# Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes



100<sup>th</sup> Meeting on 29/30 September 2016

Project Number: 15/041

**Higher Education Institution:** KAZGUU University

Astana (Kazakhstan)

Study Programme: Master in International Law

(Master (LL.M.) in International Law (60 ECTS) Master of Science in International Law (120 ECTS))

The FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes has taken the following decisions:

According to § 7 (2) in conjunction with § 10 (1) of the "Special Conditions for awarding the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes", the study programme is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: from 30th September, 2016 to 30th September, 2021

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.



# FOUNDATION FOR INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION ACCREDITATION

FIBAA – BERLINER FREIHEIT 20-24 – D-53111 BONN

# **Assessment Report**

The highlighted yellow parts of the text are those which deviate to the text in the report of the Bachelor of Laws (LL.B.)

**Higher Education Institution (HEI):** 

KAZGUU University Astana (Kazakhstan)

**Master study programme:** 

Master in International Law (LL.M.)

**Qualification awarded on completion:** 

Master (LL.M.) in International Law (60 ECTS)

Master of Science in International Law (120 ECTS)

# General Information on the study programme

#### Brief description of the study programme:

Type of accreditation:

accreditation

The programme aims to prepare graduates for professional work in the fields of public international law, private international law and supranational law to operate in an increasingly complex global society. It equips students with in-depth knowledge, skills and competencies as well as it develops their ability of critical reflection upon the governing rules regulating between states and other international actors. The learning scope of international law brings students to solve a variety of diverse issues addressing legal policies and politics that exist in a global society. Further, it enables students to undertake advanced legal research in the field of international law and to analyse international contexts and cases through the prism of international law dimension.

Type of study programme:
<u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>
Master programme
Projected study time and number of ECTS points assigned to the study programme:
2 years, 120 credit points
1 year, 60 credit points
Mode of study:
<mark>part-time</mark>
Didactic approach:
Study programme with obligatory class attendance
Otday programme with obligatory diass attendance
Double/Joint Degree programme:
no
One of the second secon
Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:
1, 20-25 students per class
Programme cycle starts in:
winter semester
Initial start of the programme:
2001
2001

# **Procedure**

A contract for the accreditation of the programme of Master in International Law (LL.M.) was made between FIBAA and KAZGUU University July 06<sup>th</sup>, 2015. On December 21<sup>st</sup>, 2015, the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation were met. At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel. The HEI agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of:

#### Prof. Dr. jur. Dr. h.c. Thomas Schomerus

Leuphana University Lüneburg Professor for Public Law (Public Law, Energy Law, Environmental Law)

#### Prof. i.R. Dr. jur. Wolfgang Voegeli

University of Hamburg Professor for Civil and Commercial Law (Family Law, Family Policy, General Civil Law, Competition Law, European and International Commercial Law)

# Mansiya Kainazarova

KIMEP University
Director of Institutional Research Department
(Institutional Research KIMEP University)

#### Julia Titze LL.M.

Municipal Utilities Herne AG Corporate Development (Commercial Lawyer)

#### Jan-Gero Alexander Hannemann

Göttingen University Student of Law

#### FIBAA project manager:

Karin Legerlotz

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, requested by the panel, and a site visit. The site visit took place on March 15<sup>th</sup>/16<sup>th</sup>/17<sup>th</sup>, 2016 at the HEI's premises in Astana, Kazakhstan. The same cluster included an appraisal of the programmes Bachelor of Laws (LL.B.), Master of Laws (LL.M.), Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD), Bachelor in International Law (LL.B.), Doctor of Philosophy in International Law (PhD) and Bachelor in Law Enforcement Activity (LL.B). The programmes of this cluster were appraised with a second cluster including the programmes Bachelor of Economics, Bachelor, of Finance, Master of Finance, Bachelor of Management, Bachelor of Accounting and Audit, Bachelor of Tourism and Bachelor of Psychology. On end of the on-site visit the panel gave a short feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on August 31<sup>st</sup>, 2016. The statement on the report was given up on September 16<sup>th</sup>, 2016, it has been taken into account in the report on hand.

# Summary

The Master in International Law (LL.M.) offered by KAZGUU University fulfils without exception the FIBAA quality requirements for master programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on starting on 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2016 and finishing on 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2021 without condition. The programme is in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid at the time of opening of the procedure, and with the Bologna declaration.

The quality requirements that have not been fulfilled – ethical aspects (see chapter 3.1.5), lecturing tutors (see chapter 3.3.4) and internationality of the student body (see chapter 3.4.2) – are no asterisk criteria, so that conditions are not necessary. The measures the HEI takes to solve the identified problems are to be considered during the re-accreditation.

The measures that the HEI takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members are to be considered during the re-accreditation.

There are many criteria in which the programme exceeds the quality requirements:

- International orientation of the study programme design (see chapter 1.2)
- Positioning of the study programme in the educational market (see chapter 1.3.1)
- Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates (see chapter 1.3.2)
- Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategy (see chapter 1.3.3)
- Admission requirements (see chapter 2.1)
- Counselling for prospective students (see chapter 2.2)
- Selection procedure (see chapter 2.3)
- Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (see chapter 2.6)
- Equality of opportunity (see Chapter 3.2.4),
- Guest lecturers (se Chapter 3.3.3)
- International contents and intercultural aspects (see chapter 3.4.1)
- Practical business experience of faculty (see Chapter 4.1.4)
- Internal cooperation (see chapter 4.1.5)
- Student support by the faculty (see Chapter 4.1.6)
- Programme Director (see chapter 4.2.1)
- Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty (see Chapter 4.2.2)
- Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (see chapter 4.3.2)
- Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (see Chapter 4.4.1)
- Career counselling and placement service (see Chapter 4.5.1)
- Alumni activities (see Chapter 4.5.2)
- Programme description (see Chapter 5.3.1)
- Information on activities during the academic year (see Chapter 5.3.2)

For the overall assessment of the programme, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

# Information

#### Information on the Institution

Kazakh State Law Institute by the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan was established by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev on March 14, 1994. The Institute set an objective to prepare highly qualified lawyers, capable in terms of socio-economic reforms to ensure legal reform in the country.

By the Decree of the Government Kazakh State Law Institute was renamed as Kazakh State Law University and transferred to the jurisdiction under the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on 5 November 1996. After the merging with the Institute of State and Law of National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan the university was renamed as Kazakh State Academy of Law (KSAL) on February 14, 2000. On October 24, 2001 the university, established as a Republican State Enterprise, was transformed into a private company and renamed as "Kazakh Humanities and Law University" (KazHLU). In 2002 KazHLU moved from Almaty to Astana, the young capital of Kazakhstan. On 16 January, 2003 "KazHLU" PC was transformed into "KazHLU" PLC, on May 19, 2004 to "KazHLU" JSC and then renamed as "KAZGUU University" in 2015.

Under the decision of the IQAA Accreditation Council, KAZGUU had been accredited for 5 years (certificate of institutional accreditation issued under No.0013 dated 01.03.2013). In addition, on December 26, 2013 KAZGUU had been accredited as a subject of state-funded scientific and (or) scientific-technical activities (certificate No. 003645 issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

Located in the heart of Kazakhstan's capital, KAZGUU University is one of the largest and fastest growing humanitarian universities of Kazakhstan with more than 5 000 students, 1000 academic and research staff.

KAZGUU University comprises three Schools that are Higher School of Law, Higher School of Economics as well as Higher School of General Education4. All students study during their first year at the Higher School General Studies and Language Training (Foundation), where the obligatory subjects named by the Ministry of Education are comprised together.

The Higher School of Law offers three degree programmes in law, international law and law enforcement activity.

The Higher School of Economics offers seven programmes in economics, management, finance, accounting and audit, tourism, psychology, and translation studies.

The Department of Postgraduate Education offers five Master's Degree Programmes in Law, in International Law, in Translation Studies, in Economics and in Finance.

The mission of the University is to contribute to the development of the society through the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence. The aim of the University is to equip students with the necessary knowledge for leading positions in the sphere of law, economics and humanities in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad.

# Statistical data and evaluation results

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
applicants	75	66	64	32	28	33
first year students	31	41	39	18	19	25
Female students	19	24	22	13	7	15
Male students	12	17	17	5	12	10
Grade of final point average	3,33	3,67	3,33	2,8	2,29	2,05
Success rate	99%	94%	90%	70%	77%	80%
Average length of study	1 year 2 year					

# Programme Description and Appraisal in Detail

# 1. Objectives

# 1.1 Objectives of the study programmes (Asterisk-Criterion)

Initially, the educational programme on Law was aiming at the realisation of the objectives set by the state to KAZGUU at the year of its formation in 1994. The main goal was then to educate highly-qualified lawyers, who would be able to ensure legal reforms in the country during its social and economic transformation. This objective is reflected in its mission until today. Since a lot of areas of law were considerably changed or even newly introduced after Kazakhstan's independency the law programmes had to be frequently reformed and adjusted to the new realities. Reforms usually did not occur step by step but were quickly implemented and often result oriented. These developments caused a series of difficulties, which are until today unfortunately reflected in the educational programmes of legal studies such as a lack of educational books, commentaries, a uniform approach to methodology and case-solving in academia and at the courts and the difficulty to reflect areas of law at a university level which are not yet or fully regulated such as administrative law or which are under permanent reform or/and without a Court System but a the Highest Council giving non-binding opinions on questions on constitutional law. The programme should therefore be seen in this context taking all the above mentioned aspects into account and the fact that Kazakhstan's legal system is still in a transitional stage.

KAZGUU aims to educate experts in the field of law for public authorities, state, entrepreneurial organisations and non-profit organisations by equipping students with theoretical and practical knowledge, mainly in substantive and procedural law. Graduates of the programme have the necessary professional competence to work as a judge, a lawyer; public prosecutor, a notary officer; a consultant in a legal department or other departments of public authorities, a specialist/an expert in tax inspection bodies, insurance companies or a legal advisor in business sphere and as junior researchers. With the Master in International Law KAZGUU aims to prepare graduates for professional work in the fields of public international law, private international law and supranational law to operate in an increasingly complex global society. Upon successful completion the graduates of the Master in International Law will be able to:

- demonstrate application of substantive and procedural law (public and private law), advanced legal analysis and reasoning, problem-solving, transfer of knowledge and written and oral communication in the legal context;
- demonstrate advanced knowledge and competences in conducting self-related and autonomous research on controversial legal issues with methodological approach applied to the concept of international public and private law;
- be able to consider and solve reasonably case situations in international and domestic legal systems in a professional and competent manner;
- analyze possible legal prospects and trends in existing legislation in international law;
- integrate in-depth knowledge, to handle complex aspects of legislation and the ability to differentiate;
- make professional decisions and ground judgments and formulate them for specialist and non-specialist audiences;
- demonstrate high level of professionalism in communication with community following legal ethics;
- apply a mastery of skills and knowledge at a level required for teaching in their discipline of law;
- synthesise the evolution of international standards and theories in relation to contemporary situations.

The one-year programme is more professional oriented with a broad focus on generalisation of international law whereas the two-year programme represents rather a combination of academic and professional trajectories with the distinction of making research. In addition, it provides students with more options to narrow their focus on economics, international human rights, and intellectual property law.

# Appraisal:

The objectives of the programme are set out consistently to prepare students to fulfil professions as judges, lawyers; public prosecutors, notary officers, consultants in a legal or other departments of public authorities, specialists/experts in tax inspection bodies, insurance companies or legal advisors in business sphere and as junior researchers in the fields of public international law, private international law and supranational law.

The panel assesses the aim of the programme as very comprehensible and considers the explanations of the objectives as clear and intelligible. The objectives are based on subject-specific and generic learning outcomes which are in line with the academic state of the art and the level of the qualification to be awarded on completion. The panel also comes to the conclusion that the areas: empowerment, employability and personality/personal development are taken into account by the objectives of the programme.

In the view of the panel the Dublin Descriptors are adequately covered by the intended learning outcomes. Also, the requirements of academic abilities are fulfilled. Hence, the panel considers the learning outcomes of the programme to be at the appropriate level for Master degrees. The University analyses the findings of alumni tracking studies. The findings of the studies are considered within the developing process of the programme.

		Exceptional	dilality	Meets quality requirements	meet allality	n.r.
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			x		

# 1.2 International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)

Owing to the influence of European educational area the programme was designed towards meeting the international educational standards and criteria. It was designed in consultation with working follow-up group comprises of experts with international educational background in the relevant fields and the other stakeholders willing to contribute to the educational and labour markets. To strengthen the graduates employability, KAZGUU implemented an internalisation strategy which includes the international cooperation with leading foreign universities and research centers; the cooperation with international intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations; the academic mobility of students, mutual exchange of students between KAZGUU and foreign HEIs; the academic mobility of the teaching staff of KAZGUU, including foreign practical training of higher-education teaching personnel, foreign experts working at KAZGUU on a regular basis and guest lectures and the participation of KAZGUU's students in international law competitions.

One of the most important components of the international orientation of the programme is the academic mobility of students, suggesting a mutual student exchange between KAZGUU and foreign universities. Since 2011, 41 students of the programme have been trained in the framework of academic mobility programme. Furthermore, the major part of the curriculum deals with international issues and the English language proficiency is addressed in various modules.

# Appraisal:

The main focus of the programme at hand is to enable the students to work and to communicate in an international context and to handle competently international tasks. This focus is clearly shown in terms of curricular contents as well as language skills which are developed during the programme.

		Exceptional		Meets quality requirements	n.r.
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)		х		

# 1.3 Positioning of the study programmes

KAZGUU is one of the three and the only private HEI that implements the full cycle of higher and postgraduate education programme - "International Law" (bachelor, master and PhD). The advantage of KAZGUU over other HEIs is a specialisation in the training of lawyers. Other universities that offer an "International Law" programme are diversified universities. Therefore KAZGUU has an impact on the Republican educational-methodical section, which develops mandatory standard curricula for the "International law" programme. Furthermore, KAZGUU won several national and international Law competitions. The Master in International Law has become popular among Bachelor students and people with relevant experience since the University has been successfully developed and implemented marketing campaign to attract more perspective students and practitioners to the programme. On annual base the University promotes the campaign such as "An open lesson" where Bachelor students majoring in international law are granted the right to visit two or more lectures along with currently enrolled Master students.

The programme is also attractive in terms of tuition fees. Payment is set at the beginning of training and cannot be changed during the study. Thus, a student is guaranteed fixity of the financial costs associated with education.

Due to the changes in the legal system during the recent years and the difficulties of a still developing legal system, there is a strong need of highly qualified judges, prosecutors, notary officers, lawyers and legal advisors. Besides equipping students with abstract and transferable knowledge in the most important areas of law, the Master Programme provide a practical approach towards the legal education that include courses focusing on solving cases, and that meet the demand of the labour market.

Currently, international law increasingly transcends national boundaries, with closer interactions between national, inter- and transnational legal regimes, actors and practices. Hence the demand for professionals practicing in international law with advanced knowledge and skills has never been greater.

With the expanding role of Bachelor and Master in International Law in global context and the increasing sophistication of the practice, KAZGUU is recognised as a leading supplier of professionals practicing in the field of national and international law. According to the latest analysis, conducted in 2015, about 84% of the graduates of the programmes Bachelor and Master in International Law are employed, and 65% of them work in the sphere of international law.

The University's overall mission is to serve the community by providing both quality and affordable education. The programme is being developed in coherence with University Strategy 2013-2020, a cornerstone of institution development. KAZGUU is implementing a

student-centred and research-led culture. The programme underlines KAZGUU's strategy providing international standards of education as well as establishing strong relations with international universities. The law programmes form the core discipline of the university and refer to its special status that it has in legal education in Kazakhstan. Hence a special focus and emphasis has always been put on the legal programmes at KAZGUU, leading to the development of the Curriculum following aspects of the European legal educational system and further trainings for academic and administrative staff, which reflects on the educational programme offered to students.

# Appraisal:

KAZGUU has thoroughly examined the educational market and used the results in establishing its own unique and competitive profile. Moreover, the panel is impressed that KAZGUU uses its good reputation to make an impact on the mandatory standard curricula for the "International law" programme for all HEIs in Kazakhstan.

The panel highly appreciates the good cooperation KAZGUU maintains with potential employers and that it thoroughly analysed the job market for graduates and has comprehensively incorporated the results in the study programme.

The study programme's qualification goals constitute the core of KAZGUU's strategy and are sustainably implemented.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	meet dilality	n.r.
1.3	Positioning of the study programme					
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market		х			
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates ("Employability")		x			
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept		х			

### 2. Admission

The admission procedure is regulated according to the "The Standard Rules of Admission to Educational Institutions", which was adopted by the decree of the government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on January 19th, 2012, No. 109.

To apply for a Master Programme students must submit to the Admission Committee the following documents:

- confirmation of completion a corresponding Bachelor degree programme with no less than 240 ECTS;
- application addressed to the Rector of the university;
- an individual study plan to be discussed and signed by national or international research advisor;
- a copy of an identity card;
- a copy of an education certificate;
- a copy of an international language certificate (if acquired);
- a list of scientific papers and instructional researches (if applicable);
- six photos of 3x4 cm;
- a medical certificate of special 086-Y type;
- a record book of employment (for those who have work experience).

Students from other universities must provide the Admission Committee with all the required documents identical with domestic students.

For the admission of international students a recognition procedure is obligatory. All copies of the documents should be officially notarised and translated into one of the following languages: Kazakh, Russian, or English.

The admission is also based on the entry examinations results. The entry examinations for the Republic of Kazakhstan include a foreign language examination and subject examination. For international applicants the entry examinations include Kazakh or Russian language examination and subject examination.

The foreign language entry examinations (Russian/Kazakh for international students) are held according to the technology and methodology developed by The National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The examination takes 180 minutes and is represented in the form of test. The whole test consists of three modules: listening, writing and reading. The results are then processed by means of the special scanning machine.

The citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, who have international language certificates with the results of 100 points according to 100-point-grading scale, are exempted from passing the foreign language examination provided by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The subject examination is set in the written form. The examination paper consists of 2 questions: the first one covers theoretical issues and the second one is oriented on a case-problem solution. The subject examination takes 120 minutes. To make the examination process more objective the format of examination paper is the same for all applicants who have chosen one and the same specialty.

Candidates are admitted to the Master programme only if they get 50 points in each examination.

Part of the selection procedure for the Master Programme is also an obligatory interview. During the interview between the Director or a Coordinator of the programme and a potential enrollee the following selection criteria are taken into account:

- obvious motivation of an enrollee to study at the chosen programme;
- clear professional aims, which are to be achieved as a result of the study;
- critical thinking and open-mindedness;

- readiness to overcome academic challenges;
- an enrollee's achievements and success in professional life.

The interview is recorded and the results and the Director's decision are reported to an enrollee right after the interview is finished.

Furthermore, a foreign language examination held by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan tests the English skills of the applicants. The certificate with the result of examination of 50 points corresponds to the Pre-intermediate language level. The applicants are exempt from entry language examination if they already have international language certificate on such as:

- Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Programme (TOEFL ITP no less than 460 points);
- Test of English as a Foreign Language Internet-based Test (TOEFL IBT no less than 87);
- Test of English as a Foreign Language Paper-based Test (TOEFL no less than 560);
- International English Language Tests System (IELTS no less than 6.0).

Candidates are admitted to the Master programme only if they get 50 points in each examination. Candidates, who get the highest points in the sum of two entry examinations of not less than 150 points, are awarded a state grant. In case the applicants have equal examination results, the one who got the highest points on the subject examination takes advantage.

Besides the results of examinations Admission Committee also takes into account student academic achievements including publications of scientific articles, certificates on scientific innovations, scientific scholarships, grants, certificates of achievements, certificates of participation in the scientific conferences and competitions and work experience on the specialty.

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan provides a financial aid by allocating state educational grants for candidates who meet all the required criteria and demonstrated high academic performance. For international applicants scholarships are granted based on international agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan with countries.

To make the evaluation procedure more objective and fair, all the applicants' works are coded by the Institution staff since it is considered as criminal breach of trust. Only the members of the examination commission are given answer codes for exam papers. It provides the selection procedure with unbiased and objective evaluation. After the evaluation all the examination papers are decoded.

The overall result of selection procedure is based on two entry examinations that are foreign language examination and subject examination. If there is a controversial issue to be resolved the special Board of Review is created. The members of the board of review consider the issues of those who disagree with the results of the examinations. In this case an applicant's paper goes through thorough review. Only the Board of Review is responsible to make a decision to add points to the applicant's exam paper if the reasons for that are confirmed. The members of the Board of Review come to their decisions by the majority of votes. If the amount of votes is equal the vote of the Director is considered as a final. The decisions made by the Board of Review are in the form of a record signed by the Director and all the members.

All appropriate information on admission rules and procedures is available in the Academic Policy and regularly updated at the university website. In addition, booklets and brochures containing this information are distributed among participants of the KAZGUU during Open House Days. The Open House Days usually take place three times within an academic year. The date, time and venue are announced on the website.

Moreover, the University offers Student Counselling Service for prospective students to help them to handle any difficulties they may be experiencing, to develop academic and personal potential. The Service offers free and confidential support and guidance to optimise their chances to obtain admission into the University.

The results of the entry examinations of applicants who are awarded with a grant are posted on the University website and also the detailed information board of the Department of Postgraduate Education. The points on each section of the exam of every applicant are given in the score chart where the last names of candidates are given in the descending order according to the overall result. The applicant has the opportunity to receive a consultation by phone or have an online consultant via the website. The admission decision is based on abovementioned transparent criteria, and communicated to applicants on the website and by e-mail/phone.

## Appraisal:

The admission conditions and procedures are properly defined, transparent and correspond to the profile development goals of the KAZGUU, because the students do not only have to have a corresponding master degree, but also have to hand in an individual study plan to be discussed and signed by a national or international research advisor and a list of scientific papers and instructional researches.

The panel considers the selection procedure as targeted to the programme goals. The selection procedure, which includes two entrance exams, is carried out in accordance with Kazakh laws and therefore satisfies the legal requirements. Moreover, the panel appreciates that KAZGUU additionally examines the personal suitability of the applicants within an interview.

Standardised language tests or a different formalised and documented language test with the requirement of a minimum score ensure that the students enrolled are able to actively participate in the classes held in a foreign language.

KAZGUU ensures a constant availability for prospective students and reacts quickly to incoming enquiries. The applicants receive detailed information about the admission process and the programme they are applying for as well as an individual counselling options according to their personal needs.

The admission procedure is described, documented, and accessible for interested parties. The admission decision is based on transparent criteria and is communicated to the students. In addition, the admission decision contains detailed information on the results of the admission procedure. The panel appreciate that the applicants have the possibility to receive a consultation after the decision.

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	meer ousurv	n.r.
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)	х			
2.2	Counselling for prospective students	Х			
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)	Х			
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)				x
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)		x		

		Exceptional		Meets quality requirements	n.r.
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of				
	admission procedure and decision		X		
	(Asterisk Criterion)				

# 3 Contents, structure and didactical concept of the programme

#### 3.1 Contents

The difference between the programme lasting one year and lasting two years is that the two-year programme covers not only a wider range of courses but it is going more into detail when it comes to case-solving and research encouraging graduates to pursue a PhD degree and/or start teaching at Kazakh HEIs.

The first semester comprises eleven submodules incorporated into three large modules: general education disciplines and two modules of the core courses. The area of focus of the general disciplines is oriented to the development of leadership and management skills with advanced knowledge of legal English since it implies they embrace the framework of international law.

The other two modules are considered to be the core modules with specialisation in the relevant area that are the theory of public international law, private international law II and implementation of international law in national law. This module grounds fundamental subjects, which frame the overarching concept of international law covering a broad variety of topical issues including international actors, human rights, collective security, application of private international law theories into national legal system, legal environment as well as its normative and philosophical foundations.

Overall the courses examine contemporary problems in the legal aspects of international relations, with attention to the nature and sources of international law and the reality of international law in international affairs, the application of international law in domestic courts, recognition of states and governments, self-determination, the law of treaties, human rights, law and policy of WTO, jurisdiction and immunities, comparative taxation law, responsibility for violations, and enforcement through economic sanctions and criminal law. The students have the option to choose three out of five electives.

The second semester proceeds to research linking with the foreign internship. The foreign internship refers to as an important element of research since it equips students with additional knowledge and skills necessary for making solid and peer-reviewed research. The international internship also provides students with the opportunity to interact with the internationally accepted best practices in the research field, access to foreign university libraries and reach out to the foreign university teaching staff. The final modules are given to practical seminars on preparation to the state examination and submission of the thesis.

The various fields of law are not separately discussed from each other but as far as they correlate and overlap related to each other, hence students develop their skills of solving cases in a wider context.

The curriculum overview is shown in the following illustration:

# Curriculum Overview



# MSc in International Law Programme, 2 Semesters

	. et	_						
-1	_	s	۰	m	ρ	51	ie	г

Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit		edit ints		kload	Method of Teaching	Form and Duration of Examinations	Weight of exam related to final
		I.	2.	Hours in Class	Hours Self- Study	i.e. lecture course, seminar		grade
	General Education Disciplines - 9	9						40 / 100
LNL5201	International Legal English	4		30	60	T	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
MNG5201	Management	2		15	30	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
MNG5202	Leadership	3		25	65	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
	Core Courses - Major Requered - 12	12						40 / 100
IL5201	Theory of Public International Law	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (180 Min)	40/100
PRL5202	International Private Law II	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (100 Min)	40/100
IL5202	Application of International Law in Domestic Legal Systems	5		30	105	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
	Core Courses - Major Requered - 9 (3 courses out of 5)	9						40 / 100
IL5208	Law and Policy of WTO	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
IL5206	Comperative Taxation Law	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
IL5207	EU Internal Market and Competition Law	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
PRL5201	International Commercial Arbitration II	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100
TSL5201	English Law	3		30	60	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40 / 100

#### 2nd Semester

I	С	Research (including foreign internship)		20			Report	
I	С	Seminars on state examination		3				
I		State examination		2			Exam Paper (180 Min)	100 / 100
I		Master Thesis		5			Thesis/Project	100 / 100
ľ	total		30	30	310	680		

The two-year Master programme consists of four semesters which incorporate five modules. The first semester consists of two modules which include general education disciplines and major core courses. These general education disciplines have a more research-oriented content and concept than the ones described above in the one-year programme. The following core courses identical that mentioned in the one-year programme since they constitute the fundamental subjects of international law and guide students to their options of choice whether it could be public or private sector orientation. Concurrently, graduates are required to visit research seminars which equip them with necessary methodology of making research.

The second semester comprises of two modules, which also include core courses and electives. The core courses are constructed with a narrow focus on solving issues on public and private fields of international law. As for the electives, the students are given much freedom to select courses of their choice that help them to design an individual programme of study to meet their academic and professional goals – whether to broaden their general preparation, specialise in their current fields of practice or to explore new areas of interest in legal practice (four out of seven courses in the second and three out of four courses in the third semester). Following up the third semester graduates take specialised courses in international criminal law with its application to the national one, advanced course in international human rights law, national resources and international environmental law and international intellectual property law as well as visit research seminars. In addition, graduates are required to strength experience in teaching practice concomitant with a high degree of individual attention and mentoring from faculty staff and support provided by the administration of the institute of postgraduate education and international relations.

The final semester is completely dedicated to the summarisation of acquired knowledge and practice, making abroad internship, submission of the thesis and preparation for the final state exam.

The various fields of law are not separately discussed from each other but as far as they correlate and overlap related to each other, students develop their skills of solving cases in a wider context.

The curriculum overview is shown in the following illustration:

#### Curriculum Overview MSc in International Law, 4 Semesters 1st Semester Modul No Title of Module / Course Unit Credit Points per Worldoad Method of Teaching Form and Duration of weight of exam related to final Semester Examinations Hours in Hours i.e. lecture course. grade Self-Class seminar Study 12 245 40 / 100 Core Courses - 12 30 60 Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 LNL5201 International Legal English Exam Paper (120 Min) GED5201 History of Philosophy and Science 30 60 L/S 40 / 100 GED5203 Pedagogics 30 Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 60 L/S MNG5202 Leadership 3 25 65 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 Core Courses - Major Required - 15 16 316 40 / 100 IL5201 Theory of Public International Law 5 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 PRL5202 International Private Law II 40 / 100 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) IL5203 Application of International Law in Domestic Legal Systems 5 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 Research Seminars 90 15 2nd Semester Core Courses - Major Required - 10 40 / 100 10 210 International Public Disputes Settlement 30 105 40/100 Exam Paper (120 Min) IL5204 International Private Disputes Settlement 5 30 105 L/S 40 / 100 Major Courses - Electives - 20 (4 courses out of 7) 20 120 420 |L5205 | International Investment Law 30 105 40 / 100 5 Exam Paper (120 Min) 30 105 L/S IL5206 Comperative Taxation Law 5 Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 IL5207 EU Internal Market and Competition Law 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 IL5208 Law and Policy of WTO 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 5 IL5209 Law and Policy of Eurasian Economic Union 5 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 30 105 L/S PRL5201 International Commercial Arbitration II 5 Exam Paper (120 Min) 40 / 100 TSL5201 English Law 40 / 100 30 105 Exam Paper (120 Min) 3rd Semester Major Courses - Electives - 15 (3 courses of 4) 315 40 / 100 15 International Criminal Law and Criminal Law of Kazakhstar - 5 30 105 Exam Paper (120 Min) International Human Rights Law II 5 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) IL6311 National Resourses and International Environmental Law 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 5 IL6313 International Intellectual Property Law 5 30 105 L/S Exam Paper (120 Min) 12 330 Teaching Experience 4th Semester Research (including foreign internship) 100 / 100 State Examination 120 Exam Paper (180 Min) 100 / 100 Master Thesis 240 Thesis/Project 100 / 100 45 2960 Total

Upon completion of the Master programme, KAZGUU awards the title "Master (LL.M.) in International Law (60 ECTS)" for the one-year programme and the title "Master of Science in International Law (120 ECTS)" for the two-year programme. These programme names follow the classification used by the ministry, e.g. for the educational grant system.

The programme is practice - and research-oriented and follows the policy of including courses on case-solving into the curriculum and of inviting external lecturers and guest speakers. The invited external lecturers and guest speakers come from real international law sector with an extensive work experience in legal system. They bring latest examples and practices from international law sector and implement them in designing case-studies, real life examples, simulations and modelling assignments for students.

Besides at KAZGUU since 2014 the Academic Diplomatic Club has been successfully functioning and so far attracting graduates to participate, and they are encouraged to practice learned theories in international law into a variety of practice settings. The Academic Diplomatic Club hosts ambassadors of different countries and outstanding speakers. It provides a free platform for discussion of topical issues of international relations in the sphere of politics, economy, culture and education.

This approach is aimed to strengthen the practical aspects of the course, to share additional external expertise and experience and to broaden the perspectives and visions of the students. Moreover, the practitioners take active participation in updating the module content by providing constant feedback on the quality of the programme and its implementation process. Furthermore, part of the programme is a ten week internship. The internship provides students with an opportunity to grow professionally, identify personal strengths and weaknesses, apply learned theory to practical situations, and gain an appreciation of the role, duties, and responsibilities of the work that the student has chosen as a career. The internship is designed cooperatively with the university, field professionals, and the student to provide an experience that is mutually beneficial to both the Intern and the organisation. An Internship Placement Process Orientation is held to inform senior students of the internship requirements and the placement process procedures. Following this meeting, students are asked to list three to five potential organisations on the "Intent to Intern" form. After completing the form and related materials, the student schedules an individual meeting with the internship coordinator. At this meeting the student's internship eligibility is determined and possible internship organisations are selected which will meet the student's professional development objectives and an agreement between the receiving organisation and KAZGUU is signed. At the end of their internship the students have to write an internship report.

The learning outcomes of the courses "Psychology", "Pedagogics" and "Management" address cross-subject and interdisciplinary issues. After the completion of these courses the students will be able to identify how leadership and ethical aspects can be incorporated along with the national law area and demonstrate understanding in management, i.e. leadership, selection, training and given the challenges presented by managing in a multicultural environment in contemporary international law.

The programme explores ethical issues in a variety of international law related settings. In some courses students encounter with discussions of the plurality of inconsistent rules and expectations of how individuals or institutions, involved in international law, should behave despite that they come from different backgrounds and could have vastly differing concepts of legal ethics. These differences arise with respect to witness preparation, document production or conflicts of interest. In other courses students examine the role of ethical discourse in international law's public and private dimensions, which open new avenues for cross-disciplinary exchange in these important fields and related disciplines. They are taught international law standards and regulations used to prepare solid, transparent statements. The framework of each module addresses the impact of codes of ethics, international standards, regulations and the challenges.

From the beginning of the programme the students familiarise themselves with the methodological competences, main requirements, assignment performance, exams to be taken, academic work expectations, research and master thesis performance. An induction session is held at the beginning of studies for every new cohort, during which the programme curriculum, learning strategy and methodology are explained by the programme administration and faculty. The students acquire knowledge and skills in key working practices such as researching and preparing literature, presenting research and project activities using various presentation techniques and visual aids, communicating research to different target groups, acquiring the essential writing skills necessary to produce academic texts, making proper references according to the internationally accepted standards on citation and gaining a basic knowledge of project and time management.

All courses of the modules of the programme are followed by written exams which could be a combination of two subjects that have an interrelated content and context. The type of evaluation, procedures and module performance are included in the respective syllabus along with the employed teaching methods and studies duration. Student performance follows the syllabus requirements, including assessment types, duration and respective requirements as academically approved including the thesis. The student performance and given grades are evaluated by achieving the learning outcomes and their overall programme performance. Tasks, questions, problems and assessments of the final examination are defined by the involved team of teaching faculty, taking into account not only knowledge but also learning outcomes. The Type of evaluation depends on the subjects. Academic freedom of the teaching faculty drives the choice of the assessments types, though. The examples of the assessments methods are:

- Written / oral projects;
- Home or in-class individual / group assignments;
- Term projects;
- Case-solving;
- Final assessment / exam.

The final theses are evaluated based on previously published and coherently applied criteria, rules and procedures. The students prove, especially in their thesis, their ability to do scientific work, to apply scientific methods.

Furthermore, for finishing the programme, the students need to have completed all modules and then pass a State Comprehensive Exam, the format of which is defined by the ministry. The types of evaluation, procedures and course performance or module performance are included in the respective syllabus along with the employed teaching methods and studies duration. A system of continuous assessment is used and has the advantage of students receiving continuous feedback on their progress. The continuous monitoring of student progress means that problems which some individual students may have are identified sooner and can be dealt with.

# Appraisal:

In the view of the panel, the programme at hand contains many important and contemporary courses and the contents of the programme are in principle adequate for the Master study programme, with the mixture of modules being balanced in terms of content. Also, regarding the sequence of the modules, they are logically aligned to one another and with the qualification and competence goals. The elective courses included in the programme enable students to acquire beneficial skills in accordance with their own preferences.

The degree and programme name correspond to the contents of the curriculum and the programme objectives.

Theory and practice are sufficiently combined throughout the curriculum. Theoretical questions are geared towards application fields to promote employability on the programme. The included internship is envisaged to link theory and practice as well. The panel appreciate the use of case studies and encourages KAZGUU to even put a stronger focus on case solving in the subject related courses.

Some of the core courses give evidence that the programme properly promotes interdisciplinary thinking.

Moreover, ethical implications of juridical ways of thinking and acting are appropriately communicated.

Finally, the programme ensures that graduates have methodological competence. The panel appreciates the systematic approach of delivering the needed skills for research work and the final thesis during the entire study programme. Methodological competence is also indicated as learning objectives in the module descriptions.

The level of performance in examinations and the thesis are aligned with the learning outcomes of the module in terms of form and content. Although, the panel encourages KAZGUU to introduce also oral examinations. At the on-site visit the panel had the opportunity to look at theses and examinations written by the students. Altogether the students have provided evidence that they are capable of doing academic work and that the learning outcomes are achieved in the programme.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.1	Contents					
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			х		
3.1.2*	Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			x		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			x		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking			Χ		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects			Х		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)			x		
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

#### 3.2 Structure

	Master in International	Master in Law Sciences in
	Law	International Law
Projected study time	1 year, 2 semester	2 years, 4 semester
Number of Credit Points (CP)	60	120
Workload per CP	25-30	25-30
Number of modules	3	5
Time required for processing	125	225 hours
the final thesis and awarded	5 ECTS	9 ECTS
СР		

The one-year programme has the following structure:

- 3 General education courses (required by the state),
- 1 Major core course (required by the state),
- 2 Major core courses (required by the school),
- 3 Major elective courses (required by the school) and
- 1 internship allocated with 20 CP.

#### The two-year programme has the following structure:

- 4 General education courses (required by the state),
- 1 Major core course (required by the state),
- 4 Major core courses (required by the school),
- 7 Major elective courses (required by the school) and
- 1 internship allocated with 18 CP.

Regarding the application of the European Credit Transfer an Accumulation System (ECTS), KAZGUU states to have implemented modules and to have assigned credit point to each module depending on its workload.

All modules have been described in module descriptions enclosing information on the year of study, the semester when the course is delivered seminars and self-study, allocated credits, pre requisites, post requisites, recommended literature, content, lecturers, methods of teaching and learning outcomes.

Primary study and exam regulations are defined at the university level, and published within the University Catalogue. In addition, the Higher School of Laws has developed its own regulations regarding admission. The Examination Regulations set comprehensive rules and procedures, such as examinations' forms, deadlines, Examiners and Board of Examiners, Evaluation Criteria, Appeal Procedure, for all examinations including the State Exit Exam. KAZGUU is involved in academic mobility programmes with partner universities. For mobility students the Learning Agreements are signed beforehand by both partner universities. The academic period spent at the partner university is recognized and regulated in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention, but one should note that the national recognition regulations completely differ. As required by the MES, to transfer ECTS in Kazakh credits the following scale must be used:

- for Bachelor students: 1 ECTS is believed to be equal to 1.5-1.8 Kazakh
- for one year Master students: 1 ECTS is believed to be equal to 2-2.4 Kazakh credits
- for two year Master students: 1 ECTS is believed to be equal to 2.5-3 Kazakh credits
- for Doctoral students: 1 ECTS is believed to be equal to 3.5-4.2 Kazakh credits

KAZGUU University uses the Grading System required by the MES

Quality	Grade Description	Percentage	Grade Point Average (GPA)
Α	Excellent	95-100	4,0
Α-	Excellent	90-94	3,67
B+		85-89	3,33
В	Good	80-84	3,0
B-		75-79	2,67
C+		70-74	2,33
С		65-69	2,0
C-	Satisfactory	60-64	1,67
D+		55-59	1,33
D		50-54	1,0
F	Fail	0-49	0

And hands out a Diploma Supplement which contains the following grading scale:

ECTC		1-
ECIS	grading	scare

Grade	Students*	Definition	At KAZGUU				
A	10%	Outstanding performance with minor errors	A/A-				
В	25%	Above the average standard but with some errors	B+				
С	30%	Generally sound work with a number of notable errors	B/B-/C+				
D	25%	Fair bur with significant shortcomings	C/C-/D+				
Е	10%	Performance meets the minimum criteria	D				
F		Some more work required before the credit can be awarded	F				
FX		Considerable further work is required	F				
* Percen	* Percentage of successful students normally achieving the grade						

In accordance with the MES requirements, the eighth semester is required to be free of classes and only the internship along with thesis preparation is allowed to be allocated upon it. For that reason, the ECTS credits are not evenly distributed across the curriculum.

To distribute ECTS to the thesis, business orientation and internship, the students' workload based on the MES requirements was estimated. The exams are assigned normally at the end of each semester. The number of exams usually corresponds to the number of courses.

The feasibility of the study programme's workload is ensured by appropriate support services, such as advisers' service, programme coordinator, HSL manager on internal affairs, who collect students' feedback, develop recommendations at the faculty level.

The data on the student body is gathered and analysed by the Registrar. According to the data, the gender equality is ensured.

With the aim to assist all HSL students and especially the students with special needs the HSL employs Student advisors and a Manager on Internal Affairs. The Platonus System permits students to apply distantly on various inquiries serving as a mean of communication among students and administration. Administration collects and processes throughout the HSL AQC students' inquires, where each case is considered on an individual basis. Possible decisions can be academical (inquires related to study – usually, it is recommended to follow an individual study plan which is developed by the adviser, inquires related to examination—an individual exam schedule could be proposed by the adviser and designed by the Registrar) or

financial (the KAZGUU Management Board can grant a scholarship or a permission to follow an individual payment schedule). The Chairman of the HSL AQC systematically reviews inquires processed and provides general policy recommendations to the policy-makers at the university and school levels.

## Appraisal:

In the structure of the student workload the ratio of core subjects, electives and practical components is weighted in a balanced manner. Also, the amount of credit points per semester is evenly spread throughout the study programme. An internship is designed and integrated in such a way that CP can be acquired. The programme consists of modules and assigns ECTS-Points per module on the basis of the necessary student workload. The module descriptions provide detailed descriptions of intended learning outcomes and the information defined in the ECTS Users' Guide.

There are legally binding study and exam regulations which contain all necessary rules and procedures and take into account, where applicable, national requirements. The study programme is designed so that students can study for a certain time at other HEIs or do internships without any extension of their overall study time. The recognition of degrees and periods of study at other HEIs is regulated in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention; the recognition of periods of practical work is also clearly defined. In the university's diploma supplements is a relative grading included.

The HEI ensures gender equality and non-discrimination. Students with disabilities are provided with affirmative actions concerning time and formal standards/requirements throughout the programme and examinations. Students in special circumstances, such as single parents, foreign students, students with a migration background and/or from so-called non-academic backgrounds, are particularly assisted. The measures taken are periodically reviewed and adapted in accordance with the obtained results.

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	meet anality	n.r.
3.2	Structure				
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2.3*	Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2.4	Equality of opportunity	Х			

# 3.3 Didactical concept

As teaching methods the programme uses a wide range of different case studies (meaning case-solving in tutorials and as well increasingly in lectures and seminars), discussions guest lectures, company visits, work-place oriented practical assignments, game projects and situational analyses.

The case method involves solving the cases and different types of situational problems (case studies with simulation description of real situations, with closed and open story; case illustrations, case problems, case evaluation). This method forms the students' skills in

determining the applicable law, legal reasoning. Also, the method allows gaining a number of social skills.

The method of discussion involves posing the issue, followed by a discussion, including work in small groups. This method helps student master critical thinking skills in dealing with specific legal issues, legal reasoning and make independent legal decisions;

The method of presentation of an essay or of a research project forms the students' ability to engage in scientific activities. Priority is given to research work in order to create a new research product, not only when student analyses the theoretical and practical material, but when he or she is also able to offer and share their vision of the disputed issue.

Furthermore the individual work of students has a significant role in the process of education; the results of such work can be in different forms:

- Traditional (writing creative essays, participating in colloquia, reviewing additional literature and articles, making presentations);
- Specific (reviewing international judicial and quasi-judicial practices, processing and analyzing of legal statistical information, preparing memoranda of the parties, decisions of international courts and tribunals, draft contracts and other international documents).

The learning materials are the area of responsibility for the teaching faculty who delivers classes. The programme administration keeps syllabuses and related learning materials for reference. A hard copy of the learning materials is provided to students before each module begins, with additional materials distributed by the teaching faculty during lectures/contact hours. All learning materials are regularly updated and also available for student during their studies in the electronic format. The learning materials give the students different points of view including approaches, solutions to different academic aspects, vision from various angles. This enables a certain degree of versatility and avoids sticking to one theory or one opinion. Moreover, KAZGUU emphasises, that learning materials are not simply given to the students to read. A part of their studies is focusing on the materials provided and delivered by the teaching faculty and another part the students seeking out information on their own, because the students are required to update their knowledge from the other sources beyond the lecture, such as investigate on the Internet, find in the reading literature, use their own experience. Through interactive work with the materials, the students are enabled to develop their own theory-based problem solving strategy. The course materials are continuously further developed according to the didactical concepts, and systematically designed according to the didactical preferences of the students.

KAZGUU encourages the teaching faculty to invite guest lecturers to their class. Guest speakers represent judges, lawyers, local or international diplomatic community and provide broader learning horizon and perspectives including interdisciplinary aspects and create additional networking opportunities for students. Because of it's good reputation and the good relations in Astana, Kazakhstan and to HEIs abroad, KAZGUU was able to invite prestigious guest lecturers.

KAZGUU states, that the programme does not have formal teacher assistants and the university does not apply student assistants to facilitate learning by the participants, as there is no need. However, the programme faculty members are available during their office hours and by other means such as via e-mail or by phone. The programme is not experiencing further demand or any requests from its participants, but if they are - the programme administration is always open for discussion and ready to address student needs and requests.

#### Appraisal:

The didactical concept of the study programme is described, plausible, and oriented towards the programme objectives. It allows for the application of different teaching and learning methods. The panel appreciates the case-oriented and interactive approach and the efforts of KAZGUU to enhance critical thinking skills of students.

During the on-site visit the panel members had the possibility to survey the accompanying course materials of several courses. They came to the conclusion that the quality of these materials varies but on balance were of a good quality and do meet international standards. They are digitally accessible, user-friendly and encourage students to engage in further independent studies. In course descriptions of each module there is up-to-date literature available in Kazakhstan. While some of them are published more than 5 years ago, they are still the most up-to-date in Kazakhstan, as there has not been published new literature related to the course so far. Within the efforts to keep up-to-date study literature, KAZGUU has subscribed for Jstore and IPRbooks data bases in 2016. By these means students of the particular program have an access to the most up-to-date international study literature of subjects.

Guest lecturers are regularly invited, their contribution forms an integral part of the study programme's didactical concept. They have a very good reputation and come from a variety of occupations, which enhances students' chances of employment thanks to the profound insights they gain.

Student assistance by lecturing tutors does not take place at present in the programme. However, the panel holds the view that student assistance is not relevant within a master programme, especially since broad and continuous support is provided by the lecturers.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	meet duality	n.r.
3.3	Didactical concept					
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)			Х		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)			Х		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers			Х		
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors				Х	

# 3.4 Internationality

The international focus of the programme reflects in the curriculum. In nearly all disciplines international and intercultural aspects are included. These disciplines are:

- International Legal English
- Theory of International Law
- International Private Law II
- Application of International Law in Domestic Legal System
- Law and Policy at WTO
- Comparative Taxation Law
- EU Market and Competition Law
- International Commercial Arbitration II
- English Law

In addition for the students of the 2-year master programme the above mentioned disciplines are supplemented by the following disciplines:

- International Public Disputes Settlement
- International Private Disputes Settlement
- International Investment Law
- Law and Policy of Eurasion Economic Union
- International Criminal Law and Criminal Law of Kazakhstan

- International Human Rights Law II
- National Resources and International Environmental Law
- International Intellectual Property Law

The educational process is facilitated by the use of international practice teaching materials, in particular:

- International treaties and other international instruments (it allows to learn conclusion
  of contracts process and obtain skills of legal norm modelling, and to consider the
  practice of implementation of international treaties);
- Decisions of international courts, tribunals and quasi-judicial bodies (used to expand the range of the student's knowledge of specific provisions in international law as well as clarifies the mechanism of decision-making in an international court);
- Acts of international organisations (help student to understand acts of international organisations, as well as their actual impact on the legal system of States Parties).

One of the intangible assets of KAZGUU is building the free society aimed at future leaders. Therefore, it welcomes students from other countries and provides the necessary assistance. To promote the programme in other countries it cooperates with HEIs from other countries. However, in the programme at hand there are only national students enrolled.

Most of the teachers in the study programme at hand are citizens of Kazakhstan, but many of them have gained international experience on an educational level in the EU, USA, Canada, Japan, Malaysia etc. and some in addition work experience. The University is planning to further increase the number of international faculty (visiting and exchange faculty). Information on vacancies and other teaching opportunities, application procedures and university's proposition can be found on the KAZGUU website. Also experts with international work experience are invited for guest lectures on a regularly basis.

The main language and the official languages of studies at KAZGUU are Russian and Kazakh. English Language is promoted in the course "International Legal English". The course is developed in a way to provide the most up-to-date English for the areas of international law necessary to handle issues in today's diplomatic world. Also, some of the teaching materials of other courses are set in the format of English language textbooks and cases studies, so that students do learn not only in Russian language but also have a component of English language.

#### Appraisal:

The high amount of international content in the curriculum is an emphasis of the programme. The panel members came to the conclusion that the international content as a result of the international orientation of the programme equips graduates with the skills they need to perform the tasks required in an international and intercultural environment.

Furthermore, there is a pure national composition of the student body. Therefore, the panel recommends that the marketing strategy should be expanded in order to attract more foreign students.

The CVs of the teaching staff as well as discussion with lecturers on-site have shown that most of the lecturers, participating in the programme have experience on an educational level abroad. The panel appreciates the efforts of KAZGUU to further promote the international composition of the faculty.

The proportion of foreign language courses and required foreign language materials corresponds with the qualification objectives of the study programme. Nevertheless, the panel

recommends KAZGUU to the increase the amount of lectures in English and thereby raise the percentage of international students.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)		х			
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body				х	
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			Х		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			Х		

# 3.5 Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)

The aim of the courses "International Public Disputes Settlement" and "International Private Disputes Settlement" are to demonstrate the application of international civil procedure norms, legal analysis and reasoning, problem-solving, transfer of knowledge and written and oral communication in the legal context.

The course "Leadership" aims at the understanding of core principles and definitions of personal growth and leadership; the understanding and analysing of own needs in personal and professional development; gaining skills and tools for personal and professional development; the ability of assessing own strengths and areas for improvement and improved emotional intelligence and resilience.

# Appraisal:

The students acquire communication and public-speaking skills as well as cooperation and conflict handling skills in the study programme. This is documented in the module descriptions and corresponds with the didactical concept of KAZGUU. The acquisition of further multidisciplinary competences, such as leadership skills and broad contextual knowledge, is also ensured.

		Exceptional	Meets quality requirements	n.r.
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)		x	

# 3.6 Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)

To prepare students for Law-making work (including the drafting of international treaties and private law contracts) as legal advisor, an expert on legal issues, government employee the programme teaches students to analyse the content of national and international law, to generalise the results and use them in modeling projects with international instruments. The programme focusses on the awareness of the legal consequences regarding development and the conclusion of international documentation.

To prepare students for the protection of the rights and interests of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the international level, including work in international commercial arbitration as a representative, a lawyer, as well as independent arbitrator or mediator the programme teaches to collect and analyse the necessary materials, including international practice, to form attitude

using legal argument and cause-and-effect link, to make independent legal decisions. This is facilitated by the use of interactive teaching methods. As a result, this leads to the formation of students' openness in establishing legal relations in various spheres of public life.

To prepare students for the representation of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the foreign policy level as a government employee, including work on diplomatic and consular relations, in international intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations as a diplomatic or consular official the students receive negotiations skills in the Academic Diplomatic Club of KAZGUU.

To prepare students for expert-advisory work (including the preparation of the scientific and legal opinions on drafting laws, agreements and transactions) as a legal expert, an expert consultant or a scientific expert the programme teaches students to analyse the content of international treaties and other instruments and to generalise the results. The students receive the ability to properly formulate the legal positions and make independent decisions that are important for future employment.

The programme also enhances students' employability in an international context due to the international orientation and content as well as through the international environment at the University. Students develop advanced understanding of the issues involved in international and intercultural business, and the challenges and opportunities it presents compared to business activity within the domestic context.

# Appraisal:

The panel is in no doubt that graduates of the programme will be employable, given the application orientation of the programme. The curriculum content is such that it is possible to achieve the employability aspired to in the programme objective and to get a degree, which has an explicit profile with regard to the content.

		Exceptional	Meets quality requirements	n.r.
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		Х	

# 4 Academic environment and framework conditions

# 4.1 Faculty

The faculty consists of the Director, the Head of department and the whole faculty rank as PhD, professors, associate professors, assistant professors including full-time lecturers and part-time visiting lecturers of those persons who are hired in national and international companies, state and private organizations. The faculty members are encouraged to have and mostly show business experience, in addition to excellent academic credentials that contributes the integration of theory and practice. It is expected that visiting lecturers, of those persons who come from national and international companies and firms, as well as state and private organizations, have significant business expertise to equip students with the skills necessary for future success. Some students choose to specialize further in a particular field of international commercial arbitration, comparative taxation law or European Union internal markets.

During the faculty meetings visiting lecturers have an opportunity to discuss specific teaching methods and ideas as well as issues related to students' professional and career development. The students directly benefit from these activities as new ideas are applied in the classroom. Hence, the faculty is actively encouraged to be engaged in research activities that is often conducted using businesses as the source of data, which gives a chance to work with practitioners around the country. To note, teaching-related publications usually include articles about new introductions in corporate law, curriculum and their potential impact on student skills and employability, business management case and an experiential exercise on improvisation in the classroom.

The HSL verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of state given (Decree No. 230 of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on 17th of February, 2012 "Regulations of Competitive Hiring and Selection of Faculty and Researchers in the Institutions of Higher Education") criteria. In addition to these, KAZGUU adopted the following requirements for academically (AQ) and professionally qualified (PQ) status:

To qualify for an AQ status and be eligible to teach in the undergraduate programme, a faculty member should possess a PhD degree from an internationally recognized university and at least one published article in one of the internationally recognised journals (emerald, Springer or Interdisciplinary journals), approved by the Research and Budget Committee.

Doctoral students are academically qualified if they are in the ABD (all but dissertation) stage To qualify for teaching at the master's level, faculty should have at least one additional contribution (to be approved by the HSE Performance Appraisal and Promotion Committee).

To qualify for the PQ status at the undergraduate level a faculty has to prove the following aspects:

- At least a Master degree from an internationally recognized university
- At least five years of industry experience
- Internationally recognized professional certifications
- Be a member of professional organizations (optional)
- Ability to teach in English
- Active consulting practice
- Working with relevant community organizations, such as Chamber of Commerce, etc.
- A prior teaching at the master's level courses with positive references
- Be a board member (optional)
- Paper presented at professional meetings

The faculty members teaching experience of the department ranges from 2 to 35 years of work. Most of the teachers have experience in teaching for more than 5 years. Some teachers have practical experience in various government agencies, commercial organizations, etc. The university pays great attention to didactic qualification of faculty and steadily and systematically improves the skills of teaching staff through internships, seminars, courses and skills development workshops. 57 teachers improved their skills using internal and external resources during 2014 and 2015.

The faculty selection is done by the HSL Performance Appraisal and Promotion Committee (FPAPC), the appointment is made by the HSL Dean. The HR Department helps in announcing a vacancy and searching appropriate candidates.

Since the programme's coordinator is responsible for the internal collaboration, coordination and overall administration, he holds an enlarged session of the faculty at the end of each academic year to discuss the current programme development. The goals of these meetings are group evaluation of the programme developments as compared with the previous year (changes in number and geography of applicants, partnerships and cooperation, student academic and individual success); need for curricular changes results of students' evaluation of particular course units, the overall quality of the study programme and their factual workload; interaction problems between lecturers; making demands towards the administrative staff etc. After each question on the agenda is discussed, a group decision is made (by voting if needed) and responsibilities to implement changes are distributed. All decisions are recorded and have binding character

The programme management addresses the issues and supports to the students that arise with the learning process. He reacts to any students' complaints during the learning process It provides in-depth information for students about the programme organisation, schedule, module requirements and expectations, and other necessary details. The faculty support the students within office hours and via Platonus and Email in accordance with the schedule approved. Office hours' information is given in each syllabus. Additional consultancy might be provided by the faculty by appointment if needed.

# Appraisal:

The structure and number of teaching staff correspond with the programme requirements and ensure that the students reach the intended qualification objectives. A list of all lecturers and of the university's full-time staff in general shows the availability of the required capacity to implement the programme. The faculty's composition, consisting of full-time and part-time lecturers, guarantees that both the academic standards and the requirements of professional practice are fully satisfied.

According to the CVs the academic ability of the teaching staff is in line with the requirements of the programme for teaching. Besides, a high number of lecturers have long-year experience in teaching. The staff's pedagogical/didactical qualifications are in line with their tasks and have been verified. Measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. The practical business experience of the faculty is above-average and influences the teaching in an impressive way.

Internal collaboration and coordination is ensured by the programme's coordinator and can be seen in the meetings of the teaching staff. The faculty members cooperate with each other for the purpose of tuning the modules towards the overall qualification objectives. As affirmed by students of the programme during the on-site visit, the counselling of students by teaching staff is intensive. Student support is an integral part of the services provided by the full-time and

part-time faculty. The lecturers are available for the students outside specified office hours as well and e-mails are answered fairly quickly. Hence, the students are "fully content" with the support they receive by the faculty.

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.1	Faculty				
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		x		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty	Х			
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)	Х			
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)	х			
4.1.7(*	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)				х

# 4.2 Programme management

The Programme Coordinator is responsible for the programme academic quality. He is assigned by the Chair of Department from the faculty members and also an AQC member with voting right. His tasks are the academic supervision of the programme, the curriculum design, the promotion and development of research in a relevant field and the development of partnerships with appropriate stakeholders. He is also responsible for the communications with the faculty members and students regarding all issues related to the programme.

The administrative staff responsible for supporting students and faculty consists of:

- Director of School of Law
- Deputy Director of School of Law
- Head of Chairs
- · Assistant of ChairsStudents Advisors
- Chair of Department
- Programme Coordinator
- Four Committees
- Academic faculty members

All responsibilities and tasks are documented in separate regulations, until the end of 2016 the HSE Code of Practice will be presented which covers every process of decision making. All committees involve faculty members from each department and also elected students representing the student body.

# Appraisal:

The panel came to the view that the programme's coordinator is the stimulus of the programme well supported by lecturers and administration stuff. Based on the interviews with the programme's coordinator, the stuff and the students the panel is highly impressed by the

sincere way in which all participants successfully manage all the above mentioned tasks and include all relevant groups in developing the study programme systematically.

Furthermore, the administrative staff acts as a service provider for students and faculty during the entire study programme. Sufficient administrative staff is available and opportunities for continuous professional development of the administration staff are assured. Decision-making processes and responsibilities of the programme management and the administration staff are defined, students are able to participate.

		Exceptional	anantv	Meets quality requirements	meer allality	n.r.
4.2	Programme management					
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)		Х			
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty		х			

# 4.3 Cooperation and partnerships

Partnership with academic institutions has become a high profile issue engaging increasing number of students and staff. KAZGUU and Department of Postgraduate Education/School of Law have signed several partnership agreements with HEI abroad e.g. with the

- Seoul National University School of Law, South Korea
- Nagoya University Graduate School of Law and School of Law
- Russian academy of advocacy and notary
- Law faculty of Lomonossov Moscow State University
- University at Albany, State University of New York, USA

Some of them gave grounding to develop dual degree and academic mobility. Within the framework of academic mobility Master students are provided with an opportunity to study at partner – universities.

The School of Law and the Department of Postgraduate Programmes continuously interacts with the employers and organizations that render guidance in the academic process. The Coordinating Council of Employers of KAZGUU was established on January 17, 2015, and it is represented by the public bodies, public organizations and legal firms. It is a collegial, advisory and consulting body that supports School of Law in terms of enhancing the quality of academic programmes being focused on practical application of the students' knowledge, skills and public competences received, conducting joint applied research, and other forms of efficient interaction between School of Law and employers. The Council operates in accordance with the Regulations that has been approved on its first meeting.

The cooperation of the Higher School of Law with commercial enterprises and organizations on the program is implemented on the basis of a bilateral termless agreement. These enterprises and organizations are the bases of research and work-experience internships:

- Astana city Prosecutor's office,
- Astana Department of State Revenue,
- Astana Department of the penitentiary system,
- Court of Astana,
- Department of Foreign Trade of the Ministry of National Economy,
- all ministries,
- Arabtec Company,
- GRATA Law firm,
- Karashyganak Petroleum

Private judicial executor's office, etc.

Internship in organizations and enterprises of the city gives practical, scientific-research experience to students, which is reflected in the results of theses and affects the formation of their professional competencies. In addition to the internship supervisor students are also attached to the University supervisor, who ensures master (doctoral) students to pass internship program and its quality performance. Students, who have performed well during the internship period, are invited for employment by the heads of organizations and enterprises in the event of vacancies. The representatives of organizations and enterprises, with which the agreements have been concluded, take an active part in the social activities of the University, particularly in holding of Job fairs where students can submit their candidacy for employment provided by enterprises and organizations. This cooperation has a positive impact on the academic content of the program, which is initially focused on the employer and on the formation of the skilled professionals. This cooperation has a positive impact on the academic content of the program, which will initially be focused on the employer, on the formation of the skilled professional. A Table below provides a list of commercial enterprises and organizations that cooperates with School of Law and Department of Postgraduate Programmes

### Appraisal:

The scope and nature of cooperation with HEI abroad are plausibly presented and documented as well as aligned with the strategy of the study programme. Cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. In the view of the panel the conducted activities contribute to the development of the students' qualification and skills. The academic mobility is one way mobility so far, but the increasing number of courses offered in English as well as attractive location of the city encourage its future alignment.

The cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations is actively promoted by means of regular meetings of those who are involved in the study programme in responsible positions, in order to discuss the further development of the programme. Such cooperation has a formative impact on the contents of the programme and on the profile of the graduates. By means of provision of internships and jobs during the vacation, they significantly contribute to the development of qualifications and skills and to the quality of the final theses.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	n.r.
4.3	Cooperation and partnerships				
4.3.1(*	c) Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			x	
4.3.2(*	and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)		x		

# 4.4 Facilities and equipment

KAZGUU offers 26 study rooms equipped with onsite projectors and 40 portable kits of projectors for interactive teaching and learning. 366 computers which all are connected by Intranet can be used by teaching and administrative staff of the Higher Schools. Two independent, symmetrical, unlimited, 32 Mbs/ and 16 Mbs channels provide the University with

internet access and also WiFI for students and staff. Furthermore the university offers computer laboratories and multimedia rooms for the students. The whole IT infrastructure has been renewed in 2013. In this context a system of video-conferencing has been implemented which allows the HSE to conduct online lectures and to have meetings and discussions online. The online portal of the University includes a learning platform "Platonus" and a system of electronic documents management «Documentolog». Both serve the students to administrate their studies and to access all necessary documents online.

The KAZGUU (database) library includes of over 50,000 volumes of books, e-books, e-journals, articles, periodicals and 393377 items (including periodic publications). Necessary books are available in Russian and English language. During the semester the regular library service hours during semesters are six days a week from Monday to Friday 9:00 – 18:00. Qualified library staff provides assistance to students in searching necessary books, journals or access to international database. Access to relevant digital media is also available from the students' home. The KAZGUU Library is member of the International Association of Users and Designers of Digital Libraries and New Information Technologies (EBNIT Association, Moscow, Russia) and uses a lot of databases based on contracts with the Ministry of Justice etc.

## Appraisal:

The whole equipment of teaching rooms, library and the whole HEI is state-of-the-art. Especially the IT and technical equipment of the labs which allow the students to do their work with the specific components needed impressed the panel very much.

The opening hours of the library take students' needs sufficiently into account. Access to the literature and journals as well as to digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is ensured. The literature expressly required for the study programme is available in the library and also kept up to date.

		Exceptional	dilality	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)		х			
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			Х		

#### 4.4 Additional services

In January 2015 the KAZGUU University has established an Office of Professional Internship, Career and Employment (OPICE), which is a body of the Coordinating Council of Employers that is related to professional internships, traineeship of students and assistance in employment for University Alumni. Beyond that the University annually holds Job Fair with national and international companies and organizations seeking for employees. Thus, the Career Counselling and Placement Service is available throughout the semesters for graduate and undergraduate KAZGUU students seeking a job. So that assistance is provided to employers seeking either full- or part-time employees. Annual graduate student survey and feedback of those who are already full- or part-time employed show that during the study programme they are progressing and getting promoted in their organizations.

The Alumni Association of School of Law KAZGUU was established in 2014 as a platform for meetings, experience exchange between students and alumni, and support for comprehensive development of KAZGUU.

The mission of the Alumni Association is to unite alumni that care about the KAZGUU's traditions. The primary goals of the association are reached by:

- keeping the university traditions;
- enhancing the competitiveness of the university;
- promotion of the brand «KAZGUU University»;
- stimulation of the interest to the university from the applicant's side;
- meetings of alumni with KAZGUU students;
- development of database of KAZGUU alumni;
- improvement of the Alumni Alley;
- organization of Annual Alumni meetings for networking;

Alumni serve as mentor to various student organizations in the University. The Alumni Association is engaged with current students to share the heritage and traditions of KAZGUU University and the significant role that they as alumni can play after graduation.

# Appraisal:

Career counselling and placement services are offered to the students and graduates to promote their employability. The HEI provides sufficient resources.

In addition, career counselling and placement services are offered to the students and graduates on an individual basis. Such activities are planned on a long time basis, performed regularly, and are actively marketed. Sufficient staff is available for this purpose. Students have access to the HEI-wide corporate network. The HEI brings its graduates in contact with representatives from business enterprises at regular events.

Alumni activities are planned on a long-term basis, performed regularly, and are actively used for assessing and evolving the programme. Sufficient (staff) resources are available for this purpose.

		Exceptional		Meets quality requirements	n.r.
4.5	Additional services				
4.5.1	Career counselling and placement service		х		
4.5.2	Alumni Activities		Х		

### 4.6 Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)

The Financial Model is developed by the Finance Department for five years ahead and reveals positive cash flows. It is based on the assumption that the number of students will not decrease, as the university is not planning to increase the tuition fee except for an adjustment increment by the official inflation rate.

There is also a significant portion of government scholarship in the university revenue. Commercial revenue is coming from supporting commercial units aimed to invest into academic programmes. KAZGUU is a non-state joint stock company financed by own resources. 35% of university shares are owned by the Government which do not still give any preferences regarding financing. There is a state order (state scholarship) in regard to prepare

the defined amount of Master students. State order is implemented on general conditions without any privileges.

# Appraisal:

The existing system guarantees that every student, once enrolled for the programme, has the possibility to finish his studies.

		Exceptional	Meets quality requirements	n.r.
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)		x	

# 5 Quality assurance and documentation

The Quality Assurance Manager who reports directly to the rector is responsible for the collaboration between the Registrar, Higher School of Economics, Higher School of Law and the School of General Education and the Rector. The programme contents, structures and results are reviewed, analyzed and recommended for changes and improvements by the schools authorized committees/councils and follow the QA procedures defined on the Higher School level.

The responsibilities of the QAM include

- Planning for the academic year QA activities
- Coordinating the implementation of the QA activities
- Collecting data and preparing a summary report on QA
- Communicating the summary report to the Higher Schools and School of General Education
- Forming and organizing the Quality Assurance Committee's work on the university level.

The QAC on the university level is responsible for implementing and monitoring the quality assurance systems that promote academic integrity and effectiveness of the strategy. Quality Assurance of the programmes is done at the Higher Schools levels by the authorized committees or councils. At the schools levels faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. The surveys are conducted by the Registrar through the Platonus system. The review is conducted by the QAC. The QAM provides reliable data and analytical reports to the Rector and the Higher Schools Deans for the further use.

The deans of the Higher Schools are responsible for communicating the results of the surveys to the respective faculty members through the Academic Quality Committees/Council on the school level.

The role of the QAC Committee on the university level is

- To develop and implement quality assurance systems and procedures across the full range of the Higher School of Economics, the Higher School of Law and the School of General Education programmes
- To monitor the implementation of quality assurance procedures and processes university-wide.
- To undertake such reviews and audits that are necessary to safeguard the integrity and quality of the university's activities.
- To provide the information and analysis necessary to support decision-making at the university level and within the academic departments
- To advice the academic units on the quality implications of proposals, policies and strategic plans.

The Registrar Office conducts a teaching quality evaluation by students at the end of each semester, namely one week before the end of classes. The questionnaire called Faculty Teaching Evaluation Form (FTEF) covers questions regarding the workload, the quality of teaching staff, learning materials etc.. The survey results are processed by the Registrar and collected by the QAM. The QAM forwards the survey results to the HSE Dean who organizes a meeting and discusses the teaching evaluation results with the relevant members. The results of the committee discussion are communicated to the programmes' coordinators and the relevant faculty members. At the beginning of each semester the school dean conducts a meeting with students in the form of an open forum with a presentation which covers the teaching evaluation results and the measures taken to address the students concerns and recommendations. The results in an aggregated format are also published on the Platonus system.

The faculty members can complete a questionnaire, the results are collected by the QAM to include them into the summary report and to discuss the results by the Quality Assurance Committee with the administration of the university.

The survey for alumni is conducted on a continuous basis through the university website. The results are collected once a year by the HSE and addressed with the AQC/QAC. The survey aims to reveal the graduates' employment data. The academic quality issues with regard to the programme content and structure are also revealed through the Alumni Club meetings. The programmes' academic quality evaluation by employers is given through the HSE Business Advisory Council.

The programme documentation which is annually revised and approved is published in

- The HSE Catalogue (website, HSE offices)
- Programme Study Plans (Registrar, HSE departments)
- KAZGUU Academic Policy (KAZGUU Catalogue)
- Programme Descriptions (Platonus, HSE Catalogue)
- KAZGUU Examination Regulations (all HSE offices, Registrar, Platonus)
- Bachelor Thesis Guidance (all HSE offices, website)
- Internship Policy (website, all HSE offices)
- Code of Conduct (website)
- HSE Brochure (website, HSE administrative offices, Registrar)85
- Course Timetable (Platonus)
- Performance Evaluation Results (Dean's office, University HR)
- The PAPC, AQC, DC, R&B committees' minutes (Dean's office)

Current news and information about the study programme are usually published online. The HSE is notably active on social networks like facebook.

# Appraisal:

A quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the programme with respect to its contents, processes, and outcomes, has been set up. It takes into account the evaluation results and the analysis on student workload, success rate, and graduate employment. Faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. Responsibilities are clearly defined.

Evaluation by the students is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality control by the faculty is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

An external evaluation is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

The study programme is described in detail. This documentation is constantly updated and easily accessible for interested parties both in print and in digital form, which ensures a high level of transparency.

Press relations and network communication are actively maintained. In its annual report the HEI presents a summary of the activities of the academic year.

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	n.r.
5.1*	Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)		х	
5.2	Instruments of quality assurance			
5.2.1	Evaluation by students		Х	
5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty		Х	
5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties		Х	
5.3	Programme documentation			
5.3.1*	Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)	Х		
5.3.2	Information on activities during the academic year	Х		

# Quality profile

HEI: KAZGUU University

Master: Master in InternationI Law (LL.M.)

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1	Objectives				
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)	x			
1.3	Positioning of the study programme				
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market	×			
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates ("Employability")	х			
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept	х			
2	Admission				
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)	x			
2.2	Counselling for prospective students	Х			
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)				Х
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)				x
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.	Contents, structure and didactical				
	concept				
3.1	Contents				
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
3.1.2*	name (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking		Χ		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects		Х		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2	Structure				
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)		x		

		Exceeds Exceptional quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2.3*	Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.2.4	Equality of opportunity	Х			
3.3	Didactical concept				
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers	Х			
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors			x	
3.4	Internationality				
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)	x			
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			х	
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty		Х		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents		Х		
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
4.	Academic environment and				
	framework conditions				
4.1	Faculty				
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		х		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		Х		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty	Х			
	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)	X			
4.1.6*		Х			
4.1.7(	Student support in distance learning				
*)	(only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)				x
4.2	Programme management				
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)	x			
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty	х			
4.3	Cooperation and partnerships				
4.3.1(	Cooperation with HEIs and other		X		
*)	academic institutions or networks		^		

Exceptional				n.r.
-------------	--	--	--	------

(Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)  4.3.2( Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)  4.4 Facilities and equipment  4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group xooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion) x  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities x  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5.1* Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students x  5.2.2 Evaluation by students x  5.3 Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Information on activities during the academic year			requirements	requirements
4.3.2( Cooperation with business enterprises *) and other organisations (Asterisk		(Asterisk Criterion for cooperation		
*) and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)  4.4 Facilities and equipment  4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and documentation  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.3 Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		programmes)		
Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)  4.4 Facilities and equipment  4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	4.3.2(	Cooperation with business enterprises		
Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)  4.4 Facilities and equipment  4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group x rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion) x  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities x  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students x  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty x  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties x  5.3 Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	*)	and other organisations (Asterisk	v	
4.4 Facilities and equipment  4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		Criterion for educational and vocational	×	
4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty 5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		programmes, franchise programmes)		
equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  x  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  x  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  x  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  x  5.3.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	4.4	Facilities and equipment		
rooms (Asterisk Criterion)  4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT		
4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)  4.5 Additional services  4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		equipment of teaching and group	X	
4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		rooms (Asterisk Criterion)		
4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)	X	
service  4.5.2 Alumni Activities  4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	4.5	Additional services		
4.5.2 Alumni Activities	4.5.1	Career counselling and placement	v	
4.6* Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)  5 Quality assurance and documentation  5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the		service	*	
(Asterisk Criterion)  5	4.5.2	Alumni Activities	Х	
(Asterisk Criterion)  5	4.6*	Financing of the study programme		
5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the			^	
development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  x  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  x  5.3.2 Information on activities during the				
processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  x  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.1*			
Criterion)  5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the			x	
5.2 Instruments of quality assurance  5.2.1 Evaluation by students  5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  x  5.3.2 Information on activities during the				
5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.2	,		
5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty  5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  x  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.2.1	Evaluation by students	X	
5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty		
employers and third parties  5.3 Programme documentation  5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  X  5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni,		
5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)  5.3.2 Information on activities during the			X	
Criterion) X 5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.3	Programme documentation		
5.3.2 Information on activities during the	5.3.1*	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		
V			X	
academic year ^	5.3.2		×	
		academic year	^	