

# Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes



**112<sup>th</sup> Meeting on 13 September 2019**

<b>Project Number:</b>	18/092
<b>Higher Education Institution:</b>	L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University
<b>Location</b>	Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan
<b>Study Programmes:</b>	5B050800 Accounting and Auditing (Bachelor) 6M050800 Accounting and Auditing (Master) 5B050900 Finance (Bachelor) 6M050900 Finance (Master) 5B090200 Tourism (Bachelor) 6M090200 Tourism (Master)
<b>Type of Accreditation</b>	re-accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes has taken the following decisions:

According to § 12 (2) in conjunction with § 16 (1) in conjunction with § 16 (2) of the “Special Conditions for awarding the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programme Accreditation “FIBAA Programme Accreditation”, the study programme is re-accredited with one condition.

Period of Accreditation: 13<sup>th</sup> September 2019 until the end of winter semester 2026/27.

Condition:

The principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention – general recognition of study periods abroad if no substantial differences can be proven by the higher education institution – are to be implemented in the study and examination regulations.

Proof of meeting this condition is to be submitted by 12<sup>th</sup> June 2020.

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.

## Assessment Report

---

---

**Higher Education Institution (HEI):**

L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU)

---

**Bachelor/Master study programmes:**

5B050800 Accounting and Auditing (Bachelor)

6M050800 Accounting and Auditing (Master)

5B050900 Finance (Bachelor)

6M050900 Finance (Master)

5B090200 Tourism (Bachelor)

6M090200 Tourism (Master)

---

**Qualification awarded on completion:**

Accounting and Auditing:

Bachelor of Economics and Business in the Speciality 5B050800 Accounting and Auditing

Master of Economic Sciences in the Speciality 6M050800 Accounting and Auditing (scientific and pedagogical direction)

“Master of Economics and Business” in the Speciality 6M050800 Accounting and Auditing (profile direction)

Finance:

Bachelor of Economics and Business in the Speciality 5B050900 Finance

Master of Economic Sciences in the Speciality 6M050900 Finance (scientific and pedagogical direction)

Master of Economics and Business in the Speciality 6M050900 Finance (profile direction)

Tourism:

Bachelor in Services in the Speciality 5B090200 Tourism

Master of Science in the Speciality 6M090200 Tourism (scientific and pedagogical direction)

Master in Services in the Speciality 6M090200 Tourism (profile direction)

# General Information on the study programmes

---

## **Brief description of the study programmes:**

### Finance

The objective of the Bachelor programme is to educate experts, who are competitive on the labor market, owning profound theoretical and practical preparation in the field of finance in private and state sectors of economy.

The Master programme aims to equip students with modern knowledge in practical, scientific and pedagogical activities as well as with management decision-making methods in order to enable them to promote financial reforms in the Republic of Kazakhstan and to teach financial disciplines.

### Accounting and Auditing:

The Bachelor programme has the goal to prepare graduates who have fundamental knowledge and experience in accounting and auditing. Mastering the programme shall provide the skills to solve professional tasks of a wide range, taking into account social and ethical aspects.

The objective of the Master programme is the preparation of highly qualified graduates with in-depth scientific knowledge and pedagogical and professional training in accounting, analytical and audit activities, who are demanded in international and domestic companies.

### Tourism:

The Bachelor programme is aimed at the formation of theoretical knowledge and practical skills in the field of tourism services and management of tourism entities. The graduates shall be able to effectively implement the labor functions envisaged by the professional standard "Tourism", to timely assess the prospects for tourism development and to develop adaptation activities.

At the Master level, research and strategy development have a stronger focus. Students develop science-based regional and national projects for the development of tourism activities on the basis of knowledge of modern tourism.

---

## **Type of study programmes:**

Bachelor programmes

Master programmes

---

## **Projected study time and number of ECTS points assigned to the study programmes:**

all bachelor programmes: 4 years / 8 semesters

152 Kazakh credit points / 240 ECTS credit points: Finance, Accounting & Auditing

153 Kazakh credit points / 242 ECTS credit points: Tourism

master programmes (scientific and pedagogical direction): 2 years / 4 semesters, 59 Kazakh credit points / 120 ECTS credit points

master programmes (profile direction): 1 year / 2 semesters, 33 Kazakh credit points / 60 ECTS credit points

---

## **Mode of study:**

full-time

---

## **Didactic approach:**

Study programme with obligatory class attendance

---

**Double/Joint Degree programmes:**

no

---

**Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:**

Accounting and Auditing (Bachelor): 196 students

Accounting and Auditing (Master): 21 students

Finance (Bachelor): 252 students

Finance (Master): 19 students

Tourism (Bachelor): 636 students

Tourism (Master): 21 students

---

**Programmes cycles start in:**

both autumn and spring semester

---

**Initial start of the programmes:**

Accounting and Auditing (Bachelor): 2004

Accounting and Auditing (Master): 2009

Finance (Bachelor): 2004

Finance (Master): 2009

Tourism (Bachelor): 2004

Tourism (Master): 2009

---

**Type of accreditation:**

Reaccreditation for all study programmes

# Procedure

A contract for the reaccreditation of the three Bachelor and three Master programmes was made between FIBAA and the Kazakh Independent agency of accreditation and rating (IAAR) as mediator of the L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU) on 7<sup>th</sup> May 2019.

IAAR is an independent Kazakh accreditation and rating agency in Higher Education Area, which is listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR). Since 2013 FIBAA and IAAR cooperate thanks to a Memorandum of Understanding.

In 2014, the initial accreditation of the Bachelor and Master programmes at hand were conducted by IAAR. The study programmes have been accredited for five years. As an agency listed in EQAR, IAAR follows the European Standards and Guidelines. Therefore, FIBAA recognised the initial accreditation of IAAR and has conducted in cooperation with IAAR a joint re-accreditation of the study programmes at hand.

In June 2014, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan followed the recommendation of the Republican Accreditation Council and decided to include FIBAA to the National Register of Accreditation Agencies. In March 2017, this registration has been successfully extended for another period of five years. This means that FIBAA's decisions on accreditation of Kazakh higher education institutions and study programmes are thus officially recognised by the Ministry. Accordingly, FIBAA must also consider the national requirements by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan in its accreditation procedures.

On 7<sup>th</sup> May 2019, the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included detailed descriptions of the programmes and, subsequently, some further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met. Also in May, FIBAA appointed a review panel. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of:

**Prof. Aurelia Kogler**

University of Applied Sciences Chur, Switzerland  
Professor of Tourism and Hospitality Industry  
(Hospitality Industry, Destination Management, Wellness Management)

**Prof. Dr. Manfred Sargl**

Bundeswehr University Munich, Germany  
Professor for Finance and Controlling  
(Cost and Performance Accounting; Investment and Financing; Controlling; Economics)

**Prof. Dr. Wolfgang Maennig**

University of Hamburg, Germany  
Professor of Economics, esp. Economic Policy  
(Economics, Economic Policy)

**Christoph Balk**

German Certified Accountant and Tax Consultant, Rheinberg, Germany  
Audit Certificates on: Risk Management & Internal Audit Systems (Audit of Financial Statements & of Governance Systems, German Tax Agency & Compliance, Governance Consulting incl. tasks such as conception, project management, coaching, training, internal audit)

**Prof. Dr. Ardak Sakhanova**

Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, Kazakh Ablai Khan University of International Relations and World Languages (Almaty city)

**Dr. Zamzagul Sultanova**

Candidate of Economic Sciences, Zhangir Khan West Kazakhstan Agrarian- Technical University (Uralsk city)

**Prof. Dr. Sedep Mirzhakypova**

Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, Narxoz University (Almaty city)

**Prof. Dr. Issakhova Parida**

Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, Almaty Management University (Almaty city)

**Dr. Andrey Koval**

Candidate of Economic Sciences, A.Baitursynov Kostanay State University (Kostanay city)

**Dr. Aliya Aktymbayeva**

Candidate of Geographical Sciences, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty city)

**Kanatova Zhansaya**

4<sup>th</sup> year Student Bachelor of Arts Economics, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, Nazarbayev University (Nur-Sultan city)

FIBAA project manager: Viktoria Tischanski

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, requested by the panel, and an on-site visit. The on-site visit took place on 3 - 5 June 2019 at the HEI's premises in Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan. At the end of the on-site visit the panel has given a short feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2019. The statement on the report was submitted on 21<sup>st</sup> August 2019; it has been taken into account in the report at hand.

# Summary

The Bachelor programmes Accounting and Audit, Finance and Tourism as well as the Master programmes Accounting and Audit, Finance and Tourism (“the programmes”) offered by L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University in Nur-Sultan (Kazakhstan) fulfil with few exceptions the FIBAA quality requirements for Bachelor programmes and for Master programmes and can be re-accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for seven years starting on the 13<sup>th</sup> September 2019 until the end of winter semester 2026/27, under conditions. The programmes are in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid at the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

The panel members identified need for improvement regarding the study and exam regulations. They recommend the accreditation on condition of meeting the following requirements:

- Condition  
The principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention – general recognition of study periods abroad if no substantial differences can be proven by the higher education institution – are to be implemented in the study and examination regulations. (see Chapter 3.2).

Proof of meeting these requirements is to be submitted by 12<sup>th</sup> June 2020.

The panel members identified several areas where the programmes could be further developed:

- International orientation of the study programme design (see Appraisal in Chapter 1.2)
- Logic and conceptual coherence (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.1)
- Rationale for degree and programme name (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.1)
- Methods and scientific practice (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.1)
- Modular structure of the study programme (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.2)
- Study and exam regulations (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.2)
- International contents and intercultural aspects (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.4)
- Internationality of student body (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.4)
- Internationality of faculty (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.4)
- Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (see Appraisal in Chapter 4.1)
- Instruments of quality assurance (see Appraisal in Chapter 5)

The measures which the HEI will eventually take in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members will have to be considered in the context of the next re-accreditation.

There are criteria in which the programmes exceed the quality requirements:

- Multidisciplinary competences and skills (see Appraisal in Chapter 3.5)
- Programme director (Tourism Bachelor and Master programme only) (see Appraisal in Chapter 4.2)
- Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty (see Appraisal in Chapter 4.2)
- Career counselling and placement service (see Appraisal in Chapter 4.5)

For the overall assessment of the programmes, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

## 0.1 Information on the institution

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (“ENU”, “University”) was founded in 1996 by the Decree of N.A.Nazarbayev, the first President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The core reason for establishing this higher education institution has to be seen in context of a Eurasian Economic Union founded in 2014, which provides a strategic direction for ENU's development and content of study programmes.

ENU positions itself as a classical university and is managed by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Supervisory Board. Currently, ENU has over 19,000 people.

ENU is a member of various international organisations and associations, including the Eurasian Association of Universities, the Association of Asian universities, the Regional network "Education and training in nuclear technology (STAR-NET)", the Network University of CIS countries and the University of SCO (Shanghai cooperation organisation) countries, Turkish Inter-University Union as well as the Scientific and Educational Consortium between Higher Education Institutions and Research Institutes of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Republic of Belarus.

The university cooperates with more than 350 universities, research centers and scientific organisations from 52 countries in Europe, America and Oceania, Asia and Africa. The main areas of cooperation are academic mobility, internships of students, joint research, invitation of professors as well as cooperation in the framework of the Erasmus+ programme.

The university successfully implemented double diploma programmes. As of 2018-2019, there are 30 joint educational programmes with 13 universities partners. Additionally, the opening of cultural and educational centers in Belarus, China, Turkey and Iran became an important area of international cooperation.

Education at undergraduate and postgraduate levels is implemented in 13 faculties and only in the form of full time study. There are 66 departments, 18 research institutes, 3 scientific laboratories and 7 scientific centers at the university. Disciplines of the study programmes are taught in Russian, Kazakh and English language. Admission is carried out on the basis of the state educational grants and on a contractual basis. By number of state education scholarship holders (72% of the total number of students), ENU is in the lead among Kazakhstani universities.

Currently, 169 educational programmes of bachelor, master and doctoral programmes have passed accreditation by international and national agencies (ACQUIN, IQAA, IAAR, ASIIN).



## 0.2 Further development of the programmes and implementation of recommendations from previous accreditation

In 2014, the initial accreditation of the Bachelor and Master programmes at hand were conducted by IAAR. The study programmes have been accredited for five years. As an agency listed in EQAR, IAAR follows the European Standards and Guidelines. Therefore, FIBAA recognised the initial accreditation of IAAR and has conducted in cooperation with IAAR a joint re-accreditation of the study programmes at hand.

In accordance with the recommendations of the IAAR panel, ENU has:

- introduced a regular (annual) monitoring and analysis of external and internal risks for the study programmes, whereby the results are used in the management of the programmes at hand (risk management measures are taken);
- developed and implemented a system of Key Performance Indicators (KPI) to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of ENU's structural units and their interaction;
- increased the volume and duration of the industrial internship in each of the Bachelor study programme;
- extended the involvement of employers in the development and evaluation of the study programmes, so that programmes are updated taken into account employers' requirements, labour market trends and the needs of society;
- attracted practitioners and employers as external reviewers of Bachelor and Master theses;
- organised visiting lectures of the foreign teachers and representatives of the professional practice;
- provided further opportunities for the academic mobility of teachers involved in the programmes;
- continued the development of a polylingual educational environment by organising polylingual students groups;
- prepared and published electronic textbooks;
- extended the range of information provided via the platform Platonus and via the website of the University and its faculties;
- improved the access to the electronic resources of ENU's library;
- increased the number of modules in English language (see Chapter 3.4).

The statistical data of the Finance Bachelor programme are the following:

		1. Cohort 2014-2015	2. Cohort 2015-2016	3. Cohort 2016-2017	4. Cohort 2017-2018	5. Cohort 2018-2019
# Study Places		195	150	183	225	168
# Applicants	∑	65	45	63	75	56
	f	40	35	39	32	27
	m	25	10	24	43	29
Application rate		33,33%	30,00%	34,43%	33,33%	33,33%
# First-Year Student	∑	65	45	63	75	56
	f	40	35	39	32	27
	m	25	10	24	43	29
Rate of female students		0,62	0,78	0,62	0,43	0,48
# Foreign Students	∑	6	6	4	4	3
	f	1	2	2	2	1
	m	5	4	2	2	2
Rate of foreign students		0,09	0,13	0,06	0,05	0,05
Percentage of occupied study places		33,33%	30,00%	34,43%	33,33%	33,33%
# Graduates	∑	53	64	72	60	54
	f	34	35	38	35	31
	m	19	29	34	25	23
Success rate		81,54%	142,22%	114,29%	80,00%	96,43%
Dropout rate		18,46%	-42,22%	-14,29%	20,00%	3,57%
Average duration of study		4	4	4	4	4
Average grade of final degree		96	94	95	97	

The statistical data of the Accounting and Audit Bachelor programme are the following:

		2014-2015	2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
# Study Places		206	202	208	222	196
# Applicants	∑	206	202	208	222	196
	f	220	158	167	26	145
	m	41	43	33	29	51
Application rate		100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
# First-Year Student	∑	62	56	33	64	43
	f	30	42	25	50	28
	m	32	14	8	14	15
Rate of female students		0,48	0,75	0,76	0,78	0,65
# Foreign Students	∑	1	0	4	1	0
	f	1	0	3	1	0
	m	0	0	1	1	0
Rate of foreign students		0,016	0,000	0,121	0,016	0,000
Percentage of occupied study places		30,10%	27,72%	15,87%	28,83%	21,94%
# Graduates	∑	66	56	0	0	0
	f	42	25	0	0	0
	m	14	8	0	0	0
Success rate		106,45%	100,00%	0,00%	0,00%	0,00%
Dropout rate		-6%	0%	100%	100%	100%
Average duration of study		4 year	4 year	4 year	4 year	4 year
Average grade of final degree		4,87	4,74	4,86	4,7	0

The statistical data of the Tourism Bachelor programme are the following:

		1. Cohort 2014-2015	2. Cohort 2015-2016	3. Cohort 2016-2017	4. Cohort 2017-2018	5. Cohort 2018-2019
# Study Places		195	150	183	225	168
# Applicants	∑	65	45	63	75	56
	f	40	35	39	32	27
	m	25	10	24	43	29
Application rate		33,33%	30,00%	34,43%	33,33%	33,33%
# First-Year Student	∑	65	45	63	75	56
	f	40	35	39	32	27
	m	25	10	24	43	29
Rate of female students		0,62	0,78	0,62	0,43	0,48
# Foreign Students	∑	6	6	4	4	3
	f	1	2	2	2	1
	m	5	4	2	2	2
Rate of foreign students		0,09	0,13	0,06	0,05	0,05
Percentage of occupied study places		33,33%	30,00%	34,43%	33,33%	33,33%
# Graduates	∑	53	64	72	60	54
	f	34	35	38	35	31
	m	19	29	34	25	23
Success rate		81,54%	142,22%	114,29%	80,00%	96,43%
Dropout rate		18,46%	-42,22%	-14,29%	20,00%	3,57%
Average duration of study		4	4	4	4	4
Average grade of final degree		96	94	95	97	

The statistical data of the Finance Master programme are the following:

		1. Cohort 2014-2015	2. Cohort 2015-2016	3. Cohort 2016-2017	4. Cohort 2017-2018	5. Cohort 2018-2019
# Study Places		20	25	30	35	25
# Applicants	∑	14	7	9	11	8
	f	9	5	7	8	4
	m	5	2	2	3	4
Application rate		0,00%	28,00%	30,00%	31,43%	32,00%
# First-Year Student	∑	14	7	9	11	8
	f	9	5	7	8	4
	m	5	2	2	3	4
Rate of female students		0,64	0,71	0,78	0,73	0,5
# Foreign Students	∑	0	0	0	0	1
	f	0	0	0	0	0
	m	0	0	0	0	1
Rate of foreign students		0	0	0	0	0,125
Percentage of occupied study places		70,00%	28,00%	30,00%	31,43%	32,00%
# Graduates	∑	9	14	7	8	9
	f	8	9	5	5	8
	m	1	5	2	3	1
Success rate		64,29%	200,00%	77,78%	72,73%	112,50%
Dropout rate		35,71%	-100,00%	22,22%	27,27%	-12,50%
Average duration of study		2	2	2	2	2
Average grade of final degree		100	94	95	96	

The statistical data of the Accounting and Audit Master programme are the following:

	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019
# Study Places	15	23	21
# Applicants	15	23	21
Application rate	7	13	17
	8	10	4
# First-Year Student	100%	100%	100%
Rate of female students	8	10	11
	4	8	9
	4	2	2
# Foreign Students	0,5	0,8	0,8
Rate of foreign students	0	0	0
	0	0	0
	0	0	0
Percentage of occupied study places	0	0	0
# Graduates	53,3%	43,5%	52,4%
Success rate	8	9	0
	4	5	0
	4	4	0
Dropout rate	100%	90%	0%
Average duration of study	0%	10%	100%
Average grade of final degree	2 year	2 year	2 year
# Study Places	4,85	3,85	4,92

The statistical data of the Tourism Master programme are the following:

		1. Cohort 2014-2015	2. Cohort 2015-2016	3. Cohort 2016-2017	4. Cohort 2017-2018	5. Cohort 2018-2019
# Study Places		20	25	30	35	25
# Applicants	Σ	14	7	9	11	8
	f	9	5	7	8	4
	m	5	2	2	3	4
Application rate		0,00%	28,00%	30,00%	31,43%	32,00%
# First-Year Student	Σ	14	7	9	11	8
	f	9	5	7	8	4
	m	5	2	2	3	4
Rate of female students		0,64	0,71	0,78	0,73	0,5
# Foreign Students	Σ	0	0	0	0	1
	f	0	0	0	0	0
	m	0	0	0	0	1
Rate of foreign students		0	0	0	0	0,125
Percentage of occupied study places		70,00%	28,00%	30,00%	31,43%	32,00%
# Graduates	Σ	9	14	7	8	9
	f	8	9	5	5	8
	m	1	5	2	3	1
Success rate		64,29%	200,00%	77,78%	72,73%	112,50%
Dropout rate		35,71%	-100,00%	22,22%	27,27%	-12,50%
Average duration of study		2	2	2	2	2
Average grade of final degree		100	94	95	96	

# Programmes' Descriptions and Appraisals in Detail

## 1. Objectives

### 1.1 Objectives of the study programmes (Asterisk-Criterion)

According to L. N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU) the qualification objectives of all study programmes are determined on the basis of the national development priorities defined by the strategy "Kazakhstan – 2050" and the Kazakh educational policy:

- maximum satisfaction of current and future needs of the national economy in specialists;
- modernisation of teaching methods;
- meeting the needs of the state, stakeholders and students in quality educational services.

#### Finance (Bachelor)

The objective of Bachelor programme "Finance" is to train competitive financial specialists adapted to changing requirements of the labor market and to new technologies. Aimed professional competencies of the students include: the ability to use modern methods of managing financial flows of an enterprise, controlling costs and ensuring efficient use of resources, controlling income and providing a firm with financial funds (including credits), carrying out tax planning, building and strategic planning of the company's financial policy, conducting financial and economic analysis of the company's transactions and preparing financial statements. Furthermore, the study programme is aimed to provide abilities and skills in the fields of financial resources and risk management, organisation and planning of businesses, markets, financial and information flows, banking, securities, insurance, taxation, budget, treasury.

#### Finance (Master)

The objective of the Master programme "Finance" is to train professionals and to provide competitive skills for the labor market with profound theoretical and practical expertise in finance within the private and public sectors of an economy. Students shall be able to apply modern knowledge in practical, scientific and educational activities, and shall be provided with skills and abilities in the field of financial, managerial, analytical, advisory, research and teaching activities.

The following professional competencies shall be provided: applying methods of analytical work related to the financial aspects of both commercial and non-profit organisations with various organisational and legal forms, including financial and credit institutions, state authorities and local self-governments, developing research and development programmes, preparing assignments for groups and individual performers, to teach financial and monetary disciplines.

#### Accounting and Auditing (Bachelor)

The Bachelor programme "Accounting and Auditing" is aimed at providing students fundamental knowledge in the fields of accounting and auditing. Graduates shall be able to apply the gained theoretical knowledge in practice and to develop their professional skills. Mastering the programme should provide the students the ability to solve a wide range of professional tasks, taking into account social and ethical aspects. Graduates shall particularly

possess skills in organisation of accounting processes, in processing accounting information, accounting registers, accounting forms as well as development of accounting policies and preparation and presentation of financial statements.

### Accounting and Auditing (Master)

The Master programme "Accounting and Auditing" is aimed to give the students the opportunity to study profound theories in the field of Accounting and Auditing and to apply them using previous knowledge and practical skills in accounting, auditing and analysis. The Master programme is focused on the preparation of specialists capable of organising, managing and ensuring the activities of accounting and analytical units (business services), as well as methodically providing audit services and performing audit activities.

### Tourism (Bachelor)

The objective of the Bachelor programme "Tourism" is to train competitive specialists with theoretical knowledge and practical skills in the field of tourism services and management of tourism supply entities. They shall be able to effectively carry out professional activities, also timely assess prospects of tourism development, and to develop adaptation measures.

Objected qualification characteristics of the graduates of the programme are the following:

- Possess economic, organisational and managerial competencies to organise touristic services;
- Possess skills of researching tourist areas and of preparing tourist routes;
- Know the theoretical foundations of tourist activities and understand the peculiarities of tourist sphere development;
- Development of practical skills of professional activity in the field of tourism;
- Understand modern specifics of tourism infrastructure development both at the national and international levels, and know the specifics of regulating tourist activities;
- be able to promote tourist (hotel) services in the tourist market and determine development strategies;
- Plan and organise processes of developing a tourist product (services) as part of the tourist business development, including development of a touristic business ownership.

### Tourism (Master)

The objective of the Master programme "Tourism" is to prepare students for being able to manage processes of promotion of services within the framework of the functioning tourist enterprise, and to develop science-based regional and national projects for the development of tourism activities on the basis of modern tourism technology and science.

Graduates shall through fundamental and special trainings perform the following professional activities:

- Development of research tools, analysis of research data and their results; preparation of surveys, reports and scientific publications;
- Organisation and conduct of research, including quantitative statistical surveys and qualitative surveys;
- Ability to analyse theoretical and econometric models on processes, phenomena and objects related to the field of professional activities, evaluation and interpretation of model results;
- Implementation of research results in real economy and commercialize new developments;

- Implementation and development of a system of socio-economic indicators for economic entities;
- Development of strategies for development and operation of enterprises, organisations and units;
- Teaching of economic disciplines in educational institutions and organizations for higher and professional education, including development of teaching material.

## Appraisal:

The qualification objectives of each of the programmes are explained and sufficiently presented in relation to the target group, targeted professional field and societal context of the related discipline. They embrace academic proficiency, comprehensive employability, as well as the development of the individual student's personality. Therefore, the described objectives and skills to be acquired correspond with the aspired bachelor and master level at graduation. The programmes take into account the requirements of the Kazakh national qualification framework.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 1.2 International orientation of the study programmes design (Asterisk Criterion)

ENU is a member of international organisations and associations, including the Eurasian Association of Universities, the Association of Asian universities, IREG, the Regional network "Education and training in nuclear technology (STAR-NET)", the Network University of CIS countries and the University of SCO (Shanghai cooperation organisation) countries, Turkish Inter-University Union, Scientific and educational consortium between higher education institutions and research institutes of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Republic of Belarus. The University cooperates with more than 350 universities, research centers and scientific organisations from 52 countries in Europe, America and Oceania, Asia and Africa.

The international orientation of the study programme design is manifested through different channels.

ENU states that during the development of the study programmes, foreign universities, which offer the same or similar study programmes, have been observed and analysed in order to examine and implement their contents.

Furthermore, the faculty staff takes an active part in international conferences, seminars and round tables held in universities of near and far abroad. This international experience is documented in reports and used for the development of the study programmes. The knowledge gained with such international activities is used for faculty's researches and publications. Research results are also implemented in teaching processes.

ENU has entered into several agreements with foreign educational institutions to support academic mobility for students, as well as professional development and mobility for teachers. These agreements include academic exchange programmes, such as Erasmus+ and DAAD programmes. Foreign lecturers are invited to carry out educational programmes

and to give lectures. Some lectures and materials are offered in three different languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English) in each of the programmes.

## Appraisal:

Each of the programme designs take into account international aspects. Academic mobility is facilitated for students and teaching staff. International exchange takes place. International experience promotes international content and orientation in each of the study programmes.

However, in order to increase international mobility and exchanges, the panel recommends to carry out further demand analysis with data from international and/or global business and labor markets to identify needs of particular adjustments. The panel also recommends to place a stronger focus on compatibility of ENU's own study programmes with those of foreign universities.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 1.3 Positioning of the study programmes

The goal of the university is to educate graduates with higher and postgraduate education, which meets the needs of the industrial and innovative development of the Kazakh economy as well as the demands of the internal and external labor market; and to create a diversified educational environment that promotes high-quality professional and civic development of students.

As main competitors of the Bachelor and Master study programmes in Nur-Sultan ENU identified the Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International trade, the KAZGUU University named after M. S. Narikbaev, the University "Turan-Astana" and the Kazakh University of technology and business. As main competitors in the market of educational services within the Republic of Kazakhstan, ENU identified the Al-Farabi Kazakh national University, the Karaganda state University named after academician E. A. Buketov and the University "Turan-Almaty".

Compared to programmes of these Kazakh institutions, ENU sees its advantages in the given relevance of its study programmes and in student's competitiveness on the labor market.

According to ENU, its departments systematically adapt qualification goals taking into account the requirements of targeted students and employer groups, by constantly reviewing requirements for adequacy and relevance of qualification goals. ENU states that taking into account requests of the employers and demands of the labor market, annual adjustments of the study programmes are made. To ensure that the study programmes cover important study fields in each of the areas of Accounting and Audit, Finance and Tourism, and to produce graduates who are compatible on related relevant markets.

Adaption of goals and adjustments of study programmes shall ensure that graduates of the programmes also possess cognitive and behavioural knowledge and skills that enable them to provide services in private, public and/or non-profit organisations.



## Appraisal:

The reasons given for the positioning in the educational market of these study programmes are plausible.

The arguments in support of graduate employability on the basis of the stated qualification objectives are convincingly presented. Future fields of employment for graduates are plausibly set forth.

With ENU being a state university that offers a broad range of courses, the study programmes are convincingly integrated into its overall strategic concept. The study programmes' qualification goals are in line with ENU's mission and strategic planning.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.3	Positioning of the study programme					
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market			X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)			X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept			X		

## 2. Admission

Kazakhstan has a national system of admission to higher education. The admission to Bachelor programmes at all HEIs of Kazakhstan is performed on a competitive basis taking into account the scores of applicants in one of two national tests for secondary school graduates - the Unified National Test (UNT) and the Comprehensive Test (CT). The test scores are also crucial for the distribution of state educational grants, which allow students to study at HEIs free of charge.

High school graduates of the current year take part in the Unified National Test (UNT) which, according to the state regulations from 2018, takes 230 minutes and contains five subjects, of which three are mandatory:

1. Mathematics,
2. Reading literacy (including ability to generalize, compare etc.) and
3. History of Kazakhstan.

Another two profile subjects can be chosen by school graduates in view of the requirements of programmes they intend to study.

Currently it is possible to take the UNT four times a year, one time free of charge, and three times for minor fees.

School graduates of the previous years, graduates of professional schools as well as those who graduated from secondary schools abroad can participate in Comprehensive Test (CT), which currently comprises the same subjects and has the same duration as well as the same amount of points as the UNT.

For the Bachelor programmes in Accounting and Auditing as well as in Finance the profile test subjects are: 1) Maths and 2) Geography. For the Bachelor programme in Tourism the profile subjects are: 1) Geography and 2) Foreign language.

The University itself does not select applicants for Bachelor programmes. Enrolment is carried out by ENU in conformity with the results of the meeting of the state Republican Competition Commission for awarding state educational grants under the MES RK. The Commission is taking its decisions based on the outcomes of the competitive selection in accordance with UNT/CT scores.

The maximum UNT/CT score in all 5 tests is 140 points. The minimum entrance requirement for enrolling at HEIs in Kazakhstan is 50 points. It is necessary to score at least 65 points for a granted tuition at ENU's Bachelor programmes.

In 2018, the passing scores for state educational grants on Bachelor programmes at hand (Kazakh and Russian group, respectively) were as follows: 136/132 points in Finance, 135/135 points in Accounting and Auditing, 134/127 points in Tourism.

Admission to Master programmes is performed according to the state admission regulations as well. Applicants need to pass two entrance examinations: the foreign language test and the programme-based examination.

The standardized foreign language test in English, German or French is organised by the National Testing Centre of the MES RK. Alternatively, applicants may present language certificates with the certain minimum amount of points/ minimal level requirements:

- for English: TOEFL ITP (at least 460 points), TOEFL IBT (at least 87 points), TOEFL PBT (560 points), IELTS (at least 6.0),
- for German: DSH (C1), TestDaF (C1),
- for French: TFI (B1), DELF (B2), DALF (C1), TCF (at least 400 points)

After submitting the relevant language certificate, applicants are exempt from taking a language proficiency test and are awarded 100 points out of the maximum of 200 points for both exams.

The programme-based exam (written or oral) is organised by the University. The admission decision is made by the admission commission, consisting of teachers specialized in the respective fields. The list of questions for examination is proposed by the respective chair and signed by the Vice Rector for Academic Affairs.

The programme-based entrance exam for the Master programme Finance includes questions on the following subjects: 1) Finance; 2) Banking; 3) Financial management. The entrance exams for the Master programme Accounting and Audit include the following subjects: 1) Fundamentals of Accounting, 2) Fundamentals of Audit, 3) Financial Accounting 1, 4) Financial accounting 2. For the Master programme Tourism, the subjects are 1) Tourism Management; 2) Tourism Marketing 3) Fundamentals of Tourism.

In order to receive a state educational grant, applicants need to achieve a total score of at least 150 points for both kind of exams for the scientific and pedagogical Master programme and at least 130 points for the profile Master programme. If applicants have the same amount of points, priority is given to the ones with more points in the programme-based test.

Applicants who have passed the entrance exams, but lost the competition for state grants, may be enrolled to the Master programmes on a fee basis.

For applicants who completed a Bachelor programme with different subject profiles than the aspired Master programmes, the lists of prerequisite subjects and credit point necessary is set out.

Foreign citizens are generally admitted to the studies at ENU on a fee basis, with the exception of the students enrolled within the framework of bilateral or multilateral agreements of Kazakhstan (e.g. citizens of Ukraine, Tajikistan, Kyrgyzstan and the member countries of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation).

On the website of ENU, there is an admission section for future students (<http://www.enu.kz/ru/abiturientu/>), where applicants can find necessary information about the admission rules and requirements for Bachelor and Master programmes. A brief information on admission is also available on the websites of related faculties (<http://ef.enu.kz/page/forincoming>).

A special Call Center for Admission has been established at ENU. Applicants can contact the University administration via phone, email or Skype.

The Center for Vocational Guidance and Testing of ENU provides advice to potential students and carries out explanatory and preparatory work for the admission campaign jointly with the Department of International Cooperation and other departments.

In order to recruit more students for the Bachelor programmes, the University works closely with secondary schools in the different regions of Kazakhstan. During the school year, ENU

organises University tours for the target groups of school students including visiting laboratories, classrooms and gaining insight into the admission and study processes through the presentations of study programmes.

Besides that, the University places information about its programmes in newspapers, and holds annual subject school olympics for pupils in the final school classes. The Faculties also organise Open Days for potential students, providing them with advice about programmes, admission rules, academic mobility, etc.

Upon the decision of the Republican Competition Commission on awarding state educational grants for Bachelor students, the order “On enrolment to higher education study programmes” is issued by ENU. The decision on enrolment to Master programmes made by the admission commission of ENU is also documented in a special order. Orders on enrolment are published on the website of the University and on ENU’s information board.

The University has an Appeals Commission to which applicants can turn if they are not satisfied with the decision on admission.

Professional experience of applicants is not required, neither on the Bachelor nor on the Master level.

Once Bachelor students are enrolled, the University conducts an IELTS based English language test to determine the students’ proficiency level. This test has become necessary due to the implementation of the principles of multilingual education at the universities of Kazakhstan. Based on the results of this test, students can participate in a range of modules taught in English.

Beyond the obligatory modules in “Foreign Language” and “Professional Foreign Language” taught in the first two study years of all Bachelor programmes, students can improve their language skills independently in one of ENU’s language centers. There are also preparatory language courses in foreign languages at the Institute for Advanced Studies and Additional Education of the University for those interested in entering the Master programmes.

## Appraisal:

The rules for admission to the ENU's Bachelor and Master programmes are developed on the basis of the state regulatory documents issued by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan. These rules are documented and openly available for interested parties on the website of the University.

The panel members find that ENU’s counselling processes and offerings meet the needs of applicants. Potential students can directly turn either to the Call Center for Admission or to the Center for Vocational Guidance and Testing of ENU for clarification of specific admission-related questions or e.g. questions on career perspectives after the graduation which is important for selecting the right study programme. Personal dialogue between applicants and the University is ensured.

As a National University, ENU has the advantage that on the Bachelor level it can enrol only the applicants with a high score in the national tests, which works towards selecting particularly qualified students. On the Master level, the University also has the opportunity to select the candidates according to their individual performance in relevant subjects. The selection procedures for both levels of study are transparent and ensure that qualified students are admitted.

Due to the fact that some of the modules are conducted in English, the English language test is organised by the University shortly after the admission to the Bachelor programmes in order to ensure that students are able to successfully complete these modules. The language centres of ENU offer English courses for students who are considered to be below the necessary level at the time of admission.

On the Master level, admission requirements with regard to the foreign language proficiency are in place in order to make sure that Master students can participate in courses taught in English and read foreign literature. These and other requirements ensure that students are able to successfully complete their study programme.

The admission decision is based on transparent criteria and is communicated in writing.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)					X
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

### **3. Contents, structure and didactical concept of the programmes**

#### **3.1 Contents**

##### General Contents of Bachelor Programmes

ENU generally follows the State Comprehensive Education Standards for higher and postgraduate education (GOSO), issued in form of a decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The GOSO standards describe for each educational programme mandatory educational activities, learning objectives and goals, examination formats and the number of required credit scores, while the concrete courses' contents are to be developed by the university. The concrete design of a particular programme represents a mixture between state-prescribed elements and those elaborated by ENU independently. Approximately 40% of programme content are state-prescribed elements which have to be approved by the government. At this point, some law changes have to be noted according to which prescriptions and approvals of curricula by the government are, beginning with 2018, not necessary any longer.

All of the Bachelor programmes consist of the following components:

- Mandatory modules (subject to the Ministry) – (marked with “GDC CC” within the curriculum)
- Mandatory modules for the speciality (component of the Higher Educational Institution) – (marked with “PD CC”)
- Elective modules (marked with “PD EC”)

ENU states that all of its Bachelor programmes ensure the students' general education by containing the “General Education” Module (Information and communication technologies, Foreign language, Kazakh/Russian language, Professionally oriented Kazakh language) and a Module on social and ethical competencies (Information and communication technologies, Modern history of Kazakhstan, and Philosophy). Thereby, efforts are undertaken to link the general content to the specific professional and scientific competences, which are necessary for the particular field of study.

All Bachelor study programmes contain four internships (one educational internship, two industrial internships and one pre-diploma research internship) in the 2<sup>nd</sup>, 4<sup>th</sup>, 6<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> semester, with a total of 12 ECTS credit points in Finance and in Accounting and Audit, and 13 ECTS credit points in Tourism.

The introductory (educational) internship in the 2<sup>nd</sup> semester is carried out at the University. The professional internship (industrial practice) for students of advanced semesters is in most cases carried out in external organisations. The goal of the pre-diploma research internship in the 8<sup>th</sup> semester is the further development of acquired research skills and the mastery of the methodology of research specific issues developed in the thesis project. After completing the internship, students should have gained further experience in methods and techniques of empirical research and should be able to apply this knowledge for the solution of theoretical and applied problems.

The learning outcomes of Bachelor courses differ between so-called Professional Competences (PC), General Professional Competences (GPC) and Universal Competences (UC). For the Master level, no further universal competences but professional and general professional competences are provided. The module descriptions each contain a detailed description of the learning objectives and learning outcomes for each course.

Bachelor students regularly start their work on the Bachelor thesis in the seventh semester and finish it in the eighth semester. The average number of written pages is 60 to 70. Credits are awarded for the thesis.

Upon completion of the Bachelor Programmes, ENU awards the title “Bachelor of economics and business” for Finance and Accounting and Audit and the title “Bachelor in Services” for Tourism.

The curricula of the study programmes are trilingual. Because of their extent and in order to ensure better legibility, they are set out in the Annex.

### Finance (Bachelor)

The study programme provides for in total 17 compulsory courses (CC) and 27 elective courses (EC). Students have to decide on their own which elective courses they would like to attend.

According to ENU, compulsory subjects such as “Introduction to Finance”, “Corporate Finance”, “Financial Management”, and/or elective components such as “Financial Analytics”, “Financial Analysis of Commercial Bank Activities”, etc. are aimed that students gain additional competencies and practical skills.

In order to transform theoretical knowledge into practical skills, the Finance subdepartment engages employers and practice experts in the teaching process as well as in the development of the educational process. For example, according to the proposals made by employers, it was deemed desirable to improve the professional competencies of students by incorporating courses that cover evaluation and analysis of the financial statements of commercial banks. Thus, the Finance subdepartment has included the discipline: “Financial analysis of a commercial bank” in its educational programme.

Another example for increasing focus on transformation of theory into practice given by ENU is the expanded number of courses for studies on global financial, credit and banking systems: International Finance, International Financial Institutions, Credit and Banking Systems of Foreign Countries. Referring to the ongoing worldwide globalisation processes and the need of knowing worldwide practices, employers have suggested to include disciplines for studies on foreign finances.

ENU aims with the increasing international focus the students to improve their professional competencies and future specialists to have improved educational level in the fields of financing and banking.

The disciplines that are studied in the Bachelor programme find their logical continuation in advanced courses at the next level of education – in the Master’s programme:

No	Disciplines of the educational program 5B050900 «Finance»	Disciplines of the educational program 6M050900 «Finance»
1.	Introduction to Finance	Theory of Finance
2.	Financial management	Financial Management (Advanced)
3.	Taxes and taxation	Fiscal planning
4.	Banking	Banking regulation
5.	Banking Monitoring and Supervision	Modern banking supervision
6.	Insurance	Modern insurance
7.	Financial risks	Financial Risk Management Companies

The study of general education disciplines allows to enhance interdisciplinary thinking through developing general professional and universal competencies: e.g. in courses such as “Mathematics in Economics“ and ”Modern History of Kazakhstan”.

Students of the Finance Bachelor programme learn methodological concepts that are oriented towards independent work with educational and scientific literature, and legal acts (laws), and towards collection and systematisation of practical and statistical materials. The competences and skills in research and development activities shall, in particular, be developed on the basis of the disciplines ”Financial Management“ and ”Corporate Finance”.

#### Accounting and Audit (Bachelor):

There are 17 compulsory courses and 29 elective courses in total.

The combination of theory and practice is carried out through industrial internships in organisations within private and public sectors at end of each year of studying (2<sup>nd</sup>, 4<sup>th</sup>, 6<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> semester).

In order to combine theory and practice, employers are actively involved in the development of the study programme. The following disciplines were recommended by employers:

№ t/d	Name Employer organizations	The number of approved disciplines in the EP	
		5B050800 «Accounting and audit»	6M050800 «Accounting and audit»
1	RSE on PVC "Center for the Study of Financial Violations" Accounts Committee for Control over the execution of the republican budget	1.State audit, 2.IC Accounting: State institution, 3. The basis of the audit of financial statements 4. Basics of compliance audit, 5. Basics of performance audit	1. Consolidation of financial statements in public institutions, 2. Specific types of public audit, 3.International standards for public sector financial reporting, 4. State audit and financial control
2	Kaz Pharma Astana LLP	1. The accountant in business 2. Accounting, reporting and taxation of small and medium-sized businesses 3. Information systems in tax accounting 4. Accounting in construction 5. Tax accounting 6.International taxation and its accounting	1. Project Analysis 2. Crisis management 3. Analysis of financial statements
3	LLP «CHA Center»	1. Accounting in road transport organizations 2.Bases of accounting in public institutions 3. Practical audit in public institutions 4. Audit-related services	1. Cost accounting and management 2. Management accounting in modern conditions 3. Controlling
4	LLP "Association of Professional Accountants and Auditors of Kazakhstan"	1. Financial Accounting 1 2. Financial Accounting 2 3. Management accounting 1 4. Management Accounting 1 5. Audit 6. Practical audit	1. Accounting in modern conditions 2. Accounting in accordance with IFRS 3. In-depth management accounting 4. International accounting and
			audit: theory and practice 5. Consolidation of financial statements



The disciplines that are studied in the Accounting and Audit Bachelor programme find their logical continuation in advanced courses at the next level of education – in the Accounting and Audit Master programme:

EP levels	Name of the discipline			
Undergraduate	Financial accounting 1	Management Accounting	Economic analysis	Audit
Master of Science and Pedagogy	Financial Accounting (Advanced)	In-depth management accounting	Industry analysis Financial statement analysis	International Standards on Auditing

According to ENU, the following competencies and skills in the field of research activities shall be formed through a number of disciplines:

- Knowledge and use of information technology, e.g. through Information and Communication Technologies, General Theory of Statistics, Economic Analysis;
- Ability to search, analyse and evaluate information regarding organisation of business processes, e.g. through Management Accounting, Management Analysis, Entrepreneurship and Business Accounting;
- Collection and analysis of information in order to identify potentials of enterprises and regions, and to identify business development opportunities, e.g. through Financial Accounting, Accounting in Construction, Analysis in Sectors of the Economy.

### Tourism (Bachelor)

The students have to pass 19 compulsory courses and 25 elective courses during their Bachelor studies in Tourism.

According to the Tourism Department, the learning outcomes of the study programme have both a theoretical and a practical orientation. Therefore, professional competencies include the development of:

- Skills on planning and organising the development of the tourist product (services) in the framework of the tourist business development, including own one;
- Knowledge and skills on promoting tourist (in particular hotel) services in the tourist market and determining development strategies;
- Ability to understand modern specifics of tourism infrastructure development at both of national and international levels, as well as knowledge of peculiarities in regulation of tourist activities;
- Practical skills of professional tourism activities.

Additionally, in order to strengthen the processes of integration of theory and practice, reports on results of internships and related materials are used within the educational processes. With analysing economic activities and business processes of tourist enterprises, students shall develop recommendations for reorganising organisational structure, and for improvement of business processes.

Interdisciplinary thinking shall be manifested with disciplines such as "Fundamentals of Tourism", where e.g. knowledge in the field of geography and skills in working with cartographic materials shall be provided. The discipline "Technique and tactics of active types of tourism" is aimed to develop student's knowledge in the field of local history, first aid and ecology. For example, the discipline "Basics of tourist areas research" shall create skills not only in identifying the touristic potential of a particular territory, but also knowledge on the geographical characteristics of the region.

The discipline "Digital technologies in analysing hospitality industry" shall form interdisciplinary skills by using computer technology and software for analytical work in this industry. Thus, with this business related discipline, students actively shall use Microsoft Office applications, namely Excel, Power Point, as well as SPSS, Statistica, etc.

Formation of competences and skills in the field of research activities shall be carried out, in particular with the following disciplines:

- Information and Communication Technologies, Digital Technologies in Analysing Hospitality Industry, Digital systems of tourist and recreational analysis – the disciplines are envisaged to acquire skills of using information technologies for research activities;
- Methods and mechanisms for developing a business plan in the fields of tourism, entrepreneurship and business – are aimed to form the ability to search, conduct analysis and evaluate information regarding the organisation of business processes in the field of tourism;
- Basics of tourist and recreational design, Tourist potential of the regions of Kazakhstan, Basics of tourist and local history work – are aimed to form the ability of collecting, analysing information in order to identify touristic potentials of a particular region and to identify possibilities to develop tourist destinations.

Additionally, the discipline "Methods and mechanisms for developing a business plan in tourism" (3<sup>rd</sup> semester) requires students to write a term paper which should create not only research skills, but also academic writing skills.

#### General Contents of Master programmes

All Master programmes consist of the following three components:

- Mandatory modules (subject to Ministry) – (marked with "GDC CC" in the curriculum)
- Mandatory modules for the speciality (component of the Higher Educational Institution) – (marked with "PD CC")
- Elective modules (marked with "PD EC")

In each of the Master programmes, there are five compulsory courses and between 9 and 11 elective courses.

Along with the formation of theoretical knowledge and practical skills, the development of competences in the field of research activities shall be provided. Thus, 7 Kazakh credits (28 ECTS credit points) are planned for student's research work (SRW).

Students can present their results of research work in proceedings of scientific conferences, such as the International Scientific Conference of Young Scientists, and/or they can send them to international and republican competitions of scientific projects.

Integration of theory and practice shall be carried out by studies on the specifics of modern research methods and applying them in the framework of their Master thesis.

In addition, there is a discipline "Pedagogy" which is aimed for students to develop pedagogical skills, and, to transform into pedagogical practice with students conducting seminars and laboratory classes.

ENU offers the Master programmes in two versions: a "Scientific and Pedagogical Master" for theoretical training that lasts for four semesters and a "Profile Master" that includes just two

semesters for theoretical training.

For both versions, same learning outcomes are defined in the first two semesters. While the “Profile Master” is completed after this time, the “Scientific and Pedagogical Master” shall provide additional knowledge in scientific research and teaching methodologies.

The aim of the “Profile Master” is to educate high professional staff for the labor market and to provide them with in-depth subject knowledge as well as practical and managerial skills. The “Scientific and Pedagogical Master” is aimed to educate professionals with additional in-depth knowledge in the field of university pedagogy and psychology, and additional skills of organising and conducting research. The target group are prospect PhD students; only graduates of the “Scientific and Pedagogical Master” have the admission to apply for a Phd programme.

For Master programmes with the pedagogical profile, there are a teaching internship in the 3<sup>rd</sup> semester and a research internship in the 4<sup>th</sup> semester in order to prepare Master students for academic work in both research and teaching.

During their teaching internship, which is mostly performed at ENU and of which the content is planned by scientific supervisors, Master students shall learn methodologies of teaching, to draw up teaching materials, to conduct lectures and seminars in the presence of supervisors etc. At the end of any internship, a report is written and publicly defended by Master students at Chair meetings.

The research internship is carried out in research institutions and at any HEIs in Kazakhstan and abroad under the control of scientific supervisors at ENU and of internship coordinators at partner institutions. Students shall collect research experience geared to the topic of their thesis. This experience and the research results shall then be outlined in an internship report, which, in the final stage, shall be defended at a meeting of the Chair.

The formal system of examination is clearly defined in the programmes (see also Chapter 3.2). Bachelor students need to pass a State Examination on the history of Kazakhstan in the first year of study. For finishing their programme, they need to have completed all modules and successfully defend a thesis.

The study and examination regulation rely on the rules specified in the Decrees of the Ministry of Education and Science, which were integrated in the academic policy of the University. According to these regulations, there are four main forms of controlling the performance in theoretical education of Bachelor and Master students:

- The current control, which is a systematic assessment of students’ performance during the semester. The forms of the current control depend on the specific module and are selected by teachers. They can include survey, written control, presentation of homework, colloquia, essays, reports, tests, project work.
- The mid-term control, which includes the results of current control; usually, there are two periods of the mid-term control per semester, whereby each period lasts for one week.
- The final control, which is conducted in the written, oral, test or combined form after the completion of the study of the entire module during the examination session; the form and the procedure of the examination for each module are set by the Academic Council of the faculty.

- The final attestation, which is conducted in the form of state examination and the defence of the thesis for Bachelor students and in form of a state comprehensive examination and the thesis/project defence for Master students.

Master students shall work on their thesis during their whole study time. The thesis shall contain approximately 90 pages. The State Attestation Commission, whose members are appointed by the decree of the Rector and the Chair is approved by the Ministry of Education and Science, and, is responsible for conducting the state comprehensive examination for Master and PhD students as well as the defence of Master and PhD theses. The state comprehensive examination for Master students is held not later than one month before defending the Master thesis. Master students who have passed a comprehensive exam with at least satisfactory grade are allowed to defend their thesis.

Upon completion of the Master programme, ENU awards the title “Master of Economics and Business“ for Finance and Accounting and Audit (profile direction ) and “Master of Economic Sciences” for the scientific and pedagogical direction. In Tourism “Master of Science” (scientific and pedagogical direction) and “Master in Services” (profile direction) is awarded. These degrees and programme names follow the Classifier of the Specialities of Higher and Postgraduate Education in the Republic of Kazakhstan, which is nationally used to ensure transparency in the higher education and on the job market for graduates as well as for other applied purposes, e.g. for the state educational grant system. The different titles of the Master degrees illustrate the difference between the two masters and ensure transparency towards the public. The transparency and clarification towards students is ensured, too.

While forming economic, legal, and professional competencies, ENU places emphasis also on a responsible, and conscientious, competent approach to the solution of various controversial situations.

In order to cultivate the ethics necessary for professional growth, the study programmes shall provide knowledge on and application of ethical standards for professional behaviour.

Research ethics and academic integrity as crucial ethical aspects are addressed in such documents as the academic policy of the University, the Code of Honor of Students, which are published online and discussed during lectures and counseling hours. Since 2016, the university successfully operates an automated information system “Anti-plagiarism” to check research work of students and scientific papers for plagiarism.

## Appraisal:

The panel finds that the curricula of all Bachelor and Master programmes generally reflect the qualification objectives of the study programmes. However, the panel sees some potentials for improvement with regard to the content and the structure of the programmes.

The panel sees that the Tourism Bachelor and Master programmes show a lack of financial contents. The graduates have to have skills and competences in financial operations in order to be successful in the labor market. During the on-site visit the panel had the opportunity to talk to employers and representatives of the labor market. They confirmed that often graduates, who start working at their organisations/companies, indeed do not have enough knowledge in financial basics. Thus, the panel recommends to insert more topics with financial content such as business and cost accounting, reporting and analysis into the curriculum.

Furthermore, the panel sees the range of elective disciplines within the Finance Bachelor and Master programmes to be too wide. The panel appreciates the opportunities for the students

but still, recommends reconsidering some sector specific differentiation on core subjects. Differentiation could be, for example, public sectors versus private sectors. Additionally, the panel recommends to raise the number of practical case studies in order to provide opportunities for the students to apply knowledge and to promote their employability.

In general, the panel considers the mandatory internships as very helpful to promote students' employability and their individual and professional development. The internships help the students to get familiar with the nature and demands of the related professional field. Bachelor and Master thesis can be written about issues identified during the internships. The panel appreciates that both the lecturer and the internship coordinator give a feedback on students' internship reports.

Regarding all of the programmes, it has not become clear to the panel which individual tracks are possible for the students. The curriculum shows a broad offer of elective courses and also how many of them the students have to attend. But it does not transparently show which specialisation areas are possible in the framework of elective disciplines. During the on-site visit the panel talked to students and has seen the automated Platonus system. The panel has no doubt that the students know the structure of the study programmes and get advice to build an individual study track. However, the panel recommends reconsidering whether the possibilities of an individual study track can be shown more transparently in the curriculum.

During the on-site visit the panel noted some mathematical inconsistencies in the summary table displaying the amount of obtained credit points within the modular education programme. It concerns only the Bachelor programmes for each of Finance, Tourism and Accounting and Audit. For example, the Bachelor programmes Finance has a wrong number in the total sum of Kazakh credits – 153 instead of 145 Kazakh credits. The panel recommends to revise the table and to correct the mathematical inconsistencies.

The programmes ensure that graduates have methodological competence, are empowered to conduct academic work and can understand and assimilate specialist literature. Methodological competences are described as learning outcomes in the curricula of all study programmes. The students are made familiar with relevant scientific methods on both the Bachelor and the Master level. This is ensured by specific seminars such as Pre-diploma Research Internships in the Bachelor programmes and research internships in the Master programmes. However, during the on-site visit the panel had the opportunity to read just a minor number of Bachelor and Master thesis in English language and, therefore, is not convinced that methodologies applied fully corresponds to worldwide standards. The panel recommends to strengthen the exchange with international research partners and to benefit from knowledge transfer regarding international standards of scientific methodology.

The governmental framework in the Republic of Kazakhstan stipulates the teaching of a range of interdisciplinary courses within the bunch of general education courses, but leaves the detail teaching concept individually to the HEI. ENU's individual conception of the Bachelor and the Master programmes this concept is consequently harnessed by means of electives, inner-course linking with aspects and interactions with specific contents of other disciplines.

The programmes also contain ethical aspects and their relevance and meaning for accounting, finance and business. The level of performance in examinations and the theses are aligned with the learning outcomes of the courses in terms of form and content. The requirements are in line with the level necessary to attain the desired qualification level. The exams are characterised by a wide variety of test formats. The final theses are evaluated based on previously published and coherently applied criteria, rules, and procedures. The students prove, especially in their thesis, their ability to do scientific work and the achievement of the study programme's qualification objectives.

The names of the programmes and of the degree titles awarded upon completion of the

programmes correspond to the state rules in Kazakhstan. However, the panel does not agree that the degree titles of the programmes reflect the content and the learning outcomes of the programmes. For example, the curriculum of the Bachelor programmes Finance and Accounting and Auditing, which both award the degree “Bachelor of Economics and Business”, have no substantial amount of economic content. The panel finds that in each of the programmes the degree titles are not compatible with the curricula.

Furthermore, the panel considers that using degree titles such as Bachelor of Arts (B.A.) / Bachelor of Science (B.Sc.) / Master of Arts (M.A.) / Master of Science (M.Sc.) would make the study programmes more comparable in the European Higher Education Area and would therefore encourage and simplify students’ academic mobility.

During the on-site visit, the panel has received the information that with the entry into force of the new law in autumn 2019, which provides the universities in Kazakhstan more autonomy, it could be possible to rename the degree titles. The panel strongly recommends to make use of this autonomy and to rename the degree titles according to their content.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.1	Contents					
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2*	Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 3.2 Structure

The Bachelor and Master programmes in Accounting and Audit have the following structure:

<b>Bachelor</b>	
Projected study time	4 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	240 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1 ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 26 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Pre-Diploma internship - 9 ECTS Writing and defence of diploma project - 8 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

<b>Master</b>	
Projected study time	2 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	120 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1 ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 9 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Scientific-research work of master student 28 ECTS are divided into 4 semesters. Research internship - 12 ECTS Writing and defence of the final thesis - 7 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

The structure of the Bachelor and Master programmes in Finance are carried out as follows:

<b>Bachelor</b>	
Projected study time	4 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	240 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1 ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 20 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Pre-Diploma internship - 9 ECTS Writing and defence of diploma project - 8 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

<b>Master</b>	
Projected study time	2 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	120 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1 ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 7 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Scientific-research work of master student 28 ECTS are divided into 4 semesters. Research internship - 12 ECTS Writing and defence of the final thesis - 7 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

The Bachelor and Master programmes in Tourism have the following structure:

<b>Bachelor</b>	
Projected study time	4 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	242 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 11 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Pre-Diploma internship - 9 ECTS Writing and defence of diploma project - 8 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

<b>Master</b>	
Projected study time	2 years
Number of Credit Points (CP)	120 (ECTS)
Workload per CP	1ECTS = 30 hours
Number of modules	Overall 3 modules
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	Scientific-research work of master student 28 ECTS are divided into 4 semesters. Research internship - 12 ECTS Writing and defence of the final thesis - 7 ECTS
Number of contact hours	Contact hours: at least 30% of the total hours

The State Comprehensive Education Standards for higher and postgraduate education (GOSO) define the standard duration and the overall workload of the study programmes:  
 4 years (240 credit points) for the Bachelor programmes;  
 1 year (60 credit points) for the Master programmes of the profile direction;  
 2 years (120 credit points) for the Master programmes of the scientific and pedagogical direction.

The planning and organisation of the educational processes at ENU are carried out on the basis of the university-own curricula. There are three types of curricula to be distinguished:

- the Basic Curricula,
- the Individual Curricula and
- the Working Curricula.

The Basic Curriculum is the main document defining the structure of each of the study programmes. It contains:

- Passport of the programme including code and name of the programme, its application area, the relevant legal base as well as the profile map of the programme: its objectives and concept;
- Qualification characteristics of graduates;
- Competency map / profile of the programme, a table combining the required professional competences as defined in professional standards issued by employers' associations, intended learning outcomes as well as the corresponding modules in which the intended competences and outcomes are to be achieved;
- Curricular overview of the related programme for all semesters, including names of the modules and subjects taught, language of instruction, workload in Kazakh and ECTS credit points, volume of hours for different types of study activities, forms of examination, codes of competences to be acquired and the responsible chair.

In addition to the Basic Curriculum, a Catalogue of Disciplines (subjects) is annually developed, which is a systematic annotated list of all subjects offered with the particular



programme, both obligatory and elective. According to the GOSO, the volume of elective modules and subjects in the Bachelor programmes should be more than 55 % of the total curriculum, in the Master programmes more than 76 %. The Catalogue of Disciplines reflects the prerequisites of each discipline and is aimed at providing students with the opportunity of individually selecting the appropriate elective subjects.

On the basis of the Basic Curriculum and the Catalogue of Disciplines, Bachelor students, assisted by their advisers, compile their Individual Curricula consisting of obligatory subjects and individually selected electives. The choice of modules and subjects shall be carried out in consideration of the obligatory sequence of study. A student may not be registered for the module, if he or she had not mastered the prerequisites in the previous semester.

Master students, assisted by their supervisors, develop individual working plans which include the Individual Curriculum, the individual plan of experimental / research work, the plan of internships, the topic, structure and the implementation plan of their final project / thesis and a plan of scientific publications.

Working curricula of programmes are constructed for an academic year on the basis of the Basic Curricula and the Individual Curricula of students and are approved by the Academic Council and the Rector of the University. Working curricula provide a framework for creating a schedule of studies as well as the calculation of teachers' workload.

An academic year consists of two semesters: the autumn and the spring semester, each has a duration of 15 weeks. The terms of organisation of all periods of study of an academic year are specified in the academic calendar.

ENU is involved in academic mobility programmes with partner universities; students are recommended to participate in these programmes during their studies. The issues of academic mobility and the recognition of periods of study at other (including foreign) HEIs are laid down in ENU's "Regulation on Academic Mobility". According to this regulation, for mobility students Learning Agreements are signed beforehand with partner universities. Academic periods spent abroad are recognised on the basis of transcripts of records within the programmes of academic mobility with the partner HEIs.

Following the state regulations, the University uses the national credit system, where 1 Kazakh credit corresponds to a varying number of academic hours, depending on the level of study and the type of educational activities:

A type of activity	Workload for 1 RK credit
Theoretical training	45 hours
Educational practice	15 hours
Teaching practice (pedagogical)	30 hours
Internship (industrial)	75 hours
Internship (research)	120 hours
SRWM (SRWD)	120 hours
Final examination	105 hours

Each academic hour of classroom work of students has to be complemented by a corresponding number of hours of independent work of students.

One academic hour corresponds to different amounts of minutes for particular types of educational activities. In general, one academic hour is equal to 50 minutes, except for the studio work where one academic hour is equal to 75 minutes, as well as laboratory work and sports where one academic hour is equal to 100 minutes.

For the purposes of academic mobility and international accreditation, ENU also uses the

ECTS system with one ECTS credit point corresponding to 30 academic hours. The recalculation of Kazakh credits into ECTS credit points and vice versa is carried out by the aid of conversion coefficients defined by the state:

A type of activity	Limits of the conversion factor
Theoretical training	1,5-1,8
Educational practice	0,5-0,6
Teaching practice (pedagogical)	1-1,2
Internship (industrial)	2,5-3
Internship (research)	4-4,8
SRWM (SRWD)	4-4,8
Final examination	3,2-4,5

During the on-site visit the panel was informed that the University is currently planning a complete transition from the national credit system to ECTS.

According to the state regulations, the maximum workload for Bachelor students including the self-study must not exceed 54 academic hours (50 minutes) per week. The maximum workload for Master students is 57 academic hours per week.

The University also states that it uses the results of the students' surveys as the basis for the analysis of the real student workload.

The design of all programmes is based on a modular system of studying. One module can comprise one or more subjects and end with a final control (see below). The duration of one module is between one and two academic semesters. The University uses a national relative grading system, which is comparable to the ECTS grading scale. The Grade Point Average (GPA, the average value of educational achievements of students) is calculated for each student for every academic year.

Letter grades	Grade Point Value	Grade Percentage Value	Traditional System of Grading
A	4,0	95-100	Өте жақсы/Отлично/ Excellent
A-	3,67	90-94	
B+	3,33	85-89	Жақсы/Хорошо/ Good
B	3,0	80-84	
B-	2,67	75-79	
C+	2,33	70-74	
C	2,0	65-69	Қанағаттанарлық/ Удовлетворительно/ Satisfactory
C-	1,67	60-64	
D+	1,33	55-59	
D-	1,0	50-54	
FX	0,5	25-49	Қанағаттанарлықсыз/ Неудовлетворительно/ Unsatisfactory
F	0	0-24	

The University issues the Diploma Supplement in the national format for all its graduates.

In order to monitor the current achievements of students, an individual performance rating of each student is composed two times during a semester based on the results of the current and the mid-term control (on a 100-percent-scale). All ratings are published in the "Platonus" automated information system. Upon completion of the module the rating of admission is determined: only the students who have a rating of at least 50 % are admitted to the final control (module examination). The overall grade of a module is composed of the grade for

current control (60 %) and the final control (40 %).

ENU provides equal opportunities and gender equality for its students and staff following the State Law „On state guarantees of equal rights and equal opportunities for men and women”. During the on-site visit, the panel noted that a significant proportion of the academic and administrative staff as well as three of five Vice Rectors are female. In the programmes Tourism and Accounting and Audit there is the majority of female students. In the programmes in Finance there is a relatively even split between female and male students.

As part of the social policy of Kazakhstan, a wide range of instruments is in place to support socially disadvantaged students. These instruments are implemented at ENU. There are quotas defined by law for the admission of disabled students and orphans. For these and other categories of disadvantaged persons, allowances and scholarship are provided by the state and the University. The provision of support to students with disabilities or in special life situations is regulated in the ENU's Rules on internal university grants, benefits and social assistance for students. Students also have advisers whose tasks include supporting their mentees in finding individual solutions for individual problems.

## Appraisal:

With regard to the overall structure of the study programmes, ENU follows the national state regulations and the international standards.

The Basic Curricula and the Catalogues of Disciplines provided by the University for each programme show how the curricula are constructed and how the modules are grouped.

The programme assigns credit points per module. The practical components, such as internships, are designed and integrated in such a way that credit points can be acquired. The panel sees that the structure of the programmes generally supports the smooth implementation of the curricula and contributes towards achieving the defined learning outcomes.

While the ECTS system is used at ENU mostly for the purposes of student mobility and international accreditation procedure, the national credit system based on the ministerial regulations is still commonly applied in practice. This system is based on contact hours and a corresponding number of hours for self-guided work, but not on actual student workload. Due to the need of recalculation from Kazakh credits into ECTS credit points, academic semesters of full-time study do not always sum up to 30 ECTS credit points, and the ratio between Kazakh and ECTS credit points varies from case to case. The panel welcomes ENU's plan to use the ECTS more extensively in the future and recommends to implement this credit system in full compliance with the ECTS Users' Guide.

The panel also recommends to involve all of the teaching staff in the implementation process of the ECTS, as they are they are the main persons applying them in daily practice. Prior to that, they should all become informed about the principles of the ECTS and the prerequisites for its thorough introduction.

The module descriptions for the modules taught in English language are provided by ENU in English. Further extensive module descriptions (Educational and Methodological Complex of the Disciplines including the syllabi) are only available in Russian language and have been subject to review by the national experts.

ENU has study and examination regulations for all study programmes based on ministerial orders, which are legally checked. The recognition of studies at other Kazakh higher education institutions is assured, as basically all of them use the state educational standards and further state regulations as a basis for the design of their curricula. The recognition of study periods abroad is organised based on the University's "Regulation on Academic Mobility". The panel could not find any reference to the principles stated in the Lisbon

Recognition Convention, which was ratified by Kazakhstan in 1997, in this regulation of the ENU. Moreover, academic periods spent abroad are only recognised within the programmes of academic mobility with the partner HEIs. The panel has got the impression that recognition of study periods abroad is not problematic for students, as they are encouraged to take part in exchange programmes as part of the University's internationalisation strategy. However, it has not become clear to the panel how the periods of study spent at foreign HEIs out of scope of the cooperation agreements are recognised at ENU. From the viewpoint of the panel, current recognition regulations do not fully comply with the Lisbon convention, which requires that: 1) the recognition of periods of study must occur if the University does not identify any substantial differences 2) there is an obligation on the part of the University to provide justification when refusing recognition. Therefore, the experts recommend to grant accreditation under the following condition:

The principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention – general recognition of study periods abroad if no substantial differences can be proven by the higher education institution – are to be implemented in the study and examination regulations.

The University has a relative grading system but the panel finds it difficult to understand its practical application. For the purposes of academic mobility, they recommend ENU to implement the ECTS Grading Table as described in the ECTS Users' Guide.

The overall feasibility of the study programmes' workload is ensured by a suitable curriculum design, an adequate number and frequency of examinations as well as through appropriate support of students by their advisers. Even though the real student workload does not serve as a basis for the design of the study programmes, this workload is taken into consideration when monitoring the quality of the study programmes (see Chapter 5). The maximum workload of students is defined based on state requirements.

ENU ensures gender equality and non-discrimination. Students with disabilities are provided with affirmative actions concerning time and formal requirements throughout the programmes and examinations. Students in special circumstances are particularly assisted.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.2 Structure					
3.2.1* Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.2* Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)				Condition	
3.2.3* Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4 Equality of opportunity			X		

### 3.3 Didactical concept

The teaching methodology varies between the Bachelor and Master level. At Bachelor level, students first gain theoretical knowledge and have more practical classes in their further studies. At Master level, students are required to conduct more individual scientific research. Thus, teaching material at Bachelor level is mostly descriptive, whereas at Master level, teaching material reflects the results of scientific analysis based on the use of various research methods.

The didactic concept of the study programmes consists of various teaching and learning methods, such as, for example, the case study method and research projects. Seminars

include methods of conducting business games, simulation trainings, discussions and presentations as well as solving cases. Typical formats of examination used at ENU are traditional written exam (written work), oral examination, creative task (project, presentation, essay and other), practical examination and testing. Students are required to attend and to actively participate in classes; they also have to do regular homework. According to the departments, it is paid attention to the use of student-oriented learning in the educational process.

Lectures are conducted in classrooms equipped with multimedia technologies, allowing to increase the level of interactivity in class and the level of absorption of the presented material. ENU has specialized classrooms with special professional software such as e.g. IS SONA Tax Reporting Processing System, 1C: Enterprise 8 configuration Accounting for Kazakhstan Version 3.0, 1C: Accounting for public institutions of Kazakhstan, 1C: Enterprise 8 Configuration "Accounting of a construction organization" edition 3.0, 1C: Enterprise 8 Configuration "Accounting for an agricultural enterprise" edition 2.0, which is used in real world of work for Accounting and Audit or special touristic equipment in order to develop students' professional competencies.

Teachers are free to choose adequate teaching methods and apply them. The departments stated that they use up-to-date teaching methods and that the content is conducted on the basis of modern achievements of science and practice in corresponding field.

The departments annually review the content of curricula, taking into account changes in the market, wishes of students and teachers as well as opinions of employers. For example, since 2016 in the Accounting and Auditing Master programme contents were included, which are suitable for passing examinations for certification of professional accountants approved by the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Teaching staff of the department annually prepares or updates teaching and methodical complexes of the courses that are developed in accordance with the objectives of the study programmes. In addition, the teaching staff of the department annually prepares teaching aids and other teaching (digital) materials for open publication. According to the departments the choice and form of didactic materials correspond to the objectives of the educational programmes. In addition, scientific articles by teachers are published in leading domestic and foreign scientific journals, which reflect scientifically-based conclusions on the topic of research, are used as educational materials. In order to create an electronic database of teaching materials, teachers of the departments prepare e-textbooks and textbooks as well as video lectures, which are aimed at promoting the competencies intended with the study programmes.

To improve students' theoretical and practical competence, visiting professors from other Kazakh and foreign universities, as well as representatives of cooperating organisations and experienced professionals are invited to conduct lectures, seminars and workshops.

The students independently build their own educational path in the form of IEP - an individual curriculum. IEP is formed for each academic period with the help of an adviser whose main task is to assist in the choice of a learning path. The position of adviser is assigned to teachers (senior teachers, assistant professors, professors) of graduating departments, who know the structure of the curriculum for this specialty and the features of the educational process on the credit system.

## Appraisal:

The didactical concept of each of the study programmes is described, plausible, and oriented towards the programme objectives. It allows for the application of different teaching and learning methods, such as, for instance, case studies or practical projects. The taken measures and the conceptual structure of knowledge transfer are suitable to encourage students' to take part actively within their own educational development.

The panel team has been informed during the on-site visit that the course materials are available on the PLATONUS system. They have no doubt that they are digitally accessible for the students.

Guest lecturers are partly involved in the teaching of the programmes. They come from Higher Education Institutions as well as from companies. This helps to promote students' employability and to develop their scientific and practical skills.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.3	Didactical concept				
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers		X		
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors		X		

### 3.4 Internationality

In terms of international and intercultural aspects, all Bachelor programmes contain courses in foreign language for professional purposes as state compulsory modules (including Modern history of Kazakhstan, Foreign Language, Professionally Oriented Foreign Language, Information and Communication Technology). All Master programmes contain courses in foreign languages, too.

International contents in the Finance Bachelor programme are e.g. "International monetary and credit relations", "International finance", "Credit and banking systems of foreign countries" and "Finance of foreign countries". These courses are aimed at learning theory and practice of financial markets. In the Finance Master programme, examples for international contents are "Global financial markets" and "Finance of transnational companies". Intercultural aspects are reflected in courses like "Speech culture and business rhetoric" and "Cultural studies".

The Accounting and Audit Bachelor programme includes international contents in courses such as "International Finance", "Corporate Finance" and "Exchange Business". The Tourism department states that the courses are set in an international context. Courses like "Culturology" shall promote students' intercultural knowledge.

In order to internationalize the study programmes, ENU tried to harmonize with the programmes of foreign higher education institutions. For instance, the development of the Finance Bachelor programme, ENU took into account the experience of the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation, the University of Utah, New York, the Narhoz University, Almaty, the St. Petersburg State Economic University, Russia.

During the development of the Tourism Bachelor programme, experience of the Russian international Academy of tourism (Moscow, Russia), the Institute of hotel business and tourism of the Russian University of peoples' friendship (Moscow, Russia), the George Washington University (Washington, USA), the University of hospitality Glion (Glion, Switzerland) and the International Academy of tourism Antalya (Antalya, Turkey) have been taken into account.

Regarding the Tourism Master programme, the programmes of the Akdeniz University (Turkey), the Montreux Institute of hospitality (Switzerland), the eSwiss Institute of hospitality and management (Leizan, Switzerland) have been taken as a basis.

There are special government funds for academic mobility, above all the Bolashak International Scholarship of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which is awarded to the best performing Master and PhD students for studying at the leading universities abroad and which covers all study related costs. Upon completion of their programmes, scholars must return to Kazakhstan to work for a period of at least 5 years. Since 2008, the scholarship is also awarded to teaching and research staff of the universities, offering them the opportunity to do research abroad. ENU incentivises its students and teachers to apply for Bolashak and they regularly receive such scholarships.

The Tourism department has 11 holders of the international scholarship "Bolashak". At Finance department (Finance/Accounting and Audit) four teachers have become scholars under the Bolashak programme. They completed Master programmes e.g. at Higher Education Institutions in UK, Switzerland and the United States.

According to ENU, academic mobility of teaching staff and students is an essential part of the internationalisation strategy aimed at training skilled professionals who can be competitive on

the domestic and international labour markets. It gives students and academic staff the opportunity to study, conduct research or participate in internships in universities abroad. Almost every Master student spends a certain amount of time (from a few days to a semester or even an academic year) at a university abroad as this is a part of the study programme requirement, mostly for research internships. During the 2014-2019 academic years, students were trained in the following countries: South Korea, Poland, Turkey, Slovakia, Russian Federation, Republic of Belarus, and Republic of Lithuania.

Additionally, every year, teachers from partner universities of the academic mobility programme are invited to conduct lectures and workshops.

The main student body consists of Kazakh students. But ENU takes measures to foster an international composition of the student contingent. Thus, a Strategy for Internationalization and Academic Mobility at ENU (paragraph 2.1.1. Inviting foreign students, Master's and doctoral students to study at ENU) was developed. In order to implement this strategy, the departments are working on the invitation of foreign students from foreign partner universities. Additionally, to ensure internationalisation and competitiveness in the global educational space, the departments develop multilingual education and increase every year the number of disciplines taught in English. The departments state that to attract foreign students, it is necessary to provide educational programmes in the language that they understand. E.g. at the Accounting and Analysis department the number of subjects in English has increased from 2 to 12 disciplines since 2014. In the Finance and Tourism Bachelor programmes, there are over 50 courses (elective/mandatory) now being offered in English.

## Appraisal:

International and intercultural content forms a sufficient part of most of the programmes' curricula, although the panel assesses the overall amount of international and intercultural aspects in the programmes as expandable. The panel recommends that the HEI should implement more international and intercultural contents in all of the Bachelor and Master programmes. This will further strengthen the employability of the graduates and help them to find a job in an international environment.

According to the panel, the international composition of the student body could be strengthened. The university made a first step in offering the Bachelor programmes in English language, which could be a good step to attract more international students.

Additionally, the international composition of the faculty staff could be strengthened. The cooperation with foreign universities helps to receive international competences and skills with lectures by foreign professors. However, the panel sees room for a significant increase of lecturers with international experience and for teaching international and intercultural skills and contents compared with other HEIs. The panel therefore recommends ENU to increase efforts on internationality of the faculty.

Required foreign language materials correspond with the qualification objectives of each of the study programmes. ENU offers obligatory foreign language course in all of the programmes. In order to further promote and facilitate academic mobility, the panel also recommends placing a stronger focus on the compatibility of ENU's programmes with those of foreign universities.



		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			X		

### 3.5 Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)

The curricula of all study programmes promote broad additional knowledge through the State Compulsory Modules. Bachelor students are required to take courses such as the Modern history of Kazakhstan, Kazakh (Russian) language, Foreign language, Philosophy, Self-knowledge, Culture of speech and business rhetoric, Sociology, Cultural studies, anti-corruption culture, etc. as part of general education to broaden their understanding of life, society and the world during the first two years of their studies.

They are also required to take programme foundation courses from other study programmes. Attending such courses from different disciplinary backgrounds improves the students' multi-skilling competencies to deal with complex business decisions. Master students are required to attend core and programme foundation courses before attending the courses related to their specialised professional domain.

The module descriptions of all of the Bachelor and Master programmes provide generic learning outcomes. Amongst others, these are soft skills, analytical and problem-solving skills.

According to ENU, the content of the study programmes also provides for formation of students' knowledge and skills in the fields of communication, public speaking, team work, analysis of personality and behavior as well as ethical principles. These skills shall mostly be formed in practical and seminar classes, where the students shall learn to independently set and solve educational and practical tasks and case studies as well as to present them, express and argue their point of view and to prove or disprove various arguments. The curriculum of each of the Master programmes includes research seminars where Master students present the results of their scientific work and have an opportunity to improve their communication skills.

Furthermore, students at the University are given the opportunity to choose and participate in any of the many clubs and associations at ENU that carry out their activities in various areas and interests. The University also encourages students to actively participate in conferences, round tables and workshops which are regularly carried out at ENU. To give an important direction in the development of scientific skills and knowledge is the involvement of young people in science; the University has founded a Council of Young Scientists.

ENU has a "Skills Development and Additional Education Institute" as an own institutional unit. The main aim of the Institute is to develop and implement professional skills and continuous additional education, to provide the consolidation and coordination of the activities of faculties and services of the university in order to expand the network and to improve the quality of additional educational services for interested parties.

The Institute implements programmes of additional professional education in the following areas:

- Professional development;
- Professional retraining of staff;
- Short-term courses;
- Training courses;
- Seminars;
- Webinars;
- Preparatory courses;
- Language courses.

Professional development courses are implemented in person and using distance learning technologies.

ENU states that the university provides multidisciplinary competences in order to give the students the skills and the ability to development as an individual, to quickly adapt to changing working conditions as well as to resolve conflicts and find compromises in the field of professional activity and everyday life.

### Appraisal:

Through various methods the students are in the position to acquire communication and public-speaking skills as well as cooperation and conflict handling skills in the study programmes. This is documented in the module descriptions. The acquisition of further multidisciplinary competences, such as leadership skills and broad contextual knowledge, is also ensured.

The panel especially considers the “Skills Development and Additional Education Institute” as very helpful to promote the multidisciplinary competences and skills of students and academic staff. The offered activities allow the members of the university to develop their professional and soft skills as well as to follow and to strengthen own interests.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)	X				

### 3.6 Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)

The Bachelor programmes are designed for comprehensive training in various disciplines. The programmes consist of mandatory courses and elective courses, which allow the students to gain a deeper understanding in the areas of their individual interests. The employability of graduates from the Bachelor programmes is based among others on the following elements: linkage between theory and practice, promotion of self-dependent work, and training of social skills. In addition, Bachelor students undertake professional internships in public and private organisations on national and regional levels, as well as in a vast range of corporations and companies. Many students already agree on working contracts while undergoing the internship. In the Master programmes, a pedagogical internship is obligatory and serves as a preparation for careers in the education system.

The Master programmes facilitate graduate employability by providing students with both general skills and specific qualifications of their specific study field. This should be promoted

through a strong relation to the particular occupational field. The Master graduates shall possess among others the following competences: professional competencies, general cultural competencies, organisational competencies, and analytical/research skills. The University can name a large number of companies that have employed Master graduates. Furthermore, many Master graduates work as lecturers at ENU and other HEIs.

The Bachelor and Master’s study programmes were developed with taking into account the requirements of the modern labor market. The university has a close relationship with the employers and companies. They meet regularly in order to discuss whether changes have to be made in the curriculum and if the students gain the skills they need for future employments.

The overall percentage of employed (employees) graduates amounted to 85% (as of academic year 2018, after one year after completion of training). According to the last three years of employment of graduates of the Master programme Tourism the rate is 90%.

ENU conducts training seminars, job fairs, leadership lectures by famous people and accomplished graduates of the faculty departments. Also, together with partner-employers, ENU annually holds presentations on student internships, workshops and webinars. During the last 3 years, various thematic marketing seminars and trainings on the current state and main directions of development of the Kazakhstan labor market were conducted.

## Appraisal:

The promotion of employability – for instance through the integration of theory and practice and through the promotion of multidisciplinary competences and skills – runs as a common thread of the study programmes through all of their modules.

The university has convincingly stated that graduates of the programmes find a profession shortly after graduation of the programme. ENU states that one reason of the high employability rate is the fact that many students get a profession in the company/organisation where they are doing their internship. They have the possibility to establish contacts with companies during their studies.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 4 Academic environment and framework conditions

### 4.1 Faculty

The teaching staff of the study programmes consists of the Deans of the Faculty of Economics, the deputy Deans, the Heads of the related Chairs, professors, associate professors, senior lecturers, lecturers and visiting professors/ lecturers.

In total, there are 42 full-time faculty members teaching at the study programmes at hand. Besides the regular teaching staff of ENU, experienced practitioners and foreign professors regularly give lectures and master classes on important issues.

By defining the number of the full-time teachers, the University adheres to the state regulation, which determines the ratio of students to teachers at all HEIs in Kazakhstan. For the Bachelor programmes it amounts to 12:1; for the Master programmes to 6:1; for the PhD programmes to 4:1.

78,6% of the teachers hold the highest academic degrees, among them 8 teachers holding an academic degree “doctor of sciences”, 18 teachers with the degree “candidate of sciences” and 7 teachers with PhD degree.

Staff recruitment for vacant positions falls within the competence of the HR department and is carried out on a competitive basis according to the HR Policy of ENU, the Rules on the procedures for recruitment, admission, adaptation, transfer and dismissal of employees of ENU, the staffing schedule and the job descriptions. The invitation of foreign lecturers is regulated by the Rules on attracting foreign specialists and the procedure for reimbursement of expenses for invitations.

When selecting candidates, ENU's Competition Commission takes account of the academic degrees and titles of the potential employees, their teaching and research experience, methodical and scientific publications as well as the English language proficiency. The decision on hiring a candidate is made by the Rector of the University on the basis of the meeting minutes of the Competition Commission. For hiring visiting lecturers no formal competition procedure is necessary; the recruitment is carried out in accordance with the relevant civil law legislation.

For each of the study programmes, the University has provided a staff handbook, where the qualification level, the academic career and the main publications of each teacher are described.

In recent years, several teachers have become winners of the national prize “The best University teacher” and other prizes for teaching excellence awarded by the Ministry of Education and Science.

A number of teachers of the Faculty undertakes active research activities, e.g. by publishing monographs, articles in national and international scientific journals, participating in scientific conferences, conducting research projects. The Faculty of Economics has provided the panel with the information on the H-index (Scopus) of six teachers.

The Faculty put emphasis on attracting practitioners as teachers. Many of the teachers – both employed on the regular basis and external lecturers – come from the professional

practice. The Accounting and Analysis department and the Finance department have staff with practical experience in the field of accounting, auditing and analysis in the sectors of the national economy, banking and public services. Teachers of the “Tourism” department have practical experience in the field of tourism and hospitality; it also has part-time teachers who work in such hotels as Rixos, Wyndham Garden Astana, Ibis Astana and national companies such as “Kazakhturizm”.

Professional development of teaching staff is carried out in order to regularly update their specialist and methodical knowledge, pedagogical skills and to introduce new teaching technologies. According to the Ministry regulations and ENU’s Rules on personnel development, all of the academic staff members should participate in the professional training as frequently as necessary, but at least once in five years. To improve the qualification of teaching staff, the University organises training courses (e.g. in the fields of information and computer technology, pedagogical skills etc.), foreign internships and internships at other HEIs in Kazakhstan.

Planning of the professional training is performed by the Faculty, personnel service and HR-department based on the analysis of teachers’ needs for professional development, and is reflected in the annually approved and implemented operational plans for HR development. Correspondingly, special budgets are annually allocated for the financing of advanced training courses in accordance with the plans, inter alia, of the courses abroad. The Faculty of Economics has presented the lists of the teachers who participated in such courses at foreign universities, e.g. those from Kyrgyzstan, Lithuania, Romania, Russia and Ukraine.

The University provides support for faculty members applying for the Bolashak Programme (Bolashak International Scholarship) to study at the leading universities overseas all-expenses paid.

Furthermore, the Division for Assessment of the Quality of Education (see Chapter 5) is responsible for the introduction and dissemination of innovative didactical methods and teaching technologies. The Division systematically visits teachers’ classes, organises open classes of teachers which are afterwards discussed by colleagues at the meetings of chairs and faculties. Faculty members are asked for their feedback. Such meetings of the teaching staff are held regularly and address issues of the educational, methodical and research work, the development of modules and study programmes (see Chapter 5).

In addition to their main obligations, some teachers also act as Bachelor students’ advisers and scientific supervisors for Master students.

Advisers are appointed from among the full-time teaching staff. The list of advisers is approved by the Deans of the Faculty. One adviser is responsible for a group of Bachelor students consisting of 20-25 students for the entire duration of study. Advisers assist students in defining their individual study tracks, determining the direction of their scientific research and the choice of supervisors for the Bachelor theses, finding places for internships, choosing paths for their personal development, including the recommendations on extracurricular activities at the University.

Supervisors – teachers with at least a PhD degree and 3 years of pedagogical experience – are in charge of creating necessary conditions for carrying out research work of students, which includes providing advice during the dissertation research, giving feedback on the scientific work and helping in the selection of places for internships.

In the process of training, students have an opportunity to receive consultation by lecturers

on a regular basis. Teachers individually support students as part of the “independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher” which is provided for each module according to a consultation schedule. There are reception hours for parents and other interested parties set out by the management of the chairs and faculties. The Dean's Office for the work with students is established, which aims at supporting students during the study process and providing them with additional services.

## Appraisal:

ENU generally defines the structure and number as well as the necessary qualification of teaching staff in accordance with the state requirements. Thus, even when professional activities of teachers in other organisations are taken into account, the structure and number of the faculty correspond to the programmes' requirements and are suitable to ensure that the students reach the intended qualification objectives. The faculty's composition, consisting of the permanent full-time and external teachers, guarantees that both the academic standards and the requirements of professional practice are fully satisfied. However, the panel noted a lack of teachers who teach in English language. During interviews the panel noted English language skills of students being significantly higher than the English language skills of teachers. Therefore, the panel recommends some mandatory English courses for teachers.

The academic qualification of the faculty also corresponds with the objectives of the study programmes. The University verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure.

Specific measures for the further qualification of faculty members are implemented. Still, in order to strengthen foreign language competences of students, the panel recommends to pay more attention to the English language proficiency of teachers, by means of both of further qualification of resident teachers and within procedures of the competitive selection of teaching staff.

The pedagogical and didactic qualification of the teaching staff is in line with teachers' tasks in the programmes. ENU ensures that assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their skills in this field.

The panel is confident that the faculty members have professional and business experience and use it in their teaching activities.

Faculty members cooperate with each other for the purpose of tuning the modules towards the overall qualification objectives and introducing modern teaching methods. Meetings of all those teaching in the programmes, both at the level of the Chairs and the Faculty, take place regularly. Scientific projects are conducted cooperatively by groups of teachers.

Student support and coaching are an integral part of the services provided by the academic staff of the Faculty.

During the interview, students reported that they are content with the support they receive.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.1	Faculty					
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty			X		
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.7(*)	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)					X

## 4.2 Programme management

The programme management coordinates the work on the development and implementation of the study programmes. All members of the department serving the study programmes, employers, and students are involved in this process. As part of updating the study programmes, at least once a year, the programme management regularly takes into account the development of science, economics, technology and the social sphere. In addition, there is an interaction with employers and the expert community on the formation, assessment and updating of the programmes' content.

Additionally, the programme management collaborates with the persons responsible for methodological work at the departments so that it:

- provides transparency in the development of the curriculum development plan based on the analysis of its functioning, the actual positioning of the University and the orientation of its activities to meet the needs of the state, employers, students and other stakeholders;
- demonstrates the functioning of the mechanisms of formation and regular review of the curriculum development plan, monitoring its implementation, evaluation of the achievement of learning goals, meeting the needs of students, employers and society, decision-making aimed at continuous improvement of the programme;
- engages representatives of stakeholder groups, including employers, students and teachers, to create a curriculum development plan;
- carries out risk management;
- ensures the participation of representatives of stakeholders (employers, teachers, students) in the collective management bodies of the study programme, as well as their representativeness in making management decisions related to the curriculum;
- demonstrates evidence of openness and accessibility to students, teachers, employers and other stakeholders.

The Tourism Bachelor and Master programme have been developed on the basis of professional standards approved by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken". On this basis, the programme management delivers learning outcomes that correspond to the standardised work functions presented in corresponding professional cards. The panel appreciated this approach as it shows a good and systematic

collaboration with representatives of business and promotes the employability of the students.

In the process of organising the educational processes teachers and students receive support from the structural units.

For first semester students, an adaptation week is held annually, which is aimed at familiarising students with the organisation of educational process at the university and its structural units, which are directly involved in ensuring accessibility, transparency and openness of educational services.

In order to ensure that the students are informed, each of them is provided with a “Student Guide”, which e.g. describes information about the university, the university’s academic policy, the rights and duties of the students and the specifics of training in terms of credit technology. The Service Center for Students provides consulting services to students on academic issues throughout the entire period of study.

With a view to administrative support of the faculty of the university, the Center for Distance Technologies was created in 2018. The main activity is aimed at developing and introducing remote technologies in organising the educational process, creating an educational ENU portal, developing electronic resources, online courses and video lectures.

The university is equipped with Platonus AIS, through which:

- Students are provided with information and methodological materials: syllabis in relevant disciplines, educational and methodical complexes of disciplines, etc.;
- Students have the opportunity to choose disciplines and form learning paths online;
- Students have access to learning materials;
- Records of the progress of the teacher, students; the system automatically calculates the admission rating of the student to the exam according to the results of intermediate control.

For continuous professional development, the university provides academic and administrative staff with the following opportunities: refresher courses, workshops and training seminars. The system of stimulating the professional and personal development of teachers and staff is carried out through gratitude, awarding certificates, prizes, introducing candidates for the title “Honored Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, and the contests “Best Teacher” and “Best Curator”. In order to stimulate teachers to self-development and to improve the quality of teaching and research activities, a KPI system was introduced and the results of which influence payment of remuneration.

In order to support young teachers at ENU, a school of pedagogical skills for young teachers has been organised. Pedagogical mentoring is ensured by assisting young teachers in the preparation and conduction of lectures as well as the development of teaching materials and extracurricular activities.

During the on-site visit the panel had the opportunity to visit the office of the Administrative unit. The dedicated staff showed how students and staff can use a computer programme there to print the documents they need by their own. They also can talk to administrative staff personally and get advice. There is also an electronic surface, where students can give a feedback on his/her satisfaction immediately after receiving the service. The results are finally analysed and used for further development.



## Appraisal:

Through discussions on-site with the Deans and Vice Deans as well as the administrative staff, the panel has concluded that the study programmes are properly organised and the overall programme organisation ensures that the programmes run smoothly. The panel considers the regular updates of the contents as well as the involvement of employers as helpful to promote students' employability.

The panel appreciated the approach of the Tourism department, which involves the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the development and external assessment of the study programme. During the on-site visit the panel has become the impression that the programme management of the Tourism department successfully takes initiatives to promote the systematic development of the study programme in a manner which includes all relevant stakeholders.

The programme director successfully takes initiatives to promote the systematic development of the study programme in a manner which includes all relevant groups.

Moreover, through the ITsystem "Platonus" and the Administrative Office, ENU adequately demonstrates that the students are supported well. The opportunities of electronic and personal service-support are used. The administrative staff acts as a service provider for students and faculty.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.2 Programme management					
4.2.1* Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)		Tourism (BA, MA)	X		
4.2.2 Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty		X			

## 4.3 Cooperation and partnerships

### Finance

The Economics Faculty (Finance, Accounting and Audit) has signed agreements with several foreign universities in USA, Finland, Romania, Germany, France, Italy, Hungary, Poland, Latvia, Lithuania, Bulgaria, Slovenia, Slovakia as well as in South Korea and Hong Kong in order to strengthen its international cooperations and to develop joint projects.

At present, a joint study programme with the Ural State University of Economics (Yekaterinburg, Russia) is in preparation, since cooperation has been established with them in various areas. In particular, the Finance department holds annual video conferences on topical issues of the development of the modern economy of the two countries in the context of a new global reality, at which leading professors from both universities gave scientific reports.

There are selected Bachelor and Master students who are trained in external academic mobility programs at following partner universities: Cracow University of Economics (Poland), Seijong University (South Korea), Higher School of Economics (Russia), Warsaw University (Poland), University of Pamukale (Turkey), Belorussian State University and others.

The objectives of concluding agreements with business enterprises and other organisations are to hold joint events such as guest lectures and round tables in order to develop the skills and knowledge of students and also to examine, evaluate and further develop study programmes. The quality of the Bachelor and Master programme is analysed by experienced, highly qualified specialists in fields of financial services. The department organises meetings and guest lectures with the participation of the following professional employers: Finexpert, Tsesna Bank JSC, BI Group Company, Sberbank of Russia JSC (branch in Astana). Furthermore, contracts and agreements were signed on professional internships with the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the State Revenue Management Department for the city of Azerbaijan, Tsesnabank JSC, Astana Finance Leasing Company and others.

## Tourism

Memorandums have been concluded with partner universities for the development of international cooperation, incl. on academic mobility of students and teachers.

On the initiative of the Tourism department, ENU signed agreements with the following foreign universities: Peoples' Friendship University of Russia; Omsk State Technological University (Russia); Xinjiang University, Urumqi (China); Renmin University (Beijing, China); Akdeniz University (Turkey); University Dokuz Eylul (Turkey); Tashkent State Economic University (Uzbekistan).

For example, an agreement on cooperation within the framework of academic mobility of students and teachers, as well as the implementation of joint research projects, was concluded with the University Dokuz Eylul (Turkey). Cooperation with Xinjiang University is aimed at improving the qualifications of teachers as well as joint research activities. In addition, due to collaboration with the Institute of Hotel Business and Tourism of the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia, an agreement on joint design of educational programmes and the development of international cooperation in the field of training specialists between the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia and ENU was concluded.

Bachelor and Master students are trained in external academic mobility programmes at following partner universities: Akdeniz University, Dokuz Eylul University, Peoples' Friendship University of Russia, Belarusian State University and others.

At the initiative of the Tourism department, the university management signed Memorandums of Cooperation with the Tourism Industry Committee of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Hotel Rixos President Astana, NGO Caravaners Club of the Republic of Kazakhstan, United World LLP, ITA Arman-Tour, Chain of restaurants Mumtaz and others.

The Tourism department organised meetings, guest lectures with the participation of the following professional employers, representatives of state bodies, deputies of the Mazhilis of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan; president of the NGO "Club Caravaners"; deputy of the Mazhilis of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan; deputy of the Mazhilis of the RK Parliament of the fifth convocation; deputy Director of the Tourism Industry Department; training manager of the Astana Marriott Hotel; president of the Association of Tourist Operators of Kazakhstan, General Director of Sayat LLP; Training Manager Hotel "St. Regis Astana; operational manager of the IBIS Hotels Astana Hotel.

In the House of students of the Ulytau District of the Karaganda Region a branch was opened to conduct research on the development of tourist routes throughout the district. The branch annually sends teachers of the department to give lectures on tourism for students,

who then take part in various competitions.

Long-term contracts and agreements on the passage of professional practice by students have been concluded: the Committee of Tourism Industry of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the Center for youth tourism and local history at Akimat of Astana; the "Club of Caravaners" of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Satti Arba" company, Hotel "Rixos President Astana"; Hotel "Radisson SAS Hotel Astana"; Sayat Tourist Company; LLP "NurWay"; Climbing wall rock, SEC Mega Center Astana; Astana Marriott Hotel and others. More than 100 individual students' agreements on acceptance for internship have also been concluded.

#### Accounting and Audit:

At the initiative of the Accounting and Analysis department, a Memorandum of Understanding was concluded with the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation (April 25, 2015) and a cooperation agreement with St. Petersburg State University of Economics (01/29/2018).

In the framework of the section "Audit and Taxation" of the UMO ROMS in the direction of preparation "Business and Management", together with the Russian University of Peoples Friendship (Russia), the Department of Accounting and Analysis held the International Scientific and Practical Online Conference "Problems of Implementing International Standards audit and accounting, the practice of their use in the CIS countries". The conference was attended by scientists from 19 universities from 6 countries: Bulgaria, Russia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Donetsk People's Republic and Belarus.

Over the past three years, students have passed foreign scientific internships at leading universities in Europe, Asia and the CIS countries (Technological University of Malaysia, University of Ljubljana, Lublin, Peoples' Friendship University of Russia, etc.).

In the framework of academic mobility students visited following foreign universities: University of Alexandru Ioan Cuza (Iasi, Romania); University of Otto von Guericke (Magdeburg, Germany); Belarusian State University (Minsk, Republic of Belarus); State National University (Dushanbe, Tajikistan); Chechen State University (Grozny, Russia). The implementation of the Master programme for students implies the mandatory completion of overseas internships (e.g. in Romania, Poland, Finland, Azerbaijan, Russian Federation).

To develop international cooperation, the department actively uses the G-global communication platform. Within the framework of the Astana Economic Forum, international online debates, conferences and other events are held regularly.

The department "Accounting and Audit" has 37 long-term contracts and agreements on the internship of students (training, production, pre-diploma, pedagogical, research, R & D, NIRS). The department of "Accounting and Analysis", in the course of organising production practices, works closely with organisations: The "National Managing Holding" KazAgro", "KazMunaiGas "NC" AK, "Economikal Sortteu Institutes".

#### For all study programmes:

The objectives of concluding agreements are to conduct joint research, invitations for lectures and workshops, and academic mobility. According to ENU, cooperation and partnership with other universities has a positive impact on learning, develops the skills and knowledge of students, and also increases the possibility of further employment. Cooperation with enterprises has a formative effect on the content of the study programmes and

contributes to their further development. The quality of the Bachelor and Master programmes is estimated by experienced, highly qualified specialists in the corresponding fields.

Finally, according to the programme of internal academic mobility, studies are conducted in Kazakhstan's partner universities: the Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (Almaty) and the K. Zhubanov Aktobe Regional State University.

## Appraisal:

The scope and nature of cooperation with HEIs, networks, business and organisations relevant for the programmes are plausibly presented. Agreements forming the basis of the cooperation are documented. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the students' studies (exchange possibilities, joint projects, dual degree options) and on the conception and implementation of the study programmes. All such activities contribute to the development of the students' qualification and skills.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.3 Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*) Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			X		
4.3.2(*) Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)			X		

## 4.4 Facilities and equipment

The academic buildings dispose inter alia, lecture halls, seminar rooms and laboratory rooms. The seminar rooms are used for courses with small student groups while the size of the lecture halls varies and holds courses with 150 students. Many classrooms are equipped with multimedia facilities (projectors, whiteboards, and multimedia devices). Several computer rooms can be used for classes and are available for the students outside the class hours. The computer rooms also provide access for the students to the library's network. The University provides for the faculty and students free access to wireless Lan (WLAN). Students and teachers always have access to the learning management system "Platonus".

For the use of distance learning technologies in classrooms, special equipment such as web cameras with microphones and headsets was installed. This technology is also used for organising scientific conferences online with all regions of Kazakhstan, as well as with other cities in the world.

During the on-site visit, the panel also had the opportunity to visit some specialised seminar rooms, which are aimed at conducting laboratory and practical classes. These rooms are equipped with special software for Accounting and Audit such as 1C-enterprise, Audit Expert, Prime Expert, Project Expert 7 and SPSS Programmes for content analysis as well as with special access to data bases.

The total fund of the library as of the 2018-2019 academic year is 1,626,430 copies. The library provides access to the following full-text databases: Springer, Scopus, Science direct, Web of science, eLibrary USA, Oxford scholarship online, Euromonitor International Passport, eBook Academic Collection, Academic Search Complite, EBS "IPRbooks", EBS "Polpred", "Electronic Library Epigraph". There is also access to the Kazakhstan National Electronic Library (KazNEB). At present, the volume of the Electronic Catalog includes 152,129 bibliographic records including 17,825 scientific articles. The open educational resources are constantly advertised on the library website. In the hall of electronic resources 115 computers can be used.

There are 38,220 items of literature on finance in both electronic and paper form, about 90,000 on tourism and about 30,445 units on accounting and auditing.

The university also has structural units for academic issues to support students in the implementation of their educational, personal and career needs. These include: the Registrar Office, the Scientific Library, the Information Technology Center, the Career Department, the International Department, the Youth Policy Center.

The fully equipped radio and television studio facilities at the university allow students hands-on experience in producing a variety of video and radio-TV programmes. Students interested in print and broadcast journalism can work for the university newspaper "Eurasia-Akparat", university Website, be involved in producing weekly television programme "Eurasia TV", and online radio "Eurasia FM".

Annually for the new academic year, repairs of the classroom stock are carried out. According to the departments, material, information and library resources are sufficient and meet the requirements of an adequate organisation of the educational process.

## Appraisal:

During the on-site visit, the panel has viewed general facilities of the University and particular departments' facilities. In the view of the panel, the number and size of teaching rooms and the equipment of all learning facilities are appropriate to the needs for conducting the programmes. The buildings are properly equipped with modern information technology. Access to the internet through laptops in classrooms and, in general, via wireless LAN is provided with free of charge. A sufficient number of group rooms is available, although teaching staff mentioned some indications to increasing needs for team meeting and/or project working rooms.

The library offers opening hours convenient to the needs of the students. Access to literature and journals is adequate and usability of digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is properly ensured, in particular regarding literature appropriate for the programmes. Literature, media and data are, according to staff interviews, kept up to date.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 4.5 Additional services

To promote employment and adaptation to the job market for graduates, the university has created a Career and Business Partnership Center. Its staff provides counselling on internship opportunities, preparation for job interviews, writing resumes, and job presentation skills. The Center also facilitates and conducts monitoring on the employment of graduates and coordinates the work of University's Council of Employers.

Furthermore, the Career and Business Partnership Center organises annual job fairs and close connections with leading companies about job vacancies. The website of the university in the section "Base of contracts" contains information about enterprises with which cooperation agreements have been concluded (about 1593 organisations). Information about vacancies, internships and up-coming events are additionally posted on the social network such as Instagram.

Students have a choice of either getting information from online sources or to visit and meet the Center's staff personally and to get an advice on-site. The Center has a large database of potential employers and regularly receives vacancies from them. The staff also helps students to prepare their curriculum vitae and provides information on potential employers and vacancies that match students' profiles. The Center maintains contact personally as well as via telephone and e-mails and accompanies students during studies and also directly after graduation.

The Alumni Association was founded to strengthen the image and corporate spirit among students and alumni of all generations and to promote educational, scientific and cultural exchange. The main objectives are development of contacts between graduates, use of experience and opportunities of graduates for the implementation of educational research projects and organisation of regular press conferences, business meetings with graduates who have achieved significant success in economics, politics, science and other fields of activity with students.

Alumnis take an active part in job fairs, practical excursions and conferences. There are annually held meetings for the dialogue of graduates with the leadership of the university and student activists. In addition, ENUTalks are held - meetings of the most successful graduates with students of the University for their motivation and striving for self-development.

According to the university the Alumni activities are a good tradition at ENU. An official Alumni Association was just recently founded in the beginning of 2019.

### Appraisal:

The panel appreciates the range of services that ENU offers to their students and graduates and the dedication of the staff. During the on-site visit the panel had the opportunity to visit the Center and to talk to the staff. The panel appreciated that staff was very dedicated and motivated. Those can approach the Career and Employment Services and receive counselling on an individual basis. The support provided is very extensive. Students have access to the HEI-wide corporate network. ENU also brings its graduates in contact with representatives from business and industry at regular events. The panel is convinced that the services help to promote employability. The conviction of individual advise of each student/graduate and the caring attitude towards them became apparent during the on-site visit.

Alumni Activities and events are performed regularly. An alumni organisation has been set up with the aim of developing a more extended alumni network. The panel is convinced that the founded Alumni Association is doing a very good work and that this organised unit will help to develop their alumni efforts systematically and on a long term.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.5	Additional services					
4.5.1	Career counselling and placement service	X				
4.5.2	Alumni Activities			X		

## 4.6 Financing of the study programmes (Asterisk Criterion)

As a Kazakh national university, ENU is state-funded, including the costs of teaching staff, administrative staff, facilities, library and other services.

The student body of ENU is financed through the budgetary funding, placement of the state educational order for the training of specialists (educational grants – Bachelor level), the placement of the state order for the training of specialists in science and pedagogy (educational grants – Master level) as well as tuition fees from applicants' own funds and other sources. Thus, those applicants who have not passed or participated in the selection for budget places can apply for programme places on a commercial basis. They sign a contract with the University and take the responsibility to pay tuition fees.

The university carries out current planning and distribution of financial resources, based on the mission of the university and using the results of work on the development of educational programmes. The study programmes are financed through annual allocations by ENU. Investment funds are allocated for staff salary as well as for teaching and learning resources.

### Appraisal:

ENU is financed by the Republic of Kazakhstan. The system of tuition fees and educational grants ensures that the university receives resources on the basis of student numbers and can thus always finance its teaching activities. Hence, a general budget exists. Within the limits of a review process and with regard to financial stability of the HEI in recent years, the panel concludes that financial stability is ensured for each current programme cycle and the entire accreditation period.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

## 5 Quality assurance and documentation

ENU has established a quality control system (QC) working on the levels of the institution as the whole, of its faculties and study programmes. The QC system comprises several sub-systems, using different technologies, methods and/or tools. It involves both internal and external stakeholders.

At the institution level, the Department for Strategic Development is in charge of ENU's quality control policy. This department is divided into three divisions: 1. The Division for Strategic Planning and Monitoring; 2. The Division for Accreditation and Rating; 3. The Division for Assessment of the Quality of Education.

Main task of the Division for Strategic Planning and Monitoring is to organise and supervise the implementation of the Development Strategy of ENU for 2018-2020 at all levels of the University's activities.

Main function of the Division for Accreditation and Rating is to support the national institutional accreditation of ENU as well as the accreditation of single study programmes by either national or international agencies included in the National Register of Accreditation Bodies of the Ministry of Education and Science. ENU has been institutionally accredited by the Kazakh national accreditation agency IQAA. Since 2011, a wide range of study programmes of the University has obtained accreditation from the national agencies IAAR and IQAA, as well as from the European agencies ASIIN and ACQUIN (Germany). The division also manages the participation of ENU in national and international university rankings.

The Division for Assessment of the Quality of Education (Q&E) organises internal audits in accordance with ENU's internal QC standards; coordinates ongoing improvement and updating of internal regulatory documents; conducts surveys with internal and external stakeholders and monitors degrees of satisfactions; keeps records and analyses of Key Performance Indicators (KPI) for academic staff, heads of chairs and deans of faculties; coordinates functioning and adequacy of the KPI information and control system.

A key quality control element of ENU to assure proper teaching is the so-called "system of educational and methodological work" (EMW). This automated system covers allocation of responsibilities and controls cover considerations of both of internal (within the University) and also external (within the system of higher education of Kazakhstan) aspects. The latter includes the task to make proposals to the Ministry of Education and Science, in particular, to raise potential improvements on state regulations, educational standards, study programmes, and other subject areas of higher education.

With regard to the quality of the University's internal processes, ENU's EMW system is carried out in order to better integrate science and education, improve educational process, keep teaching and methodical documentation, develop and implement new learning technologies, and provide training to teachers and staff.

The EMW system, among others, foresees allocation of responsibilities particularly in the following areas:

- Development and implementation of modern teaching material, including electronic learning, information and library systems;
- Development and analysis of, and quality control on curricula, textbooks, teaching material and teaching aids (including electronic media), tests and other forms of assessing of students' academic progress;



- Synthesis and dissemination of the best teaching experience and information technologies in learning;
- Monitoring of the adequate supply of literature and methodological material for teaching process;
- Methodological support for self-study work of students;
- Analysis of the quality of teaching, level of academic achievements, and of students;
- Organisation of seminars, conferences, workshops on improving the teaching process.

The EMW responsibilities reflect a hierarchic organisation. The Vice Rector for Academic Affairs is in charge of educational process of the University and the running operation of the EMW system. The main EMW administering body is the Scientific and Methodological Council of the University (SMC), which is a collegial consultative unit aimed at discussing and making recommendations to the administration of the University with regard scientific and methodological issues and educational policy. The SMC determines directions and the mechanisms of the University's quality control and assists structural units with implementation of the principles of quality management. Members of the SMC are deans and heads of administrative departments.

At the level of the faculties and chairs, the EMW is conducted by working groups including academic staff and students which are called educational and methodological commissions. There are working groups to coordinate and improve the teaching process, to develop curricula and syllabi design, and to introduce new methods and technologies into the learning process.

The EMW is also performed by teachers on the basis of individual plans, coordinated by the educational and methodological commissions, their chairs and the faculties. This work involves planning and conducting public lectures, mutual visits to the colleagues' classes and subsequent collegial discussions in department meetings with suggestions for improvement.

The implementation of the study programmes is carried out with using a revolving system of planning, monitoring, reporting and continuous improvement.

The University addresses importance to the documentation of its processes and to the clear distribution and allocation of functions and responsibilities. All academic activities, including design, approval and further development of study programmes, are regulated by internal orders: The Rules of organisation and implementation of the educational and methodological work; The Regulation on the academic council on the development and expertise of study programmes; Methodical guidelines for the development of study programmes, including experimental and innovative study programs; The Regulation on the control of the learning achievements of students etc.

At the level of the faculties, there are academic councils on the development and expertise of study programmes, which are responsible for the development of curricula in accordance with the state regulations and with the stakeholders' needs, as well as for quality of the study programmes. The councils include the leading teachers, students as well as practitioners and employers. These working groups develop the passports of the study programmes, the main curricula, the catalogues of elective disciplines as well as the methodological recommendations on internships and theses. The drafts of these documents are then considered by the educational and methodological commissions of the chairs and faculties, the SMC of the University, and then, after being endorsed by these bodies, are approved by the Rector of the University.

The documentation for particular modules (educational and methodical complexes of disciplines), including the syllabi, is developed by individual teachers in accordance with the

„Methodical recommendations for the development of teaching materials” of ENU. The drafts are considered by collegial bodies of the chairs and faculties and are then approved by the deans of the faculties. The educational and methodical complexes of disciplines are updated annually.

Teachers also contribute to monitoring and improving the quality of the programmes, e.g. by evaluating the results achieved during the study process or by making proposals for the introduction of new modules (e.g. elective courses), whereby all suggestions are recorded in the protocols of the meetings of the chairs and faculties. Students and employers are also given the opportunity to make suggestions on the content of the programmes.

Upon approval by the Academic Council and the Rector of ENU, the documentation of the study programmes is published in the “Platonus” automated information system and on the ENU website.

The University reports that monitoring of the implementation of the programmes on the level of the faculties comprises a systematic collection and analysis of statistical data with regard to a number of key indicators, e.g. the share of students who successfully passed the examinations, the graduates’ employment rate and the share of graduates moving to the next level of education; student intake; students’ satisfaction with the study conditions, study process and learning outcomes; feedback from partner organisations, etc.

Considering the feedback from stakeholders as an important tool for evaluating and improving the quality of the study programmes, ENU conducts a number of regular surveys:

- The survey “Teacher in the eyes of students” (the results are used for the Republican contest “The Best Teacher of the Year”),
- the First-year student's survey (“Platonus”-based),
- the survey on students' satisfaction with the quality of the modules taught (“Platonus”-based),
- the survey on students' satisfaction with the quality of the experimental study programmes (“Platonus”-based),
- the survey on students' satisfaction with the organisation of professional internships (online),
- the survey on graduates' satisfaction with the quality of educational services provided by ENU (online),
- the survey on employers' satisfaction with the quality of training of ENU’s graduates (online),
- the survey of academic staff on satisfaction with working conditions (“Platonus”-based),
- as well as sociological studies to determine the degree of stakeholders’ satisfaction with the quality of educational services and the transparency of the University’s activities.

An external evaluation by alumni is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes provide input for the quality development process.

The outcomes of the surveys are analysed and discussed at the meetings of the chairs and other collegial decision-making bodies. The University states, that these results are taken into account in the process of developing and updating the study programmes. The outcomes of the surveys are available for internal stakeholders (teachers and students) in the electronic document management system SYNERGY.ENU and “Platonus”. Besides that, the results are published as brochures and sent to all relevant structural units of the University; they are also presented on the LED screens on the campus. The decisions taken based on stakeholders’ feedback are communicated to students through the “Platonus” system. The academic advisors discuss the results of the surveys and the decisions taken with the

students of the respective programmes.

At the end of each academic year, students are asked by their advisors for their views on the content of the programmes, the quality of modules, the actual workload, and the topics for the final theses. At the chairs, there are “boxes for proposals” where students can submit written suggestions. The proposals of students are documented in the protocols of the chairs’ meetings and are taken into account in the further development of the programmes.

Taking into account the opinion of the graduates on the lack of the teamwork skills, which has been expressed in the graduates’ survey, the teachers were recommended to focus more on fostering those skills through various teaching methods, e.g. the implementation of group projects, business games and working in small groups.

The quality assurance policy of ENU also applies to the activities carried out by external partners including the organisations offering places for internships and partner HEIs. Quality requirements for external services are reflected in the technical specifications: The Regulation on academic mobility of students, academic staff, administrative-management staff, and researchers; The Rules for Internships etc.

The basic information about ENU, its strategic documents, as well as the latest news are published on the ENU website.

Processes related to the implementation of the study programmes are documented and accessible to the internal stakeholders in the electronic document management system of the ENU under the headings “Professional Practice”, “Study process”, “Educational and methodical work”, “Research work”, “Control of educational achievements” etc.

In the “Platonus” system, students have access to the information on study programmes, particular modules and their syllabi, internships, teaching materials, criteria for assessing learning outcomes, and grades.

The main documents belonging to the study programmes are also available on the ENU website, including the approved curricula, conditions for the recognition of prior learning, requirements and rules for awarding academic degrees, professional profile of graduates, catalogues of elective disciplines, study programmes’ development plans etc.

The University’s website and the websites of the Faculty provide information on the various aspects of the study process, including:

- Academic calendar and information on the organisation of the examination sessions;
- Information on the credit technology and the workload of students, the method of the GPA calculation, etc.;
- Instructions on the organisation of the independent work of students and the work with educational and scientific literature;
- Academic staff, etc.

The Faculty of Economics states that it has updated and further developed its website following the recommendations of the IAAR experts given in the framework of the initial accreditation of the programmes. A more detailed description of the study programs is published, comprising information on professional competencies, qualifications assigned, specializations, specifics of the profession and the labor market, requirements for admission and tuition fees.

The chairs prepare annual overviews of activities in the form of reports on the implementation of their operational plans and submit these reports in the electronic document management system. In addition, the reports on activities of the chairs are published in paper form and are

approved by the faculties.

As part of the preparation for the admission campaign, ENU also publishes information booklets on its study programmes.

## Appraisal:

The quality control system described by the University indicates sufficient appropriateness to ensure quality of teachings, contents, material, allocation of human resources, tools, facilities and technical infrastructure compliant with internal objectives and environmental needs.

The system shows strengths in clear definitions of rules, processes and responsibilities, comprehensive documentation, and consideration of a wide range of different internal and external aspects.

The panel sees a notable aspect in the involvement of key stakeholders – students, graduates, teachers, employers and professionals – in different quality related mechanics and a remarkable involvement of employers.

The panel sees the academic staff being remarkably involved in development, monitoring and improvement of modules and study programmes. Students' and employers' involvements seem to sufficiently examine future needs for graduates and in labour markets. Outcomes of surveys and measures taken are communicated to students.

The panel noted in the survey on students' satisfaction that, to the question on the workload and time given with the modules, possible answers just cover “completely satisfied”, “not satisfied” and “no answer”. In the Panel's view, the range only allows for a very general analysis. Students should better be asked for the amount of hours they spent on the different types of work, self-studies, teaching time, and examinations. The panel recommends to adjust the survey question and, if need be, adjust estimated workloads accordingly.

It is not quite clear to the panel whether information on employment of graduates is collected and interpreted. Therefore the panel recommends systematic alumni tracking studies.

It is not quite obvious to the panel, how the different elements (EMW, KPI, surveys etc.) of the quality control system are interlinked including links with the University's Strategy. The Panel recommends an internal or external assessment on appropriateness of the QC elements (EMW, KPI, surveys etc.) with particular regard to monitoring environmental needs and corresponding needs of internal alignments.

The panel has welcomed the fact that the Faculty of Economics has revised its website based on the recommendations given in the initial IAAR accreditation. However, some information on the University's website is obsolete. For instance, worldwide university ranking information was last updated in 2013; English versions are incomplete, some department information is obsolete. The panel therefore recommends regular reviews of the webpages of the University in all of three language versions (Kazakh, Russian and English) in a way that any webpage is reviewed within a 3 years period. Website content should be adequately considered with regard to needs of external stakeholder and potential students.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
5.1*	Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2	Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1	Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3	Programme documentation					
5.3.1*	Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2	Information on activities during the academic year			X		

# Quality profile

HEI: L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University

**Bachelor / Master programme:** Finance/ Accounting and Audit/ Tourism

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
<b>1</b>	<b>Objectives</b>					
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.3	Positioning of the study programme			X		
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market			X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)			X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept			X		
<b>2</b>	<b>Admission</b>					
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for Master programmes that require professional experience)					X
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
<b>3.</b>	<b>Contents, structure and didactical concept</b>					
3.1	Contents					
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2*	Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2	Structure					
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)				Condition	

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
Criterion)					
3.2.3* Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4 Equality of opportunity			X		
3.3 Didactical concept					
3.3.1* Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.2* Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.3 Guest lecturers			X		
3.3.4 Lecturing tutors			X		
3.4 Internationality					
3.4.1* International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2 Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3 Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4 Foreign language contents			X		
3.5* Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.6* Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
<b>4. Academic environment and framework conditions</b>					
4.1 Faculty					
4.1.1* Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2* Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3* Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4 Practical business experience of faculty			X		
4.1.5* Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.6* Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.7(*) Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)					X
4.2 Programme management					
4.2.1* Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)		Tourism	X		
4.2.2 Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty		X			
4.3 Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*) Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks			X	X	

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
	(Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)					
4.3.2(*)	Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)			X		
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.5	Additional services					
4.5.1	Career counselling and placement service	X				
4.5.2	Alumni Activities			X		
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
<b>5</b>	<b>Quality assurance and documentation</b>					
5.1*	Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2	Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1	Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3	Programme documentation					
5.3.1*	Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2	Information on activities during the academic year			X		



## Annex

### **Finance (Bachelor):**

The Bachelor programme Finance has the following curriculum:





білім беру модулі Модуль <span style="float: right;">общей</span> образования Module of the general education	IY 1102 FL 1102	Иностранный язык Foreign language	ООД ОК GCD CC A	Англ. English							экзамен exam	УК <sub>A</sub> УС <sub>A</sub>	<u>кафедрасы</u> Кафедра иностранных языков <u>Department of</u> <u>Foreign</u> <u>Languages</u>
	K(O)T 1101 K(R)Ya 1101 K(R)L 1101	Қазақ (орыс) тілі Казахский (русский) язык Kazakh (Russian) language	ЖБП МК ООД ОК GCD CC A	Орысша Русский Russian  Қазақша Казахский Kazakh	3	5	45		90	емтихан экзамен exam	ӘҚА УК <sub>A</sub> УС <sub>A</sub>	Практикалық қазақ тілі кафедрасы, <u>Орыс</u> <u>филологиясы</u> <u>кафедрасы</u> Кафедра практического казахского языка, кафедра русской филологии Department of practical Kazakh language, <u>Department of</u> <u>Russian Philology</u>	































## **Accounting and Audit (Bachelor)**

The Bachelor programme Accounting and Audit has the following curriculum:









































## **Tourism (Bachelor)**

The Bachelor programme Tourism has the following curriculum:

Модуль атауы және коды / Название и код модуля / Module name and code	Пәннің коды / Код дисциплины / Course code	Пән атауы / Наименование дисциплины / Course name	Цикл, компонент және А, В, С тобы / Цикл, компонент и группа А, В, С / Cycle, component	Оқыту тілі / Язык обучения / Language of instruction	Кредит көлемі / Объем кредитов / Quantity of the credits	Сабак түрі бойынша сағат көлемі / Объем часов по видам занятий / The volume of hours by types of occupations	Бақылау формасы / Форма контроля / Type of control	ктер / Формируемые компетенции	Оқитын кафедра / Читаемая кафедра / Department in charge
--	---	--	--	---	---	---	---	-----------------------------------	---















































## **Finance (Master)**

The **Master programme in Finance** has the following curriculum:













EDUC 53003 Жаһандану жағдайындағы қаржылық нарықтарды басқару және реттеу модулі Модуль управления и регулирования финансовым рынком в условиях глобализации Module for managing and regulating financial markets in globalisation	ZP 5406 IP 5406 RE 5406	Зерттеу практикасы Исследовательская практика Research extemship	ОҚТ ДВО АЕ	Каз/ рус	3	12					есеп отчет report		Қаржы Финансы Finance
Қорытынды аттестацияның модулі Модуль итоговой аттестации Module of a final assessment	KE KE CE	Кешенді емтихан Комплексный экзамен Complex examination	ОҚТ ДВО АЕ	Каз/ рус	1	3					МЕ ГЭ SE		Қаржы Финансы Finance
	MDRK OZMF DMDTh	Магистрлік диссертацияны рәсімдеу және қорғау Оформление и защита магистерских диссертаций Defense of Masters degree thesis	ОҚТ ДВО АЕ	Каз/ рус	3	7					МД қорғау Защита МД Defense of Masters degree thesis		Қаржы Финансы Finance
<b>Итого кредитов за 2 курс</b>						<b>26</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>60</b>		<b>360</b>		
					<b>Дополнительные виды обучения</b>								
					<b>Дополнительные модули, выходящие за рамки квалификации</b>								
<b>Теориялық білім беру бойынша барлығы Всего теоретического обучения Total for theoretical training</b>				Каз/рус	<b>42</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>360</b>	<b>270</b>			<b>1260</b>		
<b>Білім беру бағдарламасы бойынша барлығы Итого по образовательной программе Total for education program</b>				Каз/рус	<b>59</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>360</b>	<b>270</b>			<b>1260</b>		

/ Summary table displaying the amount of obtained credits within the modular education program

Курс /Course	Семестр /Semester	Менгерілетін модульдер саны /Количество осваиваемых модулей /Amount of modules to be studied	Оқылатын пәндер саны /Количество изучаемых дисциплин /Amount of subjects		ҚР бойынша кредиттер саны /Количество кредитов РК / Amount of RK credits						Барлық сағат саны /Всего в часах/Total amount in hours	ECTS	Саны/Количество/Amount		
			МК/OK/CC	ТК/KB/EC	Теориялық білім /Теоретическое обучение /Theoretical classes	Педагогикалық/Педагогическая /Teaching internship	Зерттеу практикасы /Исследовательская практика/Research internship	ҒЗЖ/НИП/SRW	Қорытынды аттестация /Итоговая аттестация /Final assessment	Барлығы /Всего/Total			Емтихан /Экзамен /Exam	есеп отчет report	Курстық жұмыс /Курсовая работа /Course paper
1	1	3	3	3	16	-	-	1	-	17	840	30	6	1	-
	2	2	2	3	14	-	-	2	-	16	870	30	5	1	-
2	3	1	-	4	12	3	-	2	-	17	870	30	4	2	-
	4	1	-	-	-	-	3	2	4	9	1020	30	-	2	-
<b>Барлығы/ Total:</b>	-	-	<b>5</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>3600</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>-</b>

## **Accounting and Audit (Master)**

The **Master programme in Accounting and Audit** has the following curriculum:





















экзамен Comprehensive exam		Complex examination											Department of accounting, auditing and analysis
	MDRK 6408 OZMD 6408 DDMD 6408	Магистрлік диссертацияны рәсімдеу және қорғау  Оформление и защита магистерской диссертации  Design and defense of Master's degree thesis			3	7						МДРҚ ОЗМД DDMDT	Есеп, аудит және талдау кафедрасы  Кафедра учета, аудита и анализа  Department of accounting, auditing and analysis
2 курска барлық кредит/ Итого кредитов за 2курс / Total credits for 2a year							105	75			360		
Теориялық білім беру бойынша барлығы Всего теоретического обучения Total for theoretical training			Каз/рус	42	67	360	270				1260		
Білім беру бағдарламасы бойынша барлығы Итого по образовательной программе Total for education program			Каз/рус	59	120	360	270				1260		

Курс /Course	Семестр /Semester	Менгерілетін модульдер саны /Количество осваиваемых модулей /Amount of module bestudied	Оқылатын пәндер саны /Количество изучаемых дисциплин /Amount of subjects		ҚР бойынша кредиттер саны /Количество кредитов РК / Amount of RK credits						Барлық сағат саны /Всего в часах /Total amount in hours	ECTS	Саны /Количество /Amount		
			МК/ОК/СС	ТК/КВ/ЕС	Теориялық білім /Теоретическое обучение /Theoretical classes	Педагогикалық практика /Педагогическая практика /Teaching internship	Зерттеу тәжірибесі /Исследовательская практика /Research externship	MGZJ НІРМ/ SRWG	Қорытынды аттестация /Итоговая аттестация /Final assessment	Барлығы /Всего /Total			Емтихан /Экзамен /Exam	Есеп / отчет report	Курстық жұмыс /Курсовая работа /Course paper
1	1	2	3	3	16			1		17	840	30	6	1	
	2	5	2	4	14			2		16	870	30	6	1	
2	3	2		4	12	3		2		17	870	30	4	2	
	4						3	2	4	9	1020	30		2	
Барлығы / Total:		5	5	11	42	3	3	7	4	59	3600	120	11	6	

## **Tourism (Master)**

The **Master programme in Tourism** has the following curriculum:























4 семестр / 4 семестр / Semester 4													
TOUR 52003 Туристiк қызметтi жобалау және басқаруды ұйымдастыру Проектирование и организация управления туристской деятельностью Design and tourism management organization	ZP 5306 IP 5306 RP 5306	Зерттеу тәжірибесі Исследовательская практика Research practices	ОҚТ ДВО АЕ	қазақ, орыс/ казахский, русский / kazakh, russian	3	12					есеп отчет report	КК <sub>А</sub> ПК <sub>А</sub> РС <sub>А</sub>	Туризм Туризм Tourism
TOUR 52003 Туристiк қызметтi жобалау және басқаруды ұйымдастыру Проектирование и организация управления туристской деятельностью Design and tourism management organization	MGZZh 5304 NIRM 5304 SRWG 5304	Магистранттың ғылыми зерттеу жұмысы, магистрлік диссертация орындау Научно-исследовательская работа магистранта, включая выполнение магистерской диссертации Scientific-research work of graduate students (master), course work	ОҚТ АЕ ДВО	қазақ, орыс/ казахский, русский / kazakh, russian	2	8					есеп отчет report	КК <sub>А</sub> ПК <sub>А</sub> РС <sub>А</sub>	Туризм Туризм Tourism
<b>Теориялық білім беру бойынша барлығы</b> <b>Всего теоретического обучения</b> <b>Total for theoretical training</b>					<b>42</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>330</b>		<b>1260</b>			
<b>Білім беру бағдарламасы бойынша барлығы</b> <b>Итого по образовательной программе</b> <b>Total for education program</b>					<b>59</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>300</b>		<b>1260</b>			



