

# Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee



7<sup>th</sup> Meeting on September 28, 2022

## PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

<b>Project Number:</b>	21/060, Cluster 3
<b>Higher Education Institution:</b>	KIMEP University
<b>Location:</b>	Almaty, Kazakhstan
<b>Study Programmes and type of accreditation:</b>	PhD in Economics (Initial Accreditation) PhD in Public Administration (Initial Accreditation) PhD in International Relations (Concept Accreditation) PhD in International Law (Concept Accreditation)

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decisions:

### **PhD in Economics and PhD in Public Administration:**

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from January 1, 2021, the study programmes are accredited.

**Period of Accreditation: September 28, 2022 to September 27, 2027**

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.

### **PhD in International Relations and PhD in International Law:**

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) and § 9 (4) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from January 1, 2021, the study programmes are accredited.

**Period of Accreditation: September 1, 2023 to August 31, 2028**

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.

## Assessment Report

---

---

**Higher Education Institution (HEI):**  
KIMEP University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

---

**Doctoral programmes:**  
PhD in Economics  
PhD in Public Administration  
PhD in International Relations  
PhD in International Law

# General Information on the Study Programme

---

## **Brief description of the study programmes:**

The **PhD in Economics** programme focuses on training students at an advanced level in specific fields of economics. It strives to foster creativity and academic excellence, to produce successful teachers and independent researchers with the ability to make contributions at the frontier of their field of specialisation, and to provide graduates with the skills to be highly competitive in the international academic labour market.

The **PhD in Public Administration** programme focuses on training students to acquire the skills to be highly competitive in the international academic labour market and to make contributions at the frontiers of their fields of specialisation. The skills set that graduates develop comprises conducting independent research, developing strategies, and leading developments in the field of international relations, global and regional security, foreign policy of states, and determining the priorities of the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The **PhD in International Relations** programme focuses on training students to conduct independent research, develop strategies, and lead developments in the field of international relations, global and regional security, foreign policy of states, and determine the priorities of the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The **PhD in International Law** programme is to provide legal training of superior quality, with a solid academic background and opportunities to contribute to national and international policy-making in students' respective fields of expertise. The programme is designed to develop a high level of professional knowledge, analytical and critical thinking, excellent research competencies and the ability to cooperate in an international context effectively.

---

## **Type of study programme:**

PhD programmes

---

## **Projected study time and number of ECTS credits assigned to the study programme:**

For all programmes: 3 years, 180 ECTS credits

---

## **Mode of study:**

full-time

---

## **Didactic approach:**

study programme with obligatory class attendance

---

## **Double/Joint Degree programme:**

no

---

## **Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:**

For all programmes: 15 students per year and programme

---

**Programme cycle starts in:**

For all programmes: Fall semester

---

**Initial start of the programme:**

PhD in Economics (2020)

PhD in Public Administration (2020)

PhD in International Relations (September 1, 2023)

PhD in International Law (September 1, 2023)

---

**Type of accreditation:**

Initial Accreditation: PhD in Economics; PhD in Public Administration

Concept Accreditation: PhD in International Relations; PhD in International Law



## Procedure:

On April 29, 2021, a contract for the initial accreditation of the PhD in Economics and the PhD in Public Administration as well as the concept accreditation of the PhD in International Relations and the PhD in International Law was made between FIBAA and the KIMEP University (Almaty, Kazakhstan). On February 18, 2022, the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programmes and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel<sup>1</sup>. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of:

**Prof. Dr. jur. Jan Friedrich Bruckermann**

FOM Hochschule, University of Applied Sciences, Cologne, Germany

Professor for Social Law and Health Law (Labor Law, Tax Law, Criminal Law, Commercial And Corporate Law, Social Law)

**Maia Gelashvili**

Boston College, Lynch School of Education and Human Development, USA

Doctoral student International Higher Education (PhD)

Completed: Higher and Postsecondary Education (M.A.), American Studies (M.A.)

**Dr. Mark Andrew Laffey**

SOAS University of London

Senior Lecturer in International Relations (International Studies, International Relations, International Security, Foreign Policy Analysis, Diplomacy, International Political Sociology, Postcolonial Approaches to World Politics, Hierarchy and Violence, Conflict Management and Humanitarian Action)

**Dr. Maigul Nugmanova**

Narxoz University, Almaty

Gender Economics Research Center Director (Economic theory, Gender Economics, Political Economy, International relations, Internationalization, International Scientific Projects and Fundraising)

**Dr. Philipp Stiel**

Bavarian State Chancellery, Free State of Bavaria, Munich, Germany

Secretary of State Budget Officer

Head of Budget and Internal Services Department (Organization, Rule of Law, Public Management)

---

<sup>1</sup> The panel is presented in alphabetical order.

**Prof. Dr. Adelheid Zeis**

Frankfurt University of Applied Sciences

Professor of Public Law, in particular Municipal Law and General Administrative Law (Public Law, in particular Budgetary Law/Accounting of Public Authorities and Corporate Law of Public Authorities, Public Administration, Public and Non-Profit Management)

FIBAA project manager:

Prof. Dr. Sabine Haller

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, requested by the panel, and an online conference. The online conference took place on May 25<sup>th</sup> – May 27<sup>th</sup>, 2022 via the video conferencing tool Zoom. At the end of the online conference, the panel gave a short feedback on its impressions to representatives of the University.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on August 22, 2022. The statement on the report was given up on September 4, 2022. It has been taken into account in the report on hand.

# Summary

## **PhD in Economics and PhD in Public Administration:**

The programmes PhD in Economics and PhD in Public Administration, offered by KIMEP University, fulfil the FIBAA quality requirements for PhD programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on September 28, 2022 and finishing on September 27, 2027. The programmes are in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

## **PhD in International Relations and PhD in International Law**

The programmes PhD in International Relations and PhD in International Law, offered by KIMEP University, fulfil the FIBAA quality requirements for PhD programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on September 1, 2023 and finishing on August 31, 2028. The programmes are in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

The panel identified several areas where the programmes could be further developed.

- The panel **recommends** KIMEP to monitor the content of the programmes and the quality of PhD students with regard to future careers of graduates. Since the programmes are newly established or will just begin soon, the University should monitor the success rate of the programmes. The panel also encourages the University to keep the high commitment to future employer feedback (see Chapter 1.4).
- The panel **recommends** considering whether a Master's degree in a relevant and/or closely related field could be an admission requirement, if national law permits. This seems to be important, as students who lack a solid background in their research areas will not be able to acquire the required in-depth competencies in the field of the dissertation. (see Chapter 2).
- The panel **recommends** the University to clearly define expectations towards students' achievements over the course of the programme. The applied six-steps procedure should be specified clearly, for instance by developing a research agreement between supervisor and student that states the expectation in each step and timeframe. Also the University should consider a different approach of measuring success to ease the workload on students, e.g. by notions of continuous progress instead of marking at the end of the semester or considering to switch to pass/fail evaluations (see Chapter 3.1).
- External environment imposes difficult conditions on students as they usually work alongside their studies. This might result in a negative impact on quality in the outcome of students. Therefore, the panel **recommends** that the University consider part-time options as a form of

study for working full-time students. Furthermore, the panel **recommends to** seek strong relations to the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan to convince it to reduce expectations on students in the future (see Chapter 3.1).

For the overall assessment of the programme, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

## Information on the Institution

Established in 1992, KIMEP University (further: KIMEP) is an independent, non-profit higher education institution in Kazakhstan serving a multinational student body. KIMEP is licensed and has been attested by the Kazakhstan Ministry of Education and Science (MES) as a higher education institution (HEI) authorised to provide educational services. In January 2012, KIMEP obtained university status.

KIMEP University currently offers 34 degree programmes for students including 14 undergraduate and 20 graduate level programmes in Business Administration, Accounting and Audit, Finance, Marketing, Management, Information Systems, Economics, International Journalism, Public Administration, International Relations, International Law, Law in Jurisprudence, Cognitive Science, Foreign Languages, Education Policy and Management, and Translation and Professional Communication. KIMEP offers Doctoral programmes in Business Finance, Marketing, Management and Accounting and Audit, Economics, Public Administration and Education Policy and Management. Programmes are offered at KIMEP's four academic colleges: the Bang College of Business (BCB), College of Social Sciences (CSS), Law School (LS) and College of Humanities and Education (CHE) that are supported by various units on the university level.

Based on Fall 2021 data, there are 2,007 students at KIMEP and 13,783 alumni. KIMEP students (including exchange students) historically originate from 88 different countries, representing about 50 different ethnicities and nationalities. Currently, there are 128 faculty members including 95 full-time faculties. The overall faculty/student ratio for KIMEP is 0.06 or 15.7 students per faculty. About 73 % of the University's full-time faculty members hold PhD degrees.

From a legal viewpoint, KIMEP is a joint-stock company, a non-profit organisation, which offers higher education services (including further education). Although 60 % of KIMEP shareholders are private and 40 % shares belong to the government of Kazakhstan. KIMEP University does not receive any funding from the government.

The University conventionally occupies the top positions at the Ranking of Higher Education Academic Programmes conducted by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken" that accounts for the recent University graduates' career perspectives (entry salaries, employment rate, and job search duration), and the rating based on the industry representatives' assessments. KIMEP's stated its ethical core values, comprising a fundamental commitment to honesty, integrity, transparency, meticulous care for the well-being of its students, and the delivery of academic excellence. This includes developing well-educated citizens and improving the quality of life in Kazakhstan and the Central Asian region through teaching, learning, community service and the knowledge advancements in the fields of business administration and social sciences.

Kazakhstan became the 47th signatory of the Bologna Process and the first Central Asian nation to join the European Higher Education Area (EHEA) under the 2010 Budapest-Vienna Declaration and therefore committed to the full and proper implementation of the Bologna Process, in close cooperation with HEIs, their faculty, staff, students, and other stakeholders. The Ministry of Education and Science

of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES of RK), as the responsible ministry, has instituted the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS).

## Development of the programmes

The PhD Programmes in Economics and Public Administration were introduced in fall 2020, based on the existing license of KIMEP University to offer PhD programmes in the field of Business and Economics.

### Admission and Scholarship Statistics (PhD programme in Economics)

Applicants/cohort	Cohort 2020-21	Cohort 2021-22
female	3	1
male	2	2
$\Sigma$	5	3
acceptedfemale	2	1
accepted male	1	1
acceptedforscholarship (female)	1	0
acceptedforscholarship (male)	0	1

### Admission and Scholarship Statistics (PhD programme in Public Administration)

Applicants/cohort	Cohort 2020-21	Cohort 2021-22
female	4	2
male	2	6
$\Sigma$	6	8
acceptedfemale	4	1
accepted male	2	5
acceptedforscholarship (female)	1	0
acceptedforscholarship (male)	0	1

KIMEP has also applied for licenses to offer the PhD programmes in International Relations and International Law, and the University seeks concept accreditation for these two programmes.

## Appraisal:

The panel appreciates the development of the PhD programmes as the University encourages students to pursue their academic career in the country instead of going abroad.

The success and drop-out rates cannot be evaluated since two programmes started recently. The other two programmes have not started yet.

The panel encourages KIMEP University develop a systematic mechanism for a follow-up on dropout rates and completion of studies within the foreseen time period and derive an action plan with concrete measures and responsibilities.

# Description and Appraisals in Detail

## 1. Goals and Strategy

### 1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programmes

#### **PhD programme in Economics:**

The objective of the PhD programme in Economics focuses on training students at an advanced level in specific fields of national and international economics. The programme is designed to develop a high level of professional knowledge, analytical and critical thinking, excellent research competencies and the ability to cooperate in an international context effectively. The University strives to enable graduates to be successful teachers and independent researchers with the ability to make contributions at the frontier of their field of specialisation, and to equip them with the skills to be highly competitive in the international academic labour market.

The learning goals and objectives of the programme are to produce graduates who

- have the expertise and skills to employ innovative methods and find creative solutions to a range of problems in economics and the social sciences;
- are excellent communicators in the classroom with a firm background in a range of fields in modern economics who are versed in modern didactical methods;
- are creative and innovative contributors with the ability to conduct rigorous economic analysis and the ability to publish in high-ranking journals; and
- are academics with the ability to take a leading role in scientific investigations, communicate effectively with the scientific community and defend their positions.

The objectives and requirements for the programme correspond with the European and National Frameworks, Dublin Descriptors and the University Strategy.

The Intended Learning Outcomes are as follows:

- Compose relevant research questions and develop a research agenda
- Make a substantive original contribution to a field in economics
- Design a research plan, collect and analyse data
- Communicate effectively with the scientific community and defend positions
- Critically appraise a body of scholarship in a connected research field in economics
- Develop original solutions to problems in economics and the social sciences
- Use and develop models for predicting behaviour and evaluating policies
- Develop policy recommendations



### **PhD Programme in Public Administration:**

The objective of the PhD Programme in Public Administration is to encourage intellectual inquiry and to foster the creativity and academic excellence to produce successful researchers, teachers, and practitioners. The University strives to enable graduates to be successful teachers and independent researchers with the ability to make contributions at the frontier of their field of specialisation, and to equip them with the skills to be highly competitive in the international academic labour market.

The purpose of the programme is the training of highly qualified graduates who possess outstanding research and pedagogical skills and who are highly competitive in their relevant labour markets. The skills set that graduates develop comprises conducting independent research, developing strategies, and leading developments in the field of international relations, global and regional security, foreign policy of states, and determining the priorities of the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The graduates shall demonstrate the following learning outcomes:

- to deepen the systemic knowledge and critical thinking of doctoral students to assess a diverse spectrum of problems in international relations;
- to develop the skills of analysing, assessing, and forecasting trends in the field of modern international relations, global politics, and regional and world processes;
- to expand and deepen the understanding and ability to work with modern foreign and domestic academic literature, and to be familiar with the latest scientific developments, concepts, and paradigms in the field of international relations;
- to enable students to make their own critical assessment of global events and the development of international processes;
- to develop the ability and focus of the doctoral student to make a significant contribution, and to find relevant topics and explore new research areas in the field of international relations through original scientific research.

The Intended Learning Outcomes are as follows:

- Select and construct a methodology suitable for their research topic;
- Appraise the historical origins and institutional foundations of traditional, legal-rational, and social-democratic political systems;
- Identify and evaluate the role of key civic and political actors in the agenda-setting and decision-making of public policy;
- Analyse economic events and decisions in terms of efficiency and equity;
- Evaluate the relationships between different policies and the income distribution;
- Distinguish between normative and action-oriented facets of social policy;
- Formulate and design conditions for economic and technological innovation;
- Produce an original policy contribution in the form of an advanced doctoral dissertation.

### **PhD programme in International Relations:**

The objective of the PhD programme in International Relations is the training of highly qualified graduates who possess outstanding research and pedagogical skills and who are highly competitive in their relevant labour market. The skills set that graduates develop comprises conducting independent research, developing strategies, and leading developments in the field of international relations, global

and regional security, foreign policy of states, and determining the priorities of the foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The graduates shall demonstrate the following learning outcomes:

- produce research in their area of expertise and meet standards for publication at the international level;
- systematically analyse problems in global politics, including the assessment of their impact on global and regional politics and the relations between countries, to present results, draw conclusions, and give recommendations;
- apply and critically appraise modern research methods in their area of research and in adjacent academic fields;
- put researched phenomena in their historical context, referring to theoretical and conceptual schools, determine trends and developments, and synthesize results for teaching and research output;
- analyse problems and phenomena in the field of international security, determine causal relationships and factors, and forecast and develop recommendations for solving conflicts;
- analyse global and regional economic problems and assess the scope for international and national institutions and organisations in addressing these problems;
- assess the role of international institutions and international law in global politics and analyse their impact using an interdisciplinary approach;
- assess the legal and political aspects of human rights within the field of international relations;
- develop a research agenda which leads to practically applicable results and forms the basis of their professional activity.

#### **PhD in International Law programme:**

The PhD in International Law programme was designed with the purpose of bringing a doctoral programme in line with international practices to Kazakhstan's higher education market. The goal of the programme is to provide legal training of superior quality, with a solid academic background and opportunities to contribute to national and international policy-making in students' respective fields of expertise.

The PhD programme aims to train highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel in the field of international public and private law, capable of making a significant contribution to the development of the science of international law and the practice of its application by state bodies, international organisations and in the non-governmental sector. Correspondingly, the doctoral coursework encompasses academic writing and research methods, as well as required and elective courses.

The learning goals and objectives of the programme are to produce graduates who

- acquire a solid methodological foundation and employ it to support innovative research in international law and give consultancy or gain professional practice in governmental and non-governmental organisations;
- contribute high-quality research to the international debate on international law through publications, conference participation, and other forms of scientific and professional communication;

- obtain transformational leadership skills and the ability to inspire and manage change in academic, professional, and wider social settings;
- develop high-level capabilities for autonomous analysis and evaluation of data from a variety of sources, with emphasis on recognizing and forecasting the real-world implications of developments in the discipline of international law and vice-versa.
- communicate effectively and persuasively research-based insights on international law and related fields to specialised academic audiences, the government, and the public at large.

In addition, the graduates shall be able to:

- demonstrate a systematic understanding of the meaning and role of international law in the modern world, the functional purpose of its branches, the activities of international organisations, the place of international law in the legal system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the role of international public and private law for the development of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
- analyse, critically evaluate, and generate fundamental theoretical and philosophical concepts in the field of international public and private law;
- effectively apply international treaties and other sources of international law, draw up qualified legal opinions and advice on the interpretation and application of international law;
- identify national, regional and international economic problems and challenges that can be effectively resolved by means of international public or private law, and make an expert contribution to the resolution of such problems and challenges;
- master the methods of writing world-class scientific works on international law (monographs, chapters in books, academic articles, encyclopaedia articles, etc.);
- apply in practice various methods and processes in research and expert work in the field of international law; and
- contribute to the formation of fresh knowledge, new theories and methods, interpretations and types of documentation in international law.

## Appraisal:

The qualification objectives of the programmes are explained and convincingly presented by the University in relation to the target group, targeted professional field and societal context of the discipline. They embrace academic proficiency, comprehensive employability, as well as the development of the individual student's personality. The doctoral programmes and the pursued qualification and competency goals are matched with each other.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality-requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	<b>STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES</b>					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		

## 1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market

The national education framework recognises the need to improve the performance of the higher education sector of Kazakhstan by increasing its internationalisation (for example, by requiring thesis supervisors and PhD candidates to have publications in international journals and by requiring overseas advisors to be involved in the supervision of PhD theses). KIMEP is well-placed to contribute to this goal because of its international orientation. Recognising its role in Kazakhstan, KIMEP has made a commitment to offer PhD programmes as a way of promoting excellence in higher education in Kazakhstan. As KIMEP University aims at strengthening its status as a research institution, the PhD programmes correspond to the University’s vision and support its long term strategies.

Because of its international orientation KIMEP is able to offer the programmes entirely in English language, thus differentiating their positioning from programmes of other universities and to attract international student body.

### Appraisal:

The doctoral programmes are positioned convincingly in the postgraduate education market due to the described profile and the pursued qualification and competency goals.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the educational market			X		

## 1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programmes in the Job Market for Graduates

Due to the recent start of the programmes **PhD in Economics** and the **PhD in Public Administration** there is not yet a graduating cohort. KIMEP decided to offer these programmes because of their very good placement record in all its programmes. Because of its large number of international faculty members and its English-language curriculum, KIMEP is of the opinion that it is adequately placed to train internationally competitive graduates that match the government’s vision for the future of Kazakhstan’s higher education sector.

The **PhD in International Relations (not started yet)** is building on a strong foundation as KIMEP has positioned itself as a hub for research on the Central Asian region. The China and Central Asia Studies Center attracts interest from international researchers and provides PhD students with a vibrant environment. There is increasing demand for the newest research and for graduates in various research organisations. Moreover, regional and national political developments require specialists who are able to evaluate these developments and recommend policies from a Kazakhstani perspective.

Only a few universities in Kazakhstan, located in Nur-Sultan and Almaty, already offer a **PhD in International Law**. KIMEP University's PhD in International Law programme is offered in English language and will be unique in the country (and likely probably in the Central Asian region). Professional-level English proficiency of KIMEP graduates will allow them to effectively communicate and disseminate their research to a global audience, one of which is among the personal and professional competences for doctoral studies in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework.

As one of the leading law schools in Kazakhstan, KIMEP University's School of Law caters to the needs of Kazakhstan's and Central Asia's legal services markets in that its qualified local and foreign faculty teach national and international law in the English language. The **PhD in International Law programme** is proposed in order to strengthen the foundation of current programmes and to create a place for generating new knowledge in the local environment. As a consequence, local capacity-building will progressively yield fruits, and dependence on foreign faculty will be reduced. Local candidates will get an opportunity to advance their education and career goals while remaining employed. The aim is to increase the supply of doctoral degree holders at the School of Law who will become, in the future, academic leaders at universities and research institutes in Kazakhstan and Central Asia.

As the programmes are very young or have not started yet there are no alumni. During the online conference most students reported that they intend to pursue a career in academia or in the public services/ministries of their country.

## Appraisal:

The doctoral programmes with special focus on professional qualification for science and research are positioned convincingly due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research.

The doctoral programmes are also positioned outside the science and research field by taking into account the professional qualification for employment due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	in the research fields			X		
1.3.2	outside the research fields			X		

## 1.4 Positioning of the Doctoral Programmes in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

It is part of the mission of KIMEP University to improve the quality of life in Kazakhstan, Central Asia, and beyond through teaching, research, learning, community service, and the advancement of knowledge in business administration, social sciences, law, languages, and other fields. Ultimately, the success of this mission depends on shaping the higher education sector of Kazakhstan to reflect KIMEP's core values of academic excellence and student-oriented education. All submitted PhD programmes are provided for in KIMEP University's Strategic Plan for 2022-2025. In the plan, KIMEP University emphasises its status as a research institute, so the new doctoral programmes are a necessary step to support this strategic orientation.

While historically KIMEP University has made a discernable impact with the placement of its graduates at a high level in industry and government, fulfilment of its mission ultimately depends on having a comparable impact in the field of higher education. While KIMEP is a private university that depends on tuition payments for its operations, it has made the commitment of offering PhD programmes as a contribution to the development of Kazakhstan.

In both the **Public Administration** and **Economics** programmes, KIMEP has long established itself as a reputable supplier of graduates to the Kazakhstani labour market. The Master of Arts in Economics, together with the MBA programme, was one of the first programmes offered by KIMEP University and for a long time, the Department of Public Administration was the strongest department in terms of student numbers. The **PhD programme in International Relations** will be offered by the largest department in the College of Social Sciences (CSS).

The **PhD in International Law** will complete the range of academic and professional programmes offered by the School of Law, and will allow for the successful progression of the students from the undergraduate level through a master's programme to a doctoral degree in international law. The programme is provided for in KIMEP University's Strategic Plan for the next three years, which is currently in development, along with a few other undergraduate and postgraduate programmes also in the making.

### Appraisal:

The University has an overall development strategy, also with regard to its study programmes. The study programme's qualification goals are in line with the University mission and strategic planning. The integration of the PhD programmes in the strategic concept of KIMEP is described and presented in a comprehensive manner.

However, the panel **recommends** KIMEP to monitor the content of the programme and the quality of PhD students in comparison to future careers of graduates. It should monitor the success rate of the programmes. The panel also encourages the University to keep a high commitment to future employer feedback.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.4	The Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		

## 1.5 Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities

KIMEP's values include building an inclusive environment for students, their parents, alumni, staff, faculty, and the wider community, blind to nationality, gender, age, religion, or other factors not related to the purposes of the University. It aims at increasing opportunities for students needing assistance with their academics in order for students to successfully complete their courses (KIMEP Strategic Plan 2018-21).

KIMEP University is committed to a policy of equal opportunity for learning opportunities to all qualified individuals for PhD programmes. The University is also committed to the principles of continuing life-long education. It does not discriminate against any individual or group on the basis of race, ethnicity, nationality, religion, gender, social or sexual orientation, creed, marital status, physical disabilities, remote area location, age and/or any other subjective criteria. KIMEP University seeks to enrol outstanding students who have demonstrated the potential to succeed through leadership and talent as well as having shown evidence of their capability to contribute to the community. The University has created clear and transparent procedures for accepting and promoting the success of individuals with diverse academic histories and academic needs:

Any information concerning an applicant's disability provided during the admissions process is voluntary and leads to the specific services once eligibility is proven through professional documentation submitted to the KIMEP Medical Centre. It is maintained in accordance with laws relating to confidentiality. No limitations are placed on the number or proportion of persons with disabilities who may be admitted or enrolled (KIMEP Catalogue 2021-22, p. 7). KIMEP provides disadvantage compensation in exams for students who have registered as disabled with the Student Affairs Office. KIMEP thereby establishes equal opportunities to the extent that its own entrance tests and examinations are concerned.

### Appraisal:

The University fulfils its tasks to promote gender equality and the enforcement of general prohibitions on discrimination, also with regard to the doctoral programme at hand.

In the long term, the committee encourages the KIMEP to continue representation of female faculty until the faculty teaching staff reflects the gender distribution of students, and should strive for gender diversity in higher positions.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		

## 2. Admission

Admission and enrolment to the Bachelor, Master and PhD programmes is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES) dated 31 October 2018 No. 600 “On approval of the Model Regulations for admission to undergraduate and postgraduate educational programmes” (Order 2018).

The admission procedure is organised by the Admission Office with the Programme Admission Committee of the department. The latter gives a final recommendation on who should be admitted.

For the **PhD programme in Economics** and the **PhD programme in Public Administration**, admission requirements include passing the KIMEP Graduate Entry Test (KGET) with a score of at least 15 out of 50 or, alternatively, a GMAT or GRE test result that the responsible department deems equivalent. The KGET was waived in 2020 and 2021 because KIMEP was closed to visitors due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Since 2021, an entry test for PhD students conducted at the national level has replaced the KGET. Therefore, the KGET is now only a relevant entrance level requirement for international applicants. For the **PhD programme in International Relations** and the **PhD programme in International Law**, the KGET test is not required but the nationally mandated entry test applies equally as in the other programmes.

Admission to the PhD programme is highly competitive. Admission is granted to candidates deemed most likely to complete and benefit from the programme. The final decision on admission is based on a comprehensive assessment of the applicant’s overall qualifications, motivation, determination, and commitment to the programme.

### Completed graduate degree

- Copy of a diploma confirming the completion of a master’s degree
- Copy of transcripts (diploma supplement) with grades

### Application packages shall consist of the following:

- Application form
- Copy of passport or of State ID
- Digital photo with a resolution of 300 ppi (pixels per inch) with a size of no less than 8 MP (Megapixels) in JPEG format with low compression (high quality)
- Copy of a document on completion of Master degree
- Professional CV
- Valid results of International Language Proficiency Tests (copy of IELTS certificate or original)



certificates of TOEFL)

- Medical certificate – Form # O86-U or its equivalent for foreign citizens
- Two professional letters of recommendation
- List of relevant publications and sample publication (if available)
- Upon their own discretion, an applicant may include other documents that they believe are relevant for inclusion in the application package.

#### **Additional consideration by a selection committee:**

- The graduate GPA shall be 3.0 and above or more than 69% equivalent when converted into a scale comparable to the KIMEP grading scale
- A typed statement of purpose of up to 500 words that states the applicant's academic and professional interests; how the applicant will benefit from the PhD programme professionally and personally; the applicant's strengths and qualities that will enable them to complete a rigorous doctoral programme.
- A 2-3 page research proposal: In this proposal, the candidate should lay out the general idea of their intended research and some indicative description of the method they intend to use. The candidate should demonstrate familiarity with current research, the ability to identify open research questions and the ability to create an original research proposal.
- An interview with programme admissions committee where admissions committee may consider additional evidence of excellence or aptitude such as prior publications of work experience and have the final decision making authority on the recommendation of the candidate for admission to PHD programme.

#### **Admission procedures**

Applicants will need to submit the Application Form with required documents attached for a given semester by set deadlines to the Department of Student Recruitment and Admission through an online applicant portal. The system automatically sends out a notification on receipt of applications to the email address indicated in the application. The online application is available in three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English. Applicants may easily activate their account in the system by entering a current personal email address.

Applications for admission are reviewed separately from applications for financial aid. The Admissions and Scholarship Committee is the standing committee of the KIMEP Academic Council that sets the policies and procedures for financial aid.

For recruitment purposes, the University prepares and publishes materials for internal and external advertisement, including brochures, booklets, and information sheets. The University has also created information boards to place information on majors available in the colleges, as well as extracts from Admission Rules in Kazakh, Russian, and English. Materials for KIMEP University Admission Rules and special Applicant memos are prepared for applicants.

Within the framework of the Marketing, Communications, and Public Relations Departments, information on specialisations offered by the University along with Admission Rules is broadcasted via radio stations, placed in public displays on the streets of Almaty and other cities of the country, and

published on official digital platforms and KIMEP University's social media: Facebook, Vkontakte, Instagram, and popular websites.

### **Regulation of the University Admission Commission**

In addition to international considerations when working with applicants, State admission legislation must be considered when making admission decisions, including the Law of the RK On Education, Standard Rules of Admission to Academic Institutions Offering Undergraduate Education, Standard Rules of Admission to Academic Institutions Offering Graduate Education, and Rules for Students' Transfer and Reinstatement, as well as the RK Government Order (as of July 9, 2013 #701).

The Department of Student Recruitment and Admission (DSRA) was created to recruit and admit students to KIMEP academic programmes in accordance with admission policies as well as strategic and operational plans. Annually, the DSRA organises relevant recruitment activities in Kazakhstan, Central Asia, and worldwide. The DSRA is empowered and responsible for all activities related to collection, review, and data entry from online applications of all programmes of KIMEP University. The DSRA is also responsible for the review of all applicants to determine admission or rejection to KIMEP programmes with the follow up communication that would lead to arrival, visa, registration and enrollment or re-application for the next intake. The DSRA closely works with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on issues related to required state examinations (UNT and Graduate exams). The director appoints responsible officers and informs state bodies.

### **Appraisal:**

The admission requirements for PhD students, based on the regulations of the Kazakhstan Ministry of Education and Science, are properly defined and set out transparently.

The selection procedure is carried out in accordance with the national law and therefore satisfies the legal requirements.

The decision on admission is based on transparent criteria and it is clearly communicated; rejections are reasoned. The responsibilities are clearly regulated. However, the panel encourages the University to document the administration process in a detailed way. The panel **recommends** considering whether a Master's degree in a relevant and/or closely related field could be an admission requirement, if national law permits. This seems to be important, as students who lack a solid background in their research areas will not be able to acquire the required in-depth competencies in the field of the dissertation.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>2.</b>	<b>ADMISSION</b>					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection Procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

### 3. Implementation

#### 3.1 Structure

The PhD programmes have all a comparable structure as these regulations are given by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan:

Projected study time	6 semesters
Number of Credit Points (CP)	180 ECTS credits
Workload per CP	30 hours
Number of courses	3 modules of theoretical study
Number of contact hours	288 contact hours (for theoretical study)

The programme is designed in accordance with the national requirements which define the doctoral programme as follows:

- 45 ECTS of theoretical study with Academic writing, Research methodology, research and teaching practice as a compulsory part;
- 123 ECTS of research work;
- 12 ECTS for PhD thesis preparation and defense

For the **PhD in Economics, PhD in Public Administration and PhD in International Relations**, the following table provides an overview of the modular structure of the programmes:

Module Title	ECTs
<b>Required Courses</b>	<b>10</b>
Research Methodology (Economics) or Research Methods (Public administration, International Relations)	5
Academic Writing for PhD Students in the	5

Social Sciences	
<b><i>Programme Foundation Electives</i></b>	<b>15</b>
Elective 1	5
Elective 2	5
Elective 3	5
<b><i>Internships, Research Work and Dissertation</i></b>	<b>25</b>
Pedagogic Internship	10
Research Internship	10
Experimental Research Work and Dissertation	118
Research Practice	5
<b><i>Final Attestation</i></b>	<b>12</b>
Dissertation and Defence	12
<b>Total required for graduation:</b>	<b>180</b>

All programmes contain the following modules:

- **Pedagogic Internship** (10 ECTS) where the student receives an introduction to pedagogy and training in course design and classroom management. As part of the module, the student is assigned to an internship supervisor, participates in class meetings and teaches classes under supervision.
- **Research Internship** (10 ECTS) where the student spends time at a research institute, company or university, collects data and reports.
- **Research Practice** (5 ECTS) where the student spends time (minimum four weeks) at a research institute or university abroad. The purpose of the internship is to support data collection and other field work and for the student to build their research network.

## PhD in Economics

### Required Modules

- Research Methodology (5 ECTS)
- Academic Writing for PhD Students in the Social Sciences (5 ECTS)
- Experimental Research Work and Dissertation (118 ECTS)
- Pedagogic Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Practice (5 ECTS)
- Dissertation and Defense (12 ECTS)

### Elective Modules for the PhD in Economics (15 ECTS in total)

- Development Economics
- Political Economy

- Industrial Organization
- Applied Econometrics
- Behavioral Economics
- Special Topics in Economics

## **PhD in Public Administration**

### Required Modules

- Research Methods
- Academic Writing for PhD students in the Social Sciences
- Experimental Research Work and Dissertation (118 ECTS)
- Pedagogic Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Practice (5 ECTS)
- Dissertation and Defense (12 ECTS)

### Elective Courses (15 ECTS in total)

- Comparative Governance and Development of Industrial Countries
- Contemporary Models of Public Administration and Management
- Comparative Public Policy
- Economic Perspectives on Government
- Selected Issues in Public Policy and Programme Implementation

## **PhD in International Relation**

### Required Modules

- Research Methods (5 ECTS)
- Academic Writing for PhD Students in the Social Sciences (5 ECTS)
- Experimental Research Work and Dissertation (118 ECTS)
- Pedagogic Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Internship (10 ECTS)
- Research Practice (5 ECTS)
- Dissertation and Defense (12 ECTS)

### Elective Modules (15 ECTS in total)

- Global Security Politics (5 ECTS)
- Political Institutions and International Organizations (5 ECTS)
- Human Rights Policy: International Experience (5 ECTS)
- Geopolitics (5 ECTS)
- International Economic Development (5 ECTS)
- International Relations: Legal and Research Aspects (5 ECTS)

## The 3-year Study Plan for PHD students

Year	Fall Semester	Credits ECTS	Spring Semester	Credits ECTS	Credits per Year ECTS
1	Research Methods	5	Academic Writing	5	
1	Elective 1/Specialization Courses	5	Elective 2/Specialization Courses	5	
1	Experimental Research Work 1	20	Experimental Research Work 2	20	
	<b>Total Fall</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>Total Spring</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>60</b>
2	Elective 3/Specialization Courses	5	Pedagogic Internship	10	
2	Experimental Research Work 3	20	Experimental Research Work 4	20	
2	Research Practice	5			
	<b>Total Fall</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>Total Spring</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>60</b>
3	Experimental Research Work 5	20	Experimental Research Work 6	18	
3	Research Internship	10	Dissertation and Defense	12	
	<b>Total Fall</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>Total Spring</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>60</b>
	Total Falls	90	Total Springs	90	
	<b>Grand Total</b>				<b>180</b>

The following table gives an overview of the requirements in the PhD programme in International Law:

Requirements	ECTS
Foundation required courses	10
Foundation electives courses	5
Specialisation required courses	5
Specialisation elective courses	5
Research internship	10
Pedagogical internship	10
Research work of a doctoral student, including an apprenticeship and a doctoral dissertation	123
Final attestation (PhD Dissertation and Defence)	12
<b>Total Required for Graduation</b>	<b>180</b>

The **PhD in International Law programme** offers 15 credits of regular (foundation + specialisation) class studies with mandatory class attendance. Each class is 5 ECTS with 150 learning hours devoted per module / course.<sup>2</sup>

Course Code	Course Title	ECTS
LAW6001	Academic Writing for PhD in Law Students	5
LAW6002	PhD Research Methods	5
LAW6301	Contemporary Issues of International Law	5

Each doctoral student is also expected to take 10 additional credits of foundation and specialisation elective modules / courses. Correspondingly, doctoral students may choose two of the following courses:

Course Code	Course Title	ECTS
LAW6201	Law of International Treaties (Advanced)	5
LAW6202	International Conflict and Security Law	5
LAW6203	Advanced Law of International Organizations	5
LAW6204	Philosophy of International Law	5
LAW6401	International Trade Law / Law of the WTO: Selected Issues	5
LAW6402	Private International Law (Advanced)	5
LAW6403	Topics in International Human Rights Law	5

1st year						
Code	Fall semester	ECTS	Code	Spring semester	ECTS	
LAW6001	Academic writing for PhD in law students	5	LAW6301	Contemporary Issues of International Law	5	
LAW6002	Research Methods	5	LAW6408	Research Internship	10	<b>1, 2, 3 year</b>
LAW6201	<i>Law of International Treaties (Advanced)</i>	5	LAW6501	Research work of a PhD student	118	<b>1, 2, 3 year</b>
LAW6202	<i>International Conflict and Security Law</i>	5				
LAW6203	<i>Advanced Law of International Organizations</i>	5				
LAW6204	<i>Philosophy of International Law</i>	5				

2nd year						
Code	Fall semester	ECTS	Code	Spring semester	ECTS	
LAW6401	<i>International Trade Law / Law of the WTO: Selected Issues</i>	5	LAW6502	Research apprenticeship	15	<b>1, 2, 3 year</b>
LAW6402	<i>Private International Law (Advanced)</i>	5				
LAW6403	<i>Topics in International Human Rights Law</i>	5				
LAW6208	Pedagogic Internship	10				

### For all programmes:

Students are free to take courses that fit their personal needs as long as they fulfil all requirements. The general recommendation is to take the methods course and the writing course in the first two semesters, possibly together with an elective and to continuously enroll in the different sections of the module experimental research and dissertation.

Every syllabus of a course provided to the students states the subject matter, goals, learning outcomes, topics and requirements of each module. The learning objectives guide students to manage their workload and help to acquire the essential skills to be professional in related field.

As a part of students' Research Work, PhD students prepare their theses in consultation with research advisors (national supervisor and foreign advisor). Also, they can go to the foreign research internship to work with foreign advisor or can plan it further. PhD students get their first teaching experience, work on research articles and reviews.



In addition to the thesis, each PhD student is mandated to publish academic articles in recognised peer-reviewed journals. A certain number of publications is the requirement to be admitted for the thesis defense procedure. The number of publications depends on the quality of the journals:

International peer-reviewed journals	Local recognised journals recommended by the Quality Assurance Committee of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
One article published at journal: - with JCR impact factor, <u>or</u>  - indexed by Web of Science Core Collection (Arts and Humanities Citation Index), <u>or</u>  - indexed by Science Citation Index Expanded (Social Sciences Citation Index), <u>or</u>  - having the Scopus Cite Score highest percentile of 25 and above	Three articles
One article published at journal: - with JCR impact factor, <u>or</u> - having the Scopus CiteScore highest percentile of 25 and above  <b>and</b> one articles published at journal: - ranked Q2-Q4 JCR, <u>or</u> - having the Scopus Cite Score highest percentile of 50 and above	
one article published at journal: - ranked Q1 JCR	

## Doctoral Degree Regulations

The PhD Degree Regulations are in conformity with relevant instructions and standards issued by the MES. The Regulations contain the rules on the following elements: doctoral degree requirements to complete the programme, the Doctoral Committee, admission requirements and procedure, enrolment as a doctoral student, dissertation supervision and guidance (respective duties), standard completion time, the dissertation and its constituent components, Examination Commission, evaluation procedure, publishing obligations of the doctoral student – in accordance with the logic of the MES Decree #604 of 31 October 2018 [hereinafter MES Decree #604].

The duration of the PhD programme is three years. By the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education, a PhD programme consists of 180 ECTS. There is no possibility to enrol PhD students as part-time students (there is no distinction between full-time and part-time students). The overall structure of the PhD programme as shown in section 3.1.1 is mandated.

Every student is assigned a supervisor who meets the national qualification guidelines for supervisors in the area of Social Sciences. A second international supervisor who mostly comes from the personal networks of the teaching faculty is also recruited within the first year of the respective programme.

Details on the thesis defense are provided in the PhD handbook. A prerequisite for being admitted to defend the thesis is compliance with publication requirements as laid out in the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education. The length of the publication process in reputed international journals (at least one article in a journal in the top three quartiles of some Scopus ranking is required) makes it practically difficult to finish within the regular study time of three years.

All faculty members who teach foundation and specialisation courses at the doctoral level are required to produce syllabi for their respective courses. They are guided by academic freedom in organising the content and format of their respective courses.

### **Status of the Doctoral Students**

Unless otherwise permitted, each doctoral student must be enrolled in the PhD programme for a minimum period of two years of residency. Doctoral students who begin the programme but take a leave to attend a foreign university as part of an official exchange will have the time at the foreign university counted towards their residency requirement. A student's enrolment in the doctoral programme may be terminated if the student fails to make satisfactory progress towards the degree (in accordance with the termination conditions as stipulated in the Regulations: failure to achieve satisfactory progress, failure to complete all degree requirements, as well as proven academic dishonesty and/or unethical conduct). The time limit for completion of the doctoral programme is five years but a student may petition the Doctoral Studies Committee, requesting an extension. Termination from the programme is effected upon recommendation of the Doctoral Studies Committee and subject to final approval by the majority of the Committee members. If a student's enrolment in the programme is terminated, he or she will be notified in writing, and the reasons for the termination will be clearly explained.

As all four programmes only started recently or are going to start in the future there is no evidence yet if students are able to finish within the given timeframe.

In accordance with MES Decree #604, a doctoral student is a physical person who is undergoing doctoral studies. Students enrolled in the PhD programme fall under that definition provided they have properly completed all admission requirements and procedures stipulated in the Regulations. Doctoral students must successfully complete all coursework, the dissertation writing, and oral defense within a maximum of five years after commencing the programme. Doctoral students may apply for additional time to complete the programme under extraordinary circumstances, in which case they will be required to submit a verifiable proof in support thereof. Any doctoral student who fails to register for credit work for one academic year without obtaining a leave of absence will be removed from the programme.

As a rigid structure of the PhD programmes is given by the Ministry of Education and Science of Kazakhstan, there is only room for individual content within the electives. Due to the very small number of existing students in the programmes of Economics and Public Administration only a small number of electives are offered yet. The panel learned during the online conference that students can choose these according to their preferences.

Entering the programme students are assigned one supervisor. The programmes are divided into six semesters. After each step they have to show progress and are marked individually.

## Appraisal:

In the view of experts, the structure of the PhD programme corresponds with its objectives and it properly connects the range of courses with the research tasks of the doctoral students.

The structure of the programmes takes into account the national requirements (state educational standards) in terms of programmes' components. The panel learned during the online conference that the MES' publication requirements are challenging for PhD students as students at Kazakh universities are often unable to publish articles in international peer-reviewed journals with the required impact factor within the prescribed maximum study period. The panel is aware that KIMEP cannot change the national education standards and would like to emphasise that the University should continue to provide support to students from the beginning of their studies (see recommendation in Chapter 1.4).

The panel **recommends** the University to clearly define expectations towards students' achievements over the course of the programme. The applied 6-steps procedure should be specified clearly, for instance by developing a research agreement between supervisor and student that states the expectation in each step and timeframe. Also the University should consider a different approach of measuring success to ease the workload on students, e.g. by notions of continuous progress instead of marking at the end of the semester or considering to switch to pass/fail evaluations.

The status of the doctoral students, which is defined by law, is regulated properly.

The programme consists of courses and assigns ECTS credits. Course descriptions for the PhD programme were provided and were subject to review by the expert panel. They are informative and contain all necessary information on the content, duration, requirements, recommended reading and the learning outcomes to be achieved. However, the panel did not gain the impression that the syllabi are updated regularly as some of the recommended literature sources are not shown in the current editions. Therefore, they encourage the regular refreshment of course syllabi.

External environment imposes difficult conditions on students as they usually work alongside their studies. This might result in a negative impact on quality in the outcome of students. Therefore, the panel **recommends** that the University consider part-time options as a form of study for working full-time students. Furthermore, the panel **recommends** seeking strong relations to the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan to convince it to reduce expectations on students in the future.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulations			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		

## 3.2 Content

The curriculum overview is presented in chapter 3.1.

Each semester comprises 30 ECTS credits which represent the principle of modularisation where each module includes certain number of subject units to be completed by students. Courses are delivered through a series of taught modules on specialist topics and structured around independent research projects.

The updated SCS of Postgraduate Education set an obligatory focus on the development of PhD students' research capacity. It reduced the number of credits of Theoretical Study from 60 ECTS of trainings to 45 ECTS, including at least 10 ECTS of Teaching Practice and 10 ECTS of Research Internship. It means, that in total scope of 180 ECTS only 25 ECTS should be allocated to trainings, and among them, modules on research methodology and academic writing should be provided obligatory.

According to this update, the doctoral programmes' content is research-oriented. Started with courses providing students with research competencies and skills, the programmes lead to the research implementation directly after the first year. The programmes are enhanced by foreign research internships and the opportunity to integrate international experience. The courses offered by the programmes allow PhD students to deepen their knowledge and acquire additional skills and competencies required for successful research activity. The programmes are entirely taught in English to enlarge professional foreign language knowledge.

PhD students acquire methodological and research competencies during the whole programme through theoretical study (trainings and practice), research work and internship, PhD thesis preparation and defense. All the study courses include research components and promote PhD students to conduct independent research and comply with current research methodology standards and research ethics.

PhD students undergo an internship to foreign organisations of education and science within their PhD research projects twice during the entire study (for period lasting up to 30 days) to improve the scientific base for the dissertation research, to receive advice from foreign specialists and to work in the world's leading libraries. Internship programmes are intended to be implemented in the framework of agreements between the University and foreign partner universities. As the programmes have not started yet or are still very young there is no evidence about how internships are organized. During the internship the PhD student: visits libraries, gets acquainted with the electronic resources of the partner university and collects empirical and theoretical material on the research topic.

PhD students are encouraged to publish their research results during the study. KIMEP University provides PhD students with research advisors (supervisors) who are eligible to guide them. The supervisors encourage students to have a clear and specific focus on research and article publication. Besides, every PhD student has a foreign research consultant (advisor), helping to consider the main issue in an international context. Up to now these foreign supervisors are recruited mainly from the personal networks of the teaching staff.

During the study period, doctorate students have to publish the main research results in no less than one article in an internationally recognised well-reputed journal (JCR impact-factor, Scopus CiteScore etc., according to the Degree Award Rules) and up to three articles in national journals, recommended by the MES. Supervisors can play a useful role in helping students work to specific journal styles, and in guiding them through the submission process. For the PhD programme in International Law the faculty developed a path to lead students to publications, starting with presentation of their projects on internal conferences, to national conferences and finally to publications in journals.

### **Logic and Conceptual Consistency**

The programme fully matches the objectives set by Kazakhstan's National Qualifications Framework. The relationship between programme ILO's and individual modules is shown. As a rigid structure of the PhD programmes is given by the Ministry of Education and Science of Kazakhstan, room for individual content is given within the electives.

### **Science and Research Based Teaching**

The courses Research Methodology of the **PhD Programme in Economics**, the **PhD programme in Public Administration** and the **PhD programme in International Relations** are taught by experienced researchers to ensure that different aspects of economic research are included. The courses offered as electives are taught by faculty members who have contributed to each field or who have worked in areas with a considerable overlap with the field of the course.

Depending on student demand, electives may be offered as full courses or for independent study. In either case, students have to immerse themselves with current research questions and with advanced analytical techniques.

The academic writing and research methods component of the **PhD in International Law** consists of coursework in written projects, textual work, and research design, techniques, and methodology that will assist doctoral students in developing a research proposal and conduct academic research required at the doctoral level. The required courses are designed to provide in-depth disciplinary knowledge and understanding, critical for developing the dissertation proposal and conducting dissertation research. Hence, they are linked to the individual doctoral projects and aim at contributing to the successful substantive completion of the doctoral dissertation. The elective courses provide the breadth necessary to function as a legal academic conducting both discipline-based and interdisciplinary research in the context of a law school; in reaching their ILOs, these courses are designed to equip doctoral students with a knowledge and understanding of topical issues and trends in contemporary international law and practice.

Different components of the **PhD in International Law** programme require a different set of analytical, writing and research skills that are required for a doctoral degree. Academic publishing work will include preparing and publishing two research papers: (1) one international peer reviewed conference paper which will be considered as equivalent to 4 credits, and (2) an internationally recognized journal article published in a journal listed in either SSCI or SCImago index. Article publication in a SSCI or SCImago listed journal will be considered as equivalent to 9 points. Doctoral students are expected to complete these particular requirements before the defense of their final dissertation project.

### **Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development**

The programme structure complies with the requirements set out in the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education. The required courses in research methods and academic writing provide students with a comprehensive background on research methods and with the necessary writing skills. The electives aim at facing students with new developments in the discipline. The course offerings can be adjusted to take care of the particular research interests of individual students.

Throughout the three-year programme students enrol in the sections of the experimental research and dissertation module. The sections are intended to provide a platform for the student to present their work, receive feedback but also allow some flexibility in the timing of when to achieve milestones of their research programme. An individual course will typically involve a written report, a paper prepared for publication, and/or a presentation.

The programme contains a state mandated research internship course and a state mandated research practicum course.

To prepare for a teaching career, students have to take the state mandated pedagogic practicum. The student receives an introduction to pedagogy and training in course design and classroom management. As part of the module, the student is assigned to an internship supervisor, participates in class meetings and teaches classes under supervision.

## Technical Offers

The foundation courses of the **PhD programme in Economics** are a course in Research Methodology and a course in Academic Writing, both course offerings are in accordance with national requirements. The research methods course covers theoretical and philosophical foundations, econometric practice and economic theory.

The set of elective courses cover main areas of economics where the department can draw on some expertise and, hence, is in a position to offer supervision for a related PhD thesis. All courses cover theoretical foundations and empirical applications in fields that are topical and developing and, therefore, are designed to inform the research work of the student. The Special Topics in Economics course can be adjusted to the particular needs of a student.

The research methods course for the **PhD programme in Public Administration** directly prepares for setting up the student's research plan and writing the thesis. Students work on a research problem which they will subsequently develop into a research proposal. The mandated writing course aims at inculcating a wider range of writing skills.

The elective courses cover main areas where faculty members have expertise and the department has the capacity to guide a related research project. Three of the five electives – comparative governance and development of industrial countries, comparative public policy and economic perspectives on government - and involve the rigorous analysis of institutions and the related public policies. The course Selected Issues in Public Policy and Programme Implementation can be adjusted to specific demands of individual students.

A course in Research Methodology and a course in Academic Writing also form the foundation of the **PhD programme in International Relations**. The Research Methods in International Relations course covers theoretical and philosophical foundations, qualitative and quantitative methods, hypothesis testing, progression analysis, regression models, and the theoretical foundations of international relation. It prepares students for setting up their research plan, their research agenda and the research question and to develop their proposal.

The set elective courses cover main areas of international relations. All courses cover theoretical foundations, empirical applications in fields that are topical and developing and, therefore, are designed to inform the research work of the student. Combined, electives demonstrate a diverse approach to the field and allow adjustments to the specific research interests of individual students.

The courses Global Security, Geopolitics and International Economic Development are central to the study of international relations. Depending on student demand, electives may be offered as full courses or for independent study. In either case, students have to immerse themselves with current research questions and with advanced analytical techniques.

The curriculum of the **PhD in International Law programme** is designed in such a way that doctoral students receive sufficient training in research, writing and publishing skills. Students attend 10 ECTS points of research methodology modules and they are required to prepare journal and conference papers to be submitted to international reputable journals and conferences. Moreover, doctoral students

are expected to cover 123 ECTS credits, which include an apprenticeship in addition to producing a doctoral dissertation, for a period of two to six months in a partner university or research institution outside of Kazakhstan.<sup>3</sup> Doctoral students are encouraged to concentrate and focus on their area of research interests from the very beginning of their studies at the PhD in International Law programme. A faculty member teaching LAW6002 (“PhD Research Methods”) is requested to direct doctoral students to concentrate on their research proposal, or “exposé”. This research proposal may be presented later during the third consecutive semester of their doctoral studies.

As concerns technical offers proper, the doctoral students are offered the following additional opportunities to benefit from in the course of their doctoral programme studies: (1) mini-seminars on doctoral text citing styles (once per academic year), (2) guest lectures by invited local and foreign experts on how to write and present a PhD thesis (once or twice per academic year), (3) observing lectures delivered by the full-time faculty to non-doctoral students (on topics of relevance for the doctoral students’ research, depending on the course schedule), and (4) courses on research databases, catalogues and platforms useful for PhD students (once per academic year).

### **Multidisciplinary Qualifications**

In the **PhD programmes in Economics, Public Administration and International Relations**, students acquire multidisciplinary and transferable skills throughout the curriculum as critical thinking skills, presentation, research, and investigation skills are applicable outside of the more narrowly defined field of academic research. The course Academic Writing for PhD Students in Social Sciences emphasises common foundations among the social sciences.

Within the curriculum of the **PhD programme in International Relations**, students can choose electives in the areas of law or economics which provide multidisciplinary perspectives on the questions typically addressed within an international relations programme.

In addition to providing multidisciplinary core courses in its curriculum, the **PhD in International Law programme** encompasses activities and events that are aimed at contributing to the development of doctoral students’ skills that can be applied beyond the purely international law domain: periodic doctoral colloquiums (research presentation skills), consultations on post-PhD career development by invited experts and scholars, participation in law-related round tables and conferences in Kazakhstan. The multidisciplinary element of the programme is upheld and regularly reinforced by events and opportunities offered by the Law School throughout the course of the programme.

Doctoral students are expected to present and discuss their research work and findings, knowledge, and outcomes with their doctoral colleagues and an academic audience via various research and academic conferences.

---

<sup>3</sup> In accordance with the MES Decree #604, Annex 8, Chapter 2, para. 76.



## Appraisal:

The experts formed the view that the curriculum of the study programme reflects the programme objectives, as described in Chapter 1.1, in a way that allows students to develop their research skills based on the scientific state of the art in the respective field.

There is a balanced mixture of courses in terms of content. They are arranged in a logical sequence and aimed at qualification and competency development. The modules included in the programmes provide for an acquisition of an in-depth theoretical, methodological and multidisciplinary knowledge and also practical skills in accordance with the preferences of students.

The goals of a doctoral degree according to the National Qualifications Framework of Kazakhstan and the European Qualifications Framework are fulfilled.

The teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with the learning objectives, and it takes into account the associated relevant research. The course offer covers the relevant requirements to achieve the pursued research competency of the doctoral students.

The PhD programmes ensure that graduates have methodological competence, are empowered to conduct academic work and can understand and assimilate specialist literature. Methodological competences are acquired by students in a number of modules on research methods and approaches, during the scientific and research work, the research internship, the scientific internship abroad, as well as in the process of preparing PhD thesis under the guidance of scientific supervisors and foreign scientific consultants. The internships and the high amount of research activities are aimed at qualification and competency development.

Multidisciplinary contents are part of the programme. The development of multidisciplinary competences and skills is promoted through the respective courses, the teaching and the research internship. Additionally, students develop communication and rhetorical skills by taking part at conferences, round tables and scientific workshops. Students are enabled to present their work and to discuss the knowledge gained in the specialised fields with their colleagues.

As research methodology courses play a vital role in preparing students to write their dissertation and articles, the panel encourages to continue to put emphasis on adequate research methodology training. This might also be offered to a larger group of PhD students from different programmes together.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.2	Content					
3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		

### 3.3 Examination Procedures

At the **College of Social Sciences (PhD in Economics, PhD in Public Administration and PhD in International Relations)**, a variety of methods are used to assess student learning in the taught courses such as graded homework, papers, presentations and written exams. In individual courses, different examination methods may be used as judged appropriate by the instructor of the course and in accordance with KIMEP policies.

At the **Law School (PhD in International Law)**, course examination assessments will be conducted in the form of written assignments, case-studies, presentations and/or individual academic essays. Depending on the course, an assessment may also include writing case briefs, conducting foreign law research assignments, undertaking other homework assignments, and preparing literature reviews on a legal topic of the doctoral student's choosing. These assessments are aimed at testing doctoral students' research and analytical skills and abilities, writing skills appropriate for the doctoral text level, and oral presentation skills.

Rules and procedures for the defense and assessment of the thesis are in accordance with the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education and specified in the doctoral degree regulations 3.1.2 and in the PhD handbook. There is a thesis defense in front of a thesis defense committee which complies with State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education.

A doctoral student must maintain a cumulative 3.33 GPA throughout the PhD programme. Courses in which grades below "B-" are received are not accepted for the PhD degree. Grades received in courses transferred from another educational institution are not included in calculation of the GPA. If a grade of "C+" or lower is received, the doctoral student should retake the course. More than one retake should acquire an approval from the Doctoral Committee. When the GPA is calculated, the grade for the repeated course will substitute for the original grade. Grades of "I" (incomplete) turn to "F" if the work is not completed by the 7th week of the following semester. A doctoral student whose GPA

falls below 3.33 is placed on academic probation. A student on academic probation who fails to raise the cumulative GPA to 3.33 or higher the following semester will be suspended from the programme. The Doctoral Committee may allow the student, under special circumstances, one additional semester to improve his/her GPA.

The thesis defense is organised in accordance with the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education, as laid out in the PhD handbook, which stipulates the minimum qualification requirements for the members of the thesis defense committee.

For each course, the instructor is responsible for defining expectations in accordance with the course syllabus and to choose an appropriate form of examination. KIMEP policies permit students with a disability to register with the Student Affairs Office. For a student who has registered, compensatory measures will be offered.

**Course examination procedure:** The doctoral students will be timely and properly notified by their course instructor about their exam format, assessment method, timing, place, and applicable exam rules and instructions. It is the duty of the instructor to reserve a corresponding room for an uninterrupted conduct of the examination as well as to make sure that the exam proctoring is properly and carefully organised. The doctoral students will be notified timely of their respective grades in accordance with applicable University rules for course assessment, with grade appeal procedure to be followed if necessary.

The thesis defense is organised in accordance with the State Mandatory Standards of Higher and Post-Graduate Education, as laid out in the PhD handbook, which stipulates the minimum qualification requirements for the members of the thesis defense committee.

## Appraisal:

The experts formed the view that the curriculum of the study programme reflects the programme objectives, as described in Chapter 1.1, in a way that allows students to develop their research skills-based on the scientific state of the art in the respective field.

There is a balanced mixture of courses in terms of content. They are arranged in a logical sequence and aimed at qualification and competency development. The modules included in the programmes provide for an acquisition of an in-depth theoretical, methodological and multidisciplinary knowledge and also practical skills in accordance with the preferences of students.

The organisation of the examination procedures is properly organised and defined.

The goals of a doctoral degree according to the National Qualifications Framework of Kazakhstan and the European Qualifications Framework are fulfilled.

The teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with the learning objectives, and it takes into account the associated relevant research. The course offer covers the relevant requirements to achieve the pursued research competency of the doctoral students.

The PhD programmes ensure that graduates have methodological competence, are empowered to conduct academic work and can understand and assimilate specialist literature. Methodological competences are acquired by students in a number of modules on research methods and approaches, during the scientific and research work, the research internship, the scientific internship abroad, as well as in the process of preparing PhD thesis under the guidance of scientific supervisors and foreign scientific consultants. The internships and the high amount of research activities are aimed at qualification and competency development.

Multidisciplinary contents are part of the programme. The development of multidisciplinary competences and skills is promoted through the respective courses, the teaching and the research internship.

As research methodology courses play a vital role in preparing students to write their dissertation and articles, the panel encourages to continue to put emphasis on adequate research methodology training. This might also be offered to a larger group of PhD students from different programmes together.

Data about student completion, drop-out rates and expelled students do not exist due to the very young nature of the programmes.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examinations			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		

### 3.4 Didactic Concept

The programme's didactic concept is shaped following the commitment to academic freedom, academic integrity, active involvement of learners in the academic process, increasing responsibility, and the role of educators. The didactic function is expressed in providing students with knowledge, skills and abilities they need in their research activity and future academic career. All the courses of the programme are closely related to each other and arranged in a way that the students receive basic methodology knowledge and research skills at first, and then specialised (professional) research competencies. The task of the professor is to acquaint students with new scientific knowledge to help them realise their potential in independent work.

Every course incorporated into the programme contributes to the development of this knowledge and skills through its subject-specific didactic concept. Completing the academic training should equip the PhD students with a background sufficient to conduct supervised research. Obligatory content which must be published before the beginning of the course includes the detailed syllabus of courses including information like those about required and recommended readings, details of assignments and examinations, ethical and academic integrity rules.

The PhD programme prepares students for an academic career by emphasising research and teaching skills. In Kazakhstan, graduates from doctoral programmes work not only as teachers and researchers at universities but also in administrative roles in the higher education sector, in government and business, and in research institutes. The qualification goals of the programme includes transferable skills which are sought in sectors outside of academia. The range of electives enables students to gain an overview of modern developments in the respective subject fields and the pedagogic internship prepares them for work as teachers.

Doctoral students undertake coursework, research internships, and writing a dissertation in order to graduate from the programme. By completing these programme components, doctoral students gain professional competencies to work in both academia and in legal practice. KIMEP University helps doctoral students make significant career choices, find a proper job or get a deserved promotion. Doctoral modules are structured for the purposes of further career boost of its doctoral students, and with a view to reaching for higher ground and being ready for more professional responsibility.

The PhD programmes are designed to broaden the horizons of doctoral students by offering fundamental knowledge that can be applied to all kinds of situations while also supporting personal and leadership development. Recognizing the diversity of doctoral students' goals, the University also invests in a range of career development activities, one-on-one coaching by the faculty members and KIMEP Career Centre administrators on career issues, assistance with job search activities, and access to on-campus recruiting to online resources.

After completion of a training section in first two semesters, including teaching and research practice, PhD students focus on research work, which is well-structured and supervised by KIMEP research advisor and foreign research consultant. The research component of the programme, besides permanent work with research advisors, includes preparation and publishing of the research articles and reviews, presentations of the research results at the conferences and round tables, research networking, research workshops of KIMEP faculty and, as a result, preparation of a PhD Thesis. As the programmes have not started yet or are still very young there is no evidence yet.

Also, the programme provides an opportunity of a foreign internship, where PhD students are able to visit companies, institutions or universities of the other countries to conduct an internship or research for Doctoral thesis.

Besides the research development, foreign internships promote multicultural interaction. Knowledge of the interrelation and interdependence of one's own language, culture, and learning in the construction of concepts, values and beliefs contributes to ways of perceiving one's world variably and diversely across languages and cultures on the basis of constantly re-enacting one's intra-cultural system of seeing, interpreting, and understanding the world interculturally.

Due to the small number of PhD students that started the programme they have very good opportunities to work closely with their supervisors. They reported to bring able to contact them any time by phone and seek advice. Students also are able to keep close communication with each other in and out of their academic classes.

State Regulations requires double supervision: national research advisor (supervisor) and foreign research consultant (advisor). In the first year of PhD programme students have to discuss and define PhD thesis topic, local supervisor and foreign advisor. University Academic and Research Council approves local supervisor and foreign advisor from University's partners. Supervisor/advisor has to be scholar in field of PhD student's research and have publications in certain field. According to the state regulation, research supervisor has to have at least one publication in internationally recognised well-reputed journal (JCR impact-factor, indexed by Web of Science Core Collection etc.) and five publications in journals recommended by the MES (for details, please, refer to SCS of Postgraduate Education).

## Appraisal:

The didactical concept of the PhD programmes is fully aligned with the programmes' objectives. This concept takes into account a diversity of teaching methods.

When conducting scientific work independently or under the guidance of their supervisors and consultants, doctoral students develop skills of analysing, evaluating and synthesising theoretical concepts and practical material and forming professional judgement.

Being allocated to a supervisor ensures a continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students. Students repeatedly reported the high commitment and strong motivation from supervisors. This, however, is due to the very small numbers of students in the programmes that already started. The panel encourages the University to institutionalize the support as cohorts gets larger and all programmes started.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

### 3.5 Professional Competencies/Employability

The doctoral programme is intended to convey doctoral students with professional qualification in the academic and research-oriented fields of activity. In doing so, the professional qualification is aimed both at a research-oriented activity (including teaching) and a practical vocational activity. But the targeted job market is academia and research institutions in Kazakhstan and abroad.

Programme modules are employability-oriented: the intended learning outcomes are relevant for developing employment skills as was expected when the programme was developed. The programme administration aligns the learning outcomes with regard to the student needs and implementing the steps to improve the participants' employability and certain qualifications. Especially, the PhD programmes aim to close the gap between academic and research competencies and improve skills and competencies for applied research.

#### Appraisal:

The doctoral programme is intended to convey the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research-oriented fields of activity. In doing so, the professional qualification is aimed both at a research oriented activity (including teaching) as well as a practical vocational activity.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.5	Professional Competencies / Employability			X		

## 4. Scientific Environment and Framework conditions

### 4.1 Teaching Staff

KIMEP University faculty staff consists of academically and professionally qualified members. The current **teaching staff numbers with PhDs** obtained in the respective relevant field are:

**Department of Economics: 6 to 7**

**Department of Public Administration: 4 to 5**

**Department of International Relations and Regional Studies: 8**

**Department of Law: 7 to 10**

Teaching staff is full-time or part-time employed. Additionally, there are retired or adjunct faculty members who can take over supervision tasks.

The cumulative qualification requirements for PhD supervision in Kazakhstan are regulated by paragraph 82 of Annex 8 (as amended on 5 May 2020) to Order No. 604 "On approval of state compulsory education standards at all levels of education" issued by the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on 31 October 2018. It requires that a PhD supervisor must (1) have a domestic or foreign doctoral degree, (2) have at least three years of scholarly and pedagogical experience, and (3) have published at least 6 articles in high-impact local and foreign academic journals within the last five years.

All faculty members at the College of Social Sciences (**PhD in Economics, PhD in Public Administration and PhD in International Relations**) hold PhD degrees from Western universities. All have publications in major international journals. Their fields of specialisation cover the major part of economics. If a department feels that it cannot cover an area which is of interest to one of its PhD students, it may appoint an outside instructor.

In the **PhD programme in Economics**, teaching and supervision staff covers the specific national requirements for thesis supervision in the fields of econometrics, labour economics and in fiscal policy, political economy, public economics and fiscal and monetary economics.

In the **PhD programme in Public Administration** the different areas of public administration are covered by the teaching staff and meet the national qualification requirements for supervision.

In the **PhD programme in International Relations** teaching staff covers the areas of history of international relations, nation-building, foreign policy, global and regional security, trans-border, hydro issues, international politics, Chinese politics and foreign policy.

All full-time faculty members teaching at the **PhD programme in International Law** hold doctoral degrees in law and related disciplines awarded by universities in Italy, Germany, Spain, and the United States; one more full-time faculty member is currently on leave and reading for a PhD in law at the



University of Hong Kong. Both Associate Professors fully meet requirements as to the quantity and quality of academic publications under the law of Kazakhstan, and Assistant Professors have published academic articles in local and international journals, and are working on bringing their publication portfolios in line with the requirements of Kazakhstan's law.

The full-time faculty are cooperating in a number of ongoing scholarly projects. For example, three full-time faculty members are co-editors of a two-volume textbook on International Conflict and Security Law, and two more faculty members contribute to the textbook (forthcoming in 2022). Four full-time faculty are members of the Editorial Board of the Central Asian Yearbook of International Law and International Relations (initiated by the School of Law, implemented in cooperation with the Kazakh-German University with financial support from the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD), volume 1 forthcoming in 2022).

KIMEP has been working towards getting Scopus indexation or direct ministerial recognition for its *Central Asia Business Journal*. If successful, and notwithstanding the competitive nature of the publication process, this would add another platform from which PhD students can benefit.

With the exception of three faculty members with relatively fresh PhDs in the department of International Relations, all faculty members are experienced teachers with more than 10 years of experience in teaching and research supervision. They regularly participate in professional development courses to make sure that their preparedness in pedagogy is up to modern standards. Seminars and workshops offered in the past few years concerned student-centred teaching and active learning; development and assessment of intended learning outcomes; student engagement; online teaching with Moodle, Zoom, and various educational applications; and other topics. The University has invested significant resources to prepare the faculty to teach online during the ongoing pandemic. A mandatory 10-day course on online teaching, with the participation of an expert from the U.S., was organised in the summer of 2020; upon completion of the course, all faculty members were examined by staff from the College of Humanities and Education, and received a certification. During the fall semester 2020, several faculty members, including one from the School of Law, delivered presentations on pedagogic concepts and teaching skills.

KIMEP teaching staff received yearly educational training, the latest pedagogical seminar offered by KIMEP University to the faculty is "Blended and Blended Online Learning", also delivered by a foreign expert. The faculty members of the School of Law periodically observe lectures delivered by colleagues and provide feedback, which facilitates the exchange of skills and techniques and improves the pedagogical abilities of the faculty. Besides attending professional development opportunities at KIMEP University, faculty members regularly participate in international academic mobility programmes, in order to continually increase their teaching qualifications.

### **Internationality of the Teaching Staff**

KIMEP teaching faculty proves to be very international. Almost all of them hold terminal degrees from foreign universities. During the online conference the panel was impressed by their very good English language skills. Furthermore, there is a diversity of nationalities to be found.

- At the **Department of Economics** members come from: Kazakhstan (2), USA (2), Kyrgyzstan, Germany,
- At the **Department of Public Administration faculty** members come from USA (2), Canada (2)
- At the **Department of International Relations and Regional Studies** faculty members come from Kazakhstan (4), USA (2), Finland, France/South Korea
- **At the School of Law** faculty members hold passports from Uzbekistan (2), USA, Spain, Italy, Kazakhstan.

### **Internal Cooperation within the Faculty**

Faculty members participate in meetings of the departmental Quality Assurance Committee which also reviews teaching at the PhD level. Because of the small size of the departments, typically, all department members participate. Faculty members also participate in presentations of the students within the Experimental Research and Dissertation courses where they can develop ideas and guide the thesis project. Faculty members also scientifically collaborate with one another, often across the boundaries of individual departments. Students may join such collaborative efforts.

Internal collaboration and overall administration are systematically ensured by the Dean. At the beginning of each academic year, the Dean forms committees for internal cooperation and smooth functioning of the programmes. The Dean holds weekly faculty meetings to coordinate all routine operational and strategic decisions. The Research Director periodically organises research seminars to promote awareness of ongoing research and research cooperation among the faculty members. For the doctoral programme, a Doctoral Programme Council will be established, to deal with academic and management issues specific to the programme (see also 4.3.1 and 5.4 below).

As the panel learned during the online conference, KIMEP currently works on a financial agreement on rewards for theses supervision. Until now supervisors are awarded a small monetary compensation, there is no reduction of teaching load in place.

### **Appraisal:**

The structure and number of teaching staff corresponds with the requirements of the doctoral programmes. The necessary professional breadth and depth in scientific education and the research supervision of the doctoral students is ensured. The contractual situation of the teaching staff guarantees a continuous execution of the doctoral programme. A considerable high number of teachers have relevant experience in international research and teaching abroad.

Qualifications and competencies of staff are rated well to meet the requirements for good teaching. Based on information in the self-evaluation report of the KIMEP and the CVs of the lecturers involved in the programme, the panel came to the conclusion that the research activities of the academic staff correspond with the requirements for PhD programme and support the scientific education of the doctoral students.

The School verifies the academic as well as pedagogical and didactical qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure and in line with the University's regulations. Specific measures for further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. For example, during the online conference the faculty staff confirmed that e.g. in 2020, several training seminars and webinars were held for faculty members on methodological aspects of online teaching.

Internal collaboration and coordination are ensured by the regular meetings of the teaching staff.

The panel encourages the University to establish an adequate compensation scheme for the supervision of PhD students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>4.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		

## 4.2 Cooperation and Partnership

Paragraph 82 of Annex 8 (as amended on 5 May 2020) to the Order No. 604 "On approval of state compulsory education standards at all levels of education" provides that a doctoral student must have, in addition to a local PhD supervisor, at least one foreign supervisor who, it is expected, will be involving the doctoral student in his or her scholarly projects. A research stay abroad will also be recommended.

There are a number of ways in which doctoral students can participate in international cooperation. KIMEP University is an associate member of the New Market project of the Marie Curie Research International Staff Exchange (RISE) within the Horizon 2020 programme. Doctoral students can go to European Universities and think tanks as a secondment during the duration of the project and receive financial support (2,100 Euro per 30 days of stay). Their partners in the Horizon 2020 New Markets Programme are:

- Dublin City University, Ireland (Coordinator)
- University of Helsinki, Finland

- Tallinn University of Technology, Estonia
- University of Latvia, Latvia
- INALCO - National Institute for Oriental Languages and Civilizations, France

There are also opportunities for doctoral students to visit universities and research centers in the region, for example the Kyrgyz Economic University in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan.

In addition, within the field of **International Law** it is additionally planned that doctoral students will be involved in their supervisors' ongoing scholarly projects and in the production of the Central Asian Yearbook of International Law and International Relations. The students will be encouraged to join international law associations (especially, the Asian Association of International Law), and to participate in academic conferences in the areas of their expertise, such as conferences organised by the Asian Law Institute (ASLI) at the National University of Singapore. The School has active partnerships with a number of foreign universities and regularly seeks additional partnerships for exchanges of both faculty and students. It has been a member of the Asian Law Institute (ASLI) at the National University of Singapore since 2018. The School is pursuing the development of double or joint degree programmes with other universities, including 2+2 and 3+1 undergraduate degrees with the East China University of Political Science and Law (ECUPL) in Shanghai. A partnership with the Jindal Global Law School (India) is contemplated.

Students regularly make presentations on their progress to the entire department. Department members discuss the merits and give directions where they feel that this is necessary. There are irregularly scheduled research talks in the different departments. In the past, different departments hosted researchers on Erasmus grants or Fulbright Scholarships, although this activity has paused during the COVID-19 pandemic. To some extent, online talks have taken over this role, for example, KIMEP still hosts presentations of the launch of the IMF Regional Economic Outlook. The China and Central Asia Studies Center regularly organised online talks during the pandemic.

KIMEP University organises the KIMEP International Conference, where PhD students are encouraged to participate to present their latest results and research projects in progress. Faculty members cooperate in research projects and have joint publications, in some cases across departmental boundaries. Students are expected to benefit from this kind of cooperation, for example in the form of co-authorships. Individually, faculty members of the **College of Social Sciences** are parts of personal scholarly networks, and PhD students can draw on these networks for advice or co-supervision arrangements.

All full-time faculty members at the **School of Law** are members of professional or learned societies in their areas of expertise, including the American, European, and Asian Associations of International Law, the International Centre for Animal Law and Policy (ICALP) of the Autonomous University of Barcelona (Spain), and a number of national bar associations or chambers. They are members of Editorial Boards of, or hold other editorial responsibilities at, the Asian Journal of International Law, Journal of International Criminal Justice, Review of Central and East European Law, International Review of the Red Cross, the Journal de Derecho Animal (Forum of Animal Law Studies), Law and State, and other law journals abroad and in Kazakhstan. The School of Law plans to organise interdisciplinary PhD workshops for its doctoral students where they will regularly present the outcomes of their ongoing

research. Such workshops may be organised in cooperation with other Colleges at KIMEP University and involve experts from other higher education institutions. The workshops will be devoted to substantive legal topics as well as to the methodology of legal research.

PhD workshops and academic mobility opportunities will serve as useful starting points in doctoral students’ networking. PhD students will be encouraged to attend academic conferences to develop professional networks with researchers from other countries and write joint journal articles.

## Appraisal:

Cooperation with academic institutions and networks is actively pursued, which can result, among others, in finding suitable foreign scientific consultants for all PhD students, organising joint projects, events and student exchanges, inviting visiting lecturers.

Doctoral students are encouraged to participate in relevant conferences and further scientific events. The scientific networking of KIMEP may result as a recognisable benefit for future doctoral students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		

## 4.3 Programme Management

Each department is led by the elected Department Chair, who bears administrative responsibility for running the PhD programme. Decisions on curriculum development, admission, and recommendations for scholarship are made collectively by the department. The department Quality Assurance Committee reviews teaching success also at the PhD courses. Individual instructors are responsible for assigning course grades. The thesis defense committee needs to collectively support for the candidate to pass. The School closely follows Kazakhstan’s legislation on education, the KIMEP Catalogue, and applicable policies approved by the KIMEP Academic Council.

For each of the doctoral programmes, a Doctoral Programme Council will be established, to deal with academic and programme management issues. The Council will include the Dean, the Associate Dean, the Research Director, as well as the supervisors of all doctoral students. The Council will draft the School’s doctoral regulations, to be approved by the KIMEP Academic Council, and monitor their enforcement

Each PhD programme at CSS is managed by the department chair. A staff member works as CSS programme coordinator and advises students on their study programme. The CSS college manager is responsible for material support. Further support is provided by the CSS internship coordinator in arranging internships and study stays within Kazakhstan and abroad. The PhD programmes are included in the remit of the quality assurance processes at department level.

The School of Law has two coordinators who maintain the documentation of all law programmes. The number of administrative staff is adequate to the demands of the programme. The coordinators liaise with other academic and administrative units at the University, maintain contacts with the MES and other external stakeholders, and advise prospective students. One coordinator is specifically in charge of keeping the doctoral programme's curriculum up-to-date in KIMEP's documentation. Doctoral students will be invited to evaluate the quality of the management and administration after the completion of every course/module. Students will be duly informed about the programme organisation, schedule, module requirements and expectations, and other necessary details.

All details of the doctoral programme's regulations, content and curriculum will be centralised in both printed and electronic versions in the KIMEP catalogue, which is published by the Academic Affairs office. The admission and examination regulations will be available at the Admissions Office. The Quality Assurance and Institutional Research (QAIR) Office will regularly report to the MES and other national and international education authorities. The CSS and School of Law coordinators will maintain the routine documentation of all programme-related issues, and direct prospective and current students to the respective offices.

## Appraisal:

The organisation of the study process is based on the University-internal regulations and ensures the smooth operation of the study programmes. The structural organisation, the decision-making processes, competencies and responsibilities are established and implemented accordingly. Those involved are included in the decision-making process.

Faculty members and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of the study programme. During the online conference the panel talked to several persons from administration providing students' academic and non-academic support and formed the view that sufficient administrative staff is available. Decision-making processes, authority, and responsibilities are clearly defined.

The requirements in terms of content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations are recognised through suitable documentation and publication. The interested parties also have access to the documentation in electronic form and it provides transparency.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>4.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.3	Programm Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

## 4.4 Material Resources

KIMEP University provides adequate space for students to study and learn (see Table 4). The total area available in KIMEP University is 6,370 square metres. The total number of classroom seats available is 3,003. Air-conditioning systems (centralised) are installed in all classrooms.

### Teaching Facilities

Building Location	Area sq. m.	Seating Capacity	Screens	IB	LCD	Computer	TV Set	Video
Valykhanov	3596,7	1771	37	15	37	176	4	3
EEC	169,7	56	3	0	3	3	2	2
Dostyk	155,2	67	2	0	2	13	1	0
Library	148,3	35	2	0	2	35	0	5
New Acad.	2300,1	1074	24	11	24	110	2	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>6370</b>	<b>3003</b>	<b>68</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>68</b>	<b>337</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>12</b>

Notation:

IB: Interactive board

LCD: LCD Display

The computer and related hardware and facilities at KIMEP University include 1,209 computers at KIMEP University, all of which are connected to LAN, and all 1,209 of which are connected to the Internet and 13 computer laboratories.

Classrooms are equipped with LCD-projectors, LCD-panels, interactive boards and computers, which allow multimedia presentations and access to file servers, electronic materials, and the Internet during lectures. A number of conference halls, such as the Great Hall and the High-Tech Conference Hall, are equipped with all necessary hardware to run multimedia presentations for groups of varying size. There are also eleven study rooms available with wireless Internet access.

The academic buildings include, inter alia, lecture halls, seminar rooms and laboratory rooms. The computer rooms also provide access for the students to the library's network. Each faculty member has his/her own office equipped with a PC, printer and other equipment. All buildings that are used by the School of Law are equipped with elevators and provide barrier-free access.

The KIMEP Library is one of the largest university libraries in Central Asia, with approximately 100,000 volumes and with electronic access to over 1 million journal and newspaper articles. In the academic year 2005-2006, KIMEP University renovated a campus building to expand its library services. The updated library facility serves up to 400 students simultaneously. There are public reading areas for the library's circulating collection and sections for reference, periodicals and reserve materials. There is a sufficient number of copies of mandatory literature (described in the module description) for every student.

The Olivier Giscard d'Estaing Library (OGEL) serves the academic information needs of the KIMEP University community. OGEL built a stable research collection and provides access to electronic resources that support the University's academic requirements, as well as exchanging information resources with other organisations, locally and internationally. Available electronic resources include Paragraph, JSTOR, ProQuest Business, SAGE, Econlit, Westlaw, Ebrary, and others.

Currently, the Library is open six entire days a week. The library is committed to help all students use, research and evaluate existing information resources. Wireless Internet access is provided for students throughout the Library building.

There is a yearly budget reserved for the library that splits funds according to print and electronic resources.

## Appraisal:

Since an online conference was conducted, the panel did not have the opportunity to visit the University's building. Based on the materials provided, the panel formed the view that a smooth running of the University is ensured with regard to the capacities for research, studies, teaching and administration as well as the available rooms and facilities.

The library is accessible all day. Access to relevant literature and digital media is available. Qualified library staff is there to advise students and supports students doing research.



Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		

## 4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

The main University's sources of funding is income from educational activities. Expenditure planning is carried out in accordance with the internal cost classification and legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The central budget is formed by combining the expenditure parts of the local budgets of the units, which is then integrated into a single form by the Department of Financial Development and Control.

The Financial Development and Control Department monitors the effectiveness of the University's financial resources. An annual financial report on actual performance is prepared. The current finance plan is transparent, and relates to institutional level decisions. All programmes are part of KIMEP central accounting. The financial sustainability of all programmes is guaranteed as it is included in the KIMEP Strategic Plan for 2022-25, as well as for the entire accreditation period. Financial stability is ensured by KIMEP for the current academic year as well as for the entire period of the accreditation.

There is a verbal reassurance done by the faculties that the PhD programmes are not expected to be profitable in the near future due to the low admission numbers. However, there is a financial reserve to make sure that students can finish the programmes.

The scholarship plan for fall 2022 has been approved, assigning up to two scholarship places to each programme. KIMEP University offers two full-tuition scholarships to highly deserving applicants of PhD programmes. Details of the scholarship and financial support for PhD programmes are available in the Financial Aid and the Doctoral Programme Office of the University. Applicants will be able to apply to KIMEP University for financial support.

### Appraisal:

Based on the information provided to the panel, the panel formed the view that the study programme is funded for the entire accreditation period so that students will definitely be able to complete their studies.

Scholarship programmes and financial support are available. The panel encourages KIMEP University to raise the number of scholarships with the growing number of students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		

## 5. Quality Assurance

The academic structure of KIMEP University was created to ensure appropriate academic oversight of all Colleges and academic-related departments, programmes and curriculum, faculty, budget, assessment strategies, programme reviews, and quality assurance.

Each KIMEP College or Academic Division is responsible to create their own continuous quality improvement process. This process includes annual and cyclical programme reviews, which incorporate reviews of programmes, programme faculty, budget, curriculum, assessment reports, and programme effectiveness.

There are two types of programme reviews. **Annual programme reviews** generally are limited in scope to particular programme learning outcomes, although they contain information regarding partial programme and curriculum overview, an overview of faculty, a financial overview, student learning overview, programme effectiveness, and an executive summary. **Full programme reviews** take place every 3-5 years and incorporate much of the same information as the annual programme reviews but also include an overview of all programme learning outcomes.

Information from both annual and cyclical reports is used to make revisions to the curriculum and programme effectiveness, as well as to determine market needs, student interest, value added, and financial impact. Both types of programme review are completed in the fall semester following the academic year in which data was collected and analysed. After completion, programme reviews are sent to the Vice President of Academic Affairs, Curriculum Review Committee, the Department of Quality Assurance and Institutional Research, and the Admission and Scholarship Standing Subcommittee for review and feedback. In instances of major issues or revisions, programme reviews are presented to the Academic Council and the President's Cabinet.

The quality assurance process is two-pronged:

**Students** evaluate teaching, course content, and technical support as part of the Student Perception of Teaching exercise, which is based on a questionnaire that is anonymously taken by all course participants after completion.

**Faculty members** also fill out the Course Management form, which allows for reflections on teaching success, materials used and preparation of the students. Both types of assessments together with course grade distributions are reviewed by the Department Chair and by the departmental Quality Assurance Committee.

KIMEP has established a framework for effective quality assurance that is compatible with mechanisms for institutional, departmental, and programme quality assurance. This framework is embedded in each College and in every Department, whether academic or non-academic.

**Academic Quality Assurance:** The academic structure of KIMEP University ensures the appropriate oversight of all colleges and academic affairs departments, programmes and curriculum, faculty, budget, and assessment strategies. Each college or academic division is responsible for creating their own continuous quality improvement process to include annual and cyclical programme reviews of each aspect.

### **The Office of Quality Assurance and Institutional Research (QAIR)**

The Office of QAIR is responsible for collaboration between different units at KIMEP University — executive, management, departmental, and programmes— in order to implement quality assurance systems which promote integrity and effectiveness across the University. The primary roles of the office are as follows:

- Develop and implement quality assurance systems and procedures across the full range of KIMEP’s activities.
- Monitor the implementation of quality assurance procedures and processes institution-wide.
- Undertake reviews and audits as necessary to safeguard the integrity and quality of the institution’s activities.
- Provide the information and analysis necessary to support decision-making at the institutional level and within colleges / divisions.
- Advise the institution on quality implications of proposals, policies, and strategic plans.

The **Quality Assurance and Institutional Research** department conducts student assessment every semester, as well as annual alumni surveys regarding employment and overall satisfaction with the quality of KIMEP’s education. The **Quality Assurance and Institutional Research** department also acts as a liaison between state bodies, higher education institutions, and both national and international agencies to share best practices and develop strategies for the benefit of the community as a whole. Additionally, they carry out various studies upon request that investigate particular quality aspects in individual programmes or separate areas of the University’s performance.

### **Academic Council**

The purpose of the Academic Council of KIMEP University is to manage general academic affairs, oversee academic quality assurance and curriculum review, and develop recommendations for further ap-

proval by the President's Cabinet and the Board of Trustees. College deans, the Director of the Admission and Financial Aid Office, and the Deputy to the President for Student Recruitment & Admission have representation on this committee, directly or by proxy, and provide administrative support for the committee.

This committee reviews the curricula to ensure alignment with the National Qualifications Framework to ensure that each programme submits viable programme reviews and also oversees continuous academic quality assurance. The function of the committee is to evaluate, analyse, and determine the appropriateness of any new programmes or courses, or of changes in existing programmes, criteria to be established for quality assurance controls over all matters of academic import, and to make recommendations concerning admission and scholarship, including additional criteria and student enrolment rules not covered by state standards for each major. The chairperson of the committee has the discretion to determine when a proposed change is sufficiently minor that it does not require full review by the committee.

The results of the quality assurance process at the departmental level are reflected in the programme review report of the College. Faculty performance, including teaching success and research output, are assessed in the annual faculty evaluation process.

Nevertheless, it is the intention of KIMEP to adhere to the same procedures outlined above in and as more fully set out below to ensure a high level of quality, including evaluation by doctoral students, evaluation by supervisors, and evaluation by third parties. It should also be noted that the following outline of procedures applies to current undergraduate, graduate, and, where appropriate, doctoral programmes at KIMEP.

### **Evaluation by Doctoral Students**

Doctoral students evaluate courses as part of the perception of teaching exercise, carried out by the Department for Quality Assurance and Institutional Research at the end of each term. One of the most valued instruments for teaching performance evaluation is student evaluations. In annual faculty evaluations, student interaction (both teaching and mentoring) is given a 40 percent weight.

The Student Perceptions of Instruction Survey (SPIS, previously titled Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey) is an important part of the general formal faculty evaluation process and is mandatory for each module taught in the Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral programmes, as it allows retrieving valuable student opinions on their perceptions of the instructional effectiveness, quality of teaching, and learning experience. The Survey is conducted employing a standard internet-based approach that assures greater audience scope and higher rate of responses. Links to questionnaires are distributed via email, regular reminders are sent, and respondents are encouraged, but not obliged, to answer all questions. Questionnaires are processed and analysed by the Office of Quality Assurance and Institutional Research.

The questionnaire covers the quality of teaching in the three important fields of faculty, class sessions and courses. Respondents are also provided with the possibility to add any information regarding the faculty member and course quality by including two open-ended questions.

Starting spring 2020, the Student Perception of Instruction Survey questionnaire has been updated to reflect the transition to online mode of course delivery and now has two major components: 1) Faculty Member and 2) Institutional Support for the Online Environment. The first component aims to collect students' opinion on the quality of instructional delivery, course materials provided by instructor and instructor's feedback on assignments. The second component contains questions on assessing student satisfaction with distance learning and associated support provided by the University.

Students' access to the questionnaires is arranged via the online portal, which allows them to fill in the forms at a time of their convenience and from any place connected to the Internet. To ensure objectivity, students fill in the SPIS forms after the completion of final examinations but prior to issuance of final grades, and the survey is anonymous. Feedback to faculty members is provided on the basis of each module and in aggregated format on a semester level.

### **Evaluation by Supervisors**

The PhD programme is subject to the same Quality Assurance procedure as other programmes: the departmental Quality Assurance Committee reviews student teaching evaluations and course management forms and recommends measures.

While the number of doctoral supervisors will likely represent only a fraction of the total number of full-time faculty at KIMEP, it is the intention of the University to employ the same type of survey for doctoral supervisors. The Faculty Satisfaction Surveys measure the level of faculty satisfaction pertaining to working conditions, professional development and leadership at KIMEP University to further develop the University's status as an outstanding employer and academic institution. The survey has been conducted every spring semester since the 2005-06 academic year on an anonymous and voluntary basis. All faculty members are invited to take part in the survey. Survey results are presented to top management and the faculty community in the form of a report that highlights both strong and weak aspects of KIMEP's working conditions and compares overall satisfaction with data from previous periods. The collected responses are crucial components of efforts to create a better working and learning environment.

### **Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)**

KIMEP organizes regular **alumni survey** of graduated students and employer surveys. The Advisory Board of each department comprises academic peers and stakeholders. KIMEP collects evaluations by third parties mainly through two instruments provided by the Office of QAIR: the KIMEP Alumni Survey (KAS) and the Employer Satisfaction Survey (ESS).

**The KIMEP Alumni Survey (KAS)** aims to assure the quality of professional preparation of graduates by collecting their feedback about working experience, job performance and level of satisfaction with the quality of KIMEP education, which would allow identifying areas for improvement. It has been conducted each summer since 2005 by means of email and phone interviews with graduates of previous year. Survey results are reported to management and shared with KIMEP faculty and students. Key

messages are taken as the basis for further enhancement of KIMEP's programmes, services, and overall environment.

Alumni Surveys are conducted by Institutional Research including KIMEP alumni who graduated five and ten years ago. Following FIBAA advice, since 2019, the Office has started conducting an extensive Alumni Survey aiming to simultaneously collect opinions of three cohorts of alumni – those graduated one, five, and ten years prior to survey conducting.

**Employer Satisfaction Survey (ESS)** seeks to obtain the candid opinions of employers on the perceived levels of KIMEP graduates' professional preparedness in terms of knowledge, skills, and attitudes. The survey has been conducted every fourth year since 2007 through different channels: e-mail, fax, post and visits. The most recent evaluation was conducted in the fall of 2021. The latest ESS revealed that 98% of employers are satisfied with the skills and qualities of KIMEP graduates. Moreover, the proportion of employers who expressed a desire to continue to hire graduates of KIMEP in the future increased from 82% in 2013 to 97% in 2021.

However, these instruments have not been applied in the PhD programmes yet due to their recent development.

## Appraisal:

There is a quality assurance procedure in place which is systematically used for continuous monitoring and further development of quality in terms of content, processes and results. The responsibilities are clearly defined. The quality assurance is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the higher education institution.

There is a planned regular evaluation concerning the implementation of the programme carried out by the doctoral students as well as supervisors according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development.

Finally, there is also an involvement of third parties; the results find their way into the process of quality development as well.

Due to the very young nature of the PhD programmes these instruments have not been transferred yet. The panel encourages the KIMEP University to apply these established quality assurance instruments to the respective programmes as soon as they have run up.

Quality Ratings

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			X		
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Super-ordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders)			X		

# Quality Profile



Institution: KIMEP University

PhD in Economics, PhD in Public Administration, PhD in International Relation, PhD in International Law

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceed squality requirements	Meets qualiyy requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>1.</b>	<b>STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES</b>					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market			X		
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates			X		
1.3.1	In the research fields			X		
1.3.2	Outside the research fields			X		
1.4	The positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		
<b>2.</b>	<b>ADMISSION</b>					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		
<b>3.</b>	<b>IMPLEMENTATION</b>					
3.1	<b>Structure</b>			X		
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulation			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		
3.2	<b>Contents</b>			X		



3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		
3.3	Examination Procedures			X		
3.3.1	Examination			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		
3.4	Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		
3.5	Professional Competencies/Employability			X		
<b>4.</b>	<b>SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership			X		
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		
4.3	Programme Management			X		

4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.4	Material Resources			X		
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing			X		
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			X		
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders)			X		