with international coverage (such ISEI, IAI, ACFE and alike). Conversely, PDIE, through the Faculty of Economics and Business, also invites professors from overseas universities as visiting professors (cf. p. 35 self-evaluation report).

In order to ensure that all academicians at UNDIP meet pedagogical and didactic requirements, the Institute for Development and Quality Assurance of Education (LP2MP) provides various trainings related to teaching and learning methods at UNDIP.

To promote the development of doctoral students, internal collaborations, coordination, and overall administration are provided and monitored by the Head of PDIE. The Head of PDIE is also responsible for academic aspects pertaining to the curricula and courses of modules, as well as for effective communication among staff members. The Head of PDIE addresses the issues and provides support for the students in terms of organisational issues. All course materials have been designed by teaching teams who have expertise and research in the particular topic. One course is usually delivered by three to four teaching staff under the supervision of a coordinator (professor) to ensure that all materials are delivered in accordance with the expected learning outcomes. Review of curricula and modules also involves all PDIE teaching staff. The final assessment of student achievement is determined by the Course coordinator, after discussing all components of evaluation with the members of the teaching team. Review of student's research proposals and doctoral theses also involves several teaching staff to ensure that doctoral students are provided with a wide range of perspectives. This enables students to better identify research gaps, synthesize conceptual models and promote the novelty in their research (cf. p. 36 self-evaluation report).

Appraisal:

The structure and number of teaching staff corresponds with the requirements of the doctoral programme. The necessary professional breadth and depth in scientific education and the research sponsorship of the doctoral students is ensured. The contractual situation of the teaching staff guarantees a continuous execution of the doctoral programme. A considerable number of teachers have relevant experience in international research and teaching abroad.

Qualifications and competencies of staff are rated well to meet the requirements for good teaching. Based on information in the self-evaluation report of UNDIP and the CVs of the lecturers involved in the programme, the panel came to the conclusion that the research activities of the academic staff correspond with the requirements for PhD programme and support the scientific education of the doctoral students.

UNDIP verifies the academic as well as pedagogical and didactical qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure and in line with the University's regulations. Specific measures for further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. For example, during the online conference the faculty staff confirmed that they received further qualifications regarding online teaching as response to Covid-19.

Internal collaboration and coordination are ensured by the regular meetings of the teaching staff.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1*	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2*	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5*	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		

4.2 Cooperation and Partnership

PDIE, through the Faculty of Economics and Business has formed cooperations with various universities. These cooperations are used for the purposes of joint conferences, joint research and publications, student exchange, and receiving or sending visiting professors. PDIE participates in collaborations to enrich research perspectives and develop networks with other parties. Some of the collaborations that have been established include with Haa-ga-Helia University of Applied Sciences (Finland), Saxion University of Applied Sciences (Netherlands), Université de Nantes and University of Le Havre (France), Curtin University and Griffith University (Australia), Tunghai University (Taiwan), Nagoya University (Japan).

These cooperation with overseas universities mainly focuses on

- a. broaden the insight of lecturers, students and administration staffs;
- b. improve the quality of learning activities for the students; and
- c. provide better academic quality.

Due to this cooperation, it is also possible for the students to join seminars, conferences, workshops, and trainings to partner overseas universities. Another benefit gained from this cooperation is the chance for the lecturers to pursue their doctorate degree in partner universities. The cooperation are stated in a Memorandum of Understanding as a legal and official document as proof. Credit transfer systems in collaboration with several partner universities

overseas and double degree programmes with partner universities provide flexibility for students to transfer academic performance obtained from partner campuses.

In terms of cooperation with business enterprises, the collaboration of the Faculty of Economics and Business UNDIP and Bank BCA results in ten Bloomberg terminals which all lecturers and students at the Faculty of Economics and Business UNDIP can access.

According to UNDIP, PDIE believes that the scientific networking provides doctoral students with numerous academic and research benefits. For this reason, PDIE requires its teaching staff to be actively involved in scientific and professional organisations, such as Indonesian Association of Economists, Indonesian Institute of Accountants, Association of Certified Fraud Examiners (USA), and International accreditation agency (ABEST21, Japan) and to network with other universities (such as Saxion University, the Netherlands and Curtin University of Technology, Australia). Networking is implemented through visiting professors, external examiners, seminars, joint research, joint international conferences, and student exchanges.

Appraisal:

Cooperation with academic institutions and networks is actively pursued, which can result, among others, in organising joint projects, events and student exchanges, inviting visiting lecturers.

Doctoral students are encouraged to participate in relevant conferences and further scientific events. During the interviews with students and graduates of the programme, they confirmed that they can expand a scientific network especially through participation in international events, where they present their research project, among other things.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1*	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		

4.3 Programme Management

The management of the PDIE programme is carried out by the Head of the programme. The Head of PDIE reports directly to the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business. The Head of PDIE works in close coordination with the Department of Economics, Department of Management and Department of Accounting of the faculty. The Head of the PDIE programme, along with Secretary of PDIE, are responsible for:

1. Recommending potential applicants as new doctorate students through thorough interviews,
2. Developing the curricula and modules,
3. Planning class schedules and evaluating learning outcomes,
4. Deciding the lecturers who will be assigned to certain courses,
5. Coordinating the planning, provision, and proposals for lecture, facilities and educational infrastructure,
6. Coordinating the activities of everyone involved in the programme and ensuring that the programme runs smoothly,
7. Evaluating the progress of doctorate students,
8. Documenting all programme activities.

Within the scope of PDIE, decision and policy making are carried out in a coordinated manner involving the Department of Economics, Department of Management, and Department of Accounting of the faculty.

The staff of the Academic Office provides support to PDIE students and teaching staff. The academic staff also provides professional assistance in operational management including:

1. class scheduling; providing reception and enquiries for students and faculty members; preparing letters, memorandum, reports, final examinations, class handouts and syllabi; informing class cancellations and class assignments for the faculty members; notifying students of class assignments, room changes, and class cancellations; and
2. making arrangements (such as accommodation and food, and maintenance services) for committee meetings and conferences,

The manager of the International Office of FEB also provides supports to students and teaching staff in the form of:

1. internship arrangements for students,
2. student/staff exchanges including visa support,
3. information on foreign internship programmes for students,
4. international conferences and academic activities arrangements, including short-term educational programmes.

PDIE is also supported by UNDIP Career Center (UCC) which provides students/graduates with career consultation and information about employment.

Hard copies of all information, such as that concerning content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations, are well documented by the Academic Office of PDIE and can be accessed at any time upon request. General information about the programme (such as profiles, curricula, and requirements for admission) is documented and can be accessed by the public through the PDIE website. Meanwhile, academic records for all students (personal data, academic performance and progress and other relevant information) are documented online through SIAP (Information System of Academic and Research Information System) and accessible by the student as well as lecturers (for the courses they are responsible for) through a Single Sign On (SSO) account. The performance of lecturers in teaching and research is also documented online (via SIAP) and can be accessed at any time using an SSO account.

Numerous scientific activities, such as seminars, workshops and conferences are documented on social media, including the PDIE website, Instagram, and Twitter – all of which are accessible to the public.

Appraisal:

The organisation of the study process is based on the University-internal regulations and ensures the smooth operation of the study programmes. The structural organisation, the decision-making processes, competencies and responsibilities are established and implemented accordingly. Those involved are included in the decision-making process.

Faculty members and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of the study programme. During the online conference the panel talked to several persons from administration providing students academic and non-academic support and formed the view that sufficient administrative staff is available. Decision-making processes, authority, and responsibilities are clearly defined.

The requirements in terms of content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations are recognised through suitable documentation and publication. The interested parties also have access to the documentation in electronic form and it provides transparency.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.3	Programm Management					
4.3.1*	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

4.4 Material Resources

PDIE also has laboratories (statistics, computers, Arbutus, Bloomberg, and capital market) to support doctoral students to finish their studies. Classrooms and labs can be accessed by doctoral students from 08:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. However, working spaces for students (cubical rooms) can be accessed 24 hours a day, seven days a week. All rooms and labs are equipped with internet access and multimedia capabilities in line with the needs of the study programme. PDIE also offers discussion rooms that allow students to conduct research and discussions in a more informal environment than the classroom.

All rooms are supported by up-to-date technology and equipment and Wi-Fi coverage is available across the whole University. This facility is available free of charge and enables teaching staff and students to readily use the Internet resources and internal university services. According to UNDIP, all classrooms, working spaces and other facilities are appropriately equipped for disabled students giving them barrier-free access. PDIE provides services and accommodations for students with disabilities, such as lifts, ramps and parking spaces, who present documentation of their condition (Cf. p. 39 self-evaluation report).

PDIE provides doctoral students with literature, magazines, and databases which are available in the Faculty Library and the University Library. PDIE, through the faculty (database) library, provides more than 16,954 book titles (30,428 copies). The University Library provides students with online access to e-books, e-journals, articles, and periodical publications. Books in Bahasa Indonesia and English are both available. During the semester, the regular library service hours are Monday to Friday, 08:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m.. Qualified library staff (led by a PhD librarian) is available to help students search for necessary books or journals or to access international databases. Access to relevant digital media, especially e-books and e-journals (i.e. ABI/Informa Global, Proquest, Oxford Journal, Jstor, Cambridge Journal, Science Direct, Springer, Emerald Insight and Ebsco Discovery Service), is also possible from the students' home using an SSO account. PDIE also provides a database for research in economics, management and accounting accessible by students and teaching staff in the Bloomberg Lab.

Appraisal:

Since an online conference was conducted, the panel did not have the opportunity to visit the University's building. Therefore, the panel was provided with videos and pictures of UNDIP's facilities. Based on the materials provided, the panel formed the view that a smooth running of the University is ensured with regard to the capacities for research, studies, teaching and administration as well as the available rooms and facilities.

The library is accessible during most of the day. Access to relevant literature and digital media is also available. The most important databases are accessible totally free of charge.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1*	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2*	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		

4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

The fund management system is conducted in a centralized and decentralized manner. The centralized system is implemented through one source under the coordination of the University, while the decentralized system is implemented by each faculty through a mechanism for receiving funds according to the number of students. The financial planning of the study programmes are based on a self-submitted planning budget that has been approved and ratified at the Annual Work Meeting (RKT).

The funding system for the implementation from two main sources, namely the State Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBN) and non-APBN (UNDIP). APBN is a source of financing obtained from the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia. Meanwhile, non-APBN funds are obtained through Single Tuition Fees (UKT) and Institutional Funding Donations (SPI); share of profits (dividends) from UNDIP -owned business enterprises; share of profits from collaboration with companies and/or institutions owned by UNDIP; sale of UNDIP's assets; and utilization of UNDIP assets by the third parties.

The budget preparation process is carried out at the Faculty level involving all work units and study programmes. To begin with, all study programmes prepare a Business Plan and Budget (known as RBA) every November and submit it to the faculty. An integrated RBA discussion workshop involving the faculties and units is then held in December. In the RBA workshop, PDIE presents the achievements and performance analysis of the previous years based on the targeted key performance indicators. Proposed activities and funding for the coming years are then discussed in the budget group and synchronized with the activity plans of other units and faculties. This workshop results in a draft of faculty activities and budgets which is proposed to the University.

PDIE supports the sustainability of doctoral studies by providing students with either scholarships from universities or assisting them to apply to a wide range of scholarships such as Domestic Postgraduate Education Scholarship (BPPDN), Indonesian Education Scholarship (LPDP), and from local governments. Around 60 % of the total numbers of registered students have received funding from BPPDN, LPDP or university scholarships. In addition to scholarships, PDIE students may also apply for doctoral research funding through the DIKTI research grant scheme.

Appraisal:

Based on the information provided to the panel, the panel formed the view that the study programme is funded for the entire accreditation period so that students will definitely be able to complete their studies. Scholarship programmes and financial support are available.

Quality Ratings

		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1*	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		

5. QUALITY ASSURANCE

UNDIP's quality assurance system is implemented systematically and monitored annually by internal auditors. The quality assurance system's cycle refers to Establishment, Implementation, Evaluation, Control, and Improvement of Higher Education Standards (PPEPP).⁶

The Quality Assurance System for all academic and research programmes, including PDIE, is implemented in stages. At the university level, quality assurance is carried out by two offices, namely *Lembaga Pengembangan dan Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan-LP2MP* (the Office of Development and Quality Assurance of Education) and *Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat-LPPM* (the Office of Research and Community Service). At the Faculty level, quality assurance is carried out by *Tim Penjaminan Mutu Fakultas-TPMF* (the Faculty Quality Assurance Team) and at the Department level it is carried out by *Gugus Penjaminan Mutu-GPM* (the Quality Assurance Unit).

The quality assurance system cycle at UNDIP is implemented through the PDCA system (Plan, Do, Check, Action). This system is implemented in all units, starting from the faculty, then the department, and finally to the study programme level. The implementation of the quality assurance cycle begins with setting quality standards and planning activity programmes and targets based on key performance indicators, then implementing the programme activities.

These activities are then monitored by TPMF in collaboration with GPM. Internal audits are periodically carried out by LP2MP to ensure that the study programme is complying with the twelve quality standards⁷ set by the University in the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI). PDIE carries out quality assurance activities, including monitoring and evaluation, according to the quality standards outlined in SPMI. PDIE consistently monitors and evaluates learning activities, dissertation supervision processes, academic performance of both lecturers and students, doctoral examination stages, and publication activities.

At the end of each semester, students are asked to evaluate the learning process by filling out questionnaires which assess the quality of lecturers and learning activities. These questionnaires have proven quite useful for evaluating the quality of learning at the study programme level. Following this, at the end of every year, the quality of all academic activities is audited by a certified Internal Auditor assigned by LP2MP.

The results of monitoring and evaluation are reported at each level: study programmes, departments, faculties, and the University. If there are specific findings and recommendations, corrective action is carried out immediately. For example, if lecturer attendance is lower than required or their performance is considered poor by students, the faculty will take special training actions. This training is an effort to support and improve the performance of lecturers, and is preferable to just handing out punishment.

⁶ Establishment of higher education standards refers to the Regulation of the Minister of Research, Technology and Higher Education No. 44 of 2015.

⁷ criteria containing graduate competency standards, learning process standards, learning content standards, learning assessment standards, lecturer and educational staff standards, learning management standards, student standards, academic atmosphere standards, information systems standards and educational cooperation standards.

Regular evaluation of the programme is conducted by having doctoral students complete an online questionnaire. There are twelve aspects of the learning process covered in the questionnaire, which are arranged into two sections as follows:

Section 1:

1. The usefulness of course for students
2. The clarity of material presentation by the lecturer
3. The quality of the presentation methods
4. Effectiveness and efficiency of teaching time
5. The quality of course materials provided by the lecturer
6. The competence of lecturer in the course

Section 2:

1. Whether the lecturer teaches in accordance with course outline
2. Whether the lecturer provides clear references for the course
3. Whether the above mentioned references are used in class
4. Open mindedness of lecturer and willingness to accept other arguments/perspectives
5. Effective planning of class activities
6. Implementation of teaching activities within the scheduled time

The results of the questionnaires are evaluated by TPMF and discussed in a meeting with the Dean of the Office, the Head of PDIE and GPM. The Head of PDIE then reports the results to the relevant teachers. In addition, at the beginning of each semester, the Head of PDIE also invites students to an open forum in which the student's evaluation results are presented. Students are informed of how PDIE will respond to the critique given. PDIE also conducts a survey of student satisfaction on management and learning services. This survey is also an online questionnaire. Online surveys have also been conducted to assess the effectiveness of the learning process during the COVID-19 pandemic, during which all learning activities have been delivered online using MS Team, Zoom, and other online media.

All teachers have the option to complete a questionnaire regarding instructor satisfaction of the effectiveness of the programme management. Results are collected and discussed by PDIE teams, TPMF and QAU before any necessary action is taken in response to the feedback given. At the beginning of each semester, the Head of PDIE also invites teaching staff and supervisors to a meeting in which the results of the student's evaluation of course delivery are presented. At this meeting, teaching staff may informally give their own evaluation of the learning and management programme. Teaching staff receive information on how PDIE will respond to the results to ensure continuous improvement. Similar to the students, a survey is also conducted among teaching staff regarding the effectiveness of the learning process via online media during the COVID-19 pandemic.

The surveys of external parties are conducted at the University level with the aim of revealing the graduates' employment data and their level of competence. This evaluation is conducted online via an exit survey which is accessible on SIAP. This survey is completed by graduates when they are applying for a graduation ceremony. The evaluation covers the following aspects: the Learning process, Teaching and Research networking, Facilities, Types of learning methods, and Factors determining on time study completion.

PDIE, through the university, also conducts online tracer studies to evaluate the employability of graduates, including doctorate graduates. Alumni are requested to participate in this

tracer study two years after graduation. Evaluation is also conducted by employer peers and academic peers to assess the quality of graduates. This particular survey is conducted using Google Form and distributed to employer peers and academic peers. The results of this survey are then discussed at the University level.

Appraisal:

There is a quality assurance procedure in place which is systematically used for continuous monitoring and further development of quality in terms of content, processes and results. The responsibilities are clearly defined. The quality assurance of the doctoral programme is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the higher education institution. However, the panel criticises the fact that only the workload of the lecturers is evaluated, while the actual student workload is not systematically analysed and evaluated. A question whether the actual workload of the whole course corresponds with, is lower or higher than the estimated workload (including teaching time, self-study time, and examination) is missing. Therefore, the panel recommends the following **condition**:

- The University implements an anonymous evaluation form that collects student feedback about the workload for each course.

In their statement on the report, UNDIP states that there are academic meetings (formally and informally) where the students can issue their problems regarding their study workload. Through these consultation procedures it can be detected and identified whether students face obstacles and problems in their studies. Additionally, UNDIP states that their last satisfaction survey reveals that the student's problems on finishing their study were dominated by personal reasons not academic reasons or student workloads. The panel acknowledges the support and consultancy students receive as well as the existing monitoring mechanisms. However, a systematic and particularly anonymous workload evaluation which would deliver quantitative data is essential for continuous control and improvement of the study programmes

There is a planned regular evaluation concerning the implementation of the programme carried out by the doctoral students as well as supervisors according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development.

Finally, there is also an involvement of third parties; the results find their way into the process of quality development as well.

Quality Ratings

		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results				condition	
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders)			X		

Quality Profile

Institution: Diponegoro University

Doctoral programme: Doctor of Economics



Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1*	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market			X		
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	In the research fields			X		
1.3.2	Outside the research fields			X		
1.4	The positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1*	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		
3.	IMPLEMENTATION					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1*	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2*	Doctoral Degree Regulation			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4*	Module Description			X		
3.2	Contents					

3.2.1*	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2*	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3*	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5*	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1*	Examination			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		
3.4	Didactical Concept					
3.4.1*	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactical Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		
3.5*	Professional Competencies/Employability			X		

4.	SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1*	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2*	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5*	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1*	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		
4.3	Programme Management					
4.3.1*	Structural Organisation			X		

4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1*	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2*	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1*	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1*	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results				condition	
5.2*	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)			X		